

PA-ABR-852

**WOMEN-IN-DEVELOPMENT STUDY
CAPTURING USAID'S WID
EXPERIENCES IN PAKISTAN**

January 19, 1994

PDC -0100-Z-009044-00
5829.303

The Futures Group International
1050 17th Street NW, Suite 1000 -
Washington, DC 20036

5829.303

**WOMEN-IN-DEVELOPMENT STUDY
CAPTURING USAID'S WID EXPERIENCES IN PAKISTAN**

Submitted to
The Futures Group, Washington D.C.

January 19, 1994

EDC

Enterprise & Development Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd

74 Khayaban-e-Iqbal

F-8/2, P.O. Box 2389

Islamabad, Pakistan

Tel: +92(51) 255823; 855905; 855915 Fax: +92 (51) 254024

a

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No
List of Annexure	ii
list of Abbreviations	iii
Executive Summary	v
1. BACKGROUND	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Methodology	1
1.3 Overview of Women in Pakistan	2
2. OVERVIEW OF THE IMPACT OF USAID PROJECTS ON WOMEN	4
2.1 Parameters of Impact	4
2.2 Broad Dimensions of Impact	5
2.3 Project Specific Impact	6
3. LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FUTURE	15
3.1 Conceptual Planning & Design	15
3.2 Sectoral Selection	15
3.3 Institutional Choices	16
3.4 Project Specific Lessons	17
4. STRATEGY FOR DISSEMINATION	24
4.1 Overview	24
4.2 Dissemination to Donors	24
4.3 Dissemination to GOP	25
4.4 Dissemination to NGOS	25
References	27
Annexure	29

b

LIST OF ANNEXURES

Annex I	PROJECT SPECIFIC FINDINGS	30
Annex II	CASE STUDIES OF INSTITUTIONS AND INDIVIDUALS	46
Annex III	LIST OF USAID & PROJECT STAFF INTERVIEWED	52
Annex IV	LIST OF INTERVIEWEES AT THE BENEFICIARY LEVEL	55
Annex V	LIST OF THE INWID ADVISORY COMMITTEE	61
Annex VI	CHECKLISTS FOR INTERVIEWS	64
Annex VII	LIST OF EDC PROJECT STAFF & ASSIGNMENTS	77
Annex VIII	TERMS OF REFERENCE	78

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AKRSP	The Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
APWA	All Pakistan Women's Association
ASSP	Agriculture Sector Support Project
CPR	Contraceptive Prevalence Rate
DSTP	Development Support Training Program
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
ECI	Entrepreneurship & Career Institute
EDC	Enterprise & Development Consulting
EDP	Entrepreneurship Development Program
FPDP	Forestry Planning & Development Project
PFI	Pakistan Forest Institute
FWCS	Family Welfare Cooperative Society
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GENESYS	Gender in Economic & Social Systems
GOP	Government of Pakistan
HRS	Human Resource Survey
KDADP	Kala Dhaka Area Development Program
LHRLA	Lawyers for Human Rights & Legal Aid
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MTT	Mobile Teacher Training
MTU	Management Training Unit
NEW	Network of Enterprising Women
NFE	Non-Formal Education
NGOCC	Non-Governmental Organization's Coordinating Council

NWFP	North West Frontier Province
MT	Management Training
PED	Primary Education Development
PFI	Pakistan Forestry Institute
FPDP	Forestry Planning & Development Program
PMC	Pakistan Medical Council
PCSP	Pakistan Child Survival Project
SAP	Social Action Programme
SRSC	Sarhad Rural Support Corporation
TADP	Tribal Area Development Program
TBA	Traditional Birth Attendant
TOEFL	Test of English as a Foreign Language
TOT	Training of Trainers
TVO	Trust for Voluntary Organizations
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VEC	Village Education Committee
WID	Women in Development

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report has been prepared by Enterprise & Development Consulting (EDC) private limited under contract to the Futures Group which has been working with the Office of Women in Development and USAID Missions to integrate gender concerns into development activities through the GENESYS project. The main objective of the study is to highlight USAID/Pakistan's successes in integrating gender issues into the mission's development portfolio. This report summarizes the lessons learned through USAID-funded projects in Pakistan. This study was undertaken between July 1993 and January 1994. A five member team from EDC worked on this study. The research design that was followed for this study was based on a sequential data collection and information gathering methodology which consisted of the following steps: review of secondary documents; interviews with USAID and project staff; and interviews with beneficiaries and focus group discussions.

In order to realistically assess the impact of USAID projects it is important to focus on the overall socio-economic and institutional milieu within which these projects were implemented. Most project activities undertaken for women cannot be expected to have more than a marginal impact given the socio-economic status of women in the country. The overall social indicators are low for the country as a whole but are among the lowest in the world for women. The female literacy rate is 21%, life expectancy is 55 years and fertility rate 6.5. The 1987 Labour Force Participation Survey estimated Female Labour Force Participation rate at only 12%. However, it is generally accepted that these figures do not fully take into account the women working in the informal sector. Women's productive contribution to the economy goes unrecognized as most of their work is non-remunerative. In an agriculture based economy, rural families traditionally value sons more due to the gender division of labour. Culturally and socially, a lower value is attached to a female from infancy to old age.

USAID development assistance to Pakistan has been shaped very much by the political dimensions of the relationship between the USA and Pakistan. Despite the political factors, USAID projects in Pakistan have had an impact on women in several significant ways. This is primarily as a result of changes in perceptions at the policy planning level, project design and implementation stage and at the village level. Most of USAID's projects considered here had few far-reaching policy level implications. The social sector projects were probably the most far-reaching in terms of trying to usher in broad policy and institutional reform. In other sector, the projects impacted a particular institution or a small geographic area. USAID projects led to the growing realization that women cannot be excluded from the development process. USAID assistance has been key in helping the Government of Pakistan forge a more gender sensitive approach in all sectors.

USAID has probably been one of the principal supporters of greater involvement of women in the agriculture extension programmes in Pakistan. USAID assistance helped formulate programmes which were non-traditional and very progressive in the roles which they defined for women. A direct link between women at the project level and women at the farm level was attempted in the agricultural programmes. This was important in a country where women perform important tasks in the agricultural sector but have no direct access to any type of agricultural extension advise or improved inputs directly.

A major contribution of the area development projects initiated by USAID in the North West Frontier Province is the strengthening of line departments to undertake activities for women and to sensitize the men for development planning and implementation for women. This is an important beginning in a country where women are largely absent from these departments. This has not been achieved easily. A combination of innovative approaches was used to achieve this in some of the most conservative and traditional areas in Pakistan. These approaches included following a very gradual approach, sensitivity to the concerns of both men and women, hiring special staff for women and initiating new activities for women within the traditionally described sphere to enhance their productivity and income levels.

The Forestry Planning & Development Project has played a critical role in changing perceptions towards forestry issues in Pakistan. The importance of including women in social forestry activities at the project and village level are better appreciated as a result of this and several donor funded forestry projects. From a narrowly defined technical sector, forestry is now viewed in a much broader context in which the inter-sectoral linkages between forestry and other related sectors like livestock, agriculture, irrigation, etc are better understood. This change in perception is particularly important from women's standpoint because their connection with social forestry can best be understood with a reference to issues of common property regimes, crop-livestock interactions and the institutional issues within the forestry sector.

The micro-enterprise sector has received a lot of attention in Pakistan in recent years. This is primarily due to the recognition that this sector makes a major contribution to employment and value added. USAID's investment in this sector, through its Private Enterprise Development initiative gave an important impetus to this sector and helped to focus attention on the needs of this neglected sector. However, a lot of the constraints in the sector are not of the type which can be fixed by project level intervention but need broad policy level and institutional level changes.

USAID has perhaps made its greatest impact on women through its policy initiatives within the social sectors in recent years. This

was assisted by the realization within the bureaucracy that investments in the social sectors had become imperative for overall economic and social development in the country. The initiation of the multi-donor funded Social Action Program has assisted in reaffirming some of the policy guidelines that were laid down in USAID funded projects regarding women's enrolment in schools, incentives for female teachers, establishment of girls schools, provision of basic health facilities for women and the delivery of family planning services through health outlets.

Within the social sectors, the greatest impact has been in the area of primary education for girls. There is a growing conviction that the greatest long-term impact on women is through investments in the education sector. This is due to the fact that literacy has an impact on both fertility rates and health status. The emphasis on opening primary schools for girls was led by the USAID Primary Education program in NWFP and Balochistan. Health programs were established by USAID but health services require an on-going investment in the quality of services and proper back-up and supply services. This is difficult to achieve in a country where overall investment in health infrastructure is limited, health personnel are unavailable in rural areas and para-medical staff are inadequately trained. USAID was a major donor to the small efforts at population planning in Pakistan. There is evidence that the improved delivery and marketing of contraceptives has had an appreciable affect on contraceptive prevalence rates in both the urban and rural areas of the country.

USAID's training initiative in Pakistan provided opportunities for women which were not available before. Its impact was both on women who applied and went for training courses and on those women who were encouraged by the provision of opportunities which had not been available previously. Relative to the private sector program, the performance of the public sector has been weak. However, in absolute terms, the performance has been credible keeping in mind the overwhelming obstacles facing women in Pakistan, particularly those who work in the public sector. All women agreed that the experience broadened their horizons and gave them more confidence. Women feel more confident about negotiating and dealing in the business and government sector, entering new fields and stating their demands for employment. Although the training has given them access to new opportunities, women do not feel that promotions as such were correlated to training.

USAID staff in Pakistan feel that donors cannot generally be very effective as change agents; however, they can respond to change. The genesis of change is embedded in the national political system and is not greatly influenced by funding of development projects. As such, donors must first either change the perceptions of the implementing agencies, and if they are unable to achieve that, they must invest in sectors which are considered priority sectors by the implementing agency.

USAID experience shows that programmes with specific sectoral focus have generally been more successful in Pakistan than area development projects. However, the impact of projects depends more critically on how the project has been conceived, the commitment and qualifications of its staff, institutional and financial arrangements. The social sectors appear to be the most promising in terms of a broad based long-term impact on women. The agriculture, forestry and micro-enterprise sectors are limited in their impact by the small number of women they can access. The education sector with links with other sectors has far reaching impact on women's fertility and morbidity pattern as well as their labour force participation rates.

There were essentially three institutional choices open to USAID for implementing WID projects in Pakistan: government line departments, project management units staffed jointly by expatriate consulting firms and non-governmental organizations. USAID's direct financing of the NGO movement in Pakistan has helped create an alternative institutional model which has direct access to women at the village level. From the perspective of women, the choice of institution depends upon the overall objectives of the programme, its implementation strategy and the programme components offered. It has been most successful in the social sectors by using the line agencies as the implementing agency but only after affecting a basic structural change in them. The PMU model has been affective for short-term gains but in most cases the PMU has left little behind. Women have benefitted more at a professional level by their inclusion in the PMU and NGO structure rather than within the line departments.

It is expected that the lessons which emerge from USAID's gender-related experience in Pakistan will be conveyed to two audiences: (i) organizations which will continue to carry out development activities in Pakistan including the donor community, NGO's within Pakistan and the Government of Pakistan; and (ii) development professionals in countries where women are restricted in the social and economic sphere and have low status. It is suggested that the lessons should be disseminated by using existing institutional arrangements. This is considered from a practical standpoint in view of the fact that USAID has withdrawn economic and development support from Pakistan as a result of the Pressler Amendment and the future of its development assistance is unclear. As such, the existing institutional arrangements can be used effectively for sharing USAID's experience with other donors.

1. BACKGROUND

1.1 Introduction

This report has been prepared by Enterprise & Development Consulting (EDC) private limited a consulting firm based in Pakistan under contract to the Futures Group, a United States Agency for International Development (USAID) contracting firm based in Washington, D.C. The Futures Group has been working with the Office of Women in Development and USAID Missions to integrate gender concerns into development activities through the GENESYS project. The main objective of the study is to highlight USAID/Pakistan's successes in integrating gender issues into the mission's development portfolio. This report summarizes the lessons learned through USAID-funded projects in Pakistan about integrating gender issues into the development portfolio of a country in which women are marginally involved in economic and social decision-making and their participation rates are very low.

This study was undertaken between July 1993 and January 1994. This review was undertaken at a time when the Pressler Amendment had come into affect in Pakistan and the United States was winding down all its major projects in the country. The frustration of project staff in working in the ensuing uncertainty was evident in interviews with them. A five member team from EDC worked on this study and covered USAID projects in Sindh, Balochistan, North West Frontier Province and Punjab. The types of projects covered by the team were agriculture, forestry, area development, primary education, support to NGOs, population, child survival, enterprise development and training. A copy of the terms of reference are given in annex 8. The projects were divided into three groups on the basis of the potential for direct impact on women, maturity of the project and ability to identify impact.

1.2 Methodology

The research design that was followed for this study was based on a sequential data collection and information gathering methodology which consisted of the following steps: review of secondary documents; interviews with USAID and project staff; interviews with beneficiaries and focus group discussions. The two aspects in which the suggested methodology was modified were the addition of (i) focus group sessions to assess the impact of USAID's training programme in Pakistan and (ii) a beneficiary checklist instead of a beneficiary questionnaire to assess the impact of project activities on women by employing rapid appraisal techniques. These procedures enabled EDC to cover a much larger group of beneficiaries of both the training program and of women beneficiaries in villages. This methodology is also better suited to allow an issues oriented discussion of qualitative aspects. Overall, approximately 110 women were covered through focus group

and general group discussions and about 90 women at the grass roots level were interviewed from the beneficiary group.

1.3 Overview of Women in Pakistan

Pakistan is an agriculture based economy with 70% of the population living in rural areas. The overall social indicators are low for the country as a whole but are among the lowest in the world for women. The female literacy rate is 21%, life expectancy is 55 years and fertility rate is 6.5. Women have high morbidity rates and their general health and nutritional status is poor. The 1987 Labour Force Participation Survey estimated Female Labour Force Participation rate at only 12%. However, it is generally accepted that these figures do not fully take into account the women working in the informal sector. Women's productive contribution to the economy goes unrecognized as most of their work is non-remunerative.

In an agriculture based economy, rural families traditionally value sons more due to the gender division of labour. Culturally and socially, a lower value is attached to a female from infancy to old age. The prevailing social prejudices and value system reinforce the restrictions on women. Purdah limits women's autonomy in all spheres of life and makes them almost invisible. The gender division of labour is traditionally prescribed and dictates the types of activities that can be undertaken by women. The scope of activities is dictated by a complex set of factors which have their origin in cultural and religious factors. Social factors are far more significant in prescribing the role of women compared with religious factors in Pakistan. This is because Islamic injunctions are implemented selectively based on the prevailing social values. Thus, within the Islamic context in Pakistan, the parameters which development assistance can even be allowed to address are prescribed by the socio-cultural environment.

The official regulations regarding the position of women in Pakistan are, at best, ambivalent. Women do not enjoy the measure of autonomy theoretically ensured them under the existing legal system. Women's status is significantly compromised as a result of the manner in which Islamic injunctions are interpreted and translated into the legal system. The enactment of discriminatory laws against women in the past ten years have further deteriorated women's social and legal status. The Haddood Ordinance of 1979, and the Law of Evidence of 1984 undermined women's rights. These laws negate the Pakistan Constitution which stipulates that no discrimination shall take place on the basis of sex. Under the Shariat Act of 1991, Parliament can enact discriminatory laws for women and is a cause of concern for women.

The administrative system makes no distinction between men and women and thus, in theory, provides equal opportunity to both. The

government has instituted a minimum quota of five percent for new recruitment in government departments but it is difficult to fill this quota. The prevailing social system proscribes the role of women and limits their opportunities. In some departments, GOP has created special cadres of women extension staff but the low level at which these women have generally been inducted discourage qualified women from entering service. There are very few women in government line departments and this limits the direct access of the government machinery to women. Thus a majority of the women have virtually no contact with the principal development agency in the country.

The Government is the main implementing agency of development assistance in Pakistan. WID concerns are not its priority and it does not generally address the key constraints in the sectors critical for women. The NGO sector has only become a viable institutional option in the last decade. The Government's acquiescence to WID oriented projects arise from expectations of additional finances and the political mileage from undertaking WID oriented projects. The Government initiated a separate Ministry for undertaking WID specific projects in 1979. Most donors have tried to strengthen the capacity of this Ministry. Although, the Ministry has been instrumental in initiating specific programmes for women, it remains unable to influence the decisions of line agencies. Most Departments do not have the commitment to implement programmes for women and those that do, do not have the staff for implementation.

The human constraints in Pakistan rather than the physical infrastructure constraints are the binding ones. The GOP is beginning to understand that the main reason that Pakistan has not been able to make a structural economic change is due to the socio-economic status of its women. The position of women is one of the main reasons why Pakistan has lagged behind the rest of its regional neighbours in Asia. This realization has brought a gradual shift in GOP's attitude towards gender issues. This cognitive shift has been gradual but is very real. However, the government's ability to implement some of the social sector programmes is not matched by its willingness. This willingness represents a real opportunity for project type assistance to step forward and seize the initiative.

2. OVERVIEW OF THE IMPACT OF USAID PROJECTS ON WOMEN

2.1 Parameters of Impact

In order to realistically assess the impact of USAID projects on women it is important to focus on the overall socio-economic and institutional milieu within which these projects were implemented. The parameters of impact will be determined by the current situation of women and scope for improvement in that situation. As such, it is important to understand the situation of women in Pakistan and study the impact within that context. The brief overview of the status of women given above outlines the difficulty in trying to design and implement projects specifically targeted at women.

Most project activities undertaken for women cannot be expected to have more than a marginal impact given the socio-economic status of women in the country. In a male dominated society where women's participation in the labour force is poor, income levels small, literacy level and health status low, it is difficult for development projects to play a significant role in single handedly changing the role of women. Project planning is unable to influence the existing structure of society in the short-term. Most of the USAID interventions considered here are project type assistance. Project level interventions generally have little impact on social structures. Fundamental changes are required within the socio-economic structure of society to bring about a major change in the status of women. This process is rarely donor driven and cannot be impacted through donor types of project interventions. This is also illustrated by the experience of some of the USAID assisted projects in Pakistan.

USAID development assistance to Pakistan has been shaped very much by the political dimensions of the relationship between the USA and Pakistan. In the late 1970's and early 1980's when USAID had a close relationship with the Government of Pakistan (GOP), US could not unilaterally initiate any program of social change. The GOP was willing to finance the social sectors only to augment the existing system. The environment was not conducive, at that time, to contemplate measures for broad-based social change in Pakistan. Moreover, USAID was not willing to push on the WID agenda and antagonize the GOP in the face of other greater geo-political concerns. This influencing of the development agenda as a result of political agenda has a negative impact on development projects. Thus most development projects in Pakistan were abruptly terminated in light of the Pressler Amendment. This has had a negative impact at all levels and is likely to shape the tone of development assistance between the two countries in the future.

2.2 Broad Dimensions of Impact

USAID conceived its projects in terms of impact in several areas: sectoral impact; social dimensions; institutional aspects. USAID projects in Pakistan have had an impact on women in several significant ways. This is primarily as a result of changes in perceptions at the policy planning level, project design and implementation stage and at the village level. The quantifiable benefits to beneficiaries are more difficult to assess both in terms of increase in employment, productivity and income levels or other indicators of social and economic development. It was not always possible to separate the effect of exogenous variables on any unambiguous change in the status of women. In a few cases, a direct measurable impact on women which could be attributed to USAID project interventions was identifiable. In most cases, it was not possible to measure the precise impact on a long-term basis.

Most of USAID's projects considered here had few far-reaching policy level implications. The social sector projects were probably the most far-reaching in terms of trying to usher in broad policy and institutional reform. In other sector, the projects impacted a particular institution or a small geographic area. USAID projects did lead to the growing realization that women cannot be excluded from the development process. As a result of several USAID funded projects there is a more ready acceptance of the need for female extension workers in line departments which were traditionally staffed exclusively by men. The Provincial Government in NWFP has in recent years shown a much more progressive attitude towards women than is in evidence in other Provinces. The role of USAID and other donors has been critical in shaping this attitude.

USAID assistance has been key in helping the Government of Pakistan forge a more gender sensitive approach towards the social sectors. This has been achieved in some of the most backward areas of the country in sectors where GOP has provided only limited funds. The USAID funded Primary Education Project in Balochistan has spearheaded the effort to involve more women at both the staff level in the education department and at the beneficiary level by focusing project activities on the female population of the Province. Similarly, USAID support in the family planning area has been critical in securing the government's support for the politically sensitive issue of population control in Pakistan.

At the project level, USAID projects have illustrated how women can successfully participate in the implementation of projects. USAID has played a catalytic role in demonstrating how other agencies can operate within the given socio-economic constraints and still forge a progressive programme for women. There is a growing tendency to have more projects with WID integrated components. The impact of these projects on women is significant in creating an environment

in which there is a greater acceptance of a more active role for women. This is illustrated by women's role in the micro-enterprise sector, forestry sector, education sector and the male dominated area development projects which have an interaction with a wide range of government line agencies.

At the village level, programmes of social organization, training, income-generation and savings, etc are new for women and they affect women's self-image, decision-making and ownership of resources. One of the principal factors which constraints women's status in Pakistan are male perceptions of the role of women. This role is interpreted extremely narrowly. The gender division of labour at the village level is very strongly entrenched in local perceptions. These traditional perceptions can be changed to define a newer role in which women can enjoy greater autonomy. USAID funded projects like the Gadoon Amazai, Kala Dakha, FPDP have played a critical role in changing traditional perceptions. This change in perception will in the long-run have the most significant impact on women.

The benefits which have accrued as a result of USAID funded projects include increases in female employment, productivity and income levels as well as increase in their awareness and autonomy. There are quantifiable measures available of the impact of many of these projects on women at the individual level. Due to the absence of baseline information in most projects and lack of data on specific impact indicators, it was not possible to assess the impact of all development initiatives undertaken. The availability of data with each project is of a highly variable quality and in most cases impact indicators are not recorded. Furthermore, the impact of exogenous factors is not separated out from specific endogenous variables.

2.3 Project Specific Impact

2.3.1 Agriculture Extension

USAID has probably been one of the principal supporters of greater involvement of women in the agriculture extension programmes in Pakistan. USAID assistance helped formulate programmes which were non-traditional and very progressive in the roles which they defined for women. A direct link between women at the project level and women at the farm level was attempted in the agricultural programmes. This was important in a country where women perform important tasks in the agricultural sector but have no direct access to any type of agricultural extension advise or improved inputs directly.

