

DRAFT
Education.

PN-AA7-101
ISBN 50975

A REVIEW OF EDUCATION SECTOR PROJECTS

The Women in Development
Evaluation Synthesis: Experience
of a Decade

Submitted to AID/PPC/CDIE
by Dr. Mary B. Anderson
Contract No:OTR-0085-0-00-4357-00

November 1984

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	i
INTRODUCTION.....	1
PATTERNS OF SAMPLE PROJECTS.....	3
ANALYSIS/ISSUES RAISED AND LESSONS LEARNED.....	10
RECOMMENDATIONS.....	24
APPENDICES.....	26
Appendix A Project Profiles.....	26
Mali Training Center for Rural Women.....	26
Syria English Language Training.....	28
Paraguay Rural Nonformal Education.....	29
Indonesia Planning and Management.....	31
Mali Development Leadership Training.....	32
Morocco Social Services Training.....	34
Appendix B Methodology.....	36

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Nineteen AID education sector projects were evaluated with regard to their success or lack of it in integrating women into the development of their national economies. Of the nineteen, five were WID projects, one had a WID component and thirteen were WID integrated.

The projects were divided into two main types according to whether they 1) focused on the provision of education as a development goal in itself or 2) focused on the provision of education as a means to achieving another development goal such as improved management or increased agricultural productivity. Education was seen as a resource from which future benefits are derived by individuals and by societies. The first type of project expands opportunities for and access to education to groups not previously reached. The second type often reinforces existing patterns of access and exclusion by designating prerequisites for participation in the training offered, and this often worked to the disadvantage of women who did not possess the prerequisites. In both types of projects, access to education was limited by the location and timing of the training and by the incentives for participation, and these more often excluded girls and women than boys and men.

From this limited sample of projects, no correlations were found between project success in integrating women and project types, duration, funding levels, or explicit mention of women in project documents. However, nine lessons were drawn from this comparative evaluation as follows:

#1. When females are not represented in the target group, simply stating that their inclusion is a project objective will not ensure their integration. Conversely, when a target group is designated such that it clearly include females, they will be integrated into projects even without explicit mention in project documents.

#2. When education is promoted in order to achieve another development goal, the issue of who is excluded from the education has an impact on the attainment of the secondary goal; if prerequisites exclude some sector of the population, such as women, achievement of the secondary goal will be less likely.

#3. Location, timing and incentives affect access to all education projects and have a differential impact on females and males.

#4. Even when females are not included in targeted beneficiary populations, they may be included in the project through a curriculum design that focuses on their activities/needs.

#5. Education projects designed to provide skills in areas not traditionally in the domain of women must explicitly target women in order to include them. In this regard, WID projects have, in some cases, proved successful.

#6. As a resource, education improves trainees' competitive position. If women are excluded from education projects, they are less able as a result to compete for other benefits and resources.

#7. Analysis of culture and of gender roles is not sufficient for effective integration of women into projects; the analysis must be related directly to project design and the dynamics of change must also be taken into account.

#8. Regardless of project design, an awareness on the part of project staff of the importance of women's integration into projects can make a significant difference as to whether effective integration actually occurs.

#9. In this sample, the failure to be explicit about the importance of women's roles in project design and implementation most often resulted in missed opportunities for making the project as good as it could have been had women been thoroughly integrated.

The review prompted the following recommendations. For full integration of women into AID projects, project design should be required to analyze gender differentiated activities in its target population and specify ways in which women will be included in the target group. In addition, precise project design elements that reflect and address women's special roles should be included and methods for follow-through specified.

In project evaluations, the involvement of females should be assessed as it reflects their proportion in the target population as well as in absolute numbers. In addition, factors affecting involvement should be discussed. Benefits for females and males should be compared, and missed opportunities for greater benefits should be evaluated.

Finally, special attention should be given to the linkages of access to education as a resource and future access to other benefits derived from education. All education projects should address the issue of access by attempting to extend it to groups previously excluded and by avoiding reinforcing patterns of exclusion that already exist in the target society by the use of prerequisites that limit access according to status and gender.

I. INTRODUCTION

In 1973, the Congress amended the Foreign Assistance Act to require that U.S. assistance

...be administered so as to give particular attention to those programs, projects and activities which tend to integrate women into the national economies of foreign countries through improving their status and assisting the total development effort. (Section 113)

The Agency for International Development (AID) responded by establishing an Office for Women in Development which, since that time, has been in charge of promoting and assisting efforts to integrate women into the programs and projects funded by AID in the Third World.

This report is one of six sectoral evaluations of AID projects over these past ten years to assess their effectiveness in achieving the integration of women into the development process. This report reflects an analysis of nineteen education projects between 1972 and the present.

Cross cultural studies of educational systems reveal that there is no single approach to knowledge, no single pedagogy and no single rationality. At the heart of understanding the differences in these is the issue of purpose: what, in any given society and at any given time, is the explicit (or, often, implicit) purpose of education? Purpose affects educational structures and content. What is taught, to whom, where, when, for how long--as well as who is left out of education by location, content and timing--flow from implicit and explicit purpose.

Education projects fall into two main types: those that focus on the provision of basic education as a goal in itself and those that focus on the provision of education as a means to achieving another goal (such as improved management, increased agricultural productivity, etc.). In each of these two types one finds projects that engage in direct training of a target population and those that are directed toward building an institutional capability for subsequent training

of the intended target group. In both types of projects, education is viewed as a critical resource either for the individual who attains it or for the society as a whole in the form of an educated citizenry.

This report classifies the AID projects reviewed into the two categories and analyzes their effectiveness in reaching and integrating women as this is influenced by project purpose and other factors. The report has two main sections. The first provides an overall comparison of the nineteen projects and the second analyzes how and why the projects were/were not effective in integrating women. Recommendations follow this section.

Appendix A provides profiles on six projects selected for the positive and negative lessons they offer, and Appendix B discusses the methodology used in this study and recommends next steps.

I am indebted to many people for their help in guiding this effort and cannot name them all. I must, however, thank Ms. Anamaria Viveros-Long (PPC/CDIE) whose insights and enthusiasm supported and spurred my work. Appreciation is also owed to the many people who were associated with the projects under review who were willing to talk with me and provide additional information not available in the project documents.

