



## EVALUATION

### Performance Evaluation

### Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP)

April 3, 2012

This report was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID AFGHANISTAN). It was prepared under contract with Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc. through USAID AFGHANISTAN's "Services under Program and Project Offices for Results Tracking" (SUPPORT) project.



## Performance Evaluation

# Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP)



April 3, 2012

This report was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID/AFGHANISTAN). It was prepared under contract with Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc. through USAID/AFGHANISTAN's "Services under Program and Project Offices for Results Tracking" (SUPPORT) project.

**Contracted under USAID Contract Number: GS-10F-0425M  
(Order Number: 306-M-00-07-00502-00)  
(Task Order Number 2007-012)**

**Afghanistan Services under Program and Project Offices for  
Results Tracking (SUPPORT)**

**Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.  
Afghanistan SUPPORT Project  
Wazir Akbar Khan  
Kabul, Afghanistan**

**Corporate Office:  
Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.  
1899 L Street, NW, Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA**

**SUPPORT Project  
Activity Signature Page**

**Evaluation Title: AMDEP**

**Team Leader: Richard Martin**

**Team Members: William Canter and Yama Hotak**

**This Activity was initiated by Ms. Andrea Swaka , AMDEP AOR through Mr. Sayed  
Aqa, COR/SUPPORT Program OPPD USAID/Afghanistan.**

**Activity Start Date: February 7, 2012**

**Completion Date: March 19, 2012**

**Paul King, Chief of Party/SUPPORT: \_\_\_\_\_ dated: \_\_\_\_\_ 2012**

**Hoppy Mazier, Deputy Chief of Party/SUPPORT: \_\_\_\_\_ Dated: \_\_\_\_\_ 2012**

**Disclaimer:**

The views expressed in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Government of Afghanistan, USAID, or any other organization or person associated with this project.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS .....	iv
I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	1
II. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT .....	3
2. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION .....	4
3. EVALUATION METHODS .....	4
III. FINDINGS .....	5
1. COMPONENT 1: REGIONAL BROADCAST MEDIA SUPPORT: STATIONS AND TRAINING... ..	5
2. COMPONENT 2: MULTI MEDIA PRODUCTION CENTERS (MMPC) .....	13
3. COMPONENT 4: MEDIA SOLIDARITY, ADVOCACY, AND LITERACY .....	16
4. COMPONENT 5: CUSTOMIZED MEDIA ASSISTANCE .....	24
5. COMPONENT 6: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO MINISTRIES REGULATING THE MEDIA ..	28
6. GENDER .....	32
7. SUB-GRANTS.....	34
IV. CONCLUSIONS .....	37
1. EVALUATION QUESTIONS .....	37
2. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS ABOUT THE AMDEP DESIGN .....	37
3. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS CONCERNING AMDEP IMPLEMENTATION.....	40
4. FUTURE OF THE MEDIA IN AFGHANISTAN.....	43
5. RELEVANCE TO OTHER CONFLICT-AFFECTED ENVIRONMENTS .....	43
V. RECOMMENDATIONS .....	44
1. SUSTAINABILITY, BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT .....	44
2. LEGAL AND REGULATORY ENVIRONMENT .....	44
3. PMP TRACKING AND EVALUATION .....	45
4. UNIVERSITY PARTNERS .....	45
5. SUBSIDIES AND SUB-GRANTS.....	45
ANNEX A: SCOPE OF WORK:.....	47
ANNEX B: CONTACT INFORMATION .....	58
ANNEX C: METHODOLOGY .....	62
ANNEX D: COPIES OF SURVEY INSTRUMENTS AND QUESTIONNAIRES .....	65
ANNEX E: AMDEP EVALUATION DOCUMENT LIST .....	82
ANNEX F: PROGRAM GUIDE .....	97
ANNEX G: DAI SURVEY.....	102

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AOTR	Agreement Officer Technical Representative
COP	Chief of Party
COTR	Contracting Officer's Technical Representative
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DAI	Development Alternatives Inc.
DCOP	Deputy Chief of Party
FPO	Field Program Officer
FTE	Full-time Employment
GIRoA	Government of Islamic of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
HQ	Headquarters
HR	Human Resources
ICT	Information & Communications Technology
IT	Information Technology
IWPR	Institute for War and Peace Report
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NMI	Nai Media Institute
PMP	Performance Management Plan
SMS	Short Message Service
SW	Salam Watandar
SWOT	Strengths/Weaknesses, Opportunities/ Threats
U.S	United States
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	U.S. Agency for International Development
USG	United States Government
WASSA	Women Activities Social Services Assoc.

## I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this evaluation is to identify results and lessons learned from USAID's Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP). AMDEP was designed as a one-year project (later extended) that began on November 1, 2010. It built on eight years of previous USAID media activities in Afghanistan and continued USAID's strategic focus on improving news and development-related radio information for underserved groups such as rural families, women and young people.

Through the consistent funding and support to the radio industry in Afghanistan, USAID has underwritten an enhanced forum for news and information programming outside of Kabul. By choosing radio as its primary tool, the initial groundwork was laid for a national messaging forum. Enabling provincial and district broadcasters to receive a consistent and increasingly professional series of programs was a good approach. That many of the programs have to do with national, regional and international news and information is creating the conditions for more and better citizen participation in democratic development. The stage has been set for national advertising supported messaging in the future.

AMDEP supports a comprehensive "value chain" approach to strengthening the media sector, dealing with training of journalists; establishing and operating a network of rural radio stations; introducing "new media" to enable amateur voices to communicate about social, economic, and development issues; encouraging advocacy to protect journalistic freedoms; helping citizens understand and value the importance of media information and news; training media lawyers; and supporting new media laws and policies that will support development of a dynamic, independent media industry. Internews is the lead implementer of AMDEP activities and of previous USAID media activities that led to AMDEP.

Overall, AMDEP has been remarkably successful. It had to function in a context of administrative delays and funding uncertainties, security threats, an environment of many different media projects and an unpredictable economy. The technical and managerial depth of the Internews team was an important factor in the project's success, as was its selection of effective Afghan partner organizations. Flexibility and agility on the part of USAID and Internews made it possible to adapt to changing circumstances.

The following are a few of the findings of the evaluation:

- While not all stations are a result of AMDEP funding, the Salam Watandar radio network and its 47 rural radio stations are up and running well. Overall, AMDEP equipment was functional, training of staff was effective, technical assistance to set up the stations was on target, support for administrative systems was effective and initial subsidies got the stations on the air. A weak point in the program has been a

slow start of business development planning and training to achieve financial sustainability.

- AMDEP's legal training for lawyers and legal advocacy for journalists has produced a number of valuable outcomes. A new cadre of media-savvy lawyers is becoming active in the Bar Association and in law schools. Free speech and rights of journalists now have a higher profile and effective advocates.
- The project's work with Afghan ministries is improving the implementation of telecommunications laws and policies that will promote evolution of a commercial media industry that is healthy, independent, and constructive.
- AMDEP's efforts to create regional multi-media centers (MMCs) have been a limited success. Four centers are up and running and utilization is on the rise. However the centers mainly appear to be places that provide free Internet access and computer classes. The interesting concept of citizen production of action-oriented audio and video programming is unlikely to produce strong results on a significant scale in the foreseeable future. Also, current users report unwillingness to pay in the future for services that are now free, leaving concerns about the future sustainability of the MMCs.
- An effort to promote joint lobbying and advocacy on the part of media professional associations was marginally successful. A number of conferences and workshops were held with productive exchanges of information among journalists and media industry leaders. However the different media associations did not coalesce to create a strong industry-wide presence.
- AMDEP's gender focus has been successful. The project has supported development of new radio content for women listeners -- much of it dealing with women's issues -- across the country. Many female journalists have been trained and have found employment in media outlets. Women in the media face obstacles, including gender prejudices among their families, station managers, editors, supervisors, colleagues and audiences. However the large infusion of energetic young female media professionals into the Afghan media industry is, in some good part, a consequence of AMDEP support.
- AMDEP's capacity strengthening among its Afghan partners has been well implemented and effective. Partners have acquired new technical skills, new management units, new equipment, and modern administrative systems and practices. Sub-grants have resulted in strong program results, a real sense of ownership and the potential to eventually become autonomous and self-financing.
- The Evaluation Team is convinced that AMDEP is contributing toward an accomplishment of USAID democracy and governance objectives, enhancing informed participation by citizens in democratic processes and institutions.
- AMDEP's approach is especially benefitting disadvantaged segments of the population, including rural families, women and young people.

USAID is contemplating a 17-month extension of AMDEP. The Evaluation Team has offered some suggestions for that period as follows:

- Give top priority to business planning and business development to maximize partners' ability to sustain themselves after AMDEP ends. Concentrate technical assistance and training on sustainability. Phase out operating subsidies to partners.
- Continue ongoing technical assistance to ministries dealing with legal and regulatory issues.
- Complete work leading to an independent commercial media ratings service.
- Explore linkages to transfer AMDEP tools to university law and journalism departments.
- Sharpen the project's focus on radio and leave other media for another day.

The Afghan media industry has experienced explosive growth since 2002, much of it fueled by international donor money. Now, however, AMDEP's Afghan media partners face a "perfect storm" of factors conspiring to make the future challenging. First, AMDEP is set on a glide path that will reduce its services and subsidies for partners, closing out completely in mid-2013. Second, as international support for Afghanistan in all sectors diminishes, the "bubble" of rapid media expansion may begin to contract along with the rest of the economy. If this happens, the prospects of AMDEP partners fully funding themselves from commercial advertising revenues may wane, an eventuality that should be anticipated with program activities during the time remaining.

## **II. INTRODUCTION**

### **1. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT**

USAID's scope of work for this evaluation<sup>1</sup> introduces the project as follows:

AMDEP's overall goal is *to ensure the existence of a strong, independent, pluralistic media sector that provides accurate, trusted news and information for audiences around the country*. AMDEP employs a media value-chain approach, encompassing activities from providing direct support and training to existing and new media outlets and journalists to establishing multi-media production centers, in hopes of increasing the availability of reliable information, allowing Afghans to make informed choices about goods, services, their government, and the future of Afghanistan. AMDEP seeks to address key gaps in Afghanistan's professional media development, focusing on building Afghan capacity to meet what are considered universal journalistic standards. The growth and sustainability of a diverse and uniquely Afghan media industry are top USAID priorities, as are an increased number of individuals creating and sharing news and information.

---

<sup>1</sup> USAID/Afghanistan, Scope of Work: Performance Evaluation. Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP), Cooperative Agreement Number: 306-A-00-10-00533-00.

## **2. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION**

USAID's scope of work for the evaluation identifies the purpose of the evaluation as follows:

This evaluation is being conducted to review and evaluate the performance of USAID-funded media development activities through the *Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project* (AMDEP). The evaluation will focus on assessing the effectiveness of the project's design and performance in achieving its programmatic goal and results through the six components.

This evaluation should:

- Evaluate the design, approach, implementation, impact and effectiveness of USAID's support for media development in Afghanistan through AMDEP; the discussion should include the project's effectiveness in achieving the expected results; identification of strengths and weaknesses; and an assessment sustainability of individual projects after the project's end.
- Distill lessons learned on project design and implementation to guide future USAID media development projects in conflict-affected environments; this should include identification of lessons learned and best practices to inform and improve designs and models for future programs and projects, and provide information on how the existing project could be improved.
- Specifically examine recent interventions, such as the scope, level and effectiveness of AMDEP activities in the following areas:
  - Training
  - Media outlet establishment and support
  - Use of innovative and new technologies
  - Coordination and advocacy within the independent media sector
  - Legal and regulatory framework(s)

## **3. EVALUATION METHODS**

A three person Evaluation Team worked in Afghanistan from February 7 to March 19, 2012. The evaluation began with a review of project documentation. The team then performed: (1) key informant interviews with USAID and implementing partners, (2) focus groups with field staff and beneficiaries, and (3) questionnaire surveys with field implementers and beneficiaries. Visits to project sites in Kabul, Mazar and Herat were made to directly observe project activities and facilities. Visits were also made to non-project media outlets for comparison. A more detailed description of the methodology is found in [Annex C](#).

### III. FINDINGS

#### 1. COMPONENT 1: REGIONAL BROADCAST MEDIA SUPPORT: STATIONS AND TRAINING CENTERS

##### a. Evaluation Questions:

*How effective is the training offered through the project in meeting the needs of the sector? How sustainable are project interventions (i.e. training for journalists, Nai as a training institution, Salam Watandar Radio Broadcasting)? How sustainable are partner stations (financial and operational) and what is needed for them to become sustainable?*

##### b. Design, expected results

Intermediate Result (IR) 3: Improved ability of Afghan independent media to empower citizenship and community engagement.

Sub-IR 3.1: Impact of local media on depth and frequency of interactions between community members and government representatives

Sub-IR 3.2: Competencies and performance of Afghan journalists and media professionals increased

Sub-IR 3.3: Afghan media training developed

Sub-IR 3.4: Sustainability of independent media outlets increased

Sub-IR 3.5: Access to independent media and objective sources of information increased

##### c. Implementation

With reference to AMDEP's objectives, Component 1 was delivered successfully. Specifically per deliverable:

Equipment: Stations were supplied with start-up packages enabling them to record, edit and broadcast. As editing is now a software driven activity, computers were also supplied. Microphones and digital field recording devices rounded out the complement of equipment supplied as the standard kit along with a generator. Transmitters varied in strength and in some cases were underpowered by today's media marketplace standards. Generally speaking, stations were supported adequately.

Training: This is the backbone of AMDEP. Thousands of Afghans have received training under this award. Some sources place participation at close to 60% of the working journalists in this country. The overwhelming majority of training administered by AMDEP is basic or essential level course work. Nai has performed adequately in this role and some specific spot training, under Internews, has helped to augment efforts. The current concern voiced during interventions is that training is too rudimentary. During station visits and in two focus groups, the common request was for advanced, targeted training for senior and mid level journalists and managers.

Nai's training program is not well packaged and presented, a weakness if it is to be commercially marketed to potential trainees and media employers in the future. The Nai core course curriculum presents a veneer-like, under-developed outline of course section titles only. There were no learning objectives, no teachers guide, no suggested examples, no fleshing out of presentations, no practice issues or even theory representation – just a simple, single-page outline of topics for each of the courses offered.

Technical Assistance: Specific short-term, technical assistance has been good under AMDEP. Some of the consultants have been leaders of both theory and practice in their spheres. There is a blend of western specialization that has been tempered by strong guidance from Internews. Here, by virtue of their decade of experience in Afghanistan, they have been able to infuse some cultural awareness into their consultant's preparation. There is a concern by the Evaluation Team that some AMDEP radio consultants may have had a too narrow perspective for the Salam Watandar requirements. Technical assistance in business development should have begun earlier and more strongly than it did.

Management/Administrative Systems: The Internews office and core team are cohesive, coordinated and the model of efficiency. Benefitting from 30 years of international development experience, Internews has the lessons learned, best practices and working knowledge to establish a program office and staff it appropriately. However the media sector in which AMDEP must function is fragmented, chaotic and distorted by many different funding levels, objectives and players. It is not always easy for AMDEP, a relatively small player in Afghanistan, to set its priorities and manage its resources optimally in this context. One example is the many USG media activities. While there has been positive inter-agency coordination in the area of spectrum management, additional coordination (in areas such as media training, for example) would help AMDEP.

Initial Funding Subsidy: Media outlets supported are clearly independent of GIRoA direct fiscal influence. Public interest programming was created, produced and distributed throughout the county via the Salam Watandar network of affiliated stations (see Program Rundown in Annex F). Initial start-up assistance varied from three to six months of funding, normally ramped down through implementation. Many stations were left on their own for revenue producing, following this stage of support. Thanks to the daily demands of producing three hours of original content, new and existing stations were able to enhance their product to the community, and offer opportunities to their producers and journalists to apply newly received training. All of this was made possible by AMDEP funding channeled to the Salam Watandar radio stations through Internews.

The sector may not have needed quite as many radio stations. There are 175 radio stations in Afghanistan, and not enough traditional advertising dollars to support all of them. The combination of topography and disparate population centers does suggest a need for radio stations throughout the country. However, because so many stations have been established

over the past 10 years in or near larger cities and towns, the number of stations is out of balance to the potential audience. Adding to this conundrum is the amount of potential jobs versus the number of skilled workers. Spotty spectrum management has also facilitated the proliferation of new radio stations.

Underscoring an entire radio industry snapshot is the total lack of retail, commercial advertising dollars. Most of the commercial media purchases [advertising] will go to television, if they go anywhere. Most cogently, it is not a standard of Afghan business to advertise. The culture is a word-of-mouth based, historical system that works to undermine sustainability from a traditional advertiser supported perspective. And this culture is not one that is easily influenced, yet alone changed.

d. Accomplishments and Impact

More national news for provincial audiences, women and young people: The creation of an ad hoc, unwired syndicate of affiliate stations, under the Salam Watandar network banner, is a major accomplishment. Creating a network of 47 provincial radio stations with the equipment, trained staff and management systems to operate effectively in the dangerous and complicated Afghan environment are historic results for Afghanistan. While each member station cannot be specifically attributed to AMDEP, the forward motion under the past year's funding has solidified the vision that USAID has held for the past 10 years.

National and world news and information programs are compiled from Salam Wantander's own reporters, Pajhwok and international news sources. This content is then distributed to the 47 stations for re-broadcast. The world news and information is packaged so that it is timely, relevant and interesting to local and provincial audiences. For this reason, the quality and quantity of national and world news available to provincial listeners is now much greater than it was before AMDEP.

More provincial and local news for local and national audiences: Internews activities and expertise have opened a communications portal for many more citizens than thought possible a decade ago. 47 member stations can be counted on to broadcast the same programming, during similar hours, on a 24/7/365 basis. From a message delivery standpoint, this could not have been more successful.

Because of the bilateral operating system of Salam Watandar, information and news from the regions and districts can easily make its way into the Kabul newsroom and become part of the daily feed of programming. This is a modified version of the CNN Model: small affiliates and stringers throughout the world feeding the International Headquarters in Atlanta – or in this case, Kabul. It is cost effective, operationally efficient and a good teaching tool. As a result, the provincial and community news available to the national audience has been greatly improved by AMDEP. This is another success story under USAID funding.

More educational and community information: The Salam Watandar network offers unbiased, objective, accurate information – not a common commodity in Afghanistan – to a primarily provincial and under-served audience. While much of its content is news, the network also provides programming on development topics such as health and agriculture. The local stations also produce programming of a strictly local nature about community events, problems and projects. They try to encourage dialog and participation among local listeners and leaders.

Despite AMDEP's success in launching Salam Watandar, there is a cloud on the horizon. AMDEP has delivered as requested, placing radio stations in regions and districts that were heretofore under represented. Inside those stations are journalists, managers and occasionally technicians who have received training at Nai or through Internews funded STTA consultants. However the question remains: following AMDEP, will there be enough media outlets of any genre, open and in business, and offering a place to work and hone one's abilities – once the media funding bubble bursts?

