PN-ABJ-783
74467

Study Report

on

Private Primary Education in Pakistan

Prepared by

National Educational Consultants (Pvt) Limited

for

Academy for Educational Development
Washington, D.C., U.S.A

(A USAID Project)

October, 1990

National Educational Consultants (Pvt) Limited
106 - Shaheen Centre, Block - 7, Kehkashan,
Clifton, Karachi-75600, Pakistan.
Telephone: (21) 53 49 37
Telex: 23507 TAZAM PK
Telefax: (21) 43 82 78

Table of Contents

	Executive Summary	*Page (i) - (ii)*
Chapter - I	***Introduction.***	*Page - 1*
	A... Overview	1 - 3
	B... Issues in Private Education	3 - 4
	C... Study Objectives	4 - 5
Chapter - II	***Policy and Legal Parameters of Private Education.***	*Page - 6*
	A... Government Policy Towards Private Education	6 - 8
	B... Procedures of Opening Schools	8 - 9
	C... Rules of School Registration and Operation	9 - 10
	D... Inter-Povincial Differences	10 - 15
	E... Conclusion	15 - 17
Chapter - III	***Methodology.***	*Page - 18*
	A... Sampling	18 - 19
	1) Size and Distribution	19
	2) Survey Instrument	19 - 20
	3) Method of Administration	20
	B... Sub-Sampling	20 - 22
	C... Data Analysis	22 - 24
Chapter - IV	***Findings.***	*Page - 25*
	A... Descriptive Characteristics	25 - 38
	B... Limitations of Data	38 - 39
	C... Analysis of Sub-Sample and Findings	39 - 48
	D... Cost Estimates	48 - 49

Table of Contents

Chapter - V	***Recommendations.***	*Page - 50*
	A... Recommendations for Federal Government	50
	B... Recommendations for Provincial Governments	50 - 51
	C... Recommendations for USAID	51 - 54
	References	*Page - 55*
Annexure. 1	*Study Team*	
Annuxure. 2	*Budget Allocation for Primary Education*	
Annexure. 3	*Historical Background of Private Education in Pakistan*	
Annexure. 4	*Survey Instrument*	
Annexure. 5	*List and Codes of Sub-Sampled Schools*	
Annexure. 6	*Illustrative Case Studies*	
Annexure. 7	*Individulas Interviewed*	

Executive Summary

Privately managed education has a long tradition in the Indo-Pakistan dating back to the per-British and British periods. Due to the British neglect of education of the general public, both Muslim and Hindu communities took an active part in establishing private educational institutions to safeguard their religious and political interests. Education in these institutions was largely provided free or at minimum cost and financed by the communities or individual philanthrophists.

Since 1947, a number of ethnic communities and individual entrepreneurs have been responsible for opening private institutions in the country. It is estimated that by 1967-68, approximately 40 percent of secondary schools and 50 percent of colleges were privately owned and mostly located in the urban areas. The large proportion of private education during this period is a clear reflection of the growing demand not met by the government's sources. The government resource allocation patterns in education to different levels during the same period further reflect higher percentages of allocations to primary education as compared to other levels thus inadvertently creating a private market for secondary and college education.

The significant proportion of the private market at the college level during the 1960's was largely due to individual entrepreneurs who seized upon the growing demand in urban areas. The market being essentially unregulated produced all the ills of commercialism which later in 1972 led to the Government's nationalization decree.

The nationalization and subsequent denationalization in 1979 have not much affected the potential market for private education except in shifting its focus from college level to primary and secondary level education. At present, it is estimated that over 5000 private schools with an enrolment of about 1.3 million students are functioning in the country. Most of these schools claim to be English medium and are predominantly based in the urban areas. The market remains essentially unregulated despite the plethora of existing rules and regulations which are either not enforced or poorly enforced.

The objectives of this study are to describe and analyze the major characteristics of a small sample of the existing private schools in the four provinces and provide recommendations for alleviating the constraints to qualitative improvements and quantitative expansion of private sector schools. The study is based on a survey of 432 schools in the four provinces out of which 250 schools are only primary level (1-V).

The findings from the survey indicate that private education is predominantly an urban-based phenomenon. Almost 86 percent of the schools are located in urban centers and a large majority of them are owned by individual entrepreneurs. Approximately 70 percent of these schools operate in extremely inadequate and rented facilities. It is also relevant to note that the majority of the only-primary schools are owned by individuals and established in rented buildings with poor

physical facilities.

The potential opportunities for commercialism and profit making are quite prevalent in the private market. The low price per month of education at the primary level comes to about Rs. 100 while the high price exceeds Rs. 500 per month. Private school teachers are paid low wages and only about 60 percent of them make make between Rs. 500 - Rs. 1000. Almost half of the teachers employed are ill qualified and untrained with only matriculation or intermediate degrees. The majority of the schools are Urdu medium and follo / gover.ment prescribed curriculum but most of them give the aura of being English medium.

While the majority of the schools can be legitimately characterized as commercial operations with dubious standards, there does exist a small minority of private schools that provide an acceptable quality of education. In order to examine the characteristics of these institutions, a random sub sample of 50 schools has been drawn on the basis of their "perceived" quality. An estimation of the range of quality of these schools has been made and analyzed in relation to other school characteristics including ownership; building occupancy status; grade-linkages; medium of instruction; and price. Quality is found to be significantly related to organizational ownership and management patterns, building occupancy status, and grade linkages. On the other hand, there is no significant or consistent relationship between either quality and price or quality and English medium.

The study makes recommendations to minimize and rationalize the regulatory controls over private schools, and to provide financial assistance to schools with demonstrated quality. Measures are also recommended for expanding the private sector especially in the rural areas by providing assistance to community-based and non-government organizations (NGOs').

The study has been conducted by the National Educational Consultants (Private) Limited, Karachi, with the assistance from the Academy for Educational Development, Washington, D.C. The names of the members of the study team appear in Annex. 1. The study represents an initial effort in exploring the dimensions and issues implied in private education. Further, explorations and studies are much needed.

To assist the readers, the major findings and conclusions are highlighted in **bold letters** throughout the Report.

Chapter-I Introduction

A. Overview

In order to understand the role and the status of private education in its present context, it is relevant to briefly point out the major historical antecedents of private education in Pakistan. A detailed historical background of private education under successive governments can be found under Annexure no. 1.

Prior to Pakistan independence in 1947, a significant cause of the growth of privately managed and supported education was the British colonial policy of education. The education of the "subject" population, according to British policy, was strictly governed by the colonial interest of producing a limited elite class to meet the needs of its civilian and military administration. The British government created for this purpose a chain of public schools in India which were patterned after the English Public School System and which were inaccessible to the ordinary citizens due to their prohibitive fees and language and other requirements. These were the schools that were directly financed by the government. A second feature of the British policy was to provide grants-in-aid to the local bodies and private organizations for the establishment of "secular" educational institutions in order to keep the government's role and responsibility to a minimum.

The British neglect of education in the wake of the rising political consciousness among the Muslims as well as the Hindus in the 1920's and 1930's promoted the establishment of privately managed institutions in United India. The table below presents the relative size of privately managed educational institutions at the time of independence in 1947.

Table-1
Distribution of Management of Educational Institutions in United India, 1945 - 1946

	Private Sector	Local Body	Government
Primary Schools	42.64%	53.23%	4.50%
Middle Schools	47.09%	50.24%	2.65%
High Schools	82.73%	8.09%	9.18%

Source: Qaisrani, M.N., 1989 "Involvement of Private sector in the promotion of Primary Education in Pakistan", P.3.

The institutions under the private sector in the above table were of four different categories; a) Private Public Schools which were completely financed by the

government; b) Aided Schools which received grants-in-aid from the government and followed governments' curriculum and admission policies; c) Un-aided schools which were managed and financed by the welfare organizations or communities and which did not receive any government assistance; and d) Islamic and Christian missionary schools managed and financed by religious organizations.

After the independence in 1947, the government of Pakistan assumed the responsibility for education. However, the financial resources allocated for this purpose were not adequate to meet the needs of various levels of education thus leaving a gap which was filled by the private sector. In 1967-68, the government was predominantly responsible for primary and middle level education while at the secondary and post secondary levels, the responsibility was shared by the government and the private sector as reflected in the table below:

Table-2
Distribution of Management of Educational Institutions in Pakistan, 1967 - 1968

	Private Sector	Local Body	Government
Primary Schools	4.0%	2.79%	93.18%
Middle Schools	10.30%	2.08%	87.60%
High Schools	39.65%	25.64%	34.71%
Colleges	50.78%	6.20%	43.21

Source: Qaisrani, M.N, 1989, "Involvement of private sector in Primary Education in Pakistan", P.4.

The figures in the above table point out that primary and middle school level education was predominantly financed and managed by the government. In contrast, the private sector's share at the secondary and college level was approximately 40 percent and 50 percent respectively. There could be several causes for the growth of private education at the college level during the 1960's including the increased demand and urbanization. However, an important cause was the government's resource allocations to education at different levels during the period of 1947-48 to 1967-68. Out of the total expenditure of Rs. 23.2 million on education in 1947-48, Rs. 11.0 million was related to primary education. It is worth noting that almost 50 percent of the expenditure was on primary education as compared to only 10 percent on post secondary and college education. In 1967-68, approximately 30 percent of the total expenditure was related to primary education. The expenditure estimates during the interim years (1947-48 to 1967-68) similarly showed that between 30 percent to 50 percent expenditure was related to primary education and lower percentages of expenditure related to post secondary, college and technical education (Pakistan Education Statistics, 1989, P.40-42 see Annex.2). Thus the increasing demand for college education was met by the private sector.

The rapid expansion of private sector at the college level during the 1960's was followed by strong reactions from the public as well as the government against commercialism and low quality of privately managed education. By the close of the Ayub Khan era in 1968-69, the demand for a take-over of educational institutions by teachers as well as students culminated into what is now known as the "March movement of teachers and students". Subsequently, the Peoples' Party government in 1972 made "nationalization" of education as a corner stone of its educational policy.

The government nationalized 78 colleges in Punjab and 97 in Sindh without any compensation to the owners. Since there were only a few private institutions in Balochistan and NWFP, the two provinces did not fall under the nationalization decree. Nationalization on part of the government entailed a number of problems, some of which are still continuing. The academic environment was vitiated by a large number of dissatisfied teachers of nationalized schools and a counter struggle by the ordinary government school teachers. Added to this was the pressure, relentlessly mounted by the ex-owners of the institutions.

The government responded in 1983 by enacting an amendment to the nationalization decree of 1972. This amendment had the affect of authorizing the provincial governments to restore the ownership of nationalized institutions. A second by-product of this amendment was the substantial growth of so called English medium Private schools in the country, mostly owned by individual entrepreneurs

A current official estimate of the number of registered and non-registered private schools in the country is not available. It is generally believed, however, that over 5000 elementary and secondary schools are operating and majority of them are located in the urban areas.

B. Issues in Private Education

The growth and decline of private education at different levels, the government's nationalization and denationalization, and the shifts in budgetary allocations have created hindrances to the development of primary education. **Despite the stringent government rules and regulations on private schools, there is no effective government control or regulation of standards of private schools as discussed in the next Chapter.** At the same time, the basic issues of **equity** and **quality** in the private as well as the public education have become politicized partly due to the lack of objective information.

Equity or equality of access in education can be undermined by a combination of economic and political factors. Economically, the price of education if non-affordable by a large segment of a population restricts its availability only to a few who can afford and thus compromises the notion of equity. **In Pakistan, it is quite obvious**

that private education is affordable by a very few which explains its growth in high income urban areas. An equal access to education can also be denied politically by implicitly or explicitly "reserving" the rights of admission to certain educational institutions for a limited privileged class. Economic and political considerations often reinforce each other in creating inequities. From this perspective, the government's sub-system of educational institutions established outside the "regular" system which includes the model schools, the public schools and the military schools are the privilege of a minority and are equally inaccessible to the general public. Thus from an equity point out view, it is difficult to find a justification for either the private schools or the elitist sub-system supported by the government.

Due to a lack of a uniform standard and under-developed testing procedures, the quality of education has become more a matter of perception than reality. The extrinsic characteristics of schools such as the price and the medium of instruction that are brought to bear on quality of education make it difficult to compare "regular" education provided by the government with private education.

Moreover, the public expectations of private education are founded on the "memories" of the British public schools and Christian missionary schools which in the past imparted "good" education in English at reasonable prices. Thus, the relationship between quality and English medium, in the mind of the general public, may be considered as a dogma which is carried over from the past.

The issues of equity and quality are directly or indirectly related to other issues including **price, medium of instruction,** and **management and ownership patterns** in private schools. These issues are central to the objectives of this study.

C. Study Objectives

The overall objective of the Private primary Education Study (PPES) is to identify the major issues and constraints in private education as well the necessary measures to facilitate its expansion. Specifically, the study has the following objectives:

1. Develop a simple descriptive classification system for private primary schools with respect to:

- *the nature of ownership;*
- *size and relationship of the other education levels;*
- *backgrounds characteristics of schools.*

2. Analyze the specific rules and regulations at both the federal and the provincial levels that affect the development and operation of private primary schools in

Pakistan.

3. Develop profiles of education with regards to quality of education and other school characteristics.

4. Develop recommendations for the Federal and Provincial Governments as well as for the USAID for mobilizing increased participation of the private sector in primary education.

Chapter II Policy and Legal Parameters of Private Education

A. Government Policy toward Private Education

The Government, in its education policy of 1972, took a radical departure from its pre-1972 policy by announcing the nationalization of all private educational institutions. The decision was taken on the grounds that private educational institutions, in addition to being vehicles of commercialism were responsible for creating inequalities by denying equal access to education to all and were reinforcing social class-based distinctions. Therefore, the privately managed institutions were to be nationalized and integrated into the national education system for the purposes of increasing participation and providing an equal access to education on the basis of ability and merit rather than class affiliations.

The implementation of the policy faced a number of administrative and political difficulties and could not be carried out in a uniform manner. Further, it created extra financial burdens for the Government as a result of lowering tuition fees and assuming the recurrent costs of the nationalized institutions. For instance, in Punjab out of the total outlay of Rs. 557 million in 1974-75, approximately Rs:75 million was new expenditure arising directly from nationalization. The overall national burden was actually heavier due to the reduced revenues and increased recurrent and overhead expenditures (Qaisrani, 1989). The growth rate in primary education during the 1970-78 showed a marked decline.

Comparison of Growth Rates of Primary Education in Pakistan

	Institutions	*Enrolment*	*Teachers*
1960 - 1970	7.75	6.58	6.72
1970 - 1978	3.00	6.25	5.10

Source: AEPM Paper, 49, 1989.

The Government reversed the nationalization decision in its education policy of 1979 on the conclusion that declining participation rates and the Governments' budgetary constraints make it necessary to encourage, once again, the involvement of private sector in educational development. The following policy measures were recommended (Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, 1977).

- Private enterprise will be encouraged to open educational institutions particularly in rural areas;

- Permission to set up educational institutions will be granted by the Ministry of Education or respective provincial departments;

- Criteria for according permission to set-up new educational institutions and their recognition will be developed to ensure academic standards and provision of qualified staff and their terms and conditions of service and adequate physical facilities;

- The existing legislation on nationalization of privately managed educational institutions will be suitably amended to allow opening of private educational institutions and to ensure that such institutions set up with the permission of the government will not be nationalized in future;

- Regular instructional supervision of these institutions will be undertaken by the education departments and relevant statutory bodies; and

- Income tax relief will be allowed to individuals and organizations for donations to these schools.

The successive policies of the government represent a continuation of the 1979 educational policy. The Education Policy of 1989 makes the following provisions for the involvement of the private sector:

- Reasonable tax-rebates shall be granted on the expenditure incurred on the setting up of educational facilities by the private sector. Grants-in-aid for specific purposes shall be provided to the private sector in the rural areas or the poor urban areas, and for this purpose the Education Foundations will be set-up in each Province. Companies with a paid-up capital of Rs:50 million, or more, shall be required under the law to be establish and run educational institutions up to secondary level with funds provided by them. Liberal loan facilities will also be provided to private educational institutions.

- English may be used as one of the media of instruction, in addition to Urdu or/an approved Provincial language;

- Private publishers will be encouraged to produce school text-books; and

- The Private sector will be encouraged to set-up Teachers Training Institutes and Teachers Resource Centres.

As can be concluded from the provisions in all the successive education policies since 1979, the private sector in education is not a "partner" all though the word "participation" and "invitation" to play a role in education appear with regularity. However, this accommodation of private education is invariably followed by cautious warning against commercialization and exploitation to justify government control. Weather the government gives

grants-in-aid or not, which it has not done on a regular basis from 1977-78 (when private schools and colleges were permitted to open, after the de-nationalization in 1972) but only in sporadic cases, or for specific purposes, not the least common being patronage to religious organizations such as Deeni Madrassas. To make charges on institutions that have not got any benefit, except that they are allowed to "open" an institution in the country appears to be "heavy handed". But, the logic of the policy is to allow for private sector participation and at the same time to ensure that all are working within the framework of national objectives and ideology, that a standard is maintained, that the fees-schedule is in conformity with facilities provided, so that education does not turn into an unalloyed commercial venture.

The implementation of provisions for the involvement of the private sector presents problems due to the lack of coordination and agreement between the Ministry of Education and other relevant Ministries and departments. The provisions of financial assistance and tax-rebates contained in 1989 and previous policies require an agreement from the Ministry of Finance and the Central Board of Revenue which is hard to obtain. Similarly, utility charges for electricity, gas and water are fixed by the respective municipalities and utility organizations. A change in these charges from commercial to non-commercial rates remains out-side the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Education. Therefore, a concrete and implementable policy measure for the mobilization and assistance of private sector has to be taken at the highest Inter-Ministerial level or at level of the Planning Commission. **In conclusion, the government's past and present educational policies do make provisions for the involvement of the private sector without taking any concrete steps for their effective implementation. In order to make a credible and an implementable policy the government must consider the involvement of the private sector in the policy formulation process.**

B. Procedures of Opening Schools

The registration of the birth of a school is pre-ceded by the registration of the Parent/Sponsoring body either as a Trust or a Society, consisting of usually an odd number (up to 9 in most cases) of like minded people who apply for registration under the "Societies Act of 1860" for the purpose of furthering the cause of "literary, scientific, or charitable ends". Once the Society is registered, it is entitled to an income tax rebate on monies collected as donations, endowments, gifts etc. The "Memorandum" of Association lays out the aims and objects of the society and the rules that will govern the working of the society. Once registered the Society is empowered to open-sponsor any number of institutions with the same aims and objectives.

The process of registration with Joint Stock Companies may take anything from one to three months. The promoters must submit their National Identity Cards, their professions and parentage, and a copy of the monies in a scheduled bank account,

to be used exclusively and in the name of the society. The fees are nominal.

The next step is to approach the Directorate of Education for registration of the school which is governed by the rules of registration of the respective Provincial Directorates. The rules of registration in different provinces, have articles in common, but differ in the severity of conditions.

C. Rules of School Registration and Operation

All the provinces derive their legal strength from their Education Codes, the origins of which go far back into the early 20th century. Most of these education codes have inhibiting requirements as regards to terms and conditions of service of teachers, tuition fees, physical facilities etc. **In spite of these "stringent" conditions, it is estimated that about 5000 private educational institutions with an enrolment of about 1.3 million children are functioning in the country. Most of these schools claim to be "English-medium", imparting education from pre-primary to higher secondary level. The concentration is in the urban areas, approximately 25% of all students in Karachi city are in private schools.**

The rules and regulations governing the registration of schools and their subsequent operations have common features in all the provinces. These, however, vary in their scope and breadth from one province to the other.

The following summarizes the common features of provincial rules and regulations that apply to school registration.

- The National curriculum shall be followed;
- The fee schedule shall not be changed without prior permission;
- The books prescribed by the Government, from time to time, shall be used;
- The Sponsoring/Parent/Investing body should be registered and have financial stability;
- The terms and conditions of service of teachers should be approved, and they should be paid by cheque;
- Class-room space, facilities, furniture, laboratory equipment etc. be adequate and in consideration of the class-enrolment;
- No addition of classes shall be made till prior approval is obtained;
- Arrangements shall be made for physical training and exercise;
- The school shall function for all 6 days a week;
- The school shall observe 5 working hours/days, 200 days/academic year;
- The admission fee shall be equal to the monthly tuition fee;
- No other fee be charged except those approved and Rs. 10/per student/per

year to be spent by the Head exclusively on student welfare;

- The school shall teach Arabic and Holy Quran (Nazra) as per syllabus.
- There shall be at lease 50 percent trained teachers out of the total staff;
- The Management shall submit monthly reports of progress to the Directorate of Education.

D. Inter-Provincial Differences and Specific Requirements

A review of the educational codes of the four provinces indicates differences in the scope and degrees of constraints which apply to private schools. The following summary from provincial codes serves to illustrate the varying stringincies of the requirements.

Punjab

The Government of Punjab Education Code (Rules and Appendices) 1989 covers almost every aspect of administration and management, for the Government, Aided, Local Council, Public and Cadet, Cantonment Board Schools and Colleges. Chapter V (Part I) deals with Rules of recognition and registration of privately-managed educational institutions.

As is the practice, the Director of Education is the recognizing authority for schools, under the conditions common to other codes, except for a few:

(a) In a school in Classes I to V admission will be open to both boys and girls wherever the circumstances demand and allow;

(b) If a school is promising enough to deserve encouragement but does not satisfy all the conditions of recognition, provisional recognition may be granted for a period not exceeding two years. In such cases orders shall be accompanied by a clear and definite statement of the condition to be fulfilled before the school is permanently recognized

(c) Recognition may be withdrawn by the authority empowered to grant it. When an institution or any of its departments or classes has ceased to fulfill the condition or conditions of recognition, the recognizing authority shall withdraw recognition for that institution or class provided that where recognition is withdrawn as a disciplinary measure the management shall in the first case be allowed reasonable time, to be fixed by the recognizing authority within which to remedy them and if they are remedied to the satisfaction of that authority, recognition shall not be withdrawn. Reasons for the withdrawal of registration include:

- Undue laxity in granting promotions to teachers if it continues after the warning, will be considered sufficient reason for the withdrawal of recognition from any

institution which suffers from this defect.

