

PN. 112 X-032

96164

LOGISTICS AND MANAGEMENT INFORMATION
SYSTEMS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO
THE MCHFP GENERAL DIRECTORATE
MINISTRY OF HEALTH, TURKEY

FINAL REPORT

July 1995

Paul Auxila

FAMILY PLANNING MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT

Project No.: 936-3055
Contract No.: DPE-3055-C-00-0051-00
Task Order No.: A1700 TKMOH

The Family Planning Management Development Project (FPMD) is supported by the U.S.
Agency for International Development. For further information, please contact:

FPMD
Management Sciences for Health
400 Centre Street
Newton, Massachusetts, U.S.A. 02158
Telephone: (617) 527-9202 ♦ Fax: (617) 965-2208

CONTENTS

I.	OBJECTIVES OF THE REPORT	1
II.	PROJECT BACKGROUND	1
III.	SUMMARY OF ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN UNDER THIS PROJECT	2
IV.	SPECIFIC OUTPUTS	4
V.	DISSEMINATION WORKSHOP	5
VI.	IMPORTANT NEXT STEPS TO BE CONSIDERED BY THE MCHFP	7

I. OBJECTIVES OF THE REPORT

This report summarizes the activities organized under the FPMD sub-project of technical assistance and training to the Maternal Child Health and Family Planning (MCHFP) General Directorate of Turkey. It lists the principal outputs delivered and summarizes the main recommendations for next steps. Because of FPMD's closing date of September 27, this report only includes FPMD's point of view. CDC's final report, as well as copies of the English translation of the last workshop material, will be submitted directly by CDC. This report does not intend to cover in details the Logistics component of this project. For additional details, please refer to the technical reports.

II. PROJECT BACKGROUND

The Family Planning Management Development Project (FPMD) and the Family Planning Logistics Management Project/Centers for Diseases Control (FPLM/CDC) worked on a joint project to assist the Maternal Child Health and Family Planning (MCHFP) General Directorate of Turkey to develop and test a comprehensive Family Planning Service Statistics Information System, and a Contraceptive Logistics System with the necessary management information system to support it. The goal of this project was to help the MCHFP in more rational decision making that would lead to more cost efficient utilization of resources and improvement of the quality of service delivery. The specific objectives were to ensure that by the end of the project, the MCHFP would have:

- a well designed and appropriate Contraceptives Logistics systems tested in some provinces and ready for implementation in others;
- functioning logistics and service statistics information systems providing information necessary to support the planning, monitoring and supervision functions of the MCHFP at both the provincial and national levels.
- a central LMIS team trained and ready to plan the dissemination of these systems to other provinces and support the provincial staff in its efforts to implement and use these management tools.

This project was a "test project" or initial phase of a more comprehensive set of activities. It included only five provinces: Ankara, Izmir, Manisa, Kirikkale and Aydin. On the MCHFP's request, the work in MIS was not to consider redesign of data collection forms, but to focus on data processing and utilization of information. FPMD's assistance occurred at four levels: (1) collaboration with the FPLM/CDC group in the design and implementation of a Top Up Logistics system; (2) design and implementation of a computerized MCH/FP Service Statistics Information System; (3) funding of all field activities related to the implementation of the computerized Service Statistics MIS (system reviews, tests, training workshops, system documentation, utilization and evaluation) as well as local costs for translation, computer systems, workshops, and participation of counterparts in field activities related to both the

Service Statistics and the Logistics Systems; and (4) implementation of joint activities with FPLM/CDC in the formation and training of a Logistics/Management Information Systems Technical Team at the central level in Ankara..

Although each group focussed on specific technical and training activities, most in-country activities were carried out jointly and the technical work on each side benefited from the input and experience of the other.

III. SUMMARY OF ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN UNDER THIS PROJECT

The following activities were undertaken during the period 1991 to date:

- An initial MIS and logistics needs assessment.
- An MIS and Contraceptive Logistics workshop for mid-level and senior personnel in 8 provinces around Izmir. This workshop was designed to discuss Logistics issues and introduce the concept of LMIS development.
- Appointment by the MCHFP General Directorate of a well qualified and motivated three-member Logistics/MIS Technical Team.
- A series of Logistics and MIS orientation meetings for the LMIS Technical team.
- An in-depth field review of logistics and management information systems and procedures in Ankara, Izmir and Manisa.
- A technical workshop on MIS and Contraceptive Logistics for the LMIS technical team.
- Meetings with officers from Provincial Directorates in Ankara, Izmir and Manisa to introduce the Project's objectives and plans.
- Development of proposed specifications for procedures and systems for the service statistics MIS and the logistics systems.
- Development of a computerized system for processing Turkey's data on family planning services.
- An initial test of the Services Statistics Information System in Ankara, Izmir and Manisa.
- Implementation in Ankara of the first version of the Service Statistics Information System for additional field tests.