The agriculture extension activities envisaged for women were often inconsistent with existing workloads and division of labour because they did not interpret women's role in a very narrow way. However,

there has been limited impact of these activities on women. Even where the traditional division of labour considerations were respected there has been no long term impact of these activities on women. A principal reason for this is not the design or implementation of the projects but the traditional role of women. Women are severely limited by the pre-defined social norms and are unable to take on a very progressive role. Women's access to markets and resources is limited. Despite USAID's attempt at innovation and a very progressive interpretation of women's role the project impact was limited. Thus the income earning potential of these activities remained limited and marketing was sporadic and irregular.

Due to the fact that agricultural extension agencies have been very male dominated and there are few women who are employed in agricultural extension activities. Despite USAID's effort to train women and employ them in these projects, the support from the GOP remained limited and GOP did not respond by a more open policy of inclusion of women in this area. Thus agriculture extension projects lacked institutionalization, activities were adhoc and monitoring and evaluation was weak. The emphasis of these projects was on activities and inputs and there was no overall conception of expected impact. This was perhaps necessary to obtain support for the entry of women in agricultural extension activities.

2.3.2 Area Development

A major contribution of the area development projects initiated by USAID in the North West Frontier Province is the strengthening of line departments to undertake activities for women and to sensitize the men for development planning and implementation for women. This is an important beginning in a country where women are largely absent from these departments. This has not been achieved easily. A combination of innovative approaches was used to achieve this in some of the most conservative and traditional areas in Pakistan. These approaches included following a very gradual approach, sensitivity to the concerns of both men and women, hiring special staff for women and initiating new activities for women within the traditionally described sphere to enhance their productivity and income levels.

One of the special implementation strategies devised in most of the area development programmes, was to establish credibility with the men and gain their support prior to initiating any project activities for women. The scope of these programmes was gradually expanded to include a programme of social organization, rural savings, nursery development, kitchen gardening and sale of saplings. Women's work groups were formed to work in common village based income generating opportunities. The response of the women to these programmes was very encouraging as women wanted to earn additional income and save for the future.

In most area development programmes in Pakistan, the women's programme was mainly managed through the project staff and not through line agencies. This is true of the area development projects in Gadoon Amazai, Kala Dhaka, and the Tribal Areas. There are both negative and positive aspects to this. The positive side is that decision making is rapid and the program is flexible. The disadvantage is that there are no institutional links established, and the line departments never assume responsibility for the programme. Therefore, once the project funding is withdrawn, the women's programme comes to a virtual halt. There is need to establish some sustainable institutional arrangements in order to circumvent this problem. Mindful of some of these issues, USAID had initiated a process of establishing Non-Governmental Organizations at the local level to oversee the implementation of some project activities.

Overall the direct impact of these programs on women has been limited due to the adhoc nature of the activities and the focus on inputs rather than long-term impact. Due to local sensitivities about the participation of women, these projects adhered to the traditional gender division of labour. They assisted women with the supply of inputs, access to marketing outlets and encouraging them to undertake village level marketing. However, for the future, when a greater marketing effort is required, women will need to redefine some of their traditional tasks. In the education sector, the area development programmes had a very significant impact because they established girl's schools and succeeded in encouraging the enrolment of girls in schools and teacher training programmes for women in areas where this had never been undertaken before.

2.3.3 Forestry

The Forestry Planning & Development Project has played a critical role in changing perceptions towards forestry issues in Pakistan. The importance of including women in social forestry activities at the project and village level are better appreciated as a result of this and several donor funded forestry projects. From a narrowly defined technical sector, forestry is now viewed in a much broader context in which the inter-sectoral linkages between forestry and other related sectors like livestock, agriculture, irrigation, etc are better understood. This change in perception is particularly important from women's standpoint because their connection with social forestry can best be understood with a reference to issues of common property regimes, crop-livestock interactions and the institutional issues within the forestry sector.

The NWFP forestry Department has taken the lead in trying to give a social dimension to its forestry activities by involving communities, understanding the role of women in the forestry sector and by broadening the scope of forestry sector activities to

include rangeland issues. In this context, the availability of trained women foresters will be an invaluable asset. It is likely that other provinces will follow the lead of NWFP.

The availability of trained women foresters has also encouraged NGOs involved with forestry sector activities to conceive of a more pro-active role for women in the sector and several NGOs and forestry projects have employed women trained by PFI in their projects. Prior to this, these organizations defined forestry activities in a very narrow manner in which there was no conception of a technical role for qualified women foresters.

The USAID forestry projects impacted women at two levels: (i) through the employment and training of women in the forestry sector and (ii) through the establishment and operation of nurseries for income generation for rural women. The project was able to win some support for women's inclusion in the forestry bureaucracy even though there is still some resistance to their employment. The NGO sector appears to be a more promising avenue of employment for women. At the village level, the program of nursery development has not been sustainable and none of the women who initiated nurseries have continued with the project. However, this is due to the fact that the sale of plants by women and the operation of nurseries is not an activity which has traditionally been undertaken by women.

2.3.4 Private Enterprise Development

The micro-enterprise sector has received a lot of attention in Pakistan in recent years. This is primarily due to the recognition that this sector makes a major contribution to employment and value added. Between the Small and Household-Based Manufacturing Industries Survey of 1976-1977 and 1983-84, employment in the small household based industries grew by 80% and value-added by 100%. Since the micro-enterprise sector consists primarily of family-based enterprises, women are a major player in it. However, this sector is not well linked into the existing institutional network for credit, training or input supply.

USAID's investment in this sector, through its Private Enterprise Development initiative gave an important impetus to this sector and helped to focus attention on the needs of this neglected sector. Under the Private Enterprise Development Project, women were trained as master trainers to train others and for initiating small-scale enterprises for themselves. In the workshops funded by USAID, 75-80 master trainers received training who in-turn trained 90 women at the grass roots level. Following USAID's lead other donor's launched programmes for disbursement of credit, marketing, training and input supply to this sector.

USAID's experience in the sector has been mixed. Of the total

participants met, over half are presently conducting training. Women trained to initiate small enterprise for themselves indicate that the training has helped them to augment their incomes. The training, however, has not encouraged women to enter new fields but rather to pursue enterprises in sectors traditionally managed by women. All trainers who are not linked with an institution have not subsequently trained. This indicates that an institutional structure is necessary through which women can train.

However, a lot of the constraints in the sector are not of the type which can be fixed by project level intervention but need broad policy level and institutional level changes. For example, access to credit from the formal sector is highly regulated and imposes high transactions cost on the borrower. The marketing system is again very well structured and there are structural barriers to entry for the micro-entrepreneurs. As such, project level interventions in the sector are less likely to have a lasting impact.

2.3.5 Education

USAID has perhaps made its greatest impact on women through its policy initiatives within the social sectors in recent years. This was assisted by the realization within the bureaucracy that investments in the social sectors had become imperative for overall economic and social development in the country. The initiation of the multi-donor funded Social Action Program has assisted in reaffirming some of the policy guidelines that were laid down in USAID funded projects regarding women's enrolment in schools, incentives for female teachers, establishment of girls' schools, provision of basic health facilities for women, and the delivery of family planning services through health outlets.

Within the social sectors, the greatest impact has been in the area of primary education for girls. There is a growing conviction that the greatest long-term impact on women is through investments in the education sector. This is due to the fact that literacy has an impact on both fertility rates, health status and employment. The emphasis on opening primary schools for girls was led by the USAID Primary Education Program in NWFP and Balochistan. Health programs were established by USAID but health services require an on-going investment in the quality of services and proper back-up and supply services. This is difficult to achieve in a country where overall investment in health infrastructure is limited, health personnel are unavailable in rural areas, and para-medical staff are inadequately trained. USAID was a major donor to the small efforts at population planning in Pakistan. There is evidence that the improved delivery and marketing of contraceptives has had an appreciable effect on contraceptive prevalence rates in both the urban and rural areas of the country.

The PED Program is one of the most comprehensive in primary education with respect to WID activities. The program was designed to directly address the low levels of enrolment of female children in Balochistan and NWFP provinces. Institutional development has been successful in terms of establishing a Directorate for primary education with a new structure to provide women access to positions in management and decision making. In both provinces, key management positions have been reserved for female staff to bring more women into policy making roles.

USAID's Primary Education Development (PED) program has been successful in opening co-educational primary schools in NWFP and Balochistan. In the years since the program was initiated, enrolment of girls has increased in Balochistan from 73,000 in 1989-90 to 101,000 in 1992-93 and during this time the ratio of boys to girls has shifted from 5.2:1 to 3.6:1. In NWFP, female enrolments have increased from 389,000 to 508,000, which slightly exceeded the targeted enrolment figure of 507,374 for the same period. Even more significant is that enrolment was largely increased in the rural areas. Before 1990 when PED began, the female enrolment was almost exclusively (over 75%) within Quetta. The 1992 data indicate that the percentage of girls in primary education outside of Quetta is now almost 50% of the total.

The PED program has been much more successful in Balochistan compared with the North West Frontier province. Critical for this has been the NGO called the Society for Community Support for Primary Education, which forms partnership between Government and people. This donor-initiated NGO has been critical for developing a rapport between the people and the bureaucracy. The NWFP NGO, Frontier Education Foundation, has not been so successful. Part of the problem has been that NWFP clings strongly to the traditional educational system set up under colonial times and the bureaucracy is not very flexible about innovative schooling institutions. Additionally the Quetta NGO has had a larger involvement of women in its decision-making process. This involvement has played a critical role in how these women have approached communities. The Society also places special emphasis on character building of the field staff as the success of the whole program depends on the constant effort by the field based program monitors.

2.3.6 Health

USAID undertook several initiatives in the health sector including the Primary Health Care (PHC) Project and the Pakistan Child Survival Project (PCSP). Under the PHC, local (balochi) female Medical Technicians (MTs) were recruited and trained for the first time in the history of the province. Prior to that, all female para-medical staff in Balochistan were recruited from Punjab, who served in the province for a minimum period of three years (under bond). Under the Pakistan Child Survival Project, USAID focused

its efforts towards employment of females, and succeeded in getting female medical officers (MOs) in (at least) major Rural Health Centres. The PCSP developed and implemented an interpersonal communication model in order to enable the female MOs to effectively communicate with the mothers, educating them about the available Mother and Child Health facilities. However, the impact of these projects on women has been uncertain.

The impact of the PCSP is only now being evaluated. At best, the impact of growth monitoring and promotion programmes in Pakistan is uncertain. In most cases, impact is not recorded. Where there has been an improvement in children's nutritional status and weight, it is difficult to pinpoint the specific causes or differentiate it from secular trends. It is estimated that in Pakistan the main reasons for malnutrition is inadequate feeding, illiteracy, lack of awareness, poor sanitation, repeated diarrhoea, infections, bottle feeding, etc. As such, growth monitoring and promotion by itself is likely to have little impact and an integrated approach is likely to have greater chances of success.

2.3.7. Population Planning

Family planning is a subject which is still taboo in Pakistan. The Government has been very reluctant to undertake family planning programmes due to the sensitivity of the subject. However, in recent years the GOP has started undertaking some family planning programmes as a result of the high population growth rate. Family planning programmes have only recently been initiated in Pakistan. Four critical factors which determine adoption of family planning practices are (i) characteristics and number of Field Workers involved with dissemination (ii) socio-economic characteristics of the MWRA (iii) special features of the project area and the implementation approach and service delivery of the project.

In the population sector, 92% of all the money in the sector was invested by USAID. Thus USAID had a relatively large investment in the sector. The USAID funded programme of social marketing of contraceptives through the NGOCC has assisted in increasing the CPR rate in both rural and urban areas. The evaluation of the projects suggest that the differential in the before and after CPR rates vary between 6% to 30% in rural areas and from 12% to above 40% in urban areas. According to the 1990-91 Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey, condom usage has increased from 2.1% in 1984-85 to 3.2% in 1990-91. The increase in condom usage has been attributed to the active social marketing of this method. In summary, the SMC Project has achieved its objectives. Contraceptive use in Pakistan has increased from 9% in 1984-85 to 14% in 1990-91, with condom use increasing from 2.1% to 3.2% in the same period.

The beneficiaries under the SMC project have been mainly urban and semi-urban working class men and their wives. One of the direct

benefits of increased contraceptive use is the improved well-being of women and children. Improved child spacing and limiting births decreases infant and child mortality. Also, fewer pregnancies benefit women by decreasing maternal morbidity and mortality.

The Social Action Plan (SAP) with its emphasis on female education, health, population planning and water supply is currently being developed with donor assistance. The SAP is particularly important from the standpoint of women. The GOP has for the first time accepted the need to invest in these sectors and to implement these programmes through grass-roots organizations at the village level. The Government is only just beginning to appreciate the necessity of investing in the social sectors and the private productive sectors. These factors are likely to usher in dynamic forces which will change the situation of women out of necessity, if not out of choice.

2.3.8 Training

The training program under USAID was composed of three broad components. The Development Support Training Program (DSTP) under which the DSTP foreign training for the public and private sector was undertaken and the local in-country training under the Management Training Unit (MTU). Additional training opportunities for women were provided under the Agriculture Sector Support Program (ASSP). As of May 1993, 471 women had completed training under DSTP. The private sector program was much more successful in sending women for training considering its relatively small budget and the shorter tenure of the program. Certain steps, including targeting training at professions dominated by women, lowering TOEFL requirements and an affirmative action program, marginally augmented the number of women going abroad from the public sector.

USAID's training initiative in Pakistan provided opportunities for women which were not available before. Its impact was both on women who applied and went for training courses and on those women who were encouraged by the provision of opportunities which had not been available previously. Relative to the private sector program, the performance of the public sector has been weak. However, in absolute terms, the performance has been credible keeping in mind the overwhelming obstacles facing women in Pakistan, particularly those who work in the public sector. All women agreed that the experience broadened their horizons and gave them more confidence. Women feel more confident about negotiating and dealing in the business and government sector, entering new fields and stating their demands for employment. Although the training has given them access to new opportunities, women do not feel that promotions as such were correlated to training.

USAID took preferential measures for female applicants from the public sector. At an institutional level, USAID targeted

training to professions dominated by women like health and education. One such program was the Lactation Management Program, in which a team of gynaecologists, paediatricians & nurses were sent for training. In most cases, these professions in Pakistan are dominated by women. USAID also had an implicit affirmative action program. For instance, DSTP staff always took alternative candidates if these candidates were women. Very few women nominees from the public sector were rejected and lower TOEFL scores were accepted for these women. USAID staff also constantly negotiated with the GOP to increase the number of women applicants from the public sector. The GOP's standard response was that few women interested in such scholarships. In an attempt to counter the GOP arguments, USAID staff publicized their scholarships under a 'Scholarship for Women' advertisement in 1985. The response was phenomenal and many women from the public sector applied.

The 'Scholarship for Women' advertisement also led to the most significant gender intervention on the part of USAID which was the private sector scholarship programme for women. It became evident when the applications started rolling in that there were many women in the private sector who were interested in training abroad. Consequently, the private sector scholarship programme was set up initially for women but later grew to include men. The structure of the application process was set up in such a way that it made it easier for women to apply; information was accessible to all through advertisements; the nomination process was eliminated and a competitive application process was set up in which USAID had the major say and the role of the government was minimal.

3. LESSONS LEARNT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FUTURE

3.1 Conceptual Planning & Design

USAID staff in Pakistan feel that donors cannot generally be very effective as change agents; however, they can respond to change. The genesis of change is embedded in the national political system and is not greatly influenced by funding of development projects. As such, donors must first either change the perceptions of the implementing agencies, and if they are unable to achieve that, they must invest in sectors which are considered priority sectors by the implementing agency. Forcing programmes upon agencies not conceptually prepared to implement them will lead to limited impact. Furthermore, donors are often not clear on how to deal with gender issues in an Islamic setting. Often the metaphors that are used are couched in Western terms. This leads to a backlash and hostility, particularly where issues regarding women are concerned. There is a need to develop a language and vocabulary which is non-Western and sensitive to the Islamic way of thinking.

USAID experience in Pakistan shows that in most WID projects, objectives and targets are not clearly stated whereas objectives are very clear for projects in other sectors. For example, in the agriculture sector, USAID clearly spelled out agriculture policy reform; bench marks were identified and clear deliverables were established. However, overall objectives and targets for WID components are not spelled out clearly and sometimes not even identified. For example, there was not a single WID objective in the Agriculture Sector Support Project. This undermined the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the WID projects.

In most WID projects, major emphasis is placed on the delivery of inputs to women rather than the overall impact. There seems to be a presumption that, once the inputs are provided, the impact will automatically follow. There is a general lack of understanding in examining the entire cycle through which women can become economically independent. Furthermore, traditional assumptions regarding community response are not challenged and it is assumed that the natural community response would be to exclude women from development programs due to their traditional segregation and exclusion from project activities. Many USAID projects have demonstrated that some of the traditional assumptions are not valid and that given the right incentive structure, women will be available and community support will be forthcoming for a wide range of activities.

3.2 Sectoral Selection

An on-going debate has raged between the choice of sectors with the greatest potential for impact on women. The debate has been between the choice from among specific sectors on the one hand, and

between specific sectoral focus and an area development focus on the other hand. Some of USAID's projects considered here have had a sectoral focus where as others have had a geographical focus. USAID experience shows that programmes with specific sectoral focus have generally been more successful in Pakistan than area development projects. However, the impact of projects depends more critically on how the project has been conceived, the commitment and qualifications of its staff, institutional and financial arrangements.

The social sectors appear to be the most promising in terms of a broad based long-term impact on women. The agriculture, forestry and micro-enterprise sectors are limited in their impact by the small number of women they can access. The education sector with links with other sectors has far reaching impact on women's fertility and morbidity pattern as well as their labour force participation rates. In a country like Pakistan the social sectors have far reaching implications in creating an awareness among women and in having a long-term impact on their status.

3.3 Institutional Choices

There were essentially three institutional choices open to USAID for implementing WID projects: government line departments, project management units staffed jointly by expatriate consulting firms and non-governmental organizations. From the perspective of women, the choice of institution depends upon the overall objectives of the programme, its implementation strategy and the programme components offered. Programmes implemented through existing line agencies or by affecting a structural change in the line agency are most sustainable and have the most far-reaching long-term impacts. However, these programmes require a long gestation period and are slow to get off the ground. For immediate short-term gains it is better to use the PMU type of structure. However, these institutions are unsustainable and leave very little behind at the end of the project. The NGOs are most effective in programmes which require a good out-reach and community participation.

USAID has used all three models in Pakistan. It has been most successful in the social sectors by using the line agencies as the implementing agency but only after affecting a basic structural change in them. The PMU model has been effective for short-term gains but in most cases the PMU has left little behind. Women have benefitted more at a professional level by their inclusion in the PMU and NGO structure rather than within the line departments. Within government line agencies, the recruitment of women is undertaken for specialised WID activities only and women are marginalized and kept from playing a role in the mainstream work of the departments. The exception is the inclusion of women in the Education Department where women are recruited as teachers on equivalent pay scales as men.

At the institutional level, USAID's direct financing of the NGO movement in Pakistan has helped create an alternative institutional model which has direct access to women at the village level. USAID has done this primarily by financing NGO programmes like the Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (SRSC), the Trust for Voluntary organizations (TVO) and a host of smaller NGOs in the Punjab. The GOP has undertaken a key role in supporting the NGO movement in Pakistan and has recently launched a nationwide NGO called the National Rural Support Programme. USAID's support of the NGO movement was a front runner to eliciting government's support for this parallel institutional mechanism at the village level.

Lessons are not as clearly identifiable under the Project Design and Implementation Fund (PDIF) in the NGO sector as the projects have recently been completed. Impacts under the Human Rights Fund are more discernable. The Trust for Volunteer Organization (TVO) has received limited feed back from the projects it funds, most of which are not very mature yet. Majority of the projects monitored by TVO are directed towards women. The women's projects are at various stages of completion. However, most of these projects were designed to provide a specific service for women and were not meant to be far reaching in their impact. Projects which have pursued a more dynamic approach which stresses strategic contacts with the community have been more effective than those who have used a door-to-door sales person approach.

3.4 Project Specific Lessons

3.4.1 Agriculture, Forestry & Area Development

In the agriculture, forestry and area development projects, sustainability issues were key for the success of the projects. Issues of institutional sustainability were more critical than other aspects of sustainability. Activities which develop the institutional capacity within the government line departments and at the village level are critical in building local capacity for continuing these projects upon termination of the project. A model for collaboration with line agencies for all projects planning to work with line departments is therefore, essential.

None of the projects in this sector have been able to develop an institutional model for development at the village level or an institution at the grass-roots level which can undertake the work at the end of project activities. Some projects are experimenting with non-governmental organizations to undertake this task but an overall concept and model of village level organization and development is missing from most of these projects. It is essential to have an institutional model for village level development for all projects which are planning to work at the village level with community groups.

Most of the agriculture and forestry projects did not consider the sustainability of the benefit stream of project activities. As such, the benefits in terms of increased productivity or increased income levels were short-lived. Without the support of the project, the activities could not be continued and the increase in income levels were abruptly terminated. It is essential to institute processes which will be sustainable even after the project has withdrawn. As such the provision of subsidies or input supply mechanisms which cannot be sustained after the end of the project need to be reviewed very carefully and the rationale for their provision formulated clearly.

A diagnostic process for assessing the needs of the target community is essential for an effective programme. The process of appraisal needs to continue even after project implementation has started. Unfortunately, most projects have specific components determined prior to the start of the project. Although, the need for this is appreciated in terms of budget allocations and staff recruitment. It is important to leave some flexibility to accommodate the needs of the target group articulated during the process of implementation. At present, most project formulation exercises come to an end at the beginning of project implementation.

Within most sectors like livestock, agriculture and forestry, the role of women is better appreciated if an integrated approach to these sectors is adopted. For example, planning for women in the forestry sector can be better understood if the role of women in livestock management and rangeland use is recognized. Similarly, understanding crop-livestock interactions are key to planning for women in the agriculture sector. Thus the perspective for design and planning needs to be broadened even if the project is targeted at one specific sector.

Women are largely absent from the Government line departments which are dealing with these sectors. As such, it is important for donor funded projects targeted at women to first create an institutional capability for dealing with women and women's issues. This can be done by sensitizing male staff to gender issues, special issues regarding women and by recruitment and training of women in line agencies. As a result of several USAID funded projects, there is now a cadre of women trained in agriculture, forestry, livestock and other animal and crop sciences. This capability is critical for increasing the access of line departments to women farmers.

