

PN-ABL-288

#698-0464

77252

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT PROGRAM (ADSP)

-----

ED20  
EDUCATION IN COTE D'IVOIRE

IN SEARCH OF A PRAGMATIC POLICY

Priority Actions and Desirable Lines of Emphasis

Education and Human Resources Development

Working paper # 1

Dr. C. Medjomo  
Regional EHRD Advisor  
African Development Support Project (ADSP)  
USAID - REDSO/WCA

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

AID	Agency for International Development
BGF	Budget Général de Fonctionnement
BIRD	Banque Internationale pour la Reconstruction et le Développement (World Bank)
BSIE	Budget Spécial d'Investissement et d'Equipement
DCGTX	Direction et Contrôle des Grands Travaux
ENSA	Ecole Nationale Supérieure Agronomique
ENS	Ecole Normale Supérieure
FNR	Fonds National de Régulation
GOCI	Government of Côte d'Ivoire
IAB	Institut Agricole de Bouaké
IDA	International Development Association (World Bank)
INSET	Institut National Supérieur de l'Enseignement Technique
IPNET	Institut Pédagogique National de l'Enseignement Technique
MEN	Ministère de l'Education Nationale
MENRS	Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Recherche Scientifique
METFP	Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle
PAS	Programme d'Ajustement Structurel
SYNARES	Syndicat National de la Recherche et de l'Enseignement Supérieur
SYNESCI	Syndicat National des Enseignants du Secondaire de Côte d'Ivoire
REDSO/WCA	Regional Economic Development Services Office West and Central Africa
UNDP	United Nations Development Program

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Like other countries, Côte d'Ivoire embarked on a challenging program of education and human resources development since the onset of its independence (from French rule 1960). While some important results have been obtained these achievements are below the high social and individual expectations. The country still officially has a rate of 70-77% enrollment of school age children and 43% literacy rate.

Although the provision of quality education and marketable training has been the goal of GOCI, the absence of a national Action Plan, clearly-stated policy and performance objectives, the lack of management of the system as well as the poor conditions of the teaching and learning that take place have hindered the functioning of the education institution.

Three major constraints can be identified:

- The absence of a national plan of action: The difficulty in coordinating the different units within the sub-sectors and other sectors such as the productive sector of the economy, is a clear illustration. The link between educational policy measures, on the one hand, and the state of the national economy and objectives pursued, on the other hand, is not clearly stated in the various five-year development plans. If the objective of making education an effective tool of individual accomplishment and of the self-sustained development of the society still holds, the government needs to define a plan of action that will ensure that education effectively performs this strategic function.

- The weak administrative and supervisory capacity of the system: This aspect examines the efficiency of management, which, until now, has been reduced to conflicts of competence, demonstrations of power by appointed heads and individual control often resulting in the dismissal of qualified personnel. The country today can boast of an appreciable body of skilled persons who simply need to be properly utilized. In addition, the ministries in charge of education need to improve their internal administrative linkages in order to achieve their objectives and allow better coordination with other ministries, and institutions. This involves more than a simple administrative reform. It requires individual commitment and willingness, greater responsibility and accountability. To achieve and share this spirit, the initiative and support must come from the top executive level of the government.
  
- The current weak financial situation of the country: In view of the budgetary austerity existing at the moment, designing educational plans may appear neither desirable nor feasible. Although the lack of resources remains an obstacle when it comes to achieving greater access and better quality, changes aimed at meeting both short and long term goals can no longer be postponed. The serious financial constraint needs to be considered carefully. As a national priority, measures to raise the necessary funds and to make the system efficient must be defined.

GOCI is now seeking assistance from donors to reform the entire education system. Within this context, this study attempts to suggest priority actions and desirable lines of emphasis.

Yet, making proposals appear to be an extremely difficult task not only due to the fact that forecasting is very often a purely hypothetical exercise but mainly because of the appalling absence of sound data and a national plan of action. In addition, the implementation of policies has, in the past, been extremely slow (the Education Reform Program of 1977) and the degree of political commitment or eagerness for change seems far less than required.

From the viewpoint of the attempt to tackle the management problem and the process of providing pertinent technical inputs (financial, didactic, institutional and technological etc.), AID is in a more advantageous position given its prior experience and current activities in the West African region. Yet, the nature, form and level of its assistance needs to be worked out in accordance with the procedures and primary criteria for the respective selection of development assistance projects and of need-based countries.

The formulation of a change strategy cannot be postponed. The most important opportunity and crucial asset of GOCI is the existing human resource base, composed of qualified and quite experienced administrative and technical staff who, in order to produce the desirable change, should fill the positions needed. In addition, setting a better managerial environment and a policy environment supportive of initiatives should provide the grounds for increasing performance.

## INTRODUCTION

Experience in education over the last three decades provides evidence of the extent to which the real achievement of most African education systems differ from those ascribed to them by plans and projects and more generally by the implicit philosophy underlying those projects.

Studies have made it evident that far from encouraging social development and individual achievement, educational programs and practices implemented so far have reinforced the handicaps and even created new ones.

In Côte d'Ivoire, the relative economic wellbeing of the country during the 1970s produced an explosion of the student population. In addition, the widespread policy of building specialized training institutions and providing scholarships resulted in a great number of repetitions, dropouts and eventually, in the unemployment of graduates. All these can be taken as indicators of the malfunctioning of the overall social system.

In this period of economic crisis, scarcity of funds and political turmoil, it looks like Ivorian decision-makers are having problems deciding on priority actions not only where overall development strategies are concerned but also in tackling specific educational issues.

The purpose of this assessment is to provide a comprehensive analysis of the prevailing situation, and constructive possibilities. The main objective is to give a global picture of fundamental reforms, if any, that have occurred, what impact these changes have had on the current situation and how they

influence future orientations and strategies. Beyond these legitimate concerns, the report is also intended to outline the configuration of a possible USAID Assistance Program in Basic Education.

The report is divided into four (4) major sections:

1. An overview of the current macroeconomic situation in Côte d'Ivoire;
2. An overview of the education system consisting of identifying overall goals, strategies and assessing achievements, performance and constraints;
3. An analysis of major outcomes as well as economic, pedagogical, social, institutional and policy constraints; and
4. An analysis of the specific situation of the basic education system and of desirable points of focus and priority actions for improvement.

At the time the study was carried out, it was not possible to visit sites because electoral campaigns were going on. The study is therefore based on secondary data, official reports in particular, as well as results of academic studies. A list of sources is appended to this report, etc.

#### I. A MACROECONOMIC OVERVIEW OF COTE D'IVOIRE

If its economic growth in the 60s and 70s was remarkable (even if this growth has been interpreted in diverse ways), the country is today facing a harsh economic and political crisis.

There have been many terms to portray what was seen by liberal economists to be a "miracle"; on the other hand, radicals considered this relative performance as a "mirage", an ephemeral phenomenon brought about by external mechanisms. They were sceptical about the country's internal capacity of self-sustenance. However, following the oil crisis and the fall in the price of its two major export crops - cocoa and coffee, there was a general consensus on the need to "set the country on the path to recovery". Implicitly, this was a recognition of a declining economic performance and thus, socio-economic setbacks.

Like in many other countries, experts and international organizations have come to the conclusion that a fundamental structural change is indispensable for Cote d'Ivoire to reverse its present economic decline and perhaps, in the long term bring about a sustained improvement in the socio-economic welfare of its population.

How has the country evolved over the last three decades of political autonomy? Three periods can be distinguished to characterize the country's development trends:

- From 1965 to 1975, the country experienced a rapid economic growth particularly in the secondary and tertiary sectors. An exceptionally favorable situation on the international market coupled with the increase in production of commodities such as cocoa and coffee made this performance feasible. Over that period, the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) grew at an annual rate of 7.9% in real terms, well ahead of the then estimated annual population growth rate of 4%. During this decade, industry and services reached an annual expansion rate of 10.6% and 12.6% respectively. The period was characterized by the adequate funding of socio-economic and cultural activities.

- The second phase (1975-80), contrary to the first, was characterized by a reversal of the internal and external conditions that had existed earlier on, that is, the favorable economic environment. In addition to the oil crisis, the sharp fall in the market prices of commodities such as cocoa and coffee, not only slowed down the pace of public investments that were made during the cocoa boom but also brought about internal and external macroeconomic imbalances that landed the country in a severe financial crisis in the beginning of the 1980s. As a result of this deterioration, the country had to reduce investments in agriculture (sugar factories), roads, higher education facilities, etc... During this period, public savings dropped from 18% in 1977 to 6.1% in 1980; medium and long term outstanding debts increased from 24.2% to 47.2% of the GDP. During this period, in 1977, an educational reform program was designed.
  
