PN-ABD-395
ISN 62977

CHALLENGES AND PROSPECTS

FOR

FURTHER MISSION INVOLVEMENT

IN

THE EDUCATION SECTOR

REPORT PREPARED FOR

USAID/BANGLADESH

FEBRUARY, 1989

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction 1

1.1 Findings 1
1.2 Recommendations 2

2. Overview of the Sector 3

2.1 State of Education in Bangladesh 3
2.1.1 Organization 4
2.1.2 Educational Access 5
2.1.3 Internal Efficiency 5
2.1.4 External Efficiency 6
2.1.5 Reforms 6
2.1.6 Expenditures and Rates of Return 7

2.2 Education and Development 8
2.2.1 Educational Impacts 8
2.2.2 Benefits of Educating Women 8
2.2.3 Rates of Return 9

3. Current Mission Involvement 10

3.1 Current Educational Activities 10
3.1.1 Female Secondary Scholarship Project 10
3.1.2 Technical Resources Project 11
3.1.3 Private Rural Initiatives Project 11
3.1.4 Development and Management Training 11
3.1.5 The Agricultural Research Phase-II Project Supplement 11
3.1.6 Bangladesh Agricultural University 11

3.2 Relevance of Projects to Education and Human Resources Development 11

3.3 Resources 12

4. Coordination within the Sector 13

4.1 Overview of Activities 13
4.1.1 Government of Bangladesh Priorities and Objectives 13
4.1.2 Summary of External Assistance 14
4.1.3 Areas of Opportunity 16

5. Relevant A.I.D. Experience in the Education Sector 17

5.1 Central Projects and Technologies 17
5.1.1 IEES 17
5.1.2 BRIDGES 17
5.1.3 Radio Learning 18
5 1.4 Learning Technologies 18
5.1.5 Other Resources 18
5.1.6 The New Basic Education Project - AMTED 18

5.2 Relevant Lessons Learned 19

5.3 A.I.D. in the Larger Educational Arena 21

6. Choices for Involvement, Related Issues, and Proposed Strategy 22

6.1 Choices for Involvement 22
6.1.1 Addressing Education in the Portfolio 22
6.1.2 Choosing a Focal Area 23

6.2 Related Issues 24

6.3 Proposed Strategy 26

7. Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendations 28

7.1 Findings 28
7.2 Conclusions 29

7.3 Recommendations 30

7.4 Implementation Plan 32
7.4.1 Time Phased Action Plan 32
7.4.2 Actions for Implementing Recommendations 34
7.4.3 Staffing and Timing Issues 38

Annex A Scope of Work
Annex B Document Outline
Annex C Bibliography
Annex D Individuals Consulted
Annex E Field Report

1. INTRODUCTION

This report is the result of the findings of a 2 person team which was assigned to Dhaka for a 2 week period. The team was charged with the task of developing a plan of action for further assessment work and/or pilot activities in the education sector. The full scope of work (SOW) is contained in annex A. The team consisted of Mary Joy Pigozzi (International Science and Technology Institute and Institute for International Research) and Lynellyn Long (AAAS Fellow to AID/S&T/ED).

This report documents the work of the consultancy. Its development was a collaborative process. Upon the team's arrival, the SOW was reviewed and altered slightly. It was not necessary to change the draft education section of the Action Plan nor was it appropriate to develop terms of reference for a sector assessment. A general outline for the consultancy report was developed. This is contained in Annex B. It was agreed that the product of the consultancy would exceed the 10 pages originally requested.

The team used interviews and available literature to come to its final conclusions and recommendations. Of particular value were the many conversations conducted inside and out of the USAID Mission. Two field trips provided an essential contextual backdrop. The list of individuals consulted makes up annex C and the sources consulted constitutes annex D.

This document contains 7 parts. Part 1 serves as an introduction and executive summary. Part 2 provides an overview of the educational system and the role of education in development. Current Mission involvement and that of other external assistance agencies is covered in parts 3 and 4 respectively. Part 5 summarizes relevant AID experience in the education sector. Part 6 addresses USAID's choices and relevant issues, and proposes an implementation plan. The last part, 7, presents findings and recommendations. The findings and recommendations are also summarized immediately below.

1.1 Findings

The team found that although the Ministry of Education and a large number of external assistance agencies are contributing to the education sector it is still in need of improvement. USAID is engaged in significant educational activities, although some of the impact of these might be enhanced if they were better coordinated and redirected. Of particular concern is the Female Secondary Scholarship Project. This has been a successful pilot project and deserves redirection and instutionalization. This is an appropriate time for the Mission to decide if it wishes to increase its involvement in the education sector. USAID would be a welcome contributor and there are a number of areas where it could make very useful contributions.

1.2 Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Increase involvement in the education sector.

Recommendation 2: Find a mechanism to institutionalize the Female Secondary Scholarship Project.

Recommendation 3: Conduct a limited sector review.

Recommendation 4: Identify appropriate support to strengthen lower secondary education.

Recommendation 5: Conduct 2 targetted research activities on the primary subsector.

2. Overview of the Sector

Bangladesh is one of the least developed and most densely populated countries in the world. Its population, estimated at 101 million in 1985, has a 2.7% annual growth rate. With a GNP per capita of $US160, approximately 60% of population live below the poverty line. Three quarters of the country's labor force is employed in agriculture, but landlessness and urbanization are increasing. The urban population was about 20 million in 1985 and is expected to reach between 45 and 49 million by the year 2000. Extremely low literacy rates (23.8% in 1981) constrain economic development in Bangladesh and have important implications for development goals in agriculture, population, health, and off-farm employment.

2.1 State of Education in Bangladesh

Despite recent reforms, the educational system in Bangladesh faces major fiscal and administrative challenges in meeting its goal of providing universal primary education and in developing its overall human resource base. Measures of educational access suggest that the system is biased towards urban males, with rural females having the lowest enrollment rates. Overall, the system faces problems caused by a high degree of internal and external inefficiency and low quality. The current formal educational system may also not be meeting the social and economic needs of Bangladesh. Intersectoral allocations are appropriately weighted towards basic education (with primary and secondary comprising approximately 80%), but recent subventions in the secondary sector have slightly decreased primary's share and potentially constrained overall growth. The share of education in total public expenditures is substantially below the averages of other developing countries. Low gains in literacy over the past 25 years (the adult literacy rate increased from 22% in 1961 to an estimated 28% in 1986) in light of expenditures indicate that the sector is underfunded.

2.1.1 Organization

In 1986, the educational system comprised a total of 54,365 government and non-government institutions. Of 43,661 primary schools, 36,700 were government run. The Bangladesh educational cycle largely follows the traditional British system. Primary education is for five years (Grades 1-5), junior secondary for three years (Grades 6-8), high school for two years (Grades 9 and 10), and intermediate colleges for two years (grades 11 and 12). There are two national exams: the Secondary School Certificate (SSC) at the end of Grade 10, and the Higher School Certificate (HSC) at the end of Grade 12. Exams each year (except grades 1 and 2) also determine promotion to the next level. At the end of secondary, successful candidates may enter polytechnical and vocational training institutes, agricultural training institutes, primary training institutes (PTI's), and intermediate colleges. Successful HSC holders may enter universities and colleges. An HSC is generally required for primary teacher certification.

In addition to the Government schools, there are Madrasah (Muslim religious) schools, Tols (Hindu), and non-formal schools. Many of the non-formal schools are run by mission groups and non-government organizations. The Madrasah education is a parallel system, which offers 15 years of secular and religious education to the equivalent of a master's level. The nonformal sector is diverse and includes mass literacy programs, adult education, radio instruction, family planning courses, and agricultural and vocational training.

The Ministry of Education (MOE) is responsible for all levels of education below university (including Madrasah schools). The Planning Cell in MOE prepares the five year plans and establishes goals and priorities for the sector. The Ministry has three directorates: Directorate for Primary Education (DPE), Secondary and Higher (DSHE), and Technical (DTE). There are also several autonomous bodies which oversee various aspects of educational planning and management, including: (1) the Bangladesh Bureau of Educational Information and Statistics (BANBEIS), (2) the National Curriculum and Textbook Board (NCTB), (3) the National Institute of Educational Administration Extension and Research (NIEAER), (4) the Bangladesh Educational Equipment Board (BEEB), and (5) the Bangladesh Institute of Distance Education (BIDE). The National Academy for Primary Education is semi-autonomous and coordinates pre- and in-service training of PTI instructors and primary school headteachers and teachers.

2.1.2 Educational Access

In 1985, the Government of Bangladesh established a goal of achieving universal primary education (UPE), defined as 90% enrollment of ages 6-10, by the year 2000. The Government also instituted adult mass education and literacy programs. Government funding of education, however, has been quite low and during the 1980's, represented only 1.5% of GNP (the lowest percentage in the region). By comparison, developing countries' educational share of GNP worldwide averaged 2-2.5%. To meet its UPE target goal, a World Bank Team estimates that the Government must increase funding by 7% per annum to reach an estimated 17 million pupils (at optimistically low growth rates) by the year 2000.

Enrollment rates at all educational levels are very low in comparison to other countries in the region. Primary gross enrollment averaged 65% during FY86. During the 1970's primary gross enrollment declined, but improved again in the 1980's (averaging 4.5% per year during FY82-FY86). Secondary school enrollments (27%) are also below regional averages. Access to formal education has favored urban males. Literacy rates in urban areas are 40% as opposed to 20% in rural areas and the male literacy rate (31%) is almost double that of females (16%). Females represent approximately 40% of primary and junior secondary enrollment and 33% of high schools.

2.1.3 Internal Efficiency

The Bangladesh educational system faces major problems in attracting and retaining students, in moderating costs, and in maximizing performance on examinations. In Government schools, one third of the primary students drop out before the second grade and only 23% of those enrolled in the first year proceed to the fifth. Non-governmental organizations have more success in educating poor, rural primary school children especially girls, but are limited in coverage. Although student/teacher ratios are fairly efficient (60:1 in government schools), students receive only two hours instruction a day at the primary level in eleven subjects. Under the best of circumstances, they average 140 hours/year. At the primary and secondary levels, there are shortages of materials and trained teachers (particularly female teachers in rural areas). Approximately 80% of primary teachers are trained. The 53 PTI's are under-utilized and a large number of teacher-training staff have no primary teaching experience. At the secondary level, dropout rates are low, but repeater rates high (exceeding 25%). Failure rates at the SCC and HSC (secondary exams) are about 50%; and it takes approximately 16 years to produce an SCC graduate and 5 to produce an HSC (versus 10 and 12 years, respectively). Gender and rural/urban differences are also reflected in wastage rates. A 1978 study showed that about 80% of the students in rural areas dropped out before completing primary education, as opposed to 63% in urban areas. At the primary level, 12% fewer girls make it through the system and there is some evidence that differential drop-out rates continue at the secondary level.