Institutional arrangements made for the implementation of projects are not self-sustaining and projects come to an end upon withdrawal of donor support. Support and commitment of local staff is crucial for the success of a women's program. Local male staff do not generally appreciate the implications of leaving women out of the development process. A major difficulty is in getting staff for women's projects. Most projects suffer due to lack of qualified

female staff. Identification of women for staffing should be one of the first priorities of projects.

3.4.2 Micro-enterprise Development

A supporting institutional structure is necessary for women to utilize their training skills for instructing other women. Many trainers who are not linked with institutions have not imparted training to any group. In the selection of trainers, a certain quota should be allocated for women who are linked with institutions rather than those undertaking the training in a personal capacity. This will ensure that the training includes women who have access to other women.

Experience shows that few women start a new enterprise after the enterprise training and that those currently involved with an enterprise are most likely to benefit by it. As such preference in these training courses should be given to women who are currently managing an enterprise. It is perhaps unrealistic to expect that women will initiate new enterprises as a consequence of the training.

Lack of appropriate training is one of the many constraints that enterprising women face in Pakistan. Among the most critical problems are the lack of access to and high transactions cost of formal credit, the high interest cost of informal credit, the poor linkages to factor markets and lack of access of women to market institutions and market information. Unfortunately training programmes are unable to impact any of these other critical constraints. These programmes would be more effective if they also improved women's access to credit sources and market information.

Micro-enterprise development for women has been pursued in Pakistan chiefly through Non-Governmental Organizations. These NGOs have been successful in formulating a model of organization at the enterprise level. It is recommended that in pursuing micro-enterprise development it would be far more meaningful to go through institutions and in particular, through NGOs. The access to individual women is difficult to achieve without a local institution with grass-roots contacts and local staff.

3.4.3 Social Sectors

USAID first strengthened the institutional capacity of the line agencies prior to undertaking any work in the social sectors. The linchpin of the multi-donor Social Action Programme (SAP) was the institutional capacity of the Education, Health & Public Health Engineering Department. This strengthening of the line agencies was made possible by the USAID Primary Education Development Programme. The Directorate of Primary Education in Balochistan and

NWFP was undertaken as a starting point of this project. An assessment of the capability of the line department for access to women and delivery of inputs designed for women is an essential starting point. If there is an organizational gap then restructuring should be done in consultation with government officials and local communities.

Most primary education programs have assumed that the community would be reluctant to participate in education programs for women due to social and religious considerations and teachers would be unavailable locally. The enrolment rate for women in primary schools achieved as a result of the PED has proved that this assumption is untenable, and that given the right incentive structure, both men and women are available locally for teaching in local level schools. For example, by waiving the science requirement under the Mobile Teachers Training Program (MTT), enrolment of females doubled in Balochistan.

An innovative grassroots approach to increasing girl's access to schooling which has proved effective in some rural areas has been the establishment of girl's primary schools by community members. These schools were later incorporated into the government's education system. An effective local level village education committee was formed for each school which consisted of the parents of the girls enrolled in the school. Women were specially encouraged to participate in these committees and share the responsibility of supervision. Teacher's performance is strictly monitored. It was found that proper training and monitoring was essential for field staff. However, assurance and trust in their efforts encouraged them to try innovative ideas with productive results. Mobile Teachers Training and Stay Home Teachers were two such ideas that worked. These efforts prove that proper planning in consultation with the community can lead to effective social sector programmes.

Several critical lessons are emerging as a result of health sector interventions of USAID and other donors. There is a divergence between the community's perception of health care and the implementing agencies: the community prefers curative health care and the implementing organization invariably emphasizes preventive health care. The community does not prefer preventive health care measures because there are costs associated with prevention. As a result, primary health care is rarely financed by the community. Due to the implementing agencies focus on primary health care, too much focus is given to the dissemination of information in health care problems. The issue is not always one of lack of information on health but lack of the ability to finance health care.

Within the health sector, one of the key issues is the technical strengthening of service delivery at the village level. Most health care programmes suffer from the low level of expertise of health personnel. As such, the community does not visit the Rural

Health Centres or the Basic Health Units established by the Government. USAID health programmes have developed a good outreach to the community for health delivery through the involvement of NGOs. The outreach of some of these NGOs has been very effective and USAID has given them enough room to progressively define their role in the health sector. As a result, neglected areas like nutrition improvement and growth monitoring activities have been undertaken through these bold initiatives. These programmes are also much more cost-effective than other government run programmes.

In most cases, the government has tried to replace the private sector in health care through donor funded programmes. USAID experience has demonstrated that it is important not to replace the private sector but to try and complement its activities. There are certain activities which the public sector is better able to undertake. These tasks include establishing a regulatory framework for the health sector, public health issues, immunization and management of infectious diseases, supply of medicines, training of personnel and establishing financing mechanisms for the health sector.

Largely through support provided by USAID, the GOP has undertaken several initiatives to reduce the population growth rate by trying to affect both the demand and supply of contraceptives. This effort has largely been undertaken through Non-Governmental Organizations with an effective outreach to the communities. The Contraceptive Prevalence Rates (CPR) achieved as a result demonstrate that the GOP's apprehensions regarding population planning programme were much too cautious. Experience in these programmes also suggests that there is an unmet and unexpressed demand for contraceptives which women are afraid to articulate due to social and religious taboos. Therefore, it is important to counter these religious and social arguments within the existing social and religious norms. In most cases, the support of men is vital to the programme. As such, men and women both need to be involved in family planning decisions.

A principal issue which arises with reference to the delivery of family planning services is the extent to which other services should be offered as part of a package in the project area. Services which are normally considered are maternal and child health, nutrition, hygiene, immunization, etc. This issue assumes special significance in family planning programmes in Pakistan due to the sensitive nature of family planning issues. It is felt that such a constellation of services could enhance the credibility of the project and field workers.

The high fertility rate in Pakistan is often attributed to the high infant mortality rate. As such, an effective strategy for influencing fertility behaviour is combining FP services with general services, particularly child health care services. However, the type and level of these ancillary services have to be

chosen very carefully due to their time and financial implications. This broad based approach to service delivery could prove ineffective if not backed up by a proper support infrastructure and adequate inputs. USAID has helped to integrate health sector programmes with population programmes. Prior to this, these programmes were implemented independently.

The private sector in Pakistan has played a key role in delivering health care, primary education, technology for rural water supply and supply of contraceptives. However, most development programmes do not give due recognition to the role of the private sector. As such, it is recommended that the role of the private sector be recognized in the delivery of social sector services. Initiatives by the private sector should be encouraged and also supported by the government. There is currently no system of financing health care at the village level. This is another activity which the government should provide incentives for the private sector to undertake.

3.4.4 Training Programmes

The training programmes which USAID has implemented in Pakistan demonstrate very clearly that the number of women who can avail of training opportunities both at home and abroad can be enhanced considerably if the procedures for selection encourage female participation, if course design is sensitive to the socio-economic constraints that women face in Pakistan, if the process of selection is fair, competitive and transparent and if there are sufficient incentives for women to attend the training in terms of promotions, increase in income and better career prospects. Targeting training programs to professions dominated by women is an effective way of increasing female participation.

Critical to successful processing of female applicants for training is the institution through which applications are filtered and the nature of the application process. Establishing close links with section officers in the government committed to the WID Agenda helps processing female trainees. A clear specification of the quota for men and women ensures the selection of women. In this context an implicit affirmative action program which gives clear preference to women is essential. Lowering standardized scores for female applicants is another effective way of encouraging women and bringing them at par with the level of other students.

The experience of USAID in Pakistan suggests that the financing agency is far more effective when it undertakes the responsibility for the advertisement of the scholarships and the selection of the candidates. The government line departments are not as successful in publishing or selecting appropriate female candidates. The information of the scholarships should be distributed to all government organizations and offices rather than centralizing the

information in one place. Additionally, women should be encouraged to contact the donors themselves to gain information.

To overcome constraints preventing women from going abroad, shorter courses should be offered and there should be more flexibility about taking families abroad if donors can effectively monitor participants abroad. The waiting period between selection and placement should also be reduced. This is important because the academic and career plans of women are subject to much more change and fluctuation than those of men.

4. STRATEGY FOR DISSEMINATION.

4.1 Overview

It is expected that the lessons which emerge from USAID's gender-related experience in Pakistan will be conveyed to two audiences: (i) organizations which will continue to carry out development activities in Pakistan including the donor community, NGO's within Pakistan and the Government of Pakistan; and (ii) development professionals in countries where women are restricted in the social and economic sphere and have low status. The strategy which is outlined here for dissemination is directed at development projects, donors, NGOs and the government.

It is suggested that the lessons should be disseminated by using existing institutional arrangements. This is considered from a practical standpoint in view of the fact that USAID has withdrawn economic and development support from Pakistan as a result of the Pressler Amendment and the future of its development assistance is unclear. As such, the existing institutional arrangements can be used effectively for sharing USAID's experience with other donors.

4.2 Dissemination to Donors

It is suggested that USAID use the INWID group for sharing its experiences with the donors. The INWID group is an informal association of representatives of multilateral and bilateral donor agencies. At present USAID is represented on the group by Ms. Kaneez Fatima. It is suggested that a copy of the findings be distributed to the group and each of the agencies working on WID related projects or programmes should be encouraged to incorporate the lessons highlighted in the report in the appraisal, design and implementation models of new and on-going programmes. USAID could suggest to the INWID group to add their own lessons and experiences in Pakistan to these findings. This will help to consolidate the findings of all donor agencies. It is important that these combined experiences be shared due to the lack of a consolidated institutional memory on WID issues.

The current membership of the INWID group is 25. It includes representatives of ILO, UNICEF, UNFPA, UNDP, the World Bank, ODA, ADB, GTZ, CIDA, EEC, JICA, NORAD, USAID and embassies with WID programmes. A complete list of the INWID group is given in the annexures. It is a source of inter-agency collaboration on women's issues. The group meets regularly on a monthly basis and exchanges information on issues of concern to women. The group has a rotating chair and secretariat chosen through mutual consensus of the members. Guest speakers are invited to speak on gender and WID issues. The INWID group also acts as an advisory body on women's issues in different sectors. The group has also received recognition from the Government of Pakistan and has worked closely

with it by commenting on its policy documentation and reviewing the draft of the women's section of the 8th five year plan.

4.3. Dissemination to GOP

At the policy level, there has been a divergence between the Government and the donor perceptions about priority sectors for women. Donors tend to follow a trend in providing development assistance. These trends may or may not correspond to local priorities. Donors in recent years have advocated greater spending in the social and environmental sectors. The WID initiative in Pakistan has come from the aid giving rather than the recipient countries. This basic fact guides the tone in the management, design and implementation of donor sponsored programmes by the government. Thus a first step in reconciling these two points of views is a sharing of past experiences and the lessons learnt as a result.

The GOP is not a monolith and, as a first step, it is important to identify the government institutions with whom these lessons should be shared. The experience of USAID points to the fact that apart from the very technically oriented line agencies like WAPDA, Irrigation, etc, these lessons need to be conveyed to all line departments. A Women's Cell was established in each Province within the Planning & Development Department. The role for dissemination of WID specific lessons should be coordinated by these cells. In addition, the Ministry of Women's Development should coordinate with other ministries at the Federal level. The GOP has increasingly used specialized committees for reviewing and defining broad policy parameters within specific sectors. Extensive use of Committees was undertaken by the previous government in the preparation of the Eight Five Year Plan. A special committee was constituted to deliberate on the issues critical for women. The current government undertakes the same tasks through the use of special task forces. USAID's WID experience should be shared with such committees and task forces to aid in better planning and design of policies for women.

4.4 Dissemination to NGOs

Non-Governmental Organizations are being increasingly used in Pakistan as an institution for development in Pakistan. This institutions is used both as an alternate to the government line agencies and in parallel to provide institutional and strategic support to government run programmes. As such, the NGO movement has gained considerable official and donor approval in Pakistan as a development institution. As such, it is important to involve NGOs in the process of sharing the combined lessons derived from donor experience.

There are several types of NGOs in Pakistan. These include large government and donor sponsored NGOs, WID related NGOs, social welfare NGOs and spontaneous community based neighbourhood or village level organizations. The NGOs with whom it is important to share these lessons because they are undertaking types of activities similar to USAID are the large NGOs and the NGOs specifically established for women. The other NGOs are more welfare oriented, lack a development focus and are run on an adhoc voluntary basis rather than professionally. As such, a more effective strategy will be to pursue the first two types of NGOs only.

Among the first category one can include the Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (Northern Areas), the Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (North-West Frontier Province), the Balochistan Rural Support Programme (Balochistan), the National Rural Support Programme and the Trust for Voluntary Organizations. These NGOs are well organized with effective monitoring and evaluation systems in place. It is relatively easy for these organizations to meet regularly and share their experiences. In many cases the NGOs have common members in their Board of Directors and they have established a good network of cooperation among themselves.

A host of WID specific NGOs were established primarily by women in response to the deteriorating situation of women in the country, the availability of donor funds and encouragement from the WID focused development strategies that emphasized WID components as an integral part of programmes in all sectors. It will be more difficult to share the experiences with these organizations as the WID NGOs are much more diverse in their specific interest in women, and have no system of collective meetings or information sharing. It would be best to target them at an individual level through sharing of printed material or by organizing a joint forum for them in which these experiences can be shared.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah, Tahira: North West Frontier Area Development Project. Women's Non-Formal Education Component. An Informal Assessment. July 1987. USAID.
- Academy for Educational Development, Development Support Training Project: Female Jefferson Fellows & Associates (1983-1992)_ Volume I&II.
- Bakhtiari, Quratulain, Uzma Anzar: Orientation Program for Community Education Promoters. September 1993. Society for Community Support for Primary Education, Balochistan.
- BEMIS Working Committee. Balochistan Education Management Information System. Statistical Profile of Balochistan Province. Report No. 1. Government Schools by grade and Gender. August 1992. BEMIS.
- DAI. Technical Proposal: Technical Assistance for the Implementation of the Kala Dhaka Component of the North West Frontier Area Development Project. May 1989. DAI. USAID.
- HRD. USAID: Purpose Level Monitoring System. Primary Education Development Project. March 1993. USAID.
- Khan, Shahida: Office Memorandum. WID Activities from May 25 to July 31, 1993. August 1993. KDADP. USAID.
- Mangum, Fred et al: Final Evaluation of Pakistan Food and Security Management Project and Mid-Term Evaluation of the Technical Assistance Component, Pakistan Agricultural Sector Support Program. July 10, 1991. Winrock International Institute for Agricultural Development and Development Assistance Corporation. USAID.
- Martin, Carol M: Pakistan: The Makran: Women can make a difference. A Report of Programming Strategies for Developing Women's Economic and Social Talents. December 1991. GENESYS. USAID.
- Odell, Malcolm J et al: North West Frontier Area Development Project. Evaluation Report. Volume 1 and 2. October 1990. Louis Berger International, Inc. USAID.
- Planning and Development Department, Government of NWFP: Social Action Program 1992-93 to 1994-95. (Operational Plan). September 1992. Government of NWFP.
- Saheed, Farida & Khawar Mumtaz: Women's Economic Participation in Pakistan: A Status Report. 1990. UNCIEF.

Saeed, Amera: *Structural Issues in Women's Development in Pakistan*. 1990. UNCIEF.

Sasson, Jean P. *Princess: A True Story of Life Behind the Veil in Saudi Arabia*. William & Morrow & Company, Inc., New York, 1992.

Scott, Richard B: *Technical Assistance Team (TAT) Work plan for Kala Dhaka Area Development Project May 1992 - August 1993*. July 1992. DAI. USAID.

Scott, Richard B: *Final Report of the Kala Dhaka Area Development Project, Pakistan*. August 1993. DAI. USAID.

Sherin, Nasim: *Office Memorandum. Micro-enterprise Training of Trainers Workshop for women in Lahore*. January 7, 1993. USAID.

Social Work Department. Peshawar University: *Assessment of Women's Non-formal Education Program in Gadoon Amazai*. September 1992. USAID

Society for Community Support for Primary Education, Balochistan: *List of Community Support Schools and Teachers, by Divisions*. August 1993. SCSPE.

UNCIEF: *Situation Analysis of Children & Women in Pakistan*. 1988. UNCIEF.

UNDP: *NGOs Working for Others: A Contribution to Human Development, Volume 1*. 1991. UNDP.

UNDP: *Balanced Development: An Approach for Social Action in Pakistan*. Islamabad 1992. UNDP

USAID: *USAID Pakistan: NWFP*. 1988. USAID.

Wear, Douglas et al: *Final Evaluation of the Pakistan Social Marketing of Contraceptives Project*. June 1993. DUAL. USAID.

1. AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT

1.1 Agriculture Extension

The programs formulated by USAID were non-traditional and very progressive in the roles which they defined for women. The agriculture extension activities were inconsistent with the existing workloads and division of labour. It appeared that these projects focused primarily on male farmers and the impact on women had been marginal. In most cases agricultural extension in the case of women was synonymous with kitchen gardening. In a few cases, agricultural extension was combined with the supply of agricultural inputs and a small training component. However, the supply of agricultural inputs was often at subsidized rates which distorted the true demand for these inputs and raised sustainability issues. Even where the traditional division of labour considerations were respected there was no discernible long term impact on women.

1.2 Forestry

In the forestry sector the Project Director of one of the USAID funded projects (Forestry Planning & Development Project) was instrumental in designing a program for women. Initially, the objectives for the women's component were unclear and it was only in the last two years that objectives were set for women in a systematic manner. This project has impacted women at two levels; one is through the employment and training of women in the forestry sector while the other is through operation of nurseries for income generation by rural women.

The training of women in forestry in Pakistan has been made possible due to the USAID scholarships offered to female trainees at the Pakistan Forest Institute (PFI). 34 women in 4 different groups have received this stipend. While 6 women have graduated, the majority are still under training. Of the graduates, 3 are currently employed in the forestry sector, one has left and the other two have re-enrolled for the master's program at PFI.

The project's biggest success has been in establishing an entry point for women in a totally male dominated sector. At present, one female graduate is employed by the project itself as a Monitoring & Evaluation officer while another is a lecturer at the PFI. Another female graduate from this batch has joined the Aga Khan Rural Support Program (AKRSP). As a result of the commendable work done by one of the female foresters in Taxilla, four women from the area, later enrolled at PFI as students. Several students have relatives serving in the forestry department, who have encouraged them to join PFI. The small number of females who have completed training in forestry have thus shown a great deal of incentive and potential in the sector for which they were considered unsuitable.

Keeping in view the past experiences, the absorption of female foresters may possibly be in the NGO or private rather than the public sector. The availability of trained women foresters has in the recent years enabled NGOs like the AKRSP to think of a more proactive role for women in this field. Prior to this there was no conception of female involvement in the sector both at the project or at the beneficiary level.

The project has succeeded in creating female foresters and a lobby in favour of female employment with the Provincial Forestry Department in the NWFP. The NWFP Forestry Department has also made the first move in involving communities in social forestry programs. The availability of trained women foresters in the province will be an invaluable asset to the Forestry Department in this respect.

A majority of the female students interviewed at the PFI felt confident that fields like education, research and extension can be handled successfully by them. A faculty member was of the opinion, that keeping in view the

family constraints, female foresters could be best accommodated in instruction of nursery technology such as that given by FPDP, irrigated plantations and research and training. The majority of female students at PFI are from the Punjab. The Punjab Forestry Research Institute can also be a potential employer of women. Training is also imparted to the students in hydrology and watershed management which broadens the scope of employment for them. Female students themselves were in favour of stationary jobs, owing to the cultural and religious barriers. The courses offered to the women at PFI also focus on social rather than field forestry. The students interviewed were of the opinion that inclusion of women is essential in social forestry programs as they can play a vital role in the instruction of women. They can be involved in extension services, technical assistance and forestry motivation.

The most important issue is of the sustainability of the effort to train women in this field. The admission of women in the coming year is not expected to take place as the stipends for women have been discontinued due to the termination of USAID under the Pressler Amendment. The scholarships given to female students at the Bachelor of Science (BSc.) level are also not expected to continue for the Master's program. Since there is no job security, the girls are reluctant to continue through self financing. Preference is not given to girls with Bsc. in Forestry for admission in the Masters program at PFI. The BSc. degree in forestry places these girls at a disadvantage in applying for masters programs in other fields and institutions as they lack the necessary background since their training is primarily in forestry. A mere bachelors degree holder is also not able to compete in the job market.

At the grass root level, the project succeeded in motivating not only men but also women to operate nurseries. Nurseries were managed by women in Taxilla at the time when a female sub-divisional forest officer was employed by the project staff to impart nursery technology. Seven women raised nurseries independently. In addition to this, 11 women were provided free seedling and 4 with graftings and cuttings. None of these women have continued with the nurseries. The reason given for this discontinuation is the lack of female trainers and motivator after the only female forest officer stopped working in her capacity as trainer. Some male farmers on the other hand have expanded their enterprise and successfully sold to the private sector. The success of these male farmers as opposed to women is attributed to the fact that male trainers training men have been in the field much longer than female trainers training women. The female trainer in Taxilla worked for a duration of only one and a half years.

Women nursery operators also encountered opposition from the men who could not understand why women and not men were being approached for this enterprise. While it was socially acceptable for women in Taxilla to do agricultural field work, raising nurseries was met with some resistance as it was a new enterprise. Women nursery operators were also discouraged by the forest officers who felt that it was "not a woman's job". Women however successfully operated nurseries under the supervision of a female forester, although on a much smaller scale than men. The reason for this was that women could not manage large nurseries along with their household work. Unlike men, women could not invest 8 -10 hours of the day in this pursuit. Since the returns took a year, women were also not willing to invest large sums of money.

Some of the specific problems faced by women which led to discontinuation of the nurseries included:

- . lack of access to the market
- . lack of access to inputs (seedlings, polythene bags, fertilizers, etc)
- . inability to hire or arrange labour to assist in nursery raising
- . time constraint as they were responsible for household chores as well.

The income which could be generated from even small scale nursery operations was substantial. In general, female motivation for the involvement of women on a larger scale in nursery operations was lacking. Female involvement in this field proves that it can yield positive results for women but results vary on the basis of the level of dedication on the part of the operator and the time spent in motivation and encouragement of women in a field not traditionally managed by them.

