

AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT
 WASHINGTON, D. C. 20523
 BIBLIOGRAPHIC INPUT SHEET

FOR AID USE ONLY

BATCH 61

1. SUBJECT
 CLASSI-
 FICATION

A. PRIMARY

B. SECONDARY

TEMPORARY

2. TITLE AND SUBTITLE

Evaluation unit of educational television program, Republic of Ivory Coast; final report

3. AUTHOR(S)

(101) Acad. for Educational Development

4. DOCUMENT DATE

1974

5. NUMBER OF PAGES

25p.

6. ARC NUMBER

ARC

7. REFERENCE ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS

AED

8. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES (Sponsoring Organization, Publishers, Availability)

(Final research summary)

9. ABSTRACT

(EDUCATION R&D)

An international evaluation unit was attached to the educational television (ETV) program in Ivory Coast to analyze its problems and to provide its decision-makers with information to facilitate more effective achievement of the program's goals. This report gives a brief description of the ETV program and of the unit's work in primary and out-of-school education sectors where evaluation deals with pedagogical, economic, technical, and managerial concerns. Indications of expected changes resulting from the evaluation are outlined. Goals of the country's ETV program are: (1) more equitable distribution of educational facilities throughout the country, (2) a link between educational expansion and regional development plans, thus creating job opportunities in rural areas for graduates from the system, and (3) improved teaching and learning efficiency of the system to reduce unit costs. The unit's evaluative data on this program are described as they might apply to similar programs in other countries.

10. CONTROL NUMBER

PN-AID-853

11. PRICE OF DOCUMENT

12. DESCRIPTORS

13. PROJECT NUMBER

14. CONTRACT NUMBER

AID/afr-828 GTS

15. TYPE OF DOCUMENT

Final Report

Contract AID/afr - 828

January 1, 1972 - December 31, 1974

**Evaluation Unit of Educational Television Program
Republic of Ivory Coast**

Submitted by

**Academy for Educational Development, Inc.
1414 Twenty-Second Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037**

Final Report to AID

Contract No. AID/afr - 828

I. History of contract and its amendments; sums obligated

Contract No. AID/afr - 828 was signed in January, 1972 between AID and the Academy for Educational Development, amended once in June 1972 and a second time in September 1973. The general area of American input through this contract was in the establishment and initial operations of an international Evaluation Unit attached to the Educational Television Program in Ivory Coast. Funds obligated under the contract were the following:

year one	\$25,000
year two	\$25,000
year three	\$37,760
	<hr/>
Total	\$87,760

II. Goals of Ivory Coast's ETV Program

The ETV program represents one of the most significant elements in the Ivory Coast's efforts to raise the educational level of the population with a view to helping realize the country's long-term economic and social objectives. At the moment, the use of ETV is restricted to the primary school system and to an experimental out-of-school educational system for adults and early school leavers. However, the possibility of the use of ETV in the secondary sector is actively being discussed.

Recourse to ETV is hoped

- lead to a more equitable distribution of educational facilities throughout the country, thus allowing the primary schools to become a factor of national unification in both cultural and economic spheres

- associate educational expansion with regional development plans, thus creating job opportunities in rural areas for graduates from the system

- improve the teaching and learning efficiency of the system and thus reduce unit costs so that the majority of children go through the six grades of the system with minimum repetition and drop out rates. (1)

Genesis of the Primary School ETV Innovation

In the late 1960s, Ivory Coast authorities admitted to severe weak points in their educational system: a low level of teacher qualification, ill-adapted curricula, low level of school enrollments, drastic wastage through the high rate of repeaters and dropouts. To remedy this situation, Ivory Coast asked UNESCO and the French government to plan a multi-faceted reform, including a complete overhaul of the curriculum, starting with primary school and the teacher training institutions and introducing a radically new means of reaching Ivorian teachers and students: television. Decisions were announced concurrently to adopt automatic promotion from class to class, consequently eliminating the drop-out and repeater cost, and to achieve 100% primary school enrollment by the middle of the 1980s. In 1971 TV sets, mainly battery operated, were installed in villages where the TV signals were adequately received (covering approximately 3/4 of the national territory) and 20,000 first-

(1) From the current five-year plan.

graders saw their first tele-lessons as the core of their new curriculum. Each year the broadcasts would reach a higher grade, and attain broader-based coverage, so as to reach by 1978 virtually all the primary school pupils in the country. By 1974, 100,000 first, second, and third grade pupils in over 1000 schools were receiving ten hours of TV instruction a week. Over 10,000 teachers were being re-trained through special in-service educational telecasts.