Between the Embassy and USAID, more than \$40 million was inserted into the media sphere during the last fiscal year. Such large infusions distort the media marketplace. Media outlet owners and managers do not have to market their services. Knowledge of the competition and the target audience is not a driving factor in business development and growth. Clients come to the media outlets with baskets of money and pre-designed programming requirements, and not only from the United States.

While this is technically a source of outside financial support, it is in no way reality based. A country of 20 million people, the majority of who are illiterate and living outside of any urban centers, will never generate \$40 million a year in *commercial* media purchases. However, those numbers and considerably more have driven the industry's operations for the past several years.

At some point in the not so distant future, international funding and sponsorship of broadcast media will decline rapidly. The economic bubble for the entire country, not to mention the media sphere, will shrink. The media industry grew to meet the immediate needs of a conflict situation and has expanded beyond the point of long-term viability. Preparation for a non-donor based, commercial media future must be presented to those media outlets as their best hope for survival.

All the training in the world is of no use without a place to put theory into practice. As recorded in both the Mazar and Herat focus groups, there are not enough paid positions for entry-level journalists. All of the more than 20 participants agreed that many of their classmates from university journalism faculties did not choose media careers, commonly deciding to become teachers instead.

With the possible exception of Investigative Journalism courses offered through Nai, overall

trainings are too basic. The Evaluation Team feels that too many entry-level journalists have been produced for the jobs available. Electronic media outlets now, in some instances, oversaturate audiences.

e. Sustainability

A possible USAID 17-month extension of AMDEP provides time and resources to make a decisive shift of priorities toward business development. While Salam Watandar and some of the stations have begun this process, the economic environment is not favorable and journalists are not the best salesmen. The sustainability challenge is formidable.

Business planning and development has begun, but not aggressively. In the specific case of Sales and Marketing and the Business Development courses, for example, radio stations were offered a three-day course with no follow up, or any of the traditional embedded technical assistance that characterizes many other USAID-funded media development programs.

Salam Watandar stations receive payment for advertising that accompanies centrally produced programming. Many stations earn additional revenue for local commercials and paid public service broadcasts. However, there may be a combination of factors conspiring against the network and its affiliates. Just as AMDEP support closes out, other international funding sources appear likely to diminish as well. The phase-down of international development and military assistance is likely to cause a broader economic contraction, making it difficult for the radio stations to increase their income from commercial advertising.

Tight funding and competition for resources can have both beneficial and harmful consequences for radio stations. As competition increases, audiences will become more discerning in their choice of outlet. Stations will present coverage that is more professionally produced, more clearly written and ultimately position outlets as leaders in the community. And the next logical step in this financial evolution is a heightened awareness of the potential of media advertising in the private commercial sector.

Broadcasters whose messaging is advanced and journalistically innovative will begin to build a loyal, repeat audience. This retention of audience is what motivates a sales team and drives advertiser interest. As this growth spreads dynamically, it takes the form of economic growth within the community, and by extension, within the industry. Increased audiences will attract sponsors. Sponsors will achieve product awareness, which will help drive up their customers and sales. Increased customers and sales will trickle down through the community in normal economic pathways.

It is likely that some of the Salam Watandar stations will grow, consolidate and thrive in the private sector environment. Others will not survive. It will be strategically important for AMDEP to focus strongly on business development and sustainability during a possible

USAID 17-month extension in order to maximize the number of stations that survive and thrive.

In the opinion of the Evaluation Team, refocusing on television only serves to fog the optics. The current plan by Internews to “turn a radio station into a television station” may be less than appropriate. Re-training a staff of radio professionals to work in the medium of video is a huge undertaking. Unless things strongly change, the time and money potentially available to AMDEP under a possible extension to develop provincial television will be insufficient, and the additional impact would be minimal.

The International Donor Community has created a media structure of colossal complexity. There are multiple funding streams from multiple organizations to multiple outlets that are usually competing for turf over multiple, ever-morphing and incompatible messages. As the situation evolves in a rapid and out-of-control fashion, there will be many threats and a few opportunities for AMDEP radio stations seeking to achieve financial sustainability. The challenge in the future will be to avoid the pitfalls, break donor-dependency thinking, and seize the opportunities.

f. Strengths and Weaknesses of Component 1

Weaknesses of Component 1 observed by the Evaluation Team include:

- The initial one-year AMDEP 2010-2011 timeframe and administrative delays severely limited the time for planning and implementation.
- Staffing of AMDEP partners by journalists of limited expertise and interest in business planning.
- The Nai Media Institute is not fully ready to launch its 2-year fee-for-service program, although this will be a positive step forward. The Business Plan lacks definition and substance; the projected budget is not realistic; and the curriculum, physical plant, and instructors are not ready for an April 2012 kick-off, according to a consultant report.
- A viable system is lacking for sustainability based on industry standard business development and business practices. The Business Development curriculum is a series of incomplete, skeleton outlines with little alignment to business modalities.
- The marketplace requires less entry-level training and more advanced technical training than AMDEP has supported. The consensus of all 22 journalists participating in focus groups was that there are not enough jobs to offer newly trained professionals upon graduation from Nai. Some stations take advantage of the glut and require a 90-day unpaid probationary period of each new hire, after which they substitute a new unpaid intern.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> Focus Groups in Hirat and Mazar were specific in mentioning that the unpaid probationary period of hire was the case even when a new employee arrived with working credits and credentials.

- Salam Watandar and other continuing AMDEP commitments and subsidies may consume much of the available funding during the 17 month extension, leaving insufficient funds for technical assistance and training in business development, marketing, and sales.
- Equipment-related support may falter. Technical personnel cannot get the proper test equipment and repair gear to maintain on-going, on-site facilities. There are large cities in Afghanistan with no local capacity to repair and provide routine maintenance on USAID-funded equipment purchases. Sending equipment to Kabul or people to the provinces is not a sustainable model.
- The donor funded economic bubble supporting programming may well collapse. Commercial sources of station revenue have to be discovered, developed, targeted and exploited.

Strengths of Component 1 observed by the Evaluation Team include:

- The Salam Watandar network model is robust and well adapted to the Afghan setting. A model of program underwriting is in place. The requirement for a retrofitting of operations and administration procedures and policies is the next logical step. To a limited degree, this process has begun.
- Affiliate stations are absorbing the benefits [and drawbacks] of being part of a true network-oriented syndicate of content and programming material. This will embolden marketing and sales efforts regionally, which in traditional models of media development have defined a nexus to the national broadcast picture.
- Station Managers know, and can depend on the fact, that three hours of new and original programming will come to them daily.
- Media Sales and Marketing professionals can begin to segment their broadcast day and sell media space according to “drive times”<sup>3</sup> and produce tactical collateral<sup>4</sup> designed for targeted advertisers, based on that knowledge [daily feed].
- Operations Managers can more adequately cover the needs of their outlets because of advance understanding and knowledge of the Salam Watandar daily feed. This enables staff scheduling, support operations capability, projection-based budgeting, growth and program planning and a movement towards professional and business development underwritten by broadcast traffic management. [See ANNEX F: Program Guide.]
- Ad-supported media outlets lead to healthy competition. Sustainable and consistent

---

<sup>3</sup> Drive Time refers to the morning and afternoon programming efforts of broadcasters to target messaging, news, information and other content, based on peak audience time of day. This is something that is only learned through the use and application of ratings and surveys of audiences.

<sup>4</sup> Tactical Collateral, in this usage, addresses the need for marketing materials to support media sales departments. Whereas a sales team might present a brochure that speaks to the overall mission and vision of their station, it cannot be more than a horizontal or generic statement of service to the prospective advertiser. Tactical collateral [collateral is the advertising term for all materials used to promote or sell] would deliver information to the customer designed and created to hit their target audiences. Typically this ranges from numbers in the audience who have a link to the customer’s product to new programming efforts on the part of the station. In the western model, this data would include: age, education, income and other elements.

content underscores tactical programming<sup>5</sup>. As “day parts”<sup>6</sup> are more clearly defined via programmed output, sales teams will be enabled through flexible spot availabilities in addition to many other traditional marketing and media sales tools.

- Salam Watandar offers broad coverage, identification with local communities and with Afghanistan, and program continuity -- important elements for ad-supported media.
- The need of advertisers for audience information will push the development of an independent media polling/survey/ratings service, which in turn will help to build a western modeled advertising agency and media planning environment.
- The requirements for an enhanced training focus, with advanced requirements and targets, will be driven organically by natural media outlet growth and failure.
- The Internews Technical Unit is in the process of establishing themselves as a for-profit, business. It is strongly suggested that they accelerate the 17-month, planned path to launch and that AMDEP spin off technical/engineering business training to them now, to augment initial earning capabilities. A concerted and specific request for local technical/engineering maintenance [repair] has been repeatedly expressed to the Evaluation Team. Consideration might be given to starting a technical training program with the goal of creating provincial equipment repair centers.

g. Recommendations

Radio is the primary source of news and information for Afghans; it overcomes the literacy barrier and is cheaper and more accessible than television. AMDEP’s emphasis on radio should be sharpened during a possible 17-month extension, while support for other media can be reduced.

There are numerous advanced, masters level training courses that could be implemented through a combination of Nai, NMI or Internews cooperative action, including: advance coverage planning/editorial management; beat reporting and specialization; live remote broadcasts; assignment desk management and techniques; senior editor/news director responsibilities; non-generic coverage; copy editing and “lead” creation; newsroom management; station management; segmenting and producing a newscast; show rundowns and production guides; community tuned programming; and station on-air and cross collateral promotion.

Commercial, non-donor funded advertising is clearly the key to the future. If USAID could position AMDEP to underwrite the creation of a western-style advertising industry made up

---

<sup>5</sup> Tactical Programming follows the emergence of true sales teams who work together with station marketing professionals. Once an audience segment is identified, sales teams and program executives plan and design content that will appeal to a specific target customer. An example might be a call-in radio program that is “pitched” to a mobile phone company as the logical underwriter for the program.

<sup>6</sup> Day Part refers to the broadcast programming day. Primarily divided into prime time and non-prime time as well as into, literally, day and evening by programming professionals in this industry, decisions on content and design are driven by the time of day [day part] and the audience targeted and reached, also known as penetration and reach. This concept can only be introduced into the Afghan marketplace once the funding bubble has begun to deflate; and independent ratings services and western style advertising agencies and media companies have begun to prosper.

of independent agencies that rely on ratings, media planning and placement, creative services and the full service campaign ability to really build the commercial, non-donor side of revenue to broadcasters – then there is a realistic expectation of a more sustainable future. Encouraging all U.S. funded operations in Afghanistan to use one of these agencies for the production and/or placement, if not the access to independent media in the country could strengthen this initiative. For example, DAI’s stability program did something like this, and declared their investment in this mode of outreach the “key to our success in this program.” [See ANNEX G]

Advocacy and protection of journalists’ rights should continue, although little additional AMDEP funding will be required. Recent GIRoA pronouncements on media and sustained danger faced by journalists show the importance of these activities. The February 2012 pronouncement by the Ulema Council about women in media and the Ministry of Information and Culture directive that all female TV presenters should wear veil or scarf/Chador, not use thick cosmetics and “observe Islamic ethics and national culture of the country” is another chilling example and possible harbinger of things to come.

The Evaluation Team believes that an important AMDEP result will be the enhancement of trust between the public and the media. Afghans are sophisticated media consumers and are healthily skeptical, having been fully exposed to propaganda during the era of Soviet occupation and under the Taliban regime. Without a truly independent, commercially supported mass media, balanced, fact-based and unbiased news and information might not take root.

## 2. COMPONENT 2: MULTI MEDIA PRODUCTION CENTERS (MMPC)

### a. Evaluation Questions:

*How effective have the four established MMPCs been in increasing listenership of amateur voices? How do the MMPCs collaborate with other AMDEP components, such as local media outlets and the Nai Regional Media Training Hubs? What “new mediums” and “new technology” were adopted as a result of the interventions by the innovation partners?*

#### i. Design, expected results

Component 2 was designed to increase the creation of content using new technologies by non-journalists and media producers of various types. The original plan was to establish multi-media centers throughout Afghanistan which would provide reliable high-speed Internet access and production equipment to allow individuals, organizations, or communities to produce and share media locally or throughout the country. Establishing these resource centers would enable public participation in the free exchange of ideas and empower non-traditional producers of news and information content. This effort was directed toward non-media professionals, youth, community members, women, students, and members of civil society organizations.

Anticipated results were the following:

- Intermediate Result (IR) 1: Increased civil society and citizen civic empowerment through access to social online media
- Sub-IR 1.1: Increased development of an engaged and active Afghan citizenry and civil society
- Sub-IR 1.2: Increased competency of citizens and civil society to produce online social media content
- Sub IR 1.4: Citizens and civil society access to social/online media increased

#### ii. Implementation

Between August and October 2010, AMDEP launched four multi-media centers in Mazar-e-Sharif, Kandahar, Herat and Jalalabad. The number of multi-media centers had been scaled back from a planned 11 to four because of funding limitations. Initially it was planned that the Afghan NGO WADAN would implement Component 2. However after a difficult process of trying to get WADAN up to speed, Internews decided to implement the component working directly with local civil society organizations (CSOs) in the four communities. Establishing the centers involved a labor-intensive process of identifying the local CSOs, negotiating sub-grants, creating the capacity in the four CSOs to manage and support the MMCs, equipping the MMCs and training the staff, and providing financial support for the MMCs' operations.

Each MMC received \$10,000 a month for the first four or five months, along with equipment. As of February 1, 2012, the MMCs were getting a monthly grant from Internews of about \$5,000, which covers most of their operating costs.

The MMCs offer Internet access and basic computer training. They also have audiovisual media (digital cameras, camcorders, and audio recorders) and training for aspiring citizen journalists. Providing access to “new media” enables citizens to produce media messages that can be shared with other people and communities through the Internet.

#### iii. Accomplishments, impact

The Evaluation Team visited two of the four MMCs and found them fully operational. Placing the MMCs in local CSOs seems to be working well. CSO leadership feels ownership and responsibility for the success of the MMC. The facilities are comfortable and well equipped with computers and audio-visual production gear. Each has two trainers, a male and a female, who give classes. Utilization is climbing. Total visits to the four centers increased from 2046 in August and September 2011, to 5716 between October and December. Ninety percent of the recent 5716 visitors were under 25 years old and 22%

were female. The MMCs are designed to be safe and welcoming for women, in some cases offering separate computer rooms and separate training.

Internews reports interest in citizen journalism and amateur voices in the centers, where clients are invited to make use of audiovisual equipment to produce content about local issues. The Evaluation Team interviewed users and collected survey forms in both of the MMCs it visited. While there were a few expressions of interest in taking classes in photojournalism, there were no reports of actual citizen journalism projects. It appears to the Evaluation Team that the MMCs are serving mainly as comfortable places where young people can enjoy free Internet services and computer classes. Citizen journalism and amateur voices are forward-looking ideas that make use of the new media technologies that are democratizing journalism in many industrialized countries. However, based on the AMDEP experience to date, it is not yet clear that these technologically advanced media approaches will be embraced by significant numbers of people living in Afghanistan anytime in the near future. The design of Component 2 appears to be based on imported assumptions about authority, status and communication that are better-suited to more educated and modern settings than Afghanistan.

#### iv. Sustainability

The MMCs, while housed in existing civil society organizations, are completely dependent financially on Internews, with a monthly payment that covers their operating costs. Internews is starting to move them along the road to financial sustainability. It has planned a three-day business development workshop for MMC managers covering business planning, bookkeeping, sales, and marketing. The objective is to develop a business plan for each MMC, with implementation to begin immediately. The Mazar MMC is moving ahead on its own with a three-month advanced IT course for which it will charge AF 1000 per month. The course will cover Microsoft Office, MS Windows, and website design.

It is not going to be easy for the MMCs to generate enough revenue through user fees to cover their operating costs. One of the reasons for their growing popularity is the fact that they do not charge to use their computers, Internet or their classes. Users are accustomed to free services and may be unhappy when fees are introduced. In the survey of MMC users performed by the Evaluation Team, only one client in the twenty surveyed reported willingness to pay.

#### v. Strengths and Weaknesses of Component 2

The Evaluation Team noted the following strengths of the Component 2 MMCs:

- They are the only place of their kind in their communities for ordinary Afghans to learn about and use new digital media.

- They have the potential of linking Afghans of different regions and demographics to learn more about each other's cultures and traditions.
- They are a comfortable and secure place for females to learn about computing and use the Internet.
- Users receive free services and use of ICT, making them accessible to disadvantaged groups.
- They provide good opportunities for CSO members to learn about digital media and computers, while enhancing their scope and coverage in their communities.

Weaknesses of the Component 2 MMCs observed by the Evaluation Team include:

- MMC is new in Afghanistan and few people know about the value and importance of the kinds of services it offers.
- Participation of community figures at MMC activities has not been high.
- Community utilization has been growing, but one MMC will not reach a significant proportion of the population in a province's capital.
- There is little coordination between MMC, GIRoA and civil society organizations.
- Courses are very basic.
- Available internet and computer time is limited.
- There has been little publicity.
- Business development planning has been lacking.
- Free services now may make it difficult to charge fees in the future.
- Operating costs, including Internet charges, are high.

#### vi. Recommendations

- Provide more advanced training in addition to introductory courses.
- Do not expand Component 2 activities unless substantial new funding becomes available and current centers make rapid progress toward financial self-sufficiency.
- Try to involve more community members in various MMC activities
- Increase visibility by working with local media outlets
- Develop business plans for the future
- Revisit the possibility of co-locating MMCs with Nai hubs to share expenses and facilities and development complementary training and services.

### 3. COMPONENT 4: MEDIA SOLIDARITY, ADVOCACY, AND LITERACY

#### a. Evaluation Questions:

*How effective was the project at increasing the organizational capacity of the Media Group? What were the results of the legal and advocacy training provided by the project, including law moot court competition? Was there a measurable impact of the media literacy radio programs?*

b. Design, expected results:

AMDEP's Objective 4 is "Improved media sector networking, coordination and legal environment in which Afghanistan's media operate through support for media solidarity, advocacy, and literacy." Component 4 objectives fall under AMDEP Intermediate Result (IR) 2: "Increased Ability of Afghan media sector to network and advocate for free and open media environment." Component 4 is designed to accomplish three intermediate results:

- Sub-IR 2.1: Afghan media sector network strengthened and empowered
- Sub-IR 2.2: Increased legal expertise in support of free open media
- Sub-IR 2.3: Increased public support for the media sector

The next section discusses activities intended to accomplish each sub-IR, including: (1) media solidarity (sub-IR 2.1); (2) strengthening legal expertise and legislative advocacy (sub-IR 2.2); and (3) media literacy – increasing public awareness about the importance of journalism and media (sub-IR 2.3).

c. Implementation

1) Media Solidarity and the Media Group

Under Component 4, AMDEP set about to promote collective action to defend the rights of journalists against violence and in courts, advance understanding among the public on the role of the media, and advocate for media laws to promote the growth of a free and professional media sector. The design of AMDEP envisioned coordinating the work of diverse media professional associations in Afghanistan. However media professional associations in Afghanistan proved to be poorly organized and competitive among themselves. In this not-very-conducive situation, AMDEP's strategy for trying to promote coordination among media professional associations was led by Nai, which mentored the nascent Media Group in 2011 to run media industry meetings across the nation. Based on its experience in Afghanistan and other countries, Internews believes that the best practice for donor projects with regard to professional associations is to provide "spaces" (not new organizations) for journalists to come together to discuss issues of concern to them. Nai therefore also set up the graduate clubs, with Internews mentoring, to create a "space" for informal networking and peer education.

