

PN-ABJ-577

15d

SOCIAL SOUNDNESS ANALYSIS

**Working Paper
for the
Primary Education Development Program**

**Andrea Rugh
Harvard University**

April 1989

**Institute for International Research
IQC: PDC-1109-I-11-7120-00
Delivery Order No. 11**

TABLE OF CONTENTS
SOCIAL SOUNDNESS ANALYSIS

<u>Topics</u>	<u>Page</u>
I. <u>OVERVIEW</u>	1
A. <u>Purpose</u>	1
B. <u>Method</u>	2
C. <u>Summary of main conclusions</u>	2
1. <u>Demand</u>	3
2. <u>Teacher supply</u>	3
3. <u>Teacher distribution</u>	3
4. <u>School level impact</u>	3
D. <u>Recommendations</u>	4
1. <u>To increase girls' enrollment</u>	4
2. <u>To increase teacher supply</u>	5
3. <u>To attract teachers to work in rural areas</u>	7
4. <u>To improve quality in the classroom and increase completion rates.</u>	8
5. <u>To accomplish program objectives efficiently</u>	9
6. <u>To ensure that social and cultural aspects are considered in program design and implementation</u>	10
E. <u>Issues</u>	12
II. <u>SOCIO-CULTURAL ENVIRONMENT</u>	12
A. <u>Background</u>	12
1. <u>Area and population</u>	12
2. <u>Climate and topography</u>	13

3.	<u>Economy</u>	14
4.	<u>Ethnic groups</u>	17
5.	<u>Religion</u>	20
6.	<u>Language</u>	20
B.	<u>Social organization</u>	23
1.	<u>Tribal organization</u>	23
2.	<u>Family life</u>	26
3.	<u>Educational environment</u>	30
III.	<u>SOCIAL FEASIBILITY</u>	34
A.	<u>General issues</u>	34
B.	<u>Special issues</u>	40
IV.	<u>SOCIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFICIARIES</u>	51
A.	<u>Program rationale</u>	51
B.	<u>Beneficiaries</u>	52
C.	<u>Spread effects</u>	53
D.	<u>Equity and access</u>	54
V.	<u>BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>	56
ANNEX 1.	<u>SELECTED FIELD OBSERVATIONS</u>	
ANNEX 2.	<u>SEQUENCING AND PHASING OF PED ACTIVITIES</u>	

WORKING PAPER

Social Soundness Analysis

I. OVERVIEW

A. Purpose

This working paper assesses the social soundness of the proposed Primary Education (PED) Program for Pakistan. The ten-year program will be implemented in the two provinces of Baluchistan and North West Frontier Province (NWFP). The program has two objectives: to increase the enrollment of primary age children, especially girls in rural areas, and to improve the efficiency and quality of education. A qualitatively better education will raise children's skill levels and encourage them to continue in school through the primary level.

The PED Program will fund the necessary components to achieve the above objectives. These include:

- o the provision of buildings and facilities;
- o training programs and incentives for teachers;
- o the development and distribution of instructional materials and teaching supports;
- o support for alternative educational delivery systems;
- o improvement in the administration, supervision, and management of educational resources;
- o support for research and development; and
- o monitoring and evaluation.

This paper has three sections, following this introduction. The first deals with the socio-cultural environment in Baluchistan and NWFP and the factors affecting education in these regions. This includes information about geography, history, the economy, ethnic communities and their social organization, language, and the educational environment. The intent is to provide in one document as much relevant background information as possible to program implementors.

The second section focuses on the socio-cultural feasibility of the program. It identifies the opportunities and constraints which affect program design and implementation and specifies the efforts to involve the beneficiary population in concep-

tualization of the goals and-program design. The third section considers the social benefits and impacts which are expected from program interventions. Recommendations to overcome obstacles to implementation are in introductory section D.

B. Method

This paper draws on the work of the USAID funded Harvard University Basic Research in Developing Education Systems (BRIDGES) Project, a four-year program of basic research into policy relevant educational questions of access, classroom practices, implementation, management and decision making in Pakistan. During the development of the Program Assistance Approval Document (PAAD), previous intensive experience in Pakistani schools was supplemented with two weeks of trips to NWFP and Baluchistan to talk with educational authorities, parents, teachers, teacher trainers, students, and community leaders about grassroots constraints and opportunities in education.

Altogether, the major towns and villages visited included Peshawar, Kohat, Dirgai, and Abbotabad in NWFP, and Quetta, Kolat, Pishin, Sibi, Harnai, Mand, and Turbat in Baluchistan. In addition, on the roads between these towns and in side trips, a number of Pathan, Baluch, and Brahui villages were visited.

In NWFP, Ms. Nazalee Sardar, and in Baluchistan, Mr. Akbar Barbar, both natives of these provinces added extensive knowledge of the rural areas and social organization of the people to the writing of this paper. Their experience was invaluable in permitting generalizations to larger areas and longer time spans than the necessarily short field trips would otherwise have permitted.

C. Summary of main conclusions

This working paper presents the best knowledge available at this time about the social soundness of the sectoral goals and approaches. It offers suggestions on ways to resolve major obstacles to program implementation and raises concerns which should be addressed in the detailed planning stage with government officials. In the end, the actual implementation will be carried out by the provincial authorities to reflect their goals and their institutional capacities. The strategy suggestions here will be useful to the extent that they address the agreed upon objectives of USAID and provincial implementors.

It is impossible to state the three or four activities that would be necessary to make the program socially sound. The objectives to expand the educational system and to improve the quality of educational programs are socially acceptable goals in Pakistan. The recommendations suggest socially sound ways of approaching the critical bottlenecks of implementation. The part on issues

highlights areas which could cause difficulties if not kept in mind during planning and negotiation. The part on phasing suggests the sequencing required for implementation to occur in a timely fashion with optimum benefit to the participants.

The following are the main four conclusions of the paper:

1. Demand

There is a sizeable and broad-based demand for education for both boys and girls in NWFP and Baluchistan, a demand that is currently frustrated by the lack of facilities and teaching staff. The situation is changing perhaps more quickly than officials are aware. The demand, however, is not evenly distributed everywhere and there will be areas where it will take special efforts to provide appropriate conditions for all children to go to school. The overall broad demand for education suggests that the general purposes of the program will be widely accepted.

2. Teacher supply

A major obstacle that must be overcome for timely implementation to take place is the critical scarcity of female teachers. With careful planning, the expansion of middle and secondary opportunities, and teacher training facilities, the problem of supply is solveable in NWFP. It is still a question whether enough individuals (even untrained and academically under-qualified) can be found to staff girls' schools in Baluchistan, even if a full range of strategies is used to solve the problem. It would, however, be unacceptable to back off from the problem simply because it is difficult and may cause delays in program implementation.

3. Teacher distribution

Once there are adequate numbers of teachers, the next most critical problem is the reluctance of female teachers to work in rural areas. This is a more manageable problem in NWFP where education is already more widespread and the distances between populated areas are less. In Baluchistan the problem is extremely critical, and it may only be possible to solve it partially with what, for Baluchistan, are extraordinary but currently used measures, such as coeducational schools, male teachers, teachers from other areas of Pakistan, and large incentives to attract teachers to remote areas.

4. School level impact

There is serious concern that qualitative impacts will not reach the classroom level. The paper calls for a radical approach to planning that focuses efforts narrowly on the outcomes desired in

the classroom. The fear is that broad improvements in programs will fail to address the complicated interrelationships in the classrooms which reinforce the present poor quality program.

D. Recommendations

This part summarizes the major recommendations to achieve program objectives. Among the recommendations are three areas with important cultural and social implications which may severely constrain the results of program implementation. These include the enrollment and persistence in school of primary-age girls, teacher supply and distribution, and the question of how to ensure that qualitative interventions reach the classroom.

The emphasis is on minimally needed and socially acceptable interventions to achieve the program objectives. This emphasis on parsimony is used because of the broad scope of the program and the need to concentrate resources at points where they can obtain the quantitatively largest and qualitatively best results as rapidly as possible. These points are discussed in the text.

Consideration should be given in the PEP to implementing all the following recommendations since they are a minimal set of suggestions and each attacks a specific part of the problem. The recommendations are listed in rough order of importance, but because each addresses a different problem, it is the problem's relevance to a particular context which is important. Enough information is provided in the recommendations to indicate the circumstances in which they would be operable. Except where noted these recommendations are valid for both provinces.

1. To increase girls' enrollment

a. Provide facilities as close to the homes of girls as possible, assuming no more than one to 1.5 km. distance

b. Give priority in locating schools to areas where opportunities are not readily available to children, to reach the increased enrollment objectives of the program more quickly; construction which adds on to crowded schools will make conditions more comfortable but is unlikely to increase initial enrollment unless children are refused admission because of lack of space.

c. Determine whether coeducational schools are acceptable to the community and, when possible, construct such schools, especially in small communities where it is not cost-effective to build separate sex schools; many communities are already sending their children to schools officially designated for the opposite sex.

d. Consider social criteria in selecting locations for schools: including social distance (the compatibility of the factions who will be using the schools), the perception of

the community that the location is a safe place, the support of community leaders, etc. In different settings different types of people need to be consulted about these questions.

e. Provide for sanitation, drinking water, and washing water facilities in the school.

f. Provide boundary walls for all schools.

g. Continue to provide free books and writing materials in rural Baluchistan where the system is established and seems to be working well; NWFP seems to attract students without the need for this costly incentive.

h. Encourage rural teachers to utilize reusable writing materials, such as slates and takhti writing boards, rather than costly, expendable notebooks.

i. Abolish the school uniform requirement in areas where it is a burden for parents to provide them; many rural communities already relax the rule but it should be made official to allow others to do so.

j. In communities which have no record of girls' enrollment and where parents are resistant to education for girls, assume that building primary schools for boys will in the long run help to change the attitudes of parents about educating girls (this has proved true in other countries).

k. If demand for education lags behind supply in certain areas, consider supporting motivational campaigns through the media, Imams in mosques, or community leaders.

(The problems of early dropout that can be affected by PED interventions are assumed to lie primarily in the low quality of the education program and are therefore considered under section 4 below).

2. To increase teacher supply

Extraordinary efforts need to be mounted to solve this problem, especially in Baluchistan.

a. Build substantial numbers of middle schools near currently well-enrolled primary schools in rural areas and in small towns where there is a need to produce girls with the academic qualifications to teach.

b. Increase the present scholarship fund that pays incentives for bright children to go to middle school and peg a substantial part of the increase to rural females.

c. Support the AIOU middle level degree program with a stress on serving girls in areas where such qualifications are needed to increase the teaching force, but where middle school opportunities are not available.

d. Support the AIOU secondary level degree program, with a stress on serving girls in areas where such qualifications are required to increase the potential pool of qualified teachers, but where secondary level opportunities are not available.

e. Expand the teacher training capacity by constructing girls' GCETs at the district level in NWFP, and at the division level in Baluchistan.

In NWFP these schools will be closer to the homes of candidates and therefore may encourage more individuals to enter teaching. In this province most teachers now entering the service for the first time are trained. Therefore, expanding GCETs will allow for expanding the teaching force without lowering the proportion of trained teachers.

In Baluchistan, the more critical problem is finding people to teach. Most female teachers are now untrained; training issues should be considered long term and should not interfere in the short run with getting staff into the schools.

f. Give priority for places in NWFP PTC courses for rural females in areas where trained teachers are not available.

g. Continue and increase monthly stipends for girls in teacher training institutions, with the proviso that those receiving the stipend are obligated to a specified number of years of government service.

h. End age barriers for women wanting to enter the teaching force.

i. Make it easier for women to return to the teaching force after raising families (i.e. allow them to return without losing the benefits accrued during their former service).

j. Encourage coeducation and male teachers in areas where there are difficulties finding female teachers, and permit communities to accept male teachers for girls' school.

k. Put the burden on the community to find a suitable teacher when education officials have no likely candidate; in this way minimally qualified local girls may be persuaded to teach, male teachers may found to be acceptable, or communities may make a greater effort to get along with outsider teachers.

1. Consider hiring retired males to teach in primary girls' schools where there is a scarcity of teachers; allow them to continue to receive their pension in addition to a salary so there is a financial incentive to return. This has been tried and it has proved feasible.

3. To attract teachers to work in rural areas

a. Equalize rural housing accommodation allowance with that of urban areas.

b. Provide conveyances or sufficient conveyance allowances for female teachers within commuting distance of rural schools, and in addition provide a small monthly allowance of perhaps Rs. 100/mo. to compensate them for the extra time it takes to commute long distances to rural areas. In some areas which are not regularly served by public transportation it is not enough to provide only an allowance--vehicles are required to transport teachers and perhaps to bring middle and secondary students on a return trip to their schools.

c. In addition to regular allowances provide substantial difficult-area allowances of Rs.1,000/mo. for those female teachers who must live in remote villages away from their homes. High allowances appear essential in rural Baluchistan where some kind of compensation must be offered for the privations of living in remote areas; plan for the disappearance of these allowances when local girls become available to teach in their own communities.

d. Provide teachers with a chaperonage allowance of Rs. 200/mo. for an appropriate person who will accompany them when living in a remote rural area; ensure that female teacher residences are staffed with a suitable guard (chowkidar).

e. Provide housing accommodations for men and women teachers in areas where it is difficult to find teachers and where it is reasonable to believe that a female teacher will occupy the residence; although housing has not been effective in the past in attracting females to rural areas, the substantial difficult-area and chaperonage allowances would be expected to draw some females, including possibly teaching couples, or two female teachers. The residences should be designed to revert to classrooms when they are no longer needed as residences.

f. Where it is impossible to find a matric graduate, lower entry qualifications to middle pass for girls in local areas who are willing to teach (support them with short practical training and guided instructional materials such as those described under 4 below).

g. Assess the experiment with cluster hostels and expand the areas which they cover if it seems appropriate.

4. To improve quality in the classroom and increase completion rates.

These are the minimally needed changes.

a. Improve the curricula and textbooks for Kacchi (kindergarten) through grade two, with recognition that Kacchi is a separate grade level and needs materials suited to the age (these are the grades which require the most urgent attention, but there is also a need to develop a continuous improvement and feedback system for the curricula in all the grades); these reforms are to be part of a proposed UNICEF project and could be supported and broadened by PEP.

b. Develop simple, supportive, and explicit teacher's annotated editions of the child's text, showing teachers exactly how to teach specific lessons. The purpose would be to put a minimum floor under all teachers. Such a guide would serve as the basis for supplementing preservice, inservice, supervisory and administrative courses to focus all these functions on the same outcomes. These activities are also included in the UNICEF project.

c. Develop a new exam system based on the curricula, with a new emphasis on diagnostic tests which would make it possible to monitor the progress of students. Annual evaluation exams (possibly at grades 3, 4 and 5) should also be constructed for administration to large geographical areas to allow for monitoring of teacher and school performance. Such exams would allow the system to identify excellent schools and personnel for possible recognition and show where weak schools and personnel need strengthening.

d. Focus instructional leadership and accountability at the school level by giving greater responsibility and training to head teachers or headmasters and headmistresses where these exist. Move toward giving these managers more time off from teaching to carry out instructional leadership roles and to fill in for absent teachers.

e. Develop a reasonable policy on the age of entrance to school (now children as young as three come to school, swelling the ranks of the early grades and making it difficult to teach such large numbers). Develop criteria for determining the selected age since many may have no official record of their birth. If the Kacchi group is included as part of the regular school program, make provision for a separate teacher and separate instructional materials geared to their age level. Enforce this policy to reduce the large size of early classes. Consider the fact that in some areas girls may be withdrawn from school at about age 10 and therefore it may be desirable to encourage them to come to school as early as possible.

f. Review teacher-leave policies, as they now seem unusually liberal, and conducive to greater absenteeism. Perhaps rewards such as credit toward a pension need to be given for teachers who do not take leaves.

g. Change the school year to put the major holiday at the end of one school year and before the beginning of the next (September 1 to May 31 in the warm areas and March 1 through December 15 in the cold areas). This would avoid the long break in the middle of the year when children forget the work of the first half year. This change might have a major impact on learning.

h. Make explicit a policy on teacher assignment. Evidence suggests that teachers selected from the local area are more motivated, made more accountable by their communities, and are less likely to be absent. Wherever it does not create a hardship for the teachers concerned and where there is community support for the idea, assign teachers to their own communities to work. Such a policy needs to be linked with urban/rural equalization of allowances so that teachers are not penalized for working in the rural area.

i. Pay teachers according to qualification rather than according to the fact that they teach at the primary level. This policy has been already agreed to in principle by the government.

j. Equip schools only with the minimal essential furnishings and materials needed for effective teaching to avoid cluttering classrooms and the tendency to use classroom space for storing unused or broken and un-repaired furniture. In rural areas the minimally needed items include:

- o blackboards
- o teacher tables and chairs
- o mats for the children to sit on
- o basic charts (alphabets, numbers, science models, and maps)
- o ceiling fans in areas where there is electricity and the weather is sometimes hot

k. Where urban schools are crowded, urge the government to try double shifting to produce smaller classes. (Female teachers are more easily found in urban areas).

