

PN-AAW-197 17
ISN = 47830

"PL 480 Title II Evaluations, 1980-1985:
The Lessons of Experience"

AID/FVA/PPE
June, 1985

Table of Contents

	<u>Page Number</u>
I. Introduction	1
II. Findings: The Impact and Operation of Title II Programs	1
A. MCH	1
B. FFW	10
C. SF	12
III. Lessons Learned: Implications for Future Programming and Evaluation	15
A. MCH	15
B. FFW	17
C. SF	19
IV. Conclusion. Some Final Recommendations for Program Improvement	21

Appendices:

- A. Bibliography of PL 480 Title II Evaluations (1980 to present)
- B. P.L. 480 Title II MCH Targeting Program Guidance
- C. "Guidance for Title II PVO Programs", Cable, Dec. 1983
- D. Evaluation Plan for Title II, (excerpt from FY 85/86 Evaluation Plan for FVA)

I. Introduction

The Bureau for Food for Peace and Voluntary Assistance recently reviewed all PL 480 Title II evaluations and related special studies carried out during the past five years*. The review sought to:

- o synthesize major findings;
- o document lessons learned;
- o identify policy and programming implications; and
- o recommend actions to improve Title II programs.

Evaluation findings were analyzed for each of the three major Title II program categories: Maternal Child Health (MCH), Food for Work (FFW) and School Feeding (SF). These findings are summarized in terms of impact (nutritional, health, educational income, etc.), program operations and, where appropriate, generalized as lessons for future programming. Recommendations are then made, based on the experience and analysis to date, to improve Title II programs and evaluation activities.

The need to maximize the benefits of food aid becomes apparent given the magnitude of the PL 480 Title II program. Since its inception in 1954, the U.S. has donated over 50 million tons of Title II food commodities, valued at more than \$10 billion. In 1984, 1.6 million metric tons of commodities, valued at \$459 million, were shipped under Title II.

Of the total Title II amount for FY 84, about 60% was used for developmental activities (Maternal Child Health, School Feeding and Food for Work and other child feeding programs in hospitals, orphanages and other institutions) as opposed to emergency relief. By major category, the breakdown is 23% for MCH, 20% for FFW and 8% for SF of total Title II resources.

Given the substantial resources Title II food represents, there is increased interest from Congress and from Regional Bureaus and Country Missions within A.I.D. in evaluation of Title II programs. Evaluation is intended to support and monitor optimal use of food aid. It is most usefully viewed as a process for learning what does and doesn't work and for redesigning projects and identifying resources to make them more effective.

II. Findings: The Impact and Operation of Title II Programs

A. Maternal Child Health Feeding Programs (MCH)

Since 1981, AID conducted more than fifteen evaluations and

* See Appendix A for Bibliography of PL 480 Title II Evaluations (1980 to present)

studies of MCH programs. Five of those were in-depth analyses of the nutritional status of program participants: the Sri Lanka Triposha Program; the Philippines MCH and Day Care Programs; the Morocco Preschool Nutrition Education Program; the Senegal MCH Program and the Haiti Community Health and Nutrition Program. The other evaluations provide excellent information on how programs work, common problems and constraints, and the importance of various program variables for achieving results.

1. Nutrition Effectiveness/Impact

- (a) The five programs studied in-depth demonstrate positive nutritional results related to program participation. In Sri Lanka, for example, children in the program for at least six months were nutritionally better off than children of the same age just entering the program. A comparison of participants and non-participants at eight rural day care centers in the Philippines showed a statistically significant improvement in the nutritional status of participants at seven of the eight centers. In Haiti, a before/after analysis of participants in the Seventh Day Adventist program showed that 82% increased their weight-for-age after four months in the program. Table I summarizes the findings of the five evaluations.
- (b) Program components, in addition to the food, appear to contribute significantly to nutritional impact of MCH programs. All MCH programs that achieved positive nutritional results included: a) growth monitoring systems; b) educational activities for mothers; c) training programs for health and community workers involved in the program; d) a well-defined targeting strategy, which directed food and services to nutritionally at-risk groups, i.e., malnourished children, children under three, pregnant and lactating women from low income families; and e) integration with health services.

The Sri Lanka evaluation concluded that it was the food, along with the package of health services, i.e., immunizations and deworming, that together supported the nutritional well-being of program participants. Although it is difficult to attribute the relative contribution of individual program components to improvements in nutritional status the Morocco evaluation cited the important role of nutrition education. After two and a half years of program

participation, only 11% of children receiving both food and nutrition education were malnourished compared to 33% of the children receiving food alone

Coverage of target populations is low in most countries, ranging from 10-20% of preschool children to 5-10% of the malnourished population. For example in Senegal the program is reaching 10.3% of all children under three. In Gambia, approximately 13% of children under three and about 8% of the malnourished in this age group are participating. In Morocco, the program includes 11% of poor families and 6% of all malnourished in the country. Limited food resources, lack of in-country logistic infrastructure and other constraints prohibit larger coverage. In the Asian programs, where the infrastructure is more extensive, larger percentages of the target populations are being reached, i.e., the Sri Lanka MCH program is reaching about 50% of needy families with children under five years of age. AID's Title II Outreach Grant has helped the poorest countries, such as Togo and Benin, to target food to their more remote, hard-to-reach areas and increased coverage of the poorer more vulnerable groups.

Sharing of food by all members of the family is a consistent finding in the evaluations. In Gambia, for example, 14.9 people eat from the "family pot" and, in the hungry season, monthly Title II rations are consumed in only two to three days. In Ghana and Mauritania, food commodities last two weeks under typical conditions. In Sri Lanka, despite efforts to promote Triposha's image as a child food, it is still eaten by all family members.

Health Impact

The Senegal and Haiti evaluations suggest that there is an association between lower mortality rates and program participation. Because mortality data is so costly and difficult to collect, most programs have not been able to compile this type of information. The two evaluations indicate that our understanding of real program impact may be very incomplete without mortality data.

TABLE 1

MCH NUTRITIONAL IMPACT: A SUMMARY OF FIVE EXAMPLES

<u>Country/ Program</u>	<u>Methodology</u>	<u>Findings</u>
Sri Lanka Triposha MCH Program	Retrospective longitudinal data were gathered from existing records kept in health clinics. Using this data, it was possible to compare nutritional status of long term participants in the program to newer entrants of the same age.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Children in each age group who have participated in the program are better off than those who had not. 2. Impact was due to the package of services including immunizations, weighing, parasite control. Food is an effective incentive to participation in the program. The level of impact would not have been reached without the food. 3. Uniformly, for all age groups, the rate of malnutrition is lowest among those with the longest participation in the program.
Philippines Day Care and MCH Programs	1. Day Care Program: a comparison of the statistical significance of nutritional improvement between participants, a comparison of the percentage change in the nutritional status of participants and non-participants, a comparison of the rate of nutritional improvement for participants and non-participants. Longitudinal growth data were analyzed from day care centers and matched villages without centers.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. MCH and Day Care beneficiaries appear to have experienced considerable weight gain. 2. For the Day Care program, participants gained on the average 6.5% standard weight-for-age in a six-month period, while the non-participants improved 3%. The total percentage of program participants who improved was higher and the percentage who declined was lower than for non-participants.

Country/
ProgramMethodology

2. MCH program: secondary longitudinal growth data were used to measure absolute weight changes and changes in standard weight-for-age of program participants.

Findings

3. In a sample of 238 cases from the MCH program, 53% improved, 24% remained the same and 23% declined. Those who improved experienced substantial weight gain - 6% increase in standard weight-for-age in six months.

4. Those who enter the program in the worst condition have the greatest tendency toward improvement.

5. In both the MCH and the Day Care Center evaluations, the evaluators noted that weight gain by participants compares extremely favorably with the best known results achieved in other supplementary feeding programs worldwide.

Morocco
Nutrition/
Education
Program

1. Secondary data were used to compare the nutritional status of program participants enrolled over a 2 year period to new entrants controlling for age and nutritional status at entry.

2. Secondary data were used to compare nutritional status of program participants receiving only food to those receiving food and education.

1. The program resulted in a 69% reduction in moderate and severe malnutrition of program participants.

2. The addition of an education program to the feeding program significantly improved the program impact. In 1975, with food alone, 33% of children were malnourished. In 1978, with a combination of food and education, only 11% of the participants were malnourished.

Country/
ProgramMethodologyFindingsSenegal MCH
Program

1. Study of changes in longitudinal growth data of program participants
2. Comparison of mortality rates with nutritional status of participants and non-participants.

1. Program participation rates and time in program were significantly related to growth of children under 2 years of age.

2. There was not a significant difference in growth, as defined by weight-for-age, between participants and non-participants of similar age and economic status from the same villages.

3. Mortality rates in the most vulnerable age groups were consistently lower for program participants than for non-participants.

Haiti
Community
Nutrition
Program

Study of changes in longitudinal growth data of program participants by age and nutritional status at entry.

1. Of a sample of 343 children who attended the program, 82% improved their weight-for-age in a four month period. Of this group 89% were originally malnourished; 52% were seriously malnourished (second and third degree).

2. In a sample of 132 children entering the program as second degree malnourished, approximately 71% improved to first degree or normal in four months. Of 49 third degree malnourished children, 69% improved to second or first degree. Although 31% did not move out of third degree in the four month period, 95% improved in weight-for-age by an average of 12 percentage points.

Country
Program

Methodology

Findings

In follow-up growth surveillance, 78% of the original third degree malnourished children continued to improve during a four to ten month period. More than 25% improved to the mild malnutrition category.

3. Of the 343 children who completed the four month program 72% continued to come for weighing. Of these, 70% improved their weight-for-age or stayed the same.

- (b) Information from all evaluations demonstrates that food programs increase utilization of health services and knowledge of proper health care practices. The Sri Lanka evaluation reports that the role of Triposha, a commercially produced weaning food, in bringing families to the clinics was praised by all levels of the health system. In Cameroon, enrollment in clinics which had stopped food distribution showed a significant to drastic reduction in number. In Senegal, participating mothers were more likely to return to the centers than non-participants for post-natal visits and a higher percentage of their children were vaccinated against measles.

3. Educational Impact

- (a) Strong education components appear to make a real difference in improving both the knowledge and the child care practices of participant mothers. The results of the Morocco program include: a) all program mothers knew how to read and discuss program weight charts, demonstrating an understanding of the relationship between food and growth; b) between 1975 and 1978 there was an 83% decline in number of mothers who weaned abruptly; c) between 1975 and 1978 there were statistically significant increases in the consumption of protein foods, fruits and milk of 2-5 year-old children. In Senegal, participant mothers were two times as likely to give malaria prophylaxis to their children than mothers not enrolled. The evaluation found that in those centers with highly capable direction plus audiovisual health teaching, mothers' knowledge of general health problems and remedies was unusually good.
- (b) In most other evaluations, education programs have been reported as weak and requiring upgrading and reorientation. The Burkina Faso evaluation, for example, reported that even though CRS has taken the lead in developing educational materials and in training, nutrition and health education did not appear to have the designed effect on the behavior of the mothers. Only 45% of the mothers could read the growth chart; 47% could repeat diarrhea therapy.

4. Income Effect

- (a) The economic value of a Title II ration can be significant. In Africa, the value of a typical family ration totals over \$200 per year. In Mauritania one

ration over a year is equivalent to 14% of average per capita income, and 33% of a rural nomad's income.

- (b) There is great variation in ration type and size throughout the world and thus in the ration's economic contribution to the family. In Mauritania, the program participant's family receives up to 21 kg. a month compared to 10.5 kg. in Peru.
- (c) A National Academy of Sciences 1982 study on the Nutritional Effectiveness of Title II commodities proposed that program participants receive the greatest benefits from the Title II commodities through an income-mediated effect whereby families use the money saved from not having to buy the staples provided by Title II foods to buy additional and better foods for the family. A major concern is whether this income effect leads to increased nutritional benefits for preschool children. A study by the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) suggests that, although household caloric expenditures and consumption rises with household income, there may be no measurable impact on the caloric intake of individual children. A study by Sigma One Corporation of the effects of Title II commodities in rural Panama questions whether increased income provided by Title II inputs results in a more nutritious selection of foods. While the protein content of the typical diet and perhaps its palatability were improved it did not necessarily result in higher energy content.

5. Targeting

- (a) Food is reaching the poorer population groups in all country programs evaluated and, in most MCH programs, is targeted to preschool children under five years of age.
- (b) In several programs aimed at rehabilitating malnourished children, rigorous targeting schemes, based on nutritional status, are being effectively employed. The Philippines Day Care Program includes almost 100% malnourished children and the Sri Lanka program includes 80% of children considered seriously at-risk.

- (c) A major issue raised by evaluations is whether those programs with only age criteria are reaching the truly needy vulnerable groups. A cost-benefit analysis of targeting strategies indicated that in geographic locations where prevalence of malnutrition is high and infrastructure is limited, as in many countries in Africa, it is not cost-effective to screen individuals and target resources only to malnourished children. In such cases, all children are at-risk of becoming malnourished and preventive benefits of the food would be lost. However when prevalence of malnutrition is relatively low, i.e., 25%, and there is an existing infrastructure for screening and food distribution, such as in Asia and parts of Latin America, more rigorous individual targeting would comprise a cost-effective approach. AID has developed Title II MCH Targeting Guidance that reflects these findings. (Appendix B)

B. Food for Work Programs (FFW)

Eleven major evaluations of FFW programs supported by Title II resources have been carried out during the past five years. These evaluations (Bangladesh, Burundi, Dominican Republic, Haiti, India, Indonesia, Kenya, Lesotho, Peru, the Philippines and Burkina Faso) assessed projects in terms of the stated goal for FFW: "achievement of needed agricultural, economic and community improvements by providing commodities to support the labor of unemployed and underemployed local workers." Program objectives, from the point of view of donor and recipient agencies, are multiple:

- o promote economic growth;
- o contribute directly to the incomes of disadvantaged people;
- o encourage the use of labor intensive techniques;
- o stimulate community action.

Some evaluations demonstrated effectiveness in bettering the economic status of recipients; others recorded successful creation of productive physical assets, notably roads, irrigation systems, wells and improved agricultural land. However, perhaps more importantly, the evaluations underscored the difficulty of achieving multiple objectives, particularly given currently available management, technical and other resources.

The history of FFW programs further complicates their evaluation. Often programs start as relief efforts to alleviate immediate hunger and unemployment and subsequently evolve into longer term development activities. The short- and

longer-term objectives are not necessarily complementary (and the design, management and resources needed for the latter may also differ substantially). Moreover, the size and composition of the ration also varies, depending on whether it is used as welfare, compensation for labor provided, a supplement for a cash wage, or as an incentive for community development.

Despite such variables, evaluations to date have nonetheless highlighted important impacts attributable to FFW projects. Major findings can be summarized as follows:

- (1) FFW can be a significant income supplement for people in extreme economic need, especially women heads of households. The CRS FFW program in Lesotho, for example, provides for 11,400 person years of employment annually, reaching over 25% of adult women who spend nine weeks a year working on FFW projects. In India, FFW is providing about 71 days of employment per recipient per year or about 21% of a household's annual employment. For the average FFW recipient, annual household income increased from Rs 2619 to Rs 3700 during the year he/she worked on a FFW project, with 72% of this increase attributed to employment on FFW projects.
- (2) FFW programs can help to improve rural social and productive infrastructure when they are well organized and designed. In Lesotho, for example, food aid has been responsible for the construction of a sizable portion of the unpaved roads in the country and most of the improved trails which are the principal means of access to many mountain areas. The FFW reforestation project in Peru achieved a seedling production of more than 43 million plants during 1979-81 and planted trees on over 26,000 hectares of land.
- (3) Depending on the type of FFW project, specific environmental, technical and programmatic factors can be identified as facilitators or inhibitors of success. In Bangladesh for example, several key variables emerged as critical to the long-term impact of roads projects: appurtenance structures; local maintenance efforts; soil type and compacting; availability of cycle transportation; site selection and design factors; and the presence of other development efforts in the locale.
- (4) FFW programs typically have multiple objectives, which results frequently in the dilution of overall program impact. Furthermore, longer-term outcomes - e.g., whether a FFW project materially contributes to the resource base of a community or strengthens the capacity of community

organizations - have not been adequately assessed to date. An ongoing monitoring system for FFW projects in India, however, will allow the tracking of such results and provide prospective data on benefits and costs as well as the determinants of impacts.

- (5) Apart from the issues of multiple objectives and dilution of impact, FFW programs often lack the level of management technical assistance and complementary inputs needed for achievement of desired program objectives. For example, in the FFW reforestation project in Peru, despite impressive numerical achievements in terms of tree plantings, inadequate planning has been done regarding marketing and processing operations and distribution of revenues among workers, landowners and communities. Similarly, the Lesotho program, which has resulted in identifiable positive benefits, would have been even more effective if activities had been better integrated with national development priorities and technical personnel were available to advise and supervise projects. Moreover, productivity is substantially lower in FFW programs than in comparable wage labor activities in Lesotho.
- (6) Higher productivity and development benefits could be achieved, even in the absence of desirable levels of supervision and material input, by the use of better work organization techniques and incentive structures. FFW construction projects are usually organized on a fixed daily wage basis. Experience indicates that this approach results in lower productivity and heavier supervision costs. Utilization of task work and possibly piece work organization would significantly increase productivity and lower supervision requirements. Similarly, by organizing a series of discrete project activities beginning with the most simple and proceeding to the more complex, communities can gain increased confidence and skills while creating the critical mass of infrastructure and facilities necessary for longer term development. (The Peru evaluation, for example, recommends a sequence of projects beginning with roads, tree planting, and finally processing and marketing activities.)