Specifically, AMDEP has done the following:

- Media Industry Regional and National Meetings: The Media Group, in collaboration with Nai, conducted a series of public discussions during July, August and September 2011. These discussions involved more than 400 media professionals, government officials, journalists and managers. The forums focused on two primary topics: contract law and work conditions at Afghanistan's media outlets. The most recent discussion, held in Mazar-e-Sharif on September 14, 2011, involved over 220

media professionals from nine provinces, including 50 women. Discussions concerned freedom of information and industry conditions for media workers.

- Mentoring of the executive team of the Media Group: The Media Group is made up of media managers and journalists and liaises with a network of media and media workers. Nai mentored two Media Group staff based at Nai in running meetings and conferences and developing a report and recommendations to the ministry. The Media Group experienced difficulties with some of its responsibilities and is no longer an AMDEP partner. The difficulties included complying with Internews/USAID administrative requirements and discomfort with unfamiliar subjects such as new media and the Internet. Nai seems to be picking up the slack. [The Media Group's sub-grant is discussed in Section 3.7.3]
- Nai training at regional hubs: Nai brings media workers together from different outlets in training situations and thereby enhances networking across the sector and the nation.
- Nai Graduate Clubs and website: Nai is creating a space, both face to face and online, for media workers to network, share ideas, and discuss issues pertinent to the media sector such as media law, industry employment standards, security, and election reporting. The graduate club meets every Thursday in Kabul. The membership of the Kabul Graduate Club is 120 journalists and the total membership in all five Nai hubs is 370. The Evaluation Team attended a meeting of the Kabul Graduate Club and was impressed by how well organized and well attended it was.
- Media Law Working Group: Discussed in the next section, the Media Law Working Group is an important “networking” vehicle in addition to its other planned activities. As the Media Law Working Group functions to advocate protections for journalists and media, it results in journalists networking together and with another professional sector (lawyers) to develop their skills and drive forward or protect an enabling media regulatory environment in Afghanistan.

## 2) Media Law

Before AMDEP, there were no Afghan lawyers trained to deal with media and telecommunication legal issues. To begin to address this deficiency, Nai worked with the Annenberg School of Communication to develop a successful training program in media law for Afghan lawyers. As the program developed, trainees were selected competitively to assure participation by provincial lawyers. The program consisted of three one-week courses, held once a month in April, May and June 2011. Specialized resource experts conducted each weeklong session. The first weeklong session dealt with media law – access to government information by journalists, ethics, introduction to Afghan and international media legislation. The second session taught media management law -- contracts, legal operation of media, intellectual property, licensing of journalists, etc. The third session

dealt with legal aspects of information and communication technology (ICT) including cyber security and Internet law.

Closely following the media law training, the Media Law Committee was created with AMDEP support in September 2011. The Media Law Committee is a unit of the Afghan Independent Bar Association (AIBA). It operates out of the AIBA and offers *pro bono* legal assistance to victims of violations of Afghanistan's media laws. University law schools and journalism schools do not offer media law coursework, so another task that the Media Law Committee has identified for itself is offering workshops and training in media law for journalists, more lawyers, and police who enforce media law. The Media Law Committee is poised to begin activities.

Another AMDEP activity was the Moot Court. AMDEP made it possible for Afghan universities to follow an international educational process, in which law students get an intensive, state-of-the-art training experience in media law process and content. Teams of law students from five Afghan law schools were given a hypothetical media law problem. The teams researched the relevant media laws and prepared briefs on both sides of the case. The teams then came together for "oral rounds" in which they argued their cases. Judges were the 16 graduates of the AMDEP media law courses. The Moot Court methodology provides practical real world experience in researching, writing, and arguing media law cases which complements the theoretical instruction they get in their classrooms.

In the area of advocacy, an AMDEP activity that is similar in concept to the Media Law Committee is the Nai Media Watch. Nai typically receives several complaints per month of violations of the legal rights of journalists. They perform advocacy in favor of the journalists by means of press releases, which they continue to issue until violations are rectified. Nai also prepares an annual report of violations of press freedom and rights in Afghanistan that goes to international human rights organizations. Because of its stature and history of integrity and principled advocacy, Nai commands the respect and attention of the government and is frequently able to resolve cases of violations favorably.

### 3) Legal Expertise and Legislative Advocacy

Besides its work in the area of spectrum management (Component 6), AMDEP has provided strategic legal assistance to the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT) in the regulation of new media and media content. Internews is preparing an update to a 2006 Global Internet Policy Initiative analysis of risks and needs for media regulation in Afghanistan. A World Bank program will fund telecommunication/ICT policy studies, but the Ministry hopes that AMDEP can provide complementary support of the following kinds:

- Protection and regulation of ICT content. A draft ICT law is presently before the Ministry of Justice. The Ministry of Justice needs help understanding the issues in the law; subsequently it will be important to have specialized technical assistance to help move the law through the Cabinet and Parliament.
- Help writing Internet regulations in areas such as cyber security and piracy.

To further support the creation of a favorable legal and regulatory environment for the development of ICT in Afghanistan, AMDEP supported an Innovation Lab. Held under the auspices of the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MCIT) and AMDEP between January 23 -26, 2011, it brought together a diverse group of government, commercial, and civil society experts to brainstorm about the future of information and communication technology (ICT) in Afghanistan. The intent was to explore ways in which new media – mainly cell phones and Internet – can be applied to solve specific development challenges, contribute positively to Afghan development, and thrive in a helpful regulatory environment.

Internews provided international experts to the Innovation Lab who served as advisors to the 42 Afghan new media/ICT leaders who participated. The group worked for 4 days to apply these technologies to some of the country’s many social challenges in health, education, agriculture and other sectors.

The Innovation Lab was highly rated by industry experts, the World Bank and the Afghan Government. Ministry officials who participated described the event and its outcomes in very positive terms to the Evaluation Team. Six innovative ICT solutions using mobile phone technology were designed to improve social services for Afghan citizens across the nation. The World Bank will finance implementation of these innovations in the future. The innovation lab was a successful innovation itself, creating an informal local brain trust and “space” to analyze how new communication technologies can be set up in Afghanistan in ways that benefit the country’s long-term economic and social development.

Based on the results, the Innovation Lab may be a better way to introduce new media to Afghanistan than the multi-media centers supported by Component 4. The Innovation Lab focused on an accepted and prevalent new medium – mobile phones – and model applications came from Afghan participants rather than from outside.

#### 4) Media Literacy

To increase awareness and appreciation of the importance of journalism to citizens, another AMDEP partner -- the U.S. NGO Equal Access -- produced 44 (22 Dari and 22 Pashto) episodes of the radio drama serial called *A Story of a Village*. Listening groups demonstrated the effectiveness of the programs in imparting positive content about

journalism and news to listeners. Before hearing the programs, Afghan adults in listening groups in five provinces expressed little support for journalists and media activities and Afghan youth demonstrated little understanding of the role of journalists in a democratic society. After hearing the programs, adult and youth listeners had greatly increased their support for and understanding of journalism and news. The program was broadcast on 16 stations.

Another AMDEP activity intended to increase public awareness and appreciation of media was the Youth Voices Festival held in October 2011. For three days at 10 sites, the Youth Voices Festival attracted 10,000 people. The intent was to stimulate participation by young people in civil society and government programs. To create awareness and motivation, 1,500 young trainers in five provinces were trained to use low cost media technologies such as home video and digital cameras. Internews and Roshan Telecommunications (a mobile phone company) sponsored internships designed to encourage young people to pursue media careers. In three days of training (2 hours a day), young people were introduced to media equipment, storytelling, production, and editing. As a result, about 250 participants-produced videos were uploaded to You-Tube and 1400 still photos went to Flickr. In a follow-up survey, 67% of Afghan youth surveyed report increased civic engagement following participation in the Afghan Youth Voices Festival.

d. Accomplishments and Impact

- Media Solidarity and the Media Group. While plenty of useful information was exchanged during AMDEP’s networking activities among media professional associations, a groundswell of interest in working together among the associations has not emerged. The events organized by Nai and the Media Group sparked interest, participation and information-exchange. The Internews approach of providing a “space” for these things to happen was successful. However, permanent advocacy alliances among the professional associations did not result. The Media Group functioned effectively as moderator of events, but did not emerge as a strong leader with a mandate or will to guide or represent the media sector.
- Training Program in Media Law. Sixteen Afghan lawyers completed the full cycle of three courses, constituting a first-ever core of trained lawyers prepared to deal with a range of media-related legal problems. The fact that there was very little attrition indicates the relevance and interest the content offered the participants. Some of the participants from provincial cities subsequently organized briefings and training to other local lawyers where they live. The impact of the training is immediately evident in the fact that the trained lawyers have begun to serve as activists on media law activities such as the Media Law

Committee and the Moot Court. More time will be needed to see if the lawyers become active in media litigation.

- The Moot Court approach generated much positive attention, and eight law schools are adapting the techniques and hoping to participate in an expanded Moot Court in the near future. Another indication of the success of the Moot Court activity is the fact that the legal briefs and arguments presented by participating Afghan law students were reportedly of very high quality.
- Nai Media Watch. Nai's program of vigilance and advocacy on the part of journalists and the media industry is influential and respected among journalists, media, international press freedom and human rights organizations and the Afghan government. It has contributed to the resolution of a number of violations of media rights and is a strong, principled force for freedom of expression in Afghanistan.
- Legal Expertise and Legislative Advocacy. MCIT has developed complex draft legislation governing future development of ICT in Afghanistan. MCIT informed the Evaluation Team that the draft legislation has been submitted to the Parliament, but its breadth and technical complexity has made it difficult for the Parliament to understand and debate. MCIT has requested AMDEP assistance in explaining and advocating the draft legislation with members of Parliament. Reinforcing this effort, the Innovation Lab resulted in increased awareness on the part of policymakers of the promise of new media technologies and the need to provide a positive regulatory environment for them to thrive.
- Media Literacy. Internews' Youth Voices Festival and the Equal Access radio series "Story of a Village" enhanced awareness and appreciation and participants in media and journalism. Women were important participants and beneficiaries.

#### i. Strengths and weaknesses

Strengths of Component 4 activities include the following:

- Solid working relationships in the legal sector (university law schools, the Bar Association, and the two Government Ministries dealing with media legislation) were established. AMDEP advisors were competent and effective.
- Afghan ownership is evident among the leadership of partner organizations.
- Professional knowledge and activity with regard to media law in the country were significantly increased, and institutional commitments to media law were strengthened.
- The rights of journalists were effectively defended when threatened.
- Public awareness of and interest in journalism were increased, and young people were motivated to pursue media careers.

Weaknesses of Component 4 activities include the following:

- It was difficult for AMDEP to maintain consistent, long-term support for some activities due to funding uncertainties.
- Existing professional media organizations seemed to have self-serving agendas that inhibit joining forces with other players for broad media advocacy and media industry improvements.
- There are unanswered questions about scale of activities needed to achieve AMDEP objectives. Media law and media literacy activities reached all their intended beneficiaries, but it is difficult to assess how much coverage is really sufficient to meet AMDEP's national objectives.

#### ii. Sustainability

Sustainability prospects vary among Component 4 activities. The “media literacy” activities, in spite of their obvious appeal and impact, may prove difficult to sustain. AMDEP plans to transfer the Youth Voices Festival to a local NGO and help it to become sustainable in the future. “Media Law” activities will depend on *pro bono* services by lawyers, which may or may not prove sustainable. The “legal expertise and legislative advocacy” results are fully sustainable because policy changes, once instituted, are permanent.

#### iii. Recommendations

Overall, the Evaluation Team is impressed with the productivity of Component 4 implementers and partners under difficult circumstances. Large activities have been designed and implemented, solid working partnerships have been forged, capacity has been built in a range of impressive Afghan partners, and the impact sought by AMDEP is largely being achieved. In terms of gender, participation by women has been strong.

With regard to media solidarity activities, the Evaluation Team recommends that activities with professional associations not be continued as a separate activity. Because of the nature of the local professional associations, trying to generate committed collaborative activity among them is a long-term objective that could not be accomplished during the time remaining. Nai should continue as an informal media sector coordinator and communicator.

Media law objectives have largely been accomplished, and significant future support is not needed. A target of opportunity might be providing a low level of support for integrating elements of the AMDEP legal training and moot court activities into the curricula of Afghan university law and journalism schools.

Any ongoing support for media literacy activities should be focused on local sustainability through other NGO partners or other donors.

Legislative advocacy activities are moving in an important direction and the Afghan media sector would benefit greatly from continued AMDEP support. AMDEP has effectively taken responsibility for key segments of a larger multi-agency, multi-donor legal and regulatory program. Withdrawing AMDEP support in the near future would jeopardize the work of related activities being undertaken by the World Bank, ISAF and two Afghan ministries. The Evaluation Team recommends that USAID continue AMDEP technical assistance to the Government in the areas of media and ICT regulation and policy.

#### **4. COMPONENT 5: CUSTOMIZED MEDIA ASSISTANCE**

##### **a. Evaluation Questions:**

*How effective was the assistance provided to media outlets in terms of increasing their capacity in the areas identified, in their needs assessments and business plans? How has the improved capacity been defined and measured. What additional outcomes were obtained as a result of assistance provided?*

##### **b. Design and Expected results**

Component 5 overlaps other components, was reduced in scope, and was not tracked through its own PMP indicators or IRs. AMDEP activities that were ultimately attributed to Component 5 mainly include: (1) some support for developing business plans in partners, and (2) preparatory work intended to lead to a national media ratings service.

##### **c. Implementation**

###### **1) Needs Assessments, Business Plans and Evaluation Tools**

AMDEP supported initial business planning and business development in Nai, Salam Watandar and some of the radio stations. However, the results so far are spotty and inconsistent. No concise, realistic business plans or marketing strategies have emerged in the Evaluation Team's meetings or documents. The training sessions were too short at three days each, and there was no follow up offered to participants. Less than a dozen stations participated in the training. The majority were in no position to implement what they had been offered, and there was no follow up via embedded amplification which is the model normally followed under similar USAID funded training.

The information delivered regarding needs assessment and business plans was less than adequate as it spoke to more donor funding and the pursuit of grants rather than commercial or retail business activity, and it did not delve into the key differences between sales and marketing within this unique industry. While the trainers were up to the task, the environment, the recipients and timing provided by AMDEP diluted the impact.

The Sales Training Course of study was very strong. The trainers were both able and acquainted with the marketplace. The audience was not chosen well and follow up was lacking. A professional sustainability program, written in three phases, was delivered to

AMDEP [and USAID] by an international consultant well before the sales training. This was designed for Nai, and it fit well into the scheme presented in the three-day media sales program.

Needs assessments tend to be focused on the present, rather than the future. And it appears that the net used to gather a list of “needs” was in need of repair. To move ahead based on a temporary industry bubble is not wise.

## 2) Ratings Service

AMDEP partner Altai is in the process of developing a professional, independent rating service and has completed a market assessment to determine the feasibility and potential profitability of a commercial ratings service. Current broadcast advertisers and local ad agencies have stated both interest and a willingness to pay for this service. In fact, Altai estimates that revenue from the sale of ratings data might reach \$250,000 per year.

Altai is currently pilot testing a ratings service and developing an Internet platform for selling the data to customers. It is also performing a review of potential companies to function as independent purveyors of this much-needed audience measurement, demographic and reach/penetration service to mass media. Altai and Internews are convinced that a local independent, commercial ratings service is feasible and potentially sustainable during a possible 17-month extension of AMDEP, and that development costs would not be overwhelming.

At present, there is no objective ratings service that categorically specifies who is listening, where they live, their demographics and most importantly, their reasons for tuning in. These key data are integral to long term media development and sustainability. It is a media industry standard that the clear grasp of audience identification, segmentation and definition represents a road map to marketing success. Understanding and acceptance of this requirement underscores one of the basic tenets of business modality comprehension, and may well take the form of handrails for the desired evolution in the fields of revenue sources, sales and marketing campaigns and a free, independent messaging media landscape.

The Evaluation Team is convinced, based on its own due diligence, that putting priority on an independent ratings service operation is a vital piece of the strategy required to move the Afghan media industry in the direction of being independent and sustainable.

## d. Accomplishments and Impact

Component 5 performance can be evaluated in terms of three factors: technical consultants, business and financial planning support, and the commercial viability of partners.

### 1) Consultants

Internews and its partners have been so focused on their primary area of expertise and

interest – news and information programming – that less technical firepower has been concentrated on the area of business planning. With niche topics such as media outlet business planning and sales and marketing training, especially as they relate to needs assessment and evaluation tools, it is possible that some consultants may not have had a broad enough commercial oriented, media-outlet management perspective, or were perhaps coming from a broadcast model that was not quite applicable to the distinctive media marketplace in Afghanistan.

On the opposite end of the spectrum was the impressive, single offering of a limited series of three-day seminars/workshops in Sales and Marketing. The course curriculum of this highly specialized information is one of the best ever encountered by the Evaluation Team. Unfortunately, three days are not sufficient to comprehend and then implement such advanced theory and technique, and the activity regrettably did not include the other half of this specialized technical assistance delivery which is reinforcement, re-tooling, and embedded expertise as a direct follow up to course work. The Evaluation Team suggests that the extraordinary Sales and Marketing curriculum be re-offered, this time via a longer course presentation, and that this be followed with embedded instruction and mentoring at partner stations by the same outside set of consultants. Their decidedly commercial frame of reference, enhanced by on-the-ground knowledge of the broadcast community in Afghanistan, was the perfect recipe. The hope is that this synergy can be recreated in the near term.

Other consultants were brought in to teach the creation of business plans. It is unclear how many sessions were presented, but clearly it was less than sufficient. The Evaluation Team reviewed the teaching materials and plans. The latter were no more than narratives of the market place, the recent past and a wish list for the future; the former were thin outlines, undeveloped tip sheets and tool kits. Business plans lacked fleshing out and industry standards for the private sector environment are missing.

