

PN-ABE-922

Dm n n
Please make
copy for ~~John~~ ✓ Done Done
and give ~~me~~ this back
p me PC - plus R.G. + K.D.
12/1 65829

Report on Gender Issues Consultancy

Submitted to:
Eugene R. Chiavaroli
Mission Director
USAID/Mali
Bamako

February 16, 1988

By: Virginia Caye
Lisa A. McGowan
International Center for Research on Women

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i.
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. OVERVIEW OF WOMEN IN PRODUCTION	3
A. Women's Productive Activities and Access to Resources	3
B. Demographic Variables	5
C. Additional Influences on Women's Roles	6
III. COUNTRY DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY STATEMENT: THEORETICAL OVERVIEW	7
A. Introduction	7
B. Problem Analysis	7
C. Problem Description	9
IV. PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS	11
A. Recommendations for Programming	11
B. Development du Haute Vallee	14
C. Livestock Project	26
D. Village Reforestation Project	30
E. Policy Reform	32
F. Other Findings	34
V. CONCLUSION	35
APPENDIX I LIST OF CONTACTS	
APPENDIX II FRANJENBERGER EXECUTIVE SUMMARY/FOOD CONSUMPTION SURVEY	
APPENDIX III BIBLIOGRAPHY	
APPENDIX IV DRAFT COPY OF FERNEA/CID REPORT	
A. Draft Scopes of Work for CID/WID Technical Assistants	
B. Recommendations for Farming Systems Research Project	
C. Future Research Recommendations	

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report summarizes the technical assistance provided to USAID/Mali through a consultancy by representatives of the International Center for Research on Women. The purpose of the consultancy, which was carried out collaboratively with the Consortium for International Development, was to assist USAID/Mali to better incorporate gender issues into its development programming.

The team approached the consultancy from the perspective that gender is an important variable to be considered in project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation to both improve chances of achieving project success and to avoid negative impacts from project activities. Because of a lack of statistical data, it was necessary to focus on broad issues and to develop an understanding about gender roles in Mali primarily through anthropological sources, extensive interviewing, and use of anecdotal information.

It is clear that women are partly or wholly involved in nearly all rural productive activities. While men generally provide the grains for family consumption, it is the woman who provides the fruits, vegetables, meat, milk, cheese, sauces, and oils they consume. From the sale of surplus production, the woman pays for medicines, clothing for herself and her children, dowries for her daughter, household utensils, transportation of goods to market, and food for family and religious celebrations. When grain harvests are insufficient, to the extent she is able the woman buys grains for family consumption. Artisanal and food production during the dry season provide food for the lean months; during times of drought this production is often the only buffer between hunger and starvation. The crucial productive role of women should be recognized, quantified where possible, and constructively incorporated into development planning and project implementation.

The full report analyzes and provides recommendations for all projects reviewed. Many of the recommendations are cross cutting, in that they are relevant to all of the projects. These recommendations are summarized below.

1. Disaggregate all data by both gender and ethnicity

In cultures where men and women have distinct responsibilities along the food chain, data collection which does not take into account their different activities may distort the agricultural picture. For example, because women often farm lands less fertile than their husbands, aggregating information about men's and women's fields may result in overestimating production. On the other hand, total agricultural production may be underestimated if women's own fields are not counted.

Flawed data will affect macro-economic planning; it can impede effective targeting of resources; and it limits the extent to which project impacts can be monitored. Finally, it assumes that despite individual differences in responsibilities and access to benefits, the project will enhance the family welfare. Disaggregation of data should take place throughout the development programming process, from problem identification to evaluation.

2. Develop monitoring systems that disaggregate data on project participation by and impacts on men and women, for both current and future projects. Ideally these monitoring systems should coincide to provide the data to assess overall portfolio impact and inform the programming process. It is recommended that a specialist be engaged (short-term) to develop monitoring systems for all current programs and to provide guidance in designing monitoring systems for future programs.

3. For current and future projects, establish decision points throughout the life of the project for adjustments based on analysis of the monitoring system results. Because this analysis will not be available overnight, it will be important to build into the amended project opportunities to make adjustments to the program based on the newly available information.

4. Inform project officers, contractors, consultants, counterparts of the need to include women in their survey sample. Most surveys that the team was able to review appear to have been based on interviews with male household heads to obtain information about the entire family. Because the household head cannot accurately reflect the practices, knowledge and attitude of female family members, the research results in most cases will be at best incomplete. They are likely to also be misleading.

Researchers interviewed indicated they had difficulty in reaching women, often because of the lack of female Malian enqueteurs to facilitate interviews with women. Several informants suggested that a good source of trained female extension agents to assist in surveys or to work in projects is the pool of female graduates from the Centre d'Apprentissage Agricole (CAA). Many female (and male) graduates of the CAA have been unable to find employment and are available.

5. Include in all appropriate USAID documents the requirement for disaggregation of data by gender. This should include Project Identification Documents (PID), Project Papers (PP), Requests for Proposals, Scopes of Work, Job Descriptions, etc. In the PID and the PP, gender disaggregation should be required in the Project Description, Implementation sections, the Logframe, and elsewhere as appropriate. Often gender disaggregated data in the Social Soundness Analysis is not incorporated into the actual project design.

6. Consider migration impacts on labor and skills availability in project design, including male and female labor migration, external and internal.

7. Because women are more easily reached by other women, use women trainers as much as possible. This is likely to mean specific efforts to include/expand training of women in all projects and may require expanded recruitment efforts.

In addition to the recommendations above, it is important to note that incorporating women more fully into development programs may initially involve additional management time. The use of private voluntary organizations (PVO's) may be an appropriate strategy to initiate these efforts. In selecting an implementing agency, however (PVO's, consulting firms) for project activities, the Mission should assess the implementing agency's ability and experience in reaching women. Where an implementing agency has insufficient outreach capability or experience, project planners might select an alternate implementing agency or include resources to strengthen the agency's capacity as part of the project. In selecting an implementing agency, also consider problems of mutually exclusive self-interest between beneficiaries and the implementing agency.

I. INTRODUCTION

This document summarizes the technical assistance provided to USAID/Mali through a consultancy by representatives of the International Center for Research on Women (ICRW). The technical assistance was provided under a cooperative agreement between USAID's Office of Women in Development and ICRW at the request of USAID/Mali. The consultancy was part of a collaborative effort between ICRW and the Consortium for International Development (CID), who worked as a team in gathering and analyzing information. However, the final report is being submitted in two parts, reflecting the areas of emphasis during the consultancy by each institution. This document represents Part I of the two-part report.

The purpose of the consultancy was to assist USAID/Mali to better incorporate gender issues into its development programming. Specifically the team reviewed and made recommendations on:

- current Mission projects with special emphasis on projects in the process of redesign,
- issues for discussion in the Country Development Strategy Statement, and
- subjects for follow-on research to be carried out by CID Technical Assistants in cooperation with USAID/Mali.

The consultancy was shaped by limited time to cover a wide and diverse range of projects and issues as well as extremely limited statistical data on women's participation in Mali's development. Therefore, it was necessary to focus on broad issues and to develop an understanding about gender roles in Mali primarily through anthropological sources, extensive interviewing, and use of anecdotal information. In both the anecdotal and occasional statistical data were found what appeared to be discrepancies. These may indeed have been discrepancies, or they may reflect regional diversity and cultural differences among Mali's many ethnic groups.

Unfortunately, there was insufficient time to disentangle all of the conflicting data and perceptions. Thus, some of the recommendations and descriptions of women's roles may not apply in every case. However, the team feels the broad analysis, the issues raised, and the essence of the recommendations to be valid and accurate.

The team approached the consultancy from the perspective that gender is an important variable to be considered in project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. More specifically, including gender as a variable in development programming will contribute to project success and help avoid potential negative impacts of projects. This approach is based on the findings of a report recently published by USAID's Center for Development Information and Evaluation (USAID/CDIE, 1986). The report, which evaluated

USAID projects over a ten year period, concluded that long term goals are more likely to be reached by targeting programs according to the division of labor within the family system; that is, finding the "fit" between project activities and sex-typed division of labor is important to project success. The team sought information from USAID staff and consultants, other donor agencies, Peace Corps staff and volunteers, host government officials, Malian research institutions, Malian and international nongovernmental organizations (NGO's), and other key individuals (See list of contacts in Appendix I).

From this literature review and extensive interviewing emerged a series of recommendations for overall USAID/Mali development programming and specific projects. It may be useful to note that many of the issues related to the participation of women in development activities also pertain to limited-resource Malians of either gender, since women often share with low income families the lack of access to resources and information. This connection surfaces in several parts of the document.

This final report is presented in two parts. Part I, submitted by ICRW, includes the Introduction, an Overview of Malian Women in Production, a review of the Country Development Strategy Statement, and Project Recommendations. Appendices provide supplementary information.

Part II will be submitted by CID at a later date, because the team member from CID travelled on to Chad from Mali and has not yet returned to complete her final report. Part II will contain recommendations on the Farmings Systems Research and Extension Project, follow-on research, and scopes of work for two specific research activities to be carried out by CID Technical Assistants. The draft Part II is included here as Appendix IV to show the full scope of the consultancy.

Finally, the team wishes to express its appreciation for the opportunity to work with the Mission and to thank the Mission staff for their cooperation and support. Special thanks are extended to Maimouna Dienapo, whose capable assistance greatly expanded the depth and breadth of our understanding of Mali.

II. WOMEN IN PRODUCTION

A. Women's Productive Activities and Access to Resources

Within the Malian household, there is a fairly strict division of labor and responsibility between men and women. In general, men manage and provide labor for the production of millet, sorghum, and maize, as well as for cash crops such as tobacco and cotton; they manage and care for animals and equipment used in animal traction; and they market bulk grain or cash crop production. The Malian woman produces both cash income and household consumption goods from artisanal and agricultural production, in addition to providing labor in the family and/or village communal fields farms and doing household chores. Table I on page 4 outlines the major activities of rural Malian women.

It is clear that women are partly or wholly involved in nearly all rural productive activities. While men generally provide the grains for family consumption, it is the woman who provides the fruits, vegetables, meat, milk, cheese, sauces, and oils they consume. From the sale of surplus production, the woman pays for medicines, clothing for herself and her children, dowries for her daughters, household utensils, transportation of goods to market, and food for family and religious celebrations. When grain harvests are insufficient, to the extent she is able the woman buys grains for family consumption. Artisanal and food production during the dry season provide food for the lean months; during times of drought this production is often the only buffer between hunger and starvation.

Despite the essential productive role of women, they are disadvantaged by their lack of access to land, capital, education, credit, transportation, tools, and other resources. One of the most widely noted constraints for women is the simple lack of time. Their workday is long, beginning at 5 or 6 o'clock in the morning, and finally ending at 11 or 12 o'clock at night. It has been estimated in a survey conducted by UNICEF (UNICEF, 1988) that during the rainy season, 6-7 hours a day are taken up with agricultural work, 6-7 with household work (cleaning, cooking, childcare, etc.) and the remaining 5-6 hours on activities such as the transformation of agricultural products, livestock, marketing, and the collection of fuelwood and water. *

There is as yet no data in Mali which measures the value of these many activities. Studies are needed to determine the approximate value of the goods and productive labor of women, including the value of both the labor expended in the village and family fields and the goods produced for auto-consumption and for sale. In planning and evaluating project interventions in

* In a World Bank survey, it was estimated that fully 42% of the households in a concession had to walk at 5 km a day to get water, which means that women spend two to two and a half hours a day on one task (ibid.)

