

PN-ABL-106 76823



GENDER RELEVANT FINDINGS: SYNTHESIS REPORT



Women in Development Action Group
Bureau for Research and Development
U.S. Agency for International Development
Washington D.C. 20523
June 1992

GENDER RELEVANT FINDINGS:

SYNTHESIS REPORT

**Women in Development
Action Group**

**Bureau for Research and Development
U.S. Agency for International Development
Washington, D.C. 20523
June 1992**

R&D WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT ACTION GROUP

R&D Women in Development Action Group Principals

Eric Chetwynd (Co-Chair)
Fern Finley
Bernadette Bundy
Joyce Turk
Shirley Toth
Genease Pettigrew
Patricia Bekele
Sawon Hong
William Miner

Mary Fran Freedman (Co-Chair)
Ron Grosz
Edward Lijewski
Gloria Steele
Nora Berwick
Susan Anthony
Colleen Allen
Nancy Johnson
James Hoxeng

R&D Women in Development Action Group Alternates

Vincent Cusumano
Pamela Stanbury
Twig Johnson
Frances Davidson
William Ford
Wendy Jackson
Mari Clark

Richard Pelczar
Carolyn Kiser
Krystn Wagner
Thomas Kellermann
Cecilia Woodfill
Ruth Frischer

Other Women in Development Action Group Participants

Brenda Bushouse
Annie Foster
Rosalie Norem
Jenna Luche
Edgar Ariza-Nino

Timothy Seims
Brynn Gaberman
Nancy Diamond
Keith Crawford

Office Directors

David Erbe
James Anderson
Patrick Peterson
James Sullivan
Barbara Rodgers
Samuel Rea
Duff Gillespie

Douglas Sheldon
James Daly
Richard Seifman
Twig Johnson
Eric Chetwynd
Mary Fran Freedman
Ann Van Dusen

Office of the Assistant Administrator

Richard Bissell
Bradshaw Langmaid

Ralph Smuckler
Kathy Blakeslee

The Synthesis Report was prepared for the R&D Bureau by Deborah Caro and Mary Mulhern of the Office of Women in Development's GENESYS Project.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| List of Acronyms | i |
| Forward by the Assistant Administrator | ii |
| Executive Summary | iv |
| Part I -- The Gender Combing Exercise | |
| I. Background | 1 |
| II. Purpose of the Combing Exercise | 1 |
| III. Introduction | 2 |
| Part II -- The Synthesis | |
| IV. Clusters I: Relevance to Programming Cycle | 5 |
| V. Clusters II: Recommendations and Analytical Approach | 12 |
| Part III -- Next Steps | |
| VI. Recommendations for R&D Bureau Strategic Planning | 16 |
| VII. List of Findings and Reports | 18 |
| ANNEXES: | |
| 1. Overview and Summary of R&D Office Presentations | 20 |
| 2. Reference Tables and Background Materials for Synthesis | 53 |
| 3. Cross-Sectoral Implications | 69 |

LIST OF ACRONYMS/TERMS

| | |
|----------|--|
| A.I.D. | U.S. Agency for International Development |
| AA/R&D | Assistant Administrator, R&D/Bureau |
| AFR | Africa Region |
| AIDS | Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome |
| AMIS | Agricultural Marketing Improvement Strategies |
| ARI | Acute Respiratory Infection |
| ATI | Appropriate Technology International |
| CLUSTERS | Analytical framework for grouping findings by common characteristics or outcomes (i.e., Clusters I and II represent broad groupings of smaller clusters) |
| CRSP | Collaborative Research Support Program |
| EPM. | Environmental Planning and Management Project |
| F/FRED | Forestry/Fuelwood Research and Development Project |
| GENESYS | Gender in Economic and Social Systems |
| HH | Head of Household |
| HIV | Human Immunodeficiency Virus |
| IFPRI | International Food Policy Research Institute |
| LAC | Latin America and Caribbean Region |
| NRM | Natural Resource Management |
| PIO/T | Project Implementation Order/Technical Services |
| R&D | Bureau for Research and Development, Agency for International Development |
| R&D/WID | Office of Women in Development, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/AGR | Office of Agriculture, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/EID | Office of Economic and Institutional Development, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/ED | Office of Education, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/EIN | Office of Energy, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/ENR | Office of Environment and Natural Resources, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/H | Office of Health, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/OIT | Office of International Training, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/N | Office of Nutrition, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/POP | Office of Population, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/R | Office of Research, R&D Bureau |
| R&D/UC | Agency Center for University Cooperation in Development, R&D Bureau |
| WASH | Water and Sanitation Project |
| WID | Women in Development |
| WIDAG | Women in Development Action Group |

FORWARD BY THE ASSISTANT ADMINISTRATOR

This report captures the results of a campaign in the Research and Development Bureau to strengthen its Gender and Women in Development strategy and to provide the substantive basis for the technical offices to develop their own strategies. The process involved each office in the R&D Bureau and was led by the Bureau's Women in Development Action Group (the membership of which appears on the back of the cover page).

Combing through the gender and WID specific research findings -- as well as development experiences of each office -- produced an array of sectoral and cross-sectoral findings that exceeded my expectations. We now have an excellent basis for moving ahead with office level strategies. As anticipated, both our strengths and shortcomings were revealed such that we were able to emerge with a R&D Bureau Gender and WID strategy. The essence of that strategy is contained in the recommendations of this report, all of which have been adopted.

Drawing on the guidance of our Women in Development Action Group (WIDAG) and the expertise and resources of the Office of Women in Development (R&D/WID), the Bureau will push ahead with the implementation of our program. However, we do not regard current plans as set in concrete. We see ourselves as having reached a higher threshold than we were on before we started to take a closer look at the gender and WID substance of our research and action. Working with this knowledge and continuing to examine both the sectoral and cross-sectoral or cross-cutting implications of new findings and lessons, we are confident that we can continue to improve.

I am struck also by the potential utility of our findings to others in A.I.D. working in the same sectors as R&D or in multi-sectoral programs. I hesitate to make too much of this because this report is the product of an effort to get our own Bureau's "ducks in a row" on the gender and WID issue. However, the programs of the R&D Bureau, by their nature and design, parallel and support the programs of A.I.D. field Missions. Many of the findings reported here are the result of collaboration in the field with Missions. The cross-sectoral analysis we have done may have produced insights useful to the more integrated nature of some Mission programs where multiple sectoral approaches mutually reinforce a singular goal or policy objective.

We would welcome feedback from those outside of the R&D Bureau who find this report useful or who wish to critique it in some specific respect. We are interested also in information from the field that would strengthen or call into question specific findings or lessons contained in this report.

As a guide to readers outside R&D, I would suggest a careful review of the Executive Summary, the outline of the paper on page 4 and the conclusions to each of the major

sections of Part II -- The Synthesis. The "List of Findings and Reports" at the end of the main text of the report is instructive and offers a quick overview of sector-by-sector findings. The Annex, "Overview of R&D Office Presentations", contains the raw data by Office that is the basis for the report. It is to this section that those interested in specific findings by sector should turn for detail and references.

This report was produced for the R&D Bureau by the GENESYS Project of the Office of Women in Development under a matching fund arrangement. Its principal authors were Deborah Caro and Mary Mulhern of The Futures Group. They were assisted by Brenda Bushouse of the R&D Bureau's Office of Economic and Institutional Development. Deborah Caro facilitated the synthesis sessions that were so important in reaching our final set of conclusions and recommendations.

Once again, I want to stress both my pleasure in the richness of our findings but at the same time caution that they just bring us to a new threshold of understanding. Some findings can be the basis for action. Some should be seen as tentative and the basis for further experimentation or research. Others clearly are ripe for challenge. We hope you find this report useful and welcome your comments.

Richard E. Bissell
Assistant Administrator
Bureau for Research and Development

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This document synthesizes a series of office-by-office exercises in R&D intended to identify gender relevant findings and lessons learned. It was dubbed the "combing exercise" because each office combed through its current portfolio of development activities to see what could be "uncovered" as significant in the field of gender issues in development. It is based on a series of proactive actions being taken by R&D and its Women in Development Action Group and forms the foundation for developing office-level strategies. It also provides portfolio-specific examples of the role gender plays as a critical development variable. It can be used to enhance A.I.D.'s ongoing dialogue both within and outside the Agency on gender considerations in development. Some of the findings seem obvious while others describe rather striking examples of gender-sensitive design and analysis. All are intended to corroborate the need to include gender as a legitimate and necessary variable in doing "good development".

PURPOSE OF THE SYNTHESIS REPORT

The purpose of the synthesis report is:

- To identify similarities and differences among findings across R&D Offices
- AND
- To provide some preliminary guidance on how to accelerate the institutionalization of gender considerations within the Bureau and Agency

METHODOLOGY

The task of classifying and synthesizing across offices was quite challenging. Despite the fact that each office followed a fairly standard format for their presentations, the findings themselves ranged from very localized and specific to the global (see Annex 1 of the full report for documentation).

An example of a very specific finding was presented by the Nutrition Office. Data from Kenya and Malawi suggested that household food security and preschooler nutritional status are influenced by the interaction of both income and the gender of the head of household rather than simply by one or the other. The International Food Policy and Research Institute (IFPRI) found that there are distinct differences in income, expenditures, and health status among female-headed households. The research indicates that not only total household income but also the proportion of income controlled by women has a positive impact on household caloric intake and the nutritional status of children. The IFPRI findings suggest that a closer look at the diversity within male and female-headed households is warranted and that targeting exclusively by gender may not be the most effective way to reach poor households or those most at risk.

An example of a more general finding was presented by the Population Office. They

highlighted a basic principle guiding maternal health and family planning programs that women in developing countries are at risk of illness or death from pregnancy, child birth and high fertility rates. Family planning programs significantly reduce these risks.

The Women in Development Action Group (WIDAG) resolved the problem of trying to compare disparate findings by settling on three Clusters that grouped findings by common themes. The process of defining the clusters was a conceptual struggle to group findings that cut across several sectors and types of projects. Three Clusters grouped findings by a particular set of common criteria.

Clusters I: Grouped findings by their relevance to different points in the programming cycle, i.e. whether they provided information or guidance for the identification, design, implementation, or assessment of policies, program, or projects.

Clusters II: Grouped findings according to the implications of or recommendations that emerged from the findings. This grouping provided an analytical framework for how to most appropriately and effectively incorporate gender considerations into projects, programs, and policies.

Clusters III: Grouped findings by types of direct, cross-sectoral implications such that the findings of one office had direct relevance to another sectoral office in the R&D Bureau.

Clusters I and II are discussed in the body of the report. Clusters III is the subject of a more in-depth analysis to be undertaken by the Bureau at a later date (see recommendation number six). The report uses the term "Clusters" I, II, III as macro-groupings of smaller clusters of substantive findings and conclusions.

HIGHLIGHTS OF CLUSTERS I

Clusters I: Clusters I groups findings according to whether they were applicable to the identification, design or evaluation of AID development interventions. These findings were distributed over 3 broad groups:

- INFORMATION BASE: What you need to know
- DESIGN SUBTLETIES: How to integrate gender into design
- NET BENEFITS: Differential outcomes to men and women

The findings in the Information base group either provide information or identify missing information necessary for policy, program, or project design. The findings provide what you need to know in order to identify and design interventions.

Several findings identified the need for gender disaggregated information to better document gender-specific rules of access and management of resources. For instance, research on AIDS revealed that **developing appropriate technologies such as condoms, did not provide equal protection to men and women, despite the supposed gender-neutral physical properties of the technology.** This was due to women's difficulties in controlling whether or not their husbands used condoms. Thus this finding identified a need to collect and analyze gender-specific data on sexual attitudes and behaviors as well as on cultural and social factors that put women at risk despite their knowledge of and access to proven technologies. The information base cluster demonstrates that access to reliable gender disaggregated information seems to be key to facilitating changes in the design and implementation of projects.

The design subtleties grouping, incorporates findings that are related to actual project designs and suggests how to adapt project design to reflect gender differences.

For example, one finding identified the need to address gender-specific constraints such as girls' sibling care responsibilities which limit their access to education. The design subtleties cluster suggests that **project designs should directly address gender specific constraints, focus attention on women's multiple roles, and attempt to introduce innovation within a context of respect for cultural beliefs regarding gender.** These findings are persuasive in arguing for designs that are responsive to changes in all three of these factors -- constraints, multiple roles, and belief systems.

The net benefits group focuses on differential outcomes and effects on men and women of policies, programs, and projects. The findings in this group provided examples of outcomes that were both anticipated and unanticipated or indirect.

Several findings cautioned that **opportunities for realizing increased income might be tempered by the imposition of an additional labor burden which might produce negative lateral effects on women's nutrition or health.** For example, a study of agricultural villages in southern Cameroon found that, with the introduction of a new road to improve market access and a subsequent increase in product prices, women increased the number of hours spent in production for the market by approximately 5 hours to a total of nearly 11 hours -- men devoted a total of only 1 hour toward production for the market. After the road was introduced, **women significantly increased their already long workday while men's response was fairly minimal.** New roads and infrastructure investments in rural areas may have a stronger impact on women than men by substantially expanding women's income earning opportunities. Given women's lengthy workday, however, any intervention must take into account women's time constraints and seek to alleviate an already heavy workload. Interventions should address issues of drudge work so women can focus on other productive activity.

The net benefits cluster demonstrated that the effects of programs and projects is often multidimensional for any one gender. At times, men and women might have competing

interests that are not easily satisfied by an intervention that satisfies only one aspect of those interests.

For instance, information from the Forestry Fuelwood Research and Development (F/FRED) Project revealed that women's access, management activities and priorities are a vital part of tree improvement research. Many cultures have gender-specific rules of access and management for trees and the production priorities of women differ from those of men. Women's managerial functions in subsistence forestry are critical to project success. Community level information on natural resource management (NRM) does not necessarily provide crucial gender-related information unless the data can be disaggregated, analyzed and incorporated into project planning, management, monitoring and evaluation. Both gender and social analysis are relevant to all environment and natural resource (ENR) project/program activities.

LESSONS LEARNED FROM CLUSTERS II

A second way to group the R&D Offices' presentations is according to what kind of recommendations emerge from the findings and what they suggest about how to most effectively and appropriately integrate gender considerations in future research and programming. These clusters were developed more inductively than the previous set. These findings reveal some basic principles on how to approach gender considerations analytically.

The lessons learned from this cluster that cut across the findings and sectors are:

1. **Counting Heads:** A first step for several offices was to account for the relative numbers of men and women participating in their programs. A next step entails identifying opportunities and constraints to increasing participation of women and men in development programs where they have been under-represented.
2. **Integrated Gender Analysis:** When possible, gender considerations should be analyzed in relation to other socioeconomic and cultural variables such as age, ethnicity, class, and race. The findings demonstrate that men and women are not homogeneous social categories and that gender-specific opportunities, constraints, and effects vary according to other socioeconomic factors. Project designs and implementation strategies could benefit from a more contextual analysis of gender. For instance, a Pakistan irrigation project produced evidence suggesting that landless women might be affected differently than women with land and that landless men might have more in common with landless women than with men who own land.
3. **Variable Nature of Gender Relations:** Many findings emphasized the great variability of gender relations over time and advocated for flexible and

participatory designs. Several health, agriculture, environment and education findings stressed the need to respond to those changes with a great deal of alacrity and sensitivity. For example, an Agriculture Office finding highlighted the variability of gender specific roles in aquaculture; in some cases women have assumed formerly male roles. Gender roles are fluid in response to changes in the economic and social environment and program designs must be flexible to respond appropriately.

