



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

**USAID COMMUNITY STABILIZATION
PROGRAM (CSP) COUNTERINSURGENCY
(COIN): REPORT ON COMMUNITY
INFRASTRUCTURE AND ESSENTIAL
SERVICES PROJECTS IN RAMADI AND
FALLUJA**

May 8, 2008

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by International Business & Technical Consultants, Inc., with assistance from -----, Baghdad, Iraq.

USAID COMMUNITY STABILIZATION PROGRAM (CSP) COUNTERINSURGENCY (COIN): REPORT ON COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES PROJECTS IN FALLUJA AND RAMADI



International Business & Technical Consultants, Inc.
Monitoring and Evaluation Performance Program, Phase II (MEPP II)
8614 Westwood Center Drive
Suite 400
Vienna, VA 22182

Contracted under 267-C-00-05-00508-00

DISCLAIMER

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION..... 6

BACKGROUND..... 6

METHODOLOGY..... 7

PROJECT IDENTIFICATION 7

SURVEY SUMMARY 9

 Project Accomplishments and Challenges 9

 Completed Projects..... 9

 Ongoing Projects. 26

GENERAL QUESTIONS FOR PROJECT MANAGERS AND SITE USERS 29

RECOMMENDATIONS..... 46

ANNEXES

ANNEX A. MEPP II MONITORING BACKGROUND..... 47

ANNEX B. IRD RESPONSE TO THE ANBAR CIES MONITORING 49

ANNEX C. FIELD MONITOR DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENT FOR COMPLETED PROJECTS..... 52

ANNEX D. FIELD MONITOR DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS FOR ONGOING PROJECTS. 63

ANNEX E. TRANSLATED FIELD MONITOR SITE VISIT REPORTS..... 69

List of Acronyms

AC	Advisory Committee
AoR	Area of Responsibility (of IPs)
CA	Cooperative Agreement
CIES	Community Infrastructure and Essential Services
CSP	Community Stabilization Program
EGY	Employment Generation and Youth
IBTCI	International Business & Technical Consultants, Inc.
IP	Implementing Partner
IR	Intermediate Result
IRD	International Relief and Development
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MEPP II	Monitoring and Evaluation Performance Program, Phase II
MOI	Ministry of the Interior
MOLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs
N/D	No Data
PMP	Performance Management Plan
PC	Provincial Council
PRT	Provincial Reconstruction Team
RFA	Request for Application
SO	Strategic Objective
SOW	Scope of Work
TA	Technical Assistance
US	United States
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USG	United States Government

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The International Relief and Development (IRD) Community Infrastructure and Essential Services (CIES) component of the Community Stabilization Program (CSP) implements projects to provide job opportunities, improve the cleanliness of public spaces, repair damage from terrorist attacks, renovate and construct schools and recreational facilities and provide equipment and supplies to create positive change in community perceptions, opportunities and services. International Business & Technical Consultants, Inc. (IBTCI) implements the USAID-funded Monitoring and Evaluation Performance Program, Phase II (MEPP II), which has been tasked to monitor USAID projects. IBTCI utilizes [REDACTED] [REDACTED] to supply full-time field monitors and regional field monitor team leaders.

Monitoring of CIES projects in Anbar province began on September 22, 2007 in Falluja and was completed on November 15, 2007 in Ramadi. This was the third round of monitoring activities to be conducted by IBTCI of CIES activities. A total of 42 projects were successfully monitored – 24 in Ramadi and 18 in Fallujah. Thirty-five of these projects were completed at the time of the monitoring visits while seven were on-going projects. The instrument used by the field monitors, initially developed by IRD for internal monitoring of CIES projects, was augmented by IBTCI to include questions related to project impact. The monitoring instruments (Annex B) were utilized to solicit information on project accomplishments, obstacles to implementation, site usage levels and program participant perceptions of the projects' utility and potential areas for improvement. An additional series of questions was added to the instrument for both project managers and the group interviews to address changes in security, local services and other areas of interest at the project planning and Strategic Objective level.

Findings of the monitoring visits include:

- Of the 35 completed CIES projects that were monitored, 32 were in use at the time of the assessment and all of these were being utilized for their intended purpose.
- Three of the 35 completed projects were not in use at the time of monitoring, two of these despite the passage of a month or more since the completion of the project.
- All of the construction projects were of acceptable quality according to the monitors' assessments.
- All seven of the monitored ongoing projects were being constructed according to the Bills of Quantity (BoQs) and to appropriate standards of quality
- Site users and beneficiaries reported that 33 of the 35 monitored completed projects were properly maintained and met their needs.
- For the 33 user groups that confirmed the project had made a positive difference in their lives, these included the psychological benefits of a cleaner city, a better educational environment for students and teachers, increased opportunities for sporting events and improved transportation.
- More than 200,000 Iraqis benefit from these projects on a weekly basis according to project managers' reports. Most of these figures could not be verified due to a lack of records for many of the projects. This is not necessarily a project short

coming as many CIES projects, such as street cleaning projects, would not have records for site users.

- Security concerns were the main potential obstacles to project sustainability identified by respondents and monitors.
- For the six of the seven on-going projects that were behind schedule, all were delayed due to difficulties in transporting materials and equipment through checkpoints.
- Beneficiaries and monitors highlighted the need for their municipalities to do a better job of meeting their needs and supporting the efforts of CIES projects by providing regular, dependable services to replace one-off cleaning campaigns and maintain public parks.
- All of the project managers and twenty-five of the twenty-seven site user groups that were interviewed reported that they were more hopeful about the future as a result of the projects.
- Two-thirds of the project managers and half of site user groups indicated that local services had improved in the past six months while 100% of both groups reported that security had improved in the same time period.
- Twenty-two of the thirty-four project managers interviewed expressed their belief that such projects make people less likely to engage in the type of conflict that is dividing Iraq while only seven of the twenty-seven site user groups felt the same way.

The analysis of this survey has led the MEPP II team to make several recommendations for CIES activities:

- IRD should pay particular attention to project FJ-CIES-0004, whose respondent indicated that the project is in substandard condition from a maintenance perspective.
- IRD should follow-up with RA-CIES-0036 to ensure that the maintenance staff have adequate skills to maintain the general climate control and generation equipment as well as the potentially more sophisticated medical equipment provided by the project.
- IRD should also follow-up with the other five projects that did not report having staff responsible for maintenance to see if maintenance responsibility has been established since the time of the assessment.
- Follow-up RA-CIES-0008 and FJ-CIES-0014, two projects that, although completed for at least a month, were not yet in use at the time of the monitoring visits.
- Follow-up RA-CIES-0014 to identify a solution to what appears to be a lack of either municipal or community ownership and support for this public park project that has been neglected.
- Ensure that project planning includes adequate advance planning and partnership with municipal authorities and local actors to help support the successful transfer of project responsibility and maintenance to the appropriate groups.
- Partner with LGP II and other projects that are working to build the capacity of local governments to encourage municipal ownership and follow-up of appropriate CIES projects. High-quality, sustainable municipal services are unlikely to develop as long as less appropriate groups are filling the gap and projects should use their on-going project implementation activities as local capacity building opportunities wherever possible.

- CIES program staff should consider working with the PRTs to assist in facilitating the movement of essential supplies and equipment where checkpoints impede the timely flow of vehicles.

MONITORING SELECTED COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES ACTIVITIES FROM THE COMMUNITY STABILIZATION PROGRAM¹

Introduction

The International Relief and Development (IRD) Community Infrastructure and Essential Services (CIES) component of the Community Stabilization Program (CSP) implements projects to provide job opportunities, improve the cleanliness of public spaces, repair damage from terrorist attacks, renovate and construct schools and recreational facilities and provide equipment and supplies to create positive change in community perceptions, opportunities and services. All of these activities are intended to help provide a sense of stability to communities suffering from the destruction, upheaval and uncertainty that accompany the cycle of conflict and sectarianism that currently challenges Iraq.

Background

International Business & Technical Consultants, Inc. (IBTCI) implements the USAID funded Monitoring and Evaluation Performance Program, Phase II (MEPP II). Under MEPP II, IBTCI has been tasked to provide field monitors to assist USAID to monitor projects it cannot otherwise reach. IBTCI entered into a subcontract agreement with [REDACTED] to supply full-time field monitors and regional field monitor team leaders. This agreement was approved in March 2006.

In April 2007, the Strategic Objective (SO) 7 team requested that IBTCI begin on-going monitoring of the CSP. The history of previous monitoring as well as IRD's program may be found in Annex A. Monitoring results from the CIES for two cities in Anbar Province, Ramadi and Falluja, are the subject of this report.

Based on contacts established during previous rounds of CSP monitoring, IBTCI project staff finalized the sampled list of projects on September 12, 2007 and IBTCI monitors established contact with local CSP project staff on September 16. Close communication and coordination with local mobilizers is essential to allow the field monitors to safely access the projects. IBTCI and IRD agreed that the monitors would follow standardized procedures for each visit. This procedure established an initial IRD point of contact (POC), as well as a POC from IBTCI. It should be noted that while IRD mobilizers are essential in providing access to the project sites and beneficiary interviews, they should excuse themselves during the course of the actual interview as their presence could bias the responses of those surveyed.

¹ Names of some organizations and people have been removed for security reasons.

Monitoring of CIES projects began in Falluja on September 22, 2007 and on October 21, 2007 in Ramadi. Data collection was delayed in Ramadi due to the temporary closing of IRD offices as the result of the assassination of a prominent local religious figure. Data collection was completed in Ramadi on November 15, 2007. This was the third round of monitoring activities to be conducted by IBTCI of CIES activities. A 100% sample of completed and ongoing projects in the two cities was selected for monitoring. The initial sample of forty-four projects was broken down into thirty-six completed and eight ongoing projects. Due to security barriers, two of the completed projects in Falluja could not be reached for monitoring. Additionally, over the course of the monitoring period, two of the ongoing projects reached completion, resulting in their transfer to the completed projects column. The final sample included a total of 42 projects that were successfully monitored over the course of the collection period – 24 in Ramadi and 18 in Fallujah. Thirty-five of these projects were completed at the time of the monitoring visits while seven were still on-going projects.

Methodology

The data collection instruments used by the field monitors were initially developed by IRD for their internal monitoring of CIES projects. IBTCI augmented these instruments to include questions related to project impact. The instruments were divided into three main parts consisting of an interview instrument with project implementers or managers, a group discussion with project beneficiaries and an assessment of project quality and implementation by the [REDACTED] monitor. An additional series of questions were added to the instrument for both project managers and the group interviews to address changes in security, local services and other areas of interest at the project planning and Strategic Objective level.

Project managers were asked to provide monitors, where available, with project records detailing site usage and to give their perceptions on aspects of the project including maintenance needs and training as well as potential barriers to project sustainability with concomitant proposed solutions.

Groups of site users and beneficiaries were asked about their satisfaction with and suggestions for project maintenance, whether the project met their needs and how it could be improved as well as questions about potential obstacles to sustainability and proposed solutions. As a result of the non-random nature of the participant selection process and the often small number of interviewees, data from these group discussions should be considered as anecdotal.

Project Identification

Table 1. Monitored CIES Projects

Project Code	Project Title	City	District	Status
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed

Project Code	Project Title	City	District	Status
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Qatana	Completed
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	All	Completed
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	West Central	Completed
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	West Central	Completed
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Completed
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	West Central	Completed
FJ-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jolan	Completed
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Shorta	Completed
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Mualameen	Completed
FJ-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jolan	Completed
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jolan	Completed
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Shorta	Completed
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jolan	Completed
FJ-CIES-0010	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jubail	Completed
FJ-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Shuhada	Completed
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Nazal	Completed
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Saqlawiyah	Completed
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Saqlawiyah	Completed
FJ-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	All	Completed
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	All	Completed
FJ-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Zawia	Completed
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Jubail	Completed
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Regional	Completed
RA-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Ongoing
RA-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Ongoing
RA-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Ongoing
RA-CIES-0026	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Ongoing
RA-CIES-0034	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	West Central	Ongoing
RA-CIES-0037	[REDACTED]	Ramadi	Shamea	Ongoing
FJ-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	Fallujah	Mualameen	Ongoing

Beneficiaries and managers of the projects were interviewed at project sites after monitors were led to them by IRD staff mobilizers.

Findings from the monitors' site visits and interviews are summarized in the tables below. The tables are summaries of the questions asked in the field visit instruments shown in Annex B and C.

The translated individual reports from the field monitors are attached in Annex D. The individual reports are summarized in the next section of this report. After the initial field monitoring of CSP, which was completed on November 15, 2007, project monitors were asked to revisit some of the sites where there was a lack of clarity in the initial reports or to seek additional information. This process delayed finalization of the data from the instruments until the end of December 2007.

Survey Summary

Project Accomplishments and Challenges

Projects monitored for this report fall under one of five categories: cleaning campaigns; equipment and supplies; building rehabilitation; new building construction; and park development. The cleaning campaign projects can be characterized as rapid CIES start-up projects intended to generate short-term employment opportunities in the target communities. The other projects included simple transport of electrical grid components to the rehabilitation of primary schools to the construction of health clinics. All CIES projects are intended to both produce local employment as well as providing improved infrastructure for use by citizens. As detailed in the survey results below, most project managers and site users were positively impacted by the projects that they participated in and benefited from, even if many of them did not feel that government services in general had improved substantially over the previous six months.

Table 2. CIES Project Types

Type of Project	Completed	Ongoing	Total Completed and Ongoing
Cleaning Campaign	8	0	8
Equipment and Supplies	2	0	2
Building Rehabilitation	12	2	14
New Building Construction	4	5	8
Park Development	9	0	9
Total	35	7	42

Nearly all of the projects were regarded by the community as successful based on their responses to questions about the projects meeting their needs and their satisfaction with maintenance. Two of the completed projects had negative responses in these areas. Findings from the monitor's site visits are summarized in the tables below. The tables are summaries of the questions asked in the field visit instruments shown in the annexes.

Completed Projects

Table 3 below summarizes completed project utilization. Of the 32 completed projects that were in use, all were being utilized as intended.

Table 3. Current Use of Project Site

Response	QI.6: Is the site being used?	QI.7: Is the site being used for its intended purpose?
Yes	32	32
No	3	0
Total	35	32

Three of the monitored projects were not in use at the time of the monitoring visit despite having been completed and handed over to the recipient organizations. The delay between the completion of the project and the monitoring visit was around one month for RA-CIES-0008, two weeks for RA-CIES-0025 and a month and a half for FJ-CIES-0014. While the lack of grass may be understandable for RA-CIES-0025 due to the short duration of time since completion, the other two projects should be followed-up by CSP monitors to see if they can facilitate the process of bringing these two projects to a useable and useful state.

Table 4. Reasons for Non-use of Project Sites

Project Code	Project Title	QI.8: Why is the project not in use?
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	There is no furniture in the new building and they have not received the keys to the building from the Presidency of the University despite the fact that the project has been handed over to the university.
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	The grass hasn't grown up enough in the soccer field
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	The grass is not completely grown in the playground yard

Maintenance

A series of questions were asked of respondents concerning project maintenance. These questions are part of the instrument in order to assess a crucial component of project sustainability: the preparation of a maintenance plan for ensuring that investments in development are durable.

