

PN-AAIC-439

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

A F R I C A N   W O M E N   I N   D E V E L O P M E N T

Submitted: April, 1980

JEFFALYN JOHNSON AND ASSOCIATES, INC.  
Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633



## INTRODUCTION

The Foreign Service Act (Percy Amendment) was amended in 1973 to specify that United States aid shall "give particular attention to programs, projects, and activities which tend to integrate women with the national economy of developing countries, thus improving their status and assisting the total development effort." Since the Percy Amendment, a wide variety of Women in Development (WID) projects have been funded by the Office of Women in Development (AID-PPC/WID), which was established in 1974, and other organizational units within the U.S. Agency for International Development (AID).

This evaluation report focuses on seven of these Women in Development projects funded by USAID. Its purpose is to determine whether discrete WID projects do in fact improve the welfare of women and integrate them into the development process. To determine how successful these projects have been in accomplishing this purpose, two key issues are addressed.

- Should funds continue to be provided for women's programs per se or are such funds better utilized for activities which involve women within the framework of larger, more comprehensive development projects?
- Are Women in Development projects improving the welfare of women and extending their potential as contributors to development?

In addition to these two fundamental questions, the evaluation also addressed the objectives which were outlined in the scope of work. They are:

- Determine if USAID and host country inputs were provided as planned and assess the quality, quantity, and timeliness of these inputs;
- Determine if the projected outputs were realized as planned and whether or not these outputs contributed directly to the achievement of the program goals; and
- Determine whether or not the program goals have been attained and further, whether or not this has resulted in changed behavior of the target group. Has there been a spread effect? Will there be a continuing impact or effect after termination of assistance funding?

#### METHODOLOGY

Jeffalyn Johnson and Associates, Inc. used two teams composed of two staff members each to conduct the evaluation over a four week period - February 17-March 18, 1980. Both teams were totally composed of minorities and women. The procedures used in the conduct of the study included:

- Review of all available documents at AID/Washington, USAID Missions in host countries, host government offices and visits to project sites.
- Interview of USAID personnel involved with the projects in Washington and in the recipient countries.

- Interview of project staff members and recipients of assistance.
- Visits to project sites and meetings held with local community leaders.
- Analyses of quantitative and budgetary data.

This methodology emphasized the identification and compilation of as much primary source data as was available. However, the team did experience some difficulty in obtaining requested documents, thus necessitating heavy reliance on secondary material and data obtained from interviews.

The framework within which this study was conducted included the six criteria identified by AID for selection of activities. Those criteria require that:

- The activities must relate to important development problems or opportunities to the priorities on which AID puts special emphasis, i.e., food production, rural development, nutrition, and health.
- Individual activities should fit within the parameters of the national plan of strategy regarding the advancement of Women in Development where one exists. If not, there should be a definitive expression of interest and participation.
- The focus should be on rural women who are low income farmers, herders, artisans or service workers in rural areas. The activities should relate to development

opportunities at the micro-economic level that will improve the status of the target group.

- To the extent possible, there should be emphasis on the participation of women in identification of their own needs and in the design and implementation of programs to address those needs.
- Priority will be given to innovative or experimental activities.
- When possible, prospects for replication or adaptation elsewhere will be considered in the selection and design of activities.

The report is an evaluation of African Women in Development No. 698-0388 with its seven sub-project evaluations appended.

#### COMMON THREADS

##### Project Design

The analyses of the project papers indicate that a number of the objectives of the designs were not stated in quantifiable terms. Measurable baseline data was not furnished, thus it was difficult to measure project performance and accomplishments.

Information about the methods used in the conduct of the feasibility studies and the circumstances surrounding the development of the project is essential and would have greatly facilitated the conduct of this evaluation. Feasibility

studies were not conducted for all the projects. Of the feasibility studies that were conducted, the findings appear to have been ignored or not fully utilized. The Kassack Nord Project Paper states that a study was conducted to ascertain the needs of the women. However, these findings do not appear to have been utilized. A similar situation exists with regard to the income feasibility studies in Upper Volta. The studies were not utilized, possibly due to a lack of interest and because they had not been translated.

In addition, the data collected in the studies often were not adequate to provide the kinds of information necessary for good project design or evaluation. Such studies lacked the following types of information which the evaluation team feels is needed for the design of a successful project.

- Baseline data essential to the quantification of project progress and the achievement of specific objectives, was often missing, i.e., nutritional status of the population, levels and patterns of migration, approximate level of income, current workload and division of labor, etc.

In the Casamance project, two of the stated purposes included improving the nutritional status of the population and reducing migration of young girls to the cities. However, the absence of base line

data regarding the pre-project nutritional status of the population or the rate of migration prior to the initiation of the project made it impossible to evaluate the degree to which these purposes were achieved by the conclusion of the project.

- Greater input from the target population regarding the nature and scheduling of project inputs could contribute to more effective internal management of projects. The Tivaouane project, for example, would have profited from advice from the female beneficiaries regarding the type of trees best suited for cultivation in the area.

When a feasibility study is conducted, the contributions expected from the target population should be established and agreed upon. This might insure greater, active participation by the beneficiaries in the planning and design of the project. Then, they could assist in the scheduling of their contributions so these could be synchronized with the phasing in of AID and government inputs. The Tivaouane serves as a model for this pattern. Agreements were obtained prior to the initiation of the project and, for the most part, it appears as though the villagers are complying with their agreement. On the other hand, lack of clarity regarding the village contributions

in the Casamance Project has led to confusion, resentment and declining commitment and interest on the part of some of the villages.

- The general absence of market studies has resulted in serious shortcomings in the project design process. In the Casamance project, no adequate data was collected regarding the marketability of the vegetables produced. As a result, there was saturation of the markets in the area, thereby reducing the ability of individual women to sell their produce and generate income for themselves.

So far, market studies have not been conducted for the proposed income producing activities in the Tivaouane (sheep raising) and Kassack Nord (fabric dyeing, poultry and rice production) projects. Without such studies, the project activities may suffer from assumptions and miscalculations.

When such studies have been conducted, the time lapse between completion of the feasibility study and initiation of project activities is often lengthy. As a result, in some projects it has been necessary to conduct additional studies to gather relevant data for adequate project design.

- In general, the feasibility of project goals and purposes was not realistically assessed and the magnitude

of project outputs was overly ambitious for the allotted budget and time. Additional time would have improved the achievement of project purposes for all of the projects.

- One major factor which retarded the progress of projects was the late delivery of planned inputs. Oftentimes, the slowness of input was caused by routine delays and obstacles encountered in rural environments. External factors such as climatic conditions and personnel changes also affected delivery. Most of the planning did not allow for such commonly encountered delays. In short, the time frame for achievement of project purposes should be expanded.
- Budgetary constraints were apparent in most of the projects. It was found that budget levels were insufficient to supply the projected inputs, and that no contingency funds were included to cover unexpected increases in costs. These unrealistically low budgets seemed to have been planned in response to a need to have the project fall within certain funding levels. However, lower levels of inputs and less numerically ambitious outputs could, if properly managed, increase the chance for success of the project.
- Projections regarding the magnitude of outputs were also determined to be unrealistic. For example, the

target set by the Casamance Project of a yearly income of \$9,000 per cooperative, was very unrealistic, given the allotted time frame, the level of inputs, the number of women expected to participate, and their overall workload.

- There is a need to set clearly defined and well-stated goals. In the Tivaouane project, the purposes included lightening the heavy burden of work for women and providing alternative work activities. However, in spite of the introduction of the millet mill, the likely result for the women was additional work. Care should be taken to ensure that the programmed activities actually represent work alternatives rather than work additives.
- Purposes and goals must be measurable. Increased income was a stated goal or purpose of every one of the projects but the measurement of increased income was virtually impossible, given both the reluctance of village women to reveal their incomes and the absence of baseline data.
- None of the projects included evaluation plans in the project designs. Although it was assumed that AID personnel would conduct mid-project and end-of-project evaluations, there were no procedures for evaluations included in the project papers. Many inappro-

priate decisions regarding project management and delivery of inputs might have been avoided had there been adequate internal and external monitoring of the project to provide for early detection of such problems. Recognizing the constraints imposed by lack of personnel, limited funds for transportation and time, the evaluation team recommends that a model be designed specifically for the evaluation of small projects.

It is conceivable that the Casamance Project would have identified the need for technical training and that the Kassack Nord Project might have realized that the gap in communication between SAED and AID constituted a serious constraint to the implementation of the project. Oxen might have been substituted for donkeys at an earlier stage in the Casamance project and the Sierra Leone project might have been redesigned to assure appropriate training and to provide technical assistance.

### Project Implementation

#### **Inputs**

Adequate, appropriate, and timely inputs are essential to effective implementation of projects. The absence of just one of these factors has serious consequences for the project. Every one of the projects, except Tivaouane suffered

from the absence of at least one, if not all, of the above factors. The funding for the Ghana Day Care Project arrived eight months after the project commenced. Fortunately, the project was salvaged by the Ghana YWCA which provided the necessary resources to institute the project. The inadequate funding that plagued Kassack Nord resulted in a cutback of other inputs.

The Casamance Project called into question the appropriateness of the inputs when the pumps and vehicles were inoperable. In all fairness to the project, it has been suggested that the mobylettes were not rendered mechanically inoperable, but were none-the-less unavailable for project use. Although such inputs may have been technically appropriate, the totality of the mechanical breakdown suggests that there should not be such inputs where there are no trained personnel to maintain them or where there is an absence of spare parts.

The host country institution Societe d'Amenagement d' Exploitation (SAED) was unable to provide rice fields in the vicinity of Kassack Nord for the villagers. Consequently, the villagers were forced to travel eleven kilometers to cultivate their fields and found it necessary to live at this site for five months. Therefore, their opportunity for participation was seriously limited. In retrospect, the provision of the rice fields adjacent to Kassack Nord is essential to the fulfillment of the purposes and goals of the project.

The requirement that the commodities such as medicines and vehicles be American produced resulted in greater expense for the communities, and consequently, can hardly be said to be the most appropriate input.

### Outputs

The project outputs reflect the quality and timeliness of the inputs, the realism and skillfulness of the design, as well as the effectiveness of systematic management. There is no consistent pattern of achievement of outputs throughout the projects.

Income earning capability for the women was an objective in each of the projects, but it only had modest achievement. Several of the projects were involved in some type of agricultural production - garden production, vegetable growing, millet production - each of which had marginal results. While gardens and crops achieved varying levels of success, most production did not reach income producing levels.

One of the outputs that had immediate effect on both the men and women was the literacy instruction in both Kassack Nord and Ghana.

The Tivaouane Project did not have measurable outputs as the project has yet received all of its inputs, nor have the project activities gone into full production.

### Management and Technical Assistance

The success of the projects could be increased by incorporating management systems as a component of each. Technical

assistance in the development of good management in the projects could result in more effective implementation and greater benefits to the target population.

Most of the projects indicate a need for technical assistance to develop management skills among the project personnel. This assistance would result in more effective use of inputs, supervision of personnel, appropriate ranking of priorities, improved personal relations with officials, and more realistic planning. For example, technical assistance would have benefited the Casamance Project, particularly in the maintenance of its molyettes and pumps. The officials of SAED in the Kassack Nord Project desperately needed technical assistance to understand and comply with the requirements of AID accounting and reporting procedures.

#### Local Participation

These projects appear to establish a strong correlation between the extent of involvement in the project by its beneficiaries or target populations and the success of the project. As a result of mothers' requests for assistance in caring for their children between the ages of two and five years old, the Ghana Day Care Center was established. Thus, strong community support for the day care centers has developed.

External factors, such as drought, rather than a lack of interest of the people, were responsible for the non-production

of income-generating gardens in the Ghana Day Care Project. A similar pattern was observed in Tivaouane in Senegal where the villagers consistently contributed to the project by assisting in manioc and niebe cultivation. In sharp contrast, the Kassack Nord Project has lagged with only a few activities underway. There was no evidence to support the claim that women had requested the project. Although men provided labor for some of the construction, there was no indication that the women were participating in decisions regarding implementation of the project. Although the Kassack Nord's disappointing performance is not solely attributable to non-participation, it appears that it cannot achieve its purpose without a substantial increase of interest and involvement. The Casamance activity in Senegal suffered from the same disability, but, to a lesser degree.

#### Male Involvement

Interviews with participants indicated that men participated in the projects to a substantial degree, and generally, male attitudes appeared to be positive. However, there is no conclusive evidence that WID projects have caused a significant change in the traditional attitudes of males.

In the Kassack Nord Project, men interviewed stated that they approved of the project because benefits to their women were benefits to them. However, there is some evidence, as stated by women, that the men were reducing the amounts of

money that they normally give to their womenfolk in proportion to the women's increased earnings from the sale of vegetables. Many of the projects had men in management and production positions. In the Ghana Day Care Project, the men are functioning on two committees that plan for and operate the centers for the YWCA. The Gara Cloth Project had men in the bookkeeping and sales positions and many of those who tie the fabric are men. Both the Tivaouane and Kassack Nord Projects had male managers.

#### Host Government Commitment

The local support from official sources was generally deficient. However, in those projects where the host government project personnel was skilled, committed and cooperative, the level of official support seemed to be greater. However, this does not necessarily reflect strong government support, but rather the importance of the selection of the proper staff.

#### EXTERNAL FACTORS - CONSTRAINTS

There are many obstacles to project success which are beyond the control of those who design and implement the projects. In some instances, anticipation, creative design, careful planning, and consistent monitoring can convert an obstacle into an asset. However, some external factors can create constraints that cannot be overcome. All of the projects experienced some failures when they were faced with serious constraints imposed by either the weather, culture, economics, or education.

### Weather

Drought has presented the most fearsome obstacle to the income producing component of vegetable growing in the Casamance, Tiavaouane, and Ghana Projects. The lack of rain caused water tables to drop. Wells went dry and villagers were unable to dig them deeper, thus, seriously impeding their ability to provide adequate water supply for their produce activities.

