

Return to F.F.A./A.H.

Am. 4531 NS

PN-ANL-784

REPORT ON THE EVALUATION OF ACTIVITIES

OF THE

AFRICAN-AMERICAN LABOR CENTER

December 20, 1972

REPORT ON THE EVALUATION OF ACTIVITIES OF THE  
AFRICAN-AMERICAN LABOR CENTER

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
1. Introduction.....	1
2. General Framework for the Evaluation.....	3
3. Summary Conclusions and Recommendations.....	5
A. General Recommendations.....	14
B. Country and Project Recommendations.....	15
4. The Labor Scene and AALC Relations with African Unions	23
5. Activity Sectors and General Issues.....	28
6. Country and Project Evaluations	
A. Ethiopia.....	44
B. Kenya.....	58
C. Zaire.....	67
D. Togo.....	83
E. Dahomey.....	88
F. Senegal.....	94
G. Harvard Trade Union Training Program.....	97
Appendix A - General Framework for the Evaluation -- Scope Paper	
Appendix B - Israeli Histadrut Technical Assistance in Africa	
Appendix C - The French Force Ouvriere's Institut Syndical de Cooperation (ISC)	

EVALUATION OF THE PROGRAM OF THE  
AFRICAN-AMERICAN LABOR CENTER (AALC)

1. Introduction

In the fall of 1971, agreement was reached between A.I.D. and AALC for the first comprehensive evaluation of the latter's program in Africa that has been in operation with A.I.D. support since 1966. Normal A.I.D. evaluation procedures were to be followed with the understanding that this initial evaluation would be carried out jointly by an outside consultant on behalf of A.I.D. together with representatives of the AALC. It was expected to serve as a pattern for periodic evaluations to be undertaken on an annual basis by AALC to phase in with the timing of annual program negotiations. The evaluation was scheduled for the summer of 1972 after A.I.D. selected Joseph Mintzes as its outside evaluator, and AALC in turn assigned the task to Lester Trachtman and David Brombart, Assistants to the Executive Director of AALC for programs in the anglophone and francophone African countries respectively.

In developing the design for the evaluation, an effort was made to include as many AALC activities as feasible in the planned field examination, taking into account time and cost factors involved in covering the widely dispersed program (which covers

about 20 major or institutional projects and numerous "impact projects" in over 33 countries). Preparatory work for the evaluation, which started in July, involved the selection of countries and projects which could be included in the field examination, the preparation of an agreed evaluation scope paper (see Appendix A) and the development of logical frameworks and related questions for the major projects to be examined in line with A.I.D. evaluation procedures.

In line with the foregoing, field visits were arranged to examine AALC activities in Ethiopia, Kenya, Zaire, Togo, Dahomey and Senegal. Although the direct field examination was necessarily limited to this coverage, the varied scope and geographic distribution of the AALC activities to be covered appeared to provide an adequate basis for observations that would be applicable to the program as a whole. Field visits to these countries took place in the latter half of September and during most of October. All the country visits were undertaken jointly by the outside evaluator and the respective AALC representative, except for brief visits by the former to Paris and Israel (en route to and on return from Africa) for background on other union-to-union assistance activities envisaged or carried out with donor government support in Africa.

Important AALC activities in Nigeria and Ghana were excluded because of political factors; the mostly new but potentially

useful activities in the emerging independent countries in southern Africa were neglected due to logistical problems in encompassing these geographically remote areas in the field trip. The AALC support of activities of International Trade Secretariats (ITSs) could not be covered because no activities were underway during the evaluation field visits to African countries. However, a limited evaluation of these activities undertaken by a representative ITS, the International Federation of Petroleum and Chemical Workers, will be made in the near future.

The evaluation benefited from the close cooperation of the AALC staff in New York and in the field and by the interest and advice of U.S. Government officials in the countries visited. (These generally included the Ambassador and Embassy Labor Officer and senior USAID Mission officials.) Field interviews included staff and technicians directly carrying out the various projects, and African participants, union staff and officers, employers, government officials and university authorities.

## 2. General Framework of the Evaluation

In the evaluation, the various AALC projects and activities were examined in light of the program's basic goals of:

- a) strengthening the free and democratic unions of the countries in which AALC operates (Section 601 of the Foreign Assistance Act of 1961, as amended);

- b) contributing to the economic and social development of those countries; and
- c) increasing popular participation (Title IX) in the development process.

The evaluation took account of the political, economic and social climate which largely governs the scope and nature of AALC activities in each of the countries visited. In the country evaluation reports, below, brief summaries of this setting are included. Wherever possible quantitative assessments of results have been made; however, much of the broad inter-related political, economic and social goals of the program do not lend themselves readily to such examination and to a considerable degree qualitative indicators necessarily had to be relied upon.

The approach and style of AALC operations, which emphasize union-to-union relations, entered into the examination of the various activities. Besides considering the relative effectiveness of the various AALC activities in meeting objectives, the evaluation pointed up lessons from this experience that could be used in future program planning. As an initial evaluation, a major purpose was the development of AALC's in-house capability in providing an on-going evaluation of its activities. Some attention was devoted to the relationship of AALC with the trade unions and governments in the host countries and with the USAID Missions and Embassies. Account was taken of the special non-

governmental institutional characteristics of the AALC. Both national and regional projects of the AALC were examined in the field visits in Africa. These visits were supplemented by interviews at the Harvard Trade Union Program, to which the AALC has sent a number of African participants (four trainees were in the current class).

The report which follows is introduced by the summary conclusions and related recommendations with respect to the program as a whole; those for AALC activities in the various countries follow. Background is then provided on the labor scene in Africa and on relations of AALC with African unions. Evaluation reports of the individual projects and activities are provided in the country reports which follow. The latter are introduced in each case by brief descriptive accounts of the country labor, political and economic setting in the respective countries. An account is also included in this section on the Harvard Trade Union Program (TUP). Relevant background is found in the appendices on the Israeli Histadrut's Afro-Asian Center and on plans of the French Force Ouvriere's Institut Syndical de Cooperation, a newly created French union-to-union institution to be primarily active in francophone Africa.

### 3. Summary Conclusions and Recommendations

In general, AALC activities examined in the evaluation are effectively meeting project objectives. Their impact on the

long range goals of strengthening free trade unions and increasing popular participation varies, depending on the overriding socio-political and economic factors affecting trade unions in African countries. These factors, of course, influence the nature of AALC activities which differ widely among the countries covered by the field visit. The more comprehensive programs, in particular those with significant trade union education activities as in Ethiopia and Zaire, have under difficult circumstances made important contributions to these goals. Others, such as vocational training in Kenya and activities that are largely in the governmental domain, by their nature usually have a more limited or indirect impact on these over-all objectives. However as a group the AALC projects in varying degrees have been contributing to the economic and social development of Africa.

AALC has displayed considerable resourcefulness and imagination in its activities in light of operational difficulties in one-party states where political constraints limit the role of trade unions. It has also managed to deal effectively, with only minor bruises, in familiar patterns of union rivalry and factional differences in African countries. AALC's pragmatic approach in gearing its activities and style of operation to the African environment is particularly commendable. This, at times, has meant avoidance of familiar American trade union patterns which

are not applicable and bringing in more relevant experiences as for example in projects on cooperatives, vocational training and social programs (such as industrial health services). It has generally used resources for construction of facilities and provision of equipment effectively in supporting program goals. AALC's construction of the trade union headquarters building in Addis Ababa is a notable example of highly favorable results from use of this form of assistance in a critical situation.

To the outside observer, the varied nature and differing intensity of AALC activities in Africa raise questions as to why specific programs are undertaken in a given situation, what are the implied criteria and how are priorities among competing calls on limited resources and personnel determined. Various factors are involved in the decisions on assistance; these of course are subject to the vagaries of governmental changes in Africa and bear on such factors as the political and economic position of labor and its leaders in the respective countries, the institutional structure of the labor movement, the experience and related degree of sophistication of the trade unions and not least of all the needs as perceived by the unions, keeping in mind the limited resources available to the AALC.

Major attention is focused by AALC on the most important countries and on critical areas both from an economic and

political point of view. At the same time, an attempt is made to maintain some presence wherever the labor-political climate permits outside assistance of this nature, even in the smaller and less important countries -- at least through impact projects and contacts of the regional AALC representatives. At times, in order to keep lines of communication open, only token but still useful activities are undertaken until more significant projects may again be considered. This flexibility, quick response time to meet urgent requirements and a pragmatic approach in its activities have all contributed to the over-all success of AALC programs in Africa. The following summary of conclusion of observations with respect to the main categories of AALC activities examined in the evaluation include some comparative indications.

#### Trade Union Education

Among the activities examined in the field visit, trade union education activities make the greatest contribution to the broad labor and popular participation goals. It would seem desirable for AALC to keep close watch over these activities to assure a timely phase-out of general workers education activities in favor of more advanced trade union training as in Ethiopia and Zaire. Plans for such a phase down should be scheduled for the time when the project becomes an accepted element in the African union's regular activities and their staff is in effect

carrying out the program. The phase-out plans should prepare the unions for the need to budget resources to support what has become a normal on-going requirement. AALC should at the same time move on to support more advanced or specialized training. As part of this category of AALC-supported activities, the Harvard Training Program appears to have been making a very important contribution in leadership training for the relatively small but key groups of English-speaking African trade unionists sent to the U.S. for training.

#### Vocational Training

The limited possible role of unions in most AALC-supported vocational training activities makes them less significant with respect to the broad free trade union goals than the trade union education activities. In-service training for up-grading skills of workers already in industry seems more useful than normal vocational training at roughly the post-secondary level as far as union involvement is concerned. However, important economic and social development goals of the program are met by these projects. Since most of the vocational education activities and some of the social programs are largely in the governmental domain in African countries, care should be exercised that AALC projects are coordinated with the over-all programs of the government agencies involved, and that the latter are encouraged to meet this priority requirement of worker skill improvement in Africa.

(Outside assistance of all kinds for vocational training should be encouraged in view of the enormous needs.) Planned phase-out plans of some AALC vocational training activities and follow-up on participants are areas that may need some strengthening.

#### Cooperatives

AALC's projects relating to cooperatives are generally useful, with the regional training project in Dahomey particularly noteworthy. The regional aspects of this project are excellent and have contributed to the success of the project and to the favorable outlook for its phase-out. However, the trade union role is relatively more important in the individual cooperative projects elsewhere (mostly impact projects) as in Ethiopia and Zaire.

#### Buildings and Equipment

Construction of facilities and provision of equipment has been largely a successful tool employed by the AALC. The headquarters building, constructed by AALC for the Ethiopian union, has made a major contribution to the effectiveness of this young labor organization. A workers education center in Lome represents a relatively modest outlay and innovative design; its potential should be fully realized after union differences are resolved. Provision by AALC of a mobile clinic to the Ministry of Labor in Dahomey may have been a little premature since governmental plans on its use in an industrial health program have hit some snags.

### Other Summary Conclusions

AALC's new departure of embarking on a vocational training project in Dakar with some help from the French Force Ouvriere's ISC and the French government may open opportunities for further cooperative activities with the ISC and possibly with other donor labor institutions. In some cases AALC assistance has been coordinated with other donors (e.g., in a crash shop stewards' training program in Zaire) or has brought experts or lecturers from other countries. Continued cooperative activities and coordination of these types should be encouraged.

Relations of AALC staff and Embassies and USAID Missions appeared to be satisfactory from observations during the field examinations. However, there may be areas in which AALC activities could help support A.I.D. priority objectives more, if opportunities were systematically examined by the USAID Missions and perhaps by A.I.D. in Washington. In general, there would be some advantage also to A.I.D. in sending periodic reminders to the field on guidelines governing the AALC program in view of the frequent turnover of USAID Mission personnel. Both the U.S. elements overseas and AALC have occasionally inadvertently publicly alluded to A.I.D. financing of the latter's program. The significance of these slips did not appear important since there is fairly wide knowledge of governmental relations with this and other foreign union aid activities in Africa. AALC's

ability to continue to operate on a union-to-union basis with adequate flexibility is the important factor. There may be some neglect by the USAID Missions to normal coverage and contacts with labor ministries due to an erroneous impression that the AALC covers this entire area of activity. An examination of this possible problem might be useful for A.I.D. perhaps with the help of the Labor Department.

AALC headquarters support generally appeared to be adequate. Much of the AALC field operation depends on AALC-NY direct supervision. Where experienced field representatives are on-the-spot, this task is much less difficult than where technician or less experienced administrative staff are primarily involved. Some bolstering of support may be needed in the latter cases and necessary budget and personnel requirements should be examined with AALC. In general, morale and motivation of AALC staff are good.

In carrying out the evaluation, considerable attention was paid to one of its purposes -- the development of a capability by AALC to carry out evaluations of its program on a regular basis. As noted in the introduction, all steps in the development of evaluation were carried out jointly by the outside evaluator and AALC representatives with periodic consultations with the AALC Executive Director and his Deputy in New York and, of course, with A.I.D. in Washington. The field staff were generally

prepared for the evaluation on the basis of advance communications from AALC-NY. The idea of arranging interviews with people not normally among their contacts was puzzling to some (i.e., contacting employers' representatives, some government agencies and university people). However, they quickly adjusted to this new requirement and performed adequately.

Hopefully, this initial experience with the evaluation and the results could be of some help to A.I.D. and AALC in serving as a bench-mark for future evaluations which could be carried out annually by AALC to phase into the period of program negotiations. In preparation for periodic evaluations, reporting from the field could begin to include more systematically the types of evaluative material and data that were requested during the field visits. In particular, follow-up would be strengthened by these evaluations as would interim reporting from the field with respect to progress on broad program goals as contrasted with immediate project objectives.

The following recommendations reflect the foregoing as well as observations in the Report. These are divided into two parts: the first part applies to the program generally; the second relates to specific countries and projects and is also found in the evaluations in Section 6 of the Report.1/

---

1/ These recommendations were repeated for the convenience of readers interested in particular countries.

## A. General Recommendations

1) Efforts should be made to phase-out general workers education in favor of more advanced trade union training in a timely fashion, particularly in situations where African unions are able to take care of practically all the substantive aspects of the former (e.g., Zaire and Ethiopia).