- Recognition is also liable to be withdrawn from an institution if either the management or the staff or the students of an institution take part in activities prejudicial to the integrity and solidarity of the state or disseminate opinions tending to excite feeling of disloyalty to the state or of enmity and hatred between different religions, sects or class in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, or if the students are permitted to attend political meetings or to engage in any form of political or communal agitation. Recognition will not be withdrawn under this provision without giving opportunity to the school authority concerned to show cause why recognition should not be withdrawn.

- An institution or a class of an institution from which recognition has been withdrawn shall not be restored to that previous position until the recognizing authority has been satisfied that the defects which led to the withdrawal of recognition have been removed, and that in all other respects the institution or class fulfills the prescribed conditions.

- The recognition of institution or any of its classes shall lapse if:

i) A recognized institution or class ceases to exist; or

ii) An institution is transferred to different building or locality not already approved by the competent authority; or

iii) In case of provisional recognition the conditions imposed under Article 93 of this chapter are not fulfilled on the expiry of period of provisional recognition; or an application for permanent recognition is not received, on the proper form, in the office of the competent authority concerned three months before the expiry of the said period, provided that recognition shall not lapse in the middle of the academic year but only at the end of it; or

iv) If an institution is transferred to a different managing body not already approved by the competent authority.

v) If the recognition of a school or Teaching Department has lapsed under this article, then for the purpose of future recognition it shall be treated as a new institution or a Teaching Department.

vi) Branches opened by the management of an institution already recognized shall also be treated as new institutions or classes for the purpose of recognition.

- An appeal against an order refusing or withdrawing recognition will in all cases lie with the next higher authority.

- Every student of an institution shall reside with his parents or with guardians or

in a recognized hostel or boarding house.

Grants-in-aid:

With regards to financial assistance, the Punjab Government provides funds to be expended as grants-in-aid. The maintenance grant means a grant as an aid towards its expenditure on approved items, and separate developmental grants for construction of buildings, purchase of equipment etc. are granted. The basis for calculating grants shall be up to 25 percent of the approved expenditure, after taking into consideration the income from fees, funds, donations, endowments etc. Some privileged institutions, having special and extra facilities may be given grants up to 50 percent of the approved expenditure.

For the purpose of the grant-in-aid in Elementary schools, the enrolment shall not be less than 75 and in case of girls' only institutions not less than 50. Average daily attendance should not be less than 70 percent.

The staff should be qualified, adequate and of good moral character and firmly believes in the ideology of Pakistan. It should be noted that the authorities sanctioning the grant can order an inquiry into the conduct of any member of the staff employed in an aided-institution.

These rules are perhaps the most stringent and most liable to be used for any purpose, at any time by the Directorate of Education in Punjab.

Sindh

The registration requirements of the Karachi and Hyderabad Regional Directorates of Education include conditions common to other provinces pertaining to the internal organization of the institution, class promotion, teachers' terms of service, school time table, discipline, assignment of work etc.

The Government of Sindh regulates the working of private schools through the Education Code and the West Pakistan Registration of Unrecognized Educational Institutions Ordinance (1962), in which the penalty for running an unrecognized private educational institutional institution "shall be punishable with imprisonment which may extend to one year.

Grants-in-aid:

The Government of Sindh makes provisions for financial assistance to Private schools under the rules of the Education Code of 1962. The various heads under which the Grants are provided are as follows:

Maintenance:

- 3/4th of the deficit between admitted expenditure and the income derived from fee. No school receiving this grant shall charge fee at rates higher than the approved schedule.

Building Grant:

- For purchase, erection or extension of school or hostel building, and
- The execution of extra ordinary repairs to school and hostel buildings;
- No grant is admissible for ordinary upkeep of building.
- A bond is to be executed. No grant shall exceed half the total expenditure in aid of which it is given in the case of buildings.

List of admissible items for grant in-aid:

- Pay of establishment - teaching and non-teaching, including expenditure incurred by manager of aided schools on account of leave allowance to teachers.
- Rent Taxes and Insurance.
- Charges on account of ordinary repairs to school buildings.
- Charges on account of ordinary repairs to furniture equipment.
- Charges on account of ordinary repairs to Printing.
- Pension and gratuity.

NWFP

The Government of the NWFP requires registration under Appendix 2, (Article 25) of the Frontier Education Code 1935, addressed to the Director of Education, through the District Education Officer. The form elicits information about:

- Name, Registration number and year of registration of the sponsoring body;
- Location standard of recognition desired; uniform being used;
- Total monthly receipts from fees and total monthly expenditure;
- Details about number and qualification of teachers, class-rooms and their size, enrolment per class.
- After the DEO has submitted his inspection report, it is put up to the Director, who refers it to the Deputy-Commissioner for his approval;
- Applications for extension of recognition should be forwarded by the Management a month earlier, through the DEOs, so that it may be considered well in time by the Directorate;
- Registration/Renewal record should be kept ready every time for scrutiny by

the Inspecting staff.

The Directorate of Education, Peshawar, in its circular of 22 November 1988 on the subject "Streamlining of the working of Private Schools" has warned that it has come to their notice that the conditions of recognition are not being followed, and has repeated the main body of these requirements.

Extracts from the recommendations of the Secondary Education Committee of the Provincial Education Council of the NWFP (January 1989) has also been sent to the Private Managements for compliance. The positive spirit of the circular is evident in the introduction, which reads as follows:

"The resources of the state are limited hence private enterprise in setting up of educational institutions should be encouraged through financial grants-in-aid and material assistance. This would ensure involvement of the community in the education of their children. By virtue of this, an atmosphere of competition and comparison will be created. This recommendation of patronizing the private management should not be considered to mean encouragement of mushroom growth of commercially motivated private schools, which should be definitely discouraged. Recognition should be given to those institutions only when they prove to be standard institutions imparting quality education and that they have fulfilled the prescribed conditions". Some of the conditions are:

- A special check will be kept on fees/funds structure, and the service conditions of teachers will be under constant check;
- Grants-in-aid for furniture and equipment will be provided to deserving schools;
- Facilities for in-service and pre-service training of teachers will also be provided by the Education Department.

In our view, the above recommendations are highly commendable.

It is also relevant to point out that the NWFP Directorate has an Assistant Director exclusively for Private Schools, which should be a source of help to the private schools, and the example should be replicated by the other Directorates.

Balochistan.

The Government of Balochistan, in Chapter III "Rules of recognition" stipulates that "only recognized schools are permitted to present pupils for examination held under the orders of the Department or by a University and to send up candidates for public scholarships". Some of the conditions peculiar to the Balochistan Code are:

- Recognition shall be granted by the Director, and if recognition is refused, a

copy of the order shall be sent to the Manager of the school stating the reasons for refusal:

- Management of recognized schools shall undertake that all orders of the local Government or of the Department relating to admission and removal of students, the promotion of pupils to higher classes, use of authorized text-books, the conditions under which religious instructions may be imparted, the appointment and removal of the teaching staff and conditions of service shall be strictly observed;

- That the Head-Master is recognized as the sole authority in all matters connected with school administration.

Grants-in-aid:

The Provincial Government regularly provides grants-in-aid to most of the Private schools in Balochistan. The grants are provided to support recurrent, as well as , capital expenditures. The recurrent expenditure grants are mainly for compensating teachers and range between Rs:10,000 to Rs:30,000 per annum. The developmental grants are provided for building construction and facilities improvements and support up to 50 percent of the cost estimates.

According to the estimates provided by the Directorate officials interviewed, the Balochistan Government has disbursed about Rs:470 million in developmental and Rs:170 million in recurrent grants since 1986. The development grants in 1989 have gone to well established and resourceful organizations such as Helpers Society, Islamia School, Tamir-e-Nau and Christian missionary organizations

E. Conclusions

1)...The rules and regulations as embodied in the Provincial Codes are too cumbersome and more concerned with regulating the individual owners and their behavior rather than the quality and the standards of education. The regulations in the Punjab Code are extremely restrictive as compared to those in other Provinces. In all Provinces, the enforcement of regulations is not undertaken systematically and regularly. In many cases in fact, regulations are enforced by individual officers of the Directorates as a punitive measure.

2)...The enforcement of rules and regulations by the Provincial Directorates results in harassment and the in-explanatory delays, first in registration, then in its continuation that causes genuine frustration on part of the school managers. Another factor that has found its place in the pleas and comments of the Private Managements Bodies and individuals is the "extraction" of taxes on commercial rates that are charged for electricity, water, gas and other

over-heads – besides the "old age benefit charge" at the rate of Rs. 75/- per teacher for salaries of Rs. 1500/- per month and 5% of salary per month for employees getting less than Rs. 1400/- monthly. This is expected back from Government after employees reach 60 years of age as pension to the extent of Rs. 300 - 400/- per month. **For all practical purposes, the private schools are treated by the government as commercial entities and the existing rules do not allow to make a distinction between good schools and bad schools.**

3)...Both the federal and provincial governments make provisions for Grants-in-aid for the private schools. There have been very few federal government grants awarded since 1978 - 79 after the de-nationalization. The most recent grants by the federal government were awarded in June 1990 to ten private schools in Karachi. These special grants of Rupees half million to Rupees two million were awarded to well established and apparently well-to-do private schools in Karachi including Grammar School, BVS Parsi School, St. Joseph School, and recently established St. Michael School. At the level of the provincial governments, the grants are scarcely awarded due to paucity of funds with the exception of Balochistan where Grants-in-aid are regularly given since 1986 - 87. **The Grants-in-aid are generally awarded on the "perceived" quality or reputation of schools. Political resourcefulness of individual schools is a major factor in accessing these grants. An explicit criteria and an objective method of selection does not seem to exist.**

4)...According to the Private Management, irrespective of the Province, there is no fixed time-limit for the school to get its actual registration, which is granted on a temporary basis and this state might continue for several years, and without good reason. Therefore, many schools prefer to remain outside the pale of "registration" due to Government interference, but this is harmful for the students in the long run. According to the rules, the transfer of students from a Private school to another Private school or a Government school, must be approved by the Directorate of Education. Obtaining this approval is a frustrating and time consuming process for the registered schools but in case of un-registered schools, the approval cannot be legally granted.

The Private Managements complain that there is no real assistance from Government in exchange "for services rendered to the community". Many Private school owners have requested that Government bear the cost of the training of teachers of Private schools, if the qualification conditions do not meet the requirement. Grants-in-aid for books, concessions on paper used for exercise books would reduce the running expenses. Loans on easy terms would certainly encourage genuine educationists, who could not afford the initial capital costs of setting up institutions in the early years of its establishment.

5)...From the government's perspective, the experience of the authorities and the brunt they bear from the public, as representatives of the State, lead them to the opinion that government control is needed until the market forces have

weeded out the commercial institutions. There is very little evidence, however, that government rules and regulations have restrained the rapid growth of commercially - oriented institutions. For all practical purposes, the private education is an unregulated market where government control is exerted in limited instances based upon the whims of the Directorates' officials.

In our view, there should be a positive control and over-seeing of the private sector schools by the Government. Instead of a "police-type enquiry" an inspection of the schools, under the regulations, should, include "advise" on better management and administration. Officials should meet with teachers and discuss problems of teaching and learning, help in solution of difficulties with transporters, the police and other local authorities, and so on. Instead of being on opposites of the fence, both the Government through the Directorates and the Private sector could work towards common objectives.

We propose the following measures to make regulation an effective instrument.

1. **Regulations should be reframed by the Government with the involvement of representatives from the Private sector and these should be objectively implementable and consistent with the government declared Education Policy;**

2. The Registration of institutions, as per regulation, should be completed in one month from date of submission, all documents and papers being complete;

3. Inspections should be held twice a year by a team of educationists, public-minded citizens and representatives of the Director of Education. The Inspection Committee should have a meeting with both teachers, parents and management, where solutions to financial difficulties, attitude of the authorities, performance of staff and students and the general well-being of the institution be discussed, reviewed and reported.

4. The Private managements should be encouraged to form representative organizations.

5. A Council be set up consisting of educationists, management experts, administrators to assist donor body representatives to evaluate (the applications received for grants), process, test against developed criteria the merits of an institution and its claim for grant.

This Council should over-see, guide and monitor those institutions, recipients of grants, plan and arrange training programs and work-shops for teachers and managers of private schools.

Chapter-III Methodology

The study, according to the Terms of Reference, has two major objectives requiring collection of primary data and its analysis. One, to develop a descriptive classification system of private primary schools in terms of their physical, instructional, and financial characteristics. Two, to undertake an analysis of the schools' characteristics and determine the factors which may help to differentiate among a range of schools with respect to their quality, ownership and management patterns, and their academic and financial resources.

The collection of official data on the number of private schools in the country were considered to be the first step in sampling. An attempt was made to obtain and compile the official staatistics from the Provincial Directorates of Education. Complete statistics on registered schools, however, were not available with the Directorates except with the Directorate of Karachi Region. Additionally no information was available on the number of non-registered school. This statistics provided by the Karachi Regional Directorate consists of the names and addresses of the schools, tuition fees, and grade linkages.

In order to develop some estimates of the number of private schools in each province, the study coordinators contacted the Directorates of Education in their respective provinces. The following rough estimates were thus developed for each province.

Province	No. of registered schools
Sindh	1095
Punjab	1500
NWFP	700
Balochistan	97
Total	3392

The above estimates do not reflect the total population since these were developed as rough calculations made by the study coordinators without the benefit of official statistics. In the case of Sindh, the estimates were verified with the District Education officers (DEO's) who seem to be better informed. **So far the government's record keeping of private schools is concerned, it appears that the information is more reliably available, not necessarily well organized, at the district level than at the level of the Provincial Directorates. It should also be pointed out that the Federal Ministry of Education does not keep any information on private schools.**

A. SAMPLING:

A two-stage sampling process was adopted, first to develop a descriptive classification system and then to conduct an in-depth assessment of a smaller sub-selected set of schools.

The criteria to select a general sample was governed by multiple considerations to ensure that the sample drawn was sufficiently representative. In this process, we took into account, **grade linkages, location, medium of instruction,** and **tuition prices** of the schools. The basic idea was to draw more or less an equal number of schools into the sample that cut across the above mentioned considerations. For example, a certain percentage of Primary-only schools were taken in the sample and the remaining selection included composite schools where primary grades are linked either to middle grades (6th to 8th) or to higher secondary grades (9th and 10th). Similarly, with respect to medium of instruction, schools with only English medium were supplemented with schools with Urdu and English medium, only Urdu medium, and English medium and regional language.

The outcome of our sampling process is a selected set of clusters of schools in urban, semi urban, and non-urban (urban slum and rural) locations with varying grade linkages and medium of instruction with the exception that high priced schools where the monthly tuition exceeds Rs. 500/- have been deliberately excluded from the sample. Thus, the sample is purposely skewed towards low and medium price private education under the assumption that price affordability is a critical factor in making any recommendations for strengthening or expanding of private sector education.

1. SIZE AND DISTRIBUTION OF GENERAL SAMPLE:

Out of the total estimated population of registered schools in the four provinces, a general sample is drawn comprising of 12% in Sindh, 6% in Punjab, 23% in NWFP, and 55% Balochistan. A total of 432 registered private schools are thus covered under the general sample out of which 250 are only primary schools.

2. SURVEY INSTRUMENT - GENERAL SAMPLE:

A structured questionnaire was designed to collect basic data on the physical facilities, instructional inputs and resources, financial income and expenditure, management and organizational characteristics, and other related features of the schools.

The questionnaire was pretested in several schools in Karachi to determine required changes and appropriate methods of its administration. The data obtained during the pretesting in Karachi was cross-checked against the data available with the Directorate of Education to get a feel for the accuracy of the data collected during the pretesting phase. The schools included for pretesting were those for which the Karachi Directorate had uptodate data compiled as part of the school registration and inspection procedures. No significant discrepancies were found in the two sets of data. However the survey questionnaire includes items, such as income and expenditure estimates, curriculum, teaching methods, management orientation of ownerships etc. which are in addition to the data normally collected by the Provincial Directorates during the initial and renewal of registration procedures.

As a result of the pretesting, a number of inquiry items were deleted or revised in order to elicit accurate information. A further and final revision of the questionnaire was

undertaken on the basis of the review of the instrument by the USAID and AED.

The final questionnaire employed in the collection of data is attached as Annex 4.

3. METHOD OF ADMINISTRATION

Each Provincial Coordinator engaged 2-4 researchers with previous background and experience in educational surveys who were given an orientation about the purpose and contents of the instrument and in its appropriate administration. The primary method was to visit the schools and seek an appointment with the owners, administrators, or principals to be interviewed and collect oral, written, and documented information in response to the items of inquiry. The researchers recorded the data during the interviews and in cases where documented information was provided, they completed the questionnaire soon after the interviews. This method was followed in the majority of cases except where after several visits, the respondents could not be contacted. In those instances, the survey questionnaire was left at the school and the completed responses were later collected.

The time given by the respondents and the information and documentation provided varied from one group of schools to others which is a significant indication of cooperation and information-sharing attitudes of the school management. We tend to believe that well managed and well established schools were more cooperative and open in the data collection efforts than those with commercial orientation.

A number of difficulties in the field data collection process are worth mentioning as these reflect the biases that might be introduced in the data obtained as well as the general climate within which private schools operate. First, the data was collected during a four week period between July and August when the schools all over the country were closed for summer vacations. This posed problems in contacting the owners and managers, some of whom were reported to be on extended vacations abroad.

Some of the School owners mistook the data collectors for government Inspectors or tax collectors and were reluctant and often openly hostile. This observation reflects a certain degree of distrust between the private school owners and the government. **It seems that the existing climate in which the private schools operate is of an adversarial nature where government is considered by most school owners as an obstructionist rather than a facilitator of private sector education.** Lastly, and related to the above two difficulties was the change in government in early August. This presented difficulties especially in Sindh where our inquiries about the schools were foreshadowed by the perceived fears of changes in government's policy toward private education.

B. SUB-SAMPLING:

1. SELECTION CRITERIA

The purpose of the survey under the general sample is to provide a simple descriptive

classification of private schools. Since, the data generated is not expected to lend itself to an analysis of qualitative aspects of eduction, a sub-sample from the general sample is derived to collect further in-depth information on a selected number of schools.

The criteria in the selection of the sub-sample included: **type of management, demographic location, medium of instruction, tuition price** and **building occupancy status**. First, a random number of schools, from a review of the general sample data, were selected on the basis of their "perceived quality". The selected schools were then, through a panel discussion among the team members, screened through the above criteria to ensure an equal distribution among a variety of schools. As a result, 10 to 15 schools in each province were selected for an in-depth assessment. A list of sub-selected schools in the four provinces is attached as Annex 5.

2. IN-DEPTH ASSESSMENT:

The objective of an in-depth assessment was to collect additional information on the quality of education in relation to price, ownership patterns, management behavior, and other significant correlates of quality. The assessment required to verify and complete the price information (both fee and non-fee charges) and the reccurent expenditures obtained during the general survey, as well as collection of additional information on curriculum, teaching methods, nature of proprietorship, and management behavior.

Case study method was adopted to develop individual profiles of the schools on the basis of quantitative estimates where applicable, and combined with observations and inferences derived from the personal visits and discussions with the school management.

To facilitate a comparable and systematic development of case-studies, an initial list of items for further inquiry was developed and discussed and finalized through a discussion among the team members. This was to serve simply as a check-list for in-depth assessments with the understanding that individual coordinators visiting the schools will employ observational methods to deduce all relevant information necessary to analyze the inter-relationship between price and quality, and management behavior of a school.

CHECK-LIST FOR IN-DEPTH ASSESSMENT:

Price and Quality

1. Fees-Rates of School and Non fee charges.
2. Are the facilities commensurate with the fees ?
3. Are the teachers salaries commensurate with the given profile of the school ?
4. Enrolment and Teacher-Student (Class/Section) ratio ?
5. In case of home examinations - information about frequency - manner in which the results are recorded (report cards) - relationship between parents and managemet in this regard.

6. Text books that are being used - number and variety of books in the library.
7. Curriculum innovations and coventional and non- conventional teaching methods.
8. Degree of involvement and interaction between teachers and students in the teaching - learning process, apart from the traditional roles.
9. Teachers competence and motivation.
10. Does the school have an in-house training/development, refresher program ?
11. Is the school a member of, or teachers sent to private institutions that run or hold such courses - for example: Teachers Resource Centre, Programs of the Boards of Education (of the area) etc ?
12. Are the students and parents invited to participate in the project - type of learning and teaching process ?
13. Is there any regular publication, like a school magazine or bulletin ?
14. An evaluation of physical and learning environment in the school.

MANAGEMENT

1. The nature and main objectives of the Parent/Founding body ?
2. The degree or role and contribution of the Parent/Founding body ?
3. Administrative and Financial Powers of the Principals/Head Masters/Head Mistress ?
4. Is the Principal a part of the Parent/Founding Body ?
5. What percentage of outsiders/public or parent representatives participate in the deliberations of the Governing body/Management committee of the school ?
6. Have the teachers any involvement or any responsibility in the management of the school - in academic and administrative decision making ?

C. DATA ANALYSIS:

The analysis of data collected both under the general sample and the sub-sample has been analyzed in a two step process. The intent is to move from a simple descriptive classification to a delineation of interrelationships among several factors which may help to account for significance of differences among schools. As such, the analysis of data in the second step is carried-out as an inductive exercise.

1. Preliminary analysis of the data from the general sample has relied on simple computations involving frequency distribution and percentages calculation. This analysis has been organized under two major categories: (a) Physical, non-instructional, and ownership characteristics; (b) and educational characteristic including enrolment, medium, teacher-student ratio, retention level, tuition prices, and teachers' salaries and qualifications.