- The third phase (1980 to present) was characterized by the deterioration of domestic socio-economic conditions and a worsening in the decline of coffee and cocoa market prices. This period also marked the beginning of a continuous flow of stabilization and recovery policies implemented within the framework of the structural adjustment program as defined by the International Monetary Fund (IMF). The five successive programs under this recovery policy have not brought about the expected changes yet. It is said that the Structural Adjustment Program (SAP) is indispensable for the country to reestablish a sustained growth pattern while maintaining internal and external equilibria (World Bank, 1987). Given the low economic performance and the effects of frequent political disturbances, it is not certain that Cote d'Ivoire will accomplish, in the short term, the transition from stabilization to self-sustained growth as stated in the 1987 Structural Adjustment Program.

## II. THE IVORIAN EDUCATION SYSTEM

### 2.1. General Trends

Before attaining political autonomy, Côte d'Ivoire experienced a new education pattern under the French administration, with Catholic and Protestant missionaries. From 1910 to 1959, the number of schools increased from 40 to 1,543. It must be pointed out that missionary schools during that period played a major role in this expansion, particularly in the most remote parts of the country. By 1954, the Catholics had built 316 schools while the protestants had built 20. Under French rule, the general rate of schooling was 28.45% and by 1960, there was an estimated school population of 200,045.

The period from 1960 to the late eighties was characterized by the rapid expansion of the education system at all levels. During this period, primary and secondary school enrollment increased at an annual rate of 7.2% and 11% respectively. The university, originally created as a center for graduate studies in 1958, had a student population which increased from 648 in 1964 to almost 22,000 in 1990. The initial enrollment target was 6,000. After its establishment in 1957-61, the Ministry of Technical Training was closed down and re-opened in 1971. Since this date, many secondary and institutions of higher education for vocational and technical training have been built either by private businessmen or public ministries; the efforts of the Ministry of Vocational and Technical Training (METFP), the principal initiating and executing body have been complemented by many other technical ministries (Marine, Trade, Agriculture, Transport and Public Construction, etc.). Many costly establishments were built in the country, mostly in the cities of Yamoussoukro and Abidjan.

From 1981 up to now, there has been a slowdown not in the rate of enrollment but in the expansion of the infrastructure, particularly at the secondary level. Ever since, the country has been going through a continuous declining process.

## 2.2. Trend of Public Expenditure on Education

In Côte d'Ivoire, the level of public expenditure on education is seen as one of the highest in the world. It should be mentioned that the government's budget allocation for education is only a part of the contributions made to the education sector in addition to the external aid. Local communities, private entrepreneurs and families constantly provide assistance to this sector which they deem very important.

According to a 1987 World Bank survey, the volume and pattern of investments in this sector have fluctuated greatly, indicating a lack of cohesion in the planning and management of investments. Institutions of higher education, in particular, technical and professional graduate schools like INSET, ENSA, ENS, etc., have, by far, been the most substantial beneficiaries of all efforts deployed in the sector (50-80%).

Table 2.1 confirms the constant high portion attributed to education in the country's recurrent budget.

**Table 2.1: Share of Education in Investment and Recurrent Budgets  
(FCFA billion)**

	1975	1980	1985	1988
<b>Investment Budget (GSIE)</b>				
-Total BSIE	51.2	312.8	88.0	143.6
-Education	7.0	37.6	5.4	3.0
-Share of Education(%)	13.7	12.0	6.1	2.1
<b>Recurrent Budget (BGF)</b>				
-Total BGF	126.8	338.6	418.0	493.5
-Education	51.1	147.3	176.0	220.2
-Share of Education (%)	40.3	43.5	42.1	44.6

Sources: 1975-85: RCI CEM Mars 1987. p115, 1988: BGD et PER and The key observations from the analysis of the above numbers relate to the following points:

- The share of education in the investment budget is slightly in conformity with the fluctuations that occur in the process of expansion.
- For the 1975-1980 period, the share of education does not reflect the gain in the international market, at least in the investment budget.
- Another aspect worth outlining is the high cost of the Ivorian education system.

An analysis of the structure of recurrent expenditure will throw light on a number of explanatory factors.

### 2.3. Structure of Recurrent Costs

Table 2.3 shows that the cost of education in Côte d'Ivoire is very high and also reveals the following:

There is disproportionate distribution of allocated resources to the different educational levels. Primary schools benefit the least in spite of the greater number of pupils;

The cost of vocational and technical training is higher than that of general training, both at the secondary and higher education levels;

Salaries take up a considerable portion of the allocated budget at each level of the education and training system. It accounts for nearly 93.91% of the total cost of primary education, 76.30% of general secondary education; 63.69% of technical training and 46.64% of the higher education budget. The large portion used on salaries is attributed to the following factors:

- The salary scale of a national teacher is 25-30% higher than that of another civil servant with equal qualifications;
- The great number of expatriate teachers earning three to four times the salary of national teachers with equal qualification.

It should be mentioned that, in this respect, there has been a general downward trend. Some expatriate contractors (African non Ivorians) have been converted into local contractors, that is, they have been put on the same salary scale as national teachers. Over the last five years, the overall number of expatriate technical assistance is diminishing as apparent in the following figures.

**Table 2.2: Trend of Growth of National Teaching Staff  
(1969-1990)**

	1969/1970 %	1979/1980 %	1989/1990 %
IVORIAN TEACHERS	15.67	44.14	87.13
FOREIGN SERVICE CONTRACTORS	15.29	23.47	7.27
TECHNICAL ASSISTANTS (FRENCH)	61.40	31.51	5.46
OTHER TECHNICAL ASSISTANTS	7.64	0.88	0.15
TOTAL	100.00	100.00	100.00

This table shows the general trend in the evolution of the teaching staff in Côte d'Ivoire during the past two decades (1969 to 1990). The 1969/70 academic year figures show the Ivorian teachers are almost inexistent and represent only 17.67% of the general total. The training is thus provided by non-Ivorian teachers with a percentage of more than 80% (4 teachers out of 5 are foreigners) as follows: 61.40% of French technical assistants, 15.29% of foreign service contractors and 7.64% of other technical assistants.

The statistics for 1989/90 academic year show a spectacular increase in the percentage of Ivorian teachers which is estimated at 87.13% from 44.14% in 1980. With this increase, we have a considerable decrease of the other categories of teachers which represent only 12.37% against 55.86% in 1980 and more than 80% in 1970. The outstanding aspects of this decrease is linked to the important decrease in the percentage of French technical assistants (61.40% in 1970, 31.50% in 1980 and 5.46% in 1990).

Secondly, transfers or non-teaching costs constitute the second major component of the recurrent budget. This item refers to fellowships, student allowances and government subsidies to private training institutions.

Since 1972, the number of private schools have increased tremendously, government having slowed down and even stopped building schools especially at the general secondary level. These subsidies amounted to 11.9 billion FCFA at the general secondary level and 18.6 billion FCFA at the primary level for the period 1980-1984. Estimated subsidies for 1991 is 5.831 billion CFA. From the table below, it is likely that GOCI subsidy to private schools will continue. (See Table).

- Another contributing factor to the rise in education costs is the high rates of repetition and the low number of teaching hours which has an irremediable impact on the number of required teachers and thus leads to an increase in salaries.

To sum up, as far as education financing is concerned, the country is experiencing hardships under the current economic recovery policies. However, the unit costs of the educational system remain "unmatched" in the sub-region and are higher at all stages of the ladder, as shown in the table 2.3.

#### 2.4. External Aid: Bilateral and Multilateral Contributions

Despite the volume of national public investment in education, external aid is expected to play a major role, particularly in this period of economic and financial scarcity.

It was not easy to analyze the comparative trends of the contributions made by various countries and international

organizations because of the difficulty in obtaining chronological data, the difference in currencies and the lack of assessment of targeted domains and results achieved so far. Nevertheless, the figures given in tables 2.4 and 2.5 give a sense of contribution by categories of donors, types of aid and a comparative view of the relative importance of education compared to others sectors.