C. School Feeding (SF)

Until recently, evaluations of school feeding have focused on nutritional rather than educational impacts and have had disappointing findings. SF is not nearly as effective a tool as MCH in reaching the nutritionally most vulnerable populations, e.g., children under age five and pregnant or lactating women.

As a result, in 1983, FVA commissioned a comprehensive review of the evaluation literature on school feeding to examine how and to what extent Title II SF programs achieve educational objectives^{1/}, such as increased enrollment and attendance and improved cognitive performance. A basic rationale for SF programs is two-pronged: (1) food offsets the cost of attending school and thus leads to improved attendance and enrollment, (in this context, SF programs can be viewed as income transfer schemes); and (2) at the same time, the food offsets hunger (and may reduce micro-nutrient deficiencies), thereby allowing the child to do better in school through an enhanced ability to benefit from instructions.

The 1983 review examined the results of more than twenty SF program evaluations worldwide, including retrospective (i.e., before-after) analyses and comparisons of schools with and without SF programs in the same regions. While the report finds little existing evidence of educational impact, it concludes that school feeding programs, if designed properly, can have important effects on school enrollment and attendance, especially for girls, and on cognitive development for both boys and girls.

Based on the Levinger report and more recent studies, a workshop was held in April 1984 to analyze their implications for SF program design and evaluation, resource allocation, and policy. A synthesis of major findings includes the following:

- (1) Studies to date have been methodologically flawed and results are inconclusive. Unanswered questions outnumber clear cut findings. Nevertheless, several studies present evidence of improved attendance, enrollment and school performance, as well as nutritional improvement. For example, in Haiti, a two-year longitudinal study of SF performance revealed that the program acts as a nutritional "safety net" for participants in the face of a deteriorating environment. In other words, while the nutritional status of non-participants worsened in year the malnourished children in the program held their own.

1/ School Feeding Programs in Less Developed Countries: an Analysis of Actual and Potential Impact, by Beryl Levinger, February 1983.

However, the achievement of multiple objectives in any one program appears unrealistic; attendance and nutritional status objectives may even be contradictory. The review of 15 other SF programs in Kenya, Colombia and the Philippines for example, found that no single program was successful at meeting both of these objectives. A key question, therefore, for designers is how to prioritize among multiple objectives.

- (2) SF programs are most effective when they are integrated into a broader strategy of rural development, education or nutrition. Specific components associated with increased effectiveness include: integration with primary health care programs, especially environmental sanitation and treatment of parasitic infection; a high degree of community participation; good program management and provision for staff training.
- (3) In general, targeting to individual schools or geographic areas appears preferable to targeting practices that focus on specific children, if more than nutritional outcomes are important. Aside from the fact that targeting within schools tends to promote ration sharing, the practice also dilutes such educational payoffs as teacher participation or interest in SF-related training, integration of feeding with cognitively oriented activities, and widespread parental involvement or contact with the school through its feeding program.
- (4) SF programs appear, in certain circumstances, to have a greater impact on girls than boys (e.g., in settings where female enrollment ratios are significantly lower than for males and where the labor of girls at home is particularly valued). A study in India, for example, found an association between school feeding and enrollment, especially for girls and scheduled castes and particularly in those areas that are neither the very poorest nor the most well-off economically. Retention rates were significantly higher in Mid-Day Meals districts as opposed to non-MDM districts, again favoring girls and scheduled castes. This finding has long-term development implications given the documented linkages between a mother's level of education and the health and literacy levels of her offspring.
- (5) There are many different options for ration size and composition available to SF program planners, including snack, breakfast and lunch programs. Snacks and breakfasts

may be most effective in the alleviation of temporary hunger or where a meal substitution effect is anticipated, while lunches may be a better tool to offset the opportunity costs of school attendance.

- (6) Phaseover to local financing and control of SF programs appears to be a realistic goal for most countries because it is generally more popular than other feeding programs and is less costly and easier to operate than MCH programs. Egypt and India are examples of two countries where responsibility for school feeding is now being gradually phased over, with the concerned governments assuming an increasingly larger share of program costs.

III. Lessons Learned: Implications for Future Programming and Evaluation.

Title II evaluations have spanned a full geographic and programmatic range. This accumulated experience offers valuable insights for future Title II policy and programming decisions. Specific lessons can be drawn in each major program category to guide the design of more effective programs. The lessons of experience will also inform future approaches to evaluation in all three areas. Major lessons specific to MCH FFW and SF are presented in terms of applications for program design and evaluation.

A. MCH

1. Program Design Considerations

Significant nutritional impact can be achieved through MCH food programs provided that appropriate complementary components and inputs are incorporated in program design and implementation.

Based on these findings, A.I.D. has developed and distributed to its field missions "Guidance for Title II PVO Programs" (Appendix C) which includes these specific recommendations for MCH programming:

- All MCH programs should be linked to disease prevention and central health activities, i.e., primary health care services. As a basic norm, this should include ORT (Oral Rehydration Therapy) education and referral of high risk children to medical services.

Nutrition education of participant mothers (or caretakers) should be required. At a minimum, the education component should demonstrate both the value of food for the child's health and how to properly prepare and feed the foods provided. Country or regional level needs assessments should be used to pinpoint priority nutrition education messages (e.g., breastfeeding, timely introduction of weaning foods, ORT, etc.).

Growth surveillance systems should be mandatory for all MCH programs. Without monitoring growth, there is no way to assess a program's nutritional impact. The regular weighing of children and the use of growth charts represent an effective educational tool for mothers and can also be used to easily identify high risk children.

In order to maximize the impact of limited resources, MCH programs should be targeted to the nutritionally vulnerable, at-risk members of poor households. To ensure greatest impact on these populations, priority should be given to geographic targeting, i.e., locating programs in those areas where hunger and malnutrition are problems.

2. Evaluation and Research

- (a) Achievement of nutritional impact in Title II MCH programs may be underrecorded if evaluations and monitoring systems are not carefully designed to account for prevention of malnutrition as well as recuperation. For example, if a program is to prevent at-risk children from becoming malnourished, children entering as normal may show no improvement in nutritional status. Maintenance of nutritional status in this case is what is critical. Monitoring and evaluation data therefore need to be disaggregated based on at-risk characteristics at entry.
- (b) Impact evaluations should be undertaken only where basic program components are in place and where prospective rather than retrospective studies can be done. Cornell University, at the request of AID, conducted a review of methodologies used to date to assess nutritional impact of MCH programs. The study concluded that evaluations to date that attribute nutritional impact to program components are very costly. However, impact evaluations of carefully

selected programs can produce plausible, useful and generalizable inferences if there is careful attention at an early stage of a program to evaluation design and data analysis. Confounding variables need to be considered explicitly.

- (c) Evaluations need to do more than just provide impact statistics. Evaluation designs should use disaggregation results to identify and explain differences in level of impact within programs (in Haiti for example, where one center recuperated 80% of second degree malnourished children while another recuperated only 32%, the factors underlying these differences are critical). Finally, evaluations need to consider the context in which the program operates, including socio-economic characteristics, food availability, environmental variables, such as drought and epidemics.

FFW

Program Design Considerations

- (a) Achievement of both employment generation or increased income, or both, and the creation of productive assets can be accomplished only under certain country conditions and when adequate complementary resources are available, either financed by outside sources or mobilized within the community. An example is the Burundi Route 84 project where Title II is only one of several components used to supplement cash minimum wage payments and representing 30% of a total \$2 million budget. The Lesotho program, on the other hand, could be even more effective if activities were better designed and technical personnel available to advise and supervise projects. In the absence of such resources, trade-offs between the two objectives are inevitable and A.I.D.'s "Guidance for Title II PVO Programs" cable (Appendix C) recommends that these be resolved at the planning stage through clear definition of objectives, identification of needed complementary inputs and an appropriate implementation strategy.
- (b) In designing FFW programs, goals should be based on a strategy developed through analysis of the specific environment, both physical and social, including local organizational structures and traditional labor patterns. Wherever possible, emphasis should be given to directly productive activities linked with

development policies plans and priorities. Participation in the program should be long enough to accomplish training and income-generating objectives, and food should be distributed in accordance with work norms to encourage higher productivity.

- (c) Approaches to project design and evaluation need to vary according to the type of FFW program; in all cases, however, the most successful FFW projects are those that build on and strengthen local organizations. In national public works projects (e.g., India, Lesotho, Bangladesh) coordination with the host government and/or local development agency and provision of non-food components are especially critical to proper design and execution of FFW projects. Smaller, more community-oriented projects (e.g., the Philippines, Burkina Faso, the Dominican Republic) require a strong local organization to ensure adequate management and acquisition of needed materials and technical inputs. (FFW can in these cases be instrumental in strengthening the capacity of community organizations to mobilize and manage local resources). The latter FFW activities should be simple enough for the labor skills available and the limited supervision, material resources and technical expertise available.
- (d) In determining the commodity size and composition for a FFW program, it is important to take into consideration the existing labor patterns and, in this regard, whether the ration is considered as an incentive for community labor or as a wage payment. It should be recognized that there is a major difference between a ration to compensate for labor performed for the general good and one to compensate individuals for work which benefits their own future income (e.g., where farmers are encouraged to plant fruit tree crops which will not be income-producing for several years). In the latter case workers need to be compensated only for the risk they are taking; also a much lower ration rate may be needed to avoid production disincentives.

2. Evaluation and Research

- (a) Evaluations have proved extremely useful in redesign of specific programs and in strengthening the capacity of local implementing agencies. However, the typical 4-6 week evaluation exercises are not sufficient to analyze the full range and environmental

diversity of FFW activities nor to answer critical policy and programming issues related to costs and longer-term or indirect program effects, both positive and negative. Longer time frames together with more refined methodologies for evaluations are required. During FY 1985, A.I.D. commissioned an analysis of FFW programs. That paper will be the basis for a broader review of FFW programming issues and for a revised FFW evaluation strategy.

- (b) Even with more extensive field work, however, the paucity of baseline data and the state of the art in the design and implementation of FFW projects limit the extent of possible analysis. Data are needed on costs, socioeconomic characteristics of recipients and environmental conditions. The India monitoring system, which formulates crude benefit/cost ratios and cost-effectiveness indicators, is a useful model to encourage immediate feedback for program improvement as well as for longer-term evaluation. Such monitoring systems can also help pinpoint highly successful projects which can then be examined through case studies to better identify the characteristics or determinants of success.

C. SF

1. Program Design Considerations

- (a) Given that the target group for SF does not usually include the nutritionally most-at-risk population (pre-school children, pregnant and lactating women), educational objectives such as improved learning or school performance appear to be more appropriate and attainable than reduction or prevention of malnutrition.
- (b) Program objectives should be clearly and carefully designed - e.g. enrollment, attendance, cognitive performance or nutritional status. Size and composition of the rations, targeting strategies and complementary inputs including the training of teachers and supervisors should be tailored to the selected objective(s).
- (c) Whatever the specific objective(s), SF programs are most effective when integrated as part of a more comprehensive strategy in education, nutrition, rural development, etc. In order to have an effect on

cognitive development or nutritional status, food should be combined with other program components such as parent education, teacher training, and health services.

- (d) It is generally best to target at the school rather than the individual level to minimize the problem of ration dilution. Both income levels and nutritional status are key indicators that should guide site selection. Decisions about targeting criteria and target groups should be based on clear presumptions about the net effect on the population as a whole - e.g., targeting to girls, rural populations or primary school children means, in effect, targeting away from boys, city-dwellers, and secondary school students.

2. Evaluation and Research

- (a) To date there is no definitive evidence that SF programs are effective or ineffective; the general conclusion one can derive from SF evaluations is that feeding programs seem to make a difference when there is a good fit between the program's design and the environment in which it operates. Based on the Levinger report and subsequent analysis of methodological problems involved in rigorous SF evaluations, A.I.D. does not plan an impact evaluation of SF programs in FYs 85 and 86. Funds will, however, be made available to assist PVOs to design and monitor demonstration projects.

IV. Conclusion. Some Final Recommendations for Program Improvement

The preceding section identified lessons specific to the three major program areas of Title II. Applying a broader lens to evaluation experience brings some additional general lessons into focus.

Evaluations to date provide the encouraging perspective that food aid, if properly planned, can have significant development impact. Experience, however, provides a challenging corollary to this general lesson: food commodities alone are not sufficient to achieve the desired objectives; other program components are essential - depending on the specific program area, MCH, SF or FFW - such as effective supervision and management, well-trained field staff, an education component for recipients, monitoring and evaluation systems and appropriate program design/implementation tools, such as targeting mechanisms.

Evaluations in all program categories demonstrate the importance of commitment, as evidenced by financial, material and political support, from host country governments and beneficiaries themselves. Participating PVOs, local counterpart agencies and USAIDs also need to be willing to invest adequate resources. In response to the need for additional components to complement food distribution as well as to foster increased support from host countries and sponsoring PVOs, A.I.D. recently initiated a Title II Enhancement Project. This assists PVOs to develop the agency capability and strategy required for more effective programming. The new grants program contemplates a systematic assessment of the effectiveness of various innovative approaches as well as the means for replicating successful strategies.

The importance of clarifying objectives and target groups (or targeting criteria) is a common thread among all three program categories. The proliferating or obscuring of objectives in response to the pressure of multiple and/or contradictory agendas severely handicaps program design and eventually program success.

Another general lesson relates to the food commodities themselves: programs should provide the type and quantity of food ration appropriate to program objectives as well as the target population's needs. To assist programs to identify optimal ration packages, A.I.D. is conducting pilot field studies on the consumption effects of Title II foods within

recipient households. Such research will serve as the basis for a realistic revision of guidelines for selecting the size and composition of ration packages for specific programs.

With respect to evaluation, the experience in all program areas has significant implications for future evaluation work. A.I.D.'s approach to Title II evaluation has been both broadened and refined by this experience.*

* See Appendix D for A.I.D. FY 85/86 Evaluation Plan for Title II activities.

APPENDICES

Bibliography of PL 480 Title II
Evaluations (1980 to present)

P.L. 480 Title II MCH Targeting Program
Guidance

"Guidance for Title II PVO Programs".
Cable. Dec. 1983

Evaluation Plan for Title II, (excerpt
from FY 85/86 Evaluation Plan for FVA)

10/25/85
1726DPL 480 Title II Evaluations
(1980 to Present)

	<u>DIU Ref No.*</u>
<u>BANGLADESH</u>	
<u>The Development Impact of Title II Food for Work Roads in Rural Bangladesh</u> , by Jonathan D. Hodgton, James T. Riordan and Samir Zaman, Abt Associates Inc., May 1984 (2 volumes).	PD-AAP-264
<u>Evaluation of Pilot Program Activities: Construction of Appurtenant Structures on Food for Work Roads</u> by Dan Hallett, August 1983.	PD-AAP-265
<u>Food for Work: an Evaluation of the Primary and Secondary Effects</u> , Institute of Nutrition and Food Science, University of Dacca, September 1981.	PN-AAQ-067
<u>BENIN</u>	
<u>Outreach Grant Project Assessment - Togo and Benin</u> , by Betsy Stephens, Lori Forman and Lisa Gaylord, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., April 1984.	PN-AAR-340
<u>BOLIVIA</u>	
<u>Improving Nutrition and Providing Incentives for Development: Evaluation of the P.L. 480, Title II Program in Bolivia</u> by USAID/Bolivia, December 30, 1980.	PD-AAL-153
<u>CAMERCON</u>	
<u>Evaluation of P.L. 480 Title II Food Aid Program in Cameroon</u> by Joyce M. King and Karen W. Seaton, Systematics General Corporation, July 1982.	PD-AAL-683
<u>CAPE VERDE</u>	
<u>PL 480 Title II Section 206, Cape Verde Evaluation (Volume I)</u> , by R. Apodaca <u>et al.</u> , Africa Bureau, Agency for International Development, (no date).	PD-AAP-010

* Documents may be requested from: Agency for International Development, Development Information (PPC/CDIE/DI), Room 215, SA-18, Washington, D. C. 20523. (Attention: Document Information Handling Facility).

DJIBOUTI

Evaluation Report, Catholic Relief Services, Djibouti Food and Nutrition Program by Joyce M. King, Ethleen Smith Lloyd, Agma Prins and Mark Rasmuson, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., November 1984.

PD-AAR-265

DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Plan for the Improvement of the Nutrition Component of the Title II PL-480 Program in the Dominican Republic (1984-1986) by Dr. Fernando Monckeberg, Institute of Nutrition and Food Technology, Santiago, Chile and Ms. Marcia Griffiths, International Nutrition Communications Services, Education Development Center, June, 1983. (Available in Spanish).

PD-AAP-263

Evaluation of the PL 480 Title II Program in the Dominican Republic - Final Report by Pirie M. Gall, James Eckroad and J. David Stanfield, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., January 1983. (Available in Spanish).

PD-AAM-532

ECUADOR

Evaluacion El Programa Asistencia Alimentaria Materno-Infantil (FAAMI) En El Ecuador, Plan Operativo, Ministerio de Salud Publica, Instituto Nacional de Investigaciones, Nutricionales y Medico Sociales, October 1983. (Spanish only).

PN-AAS-295

Evaluation of CRS Food and Development Program in Ecuador by David P. Nelson, David Stanfield and Helen Bratcher, June 1983.

