

Focusing on Women: A Review of the USAID/Pakistan Portfolio

**International Center for Research on Women
Washington, D.C.**

March, 1986

DRAFT

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Summary and Recommendations	i
Introduction	1
Section I: Project Reviews	2
ISM and On-Farm Water Management	3 ✓
Food Security Management	7
Forestry Planning and Development	11
Beluchistan Area Development	14
Tribal Areas and NWFP Development	21
TIPAN	23
MART	27
Rural Electrification	29
Energy Planning and Development	32
Section II: Suggestions for a Strategy	36
References	39
List of Contacts	40

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This report reviews the opportunities available for improving women's productivity, economic opportunities, and contribution to project success in USAID projects in three main areas: Agriculture, Energy, and Training. It is based mainly on project documents and interviews with USAID staff, supplemented by interviews and site visits at Karachi and Peshawar and discussions with staff of several key GOP, U.N., and private sector organizations.

There are numerous opportunities for reaching women through projects in the current USAID portfolio, and they are specified project by project in this report. Many opportunities suggested imply a concerted effort to reach down to the community level in projects that might not otherwise do so. Together, the project-level recommendations constitute a concrete strategy for improving women's situation that can be categorized, in terms of ease of implementation, as follows:

1. Data collection activities and/or review of existing data for projects that already have data components. These activities can be implemented immediately and with virtually no additional effort on the part of USAID. They represent critical opportunities to collect accurate information on women that may be incorporated into current and future project designs.

2. Strong emphasis on selection of women as training candidates. These recommendations are made for projects which already have training components and will therefore be relatively easy to implement if USAID is willing to take a strong stance with the GOP regarding this issue.

3. Community level components or sub-projects in a variety of areas to complement the more "macro-level" approach or emphasis on infrastructure in many projects. Examples of such activities include transfer of appropriate technology to women for agro-processing and livestock care, training in production techniques and marketing, income-generation for women, efforts to take account of women's roles in water management, etc. These interventions

will require a significant commitment of resources and could be undertaken in phases, beginning with one or two selected sub-projects to be implemented on a pilot basis.

Implementation of this strategy need not involve much additional staff time. However, we suggest that the WID Officer must have adequate time to devote to this strategy; relocation of the WID Assistant staff position to the Program Office and/or placement of additional FSN WID assistance in the Program Office may be required; and the WID staff should be involved with the identification of relevant technical expertise in the Pakistani private sector (through the PIO now being prepared to establish a Mission IQC for a broad range of technical services)--this would help develop a pool of technical resources for use in the WID strategy implementation.

We suggest two implementation options:

A. The WID staff would initiate selection of contractors and coordinate their implementation activities with project officers for project components or sub-projects that the Mission decides to implement. To supplement Mission staff time, USAID could take advantage of ICRW's technical assistance through our AID/W funded cooperative agreement (subject to AID/W approval). ICRW would then assist with the identification of local contractors and help monitor their implementation activities.

B. Alternatively, if the Mission wishes to further minimize staff time requirements, ICRW would be willing to play a larger role in identification (or possibly provision) of contractors, component or sub-project design, and monitoring of implementation. This would involve significantly less USAID staff time to effectively implement the WID strategy suggested here.

We believe that, in light of Mission staff constraints, these options represent the best chance for USAID to develop and implement effective interventions aimed at improving women's socioeconomic situation in Pakistan.

If the Mission would like additional services from ICRW, PPC/WID should be informed. It is likely that ICRW could obtain PPC/WID concurrence to provide implementation assistance beginning as early as May/June 1986.

Introduction

This report is the result of five person-weeks of technical assistance provided to USAID/Pakistan through ICRW's (International Center for Research on Women) cooperative agreement with AID/W Office of Women in Development, "Improving the Productivity, Income, and Economic Opportunities of Women"; and support from USAID staff including William McKinney, Tahira Abdullah, Asma Sufi, and project officers from several offices of the Mission. ICRW arrived to undertake this TDY with a general scope of work on women in development issues which was then revised and focused on a review of the opportunities available for reaching women through USAID projects in three main areas: Agriculture, Energy, and Training. Health, Population, and Nutrition programs were excluded from the review because these areas are not specified in ICRW's cooperative agreement. It was agreed that the review should be based mainly on project documents and interviews with USAID staff, although the team did conduct interviews and site visits at Karachi in Sind Province, and Peshawar in the Northwest Frontier Province. Discussions were also held with staff of several key GOP, U.N., and private sector organizations. (See List of Contacts.)

ICRW views this as a "first cut" in what we hope will be the development of a USAID strategy of very concrete project-level interventions aimed at improving women's productivity and contributions to project success. ICRW would welcome the opportunity to provide further assistance with actual component design and implementation either through our cooperative agreement, given the approval of AID/W Office of Women in Development, or through other appropriate funding sources such as project design and implementation funds.

The report contains two sections which present:

I. Brief discussions of each project reviewed and recommendations for continuing and improving the degree to which each project takes account of women's roles and addresses their needs; and

II. An outline of a strategy for implementing those recommendations with which the Mission concurs.

Section I: Project Reviews

IRRIGATION SYSTEMS MANAGEMENT

(Command Water Management) 391-0467

and

ON-FARM WATER MANAGEMENT

(Project Paper Amendment) 391-0413

These two projects will be discussed together, given that their village (or farmfield) components are similar and complementary. The Command Water Management (CWM) component of the Irrigation Systems Management (ISM) project will, among other things, promote the organization of Water User Associations (WUAs) into federations and councils to enable them to work effectively with the Irrigation Departments of provincial governments. In addition CWM will train project personnel at the sub-provincial and field extension levels in ways to organize WUAs and multidisciplinary problem solving in water management and community participation.

The On-Farm Water Management (OFWM) project will, among other things, also promote the establishment of WUAs and will train management-level government personnel and extension workers in extension techniques and alternative approaches to promote efficient utilization of water at the farm level. Whereas the CWM sub-project will concentrate on WUAs' role in public watercourse improvement, maintenance and management, the OFWM project focuses on the role that WUAs can play in water management and watercourse work on the privately--owned farmfield. The approach of both projects for these purposes is essentially the same: institutional strengthening of provincial and subprovincial governmental authorities to manage the irrigation systems, including the creation of field extension teams, the promotion of WUAs and federations of WUAs, and training of both extensionists and farmers in technical and social aspects of water management.

