

## Levels of Managerial Leadership in Southern Africa<sup>1</sup>

by  
John D. Montgomery  
Harvard University

### Abstract

Managerial leadership, the art of motivating subordinates, requires the exercise of individual creativity, but it takes similar forms even in different cultures and organizational settings. At the individual level, it involves diagnosing undesirable behavior in an organization and correcting it by various personal interventions. It takes on institutional dimensions, however, when a defective management system is responsible for the shortcomings of individual employees. Managers thus have to function at several levels where motivation is an especially challenging problem, as individuals in their relationship with subordinates whose performance is substandard, and collectively when it is the system itself that is at fault. These roles transcend institutional differences. Among managers in nine states in Southern Africa, whose activities were studied in detail, for example, private sector managers were not found to be better motivated than their counterparts in public employment. Moreover, African countries that were differentiated in economic status, political structure, and cultural background were found to differ only slightly in managerial leadership. The sources of satisfaction and dissatisfaction among them are not the same as those identified in studies of Western management, however. Finally, opportunities for providing leadership through administrative reforms are rarely exploited in Southern Africa. The systems are improving, but some promising opportunities for managerial initiatives that would provide better motivation at lower and middle levels of management are being neglected.

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 2

To the extent that leadership consists of generating and sustaining followership, successful managers must be leaders. One of their most important functions is to produce satisfactory performance on the part of their subordinates. The literature describing the procedures that contribute best to that end under different circumstances is informative, but most of its empirical base comes from experiences in Europe and the United States. African managers at lower and middle levels of responsibility, are often criticized for their lack of motivation.<sup>2</sup> There may be some basis for the complaint, though hard data comparing them with their counterparts in other parts of the world do not exist. It is likely that motivation is an important problem at all levels of management in Africa, for supervisors as well as for subordinates. A recent study of events that characterize the daily activities of managers in nine independent states in the southern part of the continent defines that problem. It also provides a basis for drawing some general conclusions about the exercise of managerial leadership even in routine situations.

In the summer of 1984, nine countries in Southern Africa (Angola, Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia, and Zimbabwe, cooperating as a group known as the Southern African Development Co-ordination Conference or SADCC) authorized a study of management training needs, covering not only the public and private sectors but also various intermediate hybrid sometimes known as parastatals and sometimes as public enterprises or statutory corporations.<sup>3</sup> As one means of identifying the skills needed in the region, the study gathered reports of management events that displayed either "effective" or "ineffective" behavior on the part of administrators. Each such incident, of which there were 1,868, was coded according to one or more of nearly fifty

### Levels of Managerial Leadership 5

individually identifiable skills. These events provide the empirical information about the functions of African managers on which this article is based.<sup>4</sup>

The most persistent issues that emerged from analysis of these incidents had to do with motivating subordinates (managers motivating other managers, in most cases). That function appeared in 377 situations - 20% of the total number examined.

Motivation does not appear in negative incidents only. In fact, the respondents were able to provide almost as many instances that had a positive valence as those with negative outcomes (183 to 194). Thus it is possible to view the problem in dynamic terms, distinguishing between situations in which managers have contributed to positive motivation and those in which they have not. Both situations reveal the extent to which the problem is one of personal relationships as contrasted with larger institutional dimensions.

### Motivation as Universal Problem

Fundamentally, motivation is an individual phenomenon, transcending (or perhaps underlying) institutional distinctions. Contrary to some popular expectations, in Africa, at least, the problem of motivation is not much more serious in the public administration than in the parastatal or private sectors: the balance between positive and negative events is about equal in all three settings. Civil servants are not much "less motivated" than employees of other large African organizations. Incidents involving motivation permeate all sectors of management, this category having ranked first in the number of events reported in the public administration, first in parastatal management, and second in the private sector (See Table 1).

#### Levels of Managerial Leadership 4

Moreover, these African countries differ only slightly in their experience with managerial motivation.

TABLE I  
RANK ORDER OF SKILL NEEDS IN THE SADCC COUNTRIES

Skill	Ang	Bet	Les	Mal	Moz	Swa	Tan	Zam	Zim
Motivating Employees	4	1	1	2	1	1	5	1	2
Personnel Management	2	5	2	5	4	2	2	4	4
Interpersonal Relations	-	3	4	1	6	5	3	2	3
Technical Skills	6	3	4	6	3	9	9	10	1
Writing Skills	-	6	10	2	-	3	1	3	5

The importance of motivation does not vary much from country to country, though it would appear that Tanzania is less afflicted than most other countries with such problems. It ranked only fifth in importance among the skills identified in the events gathered there. The distribution as between positive and negative events in Tanzania was fairly standard, however: the incidents themselves were not distinguishable from those reported elsewhere, socialist ideology or no. In most of the other eight countries, motivation came in first among all factors or skills identified in the management events.