XD-AAP-912-A

EGYPT

Improving the Nutritional Status of Weaning Age Children in Egypt: A Review of Existing Projects and Recommendations for New Projects in Conjunction with or Supplementary to the present CRS/MCH Title Foods Program by Robert W. Morgan and Carol Adelman, October 1982.

PN-AAQ-252

USAID/Cairo PL 480 Title II - Program Review by Sandra Callier, Transcentury Corporation, and Richard Rhoda, Near East Bureau, A.I.D., June 1981.

PD-AAJ-083

GAMBIA

Pre-Evaluation Assessment of the CRS Program in the Gambia by Joyce King, November 1982.

PD-AAR-477

25

Evaluation of Title II Food for Peace in Ghana by Earl Jones, Sarah A. Berkowitz and Robert Roussel, Development Associates, Inc., September 1981. PD-AAI-761

GUATEMALA

Recovery, Change and Development: A Longitudinal Study of the 1976 Guatemalan Earthquake - Final Report, Volume 1, edited by Frederick L. Bates, University of Georgia, September 1982. PN-AAQ-535

Emergency Food Programs Following the 1976 Guatemalan Earthquake: An Evaluation - Final Report #1 by Frederick L. Bates, Charles D. Killian, Daniel G. Rodeheaver and Robert E. Klein, Athens, Georgia, February 1982. PN-AAQ-014

HAITI

Evaluation Research on the P.L. 480 Title II School Feeding Program in Haiti, by Joel Cotten, USAID/Haiti, with Mitchell Rycus, Robert Timmons and William Drake, Community Systems Foundation, March 1985. PD-AAP-261

The Haiti Food for Work Evaluation by Kenneth Ribyat with the collaboration of Kathrin Lauer, Jacqueline Nowak Smucker, Yonick Deresema, Nixon Herve Maxime and Jean Joseph Hugo Pierre-Lys, Pragma Corporation, October 1984. PD-AAQ-721

Evaluation Report, Seventh Day Adventist World Service: Haiti, A.I.D. Matching Grant Program, Nutrition and Maternal/Child Health by Polly Harrison and Joyce M. King, Management Sciences for Health, December 1983. PD-AAP-260

Food Aid and Labor-Intensive Rural Development (FFW) by G. Smucker et al., USAID/Haiti, March 1980. XD-AAJ-988-A

HONDURAS

Caritas/CRS Title II Program in Honduras: A Challenge to USAID by James Pines and Joyce King, John Snow, Public Health Group, May 1985. PD-AAR-364

INDIA

The Implementation of a Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation System for PL 480 Title II Food for Work Programs in India by William Drake and John D. Nystuen, Community Systems Foundation, Ann Arbor, Michigan, June 1984. PD-AAQ-972

- Evaluation of PL 480 Title II School Feeding Program in India, USAID/New Delhi, March 1984. PN-AAQ-017
- P.L. 480 Title II Evaluation of Food for Work (FFW) in India, Summary Report by John Paul Chudy, USAID/India, March 1984. PN-AAQ-016
- An Emerging Monitoring and Evaluation System for P.L. 480 Title II Food for Work Programs in India by William D. Drake, Community Systems Foundation, August 1983. PN-AAQ-064
- Toward a Monitoring and Evaluation System for P.L. 480 Title II Maternal Child Health Programs in India by Roy I. Miller and David F. Pyle, Community Systems Foundation, June 1981. PN-AAQ-063
- An Evaluation Plan for the PL 480 Title II Food for Work Program in India, by Practical Concepts Incorporated (PCI), December 1980. PO-AAP-262
- INDONESIA
- Assessment/Redesign of the CRS PL 480 Title II, Program in Indonesia, by Judy C. Bryson, William S. Cole, Mary P. Johnston, and Alma Q. Kern, June 1984. PD-AAQ-704
- KENYA
- Kenya Food for Peace Title II Evaluation, by Practical Concepts Incorporated (PCI), April 1981. PN-AAJ-799
- LESOTHO
- Food Policy, Food Assistance and Food for Work - Guidelines for a Food for Work Action Plan 1985 - 1990, by Judy C. Bryson, October 1984. PN-AAT-120
- An Evaluation of Food Aid Programs in Lesotho with Emphasis on The CRS Program by Judy C. Bryson, January 1981. XD-AAJ-683-A
- MADAGASCAR
- PL 480 Title II Targetted MCH Program in the Democratic Republic of Madagascar. A Proposal by Seventh-Day Adventist World Service, Inc. (SAWS), June 1983. PN-AAP-225
- MALI
- PL 480 Pilot Case Studies: Tunisia Title I and Mali Title II, Section 206, by Richard Newberg, Alice Morton, and David Harmon, Ronco Consulting Corporation, January 1985. PD-AAQ-969

MAURITANIA

Evaluation Report: Mauritania PL 480 Title II Section 206 Program, by Donald G. McClelland, L. Gray Cowan, Linda S. Markey, Carol A. Stengel, December 1984. PD-AAQ-96

Mauritania Food for Peace/Title II Evaluation by Betsy Stephens and Ronald Parlato, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., April 1983. (Available in French). PD-AAN-28

MOROCCO

Morocco: Food Aid and Nutrition Education (Project Impact Evaluation No. 8) by Judith W. Gilmore, Carol C. Adelman, Anthony J. Meyer, and Melvyn C. Thorne, Agency for International Development, August 1980. PN-AAH-851

PANAMA

Income Effect of Title II Commodities in Rural Panama by Michael P. Demousis, Marielouise W. Harrell and David L. Franklin, Sigma One Corporation, September 1982. PN-AAQ-065

Evaluation of Title II Food for Peace in Panama by Earl Jones, Eliodoro G. Robles, Joan R. Thompson and George M. Coleman, Development Associates, Inc., December 1981. PD-AAM-263

PERU

An Analysis of Commodity Appropriateness for P.L. 480 Title II Rations in Peru, by Judit Katona-Apte, Lima, Peru, April 1985. PN-AAS-292

Peru: An Evaluation of P.L. 480 Title II Food Assistance, by Paul L. Doughty, Elizabeth Burleigh and Michael Painter, Institute for Development Anthropology, June 1984 (with Executive Summary). PN-AAR-342

PHILIPPINES

PL 480 Title II: A Study of the Impact of a Food Assistance Program in the Philippines by Stewart Blumenfeld, Maria-Bernardita Flores, Maura Mack, Maureen Norton and Robert Pooley, Agency for International Development, August 1982. PN-AAJ-622

Evaluation of P.L. 480 Title II Funded CRS and CARE Food for Work Program in Selected Luzon Provinces, prepared by Sycip, Gorres, Velayo & Co., June 1981. PN-AAP-056

- Effect of Classification Errors Upon Evaluation Outcomes: Nutrition Programs Revisited, by William D. Drake, Roy I. Miller and Robert J. Timmons, Community Systems Foundation, June 1984. PN-AAS-283
- Food for Work: An Analysis of Current Experience and Recommendations for Future Performance, by John W. Thomas, Harvard Institute for International Development, May 1985. (Draft)
- Guidance for Title II PVO Programs, Cable State 014324, dated January 18, 1983. PN-AAS-777
- Impact of Supplementation Schemes and Analysis of the Determinants of Preschooler Nutritional Status, International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), November 1983. PN-AAQ-066
- 1983-1984 African Food Crisis: Lessons Learned, Office of Food for Peace, Agency for International Development, Washington, D. C., June 6, 1985. PN-AAS-777
- Nutritional Analysis of Public Law 480 Title II Commodities, by Subcommittee on PL 480 Title II Analysis, Committee on International Nutrition Programs, Food and Nutrition Board, Assembly of Life Sciences and National Research Council, National Academy Press, Washington, D. C., 1982. PN-AAM-682
- Principles and Guidelines for the Evaluation of P.L. 480 Title II (Food for Peace) Programs and Policies by David E. Sahn, Community Systems Foundation, Ann Arbor, Michigan, October 1981. PN-AAQ-057
- Prospects for Household -level Research on Consumption and Nutrition Effects of PL 480 Title II Food Aid, by Anne Fleuret, April 1985. PN-AAS-298
- Outreach Grant Project Evaluation by Betsy Stephens, Charles G. Vandervoort, Judith W. Gilmore and Jose Rodriguez, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., January 1983. PD-AAM-398
- PL 480 Title II MCH Targeting Program Guidance, September 17, 1983. Cable State 265383.
- Report of Technical Assistance and Assessment - Village Level Oilseed Processing Module - Catholic Relief Services (CRS) Program by Irwin Hornstein and M. Rex Wingard, November 1982. PN-AAM-385

SENEGAL

Food Aid in Senegal: Can Targeting Provide Increased Benefits to Children in Need, by Robert J. Timmons and William D. Drake, Community Systems Foundation, November 1984. PN-AAS-678

Working Document: Evaluation of the PL 480 Title II and PENS Senegal Program, Senegal, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., May 1984. PN-AAQ-061

SRI LANKA

School Feeding: Effects on Enrollment, Attendance, and Drop-Out in Sri Lanka, by Roy I. Miller and William D. Drake, Community Systems Foundation, October 1983. PN-AAR-722

Nutrition Programs in Sri Lanka Using U.S. Food Aid (An Evaluation of P.L. 480 Title II Programs) by William D. Drake, John N. Gunning, Abraham Horwitz, Roy I. Miller, Harold L. Rice and Gnani Thenabadu, Community Systems Foundation, October 1982. PD-AAP-366

SUDAN

PL 480 Title II Targetted MCH Program in the Sudan. A Proposal by Seventh-Day Adventist World Service, Inc. (SAWS), May 1983. PN-AAP-225

TOGO

Outreach Grant Project Assessment - Togo and Benin by Betsy Stephens, Lori Forman and Lisa Gaylord, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., April 1984. PN-AAR-340

UPPER VOLTA

Upper Volta Food for Peace/Title II Evaluation by Betsy Stephens, Joanne Leslie, Elon Gilbert and Judith Gilmore, International Science and Technology Institute, Inc., September 1981. (Available in French).

OTHER

Evaluating Effects of Child Feeding Programs, Report of a Workshop on Nutritional Surveillance in Evaluation of Food for Peace Programs, Cornell Nutritional Surveillance Program, April 1985. PN-AAS-677

School Feeding Programs in Less Developed Countries: ...
Analysis of Actual and Potential Impact by Beryl Levinger,
February 1983.

PN-AAQ-015

Targeting: A Means to Better Intervention, by Robert J.
Timmons, Roy I. Miller and William D. Drake, Community Systems
Foundation, November 1983.

PN-AAQ-069

An Evaluation Scope of Work for PL 480 Title II Country
Programs, Robert R. Nathan And Associates, Inc., June 1978.

PN-AAF-644

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

Appendix B
OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 01 OF 04 STATE 265983
ORIG: N AID-88

6091 031321 AID7405

STATE 265983

6091 231321

ORIGIN OFFICE (FVPP-01)

INFO ARAF-02 AFEM-03 AFSA-03 AFFV-01 AFVU-03 AFDP-05
 AFCA-03 AAAC-01 ASEM-02 ACPT-02 ASPH-02 ASDP-02 AALA-01
 LAEM-02 LACT-03 LAGA-03 LADP-03 AAME-WI NEOP-03 FVA-01
 NEBA-03 PDPA-01 GC-01 SCAP-01 GCAC-01 GCLA-03 GCFL-01
 GCNE-01 C-91 CALI-02 CASI-03 CPS-02 STM-03 SAST-01
 NEE-03 NEME-03 PVS-03 RELO-03 MACT-03 AOSP-02 LAG-03
 NEMS-02 AOB-02 HCAP-02 LVA-02 /855 AB

INFO COT-02 IHR-10 EUR-30 AF-30 EC-02 EA-12 MHO-01
 10-15 NEA-07 ARA-00 DES-09 /135 A

DRAFTED BY AID/FVA/PPE: N SUKIN: BEN
 APPROVED BY AID/FVA/PPE: B SIDMAN
 AID/ASIA/DP: N KERTON (PHONE)
 AID/AFR/DP: C GLEASON (PHONE)
 AID/NE/DP: G DONNELLY (PHONE)
 AID/LAC/DP: N JOHNSON (PHONE)
 AID/S AND T/H: N FORMAN (PHONE)
 AID/PPG/PPR: J MCGUIRE (PHONE)
 AID/FVA/FFP: P SNEEHAN
 AID/FVA/FFP: T LAMBACHER (SUBS)

-----124664 1728972 /38

R 170449Z SEP 83 ZEX
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AID WORLDWIDE

UNCLAS STATE 265983

AIDAC

EO. 12356 N/A

TAG :

SUBJECT: PL 488 TITLE II MCH TARGETING PROGRAM GUIDANCE

1. INTRODUCTION

THIS MESSAGE PROVIDES PROGRAM GUIDANCE ON TARGETING STRATEGIES FOR REGULAR TITLE II MCH FEEDING PROGRAMS. IT UP-DATES AND EXPANDS ON HB 9, SEC. 108.1. IT HAS BEEN REVIEWED BY VOLAG SPONSORS.

THE PL 488 LEGISLATION MANDATES THAT FOOD PROVIDED UNDER THE PROGRAM BE USED TO QUOTE COMBAT HUNGER AND MALNUTRITION UNQUOTE. AID INTERPRETS THIS LEGISLATION TO MEAN THAT FOOD SHOULD BE USED BOTH TO PREVENT HUNGER AND MALNUTRITION AND TO REHABILITATE THOSE ALREADY SUFFERING FROM NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS. THUS THE PL-488 PROGRAM AND MORE SPECIFICALLY THE PL 488 TITLE II MCH PROGRAM HAVE BOTH PREVENTATIVE AND CURATIVE OBJECTIVES. GIVEN THIS BASIS THE FFP TARGETING GUIDANCE IS DIRECTED TOWARDS STRENGTHENING THE UTILIZATION OF LIMITED FOOD RESOURCES TO MOST EFFICIENTLY PREVENT AND REDUCE HUNGER AND MALNUTRITION.

2. DEFINITION AND PURPOSE

TARGETING IS THE PROCESS OF DIRECTING RESOURCES TO SELECTED POPULATION GROUPS IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE THE IMPACT OF THOSE RESOURCES. TARGETING FOOD TO CERTAIN GROUPS OF NUTRITIONALLY VULNERABLE, AT-RISK INDIVIDUALS FROM POOR HOUSEHOLDS WILL HELP ENSURE THAT (A) THE FOOD IS GOING TO THE NEEDY IN TERMS OF THEIR RISKS OF HUNGER, MALNUTRITION, DEATH, LOW BIRTHWEIGHT BABIES, DEPLETION OF NUTRIENT STORES, AND THAT (B) THE PROBABILITY OF IMPACT ON THE INTENDED RECIPIENT WILL BE HIGH, E.G., REHABILITATION OF MALNUTRITION, PREVENTION OF MALNUTRITION, REDUCTION OF MORTALITY RATES. EFFECTIVE

TARGETING STRATEGIES WILL ALSO HELP INCREASE COVERAGE OF THOSE POPULATION GROUPS MOST NUTRITIONALLY VULNERABLE BY ENSURING THAT RATIONS ARE NOT WASTED ON GROUPS WHO DO NOT NEED ADDITIONAL FOOD.

3. SUMMARY GUIDANCE STATEMENT

IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE THE IMPACT OF LIMITED RESOURCES, MCH PROGRAMS SHOULD BE TARGETED TO THE NUTRITIONALLY VULNERABLE, AT-RISK MEMBERS OF POOR HOUSEHOLDS- CHILDREN UNDER AGE FIVE WITH EMPHASIS ON MALNOURISHED CHILDREN AND CHILDREN UNDER THREE YEARS OLD; AND WOMEN OF CHILDBEARING AGES WITH EMPHASIS ON PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN. THESE GROUPS ARE PARTICULARLY VULNERABLE TO MALNUTRITION AND ITS CONSEQUENCES: MENTAL AND GROWTH RETARDATION; INCREASED SUSCEPTIBILITY TO INFECTIOUS DISEASES; MORTALITY; AND IN THE CASE OF UNDERNOURISHED WOMEN OF CHILD BEARING AGES, LOW BIRTHWEIGHT BABIES AND DEPLETION OF THEIR OWN NUTRIENT STORES DURING PREGNANCY AND LACTATION. DECISIONS REGARDING SELECTION OF SPECIFIC TARGET POPULATIONS FOR A PARTICULAR PROGRAM WILL DEPEND PRIMARILY ON THAT PROGRAM'S DEFINED OBJECTIVES; THE FEASIBILITY OF REACHING THE SELECTED GROUPS, GIVEN CULTURAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL CONSTRAINTS; AND THE AVAILABILITY OF FINANCIAL RESOURCES, MATERIALS AND MANPOWER NECESSARY FOR EFFECTIVELY CARRYING OUT THE APPROPRIATE TARGETING STRATEGY (SEE SECTION 6, EXAMPLES).

TO ENSURE MAXIMUM IMPACT ON THE DESIGNATED TARGET POPULATIONS, PRIORITY SHOULD BE GIVEN TO LOCATING PROGRAMS IN GEOGRAPHIC AREAS WHERE HUNGER AND MALNUTRITION HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED AS PROBLEMS. THIS APPROACH IS CALLED GEOGRAPHIC TARGETING. NUTRITIONAL STATUS DATA SHOULD BE USED TO DETERMINE APPROPRIATE PROGRAM SITES; WHEN NUTRITIONAL STATUS DATA ARE NOT AVAILABLE BY GEOGRAPHIC AREAS, ECONOMIC DATA THAT SUGGEST THE PRESENCE OF NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS RESULTING FROM POVERTY OR UNAVAILABILITY OF FOOD SHOULD BE USED (E.G., PER CAPITA INCOME, FOOD PRODUCTION, PERCENT LANDLESS LABORERS, UNEMPLOYMENT RATES, ETC.).