Both projects have other large components which are not field oriented or do not have any community level activities. These components will not be discussed.

In talking to the project officers involved in these projects, it became clear that, although the project papers do not reflect this very well, women are active users of the irrigation system water courses. Not only do women work in irrigated areas as hired farm laborers, but when no other water sources are available they use water from the irrigation canals for livestock, domestic and personal hygiene purposes. They may either perform certain activities like bathing children and washing clothes at the water course or carry the water from the irrigation canal to the compound, or a combination of both (Khalid, 1981, Khan and Ater, 1985). Thus, although women may not play any formal roles in the management of the watercourse network per se, and they do not have any visible decision-making functions in water course improvement and maintenance, the activities of these two projects affect them directly and, perhaps just as important, women's use of irrigation water affects project development and success. For instance, in the predecessor to the OFWM project, some watercourses were outfitted with laundry stations when improved. At some of these facilities, pounding of clothes with sticks cracked the cement lining of the laundry stations and the watercourses nearby, and women have in some areas been told that they can no longer wash clothes at the improved watercourses (Khalid 1981). According to one of the social scientists doing research on the formation and operation of WUAs, it is possible that the cement mixture used to line the laundry stations may have contained too much sand to withstand normal use. The current OFWM and ISM (CWM) projects are not building laundry or bathing facilities, possibly due to the cracking problem, but also because doing so would encourage women to wash clothes and children in water contaminated with insecticides, according to one of the project officers interviewed. However, if no other water source is available, women will continue using irrigation water, whether at the watercourse or in the compound.

This issue and several others were addressed by a consultant to USAID/Pakistan in a 1981 report (Khalid, 1981). Many of the same WID concerns in water management were taken up by two other consultants in a 1985 report

(Khan and Ater, 1985). We are aware that the Mission is knowledgeable of these issues, yet few of the concerns raised have been heeded. The two reports mentioned above together provide a comprehensive view of women's time and access problems associated with irrigation projects. Here we will highlight the most prominent issues:

- o WUAs will probably have an all-male membership and extension teams will probably be all male as well. Women will have no formal mechanisms to voice their concerns regarding restricted access to watercourses for watering livestock and performing household work. Likewise, the projects will have no way of reaching women directly in efforts to improve watercourse and water management; yet women are important users of irrigation watercourses.

- o In restricting women's access to irrigation water where this is their only source, the projects may be increasing women's work burden by forcing them and their children to haul additional amounts of water to their compounds.

- o Where women are involved in grazing livestock, they may be compelled to travel greater distances if not allowed to graze livestock near the improved watercourses. This will impose an additional time expenditure on them.

The irrigation projects have had some indirect positive impacts on women. For example, their husbands now have more time to spend at home and there is not so much fighting over water access and allocation among farmers (Khan and Ater, 1985). Nonetheless, the unresolved problems have the potential of negatively affecting women's economic roles more dramatically and, as observed earlier, may also influence project success.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. We recommend that project officers and the research team working on water management and WUAs review the details of the issues raised in Khalid 1981, and Khan and Ater 1985, in order to determine which apply to the regions and the project components for which they are responsible.

2. Where appropriate, project designs should be modified to include more buffalo wallows, bathing pools, watering outlets, and laundry stations at watercourse points where the water will not yet have had contact with contaminants.

3. Projects should consider providing hand-operated pumps for domestic use as a subcomponent or activity, both as a means of checking the problems of "misuse" of watercourses for non-agricultural purposes, and as a response to the need for domestic water sources. Eventually these pumps could be substituted by electrically-operated pumps, particularly in those villages that became effectively electrified through the last component of the Rural Electrification Project. The officers responsible for the irrigation projects might consider coordinating plans with the project officers in charge of the Rural Electrification Project, in order to identify those regions currently being served by irrigation activities that will eventually become target villages or village-clusters for electrification efforts. In those areas where project overlap the idea of providing electric water pumps near the residential districts would be feasible.

FOOD SECURITY MANAGEMENT PROJECT (391-0491)

This project has three components: economic and policy analysis, agricultural data collection, and post-harvest grain storage management. Under the first, special studies on grain systems modeling and alternatives to the rationshop systems are being undertaken. The third component will fund interventions in the public grain storage system to rehabilitate and maintain storage facilities and improve their operations. The Food Security Management (FSM) project follows Pakistan's current CDSS (1986-1990) in its efforts to strengthen government institutions to manage and implement agricultural development projects, and to provide training in policy-relevant research and policy implementation.

Project implementation is in its first year, and the first and third components, which are the areas where project activities and WID concerns might intersect, are in their early phases.

The FSM project has no component reaching down to the community and household levels and thus has no point of direct contact with village populations, male or female. The post-harvest management component is aimed at improving the state-run grain storage facilities exclusively. Nonetheless, the project officer has been considering the possibility of adding an on-farm food storage activity to this component since new information puts on-farm grain losses at higher levels than previously thought. More data may soon be available from the FAO on this point. At the time the FSM project paper was prepared (late 1983-early 1984), FAO was conducting a survey of on-farm losses as part of its efforts to improve farm technologies for food security. In our discussions with Mr. Ibrahim Ali Abul-Zahab, Project Officer for FAO in Pakistan, we learned that a baseline survey for wheat loss assessment was completed in June and one for rice was completed in November 1985. The wheat data has been analyzed and, based on the results, FAO has introduced techniques for reducing stored grain losses at the farm level on a pilot scale. In August, four-hundred and eighty farm storage facilities were fumigated and in September one-hundred and seventy metal storage bins were distributed to farmers in thirty-two villages at subsidized rates. A

revolving credit fund was established to help farmers pay for the bins. Very little additional information was available at FAO's Islamabad offices on the implementation details of the pilot project. Apparently, data is being collected periodically from these 32 villages and a project plan has been presented to FAO-Rome for expansion of pilot activities. We were unable to obtain copies of the survey report or the project document.