### Religion and Culture

Religion and culture are inseparable and although not normally spoken of in terms of impediment to progress, nevertheless may constitute strong factors in development. Development implies change. Religion and culture are rooted in tradition which is often in confrontation with change. Traditional patterns of behavior are not easily abandoned, thus, they must be given careful consideration in designing development projects so that they become a part of the process, rather than a barrier to it. Orthodox Moslem attitudes tend to relegate women to secondary status in the society. WID projects are programmed to change that status. The evaluation team did not find clear evidence of cultural or religious resistance to the projects.

### Illiteracy

Illiteracy constitutes a serious handicap to development but is a concomitant of underdevelopment. The Sierra Leone

Gara Cloth Project is illustrative. The Executive Council of that project controls the operation of the cooperative project. However, the illiteracy of its members is directly related to the problems of management within the project. Reporting requirements, accounting procedures and record keeping are all affected. The Council is unable to monitor or supervise the project and its policy making is severely limited.

### Economy of the Nation

A development project must be planned and implemented within the economic and political conditions of the nation. All projects require some government commitment. At least there must be government approval before AID can mount the project. Priorities assigned to the project may depend upon the priorities of the national budget. The rising costs of petroleum, the shortages of trained manpower, government competition for budget and manpower have an immediate impact upon the projects funded by AID. The prompt reaction of the YWCA in Ghana to the needs of the Day Care Projects reflects more the nature of the organization than it does the state of the economy. In fact, the economy of Ghana is probably in greater stress than that of any of the project countries visited. It is conceivable that the ready availability of manpower for paying positions with the projects is indicative of high levels of unemployment among men rather than the acceptance of programs tailored for women. The failure of the SAED Organization

in the Kassack Nord Project could be attributed to the inability of government to react to the needs of the project rather than willful neglect.

### FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

#### Criteria for Selection of WID Projects

The team found that all of the projects conform to AID's priority emphasis on rural women, food production, rural development, nutrition and health. The projects are innovative, and experimental. The team concluded that with some modification of design and improvement in implementation, the projects would be replicable.

Some of the projects as noted in the body of the report were seriously lacking in local support and participation. This lack of participation is detrimental to the projects.

Host country initiative, interest and commitment were spotty. The outstanding exception was the Ghana Day Care Project where the host country is represented by a private voluntary organization, the YWCA.

Project design was so inadequate as to be non-existent in one project and defective in others.

There were no market studies conducted prior to the implementation of the income-generating activities.

The absence of base line data resulted in weakened design, called into question the validity of projections, and seriously restricted the measurability of project results.

The projects' goals and objectives were unrealistically ambitious. The limitations of budget and time were insurmountable barriers to achievement of the objectives.

Project designs did not build in evaluation procedures. Evaluation should be a part of project implementation for most effective management. Many problems could have been anticipated or corrected if evaluation had been utilized as a management tool during implementation. Project implementation was significantly limited by the lateness and inadequacy of inputs, weak management and the lack of technical assistance.

In some projects AID funding was not sufficient to supply the inputs necessary to produce the projected outputs. Inputs were often late, inadequate or inappropriate. Although AID is responsive to requests for additional funding in such circumstances, loss of momentum and time plus inflationary pressures inhibit project success. In some instances, the additional funds are not the only answer to the project's problems. Limited funding for inputs resulted from both underestimation and inflation of costs. (See Appendices 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, and 7).

Many of the projects would have benefited from technical assistance. Technical assistance is needed in these projects to improve marketing, management and mechanical skills.

Projects or inputs to projects that are expensive (American made) or mechanically complex were inappropriate in most projects.

Closer monitoring of inputs and management is needed.

- Local participation in either the design or implementation of projects varied considerably. These projects reflect a close correlation between the extent of local participation and the degree of project success. Projects that lack community support are not viable.

Host government commitment to these projects was apparent in some instances but not always to a desirable degree.

**A KEY ISSUE: "Are Women in Development Projects improving the welfare of women and extending their potential as contributors to development?"**

Although these projects do not provide a conclusive answer to this question, on the other hand, they certainly do not indicate little or no impact. The inadequacies of the projects and even the failures cannot be attributed to the fact that women have been targeted by these projects, unless there can be a finding that Women in Development projects are the victims of benign neglect. The repeated low level funding of these projects, lack of useful feasibility studies, and absence of sound project design does suggest that WID projects do not enjoy high priority in AID's scheme of assistance programming.

To the extent that the projects were successful, the lot of the village woman was improved. Not one of the projects has been totally successful but most could be salvaged with the appropriate funding, technical assistance, management and monitoring. There has been enthusiastic reception of project activities that succeeded. Women have taken advantage of new training programs. They have discovered how to work together in cooperative structure. They attend literacy classes and take courses in hygiene and maternal health care. The enthusiasm of the women is the best answer to the question. These projects improve the welfare of women when they are viable. When they falter or fail they are of little benefit to anyone, but the failure is not the fault of the women. Should funds continue to be provided for women's programs per se or are such funds better utilized for activities which involve women within the framework of larger, more comprehensive development projects?

A conclusive answer cannot be provided unless and until there is an analysis and evaluation of all of the discrete women in development projects funded by AID. If the results of such an evaluation reveal a dominant pattern of inadequate funding, poor design, absence of evaluation procedures, lack of technical assistance and poor planning, then the conclusion is inescapable. Such projects do not enjoy high priority and do not yield a good return on the money invested by AID.

Continuing them will only serve to defeat the intent of the law. Each project must be assessed individually regarding its viability and the cost/benefits trade offs involved. The project evaluation for each project found in the appendix provides additional information regarding findings, conclusions and recommendations.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### Project Design

Based on the conclusions drawn from the findings, as stated earlier in this report, and on the sub-project evaluations found in the appendices, it was found that confusion over what appropriately constitutes a WID project can impact on the design of projects. In an effort both to clarify this question and to improve the design of projects, it is recommended:

- For rural development projects which include activities which are directed at improving several sectors, such as nutrition, health, agricultural production, income generation, and education, located in specific geographical areas, and designed for a specific target population, the resources currently used for separate WID projects should be integrated into the design and implementation of the larger development project.
- To those situations in which specific needs are identified and requested by women to meet their specialized

needs, such as day care or women-specific income-generating efforts, it is recommended that well-designed, carefully implemented, and adequately funded WID projects be developed.

- In designing any project, feasibility studies which address the social, economic, cultural, and political impacts of the proposed projects be conducted prior to project design. Such studies should:
  - include base line data upon which progress on project objectives can be measured;
  - include market studies which provide data on the appropriateness and feasibility of proposed activities;
  - clarify the contributions that can be expected from the target populations and contain information on their expected interest and participation in the proposed project; and
  - be conducted in a timely manner so that there is not a significant time lapse between the preparation of the study and the design and start-up of the project.
- The project design should include:
  - realistic and measurable statements of expected outputs, purposes, and goals for the project;
  - sufficient time allotted for project implementation;

- sufficient funding to assure the provision of required inputs; and
- careful consideration of constraints impacting the project, such as climatic conditions, inflation, and political circumstances.
- plans for interim and final project evaluations.

### Project Implementation

In order to assure that projects are effectively implemented, it is recommended that:

- Inputs intended for the projects are appropriate for the project activities and environment; and ensured by the existence of budget adequate to support such inputs; and are delivered in a timely manner so as not to delay the implementation of project activities.
- Expected outputs should be carefully monitored to determine if delays in outputs will affect the achievement of project goals and modifications should be made in the project design when necessary.
- Improved management and technical assistance for project personnel and participants to increase their abilities to manage and implement project activities.
- Target populations and project beneficiaries should be involved in the planning and operation of all project activities. Such participation can insure that the planned inputs and activities reflect the needs and

capabilities of project target groups and can increase their commitments and contributions to the project.

- Men should be included in the planning and implementation of all projects in order to enlist their support for and assistance in project activities.
- The cooperation and support of host government officials in the design and implementation of projects should be solicited. Whenever possible, personnel who are skilled, committed, and interested in the project should be selected and involved in project activities.
- Project personnel should monitor the external factors—weather, religion and culture, the economic and political situations in the host country, and the literacy rates—which can impact on project implementations. They need to develop "early warning systems" which will enable them to take corrective action, including budgetary or project redesign, at points early enough so as not to jeopardize the entire project.

#### Strengthening the Evaluation Process

The evaluation team is cognizant of the many pressures on officials in AID and the time constraints that constantly plague them. It is aware that despite such pressure, AID officials made a diligent effort to assist the team members prior to departure for project sites. The following recommendations are made in appreciative recognition of those efforts:

- Criteria for evaluation of projects should be restructured into two major categories: quantifiable and soft data. The quantifiable criteria should be measurable and related directly to the base line data upon which the project was originally designed. The soft data, which is based on perceptions, intuitive responses, and hearsay, will form the basis for subjective evaluations. This could assist evaluators in selecting methodologies to be used in gathering data needed to meet the criteria in each of the two categories.
- In preparing for the evaluation, sufficient time should be allowed for the evaluation team:
  - to review all project documents available in AID/Washington and to contact and discuss the project with former and current project personnel who are in the United States;
  - to review all in-country documents, to schedule and conduct interviews with project personnel, appropriate host government officials and organizations, and project participants.
  - to write and analyze the data collected, and to prepare a draft report of the project evaluated.
  - to write and modify the final report to be submitted to AID personnel.

- Because evaluations recommendations often contain valuable information which may be applicable for future evaluations and project designs, mechanisms for the transfer of such recommendations and technology contained within those recommendations should be developed.
- It is further recommended that a central respository/ data base of all evaluations on WID and WID related projects be developed in order to facilitate the utilization of such evaluations and transfer of technology.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**A F R I C A N   W O M E N   I N   D E V E L O P M E N T**

**CASAMANCE VEGETABLE GROWERS**

**EVALUATION REPORT**

**AID No. 698-0388.7**

**SENEGAL**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633**

Senegal: Casamance Vegetable Growers 698-0388.7

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Senegal Vegetable Growers Project was designed to include thirteen villages in three departments of the Casamance Region of Senegal. Project activities were only partially implemented in seven of the thirteen villages, which were originally targeted. The project was funded for two years at \$170,000, and implemented jointly through the cooperation of USAID and Promotion Humaine, Government of Senegal. The two year period has passed and the project funds have been exhausted.

The project was built around the setting up of women's cooperatives in the villages for vegetable production and marketing. Each cooperative was designed for thirty-six to forty members, so that approximately 500 women would actively participate. In each of the villages, about two hectares (five acres) of land suitable for vegetable production were to be set aside for the use of the women. The project also called for the construction of social centers in each village in which literacy and health instruction would be provided.

In the seven villages where project activities were conducted, the gardens continue to be partially productive, despite the fact that project funding has ceased. Women in some

villages have shown considerable interest in the project despite problems which arose that were beyond their control.

### PURPOSE AND GOALS

The purpose and the goals of the project were stated in very general terms.

The primary purpose of the project was to assist women vegetable producers in thirteen selected villages to increase and expand their commercial vegetable production and to help them improve village social and economic conditions through specialized training.

The stated project goals were:

- To increase the income of women vegetable producers;
- To provide better nutrition for farm families; and
- To limit the exodus of girls and young women toward the cities.

In the Casamance Region, women working in groups is not a new concept. Therefore, the project was designed to build on pre-existing organizational structure.

### METHODOLOGY

The evaluation team conducted field visits to four of the project sites; garden plots were inspected, and members of the village were interviewed. In addition, the team conducted a document review on all available, written materials at USAID/Washington and USAID/Senegal. These included project

proposals, interim project reports, correspondence, and budget documents, as well as a recently completed Project Evaluation Summary prepared by USAID/Senegal.

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

**Inputs**

Supplies needed to start up vegetable gardening activities presented several problems. The twenty-five wells are operational, but tend to run dry in the drought season; further, the land formations in some areas do not allow for the wells to be made deeper. Only two of the twenty-six pumps delivered are presently in order. Not only was the quality of the pumps poor, but spare parts were difficult to obtain for the American-made equipment. Further, qualified repair and maintenance personnel were not available. The pipes for irrigation proved to be of little use, and sprinklers and buckets continued to be the means of irrigation utilized.

The one vehicle and the eight mobylettes supplied are no longer in working order. Donkeys, which were delivered to only a few villages, proved to be disease-prone, and all but two died. It was suggested that oxen be used in the future, since they tend to be more disease resistant.

The literacy training centers were not constructed in the numbers contemplated. The ones which the team saw are being used for child care, and community meetings and had been built with funds from the vegetable gardening activity.

Most of the literacy instruction provided has been utilized by the men of the villages. Women indicated that they did not have time to attend classes or were not interested.

In the area of leadership and cooperative training, the results were mixed. The village women did receive some training cooperative management on an irregular basis. However, when a regional seminar on vegetable production was offered, only ten women attended because of lack of sufficient advance notification and poor transportation facilities.

Inputs from the women included the construction of pickets for fencing and the fences as well as planting the gardens. The men participated in the land clearing and construction of the fences in some of the villages.

CASAMANCE: Inputs (1)

PROJECT COMPONENTS	Projected	SOURCE	Supplied	EXPLANATION
Vegetable Gardens	26 Wells	AID	25 Wells	Most wells are operational but tend to run dry during the dry season.
	26 Pumps	AID	20 Pumps	Only two pumps are presently in working order due to poor quality, difficulty in obtaining spare parts, and lack of qualified repair and maintenance personnel.
	Mobylettes	AID	8 Mobylettes	At present, none of the mobylettes are in working order.
	1 Vehicle	AID	1 Vehicle	The vehicle is no longer in working condition.
	Irrigation equipment	AID	Some equipment delivered	Sprinkles and buckets were most the common means of irrigation used. Pipes have been of little or no use.
	Farming Tools	AID	Some tools delivered	
	Donkey/ Carts	AID	Few donkeys and carts delivered	Of donkeys delivered, all but two died. Choice of oxen may be indicated in future projects.
	Extension Agents	GOS	Extension Agents	Extension agents provided assistance with delivery of project inputs, explanation of project purposes and goals in villages and training in cooperative management and agricultural techniques. Services rendered were not equitably distributed among all villages and were provided infrequently and irregularly.