IV. Non-formal Adult Education

In 1973 the Ministry of education, collaborating with several other ministries and development agencies, broadcast a series of experimental programs designed for the country's adult population in general, and in particular the rural illiterates. Program topics covered subjects such as health care, infant nutrition, and development of cooperatives. The existing number of TV schools (2434 TV classes in 1973/74) is used to receive the broadcasts on weekday evenings; local "animateurs" (usually the primary school ETV teachers) translate the programs into local dialects and lead following discussion groups.

After a year of experimentation, the out-of-school educational authorities have learned that programs exclusively will not change behavior substantially. Each TV campaign, in no matter what subject (infant nutrition, development of a cooperative, etc.) must be accompanied by a planned, constant human support in the field. Concerning rural education the ETV officials have found high-level collaborators with a similar interest. The Planning Ministry after years of planning, in early 1974

financed, staffed, and named a director of the "National Bureau for Rural Affairs", which is often quoted in the Head of State's speeches as a vital organ in rural development. It is this organ which will pilot and coordinate the efforts to improve the life of the rural dwellers, and with presidential backing strong leadership in this field should be forthcoming. The acceptance in 1973 of several ministries and development agencies to join the ETV Ministry in planning and broadcasting adult education programs is another proof of wide support for the project. The budget allocated by the Ivorian government to the ETV program for out-of-school program production in 1974 approximately \$80,000 excluding salaries of foreign assistance personnel. This represents a substantial increase over the allocation for the experimental year 1973, and will likely be increased considerably in the future. One must also add to this figure the TV infrastructure already in place, and the contributions from other collaborating ministries and development agencies.

V. Creation of an External Evaluation Unit

In 1972 the Ivory Coast Secretary of State for Primary Education and Educational Television announced the creation of an External Evaluation Unit attached to his cabinet. The position of Unit Director was to be locally filled, but the understanding was that other positions would be funded by countries or agencies not directly involved in the operations of the ETV project. Currently there is an expatriate coordinator with an Ivorian scheduled to assume the director's responsibilities in July of 1975: this position is financed through World Bank loan money to Ivory

Coast:

VI. The Evaluation Unit's General Scope of Work

The main purposes of the External Evaluation Unit are twofold, concerning respectively the Ivory Coast ETV Program, and similar programs in other countries.

a) The ETV Program in Ivory Coast

Purpose: On the basis of analysis of the main problem areas in the ETV Program, to provide decision makers and staff with accurate information to facilitate more effective achievement of Program goals. The main areas of evaluative work which have been assigned to the External Evaluation Unit, in both primary and out-of-school education sectors, are those of pedagogical, economic, technical, and management evaluation. Indications of the main changes that might be expected at the end of the proposed External Evaluation Unit projects in each sector are listed below. These examples give an idea of the direction of expected changes rather than quantified measures, which are difficult to assign at the present time given the lack of accurate base-line data in many areas.

pedagogical
evaluation

- improved results on criterion tests in main primary system subject areas (French and Math)

reduced drop-out and repeater rates

- improved teaching skills
 - more positive attitudes towards ETV Program on the part of parents and teachers
 - increased relevance of curriculum to development goals
- economic evaluation**
- reduced unit costs as a result of, for example, reduced reception and production costs and more efficient management
 - more accurate forward investment planning
- technical evaluation**
- reduction in frequency of transmitter breakdowns
 - reduction in production time and hence increase in time available for training of national staff at Complex
 - increase in quality and effectiveness of ETV programs
- management evaluation**
- increase in job satisfaction of expatriate and national staff working at the ETV Complex (low at the moment by any measure)
 - improved information flow within ETV Program
 - more rational organization of functions and responsibilities (ETV Secretary's office, Primary School Director's office ETV Complex)
- out-of-school sector in particular**
- increase in attendance at broadcasts
 - appropriate changes in behavior amongst target population (e.g. development of cooperatives, improved infant nutrition)
- tie-in of broadcasts with technical back-up in villages (health care, rural development projects, etc.)