When the skills coded in the study were disaggregated to show the rank of the individuals involved, motivation appeared at the top of the list for all levels of responsibility, whether senior, middle, or junior. It came in second in the incidents in which the respondent described an event in his own most recent experience, first in the accounts of behavior of subordinates, second in the number of events in which the respondent was writing about the work of one of his colleagues, second in the situations involving the activities of a superior, and fourth in the cases in which the event transcended the internal workings of an organization because outside agencies participated. Perceiving, and doing something about, motivational problems is a managerial priority in all situations observed in the study.

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 5

As already indicated, there is not much difference in the importance of managerial motivation as between the public and parastatal sectors, where it ranked first, and private industry, where it came in second. Curiously, the top-ranking skills in the private sector were technical, which ranked only third in the parastatal enterprises and tenth in the public sector. No one examining this experience can remain in doubt that motivation is one of the most important functions of managers at all levels of responsibility, including technical ones.

## Levels of Personal Action

In dealing with problems of motivation, managers must first identify the presence of behavior or "attitudes" that require some intervention. "Attitude" is a somewhat amorphous term that describes unexplained shortcomings in behavior, and it appeared in 68 of the 193 negative events. In situations like the following there was no ostensible cause of the lack of motivation; the individual concerned just did not "bother" to carry out an assignment. Here are some examples:

- My associate failed to answer a questionnaire that would provide views on training needs.
- I told my principal personnel officer to prepare a draft letter to Finance, but he did not study the file I gave him or do anything about it.
- A colleague was assigned to take minutes, but did not do it.

Most of the other events, however, contained a hint of the circumstances that led to low motivation. In 21 events, it could be explained in terms of a lack of training or knowledge, presumably a deficiency that could be corrected by an appropriate supervisory intervention:

- Two months ago I asked my subordinate to order some axles we usually get from Italy. After a week, I noticed he had not placed the order because he did not know how to list the specifications.

Another 18 could be traced to poor supervision or management:

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 6

•I was asked to do research on a certain issue for a meeting. The deadline was unreasonable and I had to call the committee members and postpone the meeting (1378)

Similar explanations could be found for the rest of the negative incidents: lack of incentives in 17 cases, poor guidance in 10, a poor personnel management system in 9, inadequate work habits in 9, political interference in 7, poor work scheduling in 6, experience with discouragement of new ideas in 5, a shortage of resources in 4, poor interpersonal relations in 4, and a system inflexibility in 2. (The remaining 12 cases were considered too unclear to code.)

Instances in which motivation was positive also contained some ambivalent information. For example, a constructive "attitude" explained 45 cases among 180 such incidents without yielding much information as to what had brought it about:

- In my absence, two of my subordinates sent out a survey circular the responses to which provided very valuable information.
- During harvest, my subordinate organized a groups of workers to repair sub-standard irrigation furrows, and limit water wastage.

"Initiative" was one explanation for such commendable behavior, examples of which were cited in 35 management events; self-gratification seemed to be the source of motivation in 11. But the role of managers could be traced in certain instances: for example, guidance or the support of a superior official was identified in 13 incidents. Training, the absence of which was one explanation for poor performance, appeared to be the immediate cause of positive motivation in 23 instances; technical skill, which could have been acquired individually or as a result of opportunities created in the system, in 20 more, and expected rewards or appreciation in 13. Good systematic personnel management appeared to be the cause 5 times, negotiations, a

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 7

supervisory act, in 6 more; and interpersonal relations 4. The coding of positive motivation left only 5 cases unexplained.

This amalgamated summary of motivational experiences illustrates the kinds of factors associated with managerial performance considered "effective" and "ineffective," and it shows the rather high frequency of situations in which the individual's internal values and preferences play a role in official behavior. In these situations, managerial interventions are indirect and personal. Training, knowledge, and skills play second fiddle in dealing with these issues, and supervisory responses and systems factors come still lower in the hierarchy of possible influences.