5. To accomplish program objectives efficiently

A strategy for sequencing PEP activities is summarized here. The object is to show how program components can be brought on line

in a timely fashion that allows for the maximum effect from resources. Ideally, teacher supply must be increased and important qualitative improvements installed before major efforts in primary school construction begin. More detailed sequencing is found in Annex B.

The strategy consists of three phases:

a. Start-up phase. The goals of this phase are to plan and put in place activities to increase the teaching force, to prepare improved and tested instructional materials with guides for teachers, to develop materials-focused preservice and inservice teacher training courses, to train the trainers to teach these courses, and to construct new and expand old training facilities. Research would be geared to questions of policy relevance for operationalizing innovations.

b. Operational phase. During this phase each component becomes fully operational. The primary school construction will come up to speed to produce as many schools as possible within existing capacity. Instructional materials would be disseminated to successively wider geographic areas after short courses are given which teach teachers how to use them, supervisors how to supervise their use, and head teachers how to manage them. Research would be conducted into the causes of and solutions for the problems encountered during this phase.

c. Fine-tuning phase. In the final phase, construction would continue at a pace appropriate to the capacity of the system and quality improvements would be evaluated, modified, and reassessed in a continuous feedback model. During this phase attention also would be turned to more complicated problems of the educational system, including experimentation with incentives to attract those reluctant to enroll for some reason, alternative delivery systems for hard-to-reach children, incentives to attract better qualified individuals into teaching service, and a continuation of a program of research, development, and evaluation to provide more cost-effective, attractive, easily usable and diverse instructional materials and other improvements.

6. To ensure that social and cultural aspects are considered in program design and implementation.

Because it is easy to overlook the social and cultural dimensions of program activities through concern for technical aspects of design and implementation, the following two recommendations are suggested:

a. Social analyst. A social analyst should be recruited as part of the planning and later the monitoring team. This social analyst should be familiar with the conditions in rural Baluchistan and NWFP and should be knowledgeable about systems design, preferably educational systems. The analyst

would assist in designing the program components to increase the likelihood of social acceptability and consequently to insure greater program impact from the activities. In a monitoring capacity, the analyst would track social impacts and benefits, suggest ways to fine tune the delivery systems, and trouble shoot problems in implementation to devise better ways of proceeding in subsequent phases. This person should assist in designing and implementing small, solution-oriented studies which gather relevant data useful for implementation and would feed impact information into later design phases.

b. Studies. The studies would be generated by program need and therefore cannot be determined beforehand without first considering carefully what those needs would be. However, the following illustrate the kinds of studies that might be useful:

- o analysis of census data, collected as part of the initial monitoring activities, to assess priority areas for program interventions to increase the enrollments of girls;
- o impacts of the provision of single sex schools vs. coeducational schools on the enrollment of girls;
- o analysis of primary-school enrollment data to determine where middle schools for girls might be most effectively located to increase the pool of academically qualified girls for teaching;
- o development of site location criteria and ways by which they can be utilized;
- o examination of present private funding capacities and how these can be involved to defray the costs of education for the government and for poor families who can not afford to send their children to school;
- o study of what incentives are needed to attract more individuals to teaching and to work in rural areas; monitoring the effectiveness of various incentives suggested for program implementation;
- o evaluation of the effectiveness of existing cluster hostels as a way to staff rural schools;
- o analysis of school location data to see what proportion of rural girls' schools could be staffed through improved commuting systems;
- o analysis of the current school management system, including the roles of DEOs, supervisors, and head teachers, to work out ways to strengthen instructional leadership and establish accountability for teaching performance.

E. Issues

In assessing the feasibility of the program, this paper raises a number of general concerns about implementation:

- o the extent to which Pakistanis find the general objectives of the program acceptable and have participated in its conceptualization and design;
- o the rate with which the affected populations and infrastructures can absorb program interventions without undue disruption;
- o the importance of planning and appropriate mix and sequencing of activities to achieve program objectives in a timely and systematic way;
- o the necessity of tailoring program inputs and strategies to the specific conditions in various regions to spread program benefits as widely as possible, in particular to educationally-disadvantaged populations;
- o the need to coordinate the overlapping activities of the many donor agencies to avoid duplication and overburdening of the existing institutional capacity;
- o the need to temper program efficiency with concern for competing socio-cultural and economic costs; and
- o the importance of relying upon local personnel, institutions, and programs which are already established and have a track record for dealing with the details of implementation.

II. SOCIO-CULTURAL ENVIRONMENT

A. Background

1. Area and population

With an area of over 347,000 square kilometers -- about the size of West Germany -- Baluchistan encompasses almost half the land mass of Pakistan but contains only about five percent (3.75 million) of the total country's population. The majority (84 percent) of inhabitants reside in rural areas, in approximately 5,000 settlements, with an average density of about 12 persons per square kilometer. Even under the best of circumstances it is difficult to provide services to such widely-scattered populations, but under the conditions of under development -- unpaved roads, poor communication systems, and limited public transport in certain places -- the difficulties become almost insurmountable.

By contrast with Baluchistan, NWFP, with about 102,000 square kilometers, is the smallest province in Pakistan, with the second smallest population (approximately 10 million or about 12 percent). In comparison with Baluchistan the population is relatively more densely settled and has greater access to services.

2. Climate and topography

The climate varies by elevation in the two provinces. In NWFP, areas with high mountain ranges have snowfall during the winter months and are pleasantly cool during much of the rest of the year. Ample rainfall allows for the grazing of sheep in the upland tribal areas and some farming in the eastern plains and valleys. Baluchistan possesses similar conditions only in its northeastern districts. The rest of the province has little rainfall and mainly only in winter. Temperatures are as high as 50 degrees centigrade in summer, especially in the south, and often below freezing in the northern areas in winter. In both provinces the dates of the major school holidays are timed to coincide with the most unfavorable weather conditions. Despite these adjustments, weather conditions during a large part of the year make schools unpleasantly hot or cold. Children sit outside their classrooms in the sun in winter and follow the shade around the courtyard in the summer.

Five ecological zones can be distinguished in Baluchistan which set limits on the mix of pastoralism and farming that is possible. In the northeast there are rugged mountain ranges and long cold winters. The north central plateau extends from the mountain ranges in the northeast across the central part of the province, becoming increasingly more barren in the central and eastern regions. The southwestern area consists of desert plains and basins which are extremely hot and dry in summer. The broad Kacchi plain merges into the Indus Plain in the south; and finally, a coastal plain borders on the Arabian Sea.

Crops vary from apple and other fruit farming in the north to date farming in the south, with wheat, rice, jowar, maize, barley, and vegetables the other main crops. Fishing is a major industry off the Makran coast. Baluchistan's natural resources also include the oil fields of Sui and most of the natural gas that is used in Pakistan. Coal deposits are abundant in the northern districts around Quetta and Zhob but are usually mined in small operations financed by one or two investors. Other resources include chromite, lead, sulphur, copper, uranium, marble, onyx, and other decorative stones.

NWFP has the most varied topography of all of Pakistan. In the north it is bordered by the formidable Hindu Kush mountains above Chitral. These mountainous regions gradually descend into the flat alluvial plains of the Peshawar valley which in turn change into the limestone and gravel plains of D.I.Khan. Plant life

varies from the forested regions of the north across the agricultural plains of Peshawar and down to the barren plains of the south.

The Kabul river crosses the province to meet with the Indus which forms the boundary on the east with Punjab. On the west, the frontier boundary drawn up in 1893 by the British Foreign Secretary in India, Sir Mortimer Durand, maintains an uneasy demarcation between Afghanistan and Pakistan. In the south the province is marked by the boundary with Baluchistan which defines an abstract political entity but does not demarcate different Pathan tribal entities which extend across the border.

3. Economy

Baluchistan and NWFP are the economically poorest provinces of Pakistan as well as the least developed. In both provinces the large majority of people are engaged in agriculture and pastoralism. With its harsh climatic conditions and lack of rainfall (3 to 12 inches) in most areas, Baluchistan is the more impoverished of the two. Water tables in the area are diminishing at such a rapid rate that one expert estimates only a 50 year time period until the area may not be able to sustain current populations. People interviewed in the central section of the province, south of Quetta and in areas near Kalat, were more interested in talking about water problems than education. As one woman declared, "How can we think about education when we have no water to drink!"

Development indicators are a reflection of Baluchistan's deep-rooted problems--its declining water table, low levels of education, and lack of skilled professionals to provide badly needed services. Selected statistics illustrate the poverty of conditions in the province. As recently as 1983 about a fifth of the villages in Baluchistan were located 81 kilometers or more from an asphalted road and about half were located more than eight kilometers from a health facility. Only about a third had access to a primary school within one kilometer.

The situation was worse for girls: only six percent of the villages in that year reported a primary school for girls within one kilometer. Only 16 percent of villages are located within eight kilometers of a girls' middle school and only a fifth of the villages had a girls' secondary school within a radius of 16 kilometers.

Similarly, studies report high levels of mortality, poor nutrition, and disease in many of the tribal areas of the province. One such report of conditions in 120 villages of Gwadar, Kalat, and Loralai districts estimated infant and child mortality figures at 33, 29, and 17 percent respectively, figures the authors called "some of the highest mortality rates in the world (signalling) an alarming situation." (UNICEF 1981: 21). A

major part of the problem is lack of information on health, nutrition, and child care and the scarcity of water which makes even the most minimal standards of cleanliness difficult.

Large areas of Baluchistan are so barren as to provide at best only a subsistence level existence. The inhabitants of the northeastern areas, including Quetta, Pishin, Loralai, and Zhob that receive the greatest rainfall are heavily engaged in pastoralism. Large groups of Powindah (Pathans) move their herds from Afghanistan to the Indus valley across the province, and in the eastern districts Baluchi tribesmen herd their animals shorter though still substantial distances across their traditional grazing lands. Attendance in schools of these areas fluctuates greatly over the year as nomads take up residence during the warm season near Quetta and later in the winter move south to near Sibi. Some of the tribes are said to take teaching staff with them during treks to new camping grounds.

NWFP is also relatively underdeveloped economically with limited urbanization and an agricultural sector which is one of the least productive in the country (Addleton, J.S. 1984: 585). In 1983, more than half the villages in NWFP were located within three km. of an asphalted road, and close to 80 percent were less than eight kilometers from health facilities. In terms of the availability of educational services, NWFP also leads Baluchistan; about 80 percent of villages in 1983 were located within one kilometer of a primary school. The figures, however, drop dramatically for girls. Only 40 percent of villages have primary schools for girls within one kilometer and only about half have middle schools for girls within eight km.

Mountain ranges in NWFP limit irrigation and unreliable rainfall makes it difficult to grow rain-fed crops though it is ample for grazing. Employment pressures have been created in the province by thousands of Afghan refugees. One of the byproducts of the war is a substantial increase in opium production which the previous Pakistani government did little to control. Similarly, the war has significantly increased the traffic in arms and other goods flowing into Afghanistan, and subsequently the money which flows through NWFP as a result of the cottage industries taking advantage of the insatiable demand for weapons.

Of the four provinces of Pakistan, Baluchistan and NWFP are the least industrialized. What industry exists is located in the capitals, Quetta and Peshawar, and consists mainly of small scale craft and workshop enterprises. In recent years, attempts to broaden industrial activity in the country caused the central government to give special concessions to entrepreneurs who would establish new industries in areas of high unemployment. Through this means, a number of small industries have been attracted to NWFP, though usually under the control of outsiders, either those coming from other provinces of Pakistan or settlers (muhajjirs) who migrated from India at the time of partition and took over many of the economic and bureaucratic posts in Pakistan.

Baluchistan's institutions have been heavily dominated by these outsiders who have monopolized most of the positions which depend on education. These urban-dwelling Punjabis and muhajjirs expect to educate their children and thus their children make up disproportionately large numbers of the school populations in the urban areas of the province. Though there are no figures available, one division head estimated that more than 90 percent of the female teachers in Baluchistan are from these outsider groups. Most of the girls in the schools visited in the conservative town of Harnai were from these minorities. Despite the controversial nature of their presence in the province, it is apparent that without the settlers the provincial government's capacity to function would be severely limited. One Governor expelled large numbers of outsiders from the province, with the result that educational services deteriorated and as one observer remarked, "...never completely recovered."

In the southern-most division of Baluchistan, Makran, in what is one of the most underdeveloped divisions of all Pakistan, permanently settled populations engage in crop and animal raising, fishing, trade, and manual labor. The local inhabitants use complicated irrigation technologies including methods of collecting runoff water through small dams (bunds), diversion dams, springs, and subterranean channels (karez) in an area where it would otherwise be difficult to sustain agriculture. For part of the year many areas in the Turbat area are cut off by floods from Karachi, the nearest major city. The USAID Balad project is presently constructing a bridge and roadway across the flood valley near Turbat in an effort to keep communication with Karachi open throughout the year. This project is also building approximately 50 schools in the area.

A major source of income to the Makran area, and for the rest of Baluchistan and NWFP, is the remittances, estimated in some cases to be as large as 70 percent of poorer workers' wages, which are returned to Pakistan each year. One estimate (Burki 1980) suggests that half the poorer households in NWFP have at least one family member working in the Middle East. In a study of the Makran area, 12 percent of the families surveyed received their major income from workers in the Gulf. Many of the migrants work in Oman where historical connections with Gwadar (which was formerly ruled by Oman) have remained strong for several centuries.

Experience with the advantages of education in these other countries has made many of the migrants who return to Pakistan eager to educate their own daughters and sons. Examples were seen in Makran of returned migrants financing school construction and staff salaries (of male teachers) so that their daughters received an education. Unfortunately, however, the relative affluence of the returned migrants does not encourage them to seek jobs for their daughters, and thus it continues to be very difficult to find local women who will enter the teaching force.

Though sparsely settled in some areas, Makran differs from the rest of Baluchistan in that most of the population is concentrated in two valleys and along the coast in fishing villages close to one another. This concentration means that services can be provided with greater ease than in the other more sparsely populated districts of the province. In a sample study of families in the Makran area, 90 percent were found to have access to educational facilities within five kilometers of their homes. This figure, however, is not disaggregated to show the availability of schools for girls, and considering the long neglect of this area by the central government, it is unlikely that girls find schools so easily accessible. According to 1987 figures, there were 262 primary schools, 53 middle schools, and 29 secondary schools available for boys in the entire Makran division compared with 36 primary, 4 middle and 4 secondary schools for girls. Of the 37 primary girls' schools reported in 1989, 11 were closed because of difficulties in finding teaching staff.

4. Ethnic groups

Pakistan comprises a number of distinct cultural groups with separate languages, customs, social organizations, and histories. The major ethnic groups of Baluchistan include the Pathans, the Baluch, and the Brahui. In NWFP, the Pathans comprise the major ethnic group but minority groups also include Kattacks living near the Indus, Kohistanis in Swat, the Hazara to the west, and the Kalash in Chitral.

In Pakistan, Pathan areas stretch from Quetta in the south to near Chitral in the north, from the east at the Indus River to the Durand Line which divides Afghanistan from Baluchistan and NWFP. The area of their homeland spills over the border to encompass an equally large geographical area in Afghanistan.

There is a great deal of diversity in the social patterns of various Pathan groups. Confusing the issue is the question of name since many Pathans on either side of the border call themselves Afghan, a term which applies to non-Pathan groups, to designate their nationality. The term 'Pathan' deriving from the plural 'Pushtun' is used collectively to designate all of these groups, as well as the terms 'Afghans' and 'Pakhtuns'. Of the three main sections of the Pathan tribes, those living in NWFP proper comprise mainly the Eastern branches, the Yusefzais, who are characterized by a more sedentary agricultural lifestyle than highland groups of Pathans. The Pathans of the tribal areas in the mountainous regions near the border with Afghanistan are considered more lawless, and more attached to the purest ideals of the Puktanwali code of ethics which affects the life of all Pathans, wherever they may live. Pathans with more or less zeal support the idea of a separate state, Puktunistan, but do not

agree on whether there should be several states or one larger state which comprises areas in Baluchistan, NWFP, and Afghanistan.