Patterns emerging from this analysis have been summarized and discussed in the next chapter.

2. The second step concerns the analysis of data from the general sample, mostly quantitative combined with data from the in-depth assesments and case-studies of

sub-sampled schools. The in-depth assesment serves the purpose of verifying some of the quantitative information gathered earlier and obtaining qualitative information on curriculum, learning environment, teaching methods so that conclusions can be derived about the quality of education and its relationships with other schools' characteristics.

Since the focus of the study is on Private Primary Education, quality of education is hard to define in-terms of outputs such as examination results and test scores. There is no prescribed system of holding examiniations at the primary level and the variation in in-house testing does not allow for any comparisons either. Hence, we have opted for defining quality in relation to the inputs. We have taken the following inputs as the indicators of quality.

INDICATOR OF QUALITY:

1. Physical facilities
2. Teacher-student ratio
3. Teachers' qualifications
4. Student retention rates.
5. Curriculum innovations
6. Learning environment.

The data for the first four indicators was collected as part of the general survey and further verified and up-dated during the sub-sample assessments.

We developed quantitative estimates for curriculum innovation and learning environment during the case-studies of the schools. Each school in the sub-sample was rated on a scale of 1-10 on the these two indicators. The process of assigning scores involved making inferences from the data as well an expert judgement on the part of individual coordinators. In measuring curriculum innovation, the quality of text books and the non-text books materials, activity and project orientated teaching, and use of audio-visual material were taken into account. The learning environment was measured in terms of dsicipline, student-teacher ratio, physical layout and class organization, extra-curricular activities, and cleaniliness of physical facilities.

Quantitative estimates of the indicators were developed first by equally ranking them and then weighting them by a factor of 3 or 2 or 1 depending upon the value of the indicator as an input in the quality of education on the following basis:

1. Physical facilities were estimated as good, adequate, and poor and weighted by scores of 3,2, and 1 respectively.

2. Teacher student ratio was estimated as high (1: +40), medium (1:40)) and low (1:20) and weighted by 1,2, and 3 respectively. A low ratio is assumed to contribute more to quality education than medium and high ratios.

3. In estmating teachers' qualifications in a school, 50% and above trained

graduate teachers were catagorized as good; 25% to 50% trained graduate and only graduate teachers as adequate; and below 25% trained and graduate teachers as poor and ranked as 3, 2, and 1 respectively.

4. Students retention of 50% and above was measured as high; 30% to 50% as medium; and below 30% as low and weighted by scores of 3,2, and 1 respectively.

5. Curriculum innovation was estimated on a scale of 1 to 10.

6. Learning environment was estimated on a scale of 1 to 10

The method for weighting curriculum innovation and learning environmen was to take the scores (7-10) as 3, (6-4) as 2 and below 4 as 1.

The sum total of the scores on the seven indicators was taken as a measure of quality and cross tabulated with price, ownership, grade-linkages, and building occupancy status and medium of instruction. The findings from this analysis appear in the next Chapter.

Chapter-IV Findings

This Chapter presents the findings based on the analysis of the data on the general sample consisting of 432 schools in the provinces as well as of the data on the selected sub-sample of 50 schools for which case-studies have also been developed. Since the purpose of the analysis of sub-sample data is to delineate qualitative aspects of the schools, case-studies form a part of this analysis.

The analysis of general survey data describes the characteristics of the schools in each province followed by inter-provincial differences and similarities.

A. DESCRIPTIVE CHARACTERISTICS:

1. Demographic Distribution

Table-1

Province ---------> Stlement	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Urban Centers	70 22.4% 76.1%	85 27.2% 53.5%	49 17.7% 92.5%	109 34.8% 85.2%	313 72.5%
2 Urban Towns	15 21.1% 16.3%	36 50.7% 22.6%	4 5.6% 7.5%	16 22.5% 12.5%	71 16.4%
3 Semi-Urban/ Rural	7 14.6% 7.6%	38 79.2% 23.9%	-- -- --	3 6.3% 2.3%	48 11.1%
Column Total	92 21.3%	159 36.8%	53 12.3%	128 29.6%	432 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

Note: The percentages on top in each box represent row percentages and indicate inter-provincial differences. The percentages below indicate column percentages and represent intra-provincial differences.

Out of the 432 schools, approximately 89 percent of the schools are located in urban areas which include metropolitan centers like Karachi, Lahore, Rawalpindi, Peshawar, and Hyderabad as well as cities like Sukkur, Faisalabad, and Abbotabad. A small number of schools are also located in semi-urban (smaller) cities like Shikarpur and Sui, and urban slums like Malir and Orangi.

In punjab, about 76 percent of the schools in the sample are in urban centers mostly in Lahore while only 7 percent are in smaller cities (semi-urban) and 16 percent in medium size cities. There is even a higher percentage of schools in urban centers of Balochistan and Sindh. About 92 percent of all private schools in Baluchistan are located in Quetta while in Sindh, about 85 percent of the schools are based in Karachi, Hyderabad and Sukkur.

Since the sample is drawn randomly from the total number of registered schools in the country, the distribution does not provide an accurate estimate of the total population especially if non-registered schools were to be included. **However the private schools appear to be predominantly located in the urban areas with certain size population and level of income.**
Socio-economic status of a population is a reflection of the measure of affordability of private education and hence explains the virtual non-existence of private schools in rural areas. **The lowest tuition fees in private primary schools are found to be between Rs. 50 - Rs. 100 and less than half of the schools in this study fall in that range. At the lowest tuition levels, the rural populations could not possibly afford private education and hence its marketability remains limited to urban areas.**

2. Ownership

Table-2

Province ---------> Ownership	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Individual	72 29.5% 78.3%	126 51.6% 79.2%	25 10.2% 47.2%	21 8.6% 16.4%	244 56.5%
2 Trust	5 23.8% 5.4%	3 14.3% 1.9%	4 19.0% 7.5%	9 42.9% 7.0%	21 4.9%
3 Organisation	15 10.2% 16.3%	17 11.6% 10.7%	20 13.6% 37.7%	95 64.6% 74.2%	147 34.0%
4 Other	— — —	13 65.0% 8.2%	4 20.0% 7.5%	3 15.0% 2.3%	20 4.6%
Column Total	92 21.3%	159 36.8%	53 12.3%	128 29.6%	432 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

For the analysis, ownership has been classified into three main categories: individual, trust, Organization. Theoretically speaking, all registered schools have an organization behind them by virtue of the requirement to register as a social welfare organization. Therefore, a distinction between an individual ownership and an organizational ownership is determined on the basis of two factors. First, the membership of governing and management committees provides a distinction. An individual ownership represents predominally a family membership in the governing and managing committees with few outside individuals included only in name. The members outside the family have virtually no role in the management or the financial aspects of the school. Two, organizational ownership is distinguishable from individual ownership by the existence of a pre-formed and often well-formed community and/or organization that establishes a school. In cases where an organization has set-up a trust, the ownership is considered to reside with the trust rather than with the an organization.

The findings summarized from the data indicate that about 78 percent schools in Punjab are individually owned while approximately 79 percent in NWFP, 47 percent in Balochistan, and 16 percent in Sindh fall in this category. Almost 56 percent of the total schools studied are individually owned.

The second largest number 34 percent of the schools are owned by organizations. The schools owned by trusts are very few. A total of 21 schools or about 5 percent are owned by trusts out which 9 schools are based in Karachi. **The pattern of analysis of ownership does not appear consistent across the four provinces. Individual ownership appears to very high in Punjab and NWFP and it is quite low in Sindh where only 16.4 percent of the schools belong to individuals while 74 percent are owned by organizations and 57 percent by trust. The highest number of individually owned schools are in Punjab and NWFP.**

The nature of ownership is an important element and implies more than the organizational label or formal membership. The findings refer to three organizational-types (individual, organization, and trust). The variation among these three types with respect to their informal characteristics are equally important. **The capability to operate a school efficiently, weather as an organization or as an individual, is as much related to the strengths of an internal environment created through participation and involvement of teachers and staff, curriculum, and pedagogical methods. To highlight this aspect of ownership, please see the case-study (Code # 46) of the school which is owned and managed by one individual and does not have any formal organization, board, or committee.** The school is managed by the owner who acts as the Principal and who relies upon the two Vice-principals for making all academic and administrative decisions. The decision making procedures involve teachers who are formed into various committees and actively participate in bringing up the issues and their solutions. A remedial program for students is designed through counseling of the parents. **Some of these features of management in the school are also evident in other quality schools regardless of the nature of the ownership (see case-studies, group 'A' Annex-6).**

Organizational-types can also be differentiated on the basis their out-reach ability to need-based areas and populations. We find a number of NGOs running

schools in urban slums of Sindh and rural areas of Balochistan that fit into this category. A case-study under, Code No. 39 can be found as an illustration of an NGo managed school in Annex-6. A common organizational trait of NGO's is their ability to implement low cost integrated programs in rural areas.

3. Building Occupancy Status

Table-3

Province --------> Occupancy	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Owned Building	28 21.5% 30.4%	54 41.5% 34.0%	19 14.6% 35.8%	29 22.3% 26.4%	130 31.4%
2 Rented Building	64 22.5% 69.6%	105 37.0% 66.0%	34 12.0% 64.2%	81 28.5% 73.6%	284 68.6%
Column Total	92 22.2%	159 38.4%	53 12.8%	110 26.6%	414 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 18

The school buildings are either owned or rented, although the majority of owners self-pay rents for income tax purposes and as a insurance against their buildings being taken over by Government in the event of nationalization of private schools.

Almost 69 percent of the schools operate in the rented buildings. This percentage is likely to be higher for the total population if non-registered schools were to be included since most of them operate in rented buildings. The highest percentage of rented buildings on province-wise basis are found in Sindh (73.6), followed by Punjab (69.6), NWFP (66.2) and Balochistan (64.2). The majority of the schools in rented buildings in Sindh are located in Karachi metropolitan. **In one urban slum of Karachi, an estimated 200 private schools exist mostly housed in rented buildings (Interview with the coordinator of Orangi Education Project).**

The highest percentage of owned buildings are found in Balochistan (35.8%), followed by NWFP (34%), Punjab (30.4%), and Sindh (26.4%). A partial explanation of increased numbers of owned buildings in Balochistan and NWFP may have to do with easier availability of land at no cost or subsidized basis in those two provinces.

4. Physical Facilities

Table-4

Province ---------> Facility	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Good Facilities	11 19.0% 12.0%	21 36.2% 13.2%	8 13.8% 15.1%	18 31.0% 14.1%	58 13.4%
2 Adequate Facilities	56 23.8% 60.9%	69 29.4% 43.4%	29 12.3% 54.7%	81 34.5% 63.3%	235 54.4%
3 Poor Facilities	25 18.2% 27.2%	67 48.9% 42.[illegible]%	16 11.7% 30.2%	29 21.2% 22.7%	137 31.7%
Column Total	92 21.3%	157 36.8%	53 12.3%	128 29.6%	430 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 2

With respect to physical facilities, only 13.4 percent of the schools in the four provinces have good facilities. Among the schools that have good facilities, less than 1 percent have a clinic or a doctor or a playground on the premises. Libraries are included among the good facilities. There are no significant differences in good facilities from one province to another. The total number of schools with minimal adequate facilities are 54 percent across the four provinces. What is minimally adequate includes classrooms plus ancillary facilities like potable water and toilets. Thus 54% of these schools do not have a staffroom or library not to speak of playgrounds, staff rooms, computer rooms etc. Of all schools surveyed, 31.7 percent have poor facilities indicating the lack of minimally adequate classrooms and space. **Comparatively speaking, about 25 percent of the government schools, according to 1987 estimates, are shelterless and over 10 percent of the government primary schools operate in borrowed and rented buildings (National Educational Council, 1987). This points out the general need for more adequate investments in educational facilities be they governmental or private.**

5. Age of Schools

Table-5

Province ---------> Age	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Less Than	47 53.4% 51.1%	14 15.9% 8.9%	19 21.6% 35A.8%	8 9.1% 6.8%	88 21.0%
2 Between 3 -5 Years	19 24.4% 20.7%	35 44.9% 22.3%	7 9.0% 13.3%	17 21.8% 14.5%	78 18.6%
3 Between 5 - 10 Years	20 12.4% 21.7%	68 42.2% 43.3%	13 8.1% 24.5%	60 37.3% 51.3%	161 38.4%
4 10 Years & Above	6 6.5% 6.5%	40 43.5% 25.5%	14 15.2% 26.4%	32 34.8% 27.4%	92 22.0%
Column Total	92 22.0%	157 37.5%	53 12.6%	117 27.9%	419 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 13

The rate of proliferation of schools in different provinces can be indirectly measured by the age of schools. 21 percent out of the total schools in the four provinces have been established during the last three years. The highest number of schools are found in Punjab (51%) followed by Balochistan (36%). The relative percentages of schools less than 3 years old in NWFP and Sindh are minor. If we further assume school age as an indicator of stability and take 5 to 10 years period as a measure, we find that 51 percent of schools in Sindh and 43 percent in NWFP meet this criteria. The relative percentages for Balochistan and Punjab are 24 and 21.

6. Grade-Linkages

Table-6

Province ---------> Level	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Primary (I - V)	65 26.0% 71.4%	105 42.0% 67.3%	35 14.0% 66.0%	45 18.0% 36.9%	250 59.2%
2 Lower Sec. (I - VIII)	8 11.0% 8.8%	34 46.6% 21.8%	10 13.7% 18.9%	21 28.8% 17.2%	73 17.3%
3 Secondary (I - X)	18 18.2% 19.8%	17 17.2% 10.9%	8 8.1% 15.1%	56 56.6% 45.9%	99 23.5%
Column Total	91 21.6%	156 37.0%	53 12.6%	122 28.9%	422 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 10

Grade linkages from pre-primary to primary (I-V) to lower secondary (I-VIII) to secondary (I-X) appear to be related to the demographic locations of the schools in all of the provinces. In the urban centers of Sindh, 84 percent of the primary schools are either linked to lower secondary and or to secondary schools while only 13 percent have similar linkages in schools located in small cities and semi-urban areas. This pattern holds for other provinces as well. **Grade-linkages indicate a further relationship with ownership of schools. The data shows that disproprionately higher percentages of only - primary schools have individual ownership.** In Balochistan, individually owned primary level schools constitute 76 percent of the total schools while the same figure for Punjab, NWFP, and Sindh is 75 percent, 66 percent, and 43 percent respectively.

7. Teachers' Salaries

Table-7

Provinces ——> Salaries	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Less Than Rs:500	35 46.7% 41.7%	14 18.7% 12.8%	2 2.7% 5.6%	24 32.0% 21.6%	75 22.1%
2 Between Rs:500 & Rs:1,000	48 18.9% 57.1%	94 37.0% 86.2%	26 10.2% 72.2%	86 33.9% 77.5%	254 74.7%
3 Above Rs:1,000	1 9.1% 1.2%	1 9.1% 0.9%	8 72.7% 22.2%	1 9.1% 0.9%	11 3.2%
Column Total	84 24.7%	109 32.1%	36 10.6%	111 32.6%	340 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 92

Salaries of private school teachers are known to be significantly lower than the Government salaries which are low enough. **According to the survey data, approximately 10 percent of the primary school teachers at the primary level are paid less than Rs. 500/- per month. A majority of teachers, 59 percent, receive between Rs. 500/- Rs. 1000/-. Only 32 percent teachers are reported to receive Rs. 1000/- and above. The low salaries of teachers combined with lack of benefits and insecurity of service is a prevalent condition among private schools and affects the quality of education.**

The highest paid teachers, earnings Rs. 1000 and above though relatively minor in number, are found.

It is quite apparent that the majority of teachers are paid significantly lower salaries as compared to the government teachers. Several factors contribute to their low-wages. First, the wages are determined by the market. Since, a high percentage of private school teachers are untrained graduates, they do not qualify for government teaching jobs. Second, the government does not enforce its rules regarding the salaries of private school teachers and therefore inadvertantly encourages the school owners to pay lowest possible wages. Lastly, the private school teachers are predominantly

females living in urban areas and presumably most of them are second wage earners who supplement the family income which makes the low wages "acceptable".

8. Qualifications

Table-8

Province ---------> Qualification	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Under-Grads.	457 20.13% 44.89%	909 40.04% 61.17%	292 12.86% 51.49%	612 26.96% 33.06%	2270 46.12%
2 Only Grads.	424 21.88% 41.65%	451 22.64% 30.34%	146 7.32% 25.74%	971 48.74% 52.45%	1992 40.47%
3 Trained Grads.	137 20.75% 13.45%	126 19.09% 8.47%	129 19.54% 22.75%	268 40.60% 14.47%	660 13.41%
Column Total	1018 20.68%	1486 30.20%	567 11.52%	1851 37.60%	4922 100.0%

Teachers' qualification have been estimated under three main categories: Under-graduates with only matriculation or intermediate degrees, graduates with bachelor degrees; and trained graduates. **On an aggregate basis, 46 percent of the teachers are found to be undergraduates, 40 percent graduates, and only 13 percent trained graduates.** A higher percentage of undergraduates are found in NWFP and Balochistan followed by Punjab and Sindh. With respect to graduates, only Sindh has the highest number, 48 percent and Balochistan has the lowest 7 percent. **Across the provinces, the trained graduate teachers are found to be the highest in Sindh, almost 41 percent as compared to about 21 percent in Punjab. Both Balochistan and NWFP has about only to 19 percent of trained graduate teachers.**

9. Enrolment

Table-9

Province ----------> Enrolment	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Male	9676 15.38% 53.32%	20622 32.78% 63.46%	9713 15.44% 69.38%	22893 36.40% 51.17%	62904 57.51%
2 Female	8472 18.23% 46.68%	11870 25.54% 36.54%	4286 9.23% 30.62%	21845 47.00% 48.83%	46473 42.49%
Column Total	18148 16.60%	32492 29.70%	13999 12.80%	44738 40.90%	109377 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

The total enrolment in 432 schools is 109377 out of which 46473 are girls and 62904 boys. The male-female breakdown differs from one province to an other. The relative number of girls enroled are higher in Sindh and Punjab where the percentages are 48 percent and 46 percent respectively. The lowest female enrolment is in Balochistan with 30 percent. The girls' enrolment in NWFP is 36 percent.

10. Retention Levels

Table-10

Province ----------> Ret Level	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Below 30	19 19.6% 21.1%	57 58.8% 42.5%	2 2.1% 3.8%	19 19.6% 15.7%	97 24.4%
2 Between 30 - 40	6 28.6% 6.7%	7 33.3% 5.2%	1 4.8% 1.9%	7 33.3% 5.8%	21 5.3%
3 Between 40 - 50	5 19.2% 5.6%	14 53.8% 10.4%	2 7.7% 3.8%	5 19.2% 4.1%	21 6.5%
4 Above 50	60 23.6% 66.7%	56 22.0% 41.8%	48 18.9% 90.6%	90 35.4% 74.4%	92 22.0%
Column Total	90 22.6%	134 33.7%	53 13.3%	121 30.4%	398 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 34

The retention levels of the students at 50 percent and above across the provinces are the lowest in Balochistan where only 18.9 percent of the students continue in the same school while similar figures for Sindh, Punjab, and Baluchistan are 35.4%, 23.6%, 22% respectively.

11. Teacher-Student Ratio

Table-11

Province ----------> Ratio	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Less than 1:20	59 27.1% 64.1%	94 43.1% 60.3%	18 8.3% 34.0%	47 21.6% 37.6%	218 51.2%
2 Between 1:20 & 1:40	30 17.6% 32.6%	55 32.4% 35.3%	26 15.3% 49.1%	59 34.7% 47.2%	170 39.9%
3 Above 1:40	3 7.9% 3.3%	7 18.4% 4.5%	9 23.7% 17.0%	19 50.0% 15.2%	38 8.9%
Column Total	92 21.6%	156 36.6%	53 12.4%	125 29.3%	426 100.0%

Number of mission observations = 6

Teacher-student ratios have been calculated in three ranges; a ratio of 1:20 is calculated as low, a ratio 1:40 is calculated as medium, and 1:above 40 as high. About 51 percent of the schools in the sample have low, 39 percent medium, and about 9 percent high teacher-student ratios. **Thus almost 90 percent of the schools have satisfactory ratios meaning that the size of classes does not exceed 40 students per class. Overcrowding in classrooms may still exist due to the inadequate size of the classrooms and limited physical space which is a common phenomenon among the schools in the survey.**

12. Medium of Instruction

Table-12

Province ----------> Lang.	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 English	22 16.8% 23.9%	44 33.6% 29.1%	23 17.6% 44.2%	42 32.1% 33.1%	131 31.0%
2 Urdu	44 24.6% 47.8%	76 42.5% 50.3%	25 14.0% 48.1%	34 19.0% 26.8%	179 42.4%
3 English &Urdu	26 28.0% 28.3%	27 29.0% 17.9%	4 4.3% 7.7%	36 38.7% 28.3%	93 22.0%
4 Eng & Local Lang.		1 50.0% 0.7%		1 50.0% 0.8%	2 0.5%
5 Urdu & Local Lang.		1 12.5% 0.7%		7 87.5% 5.5%	8 1.9%
6 Urdu, Eng & Loc. Lan		2 25.0% 1.3%		6 75.0% 4.7%	8 1.0%
7 Local Lang.				1 100.0% 0.8%	1 0.2%
Column Total	92 21.8%	151 35.8%	52 12.3%	127 30.1%	422 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 10

A larger percentage of schools use Urdu medium than English medium. **The total percentage of Urdu medium schools is 42 as compared to 32 that offer English medium. A significant 22 percent use both English and Urdu medium.** Amongst the four provinces, NWFP has the highest percentage of Urdu medium schools and 1.3 percent schools in NWFP claim to use a combination of Urdu, English and local language. The percentage of Urdu medium schools in Balochistan is equally high (48.1%) but there is no school using the local languages. The schools that combine English with Urdu are greater in number than those with either English or Urdu medium.