1.3 Area Development

A major contribution of the area development projects initiated by USAID in the North West Frontier Province is the strengthening of line departments to undertake activities for women and to sensitize the men for development planning and implementation for women. This is an important beginning in a country where women are largely absent from these departments. This has not been achieved easily. A combination of innovative approaches was used to achieve this in some of the most conservative and traditional areas in Pakistan. These approaches included following a very gradual approach, sensitivity to the concerns of both men and women, hiring special staff for women and initiating new activities for women within the traditionally described sphere to enhance their productivity and income levels.

One of the special implementation strategies devised in most of the area development programs was to establish credibility with the men and gain their support prior to initiating any project activities for women. The scope of these programs was gradually expanded to include a programme of social organization, rural savings, nursery development, kitchen gardening and sale of saplings. Women's work groups were formed to work in common village based income generating opportunities. The response of the women to these programs was very encouraging as women wanted to earn additional income and save for the future.

In most area development programs in Pakistan, the women's program was mainly managed through the project staff and not through line agencies. This is true of the area development projects in Gadoon Amazai, Kala Dhaka, and the Tribal Areas. There are both negative and positive aspects to this. The positive side is that decision making is rapid and the program is flexible. The disadvantage is that there are no institutional links established, and the line departments never assume responsibility for the program. Therefore, once the project funding is withdrawn, the women's program comes to a virtual halt. There is need to establish some sustainable institutional arrangements in order to circumvent this problem. Mindful of some of these issues, USAID had initiated a process of establishing Non-Governmental Organizations at the local level to oversee the implementation of some project activities.

The Gadoon Amazai project has had a positive impact on women in terms of the literacy levels and primary school enrolment for girls in the project area. At the beginning of the project, there was practically no female education facilities in the whole project region. Schools existed, but only on paper. The reason was that the appointed teachers were not from the area, and therefore were reluctant to come to this remote rural area to serve. There was no special incentive system to attract teachers to these remote schools. The irregularity of teacher's attendance adversely affected the interest of local population in female education.

The Gadoon Amazai project started the Non-Formal Education (NFE) program in 1986. The program consisted of skill acquisition and adult literacy. At that time the project faced a major constraint of non-availability of local female teachers. A long term objective of the NFE project was to train teachers from the local female population. With the introduction of NFE centres women were given an opportunity to get together to discuss their problems and assess their needs. They were also provided training to improve skills in traditional crafts. On the other hand young women got the opportunity to be formally educated through adult literacy training. Some of these women went on and completed their middle standard exam under the formal education system. Some of these women themselves became teachers at the NFE centres. Key to the success of the NFE centres were the WID specialists & the training staff without their constant efforts this was not possible. The NFE program has not only provided formal educational opportunities, but has given older women an opportunity to learn new skills. The aim was to accrue additional income. However, this has not been extremely successful as market linkages for the goods these women produce have not been effectively created.

In a village of Swabi district, with the only girls high school in the region, about 20 girls completed their Matriculation: out of these 16 received Primary Teachers Course (PTC) training and were employed by the government in different schools in this project area. This was a considerable achievement as, at the beginning of the NFE project, one of the major constraints was non-availability of locally trained/educated teachers. USAID, with the help of the community, has opened one girls high schools, two middle schools and three primary schools

in the project area. All six schools have now been handed over to the Government Education Department. This achievement is a positive step towards self sufficiency and self reliance in the area of female education.

Implementing the NFE project has not been easy for the WID staff. Most of the tribes/clans inhabiting this area are very traditional and conservative in their lifestyles, and their women observe strict purdah and seclusion. Because of this WID staff have had a hard time making contact with village women and gathering them at the NFE centres. The project staff also had difficulty in getting to the women from these villages because of the lack of proper roads and inaccessibility of these villages.

Under the Kala Dhaka Area Development Project several activities were started for women, including a highly successful poultry distribution project. Other activities were: kitchen garden improvement; social forestry; livestock and poultry development; midwife training; free mobile clinics; and formation of education committees for local supervision of girls formal education. Initially the women were not very receptive to the program. However, acceptance was gained gradually. It was generally found that if the men are convinced then the women are keen to start the project.

Although there was virtually no mention of WID activities in the Project Paper, the response of the Kala Dhaka communities, both men and women, to the WID activities was positive. Credit goes to the women field workers who put this program in the field under trying conditions, discussing the activities and their potential with the women and adjusting the timing of the activities to suit the women's schedules. The key to acceptance of the project was acceptance of the women field workers. These field workers emphasized the importance of 'becoming one' with the beneficiaries. It is important for the women of the community to accept these women as their equals rather than as outside development workers.

Village women had learned kitchen gardening methods and are growing a much larger variety of vegetables and fruits introduced by the USAID. With the introduction of the new poultry varieties there was an addition in eggs and poultry produce in the village. The women of this village used this additional produce as a form of exchange for other goods. They also started marketing this produce through the local village produce shop. These women have a new sense of independence. Now their concern is the inaccessibility of the main market of Darband, where this additional produce could be sold on better profits. Passage by boat is possible only when the river is in high flow which happens only three to four months of summer. Rest of the eight months the only passage out of this village is by narrow mountainside paths.

The Kala Dhaka region is a Provincially Administered Tribal Area and is not designated as a settled area. Due to the general perception of the lack of law and order in such areas, women from outside are weary of taking up jobs here. Therefore recruitment of female field officers and other female staff is a constraint to the broader implementation of projects.

Prior to the establishment of KDADP there were no functioning primary school for girls due to lack of female teachers. However, due to the constant efforts of the KDADP WID specialist, 8 female teachers were appointed by the Education Ministry to establish 4 schools. The project staff would pressurize the government to send teachers to the area. However, even the government could not force female teachers to go to these isolated areas. The teachers that did come to the project area did so because of some innovative planning by the KDADP staff. One such method was hiring a brother and sister team in the area so that they could share lodgings and the teacher could have 'male protection'. At present, 2 schools are functioning with 56 enrolled female students. However, there are still empty school buildings designated for primary girls schools with a greater number of girls who would like to attend school. Therefore, the USAID staff have had only a limited impact on primary female education in the project area.

In other sectors, USAID had set a trend by organizing mobile health clinics. In a village of Hasan Zai tribal area a political party interested in gaining majority vote in this region had arranged for a free mobile eye clinic.

following the USAID's example. The villagers specially women had demanded this. The awareness of these possibilities was the key to mobilization of available resources. The beneficiaries were clearly women, who would be reluctant to leave household responsibilities and go to a town hospital for treatment, let alone checkups.

Overall the direct impact of these programs on women has been limited due to the adhoc nature of the activities and the focus on inputs rather than long-term impact. Due to local sensitivities about the participation of women, these projects adhered to the traditional gender division of labour. They assisted women with the supply of inputs, access to marketing outlets and encouraging them to undertake village level marketing. However, for the future, when a greater marketing effort is required, women will need to redefine some of their traditional tasks.

1.4 Private Enterprise Development Project

The Entrepreneurship and Career Institute (ECI), under the Private Investment Expansion Project, has received approximately 70% of its funds from USAID in 1992-93. The funds received by ECI are reflective of the recognition given by USAID to the informal sector, as a major source of employment and value added. Since the microenterprise sector consists primarily of family-based enterprises, women play a very significant role in it. The informal sector is also not well linked into the existing institutional network for credit, training or input supply. ECI has in this respect marked a change in policy and is geared towards the improvement of those producers whose contribution is crucial yet not formally recognized.

In the 3 workshops funded by USAID in 1992-93, 75-80 master trainers received training and trained 90 women at the grass root level. The goal of the Training of Trainers Program (TOT) was to help assist participating NGOs to develop in-house training capability to further their efforts to assist women in businesses. The existing evidence suggests that the building of training capacity has essentially depended on two factors. Primarily, NGOs whose first priority are women's issues have been much more committed to providing training opportunities for women. NGOs whose agendas are divided, however, have placed less emphasis on providing this type of training. Secondly, NGOs have faced budgetary constraints which have prevented them from providing this kind of training. Some women trainers are training with ECI and other groups. Trainers who are not linked with institutions have not imparted training to any group. This indicates that a supporting institutional structure is necessary for women to utilize their training skills for instructing other women. Of the total participants met, over half are presently conducting training.

Under the TOT program, trainers beside acquiring the theoretical background, had an opportunity to train women at the grass-root level. As of this point, many of these women at the grass-root level, are involved in their own businesses and indicate that the training has helped them augment their incomes. The success is greatly reflective of these women's need to work. Additionally, what has been useful is the support system set up by ECI which includes a resource centre where advice is always available. Those women who have dropped out have done so because of family pressure and an inability to go out of the house. The training however has not encouraged women to enter new fields but rather encouraged them to pursue enterprises in sectors traditionally managed by women such as sewing, embroidery & cooking.

2. SOCIAL SECTORS

2.1 Overview

The Social Action Plan (SAP) with its emphasis on female education, health, population planning and water supply is currently being developed with donor assistance. The SAP is particularly important from the standpoint of women. The GOP has for the first time accepted the need to invest in these sectors and to implement these programs through grass-roots organizations at the village level. The Government is only just beginning to appreciate the necessity of investing in the social sectors and the private productive sectors. These factors are likely to usher in dynamic forces which will change the situation of women out of necessity, if not out of choice.

USAID has perhaps made its greatest impact on women through its policy initiatives within the social sectors in recent years. This was assisted by the realization within the bureaucracy that investments in the social sectors had become imperative for overall economic and social development in the country. The initiation of the multi-donor funded Social Action Program has assisted in reaffirming some of the policy guidelines that were laid down in USAID funded projects regarding women's enrolment in schools, incentives for female teachers, establishment of girls schools, provision of basic health facilities for women and the delivery of family planning services through health outlets.

Within the social sectors, the greatest impact has been in the area of primary education for girls. There is a growing conviction that the greatest long-term impact on women is through investments in the education sector. This is due to the fact that literacy has an impact on both fertility rates and health status. The emphasis on opening primary schools for girls was led by the USAID Primary Education program in NWFP and Baluchistan. Health programs were established by USAID but health services require an on-going investment in the quality of services and proper back-up and supply services. This is difficult to achieve in a country where overall investment in health infrastructure is limited, health personnel are unavailable in rural areas, and para-medical staff are inadequately trained. USAID was a major donor to the small efforts at population planning in Pakistan. There is evidence that the improved delivery and marketing of contraceptives has had an appreciable effect on contraceptive prevalence rates in both the urban and rural areas of the country.

2.2 Primary Education

The single most significant impact of USAID funded projects on women is in the primary education program in Pakistan. Most primary education programs have assumed that the community would be reluctant to participate in education programs for women due to social and religious considerations and teachers would be unavailable locally. The enrolment rate for women in primary schools has proved that this assumption is untenable and that, given the right incentive structure, both men and women are available locally for teaching in local level schools. For example, by waiving the science requirement under the Mobile Teachers Training Program (MTT), enrolment of females doubled in Baluchistan.

The rationale of PED's strategy of supporting WID activities is straightforward and explicit. Rather than simply transferring resources, the project directs its effort in such a way as to develop institutional strengths in both the public and private sector. The PED Program is one of the most comprehensive in primary education with respect to WID activities. The program was designed to directly address the low levels of enrolment of female children in Baluchistan and NWFP provinces.

Institutional development has been successful in terms of establishing a Directorate for Primary Education with a new structure to provide women access to positions in management and decision making. In both provinces key management positions have been reserved for female staff to bring more women into policy making roles.

In 1989 it was generally thought that rural people did not want to send their girl children to school. This was the time when the PED staff were in the process of setting up the PED program in Baluchistan. They were also told to expect strong resistance by rural population towards female primary education. These thoughts were also shared by senior civil servants at that time. One of them asked the question "why bother?".

During 1989 the Human Resource Survey (HRS) was initiated. This survey was conducted to identify the location and number of villages that did not have a girls' school, to assess the attitudes of village leaders and the families towards the education of females, and to identify someone who will donate land for a school. The striking result was that well over 50% of the population wanted female education. Some of them were already sending their daughters to local boys' schools. Other important information was that young girls with matriculation qualifications were available in some of these villages who could be trained to be primary school teachers.

The human resource survey asked questions based on female observations and experience which proved critical to breaking the myth that parents and leaders did not want their girls to attend school. At the village community level, women were able to reach other women to effectively organize community school programs in ways that would have been extremely difficult, if not impossible for men. As the survey showed, people were not averse to sending girls and boys to the same school. Therefore, USAID's Primary Education Development (PED) program has been successful in opening co-educational primary schools in NWFP and Baluchistan. This has been achieved simply by classifying such schools as 'primary schools' rather than designating them by gender. In other words, the community and parents accepted the idea of co-educational schools as long as the schools gave a gender neutral outlook.

In the years since the program was initiated, enrolment for girls has increased in Baluchistan from 73,000 in 1989-90 to 101,000 in 1992-93 and during this time the ratio of boys to girls has shifted from 5.2:1 to 3.6:1. In NWFP, female enrolments have increased from 389,000 to 508,000, which slightly exceeded the targeted enrolment figure of 507,374 for the same period. Even more significant is that enrolment was largely increased in the rural areas. Before 1990 when PED began, the female enrolment was almost exclusively (over 75%) within Quetta. The 1992 data indicate that the percentage of girls in primary education outside of Quetta is now almost 50% of the total.

Teachers training courses have been successful in contributing to substantial increases in the number of teachers trained, especially in the rural and far flung areas. In general the need for more trained female teachers is due to limited training programs. In NWFP, 3,000 females will be needed to staff the 1,500 new primary schools that will be built as part of the Social Action Plan. Recruiting women teachers to serve in the rural areas is difficult.

An innovative community participation approach to increasing girls' access to schooling which may prove more effective in some rural areas has been the establishment of girls' primary schools by community members which later become sanctioned by the PED Directorate. Sustainability of these schools occur in the sense that the GOP is willing to incorporate these schools within the primary education system at the provincial level. Village education committees are formed which consist of the parents of the girl children going to the village school. The program promoters are encouraging women to participate in these committees and share the responsibility of supervision of these school. The promoters evaluate the progress and interest of the teachers. Teachers not taking active interest in the education of children in their schools have been replaced by other teachers most preferably based in the same village. This is to ensure appropriate selection and progress of schools.

To guarantee increased access in the rural areas, at least 60% of the new schools are built for girls. The outcome of PED in Baluchistan has been a 23% increase in the number of female schools sanctioned since the start of the program. An additional 120 female schools per year for 1992-93 and 1994-95 are planned for villages under the community support program. Ninety six female schools sanctioned this spring are included, the increase is 41% since 1989-90 and growing at a steady rate. All 240 schools are rural staffed by a local female teacher trained under the MTT Program. Increasing educational access for girls has been approached with a view that primary schools must be provided within a safe and comfortable walking distance for young girls, in safe and easy accessible locations, with boundary walls, toilets and potable water.

The instructional materials cells of the PED program have been very effective in terms of development and production of materials for increasing participatory teaching methods that are locally appropriate for all children. The newly developed materials use gender sensitive language, and visual representations.

Comparatively, the PED program has been much more successful in Baluchistan. Critical for this has been the NGO, The Society for Community Support for Primary Education, which forms partnership between Government and people. This donor-initiated NGO has been critical for developing a rapport between the people and the bureaucracy. The NWFP NGO, Frontier Education Foundation, has not been so successful. Part of the problem has been the NWFP clings strongly to the traditional educational system set up under colonial times and the bureaucracy is not so flexible about these innovative schooling institutions. Additionally the Quetta NGO has had a larger involvement of women in its decision-making process. This involvement has played a critical role in how these women have approached communities and the women of these communities. The Society also places special emphasis on character building of the field staff as the success of the whole program depends on the constant effort by the field based program monitors.

PED has initiated and implemented a program which has shown success in the attempt to increase female participation rates in all areas of the primary education system. The participation rate for women is considerably higher in Baluchistan than in NWFP. Perhaps this is due to cultural differences between the two provinces, as observed, a large number of women are now visible in the PED offices and in the field in Baluchistan compared to NWFP. Though the numbers indicate that both provinces are seeing strong gains in primary school female participation rates, Baluchistan has come from much farther behind. The reason for the rapid gains lies in the participation rates of women in the field through programs such as mobile teachers training and community education which focused on reaching women directly. It is too soon to know, but perhaps the sustainability of the program can be measured by the extent to which the gender gap is closed in all areas of policy making, planning, materials development, financial support, and teacher training.

2.3 Health

USAID undertook several initiatives in the health sector including the Primary Health Care (PHC) Project and the Pakistan Child Survival Project (PCSP). Under the PHC, local (Baluchi) female Medical Technicians (MTs) were recruited and trained for the first time in the history of the province. Prior to that, all female para-medical staff in Baluchistan were recruited from Punjab, who served in the province for a minimum period of three years (under bond). Under the Pakistan Child Survival Project, USAID focused its efforts towards training of medical officers and paramedical staff in integrated child survival and in health management information system. The major effort was towards involving female staff in these trainings. Similarly, efforts were made to get female counterparts, and finally the Baluchistan Government provided a female counterpart. The PCSP developed and implemented an interpersonal communication model in order to enable the female medical officers to effectively communicate with the mothers, educating them about the available Mother and Child Health facilities. However, the impact of these projects on women has been uncertain.

2.4 Population Planning

In the population sector, 92% of all the money in the sector was invested by USAID. Thus USAID had a relatively large investment in the sector. The USAID-funded program of social marketing of contraceptives through the NGOCC has assisted in increasing the CPR rate in both rural and urban areas. The evaluation of the projects suggest that the differential in the before and after CPR rates vary between 6% to 30% in rural areas and from 12% to above 40% in urban areas. According to the 1990-91 Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey, condom usage has increased from 2.1% in 1984-85 to 3.2% in 1990-91. The increase in condom usage has been attributed to the active social marketing of this method. In summary, the SMC Project has achieved its objectives. Contraceptive use in Pakistan has increased from 9% in 1984-85 to 14% in 1990-91, with condom use increasing from 2.1% to 3.2%

in the same period.

The SMC Project has made a number of substantial contributions toward furthering family planning objectives in Pakistan: the condom has been desensitized on a national basis; the name of the project condom, "Sathi", has become a generic term for a condom; there is wide recognition of the Sathi logo and its orange colour; Sathi is now distributed nationally in both urban and semi-urban areas; and Sathi has reached a significant sales volume. No other low-priced condom exists in the marketplace in Pakistan.

The original purpose of the SMC was to increase contraceptive use by promoting family planning and expanding the availability of contraceptives through the private sector to complement the efforts of the public sector program. In 1990, USAID officially incorporated a secondary objective of improving the sustainability of project activities.

The beneficiaries under the SMC project have been mainly urban and semi-urban working class men and their wives. According to one of the research studies done which intercepted condom purchases, about 3 out of 4 of those interviewed had monthly household incomes of Rs. 4,000 or less. The other research studies and discussions over the years with retailers have indicated that Sathi does appeal to a reasonable cross-section of the population, including those with limited discretionary income.

One of the direct benefits of increased contraceptive use is the improved well-being of women and children. Improved child spacing and limiting births decreases infant and child mortality. Also, fewer pregnancies benefit women by decreasing maternal morbidity and mortality.

3. TRAINING

3.1 Overview

The training program under USAID was composed of three broad components. The Development Support Training Program (DSTP) spearheaded two of the components, DSTP Foreign Training for the public and private sector and the local in-country training under the Management Training Unit (MTU). Additional training opportunities for women were provided under the Agriculture Sector Support Program (ASSP). In an environment where there previously were very few opportunities for female training, the whole composite of USAID training programs opened up many opportunities for women. USAID approach was both innovative and flexible. It initiated the Private Sector Scholarship Program solely to maximize the number of training opportunities for women. Also, USAID was extremely flexible with respect to broadening its mandate under MTU to incorporate the WID program and initiating the first entrepreneurial development program for women. Programs were also targeted to professions where women were likely to be dominated, an implicit affirmative action was pursued where women always considered before men and measures were constantly taken to undermine the GOP's position that few women were interested in training.

Success rates were limited because of the limitations of project design and because of constraints faced by women in Pakistan. With regards to project design, USAID was confined to using the GOP to filter its public sector program which curtailed the success of the program. Also USAID did not follow an integrated project approach with respect to its projects. USAID failed to support the complete cycle of activities needed for creating self sufficiency. Constraints facing women also curtailed their ability to avail the opportunities available for training. Women were not as able to manipulate the machinery of bureaucracy in order to access information about scholarships. Also, family obligations and socio-cultural factors limited the women's ability to take advantage of training opportunities.

3.2 DSTP Foreign Training

As of May 1993, 471 women had completed training under DSTP. However, these numbers are constantly being updated as participants return to Pakistan every day. One hundred and ninety of these women were trained under the Private Sector Scholarship Program and 281 were trained under the Public Sector Scholarship Program. In percentage terms, out of the total number of individuals trained under DSTP, 7% were women; under the Public Sector Program, 5% were women and under the Private Sector Program, 31% were women. The Private Sector Program was much more successful in sending women for training considering its relatively small budget and the shorter tenure of the program.¹

DSTP foreign training has given a group of women an opportunity to study abroad which they would not have had otherwise. Most women at the focus groups conducted stated that the experience was eye opening & confidence building. The opinion of the actual training programs however was mixed; some women felt that the training was very appropriate, while many felt the courses were not what they had asked for and were irrelevant for the Pakistani context. All women agreed that the experience broadened their horizon and gave them more confidence, particularly as they are taken more seriously upon completing the DSTP foreign training. Women felt more confident about negotiating and dealing in the business and government environment, entering new fields and negotiating their terms of employment. The training has given women access to new job opportunities. However, women did not feel that training correlated with promotions.

¹ Out of the total DSTP budget, 90% was allocated to the Public Sector Scholarship Program while 10% was utilized for the Private Sector Scholarship Program. Moreover, the Public Sector Program began in 1983-84 compared to the Private Sector Program which began in 1985-1986. Under the Private Sector Program only three batches of women were sent on training abroad.

The Public Sector Scholarships Program: The Public Sector Scholarship Program faced many obstacles and yet was still successful in processing female applicants. Perhaps the greatest constraint to female applicants from this sector has been the bureaucracy itself. The Public Sector Program is filtered through government institutions² which are well known for their hierarchical structure, rules, corruption and nepotism. Women were not as successful as men in manipulating such a system to their own advantage.