2.1.4 External Efficiency

The external inefficiency of the educational system is a major constraint on the development process. The system is designed to produce a limited number of high skilled people. The formal traditional exam system has never fundamentally been restructured. Only 5% of those who enter primary pass the HSC at the end of grade 12. Low enrollments at all levels may reflect that the curriculum is not addressing the economic and social needs of the society. A study of the primary subsector, for example, showed that primary schooling may even reduce the supply of labor, especially in the agricultural sector. For rural females with childcare responsibilities, the opportunity costs may be too high. At the secondary level, there are serious shortages of laboratory equipment and quality textbooks. Science and mathematics instruction, particularly, needs to be improved at this level. At the tertiary level, university graduates in the humanitites predominate and a large number are unemployed. The underutilization of vocational training centers may reflect that these institutions are not preparing their graduates to enter the labor market. For the population, as a whole, low literacy rates may be retarding economic growth and development. In agriculture, low literacy rates may be retarding the adoption of technologies and innovations. With increasing urbanization, the lack of functional literacy may also be a constraint on the development of other economic sectors.

2.1.5 Reforms

The Bangladesh Government has instituted several educational reforms and initiatives in this decade. Beginning in 1980, Government implemented Universal Primary Education (UPE) with the goal of achieving 70% enrollment by 1990. In its Second Primary Education Project in 1985, this target was revised to 90% by the year 2000. Highest priority has been given to widening the base of primary education.

To improve efficiency in the primary school system, Government introduced a liberal promotion policy and ungraded the first two years. A UNDP/Government team is currently examining the school year to reduce the number of days lost to inclement weather. Government has also introduced several administrative reforms to improve the efficiency of central directorates. Specifically, Government: 1) created a separate Directorate of Primary Education, 2) reorganized and strengthened the Directorate of Technical Education, 3) consolidated four engineering colleges into the Bangladesh Institutes of Technology, 4) transferred the Vocational Training Institutes to the Directorate of Technical Education and commercial institutes to the Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education, and 5) redesigned and consolidated administrative units to create the NCTB and NIEAER.

Government with the UNDP technical assistance is working to improve the quality of instruction and delivery. Curriculum reform activities at the primary level are underway to institute an "Essential Learning Continuum" based on 53 competencies. NCTB has developed preprimary readiness materials and an Annual Scheme of Work

for primary teachers at all levels. In 1982, Government introduced a policy to provide and distribute primary textbooks to every primary student free of charge. Studies elsewhere show that textbooks are extremely cost effective in improving the quality of education. However, the costs of this policy are high and Government is considering ways to reuse textbooks to moderate these costs. In Dhaka, Government is experimenting with three Patha Kali (Buds of Flowers from the Road) schools to allow street children to learn while they engage in productive manufacturing activities. Government is also investigating ways to replicate some of the advantages of non-governmental schools in the public sector.

2.1.6 Expenditures and Rates of Return

Educational expenditures averaged 1.5% (1981-86) of GNP and are well below the mean of developing countries of 4.4%. Total public expenditures on education (both current and capital) grew by 10% per annum in real terms during FY83 and FY87. This growth contrasted to the 0.2% decline of total government expenditures. Education's share of total public expenditures has showed moderate growth during the 1980's. At 11.2% in FY88, however, it is still substantially below the less developed country average (14.5% worldwide).

The distribution across subsectors favors basic education with primary and secondary accounting for 80% of the allocation. The recurrent unit costs per student year by subsector are, as follows:

primary	TK	291
secondary	TK	1,180
college	TK	1,727
university	TK	22,752

The high unit cost difference between primary and secondary reflects that a pupil/teacher ratio of 1:60 for primary, 1:30 for secondary, and 1:10 for tertiary. Teacher salaries are also higher at the upper levels and account for 98% of recurrent costs. Subventions of the secondary sector have resulted in the Government assuming 70% of secondary teachers' salaries and substantially increased recurrent costs.

The rates of return across all educational subsectors are greater than 10%. The rate of return for primary education is substantially higher than that for university. As elsewhere, the private rates of return in all subsectors are also greater than the social rates. Cost recovery measures may be possible at all levels, but particularly at the tertiary, where unit costs are high and there are lower rates of return.

2.2 Education and Development

The development of human capital is essential to the growth of overall productivity and the efficient use of physical capital. Efforts to increase levels of basic education and to relate technical training systems more effectively to productive employment are essential to: (1) the fuller application of science and technology in development, (2) increased reliance on market mechanisms and the private sector, (3) the strengthening of institutions and leadership capacity, and (4) the improvement in administration and management of local resources. This section analyzes some specific impacts of education on the development process and the rates of return from investments in education.

2.2.1 Educational Impacts

Since basic literacy and numeracy is often assumed in development projects and planning, the lack of these skills then impedes successful implementation. Education facilitates the development of democratic institutions by expanding awareness, informing decision-making processes, and facilitating the transmission of new knowledge, attitudes, and behavior. Education also increases employment and income generation. In the agricultural sector, higher levels of education correlate with adaptations of traditional methods, increased supplemental farm income, and improved dissemination of information and use of extension services. Even a few years of formal schooling has been shown to have significant effects on cognitive functioning (as measured by performance in classifying, categorizing, spatial perceptiveness, etc.). The impacts of education on the quality of life are harder to measure, but equally important.

2.2.2 Benefits of Educating Women

Education for females has particular demonstrated impacts. Shultz (1974) has shown that increased access for females results in more women entering the labor market. Improvements in access also result in more effective use of health services, improved health and sanitation practices, lower birth and infant mortality rates, and higher rates of contraception. Educating girls has higher inter-generational effects (than educating boys) and correlates with improved education of children.

An A.I.D. study in Nepal found that primary and illiterate women marry two years earlier on average than those with a lower secondary education. The Nepal study also showed that education had a low but significantly negative effect on fertility. In a preliminary analysis of Bangladesh data, Cochrane (1988) finds a positive association of increased education and fertility rates until women had 7 or more years of education. This positive effect, however, may reflect that women with more education employ better health practices. Cochrane also observed that women with 4-6 years of schooling marry about 1.5 years later and those with 7 or more years marry about 4.5 years later. She found that there was a positive association between education and contraceptive use and intention.

In a study of maternal education and child survival, Cochrane (1982) demonstrated that every additional year of school decreased the proportion of children dying by 10/1000 for women aged 20-24 and by 16/1000 for women 30-34. The findings of these and other studies generally support the conclusion that female education plays an important role in promoting child survival and female health and welfare.

2.2.3 Rates of Return

Several studies have been conducted on the rates of return to education. Jamison and Lau (1982) in a study of farm education and efficiency in Southeast Asia found that each additional year of primary and secondary education raised physical output in agriculture by 3.05%. The differential output between those completing lower secondary versus those with no schooling averaged 24%. In the same year, an A.I.D.-funded study in Nepal found that each additional year of primary education increased output by 10.7% in the Tarai region and 10.5% in the hill region. The increase reflected that more educated farmers employed technologically more progressive inputs and used extension services more.

3. CURRENT MISSION INVOLVEMENT

The USAID Mission is concerned about the role of education in the development process. So much so that as part of its preparation for writing a new Country Development Strategy Statement (CDSS) it is exploring options for becoming involved in the education sector in Bangladesh through its existing portfolio of projects and/or new activities.

This team was was positively impressed by the extent and depth of understanding of the critical role that education plays in Bangladesh's development displayed by Mission staff. A real and unrelenting sense of the importance of education was expressed by many members. The level of human resources development is recognized as a constraint to achievements in the existing USAID portfolio. It is not seen as a constraint across the board, however. Individuals working with the urban middle class (particularly in entrepreneurial activities) have little difficulty. Those working with the poor (such as farmers, and especially poor women) note how critically aware they are of the need for basic education.

Mission staff are very realistic, however. They acknowledge the necessity of taking a long-term view, knowing full well that it is a combination of well-planned activities over time that will make a significant difference. USAID staff know this long-term view in no way dilutes the importance of the need for well thought out, properly planned, and successful activities, however. And, this was brought to this team's attention very explicitly during one of our interviews. This is described in annex D.

This section of the report summarizes the range of current USAID actions in the education sector, considers their relevance in relation to human resources development in general, and addresses concerns related to resources for work in human resources development.

3.1 Current Educational Activities

The Mission has been actively involved in educational activities in the three program goals cited in the CDSS. These are to reduce human fertility, increase agricultural productivity, and expand rural employment. The educational activities are not discrete. Rather, they have been designed as integral parts of ongoing activities or in response to specific needs for education and training services. Educational activities are being implemented both in the education sector and in other sectors. These are summarized immediately below.

3.1.1 Female Secondary Scholarship Project. This pilot program, initiated in 1982, has been key to increased primary and secondary school enrollments, although its original intent was to decrease human fertility. It is also viewed by knowledgable individuals as an important avenue to increasing the number of female primary school teachers and, as a consequence, the number of girls enrolled in primary school.

3.1.2 Technical Resources Project (TRP). TRP provides technical assistance (TA) to the Bangladesh Government (BDG) in support of improved sector reform and planning. The project requires joint signature of BDG and USAID. All funds are committed for the next 7 years, but reprogramming is a possibility.

3.1.3 Private Rural Initiatives Project (PRIP). This project funds promising non-governmental initiatives. Its ultimate goal is to develop a more productive rural economy by enabling the rural poor, particularly women, to have greater access to, and skills in, managing productive resources and services.

3.1.4 Development and Management Training (DMT). DMT is designed to increase the number and utilization of well-trained inservice Bangladeshi managers in the public and private sectors. It provides both overseas training and TA. the project has not yet been contracted.

3.1.5 The Agricultural Research Phase -II Project Supplement (ARP-II Supplement). ARP-II supplement is designed to integrate research programs across ministerial and institutional lines to generate appropriate small farmer technologies and transfer of those technologies to farmers. One of the key objectives of the project is to encourage the development and management of human resources within the agricultural research system.

3.1.6 Bangladesh Agricultural University (BAU) Project. This project is designed to address the linkages between research and agricultural education. Its particular thrust is to strengthen BAU so it trains individuals who are better able to respond to farmers needs.

