

PN ABM-592

79707

**ASSESSMENT OF  
AFRICARE/GUINEA-BISSAU  
HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT  
PROJECTS AND THEIR RELATION TO  
THE USAID TRADE AND INVESTMENT  
PROMOTION SUPPORT PROGRAM**

Prepared for:

**THE UNITED STATES AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT  
Guinea-Bissau**

Prepared by:

**Daniel Gustafson**

**Aluisio M. da Rosa Borges**

**CREATIVE ASSOCIATES INTERNATIONAL INC.  
5301 Wisconsin Avenue, Northwest  
Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20015**

August, 1992

**Contract No. PDC-5832-I-00-0095-00  
Delivery Order No. 18**

## **PREFACE**

This assessment was undertaken for USAID/Guinea-Bissau through the Education and Human Resource Development IQC of Creative Associates International Inc. The evaluation is based on field work in Guinea-Bissau in July and August 1992. A draft of this report was submitted to USAID, whose comments are incorporated in this final version.

We are indebted to the support and guidance we received from USAID and Africare. All individuals we contacted connected with the Program were very cooperative and we are grateful for their frank discussion of the projects reviewed and the plans for the new Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program. We are particularly grateful for the assistance of Africare in providing for our trip to the Tombali region.

We, of course, take full responsibility for this report.

Daniel Gustafson  
Aluisio M. da Rosa Borges

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	i
List of Acronyms	iii
Executive Summary	iv
<b>I. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>A. Purpose of the Assessment</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>B. Current Status of Africare Human Resource Projects and the TIPS Program</b>	<b>2</b>
1. Vocational Skills Training Project	2
2. Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project	2
3. Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program (TIPS)	3
<b>C. Evaluation Methodology</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>D. Report Structure</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>II. Evaluative Findings</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>A. Participant Training</b>	<b>5</b>
1. Analysis of Participant Training Activities	5
2. Individual Course Analysis	6
<b>B. Vocational Training</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>C. Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>D. Africare/Guinea-Bissau Office</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>III. Africare and TIPS</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>IV. Summary of Conclusions</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>V. Recommendations</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Annex A: Scope of Work</b>	
<b>Annex B: List of Persons Interviewed</b>	
<b>Annex C: Summary of Africare Vocational Training Project Accomplishments</b>	

## **LIST OF ACRONYMS**

<b>CCIA</b>	<b>Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture</b>
<b>CEFAG</b>	<b>Experimental Agricultural Training Center in Empada</b>
<b>CEFC</b>	<b>Experimental Community Training Center in Bedanda</b>
<b>CNEP</b>	<b>Centro Nacional de Estudos e Planeamento</b>
<b>ESCOFOR</b>	<b>Institute for Training (Lisbon)</b>
<b>GOGB</b>	<b>Government of Guinea-Bissau</b>
<b>IATA</b>	<b>Portuguese Institute for Accelerated Training</b>
<b>INAFOR</b>	<b>National Institute for Technical and Professional Training</b>
<b>NGO</b>	<b>Non-Governmental Organizations</b>
<b>PVO</b>	<b>Private Voluntary Organizations</b>
<b>TIPS</b>	<b>Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program</b>

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Government of Guinea-Bissau, USAID/Bissau, and Africare/Guinea-Bissau are all in the process of consolidating recent new policy directions in support of private sector development in the country. This process involves the implementation of new policy reforms that will improve the environment for trade and investment growth, the initiation of a new USAID program in support of these reforms, and the transition of Africare activities to emphasize entrepreneurial development through training at various levels. Given this situation and the fact that several Africare projects have not yet been evaluated by external reviewers, USAID called for an assessment that would accomplish two inter-related objectives:

1. To assess the interim program effects, financial costs, and financial and institutional sustainability of the Africare human resource development program in the private sector of Guinea-Bissau; and
2. Based on the lessons learned, indicate how USAID can best structure and draw on Africare to contribute to the new program and country strategy.

A two-person team was fielded to Guinea-Bissau for a two-week period in July/August 1992 to evaluate the human resource activities of two Africare projects, the Vocational Skills Training Project and the Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project. In addition to this retrospective work, the team undertook a forward looking appraisal of how the experience and acquired expertise of Africare could contribute to the new USAID program.

Based on the review of extensive written material, interviews with a series of private and public sector representatives, and a three-day site visit to Tombali region to meet with local associations assisted by Africare, the team obtained an overview of the progress and problems to date and how the experience may apply to the Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program.

The assessment team concluded that Africare has performed well in carrying out the objectives of the participant training and vocational skills components, although both took a long time to get off the ground. The participant training courses gradually evolved to target the private sector, and Africare has worked during the past several years in direct contact with private enterprises without a government counterpart. The courses appear to have been well organized and relevant, the participant selection process was appropriate, and the costs of the courses were reasonable.

The vocational training project focused on the support of two government training centers and their transition to financially sustainable, market-driven operations. The work at the Experimental Community Training Center in Bedanda (CEFC) was

particularly successful in achieving a new orientation on the part of the Center's administration. The level and appropriateness of the courses also improved and is now meeting an existing demand for training of this type. The activities at the other center, Experimental Agricultural Training Center in Empada (CEFAG), were less successful, and activities ceased in March 1992.

The Tombali project also suffered a long delay in initiating activities, due to Government resistance in allowing Africare to work directly with private sector associations, without a government intermediary. Nine association trainers are now working with four village-level associations to identify new commercial activities and organize themselves to achieve the desired outcomes. Africare trainers have worked in close collaboration with these groups, providing basic business skill training and other organizational development skills. The groups appear to be positioned to take advantage of market opportunities although the expansion of economic activities has not yet occurred. The next phase of operations in which credit will be extended to some of the associations, and the number of associations expands will be critical for the success of the project. The project appears to be on track and results should be positive, although care must be taken in expanding activities so that the ongoing development of pilot associations is not jeopardized. The operationalization of the credit mechanism will be particularly important in this regard.

An important characteristic of the new Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program (TIPS) is the recognition that policy and regulatory reforms will not by themselves produce the desired trade and investment growth without simultaneous support of the private sector to take advantage of the improved environment. Within this approach, the experience and expertise of Africare/Guinea-Bissau could be very valuable. The contact and understanding of the private sector that Africare has acquired through work at the base of the economic pyramid should be tapped by the new program as an input into policy decisions and as a "reality check" for program activities. In addition, Africare experience in organizational development and institutional sustainability and in the provision of training courses for the private sector would be valuable. These potential activities in support of TIPS should be seen, however, as new areas for Africare, building on present experience rather than as the mere replication of current projects.

The team recommends that USAID continue support of this innovative private voluntary organization (PVO) role of Africare/Guinea-Bissau in support of entrepreneurial development, and that Africare expand its activities to work at a higher level where the multiplier effect of its training will be greater. The team found the vision of both Africare and USAID regarding the current priorities of development in Guinea-Bissau to be surprisingly similar, and increased collaboration in support of private sector development appears to offer potential benefits to both sides.

The team also recommends several specific actions for Africare/Guinea-Bissau such as increased contact with Brazilian non-governmental organizations (NGOs), greater inter-project collaboration in Guinea-Bissau, greater attention to dissemination of the results and importance of its projects to the country's development, and the re-examination of the possibilities of charging for the courses it organizes.

# I. INTRODUCTION

## A. PURPOSE OF THE ASSESSMENT

The process of political and economic reform in Guinea-Bissau is at a critical transition and consolidation stage. The Government has taken a series of decisions to reduce public sector control of the economy and allow greater democratic participation. In spite of impressive progress, the implementation of these reforms is far from complete and remains a daunting challenge.

The simple withdrawal of government interference in the market will not lead automatically to a flourishing private sector--a host of corollary decisions by both the public and private sectors must follow for trade and investment to expand. USAID/Guinea-Bissau is about to initiate an ambitious new Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program (TIPS) to address the issue of promoting a market-friendly environment while at the same time helping the private sector to respond to that improved environment.

Africare/Guinea-Bissau is similarly at an important consolidation point. Over the past several years it has developed projects that have emphasized entrepreneurial training in support of private sector development, working both with public institutions and directly with private sector producer associations. None of these evolving projects has so far undergone an external evaluation. An examination of progress to date and the lessons learned is very timely in order to assess how this experience can be utilized within the new USAID strategy, and the potential expansion of Africare's activities in the country.