DECISIONS REGARDING THE LOCATION OF PROGRAM SITES WILL ULTIMATELY BE BASED ON BOTH THE COSTS OF TRANSPORTING FOOD TO CERTAIN AREAS AND THE COSTS OF SUPPORTING THE SPECIFIED PROGRAM IN RELATIONSHIP TO THE EXPECTED OUTCOMES OF THE PROGRAM. GEOGRAPHIC CONSTRAINTS, AND EXISTENCE OR NONEXISTENCE OF A DELIVERY INFRASTRUCTURE WILL BE THE MAJOR FACTORS IN DETERMINING COSTS. THE SIZE OF THE TARGET POPULATION THAT MAY BE REACHED IN ANY ONE AREA AND/OR SEVERITY OF THE PROBLEMS TO BE ADDRESSED WILL HELP DETERMINE THE EXPECTED PROGRAM BENEFITS.

IN SUMMARY, AID'S TARGETING POLICY EMPHASIZES A COMBINATION OF GEOGRAPHIC TARGETING ALONG WITH CAREFUL SELECTION OF GROUPS OF NUTRITIONALLY VULNERABLE AT-RISK MEMBERS OF POOR HOUSEHOLDS FOR THE MOST EFFICIENT USE OF TITLE II RESOURCES.

4. RATIONALE FOR SELECTION OF TARGET GROUPS

SCIENTIFIC STUDIES WORLDWIDE HAVE SHOWN THAT CERTAIN POPULATION GROUPS ARE MORE LIKELY TO BE AFFECTED BY NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS AND ARE AT GREATER RISK OF SERIOUS CONSEQUENCES OF MALNUTRITION THAN THE REST OF THE POPULATION. THESE GROUPS ARE MOST OFTEN CHARACTERIZED BY AGE, HEALTH/PHYSIOLOGICAL STATE AND ECONOMIC NEED. THESE SAME INDICATORS ALSO PROVIDE THE BASIS FOR SELECTION OF MCH TARGET POPULATIONS AS FOLLOWS:

A. AGE - CHILDREN UNDER FIVE YEARS OF AGE HAVE A HIGH

PAGE 02 OF 04 STATE 265983

6031 031521 AIC7405

STATE 265983

6031 031521 810

PROBABILITY OF BECOMING MALNOURISHED BECAUSE OF THEIR SUSCEPTIBILITY TO A VARIETY OF DISEASES LIKE MEASLES, RESPIRATORY ILLNESSES AND DIARRHEA THAT DEGRADATE NUTRITIONAL STATUS; INTRAFAMILY FOOD DISTRIBUTION THAT FAVORS ADULTS IN MANY CULTURES; AND LACK OF PROPER QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF FOODS IN THE POORER COUNTRIES AND HOUSEHOLDS TO MEET THEIR NUTRITIONAL NEEDS. WITHIN THIS GROUP, CHILDREN FROM 6 MONTHS TO 3 YEARS ARE MOST AT RISK OF BECOMING MALNOURISHED SINCE THEIR INCREASED NUTRIENT NEEDS AND LIMITED STOMACH CAPACITIES ARE EXAGGERATED BY IMPROPER FEEDING (MEANING) PRACTICES AND/OR LACK OF PROPER FOODS. CONTACT WITH UNSANITARY ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS ALSO INCREASES AT THIS TIME. CHILDREN OF THIS AGE ARE MORE LIKELY TO SUFFER SEVERE CONSEQUENCES FROM CONTINUOUS EPISODES OF MALNUTRITION AND INFECTION.

B. HEALTH/PHYSIOLOGICAL STATE

1. MALNOURISHED CHILDREN - PRESCHOOL CHILDREN WHO ARE MALNOURISHED SUFFER SERIOUS CONSEQUENCES OF MALNUTRITION SUCH AS GROWTH AND MENTAL RETARDATION, INCREASED MORBIDITY, ETC., IF NOT IDENTIFIED AND PROPERLY TREATED. MALNUTRITION IN ASSOCIATION WITH OTHER COMMON INFECTIONS IS ONE OF THE LEADING CAUSES OF CHILDHOOD DEATH IN MANY COUNTRIES. EACH COUNTRY PROGRAM SHOULD DEFINE STANDARDS AND CRITERIA FOR IDENTIFYING AND TREATING MALNOURISHED CHILDREN.

2. PREGNANCY - NUTRIENT NEEDS FOR WOMEN INCREASE DURING PREGNANCY. WOMEN WHO ARE UNDERNOURISHED AT THE START OF AND DURING PREGNANCY ARE MORE LIKELY TO GIVE BIRTH TO LOW BIRTHWEIGHT INFANTS. THE MOTHERS THEMSELVES, WITHOUT NUTRITIONALLY ADEQUATE DIETS BEFORE AND DURING PREGNANCY, CAN ALSO BE DEPLETED OF NUTRIENT STORES AND ENTER THE PERIOD OF LACTATION AND CHILD CARE WITH LIMITED RESERVES AND IN POOR HEALTH.

3. LACTATION - DURING LACTATION WOMEN NEED INCREASED AMOUNTS OF NUTRIENTS TO SUSTAIN THEIR OWN BODY NEEDS AND MILK PRODUCTION. DURING THIS PERIOD WOMEN ARE AT-RISK OF FURTHER DEPLETION OF THEIR NUTRIENT STORES AND OF BECOMING MALNOURISHED THEMSELVES.

C. SOCIO-ECONOMIC STATUS

AID POLICY IS THAT ALL PL 480 TITLE II PARTICIPANTS BE FROM POOR, LOW-INCOME OR NEEDY FAMILIES. STUDIES HAVE SHOWN THAT THE POORER A HOUSEHOLD IS (DEFINED BY INCOME LEVELS, LAND HOLDINGS, OR OTHER POVERTY INDICATORS), THE MORE LIKELY ITS MEMBERS - PARTICULARLY CHILDREN, PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN - ARE AT-RISK OF NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS AND IN NEED OF ASSISTANCE. CRITERIA THAT DEFINE AN INDIVIDUAL'S OR A HOUSEHOLD'S LEVEL OF NEED CAN BE BASED, INTER ALIA, ON A COUNTRY'S DEFINITION OF POVERTY OR A COMMUNITY ASSESSMENT OF NEED. INDICATORS OF NEED, BESIDES INCOME, THAT HAVE BEEN USEFUL IN IDENTIFYING HOUSEHOLDS WITH GREATER NEEDS OR RISK, HAVE INCLUDED - FOR EXAMPLE - ONE PARENT HOUSEHOLDS, HOUSEHOLDS WITH SEVERAL CHILDREN UNDER FIVE YEARS OF AGE, ETHNIC ORIGINS, UNEMPLOYMENT OF HEAD OF HOUSEHOLD, ETC. SUCH CRITERIA SHOULD BE USED WHENEVER POSSIBLE TO REFINE THE SELECTION OF THE TARGET POPULATION AND ENSURE THAT THE MOST NEEDY ARE RECEIVING PROGRAM BENEFITS. WHEN IT IS NOT POSSIBLE OR APPROPRIATE TO APPLY THOSE CRITERIA BY HOUSEHOLD OR INDIVIDUAL, EFFECTIVE GEOGRAPHIC TARGETING TO THE POORER

AREAS OF THE COUNTRY WILL HELP INSURE THAT THE MAJORITY OF PARTICIPANTS ARE NEEDY.

D. DEVELOPMENT OF TARGETING STRATEGIES

TARGETING IS A BASIC ELEMENT OF ALL SERVICE/RESOURCE DELIVERY PROGRAMS, I.E., HEALTH, EDUCATION, HOUSING, ETC. TARGETING STRATEGIES SHOULD BE DESIGNED AS AN INTEGRAL PART OF ALL PL 480 TITLE II PROGRAMS AS A VEHICLE FOR REACHING STATED PROGRAM OBJECTIVES. THIS TARGETING GUIDANCE GIVES EACH COUNTRY PROGRAM BASIC PARAMETERS WITH WHICH TO DEVELOP ITS OWN MOST APPROPRIATE TARGETING STRATEGY. IN DEVELOPING TARGETING STRATEGIES THE FOLLOWING ELEMENTS SHOULD BE INCLUDED:

A) DEFINITION OF OBJECTIVES AND SELECTION OF APPROPRIATE TARGET GROUPS.

PROGRAM OBJECTIVES SHOULD BE CLEARLY DEFINED, AND DETERMINED BY A COUNTRY'S PROBLEMS AND PRIORITIES. THESE OBJECTIVES ARE THE BASIS FOR IDENTIFICATION OF THE APPROPRIATE TARGET GROUPS (SEE SECTION 6).

B) DETERMINATION OF THE FEASIBILITY FOR REACHING CERTAIN GROUPS.

DETERMINATION OF THE CONSTRAINTS TO REACHING CERTAIN TARGET GROUPS IS ESSENTIAL FOR THE DESIGN OF EFFECTIVE TARGETING STRATEGIES. CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND POLITICAL FACTORS SHOULD BE CONSIDERED. FOR EXAMPLE: (A) HOUSEHOLD SHARING OF THE FOOD RATION IS A COMMON PROBLEM IN MOST TAKE HOME PROGRAMS AND THE IDENTIFIED TARGET GROUP (E.G., PRESCHOOL CHILDREN, PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN) MAY ACTUALLY RECEIVE A VERY SMALL SHARE OF THE FOOD. GOOD EDUCATION PROGRAMS AND CAREFUL SELECTION OF COMMODITIES ARE A NECESSARY COMPLEMENT TO THE TARGETING STRATEGY TO HELP DIRECT FOOD AND OTHER CHILD CARE/HEALTH BENEFITS TO THE INTENDED RECIPIENTS; (B) IN SOME COUNTRIES TARGETING FOOD AND SERVICES ONLY TO MALNOURISHED CHILDREN MAY BE CULTURALLY UNACCEPTABLE. IN THESE CASES, WHEN OBJECTIVES OF A PROGRAM INCLUDE THE RECOVERY OF MALNOURISHED CHILDREN, PERMITTING ALL CHILDREN UNDER THREE FROM NEEDY FAMILIES TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PROGRAM MAY OFFER THE BEST WAY OF REACHING A MAJORITY OF THE CHILDREN WHO ARE CURRENTLY MALNOURISHED (IN MANY CASES OF COURSE, THE RISK OF MALNUTRITION FOR CHILDREN UNDER THREE WILL JUSTIFY SUCH AN APPROACH); AND (C) IN SOME COUNTRIES, PREGNANT WOMEN AND YOUNG CHILDREN UNDER 18 MONTHS, ALTHOUGH REGARDED AS HIGH PRIORITY

GROUPS, CONSISTENTLY DO NOT UTILIZE SERVICES PROVIDED. IN THESE CASES, OUTREACH ACTIVITIES WITH TRAINED FIELD PERSONNEL WOULD BE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS OF GOOD PROGRAM DESIGN.

C) IDENTIFICATION OF PROGRAM COMPONENTS NECESSARY FOR REACHING TARGET POPULATIONS AND ACHIEVING PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

THOSE PROGRAM COMPONENTS NECESSARY FOR EFFECTIVELY REACHING TARGET POPULATIONS TYPICALLY INCLUDE AN EDUCATION PROGRAM CONSISTING OF EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS AND CURRICULA FOR TEACHING PARTICIPANTS AND FOR SENSITIZING COMMUNITIES TO NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS, CAUSES AND PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS; TRAINING ACTIVITIES FOR FIELD PERSONNEL; A GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM BASED ON SCALES AND GROWTH CHARTS TO IDENTIFY HIGH-RISK PARTICIPANTS AND TO MONITOR THE GROWTH OF ALL PARTICIPANTS; AND THE RATION TYPE AND QUANTITY IDENTIFIED FOR EACH TARGET GROUP. MATERIALS, MANPOWER AND ADMINISTRATIVE INPUTS NECESSARY TO SUPPORT EACH PROGRAM COMPONENT SHOULD BE IDENTIFIED.

D) CALCULATION OF PROGRAMMATIC AND LOGISTICAL COSTS

PAGE 03 OF 04 STATE 265923

6891 031521 AID7405

STATE 265923

6891 031521 AID7

THE COSTS OF SUPPORTING THE SPECIFIED PROGRAM AND DELIVERY OF FOOD SHOULD BE DETERMINED BY GEOGRAPHIC AREA. THOSE GEOGRAPHIC AREAS (E.G., SLUMS, BARRIOS IN URBAN AREAS, SUBSISTENT RURAL AREAS) WHERE FOOD AND NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS ARE KNOWN TO EXIST SHOULD BE ACCESSED FIRST, IN REGARD TO THE SIZE OF THE TARGET POPULATION TO BE REACHED, SERIOUSNESS OF PROBLEMS, GEOGRAPHIC CONSTRAINTS AND THE EXISTENCE OR NONEXISTENCE OF A DELIVERY INFRASTRUCTURE. ANALYSIS OF THE COSTS AND EXPECTED OUTCOMES BY AREA SHOULD DETERMINE WHERE THE PROGRAM SITES WILL BE SITUATED AND ULTIMATELY THE LOCATION OF THE PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS.

E) COVERAGE

THE PERCENTAGE OF THE TARGET POPULATION THAT A PROGRAM CAN FEASIBLY REACH IS CALLED COVERAGE. EFFECTIVE TARGETING STRATEGIES SHOULD HELP A PROGRAM INCREASE COVERAGE OF ITS DEFINED TARGET POPULATIONS.

F) SEASONAL TARGETING STRATEGIES

IN MANY COUNTRIES THERE ARE CERTAIN PERIODS OF THE YEAR WHEN FOOD IS EXTREMELY SCARCE. IN SOME COUNTRIES THESE PERIODS ARE APTLY NAMED THE HUNGRY SEASONS. IN ORDER TO

ADDRESS THIS PARTICULAR TYPE OF PROBLEM, TARGETING STRATEGIES SHOULD CONSIDER DIRECTING RESOURCES TO THOSE AREAS MOST AFFECTED DURING THESE PERIODS, USING A LARGER RATION AND POSSIBLY A DIFFERENT TYPE OF DELIVERY MECHANISM, ETC.

G) FUNCTIONAL GROUP TARGETING STRATEGIES

WHEN THERE ARE SPECIFIC GROUPS OF PEOPLE, CHARACTERIZED BY OCCUPATION OR LIVING CONDITIONS, E.G., NOMADS OR LANDLESS LABORERS, WITH PARTICULAR NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS, SEPARATE TARGETING STRATEGIES SHOULD BE DEVELOPED BASED ON INFORMATION DESCRIBING THEIR PARTICULAR PROBLEMS AND THOSE CONSTRAINTS THAT NEED TO BE OVERCOME TO REACH THE TARGET POPULATIONS WITHIN THESE GROUPS.

B. EXAMPLES OF PROGRAM OBJECTIVES AND APPROPRIATE TARGET POPULATIONS (THIS PARAGRAPH PRESENTS IN NARRATIVE FORM A TABLE WHICH WILL BE SEPARATELY REPRODUCED AND DISTRIBUTED TO FIELD MISSIONS SHORTLY).

A. OBJECTIVE I: TO REDUCE THE INCIDENCE OF INFANT MORTALITY.

1) APPROPRIATE TARGET POPULATIONS

- A) PREGNANT WOMEN FROM POOR HOUSEHOLDS. (EMPHASIS ON UNDERNOURISHED MOTHERS.)
- B) LACTATING MOTHERS FROM POOR HOUSEHOLDS. (EMPHASIS ON UNDERNOURISHED MOTHERS.)
- C) INFANTS FROM 6 TO 12 MONTHS OF AGE FROM POOR HOUSEHOLDS.

2) RATIONALE: -

A) LOW BIRTH WEIGHT IS ASSOCIATED WITH INCREASED PROBABILITY OF INFANT MORTALITY. STUDIES SHOW THAT UNDERNOURISHED PREGNANT WOMEN ARE MORE LIKELY TO HAVE LOWER BIRTHWEIGHT BABIES THAN WELL-NOURISHED WOMEN. WHEN ADEQUATE FOOD SUPPLEMENTATION IS GIVEN TO UNDERNOURISHED PREGNANT WOMEN THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN BIRTHWEIGHTS. PREGNANCY IS AN OPPORTUNE TIME TO EDUCATE MOTHERS ABOUT PROPER CHILD CARE.

B) GIVING FOOD TO LACTATING MOTHERS WILL HELP MAINTAIN

HER OWN NUTRITIONAL STATUS WHICH IS IMPORTANT FOR GOOD CHILD CARE AS WELL AS SUBSEQUENT PREGNANCIES. GOOD NUTRITIONAL STATUS OF THE MOTHER WILL ENSURE GOOD QUALITY AND SUFFICIENT QUANTITY OF BREASTMILK.

IF GROWTH SURVEILLANCE OF THE INFANT IS LIMITED TO RECEIPT OF FOOD, IT MAYBE MORE LIKELY THAT INFANT GROWTH AND POSSIBLE PROBLEMS WILL BE CAREFULLY MONITORED. CONTINUED EDUCATION OF THE MOTHER WILL ALSO HELP PROMOTE GOOD CHILD CARE PRACTICES.