CASAMANCE: Inputs (2)

PROJECT COMPONENTS	Projected	SOURCE	Supplied	EXPLANATION
Literacy Training	Fertilizer/Pesticides	GOS	Some fertilizer & pesticides delivered	Villages in most cases supplied their own seeds and constructed their own fences.
	Seeds	Village	Seed and fencing supplied	
	5 hectares Land	Villages	From 2 to 5 hectares supplied per village	
	Construction materials & equipment for 13 Social Centers	AID	Some centers constructed and equipped	
Leadership and Cooperative Training	Training for village leaders; sponsoring of 10 seminars	AID	1 Regional seminar on vegetable production; Training in Cooperative management provided	10 women attended seminar on vegetable preservation; low attendance was due to insufficient advance notification and poor transportation facilities. Village women have received training in financial management of cooperative.
	Extension agents for training	GOS	Agents provided some training in cooperative management	Some training of women provided by GOS extension agents.

**Outputs**

A graphic description and analysis of the projected and achieved outputs are contained in the charts that follow. Materials from the chart are highlighted below for purposes of further explanation.

In the majority of the thirteen villages, most of the planned outputs have not been fully achieved. Project reports indicated that vegetable gardens were successfully implemented in seven of the villages. However, the evaluation team visited four of the seven and observed that only two had producing gardens. When questioned about the obvious inactivity in vegetable production, the women in one village replied that improperly timed planting resulted in a loss of crop, income and membership.

Another handicap experienced by the vegetable growers concerned the lack of coordination among government extension agents in their supervision of inputs and provision of technical assistance to the villages.

CASAMANCE: Outputs

PROJECT COMPONENTS	Projected	ACHIEVED	EXPLANATION
Vegetable Garden	<p>Women's agricultural cooperative formed in 13 villages involving 450 women</p> <p>Women trained to lead coops</p> <p>Women growing and selling vegetables at a yearly profit of \$9,000</p>	<p>Women's Agricultural Cooperatives formed in 7 villages</p> <p>Training provided women in financial management of coops</p> <p>Some profits realized</p>	<p>In 7 of the 13 villages women are cooperatively producing vegetables for sale. Reasons for lack of development of coops in remaining villages include insufficient attention by GOS officials, non-delivery of inputs, and social and/or political problems in the village.</p> <p>Although training in maintenance of a general fund ("caisse" formation) debt amortization, and cooperative organization was provided, it appears that it was not sufficient for the women to grasp the principles.</p> <p>Although yielding a profit at times, it is clear that the vegetable gardens are not providing village women with \$9,000 per year. Due to a reluctance to disclose information on income to outsiders for fear of taxation, actual profits made are difficult to verify.</p>
Social Action	<p>A center constructed in each village to coordinate social activities</p> <p>A specially designed curriculum</p>	<p>Completion of some centers</p> <p>Curriculum developed for training in vegetable preservation</p>	<p>While some centers have been completed, they do not appear to be serving the coordinating role as intended. In some instances, they are used for child care and infrequently for literacy training, mostly for men.</p> <p>A potentially replicable workshop on vegetable preservation was held for village women. Additional work on coop training module is necessary before it can be used effectively in training village women.</p>

**REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS**

**External Factors**

- Drought caused water tables to drop resulting in dry wells. There was not sufficient water for the gardens.
- Repair and maintenance of American-made pumps, as well as other American-made equipment, was not possible because spare parts were difficult to acquire.

**Male Attitudes**

- One or two men were usually present at interviews conducted with the women, and they expressed general support for the project.

**Male Involvement**

- Most of the extension agents and government officials concerned with the project were men;
- Village men contributed to the project by clearing land and setting up fence posts;
- One unplanned benefit for the men included the literacy training they received from the GOS agent.

## FINDINGS

### General Findings

The following findings of the evaluation team are related to the project as a whole.

- With the exception of one of the villages visited, there was little evidence that the project was requested by the project beneficiaries; rather it was imposed on them.
- The project impacted differently on each of the participating villages. Each village experienced a different level of achievement of outputs and program impacts. The inputs, also varied, and the villages received different treatment from the government extension agents. The villages expressed different degrees of satisfaction with the project.
- There was a lack of coordination between SOMIVAC and PIVAC, the two Government of Senegal agencies responsible for implementing the project, with regard to delivery of inputs and provision of training.

### Program Goal Findings

The following findings relate specifically to the program's stated goals. They are based on observation and interviews, since quantifiable data was not made available to the team.

- There was some evidence, in the villages visited, that additional income had accrued to the women as a result of their vegetable production activities.
- It appears that, in the villages where vegetables are actually produced, consumption of the vegetables by the villagers has led to improvement in the nutritional status of the population.
- There was no evidence that the migration of girls and young women to the cities has been reduced as a result of the implementation of project activities.

#### CONCLUSIONS

The general conclusion of the evaluation team is that the Casamance project was at best, a marginal success and that it could have benefited from a pre-design study, closer monitoring and supervision and appropriate levels of technical assistance.

Specific conclusions are as follows:

- Inadequate supervision, uneven monitoring and poor management of inputs by the GOS and AID seriously impeded the accomplishment of project purposes.
- The absence of a pre-design marketing study hindered effective commercialization of the vegetables and reduced the possibility of increased income for women.

- In some villages, the commitment of the village men and women to the project, never clearly ascertained from the beginning, declined during the life of the project as a result of disagreement regarding their contributions and poor and infrequent monitoring by project managers.
- The non-delivery of a number of project inputs points to a serious misuse of project funds. This fund mismanagement was never thoroughly investigated by either the GOS or AID project managers.
- In the villages visited by the team, the greatest achievement toward project goals and purposes was made in that village where women previously functioned in a cooperative unit and where they had input into the decisions made regarding their participation in the project.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

If projects similar to this are to be considered for funding in the future, it is essential that several factors be taken into consideration before implementation. In light of this evaluation, several recommendations for future projects follow.

- Prior to the establishment of any vegetable production activity by village women for market distribution

it is essential that marketing studies be conducted to avoid the problems of market saturation encountered in this project. To avoid this in the future, alternative markets need to be explored.

- Training in several areas is indicated.
  - The workshop held on vegetable preservation is an innovative idea which should be expanded. Preservation of vegetables not immediately absorbed by markets is an alternative which needs further exploration.
  - Training in vehicle and pump maintenance operation is indicated by the loss of all the mobylettes purchased for this projet and most of the pumps. Maintenance operation training should precede inputs of equipment.
  - Training in animal care is indicated. The loss of donkeys in this project has been partially attributed to disease. This recommendation will apply even if it is decided to replace the donkey with oxen.
- The monitoring and timing of inputs needs to be improved. The team makes the following recommendations:
  - In future contracts, inputs of the government should be listed by the participating agency to

allow for effective monitoring of timeliness, quality and quantity.

- Inputs should be programmed to arrive in the villages at carefully spaced intervals, to insure that the women show interest in the project, and make their contributions as a condition precedent to the delivery of further inputs.
- Closer and more consistent monitoring on the part of AID and local government is needed for projects of this scale and complexity (thirteen villages spread over three administrative districts) to assure that inputs and technical assistance are evenly distributed.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**W O M E N     I N     D E V E L O P M E N T**

**KASSACK NORD**  
**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**AID No. 698-0388.4**  
**SENEGAL**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210**  
**5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041**  
**(703) 578-4633**

Senegal: Kassack Nord 698-0388.4INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

In 1977, the Agency for International Development provided the Government of Senegal with \$25,000 to implement the Kassack Nord sub-project (No. 698-0388.4). This activity was to be conducted in the relocation village of Kassack Nord, in the Delta River Region of Senegal. The implementing agency for the project was SAED (la Societe d'Amenagement et d'Exploitation du Delta), the GOS unit responsible for relocation and development in the Delta region. The village was created in 1966 and the project paper states that in 1977 the village women requested that SAED assist them to organize a broader range of economic activities. Through a survey conducted by SAED and village elders, men and women, several concerns were identified. They included the women's heavy workload of wood gathering, millet pounding, child rearing and farming. The women expressed a desire for improved health care and sanitary conditions, literacy training and income generating activities.

At the conception of the project, activities were planned to commence in October, 1977 and be completed by December, 1978. Due to a variety of bureaucratic and budgetary difficulties, both on the part of AID and SAED, activities did not commence until January, 1979. At the time of the site visit,

February, 1980, the project had been underway approximately one year.

### PURPOSE AND GOALS

The purpose of this project was to lighten the heavy burden of daily chores performed by the women, and to establish a pre-cooperative structure which would offer as work alternatives a variety of economic and social activities including:

- construction of a women's activity center
- vegetable, rice and poultry production
- literacy training
- health training (to include nutrition and hygiene training and maternity services)
- fabric dyeing
- animal traction (donkey and cart)
- grain milling

### REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

#### Inputs

Inputs and outputs are to be found in the charts that follow. Materials found in the charts are highlighted below for purposes of further explanation.

Due to initial undercosting of the budget, the amount of input was significantly reduced. Although construction of an eight-building activity center has been completed, most project activities have not yet been implemented. Inputs supplied

to the project to date include construction materials, seeds, a grain mill, maternity instruction, literacy and hygiene instruction, and crocheting.

A few project activities have functioned on an intermittent and irregular basis. The vegetable gardening activity, while implemented, had ceased operation after one season due to the women's involvement in rice production away from the village. Literacy instruction pre-dated the project, but continues to be implemented on an intermittent basis. Crocheting instruction, an unplanned activity, has been provided by the assistant project manager, who is a woman. The grain mill has been put into place but is not being utilized. There is little evidence that these work activities have taken place within the pre-cooperative AIR structure as planned. Several sensitization seminars on organization of AIR structure have been held by the SAED project manager and literacy instructor, but the existence of the AIR as a functioning coordinating unit was not apparent.

As of February, 1980, the project funds had been expended, and additional funding had been requested. AID has agreed to provide up to \$10,000 to support the cost of the additional inputs.

At the time the project was proposed, SAED promised that land in the vicinity of Kassack Nord would be prepared for rice

cultivation at the start of the project. However, as of February, 1980, the fields were not yet ready for rice planting. Consequently, for at least five months a year, the villagers live in temporary encampments eleven kilometers away, near rice fields provided by the government. It was the opinion of the evaluation team that the frequent absences of women from the village minimized local pressure on SAED to implement project activities.

### Outputs

For the most part, the projected outputs have not been realized. The only perceptible outputs achieved include the produce and small margin of profit from the vegetable garden, the literacy instruction received and the hygiene and maternity instruction received from the midwife.

As noted above, the projected funding was inadequate to supply the level of inputs planned. A decision was made to complete construction of project buildings prior to initiation of major project activities. Consequently, project funds were exhausted before equipment and materials could be purchased for the activities. It is assumed that this decision was motivated by SAED knowledge that the rice fields close to Kassack Nord would not be completed as soon as promised. Therefore the women would have to leave the village for an extended length of time, preventing their full participation in the project.

## KASSACK NORD: Inputs and Outputs

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS			OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected 11/77	source	Achieved 2/80	Projected 11/77	Achieved 2/80	
Literacy Training	-construction materials -training materials	AID GOS	-construction materials -training materials	literacy classroom, 1 to 300 women functionally alphabetized	Literacy instructor, Mr. Kamera, lives in village, conducts classes for women who choose to attend in temporary building. No figures available for attendance or literacy rates. Cement classroom building constructed in women's activity area, not yet been used.	Village women expressed appreciation for Kamara's work. Observation of their interaction with him clearly indicates he has their confidence and encourages them to speak up. One woman stated she had assumed her time for learning was over, but is happy to discover she can still learn. Women say they attend classes whenever their work will let them.
Rice Production	-6 hectares -seed -pesticide -fertilizer -water -training for women	GOS AID AID AID GOS GOS	-land	harvest of 6 hectares of rice cultivation	Fields surrounding village not yet readied for cultivation.	Fields expected to be ready for 1980 planting season.

KASSACK NORD: Inputs and Outputs

Appendix #2

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS			OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected 11/77	Source	Achieved 2/80	Projected 11/77	Achieved 2/80	
	Vegetable Production	-6 hectares land -seeds -fertilizer -crop protection products -horticulture agent -diesel pump for irrigation	GOS AID AID AID GOS AID	All inputs applied in smaller quantities than planned due to insufficient cost estimates	Vegetable products for auto-consumption	
Grain Milling	-grain mill -construction materials for grain mill hut -cart and donkey -fuel and oil -guard salary -training in grain mill -maintenance	AID AID AID AID GOS AID	grain mill construction materials	50 tons of threshed millet	Grain mill in place, and mill hut constructed. Mill has not yet been used. Donkey cart not delivered.	SAED project director explained that the entire complex will be opened simultaneously, at which time the millet mill will be utilized. Limited funds do not permit other projected inputs at this time.

## KASSACK NORD: Inputs and Outputs

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS			OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected 11/77	source	Achieved 2/80	Projected 11/77	Achieved 2/80	
Health Components						
Village Maternity Service	-construction materials -maternity training -furnishing and equipment	AID AID AID	-construction materials  -training	Up to 70 aseptic deliveries per year	Two room, cement maternity clinic, 3 labor huts constructed. None yet open for use. Trained midwife located in village, aiding deliveries.	SAED Project Director explained that the complex will be opened in September, 1980, at which time the plumbing will have been connected for maternity clinic use. Dimensions of clinic smaller than planned due to insufficient initial cost estimates.
Health Post and Medicine Supply	-sanitation agent training -medicine	AID AID	-medicine	Health post and medicine supply	Midwife has instructed villagers in basic hygiene and dispensed non prescription parmicuticals.	Village women expressed considerable appreciation for the midwife's activities and are eagerly looking forward to the opening of the maternity clinic.