Consequently, an external assessment was conducted in July/August 1992 with two inter-related objectives:

1. To assess the interim program effects, financial costs, and financial and institutional sustainability of the Africare human resource development program in the private sector of Guinea-Bissau; and
2. Based on the lessons learned, indicate how USAID can best structure and draw on Africare to contribute to the new program and country strategy.

Although the conclusions relating to the second objective must be based on the evaluation of Africare's work on current projects, it is important to recognize that any new activity within the TIPS framework should be more than a mere continuation of present activities. Similarly, it is important to recognize that all the players involved in the new program are in a state of transition and are consolidating recent new policy directions. TIPS represents an innovative challenge for everyone: USAID, Africare, and the Government.

**B. CURRENT STATUS OF AFRICARE HUMAN RESOURCE PROJECTS AND THE TIPS PROGRAM**

**1. Vocational Skills Training Project**

The Vocational Skills Training Project was developed by Africare for USAID "to promote sustained economic growth and enhanced social welfare for Guinea-Bissau's rural population by supporting the development of a strong and dynamic private sector, particularly in the Southern Province." A Cooperative Agreement between USAID and Africare was signed August 31, 1989 for \$2,000,000.

This project has two components. The first component consists of targeted short-term participant training. It was designed to enhance the ability of the Government to support national economic development through the training of upper and mid-level public and private sector personnel in the technical and management skills required to further private sector production and finance. This component is scheduled to run through September 30, 1992 and had an original budget of \$500,000. An additional \$184,000 was reprogrammed for participant training when the activities at CEFAG were terminated (see below), giving a grand total of \$684,000. The period of execution was also extended until September 30, 1993. Expenditures of about \$344,000 are programmed for the period May 1992 through September 1993.

The second component (\$1.5 million) was set up to work with the Government's National Institute for Technical and Professional Training (INAFOR) to train rural artisans, agricultural producers and entrepreneurs in skills relevant to the promotion of increased market activity in the villages and small towns of the Southern Province. The activities were to be conducted with the two INAFOR centers, the Experimental Community Training Center in Bedanda (CEFC) and the Experimental Agricultural Training Center in Empada (CEFAG). Africare signed an agreement with the Ministry of Education in December 1989 to execute this component, which will run through September 30, 1993. Activities at CEFAG were terminated in March 1992 and \$184,000 of unexpended funds were reprogrammed to participant training, leaving a total of \$1,316,000 for this component, of which about \$190,000 remain.

**2. Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project**

The purpose of the Tombali project is to encourage private sector growth and investment in agriculture, agro-industry and fisheries. This is to be accomplished by:

1. The promotion of producer organizations and processor associations through the provision of business and management training;

2. The provision of credit to support economic activities of the associations; and
3. The provision of technical assistance to the associations to improve production and processing techniques.

In February 1990, A.I.D./Washington approved Africare's Title II multi-year operational plan, which included a four year budget of \$1,563,852 in monetized PL-480 commodities and an enhancing grant of \$424,159. In addition, in September 1990 Africare received an A.I.D. grant of \$655,000 to finance the four-year hard currency budget and one year of Africare/Guinea-Bissau operating expenses. Of the monetized PL-480 funds, about \$573,000 had been spent by the end of June 1992, and about \$399,000 of the hard by the end of April 1992. Africare/Guinea-Bissau does not have cumulative expenditure totals of the enhancement grant, which is managed by Africare/Washington.

The project suffered considerable delays in starting up (discussed in section II A) and has evolved to work directly with the associations without a government intermediary or counterpart. Actual work with the four pilot producer associations by the newly trained project staff began in September 1991. The Tombali Project is now completing the pilot phase of its activities, plans to expand considerably over the coming year, and is scheduled for completion at the end of September 1994.

### **3. The Trade and Investment Promotion Support Program (TIPS)**

The Government's market liberalization reforms led to marked increases in economic activity in the years following their adoption. This impact, however, has largely run its course and trade and investment must be increased if sustainable growth is to be achieved. The present legal, regulatory, and judicial systems present serious disincentives to private sector investment. The creation of a secure and market-friendly environment that encourages trade and investment will only come about as policy implementation proceeds and when it is accompanied by assistance to local businesses to take advantage of the improved environment.

The themes of the new Program are increased participation in policy dialogue relating to trade and investment and an expanding economic base created by local entrepreneurs. Consequently, the four targets of the TIPS Program are: (1) newly developed and widely accepted trade and investment policies and implementation strategies, (2) formulated and widely accepted trade and investment statutes and regulations, (3) improved adjudication of legal and regulatory conflicts, and (4) improved ability of entrepreneurs to respond to the improved private sector environment. The Project Paper for this five-year program has been approved, and the corresponding Program Agreement is about to be signed.

## **C. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY**

Given the status of the Africare projects and the initiation of a major new program by USAID, the assessment activity included a retrospective evaluation of progress and problems on completed work and a forward looking appraisal of how the experience and acquired local expertise of Africare could contribute to TIPS. The terms of reference are presented in Annex A.

A team of two specialists was fielded to Guinea-Bissau for a two-week period in July/August 1992. The team met with Africare/Washington staff connected with the Guinea-Bissau projects, received relevant documentation and an overview of the projects and their progress. A team planning meeting was held at Creative Associates International before departure.

In Bissau, the team conducted a series of interviews with USAID and Africare staff, Government of Guinea-Bissau (GOGB) officials, private sector representatives, and participants in Africare training courses. The team traveled for three days to the Tombali region and visited all four producer associations located in and around Cacine, providing an opportunity to discuss the project's progress, problems, and impact. All nine of the Guinean association trainers participated in the meetings with the associations and served as translators.

The assessment team would have liked to visit CEFC in Bedanda and meet with the Center's administration, unfortunately, all were in Senegal undergoing training sponsored by the project. Other knowledgeable individuals were interviewed regarding this aspect of Africare's work. A list of contacts is provided in Annex B.

The team reviewed extensive written material and documentation made available by Africare headquarters in Washington, D.C. and the Guinea-Bissau office. In addition, a "sanitized" version of the TIPS project paper containing only the technical aspects of the program was loaned to the team by USAID/Guinea-Bissau and returned at the end of the assignment.

## **D. REPORT STRUCTURE**

The remainder of this report is organized into four chapters. Chapter II contains a summary of the findings relating to the three Africare project areas (participant training, vocational training, and the Tombali project), and to the Africare/Guinea-Bissau office, its operations, and sustainability. Chapter III focuses on the TIPS program and how Africare/Guinea-Bissau experience and acquired expertise may contribute to its successful development. Chapter IV provides a summary of the conclusions that lead from the findings presented in Chapters II and III. Chapter V concludes with recommendations.

## **II. EVALUATIVE FINDINGS**

### **A. PARTICIPANT TRAINING**

This component of the evaluation uses as a point of reference the commitment made by Africare in the Cooperative Agreement Proposal. Critical to the analysis are courses and program strategy and their impact in the development of a strong and dynamic private sector. The evaluation examined all activities undertaken by Africare since the beginning of the project including: programs and courses, instructors' qualifications, curriculum design, course outlines, selection of students, evaluations, and attrition rates. The cost of each course was also analyzed. Several courses were analyzed in depth and examples of the findings are discussed below.

The evolution of the participant training component illustrates the trend of an increasingly direct private sector linkage. Originally, the candidates for short-term targeted training were selected by an inter-ministerial committee made up of representatives of the Ministry of Education, the State Secretariat for Planning, the Ministry of International Cooperation, and non-voting USAID and Africare members. In spite of efforts to recruit someone from the private sector, none was found or willing to participate.

At the urging of USAID, the project has evolved to focus on the private sector. In FY 89, all participants were from the public sector; in FY 90, 47% of the participants came from the private sector; in FY 91 three-quarters were from the private sector; and in 1992 all were private sector participants. The inter-ministerial committee did not prove to be an appropriate selection mechanism for this new focus and was eventually dropped. It should be pointed out, however, that Africare's organizational development work with the Committee contributed to it becoming a model participant selection mechanism that USAID continues to use for ATLAS selections. The Committee has developed a good sense of setting objectives, selection criteria, interviewing techniques, and transparency. Africare has since worked on its own (in conjunction with the private sector), advertising on the radio and through brochures and distributing course outlines to key private sector groups. This approach appears to have worked well. For example, Africare received 135 inquiries for the 46 vacancies for business-related courses this year.