Diagnosis of motivational problems is the first stage of managerial responsibility. Managers became aware of motivational issues when either attitudes or performance were worse (or better) than expected. Their responses to the problem depended upon whether they deemed the cause to be personal or systemic. For the most part, attitudinal problems were treated in these events as matters for individual subordinates to resolve among themselves; inadequate performance, whether a result of attitudes or other problems, had to be dealt with directly. In most cases, the action taken involved person-to-person relationships. Even problems caused by sheer want of skills could usually be handled without manipulating the system. Only when the problem was considered a product of poor organization or procedures was some kind of collective action considered.

The first set of situations in which personal interventions occurred were those involving delays, unwillingness to cooperate, or sheer ill temper. Examples illustrate how managers perceived the existence of such motivation problems:

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 8

- A day before the close of the fiscal year, a subordinate was entrusted to prepare vouchers. She refused.
- Our minister wanted some information urgently. As I was going out of station, I delegated the work of getting the required information to my subordinate. When I returned from tour I found that she had not taken any action at all.
- One of my subordinates told me he was not doing his job properly because he was not satisfied with his salary.
- Two extension officers got into a quarrel and refused to collaborate with each other in working with the union, and would not even participate in the same training program.

There were also subtler cases where performance was regarded as substandard, and where a potential or actual intervention could be identified:

- A subordinate referred applicants to me instead of giving them guidance himself as he is supposed to.
- When a lazy employee sought promotion, I advised her to work harder. She changed her attitude and did work harder. She won recognition and was later promoted.
- I was to address a meeting in a village. I gave advance notice to my subordinate stationed there, but when the day came, she was not there, and when I inquired I found she had not gone to the village for a month.

When corrective action was specifically described, it appeared that managers took three principal approaches in their personal involvement with unsatisfactory attitudes: (1) increasing the intensity of their supervision, (2) reprimanding subordinates for unsatisfactory performance,<sup>5</sup> and (3) providing exemplary behavior themselves or offering creative leadership designed to change an individual's motivation without changing the system.

Increasing the intensity of supervision implied a kind of chase in search of wrong-doers:

- Following selection interviews, a subordinate of mine did not produce his lists of recommended candidates, and I had to chase him to get the work done.
- Our previous supervisor did not point out our shortcomings or give us any guidance. It lowered our morale considerably before he was replaced (by someone who was more zealous as a supervisor).

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 9

Reprimands were reported from both sides of the table, but it is not obvious that they necessarily had a beneficial effect:

- My Council Secretary criticized me in the drought meeting rather than talking to me directly before the meeting. As a boss he did not give me much guidance or advice.
- My stores officer had been giving lame excuses for non-availability of office equipment, materials, etc. because he had not been making regular stock inspections, nor was he checking the accounts. When he was warned to improve or face disciplinary action, he succeeded in improving the system.

The exercise of creative leadership, including offering to share an employee's burden, singling out unusually good performance for public comment, or displaying a sense of professional solidarity, was also a morale builder:

- My driver objected when he found that staff members would impose upon him during lunch hour for special trips. I offered to drive them myself when he needed his rest, and he immediately changed his opinion and accepted the response to such demands as voluntary on his part and he no longer resented the arrangement.
- Yesterday I was pleased that my deputy had found a way to get people to arrive on time without insulting or abusing them. He called a meeting to discuss reasons for lack of punctuality, and let them work out ways of dealing with the problem.
- My superior two steps above me allowed me to take jobs outside my normal routine in order to get exposure and more experience. This encouraged me to do my best in my job.

Such cases of creative leadership were, obviously, rather few in number, especially where they required managers to take a chance on their own initiative. But there were enough of them to suggest how positive acts to improve motivation can extend beyond improved individual morale to affect others within the system. There can be a kind of catalytic or chain reaction effect of good management, even when they begin at the personal level:

- We had a problem in getting the vaccine required for preventing foot-and-mouth disease. A colleague decided that we ought to make the vaccine ourselves, and now we are totally self-sufficient.

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 10

•One of my clerks came back from training and started improving the department's records of supplies both at the headquarters and the field offices. The new system he introduced was greatly appreciated by the audit department.

•Our superiors practiced methods of oppression they had learned from their colonial masters, creating fear among the people in the organization. Lately they have attended management courses and the situation has improved (with consequences beneficial to the whole system).