**KASSACK NORD: Inputs and Outputs**

Appendix #2

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS			OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected 11/77	Source	Achieved 2/80	Projected 11/77	Achieved 2/80	
Poultry Production	-construction materials -poultry stock -feed -fencing -veterinary agent -training for women	AID GOS AID P.D GOS GOS	-construction materials	Profits from sale of: -25 chicks -7,200 eggs -20 roasting chickens -50 spring chickens	Cement poultry hut has been constructed in women's activity area	Original cost estimates insufficient to allow for additional inputs.
Fabric Dying	-construction materials -equipment -cloth -training for women	AID AID AID GOS	-construction materials	Sale of cloth produced	Cement hut for fabric dying constructed in women's activity area, not yet utilized. Project coordinator taught village women to sew and knit resulting in better clothing for children and sale of individual items to other villages.	Original cost estimate insufficient to allow for additional inputs. Village women voiced appreciation for their new found skills and anticipated income in the future from these new marketable skills.

KASSACK NORD: Inputs and Outputs

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS			OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected 11/77	Source	Achieved 2/80	Projected 11/77	Achieved 2/80	
Pre-Cooperative Structure (AIR)		GOS	Sensitization session on formation and management of AIR and functioning of cooperative in Senegal	Creation of an Association of Rural Interest (AIR) to provide framework for women's collective activities	Sensitization sessions held	Traditional women's organizations have not yet provided leadership for establishing formal AIR structure. Further information regarding these organizations and their functions is needed to assist their usefulness in establishing AIR groups.

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS

**Male Attitudes**

The village men stated that they were pleased with the project because whatever is good for their women is good for them. There is no compelling evidence that traditional male dominance has lessened. Local tradition requires prior male approval to ensure success of any project. There is some evidence that husbands ceased providing some income to their wives after the women experienced small increases in income from the vegetable gardening activity.

**Male Involvement**

There has been significant male input into the project. The project Director, literacy instructor and two construction personnel are male. Village males have also helped construct roofing for some of the project buildings.

FINDINGS

The evaluation team found that the project has not yet achieved its stated purpose and goals. However, the following findings reflect what has occurred to date.

- The literacy training, which pre-dated the project, has been successful.
- The hygiene training and maternity services have been well-received, and have helped to sustain the villager's interest in, and hopes for, future implementation of other project components.

## Appendix #2

- Activities designed to alleviate the women's work burden, such as the millet mill, have yet to be implemented.
- Work alternatives have been provided for the women, including crocheting and vegetable gardening. It is unclear whether these activities are taking place within a pre-cooperative structure as planned.
- It is not possible, in the absence of quantifiable data, to determine whether the limited vegetable production activity actually resulted in increased income for the women, or improved the overall nutritional status of the women and their families.
- The women demonstrated a certain amount of satisfaction with the results of the project activities that have occurred, and were enthusiastic about the benefits of possible future activities.
- The village women have not exerted a decisive role in the development process and have had difficulty articulating their needs and expectations for future project activities.

### CONCLUSIONS

Based on its findings, the evaluation team has reached the following conclusions:

## Appendix #2

- In view of the enthusiasm generated by the few activities implemented, there is an opportunity to salvage the project if SAED and USAID/Senegal reassess the activities that can be realistically implemented and if AID provides technical assistance in the implementation.
- In view of the past management problems of the project and the failure of SAED to complete the Kassack Nord rice fields, it is the opinion of the evaluation team that the additional funding requested will not result in successful implementation of the project unless the following steps are taken:
  - careful reassessment of current feasibility of planned activities is undertaken;
  - specific commitments regarding project inputs and project management are obtained from SAED;
  - an increase in the amount of supervision and technical assistance is provided to SAED project managers by USAID/DAKAR.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

Additional funding for this project has been requested. To insure that the project has the maximum potential for success, the evaluation team makes the following recommendations:

- a. ✓ ● Prior to the onset of additional project activities, SAED should undertake its promised preparation of the Kassack Nord rice fields.
- f. ✓ ● A reassessment of the feasibility of planned activities should be conducted, including a marketing survey.
- c. ✓ ● A plan should be designed by AID/DAKAR and SAED to encourage the creation of an AIR, so women will have the opportunity to participate more actively in the project. The plan could emphasize the following elements:
  - Agreements regarding specific contributions of the women to the project should be outlined. The phasing-in of certain inputs to the project should be contingent upon the fulfillment of the contributions. For example, some of the income produced from the grain mill could be applied toward the purchase of cloth in the fabric dyeing activity or the purchase of some of the chicks for poultry production.
  - Activities presenting the greatest possibilities for success should be initiated first. Successful collaboration by women in an income-generating activity such as vegetable gardening and grain

milling will encourage growth and development of the pre-cooperative structure. Working together successfully in this pre-cooperative structure will give women a stronger voice in the project and enable them to exert a more decisive role in its management.

- d. ✓ ● The AIR members should receive technical assistance to assist them in conducting a successful project. The following are some suggested areas:
- Training in record-keeping.
  - Training in the use of new technologies, e.g., grain mill, poultry production, fabric dyeing.
  - Training in equipment maintenance.
  - Training in social organization and managing the participation of all members in project activities.

Technical assistance should be provided to SAED project managers by AID to assist them in improving their management of the project.

- e. ✓ ● Familiarize the SAED project managers with AID reporting and accounting procedures and requirements.
- f. ✓ ● Assist the SAED project managers to develop a plan for the scheduling of inputs and establishing priorities for the project activities. The plan developed must harmonize the scheduling of project activities with the

planned contributions of the women and seek to implement activities with a potential for early success to encourage continued participation by the women.

- g. ✓ ● AID/DAKAR should provide more frequent and consistent monitoring of the project once additional funding is granted to insure that the above recommendations are implemented.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**A F R I C A N   W O M E N   I N   D E V E L O P M E N T**

**TIVAOUANE**

**EVALUATION REPORT**

**AID No. 698-0388.10**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633**

Dakar, Senegal: Tivaouane 698-0388.10

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Tivaouane project is a two year, \$210,000 project designed to alleviate the heavy work load of, and provide work alternatives to women in twelve villages. Six project activities were planned: millet mills, sheep raising, manioc and niebe fields, village pharmacies, wells, and village wood lots. Prior to project implementation, La Promotion Humaine (PH), the Government of Senegal implementing agency, conducted outreach activities to ascertain village interest and inform villages of proposed activities.

The twelve villages involved differ in size, location, accessibility, and prior government development activities. Project activities were originally designed to be two years in duration; due to the remoteness of some villages, the time needed to acquaint villagers with project programs, and weather problems, a one year extension has been requested. No further funding should be needed to extend the project time line.

The stated purpose of the project is to alleviate the heavy workload of women and to offer a variety of economic and social activities within a pre-cooperative structure as work alternatives. Project activities are also designed to improve the quality of village life through a program which increases women's economic incomes and promotes their role in rural development.

At the time of this evaluation, most inputs were still being set in place. Three of the activities had been partially implemented: grain milling, manioc and niebe production and use of wells. Few outputs have been realized and there has been little progress toward the achievement of project goals. However, with additional time, the project appears to have the potential to attain its stated goals and purposes.

#### PURPOSES AND GOALS

A discussion of the project purposes and the degree to which each has been achieved follows:

- To alleviate the heavy burden of daily tasks performed by women.

The project has the potential to alleviate the heavy burden of tasks for women. The use of millet mills in two villages, and wells in a number of villages, are viewed as especially beneficial labor-saving devices by the women. Once the wells are completed and women use monies earned from the project activities to purchase millet mills, as they have been encouraged to do, it is possible that they will experience a significant lightening of their work load.

- To offer as work alternatives, a variety of economic and social activities within a pre-cooperative structure.

The variety of activities being made available to women is expanding their work alternatives. The women are especially enthusiastic about the wells, sheep raising and the cultivating of fruit and nut trees. However, careful and close attention must be given to the effective harmonizing of project activities and inputs with the planned contribution of village women. It must be ensured that the women do not experience an increase work load.

Discussions with women indicate that they are progressively developing skills in organizational management through their collaboration on project activities. Increased collaboration among women in providing contributions to the project, such as donation of personal funds to start amortization funds, hauling water during well construction and providing meals for construction workers, has given women a sense of their own organizational potential. It is apparent from this that women in many villages are in the early stages of developing a pre-cooperative structure.

- To improve the quality of life by increasing women's economic income and promoting their role in rural development.

The project has the potential to fulfill this purpose. In a few villages, women have realized a small increase in income from niebe production, but have been unable to sustain

this activity because of drought. In the villages where millet mills have been utilized, women have generated a pool of funds for their collective use. More assistance in financial management of these funds will be necessary if women are to realize the maximum economic benefits from their commercial activities.

Through participation in the project, it is expected that village women will receive added income that will be of benefit to themselves and their families. As participants in groups which collectively generate funds, they will have a greater voice in activities in their own communities. Their role as generators of income for the community will not go unnoticed and will enable them to take a more active role in their own communities.

A discussion of the goals and the degree to which each has been achieved follows.

- To improve women's economic and social well-being.

It is felt that the project will ultimately achieve this goal if project activities are successfully implemented. Since the early stages of project implementation involved organization and structural planning rather than inputs projected by the project paper, project goals have not yet been attained. The evaluation team is of the opinion that the project design and methods of implementation are essentially sound, and that

progress toward improving women's social and economic well-being can be expected to continue.

- To assist women in exerting a more decisive role in the development of their milieu.

The project is making progress toward the achievement of this goal. Village women interviewed appear to have developed a sense of their own organizational and income-earning potential. In some villages where increased income was generated, women were controlling and managing their own funds. In villages where this was not the case, Promotion Humaine staff were facilitating and encouraging development of village women's financial management and organizational skills. On a national level, this project is aiding women administrators in Promotion Humaine by developing their capacity to administer community development projects.

#### METHODOLOGY

A document review of all available files were conducted in AID/Washington and AID/Dakar. This included the project paper, interim project reports, correspondence and budget reviews. Interviews were conducted with AID staff in Washington and Dakar. Government of Senegal (GOS) staff were interviewed in French. A representative sample of six villages, of the twelve involved with the project, were visited, and interviews conducted with a representative sample of villagers. A

total of fifty-nine villagers were interviewed: forty-two women and seventeen men. Village interviews were conducted in Wolof, then translated into French by the Senegalese Project Manager.

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND  
AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

**Inputs**

Project inputs are presently being put in place and should be completed in the next six months. With the exception of medical supplies and transportation costs, initial cost estimates appear to have been realistic for completion of project inputs. An extension on the completion date for the project has been requested.

**Outputs**

With the exception of the grain yielded from millet milling and some niebe produced for sale, project outputs have not yet been achieved. This is a result of external factors which have delayed the delivery of project inputs. The project is considered to be at a transitional, breakthrough point, with additional time needed for inputs to be delivered and for outputs to be achieved.

(See matrices on following pages for input/output assessments).

TIVAOUANE PROJECT INPUT/OUTPUT ACHIEVEMENT

Appendix #3

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS		OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected	Achieved	Projected	Achieved	
Wood Lots	Eucalyptus plants Wood fencing	Eucalyptus planted Barbed wire fences in place	Firewood produced for village residents	No firewood produced as yet	Trees planted have suffered from insufficient watering, due to low rainfall and improperly located and/or non-functioning wells. Barbed wire fence is inadequate protection against grazing animals. Use of eucalyptus plants being re-considered, alternate trees (cashew of mango) which yield marketable fruit, are being considered.
Village Pharmacies	Infrastructure training Medicines	No pharmacies in place or medicines purchased	Medicines supplied for use of village residents	No medicines being supplied to village residents	Medicines have not been purchased because funds proposed were inadequate for purchase of U.S. medicines, a project requirement. UNICEF village pharmacy program is seen as a possible source of supplies.
Manioc and Niebe Production	-Land -Seeds -Fertilizer -Crop protection products -Labor -Fencing	Land Seeds  Labor	10 tons per hector of manioc  Niebe for auto-consumption	No manioc produced (Peanuts planted instead). Niebe field planted and small harvests produced and sold	Low rainfall is largely responsible for shortfall in crop production. Manioc was not planted because insects destroyed other manioc plants in the area. Lack of fencing allowed animals to wander into planted area and destroy crops.

## TIVAOUANE PROJECT INPUT/OUTPUT ACHIEVEMENT

PROJECT COMPONENTS	INPUTS		OUTPUTS		EXPLANATION
	Projected	Achieved	Projected	Achieved	
<u>Millet Mills and Decorticators</u>	2 millet mills 2 decorticators gasoline oil	2 millet mills in place - one functioning	32,400 K of threshed millet @ 10 F/K	1 mill yielding income of 128,000 CFA	Delays in mill use are due to lack of proper training in installation. Successful use of mill as source of income for women will require further training in financial planning and management.
<u>Sheep Raising</u>	construction materials for pens  450 sheep  medicine & feed  labor for construction	13 sheep pens 40%-70% completed	Sheep for sale	No sheep produced for sale as yet	Sheep will be delivered upon completion of sheep pens. Design of pens seen as potentially problematic. The pens are elaborate, may not provide necessary air flow and could cause disease in the raining season. They will be closely monitored during first season.
<u>Wells</u>	Construction materials for wells  labor	14 wells 80% complete	14 Wells supplying water for village residents, vegetable plots, wood lots and sheep.	Uncompleted wells supplying a minimal amount of water for village residents	Lack of rain, descending water table and changes in well contractors have resulted in delays in well construction. The contractor must now await end of dry season (July) to ascertain proper depth before completing work on wells.

**REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS****External Factors**

The major external factor affecting the project was the weather. Because of low rainfall during the 1979-1980 growing season, no manioc, and only small amounts of niebe, were produced. Lack of rainfall also accounts for limited growth of eucalyptus trees and for delays in well construction.

Male participation in the project has been consistent. Men have contributed in a moderate way to the start-up of the project activities, mostly by assisting in manioc and niebe cultivation. They have also assisted in the management of funds earned from millet mills and have, in a general way, supported the participation of women in the project. At least two men were present during each interview conducted with village women.