TABLE I

RURAL WOMEN'S ACTIVITIESAgricultural Production:

- * Seeds, weeds, harvests, on family and/or village fields
- * Clears, seeds, weeds, and harvests from own field
- * Gathers fruit, nuts, leaves, etc. for food and medicine
- * Owns and milks livestock, especially small ruminants

Transformation of Agricultural Products:

- * Cleans, cards, and spins cotton
- * Hulls rice
- * Threshes and grinds millet and sorghum
- * Husks and grinds corn
- * Produces shea butter, palm oil, groundnut oil, etc.
- * Makes soap
- * Prepares condiments
- * Produces millet beer
- * Produces milk products

Other Artisanal Activities:

- * Pottery
- * Basket and mat weaving
- * Cloth dying
- * Leatherworking

Household Work

- * Cares for and educates children
- * Cares for the sick and elder family members
- * Cleans the home: dishes, laundry, seeping, etc.
- * Prepares meals
- * Carries meals to the fields
- * Collects fuelwood
- * Carries water

Marketing:

- * Transports and sells small grain surpluses
- * Transports and sells produce from own field
- * Transports and sells artisanal products

the area of grain and large scale cash crops such as cotton, it will be very important to accurately assess not only the value of women's labor, but the opportunity cost inherent in diverting women's labor from their traditional sphere to fill potential labor gaps created by project investments.

Until this data becomes available, it is useful to look at information on relative household contributions by gender. For example, World Bank surveys in the KBF zone of the Caye region of Mali (ibid.) indicated that 35% of men's income from the sale of cash crops went to the purchase of guns, bicycles, radios, or tin roofing. Other significant expenses for men include taxes and the purchase and care of livestock and equipment used in animal traction. Because the man's responsibility to the household remains constant--providing grains for consumption--increasing their income or the level of grain production will only benefit the larger family unit to the extent that it ensures adequate household supplies of that one commodity. Consumer items such as bicycles, which could potentially be used as labor saving devices or to transport goods to market, do not appear to be available to the women of a family--in fact, Peace Corps volunteers report that women often are obliged to pay male family members to transport their goods to market (be it on a bicycle or a cart). Radios could also be used to relay useful information to rural people in general, but again current use seems to preclude women.

UNICEF estimates, on the other hand, that virtually 100% of women's income and production is consumed directly by the family unit as whole (ibid.). The different relative contributions to household well-being produced by an increase in men's income as compared to that stemming from an increase in women's income is a crucial factor for policy makers to consider when designing projects with the goal of increasing caloric intake, overall consumption (medicines, clothing, etc.), and family well-being.

B. Demographic Variations

The many different ethnic groups in Mali each have their particular characteristics in relation to the division of labor within the family, the types of productive activity in which they engage, and the relationships between men and women. It is therefore necessary, in every project, to know with which ethnic group one is working, and how to target project activities to reach the intended beneficiaries.

Examples of cases where this is important abound. For instance, the Malinke women almost exclusively farm their own plots of land, rarely working in either the family or the village communal fields. Bambara women, on the other hand, work first in the family and/or village field, and then in their own plot in the evening. Peuhl women engage primarily in the processing and commercialization of milk, and artisanal activities such as basket and mat weaving and leatherworking. Only occasionally are they involved in agricultural production. Agricultural extension and technical assistance programs working in multi-cultural areas would have to be designed with these differences in mind if they are to be effective.

Other variables to keep in mind when designing research, surveys, or project implementation are the number of women in a family, their ages and relationships with one another, and the breakdown of responsibilities within the household. This becomes particularly important in determining target groups for extension and project activities, for instance, as the amount of time a woman would be able to find for an activity depends on her ability to share her workload with co-wives, daughters, sisters, etc.

C. Additional Influences on Women's Productive Role

It is important that planners and policy makers take note that factors such as changing weather patterns, migration, an overburdened economic system, the effect of external markets, and the increasing influence of the cash economy are acting together to change the balance of social and economic systems in Mali. Renegotiating a societal balance is the inevitable, and risky, result of the play of these changing influences. This is particularly true for women, who carry the double burden of having great responsibilities and very few tools with which to fulfill them. This is a condition of the poor generally, but it becomes more and more serious for women as internal and external efforts to develop the economy concentrate resources on the productive capacities of men, sometimes ignoring, many times displacing or destroying, the role of women in a given domain.

Women are a strong productive force in Mali, with a great deal of untapped potential. Mali cannot afford to have the productive capacity of this half of its population in any way diminished: women are needed as partners in the country's survival and development. The question for development planners is how to mitigate against the disadvantaged position of women, enhance their productivity, and in so doing strengthen the overall development process. This process can be aided through cost-effective project interventions that are carefully designed to complement the different economic roles of men and women in Mali.

The next section of this report discusses the role of gender in the analysis of development problems on which USAID is concentrating program resources. This is followed with a presentation of ideas on how to integrate women into specific projects that are both on-going and/or in the redesign stage.

III. COUNTRY DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY STATEMENT

A. Introduction

The Country Development Strategy Statement provides the analytical framework for USAID programming. From that analysis, sectoral emphases are chosen, problems within a sector are targeted, and specific projects to address those problems are identified and designed. Therefore, from a strategic point of view, the effort to take full advantage of women's productive roles in development strategies should begin with an analysis of gender issues in the CDSS, and then continue with this analysis through to project design and implementation. To that end, it is proposed that USAID include in the CDSS a broadened definition of the problems it has chosen to address, as discussed below.

B. Problem Analysis

In the Mission's action plan of 1987, the following factors were identified as three principal blocks to development in Mali:

1. policy constraints,
2. management constraints, and
3. lack of food security.

Accordingly, USAID has developed program strategies for removing (in the ideal) or reducing these blocks to economic progress. Some success has been achieved, and there are indications that more progress is likely. The current challenge for the Mission as it prepares the upcoming CDSS is to strengthen their strategies to most effectively contribute to the Malian governments long range goals of self-sufficiency and food security.

Given the crucial productive role of women, it is clear that their incorporation into the development process is not only advantageous, but also necessary for success. To do this, it would be useful to first expand the scopes of policy, food security, and management issues (as defined by AID in the Action Plan) to include the experience and contributions of women. While it is not expected that USAID could or should drastically change the nature of its interventions due to the insights gained in this type of exercise, it is important to understand the full range of issues and potential solutions involved, both in order to design effective new programs, and to minimize conflict that might arise from ongoing projects. Examples of this process are outlined below.

1. Policy constraints

To expand the analysis of policy constraints (which are currently being addressed through the policy reform program), USAID should consider not only formal sector capacities and constraints, but also those of the "informal sector", where most women entrepreneurs are concentrated. Simply removing some of the dead weight of economic structures through policy reform will not adequately promote the interests and proven capacities of the small entrepreneurs, both women and men, who form the stable base of any healthy developing economy. Unlike the formal sector, many of whose practices are shaped not by market forces but rather by government regulations and taxing policies, the informal sector is inherently market-driven. A disaggregated assessment of this dynamic sector would provide invaluable information about how, for example, goods are currently distributed throughout the country, and the role women play in the network.

This type of information would be useful in many projects. In the case of the grain marketing program, for example, it would complement and broaden current analysis to include the small scale grain trader, and inform the cost/benefit analysis of the promotion of large scale grain storage. For the Operation Haute Vallee project, it could be used to ease the transition from the OHV controlled input supply system to one functioning through the open market, and to increase the role of women in the project. This information would also give needed insight into the economic realities of the largest sector of the cash economy.

2. Management constraints

The importance of good management and efficiency within the government is highlighted in the Action Plan. The ability to accurately perceive the nature of a problem, place the problem into an overall framework that defines the parameters of possible solutions, choose a resolution strategy, commit resources, monitor progress, and adjust as necessary to achieve one's goal are the essentials of good management. Without this process, it is unlikely that any problem will be resolved in an appropriate or timely manner. Clearly the weight of flawed policy and management can cause stagnation, as evidenced by the current state of economic affairs in Mali.

For women (and men) with very few resources, whose margin of survival is small and whose access to outside resources is extremely limited, the question of good management is particularly essential, both in terms of promoting survival in the status quo, and using to advantage the resources that may become available through project interventions. If this ability is not built in at the base, as well as in higher levels of society, development efforts will forever be subverted to strategies of crisis alleviation. In order to truly build self-sustaining development, the policy of promoting improved management capacities must be extended to people at the base, including women.

3. Lack of food security:

Food security policy as currently defined revolves primarily around the production, storage and sale of millet and sorghum. Part of USAID's strategy to promote food security is to support the change in the grain distribution structure from one of complete government control to one of limited government control (storage for food emergencies and price control) and a greater dependence on market influences, while encouraging private sector investment in grain storage.

Grain production constitutes one column of support for overall food security in Mali. There is, however, another column of support, and that is the agricultural and artisanal production of women--their food, cash, and in-kind contribution to household subsistence. The exact quantity of this contribution is unknown, but clearly it is substantial, given the fact that women are the producers of almost all food that is not grain, and co-producers of the majority of the country's grains. As was noted earlier, in times of drought or poor harvest, women will purchase grains to make up for any family consumption shortfall, or if the man of the family is unable to pay all of the taxes, the women will contribute.

Because women's production is highly diversified, it is generally more stable, less subject to the swings in prices experienced in the grain market. Investment in women's productive activities, such as vegetable gardening, shea butter and condiment production, small livestock management, production of milk products, etc., would improve family income and consumption levels in good years, and provide a larger margin against low grain harvests due to "acts of God". Clearly, food security is based on a complex and varied food production capacity and which depends heavily on the input of women, and in order for policies to be effective in the long term, they will need to reflect that fact.

C. Problem Description

Having broadened the perception of the problems to be targeted by USAID's resources, it will be necessary to include in the CDSS an overview of the systems of food production, storage, distribution, marketing, and transformation, and the different roles played by men and women. Specific points that should be included in the discussion and analysis are:

1. a description of women's roles as farmers and farm laborers, artisanal producers, traders, and livestock owners.
2. the differential access to resources (such as education, land, credit, technical assistance, transportation, etc.) as determined by gender.
3. labor force participation disaggregated by gender.

4. the effect of current economic influences and agricultural policies on both men and women's patterns of production and the balance between them.

This report recognizes that there is a lack of hard data about women's economic and labor force participation, and therefore includes recommendations concerning specific data needs. However, it is also recommended that policy makers can and should search out other sources of information, such as those cited in the Bibliography and the List of Contacts. Some information needs will be met through the cooperative agreement of the USAID/Women in Development office and CID. It is also anticipated that background for many of the points included in the CDSS can be drawn from this report.

The preceding section of this report emphasizes the theoretical foundation for re-orienting program strategies to integrate women. The following sections proposes examples of gender issues to consider and techniques to use to integrate women into specific projects.

IV. PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Institutional Recommendations

As the team reviewed the USAID/Mali project portfolio, plans for future projects, and the data base that will inform the process of developing a Country Development Strategy Statement, several recurring themes related to incorporation of gender issues into programming surfaced. These concern the general process of program development and are therefore relevant to all projects. They are described in the form of recommendations below.

1. Disaggregate all data by both gender and ethnicity

In cultures where men and women have distinct responsibilities along the food chain, data collection which does not take into account their different activities may distort the agricultural picture. For example, because women often farm lands less fertile than their husbands, aggregating information about men's and women's fields may result in overestimating production. On the other hand, total agricultural production may be underestimated if women's own fields are not counted.

Flawed data will affect macro-economic planning; it can impede effective targeting of resources; and it limits the extent to which project impacts can be monitored. Finally, it assumes that despite individual differences in responsibilities and access to benefits, the project will enhance the family welfare.

Similarly, lack of disaggregation of data by ethnicity may provide a distorted perspective about the social situation. Among a few Malian ethnic groups, for example, women have very limited roles in crop production. Aggregating data about their participation with that of ethnic groups where women are very active in crop production does not enable planners to identify where resources should be directed -- to both men and women.