Historically, Pathans claim origin from the Hebrew King Saul. They are said to have been converted to Islam in the seventh century. Their history is a saga of endless battles and defenses against outsiders. Particularly during the Mogul Empire in the 16th and 17th centuries efforts were made by a number of rulers to protect the routes through Pathan territories to Kabul, but never with much success. With the decline of the Mogul Empire control shifted to Kabul and the Durrani Empire and later to the Sikhs who controlled the frontier for a short time in the 19th century. By 1849, the British annexed areas of the Punjab up to the frontier areas, and in 1874, Sir Robert Sandeman was sent out to improve relations with the Baluch tribes and the ruler of Kalat. By 1876 he had concluded an agreement that brought Kharan, Makran, and Las Bela under control of the British. In the Gandamak Treaty of 1879, that marked the end of the Afghan War, the British acquired control from the Amir of Afghanistan of the districts of Pishin, Sibi, Harnai, and Thal Chotiali.

The British first followed a policy in NWFP of negotiation coupled with divide-and-rule tactics similar to that in Baluchistan. Later they assumed a more direct interventionist approach to control the "unruly" areas. This "Forward Policy", caused them to make infrastructural changes--with military outposts and road building projects to link the areas in ways that would make it easier for them to intervene. They also sought to appease local populations by providing limited educational and health services. As a result, in the areas of direct British rule, populations have more and longer experience with education and are more familiar with its potential benefits.

Unlike the Baluch who were more open to negotiation and accommodation, Pathans maintained their resistance against the British occupation throughout the period of colonial rule. One main difference from the Baluch is that the Pathans have comprised a larger population and occupied more strategic locations on the routes between India and Central Asia (Wirsing, R.G. n.d.: 5). During the Pakistan Independence movement, Pathan leaders allied themselves with the Indian National Congress against the British.

But at the time of Independence the British foiled attempts by the Pathans to create their own independent state by confining their choice in the election to the question of whether to join with India or Pakistan. The Pathans boycotted the vote and were thus drawn into union with Pakistan. Soon after Partition, the Pathans carried out religious raids against non-Muslims in NWFP and Punjab causing many of the victims to flee into Kashmir and leading eventually to the events which sparked the first war

between Pakistan and India. NWFP, without the tribal areas and princely states, was incorporated into West Pakistan, and in 1970 was finally given independent provincial status.

The areas in Baluchistan inhabited by Baluchi tribes extend from the Suleiman range at the latitude of Quetta across to the border of Iran with the important exception of the large central plateau inhabited by Brahuis. On the north, Baluch territories are bordered by Afghanistan and on the south by the Arabian sea. Baluch territories also extend across borders deep into Iran and in a small area into Afghanistan. Settlers of Baluch origin live in substantial numbers in Punjab and Sind and many reside in the Gulf States. For historical and other reasons there is great diversity in the social life of various Baluch communities which has not always made it easy for them to unite on political issues.

The Baluch nationalist movement, for example, has more or less strongly at different points, called for a separate state of Baluchistan. But in a test of their cohesion on this issue in the 70s, many Baluchi tribes sided with the central government against a separatist state, while other tribes to the south remained neutral until the insurgency was over.

The Baluch claim they originated from Aleppo in Syria at the time of the Arab conquests in the ninth century. From linguistic evidence, however, scholars believe it more likely that they came from northwestern Iran next to the Caspian Sea. One possibility is that they settled first near Kirman around the 6th century but were driven out in the 11th century during the Seljuk invasion. By the 14th century, however, most of the Baluch had migrated to their current areas, and by the 18th century the Ahmedzai Khans of Kalat had conquered much of the area that is now modern day Baluchistan.

A number of invasions by Persians, Sindhi, Afghans and Sikhs preceded the British occupation of the area by the middle of the 19th century but none was able to fully control the tribal areas. By the 1870s the British controlled large areas of the northeast including Quetta and down to and including the previously independent Khanate of Kalat. In the southern areas of Kalat, Makran, Kharan, and Lasbela, they ruled primarily through indirect measures where agreements forged with local princes and tribal segments were played off against each other to create a balance of power in the region.

After Pakistani independence from India in 1947, the states of Kalat, Kharan, Las Bela, and Makran were given semi-autonomous status but in 1955 along with previously British Baluchistan they became part of West Pakistan and in 1970 finally were given provincial status together as the present area of Baluchistan. The name Baluchistan is something of a misnomer since the ethnic communities which comprise its inhabitants are not exclusively Baluchi.

The Brahuīs are the third major ethnic group in Baluchistan. Their origins are not clear. They claim to be the original inhabitants of the area but may have migrated originally from Iran or Syria. From the seventeenth century, when Brahuī khans of Kalat established a loose federation with neighboring Baluch tribes, they have exerted a significant impact on the politics of the central and southern areas of the province. They live mostly on the Kalat plateau where they separate the Makrani Baluch in the west from the Suleimani Baluch in the east. The relations between Baluch and Brahuīs are complicated. Some Baluch have become Brahuīs and some Brahuī leaders have supported the Baluchi nationalist movement. Estimates put the Baluch/Brahuī population in Pakistan together at more than 2.8 million, of which about a third are probably Brahuī.

5. Religion.

Religious affiliation is a potentially unifying force in a country otherwise fragmented by ethnic divisions. School curricula invest a large proportion of the instructional effort promoting this common theme. The vast majority of the populations of Baluchistan (98 percent) and NWFP (99 percent) are Muslim. The Pathans and Baluch belong to the Hanifi tradition of Sunni Islam, which is the main tradition in Pakistan. Though Islam may provide a common link between these major ethnic groups, however, a stronger attachment to clan and tribe supersedes these weaker bonds, and Islam in recent years has not proved the unifying force in nation building some would like it to be.

In Baluchistan and NWFP, while few of the Muslims (15 percent) live in urban areas, over half of the small Christian and Hindu populations live there, reflecting their strong involvement in trade and business and giving them a disproportionate influence for their small numbers (Addleton, 1985: 35). The largest group of Hindus live in Kachhi, Lasbela, and Sibi, all towns near the border with Sind and within the larger tribal areas which belong to the Baluch.

One of the most unusual of the Muslim groups is the Zikri sect which has a large number of adherents in the southern Baluchistan division of Makran. This is a dissident Muslim sect founded in India in the 15th century. The sect performs zikr (rhythmic repetitions of religious formulae) instead of prayers, does not observe a month of fasting, and performs pilgrimage to their own site near Turbat.

6. Language

Though spoken as a mother tongue by less than eight percent of Pakistani households, Urdu is nevertheless the official language of the country and one that every school child must learn. It serves as a common means of communication for the vast majority of Pakistanis who speak regional and ethnic languages.

There are more than twenty languages spoken in Pakistan. Regional languages in a rough way define group identities, perhaps better than provincial boundaries which generally do not coincide with the boundaries of ethnic communities. Many adult Pakistanis speak two or more languages whether they are literate or not, and many who are literate may know up to four languages. The question of language use is a politically sensitive issue, relating as it does to such important issues as social equity and access to opportunities.

In the last decade, along with a tendency toward greater expression of ethnicity, the trend has been toward greater use of local languages as the medium of instruction in the primary schools. In Sind and NWFP the early years of schooling are conducted at least partially in Sindi or Pushto in areas where the majority of children speak these languages. In Punjab there is also a movement to encourage the use of Punjabi in literary publications and as a medium of instruction. Very recently, the provincial government in Baluchistan has declared its intention to make local languages the medium of instruction, though it is difficult to see how they can implement such a change with the number of outside teachers who are unable to speak local languages.

The issues of language in education are important. On the one side national politicians stress the need for children to learn Urdu arguing that employment opportunities and ability to operate effectively in Pakistan society are limited without this knowledge. Urdu serves as a basis for communication and for the formation of a common Pakistani identity across ethnic communities. Local politicians argue the case of ethnic identification and complain that children have difficulty in the beginning years of schooling when they must begin learning in an unfamiliar language. (International research supports the view that initial learning is best carried out in the mother tongue).

Others point out the importance of a foreign language like English as a means of advancement to the university level where most courses are taught in that language. Without English it is difficult to aspire to the highest circles of Pakistani and international society. All agree that a knowledge of Arabic is necessary to properly carry out the requirements of religion properly. Thus Pakistani school children are subjected to a minimum of two languages (Urdu and Arabic) and a maximum of four languages (Urdu, a local language, Arabic and in some schools English) during their primary education.

Though schools may differ, Urdu is almost always introduced immediately in the first year of school along with some Arabic (sometimes only in memorized recitations). In schools where a local language is taught, it also starts in first grade. And in

many schools, even when it is not part of the official curriculum, children may learn the English alphabet and numbers in first grade. Usually English begins officially at grade six.

Baluchistan is one of the linguistically most diverse of the provinces. According to the 1981 census, which appeared before the major influx of Pushtu speakers from Afghanistan, 36 percent of the households spoke Baluchi (mostly in the eastern and southwestern districts), 25 percent Pushto (in the areas north of Quetta), 21 percent Brahui (mostly in the central districts of Kalat and Khuzdar), 8 percent Sindhi and 3 percent Siraiki. Other households spoke Hindko and Punjabi. Only 1.4 percent of the households in the province speak the official language of instruction, Urdu.

In Pakistan as a whole 24 percent of the urban households speak Urdu compared to 1.3 percent of rural households. The implications are clear for Baluchistan when one considers the advantages in joof languages which has examples in southern India. However, Brahui speakers make extensive use of Baluchi words and Brahui tribal structure includes some of the same features as the Baluchi structures. Few people are actually literate in the Brahui language.

In NWFP 68 percent of the households speak Pushto, 18 percent speak Hindko (a collective name for Indo-Aryan dialects), and 4 percent speak Siraiki. Other households speak Punjabi, Sindhi, Baluchi, and Brahui. Only 0.8 percent speak Urdu. Khowaof languages which has examples in southern India. However, Brahui speakers make extensive use of Baluchi words and Brahui tribal structure includes some of the same features as the Baluchi structures. Few people are actually literate in the Brahui language.

In NWFP 68 percent of the households speak Pushto, 18 percent speak Hindko (a collective name for Indo-Aryan dialects), and 4 percent speak Siraiki. Other households speak Punjabi, Sindhi, Baluchi, and Brahui. Only 0.8 percent speak Urdu. Khowari in Chitral and Kohistani in Kohistan are also major languages in their respective regions. Siraiki is the dominate language in D.I. Khan, and Hindko is strong in Abbottabad and Mansehra. These five districts where there are large enclaves of non-Pushto speaking inhabitants were attached to NWFP for administrative and political reasons during British rule and are not culturally homogeneous with the Pathan areas. (Addleton 1986)

At present about half the textbooks for the primary level in NWFP are produced in Pushtu for use in areas where the majority of children speak the language. These Pushtu texts have been in existence for five years and now encompass materials up to the end of grade five. In the rest of the province, Urdu is the main language of instruction.

B. Social organization

Social organization among the more than 300 major and minor tribes of the two provinces is extremely complex. This analysis can only highlight some of the social patterns and cultural traditions which may potentially affect receptivity to program interventions.

1. Tribal organization

For most Baluch and Pathans, tribal affiliation and especially allegiance to local tribal units takes precedence over allegiance to more diffuse entities such as nation, state, or even religion. This has made it difficult to unify tribal groups in support of even such popular issues as an independent state for the Pathan or Baluch nations.

a. Pathans

Pathan tribes are organized into a number of divisions composed of clans, sections, and sub-sections usually based on agnatic (connected through males) kinship relations. Pathan tribal structures are characterized by their egalitarian nature in a pattern often associated with nomadic groups where each person is considered to have equal rights and obligations within the group. Pathan leaders theoretically are not hereditary, and clan leaders (khans) are expected to win followers through demonstration of superior personal characteristics as well as an ability to promote tribal interests. Leadership remains highly decentralized with heads of local groups joining in loose consultative councils to take decisions in matters which affect them all.

Though now there are hierarchical differences in wealth and importance among the Pathans, especially between those who hold land and those who do not, the ethos of independence from rank persists to color the relations between people and prevent a rigidly hierarchical system from developing. It would be interesting to examine how Pathans operate within the hierarchical systems of government. Coordination between some sections in the department of education in Peshawar seemed to demonstrate stronger horizontal links than are usually present in such offices. Whether this is truly a Pathan influence, however, is difficult to say.

The Puktunwali code of honor serves as the basis for Pathan tribal life. It is similar to traditional Bedouin codes of ethics which value bravery and male aggressiveness and insist upon revenge to right the wrongs of infringements to honor. The group shares responsibility for the behavior of its members and is required to take actions in support of them against outsiders. The Pathans stress the importance of hospitality, the honor of their women, the protection of guests, and demonstrations of

extravagant generosity. Revenge feuds are a fact of Pathan life, and it is said that at the heart of conflicts are always gold, land, and women (zar, zan, and zamin).

With respect to education, difnthusiasm for education, an impression reinforced by a development worker who visits many of these areas, a number of teacher trainees who themselves come from rural areas, and studies conducted by BRIDGES, the National Education Council, and the World Bank. Demand for education in NWFP seems therefore likely to outstrip for some time the capacity of the government to provide educational opportunities. Nevertheless, Pathan families in all areas feel a strong sense of the need for security for their childrnthusiasm for education, an impression reinforced by a development worker who visits many of these areas, a number of teacher trainees who themselves come from rural areas, and studies conducted by BRIDGES, the National Education Council, and the World Bank. Demand for education in NWFP seems therefore likely to outstrip for some time the capacity of the government to provide educational opportunities. Nevertheless, Pathan families in all areas feel a strong sense of the need for security for their children, especially girls, and are unlikely to send them if schools are distant, or are within the social sphere of competing groups, or are in some way not secure against infringements of the Pukhtun codes of honor.

b. Baluch

Though the Baluch also belong to segmented tribes and clans, their social structure differs radically from the Pathan. Baluch tribes can be visualized as a system of groups and their leaders with members directly subordinate to the leader of their unit. Local units fall collectively under the responsibility of a head unit run by a sardar. The entire structure is centrally and hierarchically organized. At the lowest camp level, if the particular group is nomadic, the unit leader is a halk-waja (camp leader). He is subordinate to leaders of minimal lineages called mutabar, who submit to higher chiefs (waderas or takkaris). They are all finally subordinate to section chiefs (tumandars or sardars) to form the basis of a caste-like social organization.

The chain of autocratic rulers in the Baluch tribes rule by arbitrary and often despotic command. It has been suggested that fear of the various unit heads helps the system survive. At each level a petitioner with some problem to resolve must rely on the leader closest to him who, because of his position, can associate with the next higher level of leadership which in turn has access to even higher leaders, until levels are reached where decisions can be taken. It is difficult for an individual to circumvent this power structure. In many ways this hierarchical system duplicates the bureaucratic systems of Pakistan government where even the smallest issue finds its way to the top.

Another contrast with Pathan social structure relates to the matter of leadership. While close kinship almost exclusively

forms the basis for coalescing Pathan social units, it frequently serves as a reason for fragmenting the social units in Baluch society. Despite the seemingly fixed hereditary nature of leadership positions in Baluch society, there is often room for interpretation over which male in the family should assume the position. One way for a disgruntled younger son or brother to increase his own share of power is for him to form his own social unit separate from that of his competitor. This process is made easier by Baluch tolerance for the incorporation of outsiders. Such persons sign a contract of submission with a leader of a sub-unit, and take part in general camp activities (often they are hired as herdsman) until such time as they are offered an interest in the tribal lands and eventually may even be given a tribal woman in marriage.

As a result of this willingness to accommodate outsiders, one finds in Baluchi territories, such as Sibi and Loralai, the largest numbers of other minorities living, if not as an integral part of the tribal structure at least tolerated as a part of general social life. This fact may also explain the close relationships with Brahui tribes where there appears to be little reluctance to intermarry. Such tolerance is not generally found in Pathan areas, where people say that it is more difficult for outsider teachers to feel accepted. Similarly, people say that it is difficult to find students who will live in the Pishin hostel of the Government College for Elementary Teachers because women from other areas of the country do not feel comfortable in Pathan areas.

In recent years, the absolute authority of sardars in some areas has been reduced to the point where they have become simply respected leaders and no longer hold unquestioned control over their people in the same way as before. Nevertheless, it is strongly recommended in Baluchi communities to win the cooperation of sardars when establishing new educational facilities. In many areas they still continue to exert influence over essential activities of the community.

c. Makran Baluch

Social organization among the Makran Baluch is different enough to warrant separate discussion. The term 'Baluch' in that context comes closer to distinguishing social class than tribal association. In the Makran division as a whole, there are three main social classes, the hakim, who are essentially feudal land-owning classes, the Baluch, a collective term for those who are considered middle class with some land who live in small communities, and the Ghulam, the descendants of slaves freed by the Khan of Kalat in the 1920s as a result of British pressure. The Ghulam are a dark-skinned population now usually employed as servants by rich hakim and Baluch families. According to some analysts (see Barth 1953), - the transformation of Baluchi tribal system into a more static class system, seen in its most extreme

form in Makran, is a reflection of what happens when there are long periods of centralized rule.