II. PATTERNS OF SAMPLE PROJECTS

Nineteen projects in the education sector were reviewed in detail of which thirteen were WID integrated projects, one had a WID component and five were WID projects (see Table I). In only nine cases were the documents complete, covering the design, implementation and results phases of the projects. In three cases (Egypt and the two Mali projects), only one document was available. For both Mali projects, we had only the design documents and for Egypt only one mid-point evaluation. For the other seven projects, documents covered two phases of the project cycle and were sufficient to draw the conclusions shown in the Table. In cases where there was no final document, we have noted this except when additional information was supplied through interviews.

Telephone interviews were made to follow up on nine projects where additional information was desired. Through these, useful information was actually obtained on six projects (among them, the two Mali projects for which no results documents had been available).

The projects are divided into two main categories. Type I projects are those in which basic education was provided as an end in itself. Type II are those projects where education/training was provided as a means to achieving some other developmental goal such as improved management (India, Indonesia, Liberia, Mali Leadership Training, Zambia), increased agricultural productivity (Botswana Agricultural College Expansion), improved health services (Egypt), access to new jobs (Morocco Industrial and Commercial Job Training), or access to new technologies (Syria). Several projects are classified as "mixed" because they provide certain basic skills to help in various aspects of the lives of the trainees but, in the project intent, focused on some particular outcome (job performance in Mali and Costa Rica and leadership and job performance in Peru).

All projects are designed to increase or expand access to education/training as a resource, and training is offered either in-country

or out of country to accomplish this. The way in which this access is provided is one of the ways in which the differential impact of a project on women and men may be predicted or analyzed. This is discussed in more detail below under "Project Focus."

As can be seen from Table I, all projects include a component of curriculum design. This element of project design constitutes the other major point at which gender differentiation may be seen to play an important role in project effectiveness. This is discussed more fully below under "Project Design."

From Table I, it can be seen that of the six Type I projects, four were deemed overall to be good and two were considered poor. Of these six, four did not mention women in their results documents, though one of these appears to have been successful in integrating women into its program. The other two projects fell short with respect to their intended outcomes for women.

All three of the "Mixed" projects were WID projects and two of these were judged effective and one poor.

Of the ten Type II projects, six were considered good overall and four were considered poor (one, India, because it is extremely behind schedule). However, with respect to their integration of women, half were either poor or the consideration of women was lost between project design and implementation (Egypt, India, Indonesia, Morocco Social Services, Zambia). Three of the ten involved women well though not as well as intended (Botswana Agricultural College, Mali Leadership Training, Morocco Training for Women). Two had positive impacts on women beyond expectations (Liberia and Syria). Liberia, a poor project overall, had a proportionately better impact on women than on men in that while women make up only 20% of the public servants for whom the project was designed, they received 32% of the masters degrees awarded under the project and were 31% of the trainees in courses offered in-country. In Syria, while women were never mentioned in the project design, approximately

twenty-five per cent of the trainees, overall, who received training in Syria were women. In addition, the Syrian Director of the English Language Training Center at the close of the project was a woman, and six of the ten faculty members were women. No special efforts at female targetting or recruiting were made in either the Liberian or Syrian case.

From Table I we can see that Type I projects are, on average, shorter than Type II projects (3.5 years as compared to 5.09 years). No WID project was longer than five years.

Table II shows the projects arranged according to their start-up dates. Some differences appear between those begun prior to 1977 and those begun in 1977 and later. The incidence with which women were mentioned in the design documents is low before 1977 and gender disaggregation of beneficiaries even lower. After 1977, women are always discussed in the project design and more often are explicitly named as project beneficiaries. Of the five projects begun before 1977, however, three had an important and positive involvement of women whereas only six of the 14 begun in 1977 or after had such an effect. One must conclude from this that the discussion of women in the design documents of a project is neither a necessary nor a sufficient condition for ensuring women's effective integration in a project.

Table III arranges projects according to their funding amounts. They range from quite large (Yemen with \$28 million) to quite small (Peru with only \$80,000). Four of the five WID projects were below \$500,000, that is, in the lowest category. There appears to be no correlation between the amount of funding a project receives and its effectiveness in integrating women.

Because the project sample is small, it is dangerous to attempt to derive conclusions from this comparison. However, in this sample it does appear that none of the aspects by which we have compared projects---type, duration, explicit mention of women in design documents, or funding--accounts, by itself, for effectiveness in integrating women. Therefore, in the analysis that follows, we shall look more

6

clearly at those elements of design and implementation which may explain past experience and provide lessons for future programming.

