

AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT  
 WASHINGTON, D. C. 20523  
**BIBLIOGRAPHIC INPUT SHEET**

FOR AID USE ONLY

1. SUBJECT CLASSIFICATION	A. PRIMARY Social Science
	B. SECONDARY Development Planning

2. TITLE AND SUBTITLE  
 Education, communalism, and income distribution

3. AUTHOR(S)  
 Von der Mehden, F.R

4. DOCUMENT DATE 1976	5. NUMBER OF PAGES 36 p.	6. ARC NUMBER ARC
--------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------

7. REFERENCE ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS  
 Program of Development Studies, Rice University,  
 Houston, Texas 77001

8. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES (*Sponsoring Organization, Publishers, Availability*)  
 (In Program of ddevelopment studies. Paper no. 71)

9. ABSTRACT

An assessment of the impact of government policies on the distribution of income among communal groups. After evaluating the considerable importance of traditional attitudes and colonial policies, the paper analyzes the impact of post-independence official activities. Four fundamental policies are discussed in turn: 1) It is noted that various less-developed countries' governments have developed regulations either to restrict entrance into educational institutions or to provide "affirmative action" programs to aid disadvantaged groups; 2) The establishment of national languages can aid or inhibit groups depending upon this addition to employ the lingua franca; 3) Spatial distrotion leads to improve educational opportunities to those near modern centers in which Western learning is more available; 4) While efforts are being made to equalize educational expenditures, both past patterns and present programs mean that equal opportunities will demand more than equal attention to disadvantaged groups.

10. CONTROL NUMBER PN-AAC-167	11. PRICE OF DOCUMENT
12. DESCRIPTORS	13. PROJECT NUMBER
	14. CONTRACT NUMBER AID/otr-C-1394 Res.
	15. TYPE OF DOCUMENT

PROGRAM OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES  
121 Sewall Hall  
WILLIAM MARSH RICE UNIVERSITY  
Houston, Texas 77001

Paper No. 71

Education, Communalism and  
Income Distribution

by

Fred R. von der Mehden

Spring, 1976

The author is Albert Thomas Professor of Political Science and Chairman, at Rice University. This paper reports research conducted under AID contract AID/otr-C-1394 on "Distribution of Gains, Wealth and Income from Development."

Program Discussion Papers are preliminary materials circulated to stimulate discussion and critical comment. References in publications to Discussion Papers should be cleared with the authors to protect the tentative character of these papers.

E R R A T A

Page 28 line 13 should read:

expenditures in a single decade in selected Afro-Asian states.<sup>1</sup>

Page 28 footnote 1 should read: <sup>1</sup>Harbison, op. cit.

footnote 2 should be added and should read: <sup>2</sup>Hill, op. cit.

## Abstract

### Education, Communalism and Income Distribution

by

Fred R. von der Mehden

This paper is part of a broader PDS research project assessing the impact of government policies on the distribution of income among communal groups. By communal we mean those basing their identity upon language, race, ethnicity, religion or region. Here we are considering the influence of government programs in education, and particularly problems related to access to educational opportunities. It is hypothesized that education is one vital factor in achieving a higher income.

After assessing the considerable importance of traditional attitudes and colonial policies, the paper analyzes the impact of post-independence official activities. Four fundamental policies are discussed in turn: 1) It is noted that various LDC governments have developed regulations to either restrict entrance into educational institutions or to provide "affirmative action" programs to aid disadvantaged groups; 2) The establishment of national languages can aid or inhibit groups depending upon this addition to employ the lingua franca; 3) Spatial distortion leads to better educational opportunities to those near modern centers where Western learning is more available; 4) While efforts are being made to equalize educational expenditures, both past patterns and present programs mean that equal opportunities will demand more than equal attention to disadvantaged groups.



## Education, Communalism and Income Distribution

This analysis is oriented primarily toward limitations to access of groups of citizens within developing states to opportunities to participate equally in the economic life of the polity. It is based upon the expectation that government programs may act to limit members of these groups from sharing equally in the distribution of gains and wealth of the society. The groups under consideration are communal in nature, i.e., distinctive in terms of race, ethnicity, religion, language, region or other "primordial" characteristics.<sup>1</sup> Within our consideration is the rural-urban dichotomy as both a basis of separate analysis and given the frequent coincidence of rural-urban and communal patterns.

Five general areas of access limitation are the focus of present research by the Program of Development Studies: 1) educational opportunities; 2) entrance into professions and prescribed jobs; 3) ownership of land or businesses; 4) use of wealth, including the employment of tax and licensing provisions; and 5) residence. As well, we will consider general policies that may impact upon income differentials. Within these categories

---

<sup>1</sup>For discussions of the problems and definitions of ethnicity, see Cynthia Enloe, Ethnic Conflict and Political Development (Boston: Little, Brown, 1973); Anderson, von der Mehden, Young, Issues of Political Development (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, 1974); W. Bell and W. E. Freeman, Ethnicity and Nation-Building (Beverly Hills: Sage, 1974); and Glazer and Moynihan, Ethnicity (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1975).

governments have formulated a wide variety of programs, some of which have been designed purposely to limit groups while others have produced, consciously, outcomes debilitating to particular communities. An example of the latter in the United States would be standardized educational testing which has been described as injurious to blacks and other minorities. Policies may also vary in scope, ranging from isolated regulations affecting members of a community to a wide range of programs designed to control, exile or eliminate "undesirables." This paper analyzes educational policies--future publications will assess other elements of our research and bring the various segments of the analysis together systemically.

It should be noted that, while policies may be formulated to limit economic opportunities in one area, they may not affect the total income standing of the group. Thus, restrictions on Chinese and Indians in the government positions and land ownership in some East African and Southeast Asian states helped to lead these communities to more economically rewarding commercial activities. Prewar limitations on Jews in traditional academic disciplines in European academic institutions drew Jewish scholars to interdisciplinary or marginal areas of study leading to major intellectual discoveries.

### I. Educational Policies

A basic assumption of this section is that formal education is one important road to higher paying occupations. Studies in the United States and western Europe have underlined the correlation between years of schooling and income and more recently similar analyses have been employed in

TABLE 1: Percentages of Heads of Households of Youths Born in 1956 and 1960 Who Are Employed By Educational Qualification in 1970\*

Educational Qualification	Sample Number	Percent Employed (%)
No formal education	6,932	63.5
Some primary	8,757	81.0
Completed primary	4,341	84.0
Lower secondary	965	82.2
Form IV or V	833	86.8
Form VI or more	216	93.3
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>22,044</b>	<b>76.3</b>

\*Murod Bin Mohd. Noor, Lapuran (Kuala Lumpur: Kementerian Pelajaran, 1973), p. 9.