Many of the tribal structures described above are breaking down as people in even the remotest areas become integrated into the modern economy. Other sources of power, including alternative means of accumulating wealth, compete with tribal structures, giving more freedom to individuals to pursue separate avenues of influence. Schooling is just one of many vehicles which enhance individual potentials at the expense of older forms of control. Accelerating this process is the gradual assumption of political control by government commissioners.

The tribal authorities are left with little more than a consultative role in some regions, while in others they wield influence as middlemen, exchanging peace and stability in territories under their control for a larger share of government provided resources. Schools are one of the sought-after resources by local politicians and tribal leaders. An article in February 1989, in the Frontier Post, reported the promise of farmers in Malakand district to destroy their poppy crop in exchange for lift-irrigation and girls' schools for their area.

2. Family life

Pakistani society, diverse as it may be in some respects, is nevertheless consistent in its philosophy about certain aspects of social life. One is the importance of family life. Family life is the pinnacle of social value; families are the indivisible lowest common denominator of society--socially, culturally, and in many ways economically. People see themselves as members of a family first and as individuals second. The important events in life are births, marriages, and deaths, because of the shifts in relationships these events precipitate. Daily life is consumed with the activities which promote personal relationships, both in the private world of family and in the outer world of business and politics. Rewards, accountability structures, and support are all vested in this central institution. Family even becomes the metaphor around which successful organizations such as schools and businesses are run.

Pakistanis emphasize their allegiances to groups in roughly expanding order--from family to tribe to the Islamic Ummah or community of Muslims and finally to nation. Society is envisioned as a network of personal relationships (as opposed to a common American view of society as a set of abstract impersonal institutions) with categorical others defined by kinship, friendship, religion, state, and other characteristics. Personal ties are strongest at the level of close kin and weaken as the group expands to tribe, religion, and state. The nature of the attachment is, first of all, obligation to contribute to the welfare of the group and, whenever possible, to enhance its opportunities in the outside world in moral, spiritual, and material ways. In this effort, individuals representing groups

often find themselves in opposition to others representing different groups, with both competing for what invariably in the cultural idiom is perceived as a scarce resource--where the gain of another is perceived as a loss to oneself. While individuals expect to obtain their needs directly or indirectly through the primary group, they are expected in turn to suppress personal interests which conflict with the group's interests.

Primary groups such as the family are organized in Pakistan in ways that make them highly cohesive, with such mechanisms as hierarchical relationships based on age and vested authority, complementary relationships built on sex, and clear definition of the responsibilities of specified kin members to conduct the affairs of group in certain matters and arenas. These mechanisms tie people together in strong relationships precisely because people come to believe they cannot function in the roles of others and thus come to depend on these indispensable others to perform important functions in their lives. This is the opposite of American attempts to make all individuals of the society competent and interchangeable in function. In both societies, innovations which cause changes in the nature of relationships challenge the central values.

In traditional village households, for example, the focus of daily activity revolves around family needs of subsistence, with adults taking the leading role and acting as instructors in the technologies that allow the family to survive. Work is carried out together, usually in same-sex groups. Age and experience are respected, and continue to hold individuals in hierarchical respect relations to one another throughout their lifetimes. Parents always maintain their superiority. The complementarity of gender roles and the hierarchies of age provide a certain amount of stability and security in family groups.

The decision to educate children is a potentially serious threat to such familial arrangements and relationships. First, a new focus of family life is formed, not around adult activities, but around the child-centered activity of 'doing school work'--children must be given time free from family activities to do a task that they must basically do alone, without help. Families may sit with children to 'study' in the evening. Children look elsewhere for instruction and for behavioral models; illiterate parents no longer possess the skills which are valued for transmission to the child. In the household, in certain activities, such as letter writing, children become the "experts", not the parent, thus giving literate children a status that conflicts with intergenerational respect relations. As children grow older, their education sets them apart from other villagers, and they may not find work which befits their educated status in the local area.

From the traditionalist perspective of villagers and nomads, the question of education is not a foregone conclusion, but is entered into only if it appears to have advantages to the welfare

of the group (or at least does not detract from other group interests). Education's almost inevitable role in redefining hierarchical and complementary relationships--as for example when girls go to school and become prepared for possible roles outside the home--strike at the very core of what is most central in the cultural values of villagers, including in particular a belief in the centrality of family and tribal life.

When looked upon favorably, education in this cultural view is seen not so much as a way to increase independent individual potential--in fact that may be seen as a possible liability--but as a way to develop the capacities of individuals to contribute more effectively to the groups of which they are members--in the case of girls to become better wives and mothers and for boys to become better bread winners. Parents are not so much concerned with what a child learns as what the child will be able to do with it for the benefit of the group.

The constraints on school attendance for girls are primarily normative. It is difficult in the tribal or village context to see a clear advantage from education. The question might be better asked, "Why do they go to school?," rather than "Why do they not go to school?," given the difficulty in pinpointing what the advantages are in a community where girls are not expected to work and there is little opportunity to use literacy skills. Parents are usually very vague in their answers--"for their futures," "because everyone else does". One possible explanation that parents find difficulty in articulating is that they like the behavioral lessons children learn in school: to be respectful to elders, to learn discipline, orderliness, and neatness. Beginning school happens to coincide with the age when parents begin to demand responsible behavior from children, and the school therefore takes some of the burden of training away from the parents.

Girls in villages are strictly supervised and are not usually allowed to move far from their homes unchaperoned at any age, but after about the age of ten even greater care is taken. Even suggestions that their behavior is not fully correct elicits important repercussions in their families which suffer the consequences of each individual members' dishonorable or honorable behavior. In the case of dishonor, they are required to remove the offense as quickly as possible or they will suffer as a group in their relationships with others, in the marriages they contract, in their influence for years to come. Individuals cannot escape the bad behavior of their kin.

Girls in the villages of the two provinces often marry in their early teens to ensure their protection as quickly as possible. It is not always an advantage in marriage negotiations to be educated. However, the trend over time is always toward favoring the advantages of at least a limited education for girls. Two women visited during the field trip possessed primary school certificates and were married to influential though illiterate

men. Other women also noted that in villages where education for girls was becoming more common, it was becoming a sought after characteristic by men, especially those who had migrated to cities or foreign countries for work and were impressed with educated women. This is an important trend, for it persuades parents of the usefulness of limited education for their daughters.

In other Muslim countries, girls' participation trends have consistently lagged behind those of boys. Boys enroll in school in small numbers at first but with some persistence to reach higher levels. As their numbers increase, so do their dropout rates at first, until education becomes established as a norm where all boys are expected to go and stay in school to higher levels of education. As a critical mass of boys begins going in the second phase, a small number of girls begins school, starting a cycle which continues much as it did for the boys. It may be inevitable in areas which have not experienced education that a mass of boys must go to school before the circumstances are ripe for girls to take full advantage of available opportunities. Though policy makers may not want to assume that this is the case, it is nevertheless a factor to consider.

Encouraging children to continue to levels of education beyond the primary level may reflect a difference in parental perceptions of education in a village. Even when parents recognize a general usefulness to literacy skills, the sacrifices in lost labor and costs make long term education a major investment. The more grades children complete in school, the more likely parents are to think of education as preparation for employment; for parents to encourage girls to continue to middle, secondary, or higher education may imply an acceptance of the idea of outside work for their daughters rather than insistence on purely domestic roles.

The extent to which education is equated with employment may affect decisions about continuing school. Employment for women in rural and many urban areas is constrained by the very strong feeling in Pakistani society that males should provide the financial support for females--that this is an essential part of being a man (one ramification of the complementarity of gender roles). A woman who works publicly advertises the possibility that the man who should support her may not be doing so adequately. The problem is relieved somewhat if it is evident that her salary goes for her own use and does not support the household, or if her job is of such a respected status that it is assumed she works for professional as opposed to financial reasons. This respect gives such women greater latitude to move around in public. An example was given of a female medical practitioner who wears her white office coat shopping so she will be treated well by those she meets.

If the possibility of work requiring education arises, it would usually mean living elsewhere, moving into the village of

"strangers", or commuting to work--all conditions which are likely to prove impossible for a village woman who has to guard her reputation. As a consequence, there is almost no tradition of local females working in rural villages (and no models for younger girls to emulate) and therefore the question of preparing for employment through education is of little interest to village girls. One advantage of teaching as a profession is that it may offer one of the few opportunities where women can work under protected local conditions.

The extent to which marriage chances are affected by education encourages or discourages participation. Some girls suggested that there might be greater difficulty for a highly educated woman to find a comparably educated man as a husband, whereas a primary-school graduate could be married to either an educated or uneducated man. Similarly, parents may not be willing to expend money on daughters' educations if they feel the benefits will only accrue to another household after the girl marries and moves to live with her husband.

Among tribal groups a family's status may be roughly equated in proportion to the bridal price their daughters can command or their sons can pay for their brides. Status as a sardar's or other notable's daughter enhances bridal price, as do personal and familial characteristics which are impeccable. In one village, of four tribal sections, people from the most affluent section did not send their daughters to school because wealth allowed them a good negotiating position without education.

Because marriage is such an important institution in social life, parents are concerned that no questions arise about the honor of girls who move freely back and forth to school. Similarly a girl going to primary school may be withdrawn at puberty to avoid such problems and is unlikely to continue on if she reaches a level which requires going far from the immediate vicinity of the village.

3. Educational environment

a. Background

The major historic influences which shape the present educational program come from two main sources: Islamic scholarship, and the embryonic origins of educational programs in the British occupational experience. Islamic scholarship is traditionally based on an authority which is divine, is vested in materials which are considered unimpeachable--the Koran, with examples which are unquestioned--episodes from the life of the Prophet. Scholars are trained in interpretation rather than critical appraisal and scholarship is the absorption of or, in scholarly circles, the search after correct knowledge.

The educational system established by the British for the local population unwittingly drew upon this view of education as the

acquisition of a specified kind of knowledge. Its purpose was to develop a corps of medium and low level clerical and administrative staff. The object was to inculcate basic skills of language, literacy, and numeracy and, equally if not more importantly, the characteristics of discipline and respect for authority. The colonial rulers were not interested in producing free thinkers or in developing analytical skills which might in time be turned against them.

When turned over to the Pakistanis at the time of Independence in 1947, the form of educational institutions was firmly established, even while the underlying rationales for assuming this form remained implicit. Under this model the effective school became one which provided the environment in which children could be inculcated with the characteristics of order, discipline, and respect for authority, and learn modest skills in language, literacy, and numeracy. The Pakistanis reinforced the model by emphasizing that a teacher should be an exemplary model of Islamic propriety and discipline, and command the respect of children for his or her correct knowledge of textbook content. National authorities expected the orderly graduates of this system to enter the ranks of the Pakistani bureaucracy, the civil service, and the army where such skills and behavioral characteristics would be eminently useful in building the new state.

The education system is the primary instrument of the state to tackle the important task of unification. With the exception of Islamic institutions, it is the only institution which reaches down into local areas and has the explicit function of socializing children at an age when they are still malleable. The national goals of education appear in policy documents and require the schooling system to build the bridges of communication through developing a common national language; to reinforce symbols of unity through strengthening the practices of the common religion, Islam; to build a sense of loyalty and commitment to the state through a knowledge of history and culture; and to build the basic skills of development through transferring skills of literacy, numeracy, and foreign languages which allow access to higher training and technologies. The major objective of the system is to produce citizens who are disciplined, orderly, and committed, with obligations to society taking priority over their own personal fulfillment.

Classrooms all over Pakistan are conducted in ways which demonstrate that these objectives are taken seriously. The curriculum emphasizes religious and nationalist themes, the learning is rote, the atmosphere is orderly, and children are highly disciplined. It may be well to remember the importance of these social goals when contemplating reforms in the system. At the very least it is well to be aware of how well-embedded they are in the current system.

b. Strengths and weaknesses.

The problems of the education system in Pakistan have been reported in a number of documents both indigenous and foreign. The comments in this section will therefore be well known to readers who are familiar with this literature. An annex to this document includes some selected observations from field trips to Pakistani schools and educational offices which provide more details on specific conditions in schools.

Decades of neglect have left serious gaps in the capacity to address quantitative and qualitative problems in the education system. Many of these problems stem from a lack of resources to expand opportunities adequately and provide the development and replication costs that would improve the quality of programs. Some problems, however, stem from system inefficiencies of poor coordination and management.

At present, the system is only barely keeping up with population increases among certain segments of the population and it is falling seriously behind in others. In the two provinces where the program will be implemented, it will be difficult to make any headway at all toward the goals of universal education without increasing capacity significantly. In Baluchistan alone, by natural growth rate, about 25,000 boys in the age group 4-9 (this age group assumes a 6 year cycle for the primary level) are added to the relevant age group of potential primary students each year, while the capacity to absorb these children only grows at the rate of 20,000 to 25,000 annually. Among the girls of this age group, the rate of population growth is about 20,000 annually but there is provision for increasing places only for 2,000 to 3,000 of them. Thus the out-of-school population increases by about 17,000 girls each year in Baluchistan.

In NWFP, by population growth alone, about 65,000 boys are added to the relevant age group each year while educational capacity is expanded to accommodate only 50 to 60,000 of them. About 55,000 girls are also added to the age group and only 45,000 are accommodated. At best the situation is stagnant in NWFP; at worst many children are prevented from taking advantage of education simply because opportunities do not exist.

A rough proxy of quality, confounded by other factors, is the number of children who drop out of the system before completing the fifth grade. In Baluchistan, 80 percent of the urban girls and 93 percent of the rural girls drop out before completing the primary level and, in NWFP, 70 and 78 percent. With such high dropout rates, one might question whether any but a very small minority of girls in these two populations develop acceptable standards of literacy.

The picture is not altogether bleak. Current strengths upon which the PED can build both quantitative and qualitative improvements include:

- o educational authorities who recognize that the situation needs improvement and who appear to have a genuine receptivity to change;
- o dedicated professionals in provincial offices who are already analyzing and developing ingenious solutions to pressing problems of education;
- o an environment which is orderly and organized in most schools;
- o students who generally appear motivated;
- o an unserved and rapidly expanding demand for education;
- o a slavish pursuit by teachers in implementing textbooks (which provides a vehicle for qualitative changes);
- o the willingness of many communities to contribute to some of the costs of providing educational opportunities; and
- o a system, however imperfect, which exists for implementing a set of objectives (mainly implicit and social at present, but nonetheless important).

The recognized weaknesses of the system include:

- o lack of facilities,
- o poorly trained or untrained teachers,
- o teachers not adequately prepared,
- o inadequate teacher supply,
- o a poorly developed salary and career structure for teachers,
- o high absenteeism among teachers and students,
- o the inadequacy of teacher accountability/reward structures,
- o difficult curricula and instructional materials, particularly in the Kachhi years through grade two,
- o an overwhelming emphasis upon language learning to the detriment of subject skill development,
- o an exam driven instruction relying heavily on rote memorization, and other rigidly formalistic forms of learning,

- o difficulty attracting teachers to rural areas,
- o lack of instructional supports for teachers,
- o absence of effective instructional leadership,
- o high wastage rates in terms of dropout and repetition,
- o poor planning, administration, supervision, and management and the inadequacy of technologies to carry out these functions,
- o a bureaucratic structure fragmented by an emphasis on hierarchical, vertical chains of command without provision for horizontal integration and coordination, and
- o lack of consensus on what directions improvements in the system should take.

(See Annex A for selected field observations of the schooling environment).

III. SOCIAL FEASIBILITY

This section is divided into two parts. The first raises a number of general implementation issues of cultural and social importance. The second concentrates on important specific problems which unless addressed explicitly may reduce the success of program outcomes.

The discussion of issues is based on the assumption that simple solutions, channeled through existing structures and consistent with local values, are most likely to prove socially feasible. There is also an assumption that short term "perfect" solutions are not as desirable as the development of long term processes which are capable of responding in continuous fashion to changing notions of "perfection."