13. Monthly Fees at Primary level

Table-13

Province ----------> Fee Level	1 Punjab	2 N.W.F.P	3 Balochistan	4 Sindh	Row Total
1 Less Than Rs:100/-	58 19.3% 63.7%	117 38.9% 78.0%	35 11.6% 66.0%	91 30.2% 71.1%	301 71.3%
2 Between Rs:100 & Rs:500	33 28.2% 36.3%	31 26.5% 20.7%	18 15.4% 34.0%	35 29.9% 27.3%	117 27.7%
3 Above Rs:500		2 50.0% 1.3%		2 50.0% 1.6%	4 0.9%
Column Total	91 21.6%	150 35.5%	53 12.6%	128 30.3%	422 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 10

According to the data, approximately 71 percent of the school charge monthly tuition fees of less than Rs. 100/- while 28 percent charge fees between Rs. 100-500/-. **Due to the inaccuracies of the data on non-tuition charges in the general sample, the total price per student at the primary level can not be determined. However, the analysis of the data of the sub-sample, in which precise figures for tuition and non-tuition charges were collected, indicates a consistent tendency among the schools to charge at least an equal sum under non-tuition expenses such as transport, books, extra-curricular activities etc.** This suggests the percentage of low priced schools charging under Rs. 100/- per month might be less than indicated.

B. Limitations of Data

Data has also been collected on other characteristics of schools surveyed including curriculum and textbooks used, price, and general income and expenditure estimates. Regarding curriculum and textbooks, the majority of the schools follow the government prescribed syllabus. About 14.3 percent follow a blend of national and foreign curriculum, and 3.1 percent follow only foreign curriculum. The information does not signify differences in the quality of curriculum.

The general survey data presents problems in determining reliable and consistent estimates of price and income expenditures of schools. The problems is partially a result of the deficiency in the instruments used and the data collection procedures but the fundamental problem is the inaccessibility of this type of data to "outsiders" including to the government. Individuals responsible for providing required information are threatened by the requests in some cases but the majority of the schools do not have any system or organized records to readily provide this type of information. An uptodate record on enrolment, fees collected, exam results, and income and expenditure is maintained only in few schools. Financial records are often deliberately kept invisible to avoid income tax and audit related problems.

Methodological difficulties in the collection of financial data can be minimized by employing indirect means. For instance, data on price can be more reliably collected through the parents rather than the school owners. Similarly, operational expenditure data can be accessed through the income tax, municipal and utility organizations. The time allocated to this form of activity must be realistic.

C. Analysis of Sub-sample and Findings

The sub-sampling procedure and the design of the in-depth assessment is described in the previous Chapter. Essentially, the objective is to verify and collect further data on price, income and expenditure, as well as develop a set of indicators of the quality of education.

The data collected for the sub-sample provides estimates of quality for the 50 schools as well as a range of estimates on non-instructional characteristics of schools that include nature of ownership, building occupancy status, grade-linkages, price, and medium of instruction. The quality is a composite variable of several education - specific characteristics of schools while the four non-instructional characteristics represent discreet variables.

1. Estimates of Quality

The total estimates of quality for the 50 schools vary between 11 to 18. According to the method of estimating quality as described in Chapter-III, each school has been assigned a score of 3,2, or 1 on six dimensions i.e. physical facilities, teacher-student ratio; teachers qualifications, student retention level, curriculum innovation, and learning environment. The estimates for the 50 schools in the sub-sample are presented in the next table.

An initial examination of these scores across 50 cases reflects significant variations among the six variables with the exception of student retention level where more than 35 schools receive a maximum score of 3 meaning higher retention rates. Analysis of the data from the general sample suggests that retention levels are closely associated with grade-linkages meaning the lesser the grade-linkages the lower the retention levels and vice versa.

Estimates of Quality Education

School Code	Physical Facilities	Teacher - Student Ratio	Teacher Qualification	Student Retention Level	Curriculum Innovation	Learning Environment	TOTAL
1	3	2	2	1	2	3	13
2	2	1	2	2	3	3	13
3	3	2	2	3	3	3	16
4	3	2	2	3	2	3	15
5	3	2	2	1	3	3	14
6	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
7	3	3	3	3	3	3	18
8	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
9	3	3	2	3	3	3	17
10	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
11	3	2	3	3	3	2	16
12	3	2	3	3	2	2	15
13	3	3	3	3	2	3	17
14	3	2	3	1	1	2	12
15	3	3	2	2	1	2	13
16	3	2	1	3	1	2	12
17	3	2	3	2	1	2	13
18	3	2	1	3	1	2	12
19	3	2	2	3	2	3	15
20	2	3	2	3	1	2	13
21	3	3	1	2	1	1	11
22	2	2	3	2	2	3	14
23	1	3	2	1	2	2	11
24	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
25	2	3	1	3	2	2	13
26	2	2	1	2	2	2	11
27	2	3	1	3	1	1	11
28	3	2	2	1	1	1	10
29	2	2	2	1	2	2	11
30	3	3	3	1	3	3	16
31	1	2	3	1	2	2	11
32	3	1	1	3	2	3	13
33	2	2	1	3	2	2	12
34	3	2	1	3	2	2	13
35	2	2	2	3	1	1	11
36	3	1	2	3	1	1	11
37	3	2	2	3	2	2	14
38	2	3	1	2	1	2	11
39	2	3	3	3	2	2	15
40	2	2	2	3	2	2	13
41	3	2	3	3	3	2	16
42	2	3	3	3	2	2	15
43	3	2	2	3	1	1	12
44	3	2	2	3	1	2	13
45	3	2	2	3	2	2	14
46	3	3	3	3	2	2	16
47	3	3	3	3	2	2	16
48	2	2	2	3	2	2	13
49	3	2	3	3	3	3	17
50	3	2	2	3	1	2	13

2. Profiles of Quality Schools

For the purpose of the analysis, the estimates of quality are broken down into three categories 'A', 'B', and 'C'. Scores of above 16 are taken as 'A' representing high quality, scores between 13 and 15 are taken as 'B' indicating medium quality and below 13 scores as 'C' representing low quality. **From this categorization, we have developed three main profiles of quality of education. The analysis yields 14 schools in category 'A' (high quality), 21 schools in category 'B' (medium quality), and 15 schools in 'C' (low quality).**
The profiles of schools under A,B, and C categories are summarized in the next set of tables. Further, illustrative case-studies for each profile have been developed and attached as Annex-6.

Profile A: High Quality Schools

Code #	Quality	Ownership T	Ownership O	Ownership I	Building Status O	Building Status R	Grade - Linkage I-X/	Grade - Linkage I-VIII/	Grade - Linkage I-V	Medium of Inst U	Medium of Inst E	Medium of Inst U&E	Price H	Price M	Price L
3	16	X			X		X					X	X		
6	17	X			X		X					X	X		
7	18		X		X		X				X			X	
8	17	X			X		X				X		X		
9	17	X			X		X			X					X
10	17		X		X				X	X					X
11	16		X		X		X					X		X	
13	17		X		X		X				X		X		
24	17		X			X			X		X			X	
30	16			X		X	X				X			X	
41	16		X		X		X					X		X	
46	16			X		X	X				X		X		
47	16			X		X			X		X			X	
49	17		X		X		X				X			X	

Ownership	Building Status	Grade - Linkage	Medium of Instruction	Price
T = Trust		I - X = Secondary Level	U = Urdu	H = High
O = Organisation	O = Owned Building	I - VIII = Lower Sec.Level	E = English	M = Medium
I = Individual	R = Rented Building	I - V = Primary Level	U&E = Urdu & Eng.	L = Low

Profile B: Medium Quality Schools

Code #	Quality	Ownership T	Ownership O	Ownership I	Building Status O	Building Status R	Grade - Linkage I-X/	Grade - Linkage I-VIII/	Grade - Linkage I-V	Medium of Inst U	Medium of Inst E	Medium of Inst U&E	Price H	Price M	Price L
1	13		X		X		X					X			X
2	13		X			X	X			X					X
4	15		X		X		X			X				X	
5	14		X		X		X			X			X		
12	15		X		X		X				X			X	
15	13			X		X					X			X	
17	13		X			X	X	X				X	X		
19	15		X			X	X					X	X		
20	13		X		X		X			X					X
22	14		X		X			X			X				X
25	13		X			X			X	X					X
32	13		X		X				X	X					X
34	13	X			X		X			X				X	
37	14	X			X				X	X				X	
39	15		X		X				X		X			X	
40	13		X			X		X			X			X	
42	15		X			X		X			X			X	
44	13			X		X	X			X				X	
45	14		X			X		X				X		X	
48	13			X	X			X		X				X	
50	13			X		X	X					X		X	

Profile C: Low Quality Schools

Code #	Quality	Ownership T	Ownership O	Ownership I	Building Status O	Building Status R	Grade - Linkage I-X/	Grade - Linkage I-VIII/	Grade - Linkage I-V	Medium of Inst U	Medium of Inst E	Medium of Inst U&E	Price H	Price M	Price L
14	12		X		X		X				X			X	
16	12		X			X	X			X				X	
18	12		X		X			X		X				X	
21	11			X	X				X			X		X	
23	11		X			X		X				X			X
26	11		X			X		X		X					X
27	11		X		X				X	X					X
28	10			X		X	X				X			X	
29	11			X		X	X				X			X	
31	11		X			X			X		X			X	
33	12		X			X		X				X		X	
35	11		X		X		X			X					X
36	11		X		X		X			X					X
38	11		X		X			X		X					X
43	11			X		X		X		X				X	

3. Relationship between Quality and other Characteristics

The findings from an analysis of the relationship between quality and other individual variables are discussed below.

a) Quality and Ownership

Table

Ownership----> Quality	1 Trust	2 Organisation	3 Individual	Row Total
1 High	4 28.6% 66.7%	7 50.0% 21.2%	3 21.4% 27.3%	14 28.0%
2 Medium	2 9.5% 33.3%	15 71.4% 45.5%	4 19.0% 36.4%	21 42.0%
3 Low	-------	11 73.3% 33.3%	4 26.7% 36.4%	15 30.0%
Column Total	6 12.0%	33 66.0%	11 22.0%	50 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

The number of schools falling under high quality is 14, 28 percent of the sub-sample. Out of these 14 schools, 4 belong to trusts, 8 to organizations, and 3 to individuals. There is an equal number of trust and individual ownerships, while the total number of schools owned by trusts in the sub-sample is about half of those owned by individuals (6 and 11 respectively). Sixtysix percent of the trust owned schools represent high quality while the similar percentages for organizational and individual ownerships are 21.2% and 27.3%.

The medium quality schools represent 42 percent of total sub-sample. Here, about 71 percent are owned by the organizations, about 19 percent by individuals, and 9 percent by trusts. At the low quality level, 73.4 percent are organization owned and 26.4 percent are owned by individuals while trust owned schools do not appear in this category. **From the findings, it can be concluded that schools owned by trust represent higher relative shares of high and medium quality than schools owned by organizations or individuals. The relative shares between individual and oraganizational ownership in high, medium, and low quality are more or less**

equal which suggests that the difference in organizational types and quality is not very significant. A greater significance lies not in the nature of ownership but more in the management characteristics of a school. A reading of the case-studies in high quality under category "A" suggests that regardless of the formal status of ownership, the schools, share some common characteristics of management including teachers involvement, adequate salaries and adaptation of innovations in teaching and learning methods.

b) Quality and Building Occupancy Status

Table

Building Status--> Quality	1 Owned	-------	2 Rented	Row Total
1 High	10 71.4% 34.5%	-----	4 28.6% 19.0%	14 28.0%
2 Medium	11 52.4% 37.9%	-----	10 47.6% 47.6%	21 42.0%
3 Low	8 53.3% 27.6%	-----	7 46.7% 33.3%	15 30.0%
Column Total	29 58.0%	-----	21 42.0%	50 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

Almost 71 percent of high quality schools show building occupancy/ownership as compared to about 28 percent that are housed in rented buildings. The comparative ratios between the two is almost equal for the medium quality schools (22.4% as opposed to 47.6%). **The relationship between high quality and building occupancy is quite significant while medium and low quality schools do not seem to be much affected by building occupancy status. Building occupancy status is more related to high quality schools since it implies larger and better physical facilities at their disposal.** On the other hand, schools in rented buildings have bare minimum physical facilities with limited scope of their expansion or improvement.

c) Quality and Grade-linkages

Table

Grade Linkage / Quality	1 Secondary	2 Lower Secondary	3 Primary	Row Total
1 High	11 78.6% 39.3%		3 21.4% 30.0%	14 28.0%
2 Medium	11 52.4% 39.3%	6 28.6% 50.0%	4 19.0% 40.0%	22 42.0%
3 Low	6 40.0% 21.4%	6 40.0% 50.0%	3 20.0% 30.0%	15 30.0%
Column Total	28 56.0%	12 24.0%	10 20.0%	50 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

Out of the total 14 high quality schools, 10 (78.6%) have grades-linked from primary to secondary levels (1-X); and 21.4% are only primary. At the medium quality, 52.4 percent of the schools have 1-X grade-linkages, and, the share of lower secondary grades (1-VIII) is higher than that of only primary (I-V) schools. **On an aggregate basis, 56% of all quality schools show grade-linkages to the secondary level followed by 24% for middle grade-linkages. It can be concluded that quality at high, medium and low levels is clearly influenced by grade-linkages.** For all three categories of quality, the secondary level linkages predominate the lower secondary and primary linkages in determining quality.

d) Quality and Price

Table

Price ----------> / Quality	1 High	2 Medium	3 Low	Row Total
1 High	5 35.7% 55.6%	7 50.0% 25.9%	2 14.3% 14.3%	14 28.0%
2 Medium	4 19.0% 44.4%	11 52.4% 40.7%	6 28.6% 42.9%	21 42.0%
3 Low	-----	8 57.1% 28.6%	6 42.9% 42.9%	15 30.0%
Column Total	9 18.0%	27 54.0%	14 28.0%	50 100.0%

Number of missing observations = 0

Price calculations are made by combining monthly tuition and other charges including charges of admission, transportation, extra-curricular activities etc. The calculations are aggregated into three ranges - Rs. 50-100 representing low price, Rs. 100-250 medium, and over Rs. 250 high price.

Out of the 14 high quality schools, 35.7 percent are high priced, 50 percent medium priced, and 14.3 percent low priced which indicates an inconsistent relationship between the level of price and the level of quality. Among the 21 medium quality schools, medium priced schools are three times as represented as high priced schools and two times as many as low priced schools. The low quality schools are equally divided between the middle and low prices. **The findings indicate a lack of clear relationship between the level of quality and the level of price except that 42 percent of medium priced schools represent medium quality.**

e) Quality and Medium of Instruction

Table

Medium ---------> Quality	1 Urdu	2 English	3 Urdu &	Row Total
1 High	2 14.3% 10.0%	8 57.1% 44.4%	4 28.6% 33.3%	14 28.0%
2 Medium	10 47.6% 50.0%	6 28.6% 33.3%	5 23.8% 41.7%	21 42.0%
3 Low	8 53.3% 40.0%	4 26.7% 22.2%	3 20.0% 25.0%	15 30.0%
Column Total	20 40.0%	18 36.0%	12 24.0%	50 100.0%

According to the findings, the majority of the schools, 40 percent, teach in Urdu medium. English medium is used in 36 percent and 24 percent of the school use both English and Urdu medium. Among the high quality schools, about 57 percent teach in English while the remaining 43 percent teach in Urdu or in Urdu and English. **Thus English medium does not seem to be clearly related to quality even for high quality schools. At the medium and low quality levels, Urdu is predominantly used as the medium of instruction. The findings seriously undermine the popular notion which associates quality of education with English medium.**

4. Cost Estimates

a. Construction Cost

In estimating construction costs for schools, the price of land is difficult to include because of its large variations. A square foot of land could cost anywhere from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 15,000 per square foot at the market value in the country. Land therefore enters into the calculations at no-cost or a subsidized cost.

The Government provides for the allotment of amenity plots specifically for school

construction. For instance, the Karachi Development Authority (KDA) sells amenity plots of 1 acre for primary school construction and 1.5 acres for secondary school construction to private parties at the rate of Rs. 50 per square foot. Comparably, the Defence Housing Authority (DHA), Karachi is currently allocating plots at Rs. 500 per square foot to the existing schools to help construct buildings outside the residential areas. In major urban centers of other provinces, the price of amenity plots is more or less the same i.e. Rs. 50 per square foot. The construction costs vary from one province to another. In Karachi, it is estimated to be Rs. 250 per square foot for conventional construction while in Baluchistan and NWFP, it is estimated at Rs. 240 and Rs. 180 respectively.

Cost Estimates for Primary School -Hypothetical Illustration

Enrolment	=	400
10 classrooms 16' x 25'	=	4,000 sq. ft.
1 Verandah (Passage gallery) 25' x 5' x 8' =		1,000 sq. ft.
Ancillary facilities (Toilets, Staffroom, Cafeteria, Library)	=	1,000 sq. ft.
Total Covered area	=	6,000 sq. ft.
Cost at Rs. 250/sq.ft.	=	Rs. 15,00,000

The above estimates can be calculated for other places according to the variation in construction costs.

5. Operational Costs

A reliable estimation of average operational costs can not be accurately made on the basis of data from either the general sample or the sub-sample due to inaccuracies and large number of missing cases. Operational costs however, are estimated by selecting two schools from the sub-sample that are comparable, in physical facilities and enrolment, to the hypothetical school that serves the basis of the above estimated construction costs. The case-studies of the schools can be found under school Code No. 13 and Code No. 8 in the attached Annex. 6

Annual Operational Costs Excluding Teacher Salaries

1. School code No.21 (without teachers' salaries)

Enrolment (Primary section) (328)

Electricity and Water	Rs.	50,000/-	"
Telephone and Gas	Rs.	28,000/-	"
Building Maintenance	Rs.	37,000/-	"
Miscelleneous	Rs.	12,000/-	"
Total	**Rs.**	**1,27,000/-**	"

2.School Code No. 8 (with Teachers' salaries)

Enrolment (Primary section)		(517)	
Salaries	Rs.	8,40,000 /	"
Electricity	Rs.	96,000 /	"
Gas	Rs.	4,000 /	"
Water	Rs.	6,000 /	"
Excise Duty	Rs.	6,000 /	"
Total	Rs.	**9,52,000 /**	"

Excluding Teachers' salaries Rs. 1,12,000.

Chapter V: Recommendations

A. Recommendations for Federal Government

1)...The Federal Government Education Policy does make provisions for the involvement and assistance of the private sector. However, the implementation of this policy as discussed in Chapter-II has been constrained by a lack of coordination among different Ministries. The policy is formulated by the Ministry in isolation from the other policies of the government and without any participation of the private sector and other relevant beneficiaries.

It is recommended that the government should finalize its education policy vis-a-vis the private sector with due regards to its implementability and in consultation with the relevant Ministries and the Planning Commission. The formulation of the Policy should, at some appropriate juncture, involve the participation of the private sector. In addition, Education Council at the federal level should have an adequate representation from the private sector's management bodies.

2)...The rules and regulations that govern the grants-in-aid from the budget under the Federal Ministry, should be formulated in consultation with educationists, finance experts, and representatives of the private sector in order to develop an explicit and objective criteria for the grants. The rules and criteria should be conveyed to the Provincial Governments and should be made publicly available by the Directorates to prospective applicants.

3)...According to findings of this study, a high percentage of teachers in the private schools have been found to be ill-qualified and un-trained. To redress this problem to some degree, the Federal Government under its "Scholarship Pool" should invite applications from private school teachers. The eligibility for scholarships should be especially directed to better training in teaching techniques.

B. Recommendations to Provincial Governments

4)...The Provincial Educational Codes and the rules and regulations that govern the opening and operation of private schools are too restrictive and too cumbersome to enforce as described in Chapter II. Despite the restrictive nature of the rules and regulations, the private education sector is essentially an unregulated market. The Educational Codes and the associated rules and regulations should be reframed and made simple. These should be objectively implementable, and consistent with the government's Education Policy.

5)...The methods of enforcement of rules and regulations on part of the Provincial Directorates result in harassment and unnecessary delays for the private school owners (see Chapter II). The present methods of regulations should be substituted by evaluations of the schools to be undertaken by a team of educationists and representatives of the Directorates. The private school evaluations should be followed by an assessment report with a copy to the relevant school for comments and corrections.

6)... In view of the poor physical facilities and lack of play-grounds and libraries in the private schools, the Government should earmark plots and offer them to a group of about five private schools who will have access to the facilities and would use and maintain the facilities on time-and-cost sharing basis.

7)... The Directorates should arrange for teacher training, and other short courses and work-shops for familiarization of both government and private school teachers in newer areas like environmental studies, computers and communicative skills, either in their own training institutions or through the Government's own Teachers' Resource Centers or the Teachers' Resource Center, Karachi.

8)...The Government generally plans to open schools on the basis of the needs of school populations and therefore does not enter into areas where the needs have been met by the private sector. The Government should open "Model Public Schools", in an area covered by private schools, to enter and compete with the private sector.

C. Recommendations for USAID

9)... A major constraint to the development of private schools is limited access to capital financing. This severely restricts the potential investors from establishing and maintaining sufficiently adequate physical facilities - a crucial pre-requisite for a school. The findings from this study indicate that quality schools are invariably those which have the privilege of owning or occupying a proper school building. Most of these schools have not be constructed or established from private financing exclusively but partly by the Government through property allotments, transfer of physical assets, allocation of amenity plots, and grants-in-aid. Public financing, directly or indirectly, has therefore been a component in the development of good private schools. Government financing and support has been generally restricted to politically resourceful parties and it has rapidly diminished due to public resource constraints and the declining number of amenity plots.

Financial constraints also limit the plans for qualitative development of existing private schools in specific areas like teachers' training, curriculum innovations, improving teaching methods and so forth.