3.2 Relevance of Projects to Education and Human Resources Development (HRD)

A significant portion of the portfolio is already directed toward HRD. This is not surprising in light of the concerns about low levels of educational achievement and the resulting negative effects on development activities as expressed by Mission staff and demonstrated by research. One of the underlying themes in many of these projects, even if it is not explicitly expressed, is a concern with improving institutional capacity for developing human resources.

The portfolio also offers a great deal of diversity in relation to HRD. The Mission is able to provide assistance to both the public and private sectors. There is a clear and well stated concern regarding girls education and recognition of the role of women in the development process. Projects are directed toward all levels of learners: from school children to high level administrators. A range of substantive areas are covered. And, USAID's approach includes attention to management, research, and the application of knowledge.

In terms of human resources development the Mission has a broad based set of activities. This set of activities allows for action in a wide range of areas. This provides a great deal of latitude, encouraging flexibility and allowing for rapid response to expressed needs. There may be some disadvantages to this approach, however. For example, it may be difficult to

assess the impact of such a disparate array of educational activities. It might be advisable, therefore, to consider the possibility of refocussing the existing educational activities. This would be possible because of the flexibility of many of its projects. There is the option of building on this foundation for an expansion of education and human resources development activities. These choices will be addressed later in part 6 of this report.

3.3 Resources

The Mission finds itself at a difficult juncture. It has begun to reevaluate the role of education in relation to development. There is an understanding of the value of education and its role in USAID's overall development program. At the same time, there is encouragement from Washington to reconsider its portfolio in terms of education and women as a target population in light of recent congressional actions.

Clearly, the Mission did not need to be told about the value of education, and especially girls education--its portfolio demonstrates a commitment to these areas. What is difficult is further emphasizing these areas with severe personnel and financial resources.

There is no education and human resources (EHR) officer in the Mission. Nor are there plans to add one in the immediate future. Education activities are housed under Agriculture, Population and Health, and in the Program Office. As a result, they are overseen by busy professionals who all have several other important activities to monitor. This means that coordination will be essential if educational activities are to be focussed.

There is also no clear signal that there will be additional funds available to the Mission to facilitate refocussing of its education activities or to expand them even though there is a felt need (evidenced, for example, by the request for this team) and some pressure to do so. The staff are faced with a very difficult decision as a result. The Mission has worked well and consistently in three target areas as discussed in the CDSS. It is somewhat reluctant to pull back from those areas because it is well aware that it is consistent and continuous effort that makes a difference in the development process. Yet, it is also painfully aware of the constraints placed on its work by a slowly developing EHR sector. Is it a choice of one or the other?

4. Coordination Within the Sector

Coordination in the sector is essential for avoiding duplication of activities and ensuring the efficient use of scarce resources. Education, as shown earlier, is underfunded in Bangladesh and thus, external assistance is critical to helping the Government of Bangladesh meet its ambitious educational targets. The following section reviews the Government's priorities and objectives and outlines past and anticipated activities of the external assistance agencies.

4.1 Overview of Activities

In 1987, the Government of Bangladesh in its development planning set the target of achieving Universal Primary Education by the year 2000. The Government also began mass literacy programs. The donor agencies have likewise focused on the primary sector and to some extent, the nonformal sector through mass education programming. Major donors in the primary sector include: the World Bank, ADB, UNICEF/UNDP/UNESCO, and SIDA. Two donors -- ADB and U.S. A.I.D. -- have provided assistance to the secondary sector. The World Bank has taken the lead in providing intersectoral coordination and in the policy dialog with the Government. The Bank has provided the major loan to the sector and the U.N. organizations have provided technical assistance. External assistance will represent 45% of the Government's primary educational expenditures for the projected loan period (1990-93).

4.1.1 Government of Bangladesh Priorities and Objectives

In its 1988 Policy Paper on Education, MOE proposed several policy options and directions. These included giving highest priority to increasing education's allocation of resources in the overall National Development Strategy and establishing a permanent National Education Council. Some new target areas outlined in the Policy Paper are: (1) promoting pre-primary education, (2) encouraging NGO participation in non-formal education, (3) capping secondary and college subventions, (4) encouraging privatization, (5) restructuring the examination system, (6) providing English language teaching and computer education, and (7) restructuring teacher education. In setting priorities and objectives, MOE has worked closely with external assistance donors.

4.1.2 Summary of External Assistance

The following table summarizes donor activities, as reported in interviews and at a donor meeting hosted by the World Bank in Dhaka on February 13, 1988. This table represents a preliminary effort to analyze external involvement in the sector. Should the Mission decide to become more involved in this sector these data should be verified and expanded to fill in existing gaps.

TABLE I: EXTERNAL ASSISTANCE

DONOR	SUBSECTOR	ACTIVITIES	START UP	EST.$US
A.I.D.	secondary	pilot female scholarship	1982	
		NGO-administered	1984+	
		continued FESP	1987	$2.99m. grant
	higher	Bang. Agric. University		
ADB	primary	educational equipment	1978	$6m. loan
	NFE	community school	1981	13.5m. loan
		facilities	1981	
	secondary	science teacher	1984	$37m. loan
		training	1984	
	post-sec.	science curriculum & teacher training	1989	$40m. loan
	primary	Chittagong Pilot	1990	$40-50m. loan
	voc.ed.	rural youth training & skills development	1991	
	secondary	distance education	1991	
	NFE	mass literacy through NGO	1992	
	tchr.trgn.	teacher training inst.	1992	
DANIDA	NFE	mass ed. in rural develop. project.		
		Underpriviled Ed. Program (NGO-administered)		
IDA	primary	FFYP activities	1980	
	primary	SFYP activities	1985	$103m.
		school construction		
	primary	school construction and renovation (3,000/yr. - '90 and 6,000/yr. - '91-92)	1990	$90m. loan $50m. credit
		satellite schools		
		NGO primary ed.		
	tchr.trgn.	primary teachers		
		curriculum develop.		
	secondary	curriculum develop.		
		Dir. of Sec. & Higher Ed.		
	MOE	institutional develop.		

TABLE I - Continued

DONOR	SUBSECTOR	ACTIVITIES	START UP	EST.$US
Netherlands	primary	IDA UPE activities	1990	$10m. grant (co-financing)
ODA	secondary	English Lang. Trgn.	ongoing	
		mgmt. of secondary	proposed	
	higher	fellowships	on-going	
		feasibility study for open university	1990+	
	tchr. trgn.	distance program (BIDE)	1990+	
SIDA	primary	technical assistance (promotion of female teachers, curriculum develop., promotion policies).	1985	$10m.
UNDP (UNESCO)	MOE	Planning cell - EMIS/TA		
		NIEAER TA		
	primary	TA: curric. & tchr.trgn	1985	IDA loan
		school mapping - pilot	1990	IDA loan
		continued TA		
	NFE	Pilot projects (NGO & literacy w/ UNICEF)	on-going	
UNFPA	primary	population ed.	1980's	
UNICEF	primary	NCTB textbooks (paper)	1985	(parallel IDA)
		technical assistance	1985	
		TA: curric. & tchr.trgn.	1990	
		mgmt. & satellite schools		
	secondary	technical assistance		
	NFE	mass literacy	1985	(w/ UNDP)

Other donors/potential donors: NORAD and CIDA

4.1.3 Areas of Opportunity

An analysis of external assistance involvement suggests that the primary subsector is generally well-covered with the following activities underway: school construction, teacher training, curriculum development, EMIS, school mapping, and central management. The major activity in the secondary subsector is science education and some curriculum development of lower secondary. There are several activities in the vocational education, higher education, and nonformal subsectors. English language training (ELT) is covered by ODA and Government activities. Overall, donor involvement is high, but there are targetted areas that could benefit from donor assistance. In the primary subsector, there is a need for more applied research and policy studies. The secondary subsector is barely covered and could perhaps benefit from more sectoral analysis and interventions. WID and differential rural/urban access issues should be considered across all subsectors and particularly in the teacher training and secondary subsectors. The Female Educational Scholarship Program at the secondary level has been piloted and with the termination of U.S. A.I.D. funding, there is room for donor expansion in this area.

5. Relevant A.I.D. Experience in the Education Sector

A.I.D. has considerable experience in the educational sector and certain areas of comparative advantage. This section reviews central projects and technologies, lessons learned, and the Agency's role in the larger educational arena.

5.1 Central Projects and Technologies

The Bureau of Science and Technology (S&T) educational portfolio was approximately $5 million in 1988. This represented 3% of A.I.D.'s Development Assistance. Mission buy-ins to S&T projects were about three times that amount. S&T projects have developed several state-of-the-art technologies in the educational sector. Projects of particular relevance to educational concerns in Bangladesh are: Improving the Efficiency of Educational Systems (IEES), Basic Research and Implementation in Developing Education Systems (BRIDGES), Learning Technologies, Radio Learning, and a new basic education project.

5.1.1 IEES

The purpose of IEES is to help developing nations make better allocations of their education budgets and strengthen their capabilities for educational planning, management, and research. Components of IEES have included: (1) sector assessments and human resource planning, (2) building management information systems, (3) research and development support, (4) field projects for educational innovation, (5) policy dialog activities, and (6) training and institutional capacity building. The first phase of the five year project began in 1984. IEES has worked in seven countries: Somalia, Botswana, Liberia, Haiti, Indonesia, and Yemen. In 1988, the project co-hosted a conference on policy dialog and educational reform with the World Bank to which donors, educators, and government officials were invited. In the second phase of the project, IEES will continue its work in policy dialog and reform and expand its targeted studies (including school-based research).

5.1.2 BRIDGES

The purpose of BRIDGES is to design strategies to (1) increase children's access to schooling, (2) reduce dropout and repetition rates, (3) improve the amount and quality of what is learned in school, (4) optimize use of fiscal and educational resources, and (5) improve educational planning. Components of the project include subsector policy studies, training in policy analysis and models, and assistance in data management and analysis. The project began in 1985 and has developed microcomputer based software models and programs to project the growth of education systems and associated costs. In cooperation with the Women In Development (PPC/WID) Office, a subcomponent of the project has also developed software to analyze gender issues in education. The project is working in seven countries: Burundi, Egypt, Indonesia, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, Thailand, and North Yemen. Research has been conducted on decentralization and

local resource generation, female access, instructional technologies, organizational characteristics of effective schools, and effects of various inputs on educational achievement.