4. **Interdependent Resource Allocation and Access:** Many projects offered evidence of the interdependent nature of men and women's decision-making and control over resources, even when they had responsibility for different productive and non-productive activities. Therefore while one might target women with veterinary extension services because of their role in livestock production, the accompanying technical recommendations would be most effective if they were based on an understanding of how livestock raising fit into the overall production system.
5. **Multiple Duties and Roles:** Findings from almost all offices stressed the multiplicity of gender-based roles that require attention from the design phase through to the assessment of project outcomes. Research on the nutritional status of children of working mothers in Indonesia, for instance, demonstrated that how women manage these multiple roles can have a significant impact on their children. Children's nutrition was affected more adversely if mothers engaged in work inside rather than outside the home. Mothers who worked in their houses could not afford to spend the time away from their source of income to tend to their children's nutritional needs. In contrast, women who worked outside the home left their children with caretakers who appeared to focus more time and attention on food preparation and feeding of the children in their care. This and similar findings from other offices emphasized that any intervention designed to provide women and men with new opportunities must also address women's and men's collateral roles and responsibilities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Report's recommendations grew out of discussions about how to build on the synthesis process to develop the Bureau's strategy on gender considerations. Following are the elements of the Bureau's plan to achieve Office-level strategies on gender. These elements draw on the body of knowledge accumulated over the past year, starting with the "back of the envelope" assessment and continuing with the gender relevant findings exercise.

1. ***Increase Interactions with Regional Bureaus:*** As a means of stimulating discussion and interest in the Agency in seeking a collective and sustainable approach to institutionalizing attention to gender, WIDAG will collaborate with the WID Regional Officers to arrange a series of meetings to share information about process and substance gleaned from the R&D Gender Combing Exercise.
2. ***Conduct Workshops to Develop Office-level Strategies:*** A more in-depth look at Office portfolios and approaches to gender issues is needed to guide future actions in the Bureau. The WIDAG will arrange planning workshops for each Office, using interactive forums to critique approaches to gender within the Offices and determine how to best incorporate gender into the Office's overall strategy and work plan.
3. ***Train Staff:*** A "training of trainers" will be conducted with the WIDAG members, to enable them to better guide their respective Offices in developing and implementing office-level strategies. Gender analysis training will be incorporated into the current training course for senior management staff entering A.I.D. More efforts will be made to expand current gender analysis training in A.I.D. staff training courses, for example, to a full day (or longer) session.
4. ***Train Contractors:*** Develop requirements for training and certification of contractors working with the R&D Bureau. A requirement of gender analysis training will be included in the PIO/T, contracts, grants and cooperative agreements. The certification will be for a limited time (3-5 years) with a refresher course required for renewal of the certification. The contractor training program will be self-sustaining -- contractors will be charged to attend the training course and should view it as a necessary cost of doing business with the Bureau.
5. ***Increase Attention and Oversight on Project Design:*** Offices will build the gender issue into their project design, dedicating design funds for this purpose as required. A Gender representative (from the funding office) will serve on each centrally funded project design committee to ensure that gender issues are addressed at each stage of the project design process, including the initial

contractor work plan. A representative of the Bureau's WID Action Group will be available to serve as a design consultant to the R&D project manager of each newly designed R&D project.

6. *Assess Cross Cutting Findings in R&D:* Assign a R&D Bureau intern to compare the findings identified as having cross-cutting implications with the general literature on gender issues in each sector.

PART I:

THE WID COMBING EXERCISE

I. BACKGROUND

A "back of the envelope" assessment of the R&D Bureau's portfolio was prepared by the R&D/WID GENESYS project in the spring of 1991. The conclusion of the assessment was that most R&D Offices are proactively engaged in activities which address gender issues, although all Offices are not equally strong in this area. The assessment also concluded that the R&D Bureau is in a good position to positively influence A.I.D. with respect to gender concerns due to its research and field support mandate.

After participating in the Women in Development Action Group (WIDAG) discussion of the assessment results in June 1991, Richard Bissell, AA/R&D circulated a memo to R&D office directors in which he communicated his plans to request office-specific gender strategies. The purpose of the strategies were to, "enhance gender concerns in office activities and to actively support the Agency's commitment to monitor the impact of its efforts."

Following the back of the envelope assessment and Richard Bissell's request for office-level gender strategies, WIDAG arranged a workshop to assist the R&D Bureau in developing and implementing those strategies. Thirty-six R&D representatives participated in the October 1991 Workshop which was designed to:

- ◆ Reach common understandings of what an office gender strategy needs to be and how to get there;
- ◆ Exchange ideas about concrete actions that have been taken or could be taken at the office level to enhance or systematize attention to gender issues.

The two hour session presented techniques for setting strategic objectives with examples from R&D and missions. A round-table discussion followed which resulted in ideas and concrete suggestions.

II. PURPOSE OF THE COMBING EXERCISE

The Office presentations, as synthesized in this paper, are the result of an exercise designed to identify what is known, what needs to be known and what can and should be done to incorporate gender considerations into projects and field support activities in A.I.D. missions. The Office reports generally were based on projects or programs where gender had been considered during the design of at least one component of the project or program. An extension of the exercise in the future might ask why gender was not included in other projects or programs. Some of the findings presented reveal

important implications for the formulation and support of policies and programs. The objective of the presentations was to pull together substantive lessons learned or research findings about gender issues through revisiting a question from the back of the envelope assessment in greater depth. The question stated:

Based on available research results and field support activities, are there any key substantive statements that can be made about gender considerations in your sector? Any particular success stories you care to relate?

Eric Chetwynd, R&D/EID, Chair of the Women in Development Action Group, requested R&D/WID's Gender in Economic and Social Systems (GENESYS) Project staff to provide assistance in pulling together substantive issues learned and research findings about gender issues identified by R&D Offices, synthesizing the findings, and discussing how these findings support Agency priorities on women in development.

R&D Bureau Office representatives met during five sessions held between November 1991 and February 1992 to present key gender-focused findings combed from Office-level portfolios. An average of three Offices per session shared findings in written and oral form with the other offices. The public forum stimulated discussion surrounding both the corroboration and implications of the research findings. Summaries of presentations and discussions by Office are found in *Annex 1*.

III. INTRODUCTION

The purpose of the current synthesis of gender relevant findings in the R&D Bureau is to lay the foundation for developing office level strategies and to enhance A.I.D.'s ongoing dialogue with Congressional staff on gender considerations in development. The exercise was very much of a learning process for all those involved, and this document reflects the dynamic evolution of the combing exercise. The synthesis report attempts to identify similarities and differences among findings across R&D Offices and to provide some preliminary guidance on how to improve and accelerate the institutionalization of gender considerations within the Agency. The groupings and comparisons of office-level findings under specific categories are interpretive. Nevertheless, the different comparative frameworks presented in the report suggest some interesting generalizations about viable strategies for improving project, program and policy performance by incorporating gender considerations into the programming cycle.

One of the limitations to classifying and synthesizing the findings is that each office presented a number of discrete examples which were not comparable. While all offices followed a fairly standard format for presenting their results, the results themselves spanned the very localized and specific to the very global and general. In order to come up with some meaningful groupings across offices, the findings were compared

according to three sets of criteria:

- ◆ By relevance of findings' implications for different points in the programming cycle and whether the findings are primarily significant for policy formulation, program development, or project design;
- ◆ By types of recommendations and analytical approach -- i.e. what the findings imply in terms of how gender considerations can most appropriately and effectively be incorporated into projects, programs, and policies;
- ◆ By types of direct, cross-sectoral implications, such that the finding has direct relevance to another sectoral Office in the R&D Bureau.

The first two groupings are highlighted in the text of the report. They seemed to yield the greatest number of generalizations that could be used to guide programming. The third grouping, in the absence of more information, did not provide as immediate conclusions or trends. It appears in Annex 3 and will be the subject of a more indepth analysis to be undertaken by the Bureau (see recommendation number 6). A comparison of a broader sampling of the Bureau's findings with what is found in the literature on gender and development in each sector has potential to provide useful results that go beyond the first steps taken in this paper.

Methodology:

The report clusters Office-level lessons learned and research findings into similar themes in order to examine the possible implications of the findings for future planning and programming. Following suggestions received during the February 20 WIDAG meeting, the findings were arranged into groups, or "clusters," in order to highlight any possible generalizations and implications for program development and implementation. Given the broad variety of findings presented, these clusters were not easily conceptualized nor were the findings always an exact fit within the clusters. Nevertheless, the WIDAG discussed several "clusterings" in an attempt to draw out generalizations and conclusions; the results of the most interesting clusterings are discussed in Part II of the paper.

The process of defining the clusters was a conceptual struggle to group findings that cut across several sectors and types of projects. The first group of categories, referred to in this report as Clusters I, groups findings according to how they were presented. Several categories emerged, which were then related to stages in the programming cycle. Findings in this section are separated according to whether they are relevant to one (or more) of the following categories: (1) strategy development and the process of gathering background information that precedes program design; (2) project design; and (3)

evaluation and the process of drawing conclusions from past performance or activities to inform future activities. Comparing the findings in this way did not, however, reveal much about what the Bureau should be doing, but rather, commented on how gender had been addressed in the past.

The second group of clusters categorizes findings according to the implications they have for strategy development, based on the type of recommendation or analytical approach. This second group of clusters emerged out of an inductive analysis, whereby after reviewing the findings, several distinctions appeared regarding their implications for developing strategies. The results of this clustering process seemed to have significant possibilities for informing the Bureau about how it has traditionally approached WID and, more importantly, about how it effectively might approach gender issues in the future.

In response to requests from members of the WIDAG, an additional cluster group was added, to identify which findings had implications across sectors. An initial cut at this analysis is included in Annex 3 but is not discussed in the main report. It should form the basis for a separate analysis and report on cross sectoral implications in the R&D Bureau, involving a comprehensive sample of Office portfolios.

Outline of the Paper:

The paper is divided into three parts, beginning with an overview of the motivation for the exercise and the process in *Part I*. *Part II* describes the synthesis of the findings in order to identify common themes and recommendations. Each of the two sections reflects a different attempt at "clustering" the findings to expose commonalities and differences. The sections begin with an explanation of how the cluster headings were arrived at and the purpose of that type of clustering. A description and the results of the clustering follows for each section, describing where the findings fit within the cluster sub-groups. This is accompanied by a discussion of any implications that follow for each section. The reader is referred to Annex 2 for further details of the synthesis and where the individual findings were placed within the clusters.

Part III draws on discussions held at the WIDAG meeting on March 4, 1992 and input volunteered by Group members to outline the suggested next steps for the Bureau in developing its ability to consistently address gender issues.

PART II:

THE SYNTHESIS

IV. CLUSTERS I: RELEVANCE TO PROGRAMMING CYCLE

During the final session of the "Combing Exercise" the WID Office proposed a tentative framework for assessing the significance of individual findings. The grid is really a continuum which classifies findings according to how well they are corroborated by other evidence or similar results within or across regions and sectors, and by whether they have major or minor implications for A.I.D. policies, programs, and projects. The grid provides one tool which R&D Offices might apply in trying to assess how particular findings might form the basis for integrating gender considerations into their office-level action plans.

| | | |
|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Low Corroboration | Low C Minor I | Low C Major I |
| High Corroboration | High C Minor I | High C Major I |
| | Minor Implications | Major Implications |

The grid proved less appropriate for assessing clusters of findings due to the great variability in the degree of corroboration among findings. The grid, however, proved useful in raising questions about implications of the findings and their relevance for different stages of the programming cycle. The findings in Clusters I were grouped according to how the findings were stated in terms of their application to the identification, design, and evaluation of A.I.D. development interventions.

The findings fell into three rather broad groupings, and several of the findings fit into more than one cluster. The three groups are:

1. Information base
2. Design subtleties
3. Net benefits

The grid was also useful in reflecting the extent to which the clustered findings might guide policy, program, and project level decisions. Findings in the Information Base

cluster basically fell into the Policy and Program slots, with a tendency to have implications primarily at a strategic level rather than at a project design level. The type of information contained in these findings was most useful at the beginning stages of the programming cycle to identify, for example, who would be affected by or involved in the development intervention and how. The individual findings from the Design Subtleties cluster typically had implications for project design. Findings from the third cluster, Net Benefits, tended to fit into either the policy or program level, reflecting their importance for determining strategy. These findings may have come out of a project evaluation but the implications were usually for redesign or reconsideration of a policy or program that "produced" the projects.

DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS OF CLUSTERING

This section provides a discussion of what the three clusters used in this grouping indicate about gender issues in the programming cycle. The three clusters, designated as Information Base, Project Design, and Net Benefits (anticipated and unanticipated effects and indirect effects), serve as rough proxies for three parts of the programming cycle, namely, (1) information gathering and strategy development, (2) project design, and (3) evaluation and redesign. These are not discrete categories since ideally the programming cycle operates as a feedback system, using information and analysis from the evaluation stage to inform strategy development and then project design. The clusters reflect that relationship -- a particular finding may fit in more than one cluster and there is considerable overlap among the three clusters. The process of clustering necessarily involves some tradeoffs, and the focus should be not on the individual findings per se, but on what the group *as a whole* can reveal about programming and gender issues. (The corresponding tables for this section can be found in Annex 2, Tables 1-3).

1. Information Base

Many of these findings either provide information or identify missing information necessary for policy formulation, program development or project design. The type of information identified in these research and project implementation findings can be characterized in terms of asymmetry of knowledge held by different genders (e.g., women and men are more or less knowledgeable about different kinds of indigenous forest species) or in terms of differential access to or control of resources (e.g., land rights). Other findings in this cluster identify gender specific behavior or risks.

Rural women may lack the resources or knowledge needed to fully capture income benefits from an intervention or policy. For instance, the conclusion of a forestry support program was that although female participants were nominated by national agencies and donor organizations to attend workshops on gender issues in forestry

management, they were not in a position to act on this new knowledge. They lacked access to the organizational debriefing and information sharing networks that their male counterparts were part of and often were not in a position to make decisions (ENR #1). Other findings also provided information on structural constraints which limit women's economic participation. For instance the Education Office presented evidence that women's ability to increase their productivity through the adoption of new technology may be constrained by their lack of education (ED #4). These examples provide some evidence that simply facilitating women's participation in development activities may not be adequate for ensuring access to potential benefits from these programs.

Women and men in a society may have access to and control different types of knowledge and resources. Several findings point out where understanding gender specific knowledge and practices may be key to project success. For example, women in many cultures have rich knowledge about plants, diverse species and natural resource conditions. The ENR Office's EPM Project stressed the need for policy changes from the "top" to ensure that both women and men have opportunities to build their differential knowledge and skills to gain access to resources and technologies, and to contribute their knowledge and creative energy to resource management (ENR #5). The ENR Office's F/FRED Project also recognized the need for gender-disaggregated information to better document gender-specific rules of access and management of forestry resources (ENR #2). Similarly, research into local beliefs and attitudes by the Nutrition Office's Nutrition Communication Project suggests that culturally specified gender roles within the household with regard to household decision-making patterns and access to resources will influence nutritional outcomes in a household. This information is critical for making adjustments in nutrition project strategies and education (N #3).