Attitudinal changes are difficult to assess at this point. The predominant role of men in the management of funds earned by women from millet mills may indicate that little has changed. It is not clear whether this arrangement enables women to realize the maximum benefit from these funds. Additional training in financial management for women may be necessary if they are to develop confidence in their ability to manage collectively earned funds.

FINDINGS

- Women and men in most villages visited have made substantial contributions to the project including providing food for construction workers, hauling water during construction, assisting with hut construction, and other activities designed to move the project forward.
- Project managers from the implementing agency, Promotion Humaine, have provided consistent monitoring and supervision of the projects and have provided informal training to project participants during site visits.
- Women appear to be collaborating effectively in most project activities and are developing leadership and organizational skills.
- Women participated to a moderate degree in the development and design of the project and were interviewed regarding their needs prior to the project design.
- Women are participating in the project both as managers and as beneficiaries.
- Women who have succeeded in generating income from their collective production activities did not demonstrate a thorough understanding of sound financial management techniques.

### Appendix #3

- The eucalyptus trees have not produced as planned, due to low rainfall and the sophisticated tending methods required.
- The design of the sheep pen is potentially problematic because it may not provide the necessary air flow, and may create an environment conducive to disease during the rainy season.
- Village pharmacies are not presently in operation due to the high cost of obtaining American-made medicines.
- Although the project has reached its completion date, sheep-raising, firewood production, full use of wells, village pharmacy services, manioc and niebe production have not been fully implemented.
- Well construction has been delayed by poor weather, drought and changes in personnel.

### CONCLUSIONS

Based on the findings, the evaluation team feels that this project is benefiting women and has the potential to contribute to their welfare and to that of their families. This assessment is based on the following conclusions:

- There is, in general, clear commitment to, and support for, the project by the women and men in most of the villages visited, as demonstrated by their consistent contributions to the project and their positive assessment of its impact to date.

- The relatively high commitment of the Government of Senegal to the project is reflected in the consistent and competent monitoring of the project by the implementing agency, Promotion Humaine. This commitment has been a decisive factor in the progress made on the the project to date.
- Project activities and those furnished by women are contributing toward increasing their ability to work together productively in a cooperative structure.
- Baseline data obtained prior to project implementation included a moderate degree of information regarding the participation of women but does not appear to have sufficiently emphasized the kinds of information necessary for effective evaluation of the project upon completion.
- The participation of women in the project as managers at the national level is providing women with experience in administration and management of rural development projects.
- Increased training is needed by the women in techniques of financial management, including debt amortization, record-keeping and depreciation.
- The eucalyptus trees were not an appropriate choice for wood production. The fact that women recommended

cashew and fruit trees as alternatives demonstrates that they give higher priority to the production of cash crops than to production of firewood and points up a lack of thorough investigation during the project design phase.

- Inadequate investigation of appropriate sheep pen designs led to the construction of pens which may severely restrict the ability of the women to successfully engage in sheep production.
- Most delays in the implementation of uninitiated project activities are the result of external factors, such as drought, poor weather and routine delays encountered in rural environments.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

Project goals and purposes are reasonable and achievable if additional time is provided. To ensure the continuing effectiveness of the project, the evaluation team recommends the following:

- That, more frequent and systematic training be provided the women in record-keeping, debt amortization and depreciation to ensure that they derive the maximum benefit from their earnings.
- That, prior to the initiation of sheep raising and fruit and nut tree production, a market study be

### Appendix #3

conducted to determine potential markets for the goods produced from these activities and the ability of the women to assess the markets.

- That, in view of the women's lack of sheep experience in raising and alternative tree cultivation, frequent and systematic technical assistance be provided them by extension agents during the early stages of these activities.
- That, there be close monitoring of the sheep pen design by the livestock agent during the first year of operation.
- That, in order to implement the village pharmacy activities consideration be given to the purchase of UNICEF medicines or that a waiver be prepared to enable non-American medicines to be purchased.
- That the project completion date be extended by one year, to March, 1981. No additional funding is required.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**A F R I C A N   W O M E N   I N   D E V E L O P M E N T**

**GHANA DAY CARE**  
**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**AID No. 698-0388.3**  
**GHANA**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210**  
**5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041**  
**(703) 578-4633**

Ghana YWCA Day Care Centers - Project #698-0388.3

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Ghana YWCA Day Care Center project was initiated after YWCA personnel received requests from village women for assistance in caring for their young children. The Ghana YWCA, with the assistance of AID, developed a proposal whose purpose was the establishment of a day care center for children. This center was planned to provide the women with health, nutrition, and family planning services, and to establish activities to increase the earning capacity of village women.

The proposal requested a grant of \$25,000 for an 18 month period (September, 1976 - May, 1978) to fund three day care centers. Asokore, Bawaleshie, and Kona were selected as the sites for the three centers. Though the agreement was signed in 1976, the initial funding was not received until April, 1977. However, the project started eight months earlier, in September, 1976, with the YWCA assuming all project costs until funding was received.

In addition, when the agreement was signed, the YWCA found that an \$8,000 vehicle was included as an item in the \$25,000 budget. The YWCA had not expected that the car would be a part of the \$25,000 request, but would be provided by some other funding. This inclusion, in effect, reduced the amount

of money available for the day care center project to \$17,000. At this time, the YWCA made a conscious decision to concentrate most of its efforts, and limited funds, on developing Bawaleshie as a model center, which could be replicated in other areas.

#### PURPOSES AND GOALS

The stated purpose of this project was to provide day care services requested by rural women and to create a basis for activities aimed at increasing income, and improving health, nutrition, and family planning. To a very large extent, the purpose has been achieved. The day care requested is being provided through the operation of the day care centers. Children of the village are receiving health services, either at the day care center or through outreach efforts. Nutritional instructions to village mothers help in improving the village diets, while the lunches provided to center participant children are currently improving their diets.

The project objectives included:

- 150-200 children attending day care centers daily;
- women participating in educational services and utilizing health, nutrition, and family planning services; and
- development of day care centers into economically viable units supported by the villagers.

METHODOLOGY

The evaluation team visited Asokore and Bawaleshie, two of the three day care center sites. In addition, the team conducted a document review of all available YWCA and day care center records and reports, and held interviews with project personnel and participants.

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND

ACCOMPLISHMENTS

Inputs

(A chart depicting the inputs in graphic form follows). The materials below represent further explanation of materials in the charts.

The YWCA began the project prior to the receipt of AID funding, by assuming not only its projected costs, but those of AID also. The YWCA purchased basic commodities for use at the centers and used its own vehicles for transportation until the AID-supplied car arrived in December, 1977. The YWCA also began training of six young women, selected by the village, to become day care center attendants. During the course of the project, older women were trained to function as supervisors.

YWCA personnel also contacted the villages to determine what support they could offer to the project. The villages agreed to donate buildings to house the centers and food for the children's lunches. The facilities donated were generally

old, dilapidated churches or missions, which are too small to serve the children adequately. Consequently, some parents are reluctant to have their children attend the center because of overcrowding. In April, 1978, the village chief of Asokore donated an uncompleted building to serve as an alternate facility; however, at the time of this evaluation, the building is still uncompleted.

While the proposal projected that the villagers would provide payment for child care and lunches, this payment has been inconsistent, due to a variety of factors. A drought in the area destroyed most crops, thus severely reducing the income generated by the farmer population. The devastation of the crops also restricted the farmers' ability to donate food for the childrens' lunches. A backyard garden, planted at the Bawaleshie Center, was expected to provide both food and income; the drought destroyed both the garden and that expectation.

However, the villagers do periodically donate food to the center. In addition, the YWCA has coordinated activities of the Ministry of Agriculture-Home Extension Unit and the Catholic Relief, both of which have donated food to supplement the childrens' diets. The Ministry of Agriculture provides sorghum and wheat, while the Catholic Relief provides milk. Thus, the children are receiving nutritious lunches while at the centers.

GHANA DAY CARE: Inputs

INPUTS	PROJECTED	SOURCE	SUPPLIED	EXPLANATION
<p>\$25,000 grant to finance:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. salaries of workers</li> <li>2. Commodities (except for vehicle maintenance and training costs)</li> <li>3. Feasibility survey</li> <li>4. Training of 6 workers and 4 supervisors</li> </ol>	<p>Grant would provide initial monies to start and maintain project for 18 months (Sept., 1976 - May, 1978)</p>	<p>AID</p>	<p>Agreement signed in Sept., 1975. First check arrived in April, 1977</p>	<p>Because of delay in receipt of AID funding, YWCA picked up costs of training workers and sought assistance from villagers in gathering necessary commodities for centers.</p>
<p>Overhead Costs</p>	<p>YWCA would assume initial overhead costs. It was hoped that, through the development of income generating activities, that the village would at some point be able to sustain the operation of the centers</p>	<p>YWCA</p>	<p>YWCA supported overhead costs from start-up of project and, because of delay in receipt of AID funding, also assumed other project costs till funding arrived</p>	<p>YWCA is still supporting overhead costs from its own budget.</p>
<p>Vehicle maintenance and running costs</p>	<p>AID would supply car for transportation between village, while YWCA would provide maintenance and running costs</p>	<p>YWCA</p>	<p>AID supplied vehicle did not arrive until December, 1977</p>	<p>YWCA used its own vehicle prior to the arrival of the AID supplied car in December, 1977.</p>

GHANA DAY CARE: Inputs

INPUTS	PROJECTED	SOURCE	SUPPLIED	EXPLANATION
Buildings for Centers	Villagers would provide buildings to be used as day care centers	Villagers	Donated at start-up of project	Buildings were donated by village Development Committee. The facilities were all churches or missions, generally in delapidated condition. In April, 1978, the village chief of Asokore donated to the YWCA an uncompleted building to be used to house the day care center.
Payment for lunches and child care	Minimal tuition charge would help pay for lunches and attendants. Villagers would provide some food for children's lunches. Some of the output from the backyard garden planned for the day care center could be used for lunches.	Villagers	In Asokore, minimal tuition offset some costs for lunches and, on occasion, supplemented the income of the attendants. In Bawalashie, backyard garden was planted, but failed to produce any crops.	Due to drought and pests, farmers in Bawalashie lost their own crops and were then unable to pay minimal tuition. Backyard garden at Center was also destroyed. In Asokore, parents had joined together to underwrite some of the cost of the day care center, through the minimal tuition charge.

**Outputs**

Four major outputs were expected from this project. They are described on the charts that follow. The information below represents a further explanation of this material.

The outputs included trained workers and supervisors; two buildings outfitted as day care centers; health, nutrition, and family planning programs for mothers and health services for children; and a feasibility survey of income-generating activities. To an important extent, most of these outputs have been achieved.

The proposal projected that 150-200 children would be served in two buildings, outfitted as day care centers. Currently, there are 85-90 children at the Asokore Center and 69 children in Bawaleshie, all aged 2-5 years. More children would attend if the buildings could accommodate them. However, both center buildings are too small to accommodate additional children. The buildings, also, still need additional equipment and learning aids. Despite these problems, the centers have gained wide acceptance and support in the village communities.

The original staffing plans called for six day care attendants and four supervisors to be trained. The six attendants initially chosen were young girls, ages 18-21, who received training in nutrition, hygiene, and child care from YWCA

personnel in Accra. Older women were trained as supervisors. These young women, however, tended to get married, have children, and leave their positions at the day care center. Consequently, the turnover in attendants has been high. Though several attendants have been trained, at the time of this evaluation it was found that of the Bawaleshie staff of two day care attendants and some volunteers, only one attendant has been trained. Of the Asokore staff of three day care attendants and one supervisor, only the supervisor, a former teacher/social worker, has been trained. To reduce this turnover problem, the village day care committees are recommending that slightly older women, ages 25-30, be chosen as attendants.

A significant output for the entire community is the YWCA coordination of activities of the Ministry of Agriculture-Home Extension Unit, and the Ministry of Health, Public Community Health Nurses. The community health nurses provide instructions to village mothers, including non-day care participant mothers, on preparation of high protein diets and food preparation and storage. They also operate a prenatal clinic and examine and inoculate children. While non-day care participant children do receive this care, those attending the day care centers benefit from a systematic program of check-ups and inoculations that is impossible to provide on an outreach basis. Though family planning services were planned, it has

become apparent that rural communities do not readily accept the idea of family planning. In this area, approaches must be made indirectly, with family planning integrated into a package of health, nutrition, and educational services.

The feasibility survey of income generating activities was completed during the course of the project. This survey indicated that any income generating activities must be geared to meet the needs and lifestyle of the population. Since the villagers are farmers, any assistance should be agriculturally oriented. Because of the drought, efforts aimed at increasing the water supply should be considered.

Assistance in facilitating the marketing of agricultural products would also benefit the area population. Alternative income-generating activities, such as bead making or flower arrangements, might be considered to supplement agricultural efforts.

GHANA DAY CARE: Outputs

OUTPUTS	PROJECTED	ACHIEVED	EXPLANATION
Workers and supervisors trained	6 attendants and 4 supervisors trained and employed	Asokore staff (current) 3 day care attendants; 1 supervisor Bawalashie staff (current) 2 day care attendants some volunteers	The attendants initially chosen for the project were young girls, ages 18-21. These girls would get married, have children, then leave the center. Consequently, there has been a large turnover in attendants.
2 buildings outfitted as day care centers	150-200 children would be served in buildings	69 children in Bawalashie; 85-90 children in Asokore	Building in Bawalashie is too small to accommodate children adequately. Equipment and learning aids are still needed in order to provide services. Lack of space at both center bars the enrollment of additional children at the centers.
Health, nutrition and family planning programs for mothers, health services for children	Women whose children were enrolled at centers would receive health, nutrition, family planning services when they dropped off and picked up their children and during free time. Children at centers would benefit from health services provided at centers.	Outreach to community in health, nutrition, food preparation and storage, family planning and inoculations for children. Children at day care center receive systematic program of check-ups and inoculations. Children at centers receive nutritious lunches.	YWCA coordinated activities of the Ministry of Agriculture, Home Extension Unit, the Ministry of Health, Public Community Health Nurses, and Catholic Relief. Ministry of Agriculture provides sorghum and wheat, Catholic Relief provides milk for children at centers. Community health nurses provide instructions to mothers on preparation of high protein diets and operate a pre-natal clinic. Rural communities do not readily accept the idea family planning. An indirect approach is necessary on this subject.