#### **1. Analysis of Participant Training Activities**

During the first year of the project, there was very little to show in terms of actual training. The Africare FY90 Report indicates that one participant completed training in agriculture marketing and analysis at Kansas State University and five members of the inter-ministerial committee completed a study tour of Portugal and the United States.

No effort was made by Africare/Guinea-Bissau to make contact with institutions in Brazil as indicated in the project proposal.

The major problems during the first year were the relatively few training activities and the time it took Africare to organize and execute its operations. As an institution experienced in Africa and with guidelines already prepared in the project proposal, the long lead time in starting operations appears excessive. By the second year of operations there was a significant increase in activities with the project operating at full speed and 117 people trained.

As mentioned above, the Targeted Short-Term Training component was originally scheduled to terminate in September 1992, but was extended for an additional year with funds reprogrammed from the CEFAG activities. The objective of the project was also revised to emphasize the modernization of business practices among members of private sector and trade organizations.

There was a good mix of activities during the third program year from July 1991 to June 1992. During this time, 84 students received direct training under Africare's supervision. A regional course for government employees, a computerized accounting course for the private sector, a course for women in business, a short term course in the United States, and a seminar for 25 people in Bissau were activities during this year. There was a good balance of courses and seminars provided to the private sector and government employees, and an effort was made to provide training for women.

For all courses, the selection of candidates was carried out through a transparent process. There is no indication of nepotism, dishonesty, or a loose selection process.

## **2. Individual Course Analysis**

This section was included to provide a detailed look at several sample courses, the selection of students, curriculum, attrition rates, teaching, quality of the materials used in the courses, testing, and the outcomes of the courses. Three courses were selected for analysis, representative of the stated program goals and training offered. The three courses selected were: (1) management training for four students at Clark University in Atlanta, Georgia, (2) public administration and human resources, fiscal accounting, and computer science provided under an agreement with Portuguese Institute for Accelerated Training (IATA), and (3) basic accounting provided in Bissau under a contract with Escofor (the Institute for Training) of Lisbon.

**Clark University.** The course in Management and Development of Micro-Enterprises was provided for four women at Clark University in Atlanta in July 1991. Evaluations of each course, prepared by the students, indicated a good to average outcome. The participants had negative comments about per diems and the lack of experience of the instructors with the working conditions and life in Africa. An interesting comment was

that one instructor was teaching two classes simultaneously in two rooms. Scheduled visits with the private sector never took place. In addition, there were complaints about living conditions.

Suggestions for future women in development courses were put forward by the participants, such as the need to organize seminars to reduce the distance that presently exists between intellectual women in urban areas and women in the rural areas.

***Portuguese Institute for Accelerated Training (IATA).*** The second example is the IATA course offered in Lisbon to a group of 19 students (3 women) in Public Administration and Human Resources (4 weeks), Basic and Fiscal Accounting (6 weeks), and Computer Science (5 weeks). The 19 students were selected from a pool of 450 applicants. All had more than seven years of professional experience, and varied in age from 26 to 46. The IATA evaluation dissects each course and presents an excellent description of the learning activities and results achieved by each student.

***Escofor.*** The third example is Basic Accounting offered by Escofor to a group of 16 candidates from a pool of over 100 applicants. The firms represented include: AFROPOR, HOLDING LIBIG, GUIPESCAS, SHERATON HOTEL, C.U.P., SOGUIL, Business Systems, Constructions Ltd., SENARCO, DRAFEX Lda., and UNDP. The fact that ten out of the 16 students were selected from the same five companies (two foreign owned) appears to be a narrow base. Nevertheless, it should be noted that applicants were required to have a computer available at their home company, necessarily limiting the number of potential applicants in the country. The assessment team believes that participation should have been spread more broadly with one student from each company, and that applicants from international companies and second participants from the same firm should have been charged for the cost of the course. Nevertheless, Escofor appears to have put on an excellent course.

In conclusion, although the Targeted Short-Term Training component took some time to get off the ground, the quality of the work appears to have been very good. The pool of candidates for all courses indicates that there was sufficient advertisement and demand for the courses. The selection of students was based on professional and academic qualifications. Courses were well-prepared by the instructors and appropriate for the students training and needs. The outcome of each course and the low attrition rates are the best indicators of the quality of the program.

## **B. VOCATIONAL TRAINING**

In March 1990 the Government through INAFOR adopted a new policy and strategy for rural vocational training, elaborated with Africare support. This policy was directed at reorienting both the CEFC and the CEFAG, which were poorly run, with poor programs ill-suited to the needs of the private sector or to the levels of their students. For CEFAG this called for a complete reorganization, changing from a three-year agriculture school to a unit without resident long-term instruction where the instructors would take most of the training to the population. The changes envisioned for CEFC were less drastic but entailed a new curriculum and a new organizational structure.

Over time and in part a direct result of Africare collaboration, the reorientation took on a more important characteristic of moving the centers (CEFC in particular) toward financial and institutional sustainability and away from dependence on extremely meager government funds. Although Africare's collaboration in this project involved vocational training and the organization and presentation of courses, it is important to keep in mind that the major thrust of its activities evolved to focus on the reorientation of the schools to serve the needs of the market, and not on the provision of courses per se. A list of courses and other specific activities undertaken by Africare at the center is included in Annex C.

As in the case of participant training, this component appears to have taken a long time getting off the ground. The first year was particularly difficult and the project proposal did not serve as an adequate guideline. The project was based on a rather loose rolling design that appears to have been inappropriate. The assessment team believes that it would have preferable to have utilized a more tightly structured approach to the design, such as using a standard logical framework approach, particularly given the start-up difficulties.

Both centers had an Africare expatriate staff member stationed on-site, William Ndele at CEFC who was there from May 1990 to April 1992, and Lawrence Lewis at CEFAG from May 1991 to March 1992. Although no doubt qualified in technical terms, Mr. Lewis lacked sufficient language skills to be able to work effectively. The evaluation teams believes posting Mr. Lewis at Empada diminished the project's impact at CEFAG and contributed to the eventual withdrawal of USAID-financed Africare support for that center. In addition, considerable effort appears to have been expended in conflict between Africare and CEFAG over what would be funded within the project, detracting from the effort to create a more financially sustainable, market-oriented vision for the Center. This positive outcome is much more evident at CEFC.

Africare conducted a series of training of trainer courses, worked with CEFC on curriculum development, and financed a number of vocational courses conducted by CEFC staff in bicycle mechanics, blacksmithing, and other areas. The impact of these

individual vocational courses is probably quite small. An analysis of the blacksmith courses done by Africare showed little improvement in the incomes or work processes of a group of participants versus non-participants. The methodology of the study is questionable and to a large extent the outcome depends on the producer price deflator used, making any economic conclusion suspect.

Nevertheless, the more important conclusion was that the training offered (mainly in aluminum work) was not tuned to the needs of the market, and this fed into the new strategy for CEFC's institutional sustainability. The economic impact of individual courses is of course important, particularly for CEFC, but the more appropriate question for Africare relates to its impact on the institutional improvement of CEFC to be able to deliver demand-driven services.

This impact at CEFC appears to be significant and a success story that came up repeatedly in interviews with GOGB representatives. The Center went from an extremely precarious financial situation in which it depended entirely on GOGB funding to one of near self-sufficiency. In 1990, the Center undertook no contracts for training services. This year, CEFC will receive 70 million pesos from such contracts, about 80% of its total operating expenditures. The clients have been largely other donor projects (including the Tombali project, for example) and the market for this service is expanding. A market analysis of training services conducted by Africare also supported the CEFC strategy and decision to commercialize its activities.

The change from dependency on the GOGB and despondency of the staff (because of poor salaries and future prospects to a new perspective of market-driven service provision) appears to be widely recognized by relevant officials. The role that Africare played in bringing this change about, and the applicability to other government operations of this model of financial sustainability, also appear to be well-recognized.

In March 1992, Africare suggested to CEFC that the long-term resident advisor in Bedanda be transferred to Bissau and that it was time for CEFC administrators to take full responsibility for the strategy. Periodic visits and other Africare support continues, but the change in the relationship between Africare and CEFC appears to have been a wise move and consistent with the institutional sustainability plan.

Although this project has been conducted with a public sector institution, the organizational development process designed and carried out by Africare is transferable to new private sector business support agencies and could be very valuable to them. The process approach used to reorient managers to more strategically focused, client responsive operations as the means to produce valued outputs and ensure institutional sustainability appears to be well understood by Africare/Guinea-Bissau and was used effectively with CEFC.