To mobilize the private sector in the expansion of education, an appropriate vehicle for financial assistance is necessary. We recommend that USAID should consider to set-up a revolving fund with combined facilities of soft or interest-free loans and grants-in-aid which will be accessible to qualifying parties.

The following considerations are important in setting up the recommended fund so that it operates more on the basis of self-selection rather than pre-selection of applicants:

a)...The fund should be managed and monitored by an independent entity, organized informally and consisting of 4 to 5 professional experts and educationists as well representatives from the USAID, the Government, and private sector. This entity is to serve as a committee to evaluate the proposals submitted by eligible applicants.

b)... The applicants should be required to submit detailed proposals and feasibility studies which include a needs' assessment, management structure of the applicant organization, indication of parents' or community support and participation, a financial capability statement, and an action plan and cost estimates. To assist in the preparation of proposals, the applicants should be eligible for small grants, e.g., Rs. 50,000 to Rs. 100,000 to obtain external assistance from professional organizations and individuals.

c)... The grants-in-aid for qualitative development of schools should be awarded on matching basis.

d)... The revolving fund could be established with the National Banks in each province and released to the qualifying parties through the USAID on the basis of recommendations of the evaluation committee.

10)... Related to the above recommendation, the grants-in-aid component of the proposed revolving fund should be made accessible to schools as well as to educational resource and development organizations such as teacher resource centers, professional educational consultants, NGOs, and autonomous educational and training organizations such as National Institutes of Public Administration and Universities.

The grants will be made available on the basis of individual applications from the schools or above mentioned organizations or joint applications by the two in support of specific programmatic developments including teachers training and curriculum development. 50 percent of the requested funds have to be matched by all applicants through a combination of direct expenses and in-kind contributions.

11)... The private schools are predominantly concentrated in the few urban centers. According to the survey, approximately 88 percent schools in our sample are located in urban areas and the minimum price of primary education amounts to Rs:100/- per

month. Given the large differentials in income among urban, urban poor, and rural populations, private education falls outside the reach of the later two groups even if low priced schools were to be available. Therefore, some measure of subvention directly to the beneficiaries in low-income areas is essential to lessen the social inequalities resulting from private education.

We recommend that USAID consider designing a subvention program by which private education in the low-income urban and rural areas can be expanded.

This program should be designed on the principle that at least half of the government estimated price per student be transferred directly or indirectly to the private schools meeting the minimal physical facilities and other requirements. Under the direct mode of transfer, the schools may have to abide by the regulations of the government related to price limits, teachers salaries etc. and be open to financial audits which may add to bureaucratic control. An indirect transfer would imply payments to the students' parents in non-monetary forms such as educational vouchers and this might be preferable to a direct mode in terms of administrative efficiency as well inducement to parents to send their children to school.

11)... The objectives and membership character of an organization running a private school has an important bearing on the price and quality of education. The findings from our survey indicate that community based organizations and NGOs' are generally more efficient and dedicated in carrying educational and other social development activities in urban slums and rural areas. Special support in addition to that entailed in Recommendation 1, may be required to mobilize these organizations.

We recommend that USAID consider the possibility of leasing out some of the school buildings, constructed under the PEDP, to community-based organizations and NGOs' already active in social development in rural areas for the purposes of opening private schools.

13)... According to the analysis of price data in our sub sample, the average low price at the primary level is Rs:100/- per student. Thus, at the lower price levels, the costs of private primary education turns out to be Rs:1,200/- per annum, as compared to Rs:670/- for regular government schools, estimated for 1987-88. However, our estimates do not appear to be more reliable than the Government estimates.

A valid comparison of private versus public prices, requires a uniform method of calculation that accounts for both visible and hidden costs. A reliable estimation of relative costs is important to design options for financing private education.

We, therefore, recommend to USAID to undertake a study in comparative pricing of education at the primary level.

14)... According to government rules, all private schools are required to use only text books prescribed by the government and approved by the text book board. However, the conclusions from the survey data as well as information gathered during school visits show that the majority of the high quality schools do not abide by this rule. Some well established schools are known to replace, adapt and supplement the prescribed materials and claim that this is necessary to improve the content of prescribed books and create an appropriate learning and teaching environment. While we have not collected direct evidence to accept or reject this particular claim, we have observed during the course of in-depth assessments that curriculum innovations do have a positive impact on learning environment and children's motivation.

Since an important aspect of PEDP is to introduce curriculum reform, it would be worthwhile for USAID to conduct a study of the differences between government prescribed curriculum and the curriculum adaptations by private schools and determine its effects on teaching approaches and cognitive development of children.

References

1)... Bhatti, M., etal (1988): *Primary Education Improvement - Desired Measures.* National Educational Council, Islamabad, Pakistan.

2)... Government of Pakistan (1977): *.tional Educational Policy*, Ministry of Education, Islamabad, Pakistan.

3)... Government of Pakistan: *The Education Policy (1972-80)*, Ministry of Education, Islamabad, Pakistan.

4)... Government of Pakistan (1989): *Pakistan Education Statistics, 1985-86 and 1986-87.* Ministry of Education, Islamabad, Pakistan.

5)... Government of Punjab (1989): *Education Code*. Provincial Ministry of Education, Lahore, Pakistan.

6)... Ghafoor, A. (1982): *The Effects of New Trends in Educational Financing of the Plan Objectives - Equity, Quality, and Efficiency - A Case Study on Pakistan.* Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad, Pakistan.

7)... Government of Pakistan (1987): *Seventh Five Years Plan (1988-93) - Report of Sub-working Groups on Primary Education*. Planning Commission, Islamabad, Pakistan.

8)... Qaisrani, M. N. (1989): *Involvement of Private Sector in the Promotion of Primary Education in Pakistan*. Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Annexure - 1

Study Team

Study Team

National Educational Consultants (Private) Limited, Karachi, Pakistan

Prof. Anita Ghulam Ali	Chief Project Coordinator.
Prof. Umme Salma Zaman	Coordinator, Karachi Metropolitan.
Dr. Shams Mohsin Abbasi	Coordinator, Province of Sindh.
Dr. Inam-ul-Haq Kausar	Coordinator, Province of Balochistan.
Mr. Ruhul Amin	Coordinator, North Western Frontier Province.
Mr. Zafar Alam	Coordinator, Province of Punjab.
Mr. Asif Ali Kazi	Project Administrator.
Dr. Nuzhat Ali	Advisor.

Academy for Educational Development, Washington, D.C., U.S.A.

Dr. Rashid S. Ahmad	Project Monitor.

Annexure - 2

Budget Allocation for Primary Education

Budget Allocations for Primary Education (1947-48 to 1985-86)

Year	Total Expenditure on Education	Expenditure on Primary Education	Expenditure on Primary Education (Percentage)
1947 - 48	23.2	11.0	47.41
1948 - 49	38.2	20.1	52.62
1949 - 50	43.9	20.8	47.38
1954 - 55	94.5	41.7	44.12
1959 - 60	163.8	60.2	36.75
1962 - 63	346.3	91.0	26.26
1964 - 65	450.9	137.0	30.38
1966 - 67	440.0	152.1	34.56
1968 - 69	553.0	168.9	30.54
1970 - 71	789.9	221.9	28.09
1971 - 72	796.8	275.3	34.55
1972 - 73	1,000.7	315.4	31.51
1973 - 74	1,269.3	399.2	31.45
1974 - 75	1,744.5	451.5	25.88
1975 - 76	2,488.2	767.3	30.83
1976 - 77	2,802.6	853.1	30.43
1977 - 78	3,300.7	823.6	24.95
1978 - 79	3,875.9	1,305.1	33.67
1979 - 80	4,153.5	1,604.4	38.62
1980 - 81	4,619.5	1,570.0	33.98
1981 - 82	5,602.0	1,820.6	32.49
1982 - 83	6,469.5	2,092.1	32.33
1983 - 84	7,542.3	2,544.0	33.72
1984 - 85	10,224.3	3,284.1	32.12
1985 - 86	12,644.8	3,915.9	30.96

Source: Compiled from *Pakistan Education Statistics (1985-86 and 1986-87)* Ministry of Education, Central Bureau of Education, Islamabad.

Annexure - 3

Historical Background of Private Education

An Historical overview of Private Education

1. In a table from the Extracts from the Gazetteer of the Province of Sindh (Volume I-B) compiled by J.W.Smyth ICS in 1919, in which statistics for the various kinds of institutions from 1905-1906 through 1915-16 are shown, the number of Private institutions is 2, and the number of "pupils" (male and female) is 1,440 (in 1919) dropping to 1,298 in (1915-16) respectively; the number of institutions fall under the categories of Advanced, Elementary, Aided and Un-aided. An interesting note opens Chapter XII in A Volume, particularly because the "tradition" seems to have been carried froward; "of the aided schools 22 are for boys and 12 for girls. Two of them are branches of the Church Mission High School and one of the Sindh Madressah, to which they are feeders. Seven of the 12 Girls schools have been started by the Church Mission Zeenana Society in different localities in Karachi, the fees charged range from one to eight annas (1/2 a rupee) per mensem according to the standard (Class/grade)". Though under private managements, all these institutions are classed as Public schools, because they are inspected by and conform to the standards of the Educational Department. They receive a grant-in-aid from Government". Mentioned also in the same chapter are "English Middle Schools", which are of interest to us because they still exist, have flourished, and some are amongst the prestigious schools of the Province, and some of which are included in our general and in-depth samples. These "English Middle Schools' recognized by Government" are the 'Girls' Convent School and the Parish school, which are indigenous and are paid a small grant by Government. Others that warrant mention are the first Government school established in Sindh called "The Karachi Narayan Jagarnath High School" opened in October 1855 with 68 boys; the private Sindh Madressah (1885), The Karachi Grammar School (1854), St. Patrick's' School (1861), The C.M.S. (1846) in which the Founder of Pakistan, Mr. Mohammad Ali Jinnah had his earlier education. By 1922-23 the number of private schools had risen to 85 and the enrollment to 1,028 males and 490 females.

2. The proceedings of the meeting held on the 29th November-1st Dec. 1950 of the Advisory board of Education for Pakistan, were presided over the then Commerce and Education Minister, Government of Pakistan, Mr. Fazlur Rahman. Participated in by a galaxy of educationists and administrators who had built up reputations prior to the partition of the sub-continent. One notices there is a "worried" reference to the inadequacy of institutions and an appeal to the members, by the Minister to find out the real causes which are hampering this progress and development. The Minister pointed that "Education as it is to be imparted today has become so expensive that it is beyond the reach of the average man, particularly in a country where production of children, as you know is very high", there is no references at all to private enterprises. On page 50 of the report, with reference to influx of refugees to the Province of Sindh, almost all educational institutions, Primary as well as Secondary which were closed down at the time of the exodus of Hindus, were re-started either by the Government or by private enterprise, grants-in-aid under the rules were also allowed for these institutions. The report states that, the amount spent on the government and aided (ostensibly private enterprise) primary schools from 1948-50 was in the ratio of (Rs. 42,73,000 & Rs. 7,84,000) almost 6:1 respectively. Another very "progressive" feature of this account and the efforts to improve the literacy rate and education in the Province is the measure

61

that "Primary education has been made compulsory for the children of Zamindars (Feudal landowners) by enacting the Sindh Zamindary Education Act". "The participants had surely alluded to the key factor, dominating to this day, the future of many thousands of children, not necessarily born in affluence, but millions more who are associated in some sort of bondage, with the section of society referred to in the Report.

3. Within 9 years, after the pronouncements of the Advisory Committee, the privately-managed institutions, mainly involved in the running of Colleges, not so many schools, had distinguished themselves as more than just partners. In 1959, the National Commission on Education known as the Sharif Commission commenting on the situation, wrote "unfortunately during the last years many colleges have been started without fulfilling the conditions laid down by the affiliating Universities/Boards/Authorities". Government is not free from blame. The privately managed colleges were quick to follow the example. The Universities also became lax in enforcing rules, either under external pressure or in their anxiety to seek popularity". By the end of 1964-65 the attitude of the privately managed institutions had crystalized and the Government was constrained to set up "A commission on Student problems and welfare" headed by Mr. Justice Hamood-ur-Rahman. This commission did not mince words, "There can be no two opinions about the demand that commercialization of education should not be permitted. Students complain that such commercialization exists in most institutions, and they therefore demand that these colleges be taken over by Government. So long as it is necessary for us to have them, we feel that firm steps be taken to prevent their being exploited for private profiteering".

By the close of the Ayub Khan era in 1968-69 the demand for a take-over of educational institutions by students, for reasons already stated in the Hamood-ur-Rahman Commission Report; and by teachers employed in the private institutions, insecurity of service, non-payment of salaries for 4 month is in 1968, due to closure periods because of worsening the law and order situation and summer vacations, culminated, in what is now known as the "March movement of teachers and students".

4. The state of education and the demands for take-over by students and teachers appeared for the first time in election manifestos and campaigns, and the political Government formed by Mr. Z.A. Bhutto in 1972 made "nationalization" of educational institutions a corner stone of its education policy. The declared objective being the "equalising of access to education" and for "securing a decent status for the teachers". Consequently on March 15, 1972, the President, Mr. Z.A. 'Bhutto announced the new education policy, which included the taking over of 78 colleges in Punjab and 97 in sindh (where 75% of the colleges and about 40% of schools, were privately-managed). Since there were only 4 or 5 private institutions in Balochistan and only one private college, (Edwards College) in Peshawar, NWFP, these two provinces were deprived of the experience of comparison. Some "exemptions" were made, later, in Punjab and Sindh on the plea that their fee structure fitted into a "certain" that bracket so out of the absolutely elitist schools only and Edwards College remained the preserve of the ruling group. However, the relief offered by the actual take-over on the 1st September 1972 for colleges and 1st October 1972 for schools to teachers and students, provided the government the shield they needed to protect themselves from debate and accusations from the public, over the exemptions.

-68

Nationalization was not implemented in a "haphazard and un-coordinatored manner" (as stated by Louis D.Hayes who published his report in 1987) in so far as the actual taking over was concerned. It did also not fail in its main objectives-in creating a large force of educated and literate people from amongst a strata of society that could not in its wildest dreams (prior to 1972) have envisaged entrance to the precincts of hallowed schools and colleges, merely because of the demerit of poverty. Another major achievement of nationalization is that it has raised the aspiration level of the masses. They demand today, education as a birth-right and as a genuine return for payment of taxes. It has gone further, it has made the masses aware of the difference between meaningful and quality education and assembly line instruction. That, is why there is a clamour for "good institutions" which the Government, it appears is not able to provide for several reasons, mainly of course "paucity of funds". By stating its locus stand in the Sixth Five Year Plan (1983-1988), the government admitted its failure to provide, even the barest minimum to millions of the population by "encouraging private entrepreneurs to participate in the development of education, who are expected to invest Rs. 1000 million in 5 years".

5. In October of1977 a National Education Conference was convened by the Chief-Martial Law Administrator, President Zia-ul-Haq "to review the state of education and to suggest ways and means to bring it in line with our faith and ideology". From this conference emerged the National Education Policy (1979) of the Martial Law Government. In his opening address to the Conference the Minister for Education, Mr. Mohammed Ali Hoti (now Senator) took the liberty of inviting private benevolent organizations to help the Government in this gigantic task. "I also invite individuals and organizations to open educational institutions according to the norms and standards prescribed by Government. I assure you on behalf of the Government that such institutions will not be nationalized." The next paragraph starts with the sentence "There is no finality in educational thought, consequently there cannot be any finality about this policy". Whether as an incentive to the "private benevolent organizations" to accept Government assurances, or whether in admission of the failure of the Government schools to satisfy the "awakened" millions, the policy undertook to "decentralise the process of decision making by providing more powers and facilities for educational management at lower levels of education. To fulfill this objective, District School Education Authorities with sufficient powers and funds were to be constituted in every district to oversee and administer school education".

6. Since 1979 there has been phenomenal mushroom growth of private schools. Till 1988 only a few colleges had been opened by the private sector,even in a city like Karachi (population estimated to vary between 8-10 million - more than 40% of which lives in slums) where students from all over the country hanker after seats in English medium schools and colleges. Even in 1990 there are no more than 10 to 12 private colleges, (although it is estimated that more than 10,000-12,000 students will not get place in any college) with poor enrollment since only 3-4 are recognized by the authorities, and it is now a well know fact that most are converting themselves to "tuition centres" or as a slot providing one -year admissions, to enable their poor - credit clients to prove a "continuity" in their education, for eligibility to a Government College the next year. But, with the schools it is another story.

67

The 1979 policy of the Martial Law government will be long associated with the heated debate it generated on its policy of making Urdu the medium of instructions. It was decreed that by 1988 no student would be allowed to appear in the Matriculation Examination, (Grade 10) School Leaving Certificate Examination with English as the medium for answering of papers. This created a furore from the private school that had capitalized on the term "English medium" on its bill boards. Some established and reputed schools did not question the right of the Federal Government to make the decision, and switched over to Urdu; losing in the bargain, according to their statement, good students, a big chunk out of their enrollment, and much criticism from the parents who doubted their wisdom "knowing the vacillation by successive Governments on the policy of medium of instructions". However, an up-grading of quality, a marked improvement in the results and of comprehension of the students which improved visibly". The majority of the schools, however, continued to depend on English medium while the bigger investors offered O & A level courses. Two schools, which now have several branches (called campuses) all over Pakistan, have registered themselves as Private Limited Companies to avoid any interference by Government and its seasonal concepts of quality education.

In an advertisement published in "Dawn" of the 23rd March 1988 the "Parents and Educationists Action Committee for Education" (PEACE) appealed to the President, the Prime-Minister and the Minister for Education, Government of Pakistan to allow "the option of English medium to continue for all". This was to distance themselves from the A & O Level group. "Equal opportunity is our right and that of our children". The student of another well-known school demonstrated in favour of the option, but there was no clarification from Government. Some time later, it was made known through the Chairman of Board of Secondary Education that the students who took the Science Group could use English as their medium. On the 10th March 1988 (Dawn reports from Dubai) that "President Zia-ul-Haq announced a donation of one million dirhams on behalf of the Government of Pakistan to help overcome the financial difficulties of the English MEDIUM PAKISTAN ISLAMIA SECONDARY SCHOOL in Dubai". Also, there did not seem to have been any strict instructions about "decentralization" of which the Education minister Mohammad Ali Hoti had spoken, in the Conference of 1977, because as reported "private school owners were being harassed (Dawn-31st March 1988) regarding the authentication of Class V certificates by the Directorates of Education". This authentication was compulsory requirement for admission to Secondary schools - in cases of transfer of students to a registered private or Government school. The Private Schools Management Association put off its scheduled demonstration and instead called on the Director of Schools, Karachi Region to protest against the delay in the registration of private schools' applicants who had completed the formalities. Another group of parents organized a series of meetings (Dawn April 30, 1989) at which they criticised the Government for its lack of control over institutions in the private sector, asserting that no action had been taken against those who were fleecing the public. They gave the example of one school (owned by an influential political family group) that openly defied government directives and even ignored orders of the Chief-Minister. The group was deposing before Government of Sindh's Special Committee on Education and Educational Institutions which had issued questionnaires to government and Private Schools. The committee was headed by an Ex.

Education and Finance Minister, Mr Pyar Ali Allana.

7. It is relevant to point out at this stage, that on the 6th March 1986 the Education Department, Government of Sindh had constituted an Inspection Committee headed by Prof. Mrs. U.S. Zaman to:

i) Report on the fee schedule of private schools to find out whether they were commensurate with the facilities offered and qualifications of teachers;

ii) To advise the government on ways and means to make judicious use of the available resources, and to invite philanthropists, social welfare bodies and other organizations to donate in cash/kind to schools;

iii) To report and advise Government about available facilities in schools, particularly in deprived areas, and in areas where schools have been denationalized, to see if their enrollments can be increased etc.

The Inspection committee evaluated Primary and Secondary Schools from the 2nd April 1968 and continued till 1989, when they had completed the inspection of more than 400 Government and Private schools. The report is in 7 volumes, and the Inspections are to re-start. The concensus arrived at by the committee, is less interesting than the individual reports, of course, but in general the following are the observations, relevant to this study:

a) The best run private schools were those that involved the "community", through a Managing Committee or Board of Trustees to finance and oversee the working; although, in some cases, as in the case of the Agha Khan Schools which have an Education Board, the representative who had an office, kept all the office papers under lock and key, and the Principals were neither associated with collection of fees, nor could they purchase a pin. Orders went to the Management as a sort of requisition.

b) Many schools were being run (owned) by Government school teachers, which of course is illegal; and many more were just Family affairs, with daughters (as teachers)mothers (as administrators) bother-in-law and cousins (accountants, clerks, administrators) etc, and one or two innocuous and casual "members of the public", for good measure (A list of names of government college and school teacher owners/and some actually working in the school quite openly was submitted to Government but no action was taken.

c) 75% of the teachers employed in the private schools were under-qualified and had no training whatsoever, which does not mean that this was one of the main factors for the standard of education; besides, there did not appear to be any formula for payment of salaries, every person made his/her own bargain;

d) The books were kept, but were never shown on first demand - "they needed time to get them from the Head Office, the Administrator (owner) or the Auditor"- When they arrived at the office of the Board of Secondary Education, where the Saturday (weekly) meeting, reviewed and received missing documents, the balance sheets for

the last year were like out of text-books, not a paisa out of place, and rarely were there deficits. A few showed any profits. but, the committee also made its own assessment of the financial state of the visited institution; and even after all the "concessions", free-ships and scholarships, taxes, bills for over-heads had been marked-up on the high side, they found no school could make a profit of less than Rs. 1-2 million a year. These figures have not been contested by any school management so far.

e) The "good schools" had difficulties, because they tried to make improvements within their budgets, and had the entire teaching staff motivated, organized and full of enthusiasm The teachers had a sense of belonging and pride, responsibility and participation. These schools often had honest deficits. (Please see Appendix).

f) The private schools were only cursorily inspected by the directorates' DEO/SDEO (District Education Officers) and that too, usually around admission time. They complained in unison about the treatment they received from the Directorates, especially at the juncture of registration and permission for raising of fees. Both types of applications elicited much concern about requirements of the files, "for your own good", plenty of running back and forth; but, there was nothing that could not be smoothed out with shrewd "negotiation".

g) A word about the government schools - most suffered from neglect, lack of class-room space, wash-rooms, water, electricity, books, furniture, teaching aids - but, in contrast to the Private schools they had huge open spaces, not always used for the children. The problem of squatters, breaking of walls, creating a regular thoroughfare and even building mosques' in the middle of schools was quite frequently observed, and placed under the column encroachments. The teachers were qualified and all trained, but they were posted not on the basis of the teacher-subject requirement. For instance, if the teacher had enough influence she/he would be posted near the place of residence, so that the school which needed a teacher for Mathematics had several for language, or vis versa. The Heads were handicapped by the fact that their hands were tied behind their backs, not so much by the rules, but by the "telephonic instructions" which denuded them of their powers to spend on the welfare of student the annual fee of Rs. 10/- sanctioned by Government, precisely for the purpose of enabling the Head of Institutions to react promptly to minor repair or demands of students. In spite of all the knotted red-tape, some Government schools were as good, and a few even better administered, managed and successful in the public examinations than many private schools.