We were able to obtain some anecdotal data on current on-farm storage practices which show that, due to lack of adequate extension services and appropriate materials, women mix the harvested grain with mercury in an effort to reduce on-farm losses (Hague, forthcoming). The implications of this practice, however prevalent it might be are self-evident.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. We recommend that USAID consider the possibility of including an on-farm storage management component in the FSM project, both as a means of achieving the project goal in ensuring national food security through rational and efficient use of national resources, and as means of reaching the farm household and, within it, the women who are primarily responsible for post-harvest grain handling and storage (Khan and Ater, 1985:28). Specifically, AID might want to review both the data collected by FAO and the pilot project activities described above to assess both the severity of on-farm losses and the specific interventions FAO is experimenting with. In addition to pest control and improved storage facilities on the farm or homestead, the provision of credit (through innovative schemes such as revolving funds) to help farmer households pay for the cost of improved technologies, the distribution of grain processing technologies such as winnowers, grinders and mills and some extension services, might be considered. It should be stressed that these activities should, from the start, be oriented to the women in the household to ensure improvements in the handling of grain crops post-harvest and reductions of on-farm losses.

2. Under the economic and policy analysis component, the FSM project and the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) are conducting

two special studies related to management of post-harvest grain storage. One of these involves collection of household and individual level data in the rural areas. This effort should provide an excellent opportunity to gather information of good quality on women's participation in grain production and other field agricultural activities. To achieve this, we strongly recommend that women be asked directly about their field work activities. As it stands now, there is a production module administered to the male principally involved in production and another module addressed to the female which will deal with time-use and food consumption, among other things. A previous survey of activity patterns and division of labor in the Punjab (Khan and Ater, 1985) found that, compared to women's direct reports of their agricultural activities, male reports consistently underestimated the work of women and children. This finding is supported by numerous reports from other countries.

In the IFPRI study, when women are asked about the work they do, they should not be asked to identify their primary and secondary activities, but rather, to indicate the tasks they undertake in grain production and in household activities. This module will be supplemented by a time allocation study of women. The time-use study will assess women's time costs of visiting clinics and utilizing other government services, cooking, gathering firewood and water, and "a few other well-defined tasks" (Internal IFPRI memo from Harold Aldeman, December 17, 1985). We strongly recommend that the time allocation study should also ask women about the time they spend in field agricultural activities, and in post-harvest grain processing and storage.

Improving the data-base on women in agriculture is a necessary first step for project designs that adequately take into account women's roles.

During our conversations with Mission staff, other donors and GOP officials, we were given conflicting reports on the extent to which women in Pakistan are involved in field agricultural activities and the agricultural tasks they perform. It is clear that there are many impressions and unsubstantiated opinions regarding this issue. The literature on women in agriculture is also inadequate and full of generalizations that may not hold from province to province. It is, therefore, important to take advantage of

the opportunities offered by on-going projects to partly rectify this situation, without having to mount a new data collection effort or increase the costs of research components. ' .

FORESTRY PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT (391-0481)

Along with strengthening the GOP's institutional capacity to conduct forestry planning and development, and creating a research component which looks into the economic, managerial and botanical aspects of forestry, this project has an important farm-level component that will contact farmer households directly to introduce the practice of "tree farming". Mission staff working on this project and their GOP counterparts have gone far in conceptualizing how village women may be affected by the project and planning how to create income-generating activities directed at women as part of this third component. Plans are to have women participate in project activities as part of family groups and through experimental all-women run seedling nurseries. A social scientist has been brought on board to address the sociocultural dimensions of tree farming and a female social scientist is being considered to design and implement the activities in which women will participate.

The project proposes to increase the level of energy supplies so Pakistan can achieve energy self-sufficiency. In order to do this it becomes essential that the idea of tree farming on privately owned farm and rangelands catch on with the people who will be doing the actual planting. The concept of farmer advisory councils (FAC) will be implemented and tree species acceptable for traditional uses (firewood, fodder and timber) will be introduced. Field-level personnel and farmers will receive motivation and training, and the FACs will be encouraged to work closely with project field personnel in forestry management. The regions in which the project will carry out field activities are the firewood-scarce rainfed areas of the Punjab and NWFP, the irrigated lands of Nasirabad in Baluchistan and the sections of forest plantations in Sind.

Both GOP officers and Mission staff responsible for the project expect that women will become involved in forestry activities for household consumption and for income generation. The following roles for women were mentioned:

- o collection of tree seeds and sale to the project;
- o mulberry trees and sericulture;
- o apiculture;
- o seedling nurseries and sale of seedlings to the project;
- o basket weaving with materials derived from trees;
- o an integrated approach combining several of the above.

Both the project paper and the individuals developing the project expressed a concern for the effect that project activities might have on women's work burden, since forestry tasks and related income-generating activities are time intensive. Officials from the Forestry Department of the Ministry of Food and Agriculture are worried that the project design does not contemplate the introduction of technologies to reduce household work or save time and energy. This is a valid concern and should be addressed to ensure both good project performance and women's well being.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. We encourage the Mission to support the ideas of the project team regarding integration of women into the project. The project design should consider, in addition, the use of female forestry extensionists and the creation of female FACs especially in those regions where income-generating activities for women will be developed.
2. The female social scientist to be hired should be a person not only academically qualified but also well versed in WID theory and practice, and familiar with Pakistan's cultures and social structure. She will require more than cultural sensitivity to succeed.
3. One way of addressing the issue of women's work burden, and at the same time enhancing project success, would be to make a concerted effort to serve the same populations with forestry activities and energy conservation technologies and activities under the Energy Planning and Development project (EP and D). The EP and D project discussed later in this report is offering energy-saving technologies for domestic activities and new fuel sources that could mean time-savings for the women and children who usually collect firewood. On the one hand, the Forestry project is creating economic opportunities for women and possibly increasing their work-burdens, but on the other, the ED and D project is introducing time and energy saving technologies, possibly for higher monetary costs (given that the new fuel source--charcoal briquettes will have to be purchased), and no opportunities to directly increase household income. It appears that this would be a logical opportunity to address both the economic and time-saving needs of one or several populations of rural women through the complementary activities of the two projects. If target populations for both projects could be integrated, we hypothesize that women in those populations would not only benefit from the time and energy saving devices introduced by the EP and D Project, but would be better disposed to try the new fuels and technologies in order to free up time for forestry activities. In addition, once forestry activities become profitable, some of the income could go towards the purchase of the coal briquettes introduced by the EP and D Project, Thus both projects would benefit.

BALUCHISTAN AREA DEVELOPMENT (391-0479)

The purpose of the Baluchistan Area Development Project is to accelerate the integration of the Makran Division of Baluchistan into the socio-economic mainstream of Pakistan through three main components: a road component, a water component (including on-farm water management), and a planning, management and human resources development component under which a special development activities fund is being made available. As with most projects, virtually all of these components may indirectly affect women and improve their quality of life. Two of the project components, however, offer the opportunity to directly improve women's productivity in their agricultural and livestock activities and to improve their access to education, health and other social services.