### **C. TOMBALI SUSTAINABLE RURAL INITIATIVES PROJECT**

The project that best typifies Africare's emphasis on entrepreneurial training as the key to socio-economic development is the Tombali Project. Other important elements are the grass-roots operational level, the focus on local associations, and the reliance on Guinean staff. If Africare/Guinea-Bissau had to select one project area in which to concentrate and expand this would be it.

The evolution of this project also follows the trend mentioned above, of Africare increasingly working in direct contact with the private sector without a government counterpart. This modality was resisted by the government (the project was originally planned to work with the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development) and held up the start of the project for a year. The successful outcome of this experience, however, and the precedent that it sets for other NGOs in the country is important.

The project was required to provide infrastructure in Cacine for residences and office and training space, which took another ten months. After a lengthy selection process in which 300 candidates were screened in Bissau and the finalists in Tombali, nine association trainers were hired in July 1991, to work with four associations.

The methodology of the project is similar to that used with CEFC but at a lower level. It follows a process approach, working with the association members to identify promising market activities, examining the resources they currently have, identifying what will be needed for successful market entry, and providing training in decision making, basic business skills, and literacy as well as technical expertise. The objective is to develop the association and the members' business skills in order to create a sustainable and autonomous local venture that breaks out of dependence on government or donor projects for survival. The most important new skill that the project hopes to develop is the ability to think in a new way that allows the members to plan private sector activities and take advantage of new opportunities.

Of 67 existing associations in the three sectors of Tombali Region where the project operates, four were selected for the pilot phase. These include fruit growers (88 members), a trader and transport association (18 members), fishermen (16 members), and women soap makers (28 members). The associations did not begin with Africare assistance, but were either moribund due to the collapse of a government program (fruit growers and soap makers) or were in a very early stage of development. During the visit, all of the associations expressed universal praise for Africare's work with them and the important training and support that they had received in getting their groups going and in becoming oriented for commercial expansion.

The real economic expansion of all of these associations is still to come--the groundwork has been laid, but the new activities that should generate considerable increases in income have not yet been initiated. That is, the Cassumba association is not

an association of "commercial fishermen," but a group of subsistence producers who are in the process of expanding to a commercial level; the soap makers are in the process of setting up their business; and the fruit growers and trader/transporters are in the process of expanding commercial-scale activities. For most of the associations, the next critical step will be the provision of credit to allow for the new ventures.

The project is at a decisive stage for two reasons: (1) it is poised for the replication of successful experience with new groups, and (2) it is about to operationalize credit for the associations which are undergoing training to handle it. The idea is to have the Quitafine trader and transport association administer the credit to those associations that decide to take it (the most obvious candidate being the fishermen). Africare is in the process of working out the arrangements for this and providing appropriate training. Without credit, the expansion of the commercial activities of at least the fishermen and traders will not take place, although credit will not be as important for the soap makers and fruit growers. The critical nature of this stage of the associations' development and the care with which Africare must proceed with the credit scheme cannot be overemphasized.

Two association trainers have been working with each group during this pilot phase. In September 1992, each trainer is scheduled to take on an additional group, expanding the number of associations to 18, and over the next year the number of trainers is planned to increase to 16, working eventually with a total of about 32 associations. The trainers live in the village of the association, speak the local language, and appear to be competent and well-integrated into the groups. It is anticipated that the total period of direct Africare support will be 18 to 24 months before gradually pulling out and moving on to new groups. All of the associations praised the trainers and a high level of enthusiasm and understanding of the process was demonstrated on both sides. Very clearly, the trainers are people who like their work and they are working with associations with considerable dynamism.

The first activity of the association and the trainer is to conduct a physical, social, and economic study of the village. The trainers received Africare training in conducting village-based research of this type. Next, the trainer presents the results of the study and the group decides on the type of activity to pursue. The project then facilitates visits by the association to functioning enterprises like the ones desired, as well as contact with other entities related to the expanded economic activity (e.g., a visit to the port to discuss the potential for export, etc.). After further analysis of the risks and work involved with the activity, the group decides whether or not to continue. So far no group has fallen out, nor have any trainers left.

Specific training courses have been delivered on basic accounting as well as technical courses on fruit growing, outboard motor maintenance, and soap making. But the work of the trainer with the association is full-time and the experiential learning process is more or less continuous. A survey of the conditions of the groups that was

part of the village-level research will permit later comparison to determine the economic impact of the new activities.

The initial stages of organizing, training, and facilitating the groups to look for new ways to produce, process and market their products are well advanced. This work has created a psychological drive to grow and develop. Although this stage is essential, without capital, technology, and management it will stall. The consequences of early failure for expansion of this work would be very negative. For this reason it is important that the entire process be carried through with these first four pilot associations, including credit and support through the marketing of their increased production. The assessment team believes that expansion to new groups is certainly necessary but not at the expense of continued close attention to these pilot areas. Success or failure of the pilot groups will largely determine the acceptance of similar future activities in the region.

The expatriate Africare project coordinator (David Benafel) and the Guinean association trainer coordinator (Celestino Sa) live in Cacine. The roles of each and the responsibility given at all levels of the project appear to be well thought through and build the desired local autonomy and self-reliance. Given the experience of Africare in removing the expatriate presence from CEFC at an appropriate time, the team assumes that Africare will do likewise in the Tombali case.

The assessment team was particularly impressed in Cacine with the excellent relations and integration of the local staff with the associations and their communities. Clearly the ability of Africare to contribute to community development is very high.

Africare support of community associations has created conditions for economic growth and development. If the process continues successfully, this economic growth and development will lead to political development and the protection of economic interests. A key issue down the road will be to identify the appropriate time for Africare to remove all support and leave the associations entirely on their own.

Based on the discussions with Africare staff in Bissau and in Tombali and with association members, the assessment team believes that Africare has demonstrated the ability to work directly with the private sector at the local level to develop appropriate expanded economic activities. Although it is too early to quantify the economic impact of this project for participants, the chances look very good that the groups will increase their incomes significantly. In addition, the project appears to be preparing the associations and their members with skills that will allow them to continue to develop new ventures or expand existing ones in the future.

#### **D. AFRICARE/GUINEA-BISSAU OFFICE**

As indicated above, Africare activities in Guinea-Bissau have evolved over the past several years to work directly with the private sector. This has been stimulated in part by USAID emphasis on private sector development and by Africare experience in doing business in the country. The Title II PL-480 activities are new for Africare and have allowed first-hand experience in conducting business in Guinea-Bissau. Curtiss Reed, the country representative, has private sector experience and a training background. In addition, Africare/Guinea-Bissau has conducted several feasibility studies looking into possible joint ventures in Guinea-Bissau in order to augment their financial resources. They have also undertaken surveys of the market for training services and of individuals and institutions in the private sector. The office has contractual relationships with some of these to conduct targeted short-term training, leading to personal contact with local entrepreneurs. In short, the office is an active, if somewhat unique, player in the business community.

Similarly, the experience of working with CEFC and CEFAG on financial and institutional sustainability has no doubt heightened Africare/Guinea-Bissau awareness of the need to provide services sufficiently valued by its clients or stakeholders so that they continue to provide resources. All of the Guineans interviewed in both the private and public sectors: (1) seemed knowledgeable about Africare activities, (2) had a high regard for Africare's work, and (3) were satisfied with the products delivered.

Nevertheless, the assessment team believes that Africare/Guinea-Bissau could have done more, following its advice on institutional sustainability to CEFC, to keep USAID sufficiently aware of the importance and impact of their activities and how they fit into current USAID priorities. This is especially important considering the evolution of the USAID strategy since the beginning of the Africare grant. The perspective of Africare/Guinea-Bissau and USAID on the current development needs of the country are surprisingly similar, emphasizing the broadening and deepening of private sector participation. Although Africare has fulfilled its project reporting requirements, the broader picture of how Africare efforts contribute to this process has not received enough emphasis in Africare reports, and is not fully appreciated by the Mission. The assessment team likewise did not have a very clear understanding of the nature of the vocational training or Tombali projects from the written reports read prior to arrival in Bissau.

One indicator of this problem is the list of questions included in the assessment terms of reference (Annex A), which apply mainly to participant training and are not particularly relevant to the CEFC/CEFAG and Tombali projects. The different objectives and strategies of these projects and their relation to the long-term development of the country are much more interesting than the project documents and reports would indicate.