- Development of plans for starting full systems implementation and testing in the five test provinces: Ankara, Manisa, Izmir, Aydin, Kirikkale.
- First test and implementation workshop in Ankara. The goal of this workshop was to provide Provincial Health Directors and their staff with the information and tools necessary to implement the new Top-Up Logistics system and the Service Statistics Information System in the five test provinces. This workshop included central level and provincial managers, delivery teams, supervisory and data processing staff.
- Follow up at the provincial level by the MCHFP LMIS team.
- Field visits to all five provinces to survey initial results of the implementation process.
- Development of a short training guide for the use of the computerized service statistics information system. This guide is available in Turkish. It was distributed with the training material for the second implementation workshop.
- Second implementation workshop in Izmir for representatives of the five test provinces. The objective of this activity was to review the implementation of the new procedures and systems in the test provinces and to identify/discuss management and/or information issues as well as adjustments or modifications to be made to the system's specifications, training material/methodology, approach to implementation, etc.
- Focus group meetings with provincial staff to review the Service Statistics Information System and identify changes to be made.
- Development of specifications for adaptation of the data entry and data processing routines of the Service Statistics Information System.
- Implementation in the computerized service statistics information system of the changes requested and the specifications developed.
- Procurement and installation of a computer system with the necessary peripherals at the MCHFP General Directorate in Ankara.
- In-depth training of one member of the LMIS technical team in the operation of the computer system.
- Translation of the computerized system into Turkish.
- Visits to all five provinces and additional training of the data processing staff.
- Appointment of one additional member to the LMIS technical team.

- Preparation and initiation of the FPMD internal evaluation of this project.
- Visit of the LMIS technical team to MSH/Boston for additional training and preparation of the third implementation workshop.
- Organization of the third implementation workshop in Ankara. This workshop was dedicated to the identification of indicators and to use of information for decision making.
- Development of a complete technical reference manual for the computerized Service Statistics Information System. This manual is available in English at the central level.
- Organization in Izmir of the final workshop on dissemination.
- Development of a users' reference manual to facilitate training in and utilization of the Service Statistics Information System. This manual is available in Turkish at the central level. It should be made available to all the users of the system.
- Final evaluation of the project by the FPMD Evaluation Unit

IV. SPECIFIC OUTPUTS

- The most important contribution of this project was the formation, development and training of the MCHFP LMIS technical team. Several training activities were organized specifically for the team, and it has been closely involved in all aspects of this project. Responsibilities for both local technical assistance and training have been progressively transferred to the team. They have carried out their duties very well.
- A functioning computerized Service Statistics Information System tested in 5 provinces.
- A functioning Contraceptives Logistics System (collaborating with CDC)
- A fully-equipped computer station for the LMIS technical team based in Ankara.
- Trained staff in the test provinces in the use of both the logistics system and the Service Statistics Information System.
- A complete technical guide on the Service Statistics Information System. This guide is available in English at the central level.
- A brief training guide for the Service Statistics Information System available in Turkish.

- A users' guide for the Service Statistics Information System in Turkish.

V. DISSEMINATION WORKSHOP

The primary objective of this one and a half day workshop was to generate interest and commitment from additional provinces for the implementation of the service statistics and logistics information systems. The workshop took place in Izmir on 10-11 July and was attended by more than 40 participants. In addition to staff from the central level and the five test provinces, representatives from several new provinces (Adana, Erzurum, Istanbul, Samsun, Sivas) and other organizations (SSK, The World Bank Project, AVSC, Hacettepe University, etc.) also attended.

The program was as follows:

July 10, 1995

10:00 - 10:30 Opening by the Izmir Health Director, Mary Schauer, Paul Auxila, Ugur Aytac

10:30 - 10:45 Break

10:45 - 11:15 Situation of the MCHFP Services and Rationale for the LMIS Project

11:15 - 12:15 Introduction to the Programme

12:15 - 14:00 Lunch

14:00 - 14:30 Discussion of the LMIS Programme activities

14:30 - 15:15 Programme activities in the test provinces - Presentation by Kirrikale

15:15 - 15:30 Break

15:30 - 16:15 Analysis of the results in the provinces

July 11, 1995

9:30 - 10:00 Problems and lessons learned - Evaluation

10:00 - 11:00 Groups discussions - Needs to be met for expanding to other provinces

11:00 - 11:15 Break

11:15 - 12:00 Presentations of Groups discussions

12:00 - 13:00 General Discussion - Closing

Main conclusions from the workshop:

Although provinces were, in general, satisfied with the implementation of the systems, several shortcomings, concerns and constraints do remain. The following are some of the key points that need to be considered when discussing the extension of the LMIS to other provinces.