2) In-service vocational training should be favored over normal post-secondary school level of formal vocational training when considering industrial training projects. (Maximization of the trade union role should, of course, be a major consideration and institutional arrangements for phase-out should be assured.)

3) Appropriate regional projects should be encouraged and should include institutional arrangements which provide for regional participation in all aspects of the project, including direction.

4) AALC should encourage joint or cooperative assistance activities in Africa with other foreign trade union donor groups such as the Force Ouvriere's ISC, etc.

5) Headquarters support should be strengthened with respect to African activities where experienced field representatives are not on-the-spot and where AALC has to depend

largely on technicians or less experienced administrative staff. (Budget and personnel requirements should be examined by AALC and A.I.D.).

6) The evaluation should serve as a bench-mark for periodic in-house AALC evaluations. (Field staff reporting should be geared to this requirement and related follow-up activities should be encouraged.)

7) USAID Missions should arrange periodic meetings with AALC staff to exchange views on how AALC activities could help further A.I.D. priority objectives. (Similar meetings should also be considered between A.I.D./W and AALC/NY senior staff.)

8) A.I.D. and USAID Missions should keep in mind possible needs of Labor Ministries not covered by the limited AALC activities affecting the governmental sector. (The U.S. Department of Labor could be of assistance in this potentially important area of concern.)

#### B. Country and Project Recommendations

(Note: Brief summary conclusions introduce the recommendations. This material is also included at the end of each of the evaluation reports in Section 6, "Country and Project Evaluations").

1) Ethiopia: All indicators in the course of the evaluation confirmed the effectiveness of AALC activities in meeting project objectives and in making a major contri-

bution under rather difficult circumstances to the broad program goals with respect to free unions and popular participation and to economic and social development. AALC's use of resources has been very imaginative and efficient.

The following are the evaluation recommendations:

a) Within a reasonable time after an envisaged dues check off system is established, CELU (Confederation of Ethiopian Labor Unions) should be encouraged to absorb the six field workers, now concerned with workers education, into its regular staff.

b) Increasing attention should be given to upgrading trade union training activities by emphasizing shop steward and leader training, including specialized seminars.

c) Plans and preparatory work for the proposed Labor Studies Institute and related institutional arrangements should be moved ahead.

d) Periodic meetings between AALC representatives and the USAID Mission should be arranged to encourage the development by AALC of possible project ideas that could also meet A.I.D. priority objectives.

e) Efforts should be maintained to assure the smooth absorption of the in-service training activities into the comprehensive training program being developed by ILO for the Ethiopian Government.

f) The USAID and Embassy should be encouraged to use its good offices to bring in possible outside help to develop greater management competence in industrial relations.

2) Kenya: The two AALC institutional vocational training projects in Kenya are effectively meeting training targets. The printing and tailoring projects make a relatively modest contribution to the broad trade union goals of the AALC program. Economic development goals are being met by the printing project, but to a more limited extent by the tailoring project in view of the differing nature of the two industries. The trade union seminars (impact projects) make an important contribution to the broad labor goals of the program. The following are the evaluation recommendations:

a) The printing project should be definitely phased-out with the U.S. technician leaving no later than the end of 1973.

b) A last concerted effort should be made by AALC to phase-out the tailoring project by mid-1974; failing this, an effort should be made to find an alternative sponsor or preparations for liquidation should be made.

c) Future vocational training projects should assure an institutional base which would help facilitate a satisfactory phase-out.

d) Follow-up arrangements on trainees should be developed prior to the end of their programs.

e) Emphasis should continue to be placed by AALC on seminars and related trade union training activities as opportunities arise. For optimum use of resources efforts should be made to have the union increasingly introduce these activities as part of its regular education and organization program.

f) Periodic meetings between AALC representative and the USAID should be arranged to encourage the development by AALC of possible project ideas that could also meet A.I.D. priority objectives.

3) Zaire: AALC's comprehensive program of activities in Zaire over the past six years has made a significant contribution to the effectiveness of UNTZA, the largest union organization in black Africa. The specific project objectives have been met. There is some need to reorient the trade union activities to more advanced types of training. The accomplishments with respect to the broad goals on developing free trade unionism and encouraging popular par-

ticipation are limited due to governmental restraints under the one-party regime. However, AALC presence and assistance has probably opened channels of communication that can have a liberalizing effect. At the shop level, these activities have probably helped move the union into a more responsive posture relative to workers' demands.

The following are the evaluation recommendations:

a) AALC and UNTZA should be encouraged to move ahead on plans for a Labor Studies Institute, drawing on university and union specialists in Zaire and some American specialist talent. At the same time, lower level training, now carried out entirely by UNTZA staff, should be passed on to the union for financing.

b) The start made in using UNTZA resources and experience in training less well-endowed African unions should be encouraged by AALC. The location of the Pan-African publication center and the inter-regional activities involving CASOP (union health services) are good steps in this direction.

c) In the absence of possibilities for French-speaking union officials to benefit from the impact of the Harvard TUP in-depth observation of industrial relations patterns where popular participation is emphasized, alternatives should be explored (e.g.,

perhaps with F.O. collaboration in France, if radical political hazards can be overcome; or with the Histadrut in possibly arranging a modified seminar at the Afro-Asian Institute which would be mainly in the trade union rather than cooperative area).

d) Periodic meetings should be arranged by the USAID Mission with AALC representatives in order to review A.I.D. priority objectives which could be furthered by AALC activities.

4) Togo: Except for a temporary impasse with the union central organizations on the Government-appointed director, the Workers' Education Center in Togo appears to be a successful undertaking. Some re-examination of its function may be needed when and if cooperative AALC-ISC activities are expanded in the region. The regional AALC office appears well run; although it is too early to make any appraisal of the Economic Research and Documentation Center. Help in this sphere is definitely needed by Africa labor. As noted in the evaluation report on Togo in Section 6, economic research is a field in which American unions have been especially effective. It would be useful to draw upon this expertise directly or, in view of language limitations, through some U.S.-based advisory council to the Center that can help on specific union economic and social research and related policy issues.

5) Dahomey: The Pan-African Cooperative Training Center in Cotonou appears to be a significant accomplishment for AALC, perhaps most notably as the development of a fully regional training center of some value to union participants, as well as for those from cooperatives and government offices. This represents a well conceived project, with clear phase-out plans and institutional arrangements built in from the start. It is a possible model upon which AALC should try to pattern future projects. With respect to impact projects examined in Dahomey, the construction of an addition to the Labor Center seems after some delay to be nearing completion. Recent political developments leave plans on the utilization of the AALC gift of a mobile clinic to the Labor Ministry uncertain.

6) Senegal: It is too early to assess the prospects for the Tailoring and Design Institute which was to begin operation in November. The trade union role was still unclear as were the regional aspects. A most encouraging element of the project is that it represents a new departure of cooperative activity by the AALC and the French ISC supported by the U.S. and French Governments, respectively. Hopefully, plans for this project should work out satisfactorily and that future projects with ISC involvement would be more clearly orientated to the broad goals of the AALC.

7) Harvard Trade Union Program: The sending of African trade unionists to the Harvard Trade Union Program has been a very useful element in the AALC program and makes a valuable contribution to all its broad program goals. With the view to maximizing the potential of this program for African trade unionists, the following are the evaluation recommendations:

a) An experimental week's orientation program or alternatively a week at an American union office should be tried as a means of reducing the period of adjustment for African trainees.

b) In AALC projects supporting advanced trade union training in Africa, consideration should be given to adapting some of the Harvard TUP techniques, possibly by training instructors at the TUP and sending the TUP Director and other staff to provide technical assistance in introducing these methods. (Perhaps suitable African universities could also be approached on this possibility.)

c) Follow-up should be enhanced by trying brief refresher seminars or reunions in those African countries having an adequate number of graduates; the Director and possibly another staff member could probably cover several countries if arrangements are

carefully planned. (It may be of interest to note that Histadrut is gratified with its experience in follow-up seminars along this line with Afro-Asian Institute graduates - see Appendix B.)

#### 4. The Labor Scene and AALC Relations with African Unions

The AALC, which was established by AFL-CIO in 1965, built upon the very close fraternal relations developed by American labor with African trade union leaders that go back to pre-independence days. At that time, African unions were often the only permissible institutional framework in colonial countries where Africans could work for independence objectives -- albeit while ostensibly furthering the economic and social objectives of the labor organizations. Based on this experience, many of the African trade union leaders achieved prominent political roles in the early post-independence period. This relative political advantage of union leaders, of course, declined as time went on and other sources contributed more to the governing elites of the emerging countries.

However, the unions continue to provide a significant input in the political sphere and perhaps more importantly they are one of the few institutions that may provide a channel for popular participation in African countries that have increasingly come under one-party authoritarian governments and/or have succumbed

to military regimes. While at times obliged to carry out party tasks of mobilizing support for the regime, they nonetheless are directly exposed to popular pressures which cannot be readily controlled. Although the unions have not been immune to the tribal-political tensions that have plagued many of the African countries, these differences tend to be somewhat more muted in the labor unions than in other African institutions.

Throughout the pre-and post-independence periods since World War II, American labor generally benefited in its relations with African unions from its strong anti-colonialist position and the material and moral support it provided these poor and relatively inexperienced labor organizations. The evolving nationalism and Panafrikanism among the newly independent countries led many African unions to disaffiliate from the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) and other international labor confederations (with the notable exception of the industry-oriented International Trade Secretariats). The pattern of an evolving Panafrikan movement is still unsettled as efforts are continuing. The radical African unions have been the main force behind disaffiliation. In a number of cases, African unions found that much needed aid formerly providing from the international labor groups and from unions in the former colonial countries was difficult if not impossible to accept. The AFL-CIO

and other suitable bi-lateral donors (such as the German foundations, Israeli and to a lesser extent the Scandinavian unions) tried to fill the breach, generally with the support of their respective home governments.

Although ideological conflicts have been less virulent in Africa than in other developing areas, efforts to influence the African labor scene have been carried out by the Communist-led World Federation of Trade Unions (WFTU) -- which has lost most of its African affiliates -- and by unions from the various Communist countries and radical African states. So far, these efforts have had relatively limited results when contrasted with those of American and other free labor institutions.

African unions, which are largely urban-based, have developed in predominantly agricultural countries where often a major proportion of the population is engaged in subsistence activities. Only a relatively small part of union strength is found among plantation workers as contrasted with the transport, manufacturing and mining industries and, where permitted, among government workers and utilities. Unlike union history in the West, organized African labor in most cases does not represent a relatively disadvantaged economic and social group. Incomes in the industrial sectors are relatively high when compared with the general African population. Thus, unions may frequently emphasize non-

wage aspects of industrial relations, medical activities such as health clinics, vocational and literacy training, cooperatives credit unions, etc. At times, the union's access to the job market is a major asset in light of excessively high and rising unemployment in most burgeoning urban areas of Africa.

Collective bargaining, where it exists, operates under an anomalous situation. On the one hand, the suspicion and at times hostility of African governments toward foreign-owned companies, most often with offices in former colonial countries, favors the African union in possible conflict situations with the expatriate employer who generally predominates in the industrial community. On the other hand, the government usually as the largest employer is concerned about the possible spill-over effects of what it considers as unduly high wages in the private sector. The latter could affect the public sector's competitive attraction to skilled labor and result in wage pressures that affect the national budget as well as have a possible inflationary impact on the economy as a whole. (Union activity is proscribed at times in the public sector and where it is permitted collective bargaining is usually curtailed, even though union organization is generally accepted and often encouraged by the government for the private sector.)

On the employer's side, inexperience in collective bargaining and constructive industrial relations is a problem. The

habitual paternalistic pattern tends to color relations, even though the large foreign companies are represented more often by the generally more sympathetic personnel director than by owners or top management officials in negotiations. However, traditional social distances remain a factor in these relationships, particularly since relatively inexperienced unions are involved. With the possible exception of some of the small group of African-owned enterprises, the union position in the industrial sector is a far cry from the early history of hostility to trade unionism experienced in the West. (This comparative history may help to explain the greater sense of solidarity and attachment to unions that exists in the West than is evident in most African countries; it may also be a factor behind the relatively greater radical ideological tendencies in Western unionism.)

Africanization drives and the paucity of skilled labor have led to competitive efforts to attract experienced workers. Traditional tribal ties while weakened still persist in the urban areas to a considerable extent and reportedly make wage incentives at times less attractive than fringe benefits and social programs. The latter cannot be readily diluted by members of the "extended family" descending from less favored rural areas.

Against this background, AALC has been pragmatic in developing projects and activities to help the African unions. The close

personal relations of the AFL-CIO top leadership and AALC's Executive Director has made access to African union leaders and to former leaders now in the governments relatively easy. It should be noted that union-to-union assistance activities generally need formal governmental approval in the receiving countries or at least the government's informal assent. Relatively frequent informal contacts are maintained by AALC and provide an opportunity to develop and implement project ideas much more rapidly than the usual government-to-government types of aid programs in the labor sphere or for that matter similar programs of international union organizations and the ILO.

#### 5. Activity Sectors and General Issues

The range of activities included in the AALC program is rather broad -- covering projects on trade union training, vocational training, help on cooperatives, mobile medical clinics, building union facilities, providing equipment, developing credit unions, etc. Account is taken of aid to unions from other sources; at times, AALC aid for an African union is informally coordinated with that of another friendly donor labor institution to the same union. The activities undertaken in any given country depend on a number of factors: a) the size and strength of the labor organization; b) its experience and the related level of sophistication of its staff and leaders; c) the degree to which agreement can be reached among differing factions or unions within

the labor movement; d) the priorities as seen by the labor movement; e) the constraints placed on outside union help by the political powers in the country; f) the resources and expertise at the disposal of the AALC; g) language factors, with respect to the francophone countries; h) levels of education or literacy of workers also influence the nature of program activities that can be considered. In addition, observations and study in the U.S. are often too far removed from his home environment to be meaningful to the average African trade unionist. Thus, with the exception of advanced trade union training and very specialized studies, these factors favor the location of the bulk of training activities in Africa rather than sending participants to the U.S.