TABLE 2: Distribution of Occupational Levels by Educational Qualifications among Heads of Households of Youths Born in 1956 and 1960 Who Are Members of the Labor Force in 1970\*

Educational qualification	Sample number	Occupational Level			
		Skilled (%)	Semi-skilled (%)	Slight Skill (%)	Unskilled (%)
No formal education	4,689	7.0	9.9	57.2	25.8
Some primary	7,314	12.4	21.1	45.4	21.2
Completed primary	3,743	17.9	23.1	40.6	18.4
Lower Secondary Form I or III	793	36.4	28.5	26.8	8.3
Form IV or V	731	63.2	30.5	5.0	1.3
Form VI or more Pre-university	204	91.0	8.2	0.7	0.1
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>17,474</b>	<b>15.8</b>	<b>19.0</b>	<b>44.9</b>	<b>20.4</b>

\*Noor, Lapuran, p. 10.

the developing world.<sup>1</sup> F. Harbison has commented with reference to LDCs that "Without any question, formal education is an avenue through which some members of low income groups gain access to the higher income occupations."<sup>2</sup> For example, Malaysia studies show important correlations between level of education and occupation and employment (see tables 1 and 2). Education may be the means of achieving a position in the prestigious civil service where status and perquisites often go hand in hand. However, the problem is not only one of education of the elite as the paucity minimal schooling has limited upward mobility of large numbers of people in developing areas. This is particularly true of the approximately 80 per percent of Afro-Asians who were illiterate at the time of independence and the majority of the populace of many LDCs today that have no formal education. As we shall see in the following pages, this pattern has been perpetuated through family and geographic advantages. To illustrate, one study of an African elite sample showed that 80 percent of fathers were literate at a time when even the most advanced countries of the area had only 30 percent literacy.<sup>3</sup> Suffice to say, access to more lucrative occupations for citizens of LDCs is at least in part based upon attainment of literacy and a formal education. The specific correlation will vary with the particular political, economic, and social system.

<sup>1</sup>J. E. Goldthorpe, "An African Elite: A Sample Survey of Fifty-two Former Students of Makerera College in East Africa," in van der Berghe, ed., Africa, Social Problems of Change and Conflict (San Francisco: Chandler, 1965), p. 181.

<sup>2</sup>F. Harbison, The Education-Income Connection, 1975 (mimeo.). This is backed by anthropology studies. For example, see A. Maulud Yusuf, "Rural-Urban Malaysia: A Case Study in Cultural Anthropology," unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Rice University, 1976.

<sup>3</sup>See C. A. Anderson, "Economic Development and Post-primary Education," in D. Piper and T. Cole, eds., Post-Primary Education and Economic Development (Durham: Duke University Press, 1964), pp. 3-26; F. Harbison, Human Resources as the Wealth of Nations (New York: Oxford,

We are not considering the economic impact of educational policies on the economic growth of the entire polity. Discussion in this area ranges from arguments as to whether elite education or literacy lead to higher national incomes, to analysis as to whether economic development calls for limited expenditures on formal education as against other policy alternatives. While these issues will be considered at a later date, present analysis is limited to problems of access to extant educational opportunities for communal groups.

We seek to assess government educational policies that tend to limit economic opportunities in developing countries under four rubrics: 1) quotas in secondary and tertiary education and restrictions on professional training, 2) language regulations, 3) areal differentiation in programs, and 4) differential expenditures.

In analyzing the impact of educational policies, careful attention must be given to longitudinal data. In particular, traditional religious-cultural patterns and colonial educational practices have been highly relevant to an understanding of current disparities. Traditional factors remain powerful limiting forces, more in terms of the employment of educational opportunities rather than equal access, although they are relevant in the latter as well. Three examples should suffice to draw out the implications of these cultural elements although this is a rich area for future research. Religious training was long a vital core to the

---

(1973); Charles Elliott, Patterns of Poverty in the Third World (New York: Praeger, 1975); F. Harbison and C. Myers, eds., Manpower and Education (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1965). At the same time others have noted the dangers of overeducation impacting upon jobs. See E. Edwards and M. Todaro, "Education and Employment in Developing Nations," in E. Edwards, ed., Employment in Developing Nations (New York: Columbia University Press, 1975), pp. 313-29; and R. Boudon, Education, Opportunity and Social Equality (New York: Wiley, 1974).

development and maintenance of Islam and Buddhism.<sup>1</sup> Buddhist monastery schools provided primarily religious training taught by rote, based on Pali, and focused on religious texts while Moslem children followed a similar rote-oriented system employing Arabic and the Koran and Hadith. Both were for males only. This education was in contrast to Western state and missionary schools which taught courses more relevant to the modern industrial and commercial world. Thus, religious training provided a comparative disadvantage to its product in the colonial and postcolonial eras. Given the concentration of Western educational facilities in urban and other less traditional areas, access to opportunities afforded by them was limited to groups living in these centers of learning.

Traditional sex roles, often tied to religious concepts, have also inhibited females from obtaining the education necessary for economic advancement in the modern sector. Even today the very basic criteria of literacy finds considerable variation between the sexes in the LDCs of Afro-Asia. Female illiteracy in these countries averages well over 80 percent. While there were major changes in attitudes toward female education in these areas during the latter years of colonialism, progress was very slow against the traditional reaction to modern training for women. Thus, even in the more Westernized areas of southern Nigeria in 1947, less than one fifth of those in primary schools were girls and less than 750 were attending secondary schools.<sup>2</sup> In addition, females have often been

---

<sup>1</sup>For discussions of this type of traditional education see F. von der Mehden, Religion and Nationalism in Southeast Asia (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1963); A. R. Gibb, Modern Trends in Islam (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1947); and M. Halpern, The Politics of Social Change in the Middle East and North Africa (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1963) among others.

<sup>2</sup>For an analysis of colonial problems with female education, see African Education (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1953), pp. 107-115.

relegated to courses emphasizing homemaking, teacher training and other specialties limiting access to the administrative-commercial sector. This pattern is accentuated by the higher dropout rate of females as the class proceeds up the educational ladder. For example, even in Thailand where women have enjoyed greater opportunities, the percentage of females in attendance drops from 48 percent in primary schools to 41 percent in secondary to 26.4 percent at the university level.<sup>1</sup>

As a final example, we may turn to traditional attitudes among farmers to extensive educational opportunities for their children. As we shall note below, the fact of comparatively low education in rural as against urban areas is well documented. As well, numerous village studies in LDCs have commented upon the peasants' reluctance to allow their children to attend postprimary schools. In part, this has been due to the need for labor in the fields combined with questions about the relevance of continued education for an agricultural community. These questions involve distrust of secular-oriented education, nonvocational education and a paucity of opportunities to find local employment for those with an education.