In fairness, it should be mentioned that the dynamics of media industry business plans do have a unique set of requirements that are universal. Unfortunately, these were also missing. It has been observed that Internews consultants touched upon many of these issues, and templates were provided that unfortunately were not put to use as widely as they could have been by stakeholders and counterparts who attended trainings.

## 2) Financial Planning for Business

The basics of business in the media sphere require a special type of financial planning. It must be a hybrid of standard business practices with liberal applications of genre specific application. Some of the universals include: full understanding of the target audience; awareness of the competition; marketing campaign skills and sales capabilities, promotional awareness and program procurement and placement.

All of these have a direct bearing on the bottom line. All must be factored into a business

plan and the associated financial design for sustainability. While there was ample instruction on how to create and manage a financial worksheet to win and manage a grant, there appears to not have been any information passed to either Nai, Salam Watandar, or other stakeholders on how to create and manage revenue based, commercial business financial systems.

Media sales, media marketing and programming executives, with USAID bona fides, are available who can come in and identify with the current situation among Salam Watandar stations, and then design a model for them to follow that is flexible enough to morph into the future as funding dwindles and retail sponsorship and advertising hopefully grows.

In other words, the Evaluation Team suggests that AMDEP has a good opportunity to think outside the box of NGO-influenced development approaches to look for external support that truly understands and embraces the business of broadcasting as a sustainable, self-sufficient commercial industry not reliant on international organizations and donor largess.

### 3) Commercial Revenue Techniques and Goals

With grant funding, there has been little incentive for AMDEP's Afghan implementing partners to understand their audience because it had little or no bearing on an operating budget, needs projections or other standard business requirements, yet alone recognized media industry standards – during the past eight years. Concern for competition was also not a priority as multi-hour programming blocks were produced, edited and delivered ready to insert into the station's traffic system. Consequently the single driving force behind the success or failure of every commercial media outlet throughout the world is missing.

Competition is a *non-player* in Afghanistan's radio broadcasting community. And its absence will constrain independent and self-financing radio stations as they attempt to morph from mostly underwritten to self-supporting.

The direct impact, on the bottom line, of these tenants of business is something that is not widely comprehended in the stations visited by the Evaluation Team. It is the hope of the Evaluation Team that a combination of renewed vigor on the part of AMDEP and a robust economic environment can combine to grow the radio industry in Afghanistan. It will involve additional financial investment, hard work and dedication. Although time is short, Internews is positioned to be the right team at the right time.

### 4) Recommendations

By incorporating planks of an approved work plan that have a specific and direct nexus to commercial and financial independence, USAID can counsel and guide the implementing partner towards a future that makes sense based on economies of scale, accepted industry standards and marketplace realities.

- Take Business Development beyond a short course and focus on those stations that have a chance of making it.

- Engage true ‘business of broadcasting’ professionals and embed them in as many stations as possible for a minimum of 10 working days each.
- Take Operations and Administration [broadcast management] training to the point that it is oriented towards accepted standards of commercial station organization.
- Teach a full and complete version of Business Plan Design and Strategic Plan Creation aligned to industry standards of practice.
- Design advanced courses that require a minimum of six working days of instruction.
- Teach both Sales and Marketing, separately and then jointly, in an advanced manner taking the excellent framework already presented to a new, more beneficial level.
- Teach competitive programming, on-air promotion and program procurement while working with stations to be more independent in how, when and what they air.
- Build niche areas of expertise that lend themselves to specific types of production: news, information programs, consumer reporting, sector services [USAID On The Air], financial and economic news, on-air educational programming and similar.
- Only target those stations that have at least a 50-50 chance at making it beyond the end of AMDEP.

The Evaluation Team also offers a strong recommendation with regard to a national ratings service, without which a commercial independent media industry cannot function efficiently:

- Complete ongoing work of AMDEP partner Altai to design, launch and institutionalize an independent, private, national media ratings service.

## 5. COMPONENT 6: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO MINISTRIES REGULATING THE MEDIA SECTOR

### a. Evaluation Questions:

*How effective has the project been in working with and supporting the relevant ministries, law makers, media industry advocates, and other policy advocates to promote media law implementation and regulation reform? What specific results have been obtained through this collaboration? How effective was the assistance provided to media-related civil society actors to improve their ability to support stronger media regulations and freedom of speech and access to information?*

### b. Design, Expected Results

Component 6 falls under AMDEPs Intermediate Result 2, “Increased Ability of Afghan media sector to network and advocate for a free and open media environment,” and sub IR 2.4, “Media regulatory framework improved.” Component 6 is designed to contribute to improved business-friendly government regulation of the airwaves and licensing procedures.

Before AMDEP, Afghan ministry units dealing with media regulation showed both a need for technical expertise and a readiness to work with outside experts on development of improved policies and procedures. Component 6 was to begin with assessment of the frequency allocation procedures in partnership with Afghanistan Telecom Regulatory Authority (ATRA) and the two ministries engaged in media licensing. Subsequently, targeted technical assistance was to be provided to improve the country's regulatory structure and to strengthen ATRA's capacity to develop and enforce effective regulations.

The Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT) develops policies that have significant long-term implications for journalism and the development of media businesses nationwide. Lack of regulation and enforcement of broadcast transmitters' power and frequencies represents an important threat to commercially sustainable growth of the sector. The relationship between the MCIT (which controls broadcast media frequencies) and the Ministry of Information and Culture and Youth (which controls media licenses) would benefit from clarification and streamlining. Current procedures for assigning frequencies have resulted in signal interference and misallocation of frequencies to different size communities. Fair, technically sound, and transparent assignment of frequencies is required for investors to develop new media outlets and for the Government to receive revenues from frequency fees and auctions. Also, efficient spectrum planning and management are needed if the country is to benefit from new media capabilities and technologies in the future.

#### c. Implementation

Under AMDEP, Internews provided technical advice to the Ministry of Information, Culture and Youth Affairs (commonly known as MIC) and the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MCIT). Internews contracted consulting firm Albany Associates to conduct a review of the broadcast regulatory framework in Afghanistan, resulting in a range of recommendations for both ministries.

AMDEP then provided support to MCIT with regard to media licensing, including the important new area of information and communication technology (ICT). The Internews advisor has assumed an important role as a resource person and advisor to both ministries dealing with media regulation, the Directorate of Information Technology, GSM providers, Internet service providers (ISPs) and other stakeholders.

At the MIC, an Internews advisor worked to train ATRA staff in the use of monitoring equipment (both an unused monitoring van they had and also new mobile monitoring equipment provided by Internews). It quickly became evident that ATRA was in need of capacity building at all levels from monitoring, to spectrum management planning, to policy review in relation to new media such as wireless and digital broadcasting. The Minister met

a number of times with the Internews advisor to seek his advice in broader spectrum management issues and has requested his ongoing support as an embedded technical adviser at the Ministry.

e. Accomplishments and Impact

According to ATRA's Director of Spectrum Management, AMDEP has worked successfully with ATRA on the following tasks since 2011: (1) an assessment of spectrum management in Afghanistan; (2) mobile frequency monitoring by providing technical assistance, supplementary equipment, and training; (3) coordination of complementary spectrum management efforts by ISAF (military frequencies) and ATRA (civilian frequencies); (4) development of a rationale for pricing of microwave frequencies; (5) introduction of new database software (SMS4DC) that will permit efficient spectrum management of civilian and military frequencies in the future; and (6) assistance in drafting regulations needed for spectrum management and enforcement.

Twenty-four documents presenting and explaining needed near term policy changes have been submitted to the government, 55 longer-term policy recommendations to improve the media legal and regulatory framework have been submitted, and 25 technical assistance meetings have been held.

Project reports and interviews by the Evaluation Team revealed good progress toward meeting the objectives of Component 6. The long list of AMDEP's recommendations and analyses, coupled with its technical support for moving the policy reforms forward, has resulted in important improvements to date. ATRA's own capability has been strengthened significantly as it has worked with and learned from AMDEP's advisors. Furthermore, the stage has been set for even greater progress over the next year or two as additional recommendations are implemented.

The quality of AMDEP's inputs has been noteworthy. ATRA executives are very positive about the technical assistance they have received from AMDEP. Initial assessment work by AMDEP partner Albany Associates clearly and convincingly identified the issues and risks and helped ATRA set priorities and organize tasks. Based on the assessment, AMDEP advisors have been able to identify and seize opportunities such as the unused mobile monitoring equipment. They were able to coordinate with ISAF and other relevant partners. They brought relevant solutions from unexpected sources, most notably Bosnia-Herzegovina. Their technical competence was state-of-the-art.

AMDEP has carved out an important niche for itself in the complex business of telecommunications regulation and policy. It has developed close working relationships

with government officials at different levels. It has built momentum and is involved in ongoing activities that require continuing support and continuity.

#### i. Sustainability

Component 6 results are sustainable. Policy reforms become permanent once they are adopted and implemented and are therefore sustainable. Furthermore, ATRA's strengthened capacity does not put additional budgetary or human resource burdens on ATRA.

#### ii. Strengths and Weaknesses

Strengths of Component 6 include:

- A design that identified a critical set of policy constraints directly affecting the development of the media sector.
- Close coordination between civilian (USAID) and military (ISAF) actors dealing with adjacent frequencies that require a joint approach as spectrum management and regulation transition to a consolidated ATRA.
- Effective and flexible AMDEP technical assistance with insight into the unusual circumstances of spectrum regulation and management in Afghanistan.
- Openness on the part of all partners – USAID, Internews, Albany, ATRA, and MCIT – to work together in an iterative, analytical, flexible, consultative way to move toward improved regulation.

Weaknesses include:

- A large legacy of previously-assigned frequencies already in use by major and minor media players that will be difficult to modify or re-assign as new policies gain traction.
- The short-to-medium term approach that characterizes USAID (and ISAF) assistance, which is not fully responsive to ATRA's wish for consistent long-term technical assistance.
- ATRA's lack of full authority to enforce spectrum regulations.

#### iii. Recommendations

MIC and MCIT will request continuing support from USAID and AMDEP to continue the work that is in progress. Officials mentioned the following areas of need:

- Continued analysis of the pricing of microwave links
- Continued technical assistance and training to get the SMS4DC database software installed and operational
- Continued development of frequency monitoring capabilities
- Analysis of frequency bandwidth needs for FM

- Continued assistance developing policies to govern the relationship between the two Ministries that control media licensing and frequencies.
- Consideration of a re-write of current licensing regulations with a goal of decreasing the number of broadcast outlets. The model designed and implemented by Albany consulting teams in Bosnia might be applicable.

ATRA would prefer a continuous, permanent AMDEP presence of one or (preferably) two AMDEP technical advisors for two to three more years. Given the importance of the work, the low cost, and the good performance of AMDEP to date, USAID would be well-advised to continue this successful and important effort if resources permit.

## 6. GENDER

One of USAID’s AMDEP objectives is “women and youth participate in journalism and have access to training and media-related educational opportunities.” AMDEP has made a consistent and conscientious effort to promote women as implementers, professional journalists and beneficiaries. AMDEP has: (1) supported news media content focused on women’s issues, (2) included women as AMDEP project staff and beneficiaries, and (3) strengthened the participation of women in the media industry as professional communicators. Each of these is discussed below.

### a. Women-oriented content

Women journalists can be counted on to focus some of their reporting on women’s issues. AMDEP-supported female-owned radio stations and female reporters now produce a steady stream of programming intended for female audiences and dealing with women’s issues. An example is Salam Watandar’s *Hawa* (Eve) weekly radio program targeting women and girls, broadcast in both Dari and Pashto. *Hawa* episodes include interviews with successful women, reports on gender based issues from the provinces, tips on home economics, information about basic health care and advice on a range of gender based concerns. The program seeks to give voice to women through education, as well as their inclusion in business and economic areas.

### b. Female project staff and female beneficiaries.

AMDEP reports strong participation by women in all of its activities<sup>7</sup>. For example, in the Salam Watandar radio network, five of the 47 radio stations are women-owned. Currently, six female journalists are on staff at Salam Watandar’s Kabul office, and two female stringers report from Balkh and Herat provinces. In 2011, Salam Watandar trained 30

---

<sup>7</sup> Farah Mokhtarezadeh, Internews report: (AMDEP) Gender Successes and Lessons Learned, 1 January, 2012,

women in radio production and journalism. The Nai training program for new journalists held remedial training for females to enable them to qualify for Nai's training. There are three women trainers at Nai, as well as a female who serves as the Director of Training. Under AMDEP, Nai ran courses for 2303 trainees, of which 423 were female. Nai also established a Graduate Club network, with 247 members (68 of them female) in five clubs. In July 2011, only 6% of trainees were female; by November of the same year over 40% of trainees were females. Similar increases in female participation occurred at the Nai regional discussions and national forums. Initially female participation in media conferences was around 6%, but then female participation increased to 39% over a 6-month period.

AMDEP's approach to rural radio especially benefits women. Afghan males generally dominate rural, poor, traditional households. In media terms, this means that the husband controls the TV. However the wife usually can control the radio during the day when the husband is out, making radio an especially powerful medium for reaching disadvantaged women. A growing female audience at certain times of the day creates an opportunity for targeted program production and encourages tactical advertising.

c. Women as media professionals

Nai training has helped position women to find employment as media professionals. The Evaluation Team visited women-owned radio stations, other Salam Watandar stations and non-Salam Watandar TV and radio stations. In all the stations visited, women professionals were at work in significant numbers in all departments and roles. Almost all female media professionals interviewed for the evaluation reported having received Nai professional training, including women working in upscale commercial stations not served by AMDEP. At a major new non-Salam Watandar private radio and TV station in Mazar, the news director is a woman.

The Evaluation Team held focus groups with 22 women journalists in Herat and Mazar. Considering that the media industry started from nothing just ten years ago, and that Afghan culture does not always encourage young women to work outside of the home, the employment of so many woman media professionals is remarkable. It is clear that Nai's training gave many female trainees the skills and confidence to pursue media careers, including in non-AMDEP media organizations. Women participating in the Evaluation Team's focus groups in Mazar and Herat hold a variety of positions in the media where they work, including reporter, producer, photographer, presenter and technician. They are mostly young, active, articulate, and ambitious. In the future, they said that they would like to receive additional training in photojournalism, reporting, media law and ethics.

Of course, the women journalists participating in the focus groups reported plenty of problems. The stations that employ them sometimes do not give them substantive

assignments outside of the station. Their families may discourage them because the males are embarrassed to see their wives, sisters or daughters on TV. They can find themselves limited to “decorative” responsibilities as on-camera newsreaders. Station owners or editors sometimes restrict their reporting to women’s issues. In terms of investigative reporting, female journalists in the focus groups say that they self-censor because they fear reprisals from the influential males they investigate.

d. Conclusion

In an environment that presents formidable structural and cultural obstacles for women in general and for professional women in the media industry in particular, AMDEP partners have opened a number of doors. First, AMDEP has helped make news and information available to provincial women who previously only had access to traditional interpersonal information sources. Second, by providing news and civic information to women, AMDEP has empowered women by promoting their participation in community and political activities. Third, by positioning women for media employment, AMDEP has helped give skills, visibility and credibility to women as professionals.

**7. SUB-GRANTS**

a. Evaluation questions:

*Did sub-grants empower local organizations and increase their management capacity as originally intended? How effective was this approach in achieving the project’s objectives? How have the monitoring methods, protocols and information systems been applied to ensure that sub-grants are achieving stated outputs and outcomes?*

b. Internews Approach to Sub-grants

Sub-grants were awarded to Afghan partners to provide direct funding and facilitate program implementation. Of the original AMDEP award, more than \$6 million was allotted to primary Afghan partners to lead and implement core AMDEP components. Primary sub-recipients, in turn, entered into granting processes with another layer of AMDEP partners to support effective implementation of specific AMDEP efforts while building primary sub-recipients’ facility with financial process, award management and program-implementation. Internews initiated and managed sub-grants with a rigorous process of vetting, mentoring and capacity building implemented by members of its home office and Kabul management teams.

c. Did sub-grants empower local organizations and increase their management capacity as originally intended?

The sub-grants provided significant management capacity strengthening in most sub-grantees. Efficient, transparent management that is responsive to the standards and requirements of USAID and its partners is not widespread among Afghan organizations,

partly because few projects have AMDEP's emphasis on creating this capacity in local organizations. Empowering the sub-grantees to manage their activities under AMDEP required a relatively time consuming, high effort, high cost methodology on the part of Internews, along with some risks.

This resource-intensive approach might not have been justified if the objective was simply to obtain specific outputs from the sub-grantees. But the AMDEP design had parallel objectives for the sub-grantees: (1) implementing media activities and produce specific results and outputs, and (2) acquiring the capability to manage other future activities on their own. Future activities might involve grants from other donors or commercial contracts. Both require modern management systems including realistic budgeting, transparent accounting, reporting, personnel management and business planning. AMDEP's media partners clearly received strengthened management capability that will help them and the overall Afghan media sector to function more competitively, efficiently, and sustainably in the future.

As would be expected, the results of this capacity strengthening varied. A big success story was Nai. The grants management of the Nai sub-award, in addition to ensuring financial accountability and supporting program implementation, was focused on transitioning Nai towards long-term financial sustainability. As a result, Nai has transitioned from a monthly AMDEP grant of \$180,000 a month in May, June, July of 2011 to a monthly average of \$72,000 now.

WADAN and the Media Group were less successful, although Internews' approach ultimately protected USAID and AMDEP from activity failures. WADAN had difficulties with Internews' administrative requirements for sub-grantees and with technical dimensions of the MMC "new media" approaches. Internews mentioned to the Evaluation Team that WADAN's corporate culture, embodied by its leadership, manifested lukewarm commitment to the innovative MMC approach with its new technologies and focus on hands-on audio-visual media production by young people. The Media Group may have lacked the dynamic, proactive leadership needed to motivate and unify the sometimes-fractious media professional associations. Nai, which does have dynamic and recognized media industry leadership, has picked up some of the Media Group's activities. Since WADAN and the Media Group had been eased out of AMDEP early in the project, the Evaluation Team did not have time or access to further investigate the concerns with their AMDEP sub-grants. The most important conclusion in this regard is that Internews had good procedures for working closely with sub-grantees during the formative months of their relationships, detected problems early, and successfully implemented alternative sub-grants that salvaged planned interventions.

d. How effective was this approach in achieving the project's objectives?

AMDEP's approach to sub-grants contributed significantly to achieving the project's objectives. As discussed above, AMDEP's technical assistance and training for sub-grantees gave them new institutional capacities, contributing to AMDEP's objective of strengthening Afghan media institutions. By strengthening sub-grantees' management and technical capacities, AMDEP has helped create the conditions for a permanently sustainable independent media sector. Furthermore, the Afghan sub-grantees contributed to achievement of AMDEP's technical objectives in terms of improving the coverage and quality of Afghan independent media. The sub-grantees brought cultural insight, political instincts, and professional experience in the Afghan environment to the project that greatly benefited the project and that would not have been available if the project had depended on outside implementers. Empowering organizations gave the sub-grantees the chance to apply their own knowledge and experience to best effect.

