

PA-ABC-006
10A 62255

DEVELOPING A WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT STRATGEY
FOR USAID/TANZANIA

OF ECONOMIC RECCOVERY AND GROWTH
=CONSIDERING GENDER ISSUES=

Ron Grosz
AID/PPC/WID
Policy Analyst/Development Economist

PPC/WID:RGrosz:rg:5-26-88:7000W

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
INTRODUCTION	1
A NOTE ON PROCEDURE	2
THE ECONOMIC RECOVERY PROGRAM	3
GENDER AND THE ECONOMIC RECOVERY PROGRAM	6
OVERVIEW OF WID IN TANZANIA	6
CURRENT WID ACTIVITIES IN TANZANIA	7
STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT AND WOMEN	11
USAID/TANZANIA DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITY OVERVIEW	14
A MISSION STRATEGY FOR ADDRESSING GENDER ISSUES IN PLANNING, DESIGN, IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION OF ITS DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES	18
GENDER-SPECIFIC REVIEW OF MISSION ACTIVITIES	20
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ESTABLISHING MISSION SYSTEMS AND PROCEDURES FOR MONITORING AND TRACKING GENDER ISSUES	25
GENERAL COMMENTS AND OBSERVATIONS	26
CONCLUSION	28
CONCEPTS, TERMS AND DEFINITIONS	29
PEOPLE CONTACTED	33
REPORTS/DOCUMENTS CITED/USED AS BACKGROUND SUMMARY	35
ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND SOURCES	36

INTRODUCTION

The following is a report based on a brief TDY activity. It is intended as input into the development of a USAID/T Strategy on Women in Development. The Mission requested assistance in this effort and in the preparation of a study to analyze and monitor the impact of Tanzania's Economic Recovery Program on women from the Program and Policy Coordination Bureau's Office of Women in Development (PPC/WID).

Once the Mission staff meets to discuss and agrees upon the strategy, they should develop a detailed WID Action Plan that includes appropriate gender-specific targets, benchmarks and a monitoring and evaluation plan. Guidance can be provided for this activity by the WID Office. The Africa Bureau's Action Plan Guidance Cable, while intended for use in overall mission APs, serves as an excellent outline for a WID-specific Action Plan. Such an Action Plan could be drafted with relatively little additional effort by the Mission's WID officer.

It should be noted that, if the Mission progresses rapidly through the adoption of a WID strategy and the development of a concise, strong WID Action Plan, it will not only be a step ahead of some of the requirements found in legislation currently being introduced (Leland and Schroeder, Women in Development Act of 1985) but also very much in line with the Agency Administrator's requirement that all Bureaus develop WID Action Plans. It will also have brought its own mission efforts in close harmony with the Africa Bureau's outstanding WID Action Plan.

USAID/T would take a lead position along with other innovative mission-based efforts world-wide by developing a coherent strategy and plan of action for more effectively addressing gender in its development activities.

A NOTE ON PROCEDURE

A general guideline for considering gender in the development of any strategy is to pose the initial question, "IS GENDER AN ISSUE?" in the policy, program, or project under consideration. If it can legitimately be shown that it is not an issue or that gender neutrality is truly the case, one then gathers information and develops strategies to address the actual set of issues. If the question can't even be responded to because there is not enough information to answer it, a cost-effective, low-time-requirement reconnaissance effort is recommended to rapidly obtain appropriate information to determine if gender is or is not an issue. (See "Concepts, Terms and Definitions", p 29)

If gender is an issue, one then proceeds to define it and then to design strategies for addressing it. Again, at this point in the process, there may not be enough information to define just what the issue is. And, again, a cost-effective, low-time-requirement effort would be needed to get just the amount and quality of information to allow the issue to be clearly defined and the specific set of constraints, problems or untapped potentials to be clearly described. Once this is done, additional information may be needed to design an effective strategy for addressing it. The strategy might take the form of a program/project adaptation, a new program/project design element or a new development activity which fully addresses gender along with all the other things that need to be considered by that development activity.

THE ECONOMIC RECOVERY PROGRAM

Tanzania's Economic Recovery Program (ERP), in effect since July, 1986, was initiated in response to problems of declining living standards and increasing poverty caused by the combination of fundamental, internal weaknesses compounded by external deterioration of the terms of trade. These conditions followed a period, since independence through about 1978, of impressive national progress in terms of employment, education, and health services. The serious deterioration in the country's socio-economic situation is made more obvious because of this early record of progress.

The ERP involves "the development of specific policies and plans for the rehabilitation of the agricultural and industrial sectors, and for the improvement of the country's transportation system, which has become a serious impediment to productive capacity." (1, pp 2-3)

Its four major objectives are:

1. To increase food and cash crops output through appropriate incentives for production, improving marketing structures and increasing the resources available to agriculture.
2. To rehabilitate the infrastructure of the country in support of directly productive activities.
3. To increase capacity utilization of industries by allocating scarce foreign exchange to priority sectors and firms.
4. To restore international and external balances by pursuing prudent fiscal, monetary and trade policies.

Restated in the 1987 USAID/T concept paper, the ERP goal of full economic recovery in Tanzania by 1992 "will require rehabilitation and more efficient utilization of existing productive capacity." (2, p 1) The emphasis is on rehabilitation and use of productive capacity.

Currently, following the lead of the IMF and the World Bank, Tanzania's numerous donors are collaborating in the Economic Recovery Program. Despite serious economic problems, "Tanzania bears watching, for with its political stability, social harmony, high literacy rate, and untapped resources, it has great potential. Much will depend on implementation and elaboration of the Economic Recovery Program." (3, p 9)

However, to achieve its objectives, Tanzania's ERP requires high impact through very effective strategies to implement policies directed at economic recovery. A very short time frame is allotted to achieve desired results if the 1992 full recovery target date is to be met. Key here is that actions be well planned; coordinated to maximize complementarity and create synergy where possible; and minimize counterproductivity, confusion and ineffective use of the country's very limited resource base. Recovery must also be accomplished with a minimum of negative impact on vulnerable groups in Tanzanian society and optimal use of the existing and potential capacity of its entire human resource base.