A. General issues

1. The extent to which Pakistanis find the general objectives of the program acceptable and have participated in its conceptualization and design

The PEP objectives are consistent with a need felt in Pakistani society to address the problems of quality and quantity in the education program. A document from the new government outlining its stand on national issues declared that its "...principal aim is to ensure that every child receives at least 10 years of formal education" (PPP Manifesto 1988). Government education officials at the federal and provincial level were overwhelmingly enthusiastic about the potential that exists for attacking

educational problems from substantially higher levels of new funding for the sector. Many cautioned that it would be important to ensure that the money come as an additionality to current GOP funding. Some lesser officials were concerned that the program mode was not likely to accomplish badly needed changes in the way funds are used--"just more of the same thing."

Discussions held as part of the preparation of this document with parents, teachers, children, and with educational authorities close to the community level all left little doubt that there was general enthusiasm for expanding educational opportunities. People who are close to the classroom also almost universally felt that changes could be made in the curriculum to improve the quality of programs. Officials in central offices complained about the quality of the teaching force while those closer to the teachers usually felt many of the teachers were doing the best they could under the circumstances. Together, these comments translate into an overwhelming desire among all groups for expansion in the system and an acceptance among professionals that certain kinds of change might improve the quality of the educational program.

The pressures of time during the period allotted for preparing this document did not permit full scale collaboration with Pakistanis. It was decided early in the working period that the details of the program be worked out in an initial year of intensive planning with relevant officials. As much as possible this initial year should be used to establish long term professional relationships with those who will be involved in program implementation to avoid the frustration to Pakistanis of having to bring incessant waves of consultants up to speed.

2. The rate with which affected populations and institutions can absorb program interventions without undue social disruption.

This analysis assumes that potential participants in a program who actively seek its opportunities will be ready to suffer any difficulties which arise in their social situation as a result of participation. Earlier we discussed the potential for disruption in social groups which can come from education; some of these disruptions, such as enlarging the scope for employment, are considered positive while others such as the weakening of traditional types of relationships can be debilitating.

Information gathered during the writing of this report and from recently completed studies on access by BRIDGES and on rural women teachers by the NEC and Women's Division suggests that despite the potential for negative effects, there is a large unsatisfied demand for primary education in Baluchistan and NWFP. The change in attitude about education is occurring so quickly that even some bureaucrats in provincial capitals are not fully aware of how much demand exists. This does not mean that all resistance to education has vanished--indeed there are areas

where resistance, particularly to girls' education, is reportedly very high. However, there appears to be enough demand which is unsatisfied currently because of lack of resources and qualified personnel to occupy the resources of the current program. In addition, if the present trend continues one can expect that the demand will accelerate over the length of the project as education becomes the norm in increasingly larger parts of the population.

One can probably assume that where demand exists and there is no limitation on the provision of opportunities the population will be willing to absorb educational expansion at almost any rate. It is not appropriate, in any case, to restrict this rate of change where it has been locally accepted.

However, other questions with social, economic, and institutional capacity implications need to be assessed by Pakistan government officials who have a better sense of the needs in their own system:

- o How can the government reform its revenue generating structures sufficiently to sustain the high recurrent costs of a program such as this which seeks to universalize education?
- o Can existing or strengthened institutions cope with the scale of expansion expected in the primary system?
- o Can the government accompany such rapid expansion with improvements in the management, administration, and monitoring activities required if program money is to be spent wisely?
- o Can quality instructional programs be put in place quickly to ensure that increased access is not illusionary with little concomitant increase in skill levels?
- o Can higher levels of education be provided to meet the demand which increasing numbers of primary graduates will generate? :
- o Can the labor market sustain the numbers of educated people who will be seeking new kinds of jobs if the program meets its objectives? Who will continue to perform the traditional unskilled occupations? In what sectors and locations will these new jobs open up?

These may be the questions which, if ignored or not carefully considered, become the points at which the society becomes overloaded through too rapid an expansion of the primary program. It does not seem necessary at this stage to take extraordinary measures to create demand. Rather, such measures might create a demand which the system is not yet ready to meet. The issue of

incentives should be examined again later in the implementation when it may become clearer what the most cost-effective use of funds would be to encourage rather than coerce the remaining parents to enroll their children.

3. The importance of the appropriate mix and sequencing of activities to achieve program objectives in a timely and systematic way.

The quantity and quality objectives of the program are connected. The impact of educational opportunities is reduced when the quality of the program is poor and children either do not acquire the requisite skills or drop out too early to benefit from their training. Similarly, resources diverted in too great a degree toward improvements in quality reduce the capacity of the program to meet demands for access. Because quality improvements are more difficult to implement and are less visible, there is a danger that these may become compromised by a desire to expand the system rapidly. If children continue to drop out at the same rates, however, the gains in grade one access will be lost in student wastage.

In the long run the most cost-effective way to proceed is to achieve an appropriate balance of both kinds of objectives. The strategy requires implementation on all fronts simultaneously with activities increasing teacher supply, encouraging female teachers to work in rural areas, providing expanded and improved facilities, improving training programs, responding to community participation, improving instructional materials, and developing the capacity to deliver education more effectively.

Ideally the activities should also be sequenced so that quality inputs come on line before major expansion in the system. Phasing may be a way to approach this question. In the first phase there would be start up activities to develop and put in place the components which are necessary before a broad implementation of the qualitative and quantitative components. The goals of this phase will be to put in place the programs which are designed to increase the teaching force, to prepare improved and tested instructional materials with guides for teachers, to develop materials-focused pre and inservice teacher training courses, to train the trainers to teach these courses, and to construct new and expand old training facilities.

The second phase would comprise the major expansion period of construction and the dissemination of quality improvements in instructional materials and teacher training. These expansion and dissemination activities would continue into the third phase. In this last phase, attention would also be focused on some of the more difficult problems: finding alternative delivery systems and possibly incentive systems to reach difficult-to-serve populations, and fine tuning the improvements in the instructional program. An annex to this paper suggests a sequence of activi-

ties which would permit the best use and coordination of qualitative and quantitative inputs.

4. The need to tailor program inputs to specific conditions in various regions to spread program benefits as widely as possible, in particular to educationally disadvantaged populations.

Conditions vary dramatically over the target provinces. The problems of enrolling rural children in remote areas of Baluchistan are different from the problems of enrolling children in the lower class districts of Peshawar. In order to ensure optimum utilization of project opportunities, implementors should tailor solutions to specific educational problems and environments. For example, in providing facilities, consideration should be given to offering alternative designs suitable to varying weather conditions, numbers of children, and varying use of space. It should be possible for communities to request coeducational or single sex schools with the necessary features which will attract different kinds of enrollment.

The locations of schools need to be carefully worked out to ensure their equitable distribution. If questions of access are uppermost, then schools need to be built in areas where children live who would not otherwise go to school.

A range of incentives needs to be available with some flexibility in how they are administered to solve the specific problems of teacher supply and distribution. Present training programs are usually not oriented to the specific contexts for which trainees are being prepared: multigrade or single grade teaching, large and small classrooms, varying age and ability of children, and differences in local language. Alternate delivery systems need to be worked out systematically for students: who live a long distance from formal institutions, who are forced to spend much of the day at work, have special restrictions on their movements, or have other reasons why they cannot take advantage of standard programs.

From the beginning, details of the program need to be worked out separately in the two target provinces, and the mechanisms for funding should be made responsive to a demonstrated capacity to absorb the interventions.

5. The need to coordinate the overlapping activities of the many agencies to avoid duplication in and overburdening of the existing institutional capacity.

A number of agencies are presently involved in improving instructional quality: UNICEF with curriculum development, World Bank with modules (methods of instruction in the classroom), ADB with teacher training programs and model school development, and the AIOU with distance programs in teacher training and middle school and secondary degree certification. Because some lack

funding and others have a geographic focus, many activities are only designed to reach a limited clientele.

It would be a more effective use of program resources to build on a variety of these interventions, rather than duplicate them or compete with them for staff who are already engaged in similar activities. PED resources should be used by provincial authorities to assess these and other innovations and to bear the costs of replication across broader populations if evaluations prove their effectiveness.

6. The need to temper cost efficiencies with concern for competing socio-cultural and economic imperatives.

In a number of components, maintaining rigid efficiency criteria linked to minimizing costs may not always be the socially most acceptable way to proceed. For example, if it is possible to construct schools with locally available commodities and labor even if they are not quite as cost-effective as commodities and labor brought from further away, the social benefits may be greater. All things being equal it is better to see many persons benefiting from income generation than to see large profits made by a few people.

It may also be better to build a more costly, attractive school which is the pride of a community than an unattractive inexpensive school which provides no incentive for local people to maintain it properly. The model of the Aga Khan foundation school building program should be examined to see if its costs could not be reduced enough to become competitive with existing plans for schools. The Aga Khan program builds aesthetically beautiful schools, using village participation in construction and maintenance of buildings.

Similarly, programs to produce textbook at minimal costs may have the unintended consequence of undermining the businesses of many small publishing entrepreneurs.

7. The importance of relying upon indigenous personnel, institutions, and programs which are already established and have a track record for dealing with the details of implementation.

During the field trips for this paper, a number of appropriate low-cost solutions were identified which had been instituted to solve major problems in the educational system. For example, changes have been made in policies about the recruitment of teachers, and incentives have been provided to encourage teachers to go into training institutions (and guarantee the government five years' service) and to serve in rural areas. Shelters have been provided by local communities to house schools temporarily and programs have been developed to deliver training and schooling to hard-to-reach populations. Incentives have been provided to bright children who continue on to middle school.

Some of these programs have had only limited success, not because they are ineffective, but rather because the resources available to support them are not sufficient to permit their having a larger impact.

Provincial authorities through PED could expand funding for these existing structures and avoid complicated interventions which require new institutions, major staffing increases, or close coordination between a number of agencies and departments. (See the recommendations section in the introduction for specifics).

The second advantage of using existing structures is that they are staffed by local people who know how to present interventions in a culturally appropriate way, and who, in the best examples, are able to follow up with the kind of detail which will be necessary if interventions are to be tailored to specific problems. Several of the AIOU programs are exemplary in this respect, and UNICEF, though not indigenous, has Pakistanis to implement their activities who appear willing to take the time to attend to details in this way. Provincial authorities should consider using such programs to supplement their own capacities to achieve program objectives.

B. Special issues

A few issues in the educational sector are so important that unless addressed directly there is little likelihood that program resources can achieve the results intended. This section attempts to gather, in one place, conventional wisdom on the causes of these specific problems and the more reasonable of the many solutions which have been suggested to solve them. In some cases specific solutions reported here have already been instituted by provincial governments. Though there is some limitation on whether a province can implement a solution with budgetary implications independent of other provinces there are examples in which this has been done.

It is usually difficult to generalize about which causes and solutions are the most important for any one of these issues. Some will be important in one and others in another context. For more definitive project planning, many of these solutions should be explored further to see the extent to which they are practical in specific local contexts. These are a summary of current ideas, not the author's recommendations as set forth in the introduction to this paper. Those recommendations in the introduction are easy to implement through existing structures without adding substantially to administrative costs.

The specific problems which program implementors should address if objectives are to be met are the following:

- o How to attract girls to enroll at the primary level and stay in school longer;
- o How to provide sufficient numbers of teachers to staff the schools required if girls' enrollments are to be increased to satisfactory levels, and especially how to increase the supply of teachers working in rural areas;
- o How to ensure that qualitative interventions reach the level of the classroom.

Each of these problems is discussed in detail on the following pages.

1. Low levels of girls' enrollment and persistence.

Baluchistan and NWFP have the lowest participation rates in Pakistan. In 1988, only 14 percent of the girls in Baluchistan and 28 percent of the NWFP girls were enrolled. Comparable boys' figures were 70 percent in Baluchistan and 79 percent in NWFP. When disaggregated for urban and rural location, the figures are even more discouraging.

In 1983-84, the Baluchistan and NWFP urban girls' enrollments were only 20 percent and 35 percent respectively. In comparison, Sind and Punjab rates were 50 and 63 percent. In rural areas, the situation is far worse -- seven percent rural girls' enrollment in Baluchistan and only ten percent in NWFP compared to 19 and 25 percent in Sind and Punjab.

Male/female enrollment disparities within each province are equally discouraging. Urban boys' rates are 44 percent in Baluchistan and 64 percent in NWFP. Urban girls' rates are 20 percent in Baluchistan and 35 percent in NWFP. Rural rates are Baluchistan, boys 38 percent, girls seven percent; NWFP, boys 52 percent, girls ten percent.

The literature on female access to enrollment and discussions with parents, teachers, and officials gives the following as the major reasons girls do not enroll in grade one:

- o the absence of an appropriate school in the vicinity,
- o the need for a girl to work at home,
- o the costs of schooling/poverty,
- o education's lack of relevance as seen by parents and students,

- o norms about purdah, the role of women, and socially accepted standards for a particular community, and
- o the lack of parental interest (usually meaning that parents simply never thought about educating their children).

It is difficult to isolate any single or even any limited combination of reasons for the low enrollment rates of girls, conditions vary so dramatically from area to area. In Baluchistan, for example, by official reports which state that only boys attend these schools (actual observation shows a goodly number of girls also go), the mosque school program seems not to have been very effective in increasing the educational opportunities for girls, even though presumably it brought schools to areas in proximity to the homes of girls.

In NWFP it appears that mosque school programs may not have increased girls' enrollments substantially (official statistics do not break down the enrollment by sex but the schools are exclusively recorded as male schools, and the BRIDGES Access Study also shows very low enrollments of girls in that province). The general expectation is that an 'appropriate' school which will attract girls to enroll is a single-sex school.

However, there are numerous places where undeclared coeducational primary schools exist in Baluchistan and NWFP--girls or boys simply show up at the other sex's schools. Most parents and local school officials interviewed in Baluchistan reported that they felt coeducation was acceptable at the primary level because of the young age of the children. Even though it is certain that there are still many villages where parents would not accept coeducation, it appears an appropriate strategy to try to increase the number of coeducational schools where that approach is acceptable to local communities.

In Baluchistan, in one school, male teachers from the local community were teaching girls up to the end of middle level and in another to the end of primary. At the primary level, male teachers may be acceptable to parents if the male is a trusted individual from the community and if female teachers are not available. In communities where parents are eager to educate their daughters, they appear willing to make compromises about where children learn and who teaches them.

As school enrollments increase and it makes budgetary sense to build more sex-segregated schools, there is no question that most parents would prefer to have their daughters studying separately with female teachers. Schmidt (1987) says, "It is almost certain that establishing girls' primary schools...especially in NWFP would produce an explosion of female enrollments; but it is also likely that even establishing more coeducational primary schools would increase female enrollments, particularly if the teachers were female and other cost disincentives were removed" (p. 8).

Schmidt argues for a mixed approach to school construction in NWFP with provision of both coeducational and girls' schools. Single-sex schools should be located when possible in areas of lowest girls' enrollments since conditions are already not conducive to their enrollment in those communities: Kohistan and Dir in NWFP--and perhaps Khuzdar, Nasirabad, Kharan, Gawadar, and Pishin in Baluchistan. The impact should be monitored carefully to see what effects if any are produced by each strategy (that is, if a truly experimental situation can be created).

In many areas the costs of schooling have already been reduced through different means. Baluchistan provides books and writing materials free to rural students so the direct costs of education are minimal. Teachers in rural schools observed as part of the preparation of this working paper often do not require or limit the purchase of expendable notebooks, one of the major expenses in urban schools. Children wear homemade uniforms and carry makeshift school bags.

In NWFP people spoke of private charitable organizations which help local children with the costs of schooling, and, in one urban school, the headmistress described a fund from surplus school fees which she uses to provide money for books for poor children. In some areas, zakat funds (generated from a yearly tithing of Muslims of about 2.5 percent of their wealth over a minimum level) are also used for such purposes. At each Union Council level there are Zakat Committees which can decide how such funds are spent.

It is more difficult to assess the indirect costs of education, including, for example, the extent to which children's labor is required at home. In one study this category received very little emphasis in comparison to "the unavailability of nearby schools" and "the costs of education" in preventing enrollment (Chaudhrey 1988). An eldest girl may be kept at home to help a mother or provide child care, but the need for a girls' work in the home should not necessarily imply a blanket prohibition against other younger girls going to school from the same households. Child care in most rural households is casual and does not require a great deal of attention once small children can toddle and go off on their own.

Estimates of dropout rates are controversial. Official figures place the dropout rate before completion of the primary level at approximately half of all students who enter the primary school. This number may be artificially high, however, because the statistics do not take into account the fact that the time spent in the first grade (Kachhi and Pakki) is normally two to three years.

In NWFP the dropout rate for females in 1983 was 70 percent in urban areas and 78 percent in rural areas as compared to 60 and 70 percent respectively for males. In Baluchistan the dropout

rate for females was 80 percent in urban areas and 93 percent in rural areas compared with 56 and 67 percent for males.