When asked if maintenance would be needed for their projects, project managers indicated that 11 of the 35 projects required maintenance in their view (Table 5 below).

Table 5. Is Maintenance Required for the Project?

Response	QII.1: Is maintenance required?
Yes	11
No	24
Total	35

Detailed responses for why maintenance is not required for completed projects is presented in Table 6 below. Based on the responses, the question was understood by many respondents as referring primarily to immediate maintenance needs. For many of the projects that presumably would require maintenance such as primary school

rehabilitation and construction, respondents indicated that no maintenance was needed at the present time because the project was recently completed. While it may be understandable for cleaning campaigns, which are intended as one-off quick employment projects, this may indicate a lack of advanced planning, preparation and ownership for these projects by local beneficiaries. In addition, while park and stadium maintenance may not be especially difficult, someone must water, cut and fertilize the grass and plants, change light bulbs, sweep walkways, paint benches and other such tasks that make a park a lasting community resource. The monitoring process did not include a review of project proposals and other documents that may include sustainability assessments and/or maintenance plans. IBTCI will modify this question in future assessments to ensure that the timeframe of maintenance requirements is addressed in a fashion that maximizes the utility of the responses.

Table 6. Why is Maintenance Not Required?

Project Code	Project Title	Q11.1: Why is maintenance not required?
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is not required now
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is necessary for the future but it is not required in the mean time because the building is brand new
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is not required in the mean time but it will need maintenance in the future
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	The building is new and does not require maintenance now
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	No maintenance is required in the mean time because the building is new
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Maintenance is not required because the project is just a cleaning campaign.
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is not required because there is a second project established in this area
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	A public park doesn't require maintenance
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	No need for maintenance because the project is a public garden
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	The project is a park, which doesn't need maintenance
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	The project is a park, which doesn't need maintenance
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is not required now because the project is cleaning campaign
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	It does not need maintenance because the project consisted solely of transporting equipment
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	The building is new and does not require maintenance now
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	The project is a football yard and doesn't need professional maintenance
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	The project doesn't need maintenance because it is just a public park
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	It does not need maintenance because the project is providing equipment only
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	The project is a sport stadium and there is nothing that needs maintenance
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	Maintenance is not required at the moment because the project is a cleaning campaign
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Maintenance is not required at the moment because the project is a cleaning campaign of the irrigation canal

Project Code	Project Title	QII.1: Why is maintenance not required?
FJ-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Because the project is cleaning, there is no equipment to maintain
FJ-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	The type of project is irrigation canal cleaning so there's no need for maintenance
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Not required because the project is a cleaning campaign
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	Not required because it is cleaning campaign and removing of debris

The reasons that maintenance is required by projects are presented below in Table 7. There are several park projects, building rehabilitations and a sports stadium for which, in contrast to similar projects above, managers detailed the importance of maintenance to keep the facilities in a useful state. IRD should pay particular attention to project FJ-CIES-0004, whose respondent indicated that the project is in substandard condition from a maintenance perspective.

Table 7. Why is Maintenance Required?

Project Code	Project Title	QII.1: Why is maintenance required?
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Maintenance required to the building in addition to the electrical and sanitation systems
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is required because the street is public and essential in the city and requires maintenance to the lighting and cleaning and the other kinds of maintenance
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	The maintenance is required but not in mean time because the construction is new
FJ-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	The project is a general garden planted with grass and al-Didonia trees.
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	This project is a public park and it needs to be irrigated and to have more trees planted.
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Because the project is almost neglected
FJ-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Because the project is a sports stadium and the main part is planted with ground also the other part is the administrative section, which contains the administrative halls of the players
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Because the water pipes and taps in the ablution areas, coolers and electric generator require maintenance.
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Yes, the pipes and reservoirs need maintenance
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Maintenance is required for irrigating the grass and cleaning.
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	It is required because the project includes air conditioning units, electrical devices, generators and other equipment

For the projects that required maintenance according to the response to the first question in the section, respondents were asked to identify who was responsible for

maintaining the site (Table 8). For six of the eleven projects that required maintenance, no one had been identified. When no person or institution is identified this can indicate a lack of commitment to sustainability for the project whether it is a construction project or a cleaning campaign.

Table 8. Who is Responsible for Maintaining the Project?

Response	Q1.2: Who is responsible for maintaining the site?
No one	6
Name provided	3
Municipality	2
Total	11

For projects that required maintenance, respondents were asked if maintenance training would be required to ensure that maintenance staff could properly take care of the facilities and equipment (Table 9 below). Out of the eleven projects that needed maintenance, only one project would require maintenance training for staff according to the respondent. This project, RA CIES 0036: “██████████”, would reportedly need training to maintain the “medical equipment and laboratories, cooling equipments and generators”. This is also one of the projects for which no one was designated to provide maintenance at the site. The instrument did not include subsequent questions about whether this training would be provided but IRD should follow-up with this facility to ensure that the maintenance staff have adequate skills to maintain the general climate control and generation equipment as well as the potentially more sophisticated medical equipment provided by the project. IRD should also follow-up with the other five projects to see if maintenance responsibility has been established since the time of the assessment.

For the ten projects that did not require maintenance training, all respondents indicated that the tasks required for maintaining the sites, equipment and infrastructure were basic and uncomplicated.

Table 9. Reasons Maintenance Training is Not Required

Project Code	Project Title	Q11.5: Why is maintenance training not required?
RA-CIES-0008	██████████	Traditional and simple maintenance to the machines and sanitation systems
RA-CIES-0028	██████████	Traditional maintenance to the street including rehabilitation and lightning and other services
FJ-CIES-0002	██████████	The project requires only trim al-Dedonia trees, mow the grass and water garden
FJ-CIES-0003	██████████	The project is a public park. It needs only simple work to be maintained. No need for training.
FJ-CIES-0004	██████████	The project is a park and the perpetuating is represented by cutting and trimming the trees and any farm
FJ-CIES-0005	██████████	Because all the works are simple such as watering which don't require very much experience

Project Code	Project Title	Q11.5: Why is maintenance training not required?
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	The perpetuating (maintenance) process is easy and simple and doesn't need any training
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	The maintenance required is general and not specialized, like, the pipes and reservoirs need maintenance
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	The maintenance required to take care the yard and irrigate the grass and cleaning (i.e. simple tasks)
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Traditional maintenance and it does not need professional training

The survey included a question about obstacles that could affect the sustainability of the project and a subsequent question soliciting potential solutions (Table 10 below). Three respondents detailed barriers including the presence of security forces, electricity and lighting concerns for a park and a low maintenance budget. The issue of the maintenance budget was raised for a fairly large construction project that produced an additional building for a law school in Falluja. While the instrument did not include the means of assessing this concern, IRD should consider assessing the maintenance budget for this, as well as other large projects, as part of the project development process if this is not part of the project's procedures currently.

Table 10. Obstacles to Project Sustainability Identified by Project Managers

Project Code	Q11.10: What obstacles can you identify to the sustainability of equipment or the project site?	Q11.11: What solutions do you propose to address these barriers?
RA-CIES-0028	Frequent passage of the American forces and patrols of guard and police	Don't know
FJ-CIES-0014	The electricity is cutting off continuously and there are no lights for the playground	Install electricity columns and provide generators
FJ-CIES-0023	Low budget specified for the maintenance and expenditure routine	Increasing the budget three times more than the current value.

Site Usage

In order to document both the number of beneficiaries and the reliability of the data, a series of questions were included on the instrument regarding record keeping and site usage. Many of the projects monitored for this assessment would not be expected to keep records detailing usage of the site. These would include cleaning campaigns and park projects. Other facilities, such as clinics, university buildings or primary schools have attendance records to document usage. Thirteen of the completed projects reported that records were kept on the usage of the site. Monitors were able to see these records for nine of these and they reported that the figures reported by respondents could be verified using the records for four of these. As a result, reports of project beneficiaries should be seen as estimates only without reliable means of verification, therefore, many of them may be overestimates.

Table 11. Project Record Keeping on Site Usage

Response	QIV.2: Are records kept on the site usage?	QIV.4: Was the monitor able to see the records?	QIV.5: Would it be possible to verify the usage figures from the records presented?
Yes	13	9	4
No	22	4	5
Total	35	13	9

Survey respondents were asked to provide estimated numbers of site users per week, broken down by gender, for each project. These estimates, sorted from highest to lowest, are presented in Table 12 below. The figures ranged from 10 total users for a public park in Qadisiya to 150,000 weekly users of a revitalized business district.

Table 12. Estimated Number of Weekly Site Users

Project Code	Project Title	Estimated number of males users	Estimated number of female users	Total
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	100,000	50,000	150,000
FJ-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	14,000	14,000	28,000
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	7,000	7,000	14,000
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	7,000	7,000	14,000
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	5,000	5,000	10,000
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	4,000	4,000	8,000
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	3,500	3,500	7,000
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	3,500	3,500	7,000
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	2,750	2,750	5,500
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	5,050	450	5,500
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	2,700	2,650	5,350
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	2,100	1,750	3,850
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	1,910	1,875	3,785
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	1,750	1,750	3,500
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	1,500	1,500	3,000
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	1,750	1,000	2,750
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	1,305	1,000	2,305
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	744	332	1,076
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	1,000	0	1,000
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	700	50	750
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	350	350	700
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	350	350	700
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	75	550	625
FJ-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	560	0	560
FJ-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	280	120	400
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	125	125	250
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	150	100	250

Project Code	Project Title	Estimated number of males users	Estimated number of female users	Total
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	175	75	250
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	100	50	150
FJ-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	60	35	95
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	80	0	80
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	80	0	80
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	70	0	70
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	30	1	31
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	10	0	10

User Satisfaction and Recommendations

For completed projects, the field monitors assessed user satisfaction by interviewing project users and beneficiaries for the project. These groups included farmers who received irrigation water and were employed by a canal cleaning project, teachers and students from primary schools, businessmen who benefited from new equipment in a business resource center and local residents availing themselves of public parks. These findings are summarized below.

Overall, the great majority of participants indicated that the projects met their needs (Table 13 below). Two of the groups indicated that the project did not fully meet their needs. The first, RA-CIES-0014 [REDACTED] said that “maintaining it and planting it with grasses and trees” were still needed. Similar concerns were raised by the monitor who indicated that, while the construction appeared to be of acceptable quality, the park needed to be maintained by the municipality, the grass planted and watered and additional trees planted. Public park projects generally involve taking abandoned land, removing accumulated trash, grading the area, constructing a fence and some sort of landscaping. Transferring ownership of privately funded projects to municipal governments has been a challenging issue for many projects in Iraq. CSP, if it does not already do so, should place special effort in establishing and supporting local ownership of such projects.

Another project, FJ-CIES-0028, which consisted of a clean-up campaign, did not seem to go far enough according to the beneficiaries interviewed. The respondents’ suggestions for improvements included “laying the pavements and streets and completing the construction of the water network and the sewage network and construction of yards”.

Table 13. Status of Project Meeting Users’ Needs

Response	QV.5. Does this site meet your needs?
Yes	33
No	2
Total	35

All but two of the respondents were satisfied with the way the sites were maintained (Table 14 below). For the two projects where user groups were dissatisfied with maintenance, suggestions for improvement in maintenance for included “assign a person to maintain it” for RA-CIES-0014, [REDACTED], and “improvements are so important because the park is almost neglected. Expand it and give more attention to the regular watering” for FJ-CIES-0004, the [REDACTED]

Table 14. Site Users’ Satisfaction with Project Maintenance

Response	QV.7. Has the project been maintained to your satisfaction?
Yes	33
No	2
Total	35

The instrument was designed to solicit suggestions for improvements from all of the groups. As a result, there are suggestions from user groups that were not actually dissatisfied with current maintenance of the project. All of the maintenance suggestions are presented in Table 15 below.

A few of the responses provided by respondents were not directly related to maintenance, such as providing a public library for students (two primary school projects). These were left in, however, as potential suggestions for future projects. It is important to highlight that sanitation in primary schools was raised, specifically through requests for additional restrooms, for two of the six school rehabilitations.

For four of the cleaning projects, the groups proposed that the local government should take responsibility for this area. This highlights the need for a transition from conducting relatively quick projects, such as cleaning campaigns, that often use procedures and contractors that bypass the traditional roles of municipal governments to a more long-term focus on building the capacity of these authorities to reestablish such services.

Table 15. Maintenance Suggestions of Site Users

Project Code	Project Title	QV.8. Maintenance improvement the group would like to see
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Air conditioning, build a storage room, laboratory and sport rooms
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	Increase the number of bathrooms
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Public library for students
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Tiling the public street and maintenance of the sewer
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	Expand the bathrooms
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	The municipality should remove the waste regularly
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	The municipality should take more responsibility
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	An irrigation system
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Assign a person to maintain it

Project Code	Project Title	QV.8. Maintenance improvement the group would like to see
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	Appoint guards and a maintenance person to the garden
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	Appoint guards and a maintenance person to the garden
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	The cleaning should be done by the Ramadi municipality
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Coolers (water fountains) and library for the students
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Ensure there are no electricity blackouts
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	Identify persons responsible for the cleaning and watering the ground and caring of the plants
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	Support the health sector by providing medicines and medical equipments
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	Improving the electricity service
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	By hiring employees to maintain the park and make it ready all the time to receive families
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Improvements are so important because the park is almost neglected. Expand it and give more attention to the regular watering.
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	Putting stands for playing basketball and volleyball
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Expand the mosque and paving the mosque outside yard with tiles.
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Provide the generators and add the lights
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	The municipality of Saklawiya should take on its responsibility for cleaning
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Support the farmers and the health of their livestock
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Reestablishing the campaign regularly

The beneficiary and user groups were asked to describe how the community was taking responsibility for maintaining the project site or equipment (Table 16 below). From the responses, it appears that these are not formal community roles implemented through clearly delineated tasks and regular schedules. Rather, respondents are referring to a sense of ownership and responsibility that is exhibited when citizens treat public property and resources with respect by not throwing trash in the street or a park or in a schoolyard. For some beneficiary groups that included the staff of the facility, either schools or clinics, it is possible that the community referred to in the question includes themselves and that maintenance and cleanliness would fall under their professional responsibilities.