In the summary sections below, the principal AALC program activities in Africa are reviewed, followed by brief discussions of some general program issues.

#### Trade Union Eductions

Trade union education activities in Ethiopia and Zaire have made an important contribution to the growing effectiveness of the labor movements in both countries. Moving the programs from workers education on general trade union topics to more specialized seminars to meet requirements of collective bargaining is underway in Ethiopia. The national labor confederation, CELU, is expected to be in a position to take on an increasing proportion

of the costs of these activities, if pending labor legislation on dues check-off is passed. An envisaged project for a Labor Studies Institute could help significantly in meeting high priority needs of CELU. In Zaire, the AALC supports workers education and shop stewards (or cadre) training as well as some training on cooperatives. There is an apparent need to move to higher level training with respect to collective bargaining requirements as well as need for support of the Zairois union, UNTZA in its role in national economic and social policy advisory bodies. This objective could be helped by a pending proposal for a Labor Studies Institute, with the idea of having a highly qualified technician who might head the Institute also serve as an advisor to the UNTZA leadership. With the development of more advanced training and research activities, AALC should be able to phase down the lower-level training that is now carried out almost entirely by staff of UNTZA which should also be in a position to take on more of the costs.

Seminars in various specialized labor topics and for given industrial sectors have been a useful union education tool that has been supported largely by AALC impact project funds, particularly in Kenya. The AALC-supported seminars have been very well received and appear to make a useful contribution to the labor objectives of the program. As a way of maximizing benefits, there would seem to be some advantage to placing emphasis on the

financing of outside lecturers with respect to the use of AALC resources for these seminars, if the local unions cover more of the other costs.

The Harvard Trade Union Program (TUP) has been an effective element in providing advanced trade union training for selected English-speaking participants. It makes a particularly useful contribution in meeting the broad AALC program goals on free trade unionism and popular participation. Some of the TUP techniques might be considered for application in AALC advanced union training in Africa. There may also be some advantage to introducing more orientation prior to the beginning of formal class studies and for drawing on TUP staff in some follow-up meetings of graduates in Africa.

#### Vocational Training

Currently the various vocational training projects supported by AALC in the countries covered in the evaluation are meeting specific project training objectives. Delays have been encountered in a few cases in starting programs due to usual personnel recruitment problems and some inexperience in African governmental institutions concerned with the projects. While these projects do not have as great an impact on union growth and development as the union education activities, they get the unions involved positively in economic development considerations. The direct role of the unions tends to be limited -- more so in Kenya than

in Ethiopia -- but association with these activities tends to enhance their prestige.

In varying degrees, the unions help in selecting trainees for the printing and tailoring projects in Kenya and in the in-service vocational training projects on automotive maintenance and construction trades and electronics in Ethiopia. The need for up-grading skills of workers already employed was confirmed by most observers as well as by the workers and employers directly affected who found these types of projects useful. It was difficult to trace graduates who generally became self-employed and apparently were widely dispersed after leaving the tailoring institute in Nairobi.

Orderly phase-out appears promising for the printing project in Kenya with the establishment of a national industrial training levy that could bring in needed industry financial support; and for the in-service training projects in Ethiopia when an ILO assisted national training program becomes operative (hopefully in 1973) and as envisaged absorbs the projects. The outlook for successful phase-out of the tailoring project in Kenya, which is long overdue, is still unclear. On the basis of this experience it would seem that future projects should assure an institutional base which could take over the training (i.e., the Kenya Polytechnic in the case of the printing project, and the established vocational training schools that house the

projects in Ethiopia); in addition, training closely related to up-grading skills of workers in industry seems a much better risk than taking on essentially secondary school level vocational training where trainees do not yet have an attachment to industry. Of course, opportunities that maximize the role of the union should be sought at the same time.

### Cooperatives

As noted above, AALC's support of African unions in the cooperative sphere has been an imaginative approach by an AFL-CIO institution whose parent body is not actively engaged in cooperative undertakings. The regional cooperative training center in Cotonou has been carrying out a very effective program and plans for a smooth phase-out, to be accompanied by an expansion, seem to be moving along well. Individual AALC aided union cooperative projects, such as a consumer cooperative in Asmera and a laundry cooperative in Matadi, appeared to be well run, although the latter may face economic problems if envisaged contracts with ships entering the port do not materialize. Considering the well-known hazards of managerial difficulties in coops in Africa, AALC is moving cautiously in this field and has emphasized training which has applicability beyond the cooperative field in such subjects as financial accounting and administration, etc. The somewhat related AALC project for helping CELU develop credit unions in Ethiopia was at too early a stage to evaluate, but the

technician and trainees involved appear to be competent and very well motivated in what could be a useful area of activity for the labor organization.

#### Construction of Union Facilities, etc.

Building of union and related facilities has been an important and largely successful aspect of AALC activities in some African countries. The attractive union headquarters building in Addis Ababa, that AALC financed, has been a major factor in CELU's growth and effectiveness. A more modest regional building in Asmara, partially financed by AALC, will soon be completed and also promises to give the union a boost in the Eritrean area. Fuller utilization of the workers' education center constructed by AALC in Lome depends on the resolution of differences between the central labor federations and the government over the management of the center. The Lome Center reflects an innovative departure in design, including residential facilities for out-of-town participants, with relatively modest support from impact funds. Only in the case of the construction of an additional wing to the Labor Center (Bourse du Travail) in Cotonou did the AALC run into construction difficulties and, in this case, problems seem to be on the way to solution.

Construction, of course, is a relatively costly form of assistance and AALC appears to be very selective in such project activities. However, pressures for construction help from unions which feel they are less favored by AALC may become a problem.

Some indications of criteria for eligibility for assistance and of relative priorities may be useful in resisting marginal requests for such help from AALC.

Mobile Clinics, Family Health,  
Industrial Health, Pharmaceutical Supplies, etc.

AALC has assisted African unions in health and related fields in a number of ways. Essentially, the approach has taken into account an area in which African requirements are generally very great, in view of the shortage of facilities and qualified personnel, and where the unions institutionally are well placed to make a contribution in the urban areas. The union UNTZA health clinic in Zaire, which is under its mutual protection fund, CASOP (Caisse de Solidarite Ouvriere et Paysanne), has made excellent use of AALC assistance in the form of a mobile clinic and medical supplies. This activity, which AALC has helped develop and has used as a model elsewhere in Africa, is an important element in UNTZA's growing effectiveness in serving its members. Apparently, it has not noticeably distracted trade union leadership from priority union objectives in the industrial sphere -- an element that necessarily has to be taken into consideration with respect to unions less favorably endowed with resources and membership than UNTZA.

An industrial health program, involving the unions in Dehoney, was under discussion with the Ministry of Labor before the recent abrupt governmental change. A mobile clinic, provided by AALC,

has not been adequately utilized awaiting the development of this program which was to receive additional AALC help. AALC has sent over 25 drug shipments in response to requests from unions in 10 countries. The low cost of these shipments and their high visibility makes them effective impact projects. A family health clinic about to be opened with government technical support in the facilities of the tailoring institute in Nairobi promises to be a useful service to trainees and their families and perhaps members of the Clothing and Textile Union.

#### Regional Activities

The Pan-African Cooperative Training Center in Cotonou is the most significant regional activity supported by the AALC. It has been meeting and in some cases exceeding program objectives. Apparently, the Center has important regional involvement not only in trainees sent to its courses, but also in its apparently active Board of Directors which is composed of representatives from several OCAM countries. Prospects are excellent for AALC phase-out with African personnel taking on all functions. Regional elements of the printing training project in Nairobi are of relatively lesser importance. Essentially, these aspects are limited to a certain number of training places for trainees from neighboring countries in the courses which are given at the Kenyan Polytechnic. There was little evidence of regional involvement on program policy matters such as curriculum, student selection and

phase-out plans -- all of which by contrast were under the purview of the Board of the Pan-African Cooperative Training Center. This difference is probably due largely to the use of a Kenyan institution, the Polytechnic, as the umbrella for the school. Orderly phase-out, however, has been assured in both arrangements.

Other AALC regional activities observed were in early stages of development and the following are only preliminary comments. A Labor Economics and Research Center established in the Workers Education Center in Lome, is just tooling up. This is a field in which American labor experience has been outstanding and it would be desirable to develop an effective mechanism to draw upon U.S. trade union expertise. Possibly, AALC could establish an advisory board of U.S. trade union specialists who can provide guidance both with respect to research as a tool for collective bargaining as well as an aid in the evolving role of African labor in national economic and social policy.

A Pan-African trade union publication center was in even an earlier stage of development when the evaluation team visited Kinshasa. Essentially, this monthly mimeographed publication is intended to provide summary information on recent labor and economic developments in Africa for an African trade union audience. It largely excerpts newspaper and trade union journal items. AALC hopes that location in Africa with an African editor may make it easier to introduce articles by African trade unionists.

There may be some advantage in reviewing the market for this publication in the near future to determine whether it might include longer articles on specialized labor and related topics of possible direct use in the various AALC workers' education and trade union training programs in Africa. Alternatively (and perhaps preferably), these articles could be issued as monographs by the new center.<sup>2/</sup>

AALC has regional offices in Addis Ababa and Lome covering respectively East Africa and West and Central Africa. The main responsibilities of the regional representatives are to maintain contact with unions in their region and to help arrange and supervise AALC projects.

Headquarters Support, Supervision, etc.

In general, AALC headquarters support of field operations appeared to be adequate. Apparently, frequent field visits are required by senior AALC-NY staff both with respect to supervisory

---

<sup>2/</sup> The other AALC periodical, "The AALC Reporter", is primarily a monthly review of AALC activities, intended for rather wide circulation. It is published in New York in French and English. The publication draws on field reports of AALC activities, and evidently the staff reads the publication. It would be useful to query African trade unionists on the extent to which the publication is read. It was not possible to get systematic reactions during the evaluation visits. In most African trade union offices, it usually was included with many other labor publications in various degrees of accessibility. With respect to its circulation in U.S. labor circles, it probably helps to maintain awareness about AALC activities and may be of some use in recruitment efforts.

tasks as well as with program development and related negotiations. The intensity and frequency of such field visits, of course, depend to some degree on the qualifications and experience of the field staff. In addition, however, there is a need to maintain contact and interest at senior levels in the African labor movements and government circles if AALC is to maximize its effectiveness in achieving the broad labor program goals. In view of this heavy requirement "Home Office Support", budgeted at about 27 per cent of the total A.I.D. grant in 1972, with more than half going to regional AALC staff in the field, appears reasonable. (Actual headquarters budget represents only 12 per cent of the total grant.)

In addition to periodic field visits from NY, support of field operations is provided by apparently active communications, including periodic project progress reports from AALC field staff. An annual conference of AALC senior field and NY staff is held in Africa to review AALC program operations and labor, economic and political developments in Africa. At times, meetings with African trade union leaders who comprise an African American Consultative Committee are arranged to coincide with the timing of these staff conferences.<sup>3/</sup>

---

<sup>3/</sup> Somewhat broader periodic meetings of senior African trade union officials take place at the time of annual ILO conferences in Geneva and provide an opportunity for exchanges of views with AFL-CIO leaders. These sessions and informal meetings of a smaller type provide an opportunity to review AALC program developments and African trade union requirements.

A good example of excellent control and direction of the program can be found in Ethiopia, among the countries visited, where AALC has a senior permanent representative. Elsewhere, such control understandably did not appear as effective as equivalent A.I.D. direct hire programs which are supervised by the USAID Missions on the spot. Probably, the AALC would measure up well against regional A.I.D. activities and other contract projects which are probably faced with supervisory problems of a similar nature. An ever-present problem in such circumstances is the danger of relying unduly on technicians who may be less than objective when perpetuation of their functions is involved. This factor should be guarded against in cases where there is difficulty in meeting phase-out schedules.

A somewhat related situation that may require more frequent guidance by AALC is that of relatively inexperienced staff who may lose sight of important program goals when overly absorbed in day-to-day operations. To accomplish this, the required level of supervision may involve more frequent field visits and allocating more New York staff time than can be supported by the present budget. This factor should be considered when examining AALC requirements. It should be noted that these problems affect only a minor portion of the AALC program. In general, the direction was effective and morale and motivation of field and home staff was good.

## AALC Relations with USAID Missions and Embassies

AALC relations with USAID Missions and Embassies appeared to be harmonious in all the posts visited. In a few cases, there had been some confusion on the part of Missions with respect to their role vis-a-vis the AALC program with the change-over to the grant approach. It was apparent from our visits that systematic periodic exchanges of views with Missions on A.I.D. objectives would be mutually beneficial. AALC staff could help provide useful insights on labor developments in the respective African countries and AALC activities could probably be better geared to support changing A.I.D. priority objectives. There probably would also be some advantage to having such exchanges on a regular basis between A.I.D. officials in Washington and the senior programming staff of AALC-NY.

The degree to which the A.I.D. role in financing AALC activities is known abroad varies largely with the level of sophistication of local trade union and government officials. At times, U.S. official elements have transgressed the vague rules of discretion governing the financing of the AALC program and probably less frequently AALC field staff have apparently slipped on this score. In any event, the significance of such knowledge of this relationship has probably been exaggerated. Other union-to-union aid activities (e.g., of the various German labor foundations, the Israeli Histadrut and the Scandinavian unions) seem to be

relatively open about their respective governmental subsidies. This factor does not diminish significantly the advantages of informal relations on assistance matters between the foreign union representatives and local trade union and government officials. A major advantage of such aid is the relatively greater flexibility and speed as compared with direct governmental assistance. Apparently, the various foreign labor programs as in the case of the AALC do not involve direct formal intergovernmental negotiations.

These observations would strongly support the continuation of the AALC program financing as presently constituted. Open reference to and possible publicity regarding A.I.D. support should continue to be avoided. However, exaggerated efforts at disguising the source of funding to the extent of avoiding contact between U.S. and AALC personnel would appear to be unnecessary and of dubious value.

