



Associates Inc.

PN ABP880
J EN 844/38

**Côte d'Ivoire:
Municipal Development
Support Project**

Mid-Term Evaluation

**Kim L. Cuenco
Juliana H. Pigey**

March 1993

Prepared for

**U.S. Agency for International Development
Regional Economic Development Services Office
West and Central Africa
Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire**

**Delivery Order No. 1
IQC PCE-1008-I-00-2064-00**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS	iv
PREFACE	vi
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vii
1. INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT	1
2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION	1
2.1 Background	1
2.2 Project Description	3
2.3 Project Implementation Arrangement	4
3. EVALUATION FINDINGS	4
3.1 Summary of Findings	4
3.1.1 Assumption 1: No undue deterioration in the Ivoirian economy . . .	4
3.1.2 Assumption 2: The Ivoirian socio-political system remains relatively stable	5
3.2 Discussion	7
3.2.1 Municipal Management Training Component	7
3.2.2 Revenue Enhancement	19
3.2.3 Facilities Construction	20
4. CONCLUSIONS	23
5. RECOMMENDATIONS	25
5.1 Management Training Component	25
5.1.1 Project Management	25
5.1.2 Seminar Content	25
5.1.3 Other Seminars	26
5.1.4 Extension of Training to Additional Communes	26
5.1.5 Special Studies	26
5.2 Revenue Enhancement Component	26

5.3	Facility Construction Component	26
5.3.1	Condition Precedent Calling for Passage of a Municipal Civil Service Code	26
5.3.2	Adoption of Alternative Implementation Arrangement	27

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1:	Women Participants in the Mobilization of Local Resources Seminars	17
Table 2:	Pre- and Post-Test Results for Community Development Training	18
Table 3:	Breakdown of Women Participants by Social Center	18

ANNEXES

1.	List of Persons Interviewed	29
2.	DGCL Organization Chart	33
3.	DGCL Computer Training Project	34
4.	Selected References	32

ACRONYMS

AID	Agency for International Development
CAA	Caisse Autonome d'Amortissement (National Sinking Fund)
CASS	Comité d'Action Sanitaire et Social
CP	Condition Precedent
DC	Direction du Cadastre
DCGTx	Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux (Central Directorate for Public Works)
DCL	Direction des Collectivités Locales
DDS	Direction du Développement Social (Department of Social Development)
DFA	Development Fund for Africa
DGCL	Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales (Directorate of Local Government)
DGI	Direction Générale des Impôts (General Directorate of Taxes)
DI	Direction d'Informatique
FAR	Fixed Amount Reimbursement Agreement
FED	Fonds Européen de Développement
GOCI	Government of Côte d'Ivoire
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (World Bank)
ILO	International Labor Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ITC	Institutional Training Contractor

MDSP	Municipal Development Support Project
MECU	Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Construction et de l'Urbanisme (Ministry of Environment, Construction and Urbanism)
MOI	Ministère de l'Intérieur (Ministry of the Interior)
MSAS	Ministère de la Santé et des Affaires Sociales (Ministry of Health and Social Affairs)
MMTP	Municipal Management Training Program
PACD	Project Activity Completion Date
PDM	Project du Développement Municipal (Municipal Development Project)
PSC	Personal Services Contractor
REDSO/WCA	Regional Economic Development Services Office, West and Central Africa
RET	Resident Expatriate Trainer
RETD	Resident Expatriate Training Director
RLHT	Resident Local Hire Trainer
RTI	Research Triangle Institute
TOT	Training of Trainers
TRINC	Technical Resources Incorporated
UDD	Urban Development Division
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UVICOCI	Union des Villes et Communes de Côte d'Ivoire (Union of Cities and Communes of the Côte d'Ivoire)
WAAC	West African Accounting Center

PREFACE

This mid-term evaluation was undertaken by Abt Associates Inc. for the AID Regional Economic Development Services Office, West and Central Africa (REDSO/WCA), based in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire. This evaluation is based on field work done in Côte d'Ivoire in November-December 1992.

The entire Urban Development Division located within REDSO/WCA's Program Management Operations Unit was cooperative and provided excellent support. We are particularly grateful to Carleene Dei, Chief of the Urban Development Division, for her overall guidance.

We, of course, assume full responsibility for this report.

**Kim L. Cuenco
Juliana H. Pigey**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Background and Context for the Evaluation: The GOCI is currently undertaking a program of urban reform which is being implemented through the decentralization of its territorial administration and creation of autonomous municipalities. The ability of municipalities to discharge their new responsibilities and functions is constrained by weak management skills, inadequate financial resources, and limited municipal infrastructure. To assist municipalities in responding to the challenges of decentralization, the Municipal Development Support Project (MDSP) provides assistance in the areas of municipal training, revenue enhancement, and municipal facility construction.

Since the inception of the project the state of the Ivoirian economy has continued to deteriorate and major personnel changes have taken place in the Ivoirian administration. The purpose of this mid-term evaluation is to examine and assess the impact of these changes on project implementation, evaluate project performance to date, and propose recommendations for the second phase of the project.

2. Project Overview: The MDSP was authorized and the project grant agreement signed in September 1990. Significant delays in the implementation of the second and third components will require an extension of the PACD beyond the original date of October 31, 1993.

The MDSP is composed of three major components: municipal training, revenue enhancement, and municipal facility construction. The municipal training component provides training and technical assistance to the GOCI through two sub-components: (a) at the national level, the formation of a Training Unit in the Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales (DCGL) and technical assistance to the Technical Unit of the Direction du Développement Social (DDS) of the Ministère de la Santé et des Affaires Sociales (MSAS); and (b) at the municipal level, a training and technical assistance program to strengthen the management and service delivery capacity of municipal officials and agents. Under the revenue enhancement component, assistance is provided for the development of simplified cadastral studies in core cities, the promotion of the use of the private sector for the provision of urban services, the introduction of user charges for services provided by project-funded facilities, and the rationalization of existing fee and tax collection systems in other municipal facilities. Finally, the facilities construction component provides five core project cities with revenue generating facilities which can provide funds to cover recurrent costs and make a contribution to the recovery of initial construction costs through user fees and taxes.

3. Summary of Findings:

3.1. Changes in Project Assumptions: Changes to the political and economic environment in the last two years have resulted in considerable delays in the implementation of

the second and third project components. First, while the importance of decentralization is widely recognized, its implementation continues to be slowed down by the process of political and economic transition. Faced with the decline of the economy, the GOCI has reduced two major sources of municipal revenues--transferred state taxes and central government allocation--thereby seriously undermining the ability of local governments to assume the responsibilities associated with decentralization. Moreover, the distribution of powers and responsibilities between the central government and the new local governments remains undefined. Thus, while communes are critically important to the implementation of the decentralization policy, the lack of resources, both human and financial, and the continuing ambiguity of central-local government relations, pose serious impediments to the realization of the decentralization policy.

Second, major personnel turnover and institutional rivalry have delayed project implementation, and the passage of the municipal civil service law, a condition precedent (CP) to disbursement under the facility construction component. This delay is aggravated by institutional rivalry between the Ministère d'Environnement, de Construction et d'Urbanisme (MECU) and the Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux (DCGTx), the implementing agency for this component.

3.2. Progress Made in Project Implementation: Changes in the larger political-economic environment, and lengthy contracting procedures have resulted in considerable delays in the implementation of the revenue enhancement and facility construction components. However, activities under the municipal training component have taken place close to schedule, except for the community participation activities at the Direction du Développement Social (DDS) and regional social centers which are six months behind.

3.2.1 Municipal Training Component: As called for by the first CP to project disbursement, a Training Unit within the Training Division of the Human Resources Department of the DGCL was established in September 1991. The Unit is under the supervision of the Assistant Director of Human Resources. In October 1992, the head of the Training Division was appointed to coordinate the training activities of the Unit established within the Human Resources Department. However, given that this individual is not a professional trainer and has not, at the time of the evaluation, received training under the TOT program, it is recommended that he receive appropriate training without delay.

The Training Unit is composed of six trainers who provide training and technical assistance to strengthen the management and service delivery capacity of municipal officials and agents. Trainers are not presently established within the Unit itself, but exercise other functions in the DGCL. Although this arrangement permits these trainers to maintain their expertise in specialized management functions while practicing their training skills, in the long-term, a core group of full-time trainers will be necessary to respond to the growing need for training at the local and regional level, concomitant with the advance of the decentralization process. Due to fiscal constraints, no separate operating budget for the training unit has been established to date.

The training program for DGCL, DDS agents and local level agents is organized by the Institutional Training Contractor (ITC). Eleven DGCL members, an independent consultant and nine DDS trainers participated in the 9-day TOT session in December 1991.

As of the middle of the first quarter of FY 1993, thirty-two communes have received training in construction techniques, and twenty-nine have participated in seminars on road maintenance. Eleven targeted communes have received individualized training in financial analysis and resource mobilization. The first three-month follow-up evaluation of the financial analysis seminars have been conducted for nine communes, while the three-month evaluation under the resource mobilization component has been completed in eight communes. Data on the total number of training units delivered indicates participation by trainees coming from a wide range of professions. As of December 1992, there have been 83 training events involving 853 participants, or 853 units of training delivered. Of the participants, 317 have been local hire municipal-level agents, 147 central-level agents assigned to the communes and 70 elected officials. Of the remainder, 150 were agents of other ministries operating at the local level, 45 were DGCL agents assigned to Abidjan, and 88 were private sector participants. This data highlights the total number of participants in the different training activities. However, since certain participants have attended more than one seminar, the number of municipal agents actually trained is much lower than the number of participants (Refer to the Monitoring and Evaluation Activities and Plan).

One of the major evaluation criteria utilized by the training program is improvement in levels of local revenues in the post training period in those communes which have received training in revenue generation techniques. However, given that some of the towns may have benefitted from previous training provided by other donor agencies, such as UNDP/ILO, caution must be exercised in using changes in levels of revenues as a criterion of project success since the impact of training is cumulative, and communes have since adopted techniques learnt from previous and on-going training programs to meet their particular needs.

The DDS is participating in the Municipal Management Training component through the training of social workers in community development techniques. It is the central agency responsible for overseeing the staffing requirements and work program of the regional social centers. The project requested participating towns to assist DDS agents in the field to establish the Comités d'Action Social and Sanitaire (CASS), a forum for local community participation. The latter are expected to work on their own once they are functioning and have developed good working relationship with local officials. The success of this endeavor will nevertheless require some continued assistance from social workers. The project covers the cost of the travel of social workers to the towns for the above activities.

The DDS trainers expressed general satisfaction with the TOT seminar, particularly with regards to the emphasis given to the applicability of training techniques. At the same time, they expressed the need for more structured feedback on performance. In addition, trainers indicated during the interviews that the manner in which the per diem was being administered required more sensitivity to the institutional context. They explained that in some

instances, the per diem was treated as if it were the primary driving force behind the project. This response from the trainers is important to consider given that a primary objective of the MDSP is to create self-sustaining training programs within the DGCL and the DDS.

3.2.1.1 Computer Training at the DGCL: The objective of the computer training component of the MDSP is to permit the DGCL to "more rapidly and accurately track the deliberations, planning, and budgetary actions of all 135 municipalities" (MDSP Project Paper:12). In order to implement this computerization, an assessment of the computer needs of the DGCL and the Direction du Cadastre (DC) was carried out by an independent computer expert in February 1992. A workshop for all senior staff of the DGCL, including the Director General, Directors and Assistant Directors, was subsequently held in March 1992 to inform them of the results of the computer needs assessment, and to sensitize them to the computerization program. As a follow-up to the workshop, each of the DGCL Departments worked with the consultant and the RLHT to develop proposals and work plans for computerizing their functions.

The independent computer specialist has likewise developed a training plan for the DGCL which indicates the functions to be computerized, targeted trainees, software to be utilized by each department, and the materials to be provided. Training for the secretarial staff on standard software has taken place. However, only one seminar report was available in the ITC files. The schedule for the training of the DGCL professional staff should be established as soon as possible to enable the MDSP to meet the objective specified above.