Looking at completion rates is still not encouraging for girls. In NWFP, 31 percent of urban females and 22 percent of rural females complete the fifth grade while in Baluchistan only 20 percent of urban and 7 percent of rural girls complete that grade.

The reasons suggested in the literature for dropout (in addition to many of the same reasons reported for non-enrollment) include the following:

- o difficulty of education/curriculum/repetition/exam failure,
- o problems in the school related to the teacher or other children,
- o marriage,
- o norms related to puberty, and to
- o illness.

Suggestions from the literature on Pakistan for attracting more girls to school and keeping them in longer include the following:

- o providing schooling opportunities near to a girls' home,
- o providing suitable conditions in the school (boundary wall, toilets, a female teacher),
- o providing free textbooks and writing materials,
- o making the curriculum more relevant to girls by including home economics,
- o providing money incentives to individual girls tied to attendance, to scholastic achievement and to entry into middle level or to completion of primary level,
- o providing incentives to schools for enrolling more girls, high overall achievement in grade five exams, or in increasing the completion rates of girls,
- o providing free meals,
- o adjusting the hours of schooling for greater convenience,
- o mounting motivational campaigns in the mass media through the Imam or community recruitment,

- o where teachers can be found and communities guarantee sufficient enrollment, give first priority to school construction,
- o development of a better program of instruction more suitable to the ages of the children,
- o better trained and supported teachers,
- o automatic pass in grades 1-4 except in special cases to avoid the discouragement of repetition (the World Bank hopes to reach agreement with the GOP on this policy change).

Again, it is difficult to say with surety which intervention or set of interventions might work in a given area, or whether the resources necessary to effect them are cost-effective when balanced against other potential interventions. Girls seem more likely to persist in school when school buildings are located near their homes. It also seems extremely important that parents feel the school location is secure, however that is defined in the community, as boundary walls, safe location, school guard, etc.

A "close location" also includes several social meanings: in the middle of a village and not in a location somewhat distant from populated areas; not in the private home of another family where the girl may have contact with "stranger men"; not in an area of another faction of a tribe or another ethnic community; or not even in the private home of a-kin member if that kin member is in conflict with the girl's parents.

When girls continue to middle or secondary levels the question again arises of how distant the school can be but this time in the context of puberty and the norms associated with that stage of development. Girls' schools need boundary walls to give a sense of security to the parents and girls, to prevent vandalism and to allow for beautification of the grounds so animals and people will not disturb them. Girls' schools need toilets of some simple kind to keep the environs clean and sanitary and to reduce the need for long recess breaks for them to go home.

A female teacher is usually but not always necessary for girl students. They are thought to be gentler and less physical in their discipline (however, in one classroom full of boys who were being continuously beaten, the male teacher refrained from hitting the single girl even when she made the same mistakes as the boys). It is believed in many places that an older female should be around institutions where girls are present (in schools where only male teachers are present, authorities sometimes hire an older illiterate female to stay in the schools).

Another critical obstacle to persistence in school seems to be the difficult and unimaginative nature of learning. Correcting this problem requires a host of changes in curriculum, instructional materials, teacher training, etc.

The village communities which were most eager for education often demonstrated special characteristics which show the importance of local leadership. In some places, a few of the fathers of the children have worked in large urban areas or other countries where they became familiar with the advantages of education and have the resources to contribute to providing opportunities. In others a dynamic personality, male or female, presses the advantages of education to others and takes the initiative in organizing the opportunities for children to learn. In communities where schools seem to be running most effectively, the teachers are usually from the local area and have a commitment to teaching children of the community. Such teachers model their schools on the family pattern where they take a benignly paternalistic pride in the achievements of their children."

2. Lack of female teachers, especially in rural areas

The inadequate supply of female teachers and the difficulty of persuading them to work in rural areas are the two most important constraints on project implementation in Baluchistan. The speed with which schools can become functional will depend on whether these constraints can be overcome rapidly enough. Interim solutions, such as lowering qualifications, will almost certainly cause the quality of teachers to drop. Extending teacher training for an extra year or more is highly unrealistic and would only serve to compound the problems further.

The shortage of teachers is a problem in all provinces of Pakistan. It is such an acute problem in Baluchistan that 100 or more girls' schools are closed because of lack of staff. In Sibi, the female DEO found 50 closed schools when she assumed her position several years ago and has since been able to open more than 35 of them by busing teachers from urban to rural areas and recruiting retired male teachers. In Makran, 11 out of a total of 37 girls' primary schools are presently closed. Other schools are grossly understaffed. A school for 422 girls in Mand possesses 3 teachers out of a sanctioned number of 11. Approximately 100 girls are turned away from this school each year because of lack of staff.

Teacher supply will depend heavily in the near future on urban educated women in Baluchistan, since there are few women outside of urban areas who have achieved middle or higher secondary degrees. Many of these urban women are settlers from Punjab and other parts of the country and often they may not speak the local language well. The numerical potential of this group can be gauged roughly from annual girls' enrollments of middle and secondary level in recent years. In Baluchistan the numbers

total 2,747 at the middle school and 1,116 at the secondary level. Assuming that about three percent (a figure used in estimates in other countries) of these students can be recruited into teaching, only 82 teachers from the middle level (if present qualification levels were reduced) and 33 teachers from the secondary level would be available to cope with a growth rate in population alone of about 20,000 females a year, or one "warm body" teacher for 174 students just to keep up with growth rates.

Conditions are only slightly better in NWFP, where 8,332 female students enrolled in eighth grade in 1987 and 5,342 in tenth grade, to give a potential teaching force at three percent of 250 academically under qualified and 160 qualified teachers. At present rates of growth that would make 134 students per teacher just to keep up with population growth. The situation is somewhat more hopeful in NWFP where a backlog of teacher applicants and a greater willingness to engage in work might make it possible to expand the teaching force more rapidly once GCETs are built closer to the homes of candidate and sufficient hostel space is provided for those who need to board. Similarly, middle and secondary enrollments are more likely to rise rapidly if more opportunities were to be made available in areas closer to girls' homes.

The reasons females do not enter the teaching field and, once entering the field, are unwilling to go to rural areas in "worst case" Baluchistan lies in the following factors:

- o low salaries and financial disincentives to teach in rural areas;
- o absence of academically trained females in many rural villages who could act as teachers;
- o the reluctance of the small group of available urban teachers to commute long distances to rural schools because of the problems and costs of transportation;
- o the social unacceptability for women to live alone in remote villages;
- o the difficulty finding appropriate residential accommodations in villages;
- o the often higher cost of living in many villages for outsiders (higher costs of food, transportation, including the costs of holiday visits, rent, medical service, etc.);
- o the low status of teaching.

This problem is particularly acute because of the long period required to increase the supply of teachers. At least three to

five years are required to draw more girls into the middle and secondary levels simply in order to provide a pool of potential candidates.

The literature and informants suggest the following ways to attract qualified people to the teaching field, and encourage them to teach in rural areas:

- o pay teachers according to their academic qualifications (at present they are paid at the same basic rate whatever their qualification). This change has already been accepted in principle by the GOP;
- o regularize normal housing and other allowances to make them the same for urban and rural teachers (urban--i.e. Peshawar teachers, for example, receive a housing allowance of 45 percent of the basic pay compared with teachers in the rest of the "rural" province who receive 30 percent);
- o provide a chaperonage allowance for a family member to accompany a female teacher who will live in rural areas (suggested to be about Rs. 200/mo.);
- o provide a substantial difficult area allowance for female teachers who will live in remote rural areas (Rs. 200 is now being paid in Makran but officials suggest that to draw teachers, it needs to be raised to Rs. 1,000);
- o provide either transportation or a transportation allowance which adequately compensates a teacher for these costs (vans located near eight district headquarters in Baluchistan take teachers to clusters of villages -- this has permitted the opening of several closed schools);
- o provide a career development plan for teachers commensurate with that of other civil servants (teachers who are untrained start at a basic salary of BPS 7 -- Rs. 750 a month and do not receive increments until they complete training (this includes all the female teachers in Makran but one); trained teachers start at the same basic pay level but receive yearly increments of Rs. 31 up to Rs. 1,370 a month at which point they move into a new grade. Eventually they reach a ceiling of Rs. 1,590 (where their salary can only be increased if they are selected, space permitting, into a higher grade);

- o relax age requirements to permit people from the ages of 16 to 60 to enter the teaching force; allow retired individuals, where there is a need, to re-enter service and continue to keep their pension (Baluchistan has used this method to bring a retired male back into the service to teach primary school girls);
- o permit those who leave teaching prematurely to return without losing their benefits (It is said that female teachers often would like to leave the service for a few years to raise their children but now need to remain or lose their benefits; this policy change is considered a way of cutting down on absenteeism);
- o develop more effective assignment policies to assign teachers as close to their homes as possible, recognize hardship duty with more choice in later assignments, and show appreciation of family needs, such as a husband and wife being assigned to the same area, etc. (these are all issues which were important to teachers);
- o provide male teachers for girls' schools when this is acceptable in a community (some communities in Baluchistan are employing teachers from the boys' schools to teach girls after hours or during breaks);
- o when requests come for school construction, put the burden on the community to find a teacher who is willing to stay and teach (community pressure may encourage educated girls, who would otherwise stay home, to teach);
- o provide hostels and transportation for female teachers in areas where a cluster of villages is located within reasonable distance; these hostels may serve multiple purposes, as residences for health and other workers and, if they exist near preservice or inservice training centers, for the use of individuals taking these courses; and
- o provide educational scholarships and stipends for the children of urban female teachers who will go to work in rural schools. Often teachers' children can be left with relatives near to good schools and if their school fees were paid this might also be an incentive for rural teaching.

Where applicants for preservice teacher training programs are insufficient:

- o provide full scholarships and subsidization of the costs of room and board (Rs. 75/mo. is now given to teacher

trainees in NWFP and boarding costs are a very reasonable Rs. 180/mo; the teacher agrees to serve in government service for five years);

- o locate training institutes as close as possible to the homes of those to be served (At present, in NWFP, GCETs often serve girls from distant districts; it would be better to build more, smaller GCETs at the district level than to expand existing facilities).

There are some beginning signs that the numbers of graduates willing to enter teaching are increasing in urban areas of Baluchistan, though presently not nearly at the rate needed. First, there are few other socially acceptable alternatives for girls to work (teaching and medicine are the main two and medicine for several reasons tends to be reserved for girls from higher social classes). Second, because urban parents tend to be comparatively better educated, they insist on educated husbands for their daughters; to amass the kinds of funds necessary for marriage takes these young men some time and therefore it is not unusual to find such women marrying in their late twenties.

In the interim before marriage, they sometimes take up teaching and may even continue to teach after marriage. Because these girls are anxious to earn money to contribute to their marriages, salaries which do not penalize them for working in rural areas might prove attractive, especially if they are provided or have easily accessible transport which returns them home in the evenings. These unmarried women would usually not be allowed to stay overnight in villages.

A second group of women who are attracted to education in Baluchistan is the surprising number of women from conservative families who never marry. Preferred marriages among Pathans, Baluch, and Brahui take place within the extended kin group, to cousins. Though intermarriages with outsiders can sometimes occur, even between ethnic groups, conservative families usually try to avoid them. The ideal pattern of kin marriages presumes the availability of appropriate age and sex kin, which is often not the case. If there is no one suitable in the family, and no one comes who is of the right caliber then the family will not marry the girl at all. It is viewed as 'shameful' to marry daughters to men who are of lower status. Eight out of nine employees on the female divisional officer's staff in Quetta are women who are in the category of never expecting to marry. One explained, "Work outside is easier than having to face housework every day at home."

Solutions which have been offered for the teacher recruitment and distribution problems include the following:

- o equalizing the present automatic salaries and allowances of rural and urban teachers, and adding a difficult area allowance for those who live away from home in remote areas;
- o providing transportation or conveyance allowance for female teachers who commute to rural areas each day;
- o offering salaries commensurate with academic qualifications to attract a better quality candidate;
- o providing free secure (with guards) residential quarters for teachers who must live away from home;
- o provision of secure (with guards) hostels in a central area which can accommodate teachers and health workers for a number of surrounding villages; and
- o offering to build schools in places where a community can guarantee a tenth grade (or possibly an eighth-grade middle pass) female graduate who will teach.

3. Ensuring that the effects of the interventions be felt at the level of the school

Projects which are designed from the top down, where money automatically flows through a number of umbrella departments, run the risk of consuming resources in vague, large scale programs which produce no changes at all in the place which matters, the educational program in the local school. A two step exercise in the planning phase may help to reduce this risk. First, the program designers need to make explicit the results that they want to produce at the school level. This requires an analysis of why the desired result is not now being produced at the classroom level and what is required to change both the context in which the learning goes on and the kind of learning itself in order to bring about the desired objectives.

Second, interventions are then designed specifically to effect these results. For example, if the object is to change teachers' instructional behavior and the problem seems to be that the teacher does not use appropriate methods in the classroom, implementors may develop materials which support a change in behavior (for example, annotated teacher's editions of children's texts which specify the methods to use). Next they may want to manipulate the reward structure so that it reinforces the new behavior (in this example, new kinds of exams). Finally they would design a training course around materials (the annotated texts) which apply specifically to this problem.

This procedure aligns the elements which are needed to produce results and effectively limits the areas where intervention must occur, as in this case, to teachers' annotated editions, supporting tests, and a short practical course that can be embedded in inservice and preservice training. What is avoided is a broad unfocused reform of the teacher training program which runs the risk of resistance and interference by those with an entrenched interest in the current programs. Focused interventions of this kind are more likely to produce desired effects on classroom behavior, especially if they are carefully tested at each stage in the context of classroom conditions.

(See the recommendations in the opening overview for selected options that seem reasonable for PED to implement to reduce the constraints discussed above)

IV. SOCIAL IMPACTS AND BENEFICIARIES

A. Project rationale

The rationale for locating the Primary Education Development Program in Baluchistan and NWFP has as its basis assumptions about the equitable distribution of benefits and the need to effect significant social impact. The sites were chosen, first, because educational indicators in these two provinces are the most discouraging for all of Pakistan, particularly those for girls. Second, it was felt that other donor help would be concentrated more in Sind and Punjab, leading to the relative neglect of problems in Baluchistan and NWFP. Third, the limited populations in these two provinces permit a much greater impact to occur from program resources, even though challenging conditions in the two provinces may make the effort more difficult.

B. Beneficiaries

The direct beneficiaries of the PED will be the approximately 500,000 children who will have entered first grade during the life of the program, over and above the number who would be expected to go to school if expanded opportunities were not provided.

The direct beneficiaries of a more efficient, effective qualitatively improved education program are also the approximately 1.8 million children who attend the primary level in the two provinces each year. Among them are the approximately 100,000 children overall who by the end of the project would have dropped out of school were it not for the qualitative improvements in the program. For example, if the efficiency of the program were improved sufficiently to allow for net flow rates of students to

increase 2 percent per grade per year the completion rates would rise as follows (assuming the effects do not begin until the third year of the project and that the Kachhi/Pakki enrollment were disaggregated as two equal grades):

Approximate completion rates assuming a
2% yearly increase in efficiency in each grade

Province	Current %	End of Project %
Baluchistan		
Boys	42	65
Girls	35	55
NWFP		
Boys	61	78
Girls	61	78

Overall there would be a 30 to 50 percent improvement in completion rates under these assumptions, with direct benefits in increased skill levels for those who remained in the system rather than dropping out.

The direct benefit to all the children of the primary level, once quality improvements are installed, will be a more appropriate learning experience and a subsequent rise in achievement levels. Because discouragement with the difficulty of learning, especially at the lower grades, is presumed to be a major cause of dropout, improvements in instructional methods and materials should have a significant impact on the holding power of the schools and the rate at which children progress to higher grades of the primary level. Children will be prepared for a wider range of higher learning opportunities as well as greater choice in what occupations to pursue. The country benefits from the increase in numbers of citizens with functional literacy skills and the more efficient use of resources in producing primary-school graduates.

Approximately 50,000 primary school teachers are expected to improve their professional skills through the training provided by PED. The difficulties they face in the classroom should be eased with more age-suitable materials and better instructional methods. Individuals may be attracted into the teaching profession who are now discouraged by the difficulties of teaching. Teacher training programs should also be more productive and less time consuming as a result of more systematic and practical materials and course content.

Head teachers, supervisors, and administrators should benefit from training courses which are expected to be funded as a result of program interventions. Not only will they learn techniques which will help them to perform better as professionals but their jobs will be enhanced by better bases for locating and correcting learning problems in the system. Policy makers should benefit from better information systems and greater capacity to analyze and assess the rationality of solutions to educational problems.