#### Labor Ministry Activities

The dividing line between technical assistance activities which are union oriented and those that are primarily in the governmental domain in African countries is often not clear. Some AALC activities in vocational training fields, perhaps less so with respect to cooperatives and possibly some in the social welfare field (i.e., health clinics) would fall into this category. Attempts are made by AALC to maximize the union role in these

fields with varying degrees of success. In any event, the projects have generally been useful in meeting social and economic development goals and identify the unions with desirable objectives. The origins of such activities often stem from long standing close contacts between the AALC and senior governmental officials (usually at ministerial level) who are or were trade union leaders.

There may be a danger that AALC activities of the foregoing types may unintentionally have the effect of preempting spheres of activity that could benefit also from normal government-to-government technical assistance, particularly with respect to labor ministries. The USAID Missions, which in any case do not have specialists in the labor ministry field, may erroneously consider it as an area covered by the AALC. Probably, inadequate contact is maintained by the USAID on possible technical assistance relative to critically important manpower and other usual labor ministry concerns for which possible selective U.S. help could be useful. The Labor Department could probably advise A.I.D. on priority labor ministry concerns that might be examined from time to time, particularly with respect to skill improvement and manpower utilization.

When providing technical assistance and other help to governmental operations, there is also a danger of distorting the services of these agencies. Outside assistance, as has been noted by many observers in the developing countries, can result

in the diversion of rather limited local resources and scarce qualified manpower to lesser priorities (although obviously "useful" activities in light of such broad needs in these countries) that happen to be attractive to aid donors and cannot be resisted by the recipient service. It was not possible to look into these factors during the evaluation of AALC projects in this sphere. (For example, would the proposed establishment of an AALC-assisted industrial health service in Dabomey draw away resources and people in the agencies concerned from higher priorities in this very poor country? etc. Unless one examines the overall program of the ministries concerned, it is difficult to answer this important question.)

## 6. Country and Project Evaluations

### (A) ETHIOPIA

#### The Setting

The Central Ethiopian Labor Union (CELU), which was founded in 1964, claims a membership of 90,000 in 146 unions -- nearly all at the enterprise rather than industry level. This represents a rapid growth from its initial strength of roughly 33,000 members in 35 unions. Undoubtedly, early governmental tolerance and encouragement, including enabling legislation, helped. However, the motivation and the resourcefulness of its youthful leadership as well as outside help, notably from the AALC, have been con-

tributing factors in this remarkable development in a relatively rigid traditional society.

CELU has been rapidly developing experience in industrial relations and has achieved considerable stature from its representative role in national tripartite bodies, but still needs some bolstering on the substantive side, because of its limited experience and inadequate technical support. While CELU has made substantial progress in the industrial sector, it has had only limited success among plantation workers in the preponderant agricultural sector. An unaffiliated union represents airlines employees. The construction industry is relatively unorganized and the biggest employer, the government, is out-of-bounds for the unions. Pending labor legislation, enabling the check-off of dues against wage payments, should when passed help CELU overcome its still precarious financial situation. Less than half of its members now pay dues regularly. CELU leadership has displayed commendable talent of quietly maximizing advantages without antagonizing the political hierarchy. (For example, it has avoided a confrontation with the government over the censorship of the union journal which has not appeared for seven months.

In this remaining African hereditary constitutional monarchy, the political scene is dominated by the revered and aging Emperor. Although liberalizing reforms were introduced by the Emperor in the early 1960's, including enabling legislation on trade union

organization, no political parties are permitted. Power rests largely in the hands of the Emperor, the Church and an aristocratic Amhara elite of large landowners backed by the military. Uncertainties over succession, tensions between the dominant Amhara political elite and the Tigrena of Eritrea Province, endemic border difficulties, and a large and influential military establishment color the political scene. Although the trade union movement may not be a match for the principal power elements in Ethiopia, it has developed a considerable degree of autonomy and is considered by most informed observers to be an important if not the only non-governmental institution which provides for popular participation. Some observers believe it has reached a degree of stature and effectiveness that its continued existence is no longer dependent on the benevolent support or tolerance of the Emperor and the power establishment. It has successfully overcome the hazards of tribal and religious differences and has become a recognized mechanism for communicating workers grievances and problems.

Some 90 per cent of the Ethiopian population is occupied in the agriculture sector where development has been inhibited by a feudal landowning system and related social structure. Rapid urban population growth, particularly in the Addis Ababa metropolitan area, and limited economic opportunities in the older industrial center of Asmara are reflected in an enormous urban

unemployment rate and in widespread urban subsistence activities. The union's role with respect to access to the job market in part helps to explain its growing influence. This is one of the spheres where possible favoritism reflecting tribal differences can hurt the unions; CELU is alert to this possible problem.

### Evaluation

AALC activities in Ethiopia have been of major importance in the growth and development of the effectiveness of CELU. The three major programs of Workers Education, Vocational Training and the provision of the headquarters building, have each made their special contribution. At the same time, impact projects have been utilized with considerable effectiveness in support of important union goals. There was practically universal recognition among the observers interviewed from among labor, government, U.S. Embassy and USAID, employers, university, international organization, and other trade union aid donors that the results of the AALC activities as a group represented an outstanding achievement. The AALC projects have effectively met specific project objectives and have contributed significantly to the broad program goals in the labor and economic development spheres.

### Workers Education

The Workers Education program has probably been the most important of the AALC projects that contributed to the growth

and development of CELU. AALC technicians have trained six field workers who are now carrying out an effective workers education program in such fields as the elements of trade unionism, running unions, organizing, and at times adult literacy training. A program of seminars, using special publications and audio-visual aids, have reached 70,000 people in the last 3 years. In addition to running the Workers Education Program, the field workers are in effect carrying out closely related regular union staff functions of organizing and assisting in collective bargaining. (For example, the field worker in Asmara recently assisted in negotiating the 18th CELU collective bargaining agreement.)

CELU and the AALC staff in Ethiopia believe that the time has come to move up to trade union education of a more advanced and specialized nature. Special seminars in training of shop stewards in grievance handling and of trade union officials in collective bargaining and the use of trade union research, etc., are contemplated. With the anticipation of increased income, when the provision for dues check-off is enacted, CELU should be able increasingly to take on the financing of most of the present relatively elementary Workers Education program. In particular, the six field workers could be integrated into the regular CELU staff and be financed by the union.

AALC resources that would be released could then help support advanced union training and a related proposal for a Labor

Studies Institute. An impact project has helped provide the framework for an Ethiopian Industrial Relations Institute, under Professor Seyoum at the Haile Salassie University, with which the Labor Studies Institute could be associated. These institutes could help improve industrial relations which are only beginning to evolve from an almost feudal base. In addition, the Labor Studies Institute could help provide the top CELU leadership with special studies and related technical support for use in their newly acquired positions on national tripartite bodies.

Inexperience of employers in constructive use of collective bargaining and industrial relations is quite evident and some attention should be addressed to this problem -- possibly the good offices of the USAID Mission and/or the Embassy might bring in interested foundation or other support. This would not be an appropriate activity for AALC, but some progress in developing employer competence would make collective bargaining more realistic and effective. It is evident that while the top union leaders and their staff have made considerable progress, this quality is not adequately shared by lower echelon leaders who require upgrading. The advanced union training and related research activities designed for this level could do much to increase the effectiveness of the labor movement.

## In-Service Vocational Training Program

CELU apparently has maximized the limited potential of the AALC supported vocational training activities in strengthening the union, while the projects fulfill their main function of developing much needed skills for the Ethiopian economy. So far, these projects have trained over 200 participants in accordance with project objectives, taking into account revisions due to early recruitment problems. In the vocational training projects in both Addis Ababa and Asmara, the union plays an active role in assisting in the selection of trainees, helping to obtain their release in most cases from employment to enable attendance and, with the unavoidable exception of construction training activities in Addis Ababa, of including some union promotional elements in activities related to the program. (The construction industry in the Addis Ababa region, because of its structure and management, has not been amenable to unionization, so far.)

CELU has effectively used the vocational training program to make the government conscious of the need to up-grade skills of workers employed in industry by providing special training programs for workers with limited academic background -- as contrasted with the usual style of formal secondary school vocational training. (The latter type of training, incidentally, fared poorly when employers compared it with AALC's in-service program.)

On-site examinations of the projects in operation (the automotive maintenance courses in Addis Ababa were not in session)

and discussions with staff and some students generally indicated that the selection of trainees was good, instruction competent and that the students benefited. The Asmara school was the more impressive of the two schools, both from the viewpoint of the scope of studies and of the apparent motivation of the students. A spot survey of some employers who either were sending or had sent workers to the training programs and some workers at their places of employment, generally indicated that the projects were meeting training objectives. The lively demand for training and the qualifications of candidates for the limited number of openings also confirmed this observation. On the basis of an admittedly small sample of employers interviewed, there may be need for more frequent briefings of management (personnel officials, in particular) about the various courses and providing them with copies of the rather informative instruction manuals.

The training projects are housed in existing training institutions (the Building College and Tafari Mekonnen School in Addis and the "Point Four" School in Asmara) and benefit from the day-to-day supervision of the regular professional staff. A full-time AALC Administrator is no longer needed. In general, the equipment of the schools appears adequate and the training competent. The AALC technician manages to control the usual exuberance of instructors in seeking equipment.

Phase-out of AALC support, but with continued CFLU involvement in the continuing programs, depends on progress in an ILO

project which has been developing a comprehensive training policy and related program for the Ethiopian government. It is currently envisaged that this program will take effect in 1973 and will provide for the absorption of the in-service training programs. A facility for these activities is nearing completion in the Addis region. (In passing, it should be noted that the ILO program was being discussed before the AALC had initiated talks on the in-service training project. In the meantime, the AALC projects have become fully institutionalized and have trained about 200 participants.)

CELU Headquarters Building in Addis Ababa and Regional Building in Asmara

In 1969, the AALC erected an attractive modern three-story building for the labor movement in Addis. It has become the focal point for CELU's administrative structure and daily operations and has undoubtedly contributed to the remarkable progress of the Ethiopian labor movement in its short history. A widely respected Ethiopian observer of the labor scene, Professor Seyoum -- cited above, believes that CELU would have collapsed without the building. Looking at the union's old headquarters building tended to confirm this observation.

The new building is fully utilized. The CELU Secretariat uses most of the office space. The top floor is rented out for the time being and largely finances the operations of the rest

of the building. AALC regional offices are located in a few rooms on the second floor. CELU plans to take over the top floor eventually for use by various affiliated unions in the Addis region -- presumably when its finances become more stable with the adoption of the dues check-off, cited above. Its auditorium facilities are utilized almost every night by union as well as by community activities. The basic facilities were augmented by donations of equipment and furniture from various foreign labor groups.

The Asmara regional CELU headquarters building, which is being constructed with the help of an AALC grant of \$22,500 and the provision of architectural assistance, should be completed by the end of this year. It is a more modest structure than the national headquarters, but attractive and a vast improvement over the present facilities for this active regional union. It should enhance the effectiveness of operations of CELU in this important industrial center.

Impact Projects (Union Consumers Coop in Asmara, Credit Union Development and Preparatory Work on Labor Studies Institute)

On the basis of direct examination of the three impact projects cited above, it is evident that this useful tool is being employed in an imaginative and effective manner by AALC in Ethiopia.

A loan of \$10,000 to the Consumers Cooperative organized by the CELU branch in Asmara has been fully repaid on schedule.

The main product sold at the coop store is teff, an Ethiopian staple grain used in making their daily food. By advantageous purchases in large quantities, the coop is able to achieve considerable savings. The small coop seems a model of efficiency and organization particularly when considering well-known hazards in African coops. It has over 700 members who use its facilities. A careful check is kept on each customer through pictures on index cards and it maintains a good system of record keeping which is examined periodically by the government office concerned with coops. Credit unions and cooperatives hold considerable promise for future assistance and benefits for the Ethiopian worker. The value of the Asmara Cooperative is not so much in its own success as in the example it sets for what dedicated and motivated union leadership can do for their membership with proper management.

The team also met with the AACU credit union technician who has regional specialist responsibilities for AACU. He has begun a program of training three Ethiopian field workers to supervise the development of credit unions at enterprises in urban centers in various parts of the country. Both the technician and the field workers displayed a high degree of motivation and dedication to their work. It is too soon to determine the outlook of this program, but it has the enthusiastic support of the CELU leadership.

A grant of \$8,650 has been extended to the Ethiopian Labor Studies Institute which is associated with Haile Selassie University. As discussed above, there is considerable need to enhance the union's capability with respect to the specialized requirements of collective bargaining and in its role in advisory bodies. The research activities envisaged in the Institute will be closely geared to union specialist and leader training plans which CELU and AALC are currently considering.

Relations with USAID and Embassy, etc.

The evaluation team had useful entry and exit visits with the USAID Mission and also benefited from meetings with the Ambassador and members of the Embassy staff, particularly the Labor Attache. Generally, observations regarding the effectiveness of the AALC activities and the progress made by CELU with this help were very positive. Relations between the U.S. Government elements and the AALC staff apparently are good. However, there may be need for the field to be informed periodically about the new relationships with AALC under the grant arrangement in view of the high turnover rate of personnel in the USAID Mission. Of particular note in the meetings with the USAID Mission was the interest in possibilities within the scope of AALC activities for the support of certain priority A.I.D. objectives. The USAID prepared a useful memorandum (Morse to

Miller, dated October 2, 1972) which outlined some suggestions that could be considered by AALC. Hopefully, sessions such as these should be arranged periodically with the idea of following up on these suggestions as well as reviewing new ideas.

AALC assistance to the trade unions is well known by most segments of the Ethiopian community and at least on one occasion an attempt was made to exploit this relationship during political tensions (i.e., the student protest movement of about a year ago). There apparently was little if any repercussion stemming from this isolated case. This type of problem is, of course, almost unavoidable in labor assistance activities in the developing countries.