Some feel that economic adjustment for recovery is incompatible with growth. Others contend that poor countries struggling with the development process can not afford to worry about negative effects, short, mid or long term. Countries must "cross the desert" at whatever human suffering must be borne.

But an increasing body of literature indicates that adjustment and growth are, indeed, compatible, that nations can tap productive potential and still pay attention to vulnerable groups of people. Indeed, adjustment for growth does just that--it puts a human face on the adjustment and development process. "To respond adequately to human concerns, adjustment policy in developing countries will need to be oriented to structural change for sustained economic development over the longer term. In other words, the issue should not be adjustment or growth, but adjustment for growth." (4, p 5) We assert that such adjustment demands that careful consideration be given to the human resources involved in the process.

Continuing the argument that both humanitarian and economic considerations are involved in recovery, does one consider people only on social equity or moral grounds? Can a nation forge ahead, get across the desert and worry about its vulnerable population on the other side of recovery? In particular, can a poor nation like Tanzania, with its US\$ 3,151 million 1985 debt, its 3.3% per annum population growth rate and its negative trade balance of US\$ 708 million (3, p 2) afford to be concerned with human welfare when its economic resources are so constrained and its situation so urgent?

The growing body of evidence supports the assertion that the answer to this last question is "Yes." Not only is it desirable on equity or moral grounds to protect the vulnerable. Optimal employment of the productive capacity of the population, vulnerable or not, is actually a necessary

condition for the success of the economic recovery program itself. Remember that Tanzania has chosen to emphasize rehabilitation and the freeing up for use of its productive capacity. A very large proportion of that productive capacity is found in its people.

The argument can be made (but needs to be supported through relatively inexpensive reconnaissance surveys, assessments and coordinated research activities) that Tanzania has not only vulnerable groups, primarily women and children. It also has great productive capacity in its girls and women that could be more effectively tapped and dramatically expanded. It can likewise be asserted that it can and will be able to protect its vulnerable groups in the interests of not only its national conscience but because doing so is economically consistent with and necessary to achieving its economic adjustment for sustained growth.

To achieve stabilization (the shorter-run consideration), structural adjustment (the midterm) and sustainable economic growth (longer-term objective), a guiding principle "would be to increase the productive capacity of the poor to the greatest extent possible" One framework for doing so suggests using five broad approaches (5, p 3):

- increase their access to productive assets;
- raise their return on assets;
- improve their employment opportunities;
- ensure their access to education and health services;
- supplement their resources, when necessary and only as an interim measure, with transfers (eg., direct food aid).

Now, after all this discussion, the critical question must be asked, "What does all this have to do with gender?" Another way to phrase it could be, "Is gender even an issue here?" Do gender considerations enter into the context of Tanzania's Economic Recovery Program? If so, is gender something that fits in or needs to be considered and addressed by USAID/T?

GENDER AND THE ERP

WID is not, perhaps, as isolated or marginal as might be supposed when one first considers Tanzania and its recovery program. There are historical examples in which women's issues were addressed, both nationally as well as by USAID/T.

A brief overview of Women in Development in the Tanzania context includes the following:

1. The Tanzanian Constitution and legal system provide a positive environment for bringing about women's development in the country. The 1987 policy of socialism and self-reliance placed emphasis on building the society based on equality and freedom of the entire population.

2. The Union of Tanzania Women (UWT) has membership of 1 million at present. The purpose of the union is to unite all Tanzanian women and integrate them into the social, economic, cultural and political activities of the country. Because the Government has not been able to provide sufficient funds to UWT, the union has established an economic wing in 1988 that will generate resources for its own sustainability. (see p. 10, item 5, SJWATA)

3. Alongside UWT is the Ministry of Community Development, Youth, Culture and Sports (CDYCS) which is charged with promoting all aspects of Women in Development in rural and urban areas. Both the Minister and the Principal Secretary of this Ministry are women.

4. Although the ruling party (CCM) and the Government have clearly explained the basis for the construction of socialism and self-reliance, Tanzania's major development plans have not indicated specifically how women should be assisted to participate fully in the national development. To address women's developmental needs, a major conference/workshop on the role of Women in Development in Tanzania was organized by the CCM in May in Dodoma. The Party Chairman, Julius Nyerere, emphasized the following in his opening speech:

--It would be meaningless to continue talking about the country's independence if women, constituting more than half of the population, were not accepted as independent people.

--Despite efforts by the ruling party before independence, the status of women and their interests was still considered as a favor.

--The issue of women's independence was considered as confrontation between men and women whenever it was brought up in the society.

--Although the main agricultural producers were women, somehow it does not connect that earnings from agriculture should go to women.

--For the country's independence to be meaningful and for greater development to be attained, the above negative ideas must be corrected.

Such a setting provides momentum for current efforts to address gender issues in Tanzania. The nation's Women in Development activities are being pursued presently by rather forward thinking, innovative efforts--some of which are in their very early infancy. Careful planning, open and regular communication, coordination and collaboration will not only strengthen their effectiveness and take advantage of the momentum that exists, but will also increase their capacity to make considerable and relevant contributions to their nation's ERP.

Briefly, current WID-related activities that are not directly involved with the Tanzanian USAID Mission include the following:

1. Conference of Ministers Responsible for Women Affairs in the SADCC Region, May 1988, Arusha. The theme of this conference is "Women and Technology in the SADCC Region". Convened by the Ministry of Community Development, Culture, Youth and Sports, its objectives are to:

--assess the present level of technology for women and the participation of women in technology;

--identify policy instruments existing now with a view to assess their impact on women in each member state;

--formulate proposals to remove constraints on the participation of women in technology development;

--formulate proposals to create awareness among women regarding their participation in technology development and dissemination.

Institutions that are participating in the conference include the Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock Development, the Ministry of Industries and Trade, the Sokoine University of Agriculture, SIDO, UTAFITI, the Institute of Production Innovation, CARMATEC, and TEMDO.