TABLE I COMPARISON OF PROJECTS AND PROJECT INPUTS

Proj. Title/no.	Country	Proj. Type	Funding	Dates	Institution Building	Construction	Commodities	Training In-co.	Out	Curric. design	Proj. Success	Proj. Success for Women
Primary Educ. Improvement/6330222	Botswana	I	\$7.293m.	81-85	x	x	x	x	x	x	good	positive but below potential
Educ. Tech. for Unitary Schools/5140187	Colombia	I	\$452,000	76-79	x	-	x	x	-	x	good	NI/reinforced invisibility
Prim. School Reconstruction/5220116	Honduras	I	\$1.5 m.	75-76	-	x	x	x	-	x	good	NI/reinforced invisib.
Literacy Service Trng. Centr./6830237	Niger	I	\$1.81m.	81-84	x	x	x	x	x	x	med. good	poor/ too few women
Rural Nonformal Educ./5260501	Paraguay	I	\$520,000	75-77	x	-	x	x	-	x	good	NI/probably good
Basic Educ. Devt./2790053	Yemen	I	\$28.3m.	79-87	x	x	x	x	x	x	poor	fewer than intended/ 5% rather than planned 20%
Trng. Cntr. for Rur. Women/6880225	Mali	mixed WID	\$500,000	80-85	x	x	x	x	-	x	-	good
Rur. Ldrshp. Trng/5270204	Peru	mixed WID	\$80,000	78-81	x	-	x	x	-	x	-	poor
OEF/FOV Human Devt./5150140	Costa Rica	mixed WID	\$370,000	77-80	-	-	x	x	-	x	-	good/no income or employment data
Agr. College Expansion/6330074	Botswana	II	\$7.149m.	78-86	x	x	x	x	x	x	good	positive but below potential
Suez Community Pers. Trng/2630136	Egypt	II	\$7.8m.	80-85	x	x	x	x	x	x	poor	NI/reinforced invisib.
Devt. & Mgt. Trng/3860487	India	II	\$6.1m.	82-87	-	-	-	x	x	x	behind schedule	probably poor/NI in process
Kabupaten PIng. & Mgt. Trng/4970237	Indonesia	II	\$470,000	77-79	x	x	-	x	x	x	good	women visible in design/ lost by midpoint eval.
Inst. of Public Adm./6690122	Liberia	II	\$3.025m.	72-81	x	x	x	x	x	x	poor	gains for women greater than for men
Devt. Ldrshp. Trng/6880221	Mali	II	\$4.5m. approx.	80-86	-	-	-	x	x	x	good	positive but limited/ recruitment difficulties
Social Services Trng/6080157	Morocco	II WID comp	\$3.5m. approx.	80-83	x	-	x	x	-	x	fair to good	women's component not begun by mid point
Indus. & Commerc. Job Trng. for Wom. 6080147	Morocco	II WID	\$2.2m.	78-82	x	-	x	x	x	x	-	good
Eng. Lang. Trng. 2760002	Syria	II	\$1.312m.	76-84	x	x	x	x	x	x	good	positive/25% of trainees
Trng. for Wom. in Devt./6110202	Zambia	II WID	\$324,000	79-82	x	-	x	x	-	x	-	poor

TABLE II PROJECT START-UP DATES/INCLUSION OF WOMEN IN DOCUMENTS

Year	Project	Mention in Design Docs.	Disaggregation of Beneficiaries	Evaluation for Women
'72	Liberia	2	1	greater than for men but questionable
'75	Paraguay	3	2	positive
'75	Honduras	1	1	poor
'76	Colombia	1	1	poor
'76	Syria	1	1	positive
'77	Costa Rica	WID	WID	positive
'77	Indoensia	3	3	NI
'78	Peru	WID	WID	poor
'78	Botswana Ag. College	4	3	positive but below intent
'78	Morocco	WID	WID	positive but below intent
'79	Yemen	4	2	poor, below intent
'79	Zambia	WID	WID	poor
'80	Egypt	No docs	1	poor
'80	Mali	WID	WID	positive
'80	Mali Ldrshp Trng.	4	4	positive but below intent
'80	Morocco Soc. Serv.	4	4	poor
'81	Botswana Prim. Ed.	3	4	positive but below intent
'81	Niger	4	1	poor
'82	India	4	4	poor

1= No mention
3= Some specificity

2= General boilerplate/very scanty
4= Detailed discussion/analysis

TABLE III PROJECTS BY LEVELS OF FUNDING (LOP)

Project	Funding (LOP)	Evaluation for Women
Yemen	\$28.3 m.	poor/below intent
Egypt	7.8 m.	poor
Botswana Prim. Ed.	7.293 m.	positive but below intent
Botswana Ag. Col.	7.149 m.	positive but below intent
India	6.1 m.	poor
Mali Ldrshp. Trng.	4.5 m. (approx)	positive but below intent
Morocco Soc. Serv.	3.5-4 m.	poor
Liberia	3.025 m.	positive
Morocco WID	2.2-2.4 m.	positive but below intent
Niger	1.8 m.	poor
Honduras	1.5 m.	poor
Syria	1.312 m.	positive
Paraguay	\$520,000	positive
Mali WID	500,000	positive
Indonesia	470,000	NI
Colombia	452,000	poor
Costa Rica	370,000	positive
Zambia	324,000	poor
Peru	80,000	poor

III. ANALYSIS/ISSUES RAISED AND LESSONS LEARNED

In the analysis that follows, we shall explore both why and how females were or were not integrated into the projects included in this evaluation.

Project Focus.

We noted above that projects in the education sector may be divided into two types depending on whether their focus is on education as a development goal in itself or on education as a means to achieving another goal. Within these two types of projects there are issues regarding access to education that deserve further examination. In none of the nineteen projects reviewed was the analysis of the access issue, as it relates to gender, adequate for project design and implementation.

In both types of projects, education is viewed as a resource that will benefit both the individual and the society as a whole. For the society, the trained individual represents a human capital resource. For the individual, the training provides a resource which can be used for betterment either because it increases future productivity or because it represents a credential which leads to other opportunities. Access to education/training projects, then, is the first step in a chain of access. Type I projects have as their purpose the extension of education to new groups or into new subjects whereas Type II projects limit access through a series of prerequisites for involvement. Differences in access represented by these two approaches are significant and bear directly, as we shall see below, on the successful integration of women into development projects.

Each of the six projects reviewed in this study that fall into category I, did, in fact, extend access to education. The Botswana Primary Education Project stressed training people within the school system (faculty at Botswana University College, tutors in the Primary Teacher Training Institutes, and principals, inspectors and teachers

in the primary schools) with the intent that these people, in turn, should train an extended group of primary school teachers and primary school students. Two criteria for assessing the project were school participation and retention rates (especially for girls whose drop-out rates are greater than for boys). The Yemen Basic Education Project similarly trained people within the school system and provided them with additional equipment to extend education to new groups and in new disciplines (science). The Niger Literacy Service Training Center Project was intended to train literacy workers to reach the rural illiterate, out-of-school population. The Paraguay Rural Nonformal Education Project was focused on directly reaching a previously excluded target population, illiterate and semi-literate rural people. The Colombia Educational Technology for Rural Schools Project and the Honduras Primary School Reconstruction Project both sought to establish schools in new areas and to extend the education available in those schools.

Even as these six projects reached into new areas, however, they missed certain opportunities to include girls/women explicitly. This is because they failed to take account of three additional access considerations that affect who can take advantage of education projects. These three, location, timing and incentives, also affect Type II projects, and will be discussed after we, first, look at the special limitations to access of projects in this second category.