5.1.3 Radio Learning

Radio Learning is designed to improve the teaching of basic primary school skills through the use of interactive radio instruction. The project has developed instructional materials in primary mathematics, reading and writing, English as a Second Language, health, and science. A related project, Radio Science, is also underway in Papua, New Guinea. The instructional materials include curricula, scripts, taped lessons, pupil worksheets, achievement tests, and teachers' guides. The project has operated in all three regions and Radio Learning recently hosted a conference in Honduras which brought educators together from several countries.

5.1.4 Learning Technologies

Learning Technologies assists developing countries in exploring a variety of learning technologies in basic education. These technologies range from simple posters to sophisticated computer-based instruction. The project has pioneered the development of several new technologies and provides planning advice, seminars, and evaluation for missions in this area. The project has an advisory panel of educators, manufacturers, and researchers to advise the Agency on the utilization of new information and training technologies such as computers and video discs.

5.1.5 Other Resources

Several other S&T activities provide support to basic education initiatives. The Communications Support project helps missions design communication components to new or existing projects. The Rural Satellite project worked with eight host country governments to design, install, and manage distance education programs. This project has been extended into FY90. The Clearinghouse disseminates information educational technology and development communications.

5.1.6 The New Basic Education Project - ATMED

A new project, Applied Technology and Management for Educational Development (ATMED) will build on the technologies developed by IEES, BRIDGES, Learning Technologies, and Radio Learning. The project will provide technical assistance for new starts in basic education, support experimental trials and assessments, and disseminate state-of-the-art information and technologies. Cross-cutting all of these activities will be a concern for addressing the educational needs of "marginalized" populations such as girls, peri-urban dwellers, and rural children. The project is in the design stage and mission input is welcomed.

5.2 Relevant Lessons Learned

This section summarizes some of the more important findings from AID's recent work in the education sector. It is presented to provide additional information for the Mission's decision-making process and give background for the recommendations made in part 7 of this report.

We recognize that experience alone is not sufficient. It is essential to distill out the best of and analyze past experiences to inform future practice. These findings reflect this analytic process. This is not to say that what works in one context is directly and immediately transferable to another. Rather it argues for understanding what has occurred before and integrating that understanding with existing knowledge and information on the new situation. The following "lessons learned" are presented for consideration.

o **Investments in education do make a difference.** This has been documented in part 1 of this report. What is important to recognize is that these investments have an effect far beyond the education sector. For example, investments in education have measurable improvements in such areas as agricultural production and technology transfer.

o It is important to remember that educational activities occur in an **education system.** Interventions in one part of the system will affect other parts of the system, sometimes in unexpected ways. It is seldom possible for one intervention to address the entire system, but it should take that system, with all its interrelated parts, into consideration.

o **Institutionalization,** although time consuming, is key to development. Short-term benefits are relatively easy to document: the real challenge is to engage in educational activities that remain part of the system after outside assistance has been withdrawn.

o There is a critical need for **timely, targeted, applied research.** Long-term, traditional approaches of using research to solve educational problems are seldom seen as useful. Intensive, high quality research activities directed toward very specific questions are much appreciated and provide excellent opportunities for developing local research capacity.

o In most countries there is an active, and often misunderstood, **private sector.** The private sector does not necessarily offer better or more efficient education. It has often developed in response to excess demand. It often lacks coordination and quality control. There is tremendous scope for working with the private sector. It is important to consider the relationships between the public and private sectors and to ensure that working in one does not weaken the other.

o Investments in **instructional materials,** such as textbooks, have exceptionally good payoffs--much more than investments in items such as preservice teacher training and high quality facilities.

o **Newer low cost learning technologies** can provide efficient (includes the concept of effectiveness) approaches to education. These include such technologies as radio, posters, mobile training units, video, and "programmed" teaching aids. It is also often difficult to gain acceptance for these newer technologies.

o Provision of food at schools has important positive impacts. It can significantly improve learning gains in young children because it plays such an important role in nervous system development. It can also serve as an incentive to increased enrollments.

o **Access,** rather than conservative religious practices, appears to be a major constraint to increased girls enrollment. That is, educational opportunities need to be provided close to where they live for girls to participate.

o There are times when **low quality** and **inefficiency** result in decreased enrollments because the opportunity costs of sending children to school are too high.

o The value of carefully designed and targeted **technical assistance** should not be underestimated. This is not to promote unlimited technical assistance but to encourage careful analysis of when long-term and when short-term and when some combination is most appropriate. Targeted technical assistance requires good substantive backstopping.

o **Preprimary education** is valued highly in a variety of contexts, and frequently where it is least expected. There is little information on the relationship between investments in preprimary education and improved efficiency in primary school in the developing world. There is growing interest in information on this topic.

5.3 A.I.D. in the Larger Educational Arena

From the 1960's to the present, investments in education increased primary school enrollments threefold (from 100 million in 1960 to 300 million in 1987) in the developing world. Stagnation of international aid in the 1980's, however, led to a declining share of resources for education. Many developing countries, such as Bangladesh, lacked the financial resources to meet their goals of achieving universal primary education in the near future. As educational systems rapidly expanded, it also became apparent that low quality and internal inefficiency often acted as constraints in the development of educational sectors.

In this context, AID assumed a more active role in improving basic education systems in developing countries in several key areas. In 1982, the agency argued for the need to focus first on the problem of resource utilization and internal efficiency, which would over time lead to improved access and equity. The Agency found that it had the capacity to leverage relatively small investments to significantly improve the efficiency of developing countries' educational systems. This meant providing key inputs and technologies to educational sytems in areas in which the Agency had a comparative advantage (i.e., low cost learning systems, education, management information systems, sector assessments, research and policy studies, etc.).

In September, 1988, Congress, recognizing basic education's critical contribution to the development process, earmarked $US64,777,500 for programs in basic primary and secondary education. Congress mandated that AID initiate two new bilateral projects in FY89, at least one of which was to be in Sub-Saharan Africa. Congress further mandated three new bilateral projects each year in FY90 and 91. In the Congressional hearings leading to the Earmark, the House Select Committee on Hunger recommended targetting countries with low enrollment and high dropout rates. The Committee specifically recommended that ANE focus on female access to achieve universal primary education, especially in those countries with female enrollment rates less than 50%. Gender issues in education were further priortized with a Congressional WID earmark.

Meanwhile basic education and female access issues began to receive more attention in the larger international donor community. At an international donors' meeting on education held in Paris this past November, UNESCO, UNICEF, and the World Bank established an initiative to promote basic education for females. UNICEF plans to host an international conference on this initiative in the coming year. The importance of female education and the role it plays in promoting child survival was subsequently underscored by the Directors of UNICEF and WHO at A.I.D.'s ICORT meeting held in Washington, D.C. in November, 1988.

It is likely that basic education and female access issues will continue to receive international focus and attention. From its broad-based experience in the design and implementation of educational interventions, A.I.D. is well-positioned to make significant contributions to the development of these initiatives. New basic education starts in Asia and Africa will further ensure that A.I.D. will continue to play an important role in the education sector.

6. CHOICES FOR INVOLVEMENT, RELATED ISSUES, AND PROPOSED STRATEGY

This part of the report brings together the 5 preceding parts, and outlines the choices the Mission faces. Because these are difficult choices it also summarizes the issues that should be considered during the decision-making process. A final section of part 6 proposes a strategy for coming to a decision.

6.1 Choices for Involvement

There can be 2 sets of choices. The second set is dependent on the first. The first relates to how the Mission wishes to address education activities in its portfolio. The second considers what these activities might be. Each of these is discussed in more detail immediately below.

6.1.1 Addressing Education in the Portfolio. The Mission has a wide range of educational activities. These were summarized in part 3 of this report. Essentially, there are three alternatives. These are to (1) continue with the current approach, (2) continue with existing projects but refocus and redirect educational activities, or (3) embark on a concerted effort to expand USAID-supported educational activities. Each alternative has advantages and disadvantages.

The current approach has the advantage of simplicity. It does not require any changes in behavior or staffing. It has the disadvantage of being somewhat unfocussed and disparate, and it may also be inefficient. As a result, it is difficult to determine the impact of the sum of educational activities. Further, some staff have expressed their concern that this approach may be constraining achievements in other development activities.

Focusing the educational components of existing projects will make it possible to concentrate efforts, thus having more resources to support limited areas in the education sector. For example, the wide range of educational resources from projects could be used to support the Mission's agricultural or population goals. There are several disadvantages to this approach, however. It will require careful initial planning and design in the Mission, and will need regular monitoring. This may be further complicated if several different contractors are involved. This approach may also demand some unusual "contortions" of separate project activities in order to ensure the variety of overall project goals are not overridden by educational ones.

Program expansion has the advantage of addressing the "educational problem" directly. It would allow the Mission to identify where it thinks it can make an impact and design its educational program for that purpose. It has the disadvantages of requiring a longer timeline for design, and the need to address management, costs, and financing issues.

Although the alternative approaches have been stated in simple terms, the choices are complex and need to be recognized as such. The optimal approach might be a combination of the three.

6.1.2 Choosing a Focal Area. In addition to choosing an approach, USAID is in a position to select one or more focal areas for targeted assistance in the education sector. There is plenty of scope for assistance in the sector. Selection of target area(s) will require thoughtful analysis and coordination with the Ministry of Education (MOE) and other assistance agencies contributing to the education sector.

The possibilities for contribution are wide ranging. Although there are many agencies working with MOE in the primary subsector there are also "gaps" in need of attention. It appears there is just as much need for assistance to the secondary subsector and fewer agencies with a mandate to provide support at that level.

There are many other areas in need of support. Adult and nonformal education offer many opportunities for contributions, particularly in terms of "lessons learned for the formal sector. USAID has already piloted support for girls education in the formal sector. There is a clear need for additional work in this area. There is interest in addressing preprimary education. Low cost approaches to formal education will be essential if the country is to meet its goals in light of its fiscal constraints. Design and piloting of such activities should begin soon. Program expansion is pressuring the teacher training system and the administrative structure will require assistance related to management of the entire system. Moreover, although there is a great deal of information available on the sector, particularly the primary subsector, detailed information, which could be obtained through targeted policy or applied research studies, would be of major assistance to all involved in the sector.

It is not advisable nor possible, given funding and staffing constraints, to contribute in all the areas in need of support. There are some areas that are **already covered by the Ministry of Education and other external assistance agencies.** These include most aspects of primary education because it is here that the MOE, the World Bank, and a variety of other agencies (see table 1 in part 4) are focussing their attention. Nonformal education is also well covered, as is science education in the secondary subsector.