2. Request from the Ministry of Community Development, Culture, Youth and Sports to all ministries to form "FOCAL POINT TEAMS" regarding women's issues. A memo to the Ministries states "Each Ministry has been asked to establish a focal point for women's issues. The leader of the focal point team should be no less than a Commissioner. In key Ministries such as Planning and Agriculture the focal point team leader should be the Principal Secretary. It is recommended that the role of the focal points be as follows:

- a) Ensure that women are the recipients of a fair share of the resources, programmes and benefits to be gained from programmes and projects in their Ministries.
- b) Ensure that women's issues and needs relevant to the work of their Ministries are addressed as part of the main programme of the Ministry.
- c) Ensure that projects and programmes of their Ministries do not adversely affect the activities and conditions of women.
- d) Monitor the participation of women in the work of their Ministry.
- e) Monitor the development of women in professions relevant to their Ministry and the contribution of those women to Women in Development.
- f) Work as adjunct to the national machinery in implementing the Government Policy on Women.
- g) Identify emerging issues and needs of women relevant to the work of their Ministries.

3. There are a series of integrated activities, generally in collaboration with the United Nations (UNICEF, UNIFEM), concerning women and food technology. There is a project being funded to inventory existing food technologies in the country. The study will be used to "show and share", on a national basis, what women are using in different parts of Tanzania. UNIFEM has sent experts through the Women Appropriate Food Technology (WAFT) project in connection with an effort to train Community Development workers regarding women and food technology. UNIFEM is to assist in the development of a national credit scheme, on a pilot basis, to give women access to food technologies appropriate to their needs. The loan fund, from UNIFEM's Women and Food Cycle Technology Project, will be managed and administered through the National Bank of Commerce. UNIFEM has developed a "participatory action research" methodology in which villagers, themselves, generate and analyze data in their villages relevant to their food technology needs. They use this self-help, on-the-spot research to generate recommendations concerning their own needs. UNICEF has been involved in the procurement of the equipment that will be funded by the credit scheme. If the pilot succeeds, there will be follow-on and expansion activities regarding the food technology program.

4. The National Bank of Commerce has been chosen as the agency to streamline, consolidate and harmonize the system for credit to women in the country. The UNIFEM credit fund as well as other lines of credit will be managed and administered through the relevant NBC departments for Small Scale Enterprises/Industries and Agricultural Production. NBC is gearing up for this effort. The bank was selected because

--it had the local resources needed;

--it had an adequate human resource base (7,000 people);

--it had the appropriate geographical coverage in all districts on Mainland Tanzania;

--it is highly decentralized and gives lending power to its branches.

The bank has conducted feasibility studies to determine its interest rates and collateral requirements for small scale enterprises/industries and primary agricultural production. Their policy offers grace periods, lower interest rates and other concessions to women's groups and others who qualify under their guidelines. The bank is attempting to improve its staff training in order to address the special concerns of this program.

5. The Economic Wing (SUWATA) of the Tanzanian Women's Organization (UWT), established in 1983, has as its major objective to stimulate the economic development of women in Tanzania and to maintain and improve any development achieved by mobilizing further technical assistance to women. SUWATA has been involved in projects which invest in real estate for women's and children's centers, purchase of milling machines and the like. They will be setting up training for credit funds for women in the near future.

6. The Ministry of Agriculture is involved in a series of activities primarily involved with alleviating women's daily burdens and generating incomes for their own use through their own efforts. Women have begun refusing to contribute their unpaid labor to their husbands' cash crop activities and have been getting involved in other activities they themselves can control. These include production of cooking oils from oil seeds, brickmaking, biogas production and so on.

This same ministry was at the forefront of women in agricultural training and extension but feels it needs to increase the level of women in agricultural research as well. Ministry staff have identified, as a special need relevant to women, the production of animal feeds from locally available sources with local materials.

To maximize their effectiveness, all these activities must be planned, designed, implemented, monitored, evaluated and re-designed or adapted:

- a) within the context of the ERP;
- b) in close collaboration and coordination with each other; and
- c) in harmony with concrete ministry and donor WID Action Plans.

All this necessitates a carefully strategized training and information dissemination effort so that all parties use compatible approaches or at least so all parties understand each other's approaches, whether they are compatible or not. The next crucial step, for both USAID/T and other organizations who want to more effectively address gender issues, is to develop specific "how-to" strategies and to establish effective systems for appropriately addressing and monitoring gender issues in a cost-effective and complementary manner.

It should be noted that there is more and more evidence to support the hypothesis that appropriately addressing gender issues is a way of increasing or improving the efficiency and overall effectiveness of more global structural adjustment programs as well as more specific government/donor development activities.

There are economists who add another dimension to the claim that gender issues are important to address. They assert that, if one addresses women's issues, one can be relatively assured that issues of the poor majority--low-resource people--are also being addressed. Gender was chosen as an example for disaggregation of policy impacts, "not only because it has been identified as one of the main organizing principles for rural society, but, more importantly, because we believe that gender can be used as a proxy for examining impacts on low-resource farmers, both male and female. . . . Women farmers and entrepreneurs share many characteristics with other low-resource farmers (and may constitute a majority of such farmers, particularly in Africa)." (6, pp 2, 3, 5, 6)

In brief, what much of the current thinking on this subject maintains is that:

--economic adjustment and economic growth are compatible;

--vulnerable groups must be considered in the design, implementation and evaluation of policies, programs and projects, both in order to protect them as well as to fully utilize or expand their existing productive capacity (called investing in human capital with a reasonable to above-average rate of return);

--gender considerations are relevant if/when there is potential for a gender differentiated impact of adjustment and development policies, programs and projects and/or when strategies for rehabilitation, reallocation of capital (human or otherwise) and increasing productive capacity may not be gender-neutral;

--the gender of both participants and beneficiaries needs to be considered in structural adjustment for economic recovery and sustainable growth. Since research indicates that women are a vulnerable group, women's issues must be adequately addressed wherever and whenever appropriate;

--women must be considered, not only as a vulnerable group, but as a critical productive asset. Recall at least one statistic which shows they provide more than 80% of the skills and labor required to fill the nation's bellies. Their existing capacity must be tapped; their substantial potential capacity increased. This is economically sound strategy for a resource-poor country like Tanzania. It would be counterproductive in both the short and long term, not to appropriately address issues relevant to at least 50% of the population. Of this 50% of the population, a smaller sub-set (young girls and adult women) is capable right now of supplying the 80% referred to for food production. It is evident that a relatively small sub-set of the nation's population possesses a vast set of knowledge, skill and experience which are both directly and indirectly applicable to economic development. This same group of people bears, educates and feeds millions of its country's people.