There were clearly cases in which positive reinforcement of good performance might have a systemic effect, in that sometimes they encouraged improved performance of individuals other than those directly involved:

•Our Chief Community Officer was touring my district to familiarize herself with the area and also to inspect the records and accounts. I informed my subordinates of the visit but did not specifically tell them about the inspection of records. When we went to one office, we found she had kept her records and accounts so well that the CCO was all praise for her and even me for good supervision.

•We were recently required to submit four reports of about 25 pages each, within a very short period of time. My subordinates performed extremely well in rushing the project to completion, and we were given a bonus for turning in a perfect report before the deadline.

### The Second Level of Action: Systemic Change

There are cases in which individual action on a personal level is insufficient because the motivational problem is caused by institutional limitations. The manager may find it impossible to deal with limitations that are inherent or irremediable, but in many situations some fairly minor organizational or procedural changes may produce improvements in working conditions. For example, there are instances in which an injustice was done almost by inadvertance, and an alert manager might be expected to rectify the situation:

•The GM raised the salary of an employee without following the proper procedure, causing much discontent among the other employees.

•One of my field workers did not collect any council revenue at all because she said she had already exceeded her transportation budget and could not carry out the travel need.

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 11

- A subordinate attended a course in public administration abroad. She hoped that quick promotion would result but it did not. She resigned, but two days later the promotion came through. Then it was too late and she was not accepted back.
- The post of controller was downgraded when my predecessor, afraid of competition and seeking to make the post unattractive to other potential candidates, asked that it be downgraded. In our department now, the morale is low because prospects for upward mobility are not good.
- I asked another ministry to waive conditions for promotion for a number of our employees, based on technical grounds. The ministry refused and now there are a lot of complaints and a drop in work performance.
- A colleague in another ministry habitually asked his subordinates to violate rules saying that he did not like them.
- It was a promotion when I was moved to run another ministry because I had done my job well over the years. But I lacked the substantive knowledge of the new ministry's work, and I lacked courage in handling the people and resources of the new ministry.

Managers who recognize those possibilities seem prepared as a preliminary measure to try to improvise within the system, offering no challenge to those who benefit from it.

- I was pleased to be able to bring about a promotion of one of my staff members, though it took considerable pressure and persistence before I got my way.
- When our mill was started, my colleagues and I were delegated tasks that would normally have been the sole responsibility of the Chief Engineer. As a result, we worked hard and long hours to try to prove ourselves and we really enjoyed the work.

More serious problems are posed when the system itself has to be challenged in order to bring about a remedy. As might be expected, managers were much less successful in dealing directly with systemic problems than in addressing motivational problems on a personal basis. Some African administrative institutions are deeply rooted, though "new" as aspects of an independent political system, and they often draw upon traditions far older than even the colonial period itself. Management events revealed the existence of a complex system of "ethnic arithmetic," by which tribal preferences took precedence over formal procedures for recruitment and promotion. Such behavior often appears mysterious and irrational to

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 12

the outside observer, though its counterparts can be found in government operations everywhere.<sup>6</sup> In the African situation, few managers were prepared to deal frontally with such issues even if they were causing morale problems in their own staff.

Without offering to challenge such traditions, however, managers could propose or even introduce administrative reforms on their own initiative without taking much of a risk. The African experience in the use of administrative change for the purpose of motivating junior managers affords an ideal setting in which to test the relevance of western practice. That particular problem has generated a rich literature in organization theory and an abundance of experience leading to operational principles that are widely thought to be universal. Perhaps the most familiar of these theories is that of Herzberg and his followers,<sup>7</sup> who have found that organizations seem to be able to inspire their higher-level managers best by offering them "motivators," which consist of positive features like interesting or challenging work. At lower levels of responsibility, the proposed solution is to use "hygienes," such as decent pay scales, primarily to bring satisfaction to those who occupy white- or blue-collared positions.<sup>8</sup> Following this approach, the top managers would be responsible for providing the motivating forces throughout the system: they have the most control over hygienes (they set the pay scales and determine pensions and working conditions), and they have greatest influence over motivators (since they also concern themselves with the organizational mission). Critics may observe, of course, that in the private sector, where the maximum of discretion is assigned to managers, both hygienes and motivators are available at the top, where salaries are fixed at handsome hygienic levels even though motivators are also available, since it is there that managers