Africare/Guinea Bissau is a relatively decentralized operation run by qualified personnel with considerable autonomy from Africare headquarters in Washington. The Africare/Guinea-Bissau Office employs 39 people including a resident representative and three project coordinators for vocational training, the Tombali project, and the AIDS program (managed by a Peace Corps volunteer seconded to Africare). An administrator is responsible for the management of the daily operations of the office, supported by an administrative assistant. The Tombali and Vocational Training projects also have administrative assistants. In addition, the Tombali project includes a training coordinator and nine association trainers. The rest of the staff is made up of guards and other support positions.

The resumes of all technical positions were reviewed by the assessment team who found that all are well qualified, speak Portuguese, and have considerable experience with development projects in Africa. As would be expected, there is also a sense of strong personal and professional commitment to Africa's development. Technical personnel are hired by Africare Washington without input from the resident representative. This is a counterproductive policy, although the team found people hired by Africare Washington to be well qualified for their positions, with the exception of the language capability of Mr. Lewis mentioned above.

Curtiss Reed, Resident Representative/Country Director, holds a degree in Sociology from Washington University in St. Louis (1976), and certification in French from the Universite d'Aix-Marseille. He is fluent in Portuguese and French and has some abilities in three other languages. His professional background has been mainly in Africa. Except for a three year stop at The Experiment in International Living in Vermont, he worked in Tunisia, Niger, and since 1989 in Guinea-Bissau.

William Noble, Project Coordinator/Rural Training Specialist, holds a B.A. in International Affairs and Spanish from Lewis & Clark College (1980) and a M.S. in International Agricultural Development from the University of California at Davis (1985). He is fluent in Portuguese and Spanish and has some ability in Guarani and Crioulo. He has worked in Paraguay as a Peace Corp Volunteer and in Guatemala. In the United States he worked mainly with vocational training. Although this is his first experience in Africa, his fluency in Portuguese and his background in vocational education makes him well qualified for the position he now occupies.

David E. Benafel, Project Coordinator/Tombali Project, holds a B.S. in Political Science from Willamette University (1977). He is fluent in French and Bambara. He has considerable experience in Africa (Mali), where he was a Peace Corps volunteer, a project manager for CARE, and a Cooperative/Credit Manager for Africare.

The work flow and responsibilities appear well divided and the lines of authority clearly defined. There is very limited redundancy in administrative and management tasks, but the decentralization and specialization contribute to a lack of cross-expertise

among projects and limit a shared sense of the overall picture of Africare/Guinea-Bissau. There are examples, however, of collaboration between projects, particularly between vocational training and Tombali.

The assessment team recommends that Africare/Guinea-Bissau increase the interaction among projects and the sharing of information to promote greater awareness and participation of the entire office in all projects. This is important to allow for easier coverage of responsibilities during absences. It will also be increasingly important as Africare expands operations in support of the private sector at different levels, benefitting from the combined experience and perspectives. Within any possible collaboration on the TIPS program, this process will be very beneficial.

Africare/Guinea-Bissau has put together an interesting mix of expatriate and local expertise and in most cases appears to have utilized this to good advantage. The expatriate support of CEFC management has worked well, as have the Guinean association trainers working at the village level in Tombali. The register of candidates for these positions and the surveys of local training talent and institutional capacity are very valuable assets for future activities.

The FY 1993 Africare/Guinea-Bissau budget (July/June) is about \$1.35 million, of which 19% goes for administration and 81% to project activities. This mixture looks good, although it could change easily in the future depending on the amount of project funding (assuming the fixed administrative costs remain relatively constant). The fixed costs appear to be reasonable for the presence that Africare maintains in Guinea-Bissau. The projects evaluated account for about 84% of the project activities budget.

The finances and accounting are reasonably organized, designed to be handled by non-specialists with a minimum of training. The computerized system makes the presentation and manipulation of financial data very transparent and appears to be simple and efficient. The interaction between accounting done in Bissau and at Africare headquarters appears to be adequate. Monitoring and reporting of externally funded projects follow the individual project year cycles rather than Africare's fiscal year, making the information easily presentable to the financing agency. The monthly breakdown allows for reorganization of the data for Africare's fiscal year.

The sustainability of Africare/Guinea-Bissau operations looks quite good. Although the vast majority of the projects' operations are externally funded, there are several funding sources, principally USAID and A.I.D./Washington, with staggered project completion dates. The office is acutely aware of the market niche that Africare occupies and the potential demand for training and other services it offers. Africare has conducted several feasibility studies regarding possible joint ventures to augment its core

**budget and expects to initiate operations along these lines within the next year or two. In addition, the office understands the need to build the sustainability of its local counterparts to prepare them to survive beyond project funding, with considerable success in CEFC and potential success with the associations.**

### **III. AFRICARE AND TIPS**

Clearly, the level or focus of much of the TIPS program is quite different from that of Africare's work in Guinea-Bissau. Implementation of policy change in judicial, legal, and regulatory reform in support of the private sector is simply not what Africare does. Similarly, the underlying assumption of the TIPS program is that a (or perhaps the) key factor holding back private sector trade and investment is a solid institutional framework that defines and guarantees the "rules of the game." The underlying assumption of Africare's work in entrepreneurial development in Guinea-Bissau is that the key constraints are training and credit. The two views are by no means mutually exclusive and reflect more a difference in emphasis and clientele than a basic reading of the country situation. Although the overall objectives are similar (e.g., enhanced broad-based economic participation), the implementation approaches arising from these views lead in different directions and target different groups.

On the other hand, a prominent conceptual feature of TIPS is the recognition that attention must also be given to enhancing private sector participation and the ability to take advantage of the improved institutional environment. A transition from a command economy to a market one cannot be accomplished without significant participation of the private sector in economic activity. Reforms in the legal, regulatory, and judicial system are not in themselves sufficient to ensure growth of an essentially new private sector. Both sides of the equation must be worked on simultaneously. To be successful the program must foster participatory attitudes and expectations, improve the business and managerial skills of participants, and strengthen entrepreneurial activities. This last aspect relates directly to Africare experience in Guinea-Bissau.

Both TIPS and Africare target the lack of skilled manpower and poor educational and training opportunities at all levels. Training is necessary to improve technical and managerial skills as well as in "building the capacity of the private sector both to: (a) advocate change and participate in rule-making, and (b) identify and take advantage of trade and investment opportunities through greater access to information, training, and technical assistance," as the TIPS project paper puts it.

In analyzing the program concept and design, an important role for a PVO does not automatically spring to mind. Nevertheless, the experience and acquired expertise of Africare/Guinea-Bissau is surprisingly (to the assessment team at least) aligned with the vision of the TIPS project. Africare/Guinea-Bissau experience is not precisely with the groups, at the levels, or of the scale that will be required in TIPS, but its approach and lessons learned are timely and relevant to what TIPS hopes to achieve.

As pointed out above, almost all entrepreneurial activity in the country is relatively new. World Bank surveys indicate that the vast majority of the formal private

enterprises were established in the past two to three years. Many of the enterprises and activities that will emerge in the private sector as the result of the improved private sector environment will be similar to the emerging activities fostered by the Tombali project. The contacts and lessons arising out of all three Africare projects could be very valuable for the success of TIPS. At a minimum, systematic interchange between Africare and TIPS on the perspective, progress, and problems of the private sector will be necessary--regardless of any formal role for Africare within the program.

The interaction between the Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (CCIA) and Africare represents a good example of this kind of information exchange. Several illustrations came up during the interviews in which Africare projects had a more accurate appreciation of the local dynamics of CCIA membership than did the Chamber leadership in Bissau. For example, although the leadership was very keen on enlisting regional participants in an upcoming Africare course on business planning for small businesses, Chamber members in the region were not interested, perhaps because of limited literacy skills. Similarly, the Quitafine Trade and Commerce Association (Tombali Project) had tried to become affiliated with the regional Chamber but were turned away. They will attempt to join as a block in the future once they are better established.

The relations between Africare and the Chamber are very good as is the collaboration in Bissau on several projects in support of Chamber activities. The point, however, is that Africare's locally based knowledge of the private sector, the profile of the actors, and the problems they face will continue to be an important source of information and a "reality check" for the new program, regardless of any more formal role in program activities.