Because of the lack of gender-disaggregated information about gender roles relevant to current programs, this recommendation suggests the need for developing an expanded data base for all projects. Recommendations for project-specific research are described elsewhere in this report. In general however, the basic information base for projects should minimally include data on division of labor, farm management information, and access to resources and technical assistance disaggregated by gender.

Disaggregation of data should take place throughout the development programming process, from problem identification to evaluation. Thus in problem definition, for example, planners should look at the division of labor at the household level and explore if the problem at the household level is the same for men and women. To illustrate, if a male farmer were asked what is the most significant constraint to increased grain

production, he might reply labor at critical periods. For a woman, the problem might be insufficient fields or arduous labor in her husband's fields.

2. Develop monitoring systems that disaggregate data on project participation by and impacts on men and women, for both current and future projects. Ideally these monitoring systems should coincide to provide the data to assess overall portfolio impact and inform the programming process. For example, assessing USAID's impact on agriculture in the OHV region would be facilitated by the use of a subset of common parameters and indicators for both the DHV and the Farming Systems projects. It is therefore recommended that a specialist be engaged to develop at one time monitoring systems for all current programs and to provide guidance in designing monitoring systems for future programs.

3. For current and future projects, establish decision points throughout the life of the project for adjustments based on analysis of the monitoring system results. In the Livestock Project, for example, an improved Management Information System will provide planners with new information. However, this data will not be available overnight. Thus it will be important to build into the amended project opportunities to make adjustments to the program based on the newly available information.

4. Inform project officers, contractors, consultants, counterparts of the need to include women in their survey sample. Most surveys that the team was able to review appear to have been based on interviews with male household heads to obtain information about the entire family. Because the household head cannot accurately reflect the practices, knowledge and attitude of female family members, the research results in most cases will be at best incomplete. They are likely to also be misleading. Researchers interviewed indicated they had difficulty in reaching women, often because of the lack of female Malian enqueteurs to facilitate interviews with women. Several informants suggested that a good source of trained female extension agents to assist in surveys or to work in projects is the pool of female graduates from the Centre d'Apprentissage Agricole (CAA). Many female (and male) graduates of the CAA have been unable to find employment and are available.

5. Include in all appropriate USAID documents the requirement for disaggregation of data by gender. This should include Project Identification Documents (PID), Project Papers (PP), Requests for Proposals, Scopes of Work, Job Descriptions, etc. In the PID and the PP, gender disaggregation should be required in the Project Description, Implementation sections, the Logframe, and elsewhere as appropriate. Often gender disaggregated data in the Social Soundness Analysis is not incorporated into the actual project design.

6. Consider migration impacts on labor and skills availability in project design, including male and female labor migration, external and internal.

7. Because women are more easily reached by other women, use women trainers as much as possible. This is likely to mean specific efforts to include/expand training of women in all projects and may require expanded recruitment efforts.

In addition to the recommendations above, it is important to note that incorporating women more fully into development programs may initially involve additional management time. The use of private voluntary organizations (PVO's) may be an appropriate strategy to initiate these efforts. In selecting a PVO, consulting firm, or other implementing agency for project activities or short-term technical assistance, the Mission should assess the agency's ability and experience in reaching women. Where an implementing agency has insufficient outreach capability or experience, project planners might select an alternate implementing agency or include resources to strengthen the agency's capacity as part of the project. In selecting an implementing agency, also consider problems of mutually exclusive self-interest between beneficiaries and the implementing agency.

B. Development of the Haute Vallee

1. Project Description

USAID/Mali is revising and renewing its project assistance to the Operation Haute Vallee (OHV), a government rural development organization that assists farmers by providing credit and extension advice, especially in the production and marketing of cotton and tobacco. Under the new project, entitled Development of the Haute Vallee (DHV), efforts will concentrate primarily on restructuring of the OHV, especially agricultural extension; private sector/cooperative development; and possibly rural roads. OHV's range of activity may also be diversified to include promotion of vegetable crops and rice.

A project design team is currently in country to elaborate the project. A major project component, the development of farmer cooperatives, is being designed concurrently as a separate but complementary effort by the National Cooperative Business Association (NCBA, formerly CLUSA, Cooperative League of the USA.)

2. Role of Gender in Agricultural Production in the OHV

Agricultural responsibilities in Mali are differentiated by gender, although these role distinctions may blur somewhat within individual families. Among most ethnic groups in the OHV region, women make a significant contribution to agricultural production. They provide unpaid labor on family cereal fields at planting, weeding, and harvesting times. Women also provide unpaid labor for their husband's cotton crops and grow small amounts of cereals on their own fields.

By custom, most women of the OHV (and throughout Mali) have primary responsibility for providing the vegetables, peanuts and other ingredients constituting "the sauce" that accompanies the staple cereal. And in some areas, women are major rice and fonio producers.

Women have traditionally sold and bartered their own vegetables and rice crops; increasingly they are involved in some areas in small scale marketing of grains from their fields and those of their husbands's as well.

Husbands and wives maintain separate incomes, both with monogamous and polygamous marriages. Women have varying degrees of control over their own income; however, they have specific responsibilities concerning contributions to family expenses. Several studies have noted that nearly all of women's income goes directly to support the family; a larger percentage of men's income is used to purchase individual consumer goods and pay taxes.

3. Importance of Gender Roles in DHV Project Design

The DHV Project has a long term goal of increased agricultural production. Project activities are designed to improve OHV organizational processes to

facilitate increased production. Because of the traditional gender division of labor in agricultural production, gender will intervene in this project. The following illustrates how gender variables might be considered in project design.

The project seeks to increase use of inputs to raise cereal production. Shortage of labor already imposes a significant restraint on increasing production. If the project is successful in raising the level of inputs, (or if area under cultivation is increased through animal traction), labor requirements are likely to be increased. Since hiring labor is not cost effective, additional labor requirements will be met from existing sources. Women contribute labor on family cereal fields during much of the growing season but especially at critical bottleneck periods. Demand for their labor may be increased by the project; yet under current conditions, women do not participate in decision making regarding these fields, nor is it clear that they will receive benefits from increased production proportional to their additional work.

This can affect project success in several ways. For example, women can resist the additional work, affecting eventual yields. If women do contribute labor, their additional hours in cereal fields must be pulled from other activities. This may directly affect their other income generating activities and responsibilities that enhance family welfare such as food production from their own fields, gathering wild fruits and vegetables, drawing water, etc. In this case, cereal production may increase without improving overall family welfare. Thus, consideration of how gender ultimately affects project outcomes should be included in designing strategies for increasing food production.

Gender variables in agricultural production can be used to strengthen the DHV project. For example, women currently are responsible for producing vegetables for family consumption and local markets. Planners could strengthen their project by building on women's traditional vegetable production skills, providing technical assistance to increase the productivity of this traditional responsibility. On the other hand, targeting commercial vegetable production activities to men would necessitate training them in many of the skills women already possess. It may also displace women producers, whose harvest goes to the family with the surplus sold to meet family expenses. Since women contribute a greater percentage of their income directly to the family, planners should carefully consider how to target extension and credit activities for the most effective enhancement of family income.

There is the additional factor that men's cereal production contributes carbohydrates to the family diet, while women's agricultural production and gathering provides oils, protective vitamins and protein. The traditional division of responsibility for the diet that provided the necessary nutritional balance may be affected by changes in patterns of food production.

Gender is important at the OHV organization level because it is through the organization of OHV that all information is channeled to and from the field. Cultural factors constrain contact between male extension agents and women farmers. This limits the access of women to technical assistance and ultimately output. It also affects feedback into the system about problems concerning women's tasks in production. For example, time-consuming labor for seeding, weeding, and harvesting is an acknowledged constraint to increased production. Much of this labor is provided by women (and youth). However, there appears to be no activity in OHV to address this problem through such things as promotion of manual plows (now being introduced in parts of Senegal.) Inattention to these kinds of problems may be due in part to the lack of access of family laborers to technical assistance planners and providers. Project designers should consider this gender and economic variable as they consider structural changes within the OHV.

The issues above are necessarily described in broad strokes. Specific economic analyses examining the relative value of targeting project interventions according to division of labor and ultimate benefit to the family are not feasible because of the lack of data. Yet the potential net financial impact on the family from increasing the productivity of women's labor or diverting their labor from their current activities is an important issue to be addressed. Existing research in Mali and in many other parts of Africa substantiate the fact that all or nearly all of women's income is spent on family welfare. Increasing their productivity may provide a very effective way in the long term to improve family welfare. Recommendations on how this might be undertaken follow.

4. Overall Project Recommendations

The ICRW/CID team departed early in the design phase of the DHV project. Hence the recommendations that follow are directed towards the issues in the project, rather than to specific proposed strategies for addressing those issues. They are outlined according to the major thrusts of the project. Due to the limited time for project design, some of the recommendations might be included as activities in the early phases of the project.

a. Develop a more complete understanding/data base of the gender differences in the farming systems in the OHV. This would entail some initial data collection and systematic disaggregation of data in all future project studies. To the extent that the initial data collection is coordinated with the Farming Systems Research and Extension Project, it would be important to ensure that the data is readily available to DHV and OHV staff.

Because gender disaggregated data is not currently available, the DHV project design should include decision points in the first year of the project that enable modifications based on new information. Such decision points should address issues of credit, technical assistance, crop emphasis and rural infrastructure.

b. Develop monitoring systems that enable planners to measure both the participation of men and women and also the project's impact on them. Monitoring systems should enable planners to assess at the family level changes in income, income distribution, division of labor, and other changes in the family's life because of the project.

c. At the risk of being repetitious, it is again recommended that planners calculate the cost/benefit to the family, when project activities that might alter traditional division of labor and access to resources are considered, given the relative contributions of husbands and wives to the family welfare. This calculation, which would supplement conventional calculations concerning anticipated increased production, should be factored into analyses of internal rates of return.

d. In assessing the costs and benefits of new crops, planners should consider the effects of introducing new crops on the total farming system, from production to consumption. Female Malian informants indicated that some rural women are concerned about the promotion of corn production because of the extra labor required to pound it into usable form (women's responsibility.) In this example, planners might consider whether or not the promotion of corn also requires introducing corn milling machines, and the cost/benefit of a two-pronged project.

5. Extension

With reorganization of the OHV, some of the community-level extension staff positions (Chef de Secteur du Base) may be eliminated. In this scenario, extension staff at the next level, the Zone d'Expansion Rural (ZER), would redirect their activities to work more at the village level with literacy trainers and with designated representatives of village groups. This presents two problems for working with rural women's groups. First the number of female literacy trainers is extremely limited, and as noted earlier, cultural values limit contact between women farmers and male trainers.

Second, ZER interest in working at this level, especially with groups of women farmers may be dampened by the lack of prestige, the potentially greater effort needed to increase production by farmers with fewer resources, and the logistical constraints which smaller, poorer groups may present.

Specific recommendation concerning extension follow.

a. The DHV Project design should address how women's organizations may obtain access to ZER technical assistance teams; specifically, how women will know that they might receive such technical assistance and how they can obtain the assistance itself. This may involve increasing the number of female extension agents, especially in the event that the Chef de Secteur du Base positions are retained.

b. The Project Paper should include decision points in the first year to incorporate incoming gender disaggregated data on food production systems

and the results of a new OHV pilot program involving four female extensionists. Specifically these decision points should enable incorporation of new data and the lessons from the pilot program into efforts to broaden extension contacts to women in the DHV project activities.

c. The Project Paper should explore how women might obtain technical assistance in the crops women traditionally grow such as vegetables and peanuts.

d. Finally, the redesigned OHV program and structure should include the capability to provide extension training in management skills for groups of both men and women.