### Levels of Managerial Leadership 13

tackle the interesting problems and leave the uninspiring parts of their work to their subordinates. Apart from such quibbles, the "motivator-hygiene" approach to management incentives is nevertheless almost universally accepted by industrial psychologists when they apply personality theory to the workplace.<sup>9</sup>

Such motivation theories may not serve the public sector as readily as the private,<sup>10</sup> since in government, the challenges produced by work (associated with motivators) are hard to measure and still harder to manipulate, while basic salaries (which are usually important parts of the hygienes) are harder to adjust than their supposed equivalents in the private sector.<sup>11</sup> On the other hand, public employees at the bottom of the civil service pay scale have more political clout than their counterparts in industry and commerce - a function of sheer numbers plus good organization. Thus in American private industry, at least, both motivators and hygienes are available as instruments of top management, but in the public sector, only hygienes are likely to be changed in order to deal with poor motivation. Motivation of public employees in the United States seems to involve a delicate balancing act in which top managers are underpaid but rewarded by the challenge of their work, while the lower and middle levels of management, not so privileged in terms of opportunities for self-expression, are paid about as much as their private sector counterparts, and are also expected to be reasonably satisfied because of their job security. Motivating the latter consists in providing additional hygienes and linking their pay to frequent and objective performance appraisals.

This oversimplified model, though far from perfect as a description of actual practice, provides a useful starting point for testing the applicability of motivational theory in non-western societies.<sup>12</sup> Its limitations in Western

#### Levels of Managerial Leadership 14

practice are not hard to identify: public-sector hygiènes are somewhat more circumscribed than this model suggests because governments have politicized so many of the most challenging aspects of management. As politicians respond to constituent pressure or their own interest and begin to reduce the discretion available to career administrators, they are attacking a principal form of managerial motivation at its source.<sup>13</sup> Technical issues, once the domain of career specialists, are entering the political arena. Thus motivating top public managers by giving them exclusive jurisdiction over challenging problems is probably harder than it used to be. The erosion of Wilson's line of distinction between politics and administration is proceeding especially rapidly today when administrators have political functions to perform, and when politicians are more and more injecting themselves into the implementation process.<sup>14</sup>

In the developing countries, the Herzberg model suffers from a somewhat different set of deficiencies. Top-level African managers have a much larger range of functions to perform than do their American counterparts, among other reasons because politicians are not much interested in their affairs. In that part of the world, too, governments have more of the total share of the action, there being no indigenous private sector to speak of. Thus African governments tend to leave technical decisions to administrators rather than to elected politicians, and they are also forced by the needs of development policy to intrude into affairs not considered the proper domain of the state in more fully industrialized societies.<sup>15</sup> Managers are extraordinarily powerful in those circumstances. One would expect, therefore, that the morale of higher civil servants would be fairly good in Africa, since the challenges are so enormous and the opportunities for self-expression so great. On the other hand, for the middle

### Levels of Managerial Leadership 15

and lower levels, the hygienes available can provide only a very low degree of satisfaction, and so one would expect motivation to be worse there. Salaries are painfully low, and prospects for promotion not good. The civil service rolls provide such a convenient solution to the unemployment problem that they are crowded with applicants and occupants.<sup>16</sup> The physical working conditions, too, are depressing in many African countries, where even the office buildings, bequeathed by a colonial administration with low expectations of permanence, are quite literally lacking in "hygienes." Finally, the presence of an informal network of family and clan combined with a strong old-boy solidarity tends to reduce opportunities for individuals to assert their creative powers through their work. One would expect it to be hard to reward employees for individual initiative in such a setting.

The management events only partially support that hypothesis. Motivation does not appear to be better at the higher levels of the system, at least judging by the fact that the balance between positive and negative incidents is about the same at all levels. Moreover, top managers do not take chances of the type that might be expected (i.e., self-fulfilling actions taking the form of motivators). Finally, we coded the skills that were called for in the events associated with positive motivation, and they turned out to be writing and drafting, technical skills, training, and accounting -- scarcely the most challenging tasks of management.. Negative motivation was associated with personnel administration, financial management, supervision, bureaucratic politics, and work scheduling -- some of which demand personal creativity and might therefore have been expected to serve as motivators.<sup>17</sup> When positive events involving motivational problems were correlated with substantive issues, they were found to arise predominantly

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 16

in connection with organizational or bureaucratic concerns rather than technical issues. This finding may well be unique to Africa. It suggests that African managers find their greatest concerns (and triumphs) in administrative rather than substantive issues.