A resident local hired trainer (RLHT) was contracted by the ITC to carry out computer training within DGCL and in the five core project cities. The RLHT is receiving technical training from the independent computer expert. At present the status and salary structure of the RLHT remains ambiguous. The letter from the DGCL Director, assigning the RLHT exclusively to the project, is not adequate to satisfy AID requirements governing the hiring of local experts. An official decree (arrêté) needs to be issued as soon as possible by the Minister of the Civil Service to rectify this situation. The decree should confirm the DGCL memo and state that the salary of the RLHT will not be paid by the DGCL. This decree is important since AID regulations specify that no government functionary may be paid through project funds. It has likewise been difficult to perform an accurate evaluation of the performance of the RLHT to date since he was unable to produce his work program when requested by the evaluators. This work program serves as a basis for judging the performance of the RLHT on specific computer training tasks. In addition, a specific training schedule should be developed as soon as possible to program the resources, both professional and budgetary, which are necessary to implement the training of the professional staff, including the trainers themselves, in the time remaining in the project.

3.2.1.2 Regional Level Training: The regional level training program, targeted to elected officials and heads of financial and public works departments, has experienced delays due to scheduling conflicts with other training programs involving the same group of participants. Postponements have also occurred as a result of efforts to revise the contents of some of the remaining modules in keeping with lessons learned in previous seminars. As of December 1992,

only the seminars on construction techniques have been completed, and one seminar on road maintenance is still to be held. Comments from seminar participants indicate that these topics are secondary to more immediate concerns regarding limited municipal capacity to deliver urban services.

Moreover, Action Plans resulting from the seminars may not always reflect communal priorities. Often times, they reflect local level priorities as perceived uniquely by the seminar participants. To illustrate, a priority cited during a construction technique seminar was the building of two apartment units for teachers. However, interviews with senior local officials indicated that priority is, in fact, placed on the construction of revenue-generating local facilities. On the other hand, in another town, there was consensus on three measures proposed in the Action Plans: the construction of schoolrooms, improvement of toilets and building of a cemetery wall.

3.2.1.3 Local Level Training: Local level training in financial analysis and resource mobilization has been completed. The process of 3- and 6-month evaluations is underway. A consultant is being contracted to monitor and evaluate the financial management and revenue generation training activities that have taken place to date.

Follow up on the Action Plans formulated during the training sessions indicate that measures which require decisions by elected officials, and discussion between the elected body and the technical services staff tend not to be adopted. In contrast, those actions which do not require the intervention of elected officials are implemented more quickly by municipal personnel.

3.2.1.4 Social Worker Training: The pre- and post-test results of the participants trained by the DDS indicate a high level of effectiveness. Baseline studies and household surveys were carried out in July and September 1992, respectively. Since these activities are six months behind schedule, the results will be presented only in early 1993. This will delay the task of defining local Action Plans in collaboration with the CASS to the Spring of 1993. The current PACD does not provide adequate time to evaluate the effectiveness of these Plans.

3.2.1.5 Local Level Computer Training: Computers have been provided to the five core cities within the context of the cadastral studies. The computer training of these communes constitutes an additional training field that may be required by the AID project officer (Article III C of the ITC contract). In addition, the independent computer expert has been requested by AID to develop computer applications for local use. Indeed, the municipalities receiving computers would greatly benefit and would welcome the introduction of simple, immediately applicable modules based on standard municipal financial and administrative documents which are currently maintained manually. Seminars on Lotus and Word Perfect for Akoupé and Sinfra were held in November 1992. However, more intensive follow-up by the RLHT is necessary to ensure the optimum use of available hardware and software in the computerization of basic municipal administrative and financial functions.

3.2.1.6 Participation of Women: Given the small number of professional women currently employed by the DGCL, it is highly unlikely that the targeted number of women trainers called for in the project will be met. The project targets 25% DGCL women agents to be trained under the program which translates into at least two to three women in the Training Unit. While RHUDO/USAID originally proposed three women in the DGCL, only one has been included in the Technical Unit. To date, she has not conducted any training sessions under the project. In contrast, of the nine DDS participants in the TOT seminar of December 1991, four were women. This level of participation approaches the goal of the logical framework to have 50% DDS women agents trained. More participation of women is expected in the implementation of the revenue enhancement component.

3.2.2 Revenue Enhancement Component: In contrast to the more complex cadastral surveys undertaken by the GOCI, the project has opted for a simplified fiscal survey which would enable the Direction du Cadastre (DC) to rapidly create or update existing property tax rolls in project towns. Pilot cadastral studies have been successfully carried out in the cities of Sinfra and Akoupé from July to September of 1992. Since the costs of the initial cadastral surveys were lower than originally estimated, it has been anticipated that money will become available for doing additional cadastral surveys. As of October 1992, PIO/Ts had been prepared for cadastral surveys in the remaining towns of Biankouma, Duekoué, Tiassalé and possibly two other towns. To date, computer equipment has only been made available to Sinfra and Akoupé.

To assist the DC in the processing of data from the simplified cadastral exercise, computer hardware and software are being provided through the project. In November 1991, a computer needs assessment study of the DC was undertaken to ensure the optimal deployment and utilization of this equipment. However, considerable delays have been met in the purchase of the two local area networks (LANs) to permit the DGI to decentralize its computer system and to significantly augment its capacity to enter and manipulate tax data. Under the best scenario, equipment is expected to be in place only by February 1993 in spite of procurement efforts initiated as early as March 1992. The study of the property tax circuit is in progress.

A study on the privatization of public services, focusing on solid waste management, was completed in early December 1992 with disappointing results. The study concluded with the recommendation to use tractors for municipal solid waste collection in spite of the major capital and maintenance costs associated with their use. In lieu of this recommendation, Project Management has opted for a community-based solid waste management program with participation by communal authorities and local groups.

3.2.3 Facilities Construction: Over the last year, work has progressed at a slow pace due to the decreasing efficiency of the DCGTx to implement the project. The issuance of the FAR was likewise delayed by the requirement that a study be made evaluating the ability of the Caisse Autonome d'Amortissement to act as the paying agent for the construction component. This delay has had a negative impact on project implementation. Training designed to improve the collection of local taxes as well as activities relating to the privatization of urban services were to have been linked with the construction of new markets and transportation depots.

Although these activities will continue to take place, it is clear that their impact will be lessened by delays in the construction schedule.

In view of the inability of DCGTx to manage the construction component, AID has proceeded with the review of alternative implementation arrangements, including: (a) the use of direct AID contracting; (b) the creation of a private agency for construction contracting; and (c) communal contracting. The mechanism preferred by Project Management, communal contracting, places the responsibility for construction supervision on the beneficiary cities. While this alternative arrangement enjoys strong political support at the municipal level, the critical absence of qualified technical personnel to carry out the construction, coordination, supervision and cost control activities associated with the implementation of this component must be noted.

4. Conclusion: The strongest feature of the project is the relevance of its design and strategy to emerging needs at the local level created by the rapid extension of the local government system in Côte d'Ivoire. This theme was repeated in interviews with officials from central and local governments, regional and local level community development personnel and managers of other donor-funded programs. Since the success of the decentralization process ultimately lies in how successfully communes are able to respond to their new administrative and financial responsibilities, a development program which address these needs directly, at the municipal level, will ultimately leave behind the most sustainable results.

The MDSP training strategy is particularly relevant because it provides technical training on-site, where the needs are most felt, and where the community is little able to afford the frequent absence of its skilled professionals who, traditionally, are sent to a regional center for training. The sustainability of these on-site training efforts will require coordination with the training provided by the UNDP/ILO at the management level.

The challenge in the second phase of the MDSP will be to ensure that all three project components are implemented in a timely and coordinated manner. So far, considerable delay has been encountered in the implementation of the second component largely as a result of lengthy procurement and contracting procedures. Moreover, the decreasing efficiency of DCGTx has resulted to delays in the implementation of the facility construction component. The efforts taken by Project Management to circumvent the institutional blockage at DCGTx, and continuing dialogue with mayors from the participating cities should contribute to improved project performance in the second phase.

However, the overwhelming issue that needs to be addressed within the context of the project, and in the long-term is the sustainability of project results. A major issue to be addressed is the continued existence of the Training Unit beyond the PACD. At present, the Unit is financed entirely by AID and has no full-time trainers. To date, neither the DGCL nor the MOI has demonstrated the institutional commitment to the training strategy by allocating an internal budget to the Training Unit. Moreover, given the GOCI's declining financial condition, it is unlikely that these resources will be forthcoming in the near future.

It is questionable whether this Unit can be institutionalized within the DGCL unless other sources of financing can be found to support its training activities in the field. Given the GOCI's declining financial condition, it is unlikely that these funds will be provided by the DGCL. It is more realistic to expect that financial support to come either from other donors buying-in to the training program and/or municipalities themselves buying into training and technical services provided by the Technical Unit. However, the privatization of the Technical Unit will depend on two important factors. One, that the trainers receive the necessary training and specialized expertise that will enable them to respond to the emerging needs of municipalities in the decentralization process, and second, that municipalities themselves, as a result of previous training, are able to identify their own management and technical needs. Sustainability will depend therefore on successful institution-building at both the central and local levels of government. In this context, the position of the RLHT can make a significant contribution to institution-building within the DGCL, and the RLHT should be encouraged to assume a more active role in advancing the sustainability of project goals both within the DGCL and at the communal level.

With regards to DDS participation in the training component, sustainability of the objectives of the project will depend on the availability of local resources to support this initiative. Since none of the five core project cities have their own social centers, they depend on regional centers which are poorly equipped to adequately meet the needs of the cities within their jurisdiction. Given the dim economic situation faced by local governments, it is unlikely that the towns benefitting from the MDSP project will have the resources to immediately meet DDS requirements for housing a social center. Moreover, the community development program calls for local population participation through the organization of CASS. However, in order for these structures to be effective, they will need to be managed by social workers who are either on-site or can make weekly visits to the project cities, a situation made almost impossible by the shortage of municipal resources. These conditions seriously constrain the ability of the DDS to meet their community development objectives in secondary cities.

5. Recommendations: The recommendations address the following three areas:

5.1 Management Training Component:

5.1.1 Project Management:

- (a) **Institutional Training Contractor:** It is recommended that the Resident Expatriate Training Director participate more actively in direct MDSP project management. More structured feedback on each seminar should be provided to trainers as part of performance assessment and diagnosis.
- (b) **Training Unit:** First, it is recommended that training modules be reorganized according to a standardized 'cahier de charges' in order to facilitate the organization of pedagogical guides and the re-utilization of the modules by future

trainers and training programs. Second, at the end of each seminar, each trainer should prepare a more detailed report of the activity undertaken during his/her training session, specifically an analysis of the qualitative evaluation of the seminars by the participants. And third, in addition to meetings of individual trainers with the ITC, regular meetings involving all of the available trainers from the DGCL should be programmed to encourage dialogue and facilitate the learning process.

5.1.2 Seminar Content

- (a) Seminars responding to the management and financial requirements of the revenue enhancement (i.e. management of public facilities) and facility construction (i.e. resource mobilization) components of the project;
- (b) National/regional seminars (including research and training) to educate mayors and prefectural staff as to their respective responsibilities in the transition to decentralization;
- (c) National level policy discussions on decentralization to be coordinated with the Union des Villes et Communes de Côte d'Ivoire and the Conseil national pour le Developpement des Communes; and,
- (d) Seminars to assist communes in urban management and planning, focusing on the prioritization and planning of local needs.

5.1.3. Other Seminars

- (a) Mayoral retreat to give mayors of core cities the opportunity to share experiences and reinforce project commitment;
- (b) Retreat for trainers from DDS and DGCL to share their training experiences and to coordinate their efforts in the second phase of the program. The retreat could be an occasion to undertake a forward looking assessment of the project as a whole to reinforce not only the link between the two training sub-components, but the relationship of all three project components as well; and
- (c) Follow up to Yamoussoukro to reinforce mayoral interest in MSDP training efforts, including regional seminars between mayors and technical staff.

5.1.4 Extension of Training to Additional Communes: Based on the availability of additional resources, training in financial analysis/resource mobilization should be extended to other communes.

5.1.5 Special Studies: The following studies should be considered and their results incorporated into the development of existing and as well as new training modules.

- (a) Research on appropriate technology in drainage and sewerage should be undertaken as a follow-up to solid waste interventions; and,
- (b) Privatization pilot projects should be undertaken at the local, inter-communal and/or inter-regional levels. Given the multitude of small communes, studies should examine the feasibility of using private agents in urban service delivery at an inter-communal and/or inter-regional level, with the objective of fostering inter-communal cooperation for more effective service delivery.

5.2 Revenue Enhancement Component: It is recommended that contracting procedures be streamlined to minimize delays in the procurement of equipment and contracting of consultants. Given the delays in the past, it is recommended that contracting of the consultant on LAN management and maintenance be initiated without further delay, and that technical training be provided to the DG lead computer specialist under the MDSP. Since such training may not be available locally, it may be appropriate to undertake training in the U.S. or Europe. It is essential that consultant expertise be in place during the arrival of the LAN equipment to avoid further delays in project implementation.