Table 16. Site Users Views of Community Responsibility for the Project

Project Code	Project Title	QIV.9. Community responsibility for maintaining the project
--------------	---------------	---

Project Code	Project Title	QIV.9. Community responsibility for maintaining the project
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	By maintaining the cleanliness and care of public property
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	Take care of the buildings and cleaning
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Through cleaning and caring for public properties
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	The cleanliness of the school and raising the awareness of the students about it
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	Through cleaning and taking care of the buildings in particular
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Maintaining the building and not to go to the clinic without a real need.
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Each person should maintain the cleanliness of the area
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	Raise the awareness of the people for the necessity of cleaning
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	The proper use and preservation of public property
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Cleaning and feeling of responsibility by citizens
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	Maintaining the public property
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	Proper use of the site and its preservation
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	By raising the awareness of the citizens about the cleaning campaign
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	Taking care of it from the donors
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	By maintaining the cleanliness and care of public property
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	Preserving the stadium, maintaining it and cleaning and caring for the grass
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Maintaining the cleanliness and the beauty of street and the assets
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	Maintaining the greenery and cleanliness in the arena and all contents
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	Assisting with cleaning and maintenance
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	All beneficiary businessmen support this center and they consider it as their own center
FJ-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Keep and clean the garden and water trees and establishing fountains on their own.
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	By taking care of it, making it clean and having the sense of responsibility by every one
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	They show initiatives from time to time to maintain cleanliness and watering and feel that it belongs to all.
FJ-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Conserving the project and assistance in maintaining it and the process of watering the ground, which occupies an area of 9000 square meter
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	Keeping the stadium and its floor and fence and all the components clean
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Keeping the mosque clean (halls, places of ablutions) and through donations from the worshipers for maintenance
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Take care of the playground and all public

Project Code	Project Title	QIV.9. Community responsibility for maintaining the project
		properties
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	By encouraging the participation of the community by showing them the importance of cleanliness
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Through the collective participation in the cleaning and maintenance
FJ-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	By the continuous cleaning campaigns that were implemented by the professors & students
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	By taking responsibilities and protecting the public properties
FJ-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	By maintaining the channel and not allowing anyone allow to dump in any part of it
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Keeping the area clean and throwing trash in its proper place
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	By maintaining the equipment, furniture, and all the belongings and keeping them clean.

For 23 of the projects, users did not identify any obstacles to the sustainability of the project. Of the 12 responses (Table 17), six of them were security related including the presence of checkpoints, which impede free access to sites, and military forces on the streets, which most likely have a similar effect. As security improves, presumably these obstacles will diminish. Several of the obstacles and proposed suggestions are practical including the use of generators to address electricity supply issues, the establishment of a sports committee to be involved with a new soccer field project and the addition of staff to address a perceived shortage of health staff in a clinic. IRD should consider these issues and share them with project planners and monitors in the area to see how they might be addressed.

Table 17. Site Users Perceptions of Project Obstacles and Proposed Recommendations

Project Code	Project Title	QIV.9. Obstacles Group Identified That May Prevent Sustaining Project Site	QIV.10. Group Recommendation to Overcome Obstacles
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Checkpoints	Remove checkpoints and blockages
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Few employees in the center	Increase the medical and health employees in the center
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	The security situation	None
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	Sometimes worsening security situation or the passage of the American forces near the site	Don't know
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	The small size of the site	Expand the site
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	The electricity blackout and the passage of the military forces	Improve the electricity and make the street civilian
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	A park near the public street of the city and the passage of many American forces, which prevents the use of the site	None
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	Bad electricity services	Electricity problem in different Iraqi governorates must be solved
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	There is no sport committee or students union	Composing a sport committee
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Electricity cutting off and no generators	Install generators and putting lights
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	The college is outside the Falluja check point so students need to walk for long distance to reach the college in summer and winter	Including the college within the Falluja check point so the transportation can reach the college
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	No pavements in the streets	Planning new streets and putting pavements for them

User groups were asked if the project had made a difference in their daily lives. The great majority, 33 of 35, replied that the project had, in fact, made a change in their daily existence (Table 18). For the projects that had not made a change in people's daily lives according to the site users, one was the University Health Clinic that had not yet been opened (RA-CIES-0008) and the other was RA-CIES-0014 [REDACTED], which was explained with: "The project location is not good, the generator too near it, and the citizens who live in the region don't allow youths to be in the site."

Table 18. Site Users' Perceptions of Project Impact

Response	QV.7: Has the project made a difference in your daily lives?
Yes	33
No	2
Total	35

As detailed in Table 19 below, these changes were all positive and included the psychological benefits of a cleaner city, a better educational environment for students and teachers, increased opportunities for sporting events and improved transportation.

Table 19. Examples of Project Impact Provided by Site Users

Project Code	Project Title	QV.8. Specific Instances of Positive Differences in Group's Daily Life
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Expanded the number of classes and the usefulness of the building and increase the number of students
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	The psychological situation for students, increase the number of classes
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Expanded the number of classes and improved the psychological situation of the students
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Through the improved psychological situation of the students and the teachers
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	Has increased of the number of students and the psychological comfort for students and teachers
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Some roads have opened after the removal of rubble and waste in addition to the improved cleanliness
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	Cleaning the roads and places near the residents and increasing their comfort about the public situation
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	Provided jobs and improved the aesthetic landscape of the region while providing a place of entertainment
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	Changed the yard from a garbage dump to a beautiful garden
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	Beauty of the site first and foremost and then the removal of the waste disposal that existed formerly in the area
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Improve the psychological situation for the citizens who live in the region and clean the roads and the places near the site
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	Help to decrease the hours of cutting off electricity
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Through build ceilings and pouring the walk steps and increase the number of students
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	The possibility of starting championships through such a high standard stadium
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	The street was closed because of the terrorism and violence but now it is clean and passable
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	Presence of beautiful park and changing landscape of the area
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	The number of patients increased
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	Working in this professional center and using advanced training and development programs provide a very great sense and feeling that we are active men in community
FJ-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	The place was changed after it was the place to dump garbage.
FJ-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	Creating a park and games for children gives rest and relaxation for all family members including secure stability.
FJ-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	Get rid of the garbage. Convenience to the people of the region. a playground for the children
FJ-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	There are various sports activities such as: (Nasrat Al-Haq) for football it currently Ramadan Championships. In

Project Code	Project Title	QV.8. Specific Instances of Positive Differences in Group's Daily Life
		addition to the league championship for the second-class for team club and Al- Fallujah Club. The project is comfortable for families.
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	In the past, we needed to get approvals to play sport outside the college
FJ-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Through teaching and training courses and sports activities and cover the ground of the mosque and cooling the campus and the generator
FJ-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Expanded the places of ablutions and built it in a very good and satisfying way in addition to the hall, which is used for the purpose of raising the level of scientific and cultural level in the region and casting the ground of the summer chapel, which has led to an increase in the number of worshipers
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	1) Providing jobs during the achievement of the project, 2) removing garbage from the yard, 3) play in a regular playground and the possibility of sponsoring a tournament on it
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	Cleaning the roads and the area near residences and improving the psychological situation of some of the people
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Cleaning the canal and the increase in irrigation and transport of the water in the required quantities
FJ-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Now the laboratories have the capacity for the apparatus which is very important to affirming the students scientific level and that will reflect positively for the college to receive more students
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	A new department was opened in the college it is the shari'a department in an independent building for them
FJ-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	Employ labor, provides water to the agricultural lands and increase its area and its production
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Reopening some roads and yards after removing the debris from them
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	Cleaning the corridors, garden and outer yards of the hospital that reflect the care about the hospital and the level of the services that the hospital provides and gain the people trust

Construction Quality

For the 20 projects that included a construction component, monitors were asked to assess the quality of the construction. For all of the projects, the monitors observed that construction standards had been followed. Monitors were asked to compare the project's completion and quality compared with the project's Bill of Quantity (BoQ). Monitors were provided the BoQ by IRD staff for half of the monitored projects. For all of these projects, the monitors did not observe any deficiencies compared with the BoQs. Monitors were also asked to identify deficiencies in the projects outside of the BoQ and not related to the technical quality of the construction. A total of four projects were singled out by the monitors for perceived issues. The identified areas are included in Table 20 below.

Table 20. Monitor Observed Deficiencies

Project Code	Project Title	QV.9. Other Deficiencies Observed in the Project
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	There is no irrigation network
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	The project needs to be maintained and grass planted
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	The lighting in the park isn't enough. It's just four in the corners and the park is also small
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	The project should include: a library, computer labs, chapel for women, bathrooms, and the cafeteria in the same building

The field monitors were asked to identify, in their view, the major strengths and accomplishments of the projects. These are detailed in Table 21 below and include a wide variety of positive responses such as the high quality of the completed work, support for education and supplementation of municipal services.

Table 21. Project Strengths and Accomplishments According to Monitors

Project Code	Project Title	QVI.1 Project Major Strengths and Accomplishments
RA-CIES-0002	[REDACTED]	Strength of the building, the beauty of the color and support for education
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	The building and the repairs are good and the project supports education
RA-CIES-0004	[REDACTED]	The building and painting is very good, provides support to the directorate of education
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	Supports the educational sector
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	The building is good and strong, supports education
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	Good cleaning of roads, removal of rubble that had surrounded some streets
RA-CIES-0011	[REDACTED]	Supports the municipal government
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	All components of the project implemented fully and well
RA-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	The garden is public. It supports the municipality.
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	All terms of the project were implemented fully and well
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	Good pouring of the external walk steps and the good grading of the grounds
RA-CIES-0020	[REDACTED]	Reduce the infectious diseases, give support to the municipality
RA-CIES-0021	[REDACTED]	The generators and columns are new and ready to work. Supporting the electricity council

Project Code	Project Title	QVI.1 Project Major Strengths and Accomplishments
RA-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	Rehabilitation is suitable for the requirements /support the educational sector
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	The outside fence, benches and lighting
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	The repair to the explosion damage of the pavement is of good quality. The beauty of the street.
RA-CIES-0032	[REDACTED]	The beauty of park in general in its internal corridors, fencing and lighting
RA-CIES-0036	[REDACTED]	The project is important and civilized and supports the health sector
RA-CIES-0038	[REDACTED]	The supply is perfect, and meets the required purpose for the mean time.
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	The elegant laying of the pavements with nice colored bricks and polishing the stadium floor with the concrete polisher and painting it with the epoxy substance (and that is not part of the contract)
FJ-CIES-0014	[REDACTED]	Good fencing of the playground and good ground cover
FJ-CIES-0017	[REDACTED]	Support of the Saqlawiyah municipality
FJ-CIES-0018	[REDACTED]	Supporting the agricultural section
FJ-CIES-0023	[REDACTED]	The beauty of the inner and outer walls of the building, the floor, lights, and air conditioning
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Sufficient numbers of workers and monitors
FJ-CIES-0029	[REDACTED]	Sufficient numbers of workers and equipment

Monitors were asked to identify the major obstacles facing each project based on their discussions with staff and beneficiaries as well as their own observations of the project and surrounding area. For many of the projects, no obstacles were identified indicating that the project is in a good position to continue to meet the needs of site users and beneficiaries. For the twelve projects for which obstacles were listed, the majority center on security constraints and difficulties in the movement of materials and people. Two of the obstacles focused on concerns with the local governments' failures to ensure that cleaning campaigns are followed-up by regular municipal trash collection and cleaning. All of the obstacles are detailed below in Table 22.

Table 22. Major Obstacles Facing the Project According to the Monitor

Project Code	Project Title	QVI.2. Main Obstacles Facing the Project
RA-CIES-0003	[REDACTED]	The checkpoints and the concrete barricades
RA-CIES-0005	[REDACTED]	The checkpoints and the concrete blocks

Project Code	Project Title	QVI.2. Main Obstacles Facing the Project
RA-CIES-0006	[REDACTED]	The interior and exterior checkpoints were obstacles to the delivery of items in the right time
RA-CIES-0008	[REDACTED]	Lack of sufficient furniture to move to the new building knowing that the university administration received the building but not yet delivered by them to the Department Center
RA-CIES-0009	[REDACTED]	The municipality doesn't pick up waste continuously
RA-CIES-0012	[REDACTED]	The difficulty of transfer the workers and materials because the check points in Al- Ramadi city
RA-CIES-0015	[REDACTED]	The difficulty of transfer of the workers and materials because the check points in Al- Ramadi city
RA-CIES-0016	[REDACTED]	The small size of the garden and limited lighting and the lack of watering systems
RA-CIES-0025	[REDACTED]	Transport movement and check points in Ramadi
RA-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	The difficulty of transfer the materials and people because the street was closed security. Each worker should have an id and background check and they should have to wear a special uniform
FJ-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	All the outer yards in the college that surrounds the stadium are dusty yards with no grass or paved pathways
FJ-CIES-0028	[REDACTED]	Poor performance of the municipality through a lack of waste receptacles and the absence of a sewage network in the area

Ongoing Projects.

Seven of the projects monitored were ongoing in Falluja or Ramadi. Only one of the seven projects was on schedule to finish on time. The reasons for delays in completion were due mainly to changes in site location and delays in the transport of supplies. (Table 24)

Table 24. Reasons for Delays in Project Completion

Project Code	QI.7. Causes of Delay in Project Completion
RA-CIES-0007	Expansion of the project and the difficulties of transfer of the materials to the project because of the checkpoints
RA-CIES-0013	Expansion of the project and the problems of transfer of materials and machinery
RA-CIES-0024	Change in the project location and the difficulty of transportation, especially for materials
RA-CIES-0026	Change in the project location and expansion of the project and the check points in Al- Ramadi
RA-CIES-0034	Change in the place of the stadium because the presence of American forces in the site of the original project
RA-CIES-0037	Expanding the area under contract and the delay in transferring materials because of the check points

All of the projects had active work underway at the time of the field monitor’s visit (Table 25 below). Community contribution is an important tenet of community project development that ensures “ownership.” Community ownership is commonly provided through residents’ unpaid labor. In the CSP program, labor is paid to those in the age cohort that is vulnerable to participation in violence and is considered as a means to reduce insurgent incidents. This paid labor is coupled with citizen participation in a project that benefits the community. The anticipated result couples a reduction in the participation in violence with community ownership of the project.

Field monitors asked the project managers whether the community participated in supporting the project and, if so, how. For each of the projects, there was at least one element of community participation. Four projects benefited from volunteer labor, four from community provided security and three received materials donation. Four of the projects reportedly received two forms of community participation and one of the projects had three elements.

Table 25. Was There Active Work at the Site and Is the Community Supporting the Project?

Response	QI.8 Is there active work on the site	QI.9. Is the community supporting the project in some way?
Yes	7	7
No	0	0
Total	7	7

Question 4 in section 7 of the survey instrument asks monitors to determine whether there was any deviation from the approved BoQ. Monitors had the BoQ with them during their visit for all of the projects and no deficiencies were noted against the BoQ.

Field monitors were asked to assess workmanship on the project. Construction quality for all of the projects was assessed as being to standard for the work completed to date. Monitors were also asked to look for other deficiencies that, while outside the BoQ or scope of the project, could be addressed to improve the utility of the site. Perceived deficiencies were identified for five of the six projects. These included a need for simple games for children in a new park, additional work to surrounding walking areas and additional illumination (Table 26).