The SADCC events showed that these managers rarely engaged in serious administrative reform efforts, even when they recognized deficiencies in the system as costs to their own and their subordinates' motivation. Yet the events also demonstrate that when they did do so, the outcome was gratifying. There were several instances of organizational changes introduced by administrators on their own initiative. One described how a group of managers experimented with a new incentive plan (728);<sup>18</sup> a subordinate introduced a new system for dealing with crowds who were seeking access to public goods, and whose demands would have posed unusual problems for the office if customary procedures were followed (2192); a manager introduced an improvised transportation network to deliver relief supplies where existing services did not reach (1547); there was an experiment with the platoon system in the public schools to compensate for classroom shortages (1819). Organizational skills of this type were called upon 53 times in this sample of management events, including 36 instances in which these skills were used successfully.

Such managerial improvisations could be expected to raise employee morale. All of these improvisations in procedures or operations were aimed at improving performance; and nearly all the examples of systemic changes introduced in the name of efficiency or effectiveness did succeed in that immediate purpose. In succeeding, they incidentally addressed problems of motivation, especially among middle- and lower-level managers.

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 17

Given the authority exercised by African managers, and the extent to which creative approaches to administration provides a high level of motivation for them, one might expect much more by way of experimentation than these management events reported. The system cries out for administrative reforms of a type considered conventional in the west. Repeated incidents told of inflexibility in the personnel and other infrastructure support systems that affect motivation: administrative delays that imposed an additional work burden on employees at the last minute (1741, 1797, 1813, and 1827); an unexpected and undesired transfer that deprived an employee of a special opportunity (1727); and inflexibility in responding to special personnel needs (518, 568, and 2066) are typical incidents. Such events provide direct evidence of how organizational weaknesses affect individual morale at lower and intermediate levels of the service. Why, then, do top managers in Africa so rarely display leadership by undertaking administrative reforms?

One answer appears to be that these managers seldom act alone. Dealing with problems of this sort in the African context is usually an act of individual leadership; it does not occur during conventional social exchanges. It does not seem to take place through the process of mobilizing a coalition to bring about the desired effect.<sup>19</sup> Reforming the system to accommodate the value preferences of individual employees,<sup>20</sup> though a solid managerial option in most Western organizations,<sup>21</sup> may not be feasible in Africa, where systemic change is not taken as a social challenge.

Even so, modest changes in public management systems are clearly within the realm of the possible, given the freedom managers have for coping with whatever crises they deem important. A first step would appear to be to encourage an understanding of the options for such change, whose

## Levels of Managerial Leadership 18

principles are not dissimilar from those advanced in schools of management in the United States. One might well conclude that training in the administrative sciences is a precondition to administrative reform.

Training is often oversold as a solution to management problems.<sup>22</sup> Even when it is fully effective, it cannot bring about immediate improvements in large-scale operations. But before managers can do anything significant to improve system performance, they need to recognize the problems caused by motivational and other deficiencies. They have to understand as well what they can do about them on their own initiative.

New approaches to leadership and the use of authority structures as part of an organizational development strategy<sup>23</sup> will help managers both to identify motivational problems and to deal with them effectively. Many of the steps required to improve motivation involve changes in the structure and mission of organizations as well as the management of individual staff members. In their cumulative effect, they will transform administration; hence the caution with which managers approach them is understandable. But no one who has been exposed to those systems is in despair about what they have already achieved since independence. Nor can it be doubted that much more is possible. The SADCC study shows that the exercise of managerial leadership in Africa is not a matter of simply transferring known principles, but that it is beginning to surface in its own way.

23 Mar 86

Stages= 4.5+more

## FOOTNOTES.

1. I am grateful to Prof. Robert E. Klitgaard and Drs. Walter Broadnax and Hale Champion of Harvard University for helpful comments on an earlier draft of this paper. Messrs. V.V. Rama Subba Rao and John Druke, Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, were my principal research assistants in this project.

2. Goran Hyden, No Shortcuts to Progress: African Development Management in Perspective (Berkeley: Univ of Calif. Press, 1983).