Type II projects, providing education/training as a means to achieving another development goal, often reinforce patterns of limited access that already exist in a society. In each of the ten Type II projects reviewed in this evaluation, certain prerequisites for involvement meant that fewer women than men were eligible for inclusion in project activities. In some cases (Botswana Agricultural College Expansion, Suez Community Personnel Training, Mali Leadership Training, Morocco Social Services Training, Morocco Training for Women), there were previous educational requirements for participation such as successful completion of four years of primary education or completion of secondary school, etc. In other cases (India,

Indonesia, Liberia, Syria, Zambia) there were previous occupational requirements (themselves involving educational attainment in most cases). The Syria project required that people be mid-level government employees for access to the English Language Training Program and this language training, in turn, was intended to provide access to modern technologies which were available only in English.

Remarkably, while neither the design nor the results documents for this project made any explicit effort to disaggregate beneficiaries by gender, approximately 25% of the language trainees were women.

This reflects, according to the project manager, the presence of women in government employment in secondary schools and the heavy participation of the secondary school sector in this project.

The Mali Leadership Training Project illustrates the opposite in terms of female recruitment. Of the first 30 trainees selected to U.S. university education, only 3 were women, in spite of the fact that the Malian government, and the AID project officer both worked very hard to recruit women for the program. The pool of eligible people simply did not include many women who were both educationally qualified and able to leave their homes for the time required.

When English language competence is a criterion for promotion into better positions in Syria in the future, a fairly sizable group of women will be eligible for consideration. When university training and international experience are criteria for promotion in Mali, very few women will appear in the eligible group. Type II projects because they are targetted to groups with special qualifications and provide new credentials to their participants, serve to reinforce existing patterns of status and access. Because girls and women tend to fall behind in both educational and occupational attainment at each point (even the 25% women participants in the Syria project do not represent their 50% proportionality in the population as a whole), they are at a disadvantage in access to Type II projects. If they are not recruited to these projects, this disadvantage continues in relation to subsequent opportunities.

While Type I projects extend access to the resource of education and Type II projects concentrate access through designated prerequisites, both types of projects may miss opportunities to integrate females because they fail to consider gender differentiated limitations on location, timing and incentives.

By providing training/education in geographical areas not previously reached, as some Type I projects do, one does, of course, increase access for people in those areas. From many of the studies on the location of schooling and training programs, however, we know that there is potential for a differential impact by gender. Social restrictions and/or other work obligations limit the mobility of girls and women more than of boys and men. The project most concerned with the location of schools (Honduras) did not consider the relationship between location and access. The Mali Women's Training Project built the training center in a location where its targeted women would have easy access, but later had to modify the length of training programs (see below) in order to ensure that women could stay in the center for the training.

Related to the location issue is that of the provision of facilities. In the Botswana Agricultural College Project the early failure to attract sufficient women students was attributed to the lack of dormitory space for them, a problem that was later corrected. The Morocco Women's Training Project was successful in one area where all facilities were provided for women but failed in the other area because the school's director could not be persuaded to provide dormitory space for women. The Costa Rica Project was both located directly where its target population lived and provided child care for the women who secured employment. The Mali Women's Training Project also provided child care for one child under six of each of its trainees. Without this, a number of women would have been unable to participate.

Thus, where a training program is placed and the facilities provided may make a significant difference in who may benefit. Because women and men have different work obligations that affect mobility and experience different social/cultural constraints on travel and transport, the project design issues surrounding location and facilities affect access in a gender differentiated way.

Similarly, access problems may occur as a result of the timing of education projects. Studies show that obligations to carry out productive and household work limit the ability of boys, in some societies, and girls, in others, to attend school. Seasonal work requirements such as harvesting may cause students in rural areas to withdraw from school during peak agricultural periods. In some societies young girls are allowed to go to school, but as soon as the onset of puberty occurs, they are withdrawn. Thus, the scheduling of schooling and training both in terms of the hours of the day, the seasons of the year and the stages in life of potential students will have an impact on who may attend and who may not.

Finally, even when schools reach all geographic areas and their sessions are timed to fit student needs and obligations, the value placed on attendance and the probable gains from schooling may vary by sex. In the Botswana Primary Education Project documents, it was noted that girls in general drop out of school more than boys because of "low aspirations." In India, it was noted that too much education may harm a girl's chance of marriage. When jobs are not available to girls or women after training there is little incentive to enter training programs. When schooling is not perceived to be leading to desired objectives, parents may limit their own children's access to education programs or adults may decide not to participate, and the benefits perceived to derive from the resource of education may vary for females and males.

Except in those instances named above when special facilities were provided for women students, the projects reviewed in this study did not take account of location, timing and incentives as factors determining access to the project's resources. This was true even when the analysis about differences in the work and social determinants of women and men had been included in project design. Thus, we assume that access to education may not have been extended as widely as the project designers intended in each of these cases.

Issue: Education/Training projects have the potential either to extend access to an important resource or to reinforce existing patterns of limited access.

Lesson #1: If women/girls are not well represented in the targeted beneficiary population of education projects, then simply stating that their involvement is a project objective will not ensure their involvement (Mali Leadership Training, India, Indonesia). Conversely, when a beneficiary population is described in ways that clearly include girls or women, they need not be explicitly mentioned in project documents in order to be integrated into a project (Paraguay, Syria).

Lesson #2: When education/ training projects are intended to promote the achievement of another development goal, the actual success of the training program in achieving that goal will be either supported or limited by who is recruited into the education/training phase of the development strategy. When prerequisites for involvement exclude important sectors of a population for this training phase, the likelihood of achieving the other development goal is probably diminished.

Lesson #3: The location and timing of education/training projects and the incentives for participating in them influence who has access to them. For integration of women into projects, these factors must be considered in project design.

Adequacy of Project Design.

The issue of access to resources has, as noted, project design implications. Other project design issues that emerged in this review include:

1. Visibility/Invisibility of Women. Table II shows the invisibility of women in the projects reviewed. In seven of the fourteen non-WID projects studied, women were invisible in the design of the project and/or in the analysis of the project objectives in that these were not disaggregated by gender. In three projects there was no mention of women in the design document and in one the mention was superficial and "boiler-plate." Seven projects failed to disaggregate

beneficiaries by gender.