"A focus on helping women . . . requires special knowledge of the ways they acquire food and incomes, and of how they allocate time in order to use services. . . . The rationale . . . is based not only on equity, but also upon efficiency considerations. Poor health and nutrition undermines production and reduces the effect of incentives. For women the need to replace children who have died is an enormous drain upon their energy. Households for whom food security is assured should be able to adopt innovations, or take risks. Insufficient attention to primary school education seriously reduces the effectiveness of schooling at higher levels. Furthermore, primary schooling increases labor productivity in both rural and urban sectors, it reduces fertility, improves health and nutrition, and promotes other behavioral and attitudinal changes which are helpful to economic development." (7 pp 26 & 27) "You can't do anything which impacts women without also impacting their society". (interview with Joel Strauss, USAID/T)

Facts and figures are rapidly accumulating which make a compelling case for "adjustment with a human face", beyond the very important humanitarian reasons. This same evidence is

what is used to show the economic justifications for investments in the productive capacity of a country's female population. "Many studies have shown that small farms (most small farmers are women) have higher land productivity than large Evidence from Africa and Latin America shows that small-scale enterprises have social rates of return far in excess of large firms in many industries In general, primary education shows high rates of return, . . . much higher than much physical capital investment Female education increases standards of nutrition." The later point is focused on the fact that "adults stunted as a result of child malnutrition have lower productivity in physical work than normal adults," and "poor levels of nutrition are strongly associated with poor worker productivity. Female education also reduces infant mortality and rates of fertility. (4, pp 141 & 142) The argument is strong for "production, not welfare".

USAID/TANZANIA'S DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES

If the gender of those benefiting from, participating in and contributing to the economic recovery and development process needs to be considered then we must also determine if and where and how gender is an issue for development activities being carried out, planned or designed by USAID/T.

The recent USAID/T history of WID activities includes the following:

1. USAID/T funded the Arusha Women's Participation in Development Project (621-0162) from 1979-1984. The purpose was to equip women with the skills for planning, implementation and evaluation of self-help development projects. The project assisted rural women in selected villages in Arumeru District using the participatory research approach to plan and evaluate their self-help efforts. The project succeeded in establishing motivated and cohesive groups in twelve out of seventeen villages.

2. Another USAID-funded project that dealt with women was the Manpower Training Program for Maternal and Child Health Aids (621-0121), 1973-83. The purpose of the project was to improve the capability of Tanzanian institutions to provide comprehensive, nation-wide, maternal and child health as well as child-spacing services to the rural population.

The current mission program, which was developed when the present GOT recovery program was in its initial stages includes:

1. Dar es Salaam Corridor--TAZARA (690-0240), an on-going regional project directed at rehabilitation of the railroad. The project includes purchase of locomotives and other equipment, repair of rail infrastructure and maintenance/management training.

2. Transport Sector Policy Reform Program (621-0165) under the African Economic Policy Reform Program (AEPRP). This bilateral program's objective is to reinforce the GOT's policy reforms under its ERP and to stimulate the GOT to make further reforms through assistance in the rural transportation sector. It includes a

CIP-type component for the import of spare parts. No new roads will be constructed but, with the local currency generated, some existing rural roads will be maintained/rehabilitated. From project and PD&S funds, studies are being considered including: tariff structures for road and rail; funding mechanisms to ensure continuity for maintenance/imported parts; better specification of constraints to agricultural marketing; road and fuel tax revenue options; studies requested by GOT to support policy dialogue, promote donor coordination, prepare for possible follow-on activity.

3. Zanzibar Malaria Control Project (621-0163), which is intended to reduce mortality and morbidity from malaria, is scheduled to end in December 1988. USAID/T is considering designing another phase, possibly focusing more largely on malaria source reduction through technical assistance.

4. Family Planning Program preparation activities in anticipation of a possible USAID/T buy-in to a centrally-funded family planning project. PD&S funds are being considered to support analysis of the key bottlenecks in dispensing contraceptives and promoting family life education in Tanzania, as well as to make recommendations on where the Mission should concentrate its efforts.

5. Human Resource Development Assistance Project (698-0463.21) in Tanzania will be working primarily with training related to the Mission's strategic emphasis on transportation and infrastructure in the Ministry of Communications and Works, the Tanzania Harbor Corporation and the National Institute of Transport. The mission intends to look at the feasibility of setting a 50% target for females in its training activities along with a 50% target for private sector training. This is in excess of the HRDA Project target of 35% women participant training. The Mission's efforts with both the Transportation and Harbors training activities has already resulted in a 40% participation in training by female personnel. Through Mission efforts,

female staff have become aware of the opportunities and have begun to come forward for training. Mission response is to fully assist in increasing staff awareness of the opportunities, push for higher female participation and facilitate the bureaucracies involved to assure women are, indeed, trained. An activity that should be noted here is the Mission's plan to provide US training for the woman who began manufacturing feminine hygiene products. Because of this industry, Tanzania no longer has to import any of these products as it once was required to do.

6. AIDS control efforts include support to the National AIDS Program through inputs to WHO's multilateral program. Inputs include foreign exchange, local currency, condoms and training.

7. Development of a mission Food Aid Strategy. The Mission is considering funding an effort to help it develop its long-term strategy for food aid to Tanzania which will promote the country's food production and food security goals. It is currently drafting the scope of work for this activity.

8. CDSS background studies are being considered for a macroeconomic assessment as well as for a study to analyze and monitor the impact of the GOT's ERP on women.

9. Private Sector Inventory and Assessment. Funds are being requested from the African Private Enterprise Fund to conduct an inventory and assessment to enable the Mission better target its private sector activities in the future.