5.3 Facility Construction Component:

5.3.1 CP Calling for Passage of a Municipal Civil Service Code: Given the economic reality of the GOCI today and the IMF requirement that the GOCI civil service be reduced as a condition of the structural adjustment program, it is recommended that this CP be waived or be replaced with a decree by the Minister of Interior specifying the conditions of recruitment and employment for civil servants.

5.3.2 Adoption of Alternative Implementation Arrangement: The inability of the DCGTx to complete contracting actions for the initial architectural studies has resulted in over a year's delay in the implementation of this component. Since it is unlikely that neither its rivalry with MECU nor its implementation of the component will change within the immediate future, the evaluation supports the recommendation made by Project Management to identify an alternative means of implementing the facility construction component. Project Management's preferred mechanism, the Devis Administratif (communal contracting) should take into consideration the lack of qualified technical staff at the communal level. Project Management should therefore consider the hiring of independent firms to handle the construction, coordination, supervision and cost control functions associated with the implementation of this component, as well as other alternative mechanisms in the event of unexpected impediments. Since construction involves the expenditure of public funds, the issue of accountability is paramount in the choice of an appropriate implementing arrangement.

1. INTRODUCTION AND CONTEXT

The subject of this evaluation is a project developed by AID and the Government of Côte d'Ivoire (GOCI) in 1990 to support GOCI's urban reform efforts within the context of its structural adjustment program. A grant of US\$5 million from the Development Fund for Africa (DFA) was authorized in September 1980 for the Municipal Development Support Project (681-0004). The project addresses three major constraints to the urban reform and decentralization program: ineffective management, inadequate financial resource mobilization, and limited infrastructure development at the municipal level.

The evaluation was undertaken by an urban development specialist and a training specialist. The team spent four weeks in Côte d'Ivoire during which extensive discussions were held with AID Project Management, training consultants, and government counterparts. In Abidjan, the team met with senior personnel at the Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales (DGCL), Direction du Développement Social (DDS), Direction Générale des Impôts (DGI), and the Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux (DCGTx); members of the Training Unit at the DGCL and DDS trainers. Meetings were also held with the Institutional Training Contractor (ITC), including the local hire resident trainer at DGCL; representatives of the UNDP/ILO Project and the Hans Seidl Foundation; Peace Corps Volunteers assigned to the cities of Sinfra and Akoupé; and independent consultants to the MDSP. The team visited the five core project cities. With the exception of Duekoué where the visit not arranged in advance, meetings were held in all core cities with elected officials, secretary-general, and heads of the administrative, financial and technical divisions of the five core project cities; and staff of the Centre Social Regional at Man. During visits to the existing and proposed market sites, the team conducted unstructured interviews with market collectors on-site. A short questionnaire was also administered to participants of the Biankouma Financial Analysis Seminar and the Sinfra Resource Mobilization Seminar. A complete list of persons interviewed is found in Annex 1. A complete list of the most significant reference materials is found in Annex 4.

The following section of this report, Part II, provides a description of the Municipal Development Support Project. Part III presents the findings and conclusions of the mid-term evaluation, reflecting an analysis of the project from the point of view of overall progress, institutional development, and project management. Finally Part IV suggests lessons and recommendations for continuing project implementation and the development of the project.

2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

2.1 Background

The Ivoirian economy, like most of those in sub-Saharan Africa, suffered a series of setbacks over the past decade with a sharp fall in GNP per capita. The 1980 GNP per capita figure of US\$1,166 fell to US\$743 in 1987. At 4.2% per annum, the country had the second fastest population growth rate in sub-Saharan Africa which, combined with a mere 1.4% average annual growth in GNP, accelerated the crisis.

Drawn into a prolonged economic recession, the GOCI embarked upon a process of structural adjustment with the assistance of the IMF and the World Bank. Commodity prices in local currency (the CFA franc, or CFAF) for the GOCI's main exports, cocoa beans and coffee, both fell dramatically. This period was also one of unexpected CFAF exchange rate fluctuations, due to the volatility of the United States dollar and the French franc (with which the CFAF has a fixed parity of 50:1) in foreign exchange markets.

The nearly 20-year period of sustained economic growth, which came to a close in the 1980s, resulted in a rapid population increase based on both a continuous flow of migrants from adjoining Sahelian countries and a sizeable domestic population increase induced, inter alia, by a substantial improvement of the sanitary conditions. The major portion of the approximately 12 million inhabitants reside both in Abidjan, the economic center of the country, and in an enlarging network of secondary cities.

The brunt of the austerity measures, accompanying the structural adjustment program, is being borne by the urban sector. This is reflected in the sharp drop in the ratio of urban to rural incomes particularly in Abidjan. In an effort to reduce the government deficit, the GOCI has introduced substantive cuts in non-wage expenditures. This has, in turn, limited the ability of central and local governments to deliver public services and to sustain present levels of public investments. Due to their heavy reliance on the central government allocations, secondary cities have suffered a dramatic decline in basic economic and social infrastructure investments, thereby jeopardizing the long-term sustainability of the urban-rural linkages so critical to the development of domestic markets.

As part of its economic adjustment process, the GOCI recently adopted a program of urban reform which is being implemented through the decentralization of its system of territorial administration and subsequent creation of 135 autonomous municipalities. The rapid extension of the local government system, including urban centers with populations as little as 2,000 inhabitants, was undertaken without adequate assessment of the administrative, technical and financial absorptive capacity of local governments to assume their new functions and responsibilities. As a result, there is not only a shortage of trained and experienced staff at all levels of government, local development initiatives are moreover constrained by increasingly declining central government allocations and limited sources of local revenues.

Although local elections have been held, the distribution of powers and responsibilities between central and local governments, including resource allocation criteria, have not been well defined as yet. Political turmoil linked to a deepening economic recession and the emergence of a political opposition has prevailed in Côte d'Ivoire over the last two years. There has been a complete turnover in the upper-level personnel of the GOCI, and civil unrest, which plagued the country in the last two years, has resulted in an overall decrease in the efficiency of the government.

2.2 Project Description

The GOCI is currently undertaking a program of urban reform which is being implemented through the decentralization of its territorial administration and creation of autonomous municipalities. The ability of municipalities to discharge their new responsibilities and functions are constrained by weak management skills, inadequate financial resources to meet goals, and limited development of municipal infrastructure. To address these constraints, the MDSP has targeted three areas for development: (a) municipal management training, (b) revenue enhancement, and (c) construction of municipal facilities.

The Municipal Management Training component is aimed at strengthening the capacity of the GOCI to implement its policy of urban decentralization and growth at both the national and municipal levels by financing training and technical assistance and procurement of limited commodities. The municipal management training component includes two main sub-components:

- (a) at the national level, the formation of a Training Unit in the DGCL responsible for training agents from the municipalities and for providing technical assistance to selected municipalities. The training unit will also provide the DGCL with inputs for policy development intended to advance the decentralization process. The legal, budget and training departments of the DGCL will be supplied with computers and their staff trained in the use of appropriate software. Concurrently, the Technical Cell of the Department of Social Development of the Ministère de la Santé et des Affaires Sociales (MSAS) will receive training for trainers specializing in the teaching of community organization techniques, and will, in turn, be responsible for training local level social workers in project cities and for providing on-going technical assistance to municipalities.
- (b) at the municipal level, a three-year training and technical assistance program, aimed at strengthening the management and service delivery capacity of municipal officials and agents. This sub-component of the project will promote more efficient urban planning and management at the municipal level, and will encourage the participation of the private sector in the provision of public services.

The aim of the Revenue Enhancement component is to improve the financial ability of local authorities to provide urban services and to operate and maintain urban facilities through an increase in the generation of municipal revenues. This objective could be achieved by the expansion of local revenue sources and improvement of tax collection methods through the development of cadastral studies, the training of agents in the preparation and management of contracts with private sector entities, the introduction of user charges for services provided by project-funded facilities, and the rationalization of existing fee and tax collection systems in other

municipal facilities. This component of the project will include the financing of technical assistance, training and procurement of limited commodities.

Finally, the Facilities Construction component provides five core project cities with revenue generating facilities, such as markets, transport depots, commercial centers, and slaughterhouses, that can provide funds to cover recurrent costs and make a contribution to the recovery of initial construction costs via the collection of user fees and taxes. It is anticipated that at least one of the above facilities will be constructed in each core city.

2.3 Project Implementation Arrangement

The MDSP is managed by the Urban Development Division (UDD) located within REDSO/WCA's Program Management Operations Unit. The Unit is composed of one U.S. Direct Hire Urban Development Officer, and one Technical Specialist provided through an institutional contract with Technical Resources Incorporated (TRINC). The municipal training component of the MDSP is implemented through an institutional contract with RTI. REDSO/WCA provides the following types of services to the MDSP: contracting, legal, financial analysis, project development, engineering, environmental analysis, and private sector development adviser.

3. EVALUATION FINDINGS

3.1 Summary of Findings

Modifications to the Logical Framework Assumptions

3.1.1 Assumption 1: No undue deterioration in the Ivoirian economy

Changes to the political and economic environment in the last two years have resulted to considerable delays in the implementation of the second and third project components. First, while the importance of decentralization is widely recognized, its implementation continues to be slowed down by the process of political and economic transition. The assumption that the GOCI remain committed to its current urban development and decentralization program needs to be reconsidered in view of recent political and economic changes. While the Government continues to express support for its policy of decentralization, the implementation of this policy is slowed down by events associated with the process of political and economic transition. Of these events, two have a major impact on project implementation. First, faced with the decline of the economy, the GOCI has reduced two major sources of municipal revenues: transferred state taxes and central government allocation. During the fiscal year 1992, the GOCI reduced the proportion of transferred state taxes from thirty-five to twenty-five percent. More significantly, subsidies to municipalities, in the form of central government allocations, are expected to decline by 18% in fiscal year 1993, a drop from 11 billion F CFA to 8 billion F CFA. While municipal property revenues and user fees constitute a potentially major source of revenues, in addition to municipal taxes currently collected, until such a time that municipalities

are able to improve their collection procedures, this decline in central government transfers and subsidies will continue to seriously constrain decentralization efforts at the local level, particularly since as much as 67% of the revenues of newly created municipalities, including 100% for the poorest, depend on central government allocations. Secondly, in spite of this dim economic reality, the GOCI is going forward with its policy of communalization, which is at the heart of its decentralization policy. In reality the continuing process of extending the local government system has been slow and very much a transitional one. Although local elections were held in 1985, and 136 communes had been created by 1992, the distribution of powers and responsibilities between the Central government and the new local governments, as well as their financial resources, have not been well defined as yet. There is no veritable municipal government code in place, and the new legislation establishing the limits of new communal boundaries remains in draft form in abeyance of potential ethnic and political conflicts arising from the definition of new territorial boundaries. Further delay will most likely occur as new regulations are implemented and modified to take account of evolving political-economic conditions. Thus, while communes are critically important to the implementation of the decentralization policy, the lack of resources, both human and financial, and the continuing ambiguity of central-local government relations, pose serious impediments to the realization of the decentralization policy.

3.1.2 Assumption 2: The Ivoirian socio-political system remains relatively stable

The second assumption which warrants re-examination pertains to the continuing ability of participating GOCI agencies to carry out the terms of the agreement. Political turmoil linked to a deepening economic recession and the emergence of a political opposition in Côte d'Ivoire have resulted in personnel changes and institutional conflicts which have had a significant impact in the implementation of the project. Over the last two years there has been a complete turnover in the upper-level personnel of the Ivoirian Government, including the Ministries of Interior, Civil Service and Economy, Finance and Plan, which has delayed project implementation, and in particular, the institution of a municipal civil service law, a condition precedent to project disbursement. Moreover, institutional power struggles between the DCGTx and MECU have resulted in considerable delays in the implementation of the Facility Construction component of the project.

Implications for Satisfaction of Conditions Precedent to Disbursement

The above modifications to project assumptions have implications on the continuing ability of the GOCI to satisfy the Conditions Precedent (CP) to subsequent disbursement under the Facility Construction Component of the project pertaining to the passage of a law governing the status of municipal employees. This CP was introduced to address the need for trained municipal personnel, both at the managerial and technical levels, to improve the efficiency of local government operations. In most municipalities, the overwhelming majority of locally-hired municipal personnel are seriously under qualified, their employment often based on political and social considerations. Only central-level agents, seconded to the municipalities, frequently have the training and experience necessary to perform their assigned functions. It is for this reason

that the project requires, as a CP to the disbursement of construction funds, the adoption of a municipal civil service law specifying the qualifications and employment conditions for municipal employees.