C) NUTRITIOUS FOODS FOR INFANTS WILL HELP ENSURE THAT AN ADEQUATE WEANING FOOD WILL BE AVAILABLE AT THIS CRITICAL PERIOD OF LIFE.

3) PROGRAM COMPONENTS FOR EFFECTIVELY REACHING TARGET POPULATION AND PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

- (A) PROPER QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF FOOD.
- (B) EDUCATION FOR THE MOTHERS, FATHERS, COMMUNITY ON GOOD CHILD CARE PRACTICES INCLUDING BREASTFEEDING AND WEANING, I.E., TIMELY INTRODUCTION OF SOLID FOODS.
- (C) GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM - SCALES AND GROWTH CHARTS FOR MONITORING WEIGHT GAIN OF PREGNANT WOMEN AND CHILDREN UNDER 12 MONTHS.
- (D) TRAINING FOR FIELD STAFF AND PROMOTION OF OUTREACH ACTIVITIES.
- (E) REFERRAL NETWORK TO HEALTH SERVICES.

B. OBJECTIVE - II: RECUPERATE/REHABILITATE MALNOURISHED CHILDREN.

1) APPROPRIATE TARGET POPULATIONS - MALNOURISHED CHILDREN UNDER 5 YEARS OF AGE FROM POOR FAMILIES.

2) RATIONALE - SINCE THE OBJECTIVES ARE SPECIFIC TO RECUPERATION, ONLY MALNOURISHED CHILDREN SHOULD BE ADMITTED. THEIR MOTHERS AND FATHERS SHOULD PARTICIPATE IN INTENSIVE EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITIES IN ORDER TO FACILITATE THE RECOVERY OF THE CHILD AND MAINTENANCE OF NORMAL NUTRITIONAL STATUS.

3) PROGRAM COMPONENTS FOR EFFECTIVELY REACHING TARGET POPULATION AND PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

- (A) PROPER QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF FOOD.
- (B) INTENSIVE EDUCATION FOR MOTHERS, FATHERS OF MALNOURISHED CHILDREN ON GOOD CHILD CARE PRACTICES. SPECIAL INFORMATION SHOULD BE GIVEN TO EACH FAMILY REGARDING THE TREATMENT OF THE MALNOURISHED CHILD INCLUDING FOOD PREPARATION, FREQUENCY OF FEEDING, ETC., AND MAINTENANCE OF THE CHILD ONCE HEALTHY.
- (C) GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM TO IDENTIFY, MONITOR AND

EVALUATE THE PROGRESS OF THE MALNOURISHED CHILD.

- (D) TRAINING OF FIELD STAFF IN IDENTIFICATION AND TREATMENT OF MALNOURISHED.
- (E) MEDICAL PERSONNEL, MATERIALS AND PROCEDURES FOR TREATING SERIOUSLY MALNOURISHED INTEGRATED AS PART OF PROGRAM.

B. OBJECTIVE - III: TO PREVENT AND REDUCE THE INCIDENCE OF MALNUTRITION IN PRESCHOOL CHILDREN.

1) APPROPRIATE TARGET POPULATIONS - (A) CHILDREN UNDER 5 YEARS FROM POOR HOUSEHOLDS WITH EMPHASIS ON CHILDREN UNDER 3. (B) PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN.

2) RATIONALE - (A) THE PERIOD FROM 6 MONTHS TO 3 YEARS AND IN PARTICULAR THE TIME FROM 6 MONTHS TO 18 MONTHS IS

24

PAGE 04 OF 04 STATE 263333

CS91 031521 AIG7436

2 NUTRITIONALLY VULNERABLE PERIODS FOR MOST CHILDREN FROM NEEDY FAMILIES. A COMBINATION OF FOOD TO THE CHILDREN, PERIODIC GROWTH-MONITORING AND EDUCATION ABOUT PROPER CHILD CARE TO THE MOTHERS WILL HELP PREVENT EPISODES OF MALNUTRITION.

2) SAME RATIONALE UNDER EXAMPLE 1, SECTION 2 (A), (B), WITH EMPHASIS ON PREVENTATIVE ACTIONS TO REDUCE CHILDREN'S RISK OF MALNUTRITION: (A) EDUCATION ON CHILD CARE PRACTICES, (B) INCREASING MOTHERS' WELL-BEING SO SHE CAN PROPERLY TAKE CARE OF CHILDREN, (C) PREVENTING LOW BIRTHWEIGHT BABIES, AND (D) MONITORING OF CHILDREN'S GROWTH.

3) COMPONENTS NECESSARY FOR EFFECTIVELY REACHING TARGET POPULATION/AND REACHING OBJECTIVES

- (A) PROPER QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF FOOD.
- (B) EDUCATION FOR THE MOTHERS, FATHERS, COMMUNITY ON GOOD CHILD CARE PRACTICES INCLUDING BREASTFEEDING AND WEANING, I.E., TIMELY INTRODUCTION OF SOLID FOODS.
- (C) GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM - SCALES AND GROWTH CHARTS FOR MONITORING GROWTH PROGRESS OF PARTICIPANTS.
- (D) TRAINING FOR FIELD STAFF.
- (E) REFERRAL NETWORK TO HEALTH SERVICES. DAN

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

Appendix C
OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 01 OF 05 STATE 014324
CRIZIN AID-02

3687 041914 AIG6057

STATE 014324

3697 041914 AIG6058

ORIGIN OFFICE FVPP-01
INFO AAIP-02 AFEB-03 AFCA-03 AFFW-04 AFCE-03 AFCA-02 NEPD-04
AFOR-02 AFCA-03 AAAS-01 ACEM-01 ACPT-02 ASPN-02 AIDP-02
AKLA-02 LACE-02 LACA-03 LAOP-03 LACA-02 AANE-01 NECP-03
FVA-01 NETA-04 NENA-03 PFJE-01 PFER-01 PORA-02 PPEB-02
GC-01 GCAP-01 GCAS-01 FM-02 AFPO-03 ACTP-01 STM-03
FSA-02 IEE-03 IEME-03 AFD-01 AIP-01 GCM-02 CBE-01
TFD-01 SELO-01 TELER-01 PAST-01 ACP-01 LAD-02 PA-01
ASBI-03 3C-04 /114 AD

INFO OCT-02 IMP-10 EUR-00 AF-00 EG-02 EA-12 MRO-01
10-15 NEA-17 ARA-00 HA-00 L-03 AMAD-01 DES-00
/13E R

DRAFTED BY AID/FVA/PPE: J GILCREAK SUNIN/P SHEEHAN:BB
APPROVED BY AID/AA/FVA: J C BLOCH
AID/FVA/PPE: E SIDMAN (DRAFT)
;ID/FVA/PPP: L TWENTYMAN (DRAFT)
AID/AA/PPC: JRBOLTON (DRAFT)
;ID/AA/AFR: F S RUCDY (DRAFT)
AID/AA/ASIA: C W GREENLEAF (DRAFT)
AID/AA/LAC: O J REICH (DRAFT)
AID/AA/NE: M A FERG (DRAFT)
AID/SER/MP: F ALLEN (DRAFT)
SANOT/N: SBLUMENFELD (DRAFT)

-----35024 100605Z /30

R 180125Z JAN 63 ZP
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AID WORLDWIDE
XMT AMCONSUL JERUSALEM
AMBASSY TEL AVIV

UNCLAS STATE 014324

AIDAC, FROM AA/FVA, J. I. C. BLOCH TO MISSION DIRECTORS

E.O. 12356: N/A

TAGS:

SUBJECT: GUIDANCE FOR TITLE II PVO PROGRAMS

REF: STATE 134910

1. SUMMARY: THE PURPOSE OF THIS CABLE IS TO PROVIDE GUIDANCE ON THE DESIGN OF TITLE II PROGRAMS TO INCREASE THEIR DEVELOPMENT IMPACT. TITLE II COMMODITIES WILL CONTINUE IN THE 1980'S TO BE A SIGNIFICANT RESOURCE FOR MANY PVO, HOST COUNTRY AND USAID PROGRAMS AND CAN ACHIEVE DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES WHEN PROGRAMMED EFFECTIVELY. IN THE FUTURE AS PART OF AID'S PROGRAM REVIEW AND APPROVAL PROCESS AND EVALUATION PROCEDURES, TITLE II PROGRAMS WILL BE EXAMINED CAREFULLY IN TERMS OF: (1) APPROPRIATENESS OF OBJECTIVES GIVEN HOST COUNTRY PROBLEMS AND PRIORITIES AND USAID COUNTRY DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES, (2) ADEQUACY OF PROGRAM DESIGN TO MEET PROGRAM OBJECTIVES, (3) MEASURED AND/OR ESTIMATED DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACTS. LINKAGES WITH HOST COUNTRY PRIORITIES AND USAID STRATEGY WILL HELP TO MAXIMIZE IMPACT AND ECONOMIZE SCARCE RESOURCES. IN ORDER TO IMPLEMENT THIS APPROACH AND INCREASE THE EFFECTIVENESS OF TITLE II RESOURCES, CLOSER COLLABORATION BETWEEN USAIDS AND PVOs WILL BE REQUIRED, ADDITIONAL RESOURCES FOR COMPLEMENTARY INPUTS, I.E., TRAINING PROGRAMS, EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS, TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, ETC., MAY BE NECESSARY; AND MORE RIGOROUS MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF PROGRAMS WILL BE ESSENTIAL.

2. BACKGROUND: SINCE 1954 FOOD AID LEGISLATION HAS INCREASED ITS EMPHASIS ON THE DEVELOPMENTAL OBJECTIVES OF PL 480 COMMODITIES. SPECIFICALLY THE PL 480 LEGISLATION MANDATES THAT TITLE II COMMODITIES BE USED EFFECTIVELY IN

THE NEEDIEST AREAS TO COMBAT MALNUTRITION AND TO PROMOTE ECONOMIC AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT WITH EMPHASIS ON SELF-HELP ACTIVITIES, WHENEVER POSSIBLE. PVOs, BECAUSE OF THEIR DEMONSTRATED ABILITY TO WORK INDEPENDENTLY AT THE GRASS-ROOTS LEVEL, ARE GIVEN A MAJOR ROLE IN CARRYING OUT THESE PROGRAMS.

AS DIRECTED BY CONGRESS, AID HAS CONDUCTED A SERIES OF EVALUATIONS OF TITLE II PROGRAMS TO ASSESS THEIR EFFECTIVENESS IN ACHIEVING INTENDED DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES. THESE EVALUATIONS ALONG WITH OTHER STUDIES PROVIDE USEFUL INSIGHTS, PARTICULARLY WITH REGARD TO MATERNAL CHILD HEALTH SUPPLEMENTARY FEEDING PROGRAMS AND TO A LESSEER EXTENT SCHOOL FEEDING AND FOOD FOR WORK, INTO PROGRAM DESIGN COMPONENTS THAT APPEAR TO CONTRIBUTE TO MORE SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS. WHILE THE STATE OF THE ART DOES NOT SUPPORT MANY PRECISELY QUANTIFIABLE CAUSE/EFFECT RELATIONSHIPS, ENOUGH NOW IS KNOWN TO SUGGEST WAYS OF IMPROVING TITLE II PROGRAM DESIGNS FOR ACHIEVING DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACT.

3. OBJECTIVES: AID HAS IDENTIFIED (IN HANDBOOK 9, CHAPTERS 3 AND 10) THE FOLLOWING OBJECTIVES BY PROGRAM CATEGORY AS VALID DEVELOPMENTAL OBJECTIVES FOR TITLE II PROGRAMS. THE PARTICULAR OBJECTIVE PURSUED WILL DEPEND ON COUNTRY PROBLEMS AND ESTABLISHED PRIORITIES.

MATERNAL CHILD HEALTH (MCH) - (1) TO IMPROVE THE NUTRITIONAL STATUS OF PRESCHOOL CHILDREN AND/OR PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN; (2) TO CHANGE NUTRITIONAL KNOWLEDGE AND PRACTICES OF THE MOTHER; (3) TO ACHIEVE GREATER ACCESS AND UTILIZATION OF HEALTH SERVICES; (4) TO REDUCE FERTILITY; (5) TO INVOLVE WOMEN IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND INCOME GENERATING ACTIVITIES; (6) TO STRENGTHEN LOCAL PRIVATE OR GOVERNMENTAL INSTITUTIONS IN THE DELIVERY OF NUTRITION AND HEALTH SERVICES; (7) TO INSTITUTIONALIZE A NUTRITION PLANNING CAPABILITY AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL; AND (8) TO STIMULATE AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION.

FOOD FOR WORK (FFW) - TO PROVIDE INCOME AND EMPLOYMENT AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT POSSIBLE: (1) TO DEVELOP TECHNICAL SKILLS FOR FUTURE EMPLOYMENT; (2) TO DEVELOP PRODUCTIVE INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE TARGET AREA; AND (3) TO STRENGTHEN COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION.

SCHOOL FEEDING (SF) - (1) TO IMPROVE THE NUTRITIONAL STATUS OF SCHOOL-AGED CHILDREN, ESPECIALLY THE MALNOURISHED; (2) TO INCREASE ENROLLMENT AND ATTENDANCE OF NEEDY PRIMARY SCHOOL CHILDREN AND (3) TO IMPROVE THE COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT OF NEEDY SCHOOL-AGED CHILDREN.

THIS LIST IS NOT ALL-INCLUSIVE BUT ILLUSTRATES THE VARIETY OF DEVELOPMENTAL IMPACTS THAT FOOD AID, IF PROGRAMMED PROPERLY, MIGHT HELP ACHIEVE. MISSIONS ARE ENCOURAGED, IN COLLABORATION WITH PVOs, TO EXPERIMENT WITH INNOVATIVE WAYS OF PROGRAMMING TITLE II COMMODITIES IN SUPPORT OF THESE AND OTHER POSSIBLE OBJECTIVES. IN DOING SO, SUFFICIENT ATTENTION SHOULD BE PAID TO PROGRAM DESIGN TO GIVE REASONABLE ASSURANCE THAT THE OBJECTIVES CHOSEN CAN BE REALISTICALLY MET. EVALUATIONS HAVE SHOWN THAT THERE IS NOT ALWAYS COMPLETE AGREEMENT AMONG USAIDS, HOST GOVERNMENTS, AND PVOs ON STATED OBJECTIVES AND PROGRAM ELEMENTS. REASONS FOR THIS INCLUDE INADEQUATE COORDINATION, LACK OF APPROPRIATE DATA AND ANALYSIS AT THE TIME OF PROGRAM DESIGN AND LIMITED RESOURCES FOR COMPLEMENTARY INPUTS. AS PART OF THE REVIEW PROCESS OF TITLE II PROGRAMS IN THE FUTURE, AID/W INTENDS TO EXAMINE MORE CLOSELY HOW PROJECT COMPONENTS RELATE TO STATED OBJECTIVES AND THE APPROPRIATENESS OF THE OBJECTIVES TO THE PARTICULAR COUNTRY ENVIRONMENT.

4. DESIGN COMPONENTS NECESSARY FOR MCH FEEDING PROGRAMS TO

UNCLASSIFIED

36

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 02 OF 03 STATE 014324

9597 04191A A106P57

STATE 014324

9597 24:914 A10C0

ACHIEVE NUTRITION IMPACT: MCH FEEDING PROGRAMS MAY HAVE MANY OBJECTIVES, AS DESCRIBED ABOVE. THE FOLLOWING SECTION WILL ADDRESS SPECIFICALLY DESIGN COMPONENTS AFFECTING ACHIEVEMENT OF NUTRITIONAL IMPACT, A PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE.

BECAUSE OF THEIR VULNERABILITY TO BECOMING MALNOURISHED.

SEVERAL MCH PROGRAMS THAT HAVE RECORDED NUTRITIONAL IMPACT (MOROCCO, PHILIPPINES, INDIA, CHILE, SRI LANKA) SHARE MANY (THOUGH NOT NECESSARILY ALL) OF THE FOLLOWING ATTRIBUTES: (1) TARGETING OF FOOD AND SERVICES TO MALNOURISHED CHILDREN, OR NUTRITIONALLY AT-RISK GROUPS - PRESCHOOL CHILDREN, PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN FROM LOW INCOME FAMILIES; (2) APPROPRIATE TYPE AND QUANTITY OF RATION, RESPONSIVE TO PROGRAM OBJECTIVES AND TARGET POPULATION NEEDS; (3) UTILIZATION OF GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEMS TO MONITOR, BETTER MANAGE AND EVALUATE PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS; (4) INTEGRATION OF FOOD WITH HEALTH SERVICES; (5) NUTRITIONAL EDUCATION COMPONENT AND STRONG COMMUNITY OUTREACH; (6) PARTICIPATION OF BENEFICIARIES AS REFLECTED BY THEIR INVOLVEMENT IN PROGRAM DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION AND THEIR IN-KIND AND FINANCIAL CONTRIBUTIONS; (7) ADEQUATE SUPERVISION AND TRAINING FOR FIELD WORKERS; (8) HOST GOV-

ERNMENT COMMITMENT TO PROGRAM OBJECTIVES IN TERMS OF FINANCIAL AND POLITICAL SUPPORT.