There are several areas where it appears **not advisable for USAID to do additional work at this time.** These are vocational technical education, English language training, and higher education. USAID has made a major commitment to the Bangladesh Agricultural University (BAU). This commitment is appropriate in light of USAID's goals in the agricultural sector, and should continue.

There are several **promising areas for possible contribution to the education sector.** Although the primary subsector appears to be well covered there is room for some targeted applied research and policy studies. Lower secondary education is also in need of support for improvement. It is a particularly important subsector because of the implications that the universal primary education policy has for future demand for lower secondary education.

In the long run there are also likely to be opportunities to support the educational management information system (EMIS). There are already some activities in this area and so it would be important to monitor these and then make contributions in those areas where they are needed most.

6.2 Related Issues

The Mission is at an important decision point. Section 6.1 above outlined the choices it has to make. This section summarizes many of the issues that need to be taken into consideration during the decision- making process.

Education is essential to the development process. There are plenty of well-documented data that support this statement regarding the role of education in development. There is concrete evidence that this relatively new nation requires a stronger, more-skilled human resource base for its continued development.

This raises the following question for USAID: **is it worth engaging in education in a larger way?** A consequence of responding in the affirmative is that it will require careful design and implementation based on a better information base than currently exists. It is also necessary to ask whether one can afford not to. If, in fact, the status of education is hampering development in other sectors then there may be no choice but to address education in a concrete and thoughtful way.

An issue that does need to be addressed early on is whether USAID is perceived as a credible actor in the sector. There is no question that the United States has some comparative advantage in the sector. This has been noted earlier in this document (see part 5, for example). If the work and successes are not known here this issue needs to be addressed. In this regard, the Mission already has a "foot in the door" because the Female Secondary Scholarship Program is highly regarded, although not as well known as one might expect. Discrete, targeted, and useful activities conducted in a timely manner would be an important and easy way to build additional credibility.

Also well documented is the **key role women play in the development process.** Documentation and implementation of improved interventions are very different, however. The Mission is engaged in efforts to improve women's access to the benefits of development activities in its various projects. If there is to be additional work in the education sector, it must take full advantage of what we know about the importance of girls' education and translate our knowledge into realistic action.

Further advances in support of education will require that the Mission be able to creatively bring together **and utilize a wide range of resources.** This is more easily said than done. We are at an interesting juncture where there is interest from several sources in Washington to work with missions in improving the quality and efficiency of education and in increasing girls' access. In this regard both funds and experienced technical assistance are available. At the same time, this Mission has the

possibility of targetting or reprogramming a range of financial resources (including under existing projects and Title III support). Thus, there might not be such a dearth of financial resources as was originally thought. Rather, it is a question of determining resources available, how extensive they are, and how they might be combined in an appropriate and timely manner.

Any work in education (even a continuation of existing activities without focussing or expanding them) demands a strengthening of relationships with MOE. This collaboration will be essential even if the Mission decides to work in the private education sector. Currently, the Government of Bangladesh views itself as the leader in the sector and good relationships are essential for continued effective operations. Open and honest relationships are also critical for information sharing thoughout the sector in support of its improvement.

The appropriate role of technical assistance (TA) deserves serious consideration. Although expensive, long term TA has the advantage of an individual placed in a key institution who is able to monitor, assist, and reflect on day-to-day implementation of the educational program. It requires excellent technical backstopping to be effective, however. Short term TA offers the opportunity to deliver targetted expertise at critical moments. It can be viewed as "from the outside" and, therefore, inappropriate, unless it is well managed. The value of "infusion of energy" that short term TA injects should not be overlooked.

The primary education subsector is the focus of extensive attention by Government and several external assistance agencies. This subsector is also in a great deal of flux in terms of allocating various tasks and responsibilities to the different administrative bodies. Substantial resources are being committed to the subsector. This would suggest that USAID may not wish to enter this subsector in a major way at this point in time. This is not to say that there are no opportunities, however. There is a great need for specific information in many areas. There may be discrete parts of the subsector in need of attention in the next few years. And, there are certainly areas where the U.S. has a comparative advantage and could do important work such as in piloting low cost learning technologies and in applied research.

The secondary education subsector is also in need of attention. It has recently been a focal point because of Government's decision to provide subventions in support of approximately 70 percent of teachers' salaries in private secondary schools. This has underscored the need to address costs and financing of secondary education. The subsector is also constrained by its overburdened administrative structure, and need for improvements in curriculum, examinations, and the inspectorate. As access to primary education improves there will be increasing pressures on junior secondary education. There are great needs in the secondary subsector and not too many other agencies operating with already well-defined agendas. It is an area where the Mission has some experience through its Female Secondary Scholarship Project. Work in this subsector has the potential for being highly politically charged--although this is less likely at the junior secondary (basic education) than at the senior secondary level. Interventions at this level will provide excellent opportunities for policy dialogue.

There are many opportunities in nonformal education (NFE). Although the MOE is supporting a Mass Education Programme (MEP), the opportunities for support appear to be easier to access through non-governmental organizations (NGOs). There is an appeal to working with NGOs and in NFE because such work offers flexibility and is highly visible. There are several disadvantages, however. There are data to show that, in this context, relatively fewer students' educational needs are met through the nonformal structure than is possible through the formal one. The choice of working with NGOs is related to an issue that was raised previously in this section. If Government is to have a primary role in offering educational opportunities to its youngsters, then it is probably advisable to assist it as it improves its capacity in this area. Moreover, monitoring NFE activities is highly intensive.

The question of whether USAID can have an impact on the sector needs to be asked. This is a difficult issue, and perhaps one that cannot be satisfactorily resolved at this time. It is possible to address impact early on, however. There are opportunities for the Mission to contribute further to the improvement of the education sector. If the Mission decides to increase or focus its involvement it will be incumbent upon it to determine what impact it wishes to have and how that impact will be measured so this can be incorporated into any design activities. In this way, the Mission will be in a position to monitor its activities, compare progress against benchmarks, and determine impact.

The costs and financing of any proposed activities are always key concerns. It is usually easier to determine the costs than to decide how to finance a new activity that is valuable, but that has to compete with other "equally valuable" activities for funds. With regard to the current situation faced by the Mission there appear to be several financing mechanisms that could be combined in creative ways to provide the necessary financial wherewithal to support the activities necessary for USAID to determine its future role in the sector.

6.3 Proposed Strategy

There are 3 outputs from this consultancy contained in the document. These are a strategy for decisionmaking, a series of findings, and specific recommendations. This section of part 6 outlines the strategy for decisionmaking the team believes is realistic and functional for the Mission. This section has 2 subsections. The first gives the elements or underlying principles of the strategy and the second gives a time-phased action plan. (The final part of the document gives findings and recommendations)

[redacted]. Regardless of what decision the Mission makes, it is essential that it go about decisionmaking in a way that facilitates any current or existing work. The following principles were adhered to by the team as it conducted its scope of work and developed an approach for considering future work in the sector. The team recognizes the need for:

- understanding the structure of existing educational activities supported by USAID

- focussing on and coordinating with existing and new activities in existing projects

- identifying potential targets of opportunity for developing a more coherent approach to education activities and possible resources for program consolidation and/or expansion

- proposing an approach that is incremental. That is, each phase is unique and will have specific outputs or benchmarks upon completion. Arriving at a benchmark also indicates a decision point--should the Mission stop or go on to the next phase? If the decision is to stop at the end of a phase, there will be specific, measuraable outputs that will contribute to the further development of the sector, even if USAID terminates its involvement

- addressing the concept of leverage. That is, identifying for potential involvement those places where the US has a comparative advantage and where limited amounts of funding can have a significant impact

- reflecting a concern for policy dialogue--but the approach is realistic in this regard. It recognizes the need for accurate and relevant information as wellas credibility for meaningful dialogue.

The above concerns are what guided the team's development of an action plan and proposed set of actions within that plan.

7 FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This part of the report documents the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the consultancy. It also offers a plan of action for implementing the recommendations.

7.1 Findings

Although great strides have been made, there is still need for improvements in, and support to, the education sector in the country. In general, the sector is underfunded in terms of what is expected of it.

There are a large number of external assistance agencies contributing to the sector. Primary and nonformal education are the recipients of the majority of attention from external assistance agencies. Although there are many contributors to the sector there is a need for additional assistance if the MOE is to meet the its current goals and objectives.

The USAID Mission is engaged in significant educational activities in the priority areas identified in the most recent Country Development Strategy Statement. These are agriculture, population and health, and employment. Activities are implemented through ongoing projects (see part 3 of this document for a summary). The Female Secondary Scholarship Project has the potential for positive, unintended benefits in relation to primary and secondary education. It can provide female primary school teachers who can serve as a vehicle to increased girls' enrollment in primary school.

This document contains a summary of the most current data that are available on the education sector. These are provided in part 2 of the report. These data were obtained from existing documents, interviews with individuals who are intimately involved with date-to-day implementation of the sector, and the World Bank team, which was also in-country preparing the pre-appraisal report for the next education sector loan.

Acquiring more detailed data would be very time consuming and expensive and might not add a great deal to decsionmaking regarding participation in the sector. It is possible to get more data on the sector. It is questionable, however, whether knowing, for example, that the literacy rate is 29.3 percent rather than 28 percent or whether it is 23 percent or 25 percent of those who enroll in the first year of primary school proceed to the fifth year. All the figures demonstrate a need for improvement!

Furthermore, experience from other countries, such as Haiti and Somalia, indicates that positive and cost-effective contributions can be made to the sector based on this level of information. This suggests that there is sufficient information to make a decison regarding participation in the sector.

7.2 Conclusions.

This section of part 7 gives the team's conclusions with regard to its current and potential contributions to the education sector. The conclusions follow from the findings and provide the basis for the recommendations.

The exisiting Mission educational activities could be better coordinated and redirected, to offer a more coherent approach to education. The relationship between achievements in basic education and the Mission's employment-related goals need to be taken into considertion during this coordination/redirection process.

USAID should increase its involvement in the education sector because of the critical role this sector plays in a nation's development. (This has been documented in part 2 of this report). Increased involvement is appropriate because of the implications investments in education have for the future of the country, especially with regard to off-farm employment which is one of the Mission's priority development goals in Bangladesh.

USAID would be a welcome contributor to efforts to improve the sector. Furthermore, AID's work in education here and elsewhere in the world is highly regarded. The Mission can draw upon its experience here in other sectors, and on AID's extensive education experience to inform it as it increases involvment.