(b) ETV Programs in Countries Other than Ivory Coast

The External Evaluation Unit is in a privileged position, given its mandate to evaluate many different areas of the program, and the high-level specialist staff it employs, to provide useful information to other countries and international organizations concerned in setting up analogous projects. This is true of both the primary school and out-of-school education sectors and perhaps especially the latter given the current interest in non-formal educational systems. Since the Ivorian project involves a major attempt at non-formal, rural education in a developing country by the new media, it immediately fits into a cluster of programs A.I.D. has invested in with Stateside universities and research institutions. Examples of areas where data from evaluation of Ivory Coast ETV Program could usefully be reinvested in analogous programs in other countries include:

- modes of collaboration between different ministries and Development Bodies in planning out-of-school education schemes
- relative worth of different production, reception, and transmission technologies
- optimal ways of using the media and teaching modes available (TV, printed materials, face-to-face instruction, discussion groups) to achieve problem objectives.

VII. Participant Countries in Evaluation Activities

At the present time the External Evaluation Unit is financed at

staffed jointly by the Ivorian government and by the United States, the Federal Republic of Germany, and Belgium. The Ivorian government is responsible for funding the Director's post, recurrent expenses in the Unit and lodging of expatriate staff provided by the donor countries.

The government of the Federal Republic of Germany is financing the posts of three technical assistants for the period 1974/75, to work in the areas of management and technical evaluation. Studies have already been launched on:

- the production of TV programs at the Complex of Bouaké (report in preparation)
- the organization and management of the ETV Project (report in preparation)

In addition to the continuation of work in these two areas, a team of German evaluators will also be examining:

- the tasks performed by the different categories of personnel in the Project, with the aim of preparing detailed job descriptions and identifying problem areas (for example, poor definition of functions and responsibilities for posts in certain sectors of the Complex)
- the process of Ivorization of posts at all levels in the Project (this follows on logically from the task analysis that will be carried out for the preceding project)
- on a year-to-year basis, the program of development of the ETV Project (number of classes opened, number of trainee and practising teachers, development of TV transmission network, numbers of children enrolled, repetition and dropout rates, etc.)

The Belgium Government is financing a long-term program of pedagogical evaluation, to be carried out by a team of researchers from the Laboratoire de Pédagogie Expérimentale (Director: Prof. G. DE LANDSHEERE) of

the University of Liège. The contract for this work was signed in January 1974, and is for an initial period of five years, renewable for a further two years. The areas to be covered include the construction, administration and analysis of:

- a) summative achievement tests in French and Mathematics for each of the six grade levels of the primary education system; this cycle of testing is programmed to end in 1980
- b) tests designed to identify the level of cognitive and psychomotor development of children entering the system at the first grade (CP1)
- c) tests designed to measure the attitudes and opinions of ETV teaching staff toward the Project
- d) observation schedules to measure the verbal interactions between ETV teachers and pupils along certain specified dimensions
- e) summative achievement tests in French and Mathematics for trainee and practising teachers.

Each of the various instruments is to be elaborated over a three-year cycle: pre-testing in year 1, dry-run in year 2, definitive testing in year 3. Whenever possible, for the testing cited in a) - d) above, an attempt will be made to draw a comparison between ETV and non-ETV classes. The work program includes the training of Ivorians at two levels: a small number will study testing methodology in Liège; approximately forty pedagogical advisors in Ivory Coast will be trained during two-week workshops immediately prior to each testing period.