1. Water components: This component includes on-farm water management activities principally through watercourse improvement and precision land levelling. Since women are typically active users of irrigation system watercourses, effective rehabilitation of watercourses must take their usage into account. Women use water from the irrigation canals to water livestock and for domestic and personal hygiene purposes. They may graze livestock along watercourses (perhaps contributing to the deterioration of the canals), bathe children and launder clothes at the watercourse, and/or carry water from irrigation canals to the compound for domestic use. Because women may not play a formal role in water management associations, however, their use of the watercourses and its impact on project success may not be readily apparent. Several studies of the intersection of women's roles and on-farm water management in the Punjab (khalid, 1981; Khan and Ater, 1985) are available to the Mission and it is likely that, with minor variations, the issues raised therein are pertinent to this project. (For more information, see the discussion of the Irrigation Systems Management Project 391-0467 and the On-Farm Water Management Project 391-0413 in this report.)

2. Planning, Management and Human Resources Development: Under this component of the project a one million dollar special development activities

fund is available to deal with current development problems in the project areas. The project paper suggests that this fund may be used, for example, to construct schools, health facilities, or housing for teachers and health workers from outside the area. The fund will also be used to provide a baseline survey of socioeconomic conditions, and could include processing or marketing projects, among others.

Because it provides a mechanism for reaching directly to the community level, the fund could be enormously important in addressing women's needs in the project area. Since women's activities and needs are often "invisible" in the Pakistan context, however, USAID may have to take the lead in suggesting and developing uses of the fund that will have a direct effect on women.

One activity currently being explored is the development of a program of training and education for young men and women in the Makran area. The program would include scholarship support for girls at the high school level (grades 9-10, U.S.) and possible continuing support for attendance at the intermediate and/or degree colleges in Sibi, Loralai, Quetta, and Karachi (since no such colleges for girls currently exist in Makran). Incentive pay and training opportunities for teachers would also be provided in order to improve the quality of both girls' and boys' education. Eventually, some students might be supported at Pakistani and/or U.S. universities. The potential for this program to positively impact on women is great. Several suggestions for minor but critical design features are mentioned in the section on recommendations below.

A host of other activities to significantly improve the situation of women in Makran could be developed under the SDA fund. The project paper notes that an important source of non-farm income among women in Makran comes from palm mats, bags, and other palm items, and palm products are the fourth most important export from Makran. In the coastal areas women engage in finishing, fish marketing, and other retail businesses. Thus projects could be developed to improve quality and marketing of palm products; to introduce more efficient fishing methods; to improve storage and processing of fish in order to improve marketability; and to provide credit facilities and marketing for other retail businesses in which women are involved. In many areas

women's work is limited to production, and marketing is carried out through male family members or, more commonly, through middlemen. Women could therefore benefit from programs designed to replace the middleman's services. Typically middlemen carry raw materials for piecework to their women clients. The women are sometimes required to pay for all or part of the materials, or to provide additional materials or tools such as the special pliers used in making earrings, thread for sewing, or the sewing machine itself. The women are paid (per piece of work completed) by the middleman who carries the finished product to the market for sale, or to a larger distributor for whom he works. Needless to say, the women piece workers are paid extremely low wages because of the monopsonistic position of the middleman. SDA funds could be used (perhaps through the hire of a PVO) to set up a similar system in which women would, however, share in the profits from the sale of their goods; alternatively, a women's cooperative could be developed through which individuals could be hired to market the cooperative's goods in return for a fixed fee. Eventually, credit and savings facilities could be incorporated to provide adequate working capital for the expansion of women's home-based businesses.

Potential projects related to women's agricultural and livestock activities include among others: --

1. Training in:

(a) improved grain processing and storage techniques;

(b) improved poultry raising techniques and egg production;

(c) more efficient milk and butter production and handling/storage;

(d) animal health (women are majorly responsible for poultry and livestock and often have no knowledge of vaccination requirements or treatment of animal illness. A forthcoming study by Ms. Huma Haque of the Pakistan Agricultural Research Council (PARC), Islamabad, documents women's reliance on faith healers and visits to shrines to "cure" their livestock.).

2. Transfer of technology such as:

- (a) food storage facilities;
- (b) mechanized rice hullers;
- (c) mechanized grain grinders;
- (d) blowers for winnowing;
- (e) incubation boxes for eggs;
- (f) improved butter churns;
- (g) energy-efficient stoves;
- (h) oil-pressers;
- (i) facilities for handing water and firewood;
- (j) improved water pumps; and

(k) mechanized weeders (they are apparently in use in the NWFP and are important for women since, contrary to the statement on page 223 of the project paper, women do work manually in agriculture especially in transplanting, and weeding of legumes, vegetables, and other secondary crops).

3. Marketing systems for:

- (a) poultry;
- (b) eggs;
- (c) butter and milk; and
- (d) legumes and vegetables

This list is illustrative and can be expanded to include a variety of additional activities mentioned elsewhere in the report. Forestry activities involving women for example, are already being considered for this project.

Finally, an important activity to be carried out through the SDA fund is the base-line socioeconomic survey of the project area. Currently many projects do not attempt to focus on women because they are designed on the basis of inadequate information or misinformation regarding women's roles in agriculture, home-based industries, etc. The base-line survey planned under the project offers the opportunity to collect accurate information on women's activities. The opportunity will be lost, however, if the survey itself implicitly assumes that women do not work manually in agriculture, for example. As a case in point we note that, at least in its draft form, the IFPRI study to be undertaken in the Food Security Management Project (391-0491) proposes to assess women's time costs of visiting clinics and utilizing other government services, cooking, gathering firewood and water, and "a few other well defined tasks" (internal IFPRI memo from Harold Alderman, December 17, 1985). This approach virtually assures that women's agricultural activities will remain undocumented since semi-literate or illiterate rural women are unlikely to volunteer information regarding tasks that are not explicitly mentioned. The Baluchistan Area Development Project survey may benefit from the work and/or services of specialists on women's roles. Two possible consultants were mentioned in a cable from Asia/DP/E dated January 20, 1985. One of the consultants, Dr. Carroll C. Pastner, has apparently done extensive fieldwork in Baluchistan while the other, Dr. Lynn Bennett, did a significant amount of work on women in Nepal and is currently based in New Delhi. Local expertise on this issue may also be available.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

We suggest three ways in which the Baluchistan Area Development project can focus on improving women's productivity and socioeconomic situation, as well as their contribution to project effectiveness.