Many of the research findings or project results in this cluster identify differential behavior of men and women which may affect the success or orientation of development interventions. It also includes those findings related to gender-specific health risks which result from differences in men and women's behavior and roles. There are instances when women's behavior patterns are identified as distinct from men's. When the behavior is particularly beneficial to achieving the goal of the project, the findings indicate that special efforts should be made to capitalize on and facilitate those behaviors, as demonstrated by two EID Office's Projects which highlighted how women's commerce in and spending on local products in Africa contribute positively to regional rural development (EID #2 and #3). Other findings demonstrate that when the gender-specific behavior is in conflict with development goals, the success of the project will depend on developing strategies and incentives to change the gender-specific behavior and to alleviate gender-specific constraints. For instance, research on AIDS presented by the Health Office revealed that developing appropriate preventive technologies, such as condoms, did not provide equal protection to men and women, despite the supposedly gender-neutral physical properties of the technologies, due to an

imbalance in power relations within the household and the society. Thus there is a need to develop strategies that address gender-specific sexual attitudes and behaviors and cultural and socioeconomic factors that put women at risk of HIV infection (H #1).

Conclusions:

The information cluster suggests the importance of gathering gender-disaggregated data to improve project and program identification and design. The major types of information highlighted in the Office-level findings are information on gender-specific roles, knowledge, access to and control over resources and technology, and behaviors. The findings demonstrate the high degree of variability among men and women's roles in agriculture, spending patterns, trading practices, land tenure systems, literacy and numeracy, training, sexual attitudes and practices, and natural resource management practices, to name a few. Far from providing esoteric socioeconomic knowledge, such information appears to be critical for designing and evaluating the performance of A.I.D. development programs. Based on the findings in this cluster, access to reliable information seems to be key to facilitating changes in the design and implementation of programs and projects.

2. Design Subtleties:

This cluster groups findings that are related to the design of a project. Many provide recommendations on how to adapt project design to gender issues uncovered in a study, project implementation, or evaluation. Others highlight how a project design might differentially impede men and women's access to knowledge, resources, and technology or constrain their participation.

Common factors affecting project design were women's multiple roles in the household and economy, and their multiple uses of resources. Recommendations focused on the need to explicitly analyze the interactions of these roles and uses with regard to a potential project or activity. The AGR Office's Water Management II project in Pakistan emphasized the need to design water systems in accordance with women's multiple roles in agriculture and household production. For example, banks should be designed to accommodate women carrying food and fodder to and from fields and watercourses should be located and constructed so as to allow for multiple uses such as irrigation, laundering clothes, bathing children, and watering livestock (AGR #1). The Health Office corroborated such concerns through findings in the Water and Sanitation Project (WASH) which stressed the importance of incorporating women into the project as water system managers due to their primary roles as water users and as catalysts of change within their rural and urban communities (H #2).

Other findings stressed the importance of addressing gender-specific constraints such as

girls' sibling care responsibilities which limit their access to education (WID #1), or time constraints on urban women as they increasingly move into the informal and formal work force. For example, the EID Office reported findings from the AMIS Project that as urban women in Mali increasingly work outside the home, they are seeking more convenient and expedient foods to prepare which are less nutritious than more traditional coarse grain foods. This implies the need for technologies that reduce the processing time and preparation costs for coarse grains (EID #5). Similarly, according to the Nutrition Office's Weaning Project in Indonesia, women who work at home had less time to devote to their children's nutrition than those mothers who arranged for others to care for their children while they worked outside the home. The study concluded that project design should focus on how to balance work and childcare more effectively when mothers work at home (N #2).

For the most part, the findings presented by R&D Offices indicate that successful projects try to gradually modify or work with traditional roles and cultural beliefs regarding gender rather than ignoring or changing them outright. The AGR Office's Small Ruminant CRSP advocated that if women are providing up to 70% of the farm labor, 70% of the target group should be female, and that the bias that persists in some program designs, that has excluded women in target groups, must be addressed by meeting the needs of female farmers and livestock raisers (AGR #3). The AGR Office's Aquaculture Project's conclusions about project design echo those of the Small Ruminant CRSP and adds the observation that planners cannot assume that gender roles will remain static. It argues for program designs that remain flexible to adapt to changes in women's and men's roles and responsibilities (AGR #4).

A lingering bias against women in certain types of projects inhibits their participation, if not carefully addressed in the design. For instance the EID Office's AMIS Project observes that small scale rural marketing services operated by women contribute to low-cost food availability in remote areas. Restrictive regulations, however, exclude women from participation and make the whole local marketing system less capable of adapting to changing conditions and opportunities (EID #3). Other findings about project design also highlight the need for providing substitute income and for incorporating both men and women into the decision-making process. When an income source is taken away, specific efforts are required to ensure that substitute sources of income are found for women, who may face more severe or different limitations than men. The AGR Office's Water Management II project emphasized the need to develop strategies that assure displaced female laborers of ongoing sources of income (AGR #1). A similar conclusion was reached by the EID/ATI Project. While new technology can replace time consuming food processing techniques, there is also a danger of displacing women from the labor force. Therefore, projects designed to introduce new technologies must consider gender in order to assess differential costs and benefits to men and women (EID #1).

In cases where women are the target of a project, but men are key in the decision-

making process, the findings supported the conclusion that both men and women need to be included in the activity, as in the case of family planning programs which have found that project designs must incorporate both men and women so as to increase men's support for family planning efforts (POP #5). The population findings in general support the conclusion that the incorporation of gender considerations into program design, implementation, and management policies will improve the quality of services provided and will result in greater impact.

Conclusions:

The design cluster suggests that several key elements could be profitably incorporated into project design. Attention to women's multiple roles, for instance, appears to be essential for maximizing benefits and minimizing unanticipated negative lateral effects on women and their households. The findings also suggest that project designs should address gender-specific constraints that might limit access to training or extension services. Finally, the findings under this cluster indicate that successful projects work within or gradually attempt to modify cultural beliefs and roles regarding gender, while recognizing that these roles and beliefs change over time and project designs must be responsive to those changes. This advocates for involving women and men in the design and implementation of projects.

3. Net Benefits

These findings focus on outcomes by suggesting either that the net benefits of a policy, program or project are greater for women than for men or that the effects of the policy, program or project on women are contradictory (to a greater degree than on men), and the net effect is unclear. They include both anticipated and unanticipated effects, as well as indirect effects. For instance, increased income benefits may be lessened by the imposition of additional labor burdens. Other findings in this cluster identify women (or men) as particularly good conduits for achieving a distinct goal, such as child survival or reducing environmental degradation, even when they are not the direct or immediate beneficiaries.

Net benefits might accrue to women either as a consequence of direct targeting, as exemplified by the Education finding that women's literacy and numeracy enhance their access to complementary resources such as land, credit and technology, increasing their productivity in farm and household production (ED #4); or through indirect effects of a policy, as demonstrated by a WID Office finding that there is some evidence that productivity enhancing investments may be equally cost-effective in the long run for employers while offering substantial benefits to female employees (WID #4). These findings, however, neither reveal whether the benefits are gender-specific nor address what constraints must be overcome to achieve the results, such as impediments to

women's access to education, or misperceptions of employers that providing benefits is too costly.

Some of the findings in this cluster demonstrate that while women or men may derive increased benefits from a particular intervention, they may also experience other lateral effects that are less beneficial. For instance, AGR Office's Water Management Project finding highlights that while labor saving irrigation technology may provide some households with increased income, it might displace female agricultural laborers who have limited alternatives for employment (AGR #1). Similarly, a WID Office's Agricultural finding presents evidence that women may be particularly responsive to roads that increase their access to markets and provide them with additional income, but without access to labor saving technology, the net effect may be to increase women's already long workday, thus producing negative health consequences (WID #8).

Not all benefits are direct. Some findings reveal that women are perceived to be particularly well suited as agents or conduits for achieving wider social goals. In these cases, women are the focus of the interventions because of their strategic roles as mothers or resource users, rather than as direct or immediate beneficiaries. For instance, the Health Office's ARI Project finding illustrates how women are targeted as mothers and as health care workers to reduce the incidence of children's death from pneumonia (H #3). The direct benefits to women of increasing child survival, thus lowering fertility rates, are extremely long term. Similarly, several natural resource projects target women because of their roles as resource users. Even though these interventions might lead to sustaining biodiversity, which is a benefit to society as a whole, they do not necessarily benefit women directly. One of the limitations of such approaches is that women might have competing interests or constraints --i.e., although they might be genuinely interested in improving their children's health, women may not control sufficient resources to affect change. Or, a woman might be extremely interested in managing woodlots to assure a steady and accessible supply of fuel, but might be more immediately concerned with the household income her husband derives from logging.

Conclusions:

The net benefits cluster presents some tentative evidence that discerning the net effects of programs and projects by gender is often multidimensional. For instance, certain interventions might offer women increased income earning opportunities while simultaneously adding to women's labor burdens. Women and men might have competing interests that are not easily satisfied by an intervention that targets only one aspect of those interests. Projects and programs could benefit from evaluations that focus on the multiple interests of men and women depending on their various roles and responsibilities.

V. CLUSTERS II: RECOMMENDATIONS AND ANALYTICAL APPROACH

A second way to group the R&D Offices' presentations is according to what kind of recommendations emerge from the findings and what they suggest about how to most effectively and appropriately integrate gender considerations in future research and programming. These clusters were developed more inductively than the previous set. A combing through the findings revealed lessons learned that provided some basic principles on how to approach gender considerations analytically.

DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS OF CLUSTERING

Following is a discussion of how the findings fell within the five clusters used in this grouping, and what they collectively tell us about analytical approaches to gender issues. The five clusters are titled (1) Counting Heads, (2) Integrated Gender Analysis, (3) Variable Nature of Gender Relations, (4) Interdependent Resource Allocation, (5) Access and Power Relations, and (6) Multiple Duties/Roles. As in the first group of clusters, a particular finding may fit in more than one cluster and the division between the five clusters is not as clear as one would like. The process of clustering necessarily involves some tradeoffs, and the focus should be not on the individual findings per se, but on what the group *as a whole* can reveal about how to approach, and perhaps some indication of how gender issues in the Bureau's activities should be approached. (The corresponding table for this section can be found in Annex 2, Table 4)

1. *Counting Heads*

Findings in this cluster generally refer to the number of men and women involved in a project, with little or no discussion of the impact of the program on women relative to men. The findings of the Research and Training Offices fall under this cluster. The presentations of the Office of Research and the University Center focused on how many women researchers relative to men are being funded and how many proposals integrate gender concerns into research problems. The Offices of Energy and International Training addressed the issue of how to better incorporate women into their training programs by eliminating constraints such as limited access to information and rules that bar spousal funding in the same year.

2. *Integrated Gender Analysis*

In some cases, gender outweighs most other socioeconomic factors as a determinant of outcome. Often, however, an outcome is determined by gender in conjunction with other socioeconomic factors, such as income level and employment status. For instance, the Nutrition Office's IFPRI Project determined that income level, household structure,

and gender of the household head, rather than simply one or the other affect children's nutritional status in Kenya (N #1). The AGR Office's Tropsoils Project similarly concluded that a major determinant of research priorities should be the result of a holistic approach that combines detailed gender analysis with other analytical approaches (AGR #2).

These findings either explicitly or implicitly conclude that gender analysis must be an integral part of the larger socioeconomic analysis. Several of these findings demonstrate that gender as a variable cannot be isolated from consideration of other socioeconomic factors. Gender does not stand alone as a determinant of behavior or access to resources. The impact of any project, program, or policy might affect women or men differentially depending on their socioeconomic status, ethnicity, age, or race. For instance, the Pakistan Water Management II Project, reported on by the AGR Office, benefitted landholding families more than laborers. Women in laborer households were at greater risk of losing employment due to labor saving aspects of the new technology (AGR #1). The AGR Office's Bean/Cowpea Project also reported that female-headed households comprise a heterogeneous category and not all suffer from resource constraints (AGR #5). Similar findings were reported by the Offices of EID, Nutrition, and WTD.

3. *Variable Nature of Gender Relations*

The changing nature of gender relations over time is highlighted by findings in this cluster. The sexual division of labor is fluid and responds to changes in the economic and social environment. For instance, findings from the AGR Office's Bean/Cowpea CRSP in Cameroon and Botswana elucidate how the gender division of labor has changed over time in response to labor migration and changes in demand for cash and food crops (AGR # 5). The need to assure that project designs remain sufficiently flexible to accommodate changes in gender relations also is demonstrated by other findings from the Offices of AGR, Health and ENR. The AGR/Aquaculture Project stressed the need for flexible project designs that can adapt to changes in gender relations (AGR #4). The Health Office's WASH Project findings stated that traditional gender roles need not limit women's active roles in changing or improving water systems (H #2).

4. *Interdependent Resource Allocation and Access*

The allocation of and access to resources across gender lines may be interdependent, rather than clear cut. Women and men may have complementary access to resources, as the EID Office's Access II Project findings about land tenure illustrate. Changes from informal tenure to formal land titling may work to the disadvantage of women (and men who are either young or otherwise landless). Therefore data on how individuals become associated with the land, the coping strategies of men and women and how land tenure impacts on those strategies must be collected (EID #4). The

interdependence of men and women with regard to land tenure emphasizes the need to examine gender *relations*, not simply gender differences. Similarly, women and men's decisions about allocation of resources may be made within the larger context of the family and reflect a joint decision-making process that weighs the benefits and costs of competing uses for resources between members of different genders. For example, the AGR Office's Bean/Cowpea CRSP reveals that although women and men in rural Botswana have primary responsibility for agriculture and livestock respectively, decisions reached by men and women in these interrelated spheres are likely to affect household maintenance and reproduction in general (AGR #5).

These findings also recognize the need to look at relations of authority, i.e., those people who exert authority over certain kinds of decisions in relation to those who do not. The people who implement a particular task may not be the same people who have authority over the necessary resources for the task. Separate tasks in an agricultural system may be gender specific but often are not separate spheres of activity; that is, women's and men's tasks on a farm impact and infringe upon each other. For instance the WID Office's Natural Resource finding discusses how women's access to goods and income from forest products tends to diminish as a result of deforestation. The outcome of competing uses for forest products across genders may represent a trade-off in the household whereby the value of the men's use of wood may compete with women's use of trees for other purposes. Decisions may be made with the broader context of power relations within the household and community (WID #5). Similarly, within a family planning program, the need to include men in the process explicitly recognizes that power relations within a family often are a primary factor in the success or failure of family planning efforts (POP #5). The Health Office's HIV Research Project and the Education finding on the link between higher education and declining fertility also recognize that power relations between men and women are a significant factor in determining changes in behavior (H #1 and ED #3).