Annexure - 4

Survey Instrument

National Educational Consultants (Pvt) Limited
106 - Shaheen Centre, Block - 7, Kehkashan,
Clifton, Karachi-75600, Pakistan.
Telephone: (21) 53 49 37

Research Instrument - *Private Primary Education in Pakistan*

Questionnaire for the School Management

PART - 1 School Classification -1

1. Name of the School: ☐

2. Level: ☐ *Pre-Primary* ☐ *Primary* ☐ *Lower Secondary* ☐ *Secondary*

3. Where Located: ☐

4. Nature of the Settlement where school is located: ☐ *City* ☐ *Town* ☐ *Village Settlement*

5. Age of School in years: ☐ *1 - 3* ☐ *3 - 5* ☐ *5 - 10* ☐ *10 plus*

A. Management:

(i) Who owns the School: ☐ *An individual* ☐ *A trust* ☐ *An organisation* ☐ *Any other form of ownership*

(ii) The nature of organisation owning the school: ☐ *Social Welfare* ☐ *Commercial* ☐ *Trust* ☐ *Missionary*

(iii) The total number of schools run under the same organisation: ☐

(iv) Highest decision making body:

☐ An individual ☐ A board
☐ A trust ☐ Any other

(v) If the highest decision maker is an individual, his relationship with the school:

☐ Working head of the institution ☐ Chief Patron
☐ Free lance manager ☐ Any other

(vi) Terms & conditions of service of employees:

☐ Properly laid down & offered at the time of initial appointment ☐ Discretionary ☐ None

(vii) Financial Status of the Institution:

☐ Self-financed ☐ Running on Endowments
☐ Profit Making ☐ Non-Profit Making

(viii) 1...Monthly Fee Level:

Pre-Primary

☐ Less than Rs:100/- ☐ Between Rs:100/- and Rs:500/- ☐ Above Rs:500/-

Primary

☐ Less than Rs:100/- ☐ Between Rs:100/- and Rs:500/- ☐ Above Rs:500/-

2...Any other monthly/yearly charges:

☐ Books & Stationery Rs: ☐ Sports Rs:
☐ Lunch Rs: ☐ Library Rs:
☐ Transport Rs: ☐ Lab Facility Rs:
☐ Building Fund Rs: ☐ Others Rs:

3...The percentage of students who get free tuition/ scholarships:

☐ 5% ☐ 10% ☐ 15% ☐ 20%
☐ 30% ☐ More than 30%

(ix) Teacher's salary per month:

Pre-Primary

☐ Less than Rs:500/-
☐ Between Rs:500/- and Rs1,000/-

Primary

☐ Less than Rs:500/- ☐ Between Rs:500/- and

(x) Other facilities to the teachers:

☐ *Medical* ☐ *Housing* ☐ *Maternity Leave* ☐ *Provident fund , Pension & Gratuity* ☐ *Social Security* ☐ *Casual Leave* ☐ *Leave for Training and Professional Development* ☐ *Free Education for Teachers' Children* ☐ *Stipends/Scholarships for Teachers' Children*

(xi) School expenses:

☐ *Owned Building.*
Estimated Current Market Value. Rs:

☐ *Building Rented.*
Annual Rent. Rs:

☐ *Evacuee/Trust property allotted to the institution.*
Estimated Value. Rs:

(xii) Other expenses: (annual)

☐ *Ground Rent* *Rs:*
☐ *Electricity & Water* *Rs:*
☐ *Telephone & Gas* *Rs:*
☐ *Building Maintenance* *Rs:*
☐ *Others, please specify*

B. Clientele

(i) Status/profession of parents:

☐ *Government Service* ☐ *Business*
☐ *Land Owners* ☐ *Private Service*
☐ *Labourer*

(ii) The number of Government/ private primary schools in the immediate vicinity:

☐ *Private*
☐ *Government*

(iii) Level of retention of students till class-5:

☐ *30% or below* ☐ *30% to 40%*
☐ *40% to 50%* ☐ *50% and above*

C. Medium of Instruction

(i) The medium of instruction in the institution:

Pre-Primary	☐	☐
Primary	☐	☐

(ii) The examinations for which the students are said to be prepared:

- ☐ *Local Examinations*
- ☐ *Foreign Examinations*
- ☐ *Both, Local & Foreign Examinations*

D. Co-Curricular Facilities:

(i) The co-curricular activities available to the school:

- ☐ *Play Ground(s)* ☐ *Clubs/Scouting/Girl guides*
- ☐ *Indoor Games* ☐ *Cultural Activities*
- ☐ *Others*

(ii) Area where school building is situated:

- ☐ *Residential Area* ☐ *Commercial Area*
- ☐ *Any other*

(iii) Facilities available at the school:

- ☐ *Wash room for children*
- ☐ *Teachers Staff room*
- ☐ *Washroom for teachers*
- ☐ *Prayer room*
- ☐ *Library*
- ☐ *Store room*
- ☐ *Potable water for children*
- ☐ *Computer education*
- ☐ *Doctor/Nurse*
- ☐ *First Aid/Medical facilities*
- ☐ *Others*

Part-2

School Classification - 1

Statistics on Students and Teachers

(i) Total enrollment at school: ☐

(ii) Enrollment per class:

Class 1:	*Girls:*	*Boys:*	*Total:*
Class 2:	*Girls:*	*Boys:*	*Total:*
Class 3:	*Girls:*	*Boys:*	*Total:*
Class 4:	*Girls:*	*Boys:*	*Total:*
Class 5:	*Girls:*	*Boys:*	*Total:*

(iii) Total number of teachers: *Male:* *Female:* *Total:*

(iv) Student - teacher ratio: ☐

(v) Classification of teachers with respect to qualification: (write number of teachers as per qualification)

Matric: *F.A/F.Sc:*
B.A/B.Sc: *M.A/M.Sc:*
B.Ed: *M.Ed:*
Graduates with Teaching Degrees:
Non-Graduates with Teaching Certificates:

(vi) Length of service of existing staff in the institution where serving now: (mention number of staff)

Less than 3 years:
Between 3 to 5 years:
More than 5 years:

(vii) Previous background of teaching staff: (mention number of staff)

Fresh entrants without previous background:
Having more than 5 years of teaching experience:
Retired teachers:
Part-timers:

School Classification - 2

A. Curriculum

(i) Curriculum being followed in the school:

☐ *National* ☐ *Foreign*
☐ *Both National & Foreign* ☐ *Any other*

(ii) Prescribed textbooks in the school:

☐ *National* ☐ *Foreign*

(iii) The school authority responsible for selecting curriculum and textbooks:

- ☐ *Principal* ☐ *Board of Trustees/Governors*
- ☐ *School owner if different from the first two*
- ☐ *Any other*

(iv) Are there any curriculum improvement measures:

☐ *Yes* ☐ *No*

(v) If the answer to (iv) is yes, please specify:

_____

_____

(vi) Teaching methods:

- ☐ *Class Room*
- ☐ *Others, please specify:*

(vii) List of Audio-Visual Aids available at school:

- ☐
- ☐
- ☐
- ☐
- ☐
- ☐

(viii) Total teaching periods per week:

Number of periods:

(ix) Average teaching periods per week:

Mathematics:
Science:
English:
Urdu:
Islamiat:
Arts:
Others:

B. Library

(i) Total number of books available in the library:

☐ *Not issued at all* ☐ *10%:* ☐ *15%:*

(ii) Percentage of the books

C. Administrative Procedures

(i) Methods & procedures of recruitment of staff

☐ *Through open advertisement & subsequent interview* ☐ *Any Other*

(ii) Methods and procedures of firing of staff:

☐ *Through a properly laid down procedure*
☐ *Any other*

(iii) The final authority in hiring & firing:

☐ *Individual owner* ☐ *Principal of the school*
☐ *Some Board or Organisation*

(iv) Appellate authority:

☐ *Non-existent* ☐ *Nature of authority :*

(v) Methods & procedures of admissions:

☐ *Open merit basis* ☐ *first come first serve basis* ☐ *Any other*

(vi) The time limit for admission:

☐ *Restricted to specific time of year*
☐ *Continues for the whole year*

Annexure - 5

List and Codes of Sub-Sampled Schools

List and Codes of Sub-Sampled Schools

Code #	Name of School	Location
1...	Sadaf Academy	Lyari, Karachi
2...	Malik Jamal High School	Orangi, Karachi
3...	Tayyab Alvi Secondary School	Saddar, Karachi
4...	Makhdoomia Primary & Secondary School	Orangi, Karachi
5...	Zubair Public School	Gulshan, Karachi
6...	Nasra School	Depot Lines, Karachi
7...	Banglore Town Secondary School	Banglore Town, Karachi
8...	Habib Girls School	Garden Road, Karachi
9...	Ida Rieu School for Blind & Deaf	Bunder Road, Karachi
10..	Kalyana Academy	North Karachi
11..	Ruqiya Hajiani High School	Ishaqabad, Karachi
12..	Police Public School	Peshawar City
13..	Peshawar Model School for Girls	Peshawar City
14..	Pine Hills Public School	Abbottabad
15..	Achison Academy	Peshawar City
16..	Forward High School	Peshawar City
17..	Frontier Model School	Peshawar City
18..	St. Josephs' Cantonment School	Kohat
19..	International Public School	Abbottabad

List and Codes of Sub-Sampled Schools

Code #	Name of School	Location
20..	Christian Girls School	Abbottabad
21..	Nimra Public School	Peshawar City
22..	District Montessory School	Shikarpur, Sindh
23..	Victor Public School	Sukkur, Sindh
24..	Rashidi English Grammer School	Nawab Shah, Sindh
25..	Mir Haji Khuda Bux Model School	Tando Jan Mohd, Sindh
26..	Mehran Nursery, K.G & Middle School	Tando Allahyar, Sindh
27..	Happy Childrens Primary School	Hyderabad, Sindh
28..	Agha Taj Mohammad High School	Hyderabad, Sindh
29..	Alis English School	Hyderabad, Sindh
30..	British Kids Academy	Hyderabad, Sindh
31..	Angelic Primary School	Hyderabad, Sindh
32..	Tamir-e-Nau Primary School	Quetta City
33..	Children Garden School	Quetta City
34..	Islamia Girls High School	Quetta City
35..	Girls High School	Quetta City
36..	Model High School	Sui, Balochistan
37..	Islamia Public School	Quetta City
38..	Tameer-e-Millat Public School	Turbat, Balochistan
39..	T.I.B.M Model School	Quetta City

List and Codes of Sub-Sampled Schools

Code #	Name of School	Location
40..	Pak Public Model School	Quetta City
41..	Helpers Public School	Quetta City
42..	Quetta Public School	Quetta City
43..	Habib Public School	Rawalpindi
44..	Farooqi Girls School	Ravi Road, Lahore
45..	Jinnah Preparatory School	Rawalpindi
46..	Rawalpindi Public School	Rawalpindi
47..	Islamabad Kinder Garten	Rawalpindi
48..	Islamic Science Academy	Faisalabad
49..	PAF Intermediate School & College	Rawalpindi
50..	Native Public High School	Lahore

Annexure - 6

Illustrative Case-Studies

A.	**HIGH QUALITY SCHOOLS**	**CODE#**	**QUALITY SCORE**
	1.	(8)	(17)
	2.	(49)	(17)
	3.	(13)	(17)
	4.	(6)	(17)
	5.	(30)	(16)
	6.	(46)	(16)
B.	**MEDIUM QUALITY SCHOOLS**		
	7.	(39)	(15)
	8.	(3)	(15)
	9.	(45)	(14)
	10.	(22)	(14)
	11.	(1)	(13)
C.	**LOW QUALITY SHCOOL**		
	12.	(21)	(11)

Case Study No. 8, Karachi

Management: Trust

Established in 1964 as a Primary School it added a Nursery Section in 1965 and Secondary in 1968. The building was constructed on a 4 acres of land by the Trust. It is a large 3-story building in two blocks. Pre-Primary Section is housed in a separate block. There is a sufficiently large open space to be used as a playground.

Management:

The Management Committee of the Trust consists of 13 members belonging to the same Family.

The Managing Committee is the highest decision-making body and provides all the funds for the school. It has never received out-side funds for the school niether it has received any aid from the government or from individuals other than its own Trustees.

Objectives:

It is a social welfare body whose main objective is to provide quality education for all - especially to the low-income group. The school was originally intended for the poor children who were given almost free education (Rs. 5/- to Rs. 10/- p.m.) The children were from Shahrbano Baugh, a low-income housing colony at Garden East set up by the Group which also runs the following other institutions:

1. A Boys School at mauripur Road, Karachi.
2. A Boys School in Karachi City.
3. A Girls school at Kharadar, Karachi, which runs purely on donations.
4. A Hospital - Chakiwara, meant mainly for the poor.
5. (Orphanages - Zehra Homes) for girls of single parents.
6. A Girls Home at Britto Road, meant only for the children of the community.
7. A Hostel for Boys in Karachi.

Enrolment

Nursery	200
Primary	517
Secondary	601

Rates of Fees

Tuition Rs. 250/- p.m. now raised to Rs. 300/- p.m. Annual charges Rs. 120/- including library co-curricular activities, examinations etc. Admission Fee Rs. 3,000/-

Freeship

About 20% of the children are awarded full freeship. Half and Quarter freeship are

awarded to the deserving children according to the parents' income.

Quality of Education:

It is a one shift school which functions from 8.30 a.m. to 3 p.m. for girls only. Teachers are dedicated to their work and are well looked after by the management. Once appointed, they hardly ever leave the school. Teachers are encouraged to participate and innovate. Refresher Courses are regularly ogranised by the T.R.C. (Teachers Resource Centre) S P E L T (Society for Promotion of English Language Teaching) - Free in-service training is provided for teachers whose fees Rs. 250/- to Rs. 1,500/- and Rs. 3,000/- are paid by the Management. These courses ranging from 1 day to 4 weeks are organised on methodology and class-room management, leadership and time management. The school is a member of T.R.C.

Curriculum:

National supplemented by foreign books on all school subjects.

Library:

Divided into two sections - for Primary and Secondary schools. A small library is for Pre-Primary School too. Books are regularly issued to children. About 10,000 - books in the library. There is a library period for every class - 2 art periods and 2 P.T. periods per week for all.

Innovation:

Project method used. Topics like migration, environment, wild life given to children to work on.
Teacher - Student ratio = 1:20

Qualification of Teachers

Minimum qualification for teachers is Graduation.

Total number of teachers	44
MA/MSc.	5
B.Ed.	18
BA/BSc. B.Ed.	32
Non-Graduates with Teaching Certificate	1
Teachers aids	5

Medium of Instruction: English at all levels.

School Cost and Expenses

	Rs.
Salaries	70,000/- p.m.
Electricity	96,000/- p.a.
Gas	4,800/- p.a.
Water	6,000/- p.a.
Excise Duty	6,000/- p.a.

Old age benefit deposited in Government treasury Rs. 75/- per teacher if salary is above Rs. 1,500/- p.m. 5% of salary p.m. for the employees getting less than Rs. 1,400/- p.m.

This is expected to be paid back by the Govt. after 60 years of age to the employees are monthly pension of Rs. 300/- to Rs. 400/-

Summer School

In summer vacation, regular lessons are provided for English, Maths and Sindhi. Remedial classes are organised, basically for school children, but outsiders can also joint.

Negotiations are going on with a computer firm to provide 20 computers, furniture and teachers' expertise on a charge of Rs. 35/- per child per month for which the school provide a class-room. This course will be held between 9 a.m. to 3.30 p.m. daily during school hours.

Extra-curricular Activities:

Judo-Karate, cooking, painting, fabric printing, yoga, public speaking, flower-making, gardening, handicrafts, screen printing, athletics, Nursing - organised every week on Sunday afternoon for Classes VI to X - Course leaders are usually from outside.

Computers

The school has at present 2 computers.

Result

100% at S.S.C. (Secondary School Certificate) Examination Average 45 students appear in Science Group.

62 Students appear in Commerce & Home Economics.
The school organises educational excursions and field trips to steel mill, museum, zoo, factories - Moenjodaro Fares are paid by the school.

Constraints:

The management complained that

1. Taxes are paid at commercial rates.
2. Old age benefit cuts must not apply to this school which gives gratuity to its employees.
3. The school's income is not enough for expansion unless trustees help.
4. Extension of building for Primary School needed - space extension is available but it would cost about Rs. 20 lakhs for the constructions.

Future Plans:

The school has ambitious plans for future and has already started working on it:

1. Construction of a 100 x 300 sw. ft. shed on the adjoining plot of land belonging to the Cantonment Board for which permission has been obtained. This can be of a multi-purpose use - auditorium, gymnasium, net-ball field, and hall.
2. A demonstration microscope is to be purchased - approximate cost Rs. 4,000/-
3. A projector and two over-head Projectors are required which would cost about Rs. 10,000/- each.
4. An electric (cost Rs. 1,700/-) for music classes. Presently a small organ is used.
5. A video (cost about Rs. 30,000/- needed.
6. School's extra-curricular activities have to be expanded. This school is one of the best in the country and has a long tradition of successful working.

Case-study No. 49, Rawalpindi

Management : Service Organization

The institution set up over 10 years ago, is located near PAF base, Chaklala. It has an enrolment of 1996 students, both boys and girls, from Prep to Class 5 as follows.

Prep -	Girls 84	- Boys 168	Total 252
Class 1 "	12	" 240	" 360
Class 2 "	80	- " 160	" 240
Class 3 "	105	- " 211	" 316
Class 4 "	100	- " 200	" 316
Class 5 "	76	- " 152	" 228

With 52 teachers, 2 males and 50 females on the staff, the student - teacher ratio works out to 34:1. The qualifications of the teachers are :

BA/BSC - 42	FA/F.SC - 8
B Ed - 36	MA/M.SC - 20

The teachers are paid between Rs. 3000-5000 a month besides some other allowances. They are also entitled to Provident Fund, certain leave facilities, free eduction to their children as well as scholarships and stipends. They are recruited on the basis of open and tenure are also regulated through well-defined conditions, their employment of the teachers have had adequate teaching and allied experiences prior to their being inducted in this institution. the institution imparts education from Prep to higher secondary levels. Besides the normal internal exams conducted by the institution, the students take external, public exams at the secondary and higher secondary levels, conducted by the Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Eduction, annually. The institution has been obtaining 100% pass percentage in the exams mostly in A & A+ grades, including top merit position in the Federal Board.

The school functions as a private educational institution although it has been set up by the PAF authorities with the basic objective of providing quality education to the children of PAF employees. On availability of seats, other children are also admitted comprising cross sections of the community. All policy matters are decided by a duly constituted board which has representations from PAF authorities, teachers and parents. The institution functions under properly formulated plans. The school has its own building constructed at PAF cost, all other expenses amounting to approx. Rs. 1,35,000/- a year are met through private resources of the institution mainly through tuition fees. PAF and other services personnel are charged less than Rs. 100/- per month as tuition fees, while the others pay in the range of Rs. 100-500 per month. Besides tuition fees the students are also required to pay for books and stationery, sports, library, building funds and labs.

Physical facilities including well-planned school building library, playing fields and facilities for various co-curricular/extra-curricular activities are of the highest order in

institution contributing to the quality of education here. The school has elaborate arrangement for extra/co-curricular activities and cultural programme. It has a separate activities section comprising computers, electronics, art and craft and music. All these activities are supervised by trained personnels. the school also undertakes regular projects oriented field visits.

The school has plans to increase its physical facilities further and make further additions in the building. Recruitment of more teachers with proper qualifications also happens to be amidst its priorities. The school is, however, seriously handicapped in implementing these programme because of financial constraints.

The school under study is a good example of private enterprise in education with proven level of excellence in the functioning and as an innovatory agent in the sphere of learning. This school and similar chains of educational institutions set up by PAF justifiably deserve all assistance. This school along with other similar school set up by PAF play definitive leadership role and are being taken as examples of first rate schools all over the country.

Case Study No. 13, Peshawar City

Management: Individual

A. Physical Description:

The school was set up in 1979. It is conveniently situated between the old city and the cantonment area. Originally the school was co-educational however later on as required by the Education Authorities it had to be bifurcated into a girls and Boys section. Both the schools have now separate building properly designed and nicely constructed. The children mostly belong to business families; however a good number of them come from other segments of the society.

B Management

The School is owned by a rich family of Peshawar City. It has a Management Board comprising of the partners in the venture. There also exists an advisory body. The Management Board is the real decision-making authority. The main objective as stated by the owner was to meet the ever-increasing needs of education in Peshawar city with emphasis on quality education.

C. School Characteristics

The student enrolment in both sections of the school is about 2000. The teacher-student ration is 1:30. Tuition fee from class I-VIII is Rs. 290/- which includes the cost of sports and medical charges. The children of the employees and students having brothers and sisters are given some concessions in the tuition fee. Transport facilities are available at Rs. 150/- P.M. per child.