Since the Harvard Trade Union Program is covered separately in the evaluation report, mention is only made of the very positive impressions obtained in the interview and observations of the work of one of its graduates, CELU's Secretary General Isfeta Tekie. Apparently, training at Rutgers University's Industrial Relations School has also been found to be useful by the field workers interviewed in the course of the evaluation. AALC has used training in the United States on a selective basis as a means of supplementing its program in Ethiopia with apparent effectiveness. In connection with the training of hotel workers at a school furnished by Switzerland and managed by an Israeli technician, AALC has arranged for the training of two Ethiopian technicians (members of CELU) at Cornell University's hotel training school.

## Summary and Recommendations

All indicators in the course of the evaluation confirmed the effectiveness of the AALC activities in meeting project objectives and in making a major contribution to broad goals with respect to free unions and to popular participation under rather difficult circumstances and to economic and social development. AALC's use of resources has been very imaginative and efficient. The following are the evaluation recommendations:

- 1) Within a reasonable time after the envisaged dues check off system is established, CELU should be encouraged to absorb the six field workers, now concerned with workers education, into its regular staff.
- 2) Increasing attention should be given to up-grading trade union training activities by emphasizing shop steward and leader training, including specialized seminars.
- 3) Plans and preparatory work for the proposed Labor Studies Institute and related institutional arrangements should be moved ahead.
- 4) Periodic meetings between AALC representatives and the USAID Mission should be arranged to encourage the development by AALC of possible project ideas that could also meet A.I.D. priority objectives.

- 5) Efforts should be maintained to assure the smooth absorption of the in-service training activities into the comprehensive training program being developed by ILO for the Ethiopian Government.
- 6) The USAID and Embassy should be encouraged to use their good offices to bring in possible outside help to develop greater management competence in industrial relations.

(B) KENYA

The Setting

The Central Organization of Trade Unions (COTU) groups 31 industrial unions with a membership of about 300,000 into a single national federation. Although its leadership is relatively experienced by African standards and its membership significant in most of the important sectors of the economy except plantations, political-tribal differences have seriously weakened COTU. A contested union election, which had been in the courts since the spring of 1972, created a considerable degree of uncertainty in the labor movement. (The court decision, reached a week after the evaluation visit to Kenya, was reportedly being contested and governmental intervention appeared likely.)

With succession unclear in Kenya's one-party political system under the strong centralized authority of the aging Executive

President, Jomo Kenyatta, a number of observers see COTU and its leadership playing an important role in future political developments. This background was probably reflected in the contested union elections, noted above, which surfaced the sharp, political-tribal differences that have plagued the country since independence. The delicate political situation places some constraints on the nature and intensity of activities AALC can undertake in Kenya.

On the economic front, the relatively rapid rate of Africanization in Kenya and the likely impact of the current Uganda crisis on future East African economic relations, upon which Kenya depends, affected the outlook for labor. The preponderant role of expatriate investment and management in the main branches of the industrial economy probably favors labor in industrial relations because of political overtones in most possible conflict situations. Concern of the government over the possible budgetary effects as the country's largest employer as well as the general inflationary impact of wages in the private sector probably offsets this advantage. These constraints on wage movements (as well as limitations on wage incentives due to "extended-family" demands) may increase union interest in other issues in industrial relations such as grievance settlement and possibly greater emphasis on social programs.

## Evaluation

The AALC activities in Kenya have generally had a positive impact on the labor movement. Because of their nature, the two institutional projects in vocational training afford a relatively minor role and little direct advantage for the unions in contrast with trade union training for which there is currently a limited opportunity for AALC in Kenya. In the vocational training project for tailoring, the identification of the relatively weak Textile and Clothing Union with the project has apparently given the union a much needed boost in prestige. The somewhat stronger Printing Union has acquired a substantive advisory role in a tripartite training policy body for the industry -- the only union with such a role -- as a result of the project. The workers and the printing firms from which they come have or will benefit from up-graded printing skills taught in the AALC supported training project at the Kenya Polytechnic. The industry faces serious skilled labor shortages as a result of the accelerated Africanization policy in Kenya. Not only does the departure of Asians leave vacancies, but the small Asian printing shops in the past served as the training ground for workers who later moved into the large printing establishments. According to the Printing Union president, the project has strengthened labor's position in the industry and it has been a contributing factor

in the union's substantial growth record. As an aid in the evaluation, a questionnaire was drawn up to survey the impact of the training on graduates. (Results are not yet available.)

With respect to the tailoring training project, it was not possible to verify directly the results. Follow-up on graduates has been weak, largely because of the nature of their employment and deployment around the country. It was unclear as to where they have gone, except for the few who have remained as instructors. Reportedly, a number have become self-employed or have even become small employers often located in small provincial centers. In either case, they would not be union members so the union does not benefit directly, although the economy should. Unlike the printing project, it was not possible to interview employers who have hired graduates. The few clothing employers interviewed had an urgent need for higher level skills than can be provided by the project. A relatively small ready-made clothing factory reportedly trains its own operatives. Apparently, the union benefits mainly from its prestigious identification with tailoring institute and its fashion boutique and related popular fashion shows; some of the union's staff benefit from paid administrative jobs in the Institute. Attractive quarters have been prepared for a family health clinic for students at the institute. When opened in the fall with government-supplied staff, it should help support an important A.I.D. objective in Kenya.

Under the new Industrial Training Act, which provides for an industrial training levy, there is an excellent prospect that a satisfactory scheme can be worked out to phase out AALC financing of the printing project as envisaged by the end of 1973 -- provided that sustained efforts are maintained with the various elements that have to develop an agreed program (i.e., the employers, the union and the government, including the ministries of labor and of education). A definite AALC phase-out date for the end of 1973 would be helpful in stimulating timely completion of action now underway. Kenya's Polytechnic can help assure a smooth transition since it now serves as the institutional base for the project. The regional aspects of the project are met by providing openings for trainees from other countries. (About 17 non-Kenyans as opposed to approximately 200 Kenyans received training.) There was no evidence of "regionalism" in the management of the project which was entirely in the hands of the Polytechnic.

Unfortunately, the outlook for a smooth phase-out of the tailoring project -- long overdue -- is not certain. Unlike the printing project, there is no institutional framework which can absorb it nor is there any industry support in sight. Because of the nature and history of the project, which AALC inherited, workable plans for an assured and orderly phase-out have not

yet been developed. It is hoped that the new larger facilities, which will accommodate 300 students (up from the previous 140), will produce sufficient revenue to meet the operating expenses after the departure of the AALC technician. Alternatively, the AALC technician has proposed the establishment of a small co-operative children's clothing factory at the Institute that hopefully would make the project self-supporting. While a market probably exists in Kenya for low-priced children's clothes, it was not possible to assess the feasibility of this proposal which would depend heavily on the technical and managerial capability of the staff as well as prospects for financing the new venture.

Press reports and interviews of union leaders and outside observers uniformly praised the usefulness of recent trade union seminars for the printing industry and for the Mombassa port workers that were financed as AALC impact projects. This experience should be built upon by AALC as opportunities are developed. However, it would seem that limited AALC resources could go further, if its contributions would increasingly go to the support of such aspects as bringing in outside lecturers when the unions become able to take on more of the other expenditures now covered by the AALC.

It was not possible to interview any graduates of the Harvard Trade Union Program during the evaluation visit to Kenya, but

observers spoke highly of its usefulness. The observations on the Harvard program, made elsewhere in this report, are generally applicable to Kenya.

Discussions with the Acting USAID Director indicated some possible areas where AALC activities could also further A.I.D. objectives. Some examples would include family health or planning (already being incorporated in the tailoring project) and probably less hopefully rural development, possibly in future activities among plantation workers or where cooperatives are involved.

Most observers in the Embassy believe that A.I.D. support of AALC activities is well known in trade union and government circles in Kenya and among the diplomatic community. A prominent press account of a visit by a European trade union delegation to the tailoring institute, on the day the evaluation field trip in Kenya ended, openly stated that the AALC project was financed by the U. S. Government. It would be useful to obtain the Embassy Labor Reporting Officer's (and the USAID's as well as AALC's) assessment of the impact of this press item on relationships with the government and the unions in regard to the AALC activities. Despite the fact that this relationship is rather well known, it would seem that there is still an advantage of AALC flexibility over the usual government-to-government relations in most types of activities undertaken in the labor sphere. (Some general

observations on this subject are made in Section 5 of the evaluation report.)

In examining the degree of efficiency of the AALC in carrying out the projects, a rigorous cost-effective analysis would be difficult if not impossible. It would seem that a possible alternative of A.I.D. direct hire, which in any event is contrary to current A.I.D. policy, would probably be more expensive for the two projects in question. (This leaves aside the relative effectiveness of this possible alternative in meeting the important labor goals served by a union-to-union relationship.) Overhead costs, including project development and negotiation with related USAID Mission and Washington backstopping and the relatively costly personnel support system, would outweigh the possibly higher AALC technician costs (if tax advantages were monetized). An A.I.D. direct hire project would, however, emphasize the training of trainers rather than that of journeymen.

#### Summary Conclusions and Recommendations

The two AALC institutional vocational training projects in Kenya are effectively meeting training targets. The printing project makes a relatively modest contribution to the broad trade union goals of the AALC program; the tailoring project somewhat less so. Economic development goals are being met by the printing project, but to a more limited extent by the tailoring project

in view of the differing nature of the two industries. The trade union seminars (impact projects) made a useful contribution to the broad labor goals of the program. The following are the evaluation recommendations:

- 1) The printing project should be definitely phased-out with the U.S. technician leaving no later than the end of 1973.
- 2) A last concerted effort should be made by AALC to phase-out the tailoring project by mid-1974; failing this, an effort should be made to find an alternative sponsor or preparations for liquidation should be made.
- 3) Future vocational training projects should assure an institutional base which would help facilitate a satisfactory phase-out.
- 4) Follow-up arrangements on trainees should be developed prior to the end of their programs.
- 5) More emphasis should be placed by AALC on seminars and related trade union training activities as opportunities arise. For optimum use of resources, efforts should be made to have the union increasingly introduce these activities as part of its regular education and organization program.
- 6) Periodic meetings between AALC representatives and the USAID should be arranged to encourage the development

by AALC of possible project ideas that could also meet A.I.D. priority objectives.

(C) ZAIRE

The Setting

The National Union of Zairois Workers (UNTZA) is now the largest trade union organization in black Africa with a claimed membership of 900,000 and 600 offices throughout the country. Practically all organizable workers, including a sizeable group of plantation workers, are members, most of whom pay dues through a check-off system provided in the labor code. Membership grew phenomenally with the benevolent support of the present one-party regime which in 1967 obliged the three competing national centers, then having a combined membership of 150,000, to merge.

Leaders of the trade unions have moved into prominent positions in the political life of the Congo (now Zaire) throughout the post-independence period -- Premier Lumumba and Adoula in the earlier stormy period and now Po-Boloko, as President of the National Assembly, Binton, as Minister of Labor, and Katine as Director-General of the Party. While growing in membership and resources, the union was obliged to give up some independence (i.e., strikes are curtailed) and has been given some new responsibility by the governing single party, the Popular Movement of the Revolution (MPR). For example, the MPR has assigned UNTZA

the tasks of developing cooperatives for workers as well undertaking rural animation activities. (The close inter-relation of UNTZA with the party was particularly evident in observations during a one-day visit to Boma and Matadi in Bas-Zaïre).

Tribal differences are apparently a managed problem in UNTZA with the leadership conscious of the potentially disruptive effects of this persistent problem on the union (and on nation-building in troubled history of the country). With its rapid growth, UNTZA has in the past few years faced a major problem of developing needed competence particularly among its inexperienced lower-echelon leadership and shop stewards (15,000 mostly new stewards were elected in the last enterprise elections); its top leaders also need technical help in their social and economic policy roles at the national level as well as in guiding collective bargaining.

The Zaïre Government is highly centralized under the one-party, authoritarian regime established by President Mobutu since his accession to power in late 1965, following successive periods of tension and conflict since Congo's independence in 1960. Important restraints, which have significantly limited popular political participation, have affected all national institutions, including the unions.

Zaïre is potentially one of the richest countries in tropical Africa with very important mineral and agricultural resources

and a significant industrial sector. Its complicated transport sector is still much in need of a repair and improvement after long periods of neglect during the post-independence difficulties. Inflationary pressures are reappearing after several years of strong economic growth and stability favored in part by high prices for the country's principal export, copper.

There is a very serious shortage of university-trained and highly skilled personnel with the result that industry relies heavily on expatriates for its technical and managerial staffs and government operations suffer from inexperienced or inadequately trained personnel. However, by African standards, Zaire has a relatively good supply of middle level skilled workers and a relatively high level of literacy. Unemployment in its burgeoning cities remains a serious problem as elsewhere in Africa and the bulk of the national population is still in the agriculture sector, largely engaged in subsistence activities.

### Evaluation

AALC activities in Zaire have clearly made a major contribution to the effectiveness of the UNTZA. Zaire (or when it was known as Congo-Kinshasa) is one of the first countries where AALC developed programs with the unions and together with Ethiopia had the largest and most comprehensive AALC program of countries visited during the evaluation. AALC evidently benefits from its

long and close relations with the top Zairois labor leaders, some of whom (as noted above) have moved into prominent political positions. AALC apparently has been very responsive to union requirements and its activities are clearly meeting project objectives effectively. With respect to the more complicated broad program goals of furthering free trade unionism and popular participation, results are more limited due to the basic constraints placed on democratic institutions by the one-party regime. Nonetheless, these activities have contributed to the union's increasing responsiveness to shop level interests of workers in industrial health and cooperatives. The increased effectiveness of UNTZA due to AALC help has contributed to the social and economic development goals of the program. AALC-supported training activities have been particularly noteworthy in helping UNTZA cope with the large influx as well as turnover of untrained shop stewards. There is evidently an increasing need for more advanced training in collective bargaining and the related use of research as well as technical support for the top leadership in their potentially important role in national, social and economic policy.

Relations between AALC and the Embassy and the USAID Mission appear satisfactory -- despite some apparent confusion with respect to the latter's expected role vis-a-vis AALC activities under current procedures. From discussions with the USAID Mission it would seem to be mutually beneficial for AALC representatives

to meet periodically with USAID senior staff to review A.J. D. priority objectives in Zaire and how AALC activities might help.