Women interviewed in the public sector focus groups indicated that men were more successful in getting scholarships for the following reasons:

- o men have greater knowledge about scholarships due to their greater mobility, larger network of friends and colleagues and greater confidence and aggressiveness;³
- o men were more easily able to do small things for people of influence in order to curry favour and consequently have an easier time getting nominated; and
- o the majority of the senior posts are filled by men who tend to nominate other men because they believe there is a greater return in investment as men will return to work while women may give up their careers due to marriage, family obligations, etc.

The small number of women in the government sector, particularly at the senior levels, also limits the percentage of women who can go for training. Moreover, many of these women were not able to avail the training opportunities as they were constrained by socio-cultural factors as well as their inability to successfully make it through the application process.

USAID targeted training to professions dominated by women like health and education. One such program was the Lactation Management Program, in which a teams of gynaecologists, pediatricians and nurses were sent for training. Other programs targeted teachers and administrators of schools for training

USAID also had an implicit affirmative action program. For instance, DSTP staff always took alternative candidates if these candidates were women. Lower TOEFL scores were accepted for these women and very few women nominees from the public sector were rejected. USAID staff also constantly negotiated with the GOP to increase the number of women applicants from the public sector. The GOP's standard response was that few women were interested in such scholarships.

In an attempt to counter the GOP arguments, USAID staff publicized their scholarships under a 'Scholarship for Women' advertisement in 1985. The advertisement was made deliberately vague with respect to who the scholarships were targeting in order to assess the level of interest in training in various sectors. The response was phenomenal and many women from the public sector applied. USAID however was not able to process the applications as these women had not been officially nominated by the government. However, these letters of interest were shown to the GOP to highlight that women in the public sector were interested in training abroad. This advertisement not only forced the GOP to forward more female applicants but also made women in the public sector aware that such scholarships existed. The existence of a female section officer at EAD, committed to the WID

²The nomination process starts with the parent department in the province where the supervisor forwards a name to the concerned provincial ministry. From there it is forwarded to the concerned provincial Planning and Development Unit from where it is forwarded to the Economic Affairs Division in Islamabad. The Final acceptance list is forwarded to USAID.

³An interesting point to note is that the largest number of female participants from the government sector come from Ministry of Planning & Development, the ministry in which the listing of scholarships is kept and processed. Women from these ministries did indicate that it was not difficult to access the scholarship information as the information was kept in their building and they usually knew the section officer responsible.

agenda also helped publicize the women's scholarships. Nargis Sethi, The EAD Officer, actively encouraged women and disbursed information about the scholarship frequently. Although women's scholarships had existed from the inception of DSTP, women in the public sector became more aware of them during this period.

The Private Sector Scholarship Program: The 'Scholarship for Women' advertisement also led to the most significant gender intervention on the part of USAID which was the Private Sector Scholarship Program for women. It became evident from the applications that there were many women in the private sector who were interested in foreign training. Consequently, the Private Sector Scholarship was set up only for women but later grew to include men. The structure of the application process was set up in such a way that it made it easier for women to apply; information was accessible to all through advertisements, the nomination process was eliminated, a competitive application process was set up and USAID institutionalized the program in such a way that it gained majority control of the project, marginalizing the government.

Factors Which Facilitated Access to Scholarships: Besides the nomination process, the obstacles which these women faced in gaining scholarships were relatively few. Most female trainees, screened out by the language requirement, were individuals who came from middle to upper class families. Consequently, the training program supported a group of women who were relatively not as constrained by society as other women from different socio-economic groups.

Women participants did however feel that they were implicitly discriminated against as men were not constrained by their families when going abroad, but women were. Some women claimed societal pressures were such, that they could not leave their families behind. Therefore, these women, through private means, arranged to take their families abroad with them. Short courses, therefore, were preferred as it was a shorter time commitment.⁴ Although getting leave from their place of employment was not a problem, women in the public sector did worry that upon returning they would be posted to different cities and would lose out on their previous housing arrangements. This was often a constraint. Furthermore, the long waiting period between getting the scholarship and actual placement, made planning very difficult for women. Many women could not avail of the scholarship because their circumstances changed during the wait; some had married, others had families, while some had made commitments to their places of work. Employers were not sympathetic to the long gap between the acceptance and placement and would force employees to make a commitment to employment or the scholarship.

The factor which most facilitated these women going abroad was a strong educational and language background. Another important factor was family support which facilitated arrangements for the child minding when the applicant was abroad. Families were more supportive in the case of working women, particularly those who had been working for more than two years. Persistence on the part of the applicant was very important as the process was long and bureaucratic. Many participants travelled to Islamabad from various cities to follow through on their applications.⁵

3.3 Management Training Unit

The Management Training Unit's original mandate was to improve managerial skills in the public and private sector through in-country training. The program was composed of four units: Domestic Management Training Initiative (DMTI), the Training of Trainers (TOT), Women in Development (WID) & the Private Enterprise Training Initiative (PETI). The WID unit provided entrepreneurial development training, management training and TOT programs to women. However, women were allowed to participate in other programs offered under DMTI, TOT and PETI.

⁴ Short term courses are also preferred as there are no TOEFL and other standardized test requirements

⁵ MTU participants shared that they were not able to pursue their applications for training abroad as they did not have the finances to travel to Islamabad nor relatives to put them up.

The MTU WID program is the classic example of USAID's flexibility in taking up new opportunities. The WID program, as such was not part of the original mandate of MTU. Rather, it accidentally evolved from a initiative taken by The Association of Business, Professional and Agricultural Women (ABP&AW) who suggested to USAID that a management course be held for women. The demand for more courses resulted in the WID unit. It was under this unit that the first course for female entrepreneurial development was initiated in Pakistan. This evolutionary program has successfully produced a cadre of trainers for entrepreneurship and management training. With regards to producing female entrepreneurs, the program has been less successful. The behind this is that USAID failed to take a integrated approach to project planning which would have recognized that training was only one component of female entrepreneurship.

It became evident in the focus group, that very few women had started businesses after training. The women with existing businesses did however expand their businesses. Also women from business families were more successful in opening a business. All participants were very positive and motivated about the course. They also stated that they had taken many things away from the training including confidence and self awareness. However, the general opinion was that 'they taught us to stand, but before we could walk they took away their hands'. The women felt that training was the first step in entrepreneurial development; what was needed next was intensive follow ups, centres where women could go for advice, financial help and help with finding selling points. Women also felt uncomfortable in a business environment laced with corruption. USAID realized that follow up was an important component of the project but were unable to effectively pursue follow up. Attempts were made to address the problems facing women in the business world in the training, but often the context of each woman's problem was different and consequently the training became of limited use.

A self selection process, similar to that of DSTP foreign training, also existed under MTU. In this case because the training was in English and women applicants had to have sufficient funds to invest in their businesses, a certain class of women were selected. In a few cases, this was very advantageous, particularly with reference to women who come from business backgrounds.

It was to address some of the before mentioned problems, that the WID TOT program was set up. According to the WID officer of MTU, Shehnaz Kappadia, 'We felt that the courses would always be for a certain class who had access to English unless we trained our own trainers'. Therefore a training program for trainers was set up and the first trainers entered the program in 1987. The program was for three years and the trainees trained by attending and conducting workshops with trainers from abroad.

Today almost all woman involved in entrepreneurial development training or management training, has some affiliation with the USAID MTU program. Either they were trained under the MTU program or they were trained by trainers trained under the MTU program. Approximately half of the women trained in the original group (1987) continue to train in the areas of entrepreneurial development and management. Some have given up training altogether while others use their training in other areas. The second batch (1990) of trainers never successfully completed their training because their training was interrupted by the Gulf War and the Pressler Amendment. Some women did continue to train under UNICEF which continues to fund some TOT and EDP programs.

Women who continue to train tend to be women who were able to take advantage of the training courses and training opportunities set up by the MTU program and other training programs set up by other donors. Although these opportunities were available for all, single women who were not constrained by family obligations were able to avail of these opportunities more frequently. Training courses were held in a range of cities in Pakistan and required a time commitment of two weeks about four or five times a year. Often such a time commitment was difficult for women with jobs and families. Therefore some women were not able to build up extensive training expertise. Some women also felt that the MTU program did not effectively & efficiently utilize the human resources created under the MTU program. To some, this was seen as a lack of confidence in the program.

The greatest legacy of the MTU program has been that it has institutionalized EDP & management training for women under the auspicious of two organizations, the Network of Enterprising Women (NEW) and

Entrepreneurship & Career Institute (ECI). These two organizations have moved one step beyond USAID and provide training in Urdu for lower to middle class women. The evidence from these organizations seems to suggest that they have had a much higher success rate in setting up women in business enterprises (For greater details please refer to Section 3.4).

USAID was instrumental in setting up NEW. The idea was to form an organization through which female training could be institutionalized and a support network for trainers and entrepreneurs set up. MTU staff approached the TOT trainers with the idea and provided the group with consultants for team building and for setting up the constitution. However, NEW has had difficulty gathering technical and financial support. This has been critical in preventing NEW from spreading its organization to all four provinces and effectively following-up their trainees. NEW has been able to sustain itself in Karachi because of the large number of TOT trainers in the city. These trainers have volunteered their time and money in supporting NEW. However, where there are only a few TOT trainers, NEW has not been able to sustain itself.

Unlike NEW, which is an NGO, ECI is a private consultancy organization which provides services for a fee. It was set up by Shehnaz Kappadia, the first WID officer of the MTU program. ECI has been most successful in targeting women in the middle to lower income bracket and has trained approximately 2,200 women. Fifty nine percent of these women are running successful businesses today. Institutionally, ECI has been more successful in sustaining itself as it is run as a private organization, where all costs are budgeted to the client. Additionally, being located in Islamabad near the donors, the organization has been more successful in capturing contracts.

3.4 Agriculture Sector Support Program

As such, no explicit effort was made to recruit women under the Agriculture Sector Support Program (ASSP). However, around 1990, an effort was made for disadvantaged groups in the agricultural sector, which included women. If any extra emphasis was given to women, it was because of the female project staff in ASSP. According to ASSP staff in Islamabad, trainees were chosen on the basis of competence rather than gender. The aim was not to give more opportunities to women but to increase agricultural productivity. ASSP staff felt that they probably could have done more to increase women trainees but that was not the aim of the program. Also, if the aim is productivity, the pay offs in investing in men are greater in an agrarian society which follows strict rules of Purdah. However, in order to include women in the program, ASSP has defined agriculture very broadly to include anything to do with food. Also like the DSTP program, ASSP has accepted lower TOEFL scores for female participants.

Six women who had completed training under ASSP were interviewed Regarding the in-country training programs held under ASSP in Baluchistan (mentioned in the Terms Of References), the consultants were not able to locate any such program. The female participants met by the consultants were mostly urban and only one was actively involved in any agricultural activity. Two participants were nutritionists and worked in the Aga Khan University Hospital, two were agricultural economists who work with consulting firms while two were farmers. However, one women farmed more as a hobby while the other was a cattle farmer and was actively involved in her trade. These women stated that they appreciated their experience in the United States and gained confidence. However, the women farmers complained that their courses were not appropriate. The cattle farmer complained that she had asked for a course on livestock management but she was sent on an agriculture economics course. It was the general opinion of all these women that, although the training was helpful, USAID could be much more helpful to women in the agricultural sector by providing follow-ups and establishing a resource centre. This view was particularly favoured by the farmers who stated that they required all the help they could get in order to succeed in such a male-dominated sector.

4. NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS SUPPORT

4.1 Overview

Lessons are not as clearly identifiable under the Project Design and Implementation Fund (PDIF) in the NGO sector as the projects have recently been completed. Impacts under the Human Rights Fund are more discernable. As most NGOs in Pakistan are formed in order to implement WID objectives or to implement community based development, most NGOs in their mandate are gender sensitive. However, whether at the implementation level, these NGO are successful, depends on the perceptions of the staff and constraints facing any WID projects in an islamic country like Pakistan.

4.2 Trust for Voluntary Organizations

The Trust for Volunteer Organization (TVO) has received limited feed back from the projects it funds, most of which are not very mature yet. Majority of the projects monitored by TVO have women as a target group. Thirty-two projects have so far been funded by TVO, out of which 26 are on going. These are classified of exclusively WID projects and those with WID components.

The response from women beneficiaries in general has been far more positive than from the men. There is a general eagerness to learn amongst the former. The attendance at female training centres for various projects is much higher than for the same type of centres established for men. One such example is adult literacy.

TVO's experience with income generating projects for women points to the fact that the need for such projects is much higher amongst the urban women as the rural women are already involved in low level income agricultural work aside from domestic work.

The WID Program Officer of TVO feels confident that gender sensitization would bring out more positive results. Two suggested ways of promoting this would be for:

TVO to organize dialogues between NGOs working in the WID sector.

Gender training to be imparted to the staff of the projects.

4.3 All Pakistan Women's Association

The impact of funds given to the All Pakistan Women's Association (APWA) can not be determined as the auditorium for which the funding was provided is still being completed. According to APWA leadership, the auditorium will be used to further APWA's programs as well as being used for fund-raising purposes to fund APWA's education, health, family planning and vocational skills programs for women. Although, APWA has in the past focused on female education and income generation through traditional crafts, the focus has become more broad based with an emphasis on female economic independence through income generation projects in the rural areas. Problems that APWA may face in the future are that they lack young leadership and the human resources to monitor and evaluate their development work.

4.4 Family Welfare Cooperative Society

The female hostel constructed under a grant to the Family Welfare Cooperative Society (FWCS) has been in operation for about six months. The NGO's familiarity with the area and the concerns of women in the area has

resulted in a successful and fully operational unit. At any one time, all beds in the hostel are full and many women have to be turned away. Women residing in the hostel include doctors, lawyers, telegraph operators, and artists. They choose to live at the hostel because it is conveniently located, has high security, strict rules and regulations and is reasonably priced. At the present time, the hostel is self-sustaining and the NGO predicts it will continue to be so in the future. FWCS' primary focus is women and children and its motto is 'Earn, Earn and Move Towards New Horizons'. FWCS has been in the forefront of many other innovative initiatives for women. The NGO has moved to less conventional areas of training and has run courses on secretarial skills. Additionally, FWCS has been in the forefront of training women in community development from both rural and urban areas.

4.5 Lawyers for Human Rights & Legal Aid & Pakistan Women's Lawyer Association (PAWLA)

The grant provided to the Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA) has effectively been utilized and has had an empowering impact on women. The Para-legal Training Seminars have produced and institutionalized a cadre of female para-legals at NGOs who provide advice in their local community as well as screening cases for the LHRLA centre. The aim of the program was to inform women working at the grass-roots about rights and laws pertaining to women so that they could take the message forward. The institutional support component of the grant also provided for the salaries of four lawyers and technical support. However, with the implementation of Pressler and lack of new additional funding, the centre has had to curtail its level of activity and downgrade its subsequent plans. Due to the newly trained para-legals and the high level of publicity generated by the NGO, the number of cases have increased while the staffing of lawyers has been cut to two. The NGO however, continues to thrive through local funding and the determination of its President.

Unfortunately, the implementation of the Pressler Amendment has left the Pakistan Women Lawyer's Association (PAWLA) legal aid centre in a dire situation. The Legal Aid Centre to aid indigent women in Rawalpindi has barely been sustainable and is presently open two days a week as opposed to its previously six days. The Centre is totally depended on funding from its parent organization in Karachi. The number of cases the centre processes has also declined due to the limited number of lawyers able to work and a general perception in the community that the centre is no longer functioning. The two women working at the centre are not quite sure how long they will be able to sustain present activity.

The differing performance of the two human rights NGOs provides insight into how NGOs can become sustainable. What is critical is that the people who will be responsible for the project be involved in the programming of the project from the very beginning. In the PAWLA case, the people who would subsequently run the Legal Aid Centre were never involved in the planning or the decision making process. The lawyers at the centre just followed the dictates of the Karachi office and were not even aware of the differing components of the USAID grant. What is also important that NGOs be encouraged to find local funding. To make NGOs more sustainable, donors should perhaps provide a one time grant of institutional strengthening rather than per project, which will not only give NGOs more flexibility and encourage self independence but also help NGOs plan beyond projects. The differing performance of the two NGOs also indicates that committed leadership is critical.

SHAMSHAD BEGUM

Shamshad Begum is one of the successful entrepreneurs from the ECI Private Sector Initiative Program. She attended an 18 day training session of the EDP. After this she successfully started her business and is now earning Rs 2500-3000 per month. She started the business on a small scale but now engages 30-35 women with her on a piece rate basis. She is making crochet floor cushions, wall hangings, trolley covers, sofa cushions, toaster covers etc., and sells these things in different bazaars in Rawalpindi and Islamabad. Shamshad Begum is married, and has three children. Her husband is working as a peon in the Pakistan Air Force. She did not have any source of income before she started the training and her husband's salary was not enough to fulfil the household expenses. She was not satisfied with her living conditions and wanted to improve her living standard for which she joined the program. She had many skills but did not know how to utilize these for income generation.

She learnt about the training program from a friend, who advised her to meet with Shehnaz Kappadia. Shamshad Begum went there and asked Shehnaz for solutions to her problems. Shehnaz encouraged her to join EPD classes and there she learnt how to do business. On completion of this training she started her own business and started earning a profit. Presently, not only is she generating income for herself but has also provided similar opportunities to the women she has employed. Shamshad Begum is now doing a one year technical course on ready made garments in a Government Institute. She is planning to improve her knowledge about handmade things and wants to start a side business of ready made garments. She is planning to get a loan for additional needs (business) with the help of ECI from the First Women Bank. This loan will be utilized for the purchase of fabrics and sewing machines.

ZARINA ZAI

Zarina Zai is another successful entrepreneur of Private Entrepreneurship Initiative Project. She is 20, married with 3 children. Her husband is working in a government department as a Naib Qasid. His monthly income is 1200-1400. It was difficult for her to fulfil her household needs in this meagre salary. She therefore decided to augment the income through her own efforts. She could sew and make Nimko, but did not have business skills to market these products. She discussed her problems with neighbours who were unable to help. She finally meet Khalida Salimi, an EDP trainer who lived near her house. Mrs Salimi encourage her to join the EDP arranged by ECI. After 18 days of training, she was able to start her business of Nimko and sold it in a nearby bazaar with her husband's help. Her monthly income has now increased to 2000-2500. She is also making other eatables like Dahi Baras and samosas and is also sewing clothes for her neighbours. She is also managing a grocery shop outside her house. Once given the business sense, women with domestic skills are able to utilize even these for improving the living standards of their families.

SHABNAM NAZ

Shabnam also attended the EDP training. She is single and lives in her father's house. They are 10 family members living in 2 rooms. Her father is a tube well operator in Rawalpindi, with a monthly income of Rs. 2000. She does embroidery work with golden thread. She learnt this from her friend and earns more than Rs. 2000 per month. She heard about the training from her friend and agreed to attend this training. She however dropped out after a little while and did not follow through with it as she did not want to expand her business.

MAJEEDA BEGUM

Majeeda Begum lives in Kakial khurd, a small village in Sialkot district of the Punjab. Her husband, Mushtaq Ahmed is sick and cannot work in the fields. For Majeeda Begum 1991 was a year of anxiety as the eldest of her 7 children, a girl was to be married and the dowry had to be bought. The land owned by the family was not very productive and the situation was aggravated by the illness of the head of the family. Majeeda begum applied for a nursery contract and managed to convince the Divisional Forest Officer that she would be able to come up to the exacting requirements that the USAID Forestry and Planning Project had laid down for nursery operations. Half an acre of the land was set aside for the nursery and the entire family set to work on it with the technical guidance of the forestry department. Six months later, the nursery was ready for sale. 36,000 seedlings of Eucalyptus were taken by the project, and the family received Rs. 44,700. The remaining stock was taken by the local farmers and 500 trees were planted by the family. Encouraged by the success of her first endeavour, Majeeda Begum went in for another nursery with 28,000 seedlings and Rs. 35,000 were paid by the project. Apart from the dowry, the family was also able to purchase a water pump, build a small storage tank in the house and buy 200 feet of pipe line to take water from their well to the house. Majeeda begum and her family are a satisfied customer of the Winrock International effort in collaboration with the Government of Pakistan/USAID Forestry and Planning Project, to bring relief to the people of Pakistan, by helping them to plant trees on their land and operate nurseries. (Source: Winrock International)

ZAITOON BIBI

In Manda Khel FCBO of SRSC, one member called Zaitoon has demonstrated just how successful the poultry package can be when an individual is committed. Having originally received five birds from SRSC, today she has accumulated 50. Her chicken produce about 150 eggs a week and each dozen eggs is sold at approximately Rs. 18. Her weekly earnings are Rs. 225. The poultry package is not only a source of additional income but also resulted in improved diet for Zaitoon Bibi's family.

SEEME MALLICK

While working in the Development Projects Office of the Catholic Relief Services, Pakistan (CRS), Seeme realized the importance of having up to date information on modern agricultural practices. This quest for knowledge of agriculture practices and production led to her interest in education abroad. She applied for the Agriculture Sector Support Program scholarship in response to a newspaper advertisement. Seeme considers herself very fortunate to have been selected for a graduate program in International Agricultural Development at the University of California, Davis, USA.

On her return to Pakistan she was very enthusiastic to apply her newly acquired skills and training to practical use. Even before she could start a job hunt she was approached by her former professor from Quaid-e-Azam University to teach a course to the first semester M.Sc. students. She found the offer very challenging as she had no previous experience in teaching at the university level. She taught microeconomics for a semester and claims to have enjoyed the experience. Before this semester was over she was offered a job as a Research Assistant at the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), a newly established research institute in Islamabad. At SDPI she worked on a research study on the environmental effects of pesticide use in Pakistan. On receiving a better offer from Enterprise and Development Consulting (Pvt.) limited, a development consulting firm based in Islamabad, she left the job at SDPI and began work as an Assistant Manager at EDC. Seeme has also undertaken several assignments for the WID Genesys project.

The training has helped Seeme Mallick to realize her career goals, explore different career avenues, exploit her potential to the fullest and acquire a deep understanding of agro economics, a subject of her interest and choice

INSTITUTIONS

Success Stories from Management Training Unit (MTU)

Perhaps the greatest legacy of the MTU program has been that it has institutionalized the EDP & management training for women under the two organizations, the Network for Enterprising Women (NEW) and Entrepreneurship & Career Institute (ECI). These two organizations have moved one step beyond USAID and provided training in Urdu for lower to middle class women. Evidence shows that these organizations have been successful in setting up women in business enterprises.