GHANA DAY CARE: Outputs

OUTPUTS	PROJECTED	ACHIEVED	EXPLANATION
Feasibility survey of income generating activities	Survey report would indicate most feasible income generating activities, including project plans and resources required to implement them.		

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS

**External Factors**

- Drought and irrigation problems devastated the crops in Bawaleshie, thus destroying the potential income producing garden at the center. The drought also had a severe, adverse economic effect on the entire community.

**Male Attitudes**

- Men have been supportive of the day care center projects.
- In April, 1979, the village chief of Asokore, aware of the benefits accruing to the entire community from the project, donated an uncompleted building to be used for the day care center.

**Male Involvement**

- Men participate on the committees-YWCA Rural Development Committees, village day care committees-which are involved in the planning and operation of the day care centers. The YWCA has encouraged efforts to involve men more actively in the entire project.

FINDINGS

- The YWCA Day Care Center Project has resulted in the establishment of two strong day care centers, operating in the villages of Asokore and Bawaleshie. Both

centers receive significant community acceptance and support.

- Though the AID funding provided for this project was inadequate, the financial support, leadership, particularly from Kate Parks, and support from the YWCA, strongly contributed to the development of the day care centers. This support is evidenced by the YWCA's provision of funds for initiation of the project prior to the arrival of AID funding, and by the continued support of the day care centers by the YWCA since the end of the AID funding.
- There has been significant turnover in the staffs at the day care centers. This turnover has resulted when the young girls selected as day care attendants, average ages 18-21, have left their positions at the centers to marry and have families of their own.
- The current day care center buildings are small and dilapidated. The centers also lack certain important commodities; for example, sleeping mats, educational aids, kitchen utensils, and sanitation facilities in Asokore, etc.
- The Government of Ghana has shown interest in, and support for, the project to the extent its limited resources allow. Community health nurses from the

#### Appendix #4

Ministry of Health are providing health and nutritional services to village children and mothers, including non-day care participant children and mothers. The Home Extension Unit of the Ministry of Agriculture is providing some nutritional foodstuffs for the children's lunches.

- The villagers do provide some support for the day care centers, in the form of minimal tuition and/or the provision of food. However, due to the devastation caused by the drought and the depressed nature of the local economy, the villagers cannot provide the anticipated financial support for the centers, nor can they provide food on any regular basis.
- The project has had several positive effects for women, including the provision of nutritional instruction, health care, and child care. Children attending the centers have benefited from the nutritional lunches, health services, and educational activities provided at the centers. Additionally, health and nutrition services have been provided to non-participant mothers and children through outreach efforts. These effects will be discussed further in later portions of this report.

CONCLUSIONS

- The day care centers have provided significant benefits for the villages in which they are located. These benefits, provided for both participants' families and the community as a whole, include the participation of women in activities which promote child development.
- The AID funding of \$25,000, which included approximately \$8,000 for a vehicle for the project, was insufficient to support the development and operation of the three day care centers projected in the initial project proposal. The YWCA has been supporting the operation of the centers since the end of AID funding, and has applied through the Farmer's Association and Agribusiness Development (FAAD) program for additional funding to support the continuation of this project.
- Although the turnover in staff did impair the continuity of provision of experienced care, the nutritional, health, and hygiene training for the young women attendants has had some unanticipated benefits. Though these young women have left their positions at the centers, they have taken the knowledge and experience gained as day care attendants to their own families and to other village women. Thus, a "spread effect" has occurred.

It is important to note, however, that though this project has had a high turnover rate, the young women are the ones who have the most intimate involvement with the children and who are most popular with them. There should always be, however, at least one older, educated person on the staff to provide educational training and supervision for the younger women.

- The current day care center buildings are inadequate to support the program effectively. There is not enough room to accommodate the children currently enrolled, nor is there room to take in additional village children who wish to attend. Also, commodities need to be provided in order to assure optimal services for the children.
- The Government of Ghana appears to be providing as much as it can in support of the program.
- Due to the depressed nature of the economy in Ghana, it is unrealistic to expect that the villagers will likely be able to support the operation of the day care centers entirely on their own. Some form of assistance will probably be necessary for this project.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Ghana Day Care Center Project has provided valuable services to the communities in which they are

located and has promoted rural development, an objective of the AID programs. It is recommended that this project be continued and improved.

- The proposal for additional funding, placed by the YWCA with the FAAD program, should be approved and funds allocated for the extension of this project.
- In order to provide both continuity and quality care for the children at the day care center, the staff should be composed of persons of different age groups and experiences. For example, there should be at least one older, educated person on staff to provide both supervision for the day care attendants and educational instruction for the students. There should be younger women serving as day care attendants, both because of their ability to work well with the children, and for the opportunity that such employment allows for these young women to gain experience and skills that they can later bring to their own families and other village women.
- The current day care center buildings should be replaced. The village chief in Asokore has donated an uncompleted building for the use by the day care center. This building should be completed.

In Bawaleshie, if another facility cannot be found, utilization of the current facility must be maximized. For example, the children can be divided into age groups, with each group participating in different activities. One group could be inside the building, while the other group could be outside in the shade provided by the frontage of the building. Some improvements to the front yard area, including the addition of play equipment, would make this area more suitable for outside activities.

- The YWCA should continue to coordinate the services provided to the project by the Government of Ghana.
- A handicraft, such as bead or flower making, as has been suggested, should be considered as a supplemental income generating activity. These supplemental activities could provide income for the villagers until irrigation problems in the area are solved and sufficient water is available for the villagers' usual agricultural activities. In addition, these activities could provide additional revenue, even if agricultural production increased.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**W O M E N     I N     D E V E L O P M E N T**

**GARA CLOTH INDUSTRY**

**EVALUATION REPORT**

**AID No. 698-0388.2**

**SIERRA LEONE**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633**

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

The Gara Cloth Industry project was designed as a part of the regionally funded Women in Development projects (AID No. 698-0388.2). The project is supported by assistance from U.S. AID and the Government of Sierra Leone (GOSL). This evaluation was conducted to determine whether the project has resulted in a more productive integration of the women involved in the project into the national economy of Sierra Leone, both as contributors and beneficiaries of development.

AID involvement with the Gara Cloth Industry began in 1976. During that year, AID agreed to provide \$62,000 to the Government of Sierra Leone: (1) to pay for the services of a marketing consultant to analyze and help organize the Gara Cloth Industry; (2) to train members of the women's industry in marketing and design; and (3) to provide logistical support, supplies, and equipment. The project agreement period was 18 months, from December, 1976 through June, 1978, with the amount of AID assistance provided totaling \$115,165.

In July, 1978, a proposal was submitted to AID requesting additional assistance for the project. In July 1979, a two year, bilateral agreement was signed between the U.S. AID and the Government of Sierra Leone, with AID agreeing to provide \$205,000.

The primary goal of this project is to assist in the growth and development of the indigenous Gara Cloth and handicraft industry in Sierra Leone through aid and technical assistance. As stated in the project agreement, "this assistance would consist of implementing a regular and continuous flow of goods to and from producers to local and foreign markets. Such a flow of goods would include the direct importation and delivery of raw materials to the individual procedures, as well as the pick-up and cash buying of finished products from the producers for delivery to local and foreign markets." AID would fully subsidize the project during the first year, while, during the second year, support would gradually shift to the Government of Sierra Leone. At the end of the two year period, it is hoped that the project will have become self-sufficient.

#### PURPOSE AND GOAL

This evaluation was conducted during the ninth month of the first year of a two-year project. At this point, it was found that the Gara Cloth Industry Cooperative was producing quality, marketable items. A project staff had been hired, and the structure of the Cooperative itself had been reorganized. Some marketing of products to foreign countries had been conducted.

However, technical assistance in the design of management, production, and marketing systems is still necessary

to strengthen the project. Thus, it is too early to assess what the ultimate effects of this project will be.

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND ACCOMPLISHMENT

**Inputs**

The following inputs were identified as being necessary for implementation of the project. During the first year, AID would provide salaries for a network of personnel, both in-country and abroad; an in-country vehicle; and seed capital for the purchase of raw materials and cash buying of finished products. The Government of Sierra Leone (GOSL) would provide personnel input and assistance from government staff members and would pay the salaries of these personnel; rent for a showroom and design shop; fuel contribution of two gallons per day; administrative overhead; and reimbursement for the duty on the consignment of raw materials.

Selection of the project staff began in September, 1979, with most of the staff hired and on board by early October. The project staff was to include a U.S. advisor, a Sierra Leonian coordinator, two field representatives to work in the provinces, a driver, a tailor, and a seamstress. Managers for the export office and arts and crafts store, personnel from the GOSL Department of Cooperatives, were functioning in their positions prior to the staff selection process. At the time of this evaluation, all personnel, with the exception of one

field coordinator position have been hired. However, because the field supervisors are expected to deliver raw materials to the craftspeople in the provinces and to return finished goods to Freetown, the continued absence of one field supervisor could significantly interfere with the operations of this project.

Among the first acts of the project staff was the holding of a series of general meetings with cooperative members and general public to inform them of the new agreement. These meetings were held both in Freetown and in the provinces. In addition to informing members of the new plan, these meetings were used to stimulate interest in the idea of a cooperative and encourage participation in and support of the Sierra Leone Arts and Crafts Cooperative. Growth in membership of the coop has been slow, due both to cultural, economic and social factors which mitigate against such organizations and to previous mismanagement of the coop which resulted in a loss of confidence in the venture. However, the Cooperative has now been reorganized, with officers and representatives from each province elected. It is hoped that this new organizational structure, the cooperative officers themselves, will provide new leadership.

Funds for a vehicle were included in the project agreement. This vehicle is necessary for transporting raw materials to and finished goods from the provinces. After some delay

in the receipt of funds, a vehicle was purchased and a driver from the Department of Cooperatives was assigned to the project. While the GOSL provides petrol for the vehicle, the price of gasoline makes the cost of many trips to the provinces prohibitive. Careful plans must be made for utilization of these transportation resources, since other methods of transportation in Sierra Leone are slow and difficult.

Because the raw materials necessary for the Gara Cloth industry-fabrics, dyes, solvents, threads, sewing supplies and T-shirts-are not available in Sierra Leone, these goods must be imported. Using the seed capital provided by the AID funds, damask was ordered from a West German firm, dyes were ordered from Abidjan, and silk was ordered from India. These materials arrived and were distributed to cooperative members in Freetown. Likewise, threads were ordered and distributed upon arrival to members in Freetown, Bonthe, Maherie, and Bo, four of the eight villages where coop members are. However, a plan for distributing raw materials to province craftspeople has not yet been developed or implemented on a regular basis. In addition, the expectation was that the GOSL would pay the duty on the first consignment of goods. Because of Sierra Leone laws, the coop was forced to pay taxes on goods imported but was reimbursed later by the GOSL.

Finally, the GOSL was expected to provide the rent payments for a building to house the cooperative's sales and workrooms. Space had been found and rent paid. However, the cooperative was told by the landlord that the workroom was not allowed on this property and that the coop would have to vacate the property by March. Suitable space for a production center has been found in a facility outside of Freetown, with plans to maintain the salesroom in Freetown, itself. However, because of disagreement between GOSL and the project staff over the proposed location for the production center, at the time of this evaluation no site had been selected.

#### Outputs

As stated in the project agreement, the outputs expected from the infusion of technical assistance and aid would be systems for:

- direct importation and delivery of raw materials to individual producers;
- pick-up and cash buying of finished products from producers; and
- delivery of finished goods to local and foreign markets.

While these outputs were stated, no means of measuring achievement were delineated in the project agreement. In addition, this evaluation was conducted during the ninth month

of the first year of a two-year project. This report will therefore, include a description of the progress made in achieving those outputs to that point.

As stated earlier in this report, raw materials have been ordered, received, and distributed to some of the cooperative's producer members. The costs of these materials is high, to which must be added the duties levied by the Sierra Leoneans. Though these duties are to be reimbursed by the GOSL, they do add to the up-front costs incurred by the Cooperative. One way to lower the prices of these materials would be to order in large enough quantities so that the cost per item is reduced. The cooperative currently has \$13,000 in assets deposited in a bank, some of which could be used to pay for these initial bulk orders.

Though raw materials have been received in Freetown, the flow of these materials to producers has not been systematic. No distribution plan has been developed or implemented to ensure that the coop members in the provinces can obtain the raw materials they need in order to produce goods for sale.

In addition, though the Cooperative intended to provide the raw materials free of charge to the craftspeople, particularly to the rural women who cannot afford to pay, currently the management sells raw materials to coop members. The urban Gara Cloth Women Coop members will buy this material, but sell

the finished products through their own retail outlets rather than through the coop, thus earning a higher profit. The result of this practice, however, is a diminution of the profits for the cooperative.

It was anticipated that the craftspeople would receive a cash payment for their goods when they were picked up by the field supervisors on the project staff. This output has not been achieved. Currently, producers deliver finished goods to the coop for sale on consignment. There is often a long delay between the time the goods are produced and when payments from their sale are received by coop producer members. This inability to provide cash payments for finished goods causes a loss of confidence in the operations of the cooperative of members and potential members.

Delivery of goods to local and foreign markets was another anticipated output. However, at the start of this new project period, five orders, placed in September, 1978, during the first project, had not yet been delivered. Due to earlier mismanagement, checks and other records of these orders were not properly entered in project accounts and books. Priority was given to filling these orders, but some goods were refused by the purchasers because of the long delay in delivery.