5. *Multiple Duties and Roles*

Many findings refer to the multiple duties and roles women and men hold in the household, and how this can affect a project's outcome and the degree and type of participation by gender. The EID Office's AMIS (EID #5), the WID Office's girls' education finding (WID #1) and the Nutrition Office's Weaning Food Project (N #2) all emphasize potential conflicts and constraints produced by women's multiple roles as workers in the formal and informal economy, as mothers, and as food preparers. Improving women's access to resources may not be sufficient to ensure benefits for women; the simultaneous introduction of time saving technology may be a prerequisite that allows women to reap net benefits from improved marketing conditions. For instance a WID Office agriculture finding demonstrated how women responded to new economic opportunities provided by a new road by increasing food production to a much greater degree than did men. Their response, which entailed increasing the amount of time spent on agriculture, signified a substantial increase in their already

onerous labor burden (WID #8). Other findings from the EID Office's ATI Project and from the AGR Office's Water Management II Project demonstrate that attempts to alleviate women's domestic burdens through the provision of labor saving technology (EID #1) or a more readily available water source (AGR #1) may compromise women's income sources.

Conclusions:

The lessons learned from this cluster that cut across the findings and sectors are:

1. **Counting Heads:** A first step for several offices was to account for the relative numbers of men and women participating in their programs. A next step entails identifying opportunities and constraints to increasing participation of women and men in development programs where they have been under-represented.
2. **Integrated Gender Analysis:** When possible, gender considerations should be analyzed in relation to other socioeconomic and cultural variables such as age, ethnicity, class, and race. The findings demonstrate men and women are not homogeneous social categories and that gender-specific opportunities, constraints, and effects vary according to other socioeconomic factors. Project designs and implementation strategies could benefit from a more contextual analysis of gender which recognizes, for instance, that landless women might be affected differently than women with land and that landless men might have more in common with landless women than with men who own land.
3. **Variable Nature of Gender Relations:** Many findings emphasized the great variability of gender relations over time and advocated for flexible and participatory designs. Several health, agriculture, environment and education findings stressed the need to respond to those changes with a great deal of alacrity and sensitivity.
4. **Interdependent Resource Allocation and Access:** Many projects offered evidence of the interdependent nature of men and women's decision-making and control over resources, even when they had responsibility for different productive and non-productive activities. Therefore while one might target women with veterinary extension services because of their role in livestock production, the accompanying technical recommendations would be most effective if they were based on an understanding of how livestock raising fit into the overall production system.
5. **Multiple Duties and Roles:** Findings from almost all offices stressed the multiplicity of gender-based roles that require attention from the design phase through to the assessment of project outcomes.

PART III:

NEXT STEPS

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR R&D BUREAU STRATEGIC PLANNING

Following presentations by each R&D Bureau Office, a rough draft of the synthesis paper was presented to the WIDAG representatives during a meeting on March 4, 1992. Comments of participants from that meeting have been summarized below, constituting the Group's recommendations for "next steps" for the Bureau. The outcome of a subsequent meeting with the AA/R&D, Rich Bissell, was a list of definitive recommendations for the Bureau's strategic planning on integrating gender. The recommendations form a multi-pronged approach to institutionalizing gender -- they suggest that all parties involved in the Bureau's work must be targeted and brought into the process in order to succeed. The integrated approach includes working within the Bureau, within the Agency, and within the A.I.D. contractor community.

Following are the elements of the Bureau's plan to achieve Office-level strategies on gender. These elements draw on the body of knowledge accumulated over the past year, starting with the "back of the envelope" assessment and continuing with the combing exercise.

1. ***Increase Interactions with Regional Bureaus:*** As a means of stimulating discussion and interest in the Agency in seeking a collective and sustainable approach to institutionalizing attention to gender, WIDAG will collaborate with the WID Regional Officers to arrange a series of meetings to share information about process and substance gleaned from the R&D WID Combing Exercise.
2. ***Conduct Workshops to Develop Office-level Strategies:*** A more indepth look at Office portfolios and approaches to gender issues is needed to guide future actions in the Bureau. The WIDAG will arrange planning workshops for each Office, using interactive forums to critique approaches to gender within the Offices and determine how to best incorporate gender into the Office's overall strategy and work plan.
3. ***Train Staff:*** A "training of trainers" will be conducted with the WIDAG members, to enable them to better guide their respective Offices in developing and implementing Office-level strategies. Gender analysis training will be incorporated into the current training course for senior management staff entering A.I.D. More efforts will be made to expand current gender analysis training in A.I.D. staff training courses, for example, to a full day (or longer) session.
4. ***Train Contractors:*** Develop requirements for training and certification of contractors working with the R&D Bureau. A requirement of gender analysis training will be included in the PIO/T, contracts, grants and cooperative

agreements. The certification will be for a limited time (3-5 years) with a refresher course required for renewal of the certification. The contractor training program will be self-sustaining -- contractors will be charged to attend the training course and should view it as a necessary cost of doing business with the Bureau.

5. ***Increase Attention and Oversight on Project Design:*** Offices will build the gender issue into their project design, dedicating design funds for this purpose as required. A Gender representative (from the funding office) will serve on each centrally funded project design committee to ensure that gender issues are addressed at each stage of the project design process, including the initial contractor work plan. A representative of the Bureau's WID Action Group will be available to serve as a design consultant to the R&D project manager of each newly designed R&D project.
6. ***Assess Cross Cutting Findings in R&D:*** Assign a R&D Bureau intern to compare the findings identified as having cross-cutting implications with the general literature on gender issues in each sector.

VII. LIST OF FINDINGS AND REPORTS

- AGRICULTURE**
1. Effects of changes in water resources on women's agricultural and household production (Pakistan)
 2. Incorporating human concerns into soil management (Indonesia)
 3. Women as primary caretakers of small ruminants
 4. Women's everyday work in aquaculture systems
 5. Research on gender roles in Bean/Cowpea production (Africa and Latin America)
- HEALTH**
1. Research on women's risks of HIV transmission
 2. Women as users of water systems
 3. Training women to identify pneumonia in children (Nepal)
 4. Appropriate design of maternal health care services
- AGENCY CENTER FOR UNIVERSITY COOPERATION IN DEVELOPMENT**
1. Targeting women in a human resources development center (Bangladesh)
- OFFICE OF INTERNATIONAL TRAINING**
1. Number of female participants in training programs
- RESEARCH**
1. Percentage of female PIs on funded research proposals
- ECONOMIC AND INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT**
1. Technology and effects on rural women (Cameroon, Ghana)
 2. Women spent on local products (rural Kenya)
 3. Women key as buyers at farmgate and dispersed retailers (Africa)
 4. Uncertain effects of land tenure changes (derived access in Africa)
 5. Working women taking short cuts/reducing nutrition (urban Mali)
- EDUCATION**
1. Female literacy, malnutrition and life expectancy
 2. Female education and infant mortality
 3. Female education and fertility
 4. Gains in women's productivity > gains in men's productivity (Africa)
 5. Gender gaps correlated with lower GNP

**ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL
RESOURCES**

1. Poor communication of information on gender in forestry ("women's workshops")
2. Women's knowledge of forestry/species, distinct roles in management (Sri Lanka)
3. Women's role in community key to coastal resource management (Ecuador)
4. Targeting women in biodiversity support program (Kenya, Costa Rica)
5. Supporting women in their roles in NRM (policy and institutional support) (Africa and LAC)
6. Policy and training program to include women's roles in agriculture and fuelwood management

ENERGY

1. Training program -- women are being cut when short of funds

POPULATION

1. Family planning reduces maternal mortality
2. Family planning empowers women and enhances their status
3. Improvements in standard of living, other indirect benefits (Thailand)
4. Female family planning workers more accepted (Asia, LAC)
5. Men must be involved in FP activities

NUTRITION

1. Income and gender of HH head determines nutrition (Kenya, Malawi)
2. Mother's place of employment affects child nutrition (Indonesia)
3. Beliefs and attitudes of women/men re nutrition as priority (Mali)

**WOMEN IN
DEVELOPMENT**

1. Education (demand side - sibling care and low labor market returns)
2. Education (supply side - Pakistan rural schools)
3. PRE (credit approaches)
4. PRE (productivity enhancements in export oriented firms)
5. ENR (income from forest products) (India)
6. ENR (women's groups have vested interest in NRM) (Kenya)
7. Women's roles and benefits from export oriented agroprocessing
8. Women's response to improved marketing conditions (Cameroon)

Total: 45

ANNEX 1

Overview and Summary of Findings Presented

Overview of R&D Office Presentations

The Office presentations in general followed the prescribed format, stating the finding, a short background for the project or research, and the implications or recommendations for programming. The nature of the findings presented varied significantly, however, as discussed in other parts of this report. Appendix 1 contains a full summary of the presentations, with each finding briefly discussed and the implications or recommendations highlighted for easy access. Following is a short overview of the distribution by type of finding.

Cluster Distribution (refers to Part II of the report):

The following shows the distribution of findings in Clusters I and II discussed in Part II of the report. Note that in the first two cluster groupings, some findings were placed in more than one cluster, so the percentages in those clusters add up to more than 100%. All percentages are approximations, as the placing of individual findings into the clusters was a necessarily subjective process given the nature of this exercise.

Clusters I -- Relevance to Programming Cycle:

- o Approximately 42% in the Design Subtleties cluster
- o Approximately 36% in the Net Benefits cluster
- o Approximately 33% in the Information Base cluster

Clusters II -- Recommendations and Analytical Approach:

- o Approximately 29% in the Integrated Gender Analysis cluster
- o Approximately 27% in the Interdependent Resource Allocation cluster
- o Approximately 13% in the Counting Heads cluster
- o Approximately 13% in the Multiple Roles and Duties cluster
- o Approximately 11% in the Variable Gender Relations cluster

WIDAG: OFFICE PRESENTATIONS

| | Page: |
|--------------------------|--------------|
| December 6, 1991 | |
| 1. EID | 23 |
| 2. ED | 26 |
| 3. EIN | 28 |
| January 9, 1992 | |
| 5. AGR | 30 |
| 6. ENR | 32 |
| 7. Research | 36 |
| January 24, 1992 | |
| 8. Nutrition | 37 |
| 9. POP | 39 |
| January 30, 1992 | |
| 10. Health | 42 |
| 11. UC | 44 |
| 12. OIT | 45 |
| February 20, 1992 | |
| 13. WID | 47 |

Following is a summary of each presentation, with a brief description of the principal findings and the related discussion among the group.

December 6, 1991

R&D/EID

Pamela Stanbury led off the planned agenda with a presentation of gender issues learned from a review of selected case studies. The findings presented here are not the only findings to have emerged from the review of EID case studies. Time constraints prevented a comprehensive integration of all findings represented by the EID portfolio. A printed summary was distributed for reference following the presentation. She noted that some important issues and conclusions emerged from the data gathering process for this report:

- There is a need for more gender-related research.
- The findings in the report are regionally focused, that is they are based on the review of African projects.
- There is concern as to how much can be generalized from the study of one or two cases.
- The WID Office is an important spur to activity in the area of gender research.
- Gender research has significant importance for policy planning and project design.

Five principal findings emerged from the EID study of women-focused projects in Africa, including information about new technologies, economic development, agricultural marketing, tenure systems and urban food patterns.

1. **New Technologies:** Research findings from Appropriate Technology International (ATI) suggest that rural women can benefit substantially from the introduction of new labor saving technologies as users, even if they are not owners. New technologies, particularly those that are small in scale, can save labor and time in replacing traditional methods of processing food grains, oils and other materials, thus freeing women for other productive activities. A potential negative impact of the new technologies on women is their displacement from the labor force a consequence of the labor-saving aspects of the technologies.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Consult women in project design
- Distinguish between technology users and technology owners and operators

- Investigate allocation of time and labor
- Consider benefits of group ownership versus individual ownership of technology
- Create financial options for users or manufacturers

2. **Systems Approach to Regional Income and Sustainable Resource Assistance II (SARSA II):** Women can contribute significantly to the cash economy, especially at the local level, spending income from local agriculture and marketing on non-farm goods and services produced within the region. Men tend to have access to more distant and remunerative markets, but spend less of their larger revenues for locally produced goods and services than do women, and thus have a proportionally smaller impact on regional economic development.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Because male and female marketers generate income through different channels, different interventions are often needed to promote their separate activities.
 - Loans need to be tailored to small-scale female entrepreneurs.
 - Because women have a higher propensity to spend earnings locally than men, interventions that increase the returns to women's crops will be important to increasing regional income multiplication effects.
3. **Agricultural Marketing Improvement Strategies (AMIS):** Small scale agricultural marketing enterprises operated by women can contribute to more effective low cost food availability, particularly in more remote and poor areas. Women are more effective than men as small scale buyers and sellers of agricultural production at a local level. They are willing to provide these services under difficult conditions, which higher-level marketing agents (usually men) are unwilling to provide, and thus are able to significantly impact regional agricultural markets. As crop buyers, women traders are likely to dominate buying at the farmgate and in village markets when production is dispersed. Labor-intensive marketing techniques characteristic of small-scale women traders reduce damage and spoilage, increasing food availability. As sales agents, small-scale women retailers are effective in providing services to and collecting supplies of goods from small, poorer villages that produce much of the national food supply, but do not have access to large supermarkets and capital intensive retailers.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Agricultural policy should promote the capacity of small-scale agricultural enterprises.
- Regulatory impediments and restrictions that tend to exclude the participation of small agricultural entrepreneurs, most of whom are women, should be removed.
- Explicit regulatory provisions are needed to ensure that women can sell crops as owners of produce. A current presumption of male ownership of crops and trading activities negatively impacts women in project design and implementation.

4. **Access to Land, Water and Other Natural Resources II (ACCESS II):** Land and other natural resource tenure systems and changes in those systems have differential impacts on men and women. In many countries, women's rights to natural resources are indirect, the result of custom and status within a family, rather than through direct ownership. These rights are extremely important, however, as women have the major responsibility for family food supply. The trend toward modernization of tenure systems through statutory titling of land to individuals negatively affects women, as it limits their ability to use land that has previously been available to them through tradition. As a result, they are either forced to use less desirable and productive lands, or are denied rights to any land at all.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Data collection efforts need to include information on "ownership" of both men's and women's land parcels.
 - Data on how land tenure systems differentially impact men and women should be collected in surveys.
5. **Agricultural Marketing Improvement Strategies (AMIS):** As urban women increasingly work outside the home, they are seeking more convenient and easier foods to prepare, and using fewer traditional and high nutrition course grain foods for household consumption. Course grains require difficult and time-consuming preparation or costly grinding. Rice, which is more costly, is being used increasingly in urban households, since it is sold ready to cook. Additionally, course grains tend to be produced locally, whereas refined grains tend to be imported.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Reduce processing and preparation costs for course grains.
 - Promote dishes that can be prepared quickly and cheaply from processed course grains.
 - Promote better quality and appearance of course grain products.
 - Develop new course grain dishes.
-

R&D/ED

Sam Rea presented the findings of studies on the impact of women's education on a number of development variables. The studies were carried out for R&D/ED by Creative Associates.

1. **Female Literacy, Malnutrition and Life Expectancy:** A more educated mother raises healthier children and can better apply improved hygiene and nutrition. (Barrera 1990, RII 1990)

Implications/Recommendations:

- Mothers' schooling appears to be a determining factor in improved nutrition and in attenuating the effects of poor sanitation and poor water supply.
 - According to the studies, the life expectancy of children increases 1 year for every 10% increase in the schooling of their mothers, above and beyond the effects of per capita income, male educational participation and available health care.
2. **Female Education and Infant Mortality:** Education of females has been identified as an important factor in reducing infant mortality in developing countries.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Estimates suggest that an increase in female gross primary and secondary school enrollment of from 20-70% can be expected to result in a reduction in the infant mortality rates, twenty years later, of nearly 38%.