Table 2.4: External AID per Donor and Conditions (1989)

(\$US 1000)

DONORS	GIFT		CREDIT		TOTAL	
	AMOUNT	%	AMOUNT	%	AMOUNT	%
UNITED NATIONS ORGANIZATIONS	10,066	4.72	115,100	32.92	125,166	24.58
MULTILATERAL	132,461	62.04	75,702	25.60	203,163	40.88
BILATERAL	70,966	33.24	104,950	35.48	175,916	34.54
TOTAL	213,493	100	295,752	100	509,245	100

Source: UNDP; Cooperation for development: Côte D'Ivoire 1989  
March 1991

With regards to the distribution of external assistance and funding to Côte d'Ivoire in 1989 by the different donors, the multilateral type with approximately 62.04% of the general total of the grants (e.g. an amount of \$132.461 million), constitutes the most important followed by the bilateral with 33.24% and finally the the United Nations Organisation with only 4.72%, approximately \$10.066 million. The UN loans to the GOCI amount

to \$115.100 million, approximately 32.92% or 1/3 of the whole. However the bilateral type of assistance represents the second most important assistance and the multilateral one comes in third position.

Table 2.5: External Donors Financial AID to Côte d'Ivoire  
By Sectors (1989-1991)

IN US \$ 1000

	SECTORS	AMOUNT	PERCENTAGES
02	ECONOMY	304,734	0.64
04	AGRICULTURE	154,039.4	0.33
03	NATURAL RESOURCES	8,135.6	0.02
10	HEALTH	6,418.5	0.01
07	INTERNATIONAL TRADE	1,423.5	0.003
11	EDUCATION	16.2	0.0001
-	TOTAL	472,281.3	

**Table 2.6: Sources of Education Financing  
(F.CFA Millions)**

Source	1980	1981	1982	1983	1984
<b>National Source</b>					
- BSIE - Treasury	70,341	6,699	5,338	4,398	1,476
- BSIE - CSSPPA	16,776	21,510	1,652	-	-
- TOTAL	23,810	28,209	7,040	4,398	1,476
	(64.6%)	(47.7%)	(18.9%)	(20.3%)	(5.3%)
<b>External sources</b>					
	13,753	30,871	30,115	17,280	26,089
	(36.6%)	(52.3%)	(81.1%)	(78.7%)	(94.7%)
	37,563	59,080	37,155	21,678	27,565

Table 2.6 reveals a downward trend in local funding; however, the level of external funding has been increasing every year. With the fall in the prices of export commodities and under the austerity policy, government expenditure in the education sector is likely to continue decreasing. Consequently, one of the two following situations is expected to occur in order to meet society's education demands.

1. Further privatization of the system. This trend has grown since the early seventies. The key question is how the majority of citizens could, under the financial burden, afford private schools. The double-shift system and an increase in the pupil/teacher ratio resulting in crowded public schools are, for the time being, methods being used to remedy this situation.
2. Shifting costs to local communities and parents. Despite the critical socio-economic conditions, local communities

are bearing more and more of the burden of education by supporting the costs of students' stationery, their transportation and even the equipment of some schools (tables, chairs, chalk and other miscellaneous items). They also see to the building of classrooms both at the primary and, more recently, at the secondary levels through the established municipal authorities. It is officially acknowledged that this source of financing has, in the past, played an important role in reducing regional education disparities and, more recently, in responding to government's limitations.

In view of the absence of recent data, information obtained from the document "BILAN DIAGNOSTIC DU SYSTEME EDUCATIF" (1984) gives an idea of local contribution for the 1981-82 academic year as established by the "Service Central d'Architecture et de Construction Scolaire." With regards to the construction of primary schools:

- 50% of the schools built that year were built by parents;
- 14% jointly by parents and the government;
- 14% by private entrepreneurs;
- 12% by parents (villages) and state contribution through the "FRAR" program;
- 10% by housing construction firms/corporations.

The contribution of community and the municipalities is expected to increase in the future. Projected contribution for the coming years is as follows.

Table 2.7: Education and Training

(Million CFA)

OTHER SOURCES OF EXPECTED FUNDINGS					
	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995
<b>COMMUNITY AND MUNICIPALITIES</b>					
(Primary School Construction)	4,797	5,633	6,578	7,736	9,051
(Primary School Rehabilitation)	2,872	3,363	3,918	4,596	5,365
(Secondary School Construction)	4,166	4,404	4,662	5,000	5,362
(Secondary School Rehabilitation)	1,743	2,009	2,305	2,662	3,058
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>13,577</b>	<b>15,409</b>	<b>17,463</b>	<b>19,993</b>	<b>22,836</b>

## 2.5. The Importance and Status of Private Schools

This section is not conceived as a thorough analysis of the matter. It is intended to broaden our understanding of the role played today by private schools which constitute a key component of the Ivorian educational apparatus. It will only explore issues pertaining to the context of the conception of private schools, trends of attendance, the effects of changes in public policy toward private schools and how these institutions might be affected by the structural adjustment programs now underway. Equally important issues relating to the interrelationships between private and public schools, social segregation, equality of educational opportunity for children from different socio-economic backgrounds, performance and quality will, therefore, not be discussed.

Is the creation of private schools a result of the constraints on public schools or does it derive from the logic of a liberal economy? What is the underlying motivation for public aid to private schools? Does the attendance of these schools necessarily reflect the socio-economic background of children?

It is not easy to get a clear-cut answer to these questions either from official documents or from interviewing decision-makers. Private schooling in Côte d'Ivoire gives rise to fundamental ambiguities about the reasons for its establishment, its merits and effectiveness and, above all, its status in the formulation of past and current educational policies.

From a philosophical viewpoint, private schooling is aimed at promoting educational pluralism, competitiveness and the freedom of choice. In addition, there is the aspect of moral education that is emphasized in religious (catholic and protestant) institutions.

Looking at the context of conception and the rate of expansion, laïc private schooling initially began as a supplementary component to meet the increasing demand for education in view of the shortage of public structures which made them incapable of absorbing a considerable proportion of school age children both at the primary and secondary levels. It is, therefore, likely that private schools were authorized to respond to the growing number of children of primary school age who could not gain admission into public schools.

As a result of the situations described above, most private schools, with the exception of Catholic schools, appear to be set for low profile students, who did not either pass the required exams or were pushed out.

Evidence shows that at the primary and secondary education levels, there is a strong mixture of public and private institutions in Côte d'Ivoire; the creation of laic private schools reflects even more clearly the existence of bottlenecks in the educational system. Within this framework, missionary schools are said to offer a better model. Thus, the great diversity of private schools does not necessarily represent a productive and efficient academic environment, despite the fact that government trained teachers are officially appointed to some of them.

Nonetheless, since the 1970s, private schools, regardless of adequate academic standards, have constituted the greatest access to secondary education. Still, one can hardly admit that the private schools have been meeting the goals (if any) set so far, and that they are effectively responding to the social aspirations of parents and academic aspirations of their students, that is a good quality instruction and marketable education.

Table 2.8: Government's Subsidy to Private Schools (1990-1991)

(CFA 000)

TYPE	CATHOLIC		PROTESTANT		LAIC		TOTAL	
	1990	1991	1990	1991	1990	1991	1990	1991
GENERAL TRAINING								
Primary	2 268 235	2 117 000	705 958	654 958	400 850	375 850	3 375 043	3 147 808
Secondary	656 956	600 000	73 346	70 000	1 562 182	1 400 000	2 292 484	2 070 000
Tertiary	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
S//TOTAL	2 925 191	2 717 000	779 304	724 958	1 963 032	1 775 850	5 667 527	5 217 808
VOCATIONAL TRAINING								
Secondary	-	-	-	-	342 000	300 000	342 000	300 000
Tertiary	-	-	-	-	14 200	13 000	14 200	13 000
Sub//TOTAL	-	-	-	-	356 200	313 000	356 200	313 000
GENERAL TOTAL	2 925 191	2 717 000	779 304	724 958	2 319 232	2 088 850	6 023 727	5 530 808

SOURCE: Côte d'Ivoire Ministry of Economy and Finance - General Current Budget

As it appears, many issues remain unclarified. For the time being, given their explosion, operating privately-owned schools appears to be an expanding and rewarding business as can be deduced from the figures in Table 2.8.

With regards to general training, private schools have increased, in the course of the decade (1977-1987), the number of classrooms from 848 to 2,172 and the number of enrollments from 36,758 students to 93,883. Therefore, enrollments in private schools have increased by 256%. It should be pointed out that the expansion of school infrastructure, particularly at the secondary level, is a considerably increasing phenomenon in the private setting.

