

PN-ABP-953
84601

FINAL REPORT

**GENDER CONSIDERATIONS
IN DEVELOPMENT TRAINING
AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE**

June 1991
Prepared for:
Office of Women in Development
Bureau for Research and Development
Agency for International Development
Contract No. PDC-0100-Z-00-9044-00

GENESYS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS	i
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	iii
I. WORKSHOP OVERVIEW, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	1
A. Objectives	1
B. Activities	1
C. Conclusions and Recommendations	1
II. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO SELECTED USAID PROJECTS	5
A. Introduction	5
B. Technical Assistance Provided	5
APPENDIX A: Gender Issues Identified for USAID/Mali During the Training Workshops	6
APPENDIX B: Participant List for June 13-14, 1991	8
APPENDIX C: Participant List for June 17-18, 1991	9
APPENDIX D: Participant List for June 20, 1991	10
APPENDIX E: Technical Assistance Results	11
APPENDIX F: Economic and Gender Issues in Livestock	23

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

ADO	Agriculture Development Officer
AFIMA	Malian Women Engineers Association
APEX	The Mali Livestock III Project
API	Assessment of Program Impact
AV	Association Villageoise
BEEP	Basic Education Expansion Project
CHPS	Community Health and Population Services Project
CLUSA	Credit League of the United States of America
CRES	Centre Régional d'Energie Solaire
CVL	A component of the APEX Project
DFA	Development Fund for Africa
DHV	Opération pour le Développement de la Haute Vallée
DNE	Direction Nationale de l'environnement
FSN	Foreign Service National
GCID	Gender Considerations in Development
GENESYS	Gender in Economic and Social Systems
GRM	The Government of the Republic of Mali
HRDA	Human Resources Development Assistance Project
HRDO	Human Resources Development Officer
HUICOMA	A cotton seed oil marketing association
ILCA	International League of Credit Associations
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ODR	Organisation de Développement Rurale

OHV	Opération Haute Vallée
ONG	Organisation Non-Gouvernementale
PID	Project Identification Document
PIR	Project Implementation Review Document
PPC/WID	Program and Policy Coordination/The Office of Women in Development
SOW	Scope of Work
USAID	United States Agency for International Development.
USDH	United States Direct Hire
WID	Women in Development

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the request of USAID/Bamako, the GENESYS Project organized and conducted a three-week long consultation in Bamako on gender analysis and the integration of gender issues into the development process. The activity was initiated by a Mission buy-in to the GENESYS Project and was conducted by the GENESYS training team. A four-member team planned and performed three kinds of inter-related training interventions: a half-day policy forum for high-level Malian decision-makers; two 2-day training programs for USAID project personnel and their collaborators; and several days of project-and sector-specific technical assistance.

The project was conceived in FY90 after a needs assessment had been performed by two consultants from Mayatech Corporation. The original September implementation date had to be postponed three times due to political disturbances in Mali and abroad. The actual in-country activities took place from June 7 to June 28. The USAID/Mali Gender Considerations in Development Workshop Training and the following Technical Assistance occurred at a time when the new transitional government was reorganizing itself around a new five-year national development plan and a new national constitution. In addition, the government was beginning to focus on gender issues and the promotion of women's activities and associations.

An integral part of the training interventions was a half-day workshop conducted with over thirty GRM project directors, other donors, representatives from two newly created women's associations along with several high-level Malian decision makers, some of whom were involved in redesigning the national action plan for women in Mali. Both the USAID Director and the newly-appointed Cabinet Minister for Women's Promotion from the Ministry of Public Health, Social Affairs and Women's Promotion spoke on national television during the workshop opening. Their comments highlighted the important role Malian women play in national development and called for higher degrees of integration and participation.

GENESYS conducted two longer workshops with some eighty participants, for USAID staff and their collaborators. These sessions were designed to help participants acquire or hone their skills in gender analysis. There was a mix of participants representing development fields such as education, agriculture, livestock, and public health.

Following the training sessions, the trainers provided general and one-on-one technical assistance on integrating gender considerations into major projects and programs in the USAID portfolio. The technical assistance was of particular help to the design efforts on the new Agricultural Productivity and Export Project and the Community Health and Population Services Project.

At the conclusion of both the training workshops and the technical assistance, both Mission and Host Country participants stated that the WID Office intervention exceeded their expectations and promoted efforts to confront important gender issues in Mali.

I. WORKSHOP OVERVIEW, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Objectives

The overall goal of the activity was to further the institutionalization and integration of gender considerations in Mali including: USAID activities, related development programs, the 5-year national development plan, and multi-donor activities. This goal was translated into four training objectives for participants to:

- Learn the legal and policy parameters of gender as a development issue in A.I.D., other donor agencies, and developing country programs
- Understand basic components of gender analysis tools and their applications to specific projects or programs
- Develop and present strategies for integrating gender considerations into their work
- Recognize new information sources for sex-disaggregated data in Mali and elsewhere.

B. Activities

The training was conducted in Bamako, Mali from June 13 - 14 and June 17 - 18, 1991 by GENESYS training specialists Janet Tuthill, Team Leader; Drew Lent, Trainer; Martha Gaudreau, Trainer; and Sandra Amis, Logistics Specialist. The half-day policy forum was held the morning of June 20. These three events were held at the "Centre Régional d'Énergie Solaire" (CRES) in Bamako.

As a result of the needs assessment, the Mission identified five target projects for the follow-on technical assistance. Managers from each of these projects were selected to participate in the 2-day training seminars. Working with the Mission WID Officer, some modifications were made as to which project received follow-on assistance. Also, specific technical outputs were established. The general procedures for each project intervention is described in the Technical Assistance section of this report. The team planned an earlier arrival for a couple days of in-country preparation and modification to the workshops' designs.