Network for Enterprising Women (NEW)

The idea for NEW was initiated by USAID. The idea was to form an organization through which female training could be institutionalized and a support network for trainers and entrepreneurs set up. Although NEW groups have not been successful in all cities, the chapter in Karachi has met with success. NEW is run by volunteers who are trained under the MTU -TOT program. With sponsorship from various donors including USAID & UNICEF, NEW runs various programs for women entrepreneurs. Recently, the program has started conducting its program in Urdu and has been targeting lower to lower middle class women in the kachi abadis (slums) of Karachi with some success.

Entrepreneurial & Career Institute (ECI)

ECI is a private consultancy organization set up by Shehnaz Kappadia, the first WID officer of the MTU program. ECI has been most successful in targeting women in the middle to lower income bracket and has trained approximately 2,200 women. Fifty nine percent of these women are running successful businesses today. ECI was the first organization to offer training in Urdu which opened up entrepreneurial training to a new target population. Additionally, the organization provides a quarterly newsletter on micro-enterprise development in Urdu and English and provides a year round resource centre where women who have undergone training can go for advice. ECI has also helped nurture three new NGOS, Superior Welfare Organization, Entrepreneurial & Career Development Institute (ECDI) & Network of Women Entrepreneurs (NOWE) which also conduct similar training programs.

Success stories from SRSC

One of the greatest achievements of SRSC has been the successful functioning of the Female Community Based Organizations (FCBOs) in Kohat and Charsadda, patterned on the lines of the AKRSP Women's Organizations. These have undertaken several activities including management of poultry packages and training as poultry vaccinators, vocational training, kitchen gardening and provision of credit facilities.

The most successful area of implementation of the SRSC FCBOs has been the Credit & Enterprise component with a rate of 98.50 % in July 1993 in Kohat. The maximum amount of credit allocated in Kohat for a single activity has been for milk package purposes.

Poultry packages have been introduced in 16 FCBOs. Side by side there have also been 15 training courses for poultry vaccinators and 17 women have been trained. The poultry packages have in general proved to be a successful WID activity in Kohat, where in some cases women have gone on to launch mini-poultry farms. The poultry packages are delivered alongside a programme for training to women in vaccination methodologies. The average earnings of a poultry vaccinator per season are Rs. 50. The most successful case has been in Pershai FCBO where Shameem, a member has generated over Rs. 200.

In Kohat there have been 9 courses in 10 FCBOs for vocational training. 90 members have been trained in tailoring or hand and machine embroidery skills. The remaining are using their skills within the home for the family's benefit. As such out of 90 trained women approximately 30 are actively earning an income.

Women are encouraged to cultivate winter and summer vegetables as potential source of better nutrition and income generation through the provision of seeds and other necessary materials. Cases of successful adoption and impact have been in Kohat FCBOs. Primary impact of this venture has been felt within the home and has increased the food security of the families.

Girls Middle School Ulla, Gadoon Amazai

Out of the many villages of Gadoon Amazai, Ulla is one village of which Rashida Khanum (WID Officer, USAID Peshawar) is particularly proud. The reasons for this is the success of the Girls Middle School.

Village Ulla, bounded by Swabi district and Swat district is about two hours drive from the head office in Topi. Prior to the construction of a metalled road, there was only a shingle path along the mountain going up to this village. It takes the Gadoon Amazai Project WID staff 4-6 hours, depending on the weather, to get to this remote village.

The WID staff had tried to establish contact in villages much easier to access. But not all villages are ready for change. With each new resistance the WID staff went on with renewed determination and innovative ideas to gain acceptance of the local communities, and to start off with Non Formal Education (NFE) centres as focal points for the village women to gather and communicate.

The building in this village of the Girls Middle School is newly constructed. The very presence of this building symbolizes the success of the WID staff in establishing institutional link between the project activities and the Government line department. There were 20 female students at the secondary and 30 students at the Primary level. 25 girls have completed middle school, and another 15 have passed their metric level exam from this institution. These young women have gone ahead to attend the Primary Teachers Course (PTC). Out of these, 10 women were employed by the government as primary school teachers in the project area.

These numbers look small, but considering the socio-cultural environment of this area, where women follow strict purdah and have very restricted mobility, it is indeed a great stride. In this situation to convince the family elders to send young girls to school is a considerable achievement. With the employment of local young women as primary school teachers, a whole new process has begun, where local women will teach in rural schools and the government would not have to look constantly for replacements for urban teachers who refuse to stay in these far flung areas.

Vegetable Gardening in Village Kot Kai, Hasan Zai

Kot Kai village is about an hour up stream by boat from Darband. In summer when the river is high it is much easier to access this village by boat due to its riverside location. Riverside villages like this one is not the only one which the WID staff approached with their innovative ideas to train village women. They regularly went to such far flung villages on foot. Due to the socio-cultural environment women in this village had restricted mobility and practised purdah like all other women in the Kala Dhaka region. The lack of access to education and employment did not mean that the village women lacked interest in improving their economic condition. This was one of the reasons for the success of the vegetable gardening project introduced by the KDADP WID staff.

Traditionally, village women are responsible for crops and vegetable production after men finish ploughing of land and crop sowing. This production is however for family subsistence only. With the introduction of new crops the village women have started growing a much larger variety of vegetables and have also started planting non traditional fruit trees. These village women are also aware of the fact that if they somehow manage to deliver this fruit and vegetable to the market, they would be able to actually earn some profit. The problem is however of the inaccessibility of the market. It is not acceptable for women to take goods or produce themselves to the market for sale. To deliver these goods to market they are once again dependent on their menfolk. Despite these obstacles, the women have become innovative and the cultivation of fruit trees along with increased awareness is indeed a step in the right direction.

With interest and awareness comes a constant search for new possibilities. The WID staff of the project has proved to the women in this village and to so many like them in other villages of the project area that possibilities of improving the economic situation exist. Now they have to organize themselves to make use of these possibilities. Organizations of enterprising women within the village seeking solutions to their problems in terms of market accessibility, improvement of skills, basic health services have emerged and is a step in the right direction.

Society for Community Support for Primary Education (SCSPEB) Baluchistan

The persistence of the Education Promoters has brought this society to prominence in a short time in Baluchistan. The whole process that led to the establishment of the SCSPEB in Baluchistan is based on flexibility and patience on behalf of the donors and constant innovative experiments on the part of the program staff. The success of this program can be gauged by many different methods. The most evident is the inclusion of the methodology followed by SCSPEB for the promotion of community based primary education, in the Social Action Program for Baluchistan. The Structural Adjustment - that was also a part of the USAID funded PED Program of the Directorate of Primary Education made it possible for the women in that department to move up to managerial and decision making positions. This adjustment also made the whole process flexible in promoting innovative ideas to directly address the low level of female enrolment in rural primary schools.

The process of community participated education program started with the Human Resource Survey coordinated by Tahira Qazalbash in 1989. The survey and its analyses went on for 2 years, but the result was what made all future endeavour possible. The survey pointed out that the people of rural Baluchistan were in favour of educating their girls. Over 50% of villagers asked for female education. Another important outcome of this study was that there were young women in rural areas who could be trained to become primary school teachers.

In the course of the following two years many innovative ideas were implemented to improve the enrolment of girl children in primary schools. In some villages where schools did exist, both boys and girls went to the same schools. This was possible because a village usually comprises extended families which allows young children who play

together to also study together. The idea of gender free schools was based on this very concept. The term co-educational schools was not acceptable as it formalized the concept, in a way that was not acceptable in Baloch society. Whereas the concept of gender free schools was acceptable as it was based on an existing rural practice.

Due to the restricted mobility of women in Baluchistan, especially the young women, the Primary Teachers Training Program had to be modified. Instead of trying to bring young women from different villages to some central location for training, the Mobile Teachers Training was started. In this way many women got trained who otherwise would have been able to get to the provincial centre for this purpose.

Like most other rural areas, Baluchistan also faced a similar problem of lack of female teachers willing to go to rural areas for teaching. After trying various methods to encourage urban teachers' to come to rural areas, the SCSPEB started working on the concept of Stay Home Teachers. After several visits to various villages the SCSPEB's education promoters identified the particular villages where there were a minimum of 5 - 10 girls of school going age, and also a metric or middle qualified young woman who could be trained to become the primary school teacher. After receiving the teacher's training through the Mobile Teachers Training, these women start teaching in their own villages. After three months of probationary period these teachers are confirmed as regular government employees by the Directorate of Primary Education.

Soon after establishing contact with village communities, the education promoters began the process of village committee formation. For this Promoters have monthly meetings with the community to explain this idea and to get feedback. Every effort was put into having regular meetings, as this was also instrumental in keeping the spirit and enthusiasm alive.

As so much depends on the performance and enthusiasm of the education promoters in the field that there is a need for organization of regular refresher courses and group discussions at the SCSPEB head office. Special emphasis is placed on character building of these education promoters, so that they can make decisions that help promote female education in rural Baluchistan.

Nader Abbas
USAID Islamabad

Malik Ijaz Ahmed
Dir - PE Directorate, Balochistan

Iftikar Ahmed
Acting Chief HRD - USAID

Jameel Ahmed
Project Officer ASSP Training - USAID

Zehra Ahmed
USAID

Uzma Anzar
SCSPE - Quetta

Zia Awam
Lawyers for Human Rights & Legal Aid

Quratulain Bakhtiari
Coordinator - SCSPE, Quetta

John Blackton
Mission Director
USAID, Islamabad

Cindy Brown
Academy for Educational Development

Usma Chughtai
Pakistan Women Lawyer's Association

Anis Dani
TVO

Dr. William Darnell
TA - PED, Balochistan

Tariq Durrani
Policy Advisor ADP - USAID Peshawar

Khawaja Hameedullah
Project Officer Forestry - USAID

Chuck Hatch
COP Winrock (Forestry)

Iftikhar Hussain
USAID - Peshawar

M. Irshad
KDADP Kala Dhaka

Ms Zia Jalaly
Consultant
Evaluation Team for Area Development Projects

Shehnaz Kappadia
Entrepreneurship & Career Institute

Mrs. Karamat
Family Cooperative Welfare Society

Kaneez Fatima Kassim
WID Officer - USAID

Shahida Khan
KDADP Kala Dhaka

Rashida Khanum
WID Officer - USAID Peshawar

Sohail Malik
ADP - USIAD Peshawar

Virgil Miedema
Director Program

Dr Oval Myers
TIPAN, Peshawar

Donald E. Kuhlman
TIPAN, Peshawar

Shahida Nasreen
KDADP Kala Dhaka

Ms Pauline Odel
Consultant
Evaluation Team for Area Development Projects

Tariq Quarashi
Academy for Educational Development

Mrs Khalil Ramda
All Pakistan Women's Association.

Pamela Rodrigues
Network of Enterprising Women

Tony Rogers
Academy for Educational Development

Rahat Sagir
SRCS

Hank Schumacher
ADP - USAID Peshawar

Judy Schumacher
M&E Officer - USAID

Mumtaz Tanoli
KDADP Mansehra

Denis Weller
ASSP Training - USAID

Tara Upreti
Training Advisor (Primary Health Care)

Sadaqat
KDADP Mansehra

Jamshaid
KDADP Kala Dhaka

Yasmin
SCSPE - Quetta

Nasim Sherin
USAID, Islamabad

Farwah Zaffar
TVO, Islamabad

ANNEX IV LIST OF INTERVIEWEES AT THE BENEFICIARY LEVEL

Name of project	Location of the interviews (City/district)	Women Interviewed
FPDP	Peshawar	Group discussion with female students of PFI
	Taxilla	3 Female nursery operators
SRSC	Charsadda	Group meetings with members of FCBOs (Nazo 3, 4 & 5)
KDADP	Naway killi (Kala Dhaka/ PATA)	Group meeting with 6 women
	Ghari (Kala Dhaka/ PATA)	Group meeting with 5 women
	Kotkai (Kala Dhaka/ PATA)	Group meeting with 8 women
	Maira (Kala Dhaka/ PATA)	Group meeting with 5 women including the WVO.
Gadoon Amazai Area Development Project	Bisak (Gadoon-Swabi)	Group meeting with a vocational centre instructor and 20 trainees
	Ganduf (Gadoon-Swabi)	Group meeting with a vocational centre instructor and 5 women of the Adult Literacy class
	Utlah (Gadoon-Swabi)	6 female students at the secondary and 4 at the metric level at the local project school.
PED Baluchistan	Quetta	Group meeting with field promoters, Society for Community Support for Primary Education
DSTP (Public)	Karachi	2 women attended the focus group

Annex IV - list of interviewees at the beneficiary level

Name of Project	Location of Project	Number of Women Interviewed
DSTP (Public)	Lahore	9 women attended the focus group
DSTP (Public)	Islamabad	3 women attended focus group
DSTP (Private)	Karachi	5 women attended focus groups
DSTP(Private)	Lahore	4 women attended focus group
DSTP (Private)	Islamabad	8 women attended the focus group
MTU-EDP	Karachi	7 women attended the focus group
MTU-EDP	Lahore	4 women attended focus group
MTU-EDP	Islamabad	Were not able to contact any participants/ Overlap with ECI beneficiaries
MTU-TOT	Karachi	6 people attended focus group
MTU-TOT	Lahore	5 women attended focus group
MTU-TOT	Islamabad	Were not able to contact any participants/ Overlap with ECI beneficiaries
ECI	Rawalpindi/ Islamabad	9 trainers and 14 trainees

**List of MTU-EDP Focus Group participants
(Karachi)**

Nasreen Vasi
District Sales Manager
Universal Educational Systems

Munira Khan
DY. Administrator
Nasra Schools

Saleha Feroz Kapadia
Roshni Interior Products Division

Farzana Zahoor
Manager
Jimmy Studios

Tehmina Ahmed
Contributing Editor
NewsLine

Nisha Thobani
Agha Khan Hospital

Irum Maher
Housewife

**List of MTU-TOT Focus participants
(Karachi)**

Uzma Ahmed
Network for Enterprising Women

Ruqaiya Siddiqui
MNJ Communication (Private) Limited

Aiysha Koreshi
Trainer for PIA

Karen Allawala
Habits Instructor

Ambareen Farooqi
Free Lance Trainer

Yasmin Hyder

**DSTP-Public Sector Focus Group Participants
(Karachi)**

Mrs. Meher Kirmani
APWA

Rehana Memon
Planning & Development
Sindh

**DSTP-Private Sector Focus Group Participants
(Karachi)**

Raina Lari
Research Economist
NDFC

Farzana Siddiq
Manager Underwriting
Royal Insurance

Nelofar Akhtar
Manager Nutrition
Agha Khan University Hospital

Ayesha Khan
Housewife

Khadija Nazir
Library of Congress
American Consulate

**DSTP-Private Sector Focus Group
(Lahore)**

Najmussahar Anderabi
Assistant Professor of Psychology

Dr. Nishat Maqsood
Associate Professor

Dr. Hajira Hanif
Professor

Amina Ali
Consulting Architect

**DSTP Public Sector Focus Group Participants
(Lahore)**

Jamila Sharq
Director Admin
population Welfare Dept

Mrs. Aftab Jahan
DY Director
Population Planning Bureau

Ms. Seemi Waheed
Senior Research Associate
Pakistan Admin Staff

Mr. Naseem Aldleer
Deputy Financial Advisor
Pakistan Railways Lahore

Mrs. Fehmida Mushtaq
Magistrate District Court, Lahore

Prof. Mahmuda Mubasher
Professor Community Medicine

Mrs. Zareen Bano
Assistant Chief of Section
Planning & Development, Lahore

Mrs. Shamim Bhatti
Deputy Director (IEC)
Communications

**MTU-EDP Focus Group Participants
(Lahore)**

Farwah Saeed

Tehmina Anwar
American School, Lahore

Saeeda Dar
Housewife

Saira Dar
Housewife

**MTU-TOT Focus Group Participants
(Lahore)**

Hilda Saeed
Shirkat Gah

Tehmina Anwar
American School, Lahore

Urusha Fahim
Independent Consultant

Mrs. Durdana Malik
Creative Director

**DSTP Private Sector Focus Group Participants
(Islamabad)**

Samina Ajan
Housewife

Begam Sajidah Zulfiquar ali Khan

Rubina Quamber
Farmer

Nuzhat Lotia
Action Aid

Ghazala Qureshi
ICI

Amenah Raheel
Textile business

Fatima Shah
WFP

Seema Mallick

**DSTP Public Sector Focus Group Participants
(Islamabad)**

Rohina Hayat
NDFC

Hajira Pirzada
Principal
Islamabad College for Girls

ANNEX V**LIST OF THE INWID ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

Ms. Chandni Joshi
Regional Programme Advisor
UNIFEM, Islamabad

Ms. Asma Sufi
Consultant
UNIFEM, Islamabad

Ms. Samina Kamal
Programme Officer
UNDP, Islamabad

Ms. Tahira Abdullah
Programme Officer
UNFPA, Islamabad

Ms. Naheed Aziz
Programme Officer
UNICEF, Islamabad

Ms. Sarah R. Ahmad
Assistant Programme Officer
UNICEF, Islamabad

Ms. Samina Hassan
Programme Officer
ILO, 58 Khayaban-e-Iqbal
Islamabad

Ms. Shireen Khan
Programme Officer
ILO, 58 Khayaban-e-Iqbal
Islamabad

Ms. Tahseen Sayed Khan
World Bank
Ramna-5
Islamabad

Ms. Roohi Shoaib
Programme Officer
ODA/British High Commission
Islamabad.

Ms. Samina Abbas
Project Implementation Officer
Social Sector
Asian Development Bank
Islamabad.

Mr. John Townsend
Consultant
Australian High Commission
Islamabad.

Ms. Carol Presern
First secretary (Development)
ODA/British High Commission
Islamabad

Ms. Wendy Miller
CIDA
Canadian High Commission
Islamabad

Ms. Rabia Khar
CIDA
Canadian High Commission
Islamabad.

Mr. Andrew Standley
First Secretary
Commission on European Economic
Community
H.9, Street No.88
Islamabad.

Ms. Jutta Burghardt
First secretary
Devt. Cooperation german embassy
Diplomatic Enclave
Islamabad.

Ms. Yakida Oda
Assistant Resident Representative
JICA
House No.1, Street No.61
G-6/3, Islamabad.

Ms. Kaniz Fatima Kassim
USAID
18, 6th Avenue
Ramna-5, Islamabad.

Ms. Roshaneh Zafar
RWSS Unit
World Bank
H.20-A, Shahrah-e-Jumhuriat
G-5/1, Islamabad

Mr. Bashir-ul-Haq
Project Advisor
World Bank
H.20-A, Shahrah-e-Jumhuriat
G-5/1, Islamabad.

Ms. Rita Tesselaar
First Secretary (Development)
Royal Netherlands Embassy
2nd Floor, PIA Building,
Blue Area, Islamabad.

Ms. Sabira Qureshi
Royal Netherlands Embassy
2nd Floor, PIA Building
Blue Area, Islamabad

Ms. Bitten Modal
NORAD
Royal Norwegian Embassy
H.11, treet No.84
G-6/4, Islamabad.

Ms. Nazneen Serrdar
Project Officer
Devt. Cooperation
Embassy of Switzerland
H.25, Street No.19,
F-6/2, Islamabad.

CHECKLIST FOR USAID STAFF ABOUT DSTP

Key Questions

What obstacles did the candidates face in getting the scholarship, in acquiring the training and returning home?

Have the candidates been able to apply what they have learnt abroad?

What were the particular dynamics that allowed the women who went abroad to go abroad?

A. Policy Issues

- Obstacles in getting approval from GOP to send girls
- How were these obstacles removed?
- Basis of allocation of number of scholarship to girls, ratio of Male/female. GOP pressure
- Any regional/provincial preferences
- Types of courses/training recommended or suggested
- Women entering fields previously denied to women why? Why now and not before.

B. Program Management

Issue/ Problems in Pakistan:

- How are the participants informed?
- Are they keen to find out about the program?
- Selection problems
 - Applicants from only certain groups
 - Brain power but limited language power
 - Cultural barriers
 - Regional Variations
- Are there differences in how women are informed about programs in each region?
- Placement issues - What are the preferences of the women?
- Are preferences always met?
- Drop out rates - those who don't go despite final selection
- How many return during the studies because they find the process difficult.
- Commonality in background etc.
- What are the reasons given for their dropping out?
- Problems that are particular to female candidates before they go abroad, how are they overcome?

Issues/Problems in the US

- Adjustments
 - Living conditions
 - Culture/social
- Financial aspects
 - Insufficient funds

- Working with two scholarships
- Problems with Pressler Amendment and women there presently
- Academic aspects
 - Course work too difficult
 - Language problems
 - Wrong type of course
 - Relevancy of academic material
 - Methodologies to teaching difficult to deal with

Issues/Problems with DSTP

- What criticisms have been made about the program?
- What changes have been made in the program in the past? Why? Have the changes been successful?

C. Training

- Did the experience meet the expectations?
- Desire to change program / How many in appropriate program
- Relevancy of training in Pakistani context.
- How long is the training useful?
- Success stories- ie women who have utilized training to change society in some way
- How many skills transferred?

D. Return/Follow up

- Are there follow up sessions upon return/ Any help with job placement/ an issue of complaint
- Marrying sons of Uncle Sam
- Social adjustments on returning to Pakistan
- Problems with jobs etc upon return/ Face bureaucratic impediments
- How many utilize training/ ie how many get married and stop working.

E. Explain your "successes"/"failures"

- How is the program a success/failure
- Woman who are successful/ why

DATE:
INTERVIEWEE:
PROJECT:

CHECKLIST FOR USAID STAFF ABOUT MANAGEMENT TRAINING UNIT

Key Questions

What obstacles did the candidates face in getting the scholarship, and acquiring the training?

Have the candidates been able to apply what they have learnt?

What were the particular dynamics that allowed the women to apply for training?

A. Policy Issues

- Structure of MTU program
- Who Monitored
- Any Role for Government
- Any Regional/Provincial preferences
- Types of courses/training recommended or suggested
- Women entering fields previously denied to women, why? why now and not before?

B. Program Management

Issue/ Problems in Pakistan:

- How are the participants informed?
- Are they keen to find out about the program?
- Selection problems
 - Applicants from only certain groups
 - Brain power but limited language power
 - Cultural barriers
 - Regional Variations
- Are there differences in how women are informed about programs in each regions
- Placement issues - What are the preferences of the women?
- Are preferences always met?
- Drop out rates - those who don't go despite final selection
- What are the reasons given for their dropping out?