This involvment should be carefully thought out, however. It should be appropriately selected in terms of fitting in with those areas where AID has a comparative advantage, and in terms of what the MOE and other external assistance agencies are doing--collaboration and coordination will be essential for success. Observation indicates the importance of careful negotiation when introducing new contributions to the sector. In addition to the MOE there are many other organizations who have a history of working in the sector and who should be consulted.

It is also necessary to recognize that, as with other sectors such as agriculture and population, impacts are long term. Development, by definition, is a long term process and the sectors that contribute to it cannot be expected to consistently show major impacts in the short run.

There are several areas of opportunity for the Mission to contribute to improving the quality and efficiency of education where the US does, in fact, have a comparative advantage. These have been summarized in part 6 and will be addressed later in this part of the report. This is an appropriate time for the Mission to make a decision regarding future directions in the education sector in light of the Mission's calendar with regard to preparation of the Country Development Stategy Statement, the Annual Budget Summary, and the Congressional Presentation.

Entry into the education sector does not require a large financial commitment on the part of the Mission. There are areas of opportunity that would take relatively small investments. Some of these could be funded from existing sources in the Mission. Furthermore, there are additional funds available to the Mission as a result of the recent Congressional earmarks for WID and basic education.

Continued involvement with the Female Secondary Scholarship Project will continue to build USAID's credibility in the sector. It is also important that the Mission continue its cautious approach. The team has concluded that the Mission should enter the sector carefully. For this reason, it has concluded that a series of targetted and limited activities that have value as "stand alone" activities is the appropriate way to begin. (These are described later in this part of the document.)

7.3 Recommendations

The team presents 5 recommendations to the Mission. The recommendations are based on the data from Bangladesh and elsewhere that investments in education are necessary to develop the human resources base that is essential for long term development.

There is a felt need that is backed by the findings of this team to increase involvement in the education sector. The team proposes a strategy of incremental involvement at this time. It argues for immediate attention to the future of the Female Secondary Scholarship Project. This is an activity that has received good evaluations and that is at a point where a decision needs to be made regarding the future of this successful pilot project.

The team believes that support to junior secondary education and limited and targetted support to primary education are appropriate at this time, in addition to addressing the future of the pilot project. Consistent with an incremental approach, the team proposes three unique activities in junior secondary and primary education. These activities will support and assist the sector when completed. They have the added advantage of providing the Mission with additional detailed information which will enable it to decide if it wishes to continue to invest in the sector or not.

The 5 recommendations with their rationales follow.

Recommendation 1: Increase involvement in the education sector

Rationale: Investments in education are essential for development. The Mission's work in other sectors is being hampered by the level of human resources development.

Recommendation 2: Find a mechanism to instutionalize the Female Secondary Scholarship Project

Rationale: Evaluations of the program have been positive. The project has the potential to directly increase girls' enrollment in secondary school and to indirectly increase girls' enrollment at the primary level. USAID may not currently have funding for the project, especially as it is difficult to justify its continuation under the population and health budget. It is necessary to move ahead and find new mechanisms for continuation so important project gains and momentum are not lost.

Recommendation 3: Conduct a limited sector review

Rationale: A limited sector review of secondary education and those subsectors that articulate with it (primary, teacher training, administration and management, and the economic and fiscal context) is essential for understanding a subsector that is critical to improving basic education. It provides primary teachers and enables learners to be effective in the work force or in higher education

There is potential for USAID contribution to the sector in several areas. These include primary education, secondary education, the teaching force, privatization and decentralization issues, sector management, and girls' education. A limited sector review as described above would provide data on all these areas. It is essential to have additional information on the status of these components of the education system in order to determine which ones offer the most promis of good returns on investments. (A complete sector assessment would also address the following subsectors in addition to those noted above: preprimary, higher, vocational and technical, nonformal, and external assistance.)

Recommendation 4: Idenfity appropriate support to strengthen lower secondary education

Rationale: Lower secondary is a key part of the basic education cycle and in need of strengthening. It is only after students have successfully completed this part of the system that they can continue schooling and make significiant contributions to such areas as health and agricultural extension. This subsector offers many opportunities for USAID to work in areas where it has a comparative advantage. Much of secondary education is private, and the MOE is in the process of developing appropriate relationships and policies to work with those engaged in private education. The Directorate is severely understaffed. In this regard, there is the potential to work in the areas of management training, improved efficiency, and educational management information systems. The teaching force, the examinations system, and the accreditation system could also be considered as areas for potential involvement. With regard to the teaching force, there is a great deal of scope for work relating to

increasing the number of female teachers, particulary in rural areas. There is potential for policy dialogue on all aspects of the subsector. The limited sector review would provide the necessary information for making an informed decision on possible future involvements.

Recommendation 5: Conduct 2 targetted research activities on the primary subsector

Rationale: Although a great deal of information exists on primary education there is still a need for more detailed analysis of many aspects of the subsector. In particular, the following areas are in need of careful study: reasons for low rates of female enrollment; school and classroom factors that contribute to learning; freasons for, and accurate rates of, retention, dropout, and repetition; differences between rural and urban educational delivery systems, and transferring "lessons learned" form nonformal to formal education. The US has demonstrated its ability to conduct excellent studies of this nature and has many experts in these areas.

7.4 Implementation Plan

This section of part 7 presents a plan for implementing the recommendations. It begins with a time phased action plan which is followed by details on specific activity implementation. A final section addesses staffing issues.

7.4.1 Time Phased Action Plan. Table 2 presents a time phased action plan for the Mission to follow as it assesses its interest in and commitment to additional activities in the education sector. It is divided into three phases: short term, medium term, and long term. Each has a goal, objectives, and a proposed set of activities.

The short term phase is viewed as consisting of a few months at most. It consists of data gathering related to USAID's commitment in the sector, and a general assessment of sector strengths and needs, and MOE and assistance agency activities. With this information (see parts 4 and 6.1), and a general understanding of the relatd issues (see part 6.2) it should be possible for the Mission to decide if it wishes to move to the next phase. It is decides not to, it knows it has done so after careful and considered deliberation, and that it has not raised any unrealistic expectations.

The second, or medium term, phase as shown in the implemention plan is designed to meet 2 objectives. It will provide much needed information on the education sector and will enable USAID to make data-based decisions as to whether it wishes to embark upon long term commitments in support of the education sector and, if so, in which areas. Should the Mission determine at the end of this phase that it does not wish to continue in the sector in a major way, it will still have made an important contribution to the development of the sector through its analytic work. If it does decide to continue, in addition to having some of the basic information it needs, it also will have increased its credibility in the sector. For planning purposes, it should be assumed that this phase will take no longer than 2 years to complete.

TABLE 2

TIME PHASED PLAN OF ACTION

Time Action	Short-term	Med-term	Long-term
GOAL	Understand Role of ed in Mission	Define AID's role in ed sector	Strengthen basic education
OBJECTIVES	o Structure AID's potential involvement in ed sector	o Coordinate internally o Coordinate externally o Identify info needs	o Target AID's role in sector o Provide input in areas of comparative advantage & expertise
ACTIVITIES	o Develop linkages o Determine TA needs o Identify ed activities in sectors o Assess strengths o Respond to cable o Design medium-term strategy	o Set up committee or TA o Work w/ MOE & other agencies o Conduct target research & policy studies o Design long-term strategy	o Continue applied research o Implement ed project

Implementation of the final phase assumes that USAID has made the decision to engage in educational activities in a more major way. Depending on the outcome of the medium term part of the plan, actions might range from a series of interrelated research activities, to pilot experiments, to a full scale education project. Implementation of most of the short term activities has been conducted during this consultancy. The next section of this part of the document details needed actions for implementation of the medium term phase of the plan.

7.4.2 Actions for Implementing Recommendations

This section provides detail on the actions that are necessary for implementing the recommendations provided in this report. In addition to summarizing the necessary actions it provides information on timing and resources. It is listed by recommendation.

Recommendation 1: Increase involvement in the education sector

Action Steps: Choose a course of action. Further develop plan and implement it.

Recommendation 2: Find a mechanism to institutionalize the Female Secondary Scholarship Project

Action Steps: The following action steps are suggested:

Technical/Organizational

o Send a copy of the most recent evaluation to a representative of the World Bank with a cover letter indicating USAID's interest in finding an appropriate mechanism for institutionalizing the project.

o Initiate a short-term consultancy with the following responsibilities:
-develop a "presentation package" which links the project to the larger educational context
-outline the issues that need to be addressed if the project is to move from being a pilot to becoming a larger scale intervention
-market the project to the MOE and organizations with the potential to assume responsibility for the activity.

Timing

o As soon as possible

Resources

o For the consultancy:
-1 and 1/2 person months @10,000
Travel, per diem and associated costs @10,000
Materials, supplies and photocopying @500
(Total $25,500)

o Possible Sources
-Office of Women in Development, AID/W
-Title III funds

Recommendation 3: Conduct a Limited Sector Review

Action Steps: The following action steps are suggested:

Technical/Organizational

o Plan a limited sector review to address the following subsectors/ substantive areas:
-economic and financial analysis
-primary education
-secondary education
-teacher training
-administration and management
-girls' education

o Initiate a short-term consultancy to negotiate the terms of reference (TOR) with MOE and other agencies engaged in the sector, define the roles of local counterpart individuals and institutions (e.g., the Institute for Educational Research), and write up scopes of work (SOWs).

o Conduct a limited sector review which would have several outcomes. It would:

-provide USAID, MOE, and other external assistance agencies with more detailed information on these elements of the sector than is currently available
-provide USAID with a costed set of options for continued work in the sector
-provide USAID with improved linkages with MOE and other external assistance agencies in the sector
-provide on-the-job capacity building in the area of applied research for Bangladeshi counterparts

Timing

o As soon as possible for the planning consultancy

o To be determined for the sector review. This would depend on availability of experienced experts in the specified areas of expertise, availability of knowledgable individuals in-country (e.g., the Secretary of Education, representatives of other agencies), ability to schedule some field trips, and, perhaps, completion of the Female Secondary Scholarship Project consultancy.

Resources

o for the TOR/SOW consultancy:
-2 weeks, travel, per diem etc.
(Total $15,000)

o For the limited sector review:
-6 x 2 person months, counterpart costs, travel, per diem and related costs, editing and production
(Total $250,000)

o Possible sources:
-Technical Resources Project
-Title III funds
-New S&T project
-IEES project
-Office of Women in Development

Recommendation 4: Identify Appropriate Support to Strengthen Lower Secondary Education

Action Steps: The following action steps are suggested:

Technical/Organizational

o Develop a plan of action based on the findings of the limited sector review, an assessment of the value of activities to date, and a realistic appraisal of sector needs and available funds.