To date the legislation has not been passed and the date for the satisfaction of the CP has been extended to December 1993. The massive turnover in the upper-level personnel of the GOCI, including the replacement of the Minister of Interior and the Director of the Department of Local Government, and the Minister of the Civil Service and his top advisors, has led to the creation of a new working group to review the law and its possible financial and administrative repercussions. The proposed municipal civil service law falls under the broader legislation governing the status of all civil servants. However, the existing text for the municipal civil service law needs to be revised and adjusted to permit full concordance with the Civil Service Law. A major concern in the passage of this legislation is the financial implication of expanding the civil service to include municipal officials at a time when the IMF and the World Bank are counselling a reduction of the civil service as part of the GOCI's structural adjustment program. The Ministerial Decree (arrêté) creating the commission for the review of municipal-level personnel actions was prepared in October and is awaiting approval.

To date, implementation of the project has not yet been adversely affected by the GOCI's failure to meet the CP. This is because the GOCI has chosen to finance initial architectural and engineering studies for the project's construction activities out of the Housing Guarantee Loan escrow interest account earnings. Because escrow interest account earnings are generated by loan funds, they belong to the GOCI which is free to spend them as it wishes, contingent upon AID approval. In this instance, the GOCI has elected to pay for the studies as part of its counterpart contribution to the project, thereby permitting work on this component to take place. At the same time, the failure to meet the CP will come into play when construction contracts are due to be signed because Ivoirian law prohibits the Government from signing contracts for which funds are not available. It is anticipated that contracts will be ready for signature in October 1993.

In view of these constraints, there is a need to reconsider how realistic this CP can be met within the aforementioned period in view of the country's deteriorating economic conditions and IMF pressures to reduce the size of its civil service. In this regard, the evaluation supports the recommendation to replace the CP with an alternative recruitment which will bring about the results comparable to those sought by the CP but without the possible negative effects of the law, possibly in the form of a decree by the Minister of Interior specifying the conditions of recruitment and employment for civil servants.

3.2 Discussion

The following section is a discussion of the progress in the implementation of each of the three components:

3.2.1 Municipal Management Training Component

The objective of the Municipal Management Training component is to strengthen the capacity of the GOCI to manage and implement decentralization at the national and local level. At the national level, a 10-person training cell within the Directorate of Local Government (DGCL) will provide management training and technical assistance to communes. In addition, computer equipment and training will be provided to the DGCL. To mobilize community participation in the five core project cities (Akoupé, Biankouma, Duekoué, Sinfra and Tiassalé), trainers from the Direction du Développement Social (DDS) will participate in the TOT seminar, and will, in turn, train social workers in community development techniques. Training at the local level entails a two-pronged approach: (a) general training for 34 selected cities in the areas of economic development planning, financial management and public works management; and (b) more focused training on the areas of financial analysis and resource mobilization for the five core project cities.¹ Cities, receiving computer equipment under the cadastral study, will also receive training in computer use.

Most of the activities under the Municipal Management Training component have taken place on schedule. By the beginning of the first quarter of Fiscal Year 1992, the ITC personnel were in place. The ITC professional staff consists of a resident expatriate training director (RETD), a resident expatriate trainer (RET) and a resident local hire trainer (RLHT). The national training program under the MDSP and the regional program, the Municipal Management Training Program (MMTP), are administered by the ITC. In principle, the RETD divides his time equally between both training programs, while the RET is expected to devote 25% of her time to MMTP. However, in practice, the RETD has devoted close to 100% of his time on the MMTP, and the RET an equivalent amount on the MDSP.

The training program for DGCL, DDS and local level agents is organized by the Institutional Training Contractor (ITC). Eleven DGCL members, an independent consultant and nine DDS trainers participated in the 9-day TOT session in December 1991. As of the middle of the first quarter of Fiscal Year 1993, thirty-two communes have received training in construction techniques, and twenty-nine have participated in seminars on road maintenance. Eleven targeted communes have received individualized training in financial analysis and resource mobilization. The first three-month follow-up evaluation of the financial analysis seminars have been conducted for nine communes, while the three-month evaluation under the resource mobilization component has been completed in eight communes.

¹This effort has been extended to six other communes (Abengourou, Bouaflé, Danané, Sikensi, Soubré, and Touba), through financing from the Hanns Seidl Foundation.

The "Monitoring and Evaluation Activities and Plans"² document specifies, as an indicator of success, an increase in the quality and/or quantity of technical assistance provided by the DGCL Training Unit to municipalities, to be quantified by a 25% rise in the number of municipal agents trained and a commensurate increase in the amount of technical assistance provided to the communes as a result of the project. It is not surprising therefore that data presented by the ITC emphasizes the number of participants in the different training activities. However, as certain individuals attend more than one seminar³, the number of municipal agents actually trained is not necessarily equal to, and is, in fact, much lower than the number of participants.

According to ITC statistics, as of December 1992, there have been 83 training events involving 853 participants or 853 units of training delivered. Of the participants, 317 have been local hire municipal-level agents, 147 central-level agents assigned to the communes and 70 elected officials. Of the remainder, 150 were agents of other ministries operating at the local level, 47 were DGCL agents assigned to Abidjan and 88 were private sector participants. However, of the 464 training units delivered to municipal agents (both local hire and centrally assigned), some 150 had participated in more than one seminar.

Training of Trainers Program: This program is targeted to trainers within the DGCL and the DDS. Each will be discussed in turn.

(a) DGCL Training Unit: The CP to the first project disbursement requires that a training division be formally constituted within the Department of Local Government of the Ministry of the Interior. It is further required that the training unit... "be furnished with (a) an official status (by ministerial decree); (b) human resources (eight trained trainers); and (c) material resources (a budget)".⁴

In 1991 the Direction des Collectivités Locales (DCL) was elevated to the level of the Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales within the Ministry of the Interior. The Decree 376/MIS/CAB, dated October 4, 1991 defines the attributions of the Directorates, Sub-Directorates and Bureaus of the DGCL. According to Article 3, Paragraph 3 of the Decree, within the Directorate of General Local Government Affairs⁵, the third Sub-Directorate for Local Government Human Resources, Training, Continuing Education, Sensitization and Information⁶ includes a Service of Training, Continuing Education, Information and

²Municipal Development Support Project Monitoring and Evaluation Activities and Plans, p.5.

³The seminars offered were on financial analysis, resource mobilization, and construction techniques and road maintenance.

⁴Municipal Development Support Project Monitoring and Evaluation Activities and Plans, page 5.

⁵Direction des Affaires Générales des Collectivités Locales.

⁶Sous-Direction des Ressources Humaines des Collectivités locales, de la Formation, du Perfectionnement, de la Sensibilisation et de l'Information.

Sensitization⁷. This service is divided into two Bureaus. The first Bureau of Training and Continuing Education Policy⁸, constitutes the administrative support of the Training Unit of the DGCL. The head of the Training Unit reports to the Deputy Director of Human Resources. The DGCL organizational chart is presented in Annex 2.

The Training Unit is responsible for the training and continuing education of local government personnel, the development of training programs, the definition of pedagogical methods, organization and follow-up of seminars and internships, and training evaluation. Since the start of the project, the Unit has been under the supervision of the Assistant Director of Human Resources who is responsible for developing the training program, advising the trainers and evaluating their work. In October 1992, the head of the Training Division was appointed to coordinate the training activities of the Unit established within the Human Resources Department. The person appointed to this post was previously in the Sub-Directorate of the Administrative Tutelle of the DGCL. However, given that this individual is not a professional trainer and has not received training under the TOT program at the time of the evaluation, it is recommended that he receive appropriate training without delay.

The trainers themselves are not based full-time in the Training Unit but exercise other functions within the DGCL. Of the participants of TOT training program held in December 1991, six trainers conduct training seminars for municipalities, while two have since left the Unit⁹. The sole woman trained has still to conduct a training session.

It is worth noting that the majority of the trainers who participated in the TOT session of December 1991 have previously participated in a TOT seminar either from RHUDO/USAID or from other donor organizations (ILO, UNDP, IBRD, French Cooperation, and the Hans Seidl Foundation). An independent trainer, subcontracted through the ITC, organized the TOT session in December 1991. This individual took into account these previous training experiences and modified his program in order to build on the existing knowledge and skills of the DGCL and DDS trainers.

As a result of fiscal constraints, the DGCL has not allocated an operating budget for the Training Unit to date. In effect, the activities of the Training Unit are financed entirely through the municipal training component of the MDSP. Since the project paper states that..."It is expected that the training unit will continue to carry out this function for the DGCL beyond the life of the project"... the continued existence of the training program beyond the MDSP is a critical issue that must be addressed in the remaining phase of the project.

⁷Le Service de la Formation, du Perfectionnement, de l'Information et de la Sensibilisation.

⁸Bureau de la Politique de Formation et de Perfectionnement.

⁹One is currently on a 10-month internship in Paris and the other has been named Secretary General of an Ivoirian commune.

Given the small number of professional women currently employed by the DGCL, it is highly unlikely that the targeted number of women trainers called for in the project will be met. The project targets 25% DGCL women agents to be trained under the program which translates into at least two to three women in the Training Unit. While RHUDO/USAID originally proposed three women in the DGCL, only one has been included in the Technical Unit¹⁰. To date, she has not conducted any training sessions under the project. There are only two other women agents at the professional level at the DGCL. Their non-participation has been attributed to disinterest in the training activities and lack of time due to family obligations.

(b) DDS Training Unit: The Direction du Développement Social (DDS) of the Ministère de la Santé et des Affaires Sociales (MSAS) is participating in the Municipal Management Training component through the training of social workers in community development techniques. The central office of the DDS oversees the staffing requirements and work program of the regional social centers. The project requested participating towns to assist DDS agents in the field to establish the Comités d'Action Sanitaire et Social (CASS), a forum for local community participation. The latter are expected to work on their own once they are functioning and have developed good working relationships with local officials. The success of this endeavor will nevertheless require some continued assistance from social workers. The project covers the cost of travel of the social workers to the towns for the above activities.

Nine members of the DDS training cell participated in the TOT seminar of December 1991. Of these, four women agents received TOT training. This level of participation approaches the goal of the logical framework to have 50% DDS women agents trained. The DDS trainers expressed general satisfaction with the TOT seminar, particularly with regards to the emphasis given to the applicability of training techniques. At the same time they expressed the need for more structured feedback on performance. Although the ITC is present in the field, there are no official written reports with concrete observations and recommendations to the Ivoirian participants. In addition, the trainers indicated during the interviews that the manner in which the per diem was being administered required more sensitivity to the institutional context. They explained that in some instances, the per diem was treated as if it were the primary driving force behind the project. This response from the trainers is important to consider given that a primary objective of the MDSP is to create self-sustaining training programs within the DGCL and DDS.

Computer Training: The objective of the computer training component is to enable the DGCL "to more rapidly and accurately track the deliberations, planning and budgetary actions of all 135 municipalities", as well as to ... "help the DGCL to improve its own internal operations" (MDSP Project Paper:12). Accordingly, several activities have been undertaken in the last year. An assessment of the computer needs of the DGCL and the Direction du Cadastre (DC) was carried out by an independent computer expert in February 1992. A workshop for all senior staff of the DGCL, including the Director General, Directors and Deputy Directors, was subsequently held on March 1992 to inform them of the results of the computer needs

¹⁰Letter of 5 November 1991, from Michael Enders to Albert Hoba, General Director of Local Governments.

assessment, and to sensitize them to the computerization program. As a follow-up to the workshop, each of the DGCL Departments was requested to develop proposals and work plans for computerizing their functions. The independent computer specialist has likewise developed a training plan for the DGCL which indicates the functions to be computerized, targeted trainees, and the materials to be provided. Training for the secretarial staff on standard software has taken place. However, only one seminar report was available in the ITC files.

The resident local hire trainer (RLHT) is responsible for computer training at the DGCL and in the five core project cities. The RLHT is a public works engineer with basic computer training from the Institut français de gestion. However, he is neither a computer programmer nor a computer trainer, and has, since the inception of the project, been receiving computer training from an independent computer expert hired through the training component of the project. The RLHT's lack of computer skills is reflected in the document, "Formation et informatisation à la DGCL"¹¹, which clearly demonstrates how higher level computer functions have been assumed by an independent computer expert.