3. **Female Education and Fertility:** There is a strong correlation between female literacy and fertility rates, with a decrease in fertility rates as women's literacy and schooling increase. *Discussion:* The distinction between "fertility rate" and "fertility" was pointed out; members agreed that clarity of language is important in discussing these findings.

Implications/Recommendations:

- The combined effect of primary and secondary female enrollments appears stronger than that of either lever alone, and most pronounced in interaction with the level of government family planning support.
4. **Female Literacy and Farm Productivity:** Education enhances women's economic productivity on the farm (McGrath 1979). A study of 13 countries indicated that four years of primary school education for women leads to an increase in farm productivity of from 8.7% - 10%. Gains in productivity in some cases were shown to be higher for women than for men. This improvement may be due to the fact that women start from further behind, or may be related to the kind of crops under cultivation by men versus women. *Discussion:* Does women's literacy alone or general education lead to increased farm productivity? If it is education, what type has the most impact?

Implications/Recommendations:

- Literacy, numeracy and cognitive skills increase women's ability to take part in various farm activities and related training programs.
 - Women's literacy and numeracy enhance their access to complementary resources such as land, credit and technology.
5. **Female Education and GNP:** Large gender disparities in education (a large gap between school enrollments for boys and girls) appear to reduce the GNP (Schultz 1991, King 1991).

Implications/Recommendations:

- Investments in the women's schooling encourage a shift in the allocation of women's time toward market work and away from home-based work. Market based work is counted in conventional national income accounts, and hence adds to the reported level of GNP, whereas home-based work does not.
 - Better educated women are more likely to work in wage employment than are less educated women, and so tend to pay more direct and indirect taxes.
-

R&D/EIN

The Energy Office is just beginning to look at gender issues in its programs. Shirley Toth from Energy pointed out that the Office currently tracks the participation of women in training activities. Out of a total of 700 participants trained, 52 were women. A new training RFP will have a line item specifically directed to women. The program will pay all of the costs for female participants in order to encourage their participation.

Other possibilities under consideration are whether there should be special training programs for women in the energy sector. There is a problem identifying women in the sector: not as many women enter the field, a reflection of social mores against women's work in non-traditional employment. The group agreed that women do participate in this sector, and that we need more information about them and their professional development needs. The possibility of a linkage with the Office of International Training (OIT) was suggested.

General Discussion at End of Session:

The general discussion that followed the presentations focused on the linkages between the findings and the Agency's priorities. It was noted that linkages to some priority areas were thin or had not yet emerged, e.g., support for democracy, environment, transnational problems (these have focused on issues such as global warming and narcotics), and business and development partnerships. At the same time, it was observed that there was an issue of democracy with respect to population. This is particularly true in family planning programs, where in some contexts, women need to ask their husbands' permission to use contraception or face official policy which restricts families' freedom to plan for births.

There was general consensus among group members that it was not realistic to look for the same degree of gender impact in all areas. Different areas and programs have different levels of gender concerns. Variables that may also affect gender impact are: levels of staffing, the technical capabilities of staff, and the nature of a specific program within the Agency, not necessarily the area *per se*.

The group agreed that while more information is needed in the areas already reported on, R&D Offices should continue to use existing knowledge to move proactively on gender and women-specific development issues.

January 9, 1992

R&D/AGR

Ed Lijewski presented 5 findings from the Office of Agriculture. The first two findings are not specific to women but are important in terms of gender.

1. **Water Management Processes in Pakistan:** An analysis of gender-related issues in water management in Islamic societies stresses the role women play in agricultural and household production and the importance of taking those activities into account when planning irrigation systems.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Consult women about design or improvement of watercourses in order to accommodate their multiple uses for water sources
 - Conduct longitudinal studies to assess net impact of project on women and men; improvements in watercourses may translate into increased demand for women's household labor and time, e.g., better watercourses meant livestock were now being watered at home by women.
 - Assess degree of displacement of women laborers as a result of projects that improve watercourses; males no longer needed for irrigation system maintenance may be competing with women for other jobs.
 - Expand employment opportunities for rural women beyond agricultural production.
 - Narrow the gender gap in educational achievement to optimize human resources
 - Focus on culturally acceptable transfer of knowledge and information to women regarding livestock production, care and processing of products in recognition of gender specific tasks in agriculture and women's role in agricultural decision-making
2. **TropSoils/Indonesia Project (Soil Management CRSP):** Project success in AG/NRM in this region depends on ensuring that men's and women's participation is commensurate with the role they play in maintaining or sustaining an agricultural system and specific ecosystem. This project showed how to

incorporate human concerns--those of men and women individually and as family units--into soil management. Focus is on a holistic understanding of the factors affecting people's practice of agriculture, which is built in part on the results of detailed gender analysis. *Discussion:* Project implementors had good instincts both on technical and social issues; project success was due to a good analysis of key variables. Many of these findings do not focus exclusively on women, but they are all based on gender analysis.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Take a total project approach that integrates gender in the analysis

3. **Small Ruminant CRSP:** Women are the primary caretakers of small ruminants in developing countries. Women who manage small ruminant enterprises are empowered as agribusiness entrepreneurs. *Discussion:* Gender issues are not always addressed in small ruminant related projects, regardless of the fact that we do know how to respond to the gender issues in these projects.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Women are the dominant gender in small scale farm production.
- Providing 70% of total farm labor (agricultural and household), women should be 70% of target group in an agricultural project.
- Research and extension activities have a lingering bias against women farmers.
- We cannot assume that male head of household is farm manager and major contributor to small scale agricultural production.

4. **Aquaculture:** Gender specific roles in aquaculture are not very well defined; in some cases women have assumed many of the men's responsibilities (gender roles have changed over time). Early aquaculture projects targeted extension towards men. Later analysis highlighted women's roles in everyday work like feeding and fertilizing as well as marketing.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Specify women's and men's roles in capture fisheries and agriculture/aquaculture in program design stage
- Need components directed to men and women, both separately and combined

- Gender roles are fluid in response to changes in the economic and social environment; program designs must be flexible

5. **Bean/Cowpea CRSP:** Women play central roles in bean and cowpea production; in general women spend more time in food production than men; and have highly variable roles in agriculture, depending on the interaction of local level historical and sociocultural variables and national and international political and economic processes. *Discussion:* No specific research was done about whether women benefit from off-season horticultural products but we expect that they do benefit. We need more examples of what works with respect to integrating gender issues in projects and programs.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Gender analysis should be undertaken within the context of other social science analysis, e.g., locate the household in its larger social context to understand gender roles
 - Differentiate roles/impact by gender and class
-

R&D/ENR:

Nora Berwick and Nancy Diamond from the ENR Office presented gender relevant findings from 6 projects in this session, noting that there are bits and pieces of information but that we still lack conclusions and firm examples. A general suggestion at the end of the session pointed out (1) the need to identify those findings with universal application, and (2) the need to know what does not work.

1. **Forestry Resources Management II (FSP) Project:** A series of national level workshops for field personnel focused on making projects more accessible to women and integrating women into projects as active participants. The organizations involved did not necessarily learn much from the workshops because their female representatives often had poor access to their organizations' information-sharing networks. Further, the lessons learned from successful projects often are not available in the form of simple operational guides or in a manner relevant to the daily activities of field personnel.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Educate key people through relevant workshops and publications about gender-related issues. Send representatives who are well-linked to their organization's information-sharing networks and better able to influence organization policy on gender issues.
- Reinforce workshop lessons by disseminating practical, field-based operational guides on gender issues related to NRM, particularly those aspects relevant to daily project activities.

2. **Forestry Fuelwood Research and Development (F/FRED) Project:** Women's access, management activities and priorities are a vital part of tree improvement research. Many cultures have gender-specific rules of access and management for trees. In Sri Lanka, for example, it has been found that 60-88% of the species in homegardens are selected, tended and managed by women; the production priorities of women differ from those of men; and almost 75% of the work in homegardens is done by women. Women's managerial functions in subsistence forestry are critical to project success: failing to consult women on their knowledge of indigenous species and their uses can lead to making decisions that may endanger the tree species and the environment in which they are maintained by women's labor and energy. Community level information on NRM does not necessarily provide crucial gender-related information unless the data can be disaggregated, analyzed and incorporated into project planning, management, monitoring and evaluation. Both gender and social analysis are relevant to all ENR project/program activities.

Implications/Recommendations:

- The F/FRED FVF data and other such large and complex data sets can and should be disaggregated by gender; the information must then be analyzed and incorporated into the project cycle.
- There is a great need to explore further the crucial role of women in small-farm production systems to ensure protection of indigenous species and the environment in which they exist.
- In any program that promotes tree improvement for and tree growing by small-farmers, women, the local forest-management experts, need to be consulted during the project design phase and should be considered part and parcel of MPTS extension efforts.
- Data on gender alone is not likely to identify other important sociological

variables; gender should be analyzed in conjunction with other relevant socioeconomic information in order to yield valid information.

3. **Coastal Resources Management Project (CRM):** Although the projects/programs which promote the sustainable management of coastal resources often require community organizing, these efforts can still fail to identify relevant and critical gender-related issues at the local level. Women and men use different coastal resources and vary in their access to those resources. Although the CRM project has a strong emphasis on local community participation, their work plans to date have not specified the identification of key gender-related issues related to women's participation in project decision-making, activities, organizations or benefit distribution. In Ecuador, there is increasing anecdotal evidence that targeting women for education programs and community activities is effective in building the community structure essential for meaningful coastal management. *Discussion:* This project has been involving women all along. There is considerable anecdotal evidence, but we still lack systematic evaluation of the differences between involving men and women in the project (e.g., how to get them involved and any differences in results).

Implications/Recommendations:

- Professional women's management roles and approach to project implementation were different than (and in some cases, appeared to get more results) their male counterparts. There appear to be implications for the participation or lack of participation of women in the project cycle but these issues have not yet been systematically examined.
 - Work needs to begin to systematically track beneficiaries of field efforts and the impacts on women as a group need to be looked at.
 - The data must be collected, disaggregated, analyzed and incorporated into the project cycle; it should be looked at in the context of other socioeconomic variables in order to be most useful.
4. **Biodiversity Support Program:** As the primary stakeholders, women are likely to be effective conservators of threatened plant or animal resources. Two activities under this program have incorporated gender as a means of achieving the project goal: a) kitchen gardens in a Maasai Group Ranch are being introduced to local women's groups in an effort to help promote indigenous food species that are particularly nutritious but have become rare due to land degradation; and b) a special effort is being made to include women in community education programs in Costa Rica which aim to find local solutions to protect Sea Turtles and their nests.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Women's roles as users and protectors of the environment should be considered in designing conservation programs
- The involvement of women in local conservation projects helps reach children in the community as well, an important target group in environmental education.

5. **Environmental Planning and Management (EPM):** Empowerment of women, the neglected environmental managers, requires both policy and action. Projects which have involved women's organizations and have supported their efforts have been very successful in generating productive and equitable sustainable development processes (e.g., agroforestry and soil conservation in Kenya). More grassroots efforts are needed, along with policy changes that ensure women have changes to build their capacities, gain access to resources and technologies and contribute their knowledge and creative energy to resource management. Presently, such policy support is severely lacking. The EPM project aims to support women (and women's groups) and strengthen their capacities and participation in sustainable agriculture and NRM. *Discussion:* The two implementing agencies, World Resources Institute (WRI) and the Center for International Development and Environment (CIDE), have done a good job of incorporating gender into their programming. A subgroup of the research team conducting studies on environmental issues works specifically on gender issues. A list of studies will tease out the lessons learned.

Implications/Recommendations:

- A comprehensive approach to gender issues will include seminar participation and information exchange; institutional strengthening and project based support to women's organizations working in participatory sustainable agriculture and NRM; and publication of experience based discussion/policy papers on the role of women in sustainable development.
6. **Environmental and Natural Resource Policy and Training (EPAT):** This project is in the start up stage. There are no findings yet to share. The project paper did a good job of integrating gender issues but the project management is not sure how they will follow through in the work plan.

General Recommendations from R&D/ENR:

- * Contractors have suggested that project work plans spell out relevant tasks to be undertaken in order to address gender-related issues in the project. For the most part, contractors and cooperators are interested in doing more but are reluctant to move on these issues unless they are part of the contract/cooperative agreement or included in work plans.
 - * Tell project contractors/cooperators what the WID Office can offer. If the WID Office can offer technical backstopping in the field, financial resources for studies and publication and other resources, then they should directly inform project staffs.
 - * Participation of women in NRM projects should include activities related to decision-making (including policy dialogue), project design, project activities, benefit distribution, monitoring and evaluation. Sustainable and culturally-appropriate projects related to NRM seem most likely to succeed when they involve women (both professional and project clients) in the project cycle.
-

R&D/Research

Wendy Jackson presented for the Office of Research. All of the money in Research is identified for scientific research, not for social science. Nevertheless, the Office is going to ask researchers to identify impact on women in a separate section, asking researchers to consider needs and roles by gender. For example, if a vaccine or new technology/equipment is developed, will both men and women be part of the test population? Both researchers and reviewers will be asked to consider gender.

The question of equity has been looked into already in the Office, and numbers are available to indicate whether women are conducting the research. Of the 250 proposals considered for funding, women were represented on the research teams as follows:

- 19% of the Principle Investigators (PIs) were female
- 36% of the proposals had at least one women on the research team
- 46% of the proposals which were approved for funding had a woman on the team
- 45% of the proposals which were approved for funding did not have a woman on the research team
- 37% of the proposals which were approved for funding had a female PI

January 24, 1992

R&D/Nutrition

Sue Anthony presented three findings from the Office of Nutrition.

1. **Nutrition Monitoring Project (IFPRI):** Data from Kenya and Malawi suggest that household food security and preschooler nutritional status are influenced by the interaction of income and gender of the head of household rather than simply one or the other. Most household research compares female-headed households as a homogeneous group with male-headed households. The International Food Policy and Research Institute (IFPRI) found that there are distinct differences in income, expenditures, and health status among female-headed households. Research in Kenya and Malawi indicates that not only total household income but also the proportion of income controlled by women has a positive impact on household caloric intake and the nutritional status of children.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Income distribution, expenditures, and priorities may vary by gender of the household head; however, gender of the household may not be the best indicator of poverty, as female headed households themselves are not homogenous but vary in access to income, resources, size and type of expenditures.
- Higher income does not necessarily result in better health or nutritional status. Education or training to promote appropriate nurturing behaviors or interventions that exploit incentives for households to invest in their children may provide short-term gains in child health and nutrition.
- Compare coping strategies used to ensure food security, health and nutritional status in female versus male headed households; consider how changing economic policies enhance or negate these strategies.
- Gender of the head of household sometimes changes over time, particularly in Africa. Longitudinal studies should investigate whether the positive health and nutrition effects observed in certain types of female-headed households (e.g., *de facto*) are maintained over time.
- The family rank of the female head of household (mother, grandmother), and her relationship to the children in the household may be a determinant of variance in nutritional outcomes.