3. The data were gathered by an international team of which I served as project director, consisting of Dr. Esau M. Chiviya, Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management; Prof. Robert E. Klitgaard, Harvard University; Mr. Modiri J. Mbaakanyi, Executive Director, Botswana Employers Federation; Prof. A. Gaylord Obern, University of Pittsburgh; Prof. Louis A. Picard, University of Nebraska; Prof. Rukudzo Murapa, University of Zimbabwe; Mr. Bhekhe R. Dlamini, Institute of Development Management, Swaziland; Dr. Rogerio F.S. Pinto, Organization of American States; and Mr. M. J. Ziyane, Swaziland Institute of Management and Public Administration. This team was working on behalf of the Southern African Development Co-ordination Conference under a contract between the U.S. Agency for International Development and the National Association of Schools of Public Administration and Affairs. Prof. Wendell Schaeffer was the coordinator of the project for NASPAA, and Mrs. Jeanne North for AID; both of them made substantial contributions to both the management and substance of the project. Twenty students at Harvard's Kennedy School of Government performed the coding of events for skills and other factors. Lewis Brandt, Mary Byrne, Changyin Chung, Gabriella Dreyer, John Druke, Ronnie Friedman-Partie, Mrs. A.L. Ganapati, Laura Ibara, Cord Jakobeit, S.

Krishna Kumar, Roop Jyoti, Nurul Nadeem, Otty Nxumalo, Bruno Pouezat, Junio Ragrajo, Hareez Ur Rehman, Alejandro Reyes, Catherine Reilly, Peter Semneby, and Leah Taylor. They worked under the supervision of Mr. V.V. Rama Subba Rao, my research assistant at the Kennedy School.

4. The method employed in this study was derived from the "critical incident" procedure, which was developed during World War II in order to determine whether and how training and organizational changes could improve the performance of combat pilots. It has since been employed thousands of times for purposes of studying human performance in different situations, private, professional, military, and civilian. The seminal article on this experience is J. C. Flanagan, "Critical Requirements: A New Approach to Employee Evaluation," Personnel Psychology, Vol. 2, No. 4, 1949, pp. 419-425. For a recent bibliography on the subject, see Grace Fivars, The Critical Incident Technique: A Bibliography (Palo Alto, CA, American Institutes for Research, 1980). This method should not be confused with survey techniques, which are intended to elicit information about opinions, and when used to generate conclusions characterizing large groups, have to rely on statistical sampling techniques to prevent distortion. In the critical incident method, it is the most recent experience of the respondents that is to be gathered. The incidents and not the respondents constitute the universe to be analyzed. It is random in the sense that its selection of events requires each respondent to cite the most recent incident in his/her experience. In the SADCC study, the respondents were asked by the training authorities of their own governments to participate in the survey. Apart from the fact that these procedures were scheduled in the capital city and did not seek out field administrators, we are unaware of any bias in the choice of

respondents. The training authorities were situated in a central staff agency that had access to the entire cadre.

5. This particular form of managerial action is quaintly described by Frederick Herzberg as KITA ("kick him in the pants"). "One More Time: How Do You Motivate Employees?" Harvard Business Review, 46:1, Jan-Feb., 1968.

6. Goran Hyden, No Shortcuts..., cited. Peter Blunt, Organizational Theory and Behavior, An African Perspective (London & New York: Longman, 1983).

7. Fred Herzberg, B. Mauser, and B.B. Snyderman, The Motivation to Work (N.Y.: Wiley, 1959), and Herzberg, Work and the Nature of Man (Cleveland: World Publishing Co., 1965), are the first important statements of that particular distinction between positive and negative factors in motivation. See also the criticisms and refinements in V. Vroom, Work and Motivation (New York: Wiley, 1964).

8. Current doctrine, of course, links the two incentive structures by making pay scales explicitly dependent upon performance. Raymond A. Katzell and Daniel Yankelevich, Work, Productivity, and Job Satisfaction: An Evaluation of Policy-Related Research (N.Y.: The Psychological Corp., 1975). Edwin A. Locke concludes that in the end, money is the only motivator that counts. "Employee Motivation: A Discussion," Journal of Contemporary Business, 11:2, (1982). See also K. Duncan, M. Gruneberg, and D. Wallis, Eds., Changes in Working Life (N.Y.: Wiley, 1980).

9. B.C. Muthayya and I. Gnana Kannan have applied basic western models to the interpretation of management personality features in India. Development Personnel: A Psychosocial Study Across Three States in India (Hyderabad: National Institute of Community Development, 1973). See also the important Tavistock Institute's study by A. K. Rice, Productivity and

Social Organization: The Ahmedabad Experiment (London: Tavistock Publications, 1958)

10. Joseph Bower contrasts "technocratic" with "political" managerial systems, roughly the equivalent of private versus public, except that the dimensions characteristic of those types are probably found in both settings. "Managing for Efficiency, Managing for Equity," Harvard Business Review, 61:4, July-Aug. 1983.