WHILE PROGRAM CHARACTERISTICS WILL VARY DEPENDING ON LOCAL CONDITIONS, THE FOLLOWING FACTORS SHOULD BE GIVEN SERIOUS CONSIDERATION IN THE DESIGN OF ALL PROGRAMS WITH NUTRITION IMPACT OBJECTIVES:

A. SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS. TARGETING

IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE THE IMPACT OF LIMITED RESOURCES, FEEDING PROGRAMS SHOULD BE TARGETED TO NUTRITIONALLY AT-RISK GROUPS. THESE GROUPS GENERALLY COMPRISE MALNOURISHED CHILDREN UNDER 5; CHILDREN 6-36 MONTHS, PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN FROM LOW INCOME FAMILIES. ALL OF THESE GROUPS ARE PARTICULARLY VULNERABLE TO MALNUTRITION AND ITS CONSEQUENCES - INCREASED SUSCEPTIBILITY TO DISEASE, MENTAL/ GROWTH RETARDATION, POSSIBLE DEATH AND IN THE CASE OF PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN LOW BIRTHWEIGHT OF CHILDREN AND DEPLETION OF THEIR OWN VITAL NUTRIENT STORES.

SELECTION OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS SHOULD BE BASED ON CLEARLY DEFINED PROGRAM OBJECTIVES WHICH ARE DETERMINED BY A COUNTRY'S PROBLEMS, PRIORITIES AND CONSTRAINTS. IN COUNTRIES WHERE THERE ARE HIGH RATES OF MALNUTRITION AND AN ADEQUATE HEALTH INFRASTRUCTURE WITH TRAINED PERSONNEL AND GROWTH MONITORING SYSTEMS, SUCH AS IN CHILE, SRI LANKA AND THE PHILIPPINES, ETC., PROGRAMS HAVE TARGETED FOOD TO MALNOURISHED CHILDREN WITH SIGNIFICANT RESULTS. IN CHILE'S TARGETED MALNOURISHED CHILD PROGRAM, THE RECOVERY RATE FOR HEAVILY MALNOURISHED CHILDREN HAS BEEN BETWEEN 30-40 PERCENT OF SEVERELY MALNOURISHED CHILDREN. IN THE PHILIPPINES MCH PROGRAMS, WHERE AT LEAST 80 PERCENT OF THE PARTICIPANTS ENROLLED ARE MODERATELY OR SEVERELY MALNOURISHED, A SUBSTANTIAL NUTRITION IMPROVEMENT HAS BEEN FOUND - A 1 PERCENT AVERAGE GAIN IN STANDARD WEIGHT FOR AGE PER MONTH FOR UP TO 18 MONTHS OF PARTICIPATION. AND IN SRI LANKA, WHERE 4 OUT OF 5 PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS ARE MALNOURISHED OR LIKELY TO BECOME MALNOURISHED, AN EVALUATION OF BENEFICIARIES PARTICIPATING IN THE PROGRAM FOR 12 MONTHS COMPARED TO THE GROUP PARTICIPATING FOR 6 MONTHS SHOWS 29.8 PERCENT FEWER MALNOURISHED CHILDREN IN THE AGE GROUP 13 TO 24 MONTHS, 17.4 PERCENT FEWER IN THE AGE GROUP 25 TO 36 MONTHS, 22.1 PERCENT FEWER FOR 37 TO 48 MONTHS AND 15.8 PERCENT FEWER FOR 49 TO 60 MONTHS. IN MANY OF THESE MORE QUOTE PRECISELY UNQUOTE TARGETED PROGRAMS ALL CHILDREN UNDER 1 OR 2 YEARS OF AGE, PREGNANT AND LACTATING WOMEN ARE ALSO PARTICIPANTS

WHEN OBJECTIVES OF A PROGRAM INCLUDE PREVENTION AND REDUCTION OF THE INCIDENCE OF MALNUTRITION, PROGRAMS SHOULD BE TARGETED TO THE POOREST AREAS OF THE COUNTRY, MOST NEEDY COMMUNITIES AND WITHIN THESE COMMUNITIES THOSE NUTRITIONALLY AT-RISK GROUPS FROM LOW INCOME FAMILIES BECAUSE OF THE HIGH ASSOCIATION BETWEEN POVERTY AND MALNUTRITION, GEOGRAPHIC TARGETING SHOULD LOCATE PROGRAMS WHERE THERE IS A HIGH PROBABILITY OF NUTRITIONAL PROBLEMS. FURTHER SCREENING BASED ON ECONOMIC NEEDS WILL REFINE THE SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS. IN MOROCCO, PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS MUST RECEIVE A QUOTE CERTIFICATE OF INDIGENCE UNQUOTE FROM THE GOVERNMENT FOR ADMISSION. ACCORDING TO ONE ANALYSIS, THE PROGRAM RESULTED IN A 69 PERCENT REDUCTION IN THE RATE OF MODERATE AND SEVERE MALNUTRITION OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS. RECENT STUDIES INDICATE THAT TARGETING FOOD TO AT-RISK (UNDERWEIGHT) PREGNANT WOMEN CAN HAVE A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON BIRTH-WEIGHT AND MAY BE A COST EFFECTIVE WAY OF REDUCING INFANT MORTALITY. IN MOST CASES A COMBINATION OF GEOGRAPHIC TARGETING, BASED ON PREVALENCE OF MALNUTRITION AND/OR OTHER POVERTY INDICATORS, E.G., UNEMPLOYMENT RATES, POOR AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION, ETC., AND SCREENING FOR AT-RISK PARTICIPANTS LEADS TO A MORE EFFECTIVE PROGRAM.

B) GROWTH SURVEILLANCE/MONITORING AND EVALUATION - IN ONLY THOSE COUNTRIES THAT HAVE INSTITUTED GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEMS AS PART OF THEIR FEEDING PROGRAMS, E.G., CHILE, MOROCCO, PHILIPPINES, SRI LANKA, HAS IMPACT OF PROGRAMS BEEN QUANTITATIVELY SUBSTANTIATED. GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEMS ARE BASED ON PERIODIC WEIGHING OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS AND THE RECORDING OF WEIGHTS, AGE AND HEIGHTS, TYPICALLY USING WEIGHT CHARTS. WITH THIS TYPE OF MONITORING SYSTEM, A FEEDING PROGRAM CAN BE TARGETED, WELL MANAGED AND EVALUATED.

A RECENT AMERICAN PUBLIC HEALTH ASSOCIATION STUDY, GROWTH MONITORING, WHICH REVIEWED HUNDREDS OF PRIMARY HEALTH CARE AND NUTRITION PROJECTS, AND THE AID STUDY, ANALYSIS OF COMMUNITY LEVEL NUTRITION PROGRAMS, CONCLUDE THAT GROWTH MONITORING SIGNIFICANTLY IMPROVES PREVENTIVE HEALTH CARE AND INCREASES SIGNIFICANTLY A PROGRAM'S POTENTIAL TO REDUCE MALNUTRITION. IN THE PHILIPPINES, A NATIONAL GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM HAS BEEN INSTRUMENTAL IN IDENTIFYING THE MOST VULNERABLE CHILDREN. IN CHILE, A GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM HAS SCREENED FOR MALNOURISHED CHILDREN, TRACKED THEIR GROWTH AND RECOVERY, AND GRADUATED RECOVERED CHILDREN FROM THE PROGRAM. IN SRI LANKA, A GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM COMBINED WITH A STRONG CLINICAL ASSESSMENT COMPONENT HAS TARGETED THE PROGRAM TO AT LEAST ONE THIRD OF THE COUNTRY'S AT-RISK NEEDY PRE-SCHOOLERS. AND IN MOROCCO, THE

DATA COLLECTION AND MONITORING PROCEDURES HAVE BEEN INSTRUMENTAL IN ACHIEVING A HIGHER LEVEL OF PERFORMANCE AMONG CENTER STAFF.

THESE SIMPLE MONITORING SYSTEMS PROVIDE BOTH THE PROGRAM IMPLEMENTORS AND MOTHERS OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS WITH IMPORTANT FEEDBACK CONCERNING THE PROGRESS OF THE PARTICIPANTS. PROGRAM IMPLEMENTORS CAN USE THIS INFORMATION TO ADJUST THE PROGRAM, E.G., RATION SIZE, FREQUENCY OF FEEDING, ETC., TO IMPROVE ITS EFFECTIVENESS; MOTHERS CAN USE THE INFORMATION TO MAKE CHANGES IN THE FAMILY'S FOOD PRACTICES IN RESPONSE TO THE CHILD'S NEEDS. THUS THE GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM IS AN EXCELLENT MANAGEMENT AND EDUCATION TOOL AND SHOULD BE BUILT INTO ALL ONGOING AND NEW PROGRAMS.

C) NUTRITION EDUCATION - NUTRITION EDUCATION OF PARTICIPANT MOTHERS, WHICH DEMONSTRATES THE VALUE OF FOOD FOR THE

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 03 OF 05 STATE 014324

9697 041914 A106057

STATE 014324

9697

HEALTH OF THE CHILD AND HOW TO USE THE SUPPLEMENTARY FOOD PROPERLY, SHOULD BE AN INTEGRAL PART OF ALL FEEDING PROGRAMS. NUTRITION EDUCATION COMPONENTS OF FEEDING PROGRAMS HAVE AN EXCELLENT OPPORTUNITY TO REACH THE MOTHERS OF THE MORE VULNERABLE, NUTRITIONALLY AT-RISK CHILDREN AND TO BRING ABOUT PERMANENT CHANGES IN FAMILY FOOD CONSUMPTION PATTERNS THAT WILL HAVE LONG TERM IMPACT ON PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS AND THEIR SIBLINGS, I.E., INTRODUCTION OF NUTRITIOUS WEANING FOODS AT THE EARLY AGE, PRODUCTION AND USE OF INDIGENOUS FOODS FOR THE WEANING DIET, ETC.

EVALUATION OF SEVERAL PROGRAMS SHOW THAT THE NUTRITION EDUCATION COMPONENTS HAVE BEEN CRITICAL FOR ACHIEVING NUTRITION IMPACT. THE ANALYSIS OF THE MOROCCO PROGRAM SHOWS A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE (APPROXIMATELY 50 PERCENT) IN PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS WHEN A NUTRITION EDUCATION COMPONENT WAS INTRODUCED INTO THE PROGRAM. ACCORDING TO A STUDY BY THE HARVARD INSTITUTE OF INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF PRESCHOOL CLINICS IN GHANA, NUTRITION EDUCATION APPEARS TO BE THE PROGRAM COMPONENT THAT HAS HAD THE LARGEST IMPACT ON NUTRITIONAL OUTCOME.

EFFECTIVE NUTRITION EDUCATION PROGRAMS TYPICALLY HAVE STRONG OUTREACH COMPONENTS, CHARACTERIZED BY HOME VISITS, EDUCATIONAL MESSAGES AND MATERIALS ADAPTED TO LOCAL NEEDS, SENSITIZATION OF FAMILIES AS WELL AS COMMUNITY LEADERS TO LOCAL NUTRITION PROBLEMS AND CAUSES AND PRACTICAL HOUSEHOLD/COMMUNITY LEVEL INTERVENTIONS TO REDUCE MALNUTRITION.

DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATION PROGRAMS REQUIRE

DEVELOPMENT OF A TRAINING PROGRAM FOR PROGRAM PERSONNEL, DESIGN AND PRODUCTION OF EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS FOR MOTHERS, SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION OF FIELD WORKER ACTIVITIES.

D) INTEGRATION WITH HEALTH SERVICES - DIARRHEA, INFECTIOUS DISEASES AND PARASITES HAVE A DELETERIOUS EFFECT ON A YOUNG CHILD'S NUTRITIONAL STATUS. SIMILARLY, A CHILD SUFFERING FROM MALNUTRITION IS MORE SUSCEPTIBLE TO OTHER HEALTH PROBLEMS. BECAUSE OF THIS SYNERGISTIC RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN DISEASE AND NUTRITIONAL STATUS AND THE COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF PROVIDING INTEGRATED SERVICES, FEEDING PROGRAMS AND HEALTH SERVICES SHOULD BE INTEGRATED WHENEVER FEASIBLE. THE NARANGVAL INDIA STUDY CONDUCTED BY THE JOHNS HOPKINS SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH SHOWS THAT WHILE HEALTH CARE HAS A MAJOR EFFECT ON INFANT AND CHILD MORTALITY AND THAT NUTRITION CARE (INCLUDING FOOD DISTRIBUTION) ALONE REDUCED PERI-NATAL DEATH RATES - TOGETHER THEY HAD A SUBSTANTIALLY GREATER EFFECT ON MORTALITY, MORBIDITY AND GROWTH. UTILIZATION OF ALREADY IN-PLACE FACILITIES, COORDINATION OF EDUCATION MESSAGES, USE OF SIMILAR GROWTH MEASUREMENT TOOLS AS REFLECTED IN THE CHILE AND SRI LANKA PROGRAMS WOULD SERVE TO MAXIMIZE THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ALL EFFORTS AND REDUCE TIME SPENT BY RECIPIENTS IN RECEIVING SERVICES. IF PHYSICAL INTEGRATION IS IMPOSSIBLE OR NOT APPROPRIATE (AS WHEN THE HEALTH SERVICE INFRASTRUCTURE IS LIMITED), STRONG LINKAGES SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED BETWEEN THE FEEDING PROGRAM AND THE CLOSEST HEALTH SERVICE TO ENSURE TIMELY REFERRAL OF PARTICIPANTS AND FOR MUTUAL SUPPORT OF EACH OTHER'S OBJECTIVES.

E) COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION - A KEY INGREDIENT TO ACHIEVING EFFECTIVE PROGRAMS IS THE ACTIVE PARTICIPATION OF THE COMMUNITY IN THE DESIGN, IMPLEMENTATION AND SUPPORT OF PROGRAMS. THERE IS STRONG EVIDENCE, PARTICULARLY FROM PVO EXPERIENCE, THAT WHEN THIS OCCURS, THE PROGRAM IS LIKELY TO OBTAIN REGULAR PARTICIPANT ATTENDANCE (A FACTOR GREATLY INFLUENCING PROGRAM EFFECTIVENESS), INCREASE SENSITIVITY OF THE COMMUNITY TO NUTRITION PROBLEMS, AND HAVE GREATER

POTENTIAL TO INFLUENCE THE NUTRITIONAL STATUS OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS. FOR EXAMPLE IN NCTAR, INDIA, WHERE THE FEEDING PROGRAM IS EXTREMELY WELL INTEGRATED INTO VILLAGE LIFE, FREQUENCY OF ATTENDANCE AT THE CLINICS IS 96 PERCENT.

IN MANY PROGRAMS, LOCAL RESOURCES ARE MOBILIZED TO COVER PROGRAM COSTS. PARTICIPANTS PAY FOR THE SERVICES PROVIDED, AND THESE FEES ARE USED FOR OPERATING EXPENSES OF INCOME

GENERATING ACTIVITIES. IN THE PHILIPPINES AND MOROCCO, THE SALARIES OF THE VILLAGE WORKERS ARE FINANCED BY THE MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT AND THE MOTHERS THEMSELVES, WHILE IN NCTAR, THE PROJECT IS ENTIRELY SELF-SUPPORTING.

IN THE PHILIPPINES, BOLIVIA, AND NCTAR, PRESCHOOL FEEDING CENTERS ARE AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE COMMUNITY AND, IN ADDITION TO FOOD DISTRIBUTION, GENERATE A VARIETY OF SELF-HELP ACTIVITIES TO INCREASE WOMEN'S INCOMES AND VILLAGE FOOD PRODUCTION.

F) TRAINING - TRAINING OF ALL LEVELS OF PROGRAM PERSONNEL, I.E., FOOD HANDLERS, HEALTH AND VILLAGE WORKERS, AND PROGRAM SUPERVISORS, SHOULD BE AN ESSENTIAL PART OF ALL FEEDING PROGRAMS. IN PARTICULAR, TRAINING THOSE PERSONNEL WHO DISTRIBUTE FOOD, HAVE DIRECT CONTACT WITH THE BENEFICIARIES AND RESPONSIBILITY FOR NUTRITION EDUCATION, GROWTH SURVEILLANCE, ETC., IS CRITICAL FOR ACHIEVING PROGRAM IMPACT. IN THE PHILIPPINES DAY CARE PROGRAM, TRAINING WAS FOUND TO BE AN IMPORTANT FACTOR IN MOTIVATING PROGRAM PERSONNEL TO CARRY OUT NUTRITION EDUCATION AND OTHER NUTRITION-IMPROVEMENT ACTIVITIES AS PART OF THEIR DAILY RESPONSIBILITIES. AS PART OF THE MOROCCO FEEDING PROGRAM A NUTRITION INSTITUTE WAS ESTABLISHED FOR THE TRAINING OF SUPERVISORS AND FIELD WORKERS, DEVELOPING COURSE AGENDA, AND DESIGNING AND PRODUCING TRAINING MATERIALS. THE INSTITUTE ORGANIZES AND PROVIDES COURSES FOR 26 SUPERVISORS AND 500 VILLAGE WORKERS ANNUALLY. THIS TRAINING APPEARS TO HAVE CONTRIBUTED SIGNIFICANTLY TO THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE PROGRAM'S NUTRITION EDUCATION COMPONENT AND REDUCTION OF OVERALL MALNUTRITION OF PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS.

A BASIC TRAINING COURSE FOR THESE PERSONNEL SHOULD INCLUDE (1) USES AND PREPARATION OF TITLE 11 FOODS, (2) INFORMATION ABOUT LOCAL NUTRITION PROBLEMS, (3) INFORMATION ABOUT LOCAL FOOD AVAILABILITY AND FOOD PRICES AND COST-EFFECTIVE CONSUMPTION PATTERNS, (4) PEDAGOGICAL TECHNIQUES FOR COMMUNICATION WITH PARTICIPANTS (MOTHERS) AND DEVELOPMENT OF EDUCATIONAL MATERIALS, (5) INFORMATION AND FIELD PRACTICE FOR IMPLEMENTING A GROWTH SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM.