Timing

o To be determined

Resources

o Resources for the activity will be determined by which area is selected for intervention.

o Possible Sources:
  -Development and Management Training project
  -Technical Resources Project
  -Other sources cited in recommendation 3

Recommendation 5: Conduct 2 targeted research activities on the primary subsector

Action Steps: The following action steps are suggested:

Technical/Organizational

o Develop scopes of work based on findings of a limited sector review, an assessment of the value of activities to date, and a realistic appraisal of sector needs and available resources.

Timing

o To be determined

Resources

o As noted in recommendation 4

7.4.3 Staffing and Timing Issues

A decision to redirect current activities in the education sector, or to increase them has both staffing and timing issues. These issues are intimately linked. There are talented, skilled, and knowledgable individuals in the Mission who could implement these activities, with some technical assistance. The Mission workload and calendar is such that it is unlikely that any of them will have the time, however.

In light of the forthcoming activities (CDSS, Annual Budget Summary, and Congressional Presentation) the Mission needs to make a decision soon regarding what its medium term activities will be with regard to the education sector. This is necessary, because a decision to become more involved will have implications for overall programming of the Mission's activities.

There is a need for personnel to carry through the planning and implemenation of the reommended activities. The Mission needs to give this issue serious consideration as soon as possible.

In the immediate future an individual needs to be identified who can plan what needs to be done in light of the Mission's other activities and make sure that the actions necessary for implementation are carried through. This individual(s) should have a good knowledge of the Mission, be skilled in attending to details, be able to keep the larger goals of the education program and the Mission in mind while attending to more mundane activities, and be able to determine when additional assistance is necessary to carry out the workplan. For the long run, it might be necessary to consider keeping long term technical assistance to direct and monitor the activities.

ANNEX A

INCOMIN
TELEGRA

Department of State

PAGE 01 OF 02 DHAKA 10219 00 OF 02 221222Z 1017 006114 A109655
ACTION AID 00

ACTION OFFICE AMTR-06
INFO ANSA-03 OL-01 SAST-01 PPCF-01 PDPR-01 PPPB-02 GC-01
GCAN-02 AMPD-05 ES-01 STHR-01 EO-01 RELO-01 AMAD-01
TELE-01 /031 A0

INFO LOG-00 CIAE-00 EB-00 DODE-00 NEA-04 /004 W
170544 221223Z /12 38

O 221122Z DEC 88
FM AMEMBASSY DHAKA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 2364

UNCLAS DHAKA 10219

AIDAC

FOR: MULEHAN, ANE/TR/ED; FULLER, ST/ED; AND
- METHOD, PPC/PDPR/SP

E.O. 12356: N/A
SUBJECT: BANGLADESH EDUCATION SECTOR ASSESSMENT:
ST/ED ASSISTANCE

REF: (A) STATE 284560
- (B) CONVERSATIONS, CHABBOTT WITH FREEMAN AND
- MULEHAN, 10/24-26/88
- (C) LETTER, FREEMAN TO BOUGHTON, 11/23/88

1. SUMMARY: MISSION REQUESTS ANE/TR TO COORDINATE WITH ST/ED FOR THREE WEEKS OF JOAN CLAFFY CONSULTING IN DHAKA TO COINCIDE WITH WORLD BANK GENERAL EDUCATION PROJECT PRE-APRAISAL MISSION. SOW DESCRIBED BELOW.

2. BACKGROUND:

2.A. INDICATORS OF EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY AND ACHIEVEMENT IN BANGLADESH ARE AMONG THE WORST IN THE ANE REGION. IN RESPONSE TO CONGRESSIONAL EARMARKS DESIGNED TO INCREASE AID SUPPORT TO BASIC (PRIMARY AND SECONDARY) EDUCATION AND IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE PREPARATION OF A NEW CDSS IN FY 1990, USAID/B IS EXPLORING OPTIONS FOR BECOMING INVOLVED IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR IN BANGLADESH THROUGH ITS EXISTING PORTFOLIO OF PROJECTS AND/OR NEW ACTIVITIES.
2.B. A RECENT PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY IDENTIFIED SEVERAL POTENTIAL AREAS FOR CO-FINANCING UNDER THE UPCOMING WORLD BANK GENERAL EDUCATION PROJECT (1990-92), INCLUDING MIS SUPPORT TO THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION PLANNING CELL AND TO THE PLANNING CELL IN THE DIRECTORATE OF PRIMARY EDUCATION; SUPPORT TO TEACHER TRAINING, PARTICULARLY DISTANCE EDUCATION TO FACILITATE IMPLEMENTATION OF A NEW PRIMARY CURRICULA; EXPANDING THE FEMALE SECONDARY SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM TO PREPARE MORE FEMALE CANDIDATES TO ENTER THE PRIMARY TRAINING INSTITUTES; AND STRENGTHENING IN STATISTICS AND FORECASTING FOR THE BANGLADESH INSTITUTE FOR EDUCATIONAL INFORMATION AND STATISTICS. THE STUDY ALSO IDENTIFIED PROMISING EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITIES WHICH MIGHT BE FUNDED UNDER ALREADY APPROVED BILATERAL PROJECTS: EG, STRENGTHENING THE NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR EDUCATIONAL ADMINISTRATION, EXTENSION AND TRAINING THROUGH THE DEVELOPMENT AND MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT; SUPPORTING NON-FORMAL NGO PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION THROUGH THE PRIVATE RURAL INITIATIVES PROJECT.

2.C. THE WORLD BANK GENERAL EDUCATION PRE-APPRAISAL TEAM AND THE ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK PRIMARY EDUCATION PRE APPRAISAL TEAM WILL BE IN BANGLADESH IN JANUARY

AND/OR FEBRUARY 1989. THE MISSION HOPES TO COORDINATE ITS OWN EDUCATION ASSESSMENT WITH THE WORK OF THESE TWO TEAMS.

3. SCOPE OF WORK

3.A. CONSULTANT WILL WORK WITH MISSION AND LIAISE WITH OTHER DONORS IN ORDER TO TEST ASSUMPTIONS UNDERLYING PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY AND DEVELOP IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR FURTHER MISSION ASSESSMENT WORK AND/OR PILOT ACTIVITIES IN EDUCATION SECTOR. AS PART OF THIS PLAN, CONSULTANT WILL DRAFT EDUCATION SECTION OF FY90 ACTION PLAN AND WILL PREPARE, AS APPROPRIATE, TOR FOR FULL OR PARTIAL SECTOR ASSESSMENT.

3.B. IN THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPING THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, THE CONSULTANT WILL PAY PARTICULAR ATTENTION TO THE ABSORPTIVE CAPACITY OF THE BDG FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, THE AVAILABILITY OF BDG COUNTERPARTS, MISSION STAFFING PATTERNS, AND THE TIME- AND STAFF-CONSUMING NATURE OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND POLICY REFORM IN BANGLADESH.
3.C. AS TIME ALLOWS AND WITH MISSION CONCURRENCE, THE CONSULTANT MAY ALSO INVESTIGATE AREAS OF POTENTIAL COLLABORATION NOT COVERED IN THE MISSION PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY, IE, DISTANCE EDUCATION, ENGLISH LANGUAGE TRAINING, VOCATIONAL EDUCATION.

4. METHODOLOGY: DURING THREE WEEKS IN DHAKA, THE CONSULTANT WILL CARRY OUT NO ORIGINAL RESEARCH BUT WILL DRAW UPON EXISTING SURVEYS AND STUDIES. KEY ASSUMPTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS IN EXISTING STUDIES WILL BE TESTED THROUGH INTERVIEWS WITH BDG, OTHER DONOR, AND USAID PERSONNEL. THE CONSULTANT WILL, IN ADDITION , CONDUCT FOCUS GROUPS WITHIN THE MISSION, IN ORDER TO BUILD CONSENSUS ON THE PROPOSED IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. THE CONSULTANT WILL COORDINATE CLOSELY WITH THE WORLD BANK GENERAL EDUCATION PROJECT PRE-APPRAISAL TEAM AND THE ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK'S PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT PRE-AAPRAISAL TEAM, BOTH OF WHICH ARE TO BE IN DHAKA ABOUT THE SAME TIME.

5. REQUIRED REPORTS THE CONSULTANT WILL PRODUCE A BRIEF (LESS THAN 10 PAGE) SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONTINUING ISSUES; A DRAFT STATEMENT FOR THE ACTION PLAN; AND AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR RECOMMENDED SECTOR ACTIVITIES, INCLUDING TOR, IF APPROPRIATE, FOR A FULL OR PARTIAL SECTOR ASSESSMENT.. THE DRAFT OF THESE DOCUMENTS WILL BE PRESENTED AT THE BEGINNING OF THE THIRD WEEK OF THE CONSULTANCY AND THE FINAL DOCUMENTS, INCORPORATING MISSION CONCERNS AND COMMENTS, WILL BE PRESENTED BY THE END OF THE THIRD WEEK.

6. RELATIONSHIPS

6.A. THE CONSULTANT WILL ARRANGE TO BE IN BANGLADESH CONCURRENTLY WITH THE WORLD BANK GENERAL EDUCATION PRE-APPRAISAL TEAM WHICH IS NOW SCHEDULED FOR JANUARY OR FEBRUARY 1989. THIS CAN BE COORDINATED THROUGH TOM SCHMIDT AT THE WORLD BANK IN D.C. THE CONSULTANT WILL COORDINATE CLOSELY WITH THE WB PRE-APPRAISAL, WHILE NOT COMMITTING USAID TO PARTICIPATE IN ANY PART OF THE GENERAL EDUCATION PROJECT.

6.B. TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE THE CONSULTANT WILL ALSO COORDINATE IN A SIMILAR MANNER WITH THE ASIAN

40

INCOMING TELEGRAM

Department of State

DEVELOPMENT BANK'S PRIMARY EDUCATION PRE-APPRAISAL TEAM.

6. C. THE CONTROL OFFICER IN USAID/B WILL BE THE ASSISTANT PROGRAM OFFICER, COLETTE CHARBOTT.

7. LOGISTICS: THE CONSULTANT WILL BE HOUSED AT MISSION EXPENSE IN A GUEST HOUSE WHICH OFFERS LAUNDRY AND LIGHT MEAL SERVICE. IEES IS BEING ASKED TO PROVIDE AIRFARE, SALARY, AND HALF PER DIEM TO COVER FOOD AND OTHER INCIDENTAL EXPENSES. FYI: DHAKA PER DIEM RATE IS DOLS 113 END FYI. THE MISSION WILL PROVIDE SECRETARIAL SERVICES AND TRANSPORTATION, AS NECESSARY. THE USAID EXPEDITER WILL MEET CONSULTANT AT AIRPORT AND FACILITATE INTERNATIONAL TRAVEL ARRANGEMENTS.