D. School Cost/Expenses

The estimated cost of the buildings and the cost of the land which is situated in this expensive area comes to about Rs. One crore. The teachers are given government pay-scales and free transport facilities.

E. Quality of Education

The school prepares the children for the secondary school Certificate examination of the Board of Education Peshawar. Medium of Instruction is English. The Curriculum and text books are those prescribed by the Government for English medium school. Adequate Library and laboratory exist in the school. However facilities for out door games do not exist as land is quite costly and is not easily available.

F. Distinguishing of Features of the School

The school management totally depends on its own resources and has not looked for

assistance from the Government agencies. It can be judged as 'a' Private school with emphasis on quality education provided at average expenses.

G. Constraints and Recommendations

Further expansion of the school in terms of physical facilities like play grounds, classrooms and hall etc. is not possible. Such educational concerns need to be supported by the Government since a good school can not possibly run on commercial grounds.

Case-study No. 6, Karachi

Management Trust

Physical Description, building status:

The institution was established in 1949 as K.G. School and was subsequently raised to Primary School and Secondary level. Origionally housed in a small Bungalow on Bunder Road, it has since moved to its present building whose old structure has been demolished and now reconstructed as a large 3-storey school type building. It is located in an area which can be called heart of the city and caters to the educational needs of a middle - income group.

There are presently 6 Schools functioning in this building in two shifts. One branch of the school has been started in Malir and the other is shortly to start as a full-fledged technical school at Korangi Road on an area of about 1000 sq. yds.

Management;

The Education Trust and School's Management Committee consists of 11 members.

School Characteristics:

Enrolment :More than 4,000 children enroled all the branches of the School.

Pre-Primary:	{Tuition:-	Rs. 300/month,
	Admission:	Rs. 2000/-, Annual charges for
	activities	Rs. 600/-}
Primary:	{Tuituion :- Rs. 185/month, Admission Rs. 1000/-, Annual Charges Rs. 150/-}	

Quality of Education:

The school's distinguishing characteristic is its high standard of academic education as well as it varied and innovative co-curricular activities. Students are taken out for educational excurisions, visits to museums and zoos, factories and sea-side. A large number of recreational activities are organised by teachers, management and school children-all deeply involved in imporving the quality of education. Science and Arts exhibitions are organised annually. Parents Day, Open House, Prize Distribution, Sports, Social-welfare Projects for the community are some of the joint activities organised by a dedicated group of children and teachers. Field trips of school children include visits to aquarium, museum, playland, Quaid's Mazar/and his birth place.

Quite a number of ex-students of the school are engaged in nation building jobs including sports at all levels inside the country and abroad.

At the 40th Anniversay of the school (1949-1989) a very informative, interesting and pictorial souvenir was printed by a Special Committee set up for the purpose, commemorating its fruitful years of work in the educational field.

Computer Courses:

Variety of courses beginning with computer literacy programme sponsored by BCCI to training fo school accounts have been attended by students and teachers of the school during 1986 to 1990.

The School teachers have also worked during the last few years as workshop leaders and summer school organisers for Pre-Primary children of Karachi schools at T.R.C. Karachi.

They have also attended workshop on Teaching Aids for English language, Intensive Computer Courses, Book Festival at R.R.S., Workshop on Logo, Computer-aided graphics and word processing at PACES, Karachi.

Curriculum:

The school follows national curriculum, supplemented by foreign books and especially developed materials in all subjects except Urdu and Islamiat.
Medium of Instruction: Urdu and English.

Library:

The school has two separate libraries for its Primary and Secondary Sections. The total number of books exceed 4,500. Books are regularly issued to children.

Dispensary:

The school has two full time doctors to look after the health of the children.

Teacher - Student Ratio:		1:25
There are fifty teachers in the school		
Qualification	BA/B.Sc.	26
	F.A/F.Sc.	3
Graduates with teaching degree		14
Non Graduates with Teaching Certificates		7

The school has close liaison with T.R.C. (Teacher Resource Centre) and its teachers are sent for training in all school subject. It is equipped with modern instruments of educational aid like T.V., V.C.R. and computer.

Teachers employed in the school hardly ever want to leave it as according to the information available in the souvenir some have been working in the school upto 38 years.

Educational Aid:

Computer cassettes for language development, Maps, Charts, Models, Playhouse, activities, electric organs are freely used.

Constraints:

1) The existing school building has become a little over-crowded for its large enrolment in two shifts.

2) Its play-ground is not large and children have to use it in turns.

Future Plans:

The Trustees of the school propose to expand the educational facilities offered by them to other areas of the city too. Hence a branch of the school has been opened at Malir. A technical school has been started (January 1990) at Darul Salam, Korangi Road. These new institutions would need help in the field of construction and equipment.

Case-study No. 30, Hyderabad City

Management : Individual

The school was established in 1982 by an individual under a Education Society. It is presently housed in a Banglow having all facilities which are needed for a well equipped educational institutions. It is situated in a well developed area of the city. The majority of the inhabitants of the area belongs to the middle class people. The building is owned by the Chairman of the foundation.

Management

The managing committee consists of 7 numbers including the owner/Chairman of the society who is the eminent educationist. It is the highest decision making body.

Objectives

The aims and objectives of the society are :

1. The school aims at providing children with natural environment - assessing potential for every individual child and helping him/her according to his/her respective capability developing into a fulfiledged useful citizen. The stress is laid not on rote memorization but on developing various faculties of a child which will help him to develop his inward qualities so that he can grow into an independent responsible citizen who will contribute to the well being of his society.

2. The founding body makes all the contribution towards the maintenance and functioning of the school.

3. The Principal conducts the day to day administration and has fuli administrative and financial powers.

4. There is one branch run under the same organization.

Enrolment

Total enrolment at school is 127.

Rates of Fees

Pre-primary

Admission Fee	Rs. 120/-
Tuition Fee	Rs. 100/-

Primary

Admission Fee	Rs. 120/-

a1

Tuition Fee Rs. 070/-

Freeship

10% of the students avail the facility of freeship in tuition fee.

Curriculum

The school uses National curriculum and other supplementary books are also used in order to raise the academic standard of the school. Other co-curricular activities in the class room and outside the class rooms are also arranged to encourage the spirit and self confidence in the students.

Library

500 books are available in the library of school for teachers and students.

Play Ground

A play ground and beautiful lawn is attached with the school. There are swings for the children in the lawn of the school to provide the natural environment.

Teachers

Male	--
Female	10

Teacher Student Ratio

1:12

Medium of Instruction

English

Academic Qualification of Teachers

Matric	--
F.A./F.Sc.	--
B.A./B.Sc.	10

Salaries

Range between Rs. 500/- to Rs. 1000/-

Facilities Providing to Teachers

Casual leave

Building

The building is owned by the owner of the school who is the chairman of the society.

Other Expenses

Electricity	Rs. 4,000/-
Telephone	Rs. 2,400/-
Building Maintenance	Rs. 4,000/-
Others (stationary & Furnitures)	Rs. 5,000/-

Finance

It is a self financed school. The deficit, if any, is met by the management.

Constraints

The management pointed out the major constraints:-

1. Building Accommodation.
2. Qualified teachers specially in maths and science.
3. Shortage of English teaching teachers.

Recommendations

The management recommends that :-

1. The Private schools' teacher may be provided in-service training (refresher course in Maths and Science).

2. Financial aid may be provided to Private schools for Library books, Instructional material and Science Laboratory.

Case-study Code 46, Rawalpindi

Management: Individual

The School set up in 1983 owes its existence to an enterprising venture of an individual and his organisational capabilities. From a very modest beginning in 1983 with a total intake of 10 pupils at rudimentary levels, the School has now developed into a flourishing educational institution with two branches separately for boys and girls with a total enrolment of approximately 650 pupils from Nursery to Secondary level i.e upto Class 10. The girls section has an intake of 97 students from Class 1 and 5 and the boys section consists of 184 students at these levels. With a total of 32 teachers (4 males and 28 females) the student teacher ratio stands at 18.1. The educational qualification of these teachers are:-

BA/B.Sc.:	15	F.Sc:	6
B.Ed.:	03	MA/M.Sc:	8

Most of the teachers have been employed in this institution for approximately 5 years drawing an average salary of above Rs. 2000/- per month in the primary section besides subsidies for house rent and the provisions of provident funds and old age benefits. An amount of Rs. 350/- per month is charged as tuition fees at primary levels as well as Rs. 150/- per month as transport charges. Approximately 5% students are being provided freeships in addition to similar concessions to 70 Afghan students enroled as UN Refugees for which UN under writes Rs. 250/- per head.

The School is located in what once used to be a post residential township built up in the early fifties in the outskirts of Rawalpindi. With the establishment of capital city of Islamabad, the township now occupies a peripheral position between Rawalpindi and Islamabad and has receded to a diminishing position, retaining however, its erstwhile significance as a quiet, suburban residential sector mainly comprising of various government services cadres.

The socio-economic patterns of the inhabitants of this residential township remain almost the some as in the early years. The Boys section of the School is housed in an imposing rather modern - looking, double storied rented building with ample space and reasonably spaced rooms converted into class rooms with necessary modifications and renovations. The Girls section, located adjacent to the boys section has equally adequate facilities.

The school (both the boys and girls sections) is owned and administered by an individual who is also the Principal of this institution. Some 4 to 5 private schools of different dimensions are located in close proximity, but none so flourishing nor so distinctive in terms of enrolment, physical facilities, audiovisual aids and percentage of teachers strength.

The Principal happens to be an educationist of some standing and with sufficiently qualified staff the School has been functioning satisfactorily as could be deduced from the overall, prevailing reputation of this School. The quality of teaching also appears to

be good and in public examinations at grade 10 levels the School has been showing 100% success rates with 68 to 70 percent students achieving A-grade over the last 4-5 years. It follows a mixed curriculum comprising the foreign and national text books. English is the medium of instruction at all levels in this School. The School has a library with approx 2000 books and co-curricular activities are also being under taken as a regular programme.

The School has an organized system of monitoring students' progress. A notable feature of the school is its remedial programme which is individually tailored for each student at the time of admission. Part of the remediation is provided at the school and in other cases parents are counseled to adopt necessary measures.

The School does not have any formally organised governing body; the Principal alongwith the two Vice-Principal and a few senior teachers manage all of the administrative and academic functions. For all intents it is an owner-based organization that provides good education at commercial rates. Nevertheless, in consonance with the market norms, clientele patronage is contingent for the rendering of service commensurate with the costs. Such a proposition is all the more relevant in view of the fact that the school stands in competition with quite of few other schools happening to be located in same vicinity. That this school stands out as compared to the other ones indicates that it is fulfilling the expected criteria of cost-benefits.

The most distinguishing feature of this school happens to be a combination of multiple educational activities from Nursery to Secondary levels, preparation for professionals careers and interestingly, remedial measure, and counseling to parents.

The general atmosphere of the schools reflects an overall attitude of friendliness on the part of the teaching staff. The school caters on the job training for its staff.

The usual facilities of casual maternity leave are admissible to the teaching staff. Detailed breakdowns of expenses/costs were provided by the school.

Building Rent:	Rs.	5,04,000	per annum
Teachers/staff salaries:	Rs.	60,000	per annum
Elect./Water/Phone & Gas:	Rs.	07,500	per annum
Transport:	Rs.	06,000	per annum
Teaching materials:	Rs.	04,000	per annum
Other contingent:	Rs.		
Expenditure:	Rs.	05,000	per annum

Approximately 1,50,000/- per month seems to be the revenues of the school as against an estimated expenditure or Rs. 11,8,000/-

Recommendations

The Principal is averse to impositions of government rule and resents un-necessary restrictive provisions that stifle private initiatives. He indicated the fallacy in the existing

regulatory provisions to the extent that no official from the local Education Directorate never visited his school in all these years since 1983 to inspect its working. He has the following suggestions of to improve regulatory provisions:-

1)
There should be no restrictive clauses, however, an appropriate committee should be set up by the local Education Authorities to proposals examine for the opening of private schools, interview the prospective founders of the school to ascertain his/her bonafides and educational capabilities.

2)
Each private school should be categorized based on its interest, excellence, and facilities. Assistance should be provided to only good quality school.

3)
The school has its developmental plans and priorities but the major constraint happen to be financing and shortage of physical facilities. He suggested the availability of following facilities from Governmental/other aid giving agencies may help the schools:

i)
Loan faciiities on nominal rates for the schools' developmental projects;

ii) Provision of allotment of land at subsidised amenity rates; and

iii) Donation of audiovisual aids.

Case Study No. 39, Quetta, Balochistan

Management: NGO

This is a primary school established and managed by an NGO which is active in a number of educational and social development projects in rural Balochistan. Some of the project activities include:

a) **Tailoring and Cutting Centres:**

Women are taught cutting and sewing free of charges. On completion of training women are provided sewing machines with the cooperation of Zakat Department. College and School Girls are also taught cutting, sewing and embroidery at nominal charges.

b) **Female Typing Centre:**

Young females who need extra income are taught shorthand and typing and given a diploma after completion of a nine months course. Successful typists are helped in getting jobs.

c) **Employment Cell:**

With the cooperation and assistance of the Marker Factory, Survey of Pakistan, National Savings Department, Social Welfare Department, Labour Department, P.I.A., C.A.A., A.S.F., private organisations, widow, orphans, retired, skilled and unskilled personnel are provided jobs.

d) **Education Stipends:**

With the help of the philanthropists sixty male and female students are getting free education. Some of these are medical students. In addition to financial aid, books, clothes, shoes, cycles etc. are also provided to deserving students.

e) **School Health Unit:**

A health centre is functioning in the premises of Islamia High School Quetta which looks after six thousands students. Inoculation/vaccination is also carried out. All medicines are provided free with the courtesy of health department.

f) **Rural Health Centre:**

A land plot donated by a noble person in a village Killi Gul Mohammad, Quetta where a free dispensary has been set up. Construction of the M.C.H. Centre was completed within time the help of grant in aid provided by C.I.D.A. Islamabad. Poor patients are given free medicine with the help of Zakat Department. Nuitrition Programme is conducted with the help of World Food Programme.

The school is one of the three schools managed by the organization. Two of the schools are outside Quetta.

The school was established in 1988 in a self financed building at a cost of Rs. 1.4 million. It has 10 classrooms, small hall, 2 staff rooms and other essential facilities. It is built on a plot of 600 square yards. There are no schools, either government or private in the immediate vicinity with population of low and middle income families including Afghan refugees.

Management

The management committee consists of six individuals who organize and oversee a variety of developmental activities. It has delegated the responsibilities for school administration to the school principal.

The credibility of the management is reflected by the public support and donations and financial contribution. Most of the projects including these school have been started through land and financial contributions 'by the individuals'

Objectives

a) To provide education to disadvantage children and the children of single and widowed females;

b) To develop and implement integrated programs in education and social development; and

c) To mobilize communities and their resources in project development.

Enrolment

This year the enrolment of the school is 150, which has raised from last year.

Fee Rates

Admission Fee:200/- month Transport 60/- month
Tuition Fee:125/- month

Free Ship

Free ship is awarded to 5% of students.

Curriculum

The school follows the National Curriculum and the text books used in the schools are the National ones.

Library

There are 100 books for the Library.

Playground

There is an open space and a small Hall where the children can play.

Teachers

There are 8 teachers in total and all of the are female teachers.

Academic Qualification

a) Matric:	1
b) FA/FSc:	–
c) BA/BSc:	5
d) MA/MSc:	2

Teachers Student Ratio

1:19 (The ratio is kept deliberately low to maintain an appropriate learning environment)

Medium of Instruction

Pre-Primary	:	English
Primary	:	English

Salaries

Range between 500 to 1000

Facilities provided to teachers

a) Maternity leave
b) Casual leave

Other expenses

Electricity and Water	=	Rs. 5000/-
Telephone and Gas	=	Rs. 9000/-
Building Maintenance	=	Rs. 6000/-

Finances

The committee is responsible for all types of expenditure and finances.

Constraints

The committee didn't complaint about texes as the school has a tax exemption status.

Recommendation

The management suggested that Government should provide funds for Teaching Aids, like Computer, Sports, Library books Facilities for Teachers Training.

The school needs funds for the construction of upper story, which it intend to use for a girls school.

Case Study No. 3, Karachi

Management Trust/Community

The school established in 1928 originally in a rented building at Nanakwara. It was moved to its present building in 1931, which was then newly constructed by the Community Society and a Trust was set up.

Objectives:

To continue with the original objectives of the Trust to - promote quality education among poor and low-income group families.

School characters:

Housed in a large four storey building in the heart of the city (Opposite City Court), the school was nationalised in 1972 but has recently been denationalised, not yet physically handed over to the Trust because of some minor administrative hitch faced by the Directorate of School Education.

The Managing Trustees, however, are certain that these problems would soon be overcome and the school would be handed over within this month. Their plans for the face-lifting and repairs of school are ready and would be implemented as soon as the possession is restored.

During the eight years of government control and management the schools' building, its educational standards, and the quality of the teachers has suffered irremediably. It would cost a big sum of money just to restore and repair the building.

The school would start its Pre-Primary, Primary and Secondary Section as follows:

Enrolment capacity

Primary	200	(presently on rolls 30) (5 sections)
Secondary	600	(presently on rolls 516) (15 sections)
Teachers: Primary	8	(To be employed)
Secondary	24	(To be employed) (15 sections)

Clientele

Lower and middle income group families.

Fees

Admission Fee	Rs.	300/-
Tuition Fee	Rs.	150/- p.m.

Freeships:

10 to 15% of the school population will get full freeship. Sisters and brothers concession will be given.

Quality of education

Curriculum - National
But English will be taught as a subject from K.g. level. Foreign Books will be used as supplements in English, Maths, Science and other school subjects.

Teachers will be given special training for teaching English and other subjects at T.R.C.

Library: 3000 books

(To be issued to children)

Medium of Instruction: Urdu
Report Cards to be maintained and issued to parents.
School cost and Expenses:

Teachers' salaries: Rs. 17,700/- for 4 schools - two schools each for boys and girls.

Taxes

Telephone	Rs.	12,000/- p.a.
Water + Electricity	Rs.	12,000/-
Rent of school building	Rs.	28,800/- per annum for 4 schools.

Future Plans

The Management is enthusiastic about reconstructing and repairing the existing building which is presently in a poor shape. It will have to spend about Rs. 2,50,000/- for repairs. They have plans to supplement education with teaching aids like:

a) Educational films

b) Computer films

c) Vocational training (Typing, Short-land), screen printing, public speaking, tailoring, plumbing, carpentry, woodwork, and other similar trades will be introduced.

They also propose to organise and outdoor games and to hold inter-school sports competitions.

They would also introduce Girls Guide and Scouting.

The Managing Trustees also expect to get back their I acre plot of open land taken over by the Government and presently used as City Court Car Park. This land will be utilised for a girls schools building and common play-ground for all of its schools.

The Trust is an established philanthropic institution with a long tradition of social welfare work. It is expected to get back into the high stream of its philanthropic work as soon as it is given the possession of its school buildings which would have the following accommodation:

Class-rooms	20
Hall	1
Science Labs	2
Library	1
Staff Room	1
Office Rooms	1

The total number of rooms in the whole building is 42.

Case Study No. 45, Rawalpindi

Management Individual

The school is situated in a residential area on the outer fringe of Rawalpindi, a township which came into being in the late fifties bifurcated some six blocks or so based on the social and financial status of its inhabitants. Until the founding of Pakistan's Federal Capital, Islamabad in early sixties and its steady growth into a flourishing metropolis by the mid seventies, this township occupied eminent importance as a centre of large multicultural community. 'A' Block, where the prep School is located figured as the most posh section of the township inhabited relatively by the most affluent segments of the community. With the emergence of Islamabad as a modern city, Satellite Town has lost its qualitative entity of earlier years notwithstanding its lingering manifestations of distinctiveness as a peaceful residential area in contrast to the unlawful conditions prevailing and the squalor rampant in its slum areas.

The prep School under reference set up in March, 1967 with an initial intake of two pupils and one teacher, has grown steadily over the years. At present it has an enrolment of over 360 (boys and girls between the age group 4-14) in 10 classes, comprising pre-Nursery to Class VIII with an average ratio of 35 students in each class alongwith a cadre of 17 teachers including the principal, and one PTI, of which 15 are female teachers. Of them 8 possess post graduate degrees, the remaining seven are graduates with seven of them having B Ed degrees. Most of them have been on the staff of this School for over 10 years or so.

The School was founded and is owned by an eminent educationist is having held the posts of Headmasters and Head of Modern Subjects Deptt at Pakistan Military Academy from which position he retired in mid sixties. He has been the guiding spirit behind this institution, which now occupies a most reputable place as an educational institution, of its type not only in Pindi but in the entire province of Punjab and is equally well thought of in knowledgeable circles all over the country.

The school is housed in a rented residential building. It is conservative looking duplex of modest dimensions, the front portion being occupied by the owner and his family, whereas the units at the backyard have been functioning as the School premises at a monthly rent of 4500/-.

The rooms are rather smallish and not really ideal as Class-rooms. However these have been maintained properly and the school are is well-kept. There is no play ground other than a small lawn which gets inundated with slightly heavier rains as if happened during the occasion of the survey.

The survey seemed to indicate that the students are disciplined, well oriented, tidy, lively and properly attuned. The teachers appeared to be sound professionally, well-adjusted, pleasant, committed and depicting evidences of adequate interaction with pupils. Their lengths of tenure interalia reflects that they have abiding association with the institution not necessarily nurtured only by monetary considerations. The Principal's role has been akin to the role of a patriarch with some sort of a sustained

kinship. The teachers appear to come from middle and lower middle class, educated strata.