The U.S. advisor returned to the United States during December, 1979 to deliver the first orders and do additional

marketing. She returned to Sierra Leone in late February, 1980 with fifteen additional orders to be filled. At this time, no systemized production schedule exists which will insure that these orders are filled in a timely manner.

### REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS

#### **External Factors**

- Illiteracy of many members of the Sierra Leone Arts and Crafts Cooperative Executive Council limits the type and amount of training in management techniques which can be provided to them.
- The current high cost of gasoline limits the number and distance of trips to and from the provinces. The GOSL provides two gallons of gas per day, distributed on a weekly basis. Any additional gasoline must be provided by the Cooperative.

#### Male Attitudes

- Males appear to be supportive of the project.

#### Male Involvement

- Men are members of the Cooperative and produce goods for sale.
- Male government officials are involved in providing assistance to the project.

#### Social/Economic Status of Women

- The project has enabled rural women to become producers of goods.

Management Findings

- While the project is meeting its general purpose, there has been a history of mismanagement in the coop which has led to lack of confidence on the part of participants.
- There are social, economic and cultural traditions of biases against coops in Sierra Leone.
- The Executive Committee of the Cooperative is in place, but needs management and capacity building training that is coop-specific.

Operations Findings

- There is, currently, no well organized production system which provides for organized ordering and distribution of raw materials.
- Current Coop facilities for sales and production of goods were inadequate at the time of this evaluation.
- Many urban Gara Cloth Coop members have their own separate retail outlets and can make more money on their own than by selling goods through the Coop. Therefore they do not provide as much goods to the Coop as is desired.
- The Coop is operating, and the members are producing quality products - garments, dolls, scarves, horn combs, but within limitations, including the management,

production, and marketing problems already discussed.

### The Industry Findings

- The Gara Cloth Project and industry could generate foreign revenue and improve the balance of trade for Sierra Leone.
- Coop records are currently inadequate; therefore, there is a lack of an accounting system design which could provide information on costs and benefits of a Sierra Leone Gara Cloth Industry to the GOSL.

### CONCLUSIONS

#### Management

- The findings show that the historical problem with the management of the Cooperative and its distribution of raw materials, as well as its inability to cash-purchase the finished products, has led to a lack of confidence and/or discouraged participation in the Cooperative by some rural members.

#### Operations

- The type and quality of technical assistance and the timeliness of the flow of raw materials has impeded the accomplishment of project purposes and objectives.
- There is lack of incentive to sell goods through the Cooperative for some urban Gara Cloth Producers who

have alternative marketing outlets through which to market their goods.

### The Industry

- Based on the analysis of the inputs to date by the Government of Sierra Leone, there appears to be a lack of real commitment to the project agreement to foster more productive integration of women into the national economy.
- The general conclusion of the evaluation is that the Gara Cloth Industry Project has a potential to be a successful income generating enterprise and make significant contributions to the development of women and their integration into the national economy of Sierra Leone.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

#### Management

Based on the findings and conclusions of the evaluation, there should be a redesign of the Gara Cloth Project. A concentrated strategy should be designed for the acceleration of the growth and development of the Cooperative into a strong, active, and productive association by accomplishing the following:

- Technical assistance and training in coop management for members of the Cooperative's Executive Council.

- Recruitment and training of field supervisors.
- Development of an effective system for the distribution of raw materials to the Cooperative craftsmen and women.
- Repayment of past debts owed to Cooperative members in order to build their confidence in the association.
- Placement of primary emphasis on the development of rural membership.
- Identification and training of key individuals in each region to spearhead a Cooperative membership drive.
- Development of a system for the transfer of technology from one cooperative unit to another.

### Operations

There should be a reorganization of the entire production, distribution, and sales system that has its primary purpose the accruing of economically profitable benefits to the members of the Cooperative. This reorganization would include:

- Development of time estimates for the total production time of each product.
- Development of a production system which would take advantage of seasonal activities, i.e., cloth would be dyed during the dry season, while garments would be produced during the rainy season when dyeing is not possible.

- Establishment of the means by which raw materials may be purchased in larger quantities to reduce costs by using funds in the Cooperative's bank account.
- Increase of the amount of raw materials that are distributed to producers in order to develop a greater inventory of stock available for sale and export.
- Redesign of the salesroom and the organization of a production center.
- Greater attention to the diversification and update of garment styles and fabrics.
- Development of a system for prioritizing the orders to be filled to assure timely delivery of orders (particularly to foreign sales).

### The Industry

There is a great need to develop an effective marketing strategy based on the types of products, the method of production, and an understanding of the characteristics of the markets that may be accessed. The Cooperative should develop and expand foreign and local markets in order to provide incentives to urban Gara Cloth women to retail their goods through the Coop in addition to through their private shops. The following are recommended to accomplish this.

- Reorganize and redecorate the retail sales showroom in order to stimulate walk-in sales.

- Improve marketing and sales skills of Cooperative personnel through on-the-job training.
- Increase and improve quality of advertising of products.
- Involve the Ministry of Tourism and the U.S. Department of Commerce, Department of Tourism in efforts to promote the Gara Cloth Industry production methods and products as a tourist attraction.
- Develop representative relationships with individuals overseas to assist in penetrating foreign markets.

#### The Government

Strategies should be designed to foster ministerial cooperation by the Government of Sierra Leone in support of the project and to enlist the support of the diverse ministries (Tourism, Development, Trade and Industry) for the project.

- Develop an accounting design to enable the GOSL to analyze cost/benefits of the industry in the context of foreign trade.
- Utilize the benefits that can accrue to cooperatives by participating in the Department of Small Scale Industry's training program projected for next year's budget.
- Identify potential use of benefits of the Thrift and Credit Cooperative in order to finance the purchase of gross amounts of raw materials.

## Appendix #5

- Resolve the difficulties imposed by tax/duty levied by the Government of Sierra Leone on the purchase of raw materials imported by the Cooperative.
- Analyze the problem and develop protection for the Gara Cloth Industry against foreign producers and distributors which are establishing manufacturing concerns in Sierra Leone using automated technology, thus driving down the price of Gara cloth and driving the Gara Cooperative out of the market.
- Establish within these ministries clear lines of communication and dissemination of information regarding the existence, development, and on-going activities of the Cooperative.
- Increase the priority status of the Cooperative for the utilization of the resources of GOSL.
- Identify the Cooperative as a potential source of foreign revenue and contributor to the GOSL balance of trade.
- Develop a publicity campaign to be used by the three ministries to disseminate information regarding the Cooperative to domestic and foreign markets.

### Project Redesign

Careful redesign of the project would strengthen management, production, and marketing for the Gara cloth industry. This

redesign would include implementation of the recommendations listed above.

**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROVIDED BY THE EVALUATION TEAM**

In an effort to facilitate the implementation of the above recommendations, members of the evaluation team provided the following suggestions and technical assistance, both during the evaluation visit and after return to the United States.

**Management Assistance**

The evaluation team met with Mr. Gabisi, the Registrar of Cooperatives, other GOSL personnel, and project personnel to discuss a number of issues. The evaluation team was able to work out some specific problems.

- The team obtained a certificate of registry for the Cooperative. Without this certificate the Cooperative was unable to withdraw funds from its bank account.
- Mr. Gabisi agreed that:
  - The GOSL would make funds available for renting the facility designated by the GOSL as a production site for the Cooperative.
  - Mr. Jaba, the office manager, would increase the amount of time he was spending providing technical assistance to the project.
  - An analysis of financial records would be conducted in order to provide careful consideration of the

costs/benefits of the project. Such an analysis would provide a base for securing greater government support for the project.

- The GOSL was willing to provide temporary personnel to complete the staffing of the project. He would be unable to appoint permanent personnel because the GOSL currently has imposed a freeze on hiring for permanent positions.

- The evaluation team also met with U.N. Development Project personnel to ascertain their potential as a resource for the project. The personnel have many ideas which could be useful in the development of the Gara Cloth Industry and should be used as a resource.

The evaluation team also assisted project staff in developing books and record-keeping procedures. Upon return to the United States, the team set up additional ledgers and accounting systems and forwarded them to project personnel in Sierra Leone.

#### Production and Marketing Assistance

In discussion with project personnel, the evaluation team suggested that they develop production systems and plans which take maximum advantage of current work patterns.

- Since dyeing of cloth generally cannot be performed during the rainy season, these activities should be

planned for and conducted during the dry season.

- During the rainy season the staff should:
  - Create design and sew garments;
  - Increase and use inventory of fabrics to make garments;
- Develop advertising plans, including the creation of catalogue of items to be sold.

Because the Organization for African Unity (OAU) will be meeting in Sierra Leone in July, 1980, the evaluation team assisted the project staff in developing a strategy for marketing goods during that meeting. The plan includes:

- Plans for fashion shows to be held during the OAU meetings.
- Opening shops which will feature goods produced by the Cooperative in the new hotels.

The team also developed a plan for reorganizing and redecorating the salesroom in Freetown to make it more attractive and to encourage walk-in customers. The team also recommended a plan for a design of a production center, utilizing the space available for offices, intake and distribution of raw materials, design and production of finished garments and filling of orders. The production center and system, as well as the salesroom and system could be promoted as tourist attractions.

Appendix #5

It is recommended that a follow-up effort be organized to encourage implementation of the recommendations offered.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**W O M E N     I N     D E V E L O P M E N T**

**SILKWORM AND VEGETAL TANNIN STUDY**

**EVALUATION REPORT**

**AID No. 698-0388.5**

**UPPER VOLTA**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633**

Upper Volta: Income Producing Feasibility 698-0388.5INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

In 1976 feasibility studies were authorized to determine the income producing capabilities of two activities for women in Upper Volta, vegetable tannin and silkworm production. The studies were proposed by the Government of Upper Volta (GOUV), which requested AID assistance. Prior to the final approval of the projects by the Africa, Regional Affairs (AFR/RA) office, the Africa/Development Planning (AFR/DP) office and the Africa, Development Resource (AFR/DR) offices raised objections to them. The AFR/DP office submitted a memo (April 12, 1976) stating that the two studies proposed did not comply with the WID guidelines. The memo stated that the feasibility study concerning tanning was requested by GOUV because an Italian firm was considering building a shoe manufacturing factory in Bobo-Doulasso and GOUV wanted to encourage that venture. AFR/DP suggested that the study represented a political trade-off by the GOUV at the expense of rural women, and that a feasibility study would be more properly funded by the Italian firm. The AFR/DR memo (April 9, 1976) suggested that neither of the two projects concerned economic development per se; rather, they represented only an income producing possibility in the short run.

Analysis of background document suggests the reasons for authorizing the studies:

- Prior to the establishment of the shoe manufacturing plant, it was necessary to establish local tanning capabilities. Experiments show that an extract from the seed pod of the acacia nilotica (Gonakie) plant are excellent for use in the tanning process. These trees are found in abundance in the northern and eastern regions of the country. The study was authorized to determine the feasibility of rural women becoming the primary providers of this pod.
- The feasibility of silk worm cultivation was suggested by successful trials in the northern regions of the Ivory Coast. The similarity of environment in Upper Volta suggested that similar efforts would be successful there.

#### METHODOLOGY

A desk audit was conducted of these two feasibility studies at the Washington AID office. An on-site evaluation was requested of the AFR/RA office, but not approved by the AID/Mission in Ouagadougou. In light of this decision by the AID Mission in Ouagadougou, this evaluation consisted of a thorough document review which was conducted in Washington. An interview with Maryann Reigelman, WID Project Manager from

Ouagadougou, was conducted by project evaluators in Dakar and Washington, DC. The two existing pre-feasibility studies were read and evaluated against the goals and purposes of the projects. Summaries of both studies as well as the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation team follow.

SUMMARY OF PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY ON SILKWORM PRODUCTION

IN UPPER VOLTA

The study provides a comprehensive overview of all aspects of silkworm production and mulberry cultivation and examines, both from a technical and economic standpoint, the potential for launching such an activity in Upper Volta.

Specifically, the study includes information on:

- climate, topography, soil composition, rainfall, and humidity levels in Upper Volta;
- techniques of silkworm production, including favorable environmental conditions, growing periods, equipment required, care of worms at different stages of growth, packaging, etc;
- mulberry tree cultivation, including favorable environmental conditions, growing periods, planting techniques, use of by-products, etc;
- past, present and projected world market for silk; and
- economic feasibility of this activity for both domestic and foreign markets.

The study draws the following conclusions:

- That, from a technical and economic standpoint, silkworm production would be a viable venture with maximum potential for success in Upper Volta due to:
  - an ample supply of cheap labor;
  - favorable ecological conditions for the cultivation of the mulberry tree; and
  - large, vast areas of cultivatable land for the mulberry trees.
- That there are certain factors facilitating the feasibility of such an enterprise in Upper Volta. They include:
  - relatively low initial outlays of capital to start-up this activity with the potential for high profitability; and
  - reduction in the raw silk production operations in developed countries due to the high cost of labor.

The study recommends the following:

- That a two-year pilot project be initiated to ascertain the viability of this enterprise for women in Upper Volta.
- That a design team composed of silkworm production experts conduct a study designed to:
  - investigate the level of technology required for planting mulberry trees and producing silkworms.

- organize large-scale production of silkworms and mulberry trees;
  - study the possibility of developing industrial silk production locally with the possible diversification into silk thread production; and
  - organize the marketing.
- That mulberry tree plants be distributed to rural farmers for planting to test their adaptability to the environment.

**EVALUATION OF PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY ON SILKWORM PRODUCTION**  
**IN UPPER VOLTA**

Within the overall framework of determining the feasibility of launching income generating activities involving women, the specific purposes of this study were to:

- Furnish the botanical and agronomical information necessary to determine the possibility of producing mulberry trees and the information needed to raise silkworms.
- Study the feasibility of launching a silkworm production operation.
- Study the methods for organizing the rural woman in silk production.
- Study marketing problems.