- In most cases, the implementation of the LMIS systems has been well received by the local staff and has had a positive impact on staff morale, on the management of the family planning program and on the quality of services. The five test provinces demonstrated that with adequate support and human resources, both the implementation and use of the Logistics system and the service statistics information systems are not only feasible but desirable.
- The most critical point to be discussed in the context of dissemination is the sustainability of the LMIS team. In the short-run, this means its ability to train and support the new provinces as the systems are implemented. The central level now has a technically well qualified and motivated LMIS team. However, the members of that team are called upon to perform many functions in the General Directorate. The amount of time and energy available to support the LMIS effort is dangerously limited. Before planning any further expansion of the LMIS Programme, the central level needs to seriously review its strategy, its priorities in order to determine and plan for its human resources needs accordingly. The LMIS Programme could easily occupy 100% of the time of the LMIS team.
- When commodities were available from the central level; the Logistics system in the provinces allowed for timely regular distribution of contraceptives, as well as the redistribution of overstocks; and even the inclusion of other program supplies in the distribution rounds.
- In some cases, shortages or delays in deliveries of contraceptives from the central level created serious difficulties at the provincial level. The Top-Up logistics system is based on the assumption that the central level will supply the provinces regularly and on a timely basis.
- In future implementation, it will be critical that the staff of the Finance and Administrative General Directorate be closely involved from the beginning. The receipt and distribution of contraceptives require close coordination and collaboration of these two General Directorates. Most importantly, the system is based on rational planning, not on subjective estimates of what they "want."
- Additional training on how to supply health houses and on how to handle emergencies is needed at the provincial level.
- The computerized service statistics information system is now operational and being used in most test provinces. However, additional training and user support will be required from the central LMIS technical team.
- The implementation of the LMIS systems was most efficient and effective in provinces where there was interest and support at the top level. It was clear that provinces where

the Health Director or his Deputy was directly involved were more effective in implementing the systems.

- In the dissemination workshop, staff from all provinces presented transparencies with information in graph form and proceeded to interpret and discuss the meaning of these graphs and their implications for their programs. That action represented a significant step in the use of information for decision making at the provincial level. However, more training will be needed in the preparation of these graphs and the interpretation of the information for decision-making. The LMIS technical team is qualified to provide that training to the provincial staff.
- The distribution system from Ankara to the provinces should be reviewed and streamlined.
- Because of the high turnover of staff at the provincial level, it is important that significant staff redundancy be planned and that written guidelines, users manual or reference guides and training material be made available at that level.
- Distribution rounds should be used to reinforce training activities and periodic introductory training or "refresher" sessions should be planned.
- The LMIS test in these provinces created an awareness among the staff that the administrative procedures in place for receipt and delivery of commodities need to be reviewed and simplified. The tests also raised the awareness that the data collection system now in place for service statistics needs to be reviewed. The definitions are not clear and quality of data is sometimes questionable.
- In some provinces, doctors do not see these systems as having much to do with them. The LMIS technical team should develop an orientation program promoting a systematic view with doctors so they can better understand the relationship between the LMIS Programme and what they do and the services they provide.

VI. IMPORTANT NEXT STEPS TO BE CONSIDERED BY THE MCHFP

- As mentioned earlier, the extent to which the central LMIS technical team supports (with technical assistance and training) the implementation of the LMIS programme in the provinces will be one of the key determinants of whether an expansion will be successful. We believe that after this project, the LMIS team is fully qualified technically to undertake this responsibility. It will be up to the MCHFP to review its strategies and priorities and determine the extent to which the LMIS technical team can dedicate its time and energy to this plan.

- Unfortunately, there was not enough time after the last workshop to conduct several work sessions to develop a plan for expansion. We recommend that the MCHFP organize a mini-workshop with the LMIS technical team, including the Administration-Finance General Directorate and a few other key counterparts from the Provincial level to analyze the input received in the final workshop, summarize the lessons learned and develop a strategy and a plan for expansion. Ideally, that strategy should include not only the objectives and activities to be carried out for expansion, but also the identification of policy, systems and resource issues to be addressed at each level if the expansion is to be successful, and a clear time line for addressing them.
- The MCHFP should make available technical manuals and reference guides about the Logistics and the service statistics information systems at the users level.
- The MCHFP should coordinate with the Administration-Finance General Directorate to develop and implement a simple warehouse management guide for family planning commodities.