Enrolments conform to the pattern of open selection on merit during the beginning of each year. Since the School has gained a definitive repute, its clientele comprise a fairly wide spectrum mainly of middle class, educated segments encompassing the areas of Pindi and Islamabad. The School charges tuition fees at Rs. 250/- per month plus an additional charge of Rs. 10/- per month for contingent expenses and another fee of Rs. 100/- or so for conveyance. The school offers freeship to the tune of 5% of its total intake.

Assessment of qualitative aspects of the activities/programmes of the school including the quality of education imparted in this school is a somewhat ticklish proposition. Assessment on these counts implies measurement and grading against a set of criteria pertaining in the institution. In addition, this would also entail formulation of qualitative judgements about the people and organisational infrastructure of this institution, which tend to call for a more extensive exercise.

Based on an appraisals of these factors it may be concluded that on balance, the type and quality of education and overall training imparted in this institution appear to be satisfactory while giving allowance to the circumscribed physical, material and organisational resources.

The assessment of curriculum requires the examination of the question of the rationale of adoption of any particular curriculum in relation to the cultural, social, ideological and societal requirements based on the prevailing ethos of the concerned society. The curriculum in this school remains by and large the prototype of curricula in vogue in English Medium Schools of comparable levels in Pakistan with a blend of national and foreign syllabi. This school has included text books in Urdu and Islamiyat in parity with the national syllabi whereas the text books in English and Maths pertain to syllabuses adopted by some of the foreign affiliated institutions mainly published by oxford university press.

The school seems to have a fair share of co-curricular activities consisting mainly of cultural programmes including regular arrangements for imparting lessons in music. It has a small library as well.

The school undertakes regularly organised functions facilitating School parents/parents-teachers inter action. Including a system of inviting three-four parents (mothers) on rotation to tea during tea breaks in the school every morning with the teaching staff.

The school has a stream-lined system of maintaining record of the child's progress and remedial/instructions including booklets and printed materials on learning of English language etc.

It has a regular system of budgeting on an annual basis at an estimated expenditure of approx Rupees one million, duly approved by the Board of Management.

Salaries to the teachers at a minimum emolument of approx Rs. 2400/- compares very favourably with the existing scales in most of the private schools.

The school in its initial stages catered for a very limited clientele comprising middle/low middle socio-economic levels. The clientele has expanded over the years but the socio-economic composition remains almost the same consisting of govt. servants, private service, land owners and business-men with adequate backgrounds. The school has had a pioneering role in private sector, only a very limited numbers of these schools existed in 1967, whereas present number of these schools has increased some hundred folds. In the vicinity of this school, some three or four private schools are also functioning. Setting up of a preparatory school was an innovative initiative on the part of the founder of this school. The objectives are to providing ideological motivations in consonance with Pakistan's ideological precepts besides giving the students normal educational instructions. At least outwardly the school has succeeded to a great deal in achieving these objectives. Class VIII is the terminal stages and the students do not take any public exams as such. Most of them however, are admitted in other reputable institutions at Secondary levels and quite a few join established residential schools and cadet colleges.

All policy decisions are apparently based on consensus in the Board of Management although primarily the basic directional imperatives emanate by the principal himself. The school has not been running assurably on a commercial basis.

The principal draws a salary of approx. Rs. 4000/- and the income from fees etc. is mainly spent on meeting various liabilities connected with the school and its establishment charges. It was learnt that the budget reflects a debit balance of approx. Rs. 25000/- annually. It receives and accepts no financial grants from Govt. sources, some material help from private sectors in terms of electrical items and renovational facilities have been acceptable nonetheless.

All in all, the institution which happens to be privately owned has been providing a useful service to the community and comes up to a fair level of attainment not-withstanding certain understandable deficiencies in terms of physical facilities and equipments which, on balance, tend to be offset by the level of excellence of the teachers.
In its location, the from school has no scope of further physical expansion aside from supplementary renovations. There is however the need for and possibility of enhancing its material resources and further boosting up its pedagogical potentials based on a phased programme.

The school has properly laid down procedures to administrator its working, the principal is however chary of any unnecessary interference by the local authorities much as the principal seems to approve of the overall functional stipulations contained in the provincial Govt's regulations.

The school has been granted exemptions from the payment of Income Tax by the central Board of Revenue, Govt. of Pakistan assumably based on its excellence.

To sum up, the School is a good example of a moderate and modest level private

enterprise in education at private level and the most distinguishing feature remains a collective team work and harmonious balance between the Board of Management and the school administration and its most distinctive feature being that although it is a privately owned one man's enterprise it operates under a Board of Management with shared responsibilities with an open administration allowing for sharing of information. The most obvious drawback being that it is housed in a residential accommodation with very limited physical facilities inhibiting of its growth.

Recommendations

The School needs to be encouraged as it has been providing good education. With its established reputation, there will be enough justification to assist the institution in expanding its programmes by providing additional facilities for accommodation. Since it is a privately owned building, this may create some difficulties. Appropriate assistance, may however, be considered as follows:-

a) Training facilities be provided to all such existing teachers on the staff who have had no such training. For this purpose proportionate subsidy may be provided for appointing teachers on leave vacancy against the posts of teachers sponsored for training.

b) The small library maintained by the school may be replenished.

c) Soft loans may be provided to the school to meet some of its urgent developmental needs.

Case Study No. 22

Shikarpur, Sindh

The school was established as a Nursery/K.G. School in 1983 by District Montessory Board Shikarpur and raised to the Primary level in 1985. It is housed in a double storey building consisting of eight class rooms, one room for Head Mistress and for office use. It is a Government building donated to the Schools by the Social welfare Department.

MANAGEMENT

The school is run by the Distt. Montessory School Board, Shikarpur consisting of the following:-

1.	Deputy Commissioner, Shikarpur	Chairman
2.	Assistant Director Social welfare Shikarpur	Secretary
3.	Principal, Govt. Girls Degree College, Shikarpur	Member
4.	Assistant Commissioner and S.D.M. Sub-Division, Garhi Yasin	Member
5.	District Education Officer (Boys) Shikarpur	Member
6.	District Education Officer (Female) Shikarpur	Member
7.	Principal, District Montessory School Shikarpur	Member

OBJECTIVES

a. The main objective of the Parent/founding body is to promote education.
b. The founding body makes all the contributions towards the maintenance and functioning of the school.

c. The Principal conducts the day to day administration and she has full powers in curricular and co-curricular activities as she is one of the members of the Board.

d. There are three members from Education Department who are the members of the Board of Governor who prove to be very helpful for the management.

e. There are no other branches of the institutions.

The school is located on station road, Shikarpur. It is residential cum commercial area inhabitated by the middle class people. One Private and 2 Government Primary Schools are in the vicinity. 30% to 40% of the children are being retained to complete their primary schooling.

ENROLMENT

The total of the school is 340. The detail is given below:-

1.	Pre-Primary	90
2.	Primary	220
3.	Middle	30
	Total	340

DISTRICT MONTESSORI SHIKARPUR

RATES OF FEES

1.Tuition Fee

	Primary	Rs.	60/- per month
	Middle	Rs.	80/- per month
2.	Admission fee	Rs.	150/- once
3.	Examn. Fee	Rs.	30/- p.a.

The parents of the pupils can afford the fees charged by the Management as the area of the school clientele belongs to Middle class groups.

FREE SHIP

No such facility is provided to the children even teacher's children are full paying. No demand has been made from the parents side.

CURRICULUM

The school uses National curriculum.

LIBRARY

Library reading facility is not available in the school due to the limitation of the physical space.

PLAY GROUND

There is an open space in the school which is used as play ground. Physical exercises are made on the ground and other indoor games are played in the class rooms.

TEACHERS

Male

Female	10
Total:	10

TEACHERS STUDENTS RATIO

1:34

MEDIUM OF INSTRUCTION

Primary	English, Sindhi, and Urdu
Middle	English

ACADEMIC QUALIFICATION OF TEACHERS

B.A/B.Sc	05
M.A/M.Sc.	04
F.A/F.Sc.	--
Matric	01

PROFESSIONAL QUALIFICATION

Graduate with teaching degree	--
Non-Graduate with teaching certificate	01

SALARIES

The basic pay of Rs. 750/- p.m. with annual increment of Rs. 30/- is given to all teachers. Rs. 200/- p.m. are given to Principal as charge allowance. Terms and conditions.

DISTRICTS MONTESSORI SCHOOL SHIKARPUR

Services are properly laid down and offered at the time of initial appointment.

FACILITIES PROVIDED TO TEACHERS

Only casual leave facility is provided to teachers.

BUILDING

The building is owned by the Government/Social welfare Department. It has 10 rooms for classes, one for Principal and one for Office use.

OTHER EXPENSES (ANNUAL)

1. Electricity	Rs. 1,500/-
2. Water charges	Rs. 150/-
3. Telephone	Rs. 2,000/-

4. Building Maintenance Rs. 5,000/-
5. Furniture and Stationary Rs. 2,400/-

FINANCE

It is a self financed school. The deficit, if any, is met by the limited of social welfare Department and the district administration.

CONSTRAINTS

The major constraints are:-

1. Scarcity of good and trained teachers.
2. Non-availability of standardized teaching aids specially for English medium school.
3. Middle school scholarship examinations are not conducted in English Medium.
4. Accommodation for additional class rooms.
5. Accommodation and equipments for library and Science Laboratory.
6. Ground for out-door games.
7. Shortage of funds.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Management recommends the following suggestions:-

1. Financial aids be granted to meet the difficulties in re-curring and non-recurring expenses.

2. Free accomodation may be provided for the additional class rooms, Library and Science Laboratory

3. Curriculum may be revised according to the mental and physical level of the students.

4. Arrangements may be made for the training to the in-service teachers.

Case Study No. 1, Karachi

Management : Community Foundation

A. Physical Description/Building Status, Location:

It was established as a Nursery/K.G. School in 1979 by the Foundation and was raised to the Primary Level in 1981. It is presently housed in five storey building constructed on a plot of 325 sq. yds owned by the wife of the chairman of foundation. The foundation raised funds (as loan) privately to construct a proper school building. There is no government or private school in the immediate vicinity of the school.

B. Management:

Managing Committee consists of 7 members including the owner/Chairman, his wife and some eminent members of the community.

OBJECTIVE:

a) The main objectives of the Parent/Founding Body are those of a social welfare body as provided in the by-laws of the Foundation.

b) The founding body make all the contribution towards the maintenance and functioning of the school.

c) The Principal conducts the day to day administration and has financial powers laid down under the rules.

d) There are some outsiders (members of the public) who are members of the Board of Governors who prove an asset for the management.

e) There are no other branches of the institution.

C. School Characteristics:

The school is located in a socially deprived and crowded area of old city inhabited by and large, by low-income group people. It is also infested with narcotic addicts and drug-pedlars which makes it a difficult area to deal with, especially where parents' cooperation is concerned. The school management finds it very hard to retain all children in the school for full five years. It is, however, commendable that some 30% of the children are being retained to complete their primary schooling. Some of them go on to the secondary school too.

Enrolment:

1. It is also an encouraging sign that during the last four years the enrolment in the

Primary School has more than doubled from 321 in 1986 to 732 in 1990. The institution functions in two shifts and the enrolment in Primary Section for the two shifts comes to a total of 1,333.

A. Secondary School also functions in the same building with more than 300 children.

The result of the Secondary School Certificate Examination conducted by the Karachi Board of Secondary Education is as follows:

1987.....95%
1988.....90%
1989.....75%

Asked why the results have shown a downward trend, the Chairman stated that the reason was in the frequent closure of School over long periods due to the disturbed law and order situation in the neighboured during this period.

Rates of Fee:

Tuition Fee	Rs.	60/- P.M.
Admission Fee	Rs.	120/- P.M.
Examination	Rs.	20/- P.M.

Therefore through not high in comparison to the fees charged in other Private Schools, the fees are on the higher side since the area of the school clientele belongs to low income group.

Freeship:

Under the government Rules, Schools are expected to provide freeship to at least 10% of the school population. This school, however, gives freeship to 30% of the school population.

D. Quality of Education:

1) Curriculum

The school uses National and curriculum but foreign are also used in order to raise the academic standard of the school.

2) Library

There are 503 books in the library - some 50% books are issued to the children.

3) Playground

There are no open space for play ground in the school. There are two large halls which are used for physical exercises and indoor games. The children, however, have to be taken for out door games to the nearest K.M.C. play ground.

4)**Teachers**

Male	5
Female	42
Total	47

5) Teacher Students Ratio

1:30

6) Academic Qualification of Teacher

BA/M.Sc.	15
MA/M.Sc.	04
FA/F.Sc.	09
Matric	07

7) Professional Qualification

Graduates with Teaching degrees	04
Non-Graduates with teaching certificates	08

8) Salaries

Range between Rs. 500/- to Rs. 1000/-. Some teachers are paid above Rs. 1000/- per month. Terms and conditions of service laid down in writing.

9) Facilities Proved to Teachers

a) Maternity leave
b) Casual leave
c) Leave for training and professional improvement.

d) Free education to teachers' children.

10) Medium of Instruction

Pre-primary (on parents demand)	English
Primary	English & Urdu

Building

The building is owned by the wife of the chairman, who is paid annual rent of Rs. 67,200/-. It has 33 class-rooms and two large halls. The halls are used for extra-curricular activities.

E. 1) Salaries

.....?

2) Other Expenses

Electricity	Rs. 32,000/- P.A.
Water	Rs. 06,500/- P.A.
Telephone	Rs. 01,400/- P.A.
Building Maintenance	Rs. 47,000/- P.A.
Misc.	Rs. 15,000/- P.A.

3) Finances

It is a self-financed School.

The deficit, if any, is met by the Management.

F. Constraints to School Development

The management complained that though registered as a social welfare body, they had to pay to the Government the following taxes charged on commercial rates:

1)	Water Tax	Rs. 06,500/- P.A.
2)	Electricity	Rs. 32,000/- P.A.
3)	Excise Tax	Rs. 06,000/- P.A.
4)	Gas	Rs. 03,000/- P.A.

5) Old age benefit at Rs. 5% per employee per month.

6) Education @ Rs. 1000/- per employee per year.

Scarcity of Good Teacher

a) School finds it hard to employ and retain good teachers because of the social problems in the area.

b) The rules of registration and recognition are bound in rigid red - tape and cause much difficulty and harassment to the management for a smooth functioning of the school. The cr delays and barriers in solving the school problems.

Recommendations

1) The management suggest that the rules about charging taxes on commercial rates are not in keeping with the rules of registration for social welfare organisations. They are self-contradictory and should be withdrawn.

2) Old age benefits and Education Cess (supposed to be charged from industries) should not be charged from educational institutions which promotes literacy and education. Instead, in order to safeguard the interests of teachers, a scheme of provident fund and gratuity should be introduced so that teachers' terms and conditions of service are made attractive and beneficial for them.

3) A cluster of schools both private and government without grounds should get statutory permission to use a common K.M.C./Cantonment Board/Railway Board Playgrounds according to a regular time-table.

d) All schools should be encouraged to develop and expand their libraries/class-room book-shelves with reading materials and books of children's interest. (Presently books on philosophy, history, religion and second hand Penguin series books meant for grown-ups are kept to give a semblance of library). Efforts should be made to encourage the habit of reading among children. Special funds should be provided to purchase childrens' literature, to expand the reading room and to provide proper furniture for the library, so that children can sit in a pleasant, congenial atmosphere, as they certainly do not have this facility in their home environment.
e) Children should be provided with nutritious food-boiled chana, fresh fruits during school time. Eatables (usually state and un-hygienic) sold at the school gate must be stopped.

.e) The school can be helped:

i) by providing soft loans for bringing about academic and administrative reforms.

ii) by providing in-service training to teachers and giving merit award/monetary incentives at the successful completion of training to encourage them to stay in the school.

iii) by allowing representation to school managements Board of Education and Government Committees.

iv) by setting up Advisory committees consisting of educationists, eminent members of society, Government representatives, local councillors and MPAs to help the school solve its problems. The committee must visit the school at least twice a year to look into the problems.

H. Future Plans

a) The school management proposes to encourage in-service training of teachers through participation in short andnourses/workshops organised by agencies like PACC (Pakistan American Culture Centre) Spelt (Society for Promotion of English Language TEaching) and TRC (Teachers Resource Centre).

b) It also wants to start Computer Science Courses for the wright students.

c) Technical and Vocational subjects also will be introduced for the help of students so that ways learning income-generating trades.

Case-study No. 21, Peshawar City

Management : Individual

A. Physical Description:

The school has been established less than a year ago on plot of 20 marlas in an upper middle income suburb of Peshawar city. There are several private schools in the area but only two government secondary schools, one for boys and the for girls. The building of the school is appropriately constructed to serve the purpose of a school. On its two floors, the school has 10 classrooms, each with a capacity of 35 students, a library room (with no books at present), a staff room, another large meeting room, a Principal's office as well as toilets and a store room. There is small courtyard with potted plants and the building is kept clean.

B. Management:

The school has neither a parent body nor a management committee. It is owned a well as managed by an individual, who as stated is an electrical technician or engineer and who after working in Saudi Arabia for many years saved a good sum of money and upon returning to Pakistan decided to open the school to serve the educational needs of the children of his neighborhood". The owner also lives in the same locaiity. Thus the avowed objective of the school is to provide social welfare and serve the national interest. It is worth noting that these objectives of the school were explained to the evaluation team by the father - in - law of the owner while the owner himself did not have much to articulate about the objectives.

The decision-making authority rests entirely with the owner-cum-Principal.

C. **School Characteristics:**

It is a primary school with grades 1-5 and has a total number of about 100 students, both boys and girls. There are seven full-time teachers which signifies a low teacher-students ratio of about 1:13. This low ratio is due to very recent establishment of the school. The owner would like to increase the enrolment to 35 per class and have two sections for each class.

The curriculum is the same as in the government primary schools and the medium is stated to be English.

> The fee charges are Rs. 60 for grades 1-2 and Rs. 80 for grades 3-5. An additional Rs. 60 is charged per student per month for transport provided through a school-owned van. The school intends to buy a bus for transport purposes. We were not informed about any

other charges.

The clientele of the school comes from the immediate neighborhood and consists of middle and upper-middle income people working in the government or running their own businesses.

D. **Quality of Education:**

There is nothing discernible about the quality of education. It appears just like any other ordinary school where small children are confined into their classroom chairs with a teacher standing in front who carries them through textbook repetitions. When asked to identify some aspects of the quality of education in the school, the owner-cum-manager re-emphasized the special and "beautiful" design of the building. As a special feature, the owner pointed to the remote TV monitor placed in the office of the Principal and explained that this is the latest technology in educational supervision to detect class-room problems and to take remedial actions. He demonstrated its use by turning up the volume of one of the classrooms and we could see as well as hear the students repeating after the teacher. There is no school in whole of Peshawar with this latest technology, the owner told us. In response to our question, he denied that this sort of supervision may inhibit teachers and may have other adverse effects on education.

E. **School costs and expenses:**

The school building including the price of land is estimated at Rs. 65 laks self-financed by the owner. The seven teachers are paid that a total of Rs. 10,000 while the income from fees is about Rs. 8,000. It is estimated the earning from transport charges is about Rs. 7,000. There may be other charges and income that we are not aware of. The school is presently running at a loss.

F. **Constraints:**

The school needs additional finances to expand it to the middle level. The governments taxation policy does not leave any income for schools development.

A playground, laboratory equipment, and telephone installations are needed. The governments financial assistance is needed for this purpose.

G. **Recommendations:**

The government should provide financial grants for this school development.

Annexure - 7

Individuals Interviewed

Individual Interviews

- Mr. Mazhar Siddiqui
  Secretary,
  Federal Ministry of Education,
  Government of Pakistan.

- Ms. R.A. Bhatti
  Director Education,
  N.W.F.P,
  Peshawar.

- Mr. Tahir Khan
  Assistant Director,
  Primary Schools N.W.F.P,
  Peshawar.

- Mr. Muhammad Salim Khan
  Chairman,
  Board of Intermediate & Secondary Education,
  N.W.F.P,
  Peshawar.

- Mr. Khawaja Zawar Nasir
  Private Schools' Management Association,
  N.W.F.P,
  Peshawar.

- Mr. Moeed Farooqi
  Director of Education,
  Karachi Region,
  Karachi.

- Ms. Mehrunnisa Ahmad Ali
  Director,
  Teachers' Resource Centre,
  Karachi.

- Mrs. Nasira Wazir Ali
  Founder,
  Nasrs School,
  Karachi.

- Mrs. Kaniz Wajid Khan
  Trustee,
  Nasra School,
  Karachi.

- Ms. Adiba Kamal
  Principal,
  Habib Girls School,
  Karachi.

- Mr. Anwar Zai
  DEO,
  Western Karachi,
  Karachi.

- Mr. Ghaffar Siddiqui
  Deputy Director,
  Directorate of Education,
  Karachi.

- Mr. Zahid Alvi
  Owner/Principal,
  Hasni Academy,
  Karachi.

- Dr. A. Ghafoor
  Ex-Director General,
  Academy for Planning & Management (AEPM),
  Islamabad.

- Dr. Sarfraz Khawaja,
  Director Research,
  Academy for Planning & Management (AEPM),
  Islamabad.

- Dr. Ijaz A. Malik
  Director,
  USAID PEDP,
  Balochistan.

- Mr. Shahjahan Khan
  Director,
  Elementary Education,
  N.W.F.P.

- Dr. Inam-ul-Haq Kausar
  Director,
  Bureau of Curriculum and Extension Centre,
  Balochistan.

- Mr. Khawaja Nasir
  Director,
  World Bank Educational Project,
  Balochistan.

- Mrs. Suriya Allahdin Paracha
  Chairperson,
  Tanzeem Idara Bahale Mustahkeen,
  Balochistan.

- Brig (Retd) Ijaz Akbar
  Principal,
  International Public Schoc
  Abbottabad.

- Mr. Gohar Rehman Abbas
  (Retd) Director,
  Bureau of Curriculum,
  Peshawar.

- Mr. Gohar Zaman
  Principal,
  University Public School,
  Peshawar.