C. Conclusions and Recommendations

After the training seminar "Role et Participation de la Femme dans le Développement: le Contexte et les Outils Analytiques," twenty-one participants evaluated the training in terms of the personal impact the training would have within the work environment, the quality of trainers and training materials used, and on aspects of the training which were most useful, and what could be improved upon. Many useful suggestions were given to improve the training along with a majority of positive feedback. The following summarizes participant responses for each of the two sessions of the core GCID training.

June 13 and 14 Session

After the training, more than a third of the participants acquired the tools necessary to identify and analyze the factors affecting women in development within their own field as well as in other sectors. Four people stated that they would be able to include gender analysis into their own training programs. Several participants left with the intention of sharing the information and skills they learned in this workshop with their colleagues.

Participants identified several sessions as having been particularly useful. Majority (10) felt that session 2, the use of Gender Analysis, was the most helpful. Key to this session was the emphasis placed on identifying useful tools. More than a third of the participants (8) felt that all the sessions were useful and informative. Several people (7) felt that the use of case studies was particularly relevant, three of whom identified the terms of reference of the evaluation case in particular. Five people also identified session 4, Policy reform, and four mentioned session 2, the "Political and Legislative Framework" as most useful.

The workshop design was highly participatory, especially through small group discussions which enabled the participants to exchange ideas and experiences. Skills were developed to incorporate gender analysis into program and project design and implementation. Many participants felt this activity should be expanded.

Several people remarked that the training was of very high quality and given the time constraints, could not have been better. When asked to identify aspects of the training which could be improved upon, five people suggested that more time be allowed for large group discussion when reporting out in order to better benefit from the experience of others. By the same token, seven people mentioned they would like to receive a final synthesis of the group work. In response to these comments, USAID/Mali volunteered to write and distribute a synthesis document of the final group work. Some participants felt that the trainers should also include a more directive strategy of intervention on what was accomplished in the group work. Some suggestions by the participants for ways to improve the seminar include: devoting more time to consciousness-raising techniques, the optional sessions and gender analysis; less time to A.I.D. policy and DFA; and to include more diverse case studies of subjects such as health, artisan industry and animal husbandry.

Majority of the participants desired a longer seminar. Thirteen participants preferred longer sessions in order to do the work in more depth and not feel rushed. Four people felt that three days would be an optimal time to cover the material, and three felt that one week would be preferable.

All evaluations of the trainers were extremely positive ranging from "excellent" to "experienced" and "well informed." Several participants stated that the trainers made the issue very easy to understand and that they were able to impart a great deal of pertinent information. Several also mentioned that they found the trainers very open and willing to address questions which were not related to the original agenda. The ease with which the trainers facilitated lively group debate was also noted. Four participants specifically

mentioned the use of engaging materials including audio-visual equipment and the training notebook. Most of the participants felt that enough materials were provided to address the issues raised during the workshops, and that they were particularly well adapted and pertinent.

Many of the participants ended their evaluations with more general suggestions and questions. Several mentioned they would like to have access to more of this type of training in the future, with expansion to other key sectors and topics. It was suggested that the issue of how this particular training would affect national strategy and A.I.D. policy in Mali should be addressed. One participant stated that such a training should be incorporated by USAID Missions around the world as it is key in understanding gender not as a feminist issue, but as a development variable.

June 17 and 18 Session

All but one of the 18 respondents stated the utility and impact of Gender Analysis on their work. Fifteen of the participants felt that the use of Gender Analysis would be a key to conceptualizing, implementing, monitoring and evaluating projects. Four mentioned that the interaction of participants from different sectors had allowed for a broader understanding of overall issues. Three participants felt that they had become more aware of gender issues, and that they would be able to help raise their colleagues' consciousness. One participant stated that the training would be useful in her job as a trainer and another felt that the knowledge she had gained of the various sources of donor funds would be most useful in her work.

The Gender Analysis session was perceived as the most useful since it provided a real tool for use in the participants' work environment. Several other sessions were also mentioned, most notably the Policy Reform session which participants found thought-provoking. The table below lists the sessions which were mentioned. (Note that the total number of mentions is greater than the number of participants since some participants listed more than one session as "most useful.")

SESSION	NUMBER OF MENTIONS	SESSION	NUMBER OF MENTIONS
Gender Analysis	13	Group Work	2
Policy Reform	5	Fundraising	2
All Sessions	2	Development Fund for Africa	1
Case Studies	1		

Five participants identified the length of the workshop as an area for improvement, feeling it should be longer and expanded to provide more in-depth coverage of the issues already included in the workshop as well as to introduce additional issues. Several participants identified the group work sessions as needing improvement. One felt that the group work was tiring, and four felt that there should be more guidance and intervention from the trainers. One participant concluded that the discourse on theory should be more in depth, and another felt that the history of A.I.D was not relevant for Malians.

Evaluations of the trainers and training materials were positive. Ten participants described the trainers as experienced and well-informed. Others commented enthusiastically that the trainers were able to create an ambiance conducive to learning, that they were open to questions, communicated the issues well, and that their ability to guide debate was helpful. Participants further commented that the training materials were useful, relevant and well-presented.

Final comments centered on the desire for future training on the issue of gender integration and the participants' expectations for that training, such as the inclusion of women's groups in Mali to discuss the real problems facing Malian women today, adult education in rural areas as a topic of discussion, and the use of Mali-specific project documentation.