Similarly, Africare is experienced as a player in the business community of the country--as a direct participant through its PL-480 sales and possible joint ventures with the private sector, and indirectly through its role in supplying credit to the Tombali associations--could be an important source of information for the TIPS program. Africare appears to be the best positioned U.S. organization in Guinea-Bissau to articulate this ongoing experience to those directly involved with TIPS. In addition, Africare is aware of the experience of USAID and the GOGB over the past several years in implementing policy change, and appreciates the progress and problems of this experience. This perspective will be very important as new contractors are brought in to work on the program.

On the other hand, the level and scale of Africare action and interest is relatively narrow and focused on the base of the economic pyramid. (This is most true of the Tombali Project, with participant training activities aimed at a higher level, and vocational training aimed at institutional development of public sector support for the private sector.) The intention of the TIPS program is to have national impact and to reach a large number of people. This will entail considerably different actions than

could be accomplished by the mere replication of Tombali project activities throughout the country--even if this could be accomplished easily, which it cannot.

TIPS entrepreneurial development activities must have a high multiplier effect. Consequently, although the Tombali experience is aligned with the overall objectives of the new program and should inform program development, the most relevant Africare experience to the kinds of activities called for in TIPS comes from private sector participant training and its organizational development work with INAFOR centers.

An important aspect of the TIPS program is its emphasis on trade associations and other non-governmental organizations. It recognizes the need for bottom-up input to guide the policy, legal, and judicial reform processes and make such processes sustainable. Africare plans to work with the CCIA to prepare manuals for its members on different management topics, which will be included in future Africare and Chamber training courses. As mentioned above, the collaboration between the two has been productive for both sides and the Chamber's Secretary General gave a solid endorsement of Africare work in the country.

It is important to remember that these associations and business groups are all new and are not fully operational. In order to provide the services required by their members, the associations themselves must be strengthened and undergo their own process of organizational development. The experience of Africare/Guinea-Bissau with local associations, the contact with the Chamber of Commerce, and the process approach utilized to strengthen the strategic perspective of CEFC could be valuable in this process.

Given the needs of TIPS and Africare experience, activities that could be developed by Africare within target area 4 of the TIPS program include:

1. Identification of training needs either individually or to associations at the technical level (production, processing, marketing) and at the management level.
2. Development of training materials and programs around the identified needs, and delivery of courses directly or through contract with local training firms.
3. Organizational development of professional and trade associations, including training in how to become a voice for their constituents, how to identify and respond to their needs, how to articulate their mission and take advantage of opportunities, and how to develop a sustainability strategy.
4. Arranging of contact between local associations and national level bodies by setting up fora in which association members can express their problems and perspective to decision makers at the policy level.

As stated previously, at a minimum Africare and TIPS should have some type of interaction to facilitate exchange of information and perspectives on private sector development in the country. The assessment team further believes that the emerging role of Africare as a PVO working with entrepreneurial development should be encouraged. The team believes that a more systematic collaboration and exchange of ideas and experience between TIPS and Africare is called for, such as would be provided through a direct Africare role in the new program.

How to operationalize this more direct role is best left for negotiation between Africare and USAID. The assessment team, however, calls attention to the fact that Africare/Guinea-Bissau has its own institutional identity in Guinea-Bissau and its own cooperative agreement with the GOGB. The potential activities indicated above could be undertaken by Africare/Guinea-Bissau as a sub-contractor within TIPS. While this modality could work well and should be explored, it is important that both sides examine the implications regarding the GOGB/Africare relationship, particularly in light of the recent and perhaps tenuous acceptance of Africare/Guinea-Bissau working directly with the private sector without a government counterpart.

The evaluation team believes that a (sub)contractor role for Africare could promote this systematic collaboration and should be examined as an alternative, but that any contractual relationship should target very specific and easily identified activities within TIPS to avoid any confusion in the GOGB regarding Africare's operations.

#### **IV. SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS**

1. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau has done good work in the projects it has undertaken. Some parts have gone better than others, but on the whole they have been carried out well and have delivered what was intended.**
2. **The participant training activities took too long to begin full operations but have provided high quality training relevant to the needs of the participants. The switch in emphasis to the private sector was appropriate in this regard.**
3. **The vocational training activities that targeted institutional and financial sustainability of INAFOR centers were particularly successful at CEFC. The Africare/Guinea-Bissau approach in organizational development of market-oriented public institutions and producer associations appears applicable to other public and private agencies.**
4. **The Tombali project also took a long time to get going but seems to be going very well now. It is highly likely that the incomes of the association members will increase substantially.**
5. **It is too early to identify increases in participants' income but the baseline information collected by the project should permit this evaluation in the future.**
6. **The next phase of the Tombali project (credit) will be critical in determining the overall success of the project.**
7. **The Africare/Guinea-Bissau Office appears well run, with a reasonable cost structure, adequate financial controls, and well qualified staff.**
8. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau has a good image with its public (in both the private and public sectors) and is recognized for its work in entrepreneurial training.**
9. **The focus of Africare/Guinea-Bissau projects has evolved to emphasize direct contact with the private sector; this is a positive development that deserves continued support.**
10. **Africare can work effectively without a government counterpart.**
11. **Africare has good penetration in the country and access to private and public sector officials; Africare staff seem well integrated into the communities in which they operate and can mobilize teams and promote interesting interaction of participants with other sectors and projects.**

12. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau has given insufficient attention to making certain that USAID--one of its key stakeholders--understands its role in entrepreneurial development and the accomplishments of its projects in this regard. Although communication with USAID followed established reporting requirements, it should have placed greater emphasis on transmitting the importance of project results to the new USAID strategy.**
13. **The direction that Africare is going deserves support from USAID. It is an interesting role for a PVO working with the expansion of the private sector (what it takes to become an entrepreneur and move away from dependency on government), and at the same time, Africare has important expertise and experience to offer TIPS.**
14. **TIPS is innovative for recognizing the need to work simultaneously on reforming the institutional environment and promoting private sector participation to take advantage of the changes. Given the state of development of the Guinean entrepreneurial class, i.e., emerging and small, and the process/sustainability orientation of Africare, collaboration looks like it would benefit both sides.**
15. **Although the focus and level of much of the TIPS program lie outside the interest and experience of Africare, the overall orientation of Africare/Guinea-Bissau and the new TIPS program are surprisingly aligned. The exchange of ideas and experiences between the two would be of mutual benefit.**
16. **Any more substantial role of Africare in the new program should be seen as building new expertise on previous experience, rather than the replication or substitution of existing activities.**
17. **Possible areas of collaboration include identification of training needs, design and delivery of training courses for the private sector, organizational development of private sector support institutions, and the promotion of systematic contact between private sector participants and policy makers.**

## V. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. USAID should continue to support Africare/Guinea-Bissau in expanding its work with entrepreneurial development. This is a relatively new and innovative PVO role that appears to offer considerable promise within the USAID country strategy.
2. Although Africare/Guinea-Bissau could productively concentrate only on its work with grass roots private sector association development (e.g., the Tombali Project), it is recommended that it expand to work simultaneously at a higher level where the multiplier effect of its actions could be greater. This will require a long-term commitment from Africare to support development of this area.
3. Africare/Guinea-Bissau should continue to work primarily, if not exclusively, in direct relationship with private sector entities.
4. At a minimum, Africare/Guinea-Bissau and USAID should increase contact and exchange of ideas in support of the TIPS program so that the local level private sector development experience can be adequately incorporated in program activities.
5. USAID and Africare/Guinea-Bissau should consider a more direct role in TIPS in order to systematically structure this interaction and take advantage of Africare's experience and private sector network. Although the work with Tombali associations is consistent with the TIPS objectives, Africare's role in the program should build most on its participant training and organizational development experience.
6. Both sides should consider a contractual arrangement for the provision of services within TIPS. However, in order to avoid deterioration of the clear identity and good relationship that Africare has with the GOGB, if this modality is adopted it should focus on very specific and easily identified activities.
7. Africare/Guinea-Bissau should exercise considerable care in expanding activities to new associations in the Tombali region so that the development of the pilot associations does not suffer. It is particularly important that the credit scheme be properly initiated in this regard.
8. Africare/Guinea-Bissau should initiate contact with Brazilian NGOs. A good place to start may be the Grupo Esquel Foundation, an organization with offices in Washington and Brasilia and with similar interests to Africare/Guinea-Bissau. The assessment team can arrange a Washington meeting if so desired.

9. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau should give greater attention to disseminating the results and impact of its work in the country, particularly to USAID, in addition to the formal reporting requirements within each project.**
10. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau should develop greater interaction among its projects and project staff in order to build in greater redundancy in administrative and management links and to take advantage of the inter-relations between the levels at which it operates in Guinea-Bissau.**
11. **Africare/Guinea-Bissau should have greater input in the selection of candidates for long-term technical cooperation posts in the country.**
12. **The assessment team believes that conditions may have changed since Africare's market survey and it should re-examine the possibilities of charging for its courses, at least on an experimental basis.**

**ANNEX A**  
**SCOPE OF WORK**

## SCOPE OF WORK

### A. INTRODUCTION: Background to the Training Activity

During the colonial and post-independence periods, Guinea-Bissau existed with minimal institutional and human resource development. A low level of human resources continues to be one of the basic constraints to development. This constraint is especially felt in the private sector, given that the economy was, until recently, based on a socialist, centrally planned model. In order to reverse the situation, the Government began in 1984 to address a series of policy reforms aimed at opening the economy, thereby freeing the private sector to go its own way. While the private sector has begun to respond, further development will continue to be constrained by Guinea-Bissau's low-level human resources base.

To address the human resources constraints, USAID undertook to promote development of a strong private sector, with emphasis on trade and investment in critical growth sub-sectors through a program of policy, legislative, and regulatory reform. USAID and AFRICARE together have undertaken a training strategy to provide training in areas that support the development of an active private sector, as well as governmental efforts in economic reform.

Specifically, AFRICARE designed two training activities to address the situation: Vocational Skills Training Project (657-0014) and the Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project (657-0020).

The overall goal of the Vocational Skills Training Project is to promote sustained economic growth and enhanced social welfare by supporting the development of a strong and dynamic private sector. The project consists of two related sub-projects:

1. Targeted short-term training that supports national economic development through the training of government civil service and private sector upper and mid-level personnel in the technical and management skills required to further private sector production and finance; and
2. Rural vocational skills training that focusses on building the capacity of government training institutions to support the economic development of rural areas through the implementation of practical training programs in the fields of agriculture, artisanal activity, and small business management suited for those with little or no formal education.

The overall goal of the Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives Project is to encourage private sector investment and growth, and to foster greater economic growth, especially in agriculture, agro-industry, and fisheries. This will be achieved by promoting the organization of producer and processor associations through training, credit and technical assistance.

## **B. PROJECT ACTIVITY DEVELOPMENT**

AFRICARE has focussed most of its efforts on the rural southern area because of its agricultural potential and because many other donors were present in the north of the country. Africare has since modified its geographic orientation to become more national in scope. It has also withdrawn from one government center at the request of USAID/Bissau because Government allocated minimal inputs for the center's functioning. The lack of organization, resources, and management on the part of the Government did not permit the AFRICARE intervention to be cost effective. Given the diminishing capacity of government to operate institutions, AFRICARE has been more and more operating independently of any governmental structure and dealing directly with local private sector groups/individuals.

Most of AFRICARE's support for activities in Guinea-Bissau comes from USAID either from its two Grants or via the sale of PL-480 commodities in a monetized program to cover local currency administrative costs.

The USAID program environment in which Africare operates has changed this past year with the approval of a new Program Logframe and the new Trade and Investment Promotion Support Project (657-0021). Africare has responded to these developments by beginning to work more closely with the USAID-assisted project in support of the Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture. One purpose of the present evaluation is to build on Africare's experiences to date to suggest ways this important U.S. resource can contribute to USAID's new program in Guinea-Bissau.

## **C. OBJECTIVES OF THE ASSESSMENT**

The contractor shall prepare an evaluation report that:

1. Assesses the interim program effects, financial costs, financial sustainability, and organizational sustainability of the Africare program of implementing a human resource development program in the private sector of Guinea-Bissau.
2. Based on lessons learned to date, indicates how USAID can best structure and draw on Africare to contribute to implementing USAID's overall program, especially component four (direct assistance to the private sector) under the Trade and Investment Promotion Support Project.

#### D. KEY QUESTIONS TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE EVALUATION

The contractor will review the on-going training programs that AFRICARE is implementing at the moment with USAID funds to answer the following questions, as well as others that may arise in the course of this evaluation:

1. To what degree is the Project achieving its purposes and producing its outputs? What are the reasons for more or less progress?
2. How many beneficiaries have there been to date; what benefits have they received; and how many beneficiaries and benefits can be realistically expected over the remaining life of the project?
3. To what degree have newly acquired skills from Africare courses increased incomes for participants?
4. To what degree are participants able and willing to pay for training (any amount that would reduce costs)?
5. To what degree is this training program sustainable in the intermediate and longer-term future?
6. To what degree has Africare been able to work directly with local beneficiaries without local counterparts?
7. What is the a cost-benefit ratio for this program, and how does this ratio compare with ratios realized elsewhere in Africa?
8. How adequate are staff resources relative to program and staff needs? (Include an analysis of direct and indirect costs relative to the number of trainees, and the allocation of staff time to activities outside these two USAID-supported projects.)
9. To what degree were planned accomplishments realized in an appropriate time frame?
10. What has been the technical foreign input (manpower and materials), and is the current level justified (less expensive local sources available)?
11. What would be the result if there were no such training program; other donors' programs; private sector filling the gap?
12. How adequate has USAID management, program, and financial oversight been of these programs, and what changes might be appropriate?
13. To what extent are participating training institutions acquiring skills to increase their institutional viability?

14. To what degree are participating training institutions attracting clients for their services?
15. To what degree are participating training institutions able to cover their operating costs?
16. Based on answers to the above questions, what role would Africare be best able to play in USAID's new program? How should Africare's contribution be structured to perform such a role?

**E. THE CONTRACTOR WILL ACCOMPLISH THE ABOVE BY REVIEWING:**

1. The logframes for Tombali Sustainable Rural Initiatives and Vocational Education Training Projects, annual progress reports, multi-year operation plans, base line data collected at the beginning for the projects, and Project Papers (all available through Africare's office in Washington, D.C.). Other documents (available from AID/AFR/SWA) include the Project Paper for the new Trade and Investment Promotion Support Project, and USAID's recently approved new program logframe.
2. The mid-term process evaluation done on the Vocational Education Training Project, specifically the rural training activity.
3. Interviews with Africare staff in Washington, D.C. and in Guinea-Bissau.
4. Interviewing a sample of trainees, local training institutions, and local private sector organizations (Chamber of Commerce, trade organizations, etc.)
5. Making a financial review (not an audit) of the budget and accounting records at AFRICARE.

**F. REPORTS BY CONTRACTOR**

1. The contractor shall prepare a written report of the assessment conducted. The report shall describe in detail the consultant's observations, conclusions and recommendations and include, where applicable, appropriate charts of comparative costs, etc. The report shall be presented orally and discussed with USAID/BISSAU. Africare/Bissau is also to be provided a debriefing by the evaluation team. The contractor shall submit its report in draft to USAID/Bissau prior to the team's departure from Bissau.
2. The contractor shall incorporate USAID's comments on this draft report and deliver fifteen (copies) of the final report with a summary within two weeks of notification of acceptance of the draft report by USAID/Bissau. All reports shall be in English.

**G. PERFORMANCE PERIOD**

The desired timing to accomplish the above work is a two week period in August.

Duty posts and duration:

Bissau 8 days; interior 2 days.

**H. LANGUAGE**

Portuguese, S-3/R-3

**I. PROVISIONS FOR LOGISTIC SUPPORT**

Office Space and transportation in the cooperating country will be provided by AID. All other required support will be the responsibility of the supplier.