2. **The Weaning Project (Manoff):** Many mothers with weaning-age children are earning income for themselves and their families, especially in semi-urban areas. Working per se does not appear to contribute to undernutrition; rather, the actual conditions of the work affect child feeding, nutrition and care. Research in Indonesia suggests that mothers working outside the home are making child care arrangements, that though often not ideal, ensure that their children are fed during their absence. Mothers working at home may have less time to feed children than if they were with a caretaker.

Implications/Recommendations:

- In addition to information on foods and appropriate feeding practices, project design should focus on how to feed children when the mother must leave them alone for long periods of time and how to balance work and child care in the home.

3. **Nutrition Communications Project (AED):** Changes in conventional nutrition education programs are needed: beliefs and attitudes about food nutrition and health must be addressed before the target population will respond to messages aimed at changing behavior.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Build qualitative research into project design. Identify and address beliefs and attitudes of men and women to facilitate their later acceptance of nutrition interventions.
- Build access to resources into project design. It does little to inform women that they need better foods without doing something to increase their ability to acquire them.
- Both economic and non-economic incentives for investing in women's and children's nutrition should be investigated on a gender-disaggregated basis. Men and women may respond to different incentives -- men to parental pride, for example, and women to improvements in their children's health and the returns on this investment in their old age.

R&D/POP

Sawon Hong of the Office of Population introduced the presentation by explaining that family planning deals with three basic issues: fertility, which is dealt with by R&D/Pop; mortality, which is dealt with by R&D/Health; and migration, which is not commonly dealt with. The main focus of R&D/POP is fertility control, even though that is just one of several variables. From the beginning, family planning has had a focus on women, and originally was started to assist poor women. The findings presented by the Office are common issues underlying all family planning programs, not specific projects.

1. **Family Planning Improves Maternal Health:** Family planning (1) enables women to plan their pregnancies in such a way that they avoid becoming pregnant when too young, too old, or too soon, or achieving parity that carries additional risks, and (2) lowers fertility generally, by reducing the absolute number of pregnancies in the population. Family planning, by reducing the number of unwanted pregnancies, reduces the number of deaths resulting from illegal abortions.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Family planning programs have significant positive benefits for women's health.

2. **Family Planning Empowers Women and Enhance Their Status:** By introducing the concept of choice and decision-making into childbearing, family planning enhances women's status. Controlled fertility also allows women to explore other opportunities, such as education or vocation training. In Mali, girls' school attendance at the secondary level is constrained by the parents' fear of the girl becoming pregnant. In Nigeria, a high rate of abortion among female secondary school students is attributed to the school rule prohibiting pregnant girls from staying in school. In Ghana, women vendors are selling contraceptives at their stands. Employment opportunities for women are available in family planning programs. These jobs allow women to be cast as authority figures, as income earners, and as bureaucratic equals with many men. Nearly 500,000 women worldwide are employed by A.I.D.-assisted family planning programs.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Women employed in family planning programs learn transferrable skills in program planning and management.
- Family planning advertisements help to promote the image of women who use contraceptives as modern, forward looking and responsible. Mass media can be a

powerful tool to improve the status of women.

- Female school attendance rates may be positively affected by family planning programs.

3. **Improvements in the Standard of Living and Other Indirect Benefits Accrue to Users of Family Planning:** Indirect benefits of family planning are realized through women's influence on their children, women serving as role models in the community, changing perceptions of women, and high quality human resources. A study in rural Thailand found that families with fewer children are more likely to be productive and more likely to have their children attend secondary school. Children with fewer siblings enjoy improved living standards, such as more consumer goods, more savings and better housing. Women's work in family planning encourages greater education for girls by promoting the legitimacy of women's employment. Also, higher population growth is associated with lower school expenditures per child and fewer teachers per student, and with negative consequences for student's academic performance.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Given the relationship between small family size and greater educational attainment, the degree of success in family planning programs will be translated into higher levels of education in society.
- Family planning can have societal impacts by enabling family and national economic resources to be directed toward improving the quality of its vital human resources.

4. **Female Family Planning Providers are Preferred:** Women are more comfortable with female providers in many countries. Women providers have also proven successful in counseling and training males in both Bangladesh and Latin America. Female workers seem to perform better than their male counterparts, in terms of recruiting users, making frequent household visits, and representing community level needs and interests of women.

Implications/Recommendations:

- The same project can have dual benefits for women by using women as service providers and sales representatives, which provides employment and income, and at the same time, successfully providing for the family planning needs of women in the community.

5. **Family Planning Activities Must Include Males:** Disapproval by men is sometimes the greatest deterrent to female use of contraceptives. Spousal consent requirements as a condition for female sterilization and some other forms of contraception is a constraint to women's use of contraceptives. In many instances, men actively prevent women from gaining access to and using family planning. By bypassing men in most family planning efforts, the burden for family planning falls on women. Family planning must strike a balance, with both men and women taking maximum responsibility for reproductive decisions.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Male village health workers can successfully promote family planning among men where men are the primary decision-makers on family planning and family size, as in Mali.
- Teams of male and female workers can be very effective providers.
- By seeking to increase male involvement in family planning, the responsibility will be better shared between men and women. Efforts are required to increase awareness and use of male methods and to have been be supportive of their partners' family planning intentions.
- Program design must explore and address all the existing factors which tip the balance of responsibility (and the burden) in favor of women.

January 30, 1992

R&D/Health

Genease Pettigrew presented the results of the combing exercise for the Office of Health. The overall objective of the Office is to increase life expectancy through reductions in infant mortality and morbidity, with over \$100 million annually allocated to research and technical assistance.

1. **HIV Risk:** The majority of new HIV infections are transmitted heterosexually. Women's risk of being infected with HIV (through heterosexual sex) is 10% more than men's. Women are more vulnerable because they do not control the use of condoms and often can do little about a partner's refusal to use a condom. A new research program, being conducted by ICRW, is designed to look at the determinants of women's risk and to explore alternative prevention strategies. From a public health perspective, men and women need to apply pressure to each other to use safe sex practices. Data are limited on the sexual attitudes and behaviors of men and women, the cultural and socioeconomic factors that put women at risk of HIV infection and the options available to women for AIDS prevention. We do know that women's symptoms are different than men's; in women, many of the symptoms are gynecological and have not been publicized as widely as symptoms affecting men. Appropriate technology for women is critical as women could better control their risk of infection. Female condoms are not widely accepted by men; better, more discreet technologies for women have yet to be developed. Treatment is also a problem: maternal and child health clinics do not usually provide services for STDs, and since STDs in women are often asymptomatic, women tend not to visit STD clinics. *Discussion:* Peer education is often a successful way of reaching people. Women cannot act upon much of the information that is available to them, such as use of condoms. PVOs tend to look at AIDS as part of a larger, integrated development problem, while A.I.D. tends to deal with AIDS in isolation.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Public health communications models will be developed under the project that target women for AIDS prevention.
- More successful prevention programs and technology geared to women are needed.
- Programs will employ women as health workers and trainers, to provide positive role models for third world women clients.

2. **Water and Sanitation Project (WASH):** The role of women is so interrelated with effective community participation that it must be evaluated simultaneously. This is a quick response project where community participation is key. WASH has identified four significant roles women play that need to be considered in determining strategy. (1) They are the primary users of any water system and may rely on their sensory skills and traditional knowledge to choose the best water. (2) Women are often the first line in determining whether a new facility will be used; lessons in how health may be improved by the facility are crucial to its acceptance. (3) Women are managers of household water supplies. Through the community water supply may be controlled by others, women can assert their role as water managers to educate others to their needs for water supplies and funds. (4) Women can serve as catalysts or agents for change; they are capable of helping to change patterns of behavior and their roles as mothers and homemakers make them an important focus of any education strategy.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Women should not be thought of as passive recipients of improved water supplies.
- Traditional roles need not limit women's active roles in changing and improving water supplies and systems.
- Women need to be included in operation and maintenance training of facilities. Community training is provided through WASH prior to putting in a new water system.

3. **Acute Respiratory Infections (ARI) Project:** Women can be trained both as mothers and as health care workers to prevent and treat ARI in their children. The target population is children ages 5 and under. Respiratory diseases cause 1/3 of all deaths for this group. Many deaths can be averted by training mothers to recognize the difference between pneumonia and the common cold. A pilot project in rural Nepal was successful in using male and female community health workers to detect and treat pneumonia and train mothers in detection. Childhood deaths subsequently decreased by 28% in the first three years of the project, and the proportion of cases referred by the mother increased from 15% to 56%.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Health communication needs to target mothers and female health care workers to recognize the signs of pneumonia.

- Existing health systems should be upgraded to offer better quality care.
 - Women should be trained in the appropriate use of antibiotics to prevent death from pneumonia.
 - Gender disaggregation is not part of ARI reporting; this is especially critical where female infanticide is common.
4. **Mothercare Project:** Project development needs to come from the women's perspective, in other words, for women designed by women. A comprehensive approach to breast feeding and maternal nutrition is encouraged, with a focus on achieving better health outcomes for women, particularly during their childbearing years. Initial assessments by the Manoff Group found that the community's and women's perspective must be considered in project design if it hopes to change women's behavior. Spousal support is also key to influencing change in women's behavior. Physical constraints to service delivery, such as transportation or appropriate facilities, must be addressed along with perceived barriers to service. *Discussion:* Should projects for women necessarily or preferably be designed by women?

Implications/Recommendations:

- Involving women in project design needs to take the form of participatory research, using focus groups, group discussions, in-depth interviews, case studies and anthropological data.
- In some cases a woman's idea of a safe delivery differs from that of the service provider. A compromise must be made that accommodates the woman's expectation.

R&D/UC

Bill Miner from the Agency Center for University Cooperation in Development (R&D/UC) explained that the Center was established in October 1991, combining the former Support Staff of the Board for International Food and Agricultural Development and Economic Cooperation (BIFADEC) and the erstwhile Office of Research and University Relations in the Bureau for Science and Technology (S&T/RUR).

The BIFADEC Support Staff had no program funds and, therefore, no projects. The principal program activities in S&T/RUR were grants to universities: program support grants in agriculture and health, and small research grants to historically black colleges and universities (HBCUs). The initial project of R&D/UC is the University Development Linkages Program (UDLP), a matching grant program begun in FY 1991. Thirteen cooperative agreements were granted, involving 17 developing country institutions in 13 countries and 11 U.S. institutions. These awards cover diverse fields of development, including agriculture, business management, education, environment, forestry, health, nutrition, and rural/community development. A second round of competition is underway for FY 1992.

Concern for women in development and gender issues was not made explicit in the Request for Proposal (RFP) or in the criteria by which the proposals were evaluated for the first round of competition for UDLP grants. However, one of the thirteen winning proposals focuses on health, family planning, female education, and informal leadership in Bangladesh. Of the other successful proposals, those in health, literacy, nutrition, and population probably will involve women as participants and beneficiaries. In the second round of competition, gender issues have been made explicit in the RFP and in the criteria for evaluating the proposals.

Although there has been significant involvement of women and gender issues in the activities initiated through single and joint Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs and JMOUs) in agriculture and health and supported by program support grants, the reports have not been mined to elicit specific information of lessons learned. In a similar manner, a quick review of the abstracts of 72 completed (of the 152) projects funded by HBCU research grants indicates that many involve women investigators and subject matter of particular concern to women. However, there has been no effort made to discover gender-related lessons learned.

R&D/OIT

Patricia Bekele gave a presentation on the Office of International Training. She suggested that there are opportunities for increasing the number of women in training. The Office Director has communicated to the Missions the importance OIT places on increasing participation of women in A.I.D.'s training programs, especially under the CLASP program in Latin America and the Caribbean. Gender has now been integrated into the goal and purpose of the Jefferson Fellowship program. Further, the next conference for contractors will focus on gender issues in A.I.D.'s training programs.

Currently 27% of A.I.D. training participants are women. The Office is looking for ways to increase women's participation. An example from Morocco was shared, where one-third of all participants are female; the barriers to further increases include the nature of the training, which is often biased toward males. It is easier to successfully recruit women for short term training than long term training, where women face more social constraints to participation.

Several approaches were discussed that encourage increased participation by women in the training programs. In Tanzania, where 50% of training participants are female, success is attributed to the Mission's addition of one line in a newspaper advertisement saying "women are encouraged to apply." OIT is revising Handbook 10, and in the process, is making the regulations of the Thomas Jefferson Fellowship program more responsive to gender issues, encouraging greater participation by women.

With regard to gender disaggregation, OIT has a database available that is gender disaggregated. Beyond the number of men and women participating, OIT maintains information on the type of training they receive, the length of training, degree objective, facility where training is received, and age data.

February 20, 1992

R&D/WID

Ron Grosz did the final presentation of Office level findings, reporting for the Office of Women in Development. Formerly in the PPC Bureau, the WID Office faced a different mandate and a different task from the other Offices now comprising the R&D Bureau. Other R&D Offices have traditionally been sector specific with project portfolios of their own, the WID Office was responsible for making sure gender was included in the entire Agency portfolio, across sectors and regions. Since WID's whole focus has been on gender, WID combed for a sampling of some of the interesting findings from each of its four priority areas rather than combing for all findings. Two findings from each of its four priority areas were included in the presentation. Additionally, the handout and presentation included a qualifying notation next to each finding, which was meant as a rough indicator of the degree of evidence in support of each finding. *Discussion:* How does the family initiative overlap with or help support the WID mandate? The dynamics between men and women also must be approached from an intergenerational perspective, as gender specific attitudes and behaviors change over the life cycle.

1. **Demand Constraints to Female Education:** A GENESYS report highlighted the need to consider demand side factors in understanding gender gaps in education (Behrman 1991). Low perceived rates of return in labor markets for educated women and the opportunity cost of gender specialized tasks (e.g., care of younger siblings) depress the demand by parents for girls' education. Most studies have underestimated the extent to which labor market returns to schooling for females exceed those for males. Given current gender gaps in wages, equivalent investments in female and male education actually result in greater *percentage* wage increases for women than men.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Expand women's employment opportunities and reduce gender based wage discrimination to encourage families' investment in women's education.
- Development planners may consider the substantially higher rates of return to women's education as a rationale for increased levels of social investment in women's education.
- Child care facilities and preschools to relieve girls of sibling care can be considered on a pilot basis as a possible means of eliminating the gender gap in primary education rates in some developing countries.

2. **Supply Side Constraints to Female Education:** In certain settings, supply characteristics may be directly or indirectly responsible for large gender gaps in school enrollment. In rural Pakistan, the difference in availability of single sex schools for girls versus boys accounts for the majority of the substantial gender gaps in school attendance, completion rates and cognitive achievement. The gaps in achievement can be remedied by equalizing the supply of schools for girls and boys where culture dictates separate schools or improving school environment (quality of bathrooms, dormitories and eating facilities), which has been found to have a stronger influence on parental decisions regarding girls' school attendance than boys' attendance in certain settings. (Alderman, Behrman, Ross & Sabot 1990; Anderson 1986).

Implications/Recommendations:

- A focus on relatively easy-to-fix supply factors may be warranted in instances of gender gaps in education. Increasing the number of appropriate, single sex schools available to a population may be one critical factor in increasing girls' attendance rates and reducing the gender gap.
- Experimental programs may be needed to determine the best approach in a given country, such as satellite feeder schools for the initial grades in rural areas, flexible hours, hours that do not conflict with other activities and greater flexibility in seasonal patterns.