One Half Day Policy Forum on June 20

A one-half day Policy Forum was held after the two workshops to allow senior Malian officials and A.I.D. project directors to discuss development challenges and gender implications. Dennis Brennan, USAID/Mali Mission Director opened the session and welcomed the keynote speaker, Mme Debo Fanta Cissé, who outlined the importance the GRM is placing on women's role in development as new government programs are developed. Mme. Maimouna Dienapo, USAID WID Coordinator, reported to the group on the content of the gender analysis workshops and laid out the implications for future action at the A.I.D. program level.

The forum then broke into working groups which analyzed a range of policy reform options that affect women in Mali. The analysis centered on identifying stakeholder groups for legal changes which might benefit women. Several of the participants who were involved in elaborating women's issues for inclusion at the upcoming constitutional convention for the new government, decided to take the key points from the forum's discussion to the convention. Mme. Dienapo offered to produce the report summarizing the main points made in the forum for their use.

Jon Breslar, WID officer at USAID Mali, closed the session by describing some measures USAID is taking to implement gender analysis and program adjustment.

II. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO SELECTED USAID PROJECTS

A. Introduction

Prior to the training and technical assistance on addressing gender issues, provided by GENESYS, USAID/Mali commissioned a complete portfolio review in 1988 which led to the development of a WID Action Plan for the Mission. All of the points made in the Action Plan and based on the portfolio analysis are still valid in 1992. The Mission has progressed to a more targeted planning in its projects and has a number of WID coordinators working in the technical offices and some individual projects. This allocation of resources and personnel has yielded an increasing focus on the importance of gender in development success. The plans exist; the implementation is beginning.

It should be noted that, just as Mali stands at a political crossroads, the economic potential of its rural population is not yet fully realized. It was within this context that attention to gender differences and opportunities should be considered. Major economic reforms have taken place; major political changes are on their way. The determination that all of Mali's human resources contribute to its future dictates a focus, which not only takes women into account, but in some cases, focuses on activities where they are the major actors in the sector. Understanding gender differences and opportunities yields to better designed development programs and improved "People-level impact".

B. Technical Assistance Provided

At the request of the Program Office and WID Coordinator, the training team provided twelve person days of assistance to selected USAID projects. Martha Gaudreau and Janet Tuthill assisted priority projects as identified by the Mission, to either determine design opportunities for gender integration or to improve existing implementation. Working sessions were held with technical offices responsible for these activities as well as with visiting technical assistance teams and GRM personnel as needed. The Mission WID officer and WID coordinator worked closely with the team to set priorities and sort out options. A briefing for the Mission WID committee and technical office chiefs was conducted to test and further refine suggestions prior to incorporation into existing Mission documents.

Projects and activities assisted included:

- Basic Education Expansion Project (BEEP)
- Community Health and Population Services Project (CHPS)
- The Development of the Haute Vallee Project (DHV)
- The Mali Livestock III Project (APEX)
- The PVO Co-Financing Project
- Overall gender implications of Mission program logframe and assessment of program impact (API)
- Training needs and opportunities under HRDA or selected projects

The individual activities presently in the design phase such as CHPS, were provided with gender input for logical frameworks, implementation plans and design analyses. This work is reflected in the draft or final documents.

APPENDIX A: Gender Issues Identified for USAID/Mali During the Training Workshops

Generic Issues of Overall Relevance:

- Significant Mission commitment and activity which may be under-reported.
- Program Logframe and PIRs have potential for gender disaggregation which is not fully realized.
- New project activities offer significant opportunities to involve women (e.g. CHPS and APEX).
- Women do not automatically benefit because they are well-represented in a sector.
- Women are not a homogeneous group: significant caste, ethnic, age and rural/urban differences can be identified and must therefore be considered separately.
- Assuming that only women can work with women contributes to their increased marginalization.

Specific Recommendations:

- Name a USDH or FSN to be responsible for gender considerations in the Agriculture Development Office (this person need not be female).
- Share gender analysis materials with all staff.
- Seek assistance for in-country training components from HRDO to assure female participation.
- Sponsor in-country training for senior Malian women private and public sector leaders in management under HRDA.
- Start building databases in new activities which are sex-disaggregated.
- Use existing planning and monitoring tools to demonstrate significant gender differences in objectives and measurement (logframe, implementation plans, technical analyses, SOWs, etc.).

Institutional Issues

- Gender needs to be considered on two levels: institutional and field. The institutional level takes into consideration the number of women working within a particular institution or organization, what they do there, and their training opportunities. In the field level, we are talking about partners or clients in implementation -- usually rural women.

- ◆ Women in national structures need different tools from women working in the field, this includes leadership training, project planning and implementation, management training.
- ◆ Women hired for field-level activity should demonstrate an ability to work and live in rural areas. They should be included in the personnel structure and have job descriptions and performance expectations similar to men. Ethnic considerations in posting may make it easier for women to work and live in a particular area. Training opportunities should be as available for women as they are for men.
- Men working at the field-level may be more amenable and sensitive to gender training than their urban counterparts. Men working and living in the field may be more aware of the key economic role that women play in the village or they may come to this understanding faster than their male counterparts in the cities, many of whom feel that the issue is feminist attack.
- The insistence by Malian officials that only women can work with women is a misunderstanding and, possibly, an excuse for not dealing effectively with the economic role that women play in Mali.
- The two functions of ODRs, extension and commercialization, are just as incompatible as extension and enforcement for forestry departments. By concentrating efforts on cash crop production and commercialization, women are almost automatically excluded and marginalized. There is no incentive to provide technical information to women for their crops (rice, peanuts, condiments, some coarse grains) because these are cultivated on a small scale and do not contribute to generating revenue for the ODR.
- In project planning, one cannot assume that by targeting activities where women are active, women will automatically benefit. It is always easier for a male agent who has not been trained otherwise, to find the one man doing that activity and work with him exclusively.
- By working through the logframe and "genderizing" it, it is easy to see potential constraints, opportunities and impacts on women.