The failure to note women or girls among the project target groups, at worst, results in their exclusion and, at least, marginalizes them. Visibility affects project design in the education sector in two principal ways: in access to project training and in the content of project training embedded in curriculum design. The access issue was discussed above as we explored the importance of project focus. We turn now to curriculum design.

2. Curriculum Design. All nineteen projects included a curriculum design component. These were focused on training provided in-country and were a central part of project design even where the ostensible project purpose was quite different, as in the Honduras School Reconstruction Project.

In most projects (Botswana Primary Education, Colombia, Honduras, Niger, Paraguay, Yemen, Mali Women's Training, Peru, Costa Rica and Zambia) curriculum design emphasized the importance of making training "relevant" to the daily lives of the trainees. The emphasis was on teaching "useful" problem solving skills. Only in Niger, of the non-WID projects, however, was there explicit recognition of the fact that relevant training would differ for men and women. That is, the Niger Project design recognized that women and men have different daily productive economic and household roles and solve different daily problems; thus, the focus of training should be geared toward the particular experiences and needs of each. The Niger project failed to provide literacy training targeted to women's needs to the extent it intended; nonetheless, this appears to have been an implementation problem rather than one of design.

Paraguay illustrates well the importance of curriculum design for the integration of women into projects. Originally, six course areas were designated for teaching rural semi- and illiterate people. In a later project redesign, the courses on artisan and crafts skills and on health, nutrition and sanitation were dropped. While there was no analysis of activities of the target population by gender, one might assume that both of these areas were ones which could have included women in project training. Still, of the four course areas that

were taught, home management (clearly designed for women) had the highest participation (531 trainees as compared to 389 in Livestock and Poultry, 199 in Basic Agriculture, and 87 in Small Farm Management). The project was found to have had a significant impact on the trainees with 60% having adopted a new practice as a result of training. Given the course content, even though we have no figures on participation by gender, we conclude that women were integrated into this project and contributed largely to its effectiveness. Thus, even when women are not explicitly designated as beneficiaries, when course design is such that it addresses daily activities of women, they will be integrated into the project.

Curriculum design may also focus on changing the traditional daily activities of women or men. The Morocco Women's Training Project explicitly set out to train women for jobs requiring skills not traditionally theirs. In Costa Rica, the training was focused on providing women with skills and support to do new things they had not done before in terms of living in new areas and holding new jobs. Curriculum design met specific needs of women in both cases, preparing them to function in nontraditional ways. Both projects were WID projects, however, so that they were directed toward women specifically. In non-WID projects which train in areas not typically those of women, we saw that women are not well integrated (the leadership and management training projects).

Issue: Curriculum Design provides an important project component for integrating women into education/training projects. Curricula may either focus on traditional activities of women as a method of assuring their project involvement or they may explicitly retrain women for new areas.

Lesson #4: Even when women are not named as beneficiaries of projects, they may be integrated through courses whose curriculum is explicitly designed around their traditional activities.

Lesson #5: From this very limited sample of projects, we may tentatively conclude that when education sector projects are designed to provide training in areas that are not traditionally in the domain of women or girls, they must explicitly target them in order to involve them. In this instance, WID projects have been seen to be especially effective. Even when women are targeted in non-traditional skills training projects (as in the Morocco Social Services Training Project), they may not be effectively integrated into the project; that is, targeting does not ensure their integration. These relationships should be further tested in relation to a larger sample of education projects or in the field.

3. Competition over Resources. Our sample of nineteen projects did not reveal many lessons regarding competition over resources. However, three points may be made from this review. First is the obvious point that education is a resource and, as such, when access is limited then those who do not gain access not only lose in the competition for education but also have an additional competitive disadvantage as a result of being excluded from education.

Second, the degree of competition for education may be assumed to increase in relation to the expected future returns to be derived from the training or in relation to the value placed on it. One may hypothesize, for example, that the surprising rate of involvement of women in the Liberian project reflected, in part, the fact that the training was not, overall, valued very highly. Thus, the program was opened to two groups --nurses and clerical staffs-- who had not originally been named as beneficiaries in the project design and these two groups included a large number of women. Because competition among higher level groups did not exist for the program, access was permitted to people with lower status.

Third, education is not a sufficient resource to guarantee future access to other advantages. For example, in the Morocco Women's Training Project, while women received training in non-traditional skills for which there was a market, and this enabled them to compete for jobs in these areas, the project evaluator found that, in general, women were hired in positions below their

competence. The project needed to pay more attention to job placement if its objectives were to be fully realized.

Issue: Insofar as education is a limited resource, there will be competition for it. More important in this sample of projects, access to education can give a competitive advantage to a student for future goals.

Lesson #6: As a resource, education/training can improve individuals' and groups' competitive position or harm it. If women are excluded from participation in certain education/training projects through the processes discussed above, they become less able to compete for other benefits and resources as a result. Even attainment of education does not assure equal access to the benefits it is intended to bring, however.

4. Local Culture/Congruency with Additional Roles. In those projects in our sample in which women's roles remained invisible, there was no attempt to fit project design with local culture or to use project inputs to alter local roles or relationships. In some cases, the consideration of local culture and roles in project design made a positive difference (Costa Rica, Mali Women's Training). In others, however, aspects of local culture were discussed in the design documents but were not taken into account in actual project design. For example, the discussion of women's roles and cultural constraints in the India project documents is thorough and knowledgeable. Factors that limit women's access to education are named and analyzed. In the project design, however, a target of 15% women trainees is simply named; no analysis is attempted about how this is to be achieved in the face of the limitations discussed in the background documents.

In the Botswana Primary Education Project the analysis of school drop-out rates due to low aspirations among girls was not reflected in project design where no component addressed changing aspirations through offering greater opportunities or the like. In Niger, women's

roles and activities were discussed, but insufficient attention was given in project design to mechanisms through which the literacy training would actually address these.

In one case, the Morocco Women's Training Project, there was careful analysis of women's traditional roles and the potential difficulties to be encountered by the project's design to alter these through non-traditional skills training. The project design called for an ongoing analysis of problems encountered by women trainees as they entered nontraditional fields. In fact, to the surprise of the project staff, no major problems were encountered. It is difficult to understand why, from the information given, but two possible conclusions might be drawn. Either the project design addressed the issues so successfully that problems were overcome or the analysis of difficulties was, in fact, inaccurate and based in unfounded cultural biases. Possibly, also, the cultural factors that would have been expected to pose problems for women in non-traditional areas are very much in flux in Morocco, so that the analysis was outdated. Nonetheless, this was the project in which women, while placed in nontraditional jobs, were generally placed below their competence. Perhaps, the cultural strictures were encountered at this phase of the project rather than at earlier training stages considered by the project design.