While all three of the aforementioned traditional inhibitions have been weakening under the impact of political activism, communications, and other elements of modernization, they remain as obstacles to at least the employment of opportunities. To expand possibilities for the total population, governments must therefore go beyond equality of expenditures and facilities and into programs of long range attitudinal changes. Studies

<sup>1</sup>Joint Thai-U. S. Task Force, Preliminary Assessment of Education and Human Resources in Thailand, Vol. I (Bangkok, 1963), p. 197.

such as Kim Hill's analyses of educational expenditures in Turkey and Malaysia show that equal budgets do not produce equal educational outcomes.<sup>1</sup>

Colonial policies reinforced many of these old patterns while also introducing new nonegalitarian conditions. Examples of the former abound in Afro-Asia. In West Africa, British policy was to keep Islam "pure" in the northern sections of the colonies, where Moslems predominated. In Nigeria's northern provinces, inhabited by approximately one-half the colony's population, Christian missionaries were generally forbidden, and their inhabitants did not attend institutions of higher education abroad--both patterns in contrast to the Ibos and Yorubas in the south. Thus, as of 1947 only 2.5 percent of those attaining a secondary education were from the north, and as of 1951 only one university graduate was from the region and he was a converted Christian.<sup>2</sup> In the Philippines the Spanish colonial and religious administration provided education almost entirely to the Catholic majority during the nineteenth century, only in part due to the geographic isolation of the "heathen" and Moslem minorities. With regard to education of females, many a colonial administrator was reluctant to counter traditional attitudes. In the words of one early report on educational policy in British tropical Africa, "It is obvious that better

---

<sup>1</sup>Kim Q. Hill, "Distributional and Impact Analysis of Public Policy: A Two-Nation Study for Education and Health Policy" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Rice University, 1974).

<sup>2</sup>See W. Schwarz, Nigeria (London: Pall Mall, 1968), pp. 47-49; A. Nwonko and S. Hejika, The Making of a Nation: Biafia (London: Hurst, 1969, pp. 27-28; and R. Sklar and C. Whitaker, "The Federal Republic of Nigeria," in G. Carter, Regionalism in Eight African States (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1966), pp. 24-26.

education for native girls and women in Tropical Africa is urgently needed, but it is almost impossible to overstate the delicacy and the difficulties of the problem."<sup>1</sup> At the same time there is little doubt that without pressure from colonial and missionary educators the traditional forces would have delayed female advancement even longer.

As colonial administrations became entrenched, and intertwined with commercial policies, they developed new programs and practices which were particularly deleterious to equal access to educational opportunities. Here we are not discussing overall low levels of literacy in colonial Afro-Asia where, with few exceptions such as the former Belgian Congo and the Philippines, literacy at the end of the colonial occupation was less than 20 percent. Rather, we are considering actions which led to differential educational opportunities within the respective colonies. Three aspects of the problem appear to warrant special attention.

1. Urban-centered education: Educational opportunities were primarily developed in the colonial capital cities and other market centers and among groups believed "particularly responsive or particularly useful and/or important to the colonial administrators."<sup>2</sup> Thus, in West Africa Western education was concentrated along the more commercially developed coast. In Asia, the port cities and commercial towns received the greatest benefits, and on both continents rural areas were rarely, if ever, those advantaged by secondary or tertiary educational efforts. On the one hand, this

---

<sup>1</sup>African Education, op. cit., p. 107.

<sup>2</sup>Charles Elliott, Patterns of Poverty in the Third World (New York: Praeger, 1975), p. 229.

pattern tended to reinforce the dominance of the urban elite (along with traditional leaders of importance who sent their sons abroad). It also had its impact upon access to education in communal terms. In colonies with geographically-based communal groups the pattern of urban-based post-primary education severely restricted the more isolated populations and aided those near and in the cities. Thus, educational opportunities were more available to the urbanized Chinese and Indian elites of Southeast Asia, the Kikuyu of Kenya, Buganda in Uganda, Ibo and Yuruba of Nigeria, and Chewa of Zambia. For example, in Ghana following annexation of the coastal area in 1948 nearly all education was in this area to the disadvantage of the Ashanti and Northern Territories. This pattern continued to advantage the coast, and by 1948 18 percent of the population of Accra had completed at least six years of schooling which percentage for the Ashanti was only 3.9 percent and Northern Territories but 0.2 percent.<sup>1</sup> As well, colonial administrators seeking employees who were considered either "safe" politically or proficient technically, turned to particular groups with Western training. The French looked to those assimilated into French culture and who were thus in all probability educated within and around the capital cities. In Burma and the former Netherlands East Indies colonial administrations sought to employ Christians, who often came from particular converted rural ethnic groups but were educated in urban centers. In Malaysia the British used the urban-based Chinese in commercial and technical activities because they were considered more proficient and hard working.

<sup>1</sup>Encyclopedia of Education, Vol. 4 (New York: Macmillan), p. 131.

2. Education expenditures: In line with these aforementioned interests, colonial governments generally provided larger budgets for urban and commercially-oriented regions. Again, given geographically based communities within colonies, this led to differentiated communal access. There were numerous examples of this pattern. In Nigeria the number of primary grade students in government schools in the south in 1937 was 12,183 while the equally populous north had only 9,130. Secondary education figures were 608 and 65, respectively.<sup>1</sup> In the Gold Coast (Ghana) in 1950 government grants were £700,000 for the Ashanti and colony, and only £30,000 for the northern territories with over 20 percent of the population of the colony.<sup>2</sup> In Malaya expenditures on education in 1955 went to states with the highest Chinese and urban populations (over 60 percent of the educational funds although they had but 45 percent of the total population).<sup>3</sup>

3. Type of education: Integrally related to these factors was the type of education provided. In French schools in Africa primary education was in French, as the colonial administration sought to advance assimilation with the metropolitan culture.<sup>4</sup> This was reinforced through selective entrance into secondary schooling and the greatly limited university and

---

<sup>1</sup>African Education, op. cit., pp. 47-48.

<sup>2</sup>Ibid., p. 52.

<sup>3</sup>Federation of Malaya, Annual Report, 1955 (Kuala Lumpur: Government Press, 1956), p. 245.