**APPENDIX B: Participant List for
Gender Considerations in Development
June 13-14, 1991**

NAME	AFFILIATION
Jon Breslar	WID Officer, USAID
Neil Woodruff	Project Officer
Fanta Macalou	USAID/GDO
Awa Traoré	IFAHS
Mme Diallo Adama Diakité	FHI
Chahine Rassek	Project Officer, BEEP
Mme Doumbia Aissata Tapo	Ministry of Education
Mr. Néguédougou Sanago	Ministry of Education
Yacouba Konaté	USAID/GDO
Oumar Diakite	USAID/PRM
Boubacar Daou	USAID/PRM
Doral Watts	USAID/ADO
Abdoul Diallo	USAID/ADO
Tadesse Kebreab	USAID/ADO
Amadou Coulibaly	DHV
Mme Sissoko Awa Traoré	FSR/E
Mamadou Fofana	USAID/ADO
Lassana S. Diarra	SPV
David Atwood	USAID/ADO
Dr. Nlandu Mangani	IFAHS
Mme Ba Guidado Dicko	Chargée de la Promotion Féminine
Salif Samaké	Ministry of Plan Chief Training Section
Maimouna Dienapo	WID Coordinator USAID
Maloud Dicko	Ministry of Education

**APPENDIX C: Participant List for
Gender Considerations in Development
June 17-18, 1991**

NAME	AFFILIATION
Robin Foulton	USAID/GDO
Mamadou Coulibaly	USAID/GDO
Tata Sangaré	USAID/GDO
Michael Qualls	USAID/GDO
Yaya Diakité	IFAHS
Kanté Dandara Touré	Ministry of Education
Djenebou Mariko	USAID/GDO
Vic Duarte	USAID/PRM
Wayne McDonald	USAID/ADO
Doumbia Hawa Dolo	LVST Sector Project
Cheick Dramé	USAID/ADO
Mamadou Augustin Dembele	USAID/ADO
Carol Hart	USAID/GDO
Cheik Mbacke	CERPOD
Manlafi Keita	USAID/GDO
Kadiatou Cissé	USAID/PRM
Mamadou Diarra	Ministry of Education
Glenn Howze	FSR/E
Fatoumata Guindo	DHV/CLUSO
Diby Diakite	
Maimouna Dienapo	WID Coordinator USAID
Fara Guédel Mbodji	
Mariam Sanogoh	

APPENDIX D: Participant List
Half-Day Training for Senior Staff
June 20, 1991

NAME	AFFILIATION
Dennis Brennan	Mission Director, USAID
Mme Dibo Fanta Cissé	Directeur de Cabinet, Ministère de la Santé, de l'Action Sociale et de la Promotion Féminine
Mr. Richard Byess	Supervisory Program Officer
Mr. Tracy Atwood	Supervisory Agricultural Dev. Officer
Mr. George Thompson	General Development Officer, USAID
Mr. Jon Breslar	WID Officer, USAID
Mme. Maimouna Dienapo	WID Coordinator, USAID
Dr. Tuan N'Guyen	Long Term T.A. PCV
Mr. Yaya Togola	Director General, OHV
Mr. Salif Kanouté	Deputy Director, DNEF
Mr. Moussa Keita	Director, SPV
Mr. Tijani Jallo	Director, Sahel Institute
Mr. Nansour Ouaidou	Director, CERPOD
Mr. Bekaye Haidara	PVO Coord., Ministère de l'Administration Territoriale
Mr. Amadou Konaté	Directeur Nationale de l'Action Sociale
Dr. Sékou Amadou Diallo	Directeur National de la Santé Publique
Dr. Mohamed Cissé	Chef de Projet Santé Publique
Mme Diallo Fatoumata	Directrice, Bureau Projets Education
Mr. Mamadou Tiéro	Directeur Nationale la Planification
Mr. Ousmane Guindo	Conseiller Technique, Ministère du Développement Rural et de l'Environnement
Dr. Mamadou Goita	Directeur de l'Institut d'Economie Rurale
Mr. Makan Fofana	Directeur p.i. de la DRSPR
Dr. Gagni Timbo	Directeur Générale de l'Elevage
Monica Stein	Acting Controller, USAID
Mohamane Tandina	Acting Executive Officer, USAID

APPENDIX E: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE RESULTS

Mali Livestock III Project (APEX) Gender Issues

It is unclear from the PID whether or not there will be an institutional strengthening component in APEX or whether it will focus almost exclusively on private sector activity. There are gender issues that should be addressed at both the institutional and the producer level.

1. Institutional Issues

According to the final evaluation of the Mali Livestock project, only two of the seven sections of CVL are headed by women and at least two other higher level women are employed in research stations. Furthermore, within the DNE, women are employed at a minor managerial level in the fields of training and data management with women representing only 9% of the total number of people working in the field (35 of 387) at all levels (Post, Sector, and Region) yet, in a position of responsibility.

The evaluation report also indicates that none of the eight degrees from BS to PhD supported under the previous project were from women. There were some fifty-five months of short-term training provided by the project to CVL scientists but no information to determine whether or not the researchers benefitted from the trainings. Furthermore, the report on training by project personnel to DNE, Operation field staff, and students doing theses was not gender disaggregated.

In APEX, USAID should target both long- and short-term training opportunities for women. A figure such as the HRD target of 35% is not unreasonable. Both technical and management training should be included with technical training in small ruminant, poultry production, and dairy products production and management training in project/program planning, monitoring, and evaluation.