Table 26. Potential Deficiencies Identified by the Monitor

Project Code	Project Title	QII.9. Potential Deficiencies Identified by the Monitor
RA-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	Simple games for children (not included in contract)
RA-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	A cover for the grandstands and a closed hall of the other games
RA-CIES-0026	[REDACTED]	Tiling the roads from the public street to the stadium
RA-CIES-0034	[REDACTED]	The pavement surrounding the stadium should be stone color. However, this was not part of the contract
FJ-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	The project needs outer illumination (lights) and that is not mentioned in the contract

As all of the projects were ongoing, several of the monitors' comments concerning strengths and accomplishments focused on the current state of construction. For three of the projects, RA-CIES-0013, RA-CIES-0037 and RA-CIES-0013, the monitor noted the quality and attractiveness of the project's execution. These observations support the monitors' assessment that all of the projects were being completed according to the BoQs and that the construction quality met appropriate standards.

Table 27. Project Strengths and Accomplishments to Date According to the Monitor

Project Code	Project Title	QIII.1. Major Strengths and/or Accomplishments of the Project to Date
RA-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	The project has graded the field, fenced the yard and built the structure of the center
RA-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	The quality of the grading and the fences
RA-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	At the time of monitoring, the project had installed poles for the fence and graded the field.
RA-CIES-0026	[REDACTED]	The project has graded the field, built the foundation for the fence around the stadium and built the stadium structure.
RA-CIES-0034	[REDACTED]	The project is making progress in completing the stadium.
RA-CIES-0037	[REDACTED]	The park is attractive.
FJ-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	Beautiful laying of the outer pavements and the beautifulness of the outer painting of the fence

For the six projects for which the monitor identified major obstacles, the difficulty in the timely and efficient movement of materials, supplies and equipment was indicated for each one (Table 28). This issue was also flagged as a reason for the delays in meeting the completion dates for these projects. CSP staff may wish to consider utilizing the influence of the PRT representatives to facilitate the movement of essential supplies and equipment for these and future projects.

Table 28. Major Obstacles Facing the Project According to the Monitor

Project Code	Project Title	QIII.2. Main Obstacles Facing the Project
RA-CIES-0007	[REDACTED]	The movement of transfer the materials and the difficulty of movement because of the check points

Project Code	Project Title	QIII.2.Main Obstacles Facing the Project
RA-CIES-0013	[REDACTED]	The difficulty of the delivering materials and machinery because of movement restrictions as some trucks delay in the entry of Ramadi (check points) several days.
RA-CIES-0024	[REDACTED]	Transfer of heavy materials and mechanisms and the difficulty of passing from Al-Ramadi, especially for trucks and the delay of several days
RA-CIES-0026	[REDACTED]	Movement of materials because of the check points in the city
RA-CIES-0034	[REDACTED]	Transport movement from and to Al-Ramadi especially for the materials and machines and the check points in Al-Ramadi
RA-CIES-0037	[REDACTED]	The transport and processing of materials and the difficulty of passing trucks from the check points of the city of Ramadi

General Questions for Project Managers and Site Users

In order to assess how attitudes and living conditions in Anbar might have changed as a result of program activities, project managers and site user groups were asked a series of questions related to their hopefulness as a result of the project, changes in government services and security and the perceived effects of these projects on conflict in Iraq. These questions were added after data collection had begun in Falluja. In addition, the instrument used for ongoing projects only asked these questions to project managers since user groups were not part of the monitoring of ongoing projects. As a result, a total of 34 projects have responses to these questions from project managers and twenty-seven projects have responses from the site user groups. Due to the lack of a randomized sampling procedure for selecting the respondents for these questions, it is not possible to generalize directly from their answers and views to the larger population. However, it is likely that many residents of Falluja and Ramadi share their opinions as a result of the intensive reconstruction effort that is under way in these areas.

Project Manager Responses

The first question asked respondents what effect, if any, the project had produced on their hopefulness for the future. All of the respondents reported that they were “much more hopeful” (22) or “somewhat more hopeful” (12) as a result of the project. They were then asked to explain why they felt this way. These responses are listed in Table 29. The main reason for respondents’ improved hopefulness was the positive impact of reconstruction efforts in the city as evidenced by building and cleaning projects. Many respondents also focused on the reduction in unemployment brought about as a result of putting people to work.

Table 29. Reasons for Improved Hopefulness

Project ID	QIII.2 Reasons for Improved Hopefulness
FJ-CIES-0007	Feeling of the presence of real work in many projects and the commitment to contractors' responsibilities and the specifications of the project and the implementation time
FJ-CIES-0013	The beautiful views of the area and increasing of picnics areas, number of projects and the decrease in the unemployment
FJ-CIES-0014	Because there is real work in all kinds of services
FJ-CIES-0017	Because of cleaning the roads and the residential areas that decreases infectious diseases
FJ-CIES-0018	That's because the project conducts water in the required quantities to the farmers. This helps the agricultural directorate to work in the right way and increase production.
FJ-CIES-0023	Feeling of the presence of real work in all the projects and especially the commitment to meet quality standards and complete projects within the required time limit
FJ-CIES-0028	Because of seeing the progress and development and more projects and decreasing unemployment
FJ-CIES-0029	Project like this works on: Improving and developing the health care that is provided to the people Help in reducing the unemployment
RA-CIES-0002	Security now is stable and this project is raising the scientific and psychological comfort of the citizens
RA-CIES-0003	Because the project improves the comfort situation for the students and teachers
RA-CIES-0004	To raise up the scientific level in the mean time to the people who live in the region
RA-CIES-0005	Increasing numbers of students and raising the scientific and cultural level
RA-CIES-0006	The students in the school feel comfortable and it helps them to keep studying hard
RA-CIES-0007	Improvements to the appearance of the area and the arenas and stadium's design
RA-CIES-0008	Improved space for health clinic and services
RA-CIES-0009	Through feeling the attention towards the public services, the large amount of projects and employing people
RA-CIES-0011	Gives a good civilized appearance and improves public health
RA-CIES-0012	A significant shift in construction activity towards the entertainment and youth projects
RA-CIES-0013	Decrease in unemployment and the use of youths capacities
RA-CIES-0014	The improved psychological condition of area residents
RA-CIES-0015	The increasing of work movement and projects especially concerning the youth make us more hopeful
RA-CIES-0016	Providing jobs and the quality of the services presented by the projects
RA-CIES-0020	Because of cleaning the roads and residential areas near the market to give it a civilized look
RA-CIES-0021	Providing electricity to a larger number of citizens
RA-CIES-0023	Raising the educational and cultural level
RA-CIES-0024	Large projects, especially recreational and projects that absorb the energies of youth
RA-CIES-0025	Vital projects for young people to practice sports activities
RA-CIES-0026	Large construction activity and providing an outlet for energies of youth
RA-CIES-0028	The project opened an important road in the city after it was closed because of the recent damage caused by the explosions and dilapidated buildings which were removed during the project
RA-CIES-0032	See real work and projects that give us hope
RA-CIES-0034	The re building of the city and there are many projects
RA-CIES-0036	The improved health situation for the citizens who live near the project
RA-CIES-0037	Improved appearance of the area and the removal of the waste. Made it a public park and the large projects provide optimism
RA-CIES-0038	The developing projects in the governorate

Respondents were asked how services provided by the local government had changed over the past six months. A total of 23 respondents reported that services had improved while eleven indicated that there had been no change observed. Several USAID-funded initiatives, including the CSP CIES program and LGP II, work to either improve the performance of local government in providing essential services to citizens or

supplement those services by funding projects to address service deficits. While this survey does not claim to represent the population at large in Falluja and Ramadi, the fact that more than than half of the survey respondents stated that positive changes are taking place is notable and positive.

Table 30. Changes in Local Government Services Over the Past Six Months

Much improved	Somewhat improved	No change	Somewhat worse	Much worse	Total
10	13	11		0	34

As a follow-on to the preceding question, the project managers were asked what services had improved or, if there was no change, what services were most in need of attention. About two-thirds of respondents listed improvements to local government services including electricity, water and cleaning. Several of the respondents indicated that the service improvements were small and progressing slowly but this does not diminish the impression that the improvements are real to local citizens.

Table 31. What Services Have Improved?

Project ID	QIII.5. Local Government Services that Have Improved
FJ-CIES-0007	The services projects are many but they are going on slowly
FJ-CIES-0013	Some small improvement in the electricity and lighting the main streets
FJ-CIES-0014	The cleaning, electricity
FJ-CIES-0023	Many service projects were implemented but the improvement is slow
RA-CIES-0004	Improving the electricity and water currently
RA-CIES-0005	The electricity cutting hours are less and the movement of the vehicles has improved
RA-CIES-0006	The security situation is stable and providing some of the life needs like water and electricity is now available
RA-CIES-0007	Electricity, water and roads
RA-CIES-0008	Cleaning of the districts and there are more entertainment and educational projects
RA-CIES-0009	Electricity, water and cleaning
RA-CIES-0012	The electricity and infrastructure
RA-CIES-0013	Electricity, water and roads
RA-CIES-0015	The electricity, the water and the rehabilitation of the streets that was affected by the explosions
RA-CIES-0016	The electricity, sewer and cleanliness the streets
RA-CIES-0023	Improvement in the water and electricity
RA-CIES-0024	Services in general
RA-CIES-0025	Electricity and tiling and entertainment projects
RA-CIES-0026	Electricity and infrastructure
RA-CIES-0028	Opening the roads and the freedom of movement inside the city
RA-CIES-0032	All of the services are Improving but slowly
RA-CIES-0034	Improvements in water, electricity, sewer and other services and reduced unemployment
RA-CIES-0037	Small improvement in water and electricity
RA-CIES-0038	Decreasing the hours of cutting off electricity / The Ministry of Trade food items arrived on time

According to about a third of respondents, essential services including electricity, water, sewage and roads are still in need of attention. While this information is probably well known to project developers in the Anbar area, the results should still be disseminated to reinforce and stimulate more efforts to address these shortcomings. These findings provide an excellent opportunity for LGP and the PRT USAID representative to discuss ways with other PRT stakeholders to mitigate these obstacles.

Table 32. What Service Most Needs Improvement

Project ID	QIII.6. Local Government Services in Most Need of Improvement
FJ-CIES-0017	Infrastructure projects like water, electricity, and roads maintenance
FJ-CIES-0028	Making the water fit for drinking available through finishing the water network and constructing a sewage network and improving the electricity and laying the streets and paving them
FJ-CIES-0029	Basic services water, sewage, electricity, health services
RA-CIES-0002	The infrastructure projects, sewer, roads, water and electricity
RA-CIES-0003	Infrastructure projects.
RA-CIES-0011	Infrastructures projects
RA-CIES-0014	Water, electricity, main roads, sewer network
RA-CIES-0020	Infrastructures, maintain the streets
RA-CIES-0021	Increase delivery of electrical equipment and generators
RA-CIES-0036	Water, electricity, main roads

In order to assess the context of the implementation environment affecting the projects, respondents were asked to indicate how security had changed, if at all, over the previous six months. (Table 33) All but one of the respondents indicated that security conditions were “much improved”.

Table 33. Changes in Security in the Past Six Months

Much improved	Somewhat improved	No change	Somewhat worse	Much worse	Total
33	1	0	0	0	34

When asked to detail the security improvements they had observed, most responses highlighted decreases in killing, kidnapping and explosions. These responses confirm what has been reported in other venues concerning real and significant security improvements in Anbar province.

Table 34. Improvements in Security

Project ID	QIII.8 Examples of Security Improvements
FJ-CIES-0007	The security authority has been moved to the hands of the governorate citizens –and the explosives, killing and kidnapping have reduced
FJ-CIES-0013	Ending the situation of killing, assassinating, kidnapping. And the ability to get out at night
FJ-CIES-0014	There are no bombs, kidnapping and killing
FJ-CIES-0017	Through the partial removal of the blockages and decrease in the number of assassinations and the return of many people that had been threatened before
FJ-CIES-0018	Decreasing killing and kidnapping and the suicidal explosions and returning some of the threatened families
FJ-CIES-0023	The police forces are now from the same neighborhood and the evening curfew was removed. There has been a decrease in arrests, assassinations and break-ins.
FJ-CIES-0028	There is no breaking into by the American forces and there has been a decrease in the number of explosions and the ability of move around day and night
FJ-CIES-0029	The ability of the ambulance cars to do its work through transporting people day and night is the sign for the security improvement
RA-CIES-0002	The elimination of terrorism and the freedom of movement in work
RA-CIES-0003	The killing and kidnapping decreased
RA-CIES-0004	There is no problems in the mean time, the killing and kidnapping decreased
RA-CIES-0005	The elimination of criminals and the safe movement of police and security forces
RA-CIES-0006	Elimination of the terrorism and the killing and kidnapping decreased
RA-CIES-0007	Decrease the terrorism and violence
RA-CIES-0008	The lifting of curfews, day and night, and the end of all types of terrorism
RA-CIES-0009	Got rid from terrorism in its all kinds
RA-CIES-0011	Accidents decreased, IDPs have gone back to their region
RA-CIES-0012	The end of all kinds of violence and terrorism
RA-CIES-0013	The end of all kinds of violence and terrorism
RA-CIES-0014	The killing and bombing decreased
RA-CIES-0015	The end of all kinds of violence and terrorism
RA-CIES-0016	After the elimination of the terrorism the security situation was improved
RA-CIES-0020	The accidents and assassinations have decreased and the displaced families have returned to their homes.
RA-CIES-0021	The killing and kidnapping decreased
RA-CIES-0023	The elimination of terrorism
RA-CIES-0024	The lifting of the curfew and semi cases of terrorism
RA-CIES-0025	Lack of kidnappings and bombings and all acts of violence
RA-CIES-0026	The end of all kinds of terrorism
RA-CIES-0028	The decrease of curfews day and night and ending the terrorism

Project ID	QIII.8 Examples of Security Improvements
RA-CIES-0032	The elimination of violence and terrorism and the transfer of power in Ramadi to Iraqi forces
RA-CIES-0034	The transport movement has improved and the assassinations and bombings have ended
RA-CIES-0036	Arriving to the Health center safely / killing and kidnapping decreased
RA-CIES-0037	Ending the violence of all kinds
RA-CIES-0038	The killing and assassination has decreased

In an effort to document the effect of CIES projects in addressing some of the root causes of conflict in Iraq, respondents were asked to assess how such projects affect the likelihood of people to engage in conflict. Twenty-two respondents indicated that such projects made people “somewhat less likely” (16) or “much less likely” (6) to engage in conflict (Table 35).

Table 35. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict

Much more likely	Somewhat more likely	No change	Somewhat less likely	Much less likely	Total
0	1	11	16	6	34

When asked why they thought that these projects reduced the likelihood of people to engage in conflict, nearly all of the responses focused on the positive effects of reducing unemployment and improving economic conditions. While it does not prove the relationship between employment and reduced conflict, such responses seem to confirm one of the central program tenets of CSP CIES activities – putting people to work can play a role in reducing violence in Iraqi society.