<sup>4</sup>For a discussion of education in European colonies, see Piper and Cole, Post-Primary Education and Development, op. cit.; and V. Thompson and R. Adloff, French West Africa (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1956), pp. 516-56; J. S. Furnivall, Colonial Policy and Practice (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1948).

professional school admittance system. In the words of one observer, the result was that

So successful was the French program of education assimilation that the African it produced often felt much closer culturally and spiritually to the French colonial administrator than he did to his own people. A member of this educated elite felt that his place was not in a bush village, but in the administration of the territorial capital.<sup>1/</sup>

Thus, within various colonial systems a new communal group was formed composed of individuals educated by and often culturally sympathetic to the dominant metropolitan culture. This was the base to the economic elite of the postindependence era.

The impact of European educational policies on income distribution among groups within their colonies was two-fold:

1. An elite was entrenched who was European educated in language and training so as to compete more effectively in the modern world than those coming from the traditional patterns. Positions were available to the former in administration, commerce and, later, politics.

2. Urban populations were more likely to receive superior educational opportunities in secondary and tertiary education than their rural counterparts. Those benefiting were more often than not either foreign communal groups or of a different ethnic-linguistic composition than the rest of the population.

## II

We now turn to the relation of educational policy to income patterns in the contemporary era of politically independent LDCs. In our analysis we will consider the four aforementioned areas of expenditures, quotas,

---

<sup>1</sup>  
Piper and Cole, Post-primary Education, p. 183.

language, and areal differentiation. An effort will be made to provide examples of policies noted, but in most cases there are insufficient data to present universal material from throughout even Afro-Asia.

#### Quotas and restrictions

We can find numerous examples of the use of quotas or other restrictions affecting particular communal groups. Such policies can be considered under two general rubrics, restrictions on schools stressing particular cultures and languages, and quotas on students in various levels of education. These programs, as with other educational policies noted here, have been formulated with "positive" and "negative" goals in mind. In the former cases, the design has been to unify the nation by providing a common cultural and linguistic heritage. In achieving this goal it has been considered necessary to eliminate patterns of loyalty considered parochial or foreign. This stress on unity has been a principal factor in internal conflict as local elites in rural areas and foreign commercial elements in urban centers have felt increasingly threatened. Other "positive" goals have been of an "affirmative action" nature, i.e., policies established to allow disadvantaged groups to "catch up" with other communities. "Negative" goals have been to "hold back" or otherwise penalize groups perceived to be foreign, overly aggressive, or of opposing political factions.

Regulations formulated to restrict particular types of communal schools have been aimed particularly at institutions considered foreign by the indigenous elite, i.e., Chinese schools in Southeast Asia, Indian schools in East Africa and some expatriate-oriented European educational institutions. Examples abound. In Indonesia all Chinese schools in rural areas

were closed after the abortive coup of 1965. Later all use of Chinese as a mode of teaching was forbidden.<sup>1</sup> In Malaysia Chinese education has come under increasing attack from Malay nationalists who have vigorously pursued a Malay national language policy. In Thailand Chinese education is being phased out, primary schools having been reduced from 500 to 167 and a maximum of ten hours of Chinese over four years established.<sup>2</sup> In the Philippines a proposal was made at the 1971 Constitutional Convention to outlaw all "alien" schools, an effort directed against some 152 Chinese schools in the country.<sup>3</sup>

Schools designed for expatriates have found it increasingly difficult to operate in the LDCs. Regulations have been promulgated to include indigenous language instruction, restrict attendance to foreign students, enforce annual licensing procedures and generally either to isolate the institution from the indigenous community and/or nationalize its curriculum--if such schools are allowed to exist at all.

Fundamentally, these restrictions can have three influences upon access to educational opportunities in LDCs. Where alien schools are restricted or eliminated, local Chinese or Indian students who are not citizens may be totally deprived of an education in country. Unable to attend their own schools, they may be ineligible to enter government owned institutions because of their citizenship. This has recently been the fate of many Indian children in East Africa. It thus may only be the well-to-do who are

---

<sup>1</sup>D. W. Chang, "Current Status of Chinese Minorities in Southeast Asia," Asian Survey, XIII:6 (June, 1973), pp. 587-608.

<sup>2</sup>Asian Research Bulletin, I:4 (September, 1971), p. 302.

<sup>3</sup>Ibid., I:6 (November, 1971), p. 464.

able to send their children abroad for education. Secondly, by restricting "expatriate" schools to foreigners there is the possibility of limiting educational opportunities to local students. However, since tuition is usually high at these institutions, it does not seriously affect the poorer population. An advantage to breaking up these cultural schools is that it may help to crumble the linguistic-cultural economic power structure of these "alien" communities. Particularly where the alien language is the dialect of commerce, the continuation of these schools helps to maintain a closed linguistic-economic community.<sup>1</sup>

A different set of regulations has been designed to establish quotas in educational opportunities. These have been of two types: 1) restrictions upon members of certain designated groups in order to keep their numbers in institutions of learning limited, and 2) "affirmative action" programs promulgated to aid "disadvantaged" elements of the society. In the United States we have experienced both types, previous quotas on those of Jewish origin in professional schools and current efforts to increase minority attendance at institutions of higher learning.

Restrictions upon communal groups other than aliens are often difficult to prove. In the cases of foreigners such as Chinese, Indians, Levantine and migratory labor, data are available. Foreign schools have been closed or restricted, particularly regarding instruction in non indigenous languages. As well, there are rare examples where specific quotas or restrictions have been formulated for communal groups. Restrictions on women have arisen in a few countries. Korea has an upper age limit

---

<sup>1</sup>The author found this espoused as a reason given by Chinese merchants in Malaysia to hire only their own, i.e., only Chinese could do business in the commercial community.

of 25 for women only, and Afghanistan has residence requirements for women. However, a more common practice has been private support to communal groups favored by the elite controlling the educational system. When a political leader, minister of education, or school administrator takes over, members of his or her religious, linguistic, or tribal group may find it easier to get scholarships, entrance into institutions of higher education, teaching positions, etc. On the other hand, communal groups in opposition may find access to educational facilities closed or severely restricted.