Issue: Cultural factors and women's roles may affect project outcomes and should be analyzed in the planning phases for possible effects.

Lesson #7: It does no good to do a cultural analysis of women's roles and activities if this is not, then, incorporated into actual project design. Changing patterns and the dynamics of cultural change should also be considered in such analyses.

5. Skills/Sex of Project Designers and Staff. The important role that an individual staff person can play in bringing about

an effective integration of women into projects is demonstrated in several of the projects reviewed. In the Botswana Agricultural College Project for example the central role played by a woman on the evaluation teams meant that when the college claimed it was having difficulty recruiting women students because there was insufficient dormitory space, this problem was solved in project revision. In the case of the Mali projects, the presence of an AID Project Officer who was sensitive to women's issues meant that extra efforts were made and time spent to recruit women in the Leadership project and to adapt the Women's Training project to make it effective. It is her assessment that her willingness to give this extra time and effort would not have been matched by someone who did not see the importance of women's involvement in development as she does.

In the Morocco Social Services Project, the presence of three women on the design team meant that an explicit component for women was incorporated into the project. However, the lesson learned here is one of caution. The women's component was the one component of the project that was not even begun by the mid-point evaluation. This prompts us to ask where the concern for inclusion of women came from and how much it reflected an imposition on project design by the three women and how much it was of genuine concern to those in Morocco and on AID's staff who were responsible for project implementation.

In the cases where women were invisible in project design, none of the project design teams included women or anyone else who was aware of the importance of women's integration into development for project effectiveness. As the variation in assessment of WID projects indicates, however, sensitivity to women's involvement in development is not sufficient for assuring their effective integration into projects.

Lesson #8: Awareness of the importance of women's integration into development on the part of staff involved in design, implementation and/or evaluation of projects can make a significant difference to project outcomes with respect to women. However, awareness, by itself, does not ensure that a project will be effective for women. This

concern must be translated into mechanisms for project implementation that connect the concern with women's involvement with actual project activities that involve women productively.

Factors Affecting General Project Success.

In none of the projects included in this sample was it clear that the project overall was improved by the integration of women into its design. In most cases this is because women were not explicitly incorporated into the design in ways that actually reflected their productive roles and social/cultural constraints. Some of the projects reviewed (Peru, Egypt, Zambia) were not effective for reasons quite apart from their attention or inattention to women, such as management difficulties, failure of backstopping from the home office or AID, staffing problems or commodity shipment bottlenecks.

We may speculate, however, that several projects missed opportunities to be more effective than they were as a result of their failure to take account of the women who might have been in their target beneficiary populations. Examples of this include:

- The Honduras Project that could have taken the opportunity for redesigning schooling to ensure greater access to girls;
- The Colombia Project that could have specifically addressed girls' needs in the unitary school curriculum;
- The Botswana Primary Education Project that failed to make explicit efforts to overcome girls' low aspirations;
- The Paraguay Project that possibly could have increased women's productivity even more if it had focused on their economic roles as much as on their home management roles;
- The Costa Rica Project if it had focused on income and employment as its indicators of success as much as it did on participation in the training offered by the project; and
- The Botswana Agricultural College Project if it had connected needs for trained female agricultural extension agents with the potential for increasing women farmers' productivity.

Opportunities for inclusion of girls into science studies may have been missed in the Yemen project though we have no information on this; similarly, opportunities to increase the effectiveness of

female health workers may have been lost in the Egypt project.

Issue: At issue here is the degree to which it is necessary to incorporate women into project design in order to ensure the most effective project possible. While we have no evidence in this sample that any single project was made more effective as a result of women's inclusion, we know from other circumstances that this is often the case; the converse is also true: failure to include women may severely distort or diminish a project.

Lesson #9: When women's roles are not incorporated into project design and, even, when they are referred to in design documents, there are often missed opportunities for their full involvement that cause the project to be less effective in reaching its objectives than it could have been had women been fully integrated.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

As a matter of both policy and practice, the following recommendations emerge from the foregoing analysis of education sector projects:

A. Project Design: For full integration of women into AID projects, all project designs should be required to:

1. analyze female and male activities in the target population on which the project intends to have an impact;
2. specify the ways in which females will be a part of the targeted beneficiary group by both numbers and proportions of populations (if they are not represented in the target population analyze why this is so and how it will be overcome);
3. specify how the project will address the female participants' situations/needs/activities/roles as they differ from those of males; and
4. describe mechanisms for assessing the impact on females and males differentially during project implementation.

All of the above should be incorporated into the project logical framework in order to ensure that it will not be lost in later project assessments.

B. Evaluation. Project evaluations should be required to:

1. assess women's/girls' involvement in project activities as related to their proportion in the population as well as in absolute numbers and the factors determining their involvement;
2. compare the benefits females gain to those gained by males;
3. compare benefits to losses for both groups;
4. analyze missed opportunities for greater involvement of females;
5. assess the way in which lost opportunities in the given project may lead to future losses.

C. Relationship of Education Projects to Future Benefits.

In all phases of project identification, planning, design and implementation for education/training projects, special attention should be

given to the linkages of access to education as a resource and future access to other benefits derived from education. All education or training projects should directly address the issue of access; they should always attempt to extend access and broaden it and should in all instances avoid reinforcing patterns of exclusion that already exist in societies.

APPENDIX A: PROJECT PROFILES

Title/Number: Mali Training Center for Rural Women/6880225

Funding: \$500,000

Length of Project: 1980-1985

Type of Project: WID

Project Components: Technical assistance, commodities, construction, and in-country training.

Project Description: The objective of the project was to increase the capacity of Mali's rural women to bring sustained improvements in the quality of economic life at the village level through providing multi-disciplinary training. The project was intended to strengthen the capacity of the National Union of Malian Women to provide this training and to become self-sufficient in carrying it out after the close of the project.