Thus, the areas currently being considered as aspects of mission strategy and in the development of its Country Development Strategy Statement, planned for 1989, include:

1. Transportation
2. Health and Family Planning
3. Training
4. AIDS

5. Food Aid
6. Macroeconomic (ERP) support
7. Women in Development
8. Private Sector

In addition to the above, the Mission will be moving into more activities relating to agriculture. It will also be continuing some on-going involvement in wildlife management.

Since Women in Development is a cross-cutting issue in many of the Mission's activities and an element of its overall strategy, an analysis of gender issues becomes critical.

In this set of current implementation, planning and design activities, several actions can be recommended to strengthen both the consideration of gender as well as increase the likelihood that development dollars will be spent in a more effective manner and make a greater contribution both to Mission program/project as well as ERP success.

A MISSION STRATEGY FOR
ADDRESSING GENDER ISSUES IN
PLANNING, DESIGN, IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION
OF ITS DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES

GOAL: To integrate women's productive potential fully into the economic recovery and growth for development of Tanzania and to mitigate potential and actual negative impacts of the recovery and development process on them.

PURPOSE: To increase the Mission's program and project success rate and improve return on its investment of time, labor and capital through effective (optimal) use of Tanzania's female resource base, expanding its productive capacity while protecting vulnerable groups of girls and women.

To assure that gender is considered in a systematic manner in the mission's development activity cycle in an appropriate manner to achieve optimal and effective use of the Mission's resources and its efforts.

OUTPUTS: A strategy document containing a set of recommendations specific to each of the Mission's development activities which address gender where appropriate to its overall strategy and in which systems and procedures are established to assure that gender is normally considered in Mission activities.

A WID Action Plan containing appropriate benchmarks, targets and a monitoring and evaluation plan for planning, designing, implementing, monitoring and evaluating its development activities.

INPUTS: An initial strategy for its Women in Development program to be used to guide specific planning, design, implementation and evaluation activities (provided in this document).

A series of meetings with appropriate mission, host government and other governmental and non-governmental representatives to discuss specific activities and help coordinate efforts (provided partially through this TDY).

Close collaboration with the Mission's WID Officer to develop and adapt as required, both activity-specific as well as overall gender-disaggregated benchmarks and targets.

Program and project funds as required to reach benchmarks and targets and implement the strategy.

Staff time and support resources as required to implement, monitor and fine-tune or adjust the strategy as work progresses.

The Africa Bureau's WID Action Plan (8) as well as support from and collaboration of the Agency, the Africa Bureau, PPC/WID and others.

GENERAL
ASSUMPTIONS

USAID Mission decision-makers and other staff support WID initiatives and believe women do make major contributions to and can contribute more to economic development.

A.I.D. decision-makers and other personnel support WID initiatives and believe women do make major contributions to and can contribute more to economic development.

The GOT supports WID activities.

Funds are available and mechanisms can be found and/or created for using them.

GENDER-SPECIFIC REVIEW
OF MISSION ACTIVITIES

A gender-specific review of the Mission's activities includes the following recommendations:

1. TAZARA: Commit funds for training and hiring women in maintenance and management and as laborers. Specify the amount of funding recommended, the target number of women to be trained, the type of training to be given, especially in legal, accounting, management, service and other support functions as well as hiring levels. Set appropriate benchmarks to monitor and require adjustment in the plan of action if required.

2. AEPRP: Funds should be allocated for a study to better specify the constraints to agricultural marketing. Study would include gender disaggregated data and information as well as gender-specific analysis and recommendations as relevant. All other studies funded under AEPRP should include a careful assessment of whether the gender of beneficiaries and participants is relevant, either directly or indirectly. If it is, the study should include data, analysis and recommendations as appropriate. For example, a certain tax option may have a gender-differentiated impact on primary users of transportation services. Or women's potential could be tapped by training and hiring them for labor, maintenance, and management or service support staff jobs. Recommendations should include gender specific requirements for contracting under AEPRP. This could involve selection criteria of contractors that include quotas for the hiring of women in various administrative, management and/or services and support functions. Suggestions should also be made to guide the Mission on relevant policy reform issues. Guidance can be found in the Bangladesh example portfolio review recently sent to the Mission by PPC/WID.

3. ZMCP follow-on activities might determine that point-source control of malaria breeding sites is needed. This control could be influenced by women's activities. Technical assistance may call for a survey of women's knowledge of malaria and interest in community activities as well as an information dissemination program targeted at such activities.

4. Family Planning: There are obvious ramifications for considering both sexes in the design and implementation of a family planning project. Guidance can be obtained by studying other projects and programs for innovations that could be applied and/or adapted to Tanzania and USAID/T. The indirect effects on family planning of girls' and women's education and socio-economic status should be considered when planning development activities that impact on this area. A recent PID from USAID/Rwanda may provide ideas for the Mission's efforts. (9)

5. HRDA: The Mission has been selected as one of the two USAIDs to participate in creating Women's Training Potentials Profiles prototype studies planned by the Africa Bureau and PPC/WID under HRDA. The Mission should use this as well as all other sources of information and data such as the results of other Mission-supported or outside studies and surveys to design its Country Training Plan. (see especially items 2, 8 and 9 above) In addition, since many training activities relate to the Ministry of Communications and Works and The Harbors Authority, a survey of the administration, management and training procedures is recommended to assist in building insitutional capacity for the training of women. This survey should include specific recommendations concerning such activities as the selection of nominees for training and the establishment of a selection and monitoring advisory board that includes adequate female participation.