"Affirmative action" programs have been rather rare, at least in terms of systematic policies. The two paramount examples have been India and Malaysia. In the former case, "untouchables" or harijans and specified tribes can obtain scholarships, entrance into boarding schools, reserved places in schools and easier matriculation requirements.<sup>1</sup> However, these efforts have not been totally successful due to high dropout rates, geographic isolation, insufficient information and private discrimination, all of which have inhibited attempts to fill quotas. In Malaysia special efforts have been made to aid Malays and other indigenous peoples (in contrast to Chinese and Indians). As in India, discrimination in education is constitutionally forbidden, but this means discrimination against individuals based upon race, religion, descent or place of birth. Since the Chinese have generally lived in urban areas with better schools,

---

<sup>1</sup>For India see Arles, "The Economic and Social Promotion of the Scheduled Castes and Tribes in India," International Labour Review, 103 (January, 1971), pp. 29-64; L. Durkheim, "Scheduled Caste Policy in India: History, Problems, Prospects," Asian Survey, VII:4 (September, 1967), pp. 626-36; S. Anant, "Caste Hindu Attitudes: the Harijans Perception," Asian Survey, XI:3 (March, 1971), pp. 271-78.

it has been considered necessary to increase the number of both Malay students and faculty at various levels. Special efforts have thus been implemented to increase the number of Malay teachers and students at the university level, the new national university is almost entirely Malay in its student body (in part because classes are all taught in Malay) and vocational training has been aimed at aiding Malays.

Considerable further research and analysis is necessary to judge the total impact of such "affirmative action" programs on income. Cultural and spatial factors appear to remain quite important in Malaysia. Malay students still do more poorly in science fields and are underrepresented in science and engineering at the university level. Chinese with primary and secondary education still obtain more middle and high level positions than Indians and Malays<sup>1</sup> and Chinese control of guilds and associations aids them in achieving higher income occupations.

#### Language policies

We have already noted efforts to restrict "foreign" education, i.e., Chinese, Indian and expatriate schools. Here we are analyzing language policies related to the formulation of lingua francas that may restrict access in the educational realm. In developing societies the generally desirable goal of establishing a single national language may be harmful to particular communal groups. If the language of one of the indigenous linguistic elements of the polity is chosen as the lingua franca, the members of that group will have an advantage in competing for jobs and

---

<sup>1</sup>A. Wilson, "Education, Mobility, and Expectations of Youths in Malaysia," Berkeley School of Education, University of California (mimeographed), p. 14.

education where the national tongue is required. In Malaysia the language issue has been of considerable importance. The National Language Bill of 1957 had made English and Malay compulsory at the primary and secondary level, and later Malay was phased into the educational system grade by grade up to the university matriculation exams. Examinations to upper level institutions could be taken only in English or Malay. Malay was the indigenous language of approximately one-half of the population while the largest minority, the Chinese, with 37 percent of the populace was more fluent in either Chinese or English. The result was that in 1973 some Chinese students passed all their exams but Malay and were eligible for Commonwealth universities but could not attend local institutions of higher education. Meanwhile in Sarawak, in East Malaysia, the placing of intensive English in Chinese schools was explained on the basis that it would allow Chinese students to get better jobs. Chinese in both areas fear that they will be penalized in both jobs and education in competition with Malays.<sup>1</sup>

A similar problem is found elsewhere. In Sri Lanka the 1956 Language Act proclaimed Sinhalese as the national language and in 1964 a complete changeover was attempted to the detriment of the Tamil minority that found Sinhalese civil servants dominating.<sup>2</sup> The Indian government decision to make Hindi the official language triggered riots and other strong reactions

---

<sup>1</sup>For a discussion of the language question in Malaysia, see M. Roff, "The Politics of Language in Malaya," Asian Survey, VII:5 (May, 1967), pp. 316-28; and L. Comber, "Chinese Education--Perennial Malayan Problem," Asian Survey, I:8 (October, 1961), pp. 30-35; and F. Kee and E. Hong, Education in Malaysia (Kuala Lumpur: Heinemann Educational Books, 1971).

<sup>2</sup>R. Kearny, "Sinhalese Nationalism and Social Conflict in Ceylon," Pacific Affairs, XXXVII:2 (Summer, 1974), pp. 125-36.

from both those with another indigenous tongue and the English educated elite that felt their employment threatened.<sup>1</sup>

A future discussion paper will analyze the language issue more fully. Suffice to state at this point, the employment of a local language as the lingua franca is perceived by varying groups as disadvantageous. While indigenous minorities may see dangers in the majority language being chosen, individuals speaking the lingua franca may feel that their inability to employ a major European tongue will injure their opportunities. As one anthropologist reported, Malay villagers complained that, "Well, we are not educated in English; that is why we are poor."<sup>2</sup>

If the former colonial language is maintained as the lingua franca, as has happened in much of tropical Africa, egalitarianism also suffers. The same educated elite, combined with those living in more modern sectors where the European language is the mode of commerce, will be better able to compete for positions than rural populations reared in local dialects. The fact is that modern commerce, science, intellectual exchange and technology are carried out in Dutch, English, French, and other European languages--not local dialects. Without education in Western languages the deprived may find upward mobility markedly inhibited. The problems for those not speaking the European languages can be seen by examining several African states where the former colonial tongue has become the national language.

In the Cameroons the dual colonial background has led to the establishment of two European languages, English and French. The Ministry of

---

<sup>1</sup>For example, Tamils were particularly disturbed. See R. L. Hardgrove, Jr., "The Riots in Tamilnad: Problems and Prospects of India's Language Crisis," Asian Survey, V:8 (August, 1965), pp. 399-407.

<sup>2</sup>A. Malaud Yusof, op. cit., p. 37.

Education has stated that English is to be taught in all schools above the primary level in East Cameroon and French in the West Cameroon. This is within a country with approximately 100 local languages. In Ghana, English is the medium of instruction at the secondary level; yet local languages (Ewe, Fante, Ga and Twi) are widely used at the primary level. Students with these vernacular tongues must take entrance examinations to the Middle School that stresses English.<sup>1</sup> In Nigeria, the first two or three years are usually in the vernacular with English replacing the various local tongues at later grades.

A third and quite rare alternative has been to develop a new language not drawn from either the colonial power or one of the indigenous groups. This was accomplished in preindependence years by Indonesian nationalists who turned market Malay into a relatively sophisticated and highly eclectic modern language. Today a special institution sanctions new words to meet modern needs, and most Indonesian are bilingual, speaking both their own dialect and Indonesian.<sup>2</sup> However even here there may be some comparative advantage as more isolated or traditional peoples have been less proficient in the national language. For example, on the island of Java most people speak indigenous languages in day-to-day transactions, and Indonesian is a second language. Javanese is spoken in the home by 80 percent of the Indonesians in the cities of Yogyakarta and Surabaya, while the percentage of those speaking Sundanese in homes of Bandung is 94 percent. Villagers may be particularly disadvantaged, and studies on Java show that a minority of village household heads are fluent in the national language.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Encyclopedia of Education, V.I, p. 588; V. IV, p. 132.