ANY DOCUMENTATION THE TEAM WILL NEED FROM AID/W SHOULD BE HAND-CARRIED TO BANGLADESH; DIPLOMATIC POUCH SERVICE OFTEN REQUIRES FOUR TO SIX WEEKS.

8. ACTION: PER REF C, MISSION REQUESTS AME/TR, IN COODRDINATION WITH ST/ED, TO CONTRACT WITH CONSULTANT JOAN CLAFFY, FOR CONSULTANCY DESCRIBED ABOVE.

9. APPRECIATE ASSISTANCE. DE PREE

41

ANNEX B

Problems and Prospects for Mission Involvement In Education In Bangladesh

Data Source

I. Overview of Problem (1-2 pg.)

A. State of Education in Bangladesh - update WB data — WB Mtg. Reports

- GER
- literacy rates
- wastage rates
- expenditures
- regional comparison
- # schools/teachers
- organization of sector
- external efficiency issues
- long run trends (urbanis., pop growth, landlessness employment)

★ B. Education as a cross-cutting theme for: — Mission Doc. + interviews, Bibliographic data.

- agriculture
- population/health
- employment

II. Mission Concerns and Involvement (1 pg.) — Mission Interv

A. Involvements to Date

- female scholarship program
- other projects — BAU

B. Staffing Constraints and Concerns

- Program office
- Pop.
- Title III

C. Areas of Interest - Relevant Projects w/in current Portfolio

- DMT
- PREP
- Female Scholarship

Coordination with other Donors (2-3pg.)

Donor Interviews
- WB
- ADB
- UNICEF
- Japanese
- SIDA, DANIDA

A. Overview of Other Donor Activities
(chart - from Colette's work)

B. World Bank Progress

C. Other Donor Involvement (or Potential)

IV. Relevant AID experience in Education Sector (2-3pg.)

- AID/W documents + experience.

A. ST/ED projects + technologies:
(backstopping, central project portfolio)

B. Relevant lessons learned (Haiti, Pakistan, Nepal, Kenya)

C. Congressional Basic Ed/WID earmark issues

V. Potential Areas of Mission Involvement in Ed. Sector (2-3pg.)

- site visit
- Mission rpt.
- interviews w/ BDG

A. BRAC - NFE

B. MIS - NIEAER, BANBEIS, Planning Cell - MOE

C. Secondary Scholarship - training of female teachers for PTIs

D. Other areas: BIDE on sci. ed./radio, teacher training, policy reform/dialog on ↑ ~~ex~~ % of GDP for Ed., ELT

I. Findings and Recommendations (1-2pg.)

VII. Appendices / Bibliography
- SOW
- interviews

ANNEX C

Sources

Anderson, Mary B.

1988 Improving Access to Schooling in the Third World: An Overview. Basic Research and Implementation in Developing Education Systems (BRIDGES), A project of the Harvard Institute for International Development, the Harvard Graduate School of Education, and U.S. Agency for International Development.

Asian Development Bank (ADB)

1989 Post Secondary Science Education Project, Draft Final Report. With Ministry of Education, Bangladesh. Cambridge Education Consultants

1988 Post Secondary Science Education Project, Interim Report. Volume 1 The Project. With Ministry of Education, Bangladesh. Cambridge Education Consultants.

1986 Bangladesh: Sector Study on Education. Education Division, Infrastructure Department, Manila.

Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC)

1989 BRAC Brochure, Dhaka.

Benavot, Aaron

1989 Education, Gender, and Economic Development: A Cross-National Study. Sociology of Education, 1989, 62(January):14-32.

Blumberg, Rae Lesser

1988 Making the Case for the Gender Variable: Women and the Health and Well-being of Nations. Gender Technical Paper No. 2-88. Office of Women in Development, U.S. Agency for International Development.

Cochrane, Susan

1988 Letter to Bruce Fuller, November 22, 1988 on education/fertility link in Bangladesh.

Cochrane, Susan, Joanne Leslie, and Donald J. O'Hara

1982 Parental Education and Child Health, Intracountry Evidence. World Bank Reprint Series, Number 429 from Health Policy and Education, Vol. 2(1982):213-50.

Goldstone, Leo

1986 Sex Disparity In Primary Education. International Institute for Educational Planning, UNESCO.

Chamie, Mary

1983 National, Institutional, and Household Factors Affecting Young Girl's School Attendance in Developing Societies. International Center for Research on Women.

Lockheed, Marlaine E., Stephen C. Vail, and Bruce Fuller

1986 How Textbooks Affect Achievement in Developing Countries, Evidenc from Thailand. World Bank Reprint Series: Number 423 from Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, Winter, Vol. 8, No.4(1986):379-92.

Ministry of Education

1988 Continued Primary Curriculum Renewal and its implementation in Bangladesh. A brief report up to December 31, 1988. National Curriculum and Textbook Board.

Education in Bangladesh: Problems and Prospects. A paper prepared by the participants of the Sixth Senior Staff Course. Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre.

Policy Paper on Education, First Draft.

Terminal Competencies (T.Cs) expected to be achieved at the end o Primary stage of education (I-V).

Ministry of Education
1985 Third Five Year Plan (1985-90), Education Sector Document.
1982 Educational Development in Bangladesh 1980-85. Edited by S.A. Chowdhury with Delwar Hossain. A study undertaken jointly by Ministry of Education and UNESCO UNDP Project BGD/82/048.

Stromquist, Nelly P.
1987 School-related Determinants of Female Primary School Participatio and Achievement in Developing Countries: An Annotated Bibiliography. World Bank Discussion Paper, Education and Trainin Department.

Thein, Tin Myaing, M. Kabir, and Mahmuda Islam
1988 Evaluation of the Female Education Scholarship Program. Edited by Eleanore Boyse. Supported by the Asia Foundation.

UNDP/UNESCO
1989 Proposed General Education Project Bangladesh.
1988 Study on Non-formal Education, Final Report. Universal Primary Education Project: BGD/85/018.
An Experimental Study to Evolve Competency Based Mastery Learning Strategies in Mathematics for Children of Classes I and II. Under the UNDP/UNESCO UPE Technical Assistance Project: BGD/85-018-1163
An Experimental Study to Evolve Competency Based Mastery Learning Strategies in Reading and Writing of Bengali Language for Childre of Classes I and II (Undivided). Under the UNDP/UNESCO UPE Technical Assistance Project: BGD/85-018-1164.

UNICEF
1987 An Analysis of the Situation of Children in Bangladesh. BRAC Printers, Dhaka.
Development of Basic Education in Bangladesh, 1988-1993. A Programme of Cooperation between the Government of Bangladesh and UNICEF. Draft Plans of Action. Fourth Draft Version.

U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID)
1989 Agricultural Research Project - II (Supplement), Tentative Work Plan (Draft). Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.
Bangladesh Education Sector Assessment: Threshold Paper.
Privatization of Education Services. Memorandum from Lynellyn D. Long and Patrick Fine, S&T/ED to Victor Barnes, PPC/PDPR, 1/30/89
1988 Nepal: Education and Human Resources Sector Assessment. Improving the Efficiency of Educational Systems (IEES) Project. Coordinated for His Majesty's Government of Nepal by the Ministry of Educatio and Culture with the U.S. Agency for International Development.
Proposal for a Private Rural Initiatives Project in Bangladesh. Submitted by Private Agencies Collaborating Together.
S&T/HR Portfolio Directory. Bureau of Science and Technology Huma Resources Directorate.
1987 Bangladesh: Development and Management Training. Project Paper.
1984 Country Development Strategy Statement, FY1986, Bangladesh.
1982 Approaches to the Policy Dialogue. A.I.D. Policy Paper.
Basic Education and Technical Training. A.I.D. Policy Paper.
Women in Development. A.I.D. Policy Paper.

U.S. House of Representatives
1988 Congressional Record. September 26, 1988.

World Bank

1989 Bangladesh General Education Project Preappraisal, January-February, 1989. Background Information for Mission Members

Bangladesh Public Expenditure Review. A Framework for Public Resource Management in the Fourth Five Year Plan Period, FY91-95. Volume I: Inter-Sectoral Expenditure Issues (Draft).

Bangladesh General Education Project, Preappraisal Mission, January-February, 1989. Aide Memoire.

Beneficiaries of Public Education in Bangladesh, Chapter Two.

Bangladesh General Education Project, Preappraisal Mission.

Level Projections for Bangladesh General Education Project. Memorandum from Elizabeth King to Distribution, February 7, 1989.

1988 Accelerated Educational Development. Education and Employment Division, Population and Human Resources Department.

Bangladesh: A Review of Selected Issues in Education. Population and Human Resources Division, Country Department I, Asia Regional Office.

Bangladesh - Second Primary Education Project (Credit 1574-BD). Supervision Mission. Memorandum from A. Andonyadis and F. Farner t M. Karcher, Chief, ASIPH.

An Evaluation of BRAC's Primary Education Programme (Draft Report) The Study Team: Kamrunnessa Begum, Salma Akhter, and Siddiqur Rahman.

FIELD REPORT

The education team received a welcome and unexpected evaluation of AID's participant training activities while conducting interviews in Bangladesh's Ministry of Education. We had asked for, and received, an appointment with Prof. (Mrs.) A. Khanna at very short notice. Mrs. Khanna is the UNESCO Advisor to the National Curriculum and Textbook Board and has an office in the Primary Education Unit of the Primary Education Directorate.

When we introduced ourselves as representing USAID Mrs. Khanna said she had spent 9 months in the United States in 1961 sponsored by USAID. She was based at Teachers College (Columbia University) and the participant training was "one of the best educational experiences" of her life. She enjoyed her time at Columbia and was especially appreciative of having been able to visit a wide range of educational institutions throughout the United States.

Mrs. Khanna is now engaged in developing and institutionalizing major curriculum reforms in the primary education system in Bangladesh. It is a challenging assignment. Mrs. Khanna is recognized as a major force in improving primary education here. Nearly 30 years later she voluntarily attributes much of her professional achievement to her USAID-sponsored participant training. Surely, this is a real pay-off from our investment!