The project design called for women, married and over 25 years of age who have potential for village leadership to come to the Center for training in health and nutrition, gardening, midwifery and functional literacy. The plan was that the women would stay at the Center for periods of one month for the first three of these courses and for one month at a time but repeated for a total of three months for the literacy course. Each woman would be allowed to bring one child under six years of age and a day care center would be provided for these children.

In project redesign each of the four courses was shortened usually to only two weeks to make it possible for women to stay at the Center. By the mid-point evaluation, over 200 women had been trained. A follow-up survey of a randomly selected sample of villages showed that they had incorporated a number of the lessons learned and had taught these to other women in their villages.

The AID Project Officer for the project (who was also the AID WID officer in Mali) took special interest in this project and provided

special supervisory time and effort. She received some criticism for spending so much time on such a "small project." Without her effort, however, and that of the very good Malian Center Director, this project could have floundered at a number of points.

Lesson: The project illustrates the value of special interest and involvement by some staff member for project effectiveness. It also illustrates the importance of project redesign. Had the length of project courses not been shortened, attendance would have been impossible for a number of women. The two points are related in this instance: that is, the close involvement of concerned staff led to the immediate recognition of potential problems with course length, and made the project revision possible.

Title/Number: Syria English Language Training Project/276002

Funding: \$1,312,000

Length of Project: 1976-1984

Type of Project: WID integrated

Project Components: Technical assistance, commodities and training materials, in-country and US training

Project Description: The project was designed to assist the Syrian government in achieving its manpower development goals by providing English language training to potential AID participants and government of Syria officials who needed to use it in their day to day work. Further, the project intended to develop a Syrian institution for carrying out this training after the project's close.

Up to 1000 government officials were to be trained and a model for Englishlanguage training was to be developed. There was no discussion in the project design documents of male or female beneficiaries; all access to the training was to be based on position within the Syrian government employment levels.

Nonetheless, approximately 25% of the trainees were women, drawn primarily from the ranks of secondary school teachers and administrators. The Syrian government designated a woman to be the Director of the Language Training Center and she received US training for this position. She currently directs the ongoing Center and of the ten teaching faculty in addition to herself, six are women.

Lesson: The project illustrates that even without designation of women's integration in project design documents, when they are well represented in the target population, and no additional prejudice or other barriers exist, they will be included in the project. (See Project Profile on the Mali Development Leadership Training Project for the opposite lesson.)

Title/Number: Paraguay Rural Nonformal Education Project/5260501

Funding: \$520,000

Length of Project: 1975-1977

Type of Project: WID integrated

Project Components: Technical assistance, commodities and training materials, and in-country training.

Project Description: The project objectives were to provide training and to change attitudes and practices of the rural population in order to help them improve their standard of living. To do this, the project was to assist the National Apprenticeship Service in the development of a rural nonformal education program, reaching the rural illiterate and semi-literate population, in six areas: 1) basic agriculture; 2) small scale livestock and poultry; 3) small farm management; 4) crafts production; 5) home management; and 6) sanitation.

In a project revision, crafts production and sanitation were dropped from the courses offered. Nonetheless, the project trained 1,206 participants in the other four areas as follows:

Livestock and Poultry	389
Basic Agriculture	199
Home Management	531
Small Farm Management	87

The project evaluation gathered information on participants by age, education, land tenure and crop production, but not by gender. It found a high degree of success in terms of changed attitudes and practices on the part of participants. Sixty percent of the participants had adopted a new practice as a result of the training and 26% had shown the new practice to at least one other person.

Because the Home Management course was clearly designed for women, and the participation in it was the largest of the four areas, we can conclude that the project integrated women well, and that they gained from their involvement in it. We do not have any infor-

mation on the involvement of women in the other three course areas. We might also conclude that women would have been involved in the crafts production course had it been taught and they, therefore, may have lost through the project redesign that dropped this course.

Lesson: By defining the target population as rural illiterate and semi-literate people, and by designating one course area as clearly relating to activities of women, this project ensured the integration of women to a large extent. Whether the involvement was as great as it could have been had efforts been made to involve women in the other three course areas is not known.

Title/Number: Indonesia Kabupaten Provincial Planning and Management Training Project/4970237

Funding: \$470,000

Length of Project: 1977-1979

Type of Project: WID integrated

Project Components: Technical assistance and in-country training.

Project Description: In order to achieve better managed and planned development projects and activities at the Provincial and Kabupaten levels of government, the project intended to improve the nationwide training program in development planning and administration for officials and technicians at the Provincial and Kabupaten levels. This two-year phase of the project (later portions to be funded separately) was to develop a master plan for the nationwide training program.

Project design documents discussed the importance of training for women both at the Provincial/Kabupaten official and technician level, and subsequently in rural-focused development projects being planned by these people. There was some discussion of the importance of ensuring that women were represented in the early phases of training offered even under this pilot, master-plan project phase.

By the point of project evaluation, however, no mention is made of whether the master plan being evaluated addresses women's inclusion or of whether women were involved in the training offered. Lesson: Even when design documents incorporate women, they may be lost in implementation and evaluation. For this reason it is extremely important that evaluations (especially at the mid-point when project redesign is still possible) be required to address the issue of women's integration explicitly.

Title/Number: Mali Development Leadership Training/6880221

Funding: \$4,500,000 (approximately; documents disagree)

Length of Project: 1980-1986

Type of Project: Wid integrated

Project Components: Technical assistance, commodities and out-of-country training, especially in the US

Project Description: Project objectives were to increase the capacity of Mali's public and private sector institutions to serve the needs of the population and to improve the management of these institutions to ensure their capacity for doing this. To accomplish these objectives, the project was focused on providing US based training to sixty future Malian leaders. Training was to be on management, and five management symposia were to be conducted in-country as well. Four US professors were to be so closely involved in the selection, training, advising, monitoring and supporting of the trainees, and in the in-country symposia, that they would develop significant competence in Mali's management systems and problems. They would, then, provide a resource for Mali as well.

Project design documents analyzed the role of women in Mali in some detail, and objectives called for including "as many women as possible" in the training.