<sup>2</sup>T. Alisjabana, "The Indonesian Language--By-Product of Nationalism," Pacific Affairs (December, 1949).

<sup>3</sup>P. Weldon, "Indonesian and Chinese Status Differences in Urban Java," Working Paper no. 7, Department of Sociology, Univ. of Singapore.

In sum, variations in fluency in the national language(s) can inhibit students throughout their entire educational career and later make it difficult in obtaining jobs requiring such ability. Occupational limitations have been noticeable most particularly in government jobs and those demanding technological and other modern skills.

Spatial access or distortion

The issue of access to education based upon geographic setting is of central importance in considering obstacles to the attainment of higher kinds of schooling in the developing world. By spatial access is meant the ability to obtain equal education based upon the location of the student and/or his family. The relationship of spatial access to income is based upon three propositions:

- 1) The aforementioned correlations of education to income;
- 2) That a considerable disparity exists in both quality and quantity of schooling among regions, particularly between rural and urban areas;
- 3) Where communal groups in plural societies are dispersed geographically, there exist instances where access to education up through the university is limited for particular communities.

There is extensive evidence to support the second proposition regarding disparities of educational opportunities between rural and urban populations.

F. Harbison summed up evidence on several states noting

In Colombia, for example, which is one of the more advanced of the less-developed countries, nearly 10 percent of the rural schools offer no more than the first two grades of primary school; only six percent have facilities to offer the four-year primary sequence. In Kenya about 80-85 percent of the relevant age children in the more advanced Central Province attend primary school; but in several other districts and provinces, the rate may be as low as 35 percent. In Mexico the percent of population which has completed four years of

schooling is strikingly higher in the Federal District (Mexico City)--60.6--than in the rural states such as, for example, Chiapas (11.9), Guerrero (9.8), and Oaxaca (11.4).<sup>1/</sup>

Charles Elliott has plotted out primary and secondary enrollment ratio in rural areas as percentages of enrollment ratios in capital cities of African states.<sup>2</sup> (See Tables 3 and 4.) Other studies in Malaysia, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Turkey, Nigeria, and Latin America bear out this spatial distortion between rural and urban education.

The significance of this data becomes clearer when we note that the normal pattern is for the rural population to have access to only two to four years of primary education, hardly sufficient for functional literacy. In many cases there are no schools at all in villages. For example, in the 1960s Turkey had one-third of its villages without schools. Thus, the majority of rural youths in most Afro-Asian countries cannot expect to receive training for occupations beyond the semi-skilled. Underscoring this disadvantage of rural youth is the elite school mechanism through which access to the best universities is predicated upon graduation from "prestige" secondary schools which are to be found primarily in the large urban centers.

These problems can be illustrated from studies in Thailand and Malaysia. In the Thai case, the vast majority of students left by the end of the fourth year of school.<sup>3</sup> In 1961, 75 percent of those leaving school through the 18th grade had done so by the end of four years; and by that

---

<sup>1</sup>Harbison, The Education-Income Connection, pp. 4-5.

<sup>2</sup>Elliott, op. cit., pp. 231,235.

<sup>3</sup>This data has been drawn from various AID studies done in Thailand during the 1960s.

TABLE 3: Secondary Education Enrolment Ratios  
in Rural Areas as Percentages of  
Enrolment Ratios in the Capital

Country	Year	<u>Top Rural</u>			<u>Bottom Rural</u>		
		Male	Both Sexes	Female	Male	Both Sexes	Female
Kenya	1970		35.2			21.4	
Tanzania	1969	92.9	64.8	28.7	0.0	0.0	0.0
Uganda	1968		43.0			2.6	
Zambia	1969		82.4			41.2	
Cameroon <sup>a/</sup>	1965		128.0			7.0	
Ivory Coast <sup>b/</sup>	1968		--			17.3	

<sup>a</sup>Using Centre-South with Yaounde as reference.

<sup>b</sup>Comparing the Northern Region with the whole of the Southern Region, including Abidjan.

SOURCE: Annual reports of ministries of education.

TABLE 4: Primary Education Enrolment Ratios  
in Rural Areas as Percentages of  
Enrolment Ratios in the Capital

Country	Year	<u>Top Rural</u>			<u>Bottom Rural</u>		
		Male	Both Sexes	Female	Male	Both Sexes	Female
Kenya	1970		162.7			13.6	
Tanzania	1969	159.5	161.0	162.9	41.9	40.8	20.7
Uganda	1968		89.1			22.0	
Zambia	1969		106.3			68.8	
Ghana	1970		98.1			23.7	
Cameroon	1971-72 <sup>a/</sup>					24.5	12.3
Ivory Coast	1969		116.7	77.8		28.8	13.4
Upper Volta	1971	51.0	41.6	37.7	5.7	3.7	2.8
Tunisia	1969-70	208.0		104.4	80.0		13.8
Sri Lanka <sup>b/</sup>	1972		104.1			50.5	

<sup>a</sup>Using Centre-South with Yaounde as reference.

<sup>b</sup>All grades of education.

SOURCES: Annual reports of ministries of education.

year there were less than half the children attending that started the first year. By the 1970s the majority of students had completed four years, but postprimary education remained for a small minority. However, the problem of spatial distortion is emphasized by the quantity and, particularly, the quality of teaching outside the urban areas. In order to enter one of the country's better institutions of higher learning it is helpful to obtain a secondary education from a good secondary school in the Bangkok or Chiangmai regions. Yet most rural areas only go the fourth year with district towns having further primary education and provincial towns comparatively low quality secondary schools. Thus, unless a rural family has money to send its child to a boarding school or relatives in a provincial town or city, there is no access to higher institutions. Only 5 percent of Northeast Thailand's population received four years education and 31 percent received no formal education in 1961. The results appear at the college graduate level. Thus, the Northeast with one-third of the nation's population had but 14 percent of university graduates in 1961, and Bangkok with approximately 10 percent of the population had 47 percent. When the government decided to put a university in the Northeast to cater to students there, a majority of those able to matriculate were from the urban centers and not the region. It was ultimately necessary to protect slots for local students through a quota system, guaranteeing positions for Northerners. In terms of simple literacy tests in the field showed slightly over half (56 percent) of those tested in the northeastern villages had functional literacy.

In Malaysia distinct variations in school attendance, dropout and test scores also exist between rural and urban populations.<sup>1</sup> While

---

<sup>1</sup>This data has been drawn from Noor, op. cit.