Table 36. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict – Less Likely

Project ID	QIII.12 Why Would People Be Less Likely to Engage in Conflict
FJ-CIES-0013	The services projects reduce the conflicts
FJ-CIES-0029	Employing labor and decrease the jobless and improve the psychological situation for the employees and citizens
RA-CIES-0002	The partial elimination of unemployment
RA-CIES-0003	Ending the unemployment and providing a living for people
RA-CIES-0004	Availability of jobs opportunities and the problems decreased
RA-CIES-0005	The elimination of unemployment and provide jobs
RA-CIES-0006	Because the citizens are busy making a living to feed their families
RA-CIES-0007	These projects improve the living situation of many people and this reflected positively on the general situation

Project ID	QIII.12 Why Would People Be Less Likely to Engage in Conflict
RA-CIES-0008	Improve the economic situation for many people and decrease the unemployment
RA-CIES-0009	Reducing the unemployment and improving the economic situation helps in improving the situation in general
RA-CIES-0012	Decrease unemployment and improve the economical situation will decrease the conflict
RA-CIES-0013	Decreasing unemployment will increase the stability
RA-CIES-0015	The good economic situation will decrease the conflict
RA-CIES-0016	Improving the economic situation will improve the security situation
RA-CIES-0023	Provides jobs
RA-CIES-0024	Improve services and reduce unemployment reduces conflicts
RA-CIES-0025	Activating the youth will decrease the number of people involved in conflicts
RA-CIES-0026	Reducing unemployment reduces the conflict
RA-CIES-0032	Real services and the elimination of unemployment reduces conflict
RA-CIES-0034	Such projects serve the national reconciliation
RA-CIES-0036	Reduces the unemployment
RA-CIES-0037	Improvements in the economic situation and the elimination of unemployment help in reducing conflicts
RA-CIES-0038	Ending the unemployment

In contrast to the findings detailed above concerning the positive impact of CIES projects on conflict reduction, a third of respondents felt that such projects have no impact on people's tendencies to engage in the types of conflicts that are dividing Iraq. This is apparently because these people see no relationship between the types of projects that were being implemented and either the root causes or the actors involved in fueling the conflict. While there were not enough projects of different types to make statistical comparisons for this issue, respondent for all of the cleaning campaigns felt that there was no effect on conflict from these projects. This is explicitly stated in two of the responses listed below.

Table 37. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict – No Change or More Likely

Project ID	QIII.12 Why More Likely or No Change
FJ-CIES-0007	The people that are involved or engaged in the conflicts have no relation to these projects
FJ-CIES-0014	It has no relation to the divides in Iraq
FJ-CIES-0017	The people involved in this work have no relation to military or political cases
FJ-CIES-0018	Because the people involved in the project are technical people that have no relation to political and military subjects and the project provides both short-term and long-term opportunities for employment
FJ-CIES-0023	The persons who are involved in the conflicts have no relation to these projects

FJ-CIES-0028	The campaign is for cleaning and has no relation to the conflicts
RA-CIES-0011	Need patriotic reconciliation
RA-CIES-0014	The project has no relation with the conflicts
RA-CIES-0020	Cleaning campaigns have no relation with the politics and military issues
RA-CIES-0021	The project has no relation with conflict
RA-CIES-0028	These projects have nothing to do with the conflict

A final question about projects and conflicts asked respondents to list the types of projects that they felt would be best for reducing conflict in Iraq. Unfortunately, no clear consensus emerges from the responses. Potential projects range from those that engage youth, infrastructure development, and unemployment reduction initiatives.

Table 38. Best Projects for Reducing Conflict

Project ID	QIII.12 Best Projects for Reducing Conflict
FJ-CIES-0007	The services projects and eradication of joblessness
FJ-CIES-0013	The general services for all people and sport yards for the youth
FJ-CIES-0014	All of the services and infrastructure projects
FJ-CIES-0017	Through supporting the educational institutions and the factories that provide many jobs
FJ-CIES-0018	Through the essential services like water, electricity, sewage, and roads
FJ-CIES-0023	Increasing the number of projects and jobs and getting rid of unemployment
FJ-CIES-0028	All the services and infrastructures
FJ-CIES-0029	Improving the basic services and infra structures
RA-CIES-0002	Expand the projects and national reconciliation
RA-CIES-0003	Public services projects particularly
RA-CIES-0006	Increase the number of the public services projects
RA-CIES-0007	All kinds of projects
RA-CIES-0008	The services and health projects
RA-CIES-0009	All projects of all kinds because they provide a service and reduce the unemployment
RA-CIES-0011	Support factories and industry and provide job opportunities
RA-CIES-0012	All kinds of projects especially concerned the youth and sport
RA-CIES-0013	The public services projects of all kinds and education then entertainment
RA-CIES-0014	Providing job opportunities to end the unemployment.
RA-CIES-0015	All kinds of projects that reduce the unemployment and improve the economical situation and projects for improving sports because sport unified the society
RA-CIES-0016	All kinds of projects that reduce unemployment
RA-CIES-0020	Give support to the production foundations and factories that provide jobs opportunities
RA-CIES-0021	Economic projects and security plan
RA-CIES-0024	Human development projects and thus health

Project ID	QIII.12 Best Projects for Reducing Conflict
RA-CIES-0025	Increase projects that have the capacity to occupy youth potential
RA-CIES-0026	Projects concerning the youth because the sport unifies everyone
RA-CIES-0028	Housing and services projects
RA-CIES-0032	Any project that reduces unemployment
RA-CIES-0034	Health and entertainment services
RA-CIES-0036	Providing jobs for youths
RA-CIES-0037	The entertainment projects
RA-CIES-0038	Increase the public services projects and production projects and take care of education sector

The final question in this section asked respondents to identify the single biggest obstacle they faced in their lives today. The security situation was the topmost challenge identified indicating that, despite the improvements mentioned in earlier questions, there is still room for progress in this and other areas.

Table 39. Biggest Challenge Facing Respondents Today

Project ID	QIII.14. Biggest Challenge(s) Facing Respondent's Life
FJ-CIES-0007	The security situation for all of the country
FJ-CIES-0013	The security situation of the country
FJ-CIES-0014	Security situation
FJ-CIES-0017	Unstable security situation
FJ-CIES-0018	The unstable security situation
FJ-CIES-0023	The security situation for the whole of the country
FJ-CIES-0028	Denominational conflict
FJ-CIES-0029	The presence of American forces in the streets
RA-CIES-0002	The security situation
RA-CIES-0003	Electricity, security situation
RA-CIES-0004	Security situation
RA-CIES-0005	The check points in the governorate / American forces
RA-CIES-0006	The security situation and infrastructure
RA-CIES-0007	Many check points in Al-Ramadi
RA-CIES-0008	The occupation of Iraq
RA-CIES-0009	Security situation
RA-CIES-0011	Security situation
RA-CIES-0012	The whole situation in the country
RA-CIES-0013	The security situation of the country
RA-CIES-0014	The occupation
RA-CIES-0015	The whole security situation in the country
RA-CIES-0016	Reconstruction
RA-CIES-0020	The unstable security condition
RA-CIES-0021	Security situation
RA-CIES-0023	The security situation
RA-CIES-0024	Restoring stability to the country
RA-CIES-0025	Transport especially in emergency
RA-CIES-0026	The whole situation in the country

Project ID	QIII.14. Biggest Challenge(s) Facing Respondent's Life
RA-CIES-0028	Re-establishing stability
RA-CIES-0032	Sectarian conflicts
RA-CIES-0036	Killing, the checkpoints above the bridges, the exterior roads
RA-CIES-0037	The difficulties of movement
RA-CIES-0038	American army

Site User Groups Responses

The first question asked respondents what effect, if any, the project had produced on their hopefulness for the future. All of the respondents reported that they were “much more hopeful” (14) or “somewhat more hopeful” (11) as a result of the project. One reported “no change” and one “somewhat less”.

Table 40. Changes in Hopefulness of Site Users as a Result of the Project

Much more hopeful	Somewhat more hopeful	No change	Somewhat less hopeful	Much less hopeful	Total
14	11	1	1	0	27

They were then asked to explain why they felt this way. These responses are listed in Table 41. Site users' responses mirrored those of project managers: the main reason for respondents' improved hopefulness was the positive impact of reconstruction efforts in the city as evidenced by the large number of projects. A number of responses, from students and teachers that benefited from school rehabilitation projects, also highlighted the importance of projects specifically impacting education. For the group that was somewhat less hopeful, FJ-CIES-0018, a canal cleaning project, they responded “There are projects if more importance and benefit like electricity and water.”

Table 41. Reasons for Improved Hopefulness

Project ID	QVI.2 Reasons for Improved Hopefulness
FJ-CIES-0007	Seeing the real work and many promising projects which bring us hope
FJ-CIES-0014	Feeling of increased interest in the needs of youth
FJ-CIES-0017	There are many beneficial projects like electricity, water, and main roads
FJ-CIES-0023	We have hope to develop and extend the college to be a university in the future
FJ-CIES-0028	Feeling more hopeful through seeing the continuous work and decreasing the number of the jobless people
FJ-CIES-0029	The feeling of the work progressing gives hope in changing the situation
RA-CIES-0002	Optimistic because we can teach the students and encourage them in their study
RA-CIES-0003	Education is the nerve of life, project encourages scientific efforts
RA-CIES-0004	Improving the education level
RA-CIES-0005	The psychological comfort of the students and improving the educational level
RA-CIES-0006	Through improving the educational level of students
RA-CIES-0008	Because there are many projects and real work, and an improvement in the economic situation of many people

Project ID	QVI.2 Reasons for Improved Hopefulness
RA-CIES-0009	There are many projects implemented in the city
RA-CIES-0011	The public services are better now
RA-CIES-0012	Because of the large number of projects that show real interest for change for the better
RA-CIES-0014	Improved security and stability
RA-CIES-0015	The increase in work and the large number of projects especially that cares for the youth inspires more hope
RA-CIES-0016	Large number of works and projects in the city
RA-CIES-0021	Providing electricity to the citizens
RA-CIES-0023	The female students deserve access to school and learning and keeping up with the development movement
RA-CIES-0025	Through feeling the care for the youth and their needs
RA-CIES-0028	There is a real interest in improving the city and there are positive results from the projects
RA-CIES-0032	The reconstruction gives hope
RA-CIES-0036	Helps the patients and injured by giving them medical treatment
RA-CIES-0038	The improved stability and the investment in Iraqi human resources

Site users were asked how services provided by the local government had changed over the past six months. A total of 14 groups reported that services had improved while 12 indicated that there had been no change observed. As noted above, several USAID-funded initiatives, including the CSP CIES program and LGP II, work to either improve the performance of local government in providing essential services to citizens or supplement those services by funding projects to address service deficits.

Table 42. Changes in Local Government Services Over the Past Six Months

Much improved	Somewhat improved	No change	Somewhat worse	Much worse	Total
9	5	12	1	0	27

As a follow-up to the preceding question, user groups were asked what services had improved or, if there was no change, what services were most in need of attention (Table 42). As above, services most in need of improvement included water, electricity, roads and sewer systems.

Table 43. What Service Most Needs Improvement

Project ID	QVI.6. Local Government Services in Most Need of Improvement
FJ-CIES-0017	Water, electricity, roads
FJ-CIES-0018	Water and electricity
FJ-CIES-0028	Electricity
FJ-CIES-0029	Water, electricity and other services have not changed
RA-CIES-0002	Tiling street and repairing sewer, drinking water maintenance and electricity
RA-CIES-0003	The infrastructure is still not at the level of our expectations
RA-CIES-0005	The public roads, the sewer, and drinking water

Project ID	QVI.6. Local Government Services in Most Need of Improvement
RA-CIES-0006	Main roads, sewer, water, electricity
RA-CIES-0014	Sewers network, Electric and water networks
RA-CIES-0020	Roads, sewer network, drinking water network
RA-CIES-0021	Sanitation system, water, electric
RA-CIES-0023	Improve water and sewer network
RA-CIES-0036	Main roads, sewage network

About the same number of groups indicated that there had been improvements in similar areas (Table 44) making it difficult to draw broad conclusions. Given, however, that services such as water, sewer and electricity can vary widely by neighborhood, it is not surprising to find a wide variance in responses.

Table 44. What Services Have Improved?

Project ID	QVI.5. Local government services that have improved
FJ-CIES-0007	The construction of schools, offices, and other service buildings
FJ-CIES-0014	Electricity and cleaning and other services
FJ-CIES-0023	Lighting the streets and a small improvement in electricity
RA-CIES-0004	Water stations, and the sewage network
RA-CIES-0008	Medical and educational services, electricity and water
RA-CIES-0009	The electricity, water and other services but the improvement is so slow
RA-CIES-0011	Sewer network, water, electricity
RA-CIES-0012	The electricity, water and roads
RA-CIES-0015	The electricity, the water and improving affected roads
RA-CIES-0016	The cleanliness, water and electricity
RA-CIES-0025	The electricity, water and roads
RA-CIES-0028	Water and tiling roads
RA-CIES-0032	The electricity, water and cleaning services
RA-CIES-0038	Decreasing hours of cutting off electricity and water

When asked to evaluate changes in security over the past six months, all of the respondent groups indicated that conditions were either much improved or somewhat improved, with the majority, 23 of 27 respondents, indicating the former. As noted above in the project managers' responses, security improvements in the area appear to be real.

Table 45. Changes in Security in the Past Six Months

Much improved	Somewhat improved	No change	Somewhat worse	Much worse	Total
23	4	0	0	0	27

When asked to detail what improvements had been noted in security, reduced curfews and nighttime mobility, decreases in killings and kidnappings and reductions in bombings and explosions were highlighted (Table 46).

Table 46. Improvements in Security

Project ID	QVI.8 Examples of Security Improvements
FJ-CIES-0007	The low presence of the American forces, lifting of the night curfew and the checkpoints are now under control of the Iraqi forces.
FJ-CIES-0014	There is no kidnapping, killing and bombs
FJ-CIES-0017	Through decreasing the assassinations and explosions
FJ-CIES-0018	Through reducing the hours of the curfew and decreasing the number of explosions and killing
FJ-CIES-0023	Ability to go out at night and the presence of Iraqi forces and decrease in the killing and kidnapping cases
FJ-CIES-0028	Curfew was removed and decreasing explosions and no more cases of throwing dead bodies in the streets
FJ-CIES-0029	Through the freedom of movement day and night, decreasing the number of explosions and ending of break-ins by American forces
RA-CIES-0002	Free movement in the region and providing some of the essential needs
RA-CIES-0003	The killing, kidnapping and assassinations has decreased
RA-CIES-0004	Ending of the killing and kidnapping
RA-CIES-0005	Decrease the number of car bombings and killing
RA-CIES-0006	The killing and bombing decreased
RA-CIES-0008	There is no threat of terrorism against students and their attendance at the university and the end of violence and terrorism
RA-CIES-0009	There is no killing, kidnapping, bombing or raids
RA-CIES-0011	Murders has decreased, the terrorist gangs have been eliminated
RA-CIES-0012	Decrease in all kinds of terrorism
RA-CIES-0014	The ending of terrorism
RA-CIES-0015	The improvement of the security situation in all aspects and the end of all types of violence and terrorism
RA-CIES-0016	The reduction of curfews, day and night, and the elimination of terrorism
RA-CIES-0020	Defeat of terrorism
RA-CIES-0021	End of terrorism
RA-CIES-0023	The regular attendance of the students to the school/increase in the number of students/laboratory and computers
RA-CIES-0025	The possibility to move day and night and the absence of kidnapping, bombing or assassinations
RA-CIES-0028	Ending kidnapping, explosions and assassinations
RA-CIES-0032	There are no military confrontations
RA-CIES-0036	Terrorism has ended
RA-CIES-0038	Many more security personnel, the interior roads will open soon, and easier transportation

In order to document the effect of CIES projects in addressing some of the root causes of conflict in Iraq, respondents were asked to assess how these projects affect the likelihood of people to engage in conflict (Table 47). Most user groups (20 of 27) indicated that such projects made no difference to people in this issue with only seven

groups affirming that projects made people's involvement in conflict somewhat or much less likely.