According to the aforementioned document, *the role of the independent computer specialist includes the following functions:*

- (1) aiding the RLHT to elaborate training guides for Lotus, Quatro and Q&R software;
- (2) training the RLHT;
- (3) verifying the contents of the training sessions for the professional staff of the DGCL; and,
- (4) creating programs for certain DGCL tasks.

The role of the RLHT is defined as:

- (1) establishing the training calendar for the secretarial staff;
- (2) identifying the professional staff which will be participating in the training sessions (Lotus, Quatro and Q&R);
- (3) meeting and motivating future trainees; and,
- (4) collecting the documents relating to the DGCL activities which will be computerized.

Based on this assignment of tasks, it is not clear who is actually responsible for the computer training of the professional staff of the DGCL. The RLHT has been unable to produce a work program, identifying his specific tasks and responsibilities, when requested by the evaluators.

¹¹However, as the document makes note of the Journée informatique which took place on March 10, 1992, it probably dates from March or April of 1992.

This work program is useful in monitoring performance on specific computer training tasks. In addition, a specific training schedule should be developed as soon as possible to program the resources, both professional and budgetary, which are necessary to implement the training of the professional staff, including the trainers themselves, in the time remaining in the project.

According to the project paper, the primary objective of the computerization program within the DGCL is to improve technical assistance to the communes, particularly in the areas of budgeting and investment planning. However, to date only the training of secretarial staff in word processing has taken place. The training of the professional staff has not yet been scheduled. While this delay may be partly tied to the procurement of additional computers, there is no reason by some of the existing computers could not be used for providing this training. With the exception of the five computers located in the computer room, all the equipment have been distributed to the secretarial staff. Moreover, the computers in the DGCL computer room are not being used to the fullest, with two requiring repair. On three separate visits to the computer room, the evaluation team noted that only one machine, if any, was being used.

Delays in the computer training of the professional staff at the DGCL has not yet commenced and may be explained by two reasons. First, inadequate computer skills the RLHT and his need for additional technical assistance has slowed down the implementation of the training program. And secondly, the independent computer expert hired to supplant the RLHT has not yet completed the training modules and programs for specific DGCL tasks. Due to delays in this part of the training program, the PACD will not give sufficient time to evaluate the effectiveness of the computerization of DGCL tasks.

At present the status and salary structure of the RLHT remains ambiguous. In an interview with the evaluation team, the RLHT stated that his status is that of a civil servant within the DGCL where he is responsible for computer training. As such, he receives both a civil servant salary as well as a monthly fixed indemnity from RTI. The Directeur Général of the DGCL submitted a letter assigning the RLHT exclusively to the project. It does not provide for the suspension of the RLHT's civil servant salary for the duration of the project. To clarify this situation, an official decree (arrêté) needs to be issued as soon as possible by the Minister of Civil Service to rectify this situation. The decree should confirm the DGCL memo and state that the salary of the RLHT will not be paid by the DGCL. This decree is important since AID regulations specify that no government functionary may be paid through project funds.

National Level Training Seminars: National level training seminars cover the following subjects: the role of mayors, privatization of municipal services, environmental management, and municipal administration. The seminar on environmental management, focusing on the role of elected officials in municipal environmental management, took place on October 1992. It was attended by 20 mayors and elected officials, agents of the DGCL and of the DDS, and a few directors of municipal administrative services. Other seminars are scheduled in 1993. It is recommended that the seminar on the role of mayors discuss the roles, functions and training needs of elected officials and prefectural staff in the decentralization process.

Regional Level Training Program: The regional training program is targeted to mayors and elected officials, heads of financial departments and heads of municipal public works departments. Thirty-four cities have been selected to participate. Topics include: the role of elected officials in provision of public services, improved management of community health, solid waste disposal, sewage and drainage facilities, road and public space maintenance, construction techniques and potable water supply. Seminars on construction techniques were completed in 1992. One seminar on road and public space maintenance is still to be held.

Six seminars on Construction Techniques were held between April and June of 1992. They were attended by the heads and assistant heads of municipal public works departments of thirty-two (32) communes. A total of 94 participants completed the evaluation questionnaires at the end of the seminars. Each participant proposed an action plan using construction techniques acquired during the seminar, but the implementation of these plans is dependent on the financial constraints and investment priorities of municipalities.

One technical assistance mission has been completed in the commune of Alepe in early November 1992. Although technical assistance is expected to be provided to the other municipalities, a calendar of visits has not been proposed, and priority is given to specific requests for technical assistance.

The issue of the relevance of this seminar topic to the development objectives of the MDSP is revealed by participant responses to the seminar evaluation questionnaire. One of the key questions is: "Citer une chose essentielle que vous prévoyez de faire différemment / mieux après le séminaire"¹². Out of a total of 94 completed questionnaires, 23% did not respond to this question while 77% did respond. Of the latter, at least 15% indicated that they planned to build their own houses or other personal property using building techniques acquired through the seminar.

Five seminars on Road and Public Space Maintenance were held between July and October of 1992. These seminars were attended by heads and assistant heads of municipal public works departments of twenty-nine (29) communes. A total of 71 participants completed the evaluation questionnaires at the end of the seminars. The last seminar has been delayed by the transfer of the trainer to a public works department in a commune. His replacement is seeking to revise the original contents of the seminar.

Each of the participating communes formulated their own action plans based on the seminar. Among the priorities mentioned in the action plans were: regular garbage collection, and maintenance of roads and public spaces. However, the implementation of these action plans is dependent on local resources and political support for these priorities. As of the first quarter of Fiscal Year 1993, no follow-up evaluations for the road and public space maintenance seminars

¹²Indicate one essential thing that you intend to carry out differently or improve after the seminar.

have taken place. The implementation of these action plans will require the monitoring by, and reinforcement from the trainers.

Local Level Training Program: This training program is targeted to mayors, elected officials, heads and employees of municipal financial departments, public works departments, and administrative services. Other participants include the prefectural staff, professional staff of deconcentrated central ministries, and representatives of local businesses. Among the seminar topics are the following: municipal financial analysis, mobilization of local resources, cost recovery, personnel management and community development project.

Local training is designed to involve targeted communes in the preparation of the seminar. This method has been followed in the seminars on Financial Analysis and Revenue Mobilization. Prior to each seminar, the trainer undertakes a field visit to the commune to collect financial data and discuss financial and organizational problems with elected officials and administrative personnel. Information on the local situation is used as basis for developing the content of the seminar. At the conclusion of each seminar, the participants formulate the action plan which contains recommendations to improve municipal revenue generation and financial management. Finally, trainers undertake 3-, 6- and 9-month follow-up visits to each commune to verify progress made in the implementation of the action plans.

Financial Analysis Seminars: From February to November 1992, seminars on Financial Analysis were held in eleven communes. Six different DGCL trainers completed the field studies, and conducted the training seminars. The seminar reports for only five communes were available in the ITC files¹³. Of these five, a total of 65 participants completed evaluation questionnaires. However, participants did not demonstrate an overwhelmingly positive response to the question regarding the task they intended to change or improve as a result of the seminar. This weak response suggests the need to revise this aspect of the training program.

As of December 1992, nine three-month follow-up evaluations had been conducted. However, only five evaluation reports were available in ITC files¹⁴. The results of these evaluations indicate that numerous difficulties have been encountered in the actual implementation of the action plans. The problems noted by the trainers include : non-communication of the finalized action plan to the seminar participants; lack of communication between elected officials and municipal administrative staff; lack of communication between the municipality and the taxpayers; refusal of elected officials to permit municipal personnel to undertake certain reforms (management of municipal vehicles to verify gas consumption for municipal garbage collection trucks). These different problems have prevented several strategic aspects of the action plans from being implemented. The recommendations most easily adapted were generally those not requiring the approval of elected officials or discussions with local tradespeople and taxpayers.

¹³Akoupé, Bouaflé, Danané, Tiassalé and Touba.

¹⁴Abengourou, Bouaflé, Danané, Sikensi and Touba.

Mobilization of Local Resources Seminars: Seminars on Mobilization of Local Resources were conducted in eleven communes from February to December 1992. An independent local consultant undertook the field studies and training seminars. Seminar reports for six communes were available in the ITC files¹⁵. The independent consultant furnished the participant evaluations for three other communes¹⁶. For these eight cities, 183 participants completed evaluation questionnaires. Over 45 % of the respondents did not answer the question concerning which task the participant intended to change or improve as a result of the seminar. Although this figure may be partially explained by the number of participants who may have been illiterate (i.e. market salespeople), it nevertheless raises the question of how relevant the seminar is to the majority of the participants.

Eight follow-up evaluations were conducted by December 1992. However, the follow-up evaluation reports for only four municipalities were available in ITC files¹⁷. The evaluation team held discussions with the independent consultant on the follow-up evaluation results for Akoupé and Tiassalé. In general, the remarks regarding the results of the evaluation for the Financial Analysis seminars are equally applicable to those of the Resource Mobilization seminars. For instance, it was noted that action plans were extremely detailed, while communes would benefit from more succinct plans which prioritize measures required to improve local revenue collection.

It is equally difficult to attribute changes in the level of local revenues to training provided through the project, particularly since many of the communes have benefitted from previous training provided by other donor agencies, such as UNDP/ILO. For instance, it has been claimed that the Financial Analysis and Resource Mobilization seminars were successful in raising local revenues in selected communes. However, an examination of the evaluation reports and interviews with the independent consultant for the Resource Mobilization seminar indicate that it is not apparent that the increases in revenues can be attributable to the seminars. For instance, the use by DGCL trainers of the time period of three months before and after the seminar as a basis for calculating revenue changes is too short and does not account for seasonal revenue variations. Moreover, some DGCL trainers, and the independent training consultant, calculated three month revenue changes for the current year, comparing this to the level of revenues during the same period in the preceding year. This method does not account for: (1) changes made to revenue collection systems and organizations that may have been adopted by the municipality prior to the USAID seminar¹⁸; (2) the adoption of techniques learnt from

¹⁵Akoupé, Danané, Sikensi, Soubré, Tiassalé and Touba.

¹⁶Biankouma, Duekoué and Sinfra.

¹⁷Abengourou, Bouaflé, Sikensi and Soubré.

¹⁸This was the case for the city of Akoupé. The municipal administration had already taken action to improve revenue collection several months before the Resource mobilization seminar. However, during his three-month evaluation, the independent consultant attributed the increase in revenue to the impact of his seminar.

previous and on-going training programs to meet their particular needs. As the impact of training is cumulative, the success of the seminars may be more appropriately judged in the medium and long term. Caution must therefore be exercised in using changes in levels of revenues as a criterion of project success since the impact of training is cumulative, and communes have since adopted techniques learnt from previous and on-going training programs to meet their particular needs. Nevertheless, intensive technical assistance does appear to be necessary to encourage municipalities to implement the necessary reforms.

Increasing participation of women in the training sessions is one of the objectives of the MDSP. However, since relatively few women are employed at the professional level in the communes, their participation in the seminars has not been high. Nevertheless, it is worth noting that participation is higher in the seminars on Local Resource Mobilization, precisely because of the larger number of female economic agents, such as market sellers. Overall, however, less than 10% of total participants for the nine seminars on Local Resource Mobilization were women, based on information available from the files. Table 1 indicates the number of women participants in each target city.

Community Development Project: The community development component of the training program consists of: (1) the training of local social workers in community development techniques; (2) base-line studies (étude de milieu) in each of the five core project cities; (3) the development and administration of a questionnaire to 150 households in each of the five cities; (4) the creation of community action groups (Comités d'action sanitaire et social or CASS); and (5) and the elaboration of a project by each CASS based on the results of the household questionnaires.

Table 1: Women Participants in the Mobilization of Local Resources Seminars

<u>Target city</u>	<u>Total Particip.</u>	<u>Total Women</u>	<u>Women as % of Total</u>
Abengourou	?	?	?
Akoupé	38	5	13 %
Biankouma	31	3	9.6 %
Bouaflé	?	?	?
Danané	26	2	7.7 %
Duekoué	33	5	15 %
Sikensi	31	5	18 %
Sinfra	25	2	8 %
Soubré	44	1	2 %
Tiassalé	30	1	3 %
Touba	16	0	
Total	274	24	8.7 %

Source: Participant lists from the Mobilization of Resources seminar reports, ITC and consultant reports.