47 percent of urban 15+ youths were enrolled in school in the early 1970s, only 28 percent of rural youths were enrolled. Among Malays the respective percentages were 63 and 28, and Chinese 42 and 31 percent. Even Malaysia, with one of the highest percentages of its budget given to education in the world, shows high levels of attrition throughout the school system.

In sum, there is considerable evidence showing limitations in access to education from simple literacy to the university, based upon the geographic location of the student. Most of what has been analyzed has been the rural-urban gap. We now turn to the third proposition of this section, that spatial distortion can also account for variations in access among communal groups. The basic assumption here is that communal groups may find themselves either in rural areas without adequate educational facilities or from urban or missionary centers which have been favored by schools superior in quantity and quality.

We can note three communal groups that have been favored due to spatial access:

1. "Foreigners"--The colonial period allowed Chinese, Indians, and Europeans living in urban and commercial centers the opportunity to take advantage of the better educational opportunities of these areas. The various advantages of urban schooling mentioned previously accrued to at least some members of these communities. For example, in colonial Malaya the great majority of Malays were rural and there were no Malay secondary schools until 1963, while at the same time there existed 60 government assisted or partially assisted secondary schools, plus private institutions.<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Education in Malaysia, pp. 10-13.

In 1961 only 21 percent of university students were Malays (it is now about 52 percent of those taking degree courses, and 85 percent of primary technical courses.)

2. Missionary centers: In both Africa and Asia there have been missionary centers outside urban areas where superior education has been provided, thus educating the particular communal group residing in the area. Examples have been the Minahasa and Ambonese regions of Indonesia, and Christian missionary centers in Burma.

3. Communal-urban: We have numerous examples of indigenous communal groups residing in and about urban areas or centered in regions of European commercial activities and thus having heavy access to superior education. In Kenya the Kikuyu have taken advantage of this geographic factor, and one study showed that in 1962 56 percent of the Kikuyu primary school-age group had attained some schooling as compared with 38 percent of the Luo, 34 percent of the Luhyu, and 21 percent of the Kamba.<sup>1</sup> Makerere College enrollments show the tribal dominance factor in East Africa with the Kikuyu percentage of Kenyan enrollment 44.5 percent in 1953 and Ganda as a percentage of Ugandan reduced from 78 percent in 1922 but still 50 percent in 1953.<sup>2</sup>

As Charles Elliott quite properly notes, no universal statement can be made regarding the future of communal domination, and government policies differ markedly from one country to another. In the Malaysian case, efforts to increase Malay participation will mean higher rural enrollment

---

<sup>1</sup>Noted in C. Leys, Underdevelopment in Kenya (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1974), 202 fn.

<sup>2</sup>Noted in Elliott, op. cit., p. 253.

while in Sri Lanka, Kenya, and Nigeria political factors may weigh against major shifts of this nature.

While some groups may be advantaged by spatial distortion, obviously others will be injured. This is particularly true of communal groups living in sparsely populated regions where communications and economic factors will militate against equal education. Rare is the country like contemporary Malaysia where over half the children are within 2 miles and 95 percent are within 10 miles of a secondary school.<sup>1</sup> In most Afro-Asian polities there exist variations among communal groups in access to quality schools or scarcely schools of any sort. Whether they are the Taurigs of the Sahal, Moros of the Philippines, Chins of Burma, Nagas of India or Kurds of the Middle East, specific communal groups are victims of spatial distortion.

Differential expenditures: We have noted that there was often considerable disparity in expenditures on education provided different communal groups during the colonial era. In part, this was due to the successive inclusion of areas into the respective colony over time. For example, African coastal regions were usually those originally colonized and, therefore, open to the first missionary and public education. In Ghana, almost all the 12,000 students in government assisted schools in 1900 were from the coast.<sup>2</sup> Another factor was the desire to limit missionary educational activities in particular areas due to fears of religious frictions. Thus, missionary education, a major vehicle of Western learning, was largely

<sup>1</sup>Noor, op. cit., p. 60.

<sup>2</sup>Encyclopedia of Education, Vol. IV, p. 131.

absent from Moslem regions in black Africa. In addition, the poor communications systems of many colonies led to a differentiated educational infrastructure with urban and other commercial centers receiving higher governmental expenditures.

The postindependence period has seen the vast majority of newly independent states seeking the twin goals of universal, free primary education and equalization of educational expenditures throughout the polity. Research under the Program of Development Studies has shown examples where the equalization of expenditures has been achieved, at least on the provincial level. Even where this has not been attained, there has been a tremendous increase in total funds spent on education in both the rural and urban areas at all levels. Table 5 shows changing expenditures in a single decade in selected Afro-Asian states.

However, egalitarianism in funding does not necessarily lead to equal access to education. Hill's research shows that in the Turkish and Malaysian cases, where spending was basically equal on the provincial level, services provided students in different areas varied, outcomes in terms of levels of enrollment were not correlated with expenditures.<sup>2</sup> This result was not surprising given problems of language, culture, previous colonial policies and spatial distortions noted previously in this paper. Colonial governments spent unequal proportions of their budgets on different parts of their colonies which over time led to basic

---

<sup>1</sup>Hill, op. cit.

TABLE 5: Public and Private  
Recurring Expenditure  
Per Pupil by Level  
(in U. S. \$)

	<u>1960</u>	<u>1965</u>	<u>1969</u>	<u>% increase 1960-69</u>
<u>Less Developed</u>				
Algeria				
1	44	59	60	36
2	--	257	214	[-17]
3	952	1243	1309	38
Botswana				
1	15	22	25	67
2	406	336	258	-36
3	--	--	--	
C.A.R.				
1	19	24	29	53
2	204	338	163	-20
Dahomey				
1	45	53	51	13
2	119	147	318	167
3	450	714	952	112
Ethiopia				
1	18	20	21	17
2	103	84	69	-33
3	1823	1046	1944	7
Ghana				
1	14	21	22	57
2	202	262	268	32
3	3103	3361	3424	10
Hong Kong				
1	49	66	70	43
2	110	158	156	42
3	1075	1198	1162	8
India				
1	6	7	8	33
2	10	15	14	40
3	164	219	252	54
Korea				
1	10	13	23	130
2	25	29	24	-4
3	22	30	268	1118
Tunisia				
1	33	29	30	-9
2	188	149	162	-14
3	738	469	533	-28

variations in educational infrastructure between rural and urban areas. When combined with a selective placement of missionary schools, particular communal groups were advantaged, and contemporary equal expenditures are insufficient to rectify these accumulated inequities. Nor could equal funding alleviate differences in language capabilities, traditional attitudes toward education and a multitude of other problems of unequal development in plural societies. We have not been able to cover all of these elements here (future research will analyze the expenditure issue more fully), but two areas of analysis more clearly related to expenditures should be commented upon: costs due to difficulties in providing equal infrastructure to areas with dispersed populations, and covert costs. Both of these issues have been given considerable attention by education economists and will be touched upon only as they relate to communalism.