6. Literacy

Under the OHV reorganization, literacy trainers are likely to assume a larger role in coordinating technical assistance to village groups. Currently, in the OHV region there are 180 functioning literacy centers, of which 20 are female and 29 are mixed male and female. The remaining are male. Mixed centers are frequently attended predominantly by male clients.

According to one recent report, OHV's literacy activities constitute about 1% of its total overhead costs. Given this low budget, the extent to which OHV's Direction d'Actions Integrees and the Direction d'Alphabetisation Fonctionnelle et Linguistiques Appliques (DNAFLA) can reasonably be expected to carry out an extended mandate needs exploration.

Cooperating groups are intended as the main vehicle for providing technical assistance and credit. Currently such groups need to have literate members or must hire a literate person to assist in obtaining credit. This has been a barrier to women, who have significantly lower rates of literacy in Mali. An expanded literacy program within the context of agricultural development would be an opportunity to broaden OHV's outreach in general and to women in particular.

Strengthening the OHV's Division d'Activites Integrees and DNAFLA would be a cost effective method of expanding the extension network, because literacy trainers are not paid by the GRM. Recurrent costs would be limited to the costs of maintaining the headquarters staff. And because literacy trainers are from and chosen by the village, problems of trained workers leaving villages and/or not being accepted by villages would be minimized.

Specific recommendations concerning literacy follow.

a. Mechanisms for strengthening and expanding the literacy functions of OHV in coordination with DNAFLA should be explored. Although not all current USAID funding for literacy programs has been spent, interviews with representatives of women's organization suggest that this is not due

to lack of interest in literacy training. Understanding both the demand and supply sides of literacy training may require a separate study by a specialist in literacy programs. On the supply side such a study might explore the opportunities and constraints to increasing the number of female literacy trainers and how to develop mechanisms for working with women's organizations in the provision of technical assistance.

b. On the demand side, factors to be assessed should include constraints to women's attendance at literacy classes (class times are inappropriate, classes are targeted at young women, materials are not interesting, programs do not take advantage of greater leisure time of women with daughters-in-laws, etc.) and how to build on existing social structures. For example, mothers have significant influence over their sons and daughters-in-law. Drawing on this influence in a systematic way might increase the opportunities to reach both men and women.

c. Literacy programs from other countries should be studied for the insights they can give and for the innovations they have used to deal with many of the same problems the Malian effort now faces. For example, highly effective literacy programs have been developed that incorporate teaching methods especially designed for the adult learner that has never been to school, and that also promote the development of critical capabilities and community organization. This type of approach might fit particularly well with the effort to encourage traditional associations in Mali to organize for extensive economic and social activities.

d. Planners should also consider activities to strengthen the literacy program such as small grants for literacy groups with clearly designated amounts for women for appropriate technology/labor saving devices.

e. It is also recommended that training materials for women be developed on financial management, marketing, and other production/marketing skills.

7. Expansion of Rural Infrastructure

If road construction is included in the project design, the following is recommended.

a. On-going studies to monitor the effect of new roads on the production and marketing of goods by small producers, both men and women should be built into the project design. Roads will enable medium and large scale producers and traders (those who can afford vehicles) to aggregate small quantities of goods into larger volumes and transport them to market. Traders who carry their goods to market on bicycles and on their heads may be displaced.

An initial study of areas where roads were built one, two, three and four years ago would help identify where problems might have arisen. It will

be important to obtain information from both men and women. Baseline surveys should be carried out in selected villages in the areas where the road will be constructed with monitoring surveys continuing during the life of the project to see the impact on small scale producers and marketers. Analysis of the results of these surveys would enable project staff/GRM to assess if displacement takes place and what strategies should be considered to deal with the displacement. The surveys are not envisioned to be extensive but rather of the "rapid reconnaissance" genre to give planners an idea of what is happening in the villages along the road.

b. Women should be included in the survey samples and should be asked questions related to their economic activities, such as vegetable production, as well to their domestic activities.

8. Cooperative Development

Under a separate but complementary contract, the National Cooperative Business Association (NCBA) will work with the DHV design team and the GRM to develop village level cooperatives to act as the main vehicle for credit and technical assistance.

a. Gender Roles in Village Associations

Gender is an important variable in the formation and functioning of groups in Mali. Men and women have traditionally been involved in village level associations or "tons" through which self-help activities are carried out. Most tons are organized according to sex and age. Mixed male and female groups do exist but it has been suggested that within the mixed groups, women have less access to resources and rarely participate in decision making. Women are more likely to receive technical assistance through women-only groups than through mixed associations.

b. Recommendations

1) To the extent possible, efforts to strengthen the capability of groups as a transmitter of extension and credit should build on existing groups and social structures.

2) The NDBA baseline data base and monitoring systems should disaggregate by gender data about the village associations assisted. Where mixed cooperatives are assisted, monitoring systems should measure participation of and benefits received by both men and women.

3) The project objectives and indicators, in the narrative and logframe, should target the number of men's and women's organizations to be assisted.

4) Information should be collected on successful Malian cooperatives and nonformal associations, including women's associations, to identify factors leading to success and thus inform the on-going process of cooperative development.

5) Because data collection about cooperatives will be continuous process, decision points should be built into the project design to allow adjustments to project implementation plans. For example, the implementation plan should allow for assessment at regular intervals of the effect of requirements for full cooperative status and technical assistance on various kinds of farmer groups, including women.

9. Credit

a. Program Description

OHV's credit program is highly focused, providing access to inputs (primarily fertilizer) for farmers growing cash crops such as cotton and tobacco. Originally giving credit only to individuals, since 1984 the program has concentrated more heavily on group credit.

As part of the "privatization" efforts of the GRM and USAID program, the OHV has entered into an agreement with the National Agricultural Development Bank (BNA). The BNA provides credit directly to those groups who, after having established a track record of good repayment with the OHV, were "worthy" of credit from a commercial bank. To date, OHV maintains the technical assistance, and credit assessment and monitoring tasks for the BNA loans, as well as for direct OHV credit. It is expected that BNA will eventually develop its own field capabilities. At the time this report was being written, it was envisioned that OHV might concentrate on developing the capacity of groups to use credit, maintaining the risk-taking role common to development interventions in credit markets. The following section is therefore assuming that will be the case.

b. Gender Roles in Credit

As was noted earlier in this report, women's access to productive resources such as adequate tools, good land, information, and time is extremely limited. This is equally true for credit. Under the current OHV program, there are virtually no women recipients of credit. One reason for this is simply that OHV's extension agents, through whom applications for credit are channeled, do not work with women's groups. (The Action Integree of OHV is about to implement an experimental program using women SE's (Chefs de Section de Base) to work with women's groups. This experience will provide valuable insights and information into the options for reaching women in the OHV region, and should be carefully monitored). In addition, the program as it is currently structured supports investment in cash crops that are generally produced by men.

The redesign of the OHV could provide the project with the opportunity to extend its credit service to women's groups. Given the project's limited resources, its current emphasis on transferring management functions to village groups, and its goal of increasing food production and family incomes, the creation of a credit system designed to fit women's expressed needs emerges as the most cost-effective and responsive choice of project interventions. Because women are engaged in highly diversified production, most of which is food, a properly managed credit program equally accessible to women would help fulfill OHV's goal of promoting within the zone a sustainable increase in agricultural production and income through the diversification of production and improved access to financial and material inputs.

The importance of including women in the OHV's proposed strategy of diversification and increase of production stems from the nature of their role in the subsistence of the household. The culturally determined responsibilities of the women for the health and well-being of the household are vast, and unlikely to lessen in the near future. Women's lack of resources tie them to laborious and inefficient modes of production, which in turn often means the family survives at a subsistence level. Women's access to training and credit would go a long way toward removing production constraints caused by lack of information and financial resources.

The question of credit will be tied to that of group development, and is therefore also closely linked to the quality of technical assistance, literacy training, and management training that should become available in the new phase of the project. The new or modified form of these services has yet to be determined, which complicates any effort to suggest specific methods for carrying out a credit program responsive to the needs of both men and women producers. The following recommendations, therefore, are of a general nature and should be considered in the design of any credit program intending to provide equal access for men and women.

c. Recommendations

- 1) The intermediary institution providing the credit services to women, be it the OHV, a cooperative development organization, or some combination of the two, should be provided with technical assistance to ensure the proper design of the extension and credit programs for women.
- 2) The design of the project should include plans to conduct and analyze within the first year surveys that establish base-line data on women's income generating activities. The studies should be designed to give an understanding of the constraints and potentials for women in production, transformation, and marketing activities, and should use women surveyors and women informants.
- 3) Because women's income generating activities are highly diversified, and do not lend themselves to generalizations about the efficacy of specific inputs, credit funds should not be targetted to pre-determined inputs. (An added advantage to this approach in the substantial cost savings derived by cutting out the need for any sort of input delivery system.)
- 4) Repayment schedules and the size of loans should be flexible, taking into account the nature and flow of cash in women's economic activities. For example, men's cash crops are often sold all at once after harvest, producing a large sum of money at one time, allowing a lump-sum form of repayment. Women tend to produce and sell in small increments, a factor which needs to be considered in establishing repayment schedules and in determining a system of credit follow-up.

5) The project should explore using the internal unity of a group and the demonstrated ability to save and invest groups funds as a necessary and sufficient condition for credit eligibility. The advantages of this approach are many, as outlined below:

a) traditional women's groups generally have a high degree of internal unity, which is very effective internal control mechanism.

b) savings are effectively linked to investment and credit (an important area to be explored are the traditional savings associations called tontines, where women engage in group savings for consumption rather than investment. Encouraging investment of group resources in productive activities is a very low-cost, potentially high-return project intervention that is not forever dependant on donor input, and which recognizes and encourages the capacities for self-sustaining development.)

c) the experience of having saved and invested as a group serves to sharpen the management skills of the group, and give members the practical experience which will strengthen their capacity to work as an effective productive unit. In other words, it serves as a kind of dry run, or in-house training tool.

d) the demonstrated ability to save and invest serves as an extremely useful benchmark for planning, monitoring, and evaluation.

6) Literacy, bookkeeping, and management technical assistance should be provided to women's groups, but literacy should not be a requirement for access to credit. Loan programs worldwide successfully lend to illiterate women; these models should be explored for lessons and insights applicable to the Mali context.

7) It should be expected that repayment rates will be acceptable--over 95%, for instance--and if acceptable repayment rates are not achieved, the project should discern why, and adjust the program accordingly. It has been proven time and again that women are good credit risks, especially in programs designed with their particular needs and economic activities in mind. There are examples in Mali where this has proven to be true (i.s. the OXFAM UK program that provides plows and animals to women's groups, who have successfully repaid the loan in two years.) Credit is not, and should not be, a transfer payment. On the other hand, it must be recognized that poor repayment rates are often linked to poor project design. The flexibility needed to apply the lessons

learned in the actual application of a credit program should be included in the design, thus guarding against decapitalization of credit funds and promoting sustainable and productive economic activities.

C. THE LIVESTOCK PROJECT

1. Project Description

USAID/Mali will amend the on-going Livestock Project to extend and strengthen its operation. The amended project will concentrate on strengthening management by the GRM of livestock programs and improving animal health. It will focus on improving the disease diagnostic network, the information system on disease status and use of natural resources, and systems for distributing vaccines. In addition, extension systems for training field agents in animal nutrition and production problems will be upgraded, and linkages between extension and research strengthened.

The Livestock Project, which has for the most part concentrated on bovines, will increase its activities in small ruminant animal health and production.

2. Gender Roles in Livestock Production

Considerable differences exist among ethnic groups in agro-pastoral and transhumant systems in the Livestock Project area. However, women often figure prominently in livestock ownership, especially ownership of small ruminants. One study suggests that approximately 30% of small ruminants are owned by women. Women buy and/or bring livestock to a marriage and continue to own those animals they bring.