### Trade Union Education

Workers' Education: The number of UNTZA/AALC seminars for Zaire's shop stewards was sharply increased for 1972/73. During the last half of 1971 new elections were held in all enterprises with over 20 employees and some 15,000 shop stewards were elected (4/, many for the first time. In response to the urgent union need, a crash program was initiated to train as many as possible during 1972. Some 270 one-week seminar sessions were scheduled throughout the provinces for a maximum of 12,000 stewards. The task was divided evenly between AALC and one of the German Government-supported labor-oriented foundations (I.S.I.). According to reports of the union leadership and the AALC staff in Zaire, AALC has completed 67 courses with about 2,700 participants by June 30.

This unprecedented increase in training capacity was prepared by UNTZA during 1971 with the training of some 25 part-time provincial instructors. By employing these men who are scattered throughout Zaire, AALC has been able to increase the number of participants by over 600% with only a 50% increase in the training budget. Courses for shop stewards include basic instruction

---

4/ compared with 9,200 elected in 1968.

in union organization, rights, and obligations at the enterprise level and the fundamentals of Zaire's labor legislation. Such courses are aimed at the creation of an effective, trained group of trade union representatives in all major enterprises able to resolve grievances directly with the employers according to the labor law. Since 1968, there has been a remarkable decrease in illegal strikes which once plagued the Zaire economy. In part, stronger governmental and central union controls were a factor, but both government and union officials credit UNTZA's ambitious education programs with an important contribution to this record.

It was possible to arrange a meeting with a shop stewards committee (délégation syndicale) at the large Bata shoe factory in Kinshasa during the evaluation visit. All of the shop stewards had received training in one of the AILC-supported UNTZA seminars and were positive about the results. It was evident in discussions about their role in the factory that the training had helped them in dealing with workers' grievances in the plant -- recognizing, of course, that Bata has the reputation for being one of the most advanced firms in Zaire with respect to its industrial relations.

Leadership or Cadre Training: UNTZA has a national staff of about 600 scattered throughout Zaire of whom about 300 are cadres responsible for processing members' grievances with employers that have not been resolved by shop stewards. The union made a concentrated effort to train these men in the 1968-71 period and

succeeded in reaching almost all with a series of 2 to 4 week seminars concerning trade union organization and the national labor code. Several special economic, legal, and sociological sessions were also presented. During 1972-73 an effort is being made to give refresher courses to all provincial cadres in order to evaluate their capabilities and to give them review material useful in solving daily union issues. AALC sponsored one course in Lubumbashi for all cadres in Shaba Province during June. The one-week course for 33 participants stressed economics. Similar seminars are planned for Mbandaka and Kisangani later in the year.

Special Seminars: An annual, month-long international seminar for West and Central African unionists opened at the time of the evaluation survey in October. It was run by UNTZA and AALC helped by bringing in outside participants. The theme for the 1972 session was the trade union's role in cooperatives and health services. UNTZA is especially proud of this course as it is the only African union to organize and teach a seminar for other African union leaders.

A special AALC-supported seminar that dealt with cooperative training for a group of UNTZA fishermen in Boma was visited by the outside evaluator 5/ during the evaluation. Since it was the opening session, it tended to be mostly ceremonial with emphasis

---

5/ The outside evaluator was accompanied by an AALC staff member from Zaire AALC office and one from New York who was on detail to Zaire.

on inspirational oratory from local notables. However, it was evident from discussion with a UNTZA representative that the program was geared to basics for this group of rank and file members. The emphasis apparently was more on the order of "animation" and developing a closer sense of identity with the union than on the longer range goal of creating a cooperative. The union in this case, as in the entire range of AALC-supported union education activities, carried out the entire training program without the need for outside technicians. AALC financed the cost of travel of UNTZA lecturers, etc.

Evolving UNTZA Training and Research Requirements: The evaluation visit provided an opportunity to review in some depth with Cairo's union staff and leaders, responsible government officials, including the Minister of Labor, management representatives and university authorities, trade union training and related needs in view of labor and industrial relations developments. There was general recognition of the need to up-grade the skills of trade union representatives (as well as management representatives) in collective bargaining and industrial relations matters. The head of the management association saw the need for such training even though he observed that as a result the union people would become tougher negotiators. Management probably finds that strength and predictability of the unions in collective bargaining is preferable to weakness and erratic patterns.

It has become increasingly evident that trade union representatives are weak on the economic aspects of collective bargaining, particularly with respect to special factors affecting the various industries. Lack of research back-up or ability to use such materials in negotiations has handicapped the union vis-a-vis management. Discussion with the top leaders of the union indicated that this weakness has also limited the effectiveness of the union in national advisory bodies on social and economic policy. In acknowledging this thorny problem, the union's leadership explained that they had hoped for a solution in the establishment of a Labor Studies Institute -- a proposal presented to the AALC, but which could not be financed. In their growing national policy role, the leaders apparently could benefit from special research studies as well as the informal advice of a U.S. senior trade union economist until their own capabilities are developed.

This background would suggest that a shift in emphasis of AALC support in trade union education would be useful. As noted above, currently UNTZA staff is entirely responsible for carrying out the AALC-supported educational activities in the workers' education and cadre training fields. Resources could gradually be shifted from these activities, which should be ripe for complete UNTZA take-over, to more advanced training and research where AALC could maximize its contributions. Therefore, a stand-

ing AALC proposal for a Labor Studies Institute would seem worthy of examination by A.I.D. at this time. Discussion with two Zairois professors -- of the Economic and Research Institute (IRES) -- at the National University (formerly Louvanium) indicated that some local talent could be called upon in such an undertaking. The assignment of a well-qualified (hopefully U.S.) technician to assist at the Institute could also provide a source of much needed advisory help to the UNTZA leadership on national economic and social policy issues.

#### CASOP - Union Health Services

The Worker and Peasant Solidarity Fund (CASOP) was created by UNTZA in 1970 to supplement the nation's health services and to bring the benefits to a mutual aid society to its members at minimal cost. During a visit to the UNTZA dispensary in Kinshasa, the evaluation team was informed about dispensaries in Lubumbashi and Kisangani and plans soon to open additional centers in the remaining six provincial capitals. Only a paramedical director was on duty at the Kinshasa Center which depends heavily on nurses and technicians to supply paramedical assistance. Patients requiring full medical attention are moved to a municipal hospital. The CASOP fund provides medical assistance, birth, hospital, and death benefits, plus the services of ambulances and hearses. UNIC has already aided CASOP with a mobile clinic, medicines,

and office equipment. The mobile clinic was used recently in contending with a major cholera epidemic in one of the provinces.

During 1972, AALC has sponsored seminars at Kinshasa and Lubumbashi permitting CASOP's Kinshasa-based central staff to train some 45 provincial cadres. The two nine-day sessions stressed the organization of UNTZA medical programs and the techniques of forming regional CASOP committees. These courses were designed to provide an opportunity for cadre training in the field of health and facilitated contact among the various provincial staff members. Remaining funds are earmarked for a small CASOP dispensary near Kinshasa being established to serve members living too far from the main center. The evaluation visit to the latter confirmed the importance of this service to the unions. The center was in active operation. The director and staff appeared to be competent and highly motivated. From their reports and records it was apparent that AALC-supplied equipment was well utilized and CASOP redounded to the credit of UNTZA.

#### Cooperatives and Rural Animation

AALC continues to assist UNTZA in the expansion of its cooperative and rural animation activities. During the first half of 1972, a vehicle and washing machines were provided BUCOMA, a laundry co-op for unemployed seamen in Matadi. Limited operating funds were also furnished and by June this activity reportedly

has become self-supporting. It hopes soon to service ships calling at this main Zaire seaport. However, a visit to the facility in Matadi indicated that none of the shipping lines using the port had yet agreed to contract its laundry to the cooperative. The latter is operating in very cramped quarters and is depending heavily on the prospect of such contracts to achieve a sound financial position as it moves to more ample space available in the union headquarters building.

A two-week training session was reportedly held recently with AALC support for 20 members of a hotel cooperative, GOOBZA at Goma in Kivu Province. This co-op, established in 1960 by unemployed domestic workers, requested UNTZA assistance for organization and in seeking a bank loan to improve facilities. The union has agreed to send an expert to advise the co-op for several months and to guarantee a loan. Reportedly, there has been a marked improvement in the cooperative's organization following the seminar. Three study missions were sponsored by AALC at Boma, Uvira, and Bumba to explore possibilities for fishing cooperatives. Reports on UNTZA/AALC fishing project at Kalemie (Shaba Province) indicate that it continues to grow and has become independent of AALC subsidies since 1970.

It should be noted that most of UNTZA's leadership has participated in the Histadrut's Afro-Asian Institute seminars. This experience, according to a few of the leaders interviewed, has

been useful both on the cooperative aspects as well as on the social role of unions. The senior UNTZA leader concerned with coops and social activities assisted by AALC is one of the leaders who received this training.

### Vocational Training

AALC's third commercial school for employed office workers ended in April 1972. The 12-month course jointly sponsored by AALC, UNTZA, and the government's National Institute of Professional Training (INPP) had 56 graduates. Past results according to union officials who employ some of the graduates have proved that these half-day sessions in shorthand, typing, accounting, and languages have made a vast improvement in the participants' skills and, in almost all cases, have led to job promotions.

Some preliminary discussions have taken place on possible vocational training activities in Shaba Province at Lubumbashi in connection with the expansion of mining activities. AALC has been reviewing ideas with the union, the business sector, and the government with the idea of cooperating in a possible project with the latter.

### Review of Selected Impact Fund Project Activities

Angolan Seminars: The 1972 program for the two Angolan exile unions in Zaire is the most ambitious since AALC began aiding these groups in 1969. Four seminars are being arranged for mili-

tants and leaders this year stressing union organization and cooperative development. The first session took place in May at Matadi (Bas-Zaire) where some 20 members of both unions received a middle-level two-week seminar taught entirely by Angolans for the first time. Later this year AALC will sponsor a session for Angolan instructors (taught by UNTZA) in pedagogic methodology so that they can continue to train their members without depending on their Zaire counterparts. According to their leaders with whom the evaluation team met, both unions have become increasingly interested in creating cooperatives and are including co-op material in future union courses. These organizations apparently are taking more active roles in the refugee community as a result of AALC support.

Medical Symposium: During February AALC sponsored a symposium on the scope of African union medical services. This one-week session held in Kinshasa had participants from the United States (ILGWU), Ivory Coast, Tunisia, Mali, Dahomey, Angola (exile), and Zaire. Discussions centered on what services unions might provide in the field of health with special reference to the mobile clinics provided several of the participating countries by AALC. UNTZA, as co-sponsor of the meeting, was especially active in this preliminary session in presenting details on its health services that may serve as a model for other African unions.

Labor Institute Wall: Although a project to build a Labor Studies Institute near Kinshasa did not materialize in 1970, a valuable site for such a center was donated to UNTZA by the Zaire Government. Under Zairois law, to preserve title on this large plot of land it was necessary to construct a wall along the borders. AALC agreed to meet half the cost of the project or about \$5,000. (See discussion above about the need for a Labor Studies Institute.)

Participation in International Cooperative Training: With AALC impact fund assistance, both UNTZA and the Angolans continue to send participants to AALC's Pan-African Cooperative Training Center at Cotonou. This opportunity has enabled UNTZA to train new members of its co-op staff and the leaders of union sponsored projects. The Angolans are also rapidly developing a cadre of cooperative specialists and plan to develop programs among refugee peasants in Bas-Zaire Province bordering Angola.

#### Summary and Recommendations

AALC's comprehensive program of activities in Zaire over the past six years has made a significant contribution to the effectiveness of UNTZA. The specific project objectives have been met. There is some need to reorient the trade union training activities to more advanced types of training. The accomplishments with respect to the broad goals of developing free trade

unionism and encouraging popular participation are limited due to governmental restraints under a one-party regime. However, AALC presence and assistance has probably opened channels of communication that can have a liberalizing effect. At the shop level, these activities have probably helped move the union into a more responsive posture relative to workers' demands. The following are the evaluation recommendations:

- 1) AALC and UNTZA should be encouraged to move ahead on plans for a Labor Studies Institute, drawing on university and union specialists and some American specialist talent. At the same time, lower level training, now carried out entirely by UNTZA staff, should be passed on to the union for financing.
- 2) The start made in using UNTZA resources and experience in training less well-endowed African unions should be encouraged by AALC. The location of the Pan-African publication center and the inter-regional activities involving CASOP are good steps in this direction.
- 3) In the absence of possibilities for French-speaking union officials to benefit from the impact of the Harvard TUP in-depth observation of industrial relations patterns where popular participation is emphasized, alternatives should be explored (e.g., perhaps with

F.O. collaboration in France, if radical political hazards can be overcome; or with the Histadrut in possibly arranging a modified seminar at the Afro-Asian Institute which would be mainly in the trade union rather than cooperative area).

- 4) Periodic meetings should be arranged by the USAID Mission with AALC representatives in order to review A.I.D. priority objectives which could be furthered by AALC activities.

#### (D) TOGO

##### The Setting

Togolese labor is represented by two national labor confederations; one has international affiliations with the WCL (Christian union group) a major industrial federation, the clerical workers (mostly in the government sector), is relatively independent, although nominally a constituent union of the unaffiliated confederation. Differences among the unions have left them weak and the government's announced intentions of unifying them seems to be a single issue that unites the national centers -- in opposition to this proposal. A military regime that came to power after a coup in 1967 has been followed by the establishment in 1969 of a single party state under General Eyadema. The economy is heavily dependent on the agricultural sector which is largely composed of small family farms with a high proportion

in subsistence farming. Cocoa, coffee, and phosphates are the principal exports. There has been little industrial development, except for small scale enterprises that supply the local market.

## Evaluation

### The Workers Education Building (Impact Project)

The major AALC activity in Togo has been the construction of an attractive and relatively modest Workers Education Center in Lome. The building is well maintained and offers suitable facilities for the holding of workers' education activities. The second floor is used as a residence for boarding students from the interior of Togo and from other countries. The Center is also the administrative headquarters for the AALC regional representative in West and Central Africa, and since September 1, 1972, for the Regional Economic and Research Center.