Table 47. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict

Much more likely	Somewhat more likely	No change	Somewhat less likely	Much less likely	Total
0	0	20	4	3	27

When asked why CIES projects had no effect on conflict, responses focused on the disconnect, in respondents' views, between they types of projects implemented and the causes of conflict in Iraq.

Table 48. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict – No Change or More Likely

Project ID	QVI.12 Why is Conflict Made More Likely or No Change by Projects
FJ-CIES-0014	There is no relation between conflict and this project
FJ-CIES-0017	Conflict has no relation to cleaning campaign
FJ-CIES-0018	Conflict has no relation to cleaning campaign and maintenance
FJ-CIES-0028	Has no relation to conflicts
FJ-CIES-0029	Cleaning campaign has no relation to conflicts
RA-CIES-0002	Requires more holistic project which increases peoples' unity
RA-CIES-0003	The question is not clear, but the security situation is suitable for solving the conflict
RA-CIES-0004	The responsibility is in the united leadership and the central government
RA-CIES-0005	This question is not relevant to the project
RA-CIES-0006	This project has more impact business and work instead of conflicts
RA-CIES-0011	Engaging conflicts has nothing to do with cleaning campaigns
RA-CIES-0014	The subject has no relation with the project
RA-CIES-0016	These projects have nothing to do with dividing Iraq
RA-CIES-0020	There is no relation between conflicts and cleaning campaign
RA-CIES-0021	People who are engaged in conflicts have no relation with these type of projects
RA-CIES-0025	Those involved in the conflict have their own agenda
RA-CIES-0028	People involved with the conflict have their own agenda
RA-CIES-0032	No answer
RA-CIES-0036	Because the project focuses on Health
RA-CIES-0038	Because the main need is to provide jobs to citizens

For the seven groups that indicated that such projects could decrease conflict, improvements in the economic situation were seen as the main route for such change (Table 49).

Table 49. How Do These Projects Affect Likelihood of People to Engage in Conflict – Less Likely

Project ID	QVI.12 Why is Conflict Made Less Likely by These Projects?
FJ-CIES-0007	That would be because of the development taking place in all of the services
FJ-CIES-0023	Because of decreasing the numbers of the jobless and improving the economic situation
RA-CIES-0008	Improving the economic situation of many people
RA-CIES-0009	The good economic situation for people helps in improving the situation
RA-CIES-0012	Improves the economic situation
RA-CIES-0015	Because of the improvement of the economic situation
RA-CIES-0023	Because it helps the Directorate of Education

Suggestions for projects that would be best for resolving the causes of conflict in Iraq fell into several areas (Table 50). These included infrastructure projects, youth activities and projects to unite citizens. One possible message to be gleaned from this mix of recommendations is that a comprehensive mix of interventions will be required to address the variety of issues that underlie that struggles between groups in the country.

Table 50. Best Projects for Reducing Conflict

Project ID	QVI.12 Best Projects for Reducing Conflict
FJ-CIES-0007	All the projects that reduce the number of the unemployed people
FJ-CIES-0013	The general services for all people and sport yards for the youth
FJ-CIES-0014	Projects that harness the power of youths
FJ-CIES-0017	Improvement of infrastructure
FJ-CIES-0018	Improving the infrastructure
FJ-CIES-0023	Human development projects and decreasing joblessness
FJ-CIES-0028	Not sure
FJ-CIES-0029	Improving the infrastructure
RA-CIES-0002	Not sure
RA-CIES-0003	Security situation, providing job opportunities, increasing the service projects
RA-CIES-0004	Those that increase the unity of citizens
RA-CIES-0005	Industrial and commercial projects and that encourage the co-operation of the people
RA-CIES-0006	Public services projects in particular
RA-CIES-0008	Human development projects and those that absorb the energies of youth
RA-CIES-0009	Service projects
RA-CIES-0011	Improving the infrastructure
RA-CIES-0012	Unsure
RA-CIES-0014	Unite the people and stand against the tyrants and evil
RA-CIES-0015	All kinds of projects that decrease unemployment
RA-CIES-0016	The projects that improve the security and economy
RA-CIES-0020	The infrastructure is most important
RA-CIES-0021	Industrial, trading and education projects
RA-CIES-0023	The types that employ workers and youth in particular
RA-CIES-0025	Improve the education and Infrastructure sectors
RA-CIES-0028	All the educational and services projects
RA-CIES-0032	Any project, but must choose good contractors and implement honestly
RA-CIES-0036	Unite the citizens and raise awareness to stand against evil
RA-CIES-0038	Human resources development, awareness projects, projects to reach all youth

The final question in this section asked site user groups to identify the single biggest obstacle they faced in their lives today. Like the project managers, the security situation was the issue raised by most of the respondents (Table 51).

Table 51. Biggest Challenge Facing Respondents Today

Project ID	QVI.14. Biggest Challenge(s) Facing Respondent's Life
FJ-CIES-0007	The difficulty in moving from place to place in general and especially to reach the college
FJ-CIES-0013	The country security situation of the country
FJ-CIES-0014	Sectarian conflicts
FJ-CIES-0017	Security situation
FJ-CIES-0018	The security situation
FJ-CIES-0023	Security situation
FJ-CIES-0028	Denominational problem and the inability to travel between governorates
FJ-CIES-0029	Sectarian conflict
RA-CIES-0002	The lack of responsibility within a unified central command
RA-CIES-0003	The security situation, the infrastructure for the governorate
RA-CIES-0004	Security situation
RA-CIES-0005	The check points / American forces
RA-CIES-0006	The security situation
RA-CIES-0008	Re establishing the scientific glory of Iraq
RA-CIES-0011	The blocked streets, the security situation
RA-CIES-0013	The occupation
RA-CIES-0016	The occupation
RA-CIES-0020	The unstable security situation
RA-CIES-0021	The security situation
RA-CIES-0025	Sectarian conflict
RA-CIES-0028	The occupation
RA-CIES-0032	The security situation
RA-CIES-0036	The security situation
RA-CIES-0038	The governorate border checkpoints, the security situation, the infrastructures

As discussed above, due to the lack of a randomized sampling procedure for selecting respondents for both managers and the site users groups, it is not possible to generalize the responses to questions about service improvements, security and other issues outside of the specific scope of the projects respondents participated in to the overall population of the region. However, it is likely that many other citizens in the area share the views and concerns of these survey respondents.

Based on the results of the monitoring reports presented in this report, nearly all of the CIES projects observed in Falluja and Ramadi have been completed according to specification, meet the needs of users and beneficiaries and have the potential of serving as lasting community resources. According to the estimates of beneficiaries, thousands of Iraqis will benefit from the diverse and comprehensive portfolio of community enhancements implemented by CSP and their partners.

Recommendations

The analysis of these reports has lent the IBTCI team to make the following recommendations for the CSP program:

- IRD should pay particular attention to project FJ-CIES-0004, whose respondent indicated that the project is in substandard condition from a maintenance perspective.
- IRD should follow-up with RA-CIES-0036 to ensure that the maintenance staff have adequate skills to maintain the general climate control and generation equipment as well as the potentially more sophisticated medical equipment provided by the project.
- IRD should also follow-up with the other five projects that did not report having staff responsible for maintenance to see if maintenance responsibility has been established since the time of the assessment.
- Follow-up RA-CIES-0008 and FJ-CIES-0014, two projects that, although completed for at least a month, were not yet in use at the time of the monitoring visits.
- Follow-up RA-CIES-0014 to identify a solution to what appears to be a lack of either municipal or community ownership and support for this public park project that has been neglected.
- Ensure that project planning includes adequate advance planning and partnership with municipal authorities and local actors to help support the successful transfer of project responsibility and maintenance to the appropriate groups.
- Partner with LGP II and other projects that are working to build the capacity of local governments to encourage municipal ownership and follow-up of appropriate CIES projects. High-quality, sustainable municipal services are unlikely to develop as long as less appropriate groups are filling the gap and projects should use their on-going project implementation activities as local capacity building opportunities wherever possible.
- CIES program staff should consider working with the PRTs to assist in facilitating the movement of essential supplies and equipment where checkpoints impede the timely flow of vehicles.

Annex A. MEPP II Monitoring Background.

Background of the CSP and the MEPP II monitoring effort:

The United States is committed to the future success of Iraq. Within USAID/Iraq's Transition Strategic Plan 2006-2008, the first of four strategies delineated is "Focused Stabilization: Reduce the incentives for participation in violent conflict." This is the primary objective of the renamed Community Stabilization Program (CSP). To help plan and manage the process of assessing and reporting progress towards achieving its strategic objectives (SO), USAID/Iraq (hereinafter the "Mission") made final its Performance Management Plan (PMP) in August 2006. In the PMP document, consistent with earlier Mission objectives, the strategy to reduce the incentives for participation in violent conflict is identified as Strategic Objective 7 (SO 7).

The CSP is seen as a key element to transition Iraq to a stable, democratic and prosperous country. Towards this end, Request for Application (RFA) number 267-06-001 was issued on 2 January 2006 seeking applicants to implement the "Focused Stabilization in Strategic Cities Initiative" (FSSCI). International Relief and Development (IRD) was awarded the Cooperative Agreement (267-A-00-06-00503-00) on 29 May 2006. As defined in the Cooperative Agreement "Program Description", the purpose of FSSCI (now the CSP) is to "complement military security efforts, and civilian local government development, with economic and social stabilization efforts. The objectives of CSP are to: 1) create jobs and develop employable skills with a focus on unemployed youth; 2) revitalize community infrastructure and essential services; 3) support established businesses and develop new sustainable businesses; and 4) help mitigate conflict in selected communities." These four objectives were later modified (see Modification 03 below) to: 1) Public works programs and employment generation; 2) vocational training and apprenticeship programs; 3) Micro, Small-Medium Enterprise (MSME) Development program; and 4) Youth Programs (conflict mitigation).

By carrying out these activities the CSP implementing partner should achieve measurable progress towards the Mission's SO 7. The Mission PMP and the CSP PMP identify the measurable indicators that will evidence the achievement of the SO. The Intermediate Result (IR) in the Mission PMP is to show the "number of insurgent incidents decreased."

While the CSP program was started in Baghdad with primarily Community Infrastructure and Essential Services (CIES) projects, it has now expanded both geographically as well as sectorally to address the four key objectives stated in the Scope of Work. IRD is focusing on neighborhoods and districts in cities and peri-urban areas identified by the USG and GOI as areas with the greatest need.

On 19 November 2006, IBTCI was notified by the CTO about "ideas for field surveys." Among these ideas was the use of IBTCI monitors to confirm and validate projects that had been initiated through IRD by the CSP program. That initial monitoring proved successful, and has led to this follow-on effort that continues to monitor the rapidly expanding number of CSP projects. The specific assignment was to use the field monitors to examine CIES projects to:

- a) Confirm location and status of on-going projects and activities, and provide the required evidence of their existence;
- b) Assess that progress is in fact being accomplished in a satisfactory manner in terms of the implementation of projects and/or activities;
- c) Identify any problems or obstacles encountered during implementation, and provide recommendations for improvement;
- d) Assess the quality of projects, activities or services to be provided in relation to required specifications and standards;
- e) Assess community participation and/or level of customer satisfaction of projects and activities, as well as services provided (i.e. training);
- f) Assess if projects are being used for their intended purpose when completed, and of their continuation after the conclusion of program support; and
- g) Assess participation and coordination of CSP with local governments, communities, and with other U.S. government agencies.

The first report submitted by IBTCI in December 2006 covered only the CIES projects being implemented in Baghdad. Since that time, other sectors as well as geographical locations have been added and as a result, IBTCI has undertaken to enlarge the scope of the monitoring to include Business Development and Economic Growth for Youth Projects. Monitoring is on-going in Baghdad, Kirkuk, Mosul and Anbar.

Annex B. IRD Response to the Anbar CIES Monitoring

Overview

The issue of project site or equipment maintenance and upkeep after completion is a recurring theme in the report. One of the greatest challenges to successful implementation of CSP Community Infrastructure and Essential Service (CIES) projects is the lack of community contribution, to include maintenance personnel and equipment, from local government and municipalities.

The projects highlighted in the report were all implemented during intense military operations against the insurgency and, more importantly, during a time when local government was generally ineffective or non-existent. Project priorities were set by the few government officials available at reconstruction and development committees headed by US Military and members of Embedded Provincial Reconstruction Teams (EPRT). In Fallujah alone, the head of the city council, city mayor, and Directorate General of the municipality were assassinated or replaced several times in the course of a four to six month period. This contributed in part to the failure of municipal officials or Directorates General to follow through on commitments and agreements secured by CSP from their predecessors.

As each of the Anbar cities achieved greater stability, local government became much more effective and has taken the lead on setting reconstruction and development priorities. Municipal workers responsible for maintenance and upkeep are now able to move throughout the city. In all of the examples cited in the report, CSP and the Directorates General of municipality set up a cost-sharing program on maintenance and upkeep of parks and soccer fields. Through the EPRT in Fallujah and Ramadi and in coordination with the municipalities, CSP identified unemployed persons from the community to serve as maintenance personnel and supervisors for parks and recreation areas. In both cities the municipality has already begun employing these individuals and will assume full responsibility over them in April 2008.

There are also examples in the report of rehabilitation or reconstruction being completed but the facilities not being utilized. This is also related to a lack of effective and efficient government at the local and provincial level. For example, CSP experienced extensive delays in securing the list of approved medical equipment from the Directorate General of Health for several clinics after the DG was removed from the provincial council but not replaced for several months. The new Directorate General then refused to provide the appropriate approvals for several weeks delaying final turnover of three clinics to the end user. It is important to consider that working through local government in complex humanitarian environments takes time. Since the report was written the clinics have been furnished, the staff properly trained, and the project turned over to the appropriate end user.