Cost factors such as the aforementioned are important today in maintaining older disparities among regions inhabited by communal groups that are poorer or more widely dispersed. Studies show that fixed per pupil costs decline with increased school size up to particular limits.<sup>1</sup> Governments obviously face greatly increased per pupil costs in less populated areas if they expect to provide similar quality education. The need to establish more schools, compensatory funds and/or an extended transportation or boarding system adds to costs where a critical mass of students is not present.

Charges for education, overt and covert, have obvious implications for poorer communal groups attempting to employ education as a means of

<sup>1</sup> Noor, op. cit., p. 62.

upward mobility. The argument is that formal costs for attending school or fees related to matriculation, books, boarding, etc., when combined with foregone income which children may have earned instead of gaining an education, are all obstacles to poorer families considering an education for their children. Elliott notes that overt fees for a secondary education in Uganda are 40 percent of the minimum wage in Kampala with equivalent figures for other areas (Cameroons, approximately 22 percent, and for the Philippines about 12 percent). The impact upon lower incomes is shown by data from Sri Lanka where "For every Rs,20 increase in his weekly wage, the chances of a child attending school increased by 1 percent for the youngest to 3 percent for the 12-14 age group."<sup>1</sup> Given lower incomes for many poorer rural groups we can expect fees to be an even greater burden on them.

Finally, we must note that the rural-urban disparities in educational expenditures that remain do affect particular communal groups. The following conclusions from a recent report on education in Malaysia illustrate the results of many of the problems mentioned in previous pages:

Over three-fourths of Malaysian children enrol in a vernacular primary school. 83 percent of Malays, 75 percent of Chinese and 51 percent of Indians enrol in vernacular primary schools.

Most of the children of the poor attend vernacular schools. The well-to-do of each community, particularly in urban areas, are more likely to send their children to English medium schools.

Larger educational investments are made in English medium than vernacular media primary schools. On the average, as contrasted with all three vernacular media primary schools, English medium schools:

---

<sup>1</sup>Elliott, op. cit., pp. 236-37.

(a) are larger; (b) have more of every type of educational facility, e.g. libraries, audio-visual equipment, craft rooms; (c) have more qualified and younger teachers who have higher morale; and (d) make higher non-teaching expenditures per pupil<sup>1</sup>/per year--three times as high as Malay and Tamil media schools.<sup>1</sup>

### Concluding remarks

This paper has noted briefly the basic factors which appear to impose obstacles to access to education including language policies, quotas, spatial distortion, and expenditures. It would be remiss on our part to end without noting several caveats to the foregoing analysis.

1. This study is only a review of the major elements of the problems related to education and communalism. Future analysis is intended to study these issues in greater detail and to include in it empirical research in selected LDCs.

2. It is in no way the intention of this study to assert that education alone is an obstacle to higher incomes for communal groups. Other papers by PDS will analyze government policies such as taxation, confiscation, language, and job opportunities. As well we recognize the saliance of particular cultural forces. Nor is this paper centered upon basic issues related to the correlation of education to economic development. We recognize the vitality of arguments that universal primary education or a concentration upon quality higher education may not be the most desirable policies an LDC can follow if economic development is the primary goal.

3. There remains a dearth of reliable empirical data (a forthcoming paper will assess the data problems) upon which we can base our analysis. While we recognize this problem, available material provides ample evidence to support the general conclusions presented in this paper

---

<sup>1</sup>Noor, op. cit., pp. 70-71.

PROGRAM OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES  
Discussion Paper Series

- No. 54 "Income Distribution and Colombian Rural Education" (1974), 22 pp.,  
..... Wayne R. Thirsk
- No. 55 "The Within-Nation Distribution of Public Expenditures and Services:  
A Two-Nation Analysis" (1974), 19 pp..... Kim Q. Hill
- No. 56 "Managerial Discretion and the Choice of Technology by Multinational  
Firms in Brazil" (1974), 37 pp....Samuel A. Morley & Gordon W. Smith
- No. 57 "Inflation and the Share of Government Tax Revenue in National Income:  
An Empirical Test" (1974), 30 pp..... Yhi-Min Ho
- No. 58 "The Choice of Technology: Multinational Firms in Brazil" (1974),  
42 pp.....Samuel A. Morley & Gordon W. Smith
- No. 59 "The Developmental Significance of the Rise of Populism in Colombia"  
(1975), 21 pp.....Robert H. Dix
- No. 60 "Inflationary Financing, Industrial Expansion and the Gains from  
Development in Brazil" (1975), 43 pp.....Donald L. Huddle
- No. 61 "Noneconomic Factors in the Study of Economic Development" (1975),  
33 pp..... Robert Cartier
- No. 62 "Social Groups and Religious Values as Factors in Economic Develop-  
ment: A South Asian Example" (1975), 25 pp.....Robert Cartier
- No. 63 "The Bodpagaun Project: A Case of Economic Development" (1975),  
29 pp.....Robert Cartier
- No. 64 "Some Economic and Political Characteristics of the Low-Income  
Housing Market in Bogotá, Colombia and Their Implications for Public  
Policy Alternatives" (1975), 36 pp..... Timothy O. Gauhan
- No. 65 "Public Expenditures and Services as Policy Outcome Predictors:  
A Two-Nation Analysis for Health and Education" (1975)..Kim Q. Hill
- No. 66 "Low-Income Housing Development in Bogotá (1975), 32 pp.  
..... Stephen O. Bender
- No. 67 "Consumption and Earnings Patterns and Income Redistribution" (1975),  
26 pp..... J. Gregory Ballentine and Ronald Soligo
- No. 68 "Income Redistribution and Its Effects on Factor and Import Demand  
in Taiwan: A Simulation Approach" (1975), 33 pp..... Yhi-Min Ho
- No. 69 "The International Tin Agreement: A Reassessment" (1975), 19 pp.,  
..... Gordon W. Smith and George R. Schink
- No. 70 "Ethnography of Migration: Breaking out of the Bipolar Myth" (1976),  
15 pp.....Douglas Uzzell
- No. 71 "Education, Communalism and Income Distribution" (1976), 33 pp.....  
..... Fred R. von der Mehden

---

NOTE: Discussion Papers are available upon request to individual scholars and  
researchers and libraries of educational institutions.