Although the understanding of the complex systems of livestock ownership and management is incomplete, the following picture illustrates the key areas of women's involvement in livestock production. Generally, women do not manage livestock on a day-to-day basis. Their husbands will typically have management responsibility and varying degrees of control. However, women often milk both large and small ruminants, especially goats. Although reports are conflicting, it appears that in some families women have responsibility for watering and finding/providing forage to livestock in finish feeding operations.

Animals range freely in the dry season and are looked after by a herder during the growing season. The herders are in most instances paid by the husband. In return for this and other expenses incurred, the husbands receive the male progeny from their wives' animals. Women retain female progeny. Women have decision-making power over much of what happens to their animals ranging from whether or not they can be vaccinated to decisions over selling them. Women control the usage and/or income received from the sale of small ruminants and from their milking activities.

Livestock are important to USAID/Mali's food security efforts because of the role they play in the family's cash flow. If people have money they can buy food, and livestock are a liquid asset and can be turned into cash. For Malians, cattle are long-term savings, while small ruminants can be used as a short-term investment that can be liquidated as needed.

Although women own livestock, there appears to be infrequent and inconsistent interaction between livestock extension agents and women who own livestock or women who assist their husbands in livestock raising. This has several implications for development programming.

a. Project Planning

Project staff/extension agents are working from an incomplete picture of the farming system. While considerable is known in a general sense about the roles of men and women, there is little statistical data. Further, the existing data may be inaccurate because it appears to have been obtained from men only. Information related to herd ownership, management problems, and need for assistance may be distorted. Finally the available information does not appear to feed into project design and implementation. Such information would enable planners to target interventions according to the division of labor and responsibility.

For example, recognition of women's milking activities provides an opportunity to strengthen the animal health aspects of the project. Women could receive training to identify animal health problems while they are milking. This could be particularly helpful in reducing mortality in the early post-parturition period when animal losses are at their highest.

b. Project Implementation

Assumptions and insufficient understanding of ownership and management affect project activities. For example, assumptions about dissemination of information from extension agent to household head to wife appear to be incorrect. One person interviewed described an incident in which a GRM livestock agent was unable to vaccinate all animals in a family herd because some were not owned by the household head as he had stated but rather by his wife. She was not interested in having her animals vaccinated. It was discovered that the wife had not been informed by her husband of the purpose and value of vaccinations. When extension agents were able to talk with her directly, she was persuaded and the animals were vaccinated.

c. Monitoring Project Impact

Without information about and communications with women who own and/or have some responsibility for livestock, the project is unable to assess the impact, either positive or negative, of the project as a whole. For example, the Livestock Project formerly included a cattle fattening component. The evaluation report of that now discontinued component stated that the project increased workloads of some women without corresponding benefits to them. According to the evaluation, women were expected to water and feed the confined animals but did not share any of the income from the sale of these animals.

The conclusion that women were adversely affected is not shared by everyone. Some felt that the increased milk available from the project actually improved women's situation. It may be that both are true, depending on the particular family. Regular monitoring of the project through contacts with both men and women would enable project staff to measure these kinds of positive and negative impacts and to make appropriate project adjustments.

3. Recommendations

Because of the lack of specific data about women's roles, access to benefits, constraints, etc., in livestock production, the recommendations that follow relate primarily to programming processes rather than specific project directions or activities.

- a. Develop baseline data on gender and ethnic variables in livestock production.

As part of the development of the improved Management Information System, it is recommended that baseline data be collected to identify by gender, ethnic group, and animal the following information: division of labor, access to benefits from livestock production, access to technical assistance, and problems or constraints to increasing production as perceived by respondents.

Analysis of the data should enable project staff to identify where women's existing responsibilities might be utilized to improve herd health, nutrition, and general management. This data could also provide the basis for refining training approaches and techniques to reach women and to monitor project impacts on both men and women.

- b. Given the cultural constraints to women speaking openly in front of men, it would be important to survey men and women separately and to engage a Malian woman "enqueteur" to speak with women. Unemployed graduates of the agricultural college at Katibougou and the Centres d'Apprentissage Agricole offer potential sources for female enqueteurs.

- c. As the OHV becomes more experienced with the Management Information System, it is recommended that the follow additional data be collected for analysis and program adaptation:

- 1) Percentage of income derived from small ruminants and where it fits in the family's annual budget. This would increase understanding of how grain and livestock incomes interact, as well as provide information on gender differences in timing of animal sales and rates of offtake;
- 2) Milk production rates by breed by ethnic group;
- 3) The role of livestock as savings and income security.

Such information would further understanding of the farming system and enable project staff to target interventions according to ethnic group, season of the year, animal, etc.

d. Develop monitoring systems to measure participation of and project impacts on men and women using the baseline data described above.

e. Develop mechanisms to obtain feedback from women as well as men on research and extension issues, such as specific health problems.

d. If the baseline survey reveals that women have difficulty in obtaining technical assistance and information in the areas for which they are responsible, identify why they have difficulty. Cultural constraints to interaction between male livestock extension agents and women may indicate the need to consider alternative mechanisms for getting information to women. These mechanisms might include expanding the scope of work of female animal nurses to include extension work with women or training of female livestock extension workers.

f. Issues for Future Exploration

The following represent areas of possible future exploration for the Livestock Project. They deal primarily with areas where women's activities are concentrated. Outside of the current focus of the Livestock Project, these issues should be considered during the project because they offer the potential for increasing the profitability of livestock production.

1) Consider expanding the work of the Livestock Project into milk transformation, preservation, and marketing. These areas might yield significant increases in income from livestock.

2) Consider expanding into animal skin transformation. This formerly small-scale, individual enterprise, is being assumed by larger scale entrepreneurs. Investigation of tanning as an enterprise might also be undertaken under other USAID/Mali private enterprise development programs.

3) Assess the impact of current governmental restrictions on cutting trees and shrubs, often the dry season forage for sheep and goats, on small ruminant owners, both male and female.

D. Village Reforestation Project

1. Project Description

The Village Reforestation Project (VRP) is currently being considered for a three year extension. An internal evaluation was conducted at the end of the original project period to help determine the feasibility and desirability of the proposed extension. The project purpose was to identify successful and cost-effective processes for achieving reforestation and more efficient use of wood resources at the village level in Mali's Fifth Region, with long term goals of contributing to the rehabilitation of Mali's renewable resource base and ultimately improving the well-being of the villagers. The evaluation team concluded that sufficient progress had been made towards project goals, and that an extension was "highly desirable". The team made recommendations on how to improve various aspects of the program, such as management, extension, technical issues, etc.

The evaluation team felt that the VRP had a modest effect in improving the lot of women in the project area, primarily in the reduced time spent gathering fuelwood and the ease of cooking attributable to the woodstove technology promoted by the project. They concluded that there was very little other effect on the lives of women, either positive or negative, as a result of the project.

In the sociological evaluation section of the report (written by a Malian sociologist from DCCS/DREF) women's participation in VRP activities was characterized as minimal, limited to watering the plants and constructing wood stoves. Noting the prominent role which rural women have always played in agricultural production, the team strongly recommended "a much greater participation by them [women] in VRP activities, through training and extension programs developed specifically for them in the development of mini-nurseries, the work of which is very similar to that of vegetable gardening (in which most women already are involved)."

It is noteworthy that the VRP has made a defined effort to consider both the effect of the VRP on women, and identified specific areas in which they should be included. From conversations with Mana Diakite, the VRP Project Officer, it is clear that in the year since the evaluation, considerable attention has been given to the issue of integrating women into project activities as a way to broaden and strengthen the village reforestation effort. The recommendations of this report are therefore made in support of the VRP's planned outreach to women, and are presented as they relate to previously defined program strategies.

2. Gender Roles in Agroforestry

Given that women are the primary consumers of products from trees, reforestation projects will not succeed without the deliberate inclusion of

women. Women gather or cut all fuelwood, they gather fruit, nuts, and leaves for family consumption, and they use tree products for medicinal purposes. In addition, agroforestry techniques such as planting trees for shade, comfort, and food; planting living fences that can provide fodder, fuelwood and small poles; intercropping fast-growing, nitrogen fixing hardwoods in garden plots where they will fertilize the soil and provide easy access to fuelwood, are all techniques that integrate well with women's established agricultural practices and needs.

3. Recommendations:

- a. Recruit and train women extension agents to work specifically with women farmers.
- b. Ensure the extension message addresses the particular communication and technical situation of women in the villages.
- c. Train women in the benefits of exotic species, and ensure that they have access to seedlings produced in project nurseries.
- d. Survey women to determine the indigenous tree species they need and use, and include these species in nursery production.
- e. Assess the (already considerable) level of knowledge women have about gathering and planting seeds, and develop a technical assistance package that broadens that knowledge to include small nurseries, patterns of intercropping, information about exotic species, etc. In this way, the project will enhance the resources of the community and promote appropriate agroforestry practices that are not dependant on project inputs, yet which will continue to promote project goals.
- f. Carefully consider issues such as the effect of village woodlots on women's labor demands (i.e. will they be required to water the trees?), the allocation of financial and in-kind benefits derived from the harvesting of the trees (will the trees be sold for poles or lumber, or used by women for fuelwood?) and the extent to which women's interest in the many products of trees may be displaced by an over-emphasis on wood products as cash crops.

E. POLICY REFORM:

1. Program Description:

The need for lessening the control of the Malian government on the country's economy, and the need to reduce government expenditures overburdened with a huge public sector are two "policy reform" measures being supported by USAID through their intervention in the Cereals Marketing Restructuring Project (PRMC) and the Economic Policy Reform Project.

The goal of the PRMC has been to assist Mali to achieve food security on a self-sustaining basis. The three main objectives of the first phase of the project were marketing liberalization, a reduction in subsidies to the official marketing system, and the improvement of cereals production incentives. The EPRP main emphasis is to restructure the public finance structure by improving management and administration liquidating state enterprises, and shrinking public sector employment. The latter is done by offering "early retirement" to government employees through a program of "Voluntary Early Departure" (VED).

2. The Role of Gender:

The macro-economic nature of the above projects and the lack of data on their effects makes it difficult to analyze their effect on the population as a whole, or to factor out the effects on any particular target group. However, there are economic tools already available to measure the affects of macro-economic policy restructuring on the poor (i.e. Kanbur, 1987) which might be adapted to this program. (Measuring the effect of policies on the poor, and the heavy economic costs of emphasizing high growth rates in the short term over balanced growth in the long term is a fairly new discipline in economics which should be studied for the insights it can provide into these important policy questions.) The programs should be monitored carefully for unintentional results, and differential effects on men, women, and families as a whole.

A few examples might serve as useful illustrations of the possible unintentional effects of the policy reform projects. For example, in the early retirement facet of EPRP, it would be useful to know what percentage of the public sector employees women comprise, and then compare that to the percentage of women to men VED's, to monitor if women were leaving the government's employ at a more accelerated rate than men. This information could also be used as a feedback mechanism to the GRM.

In the case of the PRMC, the program that encourages private sector investment in large scale food storage could be monitored to detect potential problems of speculation and hoarding. Several reports state that grain storage at the local level appears to be adequate, and that farmers often have capacity to store grains for two years, with minimal losses. Reports indicate, however,

that farmers sell their grain at harvest in order to pay taxes, indicating that they are in a vulnerable economic position and unable, because of economic pressures, to wait until the price goes up. It is unclear how centralized storage houses constructed by the private sector would alleviate the problem, and experience in other countries suggests that the private sector may in fact capitalize on the producer vulnerability. It is also unclear in that case what relative advantage private sector storage provides over government storage. (Although women are not large scale grain producers, they and their whole family would be affected by a reduction in the profitability of grain.)