The United States government's contribution during the three-year contract period has led to the following areas of work:

- participation in a study conducted principally by a team from

Liège University on the Attitudes and Opinions of ETV teachers
(Report n° 1, April 1973)

a study of participation of the students of the Ecole Normale
des Instituteurs at Bouaké in their program of studies (Report
n° 2, June 1973)

A study of the recruitment and progression of all ETV teachers
during the school years 1971/72 and 1972/73 (Report n° 3,
August 1973)

a study of the costs of the ETV Project by Dean JAMISON and
Steve KLEES, on a mission from Stanford University

specialist assistance in the domain of French language testing
towards the Internal Evaluation Service, by John CLARK, of
Educational Testing Service, Princeton, N.J. (two visits to
Ivory Coast)

evaluation of the first two experimental phases of the use
of TV in out-of-school education

a follow-up of the situation of ETV teachers for the school
year 1973/74

initial design work on the setting-up of a cost model of the
TV Project (under the supervision of Dean JAMISON)

VIII. This section is composed of a brief description of the activities
carried out by the consultants and the field evaluator during their
missions.

McAnany mission 01/18/72 - 02/09/72

Emile McAnany
Professor of Communication
Institute of Communication Research
Stanford University
Stanford, California

(Since the earliest discussions of AID participation in the Ivory Coast ETV evaluation scheme, Professor McAnany has, at Stanford University, served as the Academy's principal investigator. Dr. McAnany visited the Bouaké project center and Abidjan ETV administrative headquarters annually over the past three years as a member of the Unesco-sponsored scientific advisory committee, a body established to aid the Ivorian ETV director in setting policy. After each mission, where McAnany systematically reviewed the current status of the overall ETV operations, stimulated planning for evaluation activities, and shared his wide experience with educational media evaluation in other parts of the world, he would make oral progress reports at the Academy and AID on the return trip to Stanford.)

During his mission three months after the first telecasts to first graders and primary school teachers the consultant recorded the initial reactions to ETV productions. He assessed the progress to date and the problems facing the ETV project authorities.

The consultant's major accomplishment was to devise a short-term evaluation plan, accepted by the newly appointed ETV Secretary of State and his cabinet. Many aspects of the plan were carried out a few months later. Finally, the

consultant returned with concrete suggestions on how the AID contract afr/828 funding should be used to allow United States consultants to set up basic pedagogical and economic measurements of ETV.

Clark mission. 04/30/73 - 05/14/73

John L.D. Clark
Senior Examiner in Foreign Language
Educational Testing Service
Princeton, New Jersey

This mission and the consultant's follow-up mission later in the year can be situated in the framework of one of the specific tasks of the Evaluation Unit: to assist the ETV project in evaluation design. The consultant's first visit enabled him to learn first-hand what evaluation activities had been conducted in the area of French language achievement or performance in primary school activities. He was then in a position to submit his recommendations for future testing activity.

The consultant proposed that summative rather than formative evaluation constitute the major thrust of future evaluation effort to determine French language mastery. It was strongly urged that local ETV project officials - in the subject area and in the feedback/evaluation area - formulate and carry out the testing project. The consultant proposed that a team be composed in Ivory Coast to prepare a "four skills" test battery for third grade pupils: listening comprehension, reading comprehension, speaking, and writing. Detailed suggestions were included in the plan as regards a timetable of activities, sampling, test administration, test scoring.

Jamison and Klees mission

Jamison 03/10/73 - 03/20/73
Klees 03/10/73 - 03/31/73

Dean Jamison
Professor of Economics
Stanford Business School
Stanford, California

Steven Klees
Graduate Student
Stanford Business School
Stanford, California

The first mission in the area of ETV project cost analysis was carried out with the goal of ascertaining as completely as possible what the costs had been to date of the ETV component of the educational reform. A secondary goal was to suggest what further steps the Evaluation Unit might undertake to insure that evaluation efforts included an adequate economic component.

The mission in Abidjan and Bouaké, plus follow-up research at the Educational Testing Service and at Stanford produced a report, "The cost of educational television in the Ivory Coast," English and French summaries of that report, and specific recommendations for future economic analysis.

The report presents cost figures distributed along these categories: administration, program production, transmission, reception, and printed support materials. Estimates of the component costs in these categories are projected for each year from 1969 to 1991. Funding is also broken down by major donor source: Ivory Coast, France, Canada, UNDP, and the World Bank. Average annual unit costs are estimated in 1972 CFA francs as between 4,000 and 4,450. The differences in these cost estimates corresponds to two basic project development options. The cost analysts supported the least cost

alternative, arguing that ETV cost in Ivory Coast was already substantially higher than initial planning documents had projected and in addition its average costs were higher than for most ETV projects.