Unfortunately, a controversy has arisen over the appointment recently of a Director of the Workers' Education Center by the Government. Although he comes from union ranks (the large relatively independent Clerical Workers Federation, noted above), the central labor confederations claim they were not consulted on this move. The latter's reactions may also reflect a concern that this is a prelude to a Government effort to force unification of the trade union movement. At a session with representatives of the central labor groups who sharply aired their complaints, it was evident that they felt that AALC had a hand in the

government's decision. It is to the credit of AALC that it has been able to keep lines of communication open despite understandable hazards of this nature in labor activities in African countries. In this case, AALC has made it clear that the matter is between the unions and the government. In the meantime, the facilities are under-utilized since the central federations are boycotting the center.

Nevertheless, so far during 1972, numerous activities were organized at the Workers' Education Center for the national trade union centers, labor federations, international organizations, community development organizations and youth and sport associations.

A meeting of the Board of Directors of the Workers' Education Center was held in September 1972. A program of activities and a budget has been approved. The AALC financial assistance of workers' education activities at the Center will amount to \$8,200 for 1973 (representing about 40% of the total costs).

#### Regional Office

The evaluation team reviewed the activities of the AALC regional representative who covers seven francophone countries. Country visits described by the representative appear to reflect the excellent relations of the AALC in West and Central Africa as a whole. The regional representative arranges for AALC assistance to workers' education seminars which include lecturers from unions, the government and outside -- usually European

technicians. He gives some lectures and controls expenditures. About two months notice is given to AALC-NY to process requests for support. Apparently, AALC is able to provide equipment and at times construction of facilities. For example, some workshops in Upper Volta's vocational center for rural artisans were built by AALC while the ILO and the UNDP provided instructors. There apparently was no direct trade union role involved in this project contrasted with the workers' education seminars.

#### Regional Economic Research and Documentation Center

The evaluation team reviewed an outline of the proposed functions of the Regional Economic Research and Documentation Center with the AALC technician who has recently arrived in Lome. The scope of functions is quite broad and much depends on how well the center can help on the varied research requirements of unions in the region. Since the technician is only beginning to build up his library and experience, it is too early to assess the outlook. For much of the specialized statistics and economic reports, the international organizations (as well as A.I.D.) in Washington and New York and those in Europe are probably much better sources than most African countries upon which the Center appears to be depending.

The Center's director will visit a certain number of West African countries in November-December in order to develop projects with national labor centers. The Center's first publication

concerns the role of research and documentation and contains the recommendations of AALC's Economic Conference in 1969 which was devoted to the creation of a regional economic and documentation center. A Togolese, experienced in documentation and research, will be employed in 1973 and will also serve as a translator. It is hoped that the development of cooperative programs between the AALC and the French FO's I.S.C. will facilitate programs related to research and documentation at the center.

#### Summary and Conclusions

Except for a temporary impasse with the union central organizations on the Government-appointed director, the Workers' Education Center appears to be a successful undertaking. Some re-examination of its function may be needed when and if cooperative AALC-ISC activities are expanded in the region. The regional AALC office appears well run; although it is too early to make any appraisal of the Economic Research and Documentation Center. Help in this sphere is definitely needed by African labor. Economic research is a field in which American unions have been especially effective. It would be useful to draw upon this expertise directly or, in view of language limitations, through some U.S.-based advisory council to the Center that can help on specific union economic and social research and related policy issues.

(E) DAHOMEY

The Setting

There are four national trade union organizations in Dahome -- three affiliated respectively with the ICFTU, the WCL (Christian) and the WFTU; and a group of unaffiliated unions. AALC has been able to maintain friendly relations with all four groups.

Political instability which has plagued the country since independence, has again brought down a relatively short-lived civilian government. (It was replaced by a military coup in early November, a couple of weeks after the evaluation visit.) Some trade union officials were in the overthrown government, notably in the Ministry of Labor which was headed by a former trade union leader.

To a considerable extent, the political instability in Dahomey is due to its economic difficulties. Independence for Dahomey, which was part of the former colonial French West Africa, left it unable to support its relatively large population with the limited resources of the area. Many Dahomeyans who had formerly worked in offices in both the private and public sectors in the large colonial region were obliged to return to Dahomey after independence and have contributed to a relatively high level of unemployment among the educated population. The economy is

highly dependent on agriculture, primarily palm oil and to a lesser extent coffee which are exported mostly to France upon which it also largely depends for economic and technical help.

### Evaluation

#### The Pan-African Cooperative Training Center

The major AALC activity in Dahomey is a regional project, the Pan-African Cooperative Training Center. It is meeting its training objectives and apparently is well along toward phase-out of American staff by the end of 1973 and AALC financial support no later than April 1974. Discussions with the Center's staff and students as well as an examination of rather complete school records confirm the very positive impression of a competently run training institute which occupies most of the attractive OCAM <sup>6/</sup> building in Cotonou.

The 200 participants who attended its 3 month seminars, have come in about equal numbers from the trade unions, governments and the cooperatives of francophone African Countries. An additional 260 trainees have attended briefer 1 month seminars; and some 160 have been trained in extension courses in member countries by the Center's staff. Technical assistance is also provided by the staff to cooperatives in the participating coun-

---

<sup>6/</sup> Common Organization of African and Malagasy States and Mauritius, a grouping of 15 countries.

tries. The Board of Directors is made up of representatives from OCAM countries and commendably reflects the regional nature of the Center.<sup>7/</sup> From the minutes of its meetings, it is evident that the Board is directly concerned with all the aspects of the operations and of the Center, including the apparently well developed plans for phase-out. These plans, prepared before the project was undertaken, provided for gradually increasing the proportion of the financial support of the Center by OCAM and for the Africanization of the staff. The plans now call for the take-over of administration of the Center by OCAM in cooperation with FAO by the end of 1973; and of all finances by April 1974. At that time, the Center plans to expand its program to cover rural and youth development programs. Reportedly, the success of this training program had encouraged OCAM to move into other fields such as telecommunications, civil aviation, etc.

Recruitment of students takes place through government contact points in each of the participating countries. However, the Director maintains informal contact with the unions and cooperatives as well as with former students to help assure the selection of balanced and qualified candidates. This is supplemented by the Director's visits to these countries where he tries

---

<sup>7/</sup> The Board is composed of a chairman (Ministry of Labor, Dahomey), a Senegalese trade unionist, a governmental official from Malagasy, a cooperative official from Niger, and an AALC-NY representative.

to encourage good relations and also maintains contact with former students.

The African staff members are apparently well qualified and highly motivated. There appears to be excellent rapport between the staff and trainees who are organized in a student union and as a practical exercise run their own small consumers cooperative. The curriculum is balanced between subjects dealing with specialized cooperative administrative topics and those dealing with accounting and economics. Thus, trade unionists and governmental people, who may not have an opportunity to apply the cooperative aspects immediately, have at least acquired skills in the widely applicable financial and economic subjects.

In sum, this AALC project is clearly meeting and perhaps exceeding its immediate training objectives. On the broader AALC program goals, it is definitely helping in the establishment of institutions which further popular participation and contribute to social and economic development. The trade unions, besides providing participants, are also involved in the program direction. The unionists (representing one-third of the participants) who receive training at the Center are likely to increase the effectiveness of their organizations upon their return.

Addition to Labor Center (Bourse du travail),  
an Impact Project

An on-site visit was made in Cotonou to the Labor Center occupied by the headquarters of the four central labor organi-

zations, noted above) where AALC under an impact project has financed an enlargement of the building which will double its original size. The annex consists of a large meeting room for about 200 people which can be divided into separate conference rooms and additional office space for the national centers. The impact project was based on an agreement between the AALC and all the Dahomeyan national trade union organizations. Due to technical difficulties experienced by the African sub-contractor, delays have occurred in the construction schedule as modifications on the original design have become necessary. Except for the unfortunate delay, this appears to be a useful impact project which should benefit the unions by enabling them to operate more effectively. An incidental side benefit is that the four unions acted together on this project.

Mobile Clinic (Impact Fund Project 114)

The mobile clinic sent by the AALC to the Ministry of Labor of Dahomey had been expected to begin operation soon with the cooperation of the Ministry of Health. Under the supervision of Dr. Varango, the Ministry expects to develop an industrial health inspection service for the first time. It will use the AALC vehicle and hopefully additional AALC assistance. Depending on developments in the cloudy political picture, further assistance to the Ministry of Labor will be discussed in the

framework of the AALC-ISC Medical Conference which will be held in Paris in January 1973 (discussed briefly in Annex C). In view of the recent coup, it is too early to determine whether this still unutilized mobile clinic will stimulate the Government (with rival Ministries of Labor and Health involved) to undertake an industrial health program. Union involvement appeared minimal except for the identity of the Minister of Labor. However, it is definitely a field in which all labor could benefit, but it is one which is almost totally in the governmental domain in Dahomey and most other former French colonial countries.

#### Summary Conclusion and Recommendations

The Pan-African Cooperative Training Center appears to be a significant accomplishment for AALC, perhaps most notably as the development of a regional training center of some value to union participants, as well as for those from cooperative and government offices. This represents a well conceived project, with clear phase-out plans and institutional arrangements built in from the start. It is a possible model upon which AALC should try to pattern future projects. With respect to the impact projects examined by the evaluation team, the construction of an addition to the Labor Center seems after some delay to be nearing completion. Recent political developments leave plans on the utilization of the AALC gift, a mobile clinic to the Labor Ministry, uncertain.

(F) SENEGAL

The Setting

Labor is unified in the National Union of Senegalese Workers. Its leaders are closely involved in the political scene with its President, Doudou N'Gom, in the cabinet as Minister of Technical Education and Vocational Training. (A number of his union associates are in top ministry positions.) Senegal moved from a parliamentary to a presidential system in 1962. The President, who founded the ruling party which holds all seats in the Parliament, has followed a policy of close friendship and collaboration with France, the former colonial power. Its economy is primarily agricultural with heavy dependence upon the single crop of peanuts for exports (80% of total). Irregular and, in recent years, very poor rainfall has resulted in serious economic problems. Senegal is the most industrialized of the former French colonies in West Africa, with about 30,000 wage-earners in over 300 establishments. France has been the major source of economic and technical aid to Senegal in its efforts to diversify the economy.

Evaluation

During the evaluation visit, an agreement between the Government of Senegal and the AALC was signed for the establishment of the Institute of Tailoring and Design to enable training to begin in November.

The Government of Senegal has fulfilled its obligation to provide 25% of the 1972-1973 budget. If account is taken of salaries and allowances of the director of the Center and a teacher put at the disposal of the Center by the French Institut Syndical de Cooperation (ISC), the contribution by the Senegalese Government and the French will be an additional 11% of total costs. The first regular course of one year with 40 participants from Senegal was to start on November 20. Students will be selected from qualified applicants finishing the regular secondary schools. The staff has been alerted to the danger of favoritism that often is a problem when available spaces for training are limited. The first regional course of three month's duration for fashion design is planned for April 1973 with 35 participants. Criteria for their selection are still unclear. In November 1973, two courses of 40 Senegalese will function as well as two or three regional courses with 35 participants.

The Institute is the first AALC vocational training project fully integrated into a national training system of an African country. It is also an excellent example of international cooperation, not only between the AALC and Senegal, but also with the French Force Ouvriere through its newly created ISC (see Appendix C). Compared to other AALC vocational training centers, including the Cooperative Training Center in Cotonou, the expatriate teachers and administrative staff is large: it consists

of one director (ISC, France), one assistant director (Senegalese) one teacher (French), and one administrator (U.S.). Plans are not yet definite on African counterparts who will be trained to take over the instructor functions. The Senegalese Assistant Director has been selected as the counterpart of the Director.

The prospects are good that the project will help meet economic development objectives, since the skills to be taught are evidently needed. Union participation, as such, is not apparent in the plans so far. The connection is based on the Minister of Vocational Training and his staff who are trade unionists now in governmental roles. As far as the students are concerned, they may or may not be union material after graduation since most are likely to become self-employed artisans or small employers. Institutional arrangements on the regional aspects apparently have not yet been worked out contrasted to the Cooperative Training Center in Dahomey. However, the first three-month seminar with regional participation is scheduled for next April.

#### Summary and Recommendations

As noted above, it is really too early to assess the prospects for the Tailoring and Design Institute. Much depends on how union participation and regional aspects develop. The most encouraging aspect of the project is that it represents a new departure of cooperative activity by the AALC and ISC supported by the U.S.

and French Governments, respectively. Hopefully, plans for this project will work out satisfactorily and that future projects with ISC involvement will be more clearly orientated to the broad program goals of the AALC.

(G) HARVARD TRADE UNION PROGRAM

The Harvard Trade Union Program (TUP), a three-month seminar program designed primarily for middle-level U.S. trade union officials, is the principal advanced training program to which AALC sends trade unionists from anglophone African countries. Out of 30 students at each seminar, about one-third are foreigners -- mostly from developing countries. The program is designed for American trade unionists and employs the case study method that is associated with Harvard Business School where it is located. However, the TUP Director and staff are experienced in translating U.S. experience for foreigners who have been attracted to the program since its establishment over 20 years ago. In addition, some Foreign Service, A.I.D. and AIFLD personnel have also attended the TUP seminars. Four African trainees (2 Ethiopian, 1 Liberian and 1 Sierra Leonian) who were sent by AALC, were at the TUP during the evaluation visit. Over 50 African participants have come to the program since the mid-1960's.

From interviews with the Africans at the seminar and a few direct contacts with graduates as well as with informed observers

during the African field visits, it is clear that students are highly pleased with the program and found it useful. Graduates have advanced in the labor movement, have moved into senior government positions or have been attracted to the private sector which reportedly competes for their services. The success story is admittedly due in part to selection -- the program and Harvard's prestigious reputation have attracted top-level candidates. Attendance at the program, aside from the training, probably helped give them needed recognition and to some extent their innate abilities contributed.