In May and June of 1992, five teams, each composed of two DDS trainers who had participated in the TOT program, conducted seminars on community development techniques. These seminars were targeted to social workers responsible for activities in the five core project cities¹⁹. The training modules were prepared by the DDS trainers. The immediate effectiveness of the seminars was measured through pre- and post-training tests. In all of the social centers which were tested, the participants rated below average on the pre-test with scores below 10/20. A marked improvement was noted in the post-test results, with averages generally reaching 13/20 and higher. The results per social center were²⁰ :

Table 2 : Pre- and Post-Test Results for Community Development Training

<u>Social center</u>	<u>Core city</u>	<u>Pre-test</u>	<u>Post-test</u>
Adzopé	Akoupé	7/20	14/20
Man	Biankouma	9.2/20	13.9/20
Guiglo	Duekoué	7.4/20	15/20
Oumé	Sinfra	8.3/20	13.3/20
Divo	Tiassalé	6.5/20	13/20

Source: Reports on community development techniques training seminars, DDS Training Unit

One of the objectives of the MDSP includes the participation of women agents in community development training. The breakdown of women participants per social center is presented in table 3 below²¹ :

Table 3: Breakdown of Women Participants by Social Center

<u>Social center</u>	<u>Core city</u>	<u>Total Particip.</u>	<u>of which - Women</u>	<u>% Total</u>
Adzopé	Akoupé	6	2	33 %
Man	Biankouma	8	4	50 %
Guiglo	Duekoué	6	1	17 %
Oumé	Sinfra	12	2	17 %
Divo	Tiassalé	8	5	63 %

Source: Reports on community development techniques training seminars, DDS Training Unit

¹⁹The regional social centers were the focus of training, as the core project cities do not currently host their own social centers. The regional centers which received training are : Adzopé (Akoupé), Man (Biankouma), Guiglo (Duekoué), Oumé (Sinfra) and Divo (Tiassalé).

²⁰The results exclude the exams taken by Peace Corps volunteers (Adzopé and Oumé), as well as results for participants who missed either the pre-test or the post-test.

²¹The Peace Corps volunteers from Akoupé and Sinfra are excluded from the totals.

Of the participants in the community development training program, 14 were women. This represents 35% of participants. The low participation rate of women in the training seminar in Guiglo and Oumé is unusual, as women are generally well represented among social workers. After the training program, each regional social center prepared a baseline study (July, 1992) to aid the DDS in designing a questionnaire on the social and sanitary conditions prevalent in selected districts. This questionnaire was then administered to 150 households in each targeted city.

The staff of one of the regional social centers visited by the evaluation team complained about the length of the questionnaire and the difficulties associated with the field survey. Indeed, the document contained over 20 pages, with the most important questions being left towards the end. In addition, there were gaps in the type of data being gathered. Some of the DDS trainers concurred with this criticism, and recognized the need to incorporate these comments in the design of future survey instruments. It would thus appear that this activity constituted not only an important training experience for both DDS and social center staff, but also an opportunity to improve their work in the field. The results of these surveys are currently being analyzed by the DDS and is scheduled for presentation to elected officials, communal agents and the community in the second quarter of Fiscal Year 1993. Based on the results, a concrete action plan is to be developed by the CASS with the assistance of the regional social centers. Nevertheless, the current PACD does not provide adequate time to evaluate the effectiveness of the plans.

Computer Training Program: Computers are being allocated to the five core project cities as part of the cadastral study under the Revenue Enhancement Component. Computer training in the use of this equipment and the development of applicable computer modules for municipal use is not directly part of the original project purpose. Nevertheless, in the contract concluded between REDSO/WCA and RTI, Article III-C (Overall description of training fields), indicates a list of required training areas and states that..."However, this list is not all inclusive. Additional fields, not listed below, may also be required from time to time as specified by the AID cognizant Project Officer". Under this rubric, the RLHT has been given the responsibility for computer training at the local level, assisted by an independent computer specialist who has been contracted to prepare training modules for Lotus and is developing computer applications for local use:

At the time of the evaluation, only Akoupé and Sinfra had received computers. Two training sessions took place in Akoupé, and one in Sinfra. The Financial Services Department of Akoupé has developed simple computer programs to track local revenues and the budget. The computerization of this commune enjoys the support of the mayor who is himself a computer engineer. In contrast, computer training in Sinfra has been less successful. The computer is locked in the office of the Head of the Financial Services Department, and is not easily accessible to the financial staff. In December 1992, the evaluation team noted that the former had not prioritized the municipal tasks to be computerized, and furthermore, was not interested in having the RLHT provide further training for another three months.

3.2.2 Revenue Enhancement

In support of the GOCI's decentralization policy, the project provides assistance to municipalities through activities intended to increase municipal revenues. The most important of these activities is the carrying out of a series of simplified cadastral surveys in designated project towns.

Simplified Cadastral Studies: In contrast to the more complex cadastral surveys undertaken by the GOCI, the project has introduced simplified fiscal surveys in the core cities as a means of calculating property values. The GOCI has traditionally carried a full-scale fiscal and physical cadastre survey which, because of its length and complexity, was rarely completed. Information from the cadastre surveys were often not utilized. By focusing its efforts on the fiscal rather than physical survey of the property, the Direction du Cadastre (DC) is able to rapidly create or update existing property tax rolls in project towns thereby improving the potential for augmenting municipal revenues via an increase in property tax collections. Previous cadastral studies in the region, carried out under the auspices of AID, have resulted in significant increases in the property tax base. Thus, cadastral surveys represent an important though under exploited method of improving the financial position of municipalities, particularly in light of the dramatic decline in centrally funded subsidies to municipal budgets.

The institution responsible for the fiscal survey is the DC within the Direction Générale des Impôts (DGI), with assistance from representatives of participating municipalities. Private firms are being hired to undertake the actual surveying. Working closely with the DC, the Direction d'Informatique (DI) is responsible for processing field data on a special computer program, updating the rolls and generating property tax bills. The final step in the process is the issuance of the tax bills by the central and regional departments of the Ivoirian Treasury followed by the collection of taxes at the local level by regional and local tax agents. At present, pilot cadastral studies have been successfully carried out in the cities of Sinfra and Akoupe from July to September of 1992. Since the costs of the initial cadastral surveys were lower than originally estimated, it has been anticipated that money will become available for doing additional cadastral surveys, in addition to the three towns originally provided for in the project. As of October 1992, AID contract papers had been prepared for cadastral surveys in the remaining towns of Biankouma, Duekoue, Tiassale and possibly two other towns.

Computerization of DGI: To assist the DGI in the processing of data from this simplified cadastral exercise, computer hardware and software is being provided under the project. In November 1991, a computer needs assessment study of the DC was undertaken to ensure the optimal deployment and utilization of this equipment. The resulting study recommended the decentralization of information management for small-scale projects, such as the simplified cadastral surveys. The use of single-user PC systems, PCs linked to the Unisys mainframes and networked microcomputer systems, is intended to decrease the dependency of data processing on the agency's currently overused Unisys mainframe computers.

Based on the computer needs assessment, the purchase order for two local area networks (LANs) to permit the DGI to decentralize its computer system and to significantly augment its capacity

to enter and manipulate tax data was issued in May 1992 as part of a giant order composed of the MSDP, HFP Project and order from Niger. The disappointing response to this request for proposals necessitated the breaking down of the order into separate item components, and the re-issuance of new purchase orders in December 1992 for the following items: a fully operated network, stand alone desktop computers/notebooks, database/CAD systems, English and French language software, and printer. Under the best scenario, the equipment is expected to be in place by February 1993.

Given the delays that have been associated with the contracting of consultants and procurement of equipment under the project, it is recommended that the process for the hiring of a local/regional expert to provide training in the management and maintenance of the LAN system be initiated as soon as possible to ensure the availability of technical assistance in time for the arrival of the computer equipment. To reinforce the technical capacity within the DU in this area, it is likewise suggested that the lead computer technician be provided the needed specialized technical training, if appropriate in the United States or France.

Study of the Property Tax Circuit: Previous experience has shown that although the initial phases of cadastral operations are fairly straight forward, the subsequent phases (those involving the distribution of bills and the collection of taxes by the central and regional branches of the Treasury) are less so. Major bottlenecks appear to exist at the level of the Treasury where the circuit that must be followed to distribute the bills appear to be long and cumbersome. More importantly, the resources required at the regional and local level to deliver the bill to its final destination, to collect the tax and to follow up in cases of non-payment appear to be woefully inadequate. To ameliorate these problems existing within both the DGI and the Treasury that now prevent the cadastral cycle from being successfully completed, a study of the property tax circuit is being undertaken.

Privatization Studies: A study on the privatization of public services, focusing on solid waste management, was completed in early December 1992 with disappointing results. The study concluded with the recommendation to use tractors for municipal solid waste collection in spite of the major capital and maintenance costs associated with their use. In lieu of this recommendation, Project Management has opted for a community-based solid waste management program with participation by communal authorities and local groups.

3.2.3 Facilities Construction:

Although technical studies and construction designs are presently underway, the start-up period for this activity suffered considerable delay. Work has progressed at a slow pace due to the decreasing efficiency of the implementing agency DCGTx and the delay in the issuance of the FAR. Each of these two institutional constraints will be discussed briefly.

Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux: Changes of ministerial responsibilities, the merger and dismemberment of ministries, as well as the creation and abolition of government

departments and agencies, formed part of the praxis of the Ivoirian Government during the second half of the 1980s. Of greatest significance was the increasing power and responsibilities of the DCGTx, which showed signs of decline in the beginning of the 1990s.

With the disbanding of the Central Office of Technical Studies (BCET) which served as the GOCI's main outlet for contracting both foreign and local consultants to work on project feasibility studies, the DCGTx began to assume greater responsibility for government technical studies in addition to its growing portfolio of large development projects. The importance of DCGTx can be gauged from the fact that, up to November 1989²², it constituted a directorate of the Presidency of the Republic. The Director-General of the DCGTx, who was appointed personally by the President, reported directly to the President himself. Soon after its creation, the DCGTx was made responsible for executing large public works in all sectors²³. In addition to its executive functions, DCGTx had financial, legal and technical responsibility for the projects it executed while they were under construction. Upon completion, this responsibility was relinquished and restored to the originating agency.

The centralization of responsibilities for public investments across many sectors in a single agency meant that the Ministry of Transport and Public Works and the Ministry of Construction and Urbanism were essentially relieved of their functions, this role having been effectively assumed by the DCGTx. For the GOCI as a whole, this involved a major restructuring of public sector investment implementation responsibilities and capabilities. DCGTx was created outside the traditional structure of government, much along the lines of a specialized investment agency. With these increased budgetary and personnel resources, the DCGTx sought to execute its projects efficiently under a strong technocratic philosophy.

However, with the departure of its former General Manager in November 1989, the DCGTx has remained without a clear definition of its administrative role vis-a-vis other parts of the central government. Moreover, the turnover in senior level personnel in the DCGTx and renewed institutional rivalry between DCGTx and MECU have led to a decreasing efficiency in the ability of the agency to implement its projects. In spite of the availability of funds and the selection of project cities in Spring 1991, the DCGTx has been slow in completing contracting arrangements for the initial architectural studies. It blames this delay on the cumbersome GOCI contract approval process in general, and on the unwillingness of MECU to approve DCGTx contracts in a timely manner, in particular. DCGTx and MECU have been involved in a struggle for the control of the Ivoirian public works construction sector over the last decade. This conflict was exacerbated by an 8-year long period of dominance during which the DCGTx assumed many of the functions traditionally held by MECU, a situation that has since been adversely affected by recent changes within the Ivoirian bureaucracy.

²²Since this date, with the departure of its former General Manager, the DCGTx has remained without a clear definition of its administrative role vis-a-vis other parts of the central government.

²³In practice, this definition gave way to a more flexible concept which brought an increasing number of smaller projects under the supervision of the DCGTx.

The failure of the DCGTx to conclude contracting arrangements for the architectural studies for the construction of revenue-generating facilities in the five project cities has had a negative impact on project implementation. Training designed to improve local tax collection as well as activities relating to the privatization of urban services were to have been linked with the construction of new markets and transportation depots. Although these activities will continue to take place, their impact will be lessened by the delays in the construction schedule.

Caisse Autonome d'Amortissement (CAA): Construction under the project is being carried out through a modified Fixed Amount Reimbursement Agreement (FAR) which was prepared in collaboration with the DCGTx. The issuance of the FAR was delayed owing to doubts about the ability of the CAA to fulfill its function as paying agent for the construction component of the project. The consulting firm Deloitte and Touche was hired to ascertain the capacity of the CAA to manage a separate project account. The results of the study confirmed the ability of the CAA to perform this function. At the suggestion of the consultants, the text of the FAR is being modified to include a section dealing with the creation and management of this separate account.