3. Recommendations

- a. Monitoring systems should be developed to measure such things as:
 - 1) if and how the structure of a market changes, and who it affects;
 - 2) is there a differential effect according to gender and income level;
 - 3) specifically at the farm level, are there changes in farm income, labor use, land use, and storage practices;
 - 4) impact of policy on the informal sector--small scale grain and vegetable trading, for example.
- b. Information from the monitoring systems should be analyzed and used as a feedback mechanism to policy makers and project designers.

F. OTHER FINDINGS

Several common themes regarding women's situation in Mali emerged during the consultancy. Because they are crosscutting issues and do not fit neatly into current USAID programming, they are treated as a separate issues in this report.

1. Labor Saving Strategies

Nearly everyone interviewed and each document read stressed the extraordinary labor requirements of Malian women and the demands on their time. This affects their ability to participate and the project's ability to benefit from their participation in literacy, agricultural, health and other development programs. At a minimum, therefore, it is critical, that the potential impact of proposed project interventions on women's labor be considered in all project planning. On a more positive note, project designers should explore what strategies their project might employ to decrease labor demands and increase women's productivity.

2. Transport

Women's entrepreneurial activities are hampered by lack of efficient transport. Few women outside of the major cities ride bicycles or mobylettes. To transport goods to market, women must either walk carrying produce on their heads or hire transportation -- sometimes from their husbands. Women may have a difficult time maintaining their competitive edge as transportation becomes increasingly motorized. Cultural values will figure prominently in the acceptability of solutions to this transport problem. Exploration of the specific transport needs and how the women themselves feel these needs might be met would be an important contribution to increasing their productivity.

V. CONCLUSION

It is not an easy task to reorient programs and strategies to incorporate a new sector of society, but the results of integrating women into development will no doubt be worth the work. Many government and private institutions in Mali have begun to highlight the work and contributions of women, and to design project interventions that will meet some of their needs. Those that have already implemented this type of program (The Women's Center, OXFAM UK, AFRICARE, CARE, UNICEF, etc.) are ready sources of information about what works and what doesn't. Within the next six months, several studies on women in agriculture should be published, which will contribute greatly to analysis and programming efforts in the near future, and there are many documents listed in the Bibliography which are currently of use.

The government of Mali is clearly aware of the constraints women face, and of their potential productivity. The Union Nationale des Femmes Maliennes (UNFM) is a quasi-political organization that advocates for women's equal access to resources such as credit, encourages women to organize, and provides funds for programs that support, for example, the use of improved woodstoves throughout the country. Four government ministries have "Promotion Feminine" departments that are charged with assisting in the integration of women into their various programs. In addition, women are being trained at government agricultural schools for positions in technical assistance, a resource that will prove valuable as projects begin to hire women extension agents and animateurs.

During the visit of the WID team, the possibility was discussed of establishing a position for a Malian women sociologist to assist the WID Officer at USAID. This is an idea that the authors wholeheartedly support. In addition to the creation of this position, it is recommended that there be a clear line of authority passing through the sociologist from the WID Program Officer, and that resources be provided for such things as publications, workshops, conferences, photocopying, ordering documents, etc. In addition, further technical assistance to Mission may be available through USAID's Office for Women in Development.

APPENDIX I

LIST OF PEOPLE CONTACTED BY ICRW/CID CONSULTANTS
JANUARY 14-FEBRUARY 1, 1988

Government of Mali

- M. Yaya Togola, Director General
Operation Haute Vallee
- Mme. Niamey Kongo Baba, Chef de la Section Action Integree
Operation Haute Vallee
- Mme. Sako Koumba Diallo, Chef de Division
- Mme. Bassa Diane Dildko, Division de Promotion Feminine
Direction National de Cooperatives (DNACOOOP)
- Mme. Diallo, Coordinatrice
Direction Nationale d'Alphabetisation Fonctionnel et Linguistiques
Appliques (DNAFLA)
- Mme. Sissoko, Chef de Division
- M. Yakuba Traore, Sociologist
Planning and Evaluation, Institute of Rural Economics
- M. Maxime Samake, Sociologist
Institute des Sciences Humaines
- Mme. Assitan Diallo, Professor
Ecole Normale Superieur
- Mme. Haidara Mariame, Director
Food Technology Lab/SRCVO

USAID and USAID Related:

Gene Chiavaroli, Mission Director

Agricultural Development Office:

- Tracy Atwood, Agricultural Development Officer
David Atwood, Cereals Marketing Reform Project
Elzadia Washington, Farming Systems R/E Project
S.K. Reddy, Farming Systems R/E Project
Rich Newburg, Operation Haute Vallee Project Officer
Maimouna Dienapo, OHV Project Assistant and WID Team visit Coordinator
Mana Diakite, Village Reforestation Project Officer
Mark Hime, Contractor, Operation Haute Vallee (Credit Specialist)

2/10

Program Office:

Richard Byess, Director
Claudia Cantrel, Program Officer
James Elliot, Economist

Livestock Project:

Chris Phelps, Project Officer
Cheick Drame, Sociologist
Edgar J. Ariza-Nino, Robert Nathan Associates (Livestock Assessment)

Other Programs:

Gaoussou Traore, Privatization Program
Oumar Dia, SAFGRAD Project Officer
Abdoul Diallo, Program Specialist and Project Manager, DNAFLA
Mme. Diallo Anna, Controller (formerly in private banking)
Malike Didebe, Administrative Assistant (re: migration)
Dennis Billodeau, Manantali Dam Resettlement Project Officer
Fanta Macalou, Manantali Dam Resettlement Project
Neil Woodruff, Health Officer
Sherry Suggs, Human Resource Development Officer
Philip Michaud, Grasshopper Control Project (formerly with CAA)
M. Fofana, CAA
Shelly Sundburg, Consultant, Health Study

Development du Haute Vallee Design Team:

Constance McCorkle, Anthropologist
Gerold Grosenick, Economist
Nick Rofe, Rural Credit Specialist
Charles Heureux, Privatization Specialist
Warren Prawl, Extension Specialist

PEACE CORPS:

Marilyn Hyde, Associate Director
Julia Morris, Associate Director, Agroforestry
Shirley Furst, Nurse
Lillie Vitelli, Agroforestry Trainer

WORLD BANK:

Michael Furst, Representative

UNICEF:

Mme. Saiko Chiba Cornale

NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS:

Sandy Laumark, Director, CARE

Mme. Thiam, La Paysanne

Andre Charrette, VITA Improved Woodstove Project

APPENDIX II

From: "Adding a Food Consumption Perspective to Farming Systems Research"
By Timothy Frankenberger (June, 1985)

1

Executive Summary

Farming systems research (FSR) projects should more effectively incorporate a food consumption perspective in the design and testing of new agricultural technology. Two reasons can be cited for why such a perspective is essential. First, given the importance of securing adequate family food supplies in the goal sets of small farmers, FSR efforts which ignore these goals are less likely to enhance the levels of well-being of project participants. Second, food consumption considerations help identify technological alternatives compatible with consumption preferences of farm families, thereby ensuring their likely acceptance. (Tripp, 1982:1) One way to begin integrating a food consumption perspective into FSR activities is to focus on a number of linkages between certain aspects of production and consumption patterns. Some of the more important linkages include:

- 1) Seasonality of production -- In most areas of the world, there is a seasonal dimension to agricultural production, food availability, malnutrition, human energy expenditure, incidence of disease and the terms of trade for the poor. Small farm families may suffer through periods of deprivation every year as a result of the adverse interaction of these seasonal aspects.
- 2) Crop mix and minor crops -- As societies become more integrated into regional, national and international markets, non-food cash crops and non-indigenous food staples may replace some subsistence crops. The shift could have detrimental consumption effects (i.e., a decline in crop diversity, increased risk due to fluctuating markets, exaggerated seasonal cycles of plenty and want, elimination of wild plant food through herbicides, less land available for the production of food crops, a breakdown of traditional food sharing networks, etc.)
- 3) Income -- Income can have an impact on consumption levels depending upon how regularly it is received (i.e., lump sums vs. periodic), what form it is in (i.e., food vs. cash) and who is the recipient in the household (i.e., women vs. men). This linkage is strongly interrelated with crop mix and seasonality.
- 4) The role of women in production -- Women are often responsible for growing food crops and their income is usually for food purchases. However, they are often neglected by agricultural extension services. In addition, increasing the agricultural labor demands of women through cash crop intervention may lead to: 1) a change in cooking habits (i.e., fewer meals and/or quicker, less nutritious meals); 2) women planting less labor intensive and less nutritious food crops (i.e., cassava instead of yams); and 3) less time devoted to child care and breast feeding.

- 5) Crop labor requirements -- The introduction of new cash crops may require more human energy input than previously grown crops, and the added energy requirement may be greater than the value of the output. These increased energy demands could also have deleterious nutritional effects on intrahousehold food distribution patterns if some members of the household require more food intake to meet the labor demands of the new crop.
- 6) Market prices and seasonality -- Market prices and access can have an impact on consumption patterns of small farm households. For example, in most developing countries, high consumer food prices coincide with small farmer food shortages. In addition, government importing and exporting policies may adversely affect the prices of crops grown locally, keeping the purchasing power of small farmers low. Finally, market inefficiency and/or periodic market instability can place a region that is dependent on market purchased food in a vulnerable position.

A thorough understanding of these production/consumption linkages is essential to ensure that FSR activities maximize consumption benefits. An awareness of these linkages enables the incorporation of consumption concerns into every phase of the FSR process. The following points suggest ways in which a consumption perspective can be integrated into each stage of the FSR process:

- 1) Through the incorporation of consumption concerns in target area selection, nutritionally at risk regions are more likely to participate in project activities.
- 2) By including consumption considerations in diagnostic baseline studies, existing consumption patterns are better understood.
- 3) Taking consumption concerns into account in formulating recommendation domains may ensure nutritionally vulnerable households are considered in the design of intervention strategies for on-farm testing.
- 4) Evaluating project performance by both production and consumption criteria will provide extension personnel with an idea of the potential consumption impact of various proposed technologies.

Efforts made to include a consumption perspective in FSR project activities, will greatly enhance the welfare of farm families. For this reason, consumption concerns should receive more attention in future FSR endeavors.

6/9

APPENDIX IV
DRAFT COPY OF FERNEA/CID REPORT

Rough Draft Outline

SCOPE OF WORK FOR CID/WID TECHNICAL ASSISTANT

Women's Organizations in Rural Mali

Justification:

A major constraint to the integration of women into the mainstream economy as full participants is their lack of external organization. Donors and development agencies are aware that women's organizations exist on the village level but have no clear idea of their function, role and influence within Malian society. A survey is needed exploring these issues and the possibility of using traditional associations as vehicles for extension, literacy, credit and as cooperatives.

Duties:

The Technical Assistant (TA) would work closely with extension and other OHV personnel to conduct village surveys in the OHV region. This survey will find existing women's organizations and assess their function and role, categorize the different types, evaluate their influence within the village, their potential as vehicles for extension, etc. within the DHV project and the most effective ways to assist them.

Collaborative Linkages:

The CID/SID TA would develop collaborative linkages with both Malian and USAID OHV personnel.

Timing:

This survey should ideally cover as many different agricultural seasons as possible to discover if there is any change in the role of women's associations. The survey could either begin in the middle of the dry season (December-April) and run until the middle of the rainy season, or vice-versa. The latter is preferable so that the harvest would be included.