ILCA has courses available in ruminant nutrition and feeding systems, rural dairy processing, and forage evaluation and production which are of particular interest to Malian women in the livestock sector. These courses could be brought to Mali if sufficient participation could be assured. Production should be the focus of training for women since there seems to be good representation of women in animal health in the public sector.

While hiring more women at the field-level should be encouraged, it is critical that the women hired be able to work effectively with rural people and be willing to work in the field. With hiring constraints imposed by the World Bank, the GRM could be encouraged to replace departing agents (attrition or other reasons for resigning) with women. In any case, male agents should be taught techniques for working with women and should be held accountable for effective extension to both men and women livestock producers. The OHV recently conducted such a training session on ways for male agents. A contact sheet has been developed so that agent contact with both men and women will be encouraged and even mandated. If this system works, a similar system could be developed for APEX.

In areas where there is a real cultural constraint that limits contact between men and women, women agents should be deployed. They should be given the same responsibilities and information as their male counterparts and they should be called by the same titles. Furthermore, women should be included in the overall number of personnel limits set for the public sector and not justified as special cases dealing with "women's issues". All extension agents' performance evaluation and job retention should depend on effective work with both men and women in small ruminant, poultry and cattle production.

2. Project Issues

By genderizing the logframe, it became apparent that APEX will be a very ambitious project. USAID, GRM and the Title XII institutions implementing the project will need to define more precisely the project objectives and possibly the geographical area for implementation. In any case, final version of the new project logframe should be gender disaggregated.

The way the project will work with livestock associations and how best to accomplish this should be examined carefully. The DHV/CLUSA credit program is being cited as a highly successful model for training AVs to obtain credit through banks. Several issues have been raised about the program which should be explored before decisions are made for selection of institutions for future activities.

The credit program seems to have been relatively unsuccessful in reaching women. The PIR reports that despite the fact that at least 75 economic activities have been supported, only five involved women's groups. According to CLUSA personnel, the process of working with AVs and in the identification of group economic activities may initially limit women's access to credit. As women participate more in AV meetings and express their opinions, they are more able to influence the AVs to support economic activities of interest to them. This is an evolutionary process particularly relevant to integrated rural development interventions which may or not be appropriately modified to work with an identified sector.

There seems to be no mechanism for coordination and collaboration for DHV project activities within the OHV zone. CLUSA functions as an independent organization within the OHV zone. It has done a good job in catalyzing group formation but has been less successful in integrating women. Also, there is no apparent linkage with extension organizations in the area. It is unclear who provides technical (crop and livestock) information to the groups formed by CLUSA. Farmers expressed concern during the Conseil d'Administration of OHV that they were receiving mixed messages regarding whom should they be working with. It appears that overzealous CLUSA agents have suggested to farmers that they need not work with the government structures for their agricultural activities.

It is very important for an ONG to be able to work in the field and collaborate with government institutions. If DNE, for example, takes leadership in livestock extension in areas where there is no ODR, then the ONG working to help livestock owners get credit will be obliged to develop a collaborative working relationship with DNE. In the livestock sector, it is particularly important to be able to cut across ethnic, cultural, and sex barriers to promote consensus for increased production.

The approach of CLUSA is a bottom-up approach to development. They will not do anything with villagers unless villagers come to them for assistance. The strict focus on "felt needs" sometimes restricts the provision of opportunities that are available but outside the experience of rural people. Extension personnel, researchers, and technical assistants can provide rural people with a range of alternatives which can be evaluated in the context of their socio-economic systems. If those opportunities are excluded from consideration, we may end up condemning women to the domain of tie-dyeing and soap-making, activities with very low economic return.

The key issue from USAID's perspective will be to have a coordinated approach in the livestock sector. The contracting mechanism chosen for DHV, with two independent contractors, may not lead to the most effective results in the field. Certainly, women have not benefitted from credit as was envisioned in the PP. With livestock representing a significant source of income (Sissoko, 1990) or better returns for labor (Luery, 1989), reaching women should be a major objective of APEX. The experience (positive and negative) of DHV should be reviewed and alternatives explored before deciding on a similar mechanism for association formation and training.

SAMPLE APEX LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

NARRATIVE SUMMARY	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS
PURPOSE: To increase productivity and the incomes of women and men in the livestock sector.	1. Absolute contribution of livestock sector to GDP increases by -- % by the ---- year of the project.
	2. Livestock related incomes of female and male producers, traders, and others increases by -- % by the --- year of the project.
OUTPUTS:	
Animal Health 1. Women and men who produce small ruminants, poultry, and cattle use veterinary services, animal extension and veterinary pharmaceuticals.	1.1 --- women and --- male small ruminant producers vaccinate their herd yearly by the --- year of project. 1.2 --- women vaccinate their chickens yearly the end of the project. 1.3 --- campaigns for poultry health, --- for small ruminant health, are conducted annually by DNE by the EOP.
2. Veterinary services and veterinary pharmaceuticals are privatized.	2.1 Number of private male veterinarians increases from --- to --- and number of female private veterinarians increases from --- to -- in the project area by EOP. 2.2 Number of female veterinary pharmacists increases from --- to --- and number of male veterinary pharmacists increases from -- to -- in the project area by EOP. 2.3 ---% of the producers association (male and female) using private veterinary services in the project at the end of the project.
3. Female and male livestock owners pay a greater share of health costs.	3.1 Government budget line items for direct veterinary services reduced by --- % at end of project.
Animal Production 4. Men and women working for DNE are capable of extending improved production techniques for small ruminants, poultry, and cattle to female and male producers.	4.1 Sample group (---%) of male and female extension agents successfully pass "false client" test biannually during life of project.
5. Female and male livestock producers adopt improved range and natural resource management, improved forages and feeding techniques.	5.1 --- male and --- female small ruminant producers (associations) practice new feeding techniques by the end of the project. 5.2 --- women poultry producers raising healthy improved breeds of chickens by EOP. 5.3 --- of men and --- women cultivating forage species.
6. Villagers and transhumant groups develop clear use rights and management plans for village common fields.	6.1 --- use rights agreements and management plans by the end of the project.