Of the first 30 trainees selected, three were women. Both the AID project officer and the Malian government put effort into recruitment of women but the pool from which to draw was simply very restricted. It was difficult to find women who were educationally qualified and whose family obligations allowed them to be gone for such a long period of time. One of the three women dropped out of the program due to a combination of academic and personal/family problems. Another woman was found to take her place. Efforts are now being made to ensure a greater representation of women in the second group of trainees, though there is no clear indication of how this might be better accomplished.

Lesson: No matter how great the detail of analysis of women's roles in project design documents, no matter how great the agreement on the importance of the inclusion of women, no matter how great the effort to recruit women, when they do not exist in the pool of people targeted for training, they will not benefit equally with men from a project. If a project is truly concerned with including women, another definition of the target group will be required. In this case, other project design modifications could also have helped. For example, training could have been provided in-country at times and locations acceptable to women. Remedial training could have been provided to those women who were able to travel but who did not meet the educational prerequisites.

Title/Number: Morocco Social Services Training Project/6080157

Funding: \$3,500,000 to \$4,000,000 (documents disagree)

Length of Project: 1980-1983

Type of Project: WID component

Project Components: Technical assistance, commodities and in-country training.

Project Description: The project was designed to improve the quality and range of skill training opportunities for low income Moroccan youth and, thereby, to increase their employability by 1) improving the administrative and management capabilities of the Ministry of Handicrafts and Social Affairs (MAAS, responsible for skills training programs); 2) upgrading and extending the training capabilities of MAAS instructors; and 3) helping establish a new National Institute for Social Action in Tangier.

The project design included a women's component, noting that while worldwide economic factors have led to unemployment among certain groups of Moroccan youth in general, the problems of increased divorce, abandonment, loss of husbands, and husbands' migration to urban centers, have left women at a particular disadvantage in employment terms. Five experimental centers were to be opened to train women in nontraditional skills areas.

By the time of the interim evaluations, all components of the project were on track except those directed at women. Thirteen vocational centers for young males were operating well, run by Peace Corps volunteers. It was estimated that they would train over 900 young men by 1983.

The inclusion of an explicit women's component may be traced to the fact that three members of the project design team were women with particular concerns to integrating women into the project.

However, though the design specified women's inclusion, there was virtually no follow-through on this in implementation. It is difficult to know exactly why from the information available. Those involved in implementation point to problems in the design assumptions and institutional arrangements. It was clear that the commitment to redesign the project in order to achieve the goals for the women's component did not exist. Project extensions may, however, allow for this in the future.

Lesson: Inclusion of women in the design phase of a project may not ensure their integration if there is insufficient commitment to the goals of their inclusion in the implementation phase. Even if project design has been inadequate for women, a commitment at implementation could introduce design revisions to accomplish the original purpose.

APPENDIX B METHODOLOGY

The methodology employed in this ten-year evaluation of AID project for their effectiveness in integrating women has three main stages. First, each consultant who was responsible for a particular sector recorded the degree of explicit attention to women which the project documents in her area revealed. For this stage, a common data collection instrument had been designed which we all used. Second, each consultant conducted a qualitative review of the projects in her sample to provide a fuller analysis of how and why project did and did not succeed in integrating women effectively. Finally, some projects will be selected for field studies that will, in turn, provide additional depth for understanding and analyzing the integration of women into projects.

Two principal hypotheses underlie the research. First, it is hypothesized that the degree of attention to women's special circumstances, economically productive roles and household roles in the design stages of projects will influence the ultimate effectiveness of a project in reaching women. The data collection instrument used by each of the consultants provided a way of tracing these connections to test this hypothesis. Unfortunately, limitations of project documents, themselves, as well as the cumbersomeness of the data collection instrument, made this tracing extremely difficult.

The second hypothesis was that the successful integration of women into projects would improve overall project effectiveness, while failure to consider and integrate women would undermine project success. Again, the data collection instrument obscured some of the analysis necessary to tease apart the elements of projects that support or fail to support this hypothesis.

Reliance on verbal references to women in project documents left little room for analysis of why and how women were or were not included in project processes and outcomes. Essentially what was missing in the application of the data collection instrument was any opportunity to describe what actually happened in projects and to analyze why these events had the effects they did.

The qualitative examinations of the projects by the consultants was intended to overcome these limitations and will have done so to some extent. Again, however, the success of this effort will be somewhat limited by the limitations of the project documents and the success of each consultant in reaching personnel who could supply missing information through conversations. In my case, I made over thirty telephone calls which netted me useful information on only six projects. Both the AID paper trail and the institutional memory failed at certain points. Even in the cases where I gained a fairly good view from project documents and additional enriching information through conversations, I do not have the same "feel" for what happened as is possible to gain through field visits. Desk officers, project officers and contractors who had responsibility for projects cannot be assumed to have completely unbiased views on project events. Field visits, therefore, are of extreme importance in providing the depth of information now needed to interpret what has been found in the evaluation to date.

The real value of this entire evaluation exercise is to be found in the comparative analysis it allows, both within sectors and across sectors. Therefore, in designing the field follow-up visits, I would suggest that certain themes be chosen for exploration and that projects from different sectors be selected for visits to pursue this exploration. For example, in the education sector analysis, it became clear that the commitment of individual staff people could make a significant difference to women's integration even when project design was not as good as it might have been. A comparison of several projects where this was the case across sectors might reveal lessons regarding 1) the degree of design specificity required to make individual staff interventions effective; 2) when and from what positions such interventions make the greatest difference.

Another theme for comparative study arises from the education sector analysis. This concerns the linkage effect of access to one resource as it affects future access to others. Clearly, early exclusion of women in a chain of linkages increases and compounds their disadvantage over time. Comparative study of projects from several sectors would allow further learning about 1) ways to break into patterns of advantage that help overcome the cumulative effect of disadvantage;

2) ways in which the definition of target populations may be made to include women and extend access; and 3) other project components (such as curriculum design in the education sector) that may be used to extend access even when target populations are limited.

The projects from the education that I would recommend for field visits will vary depending on whether this thematic approach is followed and which themes are chosen for the focus. In any case, however, I believe the Syria English Language project, the Paraguay Nonformal Education project and the Mali Leadership Training Project provide useful lessons about targeting project benefits.