6. AIDS: Both men and women should be involved in the National AIDS Program advisory board.

7. Food Aid Strategy: The role girls and women play in Tanzania's food production, transportation, storage, processing and selection must be well-understood. For example, a technology may diminish or, conversely, actually increase women's burdens vis-a-vis food or the many other activities she is involved in. It is also not always clear that imports of food assist either men or women producers or vendors, rural or urban. Serious shifts in the terms of trade between rural and urban have been noted because of CIP activities. Lags in response to policy shifts can be fatal or very harmful to people living on the edge of subsistence. Agriculture, processing and manufacturing require time to change production patterns and people can be seriously harmed during that lag period. Policies that discriminate against food in favor of export crops can also have a gender-differentiated impact. The Scope of Work for the Mission's Food Aid Strategy should include the consideration of gender issues and require expertise in women's issues to be included. Food aid is a very complex concept. The AID Administrator has just appointed an Assistant for Food Aid to help the Agency in this area

8. CDSS Background Studies: Both studies call for gender disaggregated research, analysis and recommendation. Guidance can be received from PPC/WID and the Africa Bureau in doing marcoeconomic assessments or conducting a policy inventory. The study to analyze and monitor the impact of the ERP on women is critical to the development of a coherent development strategy statement. If well designed and implemented, it would certainly help set the state-of-the-art in WID and structural reform for economic growth.
(10)

9. Private Sector Inventory and Assessment: Men's, women's and children's roles in both formal and non-formal private sector activities

should be analyzed to strengthen this study and to gain optimal economic and social effectiveness from the dollars spent on the recommendations that result from it. Micro and small scale enterprises should be investigated along with larger enterprises since there is growing awareness of the often important degree to which these levels of activity impact on developing economies. Guidance is available from both the Africa Bureau as well as PPC/WID. (eg., work underway by Orsini and Peuse under HRDA, the PEDS II effort, etc.)

There are obviously other activities the mission should consider in a fully developed Women in Development Strategy. A major one, which would not only be effective but, again, amplify the mission's lead in certain areas of WID, would be to strategize the use of its local currency fund to include WID activities. Guidance is available from PPC/WID if desired.

11. Management Plan for Use of Local Currency:
Among the ways to use these funds, the Mission should consider the following:

- support current efforts of the Ministry of CDCYS to establish a clearing-house on all information on Tanzanian women's issues, so that all such information is in one place. Later, include computers in the clearing-house to tie it into the Washington-based AID/PPC/CDIE database system.
- establish a list of local consultants with WID expertise, skills or experience.
- establish a woman's loan fund for individuals and groups to be used for micro and smallscale uses directed at productive activities, relief of time/burden, or enterprise development. There is precedent for and growing interest in alleviation of the constraint to credit faced by women in agriculture and private sector activities. Perhaps such a fund could be established in collaboration with the one being set up by UNIFEM through the National Bank of Commerce.

-hire a technically capable person to conduct a long-term study of poor rural and urban women's and men's roles and functions in order to establish an adequate baseline across the country as part of an information system regarding women in development vis-a-vis differentials in access to resources, information, etc.

-fund a short, high-level seminars and brief (2-5 days) mid-level workshop to assist the GOT develop its own WID strategy. The Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Culture has activities which are quite innovative, badly needed and very underfunded. These efforts are concerned with developing policy and a strategy for establishing systems which address women in development issues. As a beginning, a collaborative effort could be designed and implemented to help establish the foundation for the "Focal Point Teams" called for in each Ministry (as described on p. 8, item 2 above), to sensitize team members to the issues and provide them with specific "how-to" skills to design and monitor effective Ministry-level WID Action Plans.

-channel funds through an existing acceptable avenue such as the newly-appointed UNIFEM WID coordinator who will be working with the Ministry of CDCYS.

As it strategizes the use of its local currency fund, the Mission should assure that host-country men and women are included on an advisory board to assist Mission personnel develop an appropriate plan for its use.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ESTABLISHING MISSION
SYSTEMS AND PROCEDURES FOR
MONITORING AND TRACKING GENDER ISSUES

1. Someone should be appointed to review and/or coordinate a review process, for Women in Development implications, of all program and project documents (terms of reference, SOWs, PIDs, PPs, RFPs, reports and other documents) relevant to the conception, planning, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the Mission's development activities.
2. A concise SOW should be written for the above position and reviewed and approved by the Mission Director. The SOW should include review and review coordination, as above, participation at meetings, liaison with GOT, donors, NGOs and the academic community.
3. The WID officer should establish procedures, routing, what's expected, etc. to assure a mission-appropriate review and recommendation system. The procedure should include signed clearance by the Mission Director that documents were appropriately reviewed and recommendations for adapting or designing were adequately considered and adopted where appropriate. An explanation should be drafted by the WID officer and attached to relevant documents/reports if, for some reason, gender issues were not able to be adequately addressed.
4. Periodic training should be incorporated into the Mission's strategy for all USAID/T personnel involved in the planning, design, implementation and evaluation of its programs and projects. Such training will be appropriate in length, content and methodology to the particular participant group being trained. It can include increasing awareness about gender issues in economic development, giving practical experience and developing appropriate skills for addressing gender issues, periodic adjusting of systems and procedures related to the Mission's Women in Development strategy, and so on.
5. The Mission WID Officer should establish an appropriate WID tracking and monitoring system which is efficient, cost-effective and minimizes staff management burden. The tracking system should be designed in collaboration with efforts currently under way in the Africa Bureau, PPC/CDIE and PPC/WID. It should also be designed in collaboration with relevant host-country institutions and ministries, other donors, NGOs and the Tanzanian academic community.
6. The Mission should establish a WID Technical Committee to work in collaboration with the WID officer in reviews, discussions and decisions concerning gender issues in Mission development activities.

GENERAL COMMENTS AND OBSERVATIONS

The following additional points are recommended for discussion and decision:

1--The mission may want to consider the creation of citizen's advisory groups or councils, with proportional representation of women or composed entirely of women, depending on the specific activity, as part of program and project activity, as deemed appropriate. This is a technique used in many situations in many countries to assist in the difficult task of gaining adequate input and keeping communication flowing in both directions with those who are expected to benefit from, participate in and contribute to development activities. It is advisable to avoid creation of an only-women council in most circumstances since full-scale integration of women in development is more effective. Sometimes only-women's groups are marginalized. A key concern is to determine gender differentials. This requires input from both women and men.

2--There is often much primary data and secondary information in existence from a variety of sources. Quite frequently what is needed is to ferret out this data and information, clean it up if possible and use it at the appropriate level to assist in strategizing, assessing, analyzing, monitoring and evaluating development activities. It is a relatively low cost effort to gather and clean up this information and could be considered a worthwhile effort to get past the "lack-of-data" or "primary-research-costs-too-much" issues. Once such an effort is accomplished, the Mission is in the enviable position of having its information where it wants it--to use and to build upon as "development happens". Agency policy, Congressional legislation (eg., the recently introduced Women in Development Act of 1988 by Leland and Schroeder), and donor activity all require the rapid development of appropriate information about Women in Development. Accomplishing this in a cost-effective manner should be a Mission priority so it can pre-empt problems and function proactively rather than reactively.