### FINDINGS

The study provides a comprehensive, in-depth examination of all aspects of silk production and mulberry tree cultivation. It explores, from a macroeconomic level, the economic viability of such an enterprise and discusses the feasibility of launching a silk production enterprise in Upper Volta. It does not address the issue of involving and organizing women in silk production, and, as such, fails to meet one of the stated purposes. Questions which remain unanswered are as follows:

- What mechanism would be used to involve women in this activity?
- How would the men share in production, marketing and the income earned from such an activity?
- What would be the income generating potential of such an activity for the individual rural woman?
- How would the production and management of the various stages of the operation be participated in by women at the village level?

### CONCLUSIONS

Although this study provides no definitive answers regarding the ultimate profitability of silkworm production for women in Upper Volta, it does indicate that such an enterprise is feasible. Acknowledging the limitations of the findings,

the author points up the need for an additional study prior to the design of any silkworm production project. It is the opinion of the evaluation team that because of its scope and detail, this study can serve as a guide in the designing of a project specific, pre-design study. If consulted carefully, it will be of invaluable assistance to project planners.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

The evaluation team makes the following recommendations:

- That, to ascertain the current relevance of the study's findings and the feasibility of implementing a silkworm production project, AID/Upper Volta should reestablish contact with more local government officials concerned with the study.
- That prior to the initiation of any activity, government concurrence and support for the project be obtained.
- That the primary recommendation of the study, directing the initiation of a two-year pilot project preceded by a pre-design study, be implemented only after local support for implementing the project is assured.
- That the pre-design team be composed not solely of silkworm production experts, but include a Women in Development specialist and an economist.

- That, in view of the initial success of the silkworm production project in Ivory Coast, the design team visit that project to identify potentially replicable elements.
- That the present study be translated and read thoroughly by all members of the pre-design team for use as a guide in defining the parameters and scope of the pre-design study.

**SUMMARY OF PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY ON THE PRODUCTION OF VEGETAL TANNIN FROM THE ACACIA NILOTICA PLANT IN UPPER VOLTA**

Although the study begins by stating that certain types of technical and economic information was unobtainable due to time constraints, it goes on to provide a relatively in-depth examination of the botanical characteristics of the acacia nilotica, the techniques and processes involved in producing vegetal tannin and the economic feasibility of launching vegetal tanning production on a large scale in Upper Volta. The study includes technical information regarding:

- The botanical properties of the acacia nilotica, growing times, favorable climatic conditions, etc.
- The chemical composition of the various strengths of tannin produced from the acacia nilotica and a comparison with tannin produced from other acacia species.

- The various extraction processes and results obtained.
- Production, care, treatment and collection methods for the seed pod produced by the acacia nilotica.

Economic information includes:

- The costs involved in producing and supplying seed pods to users and markets.
- A cost benefit analysis of the various stages of the plant and tannin production.
- The present and projected world market for tannin produced from plants.

The study concludes that cultivation of the acacia nilotica on a massive scale solely for the production of vegetal tannin would not prove to be a profitable activity. It would encounter strong, possibly insuperable competition from chrome tannin and could not compete on the world market. Domestic demand would not be sufficient to render such an activity profitable.

The study does recommend that if the cultivation of the acacia nilotica were to be undertaken as part of a larger more global reforestation scheme, it could become a more profitable enterprise because of the multiplicity of uses of the wood.

Drawing on this latter conclusion, the study recommends that the following steps be taken:

## Appendix #6

- That an information dissemination campaign be launched to prepare the target population to undertake cultivation of the acacia nilotica.
- That acacia nilotica groves be planted in selected villages.
- That industrial production of vegetal tannin be instituted by government agencies which would also be responsible for providing technical assistance and organizing marketing.
- That a plan be developed to organize rural populations in the collection of seed pods and the planting of acacia nilotica.
- That a more in-depth study of foreign and domestic markets be conducted to determine potential demand and availability of needed supplies.
- That a more in-depth economic and financial study on the possibilities of meeting demand and the viability of setting up local tanning industry be conducted.
- That the market be monitored during the three-month period corresponding to the period of production and the centers and collection networks be established.
- That state control of organization and exporting be instituted.

- That research to improve the technical-composition of local flora be conducted.
- That forestry laws be written classifying acacia nilotica as a protected tree species.

EVALUATION OF PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY ON THE PRODUCTION OF VEGETAL TANNIN FROM THE ACACIA NILOTICA PLANT IN UPPER VOLTA

Within the overall framework of determining the feasibility of launching income-producing activities for women, the specific purposes of this study were to:

- Obtain the necessary botanical and agronomical information necessary for cultivation of the gonakie and the technical analysis of the chemical composition of the seed pod.
- Determine the probable costs involved in this production and estimate what sort of revenue could be expected.
- Determine how to organize groups and co-operatives to collect these seed pods.

FINDINGS

While indicating that certain types of technical and economic information were unobtainable due to time constraints, the study manages to provide a rather complete overview of the botanical characteristics of the acacia nilotica, appropriate collection methods, extraction

procedures for extracting vegetal tannin and the care and production necessary for the seed pod. In the second half of the study, the economic feasibility of vegetal tannin as an income-producing activity in Upper Volta is discussed. While offering some suggestions for organizing rural inhabitants into production units, the study fails to affirm the viability of this activity as an income-generating enterprise involving women as primary producers. A number of questions remain unanswered:

- What mechanism would be used to involve the women in this activity?
- How would the men share in production, marketing and the income earned from such a venture?
- How would the present, local tanners be affected by the mounting of a large scale vegetal tannin production effort aimed at involving women as primary producers?
- How would women participate in the various stages of production at the village level?

#### CONCLUSIONS

Reflecting the obvious lack of sufficient time allotted to the researcher to thoroughly investigate the subject matter, the study fails to respond fully to a number of issues. Relying heavily on charts, graphs and other materials produced

by FAO regarding vegetal tannin production in various parts of the world, the study provides insufficient data on the specifics of undertaking this activity in Upper Volta. The recommendation that the cultivation of acacia nilotica be undertaken as part of a larger reforestation scheme appears to represent an attempt by the researcher to find some justification for conducting the study and is not a well thought out suggestion for alternative uses of acacia nilotica. Furthermore, the recommendations are vague, do not appear to be grounded in fact and do not take into consideration the suitability of the cultivation of acacia nilotica relative to other tree species. In the light of this assessment, the recommendations of this study should not be implemented until and unless additional information regarding the direction and scope of GOUV/reforestation projects is obtained.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

The evaluation team recommends the following:

- That the primary conclusion/recommendation drawn by the researcher directing that the cultivation of acacia nilotica should be encouraged as part of a larger reforestation effort not be implemented until further investigation of the matter is undertaken in consultation with GOUV officials.

- That information be obtained from the researcher regarding her research methodology before any action is taken with regard to the study's recommendations.

One drawback to both studies involves the lack of information regarding methodology. It cannot be ascertained from the study how the information was obtained, how time was actually spent in Upper Volta conducting research and who the individuals were who served as sources of information. Until this information is obtained, the reader will have no definitive answers regarding the reliability and veracity of the study's findings.

**JEFFALYN JOHNSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.**  
**Management and Organization Specialists**

**A F R I C A N   W O M E N   I N   D E V E L O P M E N T**

**INCOME PRODUCING FEASIBILITY STUDY**

**EVALUATION REPORT**

**AID No. 698-0388.8**

**UPPER VOLTA**

**Two Skyline Plaza, Suite 1210  
5203 Leesburg Pike, Falls Church, Virginia 22041  
(703) 578-4633**

Upper Volta: Feasibility Study (698-0388.8)INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

In March, 1977, AID/Upper Volta provided \$65,000 to the government of Upper Volta to conduct a preliminary socio-economic study examining the role of women in the Sahel. The survey was to identify factors which could stimulate or hinder the training of women in preparation for the implementation of a proposed Non-Formal Education project entitled, "Training of Women in the Sahel". The study was conducted by the Voltaic Scientific Research Center (Centre Voltaique de Recherche Scientifique-CVRS) and was scheduled to be conducted over a ten-month period, to be concluded and submitted to AID by April, 1978. Due to a series of delays involved in executing the study, it did not arrive at the AID office in Ouagadougou until January, 1980, one and a half years after the completion deadline. By that time, the Training of Women in the Sahel Project had been designed, funded, and partially implemented and, therefore, did not benefit from the findings of the study. At present, the study is being examined by an AID anthropologist in Upper Volta to determine whether the wealth of information it contained will be of any potential use to ongoing or future Women in Development Projects.

PURPOSE AND GOALS

Within the broader context of identifying factors which could stimulate or hinder the training of women for non-formal education in the Sahel, the specific purposes of the project were as follows:

- to identify factors which would provide basic criteria for overall design of the project;
- to identify indicators for the selection of project authorities and the necessary personnel qualifications and training;
- identify potential constraints to project implementation and strategies for overcoming them; and, identify villages most likely to be receptive to the project.

The study provides a thorough overview of the social and economic roles of women of the different ethnic groups of the Sahel, emphasizing income-generating activities and daily work load. This detailed socio-economic description provides ample information on which to base the design of non-formal education projects and rural projects. It also provides an assessment of past formal education programs giving reasons for the lack of receptivity to such programs by target populations. The study points to certain factors such as the oral tradition, which must be taken into account in the development of training materials.

## Appendix #7

Drawing mainly on the data regarding existing social and economic roles of Sahelian women, the study makes some general recommendations for project activities. Suggestions include: agricultural and/or livestock training programs, health and nutrition education programs, projects designed to enable local population to make more effective use of local medicines, and programs designed to promote an appreciation for indigenous cultures. The study cautions that the specific content of a project should be decided on in collaboration with respective project beneficiaries. Guidelines for personnel are given. The study recommends that personnel and non-formal education projects geared toward women, include animatrices to serve as coordinators for the project at the family, village, and regional level. The specific functions of each animatrice are delineated in the projects in the report. The regional animatrice, charged with overseeing the activities of the village and family animatrices, would be responsible to a team of project supervisors. This team, composed of researchers, engineers, development assistance managers, educational planners, and a representative from the funding agency, would plan, follow-up, and evaluate the project components in cooperation with the regional animatrice. The study recommends this personnel structure as a model for all non-formal projects suggested above. General qualifications for animatrices

include a knowledge of the role of the function of Sahelian women, report writing skills, fluency in the local language, sensitivity to the educational needs of rural adults.

Questionnaires administered to village populations, the researchers to assess the possible constraints to project implementation and the prospects for overcoming them. Most of the villagers interviewed did not indicate receptivity to the idea of classroom instruction. Yet, they demonstrated a certain desire to receive certain benefits from their government which had not been forthcoming. Both men and women responded positively to the notion of collaborative income-generating activities for women. The report, therefore, concludes that the lack of attention from the national government, combined with a dislike for formal education and the desire for participating in income-generating activities, indicates that local populations are well disposed to accepting such projects. Villages identified as tentative project sites included:

Boulage in the Liptake region;

Sohlan in the Yahga region;

So in the Djelgodj region; and,

Lillangou in the Oudalan Region.

These villages were chosen because of their linguistic and cultural homogeneity.

## Appendix #7

In spite of the somewhat academic and general approach to the study, it appears that the researchers managed to glean information which may be of some utility to ongoing or future Women in Development projects in the Sahel. The in-depth critique of the study currently being undertaken by the AID anthropologist in Upper Volta will undoubtedly shed light on the potential usefulness of this study.

### METHODOLOGY

The methodology used for this evaluation consisted of a review of all pertinent documents, including a thorough reading of the study itself. It also involved conversation held in Dakar and Washington with Mary Ann Reigelman, WID Officer for Upper Volta. However, the mission did not grant permission for visits to Upper Volta. A desk audit was the prime source of data.

### REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF PROJECT DESIGN AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS

#### Inputs

The study was conducted by two male researchers from the CVRS who enlisted the help of six enumerators, both men and women. The study was executed in two parts: an exploratory study was conducted in January, 1978 to identify target villages, and the major data collection efforts lasted from May to September, 1978. Interviews were conducted with populations in eleven villages. The combined populations of these

villages totalled approximately 7,654 people. In addition to the anthropologist, the two researchers, and the six enumerators, there was also a chauffeur/interpreter, support staff, and seven vehicles.

### Outputs

Outputs included one 127-page report prepared by the Voltaic Center for Scientific Research which contains an extensive bibliography and samples of the questionnaires administered.

## REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF SPECIAL CONCERNS

### Constraints

A major external factor hindering the timely completion of this study appears to have been a budgetary problem in the CVRS, the implementing agency. Another factor cited by researchers as having brought about delays was the need to travel great distance over poor roads to obtain needed research data.

### Beneficiaries

Principal constraints cited by the researchers that had conducted the study included lack of time and difficulty in obtaining quantifiable information from the populations interviewed.

## FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS

The evaluation team found that, in general, the study achieved the stated purposes. The project paper calling for

the study stated that it is hoped that this study will contribute to the design of the project paper (for the non-formal education project). It seemed clear that some of the information contained in the study could have contributed to the design of the project paper, however, without more information regarding the non-formal education project currently underway in Upper Volta, the evaluation team is unable to make any assessment regarding the specific applicability of the study's findings to that project. Yet, even if the study had been available prior to the planning of the project, it appears certain that another data collection effort would have been necessary to provide the specific information needed for project design.

The women and their families who were involved in the project (which was to have evolved from the study) were to have been the beneficiaries. However, since the study was not used as a project design tool, it was of no direct benefit to the population it was originally intended to assist. It can be assumed, however, that those researchers and enumerators directly involved in the data collection process benefited from the project through increased knowledge of the role of women in the Sahel and in improvement and refinement of their data collection skills. They constitute a valuable resource of experienced researchers who can be called on to assist in future data collection efforts.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

Those interviewed stated that studies of this nature cannot alone provide the kind of data necessary for successful project design. The amount of time which elapses from the initial collection of data to actual project implementation with studies of this scope is so lengthy that the recommendations, and even the findings, are often rendered invalid by the time the project commences. The usefulness of these studies lies in their ability to set guidelines and provide direction for the more specific project design studies which must inevitably follow. These project design studies should be conducted just prior to the arrival of the pre-design team.