Issues/Problems with MTU

- What criticisms were made about the program?
- What changes had to be made in the program in the past? Why? Were the changes successful?

C. Training

- Did the experience meet the expectations
- Desire to change program/How many in appropriate program
- Relevancy of training in Pakistani context
- How long is training useful
- Success stories-ie women who have utilized training to change society in some way
- How many transfer skills?

D. Return/Follow up

E. Explain your "successes"/"failures"

- How is the program a success/failure?
- Woman who were successful/ why

DSTP PUBLIC/PRIVATE SECTOR CHECKLIST

What obstacles did you face in the process of getting the scholarship:

A. The Application Process

- **Application process:** Did the nomination process work for or against you? Based on Merit? Did every one get a fair chance at the scholarship? Did the fact that you were a woman make the process difficult or easier? How was the information distributed? Access?
- **USAID/DSTP Staff:** What role did the staff play? Helpful? Unhelpful? Were they willing to make the extra effort to get you in to programs? Did the DSTP staff encourage your input in the kind of training you needed? Participation in design of course?
- **Other constraints:** Beside the procedure were there other things which made applying difficult? Family? Financial? Institutional Constraints (pay without leave, job security)? Lack of other kind of support?

B. In the Training:

- **Cultural obstacles:** What cultural adjustment problems did you face if any? How substantial was the adjustment and did you contemplate returning because of it? Dietary problems? Religious problems?
- **Academic obstacles:** Academically, were you sufficiently skilled to be in the program you were in? Did you take extra courses? Were language skills a problem? Other problems which there like money? Lack of support group? Lack of family?
- **How helpful was the DSTP staff during training?** Islamabad? Washington? Were they quick to responded to your needs? Could they have done better?

C. On Returning

- **This is relevant to a few.** Was the cultural adjustment difficult? Did some of you not want to return? Was re-adjusting to ones family difficult?
- **Did you return to your old jobs?** Did you find that the training gave you access to new job opportunities?

D. Have you been able to apply what you have learnt:

- **Were you placed in the type of program you wanted?** Was the training what you expected? Was it too theoretical? Was it not practical enough? Was it appropriate for the Pakistani context? Did you attempt to modify the program to meet your needs? Was the training too short or too long? Public Sector: Do you return to jobs for which this training was appropriate?
- **How do you feel you have been able to use your new ideas and skills?** Have you in any way managed to change your position at work because of your training? Have you challenged prevailing norms at your institution?

- Are you able to transfer your skills to other men or women? Do you feel you have been able to improve the lives of other women in Pakistan?
 - Did you find the need to adapt the knowledge to the Pakistani environment? Was this always possible or was it not? Do you have the necessary technical equipment etc to carry out your work?
 - Have you found that your skills allow you to advance faster in your organization? Do groups/people prevent you from implementing your new ideas/skills? Did the training experience lead to changes in career paths? What are you doing now which you couldn't have done without the training?
 - Many wrote about the "social cultural" factors being more critical than the training itself?
- E. Why were you able to go abroad:**
- Was your family supportive? Did they encourage your going abroad? Did they provide financial support? Was the extended family problematic?
 - Does your family have a history of women being educated abroad? Is marital status/ age a factor in going abroad? Are your language skills/educational background superior? Did you feel that made you more confident about applying?
 - Did you feel lack of institutional support was part of the explanation for not applying? Are institutional blockages part of the explanation for other women not applying?
- F. Changes in attitude and vision:**
- Has your outlook about your own society changed? Have your notions of Male/Female equality changed? How difficult is it to incorporate these notions into your day to day existence? Do you feel that your stint abroad has made you more confident? Are you more confident around and with men? Have you learnt new ways to negotiate with men?

TRAINING OF TRAINERS FOCUS GROUP

A. Application Process:

- Application Process: How did you particular people get involved in the TOT program? How were you recruited and what were your expectations? What was attractive about the program? Was it idealism or realism? How many of you came from entrepreneurial backgrounds? Lack or not lacking-- did it make a difference in how insightful you were about the training?
- What role did the staff play? Helpful? Unhelpful? Were they willing to make the extra effort to get you in to programs? How willing were they to deal with your various bosses when they had you on as a WID Intern?
- Did the MTU staff encourage your input in the kind of training you needed? Participation in design of course? Generally how interactive was the process?

B. Training:

- Was the training what you expected? Was it too theoretical? Was it not practical enough? Was it appropriate for the Pakistani context? Was the training too short or too long? What did you think of quality of training? Differences between training by international consultants and training by NEW? What was the language you were trained in? Was language a barrier to a certain class of women?
- How many of you are training now? Why haven't you been able to utilize your training? Lack of support from where? lack of institutions? Lack of interest from the outside? Biases?
- Those who do train, what kind of impact do you think you have had? What kind of people are you reaching? What languages are you using? Are there any subsequent impacts? Ripple effects?
- Those who don't train, do you utilize those other skills in other areas?
- Did the training experience lead to changes in career paths? What are you doing now which you couldn't have done without the training?
- DSTP/ MTU comparison? What is more appropriate for the Pakistani context? What kind of institutional support is needed to encourage entrepreneurial development or is entrepreneurial development passe?
- What kind of support is generally needed to set up training? Subsequent support to training?
- What do you think of NEW? What kind of institution is it? Is it sufficient for being the premiere institution for entrepreneurial training in Pakistan?

FOCUS GROUP ON MANAGEMENT TRAINING UNIT

A. Application process:

- Application Process: How were you recruited and what were your expectations? What was attractive about the program? How many of you came from entrepreneurial backgrounds? Lack or not lacking-- did it make a difference in how insightful you were about training?
- What role did the USAID MTU staff play? Helpful? Unhelpful? Were they willing to make the extra effort to get you in to programs? How well did they accommodate your needs?
- Did the MTU staff encourage your input in the kind of training you needed? Participation in design of course? Generally how interactive was the process?

B. Training:

- Was the training what you expected? Was it too theoretical? Was it not practical enough? Was it appropriate for the context you were in? Was the training too short or too long? What did you think of quality of training? Differences between training by international consultants and training by NEW? What was the language you were trained in? Was language a barrier to certain class of women?
- This is for those who were trained by both American and Pakistani trainers? Was the quality of both good or was one better than the other? Why? Was the American training relevant in this particular context?
- What new opportunities have opened up to you after partaking in this training? What have you done with the training, you could not have done without it? How many of you began businesses after attending the MTU training program? How many of you utilized the training to expand or build up already existing businesses? If none of the above, why?
- Was the training sufficient to make you women entrepreneurs?
- What kind of resources did MTU or NEW offer after training? Were they accessible? Were they helpful?
- What do you think of NEW and ECI? Have you had subsequent contact with these institutions? Why and for what? Are they institutions which have provided resource support?
- Did the training experience lead to changes in career paths? What are you doing now which you couldn't have done without the training?
- Even if you had not had the training, would you still have attempted to start a business?

NORTH WEST FRONTIER AREA DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

- What is your opinion of the project?
- Did you acquire any skills through this project?
- Are you using any of the skills acquired for income generation If yes, which?
- What is your total monthly household income?
- What is your monthly income from this source?
- Are the products/services sold directly or is there an intermediary?
- How do you spend the income acquired through this source?
- Who is in-charge of the cash earned through this source?
- Which type of courses/activities, do you feel are most helpful for women?
- What improvements/changes/additions should be made in the curriculum/project?
- What training did the local women participated in? How are they using these skills? Are these skills helping in earning any income? In what ways?
- What are the new skills they acquired? Which are the skills that they did acquire but are not using? Why not?
- What other skills do they think are needed by them? Why do they need these skills?
- How many women were trained under the Traditional Birth Attendant training program? Did this training help increase their income levels? Are any of these women employed any where?

ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND CAREER INSTITUTE (ECI).

(ECI was sponsored by USAID under the Private Investment Expansion program. In the year 1992-93, it funded three Training of Trainer workshops.)

Check list for trainee and trainer

- What is your opinion of the Training of Trainer workshops you have attended?
- How has the workshop helped in the micro-enterprise?
- What is the nature of the business?
- Monthly income of the trainee from this source?
- Total monthly income of the trainees household?
- Which workshop attended?
- How did it help the trainer?
- Did the trainer attend more than one workshop?
- Any difficulties encountered, professional and personal by the entrepreneur?
- Does the entrepreneur have any partner or assistant?
- Who keeps the cash from the sales?
- What (other) factors have contributed towards the success of the business venture?
- What has motivated the trainer to take part in this program?
- Which type of skills has the workshop given you?
 - a. sales & marketing
 - b. technical
- Does the trainer belong to any organization or is working in a personal capacity?
- What fields are the trainees working in?
- How many women does one trainer supervise in a year?

FORESTRY PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

Checklist for forestry trainees

- Are you currently a student or an employee?
- What is your opinion of the effort to train women?
- Why did you join the program at PFI?
- What has made you join a traditionally male profession?
- What will motivate you to continue?
- For students: where do you hope to find employment?
- Do you have a relative in the forestry department who might have influenced your decision to join?
- Will you get the permission to work in rural areas?
- Are there any particular disadvantages faced by women in the field as compared to men?
- What role can be played by female foresters in the social forestry program for which their induction is essential?

Beneficiaries

- How long did you operate a nursery?
- What were the reasons for its discontinuation?
- What facilities/services should be included to make the project a success with women?
- Are you satisfied with the training you were given?
- Monthly household income?
- Monthly income from the sale of trees?
- Who were the buyers (project or private sector)?
- What are the disadvantages faced by women in doing nurseries as compared to men?
- Are you assisted by any other members of the family? Would you have succeeded had you received help?

SARHAD RURAL SUPPORT CORPORATION

- **What is your opinion about the Women's Organizations?**
- **What type of activities are you involved in through the WO?**
- **How has it helped you?**
- **What type of facilities has it provided?**
- **What type of vocation are you pursuing as a result?**
- **What is your income from this source and total household income?**
- **Is there any disadvantage faced by women in your field?**
- **What changes do you propose for the projects's improvement?**
- **Any problems concerning the project?**

CHECKLIST FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (PED)

- Is building schools in rural areas and provision of lady teachers all that is needed?
- Is community awareness or rather their acceptance is an issue that affects girl child primary education? How was this issue tackled by this project?
- How has the rural community reacted to this project?
- What are the conditions under which parents send daughters to coeducational schools? How was the project able to "create" these conditions?
- What are the lessons learned in attracting girl children to school?
- What is hierarchy of the Directorate of Education? How does it facilitate women's participation in senior managerial decisions?
- How were you able to determine that women role models are critical for gaining headway in female education? What is the evidence?
- Do teachers get hard area allowance for serving in rural areas? If not, are they provided any other incentive to serve in rural areas? How have you been able to attract female teachers in rural areas?
- What were the constraints that had to be overcome in bringing Female Primary Education to rural Baluchistan?
- How will this project be sustained after September, 1994?
- What is the long term impact of this project?

Name	Sector covered	Assignments undertaken
Maliha Hamid Hussein	Agriculture Extension & the Social Sectors	Conducted interviews of USAID and project personnel. Responsible for overall project planning, supervision and report editing.
Reehana R. Raza	DSTP & NGO sector	Conducted focus group meetings for DSTP in Lahore, Karachi and Islamabad. Undertook field surveys, project staff interviews and report writing
Seeme Mallick	Area Development & Primary Edu.	Conducted field surveys in the Gadoon, Kala Dhaka and Quetta. Also interviewed USAID and project staff and responsible for project co-ordination.
Tariq R. Anwar	Health & Primary Edu.	Interviewed USAID staff in Islamabad.
Haniya Rais	Forestry, ECI Agriculture Ext. and DSTP	Field surveys, report writing and interviews of USAID and project personnel. Interviewed 2 public sector DSTP scholarship holders in Peshawar, nursery operators in Taxilla ECI personnel and USAID staff in Islamabad and (SRSC) FCBO members in Charsadda.
Almas Parveen	Private Enterprise Development Project	Conducted interviews with ECI beneficiaries in Rawalpindi
Irum Afzal	DSTP	Acted as the resource person in Islamabad and organized the focus group meetings.
Haider Ghani	Area Development Project	Field survey in Gadoon.
Tehmina Anwar	DSTP	Acted as the resource person in Lahore and organized the focus group meetings.

ANNEX VIII TERM OF REFERENCE

SCOPE OF WORK WID STUDY

I. BACKGROUND

The United Nations Development Program (UNDP) recently established its Human Development Index based on three standard measures: life expectancy, education and income. Countries are categorized into three levels, high, medium and low. Pakistan falls in the low human development category. Much of the reason for this categorization results from the low status of women. Literacy for women is only 21.1% (World Bank, 1990), contrasted with 34.8% for men; and very few women participate directly in economic life. In the labor force, only 28.3% of the total population participates, with males at 49.4% and females at only 6.3%. According to the recent UNDP report on Pakistan, entitled Balanced Development: An Approach to Social Action in Pakistan (1992), "as long as the potential economic value of women is not fully appreciated, their status will remain dominated by their child-bearing and rearing activities." UNDP identifies that female education is the "key to unlocking this vicious circle."

The USAID Mission in Pakistan has been working innovatively through its programmatic efforts to redress this imbalance. However, in 1990, the USAID Mission in Pakistan was required by law to begin closing out its projects in accordance with the U.S. Foreign Assistance Act's Pressler Amendment, which prohibits continued assistance to Pakistan if it engages in nuclear proliferation activities. In 1991, at the time of the Asia Mission Directors Conference in Washington, the USAID/Pakistan Deputy Director responded favorably to the newly appointed Asia Bureau Gender/WID Advisor's suggestion that an effort should be made during the closeout process an offer be made to "capture" the Mission's gender-related experience.

II. PURPOSE

The purpose of the WID Study is to capture the lessons learned through USAID-funded projects about integrating gender issues into the development portfolio of a country in which women are discriminated against. These lessons will then be conveyed to two audiences: 1) organizations which will continue to carry out development activities in Pakistan including the donor community, NGOs within Pakistan and the Government of Pakistan; and 2) development professionals in other similarly restrictive countries where women have low or very low status.

This WID Study is not intended to describe the situation for women in Pakistan globally, as that information has already been made available by United Nations organizations, nor is it expected to provide an exhaustive evaluation of USAID's efforts to integrate gender considerations into its portfolio. Rather, it is expected to identify and highlight specific WID experiences in a concise and coherent manner.

13

III. STATEMENT OF WORK

Overview

The USAID/Pakistan WID Committee has concluded that a limited and focussed study documenting USAID/Pakistan's activities as they relate to gender will be worthwhile for the following reasons:

- Identifying and implementing activities that directly benefit women is not easy in a country such as Pakistan where both religious and tribal traditions often pose serious obstacles.
- The impact of integrated WID activities, whether intended or unintended, often gets overlooked in large development projects.
- USAID has made some significant accomplishments and discovered some important lessons both at the policy and the project implementation level that are well worth documenting and would prove valuable to other USAID Missions in Asia and the Near East as well as the donor community in Pakistan.

The WID Committee used its semi-annual review of the Mission's portfolio to classify the Mission's projects into three groups, based on their relevance for a WID Study. The three groups are described below:

- **GROUP I:** Projects where beneficiaries can be identified, where data is readily available and that are mature enough to have had some measurable effect.

Training

Development Support Training (DST) Project
Agricultural Sector Support (ASSP) Program

Forestry

Forestry Planning and Development (FP&D) Project

Area Development

Northwest Frontier Area Development (NWFAD) Project - Gadoon -
Amazai and Kala Dhaka
Tribal Areas Development (TAD) Project
Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (SRSC)

Primary Education

Primary Education Development (PED) Project

Agriculture Extension/Outreach

Management of Agricultural Research and Technology (MART) Project
Transformation and Integration of the Provincial Agricultural Network
(TIPAN)

Support to Non-Governmental Organizations

Project Design and Implementation Fund (PDIF)
Trust for Voluntary Organizations (TVO)

- **GROUP II:** Projects where activities are aimed at influencing women, but where one of the above three ingredients is missing.

Population

Social Marketing and Contraceptives (SMC) Project
Population Welfare Planning (PWP) Project

Child Survival

Child Survival (CS) Project

Support to Non-Governmental Organizations

Special Development Fund (SDF)

- **GROUP III:** Projects that are gender neutral, where beneficiary identification is obscure and/or any effect on women would be difficult to measure or ascribe to USAID's intervention. These projects focus mainly on institutional development, policy reform and infrastructure improvement.

Energy

Private Sector Power (PSP) Project
Energy Planning and Development (EP&D) Project
Rural Electrification (RE) Project

Private Sector

Private Investment Expansion (PIE) Project
Shelter Resources Mobilization (SRM) Project

Infrastructure

Irrigation Systems Management (ISM) Project
Roads Resources Management (RSM) Project
Balochistan Roads (BR) Project

Procedures

In order to determine the "lessons learned" from USAID/Pakistan's interventions in the above projects, the contractor will perform the following:

- 1) Review USAID/Pakistan evaluations and other project documents, with a particular emphasis on Group I interventions, with a view to summarizing gender lessons contained therein;
- 2) Interview USAID and contractor staff about the specific success stories of WID interventions which they recall, particularly in the ARD, PED, NGO and training projects;

- 3) Design beneficiary-relevant questions to measure impact, (e.g. in forestry, ask women how much local trees have helped), as outlined in Annex I, and interview project beneficiaries using them;
- 4) Distinguish in the lessons learned between the hard obstacles or constraints that USAID was able to overcome at the policy level (e.g., getting the Ministry of Education to agree to open schools for girls) and at the project implementation level;
- 5) Identify key sex-disaggregated data, if any, that has been informative for project implementation and documenting project impact; and
- 6) Prepare a synthesis of lessons learned from individual project level information in terms of the key characteristics that have led to success in these projects, on a sectoral basis or preferably cross-cutting.

The contractor is not expected to prepare an exhaustive summary of all interventions in Pakistan nor to elaborate at great length on the Pakistan experience in general. Rather, concise success stories of USAID's interventions which worked to bring women into the development process in Pakistan are to be recounted in a clear and enticing manner for replication.

The contractor is also asked to propose a strategy for conveying these "lessons learned" to other donors in Pakistan, to NGOs and to the GOP, as appropriate. In collaboration with GENESYS, a training module will then be devised to accomplish this purpose. Glossy booklets/publications will also be prepared with GENESYS supervision. GENESYS will then determine, in conjunction with the Pakistan Mission, how these lessons can be best conveyed to a wide audience, through training and document dissemination.

(Annex I contains specific information on USAID's programs and projects in Pakistan with suggested approaches to capturing the WID successes in each one. The contractor is expected to review these suggestions and follow them, as appropriate. Annex II contains a preliminary list of resource materials which have been gathered for the WID Study.)

IV. QUALIFICATIONS

The main contractor on the WID Study will be The Futures Group, proven for its abilities to manage WID studies through its selection by the R&D/WID Office in 1990 to manage the 5-year \$20 million GENESYS (Gender in Economic and Social Systems) Project.

A local subcontractor will be selected in Pakistan by the GENESYS Project, via the Asia Bureau Gender/WID Advisor, to conduct the in-country portion of the study. This firm/individual must have the following qualifications and/or provide a team with these combined skills.

- Proven capabilities to work in the Pakistani cultural milieu;
- Sensitivity to and experience with gender/WID issues;
- A social sciences background;
- Appropriate language capabilities;

- Technical expertise in one or more of the USAID sectoral areas (agriculture, human resource development, education, health, training);
- Good writing skills; and
- Prior experience in international development projects, specifically with USAID, if possible.

V. FUNDING/LEVEL OF EFFORT/BUDGET

The USAID Mission will be match funded by the R&D/WID Office on a 50/50 basis through the GENESYS Project for this entire activity. The interviews with selected USAID staff should be completed as early as possible within the 90 day assignment due to the departure of many members of the staff in the summer of 1993.

The budget presented by the sub-contractor must not exceed \$25,000 for the entire product, to be completed within 90 days. The funds will be dispersed on an incremental task basis, upon completion of discrete portions of the Scope of Work. (The total budget for the activity is somewhat larger due to the oversight and contributions of the GENESYS Project staff.)

(Illustrative budgets for this WID Study are attached. One budget illustrates anticipated expenses for the entire WID Study, conducted through the GENESYS Project by The Futures Group. The second budget illustrates the estimated costs for a sub-contracted Purchase Order for the main substance of the WID Study, to be offered to a qualified Pakistani firm or personal services contractor.)

82

USAID/PAKISTAN
WID STUDY

USAID Programs and Projects

GROUP I

Development Support Training Project (DSTP)

The Development Support Training Project (DSTP) has provided both for participant training opportunities for women in the U.S. and for in-country training. Approximately 500 women have been sent abroad, almost all to the United States, for both academic and technical training. Over half have received training in management-related fields, and over 100 in agriculture-related fields. DSTP also established a Management Training Unit that focused on in-country training in the areas of management, administration, entrepreneurship, and training of trainers. Over 1800 people were trained between 1988 and 1991, of which nearly 40% were women. (Although the Unit was closed in 1991 due to the Pressler cutbacks, the Unit's records are available from the contractor, Academy for Educational Development (AED), still in country.)

The contractor will do a follow-up study with women participant trainees from the DSTP who have returned from the U.S. and investigate the following:

- 1) Why were they willing to leave Pakistan to go to the U.S?
- 2) What obstacles did they have to overcome?
- 3) What new opportunities, if any, have been opened to them as a result of the training?

The contractor will do a similar study with beneficiaries of the Management Training Unit's in-country training. (These beneficiaries are both trainer consultants, who became trainers themselves under the project, and other trainees.)

Agricultural Sector Support Program (ASSP)

Under the Agriculture Sector Support Program (ASSP), twelve women are presently in the U.S. seeking Master's degrees in agriculture as part of the long-term training program. Amongst these are two women GOP officials from Sindh who successfully completed nine months of training in-country to prepare them for long-term training programs at the Master's level in the U.S.

Additional general training for the agricultural sector has been provided through ASSP, which sponsors programs for women in Balochistan in improving basic skills and also started a program for women in entrepreneurship. Eight women are currently receiving short-term training under ASSP.

In Phase I of the 1991 Private Sector Training Plan, five women were selected for short-term training programs in horticulture, poultry production, agriculture management and forestry. These women are now actively involved in their respective fields of interest.

As with the DSTP, the contractor will do a follow-up study with women who received training under the ASSP, both in the U.S. and in Pakistan.