Qualifications:

The TA will be a faculty member or an advanced graduate student from a CID member university. The TA should have experience, education, or training in: a) collection and analysis of survey data; b) sociology, anthropology, a gender related interdisciplinary degree or African Studies; c) the use of micro-computers for storing and analyzing survey data; d) African rural life. In addition she should be fluent in French and if possible have knowledge of a Malian African language.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

(Caye and McGowan Report on Gender Issues Consultancy)

- Africare, Inc. 1985. "Women's Rural Training Center in Ouelessebougou: An Operational Program Grant." Proposal submitted to the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Anderson, J.; Keita, N.; Sikasso, M. 1987. "Final Evaluation for the Village Reforestation Project." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Baur, Henning; and Sissoko, Keffing. 1987. "Aspects Economiques de l'Embouche Paysanne en Zone Semi-aride du Mali (1984-1986)." Prepared for the Ministeres des Ressources Naturelles et de l'Elevage and the Institut National de la Recherche Zootechnique, Forestiere, et Hydrolique. Bamako, Mali.
- _____. 1986. "Les Tendances de l'Offre et des Prix du Betail au Cours de la Saison Seche (Janvier a Juin, 1985): Observations de Quatre Marches en Zones d'Embouche Paysanne." Prepared for the Ministeres des Ressources Naturelles et de l'Elevage and the Institut National de la Recherche Zootechnique, Forestiere, et Hydrolique. Bamako, Mali.
- Baye, Abd-el Kader. 1988. "La Condition Juridique et Sociale de la Femme au Mali." New York, New York. University of Columbia/Institute of the Sahel.
- _____. (no date) "Synthese des Etudes Nationales et Observations Complementaires sur la Condition Juridique et Sociale de la Femme dans Quatre Pays du Sahel." Prepared for the Institute of the Sahel. Bamako, Mali. Center for Population and Family Health.
- Berger, Marguerite; Delancey, Virginia; Mellencamp, Amy. 1984. "Bridging the Gender Gap in Agricultural Extension." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development, Office of Women in Development. Washington, D.C.: International Center for Research on Women.
- Beridogo, Brehima. 1985. "Les Activites de la Femme Rurale et sa Participation au Programme d'Alphabetisation dans la Zone d'Intervention O.H.V." Report prepared for the Ministry of Education, Bamako, Mali.
- Bremer, Jennifer; Ellsworth, Lynn. 1986. "Consolidating Cereals Market Reform in Mali: An Analysis of Current and Potential Roles for Public and Private Sector Institutions in the Grain Market." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Brett, Smith S.; et. al. (no date) "Mali Livestock Sector Project (Project Number 688-0218): A Mid-Term Evaluation Report." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.

Buvinic, Mayra. 1984. "Projects for Women in the Third World: Explaining Their Misbehavior." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development, Office of Women in Development. Washington, D.C.: International Center for Research on Women.

Caughman, Susan. 1981. Women at Work in Mali: The Case of the Markala Cooperative. Boston, MA. African Studies Center.

Cisse, Diango. 1970. Structures des Malinke Kita. Bamako, Mali. Editions Populaires.

Clark, Randolph H. 1986. "Rural Credit Study: Operation Haute Vallee II." Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.

Cloud, Kathleen. 1977. Sex Roles in Food Production and Food Distribution Systems in the Sahel. Washington, D.C.: Office for Women in Development, the U.S. Agency for International Development.

Commission d'Evaluation et de Suivi de la Strategie Alimentaire, Ministere de l'Agriculture. 1984. "Application de la Strategie Alimentaire Malienne: la Situation en Avril." Bamako, Mali.

Creevey, Lucy E. ed. 1986. Women Farmer's in Africa: Rural Development in Mali and the Sahel. Syracuse University.

Debrah, Siegfried; Sissoko, Keffing. 1987. "Milk Production and Utilisation in the Semi-Arid Zone of Mali." Draft report, not to be quoted. Bamako, Mali.

Dembele, Diama Nango; Steffan, Philip. 1987. "Evaluation Conjointe des Programmes de Credit PRMC aux Associations, Villageoises et aux Commerçants Prives: Campagne Agricole 1986/87." Prepared for USAID. Bamako, Mali. Michigan State University.

Diakite, Samou; et al. 1987. "Rapport de Mission d'Evaluation du Projet Bois de Village Segou du 26 Novembre au 14 Decembre 1987." Prepared for the Direction Nationale des Eaux et Forets. Bamako, Mali.

Diallo, Abdoul. 1987. "Alphabetisation Fonctionnelle et Mutations Sociales en Milieu Rural Africain: le Cas de l'Operation Haute-Valle (OHV) au Mali." Thesis. Bamako, Mali.

_____. 1980. "Functional Literacy in the Fifth Region of Mali: A New Era for the O.M.M. Farmer." Thesis. Bamako, Mali.

Direction Nationale de l'Alphabetisation Fonctionnelle et de la Linguistique Appliquee. 1987. "Rapport d'Evaluation de l'Alphabetisation Fonctionnelle a l'Operation Haute Vallee." Bamako, Mali.

_____. 1978. "Rapport Final de l'Evaluation de l'Alphabetisation Fonctionnelle dans l'OACV." Bamako, Mali.

Frankenberger, Timothy R. 1985. Adding a Food Research Consumption Perspective to Farming Systems Research. Washington, D.C.: Bureau for Science and Technology, U.S. Agency for International Development.

Grant, Steve. 1980. "Mid-Project Evaluation, Functional Literacy Project 698-0410-14, 5th Region."

Institut des Sciences Humaines. 1984. " L'Exode des Femmes au Mali: La Main d'Oeuvre Domestique Feminine a Bamako et a Segou." Bamako, Mali.

_____. 1983. La Femme en Milieu Rural: Cercle de Kolokani. Bamako, Mali.

Kanbur, S. M. Ravi. 1987. "Measurement and Alleviation of Poverty with an Application to the Effects of Macro-economic Adjustment." Vol. 34, No. 1. Staff Papers, International Monetary Fund.

Keita, Nancoman. 1987. "The Experience of the Narena Village Project," Advance, Vol. I. Washington, D.C.

King, R.G. 1986. "Economics of Farming Systems Study: Operation Haute Vallee II, Mali." Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development, Bamako, Mali. Checchi and Company.

Khibe, Paul Bartholemew; Racine, Ly; Souleymane, Ba. "Investigations des Activites d'Elevage dans la Zone Semi-Aride du Mali: Campagne 1985/1986." Prepared for the Ministere des Ressources Naturelles et de l'Elevage. Bamako, Mali.

Koenig, Dolores. 1987. "The Second Campaign 1987: Manantaly Resettlement (625-0995)." Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali. Institute for Development Anthropology.

Kone, Daouda et collaborateurs. 1985. "Une Analyse des Systemes de Culture dans les Zones d'Intervention de l'E.C.I.B.E.V." Ministere Charge des Ressources Naturelles et de l'Elevage. Bamako, Mali.

Kone, Mah Noumoutie. 1987. "Les Organisations Feminines comme Instrument de la Participation de la Femme Rurale au Developpement: Cas de la Zone OHV." Thesis, Institut Polytechnique Rural de Katibougou, Mali.

Lebeau, Francis. 1986. "Technology Transfer Study: Operation Haute Vallee II." Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.

Leslie, Joanne; Lycette, Margaret; Buvinic, Mayra. 1986. "Weathering Economic Crisis: The Crucial Role of Women in Health." Paper presented at the Second Takemi Symposium on International Health, School of Public Health, Harvard University, May, 1986. International Center for Research on Women.

Lycette, Margaret A. 1984. "Improving Women's Access to Credit in the Third World: Policy and Project Recommendations." ICRW Occasional Papers No. 1. Washington, D.C.: International Center for Research on Women.

- Nadio, Mamadou. 1985. "Identification des Raisons d'Abandon des Embouchures dans la Region de Segou, 1985." Document VIII of the Commission Technique Specialisee des Productions Animales et Zootechniques, Session de Juin 1986. Ministeres des Ressources Zootechnique, Forestiere et Hydrologique. Bamako, Mali.
- Naiditch, Linda; Goncalves, Jose; and Klericki, Ana K. 1986. "SOMARC Country Assessment for Contraceptive Social Marketing in Mali." Submitted to the U.S. Agency for International Development/Office of Population. Bamako, Mali. The Futures Group.
- National Cooperative Business Association/Cooperative League of the USA, International Division. 1987. "Operational Program Grant--Mali Ton Villageois Development Project: Operation Haute Vallee II." Submitted to the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Oppenheim, Jeremy. 1987. "Private Sector Development in Mali." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Otto, Jonathan. 1985. "Prospects for Expanding PVO Activities in Mali." PACT, Inc. New York, New York.
- Putman, Diana B. 1978. "Songhoy Women: Traditions and Change Along the Banks of the Niger River." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Racine, Ly; Kone, Daouda; Traore, Bantieni. 1983. "Rapport de Mission - Reconnaissance de la Zone d'Intervention de l'ECIBEV dans le Cadre du Projet Sectoriel de l'Elevage." Institut National de la Recherche Zootechnique, Forestiere et Hydrologique. Bamako, Mali.
- Rookhuisen, Marion. 1987. "Les Femme Comme Groupe-Cible de l'Intervention de la Division de Recherches sur les Systemes de Production Rurale, Volet Fousebougou (Provisoire): Rapport d'une Mission Effectuee du 16 au 30 Mars, 1987." Centre de Recherche et de Documentation Femmes et Autonomie. Leiden, Pays-Bas.
- Roush, James L. 1981. "Final Report on the Evaluation of Operation Haute Vallee, Mali." Vol. 1. Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.
- Samake, Maximen, et al. 1980. La Situation de la Femme Rurale au Mali. Institut des Sciences Humaines. Bamako, Mali.
- Sene, Papa. 1987. "Les Tons Villageois dans la Seconde Phase de l'Operation Haute Vallee: Reflexion d'une Breve Mission." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali. Cooperative League of the U.S.A.
- Secretariat Technique de la CESA, Ministere de l'Agriculture. 1987. "Bilan et Perspectives du Projet Securite Alimentaire." Bamako, Mali.

Shea, Yvan. 1986. "Privitisation Study: Operation Haute Vallee II, Mali." Report prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali. Checchi and Company.

Taylor, George; et al. 1983. "Mid-Term Evaluation of Mali A.I.D. Project 625-0937: Village Reforestation." Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development. Bamako, Mali.

Tinker, Irene. Feminizing Development--For Growth with Equity. Care Briefs on Development Issues. Published by CARE in cooperation with the Overseas Development Council.

UNICEF. 1988. Situation Analysis: Mali. Chapter III: Femmes et Production. Bamako, Mali. (In publication.)

_____. 1987. "Bibliographie: Les Femmes et les Enfants au Mali." Bamako, Mali.

USAID. 1987. "Development of the Huate Vallee (DHV) 688-0233: Project Identification Document." Bamako, Mali.

USAID/Office of Science and Technology. 1987. "Nutrition in Agriculture Project Evaluation, July-August, 1987." Report on a Visit to Mali by Anthony Dawson.

USAID. 1986. "Integrated Family Health Services Project (228-0227)." Project Paper. Bamako, Mali.

_____. 1985. "Farming Systems Research and Extension Project." Project Paper. Bamako, Mali.

White, Karen; Otero, Maria; Lycette, Margaret; Buvinic, Mayra. 1986. Gender Issues in Latin America and the Caribbean. Prepared for the U.S. Agency for International Development, Office of Women in Development. Washington, D.C.: International Center for Research on Women.

ROUGH DRAFT

SCOPE OF WORK

for Women in Development Technical Assistance
to Farming Systems Research/Extension Project

Intrahousehold Labor, Food and Resource Allocation and the
Impact of Appropriate Technology)

INTRODUCTION

The rural Malian household is a highly labor intensive functional unit. In Mali, the term unit of production is used to describe this group of (usually) related people who function interdependently and independently within the local, regional and national economy. The population of Mali, approximately 7.6 million, is over 80% rural and 51% female. (1986 Census) Women are counted as providing only 18% of the economically active rural population, but this is because they work mostly in the subsistence sector which is not counted in national statistics. (Creevey, 1986)

In interviews with both Malians and USAID personnel one overwhelming issue that all seemed aware of in regards to rural women was that they have a very heavy work load. From rising at four in the morning to find wood and/or water for cooking and washing, to cooking the final meal at seven or eight at night, a Malian rural womans work is literally unending. Her contribution to agricultural production is noted by all Malians that I spoke with, including the director of Operation Haute Vallée (a rural development organization funded by USAID), remarked that 60% of household revenues came from womens labor. Her contribution in the agricultural sector cannot be overstated.