A distinction must be made between missionary and laïc schools. For instance, for the 1987/88 academic year, the total body of students enrolled in missionary schools was 14,973 out of a total of 93,883 students. This represents 16% of private school enrollment. The level of preference for those schools might be, to a large extent, due to the level of the family's income and the admission criteria (emphasis is placed more on academic performance than on money). Also, there has been a slow-down in the expansion of catholic schools; and over the last decade, most catholic primary and secondary schools have become government property. The reason is mostly financial: the system has, over the last two years, experienced a reversal in the trend of enrollment. There has been an increasing exodus from private to public schools. It is of interest to note that the precedent figures are indicative of the general trends in education financing, specifically, government subsidies and unit costs at the primary, general and technical secondary levels. Besides moral considerations, two critical points concerning government financial support of the private education system merit additional thought.

1. If the privatization of schools is to take over part of the educational obligation of the government, it must provide high quality education, a better learning environment conducive to better achievements, with financial sustainability.

The fact that a large portion of government subsidies (in addition to an increasing supply of teachers) is mostly allocated to private schools while the public sector also needs to be extended and equipped raises some suspicions. Criteria related to pursued goals, schools performance and pedagogical achievements and innovations should supersede financial gains and any kind of individual and social consideration in the provision of government subsidies and allocation of government-paid trained teachers.

2. As education budgets and family income increasingly become subject to restrictions, one can expect that public subsidies and private school enrollment will diminish. This situation of reducing tuition and subsidies may inhibit the expansion of the private sector, since the latter will have to face paying teachers' salaries among other costs. In this case, if cost is to be reduced, efficiency improved, and increasing demands properly met in the future, the government of Côte d'Ivoire has to determine the most adequate allocation of its limited resources so as to alleviate the high contributions made by families and, at the same time, meet the country's socio-economic objectives and human resources requirements. A clear definition of private school status and importance in future educational plans will lead to a clarification of the prevailing ambiguities and rampant complexities.

To sum up, public expenditure on education in Côte d'Ivoire is said to be "unmatched by any other country in the World"

(44% of the recurrent budget). It should be also stated that cost of education is the highest among Sub-Saharan countries. However, the considerable high part apportioned to education in the Government's budgets over the years, has not yielded any major social dividends. On the contrary, many obstacles stand in the way of achieving equality of educational opportunities. This, along with other factors, is reflected in the shortage of school facilities and equipment. It is in analyzing the distribution of the budget to the various items and educational levels, that the investments assume their full significance and reveal, to a certain extent, the existence of impeding factors in the management of the whole system. These constraints, aggravated by the persistence of the global economic turmoil which in turn contributes to budgetary austerity, are to be analyzed in the light of updated educational goals and objectives.

#### 2.6. Overall Constraints Analysis of the Education System

This section will underline the various types of obstacles which impede the normal functioning of the system as well as the delivery of services and the quality of educational programs. These obstacles stem from diverse sources: socio-political, economic, management and planning practices, etc...

In view of the problems of demographic growth, health, transportation and food, the choice of education as a major priority among the country's priorities is doomed to be revised.

It is essential to present various perceptions of prevailing and potential constraints as they appear to local policy-makers and international experts, because this is a problem perceived as being immediately related to or affecting policy action.

### 2.6.1. Appraisal of educational constraints

According to various official documents, constraints have not only remained but increased in complexity over the years. Among these problems, are the following:

1. Inappropriate content (too general and not much related to the local set-up);
2. The high rate of dropouts and repetitions (out of 1000 pupils only 16% reach the secondary level);
3. The lack of equipment and facilities (infrastructure and pedagogical material are either obsolete or lacking):
4. The lack of coherence in studies programs and smooth flow within and among the various components of the system; and
5. The declining operating budgets allocated to each secondary training institution confronted to overcrowded classrooms (80-120 pupils).

This is not a new phenomenon: The final report of "Etats Généraux" (April 1985 p. 50) on education and scientific research, denounced the mismanagement of schools resulting from centralized decision-making structures, the disregard for established management rules by most supervisors and the frequent conflicts in duty. The report also pointed out that evaluations revealed a continuous drop in the quality of teaching particularly in scientific subjects (maths, physics, etc.), an appalling weakness in language mastery and logic reasoning and a very low level of general culture, etc.

It is apparent that such an educational system is only transforming young innocent illiterates into wretched

illiterates. However, beyond the consensus on the nature of the problems and the consequent low social dividends from educational investment, actions meant to solve the prevailing seem to suffer many setbacks. In addition, it is difficult to understand current educational objectives (short, medium, and long range) and orientations in the realization of which, the above enumerated situations pose as obstacles.

#### 2.6.2. External appraisal of Ivorian education constraints

From the point of view of international organizations like UNESCO and the World Bank, education in Côte d'Ivoire faces some critical problems:

- The high unit cost of training and the increasing portion taken up by education particularly given the government's limited financial resources;
- The absence of a general, systematic planning and management approach;
- The disparities in access to education according to sex and region;
- The imbalance between the rapid population growth and insufficient and inadequate facilities;
- The high rate of repetitions and dropouts at all levels of the system;
- The very low level of internal and external efficiency; and
- The decline in enrollment at the primary level.

Under the austerity policy, the following are presented as important educational objectives:

- The reinforcement of higher education facilities and the strengthening of technical training;
- The improvement of the quality of teaching and production at the secondary level;
- The further development of primary education infrastructure in accordance with the growth rate of the basic school age population; and
- The improvement of the internal and external capacity to reduce waste and better meet the manpower requirements of the job market both from the viewpoint of short and long term prospects and global development needs.

In addition to these identified problems and objectives, three causes of these constraints are defined:

- a. The imbalance between the school population growth and the enrollment capacity of schools: With the exception of higher technical and vocational training institutions, one key characteristic of the Ivorian educational system is the over-population at all levels. The system is experiencing a decline in enrollment that is very visible at the primary level. This is due to the 4.4% population growth rate and the general fall in purchasing power. As a result, in urban areas the age for entry to the first year of primary school has moved from 7 to 9-10 years old while national enrollment rate has fallen from 75% to 69.4%. According to a recent forecast, if a 3.3% population growth rate is maintained, the rate of schooling will drop to 66.5% by the

year 1992. To maintain a growth rate of 7.3% will require an annual provision of 2,144 additional classrooms and 2,558 new teachers. Needless to say, the policy aiming at achieving education for all (100%) will require considerable effort.

At the secondary level, public school classrooms contain 80-110 pupils. Since the beginning of the 1970s, the government of Côte d'Ivoire has been promoting and highly subsidizing private secondary schools. Most of these schools were conceived as "reservoirs" for "push-outs" from the public schools, that is, they were filled with low-profile pupils. It should be mentioned that only 16% of primary school pupils get access to first year of secondary school; out of this "fortunate few", 7% get access to second cycle of the secondary level. This situation has led to the rapid and somewhat anarchistic expansion of private secondary schools where money is placed above any academic consideration in their admission criteria. However, there has been a downward trend in the rate of expansion. Due to the high school fees and the harsh economic conditions, there has been a reversal in tendency over the last few years, a drift from private to public schools through "parallel recruitment" procedures: that is, the enrollment of non-qualified students in public schools under social pressures. This situation has fundamental implications both for the quality of learning and for the effectiveness and efficiency of the educational and budget allocations.

- b. Internal and External Inefficiencies: The Ivorian educational system is one of the most expensive and selective. However, the considerable investment of Government and families have not yet resulted in the

fulfillment of individual and social expectations. The probability of productive employment is very low and certificates no longer provide job opportunities.

Regarding internal efficiency, it is usually said that the local educational system manufactures human waste due to the high dropout and unemployment rates. The large number of Ivorian children attending schools in neighboring countries (Burkina Faso, Togo, Benin, Mali, Guinea, Niger, etc.) after having been pushed out, and the increasing, already high rates of repetitions and dropouts clearly illustrate the poor functioning of the system. After the March 1990 student strikes, some of the institutionalized bottlenecks (probatoire/BAC I, for instance) which hinder the smooth flow from one level to another and from one grade to another within a given educational level, were removed. So far, the effect of this change is not pedagogically apparent.

Out of a cohort of 1000 primary school pupils, only 13 manage to reach the final year (Terminale or Grade 13) of the second level of secondary education; out of 1000 pupils in the first year of the higher secondary level ("seconde") only 435 will graduate to the university. Moreover, it takes an average of 9 academic years to finish 6-year course (to move from the second level of secondary education to university level) and 8 student years to produce one graduate from a three-year program.