The report also recommends CSP ensure adequate planning and partnership with municipal authorities. As mentioned above, this was complicated by the lack of municipal government in the assessed cities. The stability achieved in Anbar has resulted in great improvements in the effectiveness of local government and their ability to take the lead on reconstruction and development. It is not mentioned in the report whether or not IBTCI interviewed any of the municipal officials, US Military, or EPRT members. If they had, they would have discovered that CSP participates in and takes its priorities from local reconstruction and

development committee meetings that involve city councils, city mayors, municipal officials, US Military, and EPRT members. Effective planning and implementation was complicated not by lack of communication or coordination. Rather, instability, ongoing military operations, lack of capacity and mobility of local government and municipal officials, and insufficient budget resources impeded timely and effective implementation in some instances. However, continued interaction with city councils, municipalities, and community leaders has resulted in these issues being properly addressed.

Response to IBTCI Recommendations

1. IRD should pay particular attention to project FJ-CIES-0004, whose respondent indicated that the project is in substandard condition from a maintenance perspective.

Prior to implementing the project, CSP secured approval from the Directorate General of the Municipality and the city mayor to rehabilitate the park and agreement letters to maintain it upon completion. The project was completed just before major military operations began following a rise in sectarian violence as well as a change in city council and municipal leadership. Initially, the new city council and municipal leadership did not agree to follow through on past agreements made by the former city council. In February of 2008, CSP implemented several clean up campaigns in the areas where surge operations had taken place to include public parks rehabilitated by CSP and Civil Affairs units. The new city council later assigned maintenance crews to all of the public parks rehabilitated by CSP and the issue has been resolved.

2. IRD should follow-up with RA-CIES-0036 to ensure that the maintenance staff have adequate skills to maintain the general climate control and generation equipment as well as the potentially more sophisticated medical equipment provided by the project.

The provincial Directorate General of Health was required to appoint the appropriately qualified staff to maintain the generation equipment as part of the community contribution. CSP does not agree with the report that these personnel have not been appointed. The site was visited by CSP Program Director who found the generation equipment properly maintained and operated. The project did not provide for sophisticated medical equipment. The equipment was provided by the Directorate General of Health.

3. IRD should also follow-up with the other five projects that did not report having staff responsible for maintenance to see if maintenance responsibility has been established since the time of the assessment.

As mentioned above, there were challenges encountered with the municipality following up on agreed upon maintenance and upkeep responsibilities as part of the community contribution. The report is correct to stress the importance of follow up on these projects. This issues was duly resolved with the appropriate municipal officials through a temporary cost-sharing (day laborer) project with the final turn over expected in April 2008.

4. Follow-up RA-CIES-0008 and FJ-CIES-0014, two projects that, although completed for at least a month, were not yet in use at the time of the monitoring visits.

The first project, RA-CIES-0008, Al Anbar University Health Clinic encountered extensive delays as a result of challenges securing final approval for the provision of the equipment from the Directorate General of Health and, subsequently, USAID Agreement Officer

Approval for several items. These delays were extensive but part of the required approval process. The clinic has since been properly furnished and turned over to the appropriate end user. Completion and turn over of the second project, FJ-CIES-0014, Nazal Soccer Field, experienced extensive delays when a local citizen contested ownership of the property with the city council forcing CSP to delay implementation. The issue was resolved, land title from the city council verified, and the project turned over to the appropriate end user. CSP has since hosted several soccer matches at this location and it is used by locals daily.

5. Follow-up RA-CIES-0014 to identify a solution to what appears to be a lack of either municipal or community ownership and support for this public park project that has been neglected.

The municipality requested CSP implement the project and agreed to maintain the park upon completion. The CIES and M&E units both visited the project after the assessment by IBTCI and found the park was not being maintained. As part of CSP-Ramadi Municipality day labor project the park was cleaned up. It is now being monitored by the district council who pay a local citizen to supervise and maintain the park.

6. Ensure that project planning includes adequate advance planning and partnership with municipal authorities and local actors to help support the successful transfer of project responsibility and maintenance to the appropriate groups.

This has always been an integral and required component of CSP implementation. All project packages include priority requests, approvals, and agreements with the appropriate government or municipal agency. In a complex humanitarian environment where the municipality has been devastated by an insurgency it is expected that challenges will be encountered, including a failure on their part to maintain projects they have requested be implemented. This process is improving in tandem with positive security developments.

7. Partner with LGP II and other projects that are working to build the capacity of local governments to encourage municipal ownership and follow-up of appropriate CIES projects. High-quality, sustainable municipal services are unlikely to develop as long as less appropriate groups are filling the gap and projects should use their on-going project implementation activities as local capacity building opportunities wherever possible.

This is and has always been an integral component of CSP. In both cities assessed by IBTCI, CSP collaborates with all USAID implementing partners and local government officials with the aim to building capacity.

8. CIES program staff should consider working with the PRTs to assist in facilitating the movement of essential supplies and equipment where checkpoints impede the timely flow of vehicles.

PRTs are not able to improve or assist movement of essential supplies and equipment in Al Anbar. This is achieved through US Military units, Iraqi Police, and Iraqi Army.

Annex C. Field monitor data collection instrument for completed projects.

CIES COMPLETED PROJECT MONITORING FORM	
INSTRUCTION TO THE MONITOR: COMPLETE THIS FIRST PAGE OF THE MONITORING FORM BEFORE PROCEEDING TO THE PROJECT SITE.	
PROJECT INFORMATION PANEL (1-8 ARE TO BE COMPLETED AT THE PARTNERS OFFICE)	
1 PROJECT ID	2 SITE VISIT DATE DD/MM/YEAR ___/___/___
3 GOVERNORATE:	4 DISTRICT (QADA1):
5 SUB-DISTRICT (NAHIYA):	6 MAHALLA/ZUQAQ:
7 MONITOR NAME:	8 MOBILIZER NAME:
9 RESULT OF INTERVIEW: COMPLETED.....1 REFUSED.....2 NOT AT HOME3 SECURITY PREVENTED ACCESS4 OTHER (SPECIFY).....9	10 DATA ENTRY CLERK: NAME: _____ DATE OF ENTRY _____
MONITOR NOTES: IN THIS SPACE THE MONITOR RECORDS NOTES ABOUT WHY THE SITE VISIT WAS NOT COMPLETED.	

PART I – INTERVIEW WITH PROJECT MANAGER

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	PLEASE INDICATE THE NAME, TITLE AND PROJECT ROLE OF THE RESPONDENT.		
2	DESCRIBE THE PROJECT APPROVAL PROCESS		
3	WHO IS IMPLEMENTING THE PROJECT? <i>ENTER THE COMPANY OR CONTRACTORY NAME</i>		
4	WHEN WAS THIS PROJECT COMPLETED? <i>DD/MM/YEAR</i> <i>ENTER 99/99/9999 IF UNKNOWN</i>	_/_/_	
5	TYPE OF PROJECT <i>IF MULTIPLE TYPES SELECT ONLY THE DOMINANT TYPE</i>	EQUIPMENT SUPPLIES 1 CLEANING CAMPAIGN 2 NEW BUILDING CONSTRUCTION..... 3 BUILDING REHABILITATION 4 INFRASTRUCTURE (WATER, SEWER, ELECTRIC) 5 INFRASTRUCTURE (ROADS) 6 CAPACITY BUILDING 7 OTHER (PLEASE SPECIFY) 9	
6	IS THE SITE BEING USED?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 8
7	IS THE SITE BEING USED FOR ITS INTENDED PURPOSE?	YES 1 NO 2	NEXT TABLE
8	IF NO, WHY IS THE SITE NOT BEING USED OR NOT BEING USED FOR ITS INTENDED PURPOSES? WRITE ALL RESPONSES		NEXT TABLE

PART II – PROJECT MAINTENANCE QUESTIONS

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	DESCRIBE WHY MAINTENANCE IS OR IS NOT REQUIRED FOR THIS PROJECT. WRITE ALL RESPONSES		IF NONE NEEDED GOTO NEXT TABLE
2	WHO IS RESPONSIBLE FOR MAINTAINING THE PROJECT SITE? (NAME THE PERSON OR INSTITUTION RESPONSIBLE; IF NO ONE CAN BE IDENTIFIED WRITE 'NO ONE')		
3	IS TRAINING NEEDED TO MAINTAIN THIS PROJECT?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 5
4	WHAT TRAINING IS NEED FOR MAINTAINING THIS PROJECT? WRITE ALL RESPONSES		GOTO 6
5	IF NO, WHY IS MAINTENANCE TRAINING NOT REQUIRED? WRITE ALL RESPONSES		
6	IS A PERSON, OR PERSONS, WHO ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR MAINTENANCE OF THE PROJECT SITE OR EQUIPMENT AVAILABLE FOR AN INTERVIEW?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO10
THE FOLLOWING QUESTIONS ARE FOR MAINTENANCE STAFF			
7	DID YOU RECEIVE TRAINING ON HOW TO MAINTAIN THE SITE OR THE EQUIPMENT PROVIDED?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO10
8	PLEASE ASK THE PERSON TRAINED TO INDICATE THEIR STRENGTH OF AGREEMENT THAT "THE MAINTENANCE TRAINING RECEIVED WAS ADEQUATE FOR MAINTAINING THE SITE OR EQUIPMENT PROVIDED" CIRCLE ONLY ONE RESPONSE	AGREE VERY MUCH1 AGREE MODERATELY2 AGREE SLIGHTLY3 DISAGREE SLIGHTLY.....4 DISAGREE MODERATELY5 DISAGREE STRONGLY6	
9	ASK THE PERSON, OR PERSONS, TRAINED TO DESCRIBE WHY THE TRAINING RECEIVED WAS, OR WAS NOT ADEQUATE. WRITE ALL RESPONSES		

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
10	WHAT OBSTACLES CAN THE MAINTENANCE STAFF OR RESPONDENT IDENTIFY THAT PREVENT THEM FROM SUSTAINING THE OPERATION OF THE EQUIPMENT OR THE PROJECT SITE? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		IF NONE, NEXT TABLE
11	WHAT RECOMMENDATIONS DO THE MAINTENANCE STAFF OR THE RESPONDENT HAVE ON HOW THESE OBSTACLES MIGHT BE OVERCOME? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		NEXT TABLE

PART III – GENERAL QUESTIONS FOR THE RESPONDENT FROM Q1 OF THE FIRST TABLE

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	AS A RESULT OF THIS PROJECT, HOW HAS YOUR HOPEFULNESS FOR THE FUTURE CHANGED? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH MORE HOPEFUL1 SOMEWHAT MORE HOPEFUL2 NO CHANGE.....3 SOMEWHAT LESS HOPEFUL4 MUCH LESS HOPEFUL5	GOTO3 GOTO3 GOTO3
2	IF YOU ARE MORE HOPEFUL, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHAT HAS CAUSED THIS CHANGE:		GOTO 4
3	IF YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHY YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE:		
4	IN THE PAST 6 MONTHS, HOW HAVE SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT CHANGED? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH IMPROVED1 SOMEWHAT IMPROVED2 NO CHANGE.....3 SOMEWHAT WORSE.....4 MUCH WORSE.....5	GOTO 6 GOTO 6 GOTO 6
5	IF SERVICES HAVE IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF WHAT HAS IMPROVED: <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		GOTO 7
6	IF NO CHANGE OR WORSE, WHAT SERVICE MOST NEEDS IMPROVEMENT? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
7	IN THE PAST SIX MONTHS, HOW HAS	MUCH IMPROVED1	

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
	SECURITY CHANGED IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	SOMEWHAT IMPROVED2 NO CHANGE.....3 SOMEWHAT WORSE.....4 MUCH WORSE.....5	GOTO 9 GOTO 9 GOTO 9
8	IF SECURITY HAS IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF HOW SECURITY HAS IMPROVED. <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		GOTO10
9	IF NO CHANGE OR IT HAS BECOME WORSE, WHY DO YOU THINK SECURITY HAS NOT IMPROVED OR HAS BECOME WORSE IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
10	IN YOUR OPINION, HOW DO THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS AFFECT THE LIKLIHOOD OF PEOPLE TO ENGAGE IN THE TYPE OF CONFLICT THAT IS DIVIDING IRAQ? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT 1 SOMEWHAT MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT.....2 MAKES NO DIFFERENCE3 SOMEWHAT LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT.....4 MUCH LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT .5	GOTO12 GOTO12 GOTO12
11	IF THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
12	IF THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT OR WILL MAKE NO DIFFERENCE, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
13	IN YOUR OPINION, WHAT TYPES OF PROJECTS WOULD BE BEST TO DECREASE CONFLICT IN IRAQ? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
14	WHAT IS THE SINGLE BIGGEST CHALLENGE YOU ARE FACING IN YOUR LIFE TODAY? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		

PART IV – PROJECT RECORDS AND SITE USAGE

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	DESCRIBE WHO ARE INTENDED TO BE THE MAIN SPECIFIC BENEFICIARIES OF THE PROJECT OR EQUIPMENT PROVIDED (E.G., PRIMARY SCHOOL AGE CHILDREN, YOUTH, TEACHERS, THE SICK AND INJURED OF THE AREA, RESIDENTS OF A SPECIFIC AREA, THE STAFF AT A SPECIFIC HOSPITAL OR HEALTH		

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
	CLINIC ETC. WOMEN PRE AND POST NATAL)		
2	ARE RECORDS KEPT ON THE USAGE OF THE SITE?	YES 1 NO 2 NA/DK..... 3	GOTO 4 GOTO 6
3	IF NA/DK, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHY?		GOTO 6
4	WERE YOU (THE MONITOR) ABLE TO SEE THE RECORDS SHOWING SITE USAGE (E.G., ENROLMENT RECORDS, NUMBER OF PATIENTS, USERS OF SPORTS FACILITIES, ETC.)?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 6
5	IF YES, WOULD IT BE POSSIBLE TO VERIFY THE NUMBER OF BENEFICIARIES FROM THE TYPE AND NUMBER OF RECORDS KEPT BY THE PROJECT?	YES 1 NO 2	
6	PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW THE NUMBERS BELOW WERE ESTIMATED/CALCULATED:		
7	ESTIMATED NUMBER OF MALES USING THE SITE EACH WEEK		
8	ESTIMATED NUMBER OF FEMALES USING THE SITE EACH WEEK		
9	TYPICAL AGE OF MOST USERS OF THE PROJECT	INFANTS 5 AND UNDER1 PRIMARY SCHOOL AGE2 SECONDARY SCHOOL AGE3 YOUNG MEN OR WOMEN (18 – 44)4 MEN OR WOMEN (45 AND OVER).....5 ALL AGES (NO SPECIFIC AGE GROUP).....6 OTHER (SPECIFY)9	

PART V – SITE BENEFICIARY INTERVIEW

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	MONITOR DESCRIBES HERE HOW THE GROUP OF SITE USERS OR BENEFICIARIES WERE SELECTED OR ASSEMBLED FOR THE INTERVIEW:		
2	MONITOR DESCRIBES HERE THE GROUP OF SITE USERS OR BENEFICIARIES THAT WERE INTERVIEWED AT THE PROJECT SITE:		
3	NUMBER OF MALE MEMBERS IN THE GROUP		
4	NUMBER OF FEMALE MEMBERS IN THE		