C. Spread effects

The spread effects of program funding are geographical, human, and temporal. Interventions will have an impact on broad geographical areas of the two affected provinces because of expanded access the construction of schools will provide and the improved quality of school programs as successful innovations in training, materials, and methods are replicated and disseminated to the entire province. The direct beneficiaries are school children but there is also an indirect benefit. Because of the sense of "corporateness" which organizes the society, the enhanced capabilities and opportunities of one individual affect the capabilities and status of the whole group. Economically this is particularly true, in so much as education increases the occupational and income-generating potentials of individuals, it also increases the economic base of the group.

It is easy to list but difficult to quantify the other additional long-term benefits accruing to participants. They range from having the ability to negotiate more effectively in the outside world, to a better knowledge of health and cleanliness, and to the capability of reading religious writings, all elements that increase the sense of well-being of individuals who pass the benefits on to others.

Many of the effects of program interventions will not be visible for years to come, but they are nonetheless important. They relate to such "development" effects as lowered fertility rates, lowered mortality rates, better health, longer life expectancy, and better parenting. It has been said that if one complete generation becomes educated then the cycle of illiteracy will be broken, for educated parents accept the value of education.

It would be too much to ask any program funds to accomplish such a large task as universalization of education. It is not too much to ask that it move the process along more quickly, however. The current stagnant situation now in which the total of illiterates are increasing every year should change to one where schooling keeps up with population growth and significant headway is made in reducing illiteracy.

D. Equity and access

Equity generally refers to an even distribution of opportunities to all categories of people in a society whatever their race,

sex, ethnic community, or social standing. The implication in terms of the distribution of resources is that no single group is penalized because of the social category he or she occupies. Access refers to the ability of any group or individual to take advantage of opportunities.

A number of the factors in the historical and social background of Pakistan coupled with severely limited resources has caused educational opportunities to be concentrated disproportionately in urban areas and for boys, at the expense of rural areas and girls. PED will provide resources in such a way that the provincial governments can continue their attempts to right the balance. The declared intent of the program is to increase enrollments of girls and rural disadvantaged children. Focusing on these two inequities should also improve the imbalances found in relatively poorer regions. A rough priority listing for districts needing attention can be drawn up on the basis of girls' percent of first grade enrollment (if the figures can be found, it would also be well to refer to the sex-disaggregated participation rates for the provincial districts).

Using this measure, program success in diminishing inequities might be measured by the extent of the improvement in specified districts from their present level of girls' share of total enrollments (in percentages). According to this measure, districts would receive resources in the following order, from most in need to least in need:

In Baluchistan	In NWFP
Khuzdar (5)	Kohistan (2)
Nasirabad (5)	Dir (6)
Kharan (7)	Chitral (15)
Gawadar (9)	Peshawar (17)
Pishin (9)	Swat (17)
Kohlu (11)	Bannu (23)
Loralai (11)	Mansehra (25)
Zhob (11)	Kohat (25)
Panjgoor (12)	Mardan (25)
Turbat (12)	Malakand (26)
Kachhi (14)	D.I.Khan (28)
Las Bela (16)	Abbotabad (29)
Kalat (18)	
Dera Bugti (22)	
Sibi (22)	
Chagai (27)	
Quetta (38)	

In statistical terms, progress in the achievement of the access goals is best measured at the primary school entry point in grade one (or Kachhi level) where the most recent trends will be visible. For measuring the extent to which the equity goal has been met, these figures should be disaggregated for girl to expect a fully equitable distribution of opportunities by the end of the program period, because of difficulties servicing distant areas

and because of pockets of social resistance to education. In the third program phase suggested by this paper, attention should be focused on planning and developing activities specifically tailored to hard-to-reach target groups which until this point have not been served by program interventions.

V. BIBLIOGRAPH

Addleton, J.S. 1984. The Impact of International Migration to expect a fully equitable distribution of opportunities by the end of the program period, because of difficulties servicing distant areas and because of pockets of social resistance to education. In the third program phase suggested by this paper, attention should be focused on planning and developing activities specifically tailored to hard-to-reach target groups which until this point have not been served by program interventions.

V. BIBLIOGRAPH

Addleton, J.S. 1984. The Impact of International Migration on Economic Development in Pakistan. In Asian Survey, University of California Press May 1984

Addleton, J. S. 1985. A Demographic Note on the Distribution of Minorities in Pakistan. Al-Mushir, Vol. XXVII, No. 1, Spring 1985

Addleton, J.S. 1986. The Importance of Regional Languages in Pakistan. Al-Mushir, Vol. XXVIII, No. 2, Summer 1986.

Ahmed, Akbar S. 1976. Millenium and Charisma Among Pathans. Routledge and Kegan Paul, London and Boston.

Ahmed, Malik Ijaz n.d. Report on Comparative Study of Primary Education in Baluchistan. Planning Department. Quetta.

Anderson, Mary et al. n.d. The Impact of the Mosque Schools Policy on Girls' Access to Education in Pakistan (A Report on Research in Process). Harvard University BRIDGES Project.

Baluchistan 1985-86. Development Statistics of Baluchistan. Bureau of Statistics, Planning and Development Department, GOB.

Barth, F. 1953. Principles of Social Organisation in Southern Kurdistan. Universitets Etnografiske Museum, Bulletin No. 7, Oslo.

_____. 1959. Political Leadership among the Swat Pathans. The Athlone Press. New York.

Bhatti, M. A. 1987. Secondary Education in Pakistan: Perspective Planning. National Education Council, Islamabad.

_____ et al. 1988. Female Teachers in Rural Pakistan. National Education Council, Islamabad.

Baluchistan Province, n.d. Primary Education in Baluchistan. Department of Education.

Baluchistan Province 1987. Baluchistan Educational Statistics. Directorate of Education. Quetta.

Burki, Shahid J. What Migration to the Middle East May Mean for Pakistan. J. of South Asian and Middle Eastern Studies 3:3 Spring 1980.

Buzdar, Nek 1987. Socio-Economic Survey of the Makran Division of Baluchistan. USAID, Islamabad.

Chaudhrey, Nuzhat Parveen 1988. Incentives Study. Academy for Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM).

Durrani, Naeem, n.d. A Study of Parents' and Teachers' Conceptions Regarding Primary School Education. National Institute of Psychology, Islamabad.

Culbertson, Robert, et al. 1986. Primary Education in Pakistan. USAID, Islamabad.

Farooq, R.A. 1989. Teacher Training in Pakistan. AEPAM and BRIDGES, Harvard University.

Hassan, Iftikhar 1977. The Socio-cultural Variables of Dropout Syndrome in Rural Primary Schools of Pakistan. National Institute of Psychology, Islamabad.

Imperial Gazeteer of India 1984. Baluchistan. Sang-e-meel Publications, Lahore.

Kazi, Aftab A. 1987. Ethnicity and Education in Nation-Building: The Case of Pakistan. University Press of America, New York.

Khawaja, Sarfraz 1985. Primary Education in Pakistan and Other Asian Countries. AEPAM, Islamabad.

_____ 1985. Promotion of Girls' Education in the Context of Universalization of Primary Education. AEPAM, Islamabad.

Khawaja, Sarfraz and Ahmed Nawaz Malek, n.d. Construction of Cluster School Hostels for Female Teachers in Rural Areas of Pakistan. AEPAM, Islamabad.

Malak, Ahmed Nawaz and A. Rugh 1989. Education Goals, Curricula and Texts at the Primary Level in Pakistan. Background paper for BRIDGES study of classroom practices.

- MUST 1987. Statistical Data for the Year 1987-88 Regarding NWFP.
- Nyrop, Richard F. 1984. Pakistan, A Country Study. Foreign Area Studies. The American University, Washington, D.C.
- Osborne, Christine 1983. Pakistan. Longman Inc. New York.
- Pastner, Carroll McClure 1971. Sexual Dichotomization in Society and Culture: The Women of Panjgur, Baluchistan. Ph.D. dissertation, Brandeis University.
- Pehrson, Robert 1977 (compiled by Barth). The Social Organization of the Marri Baluch. Indus Publications, Karachi.
- PPP Manifesto November 1988. Information and Publicity Cell, Central Secretariat, PPP, Karachi.
- Schmidt, Ruth Laila 1987. Report on Mini-Survey of Pakistani Parents who are Educating their Daughters. Report submitted to the World Bank.
- Spooner, Brian and Allen Jones 1982. Baluchistan: An Introduction. Area Development Working Paper. Institute of Development Anthropology. Binghamton, New York.
- Spooner, Brian and Leah Glickman n.d. Baluchistan, Pakistan: A Socio-Economic Literature Review and Analysis. Document prepared for USAID.
- Tauhiddin, Mirza and S. Dawood Shah 1986. Rechecked Survey on Dropout Rates in Urban Areas. AEPAM, Islamabad.
- UNICEF 1981. Nutritional Status of Infants and Children: Survey Report for Gwadar, Kalat and Loralai Districts of Baluchistan.
- Wirsing, R.G. n.d. The Baluchis and Pathans. Minority Rights Group, London.
- World Bank 1988. Education Sector Strategy Review. Report No. 7110-PAK. Washington, DC.

ANNEX 1

SELECTED FIELD OBSERVATIONS

The following are field observations gathered as a result of several field trips made to Baluchistan and NWFP over a year and a half during work on the BRIDGES Project and in preparation for the Social Soundness Analysis for the PED Program. Overall, conditions in NWFP are more favorable to both quantitative and qualitative changes in the educational program and therefore many of the following details concentrate on the more difficult conditions of Baluchistan. It is difficult to generalize widely about conditions of schools in the two provinces, as details vary so widely. These comments therefore should be taken as illustrative rather than definitive.

Related to facilities and staffing.

Any construction of girls' schools in rural Baluchistan must be preceded by vigorous recruitment of teachers. The situation is not encouraging because of the small numbers of females who presently graduate at the qualifying level of matric. Reducing the qualification to middle pass level may be necessary in the short run, but this change cannot help but affect the quality of programs. The long term solution is to take steps to increase the numbers of girls completing the middle and secondary level and to provide more attractive conditions for entering the teaching profession.

Because of the acute shortage of female teachers, in the short term, it is questionable whether Baluchistan can afford other than short preservice training courses of a few weeks duration, in explicit teaching methods designed to prepare teachers minimally for coping in the classroom. At present the only training available for women is an in service PTC course given in the Pishin GCET with a potential output of 150 teachers a year.

In Baluchistan, the female DEO for Sibi and Harnai said there was an "infinite" need for girls' schools, "theoretically one for every village", but she admitted that she had scraped the barrel clean in opening up a large proportion of the 50 schools in her area previously closed because of lack of teachers (she has had permission to use retired male and female teachers to staff the girls' schools, and uses buses to take teachers to rural areas within a reasonable distance of the town).

A similar and perhaps more critical situation exists in the Makran area where a number of girls' schools are closed because of lack of teaching staff.

In NWFP, school facilities are in such great demand that small private institutions are springing up to meet the need of middle and lower income parents who cannot find places for their

159

children in government schools, yet cannot pay the prices of better private schools. The availability of teachers is considerably better in NWFP though there are still problems finding women who will go to rural areas, and especially finding sufficient numbers to work in low enrollment areas such as Swat, Dir, and Chitral. There are six training institutions for women in NWFP, which educational authorities would like to expand by seven more, to reach students near their homes in every district. The training in most cases is preservice and seems to be planned with careful attention to the capacity of the system to absorb new teachers as well as to giving priority to applicants who come from areas where teachers are needed.

In the NWFP we visited training facilities for girls in Dirgai, Kohat, and Peshawar. At these places, and the same may be the case elsewhere, applicants for the PTC were usually at least double the number actually accepted. The competition was so keen in fact that authorities could take a quarter to a third of the applicants from over-qualified FA certificate holders.

The current GCET training institutions visited in NWFP could expand by two or more times using the existing facilities and staff, with the condition that greatly expanded hostel space be provided (since existing hostels are close to full). However, a better (because it addresses the distribution problem of female teachers), though more costly solution may be to build GCETs as requested by officials in NWFP at the district level, where many of the students who would not otherwise be allowed to attend a distant GCET could commute daily. At present, women of various remote areas are assigned to specific GCETs (Hazara girls go to Peshawar; Chitral and Dir girls go to Malakand, etc.) where they have little choice but to find local living accommodations. If the more costly option of building new GCETs were taken, hostel space in currently existing institutions may prove sufficient because there would be fewer students living away from home. Current institutions would not need to be expanded and their extra space and staff could be used, along with that of the new GCETs to expand short in service courses. Because of the greater proximity of the localized GCETs to serving teachers, it is likely that more could take advantages of their services if properly funded.

In areas visited in Baluchistan, boys' schools were comparatively more crowded than girls' schools. In Sibi and Harnai, in ratio of actual to sanctioned teachers, the boys' schools in urban areas tended to have more than the sanctioned number of teachers while in the rural areas there were sometimes fewer than the sanctioned number, i.e. male teachers were poorly distributed, probably because of lack of living arrangements in rural areas and the difficulty of commuting daily to far off villages. Male teachers who were commuting, usually by foot, suggested that they

would be better able to do their work if residences were made available to them at the rural school where they worked. In the girls' schools in rural and urban locations in Baluchistan, there were usually fewer than the sanctioned number of teachers.

None of the schools we visited in Baluchistan provided shelter for all the grades and usually at least half of the children were outside in the school yard. The tendency was to provide shelter for the higher grades even though the number of children in those classes was small in proportion to the size of the rooms. Whenever the Kachi/Pakki class was located in a classroom, it was too large for the space available. The more usual solution was to locate the class in the school playground where there was sufficient space. The class often could not be divided into two more manageable classes because of a lack of teachers. Thus the smallest children enrolling in school for the first time often must endure the largest classes and the most extreme weather conditions. A good architect should be able to make plans which respond to the variable needs for space in schools and provide alternatives that could be adapted to specific conditions.

Buildings are higher quality, better maintained, and contain more classrooms per school in NWFP. They are usually also better ventilated and lighted. The main exceptions are urban schools in NWFP which are located in older buildings in densely populated areas, and the so-called shelterless schools which are buildings donated by private individuals and institutions and may be not up to standard.

Few of the schools visited in Baluchistan had toilets, including some of the urban girls' schools. Girls must either use a designated spot, usually between the boundary wall and the wall of the school, or long recesses are given part way through the school day so the girls can go home--a practice which cuts substantially into the instructional day. Some do not return after the break.

Three of the four girls' schools visited in Sibi and Harnai had residences for teachers; none was being used as a residence at the time, though some were used as classrooms. Many of the schools visited in eastern and northern Baluchistan, whether boys' or girls', had children of the opposite sex attending, usually up to the level of grade three but sometimes higher. This does not mean, however, that all parents would accept this idea. Usually parents sent their children to opposite sex schools for practical reasons such as the proximity of the school and the absence of the appropriate sex school, or because they believe--a prevalent idea that female teachers are better with small children. In communities north of Quetta and in the Makran area of Baluchistan where village was synonymous with an extended family group, parents expressed a willingness to send their girls to coed schools. In NWFP, there also seems to be general acceptance of the idea (See Schmidt)

61

Most of the girls enrolled in the schools of Sibi and Harnai were from families who are either outsiders or settlers who came to the area at the time of Partition, such as Punjabis, Sindis or Hindus. Very few Pathan or Baluch sent their girls to school in these areas. In one Pathan village, a community leader reported that the parents would send their girls to school if the following conditions were met:

- o separate single-sex schools with boundary walls
- o female teachers
- o situated within the village near the girls' homes
- o situated within their ethnic community and not mixing with other communities (in the same village they see the boys' school as a way to bring Pathan, and Murri Baluch together to avoid future conflicts)

After saying this, he then noted that though the parents of the community would accept girls' education under these conditions, the land owning malek would not, and so they would be unable to send girls under any conditions. Local maleks and sidars have a great deal of influence over whether education is possible in the communities they control. (This is an important factor in many areas of rural Baluchistan). It would be useless to mount efforts to provide education programs in such communities without the express cooperation of these leaders and some sort of assurance they will allow the village children to go to school. (Education removes workers from their lands and ultimately from their control).

In both rural and urban areas of Baluchistan the demand for boys' education is much higher than for girls' education, though demand for girls' education appears to be growing rapidly especially in areas where fathers have migrated outside the country for work. Given the substantial demand for both boys' and girls' education and the low levels of literacy overall, it would seem appropriate to exert efforts and resources at providing educational opportunities wherever the demand exists, rather than diverting resources into an incentive program at the primary level which might increase a demand that it may not be possible to meet fully.