G) SUPERVISION - WELL PLANNED SUPERVISION IS AN ESSENTIAL ELEMENT OF FIELD SUPPORT AND FOR THE EFFECTIVE OPERATIONS OF PROGRAMS. LONG DISTANCES FROM CENTRAL HEADQUARTERS AND LIMITED COMMUNICATIONS BETWEEN THE FIELD AND THE CAPITAL CHARACTERIZE THE MAJORITY OF PROGRAM SITES. SUPERVISION HELPS TO ENSURE THAT PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION IS BEING CARRIED OUT AS PLANNED AND THAT STANDARDIZED PROCEDURES ARE BEING ADAPTED ADEQUATELY TO LOCAL NEEDS AND CONSTRAINTS.

A MAJOR FUNCTION OF SUPERVISORS IS TO SERVE AS AN INTERMEDIARY BETWEEN LOCAL AND CENTRALIZED STAFF AND PROVIDE NECESSARY FEEDBACK TO MANAGEMENT ABOUT LOCAL CONCERNS. GOOD SUPERVISION, REFLECTED BY FREQUENTLY SCHEDULED VISITS TO THE FIELD, IS ALSO AN IMPORTANT FACTOR FOR MOTIVATING FIELD PERSONNEL. IN MOROCCO, FOR EXAMPLE, MONTHLY VISITS OF THE SUPERVISORS TO THE FEEDING CENTERS HAVE GREATLY IMPROVED THE EFFICIENCY OF LOCAL WORKERS. THE ROLE OF THE MID-LEVEL SUPERVISORY STAFF HAS BEEN RECOGNIZED BY BOTH THE MOROCCAN AND PHILIPPINE GOVERNMENTS WHICH HAVE ASSU

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 04 OF 35 STATE 014324
THE COSTS OF THEIR SALARIES.

9697 241914 A106857

STATE 014324

9697

4) INSTITUTIONALIZATION - THE MORE SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS BOTH IN TERMS OF COVERAGE AND NUTRITION IMPROVEMENTS HAVE BEEN THOSE WHERE TITLE II RESOURCES ARE WELL INTEGRATED INTO ONGOING HOST GOVERNMENT PROGRAMS. IN THESE PROGRAMS, E.G., THE PHILIPPINE DAY CARE, THE MOROCCO NUTRITION EDUCATION PROGRAM, THE SRI LANKA THERIYOGA MCH PROGRAM AND CHILE'S TARGETED M-MALNOURISHED PROGRAM, PVOs AND HOST GOVERNMENT HAVE WORKED CLOSELY TOGETHER TO DESIGN PROGRAMS WITH NUTRITION IMPACT OBJECTIVES BY COMBINING RESOURCES AND HOST COUNTRY INPUTS FOR COMPLEMENTARY ACTIVITIES. ACTIVE INVOLVEMENT BY THE HOST COUNTRY USUALLY GIVES THE TITLE II PROGRAM A QUOTE SOME UNCQUOTE IN A MINISTRY-AND OFFERS ADDITIONAL HIGH LEVEL SUPPORT TO UTILIZE THE FOOD RESOURCES MORE EFFICIENTLY IN THE FIELD.

THE PHILIPPINE DAY CARE PROGRAM, IMPLEMENTED BY THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL SERVICES AND DEVELOPMENT, HAS RESULTED IN THE CREATION OF A NATIONAL INFRASTRUCTURE OF OVER 3,000 DAY CARE CENTERS TO ADDRESS THE NUTRITION NEEDS OF THE PRE-SCHOOL POPULATION. FOOD COMMODITIES FOR THIS PROGRAM ARE PROVIDED BY THE MINISTRY AND THROUGH THE TITLE II PROGRAM. THE MINISTRY HAS ALSO INVESTED SUBSTANTIALLY IN THE NUTRITIONAL TRAINING OF BOTH REGIONAL SUPERVISORS AND DAY CARE WORKERS IN ADDITION TO FINANCING THE SALARIES OF THE 12 REGIONAL NUTRITIONISTS. IN MOROCCO, SINCE 1973, THE GOVERNMENT HAS TAKEN OVER ALL THE ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES OF THE PROGRAM AMOUNTING TO SOME DOLS 4.7 MILLION ANNUALLY, INCLUDING ABSORBING THE REGIONAL SUPERVISORY POSITIONS INTO THE NATIONAL CIVIL SERVICE. THE SRI LANKAN GOVERNMENT IN 1982 WILL BE PROVIDING 42 PERCENT OF THE FOOD COMMODITIES TO THE MCH PROGRAM AND CLOSE TO 38 PERCENT OF THE COST OF THE TOTAL PROGRAM.

HAVING A TITLE II PROGRAM INSTITUTIONALIZED AS PART OF A GOVERNMENT PROGRAM WILL ALLOW FOR A SMOOTHER PHASEOVER OF THE PROGRAM TO THE GOVERNMENT IF IT SHOULD PROVE

COST EFFECTIVE. USAIDS SHOULD ENCOURAGE CLOSER COLLABORATION BETWEEN PVOs AND HOST COUNTRIES IN TERMS OF PROGRAM DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION.

IN MANY COUNTRIES, PARTICULARLY IN AFRICA, WHERE GOVERNMENT INFRASTRUCTURE IS LIMITED AND NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS ARE ACTING AS COUNTERPARTS, PVOs SHOULD HELP BUILD THE CAPABILITY OF THESE ORGANIZATIONS TO CARRY OUT ACTIVITIES IN THE FIELD AND ASSIST LOCAL COMMUNITIES TO ASSUME RESPONSIBILITY FOR THESE PROGRAMS. EXAMPLES OF INNOVATIVE ACTIVITIES INCLUDE THE CRS OILSEED PROJECT BEING TESTED IN KENYA, UPPER VOLTA, RWANDA, GAMBIA AND THE CRS SILO PROJECT IN RWANDA. THESE PROJECTS, AS COMPONENTS OF MCH PROGRAMS, ARE DIRECTED TO GENERATING INCOME THROUGH OILSEED PRODUCTION AND PROCESSING AND REDUCING POST-HARVEST GRAIN LOSSES SO THAT POOR HOUSEHOLDS CAN INCREASE THEIR OWN FOOD CONSUMPTION.

5. FOOD FOR WORK - STUDIES OF FOOD FOR WORK ACTIVITIES INDICATE THAT PROJECTS CAN BE EFFECTIVE IN BETTERING THE ECONOMIC STATUS OF RECIPIENTS AND, IF CAREFULLY DESIGNED, IN CREATING PRODUCTIVE PHYSICAL ASSETS, SUCH AS ROADS, IRRIGATION, WELLS AND IMPROVED AGRICULTURAL LAND. FOR THOSE INDIVIDUALS, ESPECIALLY WOMEN HEADS OF HOUSEHOLD, WHO HAVE FEW OTHER SOURCES OF INCOME OR EMPLOYMENT, FOOD FOR WORK CAN PROVIDE SUBSTANTIAL BENEFITS AS SEEN IN BANGLADESH AND LESOTHO. WHILE FEW EVALUATIONS HAVE ADEQUATELY ASSESSED THE LONGER TERM BENEFITS OF THE PHYSICAL INFRASTRUCTURE CONSTRUCTED BY THE PROGRAM, SOME CASE STUDIES IN INDIA, HAITI, AND LESOTHO SHOW THAT, IF PROPERLY PLANNED, FFW PROJECTS CONTRIBUTE TO POSITIVE DEVELOPMENT RESULTS.

THE MAJOR CONSTRAINTS TO THE EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE PROJECTS INCLUDE LOW WORK PRODUCTIVITY, LACK OF CONTROL OVER THE ASSETS CREATED BY PARTICIPANTS, AND POOR INFRASTRUCTURE MAINTENANCE.

THOSE PROJECTS THAT APPEAR THE MOST SUCCESSFUL IN OPTIMIZING BOTH INCOME AND DEVELOPMENT BENEFITS INCLUDE PROGRAM COMPONENTS, IN ADDITION TO FOOD, SUCH AS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, MATERIALS AND EFFECTIVE SUPERVISION. IN PERU, OPERATIONAL PROGRAM GRANTS AND TITLE II FUNDS ARE BEING USED TO FINANCE THE LOCAL COSTS OF A REPRODUCTION PROGRAM.

FOR NATIONAL PUBLIC WORK PROJECTS, AS IN INDIA, BANGLADESH AND LESOTHO, IT IS PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT TO COORDINATE WITH THE HOST GOVERNMENT OR LOCAL RURAL DEVELOPMENT ENTITY AND, WHEREVER POSSIBLE, TO LINK UP FOOD FOR WORK PROJECTS WITH THE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN. NON-FOOD COMPONENTS ARE ESPECIALLY CRITICAL TO THE PROPER DESIGN AND EXECUTION OF THESE SCHEMES. THE SMALLER, MORE COMMUNITY-ORIENTED PROJECTS, FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE PHILIPPINES OR UPPER VOLTA, SEEM TO REQUIRE A STRONG LOCAL ORGANIZATION TO ENSURE PROPER MANAGEMENT AND ACQUISITION OF MATERIALS AND TECHNICAL INPUTS. FOOD FOR WORK CAN BE INSTRUMENTAL IN STIMULATING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THESE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS. A RECENT EVALUATION IN THE DOMINICAN REPUBLIC SUGGESTS THAT FFW IS STRENGTHENING THE CAPACITY OF COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS TO MOBILIZE AND MANAGE LOCAL RESOURCES. FOR ALL FOOD FOR WORK PROGRAMS, THE ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN SHOULD BE SIMPLE ENOUGH FOR THE LABOR SKILLS OF THE WORKERS AND THE LIMITED SUPERVISION, MATERIAL RESOURCES, AND TECHNICAL EXPERTISE AVAILABLE. THEY SHOULD BE ORGANIZED AT TIMES WHEN THEY DO NOT COMPETE WITH FARM LABOR NEEDS AND THE QUANTITY OF FOOD DISTRIBUTED SHOULD BE MONITORED SO THAT IT DOES NOT ACT AS A DISINCENTIVE TO LOCAL AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION.

6. SCHOOL FEEDING - SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAMS HAVE A VARIETY OF OBJECTIVES RANGING FROM INCREASING SCHOOL ATTENDANCE AND ENROLLMENT TO IMPROVING PARTICIPANTS' HEALTH, LEARNING CAPACITY AND NUTRITIONAL STATUS. ALTHOUGH THESE SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAMS HAVE NOT BEEN EVALUATED AS INTENSIVELY AS MCH PROGRAMS DUE GENERALLY TO A LACK OF GOOD QUANTITATIVE DATA, STUDIES TO DATE HAVE NOT DEMONSTRATED A SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENT IN NUTRITIONAL STATUS, PARTICULARLY IN COMPARISON WITH THE RESULTS OF MCH PROGRAMS. NOR HAVE EVALUATIONS BEEN ABLE TO DOCUMENT SUFFICIENTLY THE EFFECTS OF SCHOOL FEEDING ON ENROLLMENT, ATTENDANCE AND ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE.

IN ORDER TO UNDERSTAND MORE COMPLETELY THE CAUSAL LINKAGES BETWEEN SCHOOL FEEDING AND NUTRITIONAL/EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIVES AS WELL AS THE INTERVENING VARIABLES, FVA HAS COMMISSIONED DR. BERYL LEVINGER TO REVIEW THE LITERATURE ON SCHOOL FEEDING AND TO MAKE SUGGESTIONS FOR THE IMPROVED DESIGN AND EVALUATION OF SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAMS. THIS STUDY WILL BE COMPLETED SHORTLY AND WILL BE PART OF A REASSESSMENT OF THE REAL AND POTENTIAL IMPACTS OF SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAMS.

7. CONCLUSION - RECENT EVALUATIONS OF TITLE II PROGRAMS HAVE UNDERLINED THE FACT THAT FOOD BY ITSELF IS NOT A SUFFICIENT INPUT TO BRING ABOUT DEVELOPMENTAL CHANGE. THOSE FOOD PROGRAMS THAT HAVE INCLUDED SOME OF THE CRITICAL DESIGN COMPONENTS SUPPORTED BY FUNDING FROM OTHER SOURCES, SUCH AS OPERATIONAL PROGRAM GRANTS AND TITLE II LOCAL CURRENCY PROCEEDS OR BY PARTIAL MONETIZATION OF FOOD COMMODITIES, HAVE SHOWN THE GREATEST POSSIBILITY FOR ACHIEVING LONGER TERM RESULTS. PROVISION OF COMPLEMENTARY RESOURCES,

BETTER INTEGRATION OF PROGRAMS WITH HOST GOVERNMENT AND MISSION ACTIVITIES, AND CLOSER COORDINATION WITH OTHER

UNCLASSIFIED

39

UNCLASSIFIED
Department of State

OUTGOING
TELEGRAM

PAGE 05 OF 05 STATE 314324

9697 041914 AIG6957

HONOR PROGRAMS MAY OFTEN BE AS CRITICAL TO PROJECT SUCCESS
AS THE TECHNICAL PROJECT DESIGN ITSELF.

NEVERTHELESS, IT WOULD BE UNREALISTIC TO EXPECT THAT EVERY
TITLE II PROGRAM CONTAIN ALL THE ELEMENTS DISCUSSED
ABOVE. EACH COUNTRY CONTEXT IS DIFFERENT AND RESOURCE
CONSTRAINTS AND IMPLEMENTATION PROBLEMS OFTEN OVERWHELM
THE BEST OF INTENTIONS. MANY OF THE SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS
CITED IN THIS MESSAGE HAVE TAKEN YEARS TO MATURE INTO
EFFECTIVE INTERVENTIONS. AID/W IS MINDFUL THAT THE PRO-
GRAMMING SUGGESTED IN THIS CABLE CANNOT BE ACHIEVED OVER-
NIGHT AND WILL MOST CERTAINLY REQUIRE ADDITIONAL RESOURCES.
SUCCESSFUL ACCOMPLISHMENT OF THESE INTEGRATING FEATURES
WILL REQUIRE CLOSE COOPERATION BETWEEN MISSION STAFF AND
PVOS. SINCE PVOS ARE THE PRINCIPAL DESIGNERS AND IMPLEMEN-
TORS OF TITLE II ACTIVITIES, THEIR ACTIVE ROLE THROUGHOUT
THE PROGRAMMING PROCESS IS ESSENTIAL. MISSIONS NEED TO
WORK COLLABORATIVELY WITH PVOS TO ASSURE THAT PROJECT DE-
SIGN REFLECTS A PARTICULAR COUNTRY SITUATION, WITH
ADEQUATE DATA AND ANALYSIS TO SUBSTANTIATE THE OBJECTIVES
SELECTED. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, AS NECESSARY, WILL BE
MADE AVAILABLE TO PVOS AND USAIDS. AID/W IS CURRENTLY
WORKING ON REVISING THE DOCUMENTATION AND REVIEW PROCESS
FOR TITLE II PROGRAMS AND IN THIS CONTEXT WILL ALSO BE
EXPLORING THE POSSIBILITY OF MULTI-YEAR PROGRAMMING. THE
SUBSTANCE OF THIS CABLE WILL BE REFLECTED IN FUTURE AFS
AND AER GUIDANCES AND WILL BE USED IN REVIEWING THE DE-
SIGN OF TITLE II PROGRAMS IN AID/W. SHULTZ

UNCLASSIFIED

Excerpt from FY 85/86 Evaluation Plan for FVA

IV. PL 480 TITLE II

Introduction

FVA's Title II evaluation strategy has been developed to provide information to address major programmatic and policy issues directed at increasing the impact of Title II resources. Major issues include:

- How can programs (MCH, FFW, School Feeding) be designed to increase the developmental impact of Title II commodities? What are the essential components of programs, besides the food, that are necessary for achieving impact?
- What inputs, materials, manpower, technical assistance, are needed to support more effective Title II programs?
- What are optimum ration packages for achieving specific program objectives, i.e., prevention of malnutrition, increased school attendance and enrollment, construction of public works projects.
- What are the management, administrative, bureaucratic constraints for implementing effective programs and how can these constraints be overcome?
- What are feasible and scientifically acceptable methods for evaluating the costs and benefits/effectiveness of Title II programs.
- What are the costs and potential impact of programs, when implemented effectively?

In addition to these issues as a basis for FVA's evaluation agenda, Congress has mandated that at least five evaluations be carried out to assess the nutritional and other impacts problems and future prospects for Title II activities.

FVA's evaluation strategy has evolved over the last five years from using one form of evaluation activity - the process evaluation - to using four or five different evaluation mechanisms to obtain needed information. FVA currently focuses its evaluation activities in five areas:

1. Special studies and Operational Research projects. These activities are directed to provide generalized information about how supplementary feeding programs work and how they can be improved. Examples of special studies recently commissioned include an analyses of the costs and benefits

of targeting strategies, a review of studies analyzing consumption effects of economic and food subsidy programs, a state of the art paper on Food for Work Programs, their design and effectiveness. FVA also commissioned a feasibility study to determine the costs and constraints to carrying out an operational research project to evaluate the consumption effects of Title II ration packages.