Recommendation for future economic evaluation was strongly made for the following areas: cost reduction options, cost-effectiveness analysis, and cost-benefit analysis.

Jamison mission 11/09/73 - 11/23/73

Dean Jamison
Chairman, Economics of Education
Educational Testing Service
Princeton, New Jersey

The objectives of Jamison's second mission were to discuss the implications of the cost report and obtain feedback on the adequacy of its data; to plan the Eybert mission to the States by looking at the data requirements of a cost-evaluation model of the Ivorian primary education system; and to help develop plans for the economic aspects of the Evaluation Unit during the period 1974/78.

The consultant was told that the general drift of the analysis forming his report was adequate. He was pleased to learn of newly established practices to record ETV project costs within the data processing unit of the project in Abidjan. And finally he learned of official decisions which would lead to modified cost figures in future projections.

Concerning plans for the continuation of the economic evaluation, a number of possibilities were discussed. The three most promising areas of further inquiry were the following: study of cost reducing alternatives, development of the primary education cost-evaluation model, and study of economic aspects of post-primary alternatives. Outlines of each of these research areas were produced by the consultant.

Clark mission 11/03/73 - 11/10/73

The second Clark mission had as objectives: to lead a workshop in second language testing techniques for ETV project personnel in Bouaké; and to ascertain what new French language testing plans the project was adopting given the impending long-term commitment Liège University was about to make to the Ivory Coast government in the area of pedagogical evaluation.

The week-long workshop in Bouaké involved close to two dozen participants from French program production crews and from the internal evaluation service. After a discussion of general testing procedures, the three sub-groups on reading, grammar, and oral structures met to prepare specifications of test content. Final sessions were spent going over this material with the internal evaluation group who would be in a position to stimulate and coordinate future evaluation efforts in all subject matter work groups.

Concerning the long-term Belgian input into pedagogical evaluation, including French language achievement, the consultant made two recommendations: first, that a more accelerated program of evaluation might be more appealing to Ivory Coast, and second, that any Belgian willingness to share testing techniques, sampling procedures, etc. as well as data with the internal evaluation staff would greatly bolster the ETV project's potential in carrying out formative as well as summative evaluation in the area of French as a second language.

Eybert mission 01/10/74 - 02/01/74

Jean-Paul Eybert
Programmer, Data Processing Unit
Liaison Officer to Evaluation Unit
ETV Project, Bouaké, Ivory Coast

Eybert had facilitated the previous Jamison and Klees missions to Ivory Coast and was the natural selection in the search for someone in the ETV project who could insure transferability of the economic model to be developed at ETS to the Ivory Coast project.

His mission to the United States was to help Jamison and Klees in Princeton to set up a computer-based model of ETV project costs and their projected effect upon certain variables in the overall ETV system. The compatibility requirements due to existing computer facilities in Abidjan led the team to transfer the model from a UNIVAC to an IBM system.

A secondary objective of the mission was to contact American project officials elsewhere who could offer advice in cost analysis and monitoring of an ETV system. This search led Eybert to visit the State University of Nebraska project in Lincoln, Nebraska, Colorado State University, Stanford University, and Berkeley University. At Stanford talks were held with project director Emile McAnany and his team of economists who had worked in educational technology projects in Latin America.

Grant field position 09/15/72 - 08/15/73

Stephen Grant
Program Officer
Academy for Educational Development
Washington, D.C.

(One of the McAnany recommendations which also coincided with Ivorian thinking was that the AID/AED contract should furnish a full-time field evaluator, rather than solely a string of consultants, if a coherent evaluation scheduled was to be followed and have impact on the ETV program. Grant, who had five years teaching experience in Ivory Coast and who had just completed his doctorate in evaluation of a component of teacher education at the ETV model teacher training school, was the Academy's choice for the position and his selection met the approval of the Ivory Coast government.)