Another positive example is the national news agency Pajhwok. AMDEP worked with Pajhwok to set up new reporting capacity, revenue streams and management systems. Pajhwok is now ending its AMDEP activities and proceeding independently. Already, Pajhwok has secured an additional fee-for service contract from BBC to conduct monitoring services. A stronger and independent Pajhwok is a significant AMDEP contribution to a strengthened media sector in Afghanistan.

e. How have the monitoring methods, protocols and information systems been applied to ensure that sub-grants are achieving stated outputs and outcomes?

AMDEP's monitoring methods, protocols and information systems with regard to the sub-grants have been thorough and effective. Each sub-grant is monitored individually, and the results are then aggregated for full-project PMP reporting. Procedures are adapted to the particular capabilities of individual sub-grantees. For example, meticulous selection and training of the four provincial CSOs selected to implement MMCs was required because of their lack of experience and administrative systems. As a result, the MMCs are now able to manage their resources and achieve their objectives with diminishing AMDEP administrative oversight. The management skills and systems that the partners have acquired are an important part of their long-term sustainability strategies. For example, the director of a women's radio station told the Evaluation Team that she was grateful for the management skills and systems she got from AMDEP because she can now compete for and manage grants from other donors.

## **IV. CONCLUSIONS**

### **1. EVALUATION QUESTIONS:**

*To what extent has AMDEP achieved its stated goal/purpose and expected results? Has the independent media sector and its regulatory environment positively changed as a result of the project? How realistic were the stated goals? What have been the main challenges to achieving the expected results?*

The previous sections offer specific Evaluation Team conclusions about particular activities and approaches. This section contains more general conclusions on some broader topics that arose during the evaluation. The conclusions reflect consensus views of the Evaluation Team and reflect team members' professional experience and knowledge as well as information gathered during the AMDEP evaluation. The first set of conclusions deals with design issues. The second set deals with implementation. Finally, a few general conclusions about the future of the media industry in Afghanistan and programming in other conflict zones are offered.

### **2. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS ABOUT THE AMDEP DESIGN**

#### **a. Democracy and Governance (DG) Objectives**

AMDEP documentation does not feature the linkage between its media-related objectives and broader USG democracy and governance objectives. As of this evaluation, there are convincing indications that the project is contributing to positive improvements in public knowledge about, and participation in, national and local democratic events and institutions. The local media approach and objectives are strategically right to achieve DG objectives. In a baseline survey of 1433 respondents, 77% of respondents expressed their view that local media provide mechanisms for ensuring government accountability, and 80% reported that they use local media for information about the local and national government.

Audience feedback and initial surveys show a substantial number of listeners to Salam Watandar's 47 local media outlets. The large amount of more accurate, relevant news and information reaching a large number of citizens (who had virtually no news at all before 2002) can only be increasing informed participation in democratic institutions and processes. The documented impact of news media in promoting informed citizen participation in democratic governance documented in other countries further reinforces this view.

Another bit of evidence comes from the Youth Voices Festival. In a post-festival evaluation, 67% of participants surveyed reported increased civic engagement following participation in the Festival.

*Conclusion: AMDEP is contributing to the strengthening of democracy and governance in Afghanistan; this positive effect will become stronger as media news continue to grow and improve.*

b. Focus on Radio

The project's overall emphasis on radio was logical because of radio's near-universal coverage in Afghanistan, especially because of the objective of reaching less-served provincial audiences. Transmission and production equipment is relatively simple and low cost. Local production near the audience enables programming to be relevant to local issues and people, and local listeners can participate in, or react to, local programming. In this regard, call-in shows are reported to be very popular. With radio, costs to listeners are minimal, permitting even very poor households to have access.

In Afghanistan, other non-radio media offer far less coverage and have higher costs and complexity. While other communication technologies such as audio and video recorders, Internet and television offer interesting possibilities for the future, efforts to develop their potential under AMDEP led to complications and cancellations. Given its objectives, a sharper concentration on radio could have led to more impact with the same resources.

*Conclusion: AMDEP's work with radio is reaching large audiences at low cost. Other media such as television and "new media" will not, in the foreseeable future in Afghanistan, produce the reach, economy, trust, simplicity and cultural acceptability of radio.*

c. Concentration on Disadvantaged Groups

In Afghanistan, influence, information and wealth are concentrated in certain segments of the population such as urban dwellers, wealthy families, males and older people. AMDEP's design represents a conscious effort to redistribute information (and, thereby, other resources such as influence and wealth) to less privileged groups. Target groups for AMDEP services are people living in rural provinces, women and young people. In this way, AMDEP complements other media such as television, print media and Internet that are mostly used by better-off segments. The Evaluation Team observed that AMDEP's emphasis on women, youth and rural provinces permeates the project's design, implementation and PMP evaluation. The project has made a maximum effort on behalf of these segments even though they presented some special challenges and problems. The results have been positive, with ample evidence of participation, impact, receptiveness and enthusiasm on the part of the target segments.

*Conclusion: The AMDEP design strategically targeted segments of the population with greatest need for media information programming; the project was successful in tailoring activities to provinces, youth, and women; and there has been substantial improvement in*

*quality and quantity of news and other development-related information flowing to these segments.*

d. Value Chain Approach

The AMDEP design is a top-to-bottom comprehensive approach to improving independent media. The advantage of this comprehensive approach is that it addresses all the different needs of independent media. The disadvantage is that the design is complex, with a large number of sub-objectives, activities, management units and partners. For these reasons, it is remarkable that AMDEP is successfully implementing most of its components and activities in a timely fashion. Credit must be given to the collaborative and flexible management relationship between USAID and Internews. Another positive factor is the large and efficient Internews Kabul staff, with its depth of competent and committed managers and technical support people assigned to the different AMDEP activities and components.

*Conclusion: The solid management of AMDEP by Internews and USAID has largely overcome the vulnerability of a complex project design in an unpredictable environment.*

e. A National Integration Emphasis

Cultural and regional rivalries, prejudices and antagonisms abound in Afghanistan and make peace and nation building difficult. AMDEP's approach of exchanging news and programming among different provinces can facilitate information-exchanges, awareness, understanding and mutual appreciation among different cultural groups and regions. However, promoting inter-regional awareness does not seem to have received as much attention in AMDEP implementation as it might have. More emphasis on promoting inter-regional comprehension and appreciation might have strengthened the project's contribution to achieving broad USG democracy and governance priorities.

*Conclusion: Promoting national integration is an important potential function of independent media in Afghanistan that could have usefully received more priority by AMDEP.*

f. Media law and regulatory reform.

At first glance, media law and regulatory reform do not appear central to the objective of strengthening independent media, but in Afghanistan they are. Legal and regulatory issues involve different players and methodologies from the rest of AMDEP, but in the long run they will prove to be a lasting and important legacy of the project in terms of creating a positive environment for independent, sustainable, commercial media. AMDEP has been agile and effective in developing insightful and responsive policy and legislative initiatives and building the trust and confidence needed to work effectively within host country policy and legislative units and deliberations. USAID has also played an important role in linking

AMDEP's work with civilian regulatory issues with ISAF work on the military side. AMDEP's work conceptualizing and setting the stage for ICT development and management is visionary and will contribute in major ways to the constructive and profitable evolution of new media services in the future.

*Conclusion: AMDEP's work with legal, regulatory and legislative structures has been well conceptualized and effectively implemented to date, promising important and widespread impact as the media industry grows and modernizes in the future.*

g. The Internews Approach

Internews is the lead implementer of AMDEP, but it is important to also recognize Internews' role in helping to conceptualize and design AMDEP's approaches and activities. Internews' website summarizes the organization's vision as producing local news with integrity and independence, training media professionals and citizen journalists, introducing innovative media solutions, helping establish policies needed for open access to information, creating platforms for dialogue and informed debate, and research and evaluation for effective and sustainable programs even in the most challenging environments. The convergence between USAID's AMDEP design and Internews' corporate vision is obvious. The fact that Internews has a Cooperative Agreement with USAID demonstrates USAID's willingness to give Internews considerable discretion to pursue its own vision and approaches in AMDEP. Furthermore, Internews' continuous presence in the program has provided consistency as USAID managers cycle in and out of Afghanistan. For the most part, Internews' vision and constant presence have contributed to a well-designed and successful program.

*Conclusion: Internews has constructively contributed conceptual approaches as well as implementation services to AMDEP.*

### **3. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS CONCERNING AMDEP IMPLEMENTATION**

a. Consistency of Management and Funding

USAID and AMDEP managers have had to contend with funding fluctuations and uncertainties, shifting design priorities, turnover of personnel, and security-related postponements and constraints. Such problems are reportedly common in USAID/Afghanistan's projects and result from the unique nature of the program and its funding. They are not really anyone's fault and cannot be remedied, but they make for bumpy implementation. Under the circumstances, it is remarkable that AMDEP has accomplished all that it has, as quickly as it has. Especially noteworthy is the fact that USAID and Internews have been able to patch together a ten-year program that is

strategically consistent, building toward the program's overall objective of strengthening independent media in Afghanistan.

*Conclusion: AMDEP has been able to adapt to funding and management fluctuations and will successfully conclude a reasonably coherent ten-year program supporting overall improvement of Afghan independent media.*

b. Coordination

AMDEP has successfully coordinated its large portfolio of activities and partners. A large, strong staff; weekly substantive staff meetings; sharing of project reporting; and effective management leadership have resulted in smooth implementation. Outside of AMDEP, however, more and better coordination would be helpful. An Embassy Working Group seems to facilitate some information exchange but not much programmatic coordination. Because USG media activities pursue different objectives, some opportunities for synergies are being missed. An inter-agency conversation about the consequences of USG media programs on the long-term development of the Afghan media industry could have utility. The different USG initiatives to build media capacity – strengthening of journalism training, for example – could benefit from a more coordinated approach. The USG officers responsible for the different programs recognize the advantages of coordination, but the day-to-day realities of constant staff turnover, heavy workload, and the lack of an effective mechanism make coordination difficult.

*Conclusion: Coordination within AMDEP works well. Because of the work environment in the USG community, coordination between AMDEP and other USG media-related activities is not regular or thorough.*

c. Partnerships and Ownership

AMDEP has depended on a large and diverse group of Afghan partners to implement its activities instead of depending on outside staff and subcontractors. This approach involves some serious difficulties and vulnerabilities, but it also has a number of advantages. One important advantage is that local partners bring local experience, contacts, languages and insight to the project – vital assets in the very complex Afghan environment. Even more important is the fact that AMDEP has put considerable effort into capacity building for its partners. AMDEP has provided new technology, infrastructure, management and administrative systems, and training. The intent is to build partner organizations that will be able to stand up and operate independently and sustainably after AMDEP ends, becoming strategic new players with strong modern capabilities in the Afghan media industry.

At the time of this evaluation, the many different partners were found by the Evaluation Team to be at different stages in the strengthening of their capacities. All had improved

their technical capacity; most had strengthened their administrative systems (see Section 3.7. “Sub-grants”) and human resources; none had achieved autonomy or sustainability. A positive outcome is a sense of ownership. All of the partner managers interviewed by the Evaluation Team seemed comfortable and confident in their leadership roles and had fully understood and internalized the importance of their organization in the Afghan independent media community.

*Conclusion: AMDEP has successfully strengthened the capacity of its Afghan partner organizations and imparted a sense of local ownership.*

d. Business Planning and Sustainability

With the pressure of time and at USAID urging, AMDEP has begun supporting business planning with its partners. Some, such as Nai and Salam Watandar, are making institutional changes to become autonomous Afghan entities. Others, like Pajhwok and Altai, are already established organizations. However the activities and services begun under AMDEP have a long way to go to become financially sustainability, and business planning is overdue and moving slowly. The journalists who have been trained by the thousands by AMDEP often lack the business skills needed to generate revenue. This situation is made worse by the anemic state of the commercial private economy, which will somehow have to generate greatly expanded revenues for the independent media sector in the future.

*Conclusion: AMDEP has started late and made insufficient progress on the difficult challenge of business planning and financial sustainability.*

e. Evaluation

AMDEP has a very rigorous and thorough evaluation plan in conjunction with its PMP. The final evaluation using the PMP indicators will be very illuminating in terms of measuring achievements and impact.

*Conclusion: AMDEP’s PMP is providing monitoring for management purposes as the project is implemented and will produce rigorous documentation of impact when the project ends.*

f. Capacity Building

AMDEP has emphasized capacity strengthening with all of its Afghan partner organizations. Abundant technical assistance and training have been tailored to meet the partners’ needs and respond to their deficiencies. Infrastructure and equipment, staff skills, and administrative and management systems have been upgraded so that the organizations will be able to function autonomously and efficiently in the future. The only capacity that has

not been adequately developed in most of the partners is business planning and revenue generation for sustainability.

*Conclusion: AMDEP has effectively developed all the capacities in its partners that they will need to operate autonomously in the future, with the exception of business skills needed for sustainability.*

#### **4. FUTURE OF THE MEDIA IN AFGHANISTAN**

The independent media in Afghanistan have experienced explosive growth beginning since 2002, much of it fueled by international funding. Private media outlets have become bloated with subsidies, media buys from governments and new stations have proliferated as speculators have sought to cash in on the bonanza. However, it is unlikely that the current boom can be sustained. As international funders begin to phase out their presence in Afghanistan, the local media will have to compete for commercial advertising. There is uncertainty about the extent to which the Afghan private commercial sector is inclined or able to greatly increase its expenditures for advertising. The Evaluation Team found optimism among the managers of several big, successful stations but anxiety among the managers of small and provincial outlets, such as the Salam Watandar radio stations. AMDEP partners and other small and provincial media may be facing a difficult future. Just as AMDEP ramps up its final push for business development and revenue generation, the prospects for commercial revenues may not materialize as hoped.

*Conclusion: The booming Afghan media sector is likely to find itself overbuilt and vulnerable to contraction as international funding sources decline in the near future.*

#### **5. RELEVANCE TO OTHER CONFLICT-AFFECTED ENVIRONMENTS**

The Evaluation Team does not have extensive experience with projects similar to AMDEP in other conflict areas. The circumstances in Afghanistan are unique in terms of economic, cultural, topographical and military factors. It is difficult to identify comparable elements between the AMDEP experience in Afghanistan and circumstances in other conflict zones.

Perhaps one applicable lesson is that it may at times be advantageous for OTI to jump start media activities in a way that sets the stage for more long term capacity strengthening in subsequent USAID programming. Another possible lesson is that it helps to have a long-term presence of an implementing partner with technical expertise since USG managers move in and out quickly. Also, it can sometimes be advantageous to implement through good local partners, even though this sometimes involves greater management burden and time. Another point is that inter-agency coordination of different media-related activities, though difficult in a crisis, can lead to more strategic programming and greater impact.

Finally, to the extent possible, it is best to try to have a longer-term strategy and program to complement emergency short-term interventions. In a crisis, it can be difficult to take long term development plans into consideration, but a post-conflict vision ideally should be a part of a crisis intervention.

*Conclusion: Because each crisis environment is unique, there are few lessons from ANDEP that can be applied to other conflict zones. Possible helpful principles from AMDEP include: (1) encourage OTI to set the stage for subsequent USAID media capacity strengthening; (2) maintain a long-term technical implementing partner; (3) implement media activities through local host country partners; (4) try to coordinate different USG media activities; and (5) develop a long-term strategic approach to complement media crisis interventions.*

## **V. RECOMMENDATIONS**

The following recommendations are based on the assumption that is a possibility of a 17-month extension of AMDEP beginning in May 2012, with modest additional funding. There is no expectation of further support for Afghan independent media beyond this final extension.

### **1. SUSTAINABILITY, BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT**

AMDEP has made some initial progress toward autonomy and revenue generation by its partners, but the challenges are major, time is short, conditions are not very favorable, and the partners are dubious. Journalists are not always skilled or enthusiastic businesspersons. The long-term survival of the partners is at stake, as well as the permanence of AMDEP's accomplishments and results.

*Recommendation: AMDEP capacity strengthening efforts should shift from expanding services to business development and generating revenues.*

### **2. LEGAL AND REGULATORY ENVIRONMENT**

AMDEP is in the middle of important technical assistance to the GIRoA in key regulatory and legislative areas. It is important that this work continue to its conclusion. Besides GIRoA, the World Bank and ISAF are counting on continuation of AMDEP's work to help conceptualize and institutionalize a positive policy, regulatory, and legislative environment favoring efficient development of independent, private media.

*Recommendation: AMDEP should continue the ongoing work of advisors in the GIROA ministries dealing with legal and regulatory issues.*

### **3. MEDIA RATINGS SERVICE**

AMDEP has made a promising start with Altai in developing a private, independent media ratings service. A ratings service is important for the development of a private, commercial, competitive media sector. Continuing this activity to its completion is not expected to involve high costs and it will be sustainable by selling its service to advertisers and media outlets.

*Recommendation: AMDEP should complete work that is under way to establish a commercial media ratings service.*

### **4. PMP TRACKING AND EVALUATION**

AMDEP's elaborate PMP will provide interesting impact and process information about media development interventions in complicated environments. While it puts a heavy reporting burden on Internews, it offers new and unusual data for academic, policy and development readers.

*Recommendation: Continue to track the PMP indicators to the end of the 17-month extension, summarize the results for policymakers and development agencies, and disseminate the results.*

### **5. UNIVERSITY PARTNERS**

AMDEP has provided journalism and legal training in practical, targeted ways outside of traditional university law and journalism schools. However, many AMDEP trainees have university backgrounds and some mentioned the complementary nature of university (theoretical and academic content) and AMDEP (practical, hands-on experience) training. Also some AMDEP activities – like the moot court -- have sparked keen interest in university law schools. In the time remaining, AMDEP might usefully explore linkages with local universities to enable them to benefit from resources like the Moot Court methodology and Nai practical hands-on media training.

*Recommendation: Explore linkages to transfer AMDEP tools to university law and journalism departments.*

### **6. SUBSIDIES AND SUB-GRANTS**

Partners frequently expressed to the Evaluation Team contradictory views about AMDEP subsidies. While they have understood in principle the need to move toward financial sustainability, they have many urgent needs for resources and still feel that AMDEP, as the parent organization that has financed them to date, should provide them more financial support. They have seen funding fluctuate in the past, and it is unlikely that they will really accept the post-AMDEP financial reality until they have to.

*Recommendation: AMDEP should not take on additional subsidy burdens and should accelerate the phase out of ongoing subsidies for its partners.*



# USAID | AFGHANISTAN

FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

## **ANNEX A: SCOPE OF WORK:**

### **OFFICE DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE (ODG)/ OFFICE OF PROGRAM AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT (OPPD)**

#### **SCOPE OF WORK:**

#### **PERFORMANCE EVALUATION**

**AFGHANISTAN MEDIA DEVELOPMENT AND EMPOWERMENT PROJECT (AMDEP),  
COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT NUMBER: 306-A-00-10-00533-00**

#### **I. INTRODUCTION**

##### **Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP)**

Building on successes achieved in earlier projects, USAID awarded a Cooperative Agreement to Internews Networks, Inc. (Internews) on November 1, 2010 to support the *Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP)* in the amount of \$21,902,355. While the original project was planned for one year, USAID granted Internews a no-cost extension, taking the project from November 1, 2011 through the end of January 2012.