This situation causes a lot of scepticism as to the efficiency of pedagogical practices - except in graduate vocational and technical schools. There is a shortage of equipment in most schools. The deterioration of school facilities built in the 1960's, the constant increase in the size of classes (from 40 pupils to an average of 100 nowadays) hinder efforts (if there are any) to achieve pedagogical improvement. Moreover, despite

the increased number of regional education offices (Direction Régionale de l'Enseignement) at both primary and secondary levels, this initiative has not brought about any improvement in internal efficiency. Supervisory tasks are not being performed due to the lack of means: limited operating budget, lack of transportation and even gasoline.

Besides these factors, the issue calls to question the planning and management capacity of the education system with regards to large disparities. As a matter of fact, female enrollment at the primary level represents about only half of the population of girls of school-going age while boys represent 75% of the age cohort. Along the educational ladder, girls represent 40% of the total enrollment at the primary level and 29% and 18% at first and second levels of secondary education respectively and 20% at tertiary level. Across regional boundaries, primary school coverage ranges (according to DCGTX 1990) from 80% in the southern region to about 70% in the western region, to 64% in the east and less than 50% in the northern region of the country. The national estimated rate of schooling being 77%. Moreover, in 1988, budget allocation by level of education was reflected in the following figures: from a total educational budget estimated at 220 billion FCFA, 41.9% was allotted to primary education, 31.4% to secondary, 17.3% to higher education and 9.4% to technical and vocational institutions. Furthermore, between each level of education, there are discrepancies. Out of an estimated global school population of 1,517,705, 80% attended primary school; 15.4% attended publiceducational needs, expanding training facilities, improving the general secondary schools, 2% technical and vocational training schools and about 1.6% higher training institutions. It should also be mentioned that the graduate technical schools (Grandes Ecoles) which absorbed 7.4% of total public expenditure in 1988, absorb only 2.4% of the tertiary education population.

As it appears, the pattern of education expansion and resource allocation induce many constraints in the functioning of the education system.

### 2.6.3. Budgetary constraints

All interrelated issues such as meeting growing social educational needs, expanding training facilities, improving the quality of learning, strengthening existing infrastructures etc., require urgent action and consequent funding.

Given the anaemic economic situation, it is not certain that education will continue to be considered a matter of highest priority nor that its share in the current budget will be maintained at its present level. The present system of budget allocation can no longer be pursued due to limited internal resources and the continual fall in export commodity prices. However, a cut in the present portion of the allocated budget will drastically affect the already poor maintenance of existing facilities and in particular, the already low government support to primary education. The problems of internal and foreign debt, demographic growth, and the various structural adjustment programs do not allow any promising forecast for the immediate and medium future. Moreover, shifting cost to local communities or furthering privatization may not be a reasonable, realistic solution given the high cost of living, the high rate of unemployment and the already significant contribution of the population to education financing.

Yet, the country has to meet both current survival needs and, at the same time, future development requirements among which manpower issues remain a key feature.

Here lies the government's dilemma especially in this era of political and economic turmoil and uncertainty where, according to high-ranked managers, what has officially been declared to be the share of the budget attributed to education, is not what is actually allocated. Many financial stringencies occur, quite often resulting in a 30% cut off the budget. At this moment, only the item related to salary is safeguarded.

### III. BASIC EDUCATION: INSTITUTIONAL AND TECHNICAL ANALYSIS

#### 3.1. National Goals and Strategies

Primary education in Côte d'Ivoire has been declared a fundamental right for all Ivorians. The goals, objectives and policy orientations have, over past years, been slightly identical and have offered a very general outlook. Besides reading, writing and numeracy, education in Côte d'Ivoire has been assigned ambitious and idealistic national goals and developmental objectives. More specifically, on account of the failure of previous educational practices, it was stated in the 1981-85 five-year plan that education needed to be closely related to the development process (L'éducation au service du développement). The Ivorian education system therefore had the following goals:

- to provide adequate opportunities for self-improvement and sustained self-development;
- to promote creativity and impart practical skills that are relevant to the development of both the people and the society;
- to facilitate the process of socio-economic and political development by providing the needed human resources and means necessary to meet the challenges facing society.

These broad objectives needs to be broken down into more specific objectives assigned to each segment of the education system.

Although these specific objectives are not apparent, primary education could today be said to have the following goals:

- Increasing access in order to reduce regional disparities;
- Improving the internal efficiency of instruction;
- Enhancing administrative and supervisory capabilities.

In short, the major objective of the Ministry of Primary Education is to improve the effectiveness of this educational sector by equipping children (pupils) with cognitive and manual skills relevant to productive work and opportunities for secondary education.

In order to better achieve the defined objectives, various strategies have been experimented including:

- the revision of previous curricula, adopting new syllabi and textbooks;
- the strengthening of teachers training institutions in terms of length of training, content and credential requirements;
- the establishment of a qualified cadre of inspectors through selective in-service training programs;
- the enforcement of regulations and controls on pedagogy/teaching.

One key component of these strategies was, in the 70's, the introduction of a television education program aimed at developing creativity, curiosity, and manipulative skills rather than songs, poetry or pure cognitive knowledge. Some structural innovations have recently been introduced such as:

- A close involvement of Parents' Associations and communities in the building of schools and the sharing the costs of school equipment.

Evidently, the operational guidelines do not really question or affect the philosophy nor the initial structural and organizational schemes inherited from the French system. Despite the creation of eleven (11) regional offices (Direction Régionale de l'Enseignement Primaire - DREP), the decision-making process remains highly centralized. Very few constructive changes can therefore be expected and anticipated from the highly sophisticated organizational structure mainly due to the global administrative environment, the centralization of decision-making, the poor delivery of educational services, the ineffective management of schools throughout the country and the misuse of qualified personnel.

### 3.2. Expansion of the Primary Education Sector

Official data reveals that the rate of schooling in Côte d'Ivoire is about 70% and that out of the 2.601 million primary school age children, 1,417,669 were attending school. The rate of literacy is approximately 43%. Yet disparities exist both in the regions and in the enrollment of girls (42%). However, these disparities need to be analyzed in detail in order to sort out their far-reaching effects and consequences. The following data portray the trends and actors in the realm of basic education in Côte d'Ivoire (Table 3.1).

Table 3.1: Trend of Facilities Expansion, Students Enrollment and Related Rates of Growth  
(1959-1990)

YEAR	SCHOOLS			CLASSROOMS			STUDENTS					GROWTH RATE %		
	Public	Private	Total	Public	Private	Total	Public		Private		Total	Class-Rooms%	Students	
							Boys	Girls	Boys	Girls			Boys	Girls
9/60	939	604	1543	2977	1608	4585	99839	35312	50957	13938	200046	-	-	-
0/61	1095	627	1722	3625	1811	5436	119034	45237	56645	17856	238772	19	17	28
9/70	1714	463	2177	7699	2532	10231	228566	128595	67601	40055	464817	-	-	-
0/71	1826	426	2252	8549	2511	11060	251582	141897	68333	41053	502865	18	16	29
9/80	3919	499	4418	19950	3347	23297	493380	317761	85577	57472	954190	-	-	-
0/81	4297	510	4807	21967	3455	25422	529322	351647	85404	58212	1024585	46	24	70
1/82	4724	513	5237	23700	3432	27132	565142	380371	81615	57996	1085124	38	21	58
2/83	4982	519	5501	25309	3457	28766	595816	405831	77154	56114	1134915	35	17	48
3/84	5254	541	5795	26537	3505	30042	609298	420330	74356	55840	1159824	28	7	29
4/85	5450	526	5976	27244	3413	30657	608111	428679	75470	57196	1179456	14	7	20
5/86	5267	529	5796	28083	3492	31575	635389	443027	76451	59645	1214512	20	12	34
6/87	5418	514	5932	28716	3643	32359	653801	455144	80025	62561	1251531	39	15	30
7/88	5627	566	6193	29577	3818	33395	683038	474895	82948	65814	1306695	22	21	47
8/89	5885	592	6477	30171	3974	341415	712534	497702	85629	68400	1364265	17	21	51
9/90	6075	606	6681	31292	4017	35309	732411	513444	88398	70934	1405187	25	15	38

The figures in Table 3.1 clearly indicate the state and trends of primary education.

Where enrollment is concerned, the 60s and 70s were marked by an increasing growth rate both in the building of physical facilities and in the enrollment of pupils. For example, pupil enrollment grew at an annual rate of 9% during the period 1976-80.