Development projects and donors of every kind usually give direct agricultural assistance in the form of technical training and advice, equipment and products to men. A cultural taboo against women speaking to strange men prevents the mostly male extension team from ever dealing directly with the female farmer. It is often assumed by the extension service that men pass on the technical assistance to their female family members but there is no evidence to support this and there are indications that most female farmers receive almost no technical assistance.

The Farming Systems Research/Extension Project has as its goal to improve the production, productivity and incomes of rural households. This will be accomplished through the development of appropriate agricultural technology relevant to farmers needs and circumstances and the transfer of such technology. In order to do this, baseline data on labor, food and resource allocation in the rural Malian household is necessary so that such technology truly is appropriate and relevant to the needs of rural Malian farmers.. It is important that feedback from women farmers be included in this linkage. This research project will provide important information about the Malian unit of production and womens role within it. In addition, it will analyze the impact of a specific labor saving device on the work load of women in a designated area of the Operation Haute Vallée

JUSTIFICATION

The present lack of data about the exact nature of the

contribution of womens labor to the economy, the current paucity of technical aid targeted specifically to womens needs, and the overwhelming evidence that women have too much work seems to merit further study. When one considers that all the existing data on Mali and West Africa agree that women do at least 60% of the agricultural labor plus bear all the household responsibilities of child bearing (an average of 7-8 children), child rearing, cooking, cleaning, finding and carrying water and collecting wood, the need for labor-saving devices becomes clear.

This study would attempt to collect basic information on how labor, resources and food are allocated in a Malian rural household. Secondly, the study will look at the impact of a specific labor-saving device on womens labor.

DUTIES

Household surveys - The Technical Assistant (TA) will work closely with a Malian counterpart at the Direction Regionale des Systemes de la Production Rurale (DRSPR) within the USAID Farming Systems Research/Extension (FSR/E) project to conduct household surveys in the OHV region. The number of households and their location and the distribution of ethnic groups will be decided jointly by the DRSPR and the TA after the TA's arrival in Mali.

Labor-saving device or appropriate technology introduction and impact survey: A labor-saving device will be chosen by the TA and the DRSPR that is most appropriate to the needs of the

women and the households surveyed. It will be introduced in approximately one half of the surveyed households (depending on how many surveyed). After a specified period of time, all of the households will be surveyed again and a comparison made of labor allocation between those households with and those without the device. If, in fact, the device does provide more time to women and other members of the household, for example to attend a literacy class or has some other beneficial effect, then a recommendation will be made to the DRSPR to consider widespread use of the devices or technology.

COLLABORATIVE LINKAGES

The CID/WID TA would be expected to establish a collaborative working relationship with the designated Malian counterpart and work under the direction of the DRSPR and USAID. In addition, the TA would be expected to keep the WID officer, as well as the FSR/E project officer at USAID/Bamako informed as to her findings and progress of work in general.

TIMING

Because most of the agricultural work goes on during the rainy season (June - November), the technical assistant should arrive in early May in order to begin the survey in June and expect to stay approximately six months.

QUALIFICATIONS

The TA will be a faculty member or advanced graduate

student at a CID member university, with a working knowledge of both written and spoken French and if possible some knowledge of any of the Malian African languages. She should have education, experience or training in: 1) collection and use of household data, and 2) agricultural production and/or rural life. In addition, she should have education, experience or training in: 1) the use and application of micro computers for storing and analyzing survey data, 2) African rural life, and 3) agricultural economics, agronomy or economics.

RESPONSIBILITIES

CID/WID - To provide a qualified Technical Assistant in a timely fashion, international transportation costs, living expenses, and some translation and local transport costs.

DRSPR (FSR/E) - To provide supervision, a Malian counterpart (preferably a woman) and whatever financial and technical support required.

USAID/Bamako - To provide supervision, technical support and authorization to use FSR/E funds in support of this project.

FARMING SYSTEMS RESEARCH AND EXTENSION

WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

JANUARY 30, 1988 BAMAHO, MALI

Project Description

The Farming Systems Research and Extension project is primarily a research project to support and strengthen existing research institutions in Mali. The USAID Farming Systems Research and Extension project has as its primary purpose, the provision of institutional support to the Institute of Rural Economy of Mali. Through its three main components it will help expand and increase the effectiveness of the farming systems research program in order to develop agricultural technology relevant to farmers needs and circumstances and to promote the effective transfer of such technology.

The three main components are; 1) the expansion of Farming Systems Research and Extension, 2) the improvement of Research-Extension linkages, and 3) training and staff development.

The Role of Women

In terms of agricultural production, research and extension, women as farmers play an important role in the development of agricultural technology relevant to the Malian farmers needs. As is noted in greater detail in section _____, women are involved in every aspect of agricultural production and rural life.

Gender Issues and Implications for the FSR/E project

Gender enters into the FSR/E project to the extent that women and men have different agricultural tasks, crops, equipment (or lack thereof) and

different values are placed on their agricultural output. As this does appear to be the case for most rural Malian households, gender becomes a distinct issue in terms of research, and especially in terms of extension work and the transfer of relevant agricultural technologies. At present there is very little data on the gender distinctions made at the different levels of agricultural production, and how and why technologies and their transfer should differ by gender is unknown. But, what is known, for example, is that women are rarely responsible for cash crops, though they often work on them, but are responsible for feeding the ^{family} ~~children~~ (varies by ethnic group). This is an important consideration for extension workers in terms of the methods that they use to approach farmers and the kinds of technologies chosen. It becomes equally important when a research agenda is decided upon and implemented.

Recommendations

The recommendations for consideration in the FSR/E project are organized in the same order that they appear in the project paper. First in terms of the general purpose and main components, secondly, in terms of specific instances where the gender issue or the idea of addressing the specific needs of women farmers is found, and third with regards to issues raised in the reconnaissance survey.

If, as expressed in the purpose statement of the FSR/E project paper, agricultural technology is to be relevant to the needs expressed by farmers, or discovered by project personnel, than the farmers themselves need to be disaggregated by gender. Who are the farmers? What do they farm? What do they want to farm? What are their greatest needs? Are these answers different for female farmers? For example, the needs of

✓ the female Malian farmer might not be any different from that of any small farmer in Mali, in terms of resources they are very similar. But, in that men and women often farm different crops, most likely they ^{have} ~~are~~ ^{different} ~~not similar in terms of specific~~ ^{Agricultural} technology needs. ^{Need is relevant to} ~~Need relevance is an~~ ^{and because of many factors, such as} ~~important and specific question, that needs to be addressed not only by~~ gender, ~~but also by~~ ethnic group, geographical region, climate and season, among others. Apparently, future research will include some of these variables. A consideration along these lines in terms of future extension work, would be to use women extension agents, so that input from female farmers is included in the relevant information received for research.

Sociocultural features and constraints are cited as existing barriers to outreach to women. A possible strategy to deal with these might include the use of existing womens organizations or groups in the villages. The FSR/E project paper does indeed mention the utility of using farmers associations, but no implementation method is delineated and it is not made clear how extension workers will receive feedback from these groups either. As the project is mandated to find ways of involving these associations, certainly existing female organizations should be considered. Effective organizations provide an already established method of communicating, mobilizing and utilizing new technologies for rural farmers. As a means of reaching many farmers at once, and of having any communication with women farmers, village associations have a great deal of potential.

The second main component of the FSR/E project, that of improving research-extension linkages, provides an avenue for the institutionalization of gender issues in each type of link. For linkages within the research system, research should always be disaggregated by gender, and consideration of research topics that focus on womens

production and agricultural activities should be included. Linkages between the DRSPR, extension agencies and farmers could be improved by including women farmers, women extension agents and researchers that are concerned and aware of women's needs as agricultural producers. Training institutions can be encouraged by the DRSPR to recruit and train more female extension agents, and to encourage existing extension agents to provide more gender specific information from the field. Agricultural policies and plans to better integrate women farmers in every aspect of research and extension can be included while establishing the linkages between research organizations, national planners and agricultural policy makers. When agricultural policies and plans are being restructured and redesigned, consideration of potential impact on female farmers and encouragement of increased participation of women should be included.

Within the training component, recruitment of female students for agricultural training institutions and emphasis on hiring female graduates should be made.

As the CDSS mandates that USAID projects target small and low income farmers, specific consideration of female farmers as a subset of this group should be included.

In addition, consideration of applicants for the position of FSR/E project manager (USAID) should include in the terms of reference the importance of gender issues in agricultural policy and production.

The FSR/E reconnaissance survey delineated some problems in the OHV region that are specifically or potentially gender related. For example, the field interviewers admitted having had difficulty in determining family labor divisions or even receiving any input from women, since in only one village visited was a woman allowed to remain present at the

village meeting with the research group. A recommendation to include more women researchers was made by the group, to help deal with this problem. Other relevant research recommendations included the issue of animal traction as a labor substitute for migrating young men, and how to implement credit practices in villages where there is 100% illiteracy. Peanut as a cash crop controlled by women merits investigation in terms of relevant technical assistance and amount of revenue. Other possible research considerations include the issue of literacy in relation to credit, and in relation to identifying and recognizing womens needs, in the area of increasing cash ~~income~~ revenues.

INTRODUCTION ON IMPORTANCE OF RESEARCH TO BE ADDED LATER

RESEARCH RECOMMENDATIONS
WID TEAM JANUARY, 1988
USAID/BAMAKO

Our research recommendations are organized by priority, but we feel all topics are equally important - the highest priority ones address the most basic data needs. Following each research topic will be current information on its present status as a potential research topic in Mali.

I. Farm Management/Production Data:

To look at yields, use of inputs, income of yields, livestock revenues, animal traction use, decision making for farming practices, income use, agricultural labor, etc. All data should be disaggregated by gender, ethnic group, region, season, size and type of family (polygamous/monogamous, female household head, etc), income and social status. The data should be collected in such a way that the economic contribution of women to the household, local, regional and national economy can be quantified.

Present status:

OHV and the FSR/E project are apparently doing a study which will cover this major area. Whether or not the data will be disaggregated by gender, etc. is unclear.

II. Existing Women's Associations in Rural Mali and their Potential in the OHV project:

To look at existing women's groups in the rural area (OHV region) by doing village survey that would quantify the existence of such groups at the village level, and qualify them in terms of the different types, their function, power, research recommendations also.

Present status:

Under consideration as CID/WID TA proposal.

Other potential research topics:

- 1) Migration - male and female migration: causes, effects (long and short term) and potential economic and demographic impact.
- 2) Literacy - Look at possible means of increasing the adult literacy rate, and increasing education on a widespread basis - it's importance for development to disseminate information, do extension work, etc.
- 3) Need for female extension agents - At what point is gender an issue in agricultural extension/assistance work.
- 4) Cereal banks - Food security for men and women, potential long term impacts.
- 5) Successful projects targetting women - Reasons for success, how constraints were dealt with.
- 6) The work of NGO's - The effectiveness or lack thereof of NGO's and their potential as a means to reach women.
- 7) The Importance of gathered food in diet - Economic and food resource, for ex. karité nuts - potential cash crop?
- 8) Off-season activities - What different activities are substituted for agricultural labor and what is their economic impact.
- 9) Animal traction - Extent of usage, female ownership, labor substitute?