AMDEP's overall goal is *to ensure the existence of a strong, independent, pluralistic media sector that provides accurate, trusted news and information for audiences around the country.* AMDEP employs a media value-chain approach, encompassing activities from providing direct support and training to existing and new media outlets and journalists to establishing multi-media production centers, in hopes of increasing the availability of reliable information, allowing Afghans to make informed choices about goods, services, their government, and the future of Afghanistan.

USAID's evaluation policy encourages independent external evaluation to both increase accountability and inform those who develop programs and strategies to refine designs and introduce improvements into future efforts. In keeping with that aim, this evaluation is being conducted to review and evaluate the performance of USAID-funded media development activities through the *Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project (AMDEP)*. The evaluation will focus on assessing the effectiveness of the project's

design and performance in achieving its program goal. While this evaluation is examining the performance of AMDEP, this evaluation is of additional importance given that USAID has invested in Afghanistan's independent media sector with the existing partner since 2002. To date, no independent evaluation of USAID-funded media programs in Afghanistan has been undertaken.

## II. BACKGROUND CONTEXT

Under the rule of the Taliban, television was prohibited, antennas and transmitters were destroyed and only one radio station was permitted. However, in the decade since the Taliban's removal from power, the media landscape has experienced significant growth, averaging some 20% per year over the past five years.<sup>8</sup> In 2002, only one non-governmental radio station existed; as of September 2010, there were over 74 television channels, 175 FM radio stations and 800 publications.<sup>9</sup> Development of the media sector since 2005 has essentially focused on urban areas, particularly Kabul and other large cities. In addition to several semi-national networks covering multiple provinces, most of the new entities are local television and FM-radio stations with a relatively small broadcast footprint. While television use is replacing radio use in urban areas, radio remains the primary source of information for rural Afghans. Some 63% of Afghans report that they use a radio<sup>10</sup>; 95% report that they own or have regular access to a radio; and 85-90% report listening to the radio regularly.<sup>11</sup> Recent studies have shown an increased appetite for and trust in media, with media being considered the primary source of reliable information on most topics. According to a USAID-commissioned study, "media is generally viewed by Afghans as a positive force in society, celebrated for addressing key issues—economy, crime, and corruption—and is seen as a way to open minds and educate."<sup>12</sup> Further, Afghans are beginning to demand that their media serve additional societal roles, such as acting as a watchdog of government and providing educational content.

USAID has supported media development in Afghanistan since 2002. Given Afghanistan's high rates of illiteracy, most of USAID's funding to date has focused on the development of independent radio. Prior to 2006, USAID-funding supported the launch/consolidation of independent media outlets that now comprise a substantial portion of the sector, including: Arman Radio, Tolo Television, Killid Radio and magazine, Shaiq Television, Pajhwok Afghan News, Sayara Communications, Morsal (women's) magazine, and journalism training programs, including print and radio operations at Afghan universities. In August 2006, USAID awarded an Associate Cooperative Agreement to Pact, Inc. and its partner Internews Networks (Internews) in the amount of \$12,000,000 to implement the *Independent Media in Afghanistan Project*; a one-year follow-on for \$8,854,579 was

---

<sup>8</sup> Altai Consulting, "Afghan Media in 2010: Synthesis Report."

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Altai Consulting, "Afghan Media in 2010: Synthesis Report."

<sup>11</sup> Afghanistan Media Survey. Report prepared for the BBC Trust.

<sup>12</sup> Altai Consulting.

awarded in August 2009. After several additional extensions, this award ended on September 30, 2011.

The *Independent Media in Afghanistan Project*, implemented by Pact Inc. and Internews, stated goal was *to support Afghanistan's fledging independent media industry to move toward sustainability, with a focus on improved business skills, management, journalism and production skills, and reinforcement of an enabling regulatory environment.* This project supported Afghanistan's media sector through a multi-faceted program, building the capacity of local, state, and independent broadcast media through technical support, equipment upgrades, hands-on training in balanced and accurate reporting, and development of Afghan media policy and regulatory framework. AMDEP was designed to build on the successes of the *Independent Media in Afghanistan Project*.

One prominent result of USAID's support both through AMDEP and its predecessor has been the development of Salam Watandar, a national network of 47 independent local radio stations providing local and national programming to approximately 10 million Afghans. These stations, located throughout the country, are mostly based in the provincial capitals and population centers where they increasingly function, even in insecure areas, as self-supporting community-oriented businesses.

### **III. AMDEP PROGRAM GOALS AND OBJECTIVES**

Beginning in 2010, USAID's *Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project* (AMDEP) built upon the achievements of past media interventions, particularly those of the *Independent Media in Afghanistan Project*. AMDEP seeks to address key gaps in Afghanistan's professional media development, focusing on building Afghan capacity to meet what are considered universal journalistic standards. The growth and sustainability of a diverse and uniquely Afghan media industry are top USAID priorities, as are an increased number of individuals creating and sharing news and information. AMDEP's goal and objectives, as outlined below, are in line with those priorities.

As previously mentioned, AMDEP's overall goal is *to ensure the existence of a strong, independent, pluralistic media sector that provides accurate, trusted news and information for audiences around the country.*

Program objectives include:

- 1) Increase the reach and professional skills of independent media;
- 2) Empower individual and/or amateur voices through increased access to technology;
- 3) Use new media technology to facilitate the distribution and sharing of content;
- 4) Improve media sector networking, coordination, and legal environment in which Afghanistan's media operates;

- 5) Build the sustainability of private media outlets and capacity of public regulatory bodies;

To achieve these objectives, AMDEP is implementing activities divided in six components:

- 1) Regional Broadcast Media Support: Stations and Training Centers:** This component aimed to expand the reach of independent media by supporting quality public-interest programming, including support for existing and new media outlets, combined with expanded professional development opportunities for journalists.
- 2) Multi-Media Production Centers for Regional Information Access and Technology Training:** This component sought to provide the connectivity, technical tools, mentoring support, seed resources, and creative space for an emerging community of digital creators, activists, bloggers, and online producers through the establishment of civil society run and operated Multi-Media Production Centers.
- 3) Collaboration with Mobile News Service:** This component was designed to be a complementary piece to USAID's Mobile Khabar project. However, due to unforeseen circumstances the Mobile Khabar was never fully implemented. This component will not be subject to evaluation.
- 4) Media Solidarity, Advocacy and Literacy:** This component strived to raise general understanding of issues facing Afghan media among Afghan policy makers and society, including associations and legal professionals.
- 5) Customized Media Assistance:** This component offered support to select media outlets in the areas of needs assessment, business development and evaluation tools. Research towards the development of an industry-wide ratings system was intended to complement support to specific outlets.
- 6) Technical Assistance to Ministries Regulating the Media Sector:** This component was intended to support the Government of Afghanistan in addressing the emerging challenges to the media regulatory environment through a package of assistance, including technical assistance to the ministries and support for the Media Group, which represents the first national body of combined Afghan media industry representatives, including journalist associations.

#### **IV. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION**

This evaluation is being conducted to review and evaluate the performance of USAID-funded media development activities through the *Afghanistan Media Development and Empowerment Project* (AMDEP). The evaluation will focus on assessing the effectiveness

of the project's design and performance in achieving its programmatic goal and results through the six components.

It is critical that the successes and weaknesses of this program are studied and documented and recommendations are provided for potential follow-on program models to promote the development and sustainability of independent media in Afghanistan.

This evaluation should:

- Evaluate the design, approach, implementation, impact and effectiveness of USAID's support for media development in Afghanistan through AMDEP; the discussion should include the project's effectiveness in achieving the expected results; identification of strengths and weaknesses; and an assessment sustainability of individual projects after the project's end.
- Distill lessons learned on project design and implementation to guide future USAID media development projects in conflict-affected environments; this should include identification of lessons learned and best practices to inform and improve designs and models for future programs and projects, and provide information on how the existing project could be improved.
- Specifically examine recent interventions, such as the scope, level and effectiveness of AMDEP activities in the following areas:
  - Training
  - Media outlet establishment and support
  - Use of innovative and new technologies
  - Coordination and advocacy within the independent media sector
  - Legal and regulatory framework(s)

## V. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

### Program Objectives

- a) **To what extent has AMDEP achieved its stated goal/purpose and expected results.** Has the independent media sector and its regulatory environment positively changed as a result of the project? How realistic were the stated goals? What have been the main challenges to achieving the expected results?

### Program Components and Expected Results

- a) **Component 1—Regional Broadcast Media Support: Stations and Training Centers:** How effective is the training offered through the project in meeting the

needs of the sector? How sustainable are project interventions (i.e. training for journalists, Nai as a training institution, Salam Watandar Radio Broadcasting)? How sustainable are partner stations (financial and operational) and what is needed for them to become sustainable?

- b) Component 2—Multi-Media Production Centers (MMPCs):** How effective have the four established MMPCs been in increasing listenership of amateur voices? How do the MMPCs collaborate with other AMDEP components, such as local media outlets and the Nai Regional Media Training Hubs? What “new mediums” and “new technology” were adopted as a result of the interventions by the innovation partners?
- c) Component 3— Collaboration with a Mobile News Service:** This component will not be subject to evaluation.
- d) Component 4—Media Solidarity, Advocacy, and Literacy:** How effective was the project at increasing the organizational capacity of the Media Group? What were the results of the legal and advocacy training provided by the project, including law moot court competition? Was there a measurable impact of the media literacy radio programs?

**Component 5—Customized Media Assistance:** How effective was the assistance provided to media outlets in terms of increasing their capacity in the areas identified in their needs assessments and business plans? How has the improved capacity been defined and measured? What additional outcomes were obtained as a result of the assistance provided?

- e) Component 6—Technical Assistance to Ministries Regulating the Media Sector:** How effective has the project been in working with and supporting the relevant ministries, law makers, media industry advocates, and other policy advocates to promote media law implementation and regulation reform? What specific results have been obtained through this collaboration? How effective was the assistance provided to media-related civil society actors to improve their ability to support stronger media regulations and freedom of speech and access to information?
- f) Cross-Cutting Principles and Methodology:** How fully were women integrated into the various components of the program? How has the program fostered the development of women’s and youth activism in national media? How did the project increase media coverage of anti-corruption and government accountability?

## **Methodology and Management**

- a) **Sub-grants:** Did sub-grants empower local organizations and increase their management capacity as originally intended? How effective was this approach in achieving the project's objectives? How have the monitoring methods, protocols and information systems been applied to ensure that sub-grants are achieving stated outputs and outcomes?
- b) **Coordination:** How have the various implementers of this program coordinated both with each other and with their governmental, media sector, and development colleagues?
- c) **Capacity Building:** How effective was the capacity building, technical assistance, and business development training delivered through the project?
- d) **Ownership and Sustainability:** How sustainable are the investments made through this project? What support will be needed in order to facilitate sustainability?

## **Program Design and Approach**

- a) **Lessons Learned and Recommendations:** What are the strengths and weaknesses of the project's approach? To what extent did this project meet the needs of the independent media sector? What lessons learned and best practices can be applied to improve the design and models for future projects? What interventions would have been more and less effective and under what circumstances and which ones could be applied in the future?

## **VI. TEAM COMPOSITION**

The Evaluation Team shall consist of two international experts and one Afghan expert who can also serve as an interpreter. Both international experts should be senior-level evaluation analysts with media expertise and knowledge of Afghanistan's social, economic and political situation. Both should also have extensive experience designing and conducting evaluations and analyzing both quantitative and qualitative data. The Afghan expert should have familiarity with media-related issues and have experience with evaluation.

## **VII. EVALUATION SCHEDULE**

The estimated time period for undertaking this Evaluation is 47 work days, of which up to 36 calendar days should be spent in Afghanistan. The Evaluation Team is required to work six days a week. Up to two preparation days are allocated for work preceding travel to Afghanistan, and four total travel days are authorized (two days each way). The suggested start date in Afghanistan is o/a January 9, 2012. The team is required to travel to (relatively

safe) areas outside of Kabul where program activities are being implemented. At least 25% of the consultants' time will be spent outside Kabul visiting project offices, grantees offices, PRTs and interviewing program beneficiaries. A draft report will be submitted before the consultants depart Afghanistan; and a final report will be submitted within one-week of receipt of USAID comments (see below).

## **VIII. MANAGEMENT**

The Evaluation Team will work closely with Fatah Mamnoon, Agreement Officer Technical Representative (AOTR) for AMDEP, and Andrea Sawka, Senior Media Development Advisor for USAID/Afghanistan.

## **VII. DATA COLLECTION/ANALYSIS ACTIVITIES**

The consultants will review the following documents:

- a) Program Descriptions and Modifications
- b) Annual Work Plans
- c) Quarterly Reports
- d) Annual Reports
- e) PMP and other M&E documents
- f) AMDEP sub-grants list
- g) USAID-funded media assessment, *Afghan Media in 2010*

## **IX. METHODOLOGY**

The Evaluation Team will be responsible for developing an evaluation strategy and methodologies that include a mix of qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis approaches. The methodology will be presented as part of the draft work plan as outlined in the deliverables below. The Evaluation Team will be able to base their analysis on a variety of program implementation documents, as listed above, and other reports and program trackers.

The suggested methodology should include, but is not limited to:

- a) Key interviews with USAID/Afghanistan Democracy and Governance Office Staff, including the Senior Media Development Advisor, and field-based USG staff at Regional Platforms or Provincial Reconstruction Teams (PRTs);
- b) Interviews with implementing partner (Internews and sub-partner organizations) staff in Kabul;
- c) Interviews with key field-based-sub-grantee personnel, such as managers of the regional Nai hubs and Multi-Media Production Centers;

- d) Interviews and focus groups with selected beneficiaries including, but not limited to the following: media outlets, Nai, Salam Watandar, Multi-Media Production Centers, journalists, and listeners of the various media content;
- e) Interviews or focus groups with non-beneficiary Media Outlets (radio and television stations);
- f) A survey of randomly selected listeners and other beneficiaries; this may be sub-contracted, but contract approval must be obtained early in evaluation process to avoid delays in implementation;
- g) Direct observation of the Multi-Media Production Centers;
- h) Interviews with MoIC and MoCIT staff and also local partners.

Field work is suggested to include interviews in the areas with the highest concentration of activities, including Herat, Mazar-e-Sharif, Jalalabad, and Kandahar, security permitting.

## **X. REPORTING REQUIREMENTS AND DELIVERABLES**

**1. In-briefing:** The Evaluation Team, upon arrival to Afghanistan, shall meet the USAID/Afghanistan Office of Democracy and Governance (ODG) Team for introductions; presentation of the Team’s understanding of the assignments, initial assumptions, evaluation questions, etc.; discussion of initial work plan; and/or adjust SOW if necessary.

**2. Evaluation Work Plan:** The Evaluation Team shall provide an initial work plan prior to the arrival of international consultants in country, and the revised work plan 3 days after the in-briefing. The work plan will include the overall design strategy for the evaluation; (b) the methodology and data collection plan; (c) a list of the team members indicating which one will serve as the team leader and primary contact (an e-mail and phone contact for the team leader should be provided); and (d) the team’s schedule for the evaluation. The revised work plan shall include the lists of potential interviewees and sites to visit.

**3. Mid-term Briefing and Interim Meetings:** Hold a mid-term briefing with USAID on the status of the assessment including potential challenges and emerging opportunities. The team will also provide the ODG/AOTR and the Senior Media Development Advisor with periodic briefings and feedback on the team’s findings.

**4. Draft Evaluation Report:** Shall be consistent with the guidance provided in Section XI below. Length of the report: not to exceed 40 pages in English, excluding annexes in Times New Roman 12 point, single space, consistent with USAID branding policy. The report will address each of the issues identified in the SOW and any other factors the team considers to have a bearing on the objectives of the evaluation. Any such factors can be

included in the report only after consultation with USAID. **The draft evaluation per the below format will be submitted before the consultants depart Afghanistan.**

**5. Oral & PowerPoint Presentation/Briefing** to present key findings and recommendations to USAID. Conducted as agreed upon during the in-briefing sometime during the five days prior to departure.

**6. Final Evaluation Report** incorporates final comments from the ODG/AOTR and Senior Media Development Advisor. USAID comments are due within one week after the receipt of the final draft. The final report should be submitted to the ODG and Program Office-OPPD within one week of receipt of comments.