Grant's main tasks during his two-year assignment were to facilitate United States consultant missions, to assist the Evaluation Unit Coordinator in drawing up a two-year evaluation work program as far as the United States input was concerned, to participate in group evaluation efforts at the ETV project center as well as to initiate his own evaluation projects in keeping with the Unit's overall priorities. The evaluation reports submitted to the ETV Secretary of State which Grant authored or had a major role in preparing were the following: "Les attitudes des corps enseignant," "La participation des premiers élèves de l'école normale d'instituteurs de Bouaké à leur programme," "La situation des maîtres télévisuels 1971/72, 1972/73, 1973/74," "Programme de Travail, 1974/76," "La télévision extra-scolaire en quatre

villages." Summaries of the contents of the preceding reports which have been distributed by the ETV Secretary's office can be found in the forthcoming December 1974 Instructional Technology Report published by the AID-sponsored Information Center on Instructional Technology at the Academy.

IX. Outlook as of December 31, 1974

Since initial A.I.D support of the Ivory Coast ETV evaluation effort, many "unknowns" have become "knowns" and an evolution has occurred. A special Ministry of Education official has been named (January 1972) to direct the ETV program. He has created an external evaluation unit which he maintains as part of his cabinet. The Unit has been granted a mandate for research and evaluation activity, has acquired office space (in Bouaké and Abidjan) and a recurrent budget, and has secured international funding from three sources: the United States, and German, and the Belgian governments. The Evaluation Unit has a full-time coordinator (currently funded with World Bank loan money) and a Director-in-training (an Ivorian) who has been spending the last year on a Unesco fellowship studying evaluation techniques in Paris, Liège, and Stanford. The Unit has produced several reports for the ETV Secretary, has participated in planning meetings, and has collaborated closely with the internal evaluation (feedback) service as well as with any project official requesting evaluation assistance. During its past operation the Unit has obtained the participation of several local resources: the Institute for Applied Linguistics, the Ethno-Sociology Institute, the Ivorian Institute of Public Opinion, the Institute of Applied Psychology, the Institute of Pedagogical Research, the primary school pedagogical advisors, field data collectors, and the project's data processing unit.

As the American input has continued over three years the nature of its contribution has evolved. An initial policy of exclusively consultant

missions (year one) has evolved into a commitment to place a full-time evaluator in the field (years two and three). While contract AID afr/828 was offered Ivory Coast with the principal intention of assisting in the creation, the design, and in the initial planning of an Evaluation Unit, it also allowed participating in data collection and analysis as well as granting assistance to the ETV project on evaluation matters.

The Ivorian ETV Secretary of State visited Washington in June, 1973 and requested a long-term commitment from A.I.D. in continued support for the Evaluation Unit. The Unit's work program calls for United States Evaluation specialists in two fields: economic analysis and non-formal adult education TV program evaluation. In May 1974 the United States Ambassador to Ivory Coast submitted a PROP to AID/Washington, Africa Bureau for five years of funding in those two areas. At this date, a project agreement is under review for the continued AID funding of evaluation. Professor McAnany spent two weeks in Abidjan in October 1974 in order to assess how in the out-of-school component United States participation could be most helpful. The economic analysis, it has been proposed, would involve the same researchers who initiated the study in 1972 and who already have amply described their research plan. The Academy feels satisfied with the accomplishments its previous consultants and field director have made in the initial operations of the Evaluation Unit and hopes those critical achievements may be perceived as an investment toward future continued support of the needed evaluation effort, as it develops within the Ivory Coast ETV project.

Appendix A

Reports produced under partial U.S.A.I.D. support and submitted to the Secretary of State for Primary Education and Educational Television, Ministry of National Education, Abidjan, Ivory Coast

1. Les Attitudes du Corps Enseignant (enquête nationale sur la première année d'éducation télévisuelle)
2. La Participation des Premiers Elèves de l'Ecole Normale d'Instituteurs de Bouaké à Leur Programme
3. The Cost of Educational Television in the Ivory Coast
4. La Situation des Maîtres Télévisuels 1973/74
5. Suggestions for Evaluation in the ETV French Program
6. Mission Report on ETV French Program (November, 1973)
7. La Situation des Maîtres Télévisuels 1973/74
8. La Télévision Extra-Scolaire en Quatre Villages