1. Review the water management issues raised in Khalid, 1981, and Khan and Ater, 1985, and consider the provision of buffalo wallows, bathing pools, watering outlets, and laundry stations along watercourses to be rehabilitated under the project's water component.

2. Work with consultants, research groups, or PVOs (local or expatriate) who are focused on women's roles in rural areas to develop a variety of projects to improve women's education, training, agricultural productivity, and returns from home-based and retail businesses through the Special Development Activities Fund. For the education activity already being considered under the fund, we suggest a strong outreach component to make information out the benefits of girls' education available to parents and to address their concerns regarding girls' safety at local schools and, especially, at colleges in Sibi, Loralai, Quetta, and Karachi. In addition to providing chaperoning of girls the program should also include a counselling component for girls (and their parents) who may have doubts concerning the value or appropriateness of obtaining education and who may be separated from their parents and an extremely protective environment for the first time in their lives.

3. Ensure that appropriate questions regarding women's activities and needs in the project area are asked of women in the base-line survey to be carried out under the SDA fund. The information gathered will be invaluable in determining additional projects for the SDA fund and also as a basis for correcting misinformation rural about women in Pakistan.

Issue: How Much Can One Project Accomplish?

The foregoing discussion responds to the Mission's request that the ICRW team outline any potential openings for USAID projects to focus on women. We

understand that is unlikely that all potential activities can be undertaken in any one project. In the Baluchistan Area Development project the difficulty of working in an extremely underdeveloped and sensitive area may further limit the number of small development activities that can be implemented. Nevertheless, we have provided an extensive list of potential activities because, by virtue of including a Special Development Activities Fund, the project design lends itself, in theory, to the types of interventions most likely to impact upon women. Virtually all of the development activities mentioned could be undertaken in any project with a component oriented to community level development interventions.

TRIBAL AREAS DEVELOPMENT (391-0471)

and

NWFP DEVELOPMENT (391-0485)

These two projects are similar to the Baluchistan Area Development Project in that their potential impact upon women lies most concretely in two components: irrigation or watershed management and local development projects.

It is generally held that women's roles in the tribal areas and in the NWFP are much more restricted than in the other provinces of Pakistan. To some extent this may be true--for example, women in these areas may be less likely to leave their compounds than they are in the Punjab. This does not mean that women's roles in agriculture and livestock are particularly limited, however, since in these project areas the "compound" often includes a large amount of planted fields and grazing area for livestock. Information gathered at the Agricultural University of Peshawar indicates that, at least among the lower-income groups, all the concerns regarding women's use of irrigation systems and their agricultural and post-harvest processing activities mentioned in our discussion of the Baluchistan Area Development and other projects are also pertinent for the tribal areas and the NWFP. Recommendations for ensuring a positive impact upon women are therefore similar.

As with the Baluchistan project, it is likely that the difficult areas in which the project operates will limit the number of activities that can actually be implemented.

It is worth noting that, despite what may be more stringent adherence to the tradition of purdah in the NWFP, several U.N. agencies--I.L.O., FAO World Food Programme, and the U.S. High Commission for Refugees--are working on income-generating projects for women. In addition, "industrial homes" established by local councils in the Peshawar area have succeeded in drawing women out of their compounds for training in sewing and knitting skills. These programs are not very lucrative for the women involved, but they could

provide the basis for introduction of training in improved dairy and egg production and marketing techniques, livestock care, etc. One Peshawar-based PVO, Ockenden Venture, has been successfully filling the role of "a benevolent middleman" for refugee women's sewing and embroidery products. A similar approach could undoubtedly be extended to local women as well.

RECOMMENDATIONS

As with the Baluchistan Area Development Project, we suggest that USAID:

1. Take account of women's usage of irrigation systems to be improved under the projects.

2. Develop small-scale projects focused on women's training and education, improved agricultural productivity and livestock activities, and training and marketing for home-based income-generation.

3. Utilize any base-line surveys or evaluations that may occur under the projects to obtain accurate information regarding rural women's activities in the project areas.

**TRANSFORMATION AND INTEGRATION OF THE
PROVINCIAL AGRICULTURAL NETWORK (TIPAN) 391-0488**

The TIPAN Project at the Agricultural University of Peshawar (AU) in the NWFP offers enormous potential for benefitting women and improving the understanding of women's roles in agriculture through each of its six main components:

1. The Teaching Program: This program includes a revised admissions policy that expands the sources of entering freshmen. The enrollment of women is being encouraged to increase the numbers of female agricultural professionals in the province. Five or six women have already entered the university--a small number, but one that represents a major effort to encourage female enrollment and provide appropriate facilities at this previously all-male institution. As project staff are well aware, continued enrollment of women will depend to a large extent on completion of planned housing for women. Currently female students are housed at the University of Peshawar but it is unlikely that more rooms can be provided on this basis; in any event, female agricultural students must prepare for frequent exams under the term system and find it difficult to do so while housed at the University of Peshawar since their study habits differ markedly from those of U. of P. students who are working under an end-of-year exam system.

2. The Research Program: The new research program will have a problem-solving orientation and will require a multi-disciplinary approach in view of the complex farming systems of NWFP. Such an approach, in order to be effective, must take into account the role that women play in farm production, livestock care, and agro-based industries in the NWFP and throughout Pakistan. The background design document for the project suggests the creation of a Division in the Study of Rural Households in the Faculty of Rural Social Sciences. This Division could be used as a source of information on rural women in agriculture to be fed into all aspects of the research program.

3. The Outreach Program: Under this component AU will develop technology packages for major crops, animal husbandry practices and the

farming systems of the province for transfer by extension agents. In addition a cadre of outreach personnel will be developed to serve as subject matter specialists for the extension services as well as continuing education programs for agricultural offices and field workers. It is critical that this outreach program transfer information about women's farm activities to the extension services. Women should also constitute a significant proportion of outreach cadres in order to work with farm women. Continuing education courses should inform agricultural officers and field workers regarding women's roles in agriculture and special efforts should be made to train and/or upgrade women extensionists and deal with special problems of transport or housing that they may face in their work in rural areas.