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
	GROUP		
5	DOES THIS PROJECT/EQUIPMENT MEET YOUR NEEDS? (RECORD THE MAJORITY HELD VIEW)	YES1 NO.....2	
6	WHAT CHANGES OR IMPROVEMENTS TO THE PROJECT SITE WOULD THE GROUP LIKE TO SEE? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
7	ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE WAY THE PROJECT HAS BEEN MAINTAINED?	YES1 NO.....2	
8	WHAT IMPROVEMENTS IN THE MAINTENANCE OF THE SITE WOULD THE GROUP LIKE TO SEE? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
9	HOW IS THE COMMUNITY TAKING RESPONSIBILITY FOR MAINTAINING THE PROJECT SITE OR EQUIPMENT? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
10	WHAT OBSTACLES CAN THE GROUP IDENTIFY THAT PREVENT THEM FROM SUSTAINING THE OPERATION OF THE EQUIPMENT OR THE PROJECT SITE? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
11	WHAT RECOMMENDATIONS DOES THE GROUP HAVE ON HOW THESE OBSTACLES MIGHT BE OVERCOME? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
12	HAS THE PROJECT MADE A DIFFERENCE IN YOUR DAILY LIVES?	YES1 NO.....2	GOTO 14

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
13	IF THE GROUP CONFIRMS THAT THE PROJECT HAS MADE A POSITIVE DIFFERENCE IN THEIR DAILY LIVES ASK THEM TO PROVIDE <u>SPECIFIC INSTANCES</u> OF WHY THIS IS SO. <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
14	IF THE GROUP SAYS THAT THE PROJECT HAS NOT MADE A POSITIVE DIFFERENCE IN THEIR DAILY LIVES ASK THEM TO IDENTIFY THE REASONS THAT THIS IS SO. <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		

PART VI – GENERAL QUESTIONS FOR THE PROJECT BENEFICIARIES

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	AS A RESULT OF THIS PROJECT ARE YOU FEELING MORE HOPEFUL FOR THE FUTURE, LESS HOPEFUL FOR THE FUTURE OR NO DIFFERENCE? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH MORE HOPEFUL1 SOMEWHAT MORE HOPEFUL2 NO CHANGE.....3 SOMEWHAT LESS HOPEFUL4 MUCH LESS HOPEFUL5	GOTO3 GOTO3 GOTO3
2	IF YOU ARE MORE HOPEFUL, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHAT HAS CAUSED THIS CHANGE:		GOTO 4
3	IF YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHY YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE:		
4	IN THE PAST 6 MONTHS, HOW HAVE SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT CHANGED? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH IMPROVED1 SOMEWHAT IMPROVED2 NO CHANGE.....3 SOMEWHAT WORSE.....4 MUCH WORSE.....5	GOTO 6 GOTO 6 GOTO 6
5	IF SERVICES HAVE IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF WHAT HAS IMPROVED: <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		GOTO 7
6	IF NO CHANGE OR WORSE, WHAT SERVICE MOST NEEDS IMPROVEMENT?		

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
7	IN THE PAST SIX MONTHS, HOW HAS SECURITY CHANGED IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD?	MUCH IMPROVED 1 SOMEWHAT IMPROVED 2 NO CHANGE..... 3 SOMEWHAT WORSE..... 4 MUCH WORSE..... 5	GOTO 9 GOTO 9 GOTO 9
	<i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>		
8	IF SECURITY HAS IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF HOW SECURITY HAS IMPROVED.		GOTO 10
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
9	IF NO CHANGE OR IT HAS BECOME WORSE, WHY DO YOU THINK SECURITY HAS NOT IMPROVED OR HAS BECOME WORSE IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD?		
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
10	DO YOU BELIEVE THAT THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE MORE OR LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN THE TYPE OF CONFLICT THAT IS DIVIDING IRAQ?	MUCH MORE LIKELY 1 SOMEWHAT MORE LIKELY 2 MAKES NO DIFFERENCE 3 SOMEWHAT LESS LIKELY 4 MUCH LESS LIKELY 5	GOTO 12 GOTO 12 GOTO 12
11	IF PARTICIPATION IN THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO?		
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
12	IF PARTICIPATION IN THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT OR WILL MAKE NO DIFFERENCE, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO?		
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
13	IN YOUR OPINION, WHAT TYPES OF PROJECTS WOULD BE BEST TO DECREASE CONFLICT IN IRAQ?		
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
14	WHAT IS THE SINGLE BIGGEST CHALLENGE YOU ARE FACING IN YOUR LIFE TODAY?		
	<i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		

PART VII – MONITOR’S OBSERVATIONS ON THE QUALITY OF CONSTRUCTION

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	DOES THIS PROJECT INCLUDE NEW CONSTRUCTION, REPAIRS OR REHABILITATION OF EXISTING FACILITIES OR INFRASTRUCTURE?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO NEXT TABLE
2	WHEN MAKING MY OBSERVATIONS I HAD A COPY OF THE BILL OF QUANTITY WITH ME?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 4

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
3	WHY DID THE MONITOR NOT HAVE A COPY OF THE BOQ?		GOTO 5
4	IF YOU OBSERVED DEFICIENCIES IN THE PROJECT COMPARED WITH THE BOQ, PLEASE <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT		
5	IS THE QUALITY OF THE CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION OF THE PROJECT TO STANDARD?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 9
6	IF NO, <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT:		
7	IF CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION WAS BELOW STANDARD HAS THE USEFULNESS OF THE PROJECT BEEN AFFECTED?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 9
8	IF THE USEFULNESS OF THE PROJECT HAS BEEN AFFECTED BY BELOW STANDARD CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION DESCRIBE FULLY HOW THIS HAS OCCURRED		
9	IF YOU OBSERVED OTHER DEFICIENCIES IN THE PROJECT, PLEASE <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT:		
10	WOULD YOU RECOMMEND THAT AN EXPERT VISIT THIS SITE?	YES 1 NO 2	

PART VIII – MONITOR’S COMMENTS:

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE
1	WHAT ARE THE MAJOR STRENGTHS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THIS PROJECT?	

2	WHAT ARE THE MAIN OBSTACLES FACING THE PROJECT BASED ON YOUR VISIT?	
3	MONITOR'S COMMENTS AND OR RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING THIS PROJECT	
4	WAS IRD STAFF PRESENT DURING THE INTERVIEW?	YES 1 NO 2
5	MONITOR'S FIELD NOTES REGARDING THE MONITORING PROCESS	

Annex D. Field monitor data collection instruments for ongoing projects.

CIES ONGOING PROJECT MONITORING FORM	
INSTRUCTION TO THE MONITOR: COMPLETE THIS FIRST PAGE OF THE MONITORING FORM BEFORE PROCEEDING TO THE PROJECT SITE.	
PROJECT INFORMATION PANEL (1-8 ARE TO BE COMPLETED AT THE PARTNERS OFFICE)	
1 PROJECT ID	2 SITE VISIT DATE DD/MM/YEAR ___/___/___
3 GOVERNORATE:	4 DISTRICT (QADA1):
5 SUB-DISTRICT (NAHIYA):	6 MAHALLA/ZUQAQ:
7 MONITOR NAME:	8 MOBILIZER NAME:
9 RESULT OF INTERVIEW: COMPLETED..... 1 REFUSED 2 NOT AT HOME 3 SECURITY PREVENTED ACCESS..... 4 OTHER (SPECIFY) 9	10 DATA ENTRY CLERK: NAME: _____ DATE OF ENTRY _____
MONITOR NOTES: IN THIS SPACE THE MONITOR RECORDS NOTES ABOUT WHY THE SITE VISIT WAS NOT COMPLETED.	

PART I – INTERVIEW WITH PROJECT SITE MANAGER/FOREMAN

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
9	PLEASE INDICATE THE NAME, TITLE AND PROJECT ROLE OF THE RESPONDENT:		
10	DESCRIBE THE PROJECT APPROVAL PROCESS		
11	WHO IS IMPLEMENTING THE PROJECT? <i>ENTER THE COMPANY OR CONTRACTORY NAME</i>		
12	ACCORDING TO THE SIGNED CONTRACT, WHEN IS THIS PROJECT SCHEDULED TO BE COMPLETED? <i>DD/MM/YEAR</i> <i>ENTER 99/99/9999 IF UNKNOWN</i>	_/_/_	
13	IS THE PROJECT ON TARGET TO BE COMPLETED ACCORDING TO THE CONTRACT?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 8
14	IF NO, WHEN IS IT ANTICIPATED TO BE COMPLETED? <i>DD/MM/YEAR</i> <i>ENTER 99/99/9999 IF UNKNOWN</i>	_/_/_	
15	IF COMPLETION IS DELAYED WHAT ARE THE CAUSES?		
16	IS THERE ACTIVE WORK ON THE SITE?	YES 1 NO 2	
17	IS THE COMMUNITY INVOLVED IN THE WORK ON THE SITE PROVIDING "SWEAT EQUITY"?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO11
18	IF YES, WHAT WORK IS THE COMMUNITY PROVIDING? <i>CIRCLE ALL THAT APPLY</i>	PROJECT DESIGN 1 UNPAID VOLUNTEER LABOR 2 PROVIDING SECURITY TO THE PROJECT 3 DONATION OF PROJECT MATERIALS OR EQUIPMENT 4 OTHER (PLEASE DESCRIBE OTHER) 9	GOTO12 GOTO12 GOTO12 GOTO12 GOTO12
19	IF NO, WHY IS THE COMMUNITY NOT PARTICIPATING IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
20	TYPE OF PROJECT <i>IF MULTIPLE TYPES SELECT ONLY THE DOMINANT TYPE</i>	EQUIPMENT SUPPLIES 1 CLEANING CAMPAIGN 2 NEW BUILDING CONSTRUCTION..... 3 BUILDING REHABILITATION 4 INFRASTRUCTURE (WATER, SEWER, ELECTRIC 5 INFRASTRUCTURE (ROADS) 6 CAPACITY BUILDING 7 OTHER (PLEASE SPECIFY) 9	

PART II – GENERAL QUESTIONS FOR THE RESPONDENT

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	AS A RESULT OF THIS PROJECT, HOW HAS YOUR HOPEFULNESS FOR THE FUTURE CHANGED? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH MORE HOPEFUL 1 SOMEWHAT MORE HOPEFUL 2 NO CHANGE..... 3 SOMEWHAT LESS HOPEFUL..... 4 MUCH LESS HOPEFUL 5	GOTO 3 GOTO 3 GOTO 3
2	IF YOU ARE MORE HOPEFUL, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHAT HAS CAUSED THIS CHANGE:		GOTO 4
3	IF YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE, PLEASE EXPLAIN WHY YOU ARE LESS HOPEFUL OR THERE HAS BEEN NO CHANGE:		
4	IN THE PAST 6 MONTHS, HOW HAVE SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT CHANGED? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH IMPROVED 1 SOMEWHAT IMPROVED 2 NO CHANGE..... 3 SOMEWHAT WORSE..... 4 MUCH WORSE..... 5	GOTO 6 GOTO 6 GOTO 6
5	IF SERVICES HAVE IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF WHAT HAS IMPROVED: <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		GOTO 7
6	IF NO CHANGE OR WORSE, WHAT SERVICE MOST NEEDS IMPROVEMENT? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
7	IN THE PAST SIX MONTHS, HOW HAS SECURITY CHANGED IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH IMPROVED 1 SOMEWHAT IMPROVED 2 NO CHANGE..... 3 SOMEWHAT WORSE..... 4 MUCH WORSE..... 5	GOTO 9 GOTO 9 GOTO 9

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
8	IF SECURITY HAS IMPROVED, PLEASE GIVE SPECIFIC EXAMPLES OF HOW SECURITY HAS IMPROVED. <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		GOTO10
9	IF NO CHANGE OR IT HAS BECOME WORSE, WHY DO YOU THINK SECURITY HAS NOT IMPROVED OR HAS BECOME WORSE IN YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
10	IN YOUR OPINION, HOW DO THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS AFFECT THE LIKLIHOOD OF PEOPLE TO ENGAGE IN THE TYPE OF CONFLICT THAT IS DIVIDING IRAQ? <i>MONITOR READ RESPONSES</i>	MUCH MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT 1 SOMEWHAT MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT.....2 MAKES NO DIFFERENCE3 SOMEWHAT LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT.....4 MUCH LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT .5	GOTO12 GOTO12 GOTO12
11	IF THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE LESS LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
12	IF THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS WOULD MAKE PEOPLE MORE LIKELY TO ENGAGE IN CONFLICT OR WILL MAKE NO DIFFERENCE, WHY DO YOU BELIEVE THIS IS SO? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
13	IN YOUR OPINION, WHAT TYPES OF PROJECTS WOULD BE BEST TO DECREASE CONFLICT IN IRAQ? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		
14	WHAT IS THE SINGLE BIGGEST CHALLENGE YOU ARE FACING IN YOUR LIFE TODAY? <i>WRITE ALL RESPONSES</i>		

PART II – MONITOR’S OBSERVATIONS ON THE QUALITY OF CONSTRUCTION

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
1	DOES THIS PROJECT INCLUDE NEW CONSTRUCTION, REPAIRS OR REHABILITATION OF EXISTING FACILITIES OR INFRASTRUCTURE?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO NEXT TABLE
2	WHEN MAKING MY OBSERVATIONS I HAD A COPY OF THE BILL OF QUANTITY WITH ME?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 4
3	WHY DID THE MONITOR NOT HAVE A COPY OF THE BOQ?		GOTO 5

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE	SKIP
4	IF YOU OBSERVED DEFICIENCIES IN THE PROJECT COMPARED WITH THE BOQ, PLEASE <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT		
5	IS THE QUALITY OF THE CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION OF THE PROJECT TO STANDARD?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 9
6	IF NO, <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT:		
7	IF CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION WAS BELOW STANDARD HAS THE USEFULNESS OF THE PROJECT BEEN AFFECTED?	YES 1 NO 2	GOTO 9
8	IF THE USEFULNESS OF THE PROJECT HAS BEEN AFFECTED BY BELOW STANDARD CONSTRUCTION, REPAIR OR REHABILITATION DESCRIBE FULLY HOW THIS HAS OCCURRED		
9	IF YOU OBSERVED OTHER DEFICIENCIES IN THE PROJECT, PLEASE <u>DESCRIBE FULLY</u> WHAT WAS FOUND TO BE DEFICIENT:		
10	WOULD YOU RECOMMEND THAT AN EXPERT VISIT THIS SITE?	YES 1 NO 2	

PART III – MONITOR’S NOTES

#	QUESTION	RESPONSE
1	WHAT ARE THE MAJOR STRENGTHS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF THIS PROJECT TO DATE?	
2	WHAT OBSTACLES IS THE PROJECT FACING?	
3	MONITOR’S COMMENTS AND OR RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING THIS PROJECT	

4	WAS IRD STAFF PRESENT DURING THE INTERVIEW?	YES 1 NO 2
5	MONITOR'S FIELD NOTES REGARDING THE MONITORING PROCESS	

Annex E. Translated field monitor site visit reports.

(REDACTED)