7. Domestic and imported feed for small ruminants, poultry, and cattle are available to women and mer. producers.	7.1 --- % increase in the number of women purchasing domestic and imported feed for poultry. 7.2 % increase in the number of producers (male and female) and associations (male and female) purchasing domestic and imported feed for cattle.
Marketing 8. Transaction costs and informal taxes on livestock trade are reduced.	8.1 TBD
9. Small-scale female and male producers provide an increasing share of milk to the dairy.	9.1 Number of small scale milk producers (male and female) providing milk to the dairy increases from --- M to M and from --- F to F by the EOP.
10. Women adopt improved methods of processing milk from small and large ruminants.	10.1 Number of women producing dairy products increases from -- - to --- in the project area by the EOP.
11. Marketing of dairy products by women is increased.	11.1 % increase in dairy products marketed by women in the project area by EOP.
12. Associations of male and female producers, traders and others will be capable of using their organizations to get credit, expand markets, and lobby for regulations in the livestock sector.	12.1 --- % of loans applied for by female and --- % for by male livestock producers are disbursed. 12.2 --- % loans applied for by F traders and M traders are disbursed. 12.3 --- % loans applied for by F transporters and M transporters are disbursed.
13. A functional livestock market information system with information on markets and regulations in Mali and West Africa provides services to men and women in the livestock sector.	13.1 --- weekly radio spots for market information are transmitted by the end of project.

The Development of the Haute Vallée Project (DHV) Gender Issues

The functions of OHV, extension and marketing to generate operating costs may be limiting the ability of the institution to work with rural women. By concentrating efforts on cash crop production and marketing, women may be excluded or marginalized. There is no incentive to provide information to women for their crops or livestock because these are cultivated (raised) on a small scale and do not contribute to generating revenue for the OHV. This can be viewed as an institutional constraint and the more effective integration of women into the activities of OHV should be examined in this context.

By the same token, one of the key activities that generates income for OHV is credit. Since there is increased awareness of the need to provide access to credit for women, the new credit initiatives of OHV such as informal sector credit, guaranteed fund for credit of women's groups

could potentially have a considerable impact on the economic situation of women and families in the OHV zone.

Observations, questions, and comments for consideration by USAID and OHV as they consider ways of working more effectively with people within the OHV zone are presented below. Since there was no time for field visits to see actual functioning of OHV at the village level, more questions were raised than answered which can form the basis of discussions within the organization particularly as the review of project activities occurs later.

1. System for monitoring and evaluation

In reviewing the Rapport des Activités Annuelles and the USAID PIRs, there was no gender disaggregation of data and information. While there is a lot of activity going on in the field, there is no way to determine if both men and women are benefitting from project resources. OHV may have more participation by women than the reports reflect.

Reports about OHV activities should include the sex of AV members, managers of economic activities, agents, farmers and "animateurs" trained or participating in field days. A new reporting system for OHV extension personnel at all levels will make collection of this information a requirement. The monitoring and evaluation unit of OHV should include gender disaggregation in its annual report of activities, bringing about the need for the community development and functional literacy sections of OHV to keep gender disaggregated records. **Reports should not be accepted by USAID and considered complete without this information.**

CLUSA has indicated that they are gender disaggregating their activity reports. The one report seen had a WID section with some statistics indicating that women's participation was increasing. However, it was not as extensive as the preceding sections with a number of contacts for AVs, committees, animateurs, etc. One reason that women have not been as effectively integrated into CLUSA activities is the philosophical approach of CLUSA which holds the AVs responsible for their own actions. As women realize they must take more initiative with the AVs, their presence and relative proportion of acquired benefits will increase.

2. Female personnel within OHV

After reorganization, the organizational chart of OHV shows 80 extension agents, 10 Sector Chiefs, 10 Assistant Sector Chiefs and 7 subject matter specialists in the Extension Division. This means that, for each sector, approximately 8 extension agents work with farmers and livestock owners. Support is provided by sector level and central office specialists. In the Planning and Development Division, there is a community development specialist and no one at the field level.

Six women were hired and placed at the sector level to work on women's issues. Their position and responsibilities within the organizational structure are not clearly defined. It seems that since there is a WID specialist in the Extension Division, the six women are working under her supervision or direction. It appears that, in the interest of fulfilling some requirement to integrate women into OHV, seven women were hired (including the WID specialist in Bamako) without considering how to make them functional within the mandate and structure of OHV.

Currently 10 extension agent positions are unfilled. If qualified women who demonstrate a willingness to live and work in rural areas can be found, they should be hired. This would be a first step toward more effectively integrating women into OHV. This could also be considered a first step in a long-term personnel plan that would employ 25% female extension agents (2 per sector) out of the 80 envisioned in the project paper. Since the IMF has imposed personnel ceilings on public service employees, the remaining women would be hired as positions are opened up due to attrition, poor job performance, or from resignation. As women gain experience in the field, they could be promoted to Assistant Sector Chief and ultimately Sector Chief.

Women (and male) extension agents should be selected for their ability to work with rural women and men and willingness to live at the village level. Before being tenured in the public sector, they should undergo a trial period to be sure that they are functional in the field.