2. Process evaluations. These types of evaluations are collaborative efforts, undertaken by USAIDs, PVO's and host governments to examine the operations of specific country programs. These evaluations identify constraints to program effectiveness and recommend improvements in program design and implementation. Recent process evaluations with FVA support have been carried out in Peru, Indonesia, Haiti, and the Dominican Republic.
3. Impact Evaluations. The objective of this type of evaluation is to provide definitive information on program impact. Impact evaluations should be able to attribute observed effects directly to the program. The largest effort FVA has undertaken is the Senegal MCH Impact Evaluation which has been completed and technically reviewed. A workshop will be held in FY 1985 in Senegal to discuss evaluation findings and how the program can be improved. FVA is also assisting USAID/Haiti in completing the analysis of its impact evaluation of the Haiti School Feeding Program. Because of the costs and time involved in carrying out impact evaluations, FVA requires that a feasibility study be carried out first to determine if the basic program is operating adequately, that there is a definitive need by decision makers for such an evaluation, and that there is an in-country capability for collecting reliable information. During FY 1984 we have concentrated on reviewing and analyzing past impact evaluations (described below) and will be using these findings to guide our impact activities in FY 85/86.
4. Development of evaluation approaches and methodologies for assessing costs, outcomes and impact of programs.

Many attempts to carry out impact evaluations of supplementary feeding programs have failed because of incorrect evaluation designs and paucity of reliable data. In order to address these problems, FVA has carried out several activities which will help determine feasible and scientifically correct approaches to evaluating costs and benefits of Title II programs. FVA commissioned Dr. Beryl Levinger to review and critique existing evaluations of

School Feeding Programs. A workshop was held in May 1984 to discuss findings. The outcomes will provide a basis for FVA's work in SF during FY 85/86. A Consultative Group on Evaluating Nutritional Impact of Supplementary Feeding programs was brought together in September 1984 at Cornell University. This group reviewed and critiqued existing MCH evaluations and recommended scientifically acceptable evaluation approaches which would increase the validity of results. In addition to these activities, a guide and discussion paper for assessing cost-effectiveness of PVO projects has been produced and a manual for field use is being prepared.

Development of PVO capability to monitor and evaluate their own programs. FVA has begun to support a variety of activities which will help improve PVO and host government capability to manage and evaluate their programs more effectively. Those activities include providing grants and technical assistance to host governments and PVOs to develop information management and monitoring systems and to integrate evaluation design into new and ongoing programs. A grant to the Ecuador MOH is assisting that country develop a growth monitoring system as part of its national supplementary feeding program and has supported the development and implementation of a prospective approach to evaluation. USAID/India and CRS are currently testing a monitoring system for FFW programs and will likely initiate a program-wide system with FVA support. USAID/Indonesia and Bangladesh will be developing similar systems in FY 1985.

Lessons Learned

During FY 84 priority has been given to analysis and synthesis of existing evaluations and studies.

MCH

AID has carried out approximately 12 centrally-funded evaluations since 1981. Five of these evaluations have impact data that can be used to compare results. These evaluations include: the Sri Lanka Triposha Program, the Philippines MCH and Day Care programs, the Morocco Preschool Nutrition Education Programs, the Senegal MCH Program and the Haiti Community Health and Nutrition Program. The other evaluations provide information about how programs work and common problems. Major findings include:

416

During 2nd quarter FY 85 FVA/PPE will be developing an evaluation strategy for assessing the operations and effectiveness of selected 416 projects. Approximately three evaluations will be carried out in FY 85 and 86. In addition FVA/PPE will put together recommended guidelines for host countries and PVOs to assess the acceptability and utilization of 416 commodities in on-site/take home family feeding programs where dairy commodities have not been used before.

206

Six chronic food deficit African countries have 206 programs in order to promote food security through self-help activities and policy reforms. FVA together with the Africa Bureau will support at least two evaluations of 206 programs during FY 85/86. These evaluations will focus on the effectiveness of the self-help activities and policy reforms as well as explore emergency preparedness activities that could be undertaken as part of the 206 programs.

Donor Coordination

FVA will be working with WFP and other multilateral donor organizations to identify major evaluation issues, to develop consistent methodologies, and to share lessons learned. In this context, FVA will take an active role in the WFP assessment to be conducted by the Department of State during FY 1985. The State/AID/USDA team will examine issues of resource allocation, project design, collaboration with other donors, and effectiveness and efficiency of field activities.

The attached table provides information on specific evaluations scheduled in FY 1985 and FY 1986.

Utilization of Evaluation Results

FVA's Office of Evaluation has tried to utilize a variety of channels to help ensure that evaluation results are widely disseminated and effectively utilized. We consider our activities to disseminate information and provide it in a way that is appropriate and timely for decisionmaking to be critical responsibilities.

- During FY 84 findings from our analyses of the MCH, SF and FFW evaluations were used to write guidance for the PVO Operational Program Plan preparation cable sent to all USAIDs. Issues addressed included targeting, definition of coverage, clarification of objectives, complementary components and inputs. Previously we have written policy

guidance cables on targeting and program design based on evaluation findings. Lessons learned from our evaluation will be presented at the Regional FFPO's conferences during FY 85.

- The evaluation office prepared issues for all ABS reviews involving countries where process and/or impact evaluations were carried out, i.e. Indonesia, Peru, Dominican Republic, Senegal.
- Evaluation results which indicated that food alone would not achieve impact and which identified essential complementary components were the basis for the development and approval of a new Program Enhancement Project. This project will give grant funds to PVOs to develop strategies for design and implementation of complementary components in conjunction with their food program.
- Country evaluations have been instrumental in guiding USAID and PVOs with changes in programs. The Dominican Republic evaluation acted as an incentive for developing 3 year program plan and a new outreach grant for CARE. The Indonesia evaluation has resulted in the redesign of the MCH and FFW programs and a reallocation of resources between programs.

1984. Proceedings will be available in November FY 85. A cable or follow-up document written for USAIDs, PVOs, and host government offices, will be prepared to clarify evaluation approaches, uses, costs and time requirements needed to answer a variety of impact questions. This document should be ready by May 1985.

Several process evaluations will be carried out in selected countries in order to improve program operations and help with upcoming programming decisions. Country programs that have been scheduled for FY 85/86 evaluations include: Djibouti CRS Food and Nutrition Program, CRS Egypt Food and Nutrition Education, Bolivia Title II Program. The Djibouti evaluation will be used as a basis for design of a new OPG with greater emphasis on an integrated food and primary health care approach. FVA will assist the Egypt program to design an assessment of the progress of the new CRS MCH food education program and determine how to overcome existing obstacles. This information will be used to guide the phase down/over of the program. The evaluation of the Bolivia program will determine what additional technical assistance and/or resources as well as management improvements are necessary to increase the effectiveness of these programs.

Over the next two years, FVA anticipates carrying out a minimum of one and possibly two impact evaluations, in order to refine and test recommended methodologies for evaluating nutrition impact of supplementary feeding programs. The methodologies used would be based on the Cornell Consultative Group's recommendations. One evaluation will be carried out in collaboration with INCAP in Central America. Another would be carried out in Asia or Africa, in close collaboration with the host country and PVO. Feasibility studies will be carried out in the 3rd and 4th quarters of 1985 to determine the need, costs and evaluation design for the impact evaluations.

FVA will also be supporting several activities to help PVOs increase their capability to better manage and evaluate their own programs. Under FVA's new Program Enhancement Project all PVOs will have the opportunity to receive grant funds to develop better information management systems. The FVA Evaluation office will be working closely with PVOs to design this component of their grant proposals. The monitoring system, funded under the FVA grant to the Ecuador MOH, will be implemented in pilot clinics during FY 85, and information generated along with several cross-sectional studies will be used to evaluate the program in FY 86.

- In general it is preferable to target to the school rather than the individual.

FFW

Analysis of the Burundi, Lesotho, India, Indonesia, Peru and Bangladesh programs provide the following insights:

- FFW programs can be important income supplements for people in extreme economic need, especially women heads of households.
- FFW programs can help to improve rural, social and productive infrastructures when projects are well organized and designed. However, most evaluations have not adequately assessed the impact of assets created by the program. In order to analyze these longer-term results, special studies are needed to examine maintenance and distribution of economic gains over time.
- FFW programs typically have multiple objectives, which lead in many cases to a dilution of the overall impact of the program. There is in practice a tradeoff between maximizing development impact with FFW programs on one hand and, for example, employment generation in the most needy areas on the other. Priority objectives need to be considered in the design stage of the FFW activities.
- The level of management, technical assistance and complementary inputs usually available to programs is currently inadequate for achieving program objectives.
- In determining the commodity size and composition, it is important to take into consideration the existing labor patterns and in this regard whether the ration is considered as an incentive for community labor or as a wage payment.
- Community level institutions with effective participation by beneficiaries in project planning and management are critical to the creation of productive assets and the equitable distribution of longer-term benefits. FFW programs that are most successful build on and strengthen local organizations.

Implementation Plan

General

During FY 85/86, FVA will continue its efforts to synthesize, disseminate and apply evaluation findings. Activities include:

- Length of time in the program has had a direct positive effect on nutritional status of participants. Rates of malnutrition tend to be consistently lower for the segment of the population with the longest participation in the program.
- Food alone is usually insufficient to affect nutritional status of participants. Other essential program components include: nutrition education, growth monitoring systems, integration of health services, particularly ORT and immunizations. As shown in the Morocco evaluation, an education component substantially increased the effectiveness of the program. 33% of children receiving food were malnourished after 2 1/2 years compared to 11% of a comparable group who received food and education.
- There is evidence that supplementary feeding programs provide an incentive for increased utilization of health services. The Senegal evaluation for example indicated that program participants were more likely to use preventative health services than non-participants.
- There appears to be an important association between participation rates, defined as frequency of attendance and receipt of food by a participant and the nutritional status of the participant. For example in Cameroon, the rate of malnutrition was 8-12% higher in groups with low attendance rates than in groups with higher attendance. In Haiti, those centers with higher participation rates had substantially better recuperation rates.
- Coverage of target populations is low in most countries, ranging from 10-20% of preschool populations to between 5 to 10% of the malnourished. Asian programs seem to have the largest coverage of at-risk children, i.e., up to 60% in the Sri Lanka program.
- Household interviews indicated that sharing of food by all members of a participant family is common, particularly in Africa.
- A cost-benefit analysis of targeting strategies suggests that when there are high rates of malnutrition in a given geographical area, strict targeting to individuals based on nutritional criteria is not cost-effective. However, in those areas where malnutrition is relatively low, it is definitely more cost-effective to target on the basis of nutritional status.

- Preparation and distribution of a paper, entitled "Lessons Learned from Title II Evaluations." A meeting will be held with the PVOs and other offices in AID to discuss findings. This paper will be used as a basis for discussion at the Food for Peace Regional Meetings and other meetings, i.e. Africa Bureau Nutrition and Primary Health Care Conference in Abidjan in October 1985.
- Completion and testing of a manual to assess the costs and effectiveness of selected PVO projects including Title II projects. Case studies from Title II projects have been used to prepare the manual and several additional projects will be selected in FY 85 for the initial testing of the proposed cost/effectiveness methodology.

FVA will also be working with the Latin America Bureau to design and carry out an assessment of their PL 480 program which will include analyses of existing evaluations, i.e. Haiti FFW and MCH; DR and Peru program evaluations, ROCAP assessment of Central American food programs, etc. Issues to be addressed include: Adequacy of phaseover plans, coordination and effectiveness of programs, use of Titles I and II in response to economic austerity measures, etc.

Based on evaluation findings and lessons learned, FVA will be working with USAIDs and the PVOs to improve their operational program plans and with Regional Bureaus to strengthen their review of PL 480 programs.

MCH

During FY 85/86, FVA will continue its efforts to analyze and disseminate evaluation findings. Activities include:

- Workshop in Senegal with CRS, GOS, and AID to discuss Title II Senegal CRS Evaluation findings and recommended follow-up actions, February 1985.
- Completion and dissemination of a special study on targeting entitled "Targeting: A Means To Better Intervention" - which will include analyses of targeting strategies for Latin America, Asia and African situations. This paper will be used as a basis for a targeting session at the U.N. Subcommittee on Nutrition Task Force Workshop on Nutrition and Food Aid in January 1985.
- Distribution of proceedings from the FVA supported Consultative Group Workshop on Methodologies to Evaluate Nutrition Impact, held at Cornell University, September

- Methodologies for evaluating nutritional impact have been inconsistent. Feasibility studies including detailed evaluation designs and plans for addressing confounding variables should be prerequisites for supporting impact evaluations.

School Feeding (SF)

In 1983, FVA commissioned Beryl Levinger to carry out a comprehensive review of the evaluation literature on school feeding. The final product, a report entitled "School Feeding Programs in Less Developed Countries: An Analysis of Actual and Potential Impact" is a rigorous review of the results and methodologies of over twenty evaluations. A Workshop was held in April 1984 to discuss the findings and follow-up actions. Conclusions reached include:

- There is no definitive evidence that says SF programs are effective or ineffective. Studies to date have been methodologically flawed and results are, therefore, inconclusive. However, several studies do present evidence that increases in attendance, enrollment and school performance, as well as nutritional improvement have been observed.
- Educational objectives of SF programs, such as increased enrollment and attendance, are legitimate objectives under PL 480 legislation and Handbook 9.
- Program objectives must be carefully defined, with ration packages, targeting strategies and other components designed to specifically reach identified objectives. This means that SF programs with nutritional objectives would be designed differently than SF programs emphasizing enrollment. Size and composition of the ration in particular would vary with each objective.
- SFP are most effective when they are integrated into a rural development, educational or country nutrition strategy. SF programs should not stand alone but be part of total program for combatting malnutrition or increasing literacy rates, etc.
- Community participation seems to increase the effectiveness of SF programs.
- In order to have an effect on cognitive development or nutritional status, food should be combined with other program components, i.e. parent education, teacher training, health services.

Technical assistance will be available to CRS' Africa Programs for the review of their Growth Surveillance System with an emphasis on analyses and project-manager use of data. Case study materials will be put together describing the benefits and weaknesses of on-going monitoring systems. These materials will be used at PVO and FFPO officer regional conferences.

In 1984, FVA commissioned Dr. Ann Fleuret to carry out a feasibility study for the design and implementation of an operational research project to assess the consumption effects of Title II ration packages. We wanted two questions to be answered: could the intervening variables, besides the ration package which affect consumption be controlled for; and could results from several small intensive studies be generalized to other countries? The feasibility study has been completed. It answers both questions positively and recommends that we proceed with an operational research activity. FVA will be holding a technical review of the feasibility study and if found to be acceptable, we would anticipate sending design teams to the field by 4th quarter FY 85. Implementation of the studies would begin by 2nd quarter FY 86 and continue for approximately two years. Results of the operational research activity would help us determine optimum ration packages (size, and type of food) to achieve maximum consumption benefits for target populations.

School Feeding

The proceedings of FVA's School Feeding Workshop will be available for distribution during 1st quarter FY 1985. This document will be distributed to all USAIDs and PVOs with SF programs. Both evaluation and design recommendations will be highlighted.

TA and grant funds under the Program Enhancement Project will be available to PVOs for developing better management information systems as part of SF programs. This will include designing better monitoring systems for evaluating attendance, enrollment, performance, and nutritional improvement.

Further in-depth analyses of the Haiti SF Evaluation will be completed by 2nd quarter FY 1985. These findings should help confirm whether the Haiti program is having a significant impact on nutritional status, enrollment and attendance. Depending on the outcomes, both USAID/Haiti and the GOH will be making resource decisions.

Based on the Levinger report and subsequent conference discussions about the methodological problems involved in

carrying out rigorous evaluations, FVA does not have plans to evaluate the impact of any SF program during FYs 85 and 86. FVA will, however, earmark funds for assistance to PVO in designing, monitoring and evaluating components for demonstration projects. We envision these efforts to be small-scale such as the CRS Ecuador SF Program. During FY 85 FVA will be working with the ASIA Bureau to design an evaluation to assess SF programs' effects on female enrollment and attendance.

Food for Work

The paper entitled "FFW Programs" by John Thomas will be completed by 2nd quarter FY 85. This paper will provide a basis for a workshop to be held in the Spring of 1985. The focus of the workshop will be on how to improve the effectiveness of FFW programs as well as to discuss evaluation needs and approaches. Based on the workshop outcomes, FVA will plan its FFW evaluation strategy. During FYs 85 and 86, FVA, in collaboration with the ASIA Bureau, will be supporting the development and implementation of the India and Indonesia FFW monitoring systems.

Title II Emergency Programs

During FY 84 FVA supported the development of a surveillance system by the U.S. Center for Disease Control in Mauritania to monitor the nutritional and health status of drought-stricken populations. The results of the two surveys, carried out in Mauritania have helped USAID and the GORM better target and allocate program resources. In FY 85, FVA will support similar activities in such African countries as Upper Volta and Mali. It is anticipated that these surveillance activities may be institutionalized as part of their early warning surveillance systems.

During 1st quarter FY 1985, FVA will analyze field responses to a cable asking USAIDs for information on the planning and implementation of the AID emergency relief effort in Africa. Based on this analysis, in collaboration with OFDA and the African Emergency Task Force, FVA will support an assessment of selected issues, i.e. adequacy of needs assessments, procurement of vehicles, timeliness of food shipments, etc., in order to improve AID's emergency response efforts and help design 206 preparedness activities. This will be coordinated with the Food Data Needs Assessment Project which will provide funds and contract personnel to African Missions to improve their capacity to estimate food aid needs and strengthen host country food planning systems.