97

Forestry Planning and Development Project (FPD)

Under the Forestry Planning and Development Project, a major breakthrough has been made in securing admission for women for the first time to train as foresters at the Pakistan Forest Institute in Peshawar. With USAID funding, the number of women forestry graduates in the country will exceed 30 by the end of 1994. These female graduates are intended to be employed in social forestry endeavors and are expected to have direct impact in advancing the merits of social forestry, especially as it affects women beneficiaries.

In addition, some of the private sector nurseries established by the project are run by women. There are also some women plantation owners.

Some of the WID lessons learned through the project include the need to be opportunistic and respond to particular situations which allow small changes which can provide an entry point for future interventions of a grander nature. An example of this occurred when a woman became the first female forester at the Institute because her name appeared to the registrar to be a male name. Another potential entry point has been identified as the father-daughter linkage. Those fathers who are themselves foresters whose daughters have been encouraged to study at the Institute are predicted to be strong supporters of their daughters' placement in rural settings as employed foresters.

The contractor will review the Forestry Planning and Development Project for lessons learned, as follows:

- 1) Meet with trained women foresters and investigate the following:
 - a) Why the foresters joined the program.
 - b) What will motivate foresters to continue.
- 2) Interview on-farm beneficiaries. Since a major objective of the project was to increase the supply of firewood to private farmers, the following questions, at least, should be asked:
 - a) What effect has the project had on women as major gatherers of firewood?
 - b) Has the introduction of trees at the farm level changed the women's routine in terms of providing both firewood and fodder?
 - c) Would the employment of women extension workers augment the benefits of social forestry to women at the farm site?
- 3) Attempt to answer the following questions:
 - a) Will the women nursery owners survive after the project support ends?
 - b) Are women nursery owners as competitive as male nursery owners in sales to the private sector, as opposed to the subsidized sales to the Forestry Department?
 - c) Are the plots of women plantation owners as successful as those managed by men? If not, why not?

8/1

- d) What effect would employing more female forestry graduates as extension workers have on the female-run enterprises?

Northwest Frontier Area and Tribal Areas Development Projects (NWFAD and TADP)

Under the Northwest Frontier Area Development (NWFAD) Project, over 30 Non-Formal Education (NFE) centers have been established in the Gadoon-Amazai area. Nearly 2000 women have already been trained in skills such as vegetable gardening, livestock raising, social forestry, sewing, embroidery, knitting, adult literacy and health education. Seventeen local grassroots women's organizations have been established.

The project has also started and operates six girls' schools (3 primary schools, 2 middle schools, and 1 high school), bringing in teachers from outside the area and renting local facilities. There were no girls' secondary schools in the project area before these schools opened. Village acceptance and support for these schools is reflected in a 70% enrollment increase this year. The girls currently enrolled in Grade 10 will be the first females ever to graduate from a local secondary school.

In addition, poultry distribution and training of women in poultry breeding has been undertaken as part of the NWFAD Project, focusing on the remote Kala Dhaka region. Women are given chicken "units" (5 hens and 1 rooster) and veterinary necessities and are trained in the basics of poultry husbandry.

(Other agricultural projects have provided assistance to women. The Food Security Management Project conducted a workshop for women on technology transfer for insect and rodent control at Fateh Jhang. Copies of the training manual used at the workshop were provided to the Women's Foundation in Lahore. Under the Management of Agricultural Research and Technology Project (MART), women in development programs have been held on crop production and livestock management activities in Fatehjang Tehsil through the project's Farming Systems Research component with its separate WID element aimed at directly increasing the productivity of rural women. The TIPAN Project is developing the capacity of the Agricultural University in Peshawar. The University has a separate Directorate of Outreach that is trying to establish a program directly involving rural women and youth.)

This project offers some truly ground-breaking examples of success stories. To begin with, it is particularly impressive that any activities promoting the involvement of women were able to be undertaken at all in these extremely isolated areas, where the donor community had not previously been active.

NWFAD has recently completed an internal in-depth assessment of the NFE Centers which resulted in an Action Plan that will restructure the management system and focus on an improved program with the training needed to deliver it. The project maintains records on the progress made by the project-run girls' schools. Field visits and interviews for both the NFEs and the girls' schools would be possible.

Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (SRSC)

The Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (SRSC) is a newly formed NGO operating in two districts of the Northwest Frontier Province, where women are restricted by social and cultural constraints and have traditionally been excluded from the decision making process. SRSC's approach is to support women to develop separate organizations and enterprises traditionally managed by women. In the past two years, nearly forty Women's Organizations (WOs) have been formed, extension workers have been trained, activities have been identified, and productive investments have been initiated.

Women beneficiaries in this project are easily identified. Three recent evaluations / assessments of SRSC have been completed, one by the United Nations, one by SRSC and its founding contractor, Winrock, and the third by USAID.

Primary Education Program (PED)

The PED Program started in 1989 with a goal of increasing access to primary education for girls in two of the least developed provinces in the country, the Northwest Frontier and Balochistan Provinces. At a funding level of \$77 million over five years, it is one of the Agency's largest basic education programs. It is designed to increase female participation by training more women teachers and ensuring that new schools are located close to where girls live.

This is obviously an important activity, one that should provide major, long-lasting benefits for the female population in both Balochistan and the NWFP. Examples of the importance already attached to primary education for girls is the GOP's commitment to support construction of new schools only for girls for the next two years.

Three lessons learned can already be cited. One is that, according to the project's Human Resource Survey, parents are willing to send girls to school, even coed schools, under certain conditions. The second is that the preschool level can provide an innovative entry point for girls' education, allowing girls to gain an extra year of education at little extra cost and no social disruption. The third, at the policy level, is that it is very important to have female role models in meetings where policy decisions are made about girls' education.

The contractor will extract lessons learned about attracting girl children into primary education through a review of project documentation and interviews with staff. Many of these lessons have already been understood and documented in regular program and project documents. It needs only to be extracted, compiled and summarized for dissemination.

In addition, an evaluation of the PED program is scheduled for early 1993. As the Scope of Work includes an assessment of program activities on a gender-disaggregated basis, the evaluation should provide some additional complementary information to be added to the WID Study.

Support for NGOs: Human Rights Activities

Under Section 116(e) of the Human Rights Fund for FY 90, a number of grants have been provided to NGOs to carry out human rights activities. Amongst these grants are the following:

Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid: A grant was provided to the Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid to support operation of a legal aid center in Karachi that has facilitated two paralegal training seminars where NGO staff, community workers and volunteers, most of whom are women, have been taught basic family law. This training is intended to enable the participants to provide advice in their communities and encourage people to professional help from lawyers at the center.

Pakistan Women Lawyers' Association: A grant has been provided to this group to support a liaison legal aid center at Rawalpindi, extending legal assistance to indigent women. The center also serves as a base for the PWLA to monitor legislation pertaining to women's rights, and to track legislators' voting records on these issues.

Under the Project Design and Implementation Fund (PDIF), grants have been made

86

Under the Project Design and Implementation Fund (PDIF), grants have been made available to women-based NGOs as described below:

Family Welfare Cooperative Society: A grant has been provided to the FWCS for the construction and furnishing of a working women's hostel in Lahore. This facility is within walking distance of government offices and institutions in an area where there is no accommodation available for women. FWCS hopes the hostel will be self-sustaining in the future.

All Pakistan Women's Association: A multi-purpose auditorium has been constructed for the Punjab branch of the APWA. This auditorium will be used to further APWA's programs as well as becoming an income generating facility to fund APWA's education, health, family planning, and vocational skills programs for the indigent women of Lahore.

With the growth of enthusiasm for NGOs in Pakistan, and with USAID's hope to provide future development assistance to Pakistan through NGOs, it will be particularly important for the contractor to document how gender considerations are handled by NGOs.

GROUP II

Social Marketing of Contraceptives Project (SMC)

The Social Marketing of Contraceptives Project (SMC) promotes family planning and attempts to expand the availability of contraceptives through the private sector. The primary beneficiaries of this project are the women who are protected by contraception, thus greatly improving their health and lowering Pakistan's very high maternal mortality rate.

The SMC Project has conducted various surveys to determine the percentage of the population covered by contraception, but these surveys have been primarily directed at the male purchasers and suppliers of condoms. There is very little, if any, data on individual female beneficiaries; and, as there are no women shopkeepers, this has been an empty avenue of investigation.

While women could be identified and located based on clinic and NGO records for follow-up interviews about the impact of the SMC Project, it is deemed cost-ineffective to attempt such an undertaking. The SMC Project has just undergone an evaluation. As the SOW for the evaluation was not designed with this WID Study in mind, it may well not have included sufficient questions to capture gender lessons. However, it should be reviewed. Likewise, some of the lessons learned in the health sector may be contained in the Primary Health Care Project evaluation conducted in 1991.

11

Population Welfare Planning Project (PWP)

The Population Welfare Planning Project benefits millions of Pakistani women by providing maternal health and family planning services. Over 4000 female community health workers, health technicians and medical officers have received training in clinical and health care delivery skills to this end.

On a national level, the best and most recent data available is from the PWP-funded Demographic Health Survey completed in 1991. The contractor will be expected to review this survey for insights relevant to this WID Study.

The Mission WID Committee notes that no follow-up has been done with individual women in addition to this survey. While the resultant information would be very important for this WID Study, the WID Committee feels, as with the SMC Project, that it is unlikely that the benefit of such a follow-up would justify the considerable time and cost involved.

Child Survival Project (CSP)

The Child Survival Project targets the nation's mothers and mothers-in-law for communication and research programs on improving child care and survival. It also improves child survival by expanded immunizations and availability and knowledge of oral rehydration.

The original project as outlined in the Project Paper has had major changes, owing to a late start-up and major funding cuts due to the Pressler Amendment. Under the revised strategy, a curriculum has been developed and the training component began this year. It would be too early to review the effectiveness of either the curriculum or the training.

However, the project will be formally evaluated in mid-1993. The contractor will provide input to the design of this evaluation to ensure that it captures the successes of the project in meeting its objectives for women and children. (FYI, if there is a specific WID component to the evaluation, the Mission may be able to match CSP funds with R&D funds on a 50/50 basis.)

Special Development Fund (SDF)

The Special Development Fund Project supports, amongst other activities, the establishment of the Trust for Voluntary Organizations (TVO) through a \$30 million endowment. This purpose of the trust is to promote the development of the NGO sector in Pakistan. Its three target areas are Human Resource Development, Women in Development, and Community Health. A number of its beneficiaries are women-based NGOs promoting WID objectives.

As it is too early to collect success stories from TVO about women-focused interventions, as the first grants were issued in May 1992, the contractor should discuss with the TVO its concrete agenda for evaluation of activities with either a WID-specific, WID-integrated, or WID-component focus. The contractor should also review TVO's criteria for grants and work with the TVO to develop a plan for promoting gender-sensitivity training for all NGOs receiving funding from the endowment.

GROUP III

Private Enterprise Development Project

Although most of the private sector interventions have been at a macro-level, and thus relatively gender-neutral, funding was set aside by the O/PEN in USAID/Pakistan to conduct a training of trainers' workshop in women's enterprise development during 1992/93. Women

have taken the lead in micro-enterprise training and establishing small credit programs in Pakistan. This training is intended to assist participating NGOs to develop an in-house training capability to further their efforts to assist women to start or improve a business.

The contractor should investigate to what extent these workshops have taken place and provide a follow-up study with those trainers trained to determine the impact of the training.

89

**USAID/PAKISTAN
WID STUDY**

Bibliography

The following documents have been identified as resources for the WID Study. Most (marked with *) are available through the WID Officer in the USAID/Pakistan Mission. The annotations have been provided to assist the study team identify relevant materials for the study. This list is meant to be illustrative, not inclusive.

PAKISTAN: GENERAL

Research Triangle Institute. "Gender Resource Awareness for National Development" (GRAND). Trip Report.

*UNDP. NGOs Working for Others: A Contribution to Human Development. Volumes I and II. 1991.

This publication is a result of a recognition that non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have an increasingly important role to play in the development process in Pakistan. Despite substantial development assistance by bilateral and multilateral agencies and efforts of governments in Pakistan to effectively promote development and to raise the standards of living of the poor, overall, there has been limited success in alleviating poverty. Added to this is the belief that NGOs in Pakistan have the potential to bring about structural change in the society and to improve the conditions of the disadvantaged. Volume I of this publication provides an analysis of the aims, development, strengths, weaknesses and work of NGOs in Pakistan. Volume II serves as an appendix and gives a list of the NGOs contacted for the survey.

*UNDP. Balanced Development: An Approach to Social Action in Pakistan. Islamabad, 1992.

The past few years have witnessed a growing international consensus that development is more than economic growth: development is about people. Pakistan is at the forefront of this discussion. There has been a convergence of national and international concerns over the inadequate impact of development resources on the quality of people's lives in Pakistan. Hence, over the past two years, UNDP has attempted to formulate an alternative to the traditional approaches to development in Pakistan, in close collaboration with Pakistani authorities, and other international donors, especially UNICEF, UNFPA and the World Bank. This report is a result of this exercise.

*USAID. Forward Together: United States Economic Aid to Pakistan. 1988.

This booklet reports on one chapter in the long-term 30-year partnership between Pakistan and the U.S. It describes the period between 1982-87.

USAID/PAKISTAN: PROGRAM/PROJECT/EVALUATION DOCUMENTS

Background Memoranda to WID in USAID/Pakistan

*Study on Gender Issues in Pakistan" - Judy Schumacher, M&E Specialist, O/DRM, USAID/ Pakistan, December 6, 1992

*"WID Agenda and Accomplishments: Highlights of WID Initiatives and Accomplishments by Sector" - Kaneez Fatima Kassim, WID Officer, USAID/Pakistan, February 1993.

Development Support Training Project: Documents.

*Academy for Educational Development. Development Support Training Project: Female Jefferson Fellows and Associates. (1983-92).

*Volume I: This report provides data on female participants who have completed training. The data includes name, personal and employer addresses, dates of study, major field of study, length of study, degree, and funding project.

*Volume II: This report provides information generated by a follow-up survey questionnaire and analyses issues related to training utilization. Participant narratives are also included.

Development Associates. Evaluation of the International Center for Research on Women's Assistance to USAID/Pakistan. 1987.

*The Futures Group. Pakistan: The Makran: Women Can Make A Difference (A Report of Programming Strategies for Development of Women's Economic and Social Talents). Prepared by Carol Martin. GENESYS Project, 1992.

The Makran Division of Balochistan Province has been neglected in the Pakistan's development plans. In efforts to remedy this, in part, USAID sponsored the Balochistan Area Development Project (BALAD). When the Pressler Amendment required phase out of USAID's assistance to Pakistan, this report was commissioned to investigate how Makran women's development needs could be carried out through local NGOs. This report highlights sectoral constraints uncovered by the research and presents recommendations for program design by NGOs.

Forestry Planning and Development Project: Documents.

*Muhammad, Miss Mamoona Wali. "WID Activities in the Forestry Planning and Development Project." April 1991.

This paper was presented at the Workshop on Employment of Women in Forestry co-sponsored by the Pakistan Forest Institute and the ILO.

*Huke, Susan, and M.C. Koestar. "A Concept Paper: Second National Workshop on Women in Forestry to be held in Islamabad, Pakistan." September, 1992.

This concept paper outlines a follow-up workshop to be held in 1993, two years after an original workshop on Women in Forestry organized by ILO in Pakistan. At the original workshop papers were presented which reviewed the extent of women's participation in the forestry sector and promoted the formation of working groups to recommend ways to increase the participation of women. The primary goal of the second workshop will be to enhance and facilitate the role of women, both forestry professionals and land users, in

forestry and agro-forestry education, training, research and extension.

Microenterprise Training of Trainers: Documents.

*Memorandum. "Microenterprise Training of Trainers (TOT) Workshop for Women in Lahore" - Prepared by Nasim Sherin, O/PEN, USAID, January 7, 1993

*Memorandum. "Microenterprise Training of Trainers (TOT) Workshop for Women in Lahore" - Prepared by Nasim Sherin, O/PEN, USAID, February 9, 1993

Northwest Frontier Area Development Project: Documents.

*Project Paper. "Women in Development: Non-Formal Education."

*Project Paper. "Designing of Non-Formal Education Curriculum for Women in Tribal Agency, Kurram." - Razia Abbas, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad.

*Abdullah, Tahira. NWFADP: Women's Non-Formal Education Component: An Informal Assessment. Office of Program, USAID/Islamabad, 1987.

This informal assessment of a WID initiative underway in a remote, isolated, physically difficult of access, socio-culturally tradition-bound and economically lagging area of the NWFP was prepared for the Northwest Frontier Area Development Project staff. It is based on visits to 12 centers.

*"Assessment of Non-Formal Education Program" - Mary Jane Javed and Rashida Khanum. July 1990.

*"Women in Development Programs in Gadoon-Amazai: Non-Formal Education Activities" - May 1992.

*"From Poppy Substitution to Sustainable Development: Conceptual Framework and the Action Plan for Project Transformation" - Izhar Ali Hunzai, Aga Khan Rural Support Programme, Gilgit, August 1992.

*"Assessment of Women's Non-Formal Education Program in Gadoon-Amazai" - Peshawar University WID Team, September 1992.

This study of the non-formal education program in Gadoon was conducted in order to assess its impact and document any problems concerned with its implementation. Six university graduates were contracted from Peshawar University to conduct the study. The assessment was intended to be a tool to help in better planning for the future sustainability of women's non-formal education programs in the Gadoon-Amazai area.

Primary Education Development Program (PED): Documents.

*Human Resource Survey: Northwest Frontier Province - Office of the Directorate of Primary Education, June 1992.

The HRS was designed to collect information on the current status and prospects for primary education in the villages of Northwest Frontier Province. A main concern was female teacher supply and distribution.

*"A First Report for Use in Primary School Construction for the Human Resources

92

Survey" - Andrea Rugh

This report contains findings from 4,630 villages surveyed in the Human Resource Survey. It was prepared to provide the P&D Department of the Primary Education Directorate with information on the semi-urban villages in which the community support for girls' education is reported to be high, in which there are no schools, and where someone in the village has indicated willingness to donate land for a school.

- *"Purpose Level Indicators"
- *"Implementation Plan: Summary of Sectoral Policy Issues for Social Action Program (Education)"
- *"Mid-Year Progress Report: Fourth Annual Work Plan 1992-93" - Directorate of Primary Education, NWFP, December 1992.
- *"Revised Fourth Annual Work Plan 1992/93" - Directorate of Primary Education, North West Frontier Province, December 1992.
- *"Number of Teachers Required in 1992-93"

Sarhad Rural Support Corporation (SRSC) Documents

- *Annual Review. 1991.
- *"Impact Assessment of CIDA Funded Land Reclamation Project in Nazu Kaley, District Charsadda"
- *"A Review of Women's Organizations (WOs) Activities in Charsadda District as of August 1992" - Anila Ikhlas
- *"A Review of Women's Organizations (WOs) Activities in Kohat District as of August 1992" - Anila Ikhlas
- *A Strategic Planning Assessment. October 1992.

WID RESOURCES: PAKISTAN

- *Hussain, Faqir. Status of Women in NWFP (Pakistan). USAID. August, 1992.

This study analyzes the economic, legal, political, religious, health, educational, social and cultural dimensions of the status of women in the NWFP; examines the current allegedly discriminatory laws, policies and practices sanctioned by socio-cultural norms; examines the rights and guarantees provided by law and investigates the reasons for their ineffectiveness; and suggests remedies and measures for ameliorating the conditions of women in Pakistan so that they can become productive members of society.

- *Information Network on Women in Development (INWID). Towards Increased Integration of Women's Issues in the GOP's Eighth Five-Year Plan: A Discussion Paper Prepared for the Planning Commission. Islamabad, February 1991.

As an input to the preparatory planning for the Eighth Five -year Plan (1993-98), this paper attempts to list main planning concerns related to increased mainstreaming of

WID issues, review past efforts to identify major achievements, constraints and emerging opportunities; and to present recommended strategies for discussion with specific reference to improving women's status. It was prepared by the WID Focal Points of the major donor agencies in Pakistan.

Shirkat-Gah. Subha. A Newsletter on Women and Development.

*UNDP. Women in Development: Pakistan. 1991.

This report on WID underlines the growing concern for including women in the development planning process in Pakistan. Making women contributors to development and at the same time beneficiaries of progress is increasingly recognized as a national objective. A major reason for preparing this booklet is the recognition that most donors are actively involved in WID activities and that readily available information on WID policies and examples of projects could facilitate better collaboration.

*UNICEF. The Girl Child in Pakistan: Priority Concerns. Prepared by Sabeeha Hafeez.

This paper was presented at the UNICEF Strategy Meeting on the SAARC Year of the Girl Child at Islamabad, January 28-30, 1990. It deals with six points: 1) neglect of girl children; 2) differential impact of social environment on boys and girls; 3) discriminatory cultural attitudes toward girls; 4) status inconsistencies; 5) attitudes of indifference toward girls; and 6) disparities in opportunities and access to services and resources.

*UNICEF. Situation Analysis of Children and Women in Pakistan. 1988.

This publication is a first attempt at contributing to an understanding of the extent, nature, correlation and consequences of the different factors that determine children's development in Pakistan. It is a part of the preparation for a renewed social response to the current situation of children. It is also an advocacy response addressed to those who are responsible for planning, administering and deciding upon not only social development in general, but more specifically, for the children who will be adults in the 21st century.

*UNICEF. Women's Economic Participation in Pakistan: A Status Report. Prepared by Farida Shaheed and Khawar Mumtaz.

This report presents the desk research undertaken in 1990 as an input towards preparation of the GOP/UNICEF "Situation Analysis of Children and Women in

Pakistan." It includes recommendations for improving women's economic participation in Pakistan.

*UNICEF. Structural Issues in Women's Development in Pakistan. Prepared by Amera Saeed. 1990.

This desk research report was undertaken as an input towards the preparation of the GOP/UNICEF "Situation Analysis of Children and Women in Pakistan." It is an enquiry into the structural issues pertaining to women's situation, development and status in Pakistan, including the socio-cultural environment, data constraints, constitutional provisions and legal status, political roles, and policy formulation re development issues.

OTHER

Engendering Development in Asia and the Near East: A Sourcebook. USAID/ICRW, 1992.

Sasson, Jean P. Princess: A True Story of life Behind the Veil in Saudi Arabia. William Morrow and Company, Inc., New York, 1992.

C:\TAS\FATIMA\PIOT.WID

95