OHV needs to review the position of the six women currently working in the field. What are their qualifications? What are they currently doing and how do they fit into the structure of OHV? If they are to be in the Extension Division, can they be assigned into one of the 10 extension agent slots or are they overqualified? Could they be trained and used as sectoral credit agents to promote the informal sector credit and the group credit programs through the banks?

Putting women into undefined positions is only tokenism of the worst kind.

3. Extension

The extension division is currently working with male agents to give them tools and techniques for working with rural women. There are indications that the agents have responded favorably to the training. New forms for recording extension contacts in the field will make it possible to monitor the level of contact agents have with women and will permit follow-up by their supervisors to assure that women's technical problems are being addressed. This initiative is very important and should be monitored closely to determine if male extension agents can work effectively with women. Malian officials who say that only women can work with women are using this as an excuse for not addressing rural economic development issues. It may be that men working in the field are more aware of women's economic importance in the village than their urban counterparts. With proper training, male agents may be able to provide effective extension support to women especially if job performance and retention are dependent on it.

As audiovisual materials are prepared, it will be important to have gender balance in the visual and audio images presented. It appears that the extension division is very aware of these issues and is prepared to address them. A key limitation for women's participation in the credit and extension programming of OHV is lack of information. Although many women apparently do not have access to radios, radio programming might still be effective in making women aware of extension services available to them. Innovative ways of modeling a husband's concern for his wife's activities by encouraging her to go to the agent, or even having the wife pass information to the husband might be used. The rural world radio show may be useful or radio time could be bought during the day or evening when women would more likely be near their husband's radios.

An opportunity for planning extension interventions with women would be to link technical information and training to credit programs for women. For example, when credit is accorded to a group of women for a cereal bank, training in improved cereal production, storage techniques, and marketing could be included. The credit agent working with the women to establish the credit amount, could schedule visits with the extension agent to help the women use more effective techniques and improve their chances for success in their economic activity. The schedule of visits could be sent to the extension division head who would follow-up to assure that the agent provided this service to the women.

4. Credit within OHV

To facilitate examination of credit-related issues, the following questions were considered during the workshop training seminars:

- If someone does not belong to an AV, how does this person get credit? How does the feasibility study and development of the account get done? Does this person have access to technical support and information?
- For women: Is credit really needed? Do women solve their own financial problems through the "tontine"? If the tontine is a banking mechanism, is another credit mechanism needed? If this money was in a bank account, could they make interest?
- Would any bank be willing to develop the kind of flexible collateral system and repayment system that women need? Could you get the "tontines" into the formal banking system?
- Under any circumstances, would OHV be capable of developing an effective credit system?

Recent bank protocols with permitting groups within and outside the existing AVs to have access to credit, have been formalized in two banks and under negotiation in another two. This should facilitate women's access to credit since it seems that women's economic activities are not high priority for the Village Associations.

A women's credit program guaranteed by OHV and the new OHV informal sector credit program will also provide more access to credit for women. If credit has been the limiting factor in developing women's economic activities, these initiatives will be helpful. A major limitation needing redress is the lack of trained personnel working at the field level to help people with the development of their credit applications and accounts.

A lot of time has been spent returning poorly prepared credit applications. The Sector Chiefs have been responsible for working with people seeking credit but it is unclear how skilled are they in doing this type of work. While CLUSA has a mandate to train AVs in preparing and managing credit for economic activities, those people not directly serviced by CLUSA, do not have access to this technical assistance or training. If OHV wants to provide this service, it needs to develop the expertise within OHV to do feasibility studies, prepare credit applications, manage economic activities, etc. as well as to train others to do such activities.

Credit coordinators should be employed (retrained and redeployed) to work with women and men needing credit. These coordinators should train women and men to do an economic analysis of the proposed activity and develop the dossier. They should work with the nearest OHV extension agent to set up a series of extension visits for technical support. Other job responsibilities could be those delimited in the informal sector credit manual: follow-up of economic activity, collection of loan payments, etc. The six women who have been hired at OHV could be integrated by making them function as credit agents.

It will be particularly important to work closely with the first women's groups applying for credit at the banks. Some of the traditional women's groups are very experienced and would be able, with a little support, to develop an acceptable credit application. The success of the first recipients of credit will assure the bank's interest in pursuing this program with other groups not associated with existing AVs.

Additional documentation and credit manuals developed within OHV should be reviewed for their gender sensitivity. The informal sector credit program manual used very gender neutral language that might be misconstrued to favor men's credit applications. The modifications suggested during this consultancy will help clarify the OHV policy that credit will be awarded without regard to sex, age or ethnic group.

5. Functional Literacy

The materials developed for functional and post literacy use serve as an excellent tool in providing women with information on a range of issues. As Mali prepares for democracy, materials can be developed to inform women about democracy, their roles and responsibilities as citizens in a democratic society and the electoral process. These materials could also be used to inform women of their legal rights under the constitution and the legal codes (marriage code, commerce code etc.). Materials could also be developed about sources of information of interest to women such as extension, health centers, etc.

Malian Women Engineers Association (AFIMA)

With increased awareness and concern about the integration of women into the economic activities and development of Mali, there has been a proliferation of "Promotion Féminine" positions within several ministries, at the cabinet and department level. A newly reorganized ministry that includes health, social affairs and "promotion féminine" has primary responsibility for women's issues nationwide. The women that have been put in these positions are anxious to have an impact on their respective ministries and departments. In some cases they are still acting like field-level agents with the focus on action at that level. They need support and training to be able to analyze the situation and make decisions as the policy-makers.