Alternative Implementing Arrangements: Given the failure of the DCGTx to manage and supervise the construction component in a timely manner, the Project Manager has gone ahead and reviewed alternative methods of implementing the component. Three components were reviewed: direct AID contracting, communal contracting (Devis Administratif) and private agency contracting. The first alternative was turned down by AID owing to the excessive demand it would place on the existing staff of the REDSO Procurement Office. The second alternative, communal contracting, was developed by Fonds Européen de Développement (FED) over a 2-year period and is being currently employed by it in its small projects. Under this arrangement, cities undertake the contracting activities themselves. The system is, however, rather complex and requires a number of exemptions to accepted procedures. The third alternative involves the creation of an agency by the Ministry of Employment and Civil Service for the rapid generation of employment through this project activity.

AID is interested in transferring the responsibility of construction supervision from the DCGTx to the beneficiary cities, through a system currently employed by the FED in its small projects. While this alternative may enjoy strong political support at the municipal level, the critical absence of qualified technical personnel to carry out the construction, coordination, supervision and cost control activities associated with the implementation of this component must be noted. Since construction involves the expenditure of public funds, the issue of accountability is paramount in the choice of an appropriate implementing arrangement. It is likewise important to make note of the willingness of the Ministry of Economy and Finance to exercise greater flexibility in its policy governing the use of grant money vis-a-vis an alternative implementation arrangement in order to ensure that this component did not fail due to the inability of the DCGTx to carry out its assigned responsibility.

4. CONCLUSIONS

The strongest feature of the project is the relevance of its design and strategy to emerging needs at the local level created by the rapid extension of the local government system in Côte d'Ivoire. This theme was repeated in interviews with officials from central and local governments, regional and local level community development personnel and managers of other donor-funded programs. Since the success of the decentralization process ultimately lies in how successfully communes are able to respond to their new administrative and financial responsibilities, a development program which address these needs directly, at the municipal level, will ultimately leave behind the most sustainable results.

The MDSP training strategy is particularly relevant because it provides technical training on-site, where the needs are most felt, and where the community is little able to afford the frequent absence of its skilled professionals who, traditionally, are sent to a regional center for training. The sustainability of these on-site training efforts will require coordination with the training provided by the UNDP/ILO at the management level.

The challenge in the second phase of the MDSP will be to ensure that all three project components are implemented in a timely and coordinated manner. So far, considerable delay has been encountered in the implementation of the second component largely as a result of lengthy procurement and contracting procedures. Moreover, the decreasing efficiency of DCGTx has resulted to delays in the implementation of the facility construction component. The efforts taken by Project Management to circumvent the institutional blockage at DCGTx, and continuing dialogue with mayors from the participating cities should contribute to improved project performance in the second phase.

However, the overwhelming issue that needs to be addressed within the context of the project, and in the long-term is the sustainability of project results. A major issue to be addressed is the continued existence of the Training Unit beyond the PACD. At present, the Unit is financed entirely by AID and has no full-time trainers. To date, neither the DGCL nor the MOI has demonstrated the institutional commitment to the training strategy by allocating an internal budget to the Training Unit. Moreover, given the GOCI's declining financial condition, it is unlikely that these resources will be forthcoming in the near future.

It is questionable whether this Unit can be institutionalized within the DGCL unless other sources of financing can be found to support its training activities in the field. Given the GOCI's declining financial condition, it is unlikely that these funds will be provided by the DGCL. It is more realistic to expect that financial support to come either from other donors buying-in to the training program and/or municipalities themselves buying into training and technical services provided by the Technical Unit. However, the privatization of the Technical Unit will depend on two important factors. One, that the trainers receive the necessary training and specialized expertise that will enable them to respond to the emerging needs of municipalities in the decentralization process, and second, that municipalities themselves, as a result of previous training, are able to identify their own management and technical needs. Sustainability will

depend therefore on successful institution-building at both the central and local levels of government. In this context, the position of the RLHT can make a significant contribution to institution-building within the DGCL, and the RLHT should be encouraged to assume a more active role in advancing the sustainability of project goals both within the DGCL and at the communal level.

With regards to DDS participation in the training component, sustainability of the objectives of the project will depend on the availability of local resources to support this initiative. Since none of the five core project cities have their own social centers, they depend on regional centers which are poorly equipped to adequately meet the needs of the cities within their jurisdiction. Given the dim economic situation faced by local governments, it is unlikely that the towns benefitting from the MDSP project will have the resources to immediately meet DDS requirements for housing a social center. Moreover, the community development program calls for local population participation through the organization of CASS. However, in order for these structures to be effective, they will need to be managed by social workers' who are either on-site or can make weekly visits to the project cities, a situation made almost impossible by the shortage of municipal resources. These conditions seriously constrain the ability of the DDS to meet their community development objectives in secondary cities.

5. RECOMMENDATIONS

The recommendations address the following three areas:

5.1 Management Training Component:

5.1.1 Project Management:

(a) Institutional Training Contractor: It is recommended that the Resident Expatriate Training Director participate more actively in direct MDSP project management. More structured feedback on each seminar should be provided to trainers as part of performance assessment and diagnosis.

(b) Training Unit: First, it is recommended that training modules be reorganized according to a standardized 'cahier de charges' in order to facilitate the organization of pedagogical guides and the re-utilization of the modules by future trainers and training programs. Second, at the end of each seminar, each trainer should prepare a more detailed report of the activity undertaken during his/her training session, specifically an analysis of the qualitative evaluation of the seminars by the participants. And third, in addition to meetings of individual trainers with the ITC, regular meetings involving all of the available trainers from the DGCL should be programmed to encourage dialogue and facilitate the learning process.

5.1.2 Seminar Content

- (a) Seminars responding to the management and financial requirements of the revenue enhancement (i.e. management of public facilities) and facility construction (i.e. resource mobilization) components of the project;
- (b) National/regional seminars (including research and training) to educate mayors and prefectural staff as to their respective responsibilities in the transition to decentralization;
- (c) National level policy discussions on decentralization to be coordinated with the Union des Villes et Communes de Côte d'Ivoire and the Conseil national pour le Developpement de Communes; and,
- (d) Seminars to assist communes in urban management and planning, focusing on the prioritization and planning of local needs.

5.1.3. Other Seminars

- (a) Mayoral retreat to give mayors of core cities the opportunity to share experiences and reinforce project commitment;
- (b) Retreat for trainers from DDS and DGCL to share their training experiences and to coordinate their efforts in the second phase of the program. The retreat could be an occasion to undertake a forward looking assessment of the project as a whole to reinforce not only the link between the two training sub-components, but the relationship of all three project components as well; and
- (c) Follow up to Yamoussoukro to reinforce mayoral interest in MSDP training efforts, including regional seminars between mayors and technical staff.

5.1.4 Extension of Training to Additional Communes: Based on the availability of additional resources, training in financial analysis/resource mobilization should be extended to other communes.

5.1.5 Special Studies: The following studies should be considered and their results incorporated into the development of existing and as well as new training modules.

- (a) Research on appropriate technology in drainage and sewerage should be undertaken as a follow-up to solid waste interventions; and,
- (b) Privatization pilot projects should be undertaken at the local, inter-communal and/or inter-regional levels. Given the multitude of small communes, studies should examine the feasibility of using private agents in urban service delivery at an inter-communal and/or inter-regional level, with the objective of fostering inter-communal cooperation for more effective service delivery.

5.2 Revenue Enhancement Component: It is recommended that contracting procedures be streamlined to minimize delays in the procurement of equipment and contracting of consultants. Given the delays in the past, it is recommended that contracting of the consultant on LAN management and maintenance be initiated without further delay, and that technical training be provided to the DG lead computer specialist under the MDSP. Since such training may not be available locally, it may be appropriate to undertake training in the U.S. or Europe. It is essential that consultant expertise be in place during the arrival of the LAN equipment to avoid further delays in project implementation.

5.3 Facility Construction Component:

5.3.1 Condition Precedent Calling for Passage of a Municipal Civil Service Code: Given the economic reality of the GOCI today and the IMF requirement that the GOCI civil service be

reduced as a condition of the structural adjustment program, it is recommended that this Condition Precedent be waived or be replaced with a decree by the Minister of Interior specifying the conditions of recruitment and employment for civil servants.

5.3.2 Adoption of Alternative Implementation Arrangement: The inability of the DCGTx to complete contracting actions for the initial architectural studies has resulted in over a year's delay in the implementation of this component. Since it is unlikely that neither its rivalry with MECU nor its implementation of the component will change within the immediate future, the evaluation supports the recommendation made by Project Management to identify an alternative means of implementing the facility construction component. Project Management's preferred mechanism, the Devis Administratif (communal contracting) should take into consideration the lack of qualified technical staff at the communal level. Project Management should therefore consider the hiring of independent firms to handle the construction, coordination, supervision and cost control functions associated with the implementation of this component, as well as other alternative mechanisms in the event of unexpected impediments. Since construction involves the expenditure of public funds, the issue of accountability is paramount in the choice of an appropriate implementing arrangement.

ANNEX 1

List of Persons Interviewed

REDSO/WCA

Carlene DEI
Scott JOHNSON
Margaret ALEXANDER

Research Triangle Institute

Jean-Michel LEBRETON
Julie Aberg ROBISON
Charles ASSOUMOU

Resident expatriate training director
Resident expatriate trainer
Resident local hire trainer

DGCL

Albert HOBA
Mamadou SIDIBE
Jean-Baptiste AKE
Gaston OULAI
Touré OUMAR
Fatoumata OUTTARA
M. DIARRASSOUBA
Jules N'DRI
M. KINIMO
Ya'aba KOUE
Charles ASSOUMOU

Directeur Général
Sous-Directeur de la Tutelle Financière
Sous-Directeur des Ressources Humaines
Service de l'Inspection
Service de l'Inspection
Service des marchés
Service de la Tutelle Financière
Service Technique
Service de l'Inspection
Chef de Bureau de la Formation
Service informatique

DDS

Mme. SEKI
M. LEFRI
René OWOCHI
Fanta KABA

Directrice de la DDS
Directeur de la Cellule Technique
Assistant Social
Enseignante à INFA

DDS Continued:

Justine DIA
Mme. TRAORE
Mme. KOKOBO
M. SEKA

Assistante Sociale
Assistante Sociale
Assistante Sociale
Assistant Social

DCGTx

M. BLAL

Ingénieur

DGI and DC

Jean Claude GOHOU
Mme Saraka
M. Adiamble

Responsable Projet AID
Directrice du Cadastre et de la Conservation Foncière
Directeur des Services Informatiques

Town of AKOUPE

Mayor
Lazare YAPO
M. KAPHET
Ancel Ange KOFFI
M. BOTTO

Premier maire adjoint
Secrétaire général
Chef des services financiers
Chef des services administratifs

Town of BIANKOUMA

Secrétaire général
Chef des services techniques

Town of SINFRA

Premier maire adjoint
Chef des services financiers
Chef des services techniques

Town of TLIASSALE

Secrétaire général
Yobouet KOUAME
Chef des services techniques

Chef des services financiers

MAN - Centre social régional

Siméon Irié BONY
Alain Laurent DO-BITRA
Lao VOYE
Virginie ASSEY APPE
Gbokolo TOURE KONATE
Aminata Diomandé GLIE
Guisso ALPHA

**Responsable du centre social
Assistant Social
Assistant Social
Assistante Sociale Adjointe
Assistante Sociale Adjointe
Assistante Sociale Adjointe
Assistant Sociale Adjoint**

UNDP/ILO

Jean-Michel BEYNA

Hans Seidl Foundation

Lambert JUNGMANN

Resident Representative

OTHERS

Isidore LECADOU
David HUNSBERGER
Christopher BOGGS
Brian NICHOLSON

**Independent Ivoirian Consultant
Independent Computer Consultant
Peace Corps Volunteer - Sinfra
Peace Corps Volunteer - Akoupé**

ANNEX 2
DGCL Organization Chart

ANNEX 3
DGCL Computer Training Project

PROJET DE SOUTIEN AU DEVELOPPEMENT COMMUNAL

FORMATION ET INFORMATISATION A LA DGCL

Le volet formation du Projet de Soutien au Développement Communal (PSDM) en cours de mise en oeuvre, consacre une importante part à la formation en informatique des agents de la DGCL.