However, it is also evident that the content and organization of the program were important ingredients. The specific cases of U.S. industrial relations experience are selected and apparently studied in such a way as to provide an appreciation of differing conflict and accommodation patterns involved in relations between unions and management in American industry. Together with an appraisal of U.S. labor history and the structure and nature of union organizations, the program offers an unusual vantage point for observing the significance of popular participation in American society. The close associations and friendships developed with Americans participating in the program (and other Africans and Asians) reinforces this impression. Aside from the specific trade union training involved, this program's potential in helping on broad program goals of free trade unionism and popular

participation ranks very high and undoubtedly makes a lasting impression on an important potential leadership group in African society.

In addition to the three months seminar, AALC supported African participants have a 2 week travel-study tour afterwards. These are arranged by the NY office which tries to match the visit with the trainees' interests; the tours usually involve observations of union offices, sometimes those of their American colleagues in the TUP.

From discussions with the current participants and the Direct of TUP, there appears to be a period of up to a month before the African trainees become adequately informed about U.S. labor and industrial relations institutions to give them the assurance needed to participate fully in seminar discussions. It would seem worthwhile to try a week's special orientation program before the seminar as a way of shortening this adjustment period. Perhaps, this could be tried experimentally with an up-coming cycle at the seminar. Alternatively a week's study within a union office was suggested.

On the content of the program, the Africans tended to prefer relatively greater attention to comparative labor law and communications techniques within the labor movement to the present emphasis. However, they were rather diffident on their prefer-

ences -- apparently being unwilling to tamper too much with a program which in general they find very useful.

Much of the follow-up is informal through correspondence with classmates and TUP staff. In addition, a twice yearly newsletter is sent out informing alumni of what has happened to their colleagues. A questionnaire, sent out a few years ago, on the effectiveness of the program produced a very high rate of response -- all laudatory.

#### Summary Observations and Recommendations

The sending of African trade unionists to the Harvard Trade Union Program has been a very useful element in the AALC program and makes a valuable contribution to all its broad program goals. With the view to maximizing the potential of this program for African trade unionists, the following are the evaluation recommendations:

- 1) An experimental week's orientation program or alternatively a week at an American union office should be tried as a means of reducing the period of adjustment for African trainees.
- 2) In AALC projects supporting advanced trade union training in Africa, consideration should be given to adapting some of the Harvard TUP techniques, possibly by training

instructors at the TUP and sending the TUP Director and other staff to provide technical assistance in introducing these methods. (Perhaps suitable African universities could also be approached on this possibility.)

- 3) Follow-up should be enhanced by trying brief refresher seminars or reunions in those African countries having an adequate number of graduates; the Director and possibly another staff member could probably cover several countries if arrangements are carefully planned. (It may be of interest to note that Histadrut is gratified with its experience in follow-up seminars along this line with Afro-Asian Institute graduates -- see Appendix B.)

## APPENDIX A

### EVALUATION OF THE AALC PROGRAM -- SCOPE PAPER<sup>1/</sup>

#### General Framework

The evaluation of the component projects of the AALC program should be assessed in light of the program's basic goals of:

- 1) strengthening the free and democratic unions of the countries in which the AALC operates;
- 2) contributing to the economic and social development of those countries; and
- 3) increasing popular participation in the development process (Title IX).

In view of the importance of the political, economic and social climate of the respective African countries first in decisions on what types of AALC activities are undertaken and then on how they are to be carried out, these factors should be weighed in the assessment of the AALC program in achieving objectives. As part of these considerations are the historical factors regarding the development of the AALC program, its sponsorship by the AFL-CIO, and the special relationships of the American labor movement with the trade unions of the emerging African countries and the changing role of various international labor groups in the African labor scene. An important part of this

---

<sup>1/</sup> The scope paper was drafted on July 17, 1972 -- prior to the field visits.

Background has been the significant role of the African trade union leaders in the early independence movements in a number of African countries prior to independence and the close personal relationships maintained by American labor with these leaders, a number of whom later achieved prominent political stature in the independent African states.

Implicit in the broad program goals cited above are inter-related political, economic and social objectives that do not lend themselves readily to quantitative measurement with respect to each of the individual AALC project activities to be examined. Effectiveness of the AALC project activities in achieving these broad goals will necessarily have to be assessed largely in qualitative terms. In some cases, there would be some advantage to considering how the AALC projects as a group over time (i.e., taking the various institutional and impact projects over the past few years together) may have contributed to these objectives. Where possible, quantitative information would, of course, also be drawn upon when such data are available for the specific AALC activities.

The approach or style of operation of the AALC should be an important consideration entering into the evaluation. To the extent feasible, the significance of its sponsorship by the AFL-CIO should be assessed in contrast to alternative ways of carry-

ing out these types of activities. For example, aspects of some AALC activities may be compared with somewhat analogous direct A.I.D. technical assistance projects (e.g., vocational training, cooperatives, facets of community development, housing, etc.). Where possible, some comparison with the technical assistance activities of various national and international labor groups in Africa could also be considerable (e.g., possibly of the WFTU and its component national federations such as the French CGT, etc., and the ILO).

A major aspect of the evaluation should be the examination of the relative effectiveness among the various AALC activities in meeting objectives with the view to providing background that could be considered in future program plans. In particular, possible new approaches which may be considered more widely should be examined. Not least of the considerations in the evaluation should be the strengthening of the in-house capability of the AAL in providing an on-going evaluation of its program activities.

In connection with the foregoing, of course, the assessment should examine the extent to which the AALC activities have been able to maintain and benefit from a non-U.S. Government identity. AALC relationships with host country governments, trade unions and USAID Missions and Embassies would enter into this aspect of

the evaluation which necessarily would have to be carried out with considerable care and discretion.

An assessment should be made of the effectiveness of AALC headquarters relations with field operations. AALC experience in recruitment, programming and logistical support for the various projects and activities should be examined in this context.

The aforementioned elements in the general framework of this evaluation will be considered as far as possible in the examination of the individual AALC activities, discussed below.

#### The AALC Projects and Activities

In view of time and cost restraints, it will not be possible to examine all AALC projects. However, an attempt will be made to include most (if not, all) the institutional projects. As representative a sample of impact projects as possible will be selected for evaluation, taking into account the logistical advantages of examining those located near the large institutional projects.

The major institutional projects selected for direct evaluation will comprise all types covered by the AALC program. Thus, the evaluation will include projects on: trade union leader and cadre training; vocational training; cooperatives; trade union research; and important facilities constructed by the AALC.

Although the evaluation will focus primarily on on-going and completed projects, in some cases new projects involving significant departures may also be examined to the extent that meaningful appraisals seem possible (e.g., the projects involving cooperation with the French Government and the Force Ouvriere). Past AALC experience of cooperative technical assistance relationships with the ECA and ILO should also be examined, if feasible, with respect to patterns that may be meaningful for future joint undertakings.

An attempt should be made to include as representative sample as possible of impact projects among those chosen for evaluation. These should therefore include trade union seminars, mobile health clinics, equipment and supplies for trade unions and travel-study grants (such as those to the Harvard Trade Union Program). The ITS projects sponsored by AALC will also be examined in this evaluation.

## APPENDIX B

### ISRAELI HISTADRUT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE IN AFRICA

For purposes of comparison as well as a possible area for coordinated or cooperative undertakings with the AALC, a limited review of the African activities of the Histadrut (the Israeli Labor Confederation) was included in the field trip.<sup>1/</sup> Histadrut with which the AFL-CIO has maintained close relations, also has an active technical assistance program in Africa with governmental support. Unlike the AALC, it emphasizes training Africans in its home country at the Afro-Asian Institute in Tel Aviv. The Institute arranges 3-1/2 month programs in English and French for trade union, cooperative and government officials. Considerable emphasis is placed on direct field experience in the Kibbutzim (agricultural communes) and probably of more interest to Africans, the Moshavs (agricultural cooperatives). Histadrut also carries out shorter tailored study trips for top union officials and occasionally runs seminars for groups of African labor leaders in Israel. The Histadrut does not provide technical assistance directly in Africa with the exception of some Histadrut sponsored seminars. It furnishes experts to the Israeli Government within

---

<sup>1/</sup> The outside evaluator visited Israel enroute to Africa for discussions at the Histadrut's Afro-Asian Institute and in the Foreign Ministry (African and Foreign Assistance Sections) and with the Labor Attache in the American Embassy.

the latter's regular foreign assistance program and occasionally provides lecturers at African trade union seminars, including some under AALC auspices. Reportedly the Government provides half the budget for training at the Institute with the Histadrut covering the remainder. Foreign travel costs are left to the sending country.

African labor leaders contacted in the course of the evaluation visits who had also been at the Institute spoke very favorably of the training they received. A number observed that the Histadrut structure and role in the Israeli economy provide a better model for them than do those of the unions in the highly industrialized countries in the West. Their programs at the Institute included both trade union and cooperative subjects. Usually, their field visits to the Moshavs were considered the most impressive aspect of the program. As in the case of the Harvard Trade Union Program, discussed elsewhere in this report, they found contacts with labor leaders from other African countries a useful fringe benefit. To some extent, the program, like that at Harvard, gives participants some direct observations of democratic institutions. Unlike the Harvard program, which is primarily designed for American labor officials who are students, there is probably little continuing informal contact with individual Israeli labor leaders after the program. However, the Institute

has a systematic follow-up program which includes meetings of former students in the various African countries. (One such meeting was in session during the evaluation visit to Nairobi.) Reportedly, alumni help in selecting candidates for the training at the Institute is useful as a follow-up technique as well as a factor in quality control in recruitment.

The Histadrut experience with follow-up meetings of graduates and their role in helping on new candidates would tend to confirm the desirability of AALC considering something along this approach for Harvard Trade Union Program graduates in Africa. Histadrut is amenable to expanding the rather limited cooperative activities with AALC (or its participation in AALC activities). (The big question with respect to various offers of cooperation with AALC from foreign donor labor groups is whether the latter are willing to share costs.)

In sum, the AALC and Histadrut programs reflect the basic relative strengths of their respective institutions and national experience. For the Histadrut, geographic proximity, mastery of the language problem and national patterns that are more adaptable to African experience favor training of Africans in Israel with special emphasis on the social role of unions and on cooperatives. AALC uses foreign training very selectively for advanced specialize union training and concentrates on training activities in Africa, emphasizing the development of a local training capability. It

has moved into cooperative training and vocational training as well as social programs to accommodate the special needs of African unions in an environment markedly different from that of the United States. Both programs necessarily have to be flexible with regard to their activities in what often becomes a politically sensitive area, increasingly more for the Histadrut than for the AFL-CIO. Histadrut, on the basis of its own domestic role, directs its attention to unions and cooperatives as well as to government officials concerned with labor and social programs. AALC has more or less the same constituency with relatively greater emphasis on trade unionists and less on cooperatives not directly associated with unions. AALC makes use of other forms of assistance than technical assistance and/or training to which Histadrut is limited. Both programs operate with government support, Histadrut probably more openly than the AALC.

APPENDIX C

THE FRENCH FORCE OUVRIERE'S  
INSTITUT SYNDICAL DE COOPERATION

In view of the promising outlook for cooperative undertakings by the AALC and the French Force Ouvriere's (FO) recently established Institut Syndical de Cooperation (ISC), a brief review of the ISC and its plans has been included in this report.<sup>1/</sup> The FO established the ISC in March 1972 as a separate union-to-union foreign aid institution, patterned largely on the AALC structure vis-a-vis the AFL-CIO. ISC expects to obtain recognition soon by the French Government as a non-governmental institution eligible for governmental assistance with regard to activities in the labor sphere in Africa and in particular those it plans to undertake jointly with the AALC.

The AFL-CIO (and since its creation, the AALC), have maintained close relations with the FO since it broke away from the Communist-led General Confederation of Labor (CGT) in 1947. FO had a number of associated unions in French colonial Africa, particularly in the public sector. During the post-independence period, unions in francophone Africa have tended more frequently

---

1/ The outside evaluator visited FO headquarters in Paris on ISC plans and also reviewed the outlook with the Labor Attache in the American Embassy.

to follow the metropolitan patterns of union structure than have those in the former British colonies. While drives toward Pan-African unionism have broken most of these ties, FO has been relatively more successful than the other French labor groups in maintaining informal contacts with African labor leaders -- although with a very low profile and hampered by inadequate resources. For the past ten years, it has conducted annual one-month seminars in Paris for trade union officials from francophone countries and occasionally FO leaders have visited unions in these countries.

With the establishment of the ISC, hopefully, it expects to expand its activities with governmental support and through cooperative ventures with the AALC. In addition to the tailoring and regional fashion institute in Dakar, the ISC and AALC plan a seminar on tropical medicine in Paris in January 1973. In April, ISC plans a trade union conference in Dakar that will serve as an opportunity to explore program ideas.

There are, of course, obvious advantages to the development of cooperative activities by the AALC and the ISC. Besides helping to provide French-speaking specialists, ISC should be able to bring in additional resources, particularly after its legal status is formally approved by the French Government. (Reportedly, the French Government has either approved or has under consideration

recognition of a similar institutional arrangement with the largely Christian trade union group, the CFDT, for operations in Latin America and vaguely an arrangement with the CGT in Eastern Europe.) The joint ISC-AALC activities could benefit from FO's close contacts with labor and government officials in francophone Africa and from its familiarity with institutions in these countries that have been strongly influenced by French patterns. (These institutional factors can in some cases also inhibit desired changes -- for example, in increasing the trade union role in such social programs as industrial health activities which are held more closely under the government's aegis in French-influenced patterns, etc.)

The outlook for expanding cooperative or joint AALC-ISC activities depends to a large degree on the ISC's ability to tool up and obtain needed French Government support. At present, it only has the part-time services of a dynamic Director-General who momentarily expects some staff. The recent activation of the promising tailoring institute in Dakar and plans for the upcoming meetings in early 1973 could stimulate a number of potentially useful project ideas that could be undertaken jointly with AALC. A.I.D.'s support of AALC in these initial activities will probably be instrumental in giving ISC the necessary stature to obtain needed French governmental recognition and related help.