## **XI. FINAL REPORT FORMAT**

The evaluation report shall include the following:

1. Title Page
2. Table of Contents
3. List of any acronyms, tables, or charts (if needed)
4. Acknowledgements or Preface (optional)
5. Executive Summary
6. Introductory Chapter
  - a. A description of the project evaluated, including goals and objectives.
  - b. Brief statement on purpose of the evaluation, including a list of the main evaluation questions.
  - c. Brief statement on the methods used in the evaluation such as desk/document review, interviews, site visits, surveys, etc.
7. Findings: This section should describe the findings, focusing on each of the evaluation questions.
8. Conclusions: This section should include value statements drawn from the data gathered during the evaluation process.
9. Recommendations: This section should include actionable statements for ongoing programming and recommendations for the design and performance of future programming. It should also include recommended future objectives and types of activities based on lessons learned.
10. Annex
  - a. Statement of Work
  - b. Places visited; list of organizations and people interviewed
  - c. Methodology description
  - d. Copies of all survey instruments and questionnaires
  - e. Critical background documents

f. List of key documents reviewed

## ANNEX B: CONTACTS

Date	Entity	First Name	Last Name	Contact Title
2/1/2012	Internews Network	Marjorie	Rouse	SVP - Programs
2/1/2012	Internews Network	Dawn	Stallard	Program Officer - AF
2/8/2012	USAID	Adisa	Busuladzic	Outreach/Comms Officer
2/8/2012	USAID	Andrea	Sawka	Sr Media Advisor
2/8/2012	USAID	Asta	Zinbo	Media Team Lead
2/8/2012	USAID	Claudia	Pastor	Unknown
2/8/2012	USAID	Fatah Abdul	Mamnoon	AOTR
2/8/2012	USAID	Maggie	Rajala	OPPD ME Manager
2/8/2012	USAID	Sayed	Aqa	CTO Support
2/11/2012	Internews Kabul	Jan	McArthur	Chief of Party
2/11/2012	Internews Kabul	Susan	Angle	DCOP
2/11/2012	Internews Kabul	Zalmai	Ahadi	SW - Dep Ops Manager
2/13/2012	Nai	Abdul Mujeeb	Khalvatgar	Executive Director
2/13/2012	Internews Kabul	Craig	Twitt	NAI Consultant
2/13/2012	Internews Kabul	Mir Abdul Wahed	Hashimi	Media Law Enabling Advisor
2/13/2012	Internews Kabul	Mujtaba	Ayan	Sr. Program Manager
2/14/2012	AIBA	Aiuuddin	Bahodway	Admin Officer ML Comm
2/14/2012	AIBA	Karim	Amirzoi	President Media Law Comm
2/14/2012	Equal Access	Irfan	Younas	Country Director/Pak
2/14/2012	Equal Access	Dr. Anwar	Jamili	Counry Director
2/14/2012	Equal Access	Nasir	Shoaib	Admin & Finance Officer/Pak
2/14/2012	Equal Access	Ronnie	Goldfarb	President & CEO
2/14/2012	Equal Access	Zabiullah	Jalili	Office Manager/Sec Dir
2/14/2012	Internews Kabul	Adam	Levin	Director M&E/KM/Media Law
2/14/2012	Internews Kabul	Indu	Nepal	Dir. Youth Festival Project

2/14/2012	Internews Kabul	Safiullah	Ziai	Dep Dir Youth Festival
2/14/2012	Embassy	Jeanine	Collins	Dep Director Strat Com
2/14/2012	Embassy	Mark	Thornburg	Asst Information Officer
2/14/2012	Embassy	Rashmee Roshan	Lall	PAS Officer
2/15/2012	Internews Kabul	Javid	Hamdard	ICT Consultant to Min
2/15/2012	Internews Kabul	Najeebullah	Amiri	Chief Editor
2/16/2012	Deloitte	Oliver	Dziggel	Sr ICT Advisor
2/16/2012	ISAF	Beth	Bierden	Director T/C Advisory Team
2/16/2012	ISAF	Greg	Armentt	Spectrum Management
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Ali	Mohaqqeq	Program Officer
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Ali Mujtaba	Safari	TV Manager
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Fakhruddin	Yousufy	IT Manager
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Ian	MacWilliam	Program Advisor
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Khalilullah	Sadat	Sr. Technology Manager
2/16/2012	Internews Kabul	Mark	Timpany	Regional Tech/Training Adv
2/19/2012	MCIT	Muhammad Aimal	Marjan	Director General ICT
2/19/2012	MCIT - ATRA	Naqibullah	Sailab	Director of Spectrum Management Department
2/27/2012	Ariana Television	David	Reid	Senior Vice President
2/28/2012	Radio Rabea-e-Balkh	Mubina	Khairandish	Directress
2/29/2012	State/Mazar	Saeid	Jahesh	Public Diplomacy Assistant, Northern Region
2/29/2012	USAID/Mazar	Amy	Bruins	Field Program Officer
2/29/2012	USAID/Mazar	David	Strine	Field Program Officer
2/29/2012	USAID/Mazar	Mohammad	Zia	Deputy Field Program Officer
2/29/2012	Internews Kabul	Mohammad Samim	Quraishi	Sub Offices Coordinator
2/29/2012	Nai Hub/Mazar	Nooragha	Sharifi	Hub Manager
2/29/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Najib	Paikan	General Manager

2/29/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Naved	Sarosh	Advisor General Consultant
3/1/2012	Balkh Prov Gov't	Monir Ahmad	Farhad	Media Director & Spokesperson of Governor
3/1/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Leena	Rustayee	Unknown
3/1/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Parwan Sebat	Aria	Unknown
3/1/2012	Killid Group	Nazifa	Sadat	Producer/Anchor
3/1/2012	Nai Hub/Mazar	Mayam	Ghamgusar	Nai Trainer
3/1/2012	Radio Nehal	Saina	Safi	News Presenter
3/1/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Asilla	Sahil	News Director
3/1/2012	RZU TV/Radio	Fazila	Ariamal	Reporter
3/1/2012	TV/Radio Lahza	Fatana	Hassanzada	Reporter
3/1/2012	BBC & Print	Farkhanda	Rajabe	Reporter
3/1/2012	Mehr Radio TV	Zaman	Hosaini	Programming Manager
3/4/2012	WASSA	Hamidullah	Nasibi	Legal & Social Protection Coordinator
3/4/2012	Pamir Press	Zahra	Mosailby	Reporter/Editor
3/4/2012	Bakhter News/Tamina News	Wahida	Samady	Reporter/Editor
3/4/2012	Bakhter News Agency	Arezoo	Loudin	Reporter
3/4/2012	BBC/Radio Liberty	Stoary	Karimi	Reporter/Presenter
3/4/2012	Ariana Television	Waheedah	Ahrary	Producer/Presenter/Reporter
3/4/2012	Mihan TV	Elha	Khaleqi	Presenter/Reporter
3/4/2012	Freelance	Oranous	Honib	Producer/Journalist/Presenter
3/4/2012	Unknown	Paiez	-	Reporter
3/4/2012	Voice of Freedom Mag	Massoama	Hassan	Photo-Journalist
3/4/2012	Radio/TV Taraqi	Malali	Herway	Reporter
3/4/2012	Ariana Television	Fattana	Afandi	Presenter
3/4/2012	Radio Baraan	Hayatullah	Hamed	Manager
3/5/2012	Pajhwok	Danish	Karokil	Director & Editor-In-Chief
3/6/2012	Pahjwok	Naheed	Ferozi	Finance Manager

3/7/2012	Altai Consulting	Eric	Davin	Partner
3/7/2012	Altail Consulting	Adrian	Carriere	Consultant

## ANNEX C: METHODOLOGY

### 1. Overall Evaluation Approach

As clarified during the USAID In-briefing, the AMDEP Performance Evaluation had the following characteristics:

- It primarily examined the current AMDEP project, not prior USAID media activities.
- It was principally qualitative and did not repeat or synthesize quantitative information already provided in project reports and documents.
- The evaluators' professional views and experience conditioned normative judgments and recommendations; objectivity, balance and multiple sources conditioned factual observations.
- The evaluation was both retrospective and prospective.
- The evaluation did not focus on other donor or other USG media activities.
- Recommendations mainly refer to a planned 17-month extension of AMDEP activities.

### 2. Methodology and Data Collection Plan

Initial data were gathered by reviewing project documentation provided to the Evaluation Team by USAID and Internews. Program descriptions and modifications, annual work plans, quarterly reports, annual reports, the PMP and other M&E documents, the AMDEP sub-grants list, the USAID 2010 media assessment and other documents were read by the team.

On the ground first hand observations came from site visits. The team visited Mazar and Herat to observe and conduct interviews at local Nai hubs, multi-media centers and Salam Watandar radio stations.

The methodology of the evaluation sought qualitative information through individual key informant interviews, focus groups, and surveys. For most interviews and respondents, the following categories of questions were asked:

- Process questions concerning the effectiveness of AMDEP interventions, including how respondents became involved with AMDEP and with which AMDEP partner, what activities they participated in, when and for how long they have been involved with AMDEP, what kinds of AMDEP people and partners were involved, and what services were provided by AMDEP.
- Results questions about the benefits respondents received, including skills, knowledge, motivation, employment, improved job performance, and opportunities to network and help colleagues.
- Opinion questions asking respondents' views about the strengths and weaknesses of AMDEP, qualifications of AMDEP personnel, how well-suited AMDEP's services were to the respondents' professional needs and interests, whether AMDEP's materials were sufficiently intensive and clear, whether respondents enjoyed their experience with

AMDEP, and whether they would like to participate in other AMDEP activities in the future.

- Impact questions about how participating in AMDEP services affected (or did not affect) the respondents' competencies and job performance, how the performance of respondents' workplaces benefitted from employees' associations with AMDEP, and whether the media profession and industry are serving the country's needs more effectively as a result of AMDEP
- Recommendation questions about how AMDEP's services could be improved in the future, what additional future services are needed, how AMDEP might be streamlined and made more sustainable and what additional stakeholders might benefit from new AMDEP-type services in the future.

Information was gathered from respondents using the following approaches:

- Key Informant Interviews

The Evaluation Team developed develop semi-structured interviews enabling collection of data for a standard set of issues while also giving them the freedom to pursue new lines of questioning based in the respondent responses. Key informant interviews were be carried out with:

- Implementation leaders such as Internews component leaders
- Subject matter specialists such as technical assistance advisors
- Managers of partner organizations such as the Executive Director of NAI
- Government policymakers and regulators who have been supported in analyses of issues such as spectrum management
- Technical staff of Altai to get relevant statistical information.

These interviews were targeted to individuals, and questions were tailored to each specific informant, institution and activity.

- Focus Groups

The Evaluation Team organized informal focus groups with different categories of stakeholders to observe reactions and interactions regarding AMDEP-related issues. Focus groups were group interviews intended to elicit discussion, exchange of views, consensus, or a range of different opinions. Group interviews were organized among the following stakeholders:

- Women journalists
- Nai trainees
- Nai trainers
- Multi-media center staff
- Internet users at multi-media centers
- Nai alumni

- Surveys

Short written or oral surveys were administered to different AMDEP stakeholders. Email surveys were carried out with the following staff members of the 47 Salam Watandar radio stations:

- Technical and maintenance personnel
- Business development staff, station managers
- People with programming and journalistic responsibilities

Paper questionnaires were given to Nai trainees and MMC customers.

## ANNEX D: COPIES OF SURVEY INSTRUMENTS AND QUESTIONNAIRES

### 1. Interview Guides for Informant Interviews and Focus Groups

- MCC Customer Interview
- MCC Manager Interview
- Nai/Internews Trainer Interview
- Nai/Internews Trainee Interview
- Radio Journalist Interview
- Radio Technician Interview
- Radio Station Manager Interview

### 2. Email Survey of Salam Watandar Radio Stations

- Cover memo
- Station manager questionnaire
- Radio journalist questionnaire
- Radio technician questionnaire

### MCC Customer Interview Form

Person Interviewed:

Location:

Date:

	Question	Response
1	Please describe your use of the MMC	
1a	▪ How often?	
1b	▪ What services?	
2	How did you hear about the MMC?	
3	<b>Did you receive training? If so, please comment on:</b>	
3a	▪ Content of training	
3b	▪ Length of training	
3c	▪ Quality of training	
3d	▪ Usefulness of training	
4	Would you like to receive	

	additional training? If so, what subjects?	
5	Why is the MMC interesting and useful to you?	
6	What communication media technologies have you used at the MMC?	
7	Have you tried to produce any communication for groups or the public at the MMC?	
8	How do you see MMC services evolving in the future?	
9	How much would you be willing to pay to use the MMC?	

MMC Manager Interview Form

Person Interviewed:

Location:

Date:

Interviewer:

	Question	Response
1	Please briefly describe what you have achieved and learned during your time with the MMC project.	
2	<b>What training did you and your staff receive from the AMDEP project?</b>	
2a	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ People trained: number &amp; job responsibilities</li> </ul>	
2b	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Content of the training (skills &amp; knowledge)</li> </ul>	
2c	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Quality and suitability of the training</li> </ul>	
2d	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Utility of the training for MMC operations</li> </ul>	

3	<b>What equipment did the MMC receive from the AMDEP Project?</b>	
3a	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Quality and suitability of the equipment</li> </ul>	
3b	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Can the equipment be permanently maintained and operated by the MMC?</li> </ul>	
4	How adequate is the location of the MMC?	
5	How well does the sub-grant from Internews work?	
6	How has the MMC been promoted?	
7	What are the trends in use of the MMC?	
8	What sort of people are coming to the MMC? How many women? How many young people?	
9	What MMC services are most popular?	
10	What training does the MMC offer to its customers?	
11	Are any customers producing media communication for the public?	
12	Have you seen any examples of civic action using MMC resources?	
13	<b>Do you believe that the MMC can become self-financing by charging small fees to users?</b>	

13a	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ How much could be charged?</li> </ul>	
13b	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Would users object?</li> </ul>	
13c	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Would users stop using the MMC?</li> </ul>	
14	How do you see the MMC model evolving in the future?	
15	Do you believe that “new media” like MMC can make a difference in the development of Afghanistan and of this community?	
16	How many visitors to the MMC asked for journalism training?	

**Nai/Internews Trainer Interview Form**

Person Interviewed:

Location:

Date:

Interviewer:

1	History of your work as an AMDEP trainer	
2	Who are the trainees, how are they selected, what is their knowledge and experience?	
3	What is the training program you offer – length, materials, content, teaching method?	
4	What feedback is there –	

	attendance, class participation, grading or evaluation?	
5	What are the results after training – employment, improved performance, career advancement?	
6	Is there follow up training or mentoring?	
7	What are strengths and weaknesses of the training program?	
8	Is there demand or need for future training?	
9	Do you see prospects for fee-for-service training?	

**Nai Trainee Interview Form**

Person Interviewed:

Location:

Date:

Interviewer:

	Question	Response
1	Personal history of Nai training: When? What training?	
2	Quality of the training: materials, instructors, content	
3	Utility of the training – appropriate to trainee needs and workplace	

	needs	
4	The content – too advanced or rudimentary, too long or short, easy or hard	
5	Benefits of the training to the trainee – helped get employment, improved performance, career advancement	
6	Need for additional training in the future?	
7	Willingness to pay for training (by the trainee or the employer)?	
8	Suggestions for improving or expanding the Nai and Internews training	

**Journalist Interview Form**

Person Interviewed:

Location:

Date:

Interviewer:

	Question	Response
1	Please describe your work as a journalist.	
2	How many journalists work at [your workplace]?	
3	What training and experience do you have in journalism?	











a		
7 b	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Feedback?</li> </ul>	
7 c	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Community participation?</li> </ul>	
8	<b>Strengths &amp; weaknesses of AMDEP?</b>	
9	<b>Importance of radio for Afghan &amp; local development?</b>	

E-Survey of Salam Watandar Radio Stations

E-mail Cover Letter

To: Salam Watandar Station Managers

From: AMDEP Evaluation Team, USAID/SUPPORT Program

Subject: Evaluation of the Afghan Media and Development Project (AMDEP)

Cecchi Consulting has been contracted by USAID to do an evaluation of the AMDEP Project. One of the important components in the project is support for the Salam Watandar radio network. We are writing to request your assistance, as a Salam Watandar station manager, with questionnaires that will make an important contribution to our evaluation.

Our Evaluation Team will only be able to visit a few Salam Watandar radio stations. However we need information from as many of the stations as possible for our evaluation. Therefore, we

are sending by this email three different electronic questionnaires for people who work in your station. The questionnaires are for the following people:

- The station manager
- Technical and maintenance staff
- Reporters, writers, and journalists

We would greatly appreciate your assistance in getting the questionnaires to the right people, seeing that they are filled out, and returning them to us. Respondents are invited to add comments wherever they wish on the questionnaires. The more questionnaires we receive from various members of your staff, the better.

The questionnaires are included as attachments to this email. We hope that you will be able to copy and distribute them electronically and that respondents will be able to add their responses by creating a new document with their responses. This document can then be emailed back to us at ....

The responses to the questionnaires that we receive will be added together to make up an important part of our evaluation report. Respondents will not be individually identified either by name or by radio station. We ask you to respond frankly and honestly to these questions.

We greatly appreciate your assistance with this evaluation. Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have questions or comments.

**AMDEP Evaluation: E-Survey, Salam Watandar Radio Stations**

**Station Manager Questionnaire**

Please “save” the following questionnaire on your computer, type in your responses (the response box will expand automatically if you need more space), “save” again, and email the questionnaire with your responses to: [nnoori@hecchiconsulting.com](mailto:nnoori@hecchiconsulting.com)

	Question	Response	
1	How many years of experience do you have performing your job?	<input type="checkbox"/> 0-2	<input type="checkbox"/> 6-10
		<input type="checkbox"/> 3-5	<input type="checkbox"/> more than 10

	Have you personally received training from Nai or Internews? Did you receive any of the following kinds of training?	<input type="checkbox"/> business <input type="checkbox"/> business development <input type="checkbox"/> media sales <input type="checkbox"/> media marketing <input type="checkbox"/> traffic & scheduling <input type="checkbox"/> programming <input type="checkbox"/> audience research
2a	How would you rate the quality and relevance of the training you received?	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> Fairly good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
<input type="checkbox"/> 3	How many members of your station staff have received training from Nai or Internews?	<input type="checkbox"/> 0 <input type="checkbox"/> 6-10 <input type="checkbox"/> 1-2 <input type="checkbox"/> 11- 16 <input type="checkbox"/> 3-5 <input type="checkbox"/> over 16
3b	How would you rate the quality and relevance of the training?	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> Fairly good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
3c	Did staff performance improve as a result?	<input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> quite a lot <input type="checkbox"/> a little <input type="checkbox"/> a lot
3d	What additional training does your staff need? Indicate courses or skills.	1. _____ 2. _____ 3. _____
3e	Will you be able to pay for training in the future?	<input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> partially <input type="checkbox"/> yes
4	Do you have a business plan?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
5	Will your station be able to cover its expenses without support from AMDEP in the future?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> partly <input type="checkbox"/> no
6	How would you rate the equipment you received from AMDEP?	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> Fairly good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
7	How would you rate the technical assistance you received from AMDEP?	<input type="checkbox"/> Poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> Fairly good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
8	What one thing does your	

	station needs most to improve its operations, service to the community and quality of product in the next 18 months?	
9	What is your view of the importance of local radio in Afghanistan and in your community?	

Additional comments:

### **AMDEP Evaluation: E-Survey of Salam Watandar Radio Stations**

#### **Journalist Questionnaire**

Please “save” the following questionnaire on your computer, type in your responses (the response box will expand automatically if you need more space), “save” again, and email the questionnaire with your responses to: [nnoori@chechiconsulting.com](mailto:nnoori@chechiconsulting.com)

	Question	Response
1	How many years of experience do you have performing your job?	<input type="checkbox"/> 0-2 <input type="checkbox"/> 6-10 <input type="checkbox"/> 2-5 <input type="checkbox"/> more than 10
2	Have you personally received training from Nai or Internews? If so, which courses?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no 1. _____ 2. _____
3	How frequently do you apply the training you received?	<input type="checkbox"/> never <input type="checkbox"/> once a month <input type="checkbox"/> once a week <input type="checkbox"/> every day
4	What additional training would you like? Name skills or courses.	1. _____ 2. _____
5	Would you or the station be willing to pay for more training?	<input type="checkbox"/> no <input type="checkbox"/> partially <input type="checkbox"/> yes
6	Does your newsroom have “beat” (specialized) reporting?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
7	Are assignments permanent or rotating?	<input type="checkbox"/> permanent <input type="checkbox"/> rotating
8	If there is a rotation system, how long are assignments?	<input type="checkbox"/> 0-2 weeks <input type="checkbox"/> 2-4 weeks <input type="checkbox"/> more than 4 weeks
9	Do you have a daily editorial meeting?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no

10	Do you have the option of working directly with the News Director/Senior Editor?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
11	Do you have an Editor/Reporter [Producer/Reporter] system?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
12	Do you cooperate with any other News Outlets in your area?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
13	Do you make use of Pajhwok services	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
14	Do the Salam Watandar newscasts help you cover the news?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
15	What one thing does your News Room require to improve its operations, service to the community and quality of product in the next 18 months?	