3. **Credit to Small Scale Enterprises:** The following characteristics generally apply to women's businesses in developing countries:

- * Tend to be home based and small in response to restrictions on mobility, time, access to capital and credit, and as a way of minimizing conflict with their maternal and household roles.
- * Concentrated in certain sectors, such as trade, commerce and services.
- * Frequently operate on a part time or seasonal basis to accommodate their multiple roles in the household, and tend to be more diversified than men's businesses as a means of minimizing the risks involved with specialization. (Downing 1990; Weidemann 1991; Gender Manual for SSE, A.I.D. 1987)

Implications/Recommendations:

- Creative approaches to credit such as group loans in combination with simplified application processes and convenient branch office locations greatly

improve women's access to credit. Promoting the use of group loans, projects can reach the needy by eliminating collateral and cosignature requirements, and overcoming constraints such as illiteracy and lack of experience with formal banking institutions.

- Credit facilities should eliminate "up front" costs (including time costs) and recognize that women are equal to or better than men as credit risks.
- Convenient branch office location overcome limitations on women's mobility, such as time and social attitudes.

4. **Productivity Enhancements in Export Oriented Enterprises:** In export oriented enterprises, heightened pressure to operate efficiently in order to compete in international markets encourages many companies to cut costs by subcontracting ("outwork"), using temporary labor, and prescribing less than optimal safety precautions in the work place. These mechanisms have a disproportionate effect on women, who tend: to hold the lowest paying, lowest status jobs; represent a large portion of part time and temporary employees; and frequently are exposed to relatively poor work conditions. Many agribusiness firms in Asia and the Near East hesitate to improve working conditions or offer better wages, benefits, and full time employment in the belief that it will reduce profits. Preliminary research, however, suggests that such provisions may substantially increase workers' productivity, making these changes cost effective investments even in instances of a surplus labor supply. (Standing 1989; Islam & Dixon-Mueller 1991)

Implications/Recommendations:

- Better conditions and terms (benefits, wages, security, etc.) will increase job satisfaction, increase stability of the work force, and improve worker productivity levels.
- Policies should encourage productivity enhancing investments by firms as a means of increasing long run profits and organizational sustainability. Improvements in the quality of life for employees also ensue, with disproportionate positive impacts on women.
- Export oriented enterprises, by changing their orientation from cost cutting measures toward productivity enhancing incentives, will positively affect the situation for female employees in particular.

5. **Income from Forest Products:** Women in developing countries frequently earn a large part of their incomes from forest products, either directly through extraction or indirectly through small scale manufacturing. In these situations, deforestation can result in a partial or complete loss of income for women. In India, women identify loss of income as the most serious consequence of deforestation -- not added time for fuelwood collection. Due to the lack of alternative income generating opportunities for rural women in particular, they sometimes have a greater stake in forest management than do men.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Preserve income generating opportunities for women to ensure their support in forestry projects. Improve and sustain their small scale forest industries rather than simply planting new tree stands that do not yield marketable products.
- If women see clear benefits accruing to them from a project, they are more likely to contribute their labor to planting and maintenance.

6. **Community Groups and Natural Resource Management:** Women's groups have organized to combat natural resource degradation at the local level. Their ability to affect change, however, may be limited by their lack of linkages to development and government agencies. An ECOGEN case study of local institutional management of erosion in Kenya revealed that *Mwethya* groups (primarily women's groups) organized to improve water resources and combat natural resource degradation in their local villages. These groups now function as the backbone of the village's resource management activities. Their successes have been negated by the government sanctioned practice of sand scooping, which destroys the water beds. Sand scooping provides low cost inputs to the construction industry, a priority for national development. With poor ties to government and development agencies and poor communication with other villages to garner additional support, the *Mwethya* groups were not able to stop the practice.

Implications/Recommendations:

- While women's groups may have a vested interest in natural resource management, simply organizing into groups may not be effective without the support of intermediary organizations such as umbrella groups as a means of strengthening their voice and effectiveness.
- Improvements in local infrastructure facilitate communication and allow extension agents to more effectively transmit local concerns and report on conflicts between national and local development goals.

7. **Export Oriented Agribusiness:** Expansion of export oriented agroprocessing industries often draws on women as the primary source of labor. GENESYS reports highlight the fact that almost invariably, the expansion of these industries has elicited high female participation in the work force, even in cultures where women's employment outside the home is discouraged. It may also increase demand for agricultural inputs supplied by small scale, female producers who are frequently in the non-formal sector. Among the fast growing agricultural exports, fruits, vegetables and nuts comprise nearly half of traded value, and women typically play critical roles in their production and processing under both traditional and modern arrangements.

Implications/Recommendations:

- Export promotion programs will have a major effect on the type and extent of employment opportunities available to women in their roles as laborers, input suppliers and entrepreneurs.
 - Incorporate information on women's anticipated level and type of participation and any constraints to participation (at individual, household, community or national level) into rapid appraisals, commodity feasibility studies and other A.I.D.-commissioned analyses.
 - Promote the development of those subsectors with high growth potential and where women's anticipated participation and benefits are substantial.
8. **Market Access and Conditions:** Some evidence suggests that women can be more responsive than men to improved marketing conditions and rising prices for food crops (e.g. fruits, vegetables, nuts). A study of agricultural villages in southern Cameroon found that, with the introduction of a new road to improve market access and a subsequent increase in product prices, women increased the number of hours spent in production for the market by approximately 5 hours to a total of nearly 11 hours -- men devoted a total of only 1 hour toward production for the market. Further, the average work week for men in the two village sample was only 32 hours, while women averaged nearly 64 hours per week; after the road was introduced, women significantly increased their already long workday while men's response was fairly minimal. Women's critical need for additional income was cited as the rationale for the differences in responsiveness. (Henn 1988)

Implications/Recommendations:

- New roads and infrastructure investments in rural areas may have a stronger impact on women than men by substantially expanding women's income earning

opportunities.

- **Road building is generally considered a gender-neutral intervention and receives support on the merits of its numerous other benefits. Road building is not, however, gender neutral.**
- **Donor agencies need to provide training and/or extension services to the population affected by the road in order to maximize potential multiplier effects.**
- **Given women's lengthy workday, any intervention must take into account women's time constraints and seek to alleviate an already heavy workload. Interventions should address issues of drudge work so women can focus on other productive activity.**

ANNEX 2

Reference Tables and Background Material for Synthesis

Table 1

CLUSTERS I: BREAKDOWN BY OFFICES AND FINDINGS

| Office | Information Base | Design | Net Benefits |
|--|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Agriculture | AGR 5 | AGR 1 AGR 2 AGR 3 AGR 4 | AGR 1 |
| Health | H 1 | H 2 H 4 | H 3 |
| University Center | UC 1 | | |
| Economic and Institutional Development | EID 2 EID 3 EID 4 | EID 1 EID 3 EID 5 | EID 1 EID 4 |
| Education | ED 4 | | ED 1 ED 2 ED 3 ED 4 |
| Environment and Natural Resources | ENR 1 ENR 2 ENR 5 ENR 6 | ENR 3 | ENR 1 ENR 4 |
| Energy | | EIN 1 | |
| Population | POP 1 POP 2 | POP 4 POP 5 | POP 2 POP 3 |
| Nutrition | N 1 N 2 N 3 | N 1 N 3 | |
| Women in Development | | WID 1 WID 2 WID 3 WID 5 | WID 4 WID 6 WID 7 WID 8 |

Table 2

THE WID GRID:

**A TOOL TO HELP IDENTIFY PRIORITY AREAS FOR RESEARCH
AND DEVELOPMENT**

| | | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Low Corroboration | Low C Minor I | Low C Major I |
| High Corroboration | High C Minor I | High C Major I |
| | Minor Implications | Major Implications |

Table 3

CLUSTERS I: BY IMPLICATION LEVEL

| | POLICY | PROGRAM | PROJECT |
|---------------------|--|---|--|
| INFORMATION BASE | H 1 UC 1 EID 2 EID 3 EID 4 ED 4 ENR 5 ENR 6 POP 1 POP 2 N 1 N 2 | AGR 5 H 1 UC 1 EID 4 ENR 1 ENR 2 N 1 N 3 | AGR 5 EID 4 ENR 1 |
| DESIGN | EID 3 EID 5 | AGR 1 H 2 EID 1 EID 3 EID 5 ENR 3 EIN POP 4 POP 5 WID 1 WID 2 | AGR 1 AGR 2 AGR 3 AGR 4 H 2 H 4 EID 1 EID 5 ENR 3 POP 4 POP 5 N 3 WID 1 WID 2 WID 3 WID 5 |
| NET BENEFITS | AGR 1 EID 1 EID 4 ED 1 ED 2 ED 3 POP 2 POP 3 WID 4 WID 7 WID 8 | AGR 1 H 3 EID 1 EID 4 ENR 1 ENR 4 WID 4 WID 6 WID 8 | H 3 EID 4 ENR 1 ENR 4 |

Table 4

CLUSTERS II: BREAKDOWN BY OFFICES AND FINDINGS

| | Counting Heads | Integrated Gender Analysis | Variable Gender Relations | Power Relations/ Resource Allocation & Access | Multiple Roles and Duties |
|-----|----------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|---|---------------------------|
| AGR | AGR 5 | AGR 1 AGR 2 AGR 5 | AGR 3 AGR 4 AGR 5 | AGR 1 AGR 2 AGR 4 AGR 5 | AGR 1 |
| H | | | H 2 | H 1 H 4 | |
| UC | UC 1 | | | | |
| EID | | EID 2 EID 5 | | EID 1 EID 3 EID 4 | EID 5 |
| R | R 1 | | | | |
| OIT | OIT 1 | | | | |
| ED | | | | ED 3 | |
| ENR | | ENR 2 | ENR 4 | | |
| EIN | EIN 1 | | | | |
| POP | POP 2 | | | POP 5 | |
| N | | N 1 N 2 N 3 | | | N 2 |
| WID | | WID 1 WID 3 WID 7 WID 8 | | WID 5 | WID 1 WID 3 WID 8 |

ANNOTATIONS

Clusters I -- Relevance to Programming Cycle

Following is a list of findings for each cluster in the first group of clusters (Clusters I). A brief annotation appears next to it, usually drawn directly from the Office handout describing the finding. The annotation is intended as an explanation for why a finding is included in a particular cluster. Several findings appear in more than one cluster, a reflection of the multidimensional nature of many of the findings. The reference on the left hand side (e.g., Agriculture #5) refers to the Office that presented the finding, and the number assigned that finding for the purposes of the analysis. Please refer to the first page of this annex (page 3) for a complete list of findings according to their assigned number and relevant Office; a short descriptive title also appears to help identify the finding, and full descriptions are provided in Annex 1.

1. Information Base:

- Agriculture #5** -- Bean/Cowpea CRSP: Women play central roles in bean and cowpea production; in general, spend more time in food production than men; and have highly variable roles in agriculture, depending on the interaction of local level historical and sociocultural variables and national and international political and economic processes.
- Health #1** -- HIV research aims to collect data and understand the sexual attitudes and behaviors and cultural and socioeconomic factors that put women at risk of HIV infection. Such information is critical for the design of appropriate prevention strategies.
- University** -- Human Resources Center in Bangladesh will undertake surveys, studies, analyses, pilot projects and training directed toward the amelioration of selected problems, with special regard to the well-being of women, e.g., family planning, health care, and female education.
- EID #2** -- Since spending patterns of women are relatively more localized than men, women make significant economic contributions to local income multiplication and to town building processes within rural African regions. Getting resources into the hands of women will be critical to increasing the regional income multiplication that underlies rural regional development.
- EID #3** -- Women traders are likely to dominate buying at the farmgate and in village markets when production is dispersed. Small-scale women traders use labor intensive marketing techniques that reduce spoilage. They also provide services to dispersed demand and are effective in collecting dispersed supplies of goods.

- EID #4** -- Women have derived access to land in many African countries; their rights are informal or secondary and so may be overlooked in the redesign of land tenure systems.
- Education #4** -- Women's literacy and numeracy enhance their access to complementary resources such as land, credit and technology, increasing their productivity in farm and household production.
- ENR #1** -- Forestry Support Program: Female participants are being identified and nominated by national agencies and donor organizations to attend workshops on gender issues in forestry management. These individuals may enjoy less access to the organizational debriefing and information sharing networks than male counterparts and thus are less capable of transmitting information from the workshop.
- ENR #2** -- Men's and women's tree management practices can vary by gender; women's experience and knowledge of tree management are greatly needed, particularly in harvesting fruits for specific uses or processing. Women are often the local forest experts. Failing to consult women about indigenous species and their uses can lead to making decisions that may endanger the tree species and the environment in which they are maintained by women's labor and energy.
- ENR #5** -- In many cultures, women have rich knowledge about plants, diverse species and natural resource conditions. Policy changes are needed from the "top" to ensure that women have chances to build their capacities, gain access to resources and technologies, and contribute their knowledge and creative energy to resource management. Presently, such policy support is severely lacking.
- ENR #6** -- Women's major role in agricultural and fuelwood-gathering activities, along with other gender issues, will influence decisions about environmental policy.
- Population #1** -- Women in developing countries are particularly at risk of illness or death from pregnancy, child birth and high fertility rates. Family planning programs significantly reduce these risks.
- Nutrition #1** -- There is significant diversity among female headed households with respect to income, expenditures, and health status. The nutritional status of children is determined jointly by a number of factors; household headship is only one of those factors.
- Nutrition #2** -- Undernutrition of weaning-age children whose mothers work may be determined more by the conditions of the mother's work than by the fact that she works.

- Nutrition #3** -- Research into local beliefs and attitudes about health and nutrition suggests that changes in strategy and approach from conventional nutrition education are necessary. Family structure, traditional household decision-making patterns, and women's limited access to resources will influence nutritional outcomes in a household.
- 2. Design:**
- Agriculture #1** -- How the distribution of costs and benefits [of an irrigation system] is conditioned by gender should be examined for each culture and production system. Improvements in rural irrigation systems should try to accommodate women's multiple roles in agricultural and household production, e.g., carrying food or fodder while gathering water from the source.
- Agriculture #2** -- TropSoils in Indonesia promotes a holistic approach to understanding the factors which affect people's practice of agriculture. Project success was due to a good analysis of key variables, including gender.
- Agriculture #3** -- A bias persists in agricultural project design that excludes women from target groups and overlooks their dominant role in small ruminants and small scale agricultural production.
- Agriculture #4** -- Early aquaculture development projects directed extension services to men although women were carrying out the day-to-day activities, such as feeding and fertilizing. These projects should have components that target both men and women, separately and combined.
- Health #2** -- Successful project interventions in water systems take into account the multiple uses of water by women in both urban and rural communities, women's role as water managers, and their historical place as mothers and homemakers in changing behavior patterns of the household.
- Health #4** -- Project development in health care needs to come from the women's perspective; for women, designed by women. Physical and perceived barriers to service delivery should be identified and overcome during the project design process.
- EID #1** -- Women can benefit from new labor saving technologies even if they are users but not owners. Projects should assess impact of introducing new technology on men and women and may need to assist women in identifying new income sources (limited opportunities for women). Also, distinguish between technology owners and users; consider group versus individual ownership.
- EID #3** -- Given rural small-scale women traders' important role in food and marketing systems in poor and remote areas, we need to reduce

regulatory harassment and impediments to women traders and ensure that women can sell crops as owners of produce.