C'est pour assurer la réussite totale de cette opération, que plusieurs actions ont été entreprises par le RHUDO/USAID:

- Une étude d'évaluation du niveau d'informatisation des services de la DGCL, entreprise par Mr David HUNSBERGER, consultant de l'USAID;
- Une journée d'information et de sensibilisation qui a permis d'obtenir le soutien et le concours de toute la direction de la DGCL pour le bon déroulement de cette opération;
- Plusieurs réunions ont eu lieu au sein du RHUDO/USAID, ou entre cet organisme et la DGCL, ou le consultant. Ce dernier a rencontré à plusieurs reprises, les principaux acteurs de l'informatique de la DGCL;

Toutes ces concertations ont eu pour but, de définir les objectifs de la formation, les tâches auxquelles une amélioration peut être apportée par l'informatique, le matériel nécessaire, et les différents types d'agents qui devraient bénéficier de la formation.

A l'issue de toutes ces rencontres, et suite à l'examen des plans informatiques présentés par toutes les sous-structures (Directions et Sous-Directions) de la DGCL, le plan de formation suivant a été retenu par le RHUDO/USAID, au bénéfice de la DGCL:

I- LES TACHES A INFORMATISER

Deux catégories de tâches sont à informatiser; les tâches standards qui portent sur les travaux de secrétariat, et les tâches spécifiques qui sont issues des plans proposés par les S/Directions.

1- Tâches standards

Il s'agit du Traitement de Texte, pour lequel toutes les Directions et S/Directions sont concernées;

- La formation qui a déjà débuté à ce niveau, porte essentiellement sur le WordPerfect (WP) dont l'achat a

été proposé par le consultant, à l'USAID, en raison de ses performances.

- Environ douze (12) secrétaires sont concernées.
- Toutes les participantes à ces séminaires doivent désormais être capables de saisir les courriers, les rapports et autres documents à l'aide du micro-ordinateur.
- Chaque participante suivra un premier séminaire d'initiation au WP, puis un deuxième séminaire de perfectionnement.

2- Tâches spécifiques

Comme cela a été envisagé lors de la journée de sensibilisation, le PSDM ne peut informatiser toutes les activités de toutes les S/Directions à la fois. Ainsi, neuf (9) principales tâches précises ont été sélectionnées dans quatre (4) Sous-Directions, à partir des plans proposés:

2.1 LISTE DES TACHES PAR SOUS-DIRECTION

2.1.1 S/D de la Politique de Développement des C.L.

- Informations et Statistiques sur les budgets approuvés (fonctionnement, investissement, grandes sections budgétaires, masse salariale, ratios,...)
- Programmes Triennaux (connaissance de toutes les opérations par nature et par service de chaque commune)

2.1.2 S/D de la Tutelle Financière

- Informations et Statistiques sur les Comptes Administratifs de chaque exercice, pour chaque commune.

2.1.3 S/D de la Tutelle Administrative

- Gestion des élus
- Gestion des délibérations des conseils municipaux
- Monographie des communes (Informations et données de base)
- Liste des textes légaux et réglementaires.

2.1.4 S/D des Ressources Humaines

- Gestion des Personnels (Identité, lieu d'affectation,...):
 - * Agents de l'Etat
 - * Agents recrutés par la commune
 - * Agents chargés de la Tutelle déconcentrée.

- Suivi des Séminaires de Formation (Thèmes, dates, lieu, organisateurs, animateurs, noms des participants)

Notons que ces informations traitées au niveau des S/Directions seront disponibles sur les appareils du Directeur Général et des Directeurs, lesquels pourront les consulter à partir d'un écran maître.

2.2 CLASSEMENT DES TACHES PAR PRIORITE

L'ensemble des tâches identifiées sont classées ci-après selon trois niveaux de priorité:

Priorité 1:

- Informations et Statistiques sur les budgets approuvés
- Informations et Statistiques sur les Comptes Administratifs de chaque exercice, pour chaque commune.
- Gestion des élus
- Gestion des délibérations des conseils municipaux
- Gestion des Personnels.

Priorité 2

- Programmes Triennaux
- Monographie des communes
- Suivi des Séminaires de Formation

Priorité 3

- Liste des textes légaux et réglementaires.

II- LES LOGICIELS ET LE PERSONNEL INDISPENSABLES

L'étude des différentes tâches a permis d'identifier les logiciels appropriés, de même que le personnel qui sera formé à leur utilisation, pour assurer l'informatisation de ces différentes applications.

SOUS-DIRECTIONS	LOGICIELS		NOMBRE DE PERSONNES
	Q & R	LOTUS/QUATRO	
1- S/D BUDGET		X	4
2- S/D TUT. FINANCIERE		X	2
3- S/D TUT. ADMINISTRAT.	X		2
4- S/D RESS. HUMAINES	X		2
5- Sces rattachés/ D.G.	X	X	2

Un quatrième logiciel sera fourni à la DGCL; il s'agit du PARADOX (gestionnaire de base de données) pour lequel le Projet ne prévoit aucun séminaire de formation.

Ainsi, la formation pour l'informatisation des tâches spécifiques concernera douze (12) agents. Huit (8) suivront le cours sur les tableurs (Lotus et Quatro), et six (6) autres celui sur le gestionnaire des bases de données. Les deux agents de la Direction Générale et des Services rattachés participeront aux séminaires sur les deux types de logiciels.

En résumé, douze (12) secrétaires seront formées au traitement de texte (WP) pour accomplir les tâches standards, tandis que douze (12) chargés d'étude suivront les séminaires sur les tableurs (Lotus et Quatro) et le gestionnaire de base de données (Q & R). Soit un total de vingt-quatre (24) agents que le Projet envisage de former.

III- LE MATERIEL NECESSAIRE

Pour atteindre les objectifs de la formation, un minimum de matériel est indispensable pour:

- assurer la réussite des séminaires;
- concrétiser toute la finalité de cette opération, à savoir, l'utilisation régulière et efficiente de l'outil informatique comme matériel de travail, pour accomplir toutes les tâches énumérées ci-dessus.

A cet effet, nous proposons la liste des matériels ainsi que leur répartition dans les différents services concernés.

SERVICE	MATERIELS INFORMATIQUES		
	Existant	A pourvoir	Total
1- Direction Générale	2	0	2
2- D.A.G.C.L.	1	0	1
3- D.D.C.L.	1	0	1
4- S/D BUDGET	0	2	2
5- S/D MARCHE	0	1	1
6- S/D PATRIMOINE	0	0	0
7- S/D TUT. ADMINIST.	0	2	2
8- S/D TUT. FINANCIERE	0	2	2
9- S/D RESSOURCES HUMAINES	1	1	2
10- Sce INSPECTION	0	1	1
11- Sce INFORMATIQUE	3	0	3
TOTAL	8	9	17

Un minimum de dix-sept (17) micro-ordinateurs permettront d'atteindre les objectifs que le PSDM s'est fixés à travers ce programme de formation. La répartition de ce matériel dans les différents services appelle quelques observations:

- Les deux machines actuellement en panne, ne sont pas comptabilisées dans la liste. Leur réparation par la DGCL ou l'USAID permettra d'augmenter le parc, et équiper les

services qui sont insuffisamment ou pas du tout servis.

- La S/Direction du Patrimoine qui partage le même espace que le service informatique, utilisera avec ce dernier, les machines qui sont dans la salle des machines.
- Enfin, rappelons à toutes fins utiles, qu'après approbation du plan par la DGCL, la liste des matériels ci-dessus doit être proposée à l'USAID qui est disposé à les acquérir, pourvu que leur utilisation se justifie.

IV- LE PROGRAMME D'ACQUISITION DES MATERIELS ET LOGICIELS

La mise en oeuvre du programme de formation est liée à la disponibilité des machines. En effet, la formation dispensée ne peut réellement être utile que si les participants disposent immédiatement de machines qui leur permettront d'être opérationnels.

1- LES LOGICIELS

- Le WP et le Lotus ont été déjà fournis par le PSDM.
- Le Q & R, le Quatro et le Paradox seront fournis par le PSDM dans la première quinzaine du mois de Septembre 92.

2- LES MATERIELS

Huit micro-ordinateurs sont en ce moment disponibles dans cinq (5) services. Neuf (9) autres doivent être livrées par le PSDM dans les prochains mois, et affectées dans les services selon l'ordre suivant:

- Première livraison: Quatre (4) machines d'ici Décembre 92 (probablement), et qui seront affectées dans les services suivants:
 - S/D BUDGET: deux (2) machines
 - S/D TUTELLE FINANCIERE: une (1) machine
 - S/D TUTELLE ADMINISTRATIVE: une (1) machine
- Deuxième livraison: Cinq (5) machines au cours de l'année 93, au plus tard en Août, lesquelles seront affectées dans les services suivants:
 - S/D TUTELLE FINANCIERE: une (1) machine
 - S/D TUTELLE ADMINISTRATIVE: une (1) machine
 - S/D RESSOURCES HUMAINES: une (1) machine
 - S/D MARCHE (ou S/D PATRIMOINE): une (1) machine
 - Service INSPECTION: une (1) machine.

V- AUTRES DISPOSITIONS

La plan-programme proposé ci-dessus ne peut connaître la réussite, que si chaque partenaire joue le rôle qui lui est assigné.

1- ROLE DE Mr David HUNSBERGER (Consultant de l'USAID)

Mr David H. devra:

- * assister Mr Charles ASSOUMOU dans l'élaboration des guides de formation du Lotus, du Quatro et du Q & R.
- * assurer la formation du formateur (Charles), et participer à la programmation des séminaires en veillant sur le contenu de chaque session de formation qui doit tenir compte des tâches à informatiser.
- * participer à la programmation de certaines tâches par service, définissant ainsi l'usage qui sera fait des logiciels.
- * estimer le temps de toutes ces interventions en accord avec Mme DEI.

2- ROLE DE Mr Charles ASSOUMOU

Mr Charles A. qui suit particulièrement ce volet du programme de formation du PSDM devra:

- * établir un calendrier indicatif pour l'exécution du programme au WP (Initiation et Perfectionnement), avec les douze (12) secrétaires.
- * rendre compte de ce plan à la DGCL
- * identifier tous les participants aux différentes sessions de formation avec les Sous-Directeurs.
- * rencontrer et motiver ces futurs séminaristes.
- * réunir tous les documents utiles, relatifs aux tâches qui seront informatisées.

3- RECOMMANDATIONS A L'ENDROIT DE LA DGCL

- * La DGCL devra apprécier, dans les meilleurs délais, le plan proposé.
- * La liste des participants aux différents séminaires doit être établie par chaque S/Directeur.

- * Il est à noter que la liste des participants doit être limitée et close, pour éviter les hésitations et les reprises. Elle devra être officielle et publiée.
- * Nous recommandons aux S/Directeurs, de choisir de préférence les volontaires. Par ailleurs, compte tenu de la spécificité de la formation qui sera dispensée, il sera souhaitable que les intéressés conservent leur poste jusqu'en Août 93 au plus tôt.
- * Enfin, pour augmenter le parc de matériels à son profit, nous suggérons à la DGCL de réparer les deux machines actuellement en panne.

ANNEX 4

Selected References

Aberg Robison, Julie, "Municipal Development Support Project: Training Component", September 10, 1992.

Deloitte & Touche, "Financial Assessment of Caisse Autonome D'Amortissement Separate Accounts Maintenance Capabilities" (draft), RHUDO/WCA IQC No. 624-0510-1-9009-00.

Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux, "Actualization des Indicateurs Urbains", February 1991.

Hunsberger, David D., "Assessment of Computerization at the Direction Generale des Collectivites Locales and the Direction du Cadastre", prepared for Rhudo/WCA, Abidjan, February 7, 1992.

Lent, Drew, "Final Workshop Report of the Training of Trainers", Management Information Systems, September 10-20, 1991.

Poulin, Roger, "An Overview and Analysis of the Côte d'Ivoire Economy" (draft), prepared for AID, June 12, 1992.

Research Triangle Institute, Quarterly Report #1 (September-December 1991), Quarterly Report #2 (January-March 1992), Quarterly report #3 (April-June 1992), and Quarterly Report #4 (July-September 1992).

Robert, Robert, "Développement Décentralisé et Initiatives de Base", PNUD/MDP, September 1992.

U.S. Agency for International Development, Municipal Development Support Project, Project Paper.

U.S. Agency for International Development, Project Grant Agreement between the Republic of Côte d'Ivoire and the United States of America for Municipal Development Support, A.I.D Project No. 681-0004, September 28, 1990.