Identity and Mission Statement

AFIMA's role as a professional women's organization differs from that of a development organization and is in a position to set policy and direction as long as the organization gains some leadership skills. Development activity should be limited since they do not have the experience and knowledge base. Instead, they should further the cause of young professionals by getting them involved with agencies and organizations with experience. To be really effective as a development organization and to have an impact, AFIMA needs individuals who will be able and willing to work and live outside Bamako. Therefore, networking with other organizations and professionals is important. It could be that some regional people (Sikasso, Mopti, Cayes, Kidal) would be willing to support development activities (with their time and effort).

While it is good to get more women into the ministries in advisor capacities, they need to be able to work with and influence their male counterparts for them to be effective. Furthermore, while it is good to get more women into the agriculture and rural development sectors, their effectiveness will be minimized if they are unwilling to work en brousse. What are housing alternatives in Mali? In Burundi, single women are housed in dormitories run by religious people or in same sex apartment complexes, "homes". AFIMA could also promote the use of functional literacy activities for women's rights education and citizen responsibility.

The following is a list, generated at the AFIMA meeting, of lobbying ideas to improve women's work conditions:

- Review work codes. Establish a policy position that women think is compatible with their roles as professionals, housewives, and mothers, then lobby for that position in discussions during the upcoming national congress.
- Encourage young women to pursue professional careers using science fairs, competitions, job fairs, and career days. Use recorded "rural monde" extension messages so that students can hear a woman's voice speak to professional development.
- Develop ways to identify more women engineers (this information would be useful to A.I.D. and other donors in searching for contract technical personnel). For example,
 - For each current female member to identify classmates from her graduating class as well as individuals from the graduating class before and after hers. It should be easy to cross-check such a list since not many women attend school. A hydrologist met at the meeting was the only woman from her graduating class.
- Send letters to those who are not members at AFIMA inviting them to attend our meetings.
- Lists of professionals, along with their job title and training history would be useful to USAID/Mali's participant training efforts.

Basic Education Expansion Project (BEEP)

The gender analysis team worked with the Cellule de Planification et Suivi from the Girls Educational Unit in the Ministry of Education to outline some steps they might take to strengthen their efforts in increasing girls' access to education. BEEP has been heavily involved in teacher orientation and training and is eager to work on enhancing its community development and monitoring expertise. The team was asked by the Planning Unit in the Ministry to suggest potential training opportunities for the staff. They anticipate expanding their activities as their role grows and there is more field follow-up to do. They hope to be able to design and implement their own management follow-up for field training programs. To do so, they anticipate re-examining the training content which was used by outside consultants to train teachers in the regions. They plan to develop a training of trainers program so that more outreach programs can be developed to incorporate lessons learned from girls' education initiatives and promote effective enrollment and retention strategies. The Planning Unit would also like to develop a core group and decrease technical assistance needs in the future. The gender analysis team has identified regional sources of training programs for the ministry personnel:

1. CESAO
BP 305
Bobo-Dioulasso, Burkina Faso
Courses in rural community organization, WID, on communication (2-5 week length).
2. IPD-AOS
BP 1756
Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso
Extension methods for community organization and courses in monitoring methods (2-8 week length).
3. AFCA-SIPCA
BP 4151
Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire
Short-term course in WID.

Community Health and Population Services Project (CHPS)

The design of phase II of CHPS offers significant opportunities to gender disaggregate information on service delivery and to use the information to expand future project impact. The GENESYS team met with project design staff and the Mission WID coordinator to offer suggestions on improving the project's logical framework to better capture gender concerns. These suggestions were incorporated into a revised logical framework. A format for a monitoring system to include in the project paper was proposed.

The success of the CHPS project as a sustainable program is linked to increased incomes for women since they are the primary source of the user fees needed to ensure continued operation beyond project life. The MIS being developed by CDC provides an opportunity to ensure gender disaggregation in the collection and analysis of data to be used by CHPS and the GRM. Careful attention to the local Malian capacity to operate the system and use the data over time

will be essential. Dialogue on the development of this system can be used to reinforce interest in collecting and analyzing data along gender differences.

The Mission WID committee and Health Office staff were preparing issues for the CHPS social soundness analysis during the assistance period. Suggestions for expansion of the scope of analysis were discussed with staff and a jointly-developed set of questions were produced. The technical assistance team provided assistance on the development of a scope of work for a project demographer.

APPENDIX F: ECONOMIC AND GENDER ISSUES IN LIVESTOCK

The questions were developed out of the training session to be considered during the TDY of a Livestock Economist who was coming to the Mission in July:

- What role do women play in export marketing of livestock? What is their economic contribution to this subsector?
- What is the contribution of the dairy industry to overall incomes in the livestock sector? What percentage of women's income comes from the sale of fresh milk or other milk products in Bamako District and within a 100 km radius? What is the potential market for processed milk products in the urban centers -- Bamako, Segou, etc?
- What is the contribution of small ruminant production (and by-products) to women's income? In what parts of the commercialization circuit do women currently play a role? What sources of credit do women have for increasing their activity in small ruminants?
- What is the contribution of the sale of poultry and poultry products to women's income? What proportion of production costs does feed represent for women? What sources of feed and new breeds are available to women?
- How important are women dairy cattle owner in the livestock sector? What proportion of their overall income comes from milk production and commercialization? Do women sell to the dairy or to individual clients?
- Look to GEMINI study for information on livestock by-product (hides and skins) marketing circuits. What is the contribution to women's income of this activity? Can it be expanded and to what extent (would the market sustain increased activity in this subsector)?
- Is there any animal feed industry outside of cotton seed cakes from HUICOMA? What role do women play currently in feed production?