3-It is cost-effective to disaggregate all new data-gathering efforts as well as to begin such disaggregation in on-going mission activity. And, the best time to begin disaggregating information by gender is now. If an error is made by disaggregating by gender when it is later discovered that it was not required, information can always be simply and inexpensively re-aggregated. The obverse is not true.

IN CONCLUSION

The mission has the opportunity of being in a leadership position vis-a-vis its consideration of gender. It is already in the position of being able to be "pro"active and logical rather than "re"active since it is in the process of establishing a new development strategy and set of program activities. It is also operating in a country that is taking some substantial local initiative regarding addressing the issues of Women in Development. It can provide impetus to that effort with the assurance that its dollars and shillings will be better spent, its programs and projects will be more effective and successful and economic recovery and growth will, by most criteria, "happen better".

This report, based on a ten-day TDY, is offered as suggestion and recommendation for further study, discussion and decision.

I would like to thank all those people, Mission staff, official Tanzanians and the many others I met, who spent valuable time with me to give me the perspective and background information and their insights and aspirations regarding women and development activities in Tanzania.

Special thanks go to Joe Stepanek for his encouragement of this effort and his special insights into the problems of increasing the skills and capacities of a developing nation's human resource base. The close collaboration of Hedwiga Mbuya and the guidance and advice provided by Paula Tavrow were major contributions to this report. Continued awareness of gender issues and increasing capacity to address them by Mission staff is a necessary condition for the success of their WID strategy.

CONCEPTS, TERMS AND DEFINITIONS

1. GENDER AND WOMEN

The initial impetus for a focus on the roles and functions of women in developing countries was a concern with equity--an attempt to ensure that development projects and processes provided benefits to women as well as to men. Over time, however, it became clear that differences between the roles, responsibilities and opportunities of men and women have implications that go beyond equity; they also effect projects' ability to achieve their immediate purposes and long-range development goals. The introduction of the more relational term "gender" to complement emphasis on "women" is one important indication of a growing concern with the broader implications of differences between men's and women's economic roles.

A focus on "women" in isolation can obscure differences among women stemming from age, socioeconomic status, and stage in the production cycle. "Gender" is a broader analytic concept, which not only encompasses concern with women but also with men. Gender differential effect, impact, results, opportunity, access and control is part of the determinant of whether a development activity is appropriate as well as whether it will be effective. Gender, like age and socioeconomic status, is an aspect of social organization that both reflects and is circumscribed by the surrounding culture.

2. BENEFICIARY AND PARTICIPANT

In recent years, development theorists have come to differentiate between direct versus indirect and intended versus unintended beneficiaries of programs and projects. But there has been no comparable rigor in the distinction between participants and beneficiaries. Regardless of whether they play any active role in a program or project, residents in affected areas are commonly referred to as "participants". Regardless of whether or not they actually benefit, participants in development activities are commonly referred to as "beneficiaries".

There is a clear need for more precise terminology. The simple equation of presence in the project area with "participation" and the equation of "participation in" with "benefit from" a project is particularly troublesome in the case of women. For example, it can never be assumed that if one family member participates in a project, the whole family participates. Nor can it be assumed that if one family member

benefits, there is an automatic "trickle over" benefit to other members. Precision about the gender, age, and socioeconomic status of project participants and actual beneficiaries is important.

Clarification of terminology is a prerequisite for shedding light on how the distribution of benefits within households affect women's and men's differential incentives to undertake project activities and how these affect project and program outcomes. It is also basic to the reality that women's productive capacity, as major contributors to and participants in economic development, is an integral part of the development equation. They not only are supposed to benefit from but must participate in and contribute to programs and projects.

3. PRODUCTIVE CAPACITY

The human resource base of developing nations is often their most valuable asset. Tapping and expanding it must be carefully strategized. The skills and experience possessed by the female population is an integral part of this human resource base. It is this resource that is a necessary part of economic effectiveness and is the reason for developing a Women in Development Strategy that seeks to optimize women's participation in and contribution to the development of their societies.

4. ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS

The concept of economic efficiency weighs outputs against inputs and asserts that the point of efficiency is that at which output is at its maximum for a given set of inputs.

The concept of economic effectiveness is a more global concept and would hold that economic efficiency need not be economic effectiveness and visa versa. Maximum output of a given operation may actually be counterproductive to the function of the overall economic system. Economic efficiency is often the major or sole decision-making criterion for resource allocation. Unfortunately, effectiveness is sometimes compromised and the individual activity can be judged "successful" on efficiency grounds when, in fact, it contributed to less than or reduced effectiveness overall.

It is suggested that efficiency criteria be used to assess economic activities within the context of effectiveness.

5. Constraint and Issue

Strategic consideration of gender is relevant if/when there is potential for gender differential impact of the development process. Such differential impact could be either positive or negative. Consideration of gender is also relevant if/when there is a potential for expanding economically positive contributions of productive capacity or where this potential is under or unused.

In the process of conducting gender analysis and project adaptation, there has been a marked tendency to focus on the "problems" or "constraints" which impede women's full participation in economic development. While it is, of course, imperative to identify the constraints faced by both male and female beneficiaries, it is equally important to recognize the assets and opportunities which a target population may possess.

For example, small-holders in Africa, have been extremely effective in planning and participating in agricultural research when given the opportunity. African farmers have, by necessity become the agricultural experts for their particular environment and have for generations integrated biological, economic, environmental, and social factors into their farming decisions. Similarly, many farmers (particularly women) have formed informal cooperatives to undertake agricultural labor on each others fields in response to household labor shortages. These informal institutions and indigenous knowledge systems should be identified and utilized as project assets.

In order to stress that both the negative and the positive are critical in analyzing, adapting or designing development activities, the more inclusive term "issue" will be used. It is a broader concept and helps assure that both constraints and opportunities are effectively addressed and discussed.