However, the 1980s were characterized by a reversal of the above trends. Enrollment has been declining significantly at an incredible pace: from 42% in the period from 1981 to 1984 to 26.5% from 1988 to 1990. The rate of first-year admissions to primary schools has dropped from 9.5% in 1978 to about 5% in 1990.

Table 3.2 : Private Primary Schools by Category  
(Academic year 1989 - 90)

CATEGORY	Number of Schools	Number of Classrooms	Number of Pupils	Number of Teachers
Catholic	318	2,056	87,518	2,138
Methodist	37	256	10,150	270
Evangelic	46	284	10,367	307
Adventist	5	25	908	25
Assemblies of God	5	32	1,325	36
Laic	195	1,626	57,627	1,922
TOTAL	606	4,279	167,895	4,698

Source: Ministry of Primary Education. Statistical data 1989 - 1990. p26

Private schooling (Table 3.2), particularly in urban areas has supplemented government built schools. It should be mentioned that, since the 1970s, most primary schools in rural areas were built by the local communities with or without government assistance, through the FRAR (Regional Rural Development Funds) program. Moreover, most housing programs in urban areas have incorporated the creation of one or two primary schools. Despite all these efforts, no matter how substantial they may be, it has not been possible to meet the increasing education needs in a satisfactory manner yet, particularly when it comes to access to the first year. In over-populated sub-urban areas such as Yopougon, Abobo or Koumassi, one class could contain as many as seventy pupils and priority in access to the first year of primary school is given to children between the ages of 8 and 9. The enrollment of children between 6 and 7, as officially recommended, is rare in urban areas due to the shortage of school facilities. Disparities still exist in the supply of primary education facilities between regions and between residential areas in a given city. (Report of "Comité de Suivi" - 1991. p9).

- Teacher supply suffers a lack of appropriate management, planning and coordination. If training has reached a good level over the last seven years, the degree to which the distribution of this body of trained manpower matches the needs and demands of the rural and urban areas as well as those of the regions is to be reappraised. While there is an excess of teachers, mostly women, in urban areas, a number of classrooms in remote rural areas do not have teachers. Key personnel in the Administration are aware of the situation even though, paradoxically, it is not reflected in official reports. Moreover, many of the teachers who teach in private schools are untrained. A more coherent coordination would be of great use to this segment of the system.

- Although the gross and net enrollment of girls has been significant, there is still a great difference when it is compared with the enrollment of boys. This is particularly perceptible in the regions and at all levels of the school ladder. This is due to prevailing cultural beliefs, expectations, individual appreciation of the educational rate of returns particularly for girls and the large number of dropouts. However, in some regions, like the north for example, where the rural-urban exodus is particularly pronounced, there is a tendency to keep young boys at home to help the older men on the farms.

- Internal efficiency is very low. Two main obstacles that hinder the true democratization of primary education are: the limited access to first year and secondary levels. The repetition rate is very high - about 47.3% in 1989 at the national level. Nevertheless, from available data, the disparities in the regions are evident. This is due to the overall pedagogical environment and, to a larger extent, to the limited number of admissions to the first year of the lower secondary level. During the last two years, there has been a tendency, in some public primary schools in Abidjan, to push pupils out systematically after a year of attendance of the last class (CM2). This way, the repetition rate falls while the dropout rate rises considerably.

For the particular urban sector of the educational system, solutions such as increasing an already overcrowded classroom, or increasing the hours of teachers (45 hours/week) seem not only unrealistic but also not feasible. Educational facilities have to be increased both at the post-primary and baseline levels in order to meet growing demand caused mainly by the high fertility rate and migration.

However, the low rate of school attendance observed in the northern and south-western regions of the country require close examination and appropriate solutions as well as the imbalance between boys and girls enrollments.

- Finally, the establishment of educational standards, the relevance and appropriateness of curricula to practical requirements and good performance in the post-primary system should be critical concerns in any attempt to consolidate the Ivorian primary school system. There are evidently many bottlenecks in the system that are worth analyzing.

### 3.3. Constraint Analysis as Related to Primary Education

All the major constraints analyzed in the overview of the education system remain valid for the primary sector and have even worsened in some cases. However, three principal issues affecting this sector and which might determine, to a large extent, its future development need to be analyzed further:

- a. Constraints caused by population growth and the insufficient number of facilities;
- b. Institutional and policy constraints;
- c. Financial constraints.

These constraints will be analyzed in relation to the quality and efficiency of primary education.

#### 3.3.1. Constraints related to demographic growth and the insufficient number of facilities:

It is estimated that the population of Côte d'Ivoire grows at an annual rate of 4.4%. By the year 1992, the population will

be estimated at 13,923,253 inhabitants with a cohort of 2.255.567 primary school age children. This implies, in educational terms, that more facilities, a greater teacher supply and additional investment are needed. The World Bank estimates that such an investment (building and equipment of new classrooms) will cost between 2.395 and 5.939 billion FCFA; accordingly, teachers' salaries will increase from 2.655 to 5.097 billion CFA; operational costs will require an additional 398 to 765 million FCFA. It should be restated that 93.91% of the primary education budget goes into salaries. Under the present circumstances, it is not feasible for the government to provide the above projected financial needs for the adequate expansion of the sector. The shortage of physical facilities will inevitably lead to a greater deterioration in the quality of teaching as has already been experienced in urban areas where, even if it does not appear in official documents, classrooms often contain more than 70 pupils in public schools. It is not certain that without government subsidies, private schools will be able to cope with the growing demand for education. Even if they are able to do so, the cost will be more than most families can afford and the quality of educational output can not be guaranteed due to the poor management of schools and the poor performance of most teachers. The population is likely to continue increasing over the next decade. It is obvious that the "financially tight budgets and the even larger cohort of pupils have starved the education system of essential inputs such as textbooks and facilities maintenance" (World Bank Policy Study, 1988 p.39). Most children, as a result, will never gain access to primary school and the high fertility rate will only lead to the further degradation of the already poor quality and inefficiency of primary education.

Further expansion and the improvement of quality are necessary factors and should be simultaneously undertaken since basic education is a fundamental human right as are other factors such as the opportunity to learn for all children, the availability of good quality programs all over the country and even tertiary education.

Evidently, the issue is not an easy one, particularly in an environment where decision-making is an exclusive process which is quite often perceived by top officials as a risky enterprise.

### 3.3.2. Institutional and Policy Constraints

In Côte d'Ivoire, many ministries, organizations and individuals are involved at various levels, in the establishment and functioning of primary education. However, despite the involvement of this pool of actors, decision-making, policy design and implementation still fall short of expectations. This is due to (1) the mandate of the Primary Education Ministry; (2) the institutional and organizational structure; (3) the competence and autonomy of managerial personnel at the ministry level, headmasters, inspectors etc.; and (4) the degree of integration between the structures and organizations involved and their effective participation in the whole process, mainly that of decision-making, priority area determination, resources allocation etc...

It is not possible, given the context and methodology of the study, to pinpoint which of the four above factors has the most significant effect on the current situation. In the present system, all decisions are made at the ministerial level and it is not clear how inputs from the local community and other factors are taken into account. It is also not clear, neither

from official documents nor from its daily activities despite its detachment from the other ministries in charge of various segments of the education system, what the specific mandate of primary education ministry is, what national goals and strategies have been set and how regional officers and inspectors fit into the management scheme.

If the aim of creating a Ministry of Primary Education was the improvement of the quality of school administration and teaching in order to strengthen this sector, then policies related to considerations such as the effective supervision of teachers, planning, financial and human resource management, the information system, the high drop-out and repetition rates, limited budgets, declining enrollment etc., should have followed.

From available documents, and on the account of existing and officially acknowledged problems such as deteriorating quality, it is not apparent whether any measures or policies have been formulated to tackle these problems and, if so, whether these measures and policies are being enforced or whether they are appropriate or accurate.

The system is in dire need of an effective and participatory decision-making structure. At the same time, policy statements in order to be relevant, require a clear definition of current areas of fundamental educational sub-concerns. A highly-centralized decision-making system only means isolation from new prospects, low staff morale, low public confidence and poor policy implementations towards education leadership. For its own credibility and as a prime responsibility, the Ministry should seek to provide solutions to specific prevailing problems and not put finance before policy even though the search for sustained financial viability remains a priority task.