11. John M. Greener, Harry P. Hatry, Margo P. Koss, Annie P. Millar, and Jane P. Woodward have carefully compared different pay incentive schemes used in the public sector. Productivity and Motivation: A Review of State and Local Government Initiatives (Washington: Urban Institute, 1981).

12. See also Jon R. Morris, "The Transferability of Western Management Concepts and Programmes: an East African Perspective," in Joseph E. Black et al., Education and Training for Public Sector Management in Developing Countries (New York: Rockefeller Foundation, 1977).

13. Politicians are expected to perform technical functions once left to technical agencies, as evidenced by the enlarged congressional staffs and the research expertise available to elected officials, resulting in longer laws and executive decrees designed to take the guesswork (i.e., discretion) out of administration.

14. Woodrow Wilson's classic article on the subject has provided generations of political scientists with food for thought. "The Study of Administration," Political Science Quarterly, 2, June, 1887. A summary of the amendments to that distinction between politics and administration appears in Felix A Nigro, Modern Public Administration (New York: Harper & Row, 2d Ed., 1970), Chapter I. A comprehensive discussion of the politics-administration cleavage appears in Jack Rabin and James M.

Bowman, eds., Politics and Administration: Woodrow Wilson and American Public Administration (New York: Marcel Dekker, 1984).

15. Cultural and social traditions that are incompatible with national policies are considered fair game for planners and developers in the government to change. Goran Hyden, No Shortcuts to Progress: African Development Management in Perspective (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983). There is evidence that in recent years governments in industrial countries are also reaching into private matters once considered cultural or moral rather than political. Family planning issues are among the most obvious examples.

16. Selcut Ozgediz, Managing the Public Service in Developing Countries, Washington: World Bank Staff Working Paper No. 583 (1983).

17. I am indebted for this set of correlations to Mr. Roop Jyoti, a student at the Kennedy School, Harvard.

18. The numbers in parentheses refer to the location of the incident described in the data bank, and are included as a space-saving convenience; readers may obtain the full description of the incident, as well as those of the other events detailed in this paper, by writing to the author.

19. Evidence for this statement appears in John D. Montgomery, "Bureaucratic Politics in Southern Africa," Public Administration Review, forthcoming.

20. Robert A. Stringer, Jr., "Achievement Motivation and Management Control," Personnel Administration, 29:6, 1966, lists eight principles of organization that should be applied to accommodate individual achievement needs in an organization. Daniel J. Brass summarizes the evidence, including his own studies, that structural factors affect motivation and performance. "Structural Relationships, Job Characteristics, and Worker

- Satisfaction and Performance," Administrative Science Quarterly 26 (1981). For a cautionary note on the prospects of improving morale indefinitely by job redefinition, see Joseph E. Champous, "A Three Sample Test of Some Extensions to the Job Characteristics Model of Work Motivation," Academy of Management Journal, 23:3 (1980).
21. Abraham Maslow, Motivation and Personality, (New York, Harper and Brothers, 1954) A study of motivation among community development workers in India applied the Maslow theory of motivation to measure their commitment to the program. Only one-quarter of the respondents showed such commitment; the rest were said to be concerned with their own self-interest. Dan Fritz, "Bureaucratic Commitment in Rural India: A Psychological Application," Asian Survey 16:4 (1976). Local government experience with job enrichment is described in John M. Greener, et al, cited, ch. 18-23.
22. See, for example, John D. Montgomery, "The Great Training Robbery: A Discussion of Teaching Methodologies," in Training for Agricultural Project Management, Food Production and Rural Development Division (London: Commonwealth Secretariat, Marlborough House, May, 1980); George M. Honadle and John P. Hannah, "Management Performance for Rural Development: Packaged Training or Capacity Building," in Public Administration and Development 2 (1982).
23. Warren G. Bennis, Organizational Development: Its Nature, Origins, and Prospects (London: Addison-Wesley, 1969); for practical guidance, see Robert Abramson and Walter Haislet, Planning for Improved Enterprise Performance. A Guide for Managers and Consultants (Geneva: International Labour Organization, 1979).