6. Appropriate

To bring some clarity to this bandied and brandished term, here it is used as an adjective to modify something that works, that gets the job done, is sustainable, used and useable in a specific situation by a particular user in a socio-economic environment.

In that sense, "appropriate" technology is technology that works, is useable and used, that gets the job done by and for the people it is intended for and is affordable and repairable within the socio-economic context of its use.

"Appropriate" information is information that is used and useable at the level and in the specific situation intended. Thus, data that can be gathered, analyzed and used in a cost-effective manner and transformed into useable and useful information may be appropriate. Some situations call for a number presented to the fourth decimal place. Analysis that distinguishes changes at that fourth decimal place are critical, for example, in certain discussion about electronic information transfer. The same numbers and distinctions between them would be inappropriate for discussion, say, about the rate of glaciation across northern America during the ice age.

A key myth that needs to be broken is that appropriateness of technology, information, training, policies and so on can be determined outside a specific socio-cultural situation. One can't look at a new tool and say it is appropriate technology without knowing who will use it, how, when, where. Appropriateness is determined, to a large degree, then, by the job that needs to get done and by the people using the information, technology, and so on. "Appropriate" can not modify a noun in a vacuum. And, what is appropriate technology for one situation can be inappropriate in another. Simple, primitive, low-impact, hand-operated, wind-driven and other modifiers are often used incorrectly as synonyms for appropriate.

PEOPLE CONTACTED

- BAKER, Stafford, AID/AFR/PD/EA, Project Development Officer
- CHIAMBA, William, National Bank of Commerce
- DEMBOWSKI, Don, AID/PPC/CDIE/DI, Economic and Social Data System
- DIAZ-HERRERA, Elizabeth, Small Business Development Consultant for Women and Minority-owned Enterprises, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin
- HAHN, Zach, USAID, Project Development Officer
- JASPER, Jan, Institute of Production Innovation, Financial Advisor University of Dar es Salaam
- KAWANDAKAMU, H.S., National Bank of Commerce
- KIBONDE, F.J., National Bank of Commerce, Director of Domestic Banking
- KOCKEN, Els, UNIFEM Representative, Dar es Salaam
- LUENA, Grace, Ministry of Agriculture
- LYCETTE, Margarete, International Center for Research on Women, Washington, DC
- MANSUR, Beatrice, Ministry of Community Development, Culture, Youth and Sports, Department of Women and Children
- MBISE Ndemanyiswa, Shirika la Uchumi la Wanawake Tanzania (SUWATA), The Economic Wing of the National Women's Union (UWT)
- MBUYA, Hedwiga, USAID, WID Officer
- MDOE, Miki, USAID, Training Officer
- MWAMBENJA, S.M.J., National Bank of Commerce, Manager of Follow-up and Loan Administration
- NGOWI, Daniel, USAID, Economist
- NKOMA-WAMUNZA, Alice, Women Research and Documentation Project, University of Dar es Salaam

- NOREM, Rosalie, Interim Chair, Department of Family Environment, College of Family and Consumer Sciences, Iowa State University, Ames, Iowa
- POATS, Susan V., formerly Associate Director Farming Systems Support Project, University of Florida, Co-director of Gender and Agriculture Project of the Population Council, Gainesville, Florida
- ROSE, John, AID/AFR/EA, Tanzania Desk Officer
- SPRING, Anita, Associate Dean of the College of Liberal Arts and Science, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida
- STEPANEK, Joseph, USAID, Mission Representative
- STRAUSS, Joel, USAID, Food and Agriculture Officer
- TAVROW, Paula, USAID, Program Officer/Economist

REPORTS AND DOCUMENTS CITED

1. Report to the Consultative Group for Tanzania on the Government's Economic Recovery Program, Eastern and Southern Africa Regional Office, May 20, 1986.
2. Concept Paper for A.I.D. Development Assistance to Tanzania, USAID/Tanzania, March 12, 1987.
3. Foreign Economic Trends and their Implications for the United States, Tanzania, prepared by American Embassy Dar es Salaam for U.S. Dept. of Commerce, International Marketing Information Series, FET 87-50, July 1987.
4. Adjustment with a Human Face Vol.1: Protecting the Vulnerable and Promoting Growth, Andrea Cornia, Richard Jolly and Francis Stewart, 1987.
5. The Alleviation of Poverty under Structural Adjustment, Lionel Demery and Tony Addison, The World Bank (IBRD), 1987.
6. The Policy Inventory, A Manual for Rapid Appraisal of Policies Affecting the Agricultural Sector with Disaggregation of Impacts by Gender: A Summary, in Participant Workbook, Gender Resources in African Agricultural Systems AID Workshop held September 24-26, 1987 in Nairobi, Kenya.
7. Structural Adjustment and Vulnerable Groups in Sierra Leone, Richard Longhurst, Samura Kamara and Joseph Mansura, 1988 in IDS Bulletin, Vol.19, No.1, Brighton, Institute of Development Studies.
8. Africa Bureau WID Action Plan, AID/AFR, 1987; 1988 update.
9. Project Identification Document for the Rwanda Family Planning Project (696-0128), December 1987, USAID/Rwanda.
10. Conceptual Framework and Terms of Reference for A Pilot Case Study to Analyze and Monitor the Impact of Tanzania's Economic Recovery Program on Women: Establishing a Baseline and Tracking System. Ron Grosz for USAID/T with AID/PPC/WID, 15 April 1988.

ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND SOURCES

1. The Impact of Structural Adjustment on Women: Concepts and Issues, Diane Elson, University of Manchester, May, 1987.
2. Women in Development: A.I.D.'s Experience, 1973-1985; Vol 1. Synthesis Paper, A.I.D. Program Evaluation Report No. 18, Alice S. Carloni, April 1987.
3. Gender Issues in Latin America and the Carribbean, The Gender Manual Series, A.I.D., 1986.
4. A Women in Development Implementation Plan for USAID/Bangladesh, M. Berger, International Center for Research on Women, and M. Greeley, Institute for Development Studies, University of Sussex, April 1987.