### 3.3.3. Financial constraints

Finance has always been presented, in the public administration, as the missing means, the reason for all inaction. Unlike in past years, the budget amount has, in general, been considerably reduced even though this reduction has been much more drastic in the primary education sector which has always been marginalized both in public expenditure and in the allocation of donors' aid.

Given the current difficulties, future enrollment trends and related additional investments facing the primary education sector, on the one hand, and the imposed restrictions due to the stabilization program on the other hand, it is neither realistic nor feasible to increase the share of education in the country's budget. Moreover, the purchasing power of each family has declined considerably and the majority of both the rural and urban low and middle income populations can no longer afford private schools for their children. Until now, greater reliance on government funding has prevailed but the continuous sharp fall in the market prices of coffee and cocoa has led to a drastic reduction in public investment and to greater poverty. Thus, the question arises whether education should remain a warranted budgetary priority or if its primary component should specifically be allocated a greater share by shifting part of secondary and tertiary education budgets.

National sustainability is, therefore, the challenge of the 1990s. The question is how to meet this challenge under present circumstances?

### 3.4. Concluding Remarks

The history of Côte d'Ivoire's education, over the last thirty years, has been one of chaotic success. The main lesson that

can be learnt from Côte d'Ivoire's experience is that the institution remains locked in the policies of earlier decades. If alternatives are to be sought and converted into real opportunities for self-sustained development, then forward-looking policies need to be formulated rather than belated corrections of past mistakes. Again, if the modest success of the '60s and late 70s is to be recovered, the Structural Adjustment Programs (SAP) will not be enough to put a stop to past practices and educational philosophy and management. No matter how legitimate the goals may seem, the implications of the SAP such as further financial and budgetary restrictions, impoverishment of urban and rural populations, obsolescence of industrial activities and their related effects on employment, need to be weighed and their impact on educational policy needs to be clearly addressed.

In the absence of a healthy financial environment and firm economic policies, worse setbacks could yet emerge despite the present political activism. In this sense, and according to economic forecasts, the Côte d'Ivoire of the 1990s will remain for a while, perched on a knife's edge. In this context, educational achievements will continue to fall short in comparison to the needs of the increasing school-age population. Also, since the government is concerned with meeting IMF requirements regarding managing deficits, arresting inflationary trends, reducing or maintaining foreign debts at present levels, maintaining the balance between government revenue and expenditure etc., designing major education plans may not be a major preoccupation particularly at this time of political and economic turmoils. Thus, the implementation of any educational plan depends, first of all, on the willingness to reform and secondly, on the ability to raise the needed financial and human resources.

According to present estimations, maintaining the recurrent budget at its present level and/or investing further to meet unavoidable educational needs is a real dilemma given the considerable and urgent needs of other vital development sectors (agriculture, health, etc.). Furthermore, reductions in public expenditure at all levels of the education system, particularly teachers' salaries, subsidies to private schools, and grants may have little effect internally but will inevitably lead to social disorder. Thus, achieving an adequate level of growth in the education sector as well as good quality and efficient training programs, in the near future, will certainly require more than a convergence of public and private sector initiatives. Nevertheless, the prospect of educational change, which is likely to provide some basis for optimism, will heavily depend on the formulation of forward-looking policies and external assistance.

#### IV. OPPORTUNITIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHANGE

The formulation of a change strategy cannot be postponed any longer in view of the urgency of the prevailing situation.

Yet, making proposals for survival appears to be an extremely difficult task not only due to the fact that forecasting is very often a purely hypothetical exercise but mainly because of the appalling absence of sound data and a national plan of action. In addition, the implementation of policies has, in the past, been extremely slow (the Education Reform Program of 1977) and the degree of political commitment or eagerness for change seems far less than it should normally be.

However, coherent policies and measures must be central features of any attempt to solve the global crisis. With regards to the educational system, policy recommendations must take into account the shortcomings and requirements for future social development.

What recommendations can be made regarding future government actions and external donor assistance?

##### 4.1. Opportunities for Educational Change in Present Context

The opportunities together with contingency factors have to do with the following:

First of all, with the appointment of a new governmental cabinet, composed of skilled technocrats who are highly committed to change, mostly in the realm of administrative and financial management. In that regard, the clarification of each ministry's assignments, goals and the definition of

specific tasks and objectives is an innovation in the government's working style and a promising sign in the management of schools.

Secondly, although the Structural Adjustment Programs have resulted in a heavy social burden, they, nonetheless, have the merit of showing that the era of waste and misutilization of public funds is over and that precise objectives and appropriate strategies are prerequisites for an effective undertaking. A successful short-term program-based budget would nurture and increase the capacity for designing sound, coherent long-term integrated programs and pinpoint related costs and social dividends. Thus, despite the high social cost involved, the design and implementation of structural adjustment programs need to be considered both as a means of improving management and planning practices and as an opportunity to learn.

Thirdly, support from donor agencies to specific segments of the system is possible and should be encouraged. However, internal efforts should not be reduced to the mere implementation of such programs. No matter how important they are, they should be evaluated and implemented on a periodic basis in terms of program and project relevance and in light of the national education action plan. By so doing, they can be geared to priority fields of action in the country, duplication of activities can be avoided and better coordination and coverage ensured.

Finally, the greatest opportunity today is the government's desire to renounce its "laissez-faire" attitude that has characterized public administrative management so as to secure external credibility and high internal performance. This type of innovative management requires that a decentralization

objective be established methodically and effectively for greater local control and supervision.

#### 4.2. Policy Issues: Educational Areas of Social Concerns

There is dire need to transform the education system to meet present and future development requirements; especially the basic education level so as to guarantee a quality learning and increase the likelihood of performing adequately in the secondary system. Two (2) main lines of change are perceptible in the work of the "Comité de Suivi" which has constituted the basis of the World Bank's document:

- 1) To increase enrollment up to 90% by the year 2000. This will obviously require, especially on the urban centers, construction of new classrooms, rehabilitation of old ones and introduction of a double-shift system. In addition, in order to cope with social and cultural resistance, the overwhelming lack of motivation, lack of trust in school capacity for social mobility apparent in the low rate of enrollment in some regions of the country and also in the sharp drop of rate of attendance experienced over the last five (5) years, solutions must be found.
- 2) To improve the quality of the learning/teaching process. This objective is appraised in terms of adequate supply of pedagogical inputs, books, training and in-service of teachers and the revision of textbooks.
- 3) To promote greater access to the various steps of the education ladder and singularly at the primary level.

In order to incorporate these concerns into a national plan of action and concretize them efficiently through the use of resources that are available locally and through international organizations assistance, the following considerations must be set as prerequisites in the definition of what could be the major tasks and strategic measures to improve basic education quality.

4.2.1. Main objectives of action and basic strategic principles of action

Under present circumstances, the priority actions of the government should include but not be limited to the following:

- The design of a national education action plan;
- The improvement of internal efficiency, administration, equity and access;
- Community participation in school expansion, supervision and control;
- Cost containment and quality improvement;
- The rationalization of the subsidy program to private schools;
- The optimization of cost-effectiveness in educational project design and implementation; and
- The provision of incentives for upgrading the teaching personnel.

In order to effectively pursue these objectives in such a way as to link education to the development process, government strategies should be guided by the following principles:

- Priority to government activities aimed at improving the management capacity of institutions and schools to undertake effective autonomous actions in their environment rather than activities where the government takes it upon itself to solve such problems alone.
- High selectivity in education activities so as to concentrate scarce resources in strategic domains rather than in a broad array of programs which very often do not have any significant bearing on the particular situations.
- Emphasis on activities aimed at strengthening the internal capacity of the Ministries and central and regional directorates to independently identify, define and deal with challenges, problems and priorities peculiar to each situation; this will lessen the reliance on governmental hierarchy. This could be a first step toward the regionalization in programming and implementation.
- Systematic and periodic assessments of the impact of educational programs and projects;
- Greater involvement of local expertise in the design and implementation process as well as in the valorization of the results of research, technical reviews and frequent workshops associated with education issues.
- Greater use of a programmed approach to planning in order to focus available scarce financial resources on key objectives.

What recommendations could then be made in terms of future government policies concerning external donor assistance?

Observations and suggestions in Table 4.1 focus on what should be considered as desirable areas of emphasis and priority lines of action.