**ANNEX B**  
**LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED**

## **LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED**

Jose Humberto Alvarenga	Director General of Cooperation, Ministry of International Cooperation
Clara Joaquim Andre	Tombali Association Trainer (Cacine Traders)
Mamadu Badji	Chamber of Commerce Support Project Coordinator, Labat-Anderson Guinea Bissau
Dennis Baker	Human Resources Development Officer, USAID/Bissau
Francisco Balde	Tombali Association Trainer (Darhuda Soap Makers)
Issufu Bangura	Tombali Association Trainer (Cacine Traders)
David Benafel	Tombali Project Coordinator
Malam Biai	Tombali Association Trainer (Cassumba Fishermen)
Esteves Caetano	Tombali Association Trainer (Cameconde Fruit Growers)
Elizabeth Crittenden	Administrator, Africare/Guinea-Bissau
Flavio Fernandes	Vice President, Young Entrepreneurs Association
Fernando Ferrage	Executive Secretary, Guinea-Bissau Chamber of Commerce
Alfredo Hanem	Director, Solidami
Luciano Inbulna	Tombali Association Trainer (Cameconde Fruit Growers)
Joseph Kennedy	Director of Economic Development Africare/Washington
Michael Lukomski	USAID/Bissau Representative
William P. Noble	Coordinator, Africare Vocational Skills Training Project
Katharina Puffenberger	Former Food Resource Officer, Africare/Washington
Curtiss Reed Jr.	Africare/Guinea-Bissau Resident Representative
Antonio Jaime Sa	Tombali Association Trainer (Cassumba Fishermen)
Celestino Fernando Sa	Africare Training Coordinator, Tomabli Project

Mamadou Lamine Sano Tombali Association Trainer (Cameconde Fruit Growers)

Alexandre da Silva Director of Operational Services, INAFOR

Mark Smith Assistant Program Officer for Guinea and Guinea-Bissau,  
Africare/Washington

Robert Wilson Regional Director for West Africa, Africare/Washington

Barry Yasim Tombali Association Trainer (Darhuda Soap Makers)

Members of the Cacine Trader and Transporters Association

Members of the Cameconde Fruit Growers Association

Members of the Cassumba Fishermen Association

Members of the Darhuda Soap Makers Association

**ANNEX C**

**SUMMARY OF AFRICARE VOCATIONAL  
TRAINING PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS**

# **SUMMARY OF AFRICARE VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS**

## **I. PARTICIPANT TRAINING**

### **YEAR ONE: JULY 1989 - JUNE 1990**

1. Identified individual and collective training priorities of over thirty GOGB and the private sector entities.
2. Developed a USAID/BISSAU approved National Training Plan.
3. Established procedures and selection criteria for short-term training scholarship candidates.
4. Screened over 350 applications for short-term training scholarships.
5. Established criteria for desired overseas and in-country training programs.
6. Selected 39 scholarship candidates for in-country (19) and overseas (20) training.
7. Conducted an informal survey of returned training participants.
8. Identified Portuguese training institutions that satisfy the committee's pre-established criteria.

---

### **YEAR TWO: JULY 1990 - JUNE 1991**

1. Identified individual and collective training priorities of over seventy GOGB and private sector entities.
2. Developed USAID/Bissau approved annual training plan.
3. Established procedures and selection criteria for short-term training scholarship candidates.
4. Screened over 550 applications for short-term training scholarships.
5. Financed agricultural marketing training for Guinean at Kansas State University in Manhattan, Kansas, USA.

6. Financed computer, administrative, and accounting training for nineteen (19) Guineans at the Centro Nacional de Estudos e Planeamento/ Instituto de Aperfeçoamento Tecnico Acelerado (CNEP/IATA) in Lisbon, Portugal.
7. Financed computer training for four Guineans at the Empreedimentos, Sistemas Informaticos e Consultoria, Lda. in Bissau.
8. Conducted a formal survey of returned training participants.
9. Selected 48 GOGB regional civil servants (including three women) for in-country training in the areas of public administration, bookkeeping, business Portuguese, and mathematics.
10. Selected 25 representatives (two women) from private sector firms and/or entrepreneurs for training in business planning.
11. Selected four Guinean women to attend the Small Business Development and Management Workshop in Atlanta, Georgia.
12. Selected sixteen representatives (four women) from 12 private firms for a computerized accounting course.
13. Selected one Guinean to attend United States Telecommunications Training Institute seminars in Washington, D.C and Minneapolis, MN.

---

**YEAR THREE: JULY 1991 - JUNE 1992**

1. Financed and monitored three regional training courses (seven weeks in length) for 48 public sector administrative employees in the areas of public administration, business Portuguese, statistics (conducted by a public sector national training organization).
2. Financed and monitored an intensive training course (six weeks) for 16 private sector employees in computerized accounting.
3. Financed and monitored a course on Women in Development/ Small Business Management attended by four women in the United States.
4. Selected one private sector employee to attend a six week training in Telecommunications at the U.S. Telecommunications Training Institute.
5. Conducted a three day training seminar for 25 business operators in the "Elements of a Successful Business Plan" through two in-country trainers.
6. Designed a curriculum for a course in "Small Business Administration".

7. Awarded two businessmen contracts to two Guinean training institutions to conduct " Small Business Administration Courses".
8. Designed a questionnaire to evaluate the training of Small Business Administration courses.

---

## II. VOCATIONAL TRAINING

### YEAR ONE: JUNE 1989 - JULY 1990

1. Placed the following personnel:
  - a. a project coordinator who provided ongoing technical assistance to the CEFC/Bedanda and CEFAG/Empada directors in the areas of administration and management;
  - b. a short-term consultant who successfully assisted the Ministry of Education redefine and restructure rural vocational education policy and programs; and
  - c. two short-term tropical agriculture specialists who recommended changes to the curriculum at CEFAG/Empada.
2. Provided practical training opportunities for blacksmith, carpenter, and mechanic students. Also established training of trainers courses.

---

### YEAR TWO: JUNE 1990 - JULY 1991

1. Provided technical assistance for the reformulation of the Ministry of Education's rural vocational skills training policy, including the revision of curricula at CEFC/Bedanda and CEFAG/Empada.
2. Provided on-the-job training to the CEFC/Bedanda and CEFAG/Empada directors in the areas of organizational development and management which resulted in the Ministry of Education approval of revised administrative plans submitted by each director for their respective centers.
3. Published research on the income and production activity levels of traditional artisans and producers.
4. Financed the construction of a mechanic workshop and the rehabilitation of other staff housing at CEFAG/Empada.

5. Financed and completed an instructors dormitory and rehabilitated other staff housing at CEFAG/Empada, including constructing a well.
6. Financed and supervised in-service training for instructors at CEFC/Bedanda and CEFAG/Empada in the areas of curriculum planning, course design, pedagogy/andragogy, and village research and methodology.
7. Organized supervised internships in the areas of research and methodology, management planning, small enterprise development, and fish drying and processing.

---

**YEAR THREE: JUNE 1991 - JULY 1992**

The draft FY 1992 Annual Report states that Africare continued to support the operations of two rural training centers in southern Guinea-Bissau that target training to meet the needs of rural producers in the primary sector (agriculture, CEFAG/Empada) and the secondary sector (agro-processing and artisanship, CEFC/Bedanda) of the local economy. Africare has pursued a three prong strategy which has the twin objectives of institutionalizing a village-based training system and creating the managerial capability and financial autonomy for the centers to operate effectively after project funding has ended.

Specific accomplishments of the two components (CEFAG/Empada and CEFC/Bedanda) were:

***CEFAG/Empada***

1. A five-week training of trainers (TOT) seminar in animal traction at the center;
2. A seven week TOT in methodology of rural extension at an agricultural center in Northern Guinea-Bissau;
3. A four week TOT program in experimental plot design conducted by project personnel at the Center;
4. A three week TOT seminar in training courses design;
5. Study visits to an agricultural experimental station and a commercial farm;
6. Distribution of vegetable seeds to six villages and explanation of gardening techniques;

fb

7. Formal training in land-preparation techniques, spacing requirements, and backup sprayer use and maintenance to approximately 50 different rural producers in three different villages; and
8. Planting of peanut (one acre) for research and production.

***CEFC/Bedanda***

1. Individualized TOT in:

- general mechanics at a private garage in Bissau (three weeks);
- metalsmithing at a development project in Northern Guinea-Bissau (four weeks) under two instructors;
- drying and smoking of fish for a rural association in Southern Senegal (three weeks) under two instructors;
- public administration and statistics course (seven week intensive program);
- advanced accounting course in Bissau (12 weeks);
- interviewing and transcribing techniques for rural entrepreneurs in local languages (four week program); and
- course design, budgets, and report writing for private companies (one-week seminar).

2. During FY 1992 the project completed 14 courses varying in length from one to twelve weeks. These courses were as follows:

Title	No. of Courses	No. of Participants
Small enterprise	6 courses	82 participants
Mechanics	2 courses	18 participants
Artisanship	4 courses	33 participants
Agro-industry	2 courses	20 participants