- EID #5 -- Urban working women in Mali are seeking more convenient and easy foods to prepare; the refined grains often are less nutritious and imported. Successful project interventions will accommodate women's desire to reduce the amount of time spent on food preparation and their need to pursue income generating activities.
- ENR #3 -- Targeting women for education in Ecuador's coastal resources management program appears to be an effective means of building the community structure essential for program success.
- Energy -- There is a bias against female participants in energy sector training programs. When funds are short, women are cut. (Is this because they are less qualified candidates, because they are women, or both?)
- Population #4 -- Female family planning workers are more effective providers to female clients in many countries; women are also successfully providing certain services to males in some countries. The gender of the provider may be critical to project success.
- Population #5 -- Family planning activities that do not include men risk overlooking what may be the greatest deterrent to female use of contraceptives, sometimes more than income or social status.
- Nutrition #3 -- Men and women may respond to different incentives for investing in women's and children's nutrition. These incentives may be economic and non-economic, such as parental pride or security in one's old age.
- WID #1 -- Design of education projects should investigate gender specific demand constraints. Specific interventions should be targeted at overcoming specific constraints, such as preschools to alleviate girls' responsibilities in sibling care or improving employment conditions and opportunities for women, thereby providing an economic incentive to invest in female education.
- WID #2 -- There may be significant supply side constraints to parental demand for female education in some cultures; these constraints are relatively easy to overcome and can be dealt with during project design (e.g., physical conditions of schools, location, and availability of single sex schools).
- WID #3 -- Creative approaches to credit for small businesses can improve access to credit for the poor, and particularly poor women who face several gender specific constraints to obtaining credit.

- WID #5** -- Women's income from forest products may be jeopardized as a result of deforestation. Projects should try to preserve income generating opportunities for women where possible.
- 3. Net Benefits:**
- Agriculture #1** -- The introduction of labor saving technology in irrigation systems may displace rural workers formerly involved in system maintenance. Male laborers may subsequently compete with for work with female agricultural laborers who have limited alternatives for other employment.
- Health #3** -- Women are targeted as mothers and as health care workers to reduce the incidence of children's death due to pneumonia. Increased rates of child survival contribute to lower fertility rates in the long run, with subsequent increases in women's health status from fewer pregnancies and births.
- EID #1** -- Women may benefit from the introduction of labor saving technologies; they may also be displaced from jobs by its introduction or see declines in income from traditional processes ("women" controlled income).
- EID #4** -- Men and women are differentially affected by changes in land tenure systems. As systems formalize and move toward individualized access and use, women are often forced onto the least desirable and productive lands and, at worst, their limited rights may be extinguished altogether. There is some evidence that formal land titling and registration programs work to the disadvantage of women who may have formerly retained use rights and subsequently lose their customary tenure arrangements.
- Education #1** -- A more educated mother raises healthier children and maintains higher standards for hygiene and nutrition in the household. Educating females is a means of improving the health and standard of living in a community.
- Education #2** -- Female education is an important factor in reducing infant mortality; long run benefits for women ensue in the form of fewer pregnancies required to achieve desired completed family size.
- Education #3** -- Female literacy is strongly correlated with lower fertility rates; educating women helps reduce population growth, with associated benefits for society at large.
- ENR #1** -- Activities to encourage gender analysis in forestry support programs are having less than optimal impact due in part to lack of effective communication about the issues. For instance, workshop information is marginalized by sending special female designates. Successful resource management activities that included gender issues are small scale or isolated instances that are rarely shared with other resource users or

extension agents.

- ENR #4** -- Biodiversity Support Program targets women in Costa Rica (sea turtles) and Kenya (Maasai and indigenous food species) to help achieve environmental conservation and management goals. Benefits accrue to women as they are primary users of these particular resources and have a vested interest in sustainable use.
- Population #2** -- Women often reap substantial benefits from family planning activities, including increasing their options for employment and education. Employment with family planning programs often is viewed as a high status job within a community and also endows the women with transferrable skills.
- Population #3** -- Other indirect benefits from family planning include the tendency for children in smaller families to enjoy a higher standard of living and to attend secondary school, improved social status of women, and lower population growth rates (and attendant benefits).
- WID #4** -- In export oriented productive enterprises, women tend to hold the lowest paying, lowest status jobs; represent a large portion of part time and temporary employees; and frequently are exposed to relatively poor work conditions. Cost cutting measures by firms competing internationally disproportionately affect women. Nevertheless, this employment often represents a substantial improvement over alternative job opportunities open to the women employed by these firms. Some evidence that productivity enhancing investments may be equally cost-effective in the long run for employers while offering substantial benefits to female employees.
- WID #6** -- Women often have a vested interest in combating natural resource degradation; local women's groups may be a useful means of organizing community involvement in natural resource management projects.
- WID #7** -- Women in particular may benefit from programs that promote export oriented agribusiness, as it often draws on women as the primary source of labor. It may also increase the demand for agricultural inputs supplied by small scale female producers. Women also play key roles in the production and processing of a substantial portion of fast growing agricultural exports (fruits, vegetables, nuts).
- WID #8** -- Women may be particularly responsive to infrastructure improvements that increase their access to markets and assist in generating income. Without labor saving technology to help reduce other household and agricultural production duties, the net effect may be to increase women's already long workday with negative health consequences.

ANNOTATIONS

Clusters II -- Recommendations and Analytical Approach

Following is a list of findings for each cluster in the second group of clusters (Clusters II). A brief annotation appears next to it, usually drawn directly from the Office handout describing the finding. The annotation is intended as an explanation for why a finding is included in a particular cluster. Several findings appear in more than one cluster, a reflection of the multidimensional nature of many of the findings. The reference on the left hand side (e.g., Agriculture #5) refers to the Office that presented the finding, and the number assigned that finding for the purposes of the analysis. Please refer to page 3 at the beginning of this annex for a complete list of findings according to their assigned number and relevant Office; a short descriptive title also appears to help identify the finding, and full descriptions are provided in Annex 1.

1. Counting Heads:

- Agriculture #5 -- Bean/Cowpea CRSP student training programs "continues to encourage the inclusion of women in its training programs and currently nearly half of those being supported are women."
- University -- Discussion of HBCU Research Grant program -- scanning project titles indicated that "44 of 152 funded projects (29%) concern women"
- Research -- Presentation of % of women involved in research teams: Of total proposals, 19% of PIs were women and 36% had at least one female team member. Of proposals receiving A.I.D. funding, 37% of PIs were women, and 46% had at least one female team member.
- OIT -- 20% of participants are women; 33% in Morocco and 50% in Tanzania
- Energy -- Since 1987, 51 women have been trained of a total of 700 participants from approximately 18 countries.
- Population #2 -- One part of finding was that "nearly half a million women are employed by A.I.D. assisted family planning programs worldwide."

2. Integrated Gender Analysis:

- Agriculture #1 -- Costs and benefits of irrigation "are conditioned by the socio-economic status of the household, its access to land, and the spatial features of the particular water system. How the distribution of costs and benefits is conditioned by gender should be examined *for each culture and production system.*"

- Agriculture #2** -- TropSoils in Indonesia looked at human concerns -- those of men and women individually and as family units -- with respect to soil management.
- Agriculture #5** -- Bean/Cowpea research advises on both class and gender: "Locating the household in its larger social context and calling attention to the interrelationship between agriculture and other sectors of the economy, therefore, may be of as much, if not greater, use than providing descriptive materials."
- EID #2** -- The observation that spending patterns of women are more localized than men applies to rural women in Kenya; this probably does not hold true across different income and urbanization levels
- EID #5** -- Working women are seeking more convenient and easy-to-prepare foods that often have lower nutritional value. The finding applies to urban women working outside the home, a group defined by significant socioeconomic factors above and beyond gender.
- ENR #2** -- There are gender specific rules of access and management for trees in many cultures; we must examine the cultural context before assuming gender differences
- Nutrition #1** -- Children's nutritional status is affected by both income and gender of the head of household, rather than by simply one or the other.
- Nutrition #2** -- Mother's place of employment affects child nutrition in Indonesia -- this is often a reflection of class, education, and ethnicity
- Nutrition #3** -- The beliefs and attitudes of certain societies affect women's and men's views of the importance of nutrition. It is not sufficient to assume that women will place a greater value on nutrition than men; in fact, a variety of factors will determine both men's and women's views.
- WID #1** -- Demand side constraints to female education are often rooted in religion, class, race and ethnicity and need to be analyzed with those factors in mind.
- WID #3** -- Limited access to credit affects (men and) particularly women with low socioeconomic status; credit should be allocated on the basis of need, not simply on the basis of gender.
- WID #7** -- Education, age and social status, in addition to gender, will determine if and how a woman benefits from export oriented agribusiness. Certain groups of women will be employed directly by a firm, while others will be self-employed and provide inputs to the firm.

WID #8 -- Gender was the obvious factor in the women's relatively greater response to the new market road; it reflects relative income across genders and women's lack of other income generating opportunities

3. Variable Nature of Gender Relations:

Agriculture #3 -- Women are the dominant gender in small scale farm production; projects have assumed that the male head of household is the farm manager and major contributor towards small scale agricultural production in all agricultural production systems.

Agriculture #4 -- Aquaculture involves both men and women at different stages of production. Planners cannot assume that these roles will remain static. Program designs must be flexible.

Agriculture #5 -- Bean/Cowpea Article: "Small-scale agriculture and the division of labor by gender within it are continually modified by factors associated with the household, community and broader political economy."

Health #2 -- WASH Project recommendation: "Traditional roles need not limit women's active roles in changing and improving water supplies and systems."

ENR #4 -- Women were the traditional gatherers of indigenous food species that supplemented the Maasai diet; the food species are rarely collected now that the Maasai are living in the group ranch. Pilot project is trying to get women to grow these species in home gardens.

4. Interdependent Resource Allocation and Access and Power Relations:

Agriculture #1 -- Water Resources in Pakistan: Women are involved in agricultural decisions (especially livestock production, care and processing products) and should be targeted for relevant training/extension services.

Agriculture #2 -- TropSoils in Indonesia promotes a holistic approach to understanding the factors which affect people's practice of agriculture.

Agriculture #4 -- Aquaculture involves both men and women at different stages of production: men dominate during clearing and construction of the pond, and women in the everyday work such as feeding and fertilizing.

Health #1 -- HIV research into reducing the risks for women of HIV transmission have pointed out women's inability to influence men's use of condoms in many societies, a direct consequence of the structure of power relations.

Similarly, women often have little or no control over their sexual partner's sexual habits or promiscuity, leaving themselves vulnerable to transmission.

- Health #4** -- Mothercare: Social attitudes (including men's) about appropriate health facilities will influence women's use of health care services. The other actors who influence a women's decision to go to a health center need to be considered in project design.
- EID #1** -- Rural women can benefit from new labor saving technologies as users, even if they are not owners (Africa). Recommendation: distinguish between technology users and technology owners and operators; consider the benefits of group ownership versus individual ownership of technology.
- EJD #3** -- AMIS Project (Africa): Recommends that "explicit provisions are needed to ensure women can sell crops as owners of produce. Without such provision, the presumption of male ownership and trading currently prevailing is very likely to govern project design and implementation."
- EID #4** -- Women have derived access to land in many African countries: "rights to land only accrue to women as a result of their status within a family." Changes in land tenure systems may not appropriately investigate the informal and secondary rights that women have, inadvertently leaving women worse off than before by moving land rights out of the arena of customary law and into statutory law.
- Education #3** -- Some of the correlation between female education and reduced rates of fertility is due to the improvements in the status of women within the household and their increased bargaining power as a result of higher levels education.
- Population #5** -- Family planning activities must recognize the importance of men in determining women's decisions about contraceptive use, either through influence or access to resources. Spousal consent is required in many programs for female sterilization and other forms of contraception. In other countries, men actively prevent women from practicing contraception. A women's decisions about her body often are made within the context of her role as mother, wife, and daughter-in-law, and are influenced or determined by her husband and sometimes parents or in-laws. The use of male family planning workers may be recommended where men are the primary decision-makers about family planning and family size. There is a need to strike a balance between men and women re responsibility for reproductive decisions.
- WID #5** -- Women's income from forest products tends to be diminished as a result of deforestation, which sometimes is at the hands of men in the

family cutting trees for cash. The outcome of competing uses for forest products across genders may represent a tradeoff in the household, whereby the value of the men's use of the wood was compared with the women's use of the wood. Decisions may be made within the broader context of the household.

5. Multiple Duties/Roles:

- Agriculture #1** -- Women carrying food or fodder while getting water need appropriate compacted banks to make foot travel easier; women use watercourses for gathering water as well as doing laundry and bathing children and animals;
- EID #5** -- Working women in Mali taking short cuts with food preparation to save time; resulted in lower levels of nutrition for household members
- Nutrition #2** -- Women working at home in Indonesia may have insufficient time to devote to child care and nutrition; children of women working away from the home and staying with child care providers received better care
- WID #1** -- Girls' household responsibilities conflict with school attendance
- WID #3** -- Women's multiple roles affect type/size of enterprise
- WID #8** -- Women's long work week and response to introduction of market road.

ANNEX 3

Cross Sectoral Implications

Clusters III – Cross Sectoral Implications

This clustering was conducted to identify the extent to which the findings presented had implications for other R&D Offices or sectors. There are significant indirect implications of almost every finding presented, but for the purposes of this exercise, the cross tabulation was limited to direct implications only

A simple cross tabulation was used to identify any patterns, or areas where there was significant cross-over between sectors. The tabulation is of use as a reference to those persons interested in finding supporting information from other Offices; however, discussion of the generalizations that might be drawn from these relationships is integrated into the main text of the report.

The table is presented below and on the next page, referencing the Office and the number of the finding (see Annex 1 or 2 for specifics of the findings). The strongest showing across sectors appeared in the categories entitled "employment/income" and "education/training." There was substantial representation in "technology," "growth," and "gender disaggregated data." The other categories had less than five findings each.

| Topic | Finding |
|------------|--|
| Credit | EID 2 ED 4 WID 3 |
| Technology | EID 1 EID 5 ED 4 WID 8 H 1 H 1 AGR 1 |
| Extension | ED 4 ENR 2 AGR 3 EID 5 |
| Tenure | EID 1 EID 4 |

| | |
|------------------------|---|
| Employment/Income | EID 1 EID 2 EID 5 ED 5 AGR 1 N 2 N 3 POP 2 POP 4 WID 1 WID 4 WID 5 WID 7 WID 8 |
| Regulations | EID 3 OIT 1 |
| Growth | EID 2 ED 4 ED 5 WID 4 WID 7 POP 3 |
| Community Organization | ENR 3 ENR 4 ENR 5 WID 6 |
| Health | ED 1 ED 2 UC 1 POP 1 |
| Nutrition | EID 3 EID 5 ED 1 |
| Family Planning | ED 2 ED 3 UC 1 |

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Education/Training | ENR 1 ENR 3 ENR 4 AGR 1 N 1 UC 1 H 1 H 2 H 3 POP 2 POP 3 EIN 1 |
| Gender-disaggregated Data | OIT 1 H 3 N 3 ENR 2 ENR 3 AGR 5 |