4 Support Centers, Physical Facilities, and Equipment: Among other items, this component provides for the construction of dormitories. As mentioned previously, virtually the entire program to increase women's enrollment at the university will depend on the construction of women's dormitories--an obligation of which the GOP should be strongly reminded.

5. New Personnel, Facilities and Organizational Structure: Under this component the faculty structure is being reorganized to comprise four new faculties: Plant Sciences, Animal Husbandry, Engineering Applications, and Rural Social Sciences. Discussions with project staff at Peshawar indicate that the Rural Social Sciences program may be created within the Institute of Development Studies at AU. An issue to be considered is whether or not this implies that Rural Social Sciences--an area of study which is most likely to focus on women in agriculture--is of less central concern than plant sciences, engineering applications, etc. More important, it appears that the Rural Social Sciences program is not yet in place; thus the current degree program is probably not preparing students with knowledge of women's agricultural activities and their critical roles in farm households, livestock care, and technology transfer.

6. Participant Training and Technical Assistance: This component will finance long- and short-term participant training in the U.S. It appears that efforts are being made to recruit women for this program; such efforts should be supported and continued.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

It is clear that TIPAN project staff are making major efforts to incorporate women into the project. USAID can support and facilitate these efforts in several ways:

1. Begin construction of female dormitories as soon as possible so that efforts to recruit female students and faculty can continue.

2. Support the creation and staffing of the Rural Social Sciences faculty in order to emphasize research on women's roles in the farming systems of the NWFP and Pakistan. Such research is critical for the development of a well rounded curriculum and for effective outreach programs.

3. Emphasize the importance of information about women in agriculture as part of outreach programs.

4. Actively recruit women as members of outreach cadres and as participants in continuing education programs.

5. Support the efforts being made to recruit women as participant trainees.

6. Review the detailed "Program for Women", Chapter 5 of the background document for project design which discusses a variety of ways in which women's concerns should be addressed in the TIPAN project.

NOTE: The possibility of using distance learning methodology in TIPAN's outreach component is mentioned in the background project design document, and the development of mass media programs and audio-visual aids are discussed in the project paper. The ICRW Team had the opportunity of visiting the Allama Iqbal Open University in Islamabad and we suggest that the TIPAN outreach program might benefit from the Open University's experience with distance

learning. UNICEF is currently using material developed by Allama Iqbal for child welfare outreach programs, and we understand that special programs can be commissioned in a variety of areas including agriculture

MANAGEMENT OF AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGY

(MART - '391-0489)

The MART Project consists of five components: research management and administration; information transfer; training for the agricultural research network; arid zone research; and wheat and maize coordinated programs. It is through the training component that the project has the most potential for a direct and positive impact on women.

The training component includes, among other activities, training of the National Agriculture Research Center (NARC) and Provincial training facility staff, development of tailored in-country training courses, and overseas participant training. Since women in Pakistan play significant roles in agricultural research, especially laboratory work, they can potentially benefit from each of these activities.

A visit to the NARC revealed that a fairly good proportion of NARC staff are women (about 25 percent). It appears that a definite effort has been made to recruit female staff; hopefully, such efforts will continue. Additionally, female staff should be involved in organizing courses at the NARC Training Institute and should themselves receive training.

Recipients of NARC training are currently nominated at the provincial level. Women are included, but they constitute only two or three percent of recipients. It is unclear whether this is due to a lack of female agricultural researchers in the provinces or, more likely, the tendency of provincial officials to nominate male staff as candidates for training. Dr. Hankins of USAID has suggested the possibility of holding a conference of women agricultural researchers at the NARC Training Institute as a way to provide practical and moral support for women researchers, and to determine how many women are involved in research at the provincial level. Alternatively a quota system could be used requiring that, for example, one out of every four nominees be female. It is, of course, preferable to avoid

quota systems, but USAID experience in several projects has shown that, in the Pakistani context, they may be the only method of inducing the GOP to actively include women in training programs.

Finally, the participant training component of the project should also provide substantial opportunities for training women researchers abroad. Again USAID may have to take a firm stance regarding the need to actively recruit women under this component.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Women are fairly well involved in the MART project, however, their participation could be significantly improved by:

1. Continuing and expanding efforts to recruit female professional staff for NARC.

2. Hiring female staff for NARC's Training Institute and including them in the project's training for trainers.

3. Insisting that more female researchers at the provincial level be nominated for NARC training courses--either by specifying female researchers who may be identified through a conference of women agricultural researchers or by instituting a quota system.

4. Ensuring that substantial numbers of women participate in the overseas training component. Again, a quota system (formal or informal) may be necessary.

RURAL ELECTRIFICATION (391-0473)

This project is designed to assist the GOP to expand reliable electric service to a greater number of Pakistan's rural population for productive and social uses, to improve the rural poor's access to that service, and to assist the GOP in overcoming a shortfall in electric power generating capacity. Five components constitute the project: institutional improvement, distribution function reduction; power generation; and rural distribution system expansion. Four out of the five components include training activities and thus provide the opportunity for a direct and positive impact on women. The institutional improvement component of the project, for example, provides for training of WAPDA implementation staff and staff exchanges with sister-utilities in the U.S. Firm insistence by USAID that women have access to these training opportunities could result in substantial benefits for women. Similar training for implementation staff will be provided under each project component (except power generation).

Improving women's access to training opportunities assumes, of course, that there are significant numbers of female employees in positions appropriate for the training programs. While WAPDA does not currently employ a high proportion of women, USAID project managers have made clear to WAPDA officials the importance of integrating women into WAPDA and project activities. There now seems to be an increasing tendency for WAPDA to place women in some key positions.

An important aspect of this project is the amount of training being done with private sector Pakistani firms that provide technical services to WAPDA. Staff of these firms benefit from expatriate technical assistance under the project and will eventually constitute a trained core of technical expertise in Pakistan. USAID project managers are strongly emphasizing to these firms the importance of involving female employee in the training and technical assistance available through the project. These efforts to involve both WAPDA and private sector female employees are an important and commendable feature of the Rural Electrification project.