#### 4.3: Possible Areas of Assistance

It would have been of great interest to give a succinct outline of the impact of past external support to the Ivorian educational system, new targeted domains of development and official strategies and options and related achievement. As mentioned earlier in this report, there is no available data on that aspect neither is there a strategic action plan; all these situations do not allow for a clear vision of where external assistance is badly needed. However, from various reports, in particular the World Bank study, the MENRS' "Etats Généraux" and the draft policy paper of the "Committee on Human Resources", three (3) educational areas (see below) appear of critical concerns in the short term:

- the expansion of basic education physical facilities to meet population growth and related educational demands. In this context, although focus might be put on urban areas, some rural settings should be given equal importance because of the low level of educational services delivery.
  
- the improvement of the quality of instruction: This issue is twofold: on the one hand, it implies an increase in program quality, and on the other hand, an improvement in teaching performance and relevance. Besides training, new pedagogical technologies and innovations as well as a

systematic monitoring and evaluation should be envisioned to cope with the rampant inefficiency at all levels of the system.

- Planning, Administration and Supervision: The lack of coordination, the absence of institutional incentives, the misuse of trained personnel and the form of allocation of financial resources constitute serious impediments to the productive and effective management of the sector. In the absence of an information management system, the rote administrative style has stifled initiatives, innovations and the promptitude in dealing with generic and specific everlasting problems. From the central directorate level right down to the regional office and to the inspectorate levels, the system operates in a centralized and exclusive manner particularly when it comes to decision-making.

The point here is that it involves more than a simple reexamination of the process of coordination among various units of the Ministry of Education and the public and private sectors, it also involves pointing out the need for an efficient use of financial and human resources. This has to do with the institutional capacity to plan ahead and foster initiatives and innovative tasks. Finally, it also involves a quest for sustainability in order to achieve sequential goals and objectives and also, to secure and amplify results achieved by prior plans, programs and projects. In this respect, the need for school administration and teacher supervision becomes critical in any attempt to create a stimulating learning environment.

The action agenda described above is an impressive one which cannot be implemented either by mere government statements regarding its intentions or by receiving external financial assistance. Instead, what is required of the government and

donors is relevant and decisive commitments and coordinated efforts in terms of policy reform, the building of a consistent, rigorous capacity to design and implement these strategic activities likely to improve the quality and efficiency of the education system which, in turn, is expected to ensure the sustainability of the overall development process underway.

17/11

Fundamental social concerns	Sub-concerns	Sub-sub-concerns	Agenda for possible actions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Cognitive achievement</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Improvement in learning results</li><li>- Improvement in teaching conditions</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Better learning environment adequate supply and delivery of learning materials</li><li>- Growth in scientific and creative activities</li><li>- Evaluation and monitoring</li><li>- Fairness in examination and improving academic standards</li><li>- Greater performance and sense of competitiveness</li><li>- Incentives for outstanding innovative accomplishments</li></ul>
Finance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Cost containment</li><li>- Increasing recession and conditionalities of external loans</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Personnel cost</li><li>- Unit cost of training</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Reduce governmental hiring of expensive technical assistance personnel and excessive expenditures</li><li>- Reduce repetition rate</li><li>- Provision of low cost textbooks</li><li>- Shift slightly emphasis from higher, secondary education to basic education in budget allocation</li><li>- Search external funding</li><li>- Cost-sharing (both state and local communities)</li><li>- Reduce governments subsidies to private schools</li></ul>

Fundamental social concerns	Sub-concerns	Sub-sub-concerns	Agenda for possible actions
<p>Planning and management</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Improve management performance</li>   <li>- Strengthen national capacity for policy planning and implementation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Greater community participation in school administration</li>   <li>- Decentralization of decision-making structures at regional and inspectorate levels</li>   <li>- Policy analysis and assessment</li>   <li>- Shorten delay of implementation and foster relevancy of specific policy package</li>   <li>- Administration/supervision share of responsibility and coordination</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Support for regional communities initiatives</li>   <li>- Greater autonomy in the provision of school facilities and equipment and authority of control in the allocation of resources</li>   <li>- Practical mechanism for true consultations. More opportunity for public debate; involvement in formulation of educational strategies</li>   <li>- Strengthen manpower planning and the efficient use of already trained specialists</li>   <li>- Set national and regional commissions and appoint technical staff to overview and reinforce these commissions</li>   <li>- Change prevailing education philosophy and planning</li> </ul>

2/11

2/17/77

social concerns	Sub-concerns	Sub-sub-concerns	Agenda for possible actions
Access	- Enrollment ratios by age group	- Increased class size (70- 100) despite overall enrollment stagnation and decline - High rates (4.4%) of demographic growth	- Improvement of existing structures and equipment - Construction of new classrooms
	- Equality of learning opportunities (sex, region)	- Facilities shortage - Low level of primary and secondary schools entrance	- Pedagogic equipment supply - Delivery of educational services
Efficiency	- Quality of instruction	- Quality of teaching - Optional use of teachers skills and time - Effectiveness of supervision (300-500 for one inspector)	- More opportunities for in-service professional training - Reduce rate of dropouts and repetitions - Improvement of supervision system - Development of awareness and attitude to performance teaching - Reduction of class size to an optimum of 40 - Increase the number of inspectors - Availability of new technologies and incentives for innovative pedagogical practices

**CONCLUSION:** Côte d'Ivoire after three decades of educational practice: Success and failures:

It is usually admitted that education is the driving force behind individual mobility and social progress. Yet, Côte d'Ivoire does not seem to have achieved a real and meaningful socio-economic transformation as a result of its considerable investment in education.

The prevailing system clearly illustrates the existence of many shortcomings like falling quality, high dropout rate, low social dividends, etc.

Success refers mainly to the quantitative growth of school facilities, student enrollment, the diversification and vocationalization of training components, the number of highly trained personnel and, to a certain extent, the degree of self-sufficiency in teacher supply. However, the contribution of education to development still remains unsatisfactory.

Over the past thirty years, Côte d'Ivoire has achieved some undeniable progress in providing its population with education (mainly formal).

The school infrastructure that has been built has made it possible to achieve a high enrollment rate among the school age population. Although, illiteracy has not been eradicated, attendance at all levels of the education ladder has increased considerably.

However, these achievements which are very often presented by local decision-makers as an illustration of the government's commitment to meet the society's vital needs and its awareness of the importance of education in the process of national

development remains short of meeting the real needs of Côte d'Ivoire. One is left with the impression that the institution has not adequately achieved its set goals and objectives, or that it has not been managed as the cornerstone of a sustainable development strategy. Difficulties in access, the high rates of repetitions and dropouts, the increasing unemployment of skilled, costly trained specialists as well as the call for an action plan for Basic Education" or an "Education for All" indicate clearly that the challenge of the early days of independence still talks: That is "The enrollment of not only the entire school age population in school but actually receives an education, masters what is taught, acquires the basic knowledge indispensable to the full flowering of the individual and of society, and finally completes the period of compulsory schooling decreed by each country". This still appears as an unfulfilled dream.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

World Bank	The Côte d'Ivoire in transition from structural adjustment to self-sustained growth. Vol. II, Report No. 6051-ivc, March 1987.
World Bank	Côte d'Ivoire: Document de travail sur les Ressources Humaines. Rapport N° 7587-ivc, Janvier 1989.
World Bank	Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies for Adjustment, Revitalization and Expansion. A World Bank Policy Study, January 1988.
Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Recherche Scientifique	Etats Généraux de l'Education et de la Recherche Scientifique: Synthèse des travaux, Avril 1985.
"	Bilan Diagnostic du Système Educatif 1981-1984, Octobre 1984. Document préparatoire au plan quinquenal 1985-1990.
Ministère de l'Enseignement Primaire	Statistiques: Année scolaire 1989-1990
SYNARES (Syndicat National de la Recherche et de l'Enseignement Supérieur)	Memorandum sur l'education, l'enseignement et la recherche scientifique en Côte d'Ivoire, Abidjan, Mai 1985.
"	Evolution de la Situation Générale en Côte d'Ivoire de 1960 à 1990: Données chiffrées, Rapport de la Commission "Politique de l'Education et de la Recherche" au 9e Congrès du PDCI-RDA, Octobre 1990.

UNDP	Coopération au Développement. Côte d'Ivoire Rapport 1987 - Juillet 1988
UNDP	Coopération au Développement. Côte d'Ivoire Rapport 1989 - Mars 1991
Ministère de l'Education Nationale	Programme de Valorisation des Ressources Humaines. Planification, Programmation, Budgétisation dans le secteur de l'éducation. Rapport du Comité de Suivi sur la Valorisation des Ressources Humaines - Juin 1991