Boundary walls

Boundary walls are considered essential by school authorities, and do appear to have many useful features. Parents consider them essential for the security of their daughters. They allow the planting of trees (sheep can't eat them) which makes a major difference in the comfort level of classrooms. Arbors can be made which rest on the walls to support vines or woven mats in warm weather to shelter outdoor classes. Vandalism can be

62

controlled more easily, etc. We found that most of the schools in both Baluchistan and NWFP with boundary walls had gone to considerable effort to landscape the grounds even when nettle boundary walls had to be constructed.

Equipment

Blackboards, sitting mats, and fans are the most essential features of classrooms. Convenient but not essential are low desks that can be used for storing books and writing on from a position on the floor.

Blackboards are almost always poor quality. Quality control should be required if they are to become part of the assistance package. They can be fixed to the wall in single grade classrooms but need to be moveable for multigrade and unsheltered classes. The moveable boards are more convenient when double-sided so they can be used to preserve material used on a daily basis like alphabets and numbers. If the boards are free standing they need to rest on some kind of firm tripod support that allows writing from an upright position and is easily transported by young children.

Teacher chairs and desks are considered important by teachers who otherwise can not sit down during the day (the chair allows them to command a view over the students). They are more important than student desks and chairs which are only appropriate in schools where there are few students and a great deal of space, or for children who are older and have reached the middle school level. They may also be appropriate in some urban schools where there is sufficient space and where, in their homes children are accustomed to sitting up off the floor. Desks only work under certain conditions (many were stored in a classroom in one school because there were too many children for them to be used conveniently). Student desks and chairs restrict flexibility in grouping children and are almost always the wrong size for the children.

In general, furnishings provide respectability to a school and people take pride in a well-equipped school. Everywhere teachers equate good furnishings with good education, even though they will admit, when pressed, that good teaching can go on without such amenities. This is part of the prevailing view that a good school is presentable, orderly, clean, and well-disciplined. It is easier for staff to build these characteristics in a school when they have available the means to make things orderly: gongs, water canisters, rows of desks, boundary walls, blackboards, and other objects that delimit the time and space set aside for certain activities.

Related to teachers

Teachers with personal problems such as long commutes, heavy expenses for housing, problems with local leaders in the

communities where they teach, and living at a distance from family members are generally more consumed with their own problems than with motivation to teach well. They are more likely to absent themselves from school, to shorten the school day because of the time required going and coming from school, and to consume considerable amount of time trying to transfer out. The schools visited where teachers were not local all suffered in some degree from these problems, especially from rapid turnover.

Where no local teachers are available, providing residences in schools for male teachers might alleviate some of these problems in boys' schools. Residences are much more likely to be used by males in rural areas than would residences for females. It seems better to encourage male teachers to work in rural areas by providing residences (a one-time cost) than to provide exceptional allowances (a recurrent cost). If residences are provided, they should be built to double as classrooms when not used by teachers.

Local teachers appear to give better service; are personally happier in the job; can be controlled better by the local community; and they can speak the local language. They usually are happy to teach in their villages without any special allowances. They should be given priority in recruitment and in admission to teacher training schools (perhaps even scholarship help as an incentive to candidates who live in areas where teachers are hard to find). On the negative side, DEOs often don't like to assign teachers to their own communities because, with community support, they are hard to control. One commented that "Outsider teachers try to do a good job so they can get transferred elsewhere." Another complained that the quality of children's Urdu may be lower if the teachers spend too much time using the local language. To avoid these problems and to maintain his own influence, one DEO was found to be assigning teachers from a town to a village and local villagers to schools in the town, requiring both sets of teachers to walk over five kilometers a day, one-way, to their respective schools.

Quality of instruction

Suggestions that primary teachers be paid according to their general and professional qualifications might do much to encourage teachers to spend the time to improve their capabilities. It might also encourage more qualified candidates to enter primary school teaching. One teacher was found to be skipping a whole unit of fifth grade math because she had never taken geometry when she went to school and therefore was unable to teach the subject herself.

Most teachers agree that the training they received, if any, was not relevant to the classroom situation. A DEO in Sibi said that they weren't particularly interested in a teacher training institute in Sibi, although the nearest institutes were three

hours away by car and few teachers had received any training. The reason: "untrained teachers are better than trained teachers". Many teachers expressed dissatisfaction with training in NWFP and other provinces and felt they had learned little to prepare themselves for classroom teaching.

The major female candidates available for teacher training in Baluchistan would be locally resident Punjabis and settlers who consider teaching one of the few forms of employment appropriate for educated women. These women are graduating from middle and high schools in increasing numbers every year. Because they are educated, according to several reports, it is necessary for them to wait some years for young educated men in their age group to become established enough to marry. Educated females don't usually marry before 25 and often even later. They therefore have several years when they want to teach, and most continue on after marriage to avoid losing their teaching benefits. Teacher training institutes could draw upon this pool of willing candidates if there were salary incentives to become professionally qualified as suggested above.

Instructional materials outside of textbooks and teaching kits locked away in a cabinet are hard to find in classrooms. Sometimes the walls of rooms are adorned with faded verses from the Koran, or maps of Baluchistan and Pakistan. All are hung too high to see easily and may only be rarely used for classroom instruction. It is doubtful whether instructional materials, unless tied directly to the curriculum in some compelling way, would be used by teachers. The most useful would be simple plasticized charts of the alphabet and numbers for Kachi and Pakki grades, with instructions in small letters suggesting different ways the teachers might use them, and indicating how high they should be hung for young children to use them properly. The alphabet charts should avoid pictures which may be confusing to children with different mother tongues.

The numbers should be associated with sets of objects (the example in one but not all of the teaching kits I saw should be avoided; there, for some unknown reason, each number is associated with an incorrect set of objects). Any instructional materials of this kind should be tested first on a limited basis to insure that there are no mistakes in presentation or problems in usage (the textbooks are full of these kinds of problem). Observation in the early grades suggests that the teacher would be saved a great deal of classroom time spent daily in writing these sequences on the blackboard if simple, easy to read charts were available. Further it might more profitably encourage teachers to require children to refer to the charts rather than to trace endlessly over teacher produced letters and numbers. Instructional charts for the higher grades should be produced sparingly and in every case tied directly and usefully to the curriculum. It is better not to provide such charts if they are only used to decorate the walls (one class we saw had five of the same maps of Pakistan glued to the wall) or similarly if they are

65

so lacking in relevance that the teacher forgets to bring it out once a year. Materials which lack relevance reinforce the teacher's notion that bureaucrats don't really understand the situation and causes them routinely to ignore any innovations that are sent to them.

The problems teachers have with textbooks are probably the most vexing they face. This is most critical in the Kachi and Pakki years, and to lesser degrees in grade two. If textbooks were improved for these three years and teachers were trained in more effective ways to teach these grades, dropout rates almost certainly would decline. This becomes clear when watching the classes in action. The Pakki, or grade one class, is an official grade reported under regular enrollments. It has become the practice in most, perhaps all, schools to extend the Pakki class down one and often two years to "get children used to going to school". These additional children are often unofficial unregistered children or they appear for several years in combined Kachi/Pakki grade, as though they are new entrants every year (thus making the official registers appear as though there is a high dropout rate between grades one and two, which indeed there is, though not as large as it would appear).

The practice of accommodating so many children for several years in the same class is almost certainly a consequence of the difficulty of the early texts. It has become the practice in most schools to require a test of the Kachi children's mastery of the first primer book before allowing them to become full-fledged Pakki members. By that time the majority of students have become discouraged and dropped out.

When schools separate out the Pakki children their numbers are only a fraction of the large Kachi class. Typical rural schools usually do not have enough teachers to accommodate two classes and therefore they are likely to be combined.

One class which was a fairly standard example contained about 75 students varying in age from about three years to boys whose voices were beginning to change. New arrivals join the back rows in the room and if they stay more than a few days are given the first book (textbooks are given free in Baluchistan, but are in short supply in these early grades because of the number of children who come for a few days and drop out, taking their books with them). Teachers generally ignore these back rows except to keep a semblance of order in them. The new arrivals are gradually socialized into the chanting of alphabets and numbers, and patriotic verses that make up a good part of the Kachi/Pakki day. Another major chunk of time is spent writing alphabets and numbers on the clay washed boards called takhtis. Some classes do nothing but these two activities. Better teachers listen to each child individually reciting from their books--practically every child is at a different point in the work because of the

staggered way they join the class. More likely the teacher concentrates on getting the front rows through the requisite texts to promote them, after several years, into the second grade.

In the class in question, children in the back rows came for the three days we observed them, and had no individual contact with the teacher. For most of the time they sat doing nothing, and only joined in occasionally during the chanting. It is hard to blame the teacher who can not be sure these young children will stay long enough to make it worth his trouble. His energies are taken up by the older students who by their persistence have shown themselves worthy of his attentions. It is difficult to know how such a class could be effectively taught given the current problems with materials, and the huge numbers of children in various stages of progress. There is a need to improve the materials, and to limit the numbers in this class to children who are old enough to profit from instruction. It is unlikely, however, that parents or teachers will accept limitations on the ages of children until the texts are easy enough to be absorbed in a single year. If the numbers of children in these classes are not reduced, then improved materials will have to be almost self-teaching to accommodate the level and stages of the children.

What makes these texts so difficult? First is the fact that the materials are usually in a language that the children are not familiar with. When examples are presented of objects which start with an alphabetic letter, they are likely to have a local name which starts with another letter, thus causing more rather than less confusion. The primer which introduces the letters becomes increasingly more difficult with each letter. Besides presenting the letter, the book soon is showing how the letter is written in its three forms at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end of a word. Words are also introduced from the early pages of the primer, not always with a relationship to the letter in question. By the seventeenth letter, whole sentences are presented with no relationship at all to the letter ("My brother's wife gives me whey to drink"). Thus before the child has even mastered the letters of the alphabet, he or she must be able to read.

The same is true for the beginning math book where there are numerous confusions in the pictorial representations of "bigger than" "smaller than", etc. After this first unit, the second unit for the first grade requires the children to learn, among other things, the numbers from 1 to 100, certain fractions, decimals, the concept of zero, etc.

The Urdu book with which the grade one Pakki class starts is a reading book that children memorize. When asked, a child often cannot pick out individual words separated from their memorized context. A measure of the teaching quality at this grade level is whether a child can both read and understand individual words.

This capacity does not seem secure until grade three, when children may be able to pick up something now and decipher most of its content. In the time given to struggling with difficult texts children could progress a great deal further and with far greater comprehension if they were presented appropriate and well-sequenced materials.

Teachers in this Kachi/Pakki grade have, with few exceptions, become orchestrators of repetition, oral and written. Teachers' guides are said to exist but none were available in any of the schools we visited, and it is unlikely they would be used if they were not tied directly to individual lessons and specific material. Most useful would be instructions written directly into a text similar to that for the students, so that there would be no extra effort required to use them. The teachers are used to accepting advice and are all-to-eager to be told the "right way" to do things. They need suggestions for making schoolwork more interesting and productive, and need to be made aware of the implications for learning of the practices they use, such as calling mainly on those whose hands are raised, or giving children the answers rather than asking them for answers. Given the present constraints in instructional materials, however, the first remedy appears to lie in a more usable text.

Teachers complain that children forget everything over the summer holiday (June, July, and August) which comes in the middle of the school year (April to March in most areas). To change the school year so it starts in September would be a simple expedient that would allow continuity in the work of a grade level, avoiding some of the time devoted to review in the year.

Similarly, many schools have breaks which last up to 40 minutes to allow children to go home for snacks and bathrooms. Providing toilets in schools may enable the schools to shorten the break period and give more time to instruction.

The writing materials used by children at present are very difficult to use. While sharpened bamboo pens, painted tin slates, and wooden paddles washed with clay are ingenious and cheap, they have certain limitations. Much classroom time is spent on reclaying and drying the takhti boards, and if the teacher doesn't permit this activity, then they are only usable once in the school day. It is very disruptive of the large Kachi/Pakki classes when children are moving back and forth preparing their boards. In schools where water is difficult to obtain, the takhti water often doubles for drinking water.

Slate boards and chalk are easier to clean and use. Children carry wiper rags and sometimes a small bottle of water (otherwise they spit on the boards) to erase them. Slates cannot be used for homework because they smudge easily.

The bamboo pens are very difficult to use. They clog and almost never have the proper amount of ink. They need to be redipped

68

after every one or two letters. The ink spills easily and gets all over the children's clothes, books, and hands. The point of the pen must be sharpened frequently, a difficult task for a small child. If not done properly, the letters become thick and illegible. The takhti boards are small. To accommodate the numbers up to 50, for example, requires very tiny numbers. One blot and the number is lost. It cannot be changed until the whole board is rewashed. These problems with writing materials are very frustrating to small children.

ANNEX 2

SEQUENCING AND PHASING OF PED ACTIVITIES

This annex suggests a strategy for sequencing PED Program activities. The object is to show how program components can be brought on line in a timely fashion that allows for the maximum effect from program resources. Ideally, qualitative improvements should be installed before major expansion occurs in primary school construction to ensure that the new entrants into the system receive the best learning experience possible. Without these qualitative improvements, the effects of increased early enrollment may be lost, as children continue to leave the system prematurely before developing literacy skills.

The strategy proposed consists of three phases, the length of each to be determined by successful attainment of agreed-upon benchmarks. Each program component would proceed through the phases at its own pace but integrated into an overall timetable coordinated with other components.

I. Start-up phase. This phase prepares the way for the full operational stage in which both qualitative and quantitative components are ready for full replication and dissemination. The goals of this phase will be to put in place the activities designed to increase the teaching force, to prepare improved and tested instructional materials with guides for teachers, to develop materials-focused preservice and inservice teacher training courses, to train the trainers to teach these courses, and to construct new and expand old training facilities. Research would be geared to questions of policy relevance, related to operationalizing innovations.

II. Operational phase. During this phase each component becomes fully operational. The primary school construction will come up to speed to produce as many schools as possible within existing capacity. Instructional materials would be disseminated to successively wider geographic areas after short courses are given which teach teachers how to use them, supervisors how to supervise their use, and head teachers how to manage them. Research would be conducted into the causes of and solutions for the problems encountered during this phase.

III. Fine tuning phase. In the final phase, construction would continue at a pace appropriate to the capacity of the system and quality improvements would be evaluated, modified, and reassessed in a continuous feedback model. During this phase attention would also be turned to more complicated problems of the educational system, including experimentation with incentives to attract

those who are reluctant to enroll for some reason, alternative delivery systems for hard-to-reach children, incentives to attract better qualified individuals into teaching service, and a continuation of a program of research, development, and evaluation to provide more cost-effective, attractive, easily usable, and diverse instructional materials and other improvements.

PHASE I. The planning and start-up would contain the following activities:

- o Policy dialogue on quantity issues:
 - teacher incentives (pay scale, allowances)
 - construction priorities
 - school location criteria
- o Policy dialogue on quality issues:
 - qualitative improvement planning with relevant policy changes
 - coordination and integration of qualitative improvements
- o School location data collected and analyzed in usable form:
 - Large scale construction of middle schools
 - furnishings and equipment
- o Installation of AIOU middle and secondary certification programs
- o Expansion of AIOU distance teacher training program
- o Technical assistance to:
 - develop instructional objectives, sequenced, etc.
 - construct criterion referenced tests
 - assess the results of present learning
 - improve textbook quality
 - test improved texts and set up feedback cycle for continuous textbook improvement
 - improve textbook design and quality
 - develop annotated primary school guides for teachers
 - test guides in pilot schools
 - develop improved teacher training courses
 - produce teacher training materials tied to primary curricula improvements
 - train teacher trainers
 - develop management courses tied to the new primary curricula and instructional approaches, and
 - expansion of the existing GCETs (where necessary) and construction of new GCETs.

PHASE II: The operational phase will include the following activities:

- o installation of instructional improvements in schools (starting at grade one level and proceeding each year to successively higher grade levels)
- o continuation of the development and improvement cycles for instructional materials, and training
- o continuation of AIOU programs for middle, secondary, and teacher training programs
- o continuation of efforts to expand teacher supply
- o continuation of middle school construction
- o full-scale construction of primary schools, and
- o construction of cluster hostels (if evaluation shows this idea to work) in coordination with teacher needs for new primary schools

PHASE III. The fine tuning phase would include:

- o continuation of relevant activities from the two earlier phases
 - o experimentation on a small scale with incentives plan to attract difficult-to-enroll primary and middle school age girls
 - o experimentation with alternative delivery systems for hard-to-reach children
 - o incentive plan to attract better qualified individuals to teaching, and
 - o research activities which support other fine grained improvements
- 12