Another important feature of the project, in terms of potential impact on women, is the Rural Distribution component. Under this component the project will eventually fund approximately 184,000 residential connections and 4,500 community connections (in addition to commercial, industrial, and tubewell connections). These connections will undoubtedly benefit women both directly and indirectly. The project's impact on women, however, could be greatly improved by complementing the rural distribution component with a program of village and community level efforts to introduce technologies that save time and improve productivity in agricultural, livestock, and household production. That is, the electrification of villages could be complemented by a number of small projects designed to introduce and provide training in the use of food storage facilities, rice hullers, grain grinders, egg incubation boxes, household water pumps, blowers for winnowing, etc. The use of all of these technologies is made possible by the introduction of electricity and all would result in increased time saving and productivity for rural women who are majorly responsible for livestock care, poultry, production of dairy products, and post-harvest processing of grains. (See also the discussion of the Irrigation Systems Management and On-Farm Water Management Projects).

There are innumerable additional uses of electricity, of course. The point is that the project's direct benefits for women could be greatly expanded by taking the project one step beyond provision of electricity to provision of appropriate electrically powered technologies. The addition of a program of community-level projects need not involve additional USDH staff for the project since these are substantial numbers of PVOs, university-based outreach groups, and private sector firms that could be contracted to carry out such projects. A mechanism for supervising these contractors is discussed under "implementation options" in the final section of this report.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Rural Electrification project has a great deal of potential to positively impact on women, much of which is already being realized through the project manager's efforts to involve women in training and technical assistance activities. We suggest that USAID:

1. Support continued efforts to involve women in training under the project.

2. Consider adding a component for community-level introduction of appropriate technologies for women, and training in the use of such technologies. An illustrative list of these items is included in the text above. It appears that local PVOs, university-based outreach groups and private sector firms working in these areas could be readily identified.

ENERGY PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT

(391-0478)

Women have a stake in efficient and reliable fuel sources for household uses (cooking, heating, lighting) since they spend considerable time and caloric energy procuring firewood or dung patties for these purposes. The energy conservation and reusable energy components of this project are ultimately aimed at women. Feasibility and market studies will be developed to test the acceptability of small hydro, solar and biomass technologies for household and/or community use. Coal briquettes of different quality, smoke levels and prices will be introduced, and efficient wood and coal burning stove will be made available to women. The testing of these products will most likely take place in the areas where Afghan refugees have settled in NWFP. A coal-burning stove developed by the Indian Central Fuel Research Unit has been selected for trials in Pakistan under this project.

Although the activities under this project aimed at women will probably not create any direct income-generating opportunities for them, they are important for increasing women's productivity in other areas, by virtue of the time savings they will accrue from not having to collect firewood and make dung patties and through more efficient cooking methods. The project team should be careful that the coal and wood burning stoves they select are well suited to the cooking practices of women. Several people, including one working in the refugee camps near Peshawar, told us that if women cannot easily see the flame while cooking they will either tear off the front and back dampers of the stoves, thereby reducing their energy efficiency, or reject them altogether. FAO is experimenting with fuel efficient wood burning stoves attached to smokestacks in NWFP. The I.L.O. has been utilizing the appropriate technology designs of a group called Arotech Asia (4th Floor, Yakuo Bldg., Dasmarinas St., Binondo, Manila, Philippines - Telex 40131 YUTIVO PM) in other Asian countries with a particular view to encouraging culturally-sensitive stove design, and the GOP Women's Division has been looking into the possibility of introducing briquettes made out of sugarcane bagasse. The idea

is that it is probably easier to rethink the design of a stove than to change the cooking habits of hundreds of women.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. The time-saving and energy-efficient technologies introduced under this project should offer a range of options to its ultimate users, so that they may be adapted to current practices and preferences. We learned from the I.L.O. staff in Islamabad that Andrea Singh, a well known Indian-American anthropologist, has recently published a book on appropriate food processing and cooking technologies for the South Asian Sub-continent. Although we were unable to obtain a copy, we understand it is available through the I.L.O.

2. Earlier, the recommendation was made that field activities under this project could be integrated with those planned under the Forestry Planning and Development (FP and D) project which will be aimed at women. If the same populations were served by the complementary activities of both projects, women's time savings under the EP and D project could be productively tapped by the income-generating activities of the FP and D project. Moreover, some of the income derived under the latter could be used to defray some of costs of new fuels under the former. Please see the section on recommendations of the FP and D project for a more extensive discussion of this point.

DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT TRAINING (391-0474)

The Development Support Training project is designed to upgrade the managerial and technical expertise of Pakistanis in the public and private sectors who are involved in the planning, development, and implementation of Pakistan's priority social and economic development programs. The project consists of two components, in-country training and overseas training, with a main focus on the in-country training.

Both project components have great potential for reaching women and it is clear that the project's managers are actively exploiting this potential.

In-country, the project has already financed a CEDPA (Center for Development and Population Activities) management training course for women working in the population sector, held in Karachi in September/October 1985.

Management training for the Pakistan Business, Professional, and Agricultural Women's Association is also likely to be funded under the project.

Through its overseas training component the project will be funding short-term training and long-term degree programs in the U.S. for some forty female candidates. These women were selected by USAID and EAD from amongst applicants who had been recruited through an advertisement placed in national papers directly by USAID. This active pursuit by USAID of a focus on women is commendable and is illustrative of the degree of freedom USAID may have to focus on women once it is made clear to the GOP that promoting women's participation in projects is an AID priority.

The project's design allows for a great deal of flexibility in determining the training and other activities that can be funded through the project. Discussions with the project officer indicate that the project might be used to fund, for example, training and upgrading of local PVOs, and

possibly the provision of credit funds to be administered by these PVOs or other private sector groups.

If USAID decides to implement some of the recommendations in this report regarding community-level projects, the DST project could be a source of funding and expertise for related training activities and/or upgrading of PVOs or other groups chosen to implement community-level projects for women.

RECOMMENDATIONS

USAID should support continued efforts to train women under this project and possibly consider using the DST project to help implement some of the recommendations suggested in this report for other USAID projects.

Section II: Suggestions for a Strategy

Virtually all of the recommendations listed in the previous section can be readily incorporated into USAID's portfolio in so far as they are limited to areas in which the Mission is currently working. Many do require, however, a concerted effort to reach down to the community level in projects that might not otherwise do so. Together these recommendations constitute a very concrete strategy for encouraging and improving women's economic opportunities in Pakistan. In terms of ease of implementation, the strategy falls into three categories:

1. Data collection activities and/or review of existing data, such as those suggested for the Food Security Management project, and the Baluchistan Area Development project: These activities can be implemented immediately and with virtually no additional effort on the part of USAID. In fact, it is critical that such revisions in data collection be made now, before survey designs and questionnaires have been finalized. The Mission should not miss these opportunities to collect accurate information on women that may be incorporated into current and future project designs.