Additional comments:

## AMDEP EVALUATION: E-Survey of Salam Watandar Radio Stations

### Technical Staff

Please “save” the following questionnaire on your computer, type in your responses (the response box will expand automatically if you need more space), “save” again, and send the questionnaire by return email with your responses to: [nnoori@checchiconsulting.com](mailto:nnoori@checchiconsulting.com).

	Question	Response
1	How many years of experience do you have performing your job?	<input type="checkbox"/> 0-2 years <input type="checkbox"/> 3-6 years <input type="checkbox"/> 5 or more years
2	What training have you received from Nai or Internews? (name courses)	1. _____ 2. _____ 3. _____ 4. _____
3	How frequently do you apply the training you have received?	<input type="checkbox"/> never <input type="checkbox"/> once a week  <input type="checkbox"/> once a month <input type="checkbox"/> every day
4	Would you take advanced training if you had to pay for it?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
5	Does your station have sufficient test equipment?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no

6	Do you have a complete set of tools to do your work?	<input type="checkbox"/> yes <input type="checkbox"/> no
7	How would you rate the training you received?	<input type="checkbox"/> poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
8	How would you rate the equipment you received?	<input type="checkbox"/> poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
9	How would you rate the technical support you received?	<input type="checkbox"/> poor <input type="checkbox"/> very good <input type="checkbox"/> good <input type="checkbox"/> excellent
10	What one thing does your station require most to improve its operations, service to the community, and quality of broadcast in the next 18 months?	

Additional comments:

## ANNEX E: AMDEP Evaluation Document List









- 2. General FGD PA.docx
- 3. Content FGD PA.docx
- 4. Non-users Questionnaire PA.docx
- 5. FGD Note-taking Sheet PA.docx
- 6. Data Entry Sheet PA.xlsx
- 7. Draft Report PA.docx
- ▼ 4. Research Manual
  - Audience Reserach Training Manual EN.docx
  - Audience Reserach Training Manual PA.docx
- ▼ 5. Completion report
  - AMDEP Audience Training report.docx
- ▼ Business Development materials online
  - 8CB - Pro Forma Bus Plan - Dec 02.doc
  - CIMA-Business\_Model - 08-22-11.pdf
  - General - Pro Forma Bus Plan - Dec 02.doc
  - Grants manual\_28nov11.doc
  - Internews Sales and Marketing Tool Kit Matrix 23Jun11.docx
  - Internews2011-09\_StartingALocalRadioStation.pdf
  - Strategic Communications Tools Matrix\_JM\_Nov09.docx
  - Strategic Planning Outline - Jan McArthur.doc
  - Voice Pro Forma Bus Plan - Dec 021.doc
- ▼ Business training (2006-08)
  - Business training manual - module 3.doc
  - New BD Curricullm complete.doc
  - Diploma in Media Syllabus NMI FinalDec2011.doc
  - MediaSalesEssentialManual1.docx
  - Nai-NMI transition timeline 29oct11.xlsx
  - Nai-NMI transition workplan Jun-Aug 2011.docx
  - NAImediaInstituteplan.pptx
  - NMI business planning and research.docx
  - NMI Revenue Budget.xlsx
- ▼ Sales and Marketing training materials
  - ▼ Handouts
    - HO Sales.doc
    - HO Advertisements that create a call to action.doc
    - HO Basic market survey terms.doc
    - HO Case study answers.doc
    - HO Case study Selling Advertsising.doc









- Radio Naw Bahar-e-Balkh.jpg
- Radio Rabi-e-Balkhee address.jpg
- Radio Sada-e-Jawan Herat Uni Station.jpg
- Regulatory Package English.zip
- Regulatory Package\_Dari.zip
- Sada-e-Jawan Map.jpg
- Sada-e-Jawan Map1.jpg
- Salam Watandar Clients 2011.docx
- Strategic Communications Tools Matrix\_JM\_Nov09.docx
- Strategic Planning Outline – Jan McArthur.doc
- SW 9 Month Transition Plan\_Feb to Oct 2012.docx
- SW Functions Chart 2011.pdf
- SW Partner Stations list, details – Feb 2012.xls
- SW Transition Summary Jan 2012.xlsx
- SW Work Plan Feb – end April 2012.docx
- Technical Team\_ Partner Stations\_help line.xls
- The State of Telecom and Internet in Afghanistan at a Glance.pdf
- ▼ Tool Kit Dari
  - 2. General FGD DA.docx
  - 3. Content FGD DA.docx
  - 6. Data Entry Sheet DA.xlsx
  - 7. Draft Report DA.docx
- ▼ Tool Kit English
  - 3. Content FGD EN.docx
  - 7. Draft Report EN.docx
- ▼ Tool Kit Pashto
  - 2. General FGD PA.docx
  - 3. Content FGD PA.docx
  - 7. Draft Report PA.docx
- Voice Pro Forma Bus Plan – Dec 021.doc
- Wassa Map New.jpg
- 3 Mo WorkPlan.xls
- ▼ 3.6.12 Dump
  - AMDEP Supporting an Enabling Media Law and Media Regulatory Environment.docx
  - Evaluator Meeting Schedule\_JM\_3March12.docx
- ▼ Nai Bus Dev & M'ment
  - AMDEP CAPACITY BUILDING IN SUSTAINABILITY OF MEDIA PARTNERS\_22Feb12.docx
  - Nai Bus Dev & M'ment.zip

- ▼ Nai Media Sustainability Efforts
  - ▼ Audience research toolkit
    - AMDEP Audience Training report.pdf
    - ▼ Audience Reserach Training Deliverables – Final
      - ▶ 1. TOT Manual
      - ▶ 2. Training Slides
      - ▶ 3. Tool Kit
      - ▶ 4. Research Manual
      - ▶ 5. Completion report
  - ▼ Business Development materials online
    - 8CB – Pro Forma Bus Plan – Dec 02.doc
    - CIMA–Business\_Model – 08–22–11.pdf
    - General – Pro Forma Bus Plan – Dec 02.doc
    - Grants manual\_28nov11.doc
    - Internews Sales and Marketing Tool Kit Matrix 23Jun11.docx
    - Internews2011–09\_StartingALocalRadioStation.pdf
    - Strategic Communications Tools Matrix\_JM\_Nov09.docx
    - Strategic Planning Outline – Jan McArthur.doc
    - Voice Pro Forma Bus Plan – Dec 021.doc
  - ▼ Business training (2006–08)
    - Business training manual – module 3.doc
    - New BD Curricullm complete.doc
    - Diploma in Media Syllabus NMI FinalDec2011.doc
    - MediaSalesEssentialManual1.docx
    - Nai–NMI transition timeline 29oct11.xlsx
    - Nai–NMI transition workplan Jun–Aug 2011.docx
    - NAlmedialnstituteplan.pptx
    - NMI business planning and research.docx
    - NMI Revenue Budget.xlsx
  - ▼ Sales and Marketing training materials
    - ▶ Handouts
    - ▶ M & E Questions
  - ▼ Station management course materials
    - MediaManagementSmallStationFINALENG.doc
    - PowerPoints.zip
    - Quizzes & M&E.zip
  - Steve Ahern Nai Media Institute Report and Recommendations.pdf



-  Media Watch Report 78.pdf
-  Report Gender Lessons Learned 2010 – 2012.pdf
-  SW Affiliated Stations list Feb 2012.pdf
-  SW Provincial Radio Network.png
-  USAID-AMDEP Success Stories and Press Releases.pdf
-  Business training manual – module 3.doc
-  Cedomir draft report.doc
-  Cedomir Final Report.doc
-  Evaluator Meeting\_Schedule\_JM\_21Feb12\_.docx
-  Evaluator's Portfolio (Dick & Bill)- Feb 13.pdf
-  Final Report Annex 1.doc
-  INEWS ROSTER.xls
-  Internews Afghanistan Gender Feb 2012.pdf
-  Internews AMDEP NCE 3 MTH Workplan\_FebApr\_Resubmitted\_18Feb12.xls
-  Internews AMDEP Q4 Report\_30Sept11\_FINAL.pdf
-  Internews AMDEP QTR Report No 5 – 31Dec11\_Submitted 31Jan12.pdf
-  Internews Gender Successes & Lessons Learned\_FM\_2Jan11.pdf
-  Internews Supported FM Radio Expansion 2003–2011.pdf
-  Internews\_AMDEP TECH\_Proposal – FINALrevised 0209201(1).docx
-  Investigative reporting course outline.doc
-  Journalism essential course.docx
-  Media Watch Annual Report.pdf
-  Media Watch Report 73.pdf
-  Media Watch Report 68.pdf
-  Media Watch Report 78.pdf
-  MediaSalesEssentialManual1.docx
-  New BD Curricullm complete.doc
-  Partner & Program Overview – Ext Evaluation\_Feb 2012[1].docx
-  Radio Journalism.docx
-  Radio Naw Bahar-e-Balkh.jpg
-  Radio package production.doc
-  Radio Rabi-e-Balkhee adres.jpg
-  Radio Sahar\_Herat map.jpg
-  Regulatory Package Eglsh.zip
-  Regulatory Pakage\_Dari.zip
-  Salam Watandar Stations TX-tower info.pdf
-  SW Affiliated Stations list Feb 2012.pdf
-  SW Partner Radio\_Technical Summary\_09-Feb-12 Mujtaba.xlsx

- SW Provincial Radio Network.png
- SW Provincial Sringers Trained.xlsx
- SW Rundown.xls
- SW Station List.xls
- SW Trainees Women's Program.xlsx
- Tech Roster SW.xls
- untitled.xls
- Updated I/N Roster 2.18.xls
- USAID Internews Local Radio Fix It Program\_3Jan12\_JM.docx
- USAID-AMDEP Success Stories and Press Releases.pdf
- Video Journalism essentials.docx
- Wassa Map New.jpg
- AMDEP report outline 3.8.12.docx
- AMDEP report outline.docx
- AMDEP Sched 25 Feb-2 Mar.pdf
- Billz Travel Grid\_R6.xls.pdf
- case\_study\_c\_and\_e\_alam\_radio.pdf
- ▶ Checchi Kabul Stuff
- ▶ Checchi Templates
- CIMA-Afghanistan - 02-23-12.pdf
- Component 1 Template.docx
- DAI Survey Results.docx
- ▼ From USAID
  - Nai Media Institute Sustainability Report and Recommendations.pdf
  - Afghan Media in 2010 - Executive Summary.pdf
  - Afghanistan gender report final edits 11-01-11 for Mission review.pdf
  - Afghanistan--Licensing Assessment (final-26 Apr 2011).pdf
  - Altai Full Report Afghan Media in 2010.pdf
  - AMDEP PMP and Indicators Baseline Research Findings- 11 Feb.doc
  - AMDEP PMP\_ Revised - FINLA - 25 June 2011.doc
  - AMDEP Q1 final report.doc
  - AMDEP Q2 final report.docx
  - AMDEP Q3 final report.pdf
  - AMDEP Q4 final report.pdf
  - AMDEP Q5 (FY12 Q1) final report.pdf
  - AMDEP Q5 (FY12 Q1) final report(1).pdf
  - AMDEP Workplan Final - 3 March 2001.xls
  - AMDEP\_Baseline Report\_July 2011.pdf

- amdep\_rfa.doc
- Amendment 1\_RFA AMDEP.pdf
- Amendment\_1\_RFP\_306-10-0031.pdf
- Balkh Media ready for book.docx
- Cooperative Agreement-306-A-00-06-00519-00-PACT-2006-2009.pdf
- Earlier Media Support from 2001-2pdf.pdf
- Herat Media for book.docx
- Internews AMDEP NCE 3 MTH Workplan\_1 Feb - 30 April\_Submitted\_7Feb11.xls
- Internews Partner Radio Stations List\_20Dec.xlsx
- Internews\_AMDEP TECH\_Proposal - FINALrevised 0209201.docx
- List & contact of Sub-grantees AMDEP .docx
- MMPC contacts.docx
- Nai hub contact information.docx
- NCE work plan - FINAL-Nov 2011- 31Jan 2012\_ Submitted 29 Nov 2011- FINAL.txt
- NCE work plan - FINAL-Nov 2011- 31Jan 2012\_ Submitted 29 Nov 2011- FINAL.xls
- Panjshir Media ready for book.docx
- Radio party Invitation.pdf
- SW\_Map\_table.pdf
- UPDATED Salam Watandar Partner Stations - list, 2012.xls
- USAIDEvaluationPolicy.pdf
- USIP\_Afghanistan\_Media\_Assessment.pdf

**ANNEX F: PROGRAM GUIDE**

**SW weekly Broadcasting Schedule Updated Feb-04-2012 (7:00 am-9:00pm)**

<b>Time</b>	<b>Saturday</b>	<b>Sunday</b>	<b>Monday</b>	<b>Tuesday</b>		<b>Wednesday</b>	<b>Thursday</b>	<b>Friday</b>	<b>Time</b>
7:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	Introducing prog. & music	7:00					
7:05	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements/m	7:05
7:08	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	usic	7:08
7:45	Weekly Interview	Chara Johie(Fix-it)	Hawa(Women Stations)	Weblogistan	Advertisements /musics	Ghorchan (R.statoinis pro)	Life's stories	Bola Banna - 7:30am	7:45
8:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	8:00
8:05	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements /music	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	8:05
8:08	Women's Mirror	Darseman (My school)	Children Radio	Women's Mirror		Afghanistan & Economy	Khana-i-Atfal (Kids)	Porsupal (call in)	8:08
8:30	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access programs	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	8:30
9:30	Equall Access programs	Equall Access programs	Equall Access programs	9:30					
10:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	10:00					

10:05	Advertisements/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	Advertisements/music	10:05
10:30	Report	Report	Report	Report	Report	Report	Report	Report	Report	10:30
10:15	Zarpakhawra BBC	The Paney bol mokh	Mashom (Children City)	Atal Qaher (Disabled)		Lobey (Sport)	Lobey (Sport)	Mashom ano(children)		10:15
10:30	Gape Dehqan(Farmers' speech)	Nasle Omid(Youths)	Rahe Qaria (Agriculture)	Nasle Omid(youths)	Musics	Rahe Qaria Agriculture	Nasle Omid(Youths)	Sports		10:30
10:45	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	10:45
11:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	11:00
11:05	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	11:05
11:30	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Parwaze...(Children)	Kids Radio		11:30
11:45	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	11:45
12:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	12:00
12:05	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	12:05

							ic	sic	
12:08	Sazha (Musics & Advertises)	The Paney Bol	12:08						
12:30								Media Watch report	12:30
13:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	13:00
13:05	Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music	13:05						
13>08	Deen Dunya (PACTprogram )	The Haqdivi	Rahe Haq/ Haqlara	Atal Qaher (Disabled)	Advertisements /musics	The Haqdivi	Deen Dunya (PACTprogram )	Deen Dunya (PACTprogram )	13>08
13:30	Musics/Advertisements	Musics/Advertisements	Musics/Advertisements	Musics/Advertisements		Musics/Advertisements	Musics/Advertisements	Musics/Advertisements	13:30
14:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	14:00
14:05	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Porsupal	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	14:05
14:08	Weekly Interview	Chara Johie(Fix-it)	Hawa(WomenStations)	Weblogistan		Ghorchan(R.stat oins pro)	Life's stories	Atrang	14:08
14:30	Onay maraka(Interview)	Gapedehqan(Farmers')	Juawara Katana	Atal Qaher (Disabled)		Puli puri (PACT Pro.)	Puli puri (PACT Pro.)	Puli puri (PACT Pro.)	14:30
14:45	Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music		Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music	Advertisment/music	14:45

							ic	sic	
15:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	15:00
15:05	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	Advertisement/music	15:05
15:08	Dagologh oncha live infarm.	Lobi sportman live	Mashalona phisicology	Zarinmazdigar litterature		Lobey (Sportman live)	Dagologh oncha info.	Zune aw zuwand	15:08
16:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin		News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	16:00
16:05	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements		Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	16:05
16:08	Women's Mirror	Darse man (school)	Kids Radio	Women's Mirror		Afghanistan Economy	Life's stories	Nasle Omid (4:05)	16:08
16:30	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access programs	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	Equall Access pro.	16:30
18:00	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	News Bulletin	Advertisement/music	18:00
18:05	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	Advertisements	music	Advertisements	Advertisements	Haft Roze (Round Table)	18:05
18:30	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Bakhabar	Story from a village	18:30
19:00	Nasle	Raheqaria(Agri)	Nasle	Raheqaria(Agri)	Advertisements	Nasle	Sports	Gape	19:00

0	Omid(Youths)	culture)	Omid(Youths)	ulture)	/musics	Omid(Youths)		Dehqan (Farmers')	
19:30	Women's Mirror	Call in, Musics & advertisement	Call in, Musics & advertisement	Women's Mirror		Call in, Musics & advertisement	Rah-e-Haq/music	Media Watch Rep/musics	19:30
20-21	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Saz (Music & Advertizes)	Porsopal & musics	20:00 - 20:30

**ANNEX G: DAI SURVEY**  
**DAI ASI-East Program**

**E-Interview 3.7.12**  
**Respondent: Acting Chief of Party**

All questions were sent in an email, this is a copy/paste of that email. Original email is available upon request.

Under what USAID sector is your water/energy/environment program?

- Our program is a stabilization program

Has your project used local Afghan media for outreach, promotion or advertising?

- Yes

If so, was it part of the initial SOW or an add-on?

- Part of the initial SOW

Have you used radio?

- Yes

Have you used TV?

- No

Have you used Print?

- Yes

Was there continuity between mediums; did a radio spot support and connect to a TV spot or print ad?

- Yes

Do you have a cyber [web] presence?

- No

Did you use SMS technology?

- Yes

If you used radio, who did the creative work [writing/producing]?

- CSOs that we funded and firms we recruited (list below)

If you used TV, who did the creative work [writing/producing]?

- N/A

If you were in print, who did the design work?

- Firms we recruited (list below)

Regardless of medium used, did you hire out for a media plan and media purchase [buy time]?

- Yes

Regardless of medium used, would you say that media outreach had an acceptable level of ROI?

- It is key to the success of our programs

Which medium selected by your project worked the best?

- Radio

Have you attempted a market penetration outside of Kabul?

▪ We only work in very difficult districts, mostly along the border with Pakistan  
If so, which cities/provinces?

▪ Nangarhar, Kunar, Paktika, Khost, Ghazni, and also Uruzgan and Wardak  
If so, which mediums did you use in each area?

- Radio

Lastly, could give me the names of the media outlets that you worked with, any media planning or media placement firms, or ad agencies that you may have worked with during this period.

- The Star Group, Moby Group, Awaz and Sayara

And also at the beginning of the program: Cetena and Equal Access

- Cetena and Equal Access