2. Strong emphasis on selection of women as training candidates, and in some cases quotas for women trainees: USAID project officers, in many instances, are already taking a firm stance with GOP counterparts regarding the priority that USAID attaches to women's participation in training programs. It will be relatively easy to implement similar approaches in all projects with training components, but the Mission should consider institutionalizing an emphasis on women either through project agreements or through agreements regarding specific sub-components.

3. Community level components in a variety of areas to complement the more "macro-level" approach or emphasis on infrastructure in projects such as Rural Electrification, Food Security Management, the Area Development projects, etc: These recommended components or sub-projects will require significantly more resources--although not necessarily more staff time--for

implementation. GOP approval must be obtained, project components designed, and local PVOs or other private sector groups with appropriate expertise must be identified and contracted. This category would constitute the heart of an effective strategy and the Mission might consider phasing these activities, beginning with one or two selected sub-projects to be implemented on a pilot basis. Overall implementation options are outlined below.

Implementation Options: ICRW is aware of, on the one hand, USAID'S desire to effectively reach women and, on the other hand, the Mission's significant staff constraints. We can suggest two implementation options that will require little or no additional U.S. Direct Hire staff time and minimal additions of Foreign Service National staff time. Critical prerequisites for effective implementation through either option, however, are:

- (1) A strong Mission commitment to implementing a WID strategy; and
- (2) Provision of a mandate for the WID Officer and WID Assistant(s) to collaborate with project officers in order to implement the strategy.

Meeting the latter prerequisite will involve ensuring that the WID Officer has sufficient time to devote to the WID strategy; possible relocation of the WID Assistant staff position to the Program Office and/or placement of additional WID assistance in the Program Office to ensure an overview of the Mission portfolio; and availability to the WID Officer and Assistant(s) of appropriate sector-specific expertise. We suggest that the WID Officer and Assistant(s) be involved with the identification of relevant technical expertise in the Pakistani private sector that we understand will be undertaken through a PIO now being prepared by PDM and RLA to establish a Mission IQC for a broad range of technical services. The technical expertise to be identified for WID purposes should include areas mentioned in our project recommendations (Section I) such as transfer of appropriate technology for women in agro-processing and livestock care, women's roles in water management, income-generation for women, training in production techniques and marketing, management training, etc. Organizations or individuals thus identified will form a pool of resources available for use in the following WID strategy implementation options:

Option A: The WID Officer and WID Assistant(s) would investigate the qualifications of various local PVOs, research groups, or other private sector organizations that could be hired as contractors to implement the various recommendations made in this report. The WID staff would be responsible for initiating selection of contractors and coordinating their implementation activities with project officers for recommended project components that the Mission decides to support. This could, depending on the actual number of activities undertaken, require a substantial amount of time from the existing FSN WID Assistant or the hire of an additional FSN staff person. To supplement Mission staff time, USAID could take advantage of technical assistance from ICRW through our AID/W funded cooperative agreement, given PPC/WID conditions and approval. ICRW would then assist the Mission in the identification of local contractors and help monitor implementation activities.

Option B: Alternatively, if the Mission wishes to further minimize staff time requirements, ICRW would be willing to play a larger role in identification of contractors, assistance with design, and monitoring of implementation. (Again, provision of these services would be subject to PPC/WID conditions and approval). Under this option significantly less USAID staff time would be necessary to effectively implement the WID strategy.

We believe that, in light of Mission staff constraints, these two options represent the best chance for USAID to develop and implement effective interventions aimed at improving women's economic situation in Pakistan.

Next Steps: We suggest that USAID consider and decide upon the project recommendations and implementation options discussed in this report as soon as possible. Comments and/or requests for revisions or additional information can be sent either to PPC/WID or directly to ICRW. The ICRW team will brief PPC/WID regarding our TDY activities upon return to Washington. If the Mission would like additional services from ICRW, PPC/WID should be informed. It is likely that ICRW could obtain PPC/WID concurrence to provide USAID with implementation assistance beginning as soon as May/June 1986.

REFERENCES

Haque, Huma. Forthcoming 1986. Study of women's roles in agriculture in the Punjab as yet untitled. To be available through the Pakistan Agricultural Research Council, Islamabad.

Khalid, Asma. 1981. "The Impact of Watercourse Improvement on Women." Islamabad." Islamabad: prepared for USAID, Contract # AID-391-08/81.

Khan, Samina and Carolyn Ater. 1985. "Analysis of Water Management Processes, Agricultural and Household Activities by Gender Roles in Four Villages, Punjab, Pakistan." Lubbock, Texas: Texas Tech University.

List of Contacts

Agricultural University of Peshawar

Dr. Earl Rodda
Dr. Martin V. Waananen

Allama Iqbal Open University

Dr. Iftikhar Hassan

CIDA

Lorne Heukroth
Carol Kerfoot
Nasim Zehra Akhlaque

FAO

Ibrahim Ali Abul-Zahab

FAO-World Food Program

Yasmin Akhtar Qureshi

GOP

Pakistan Agricultural Research Council:

Huma Haque

National Agricultural Research Center:

Azra Quraishi
Dr. Rahman Khan

Ministry of Food and Agriculture, Forestry Department:

J.A. Qazi
L. Lateef Rao

Women's Division:

Sabiha Syed
Shamsa Riaz
J.S. Masood Ali
Sabiha Hafeez

ILO

Rita Tesselaar
Samina Hassan
Saskia Veeer
Kiran Omar Khan
Lynn Mueller

Shirkat Gah - Women's Resource Center, Karachi

UNICEF

Yasmin Ehsen

USAID

ARD:

Alan Hankins, Chief
Peter Reiss
Alfred Merkel
Barry Primm
John Quay
John Foster
Maurice Fleming
John Anania
Bob Mathia
Dean Alter

E&E:

Jim Bever
Anjum Ahmad
Ken Lue Phang
Terry D'Souza
John Addleton

HPN:

Ray Martin, Chief
Enid Spielman
Heather Goldman

HRT:
Jon Gant, Chief
Asma Sufi

O/DIR:
Jimmy Stone, Deputy Mission Director

PMD:
Robert Nachtrieb, Chief

PRO:
Wayne Tate
William McKinney
Tahira Abdullah

RLA:
Stephen Spielman