



Technical Support for the Zanzibar Country Coordinating Mechanism Final Report for OGAC Washington & USAID/Tanzania

Catherine Severo, MSH
Clare Gibson Giraud, Consultant
Paul Kizza, Consultant
Wayne Stinson, MSH
Saeed Osmani, MSH
Patrick Waweru, Deloitte/Tz
Frank Thurania, Deloitte/Tz
Peter Maina, Maer Associates

March 7, 2007

This report was made possible through support provided by the US Agency for International Development, under the terms of Cooperative Agreement Number GPO-A-00-05-00024-00. The opinions expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the US Agency for International Development.

Leadership, Management and Sustainability Program
Management Sciences for Health
784 Memorial Drive
Cambridge, MA 02139
Telephone: (617) 250-9500
www.msh.org/lms



Technical Support for the Zanzibar Country Coordinating Mechanism

Final Report For OGAC Washington & USAID/Tanzania

7 March 2007

LMS GF Support Team:

**Catherine Severo, MSH
Clare Gibson Giraud, Consultant
Paul Kizza, Consultant
Wayne Stinson, MSH
Saeed Osmani, MSH
Patrick Waweru, Deloitte/Tz
Frank Thuraira, Deloitte/Tz
Peter Maina, Maer Associates**

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

Introduction

Under the new OGAC support mechanism for Global Fund activities, Management Sciences for Health's Leadership, Management & Sustainability Project (LMS) provided technical support to the Zanzibar Country Coordinating Mechanism (ZGFCCM) and the Principal Recipients of Global Fund grants in Zanzibar from September 2006 through February 2007.¹ This final report summarizes the products of that effort, the decisions made by the ZGFCCM, and the immediate changes ensuing from the support process.

The objectives of this support were to:

- a) Assist the ZGFCCM to become fully functional, including re-orientation of members to CCM responsibilities and development of framework documentation;
- b) Assist the ZGFCCM to form and operationalise a CCM Secretariat;
- c) Strengthen the ability of the ZGFCCM to provide active oversight and leadership for Global Fund activities and provide a clear process for identifying and addressing performance problems and major bottlenecks, which cannot be resolved by the Principal Recipients alone;
- d) Improve monitoring and reporting on Global Fund activities, including development of high-level tools for monitoring and feedback between the ZGFCCM and the Principal Recipients and introduction of management/leadership indicators for the Principal Recipients.

The scope of work formulated by the ZGFCCM with USAID/Tanzania was approved by OGAC in July 2006. The team formed by LMS for this mission included: Clare Gibson Giraud (leadership, governance), Paul Kizza (Secretariat, work planning, governance), Peter Maina (Secretariat), Frank Thurairia (budgets); Wayne Stinson and Saeed Osmani (oversight and information). The team was led by Catherine Severo and received support from Patrick Waweru, former Local Funding Agent, and Ken Heise, MSH/LMS Resident Advisor. The team accomplished three intensive periods of work in Stonetown from 11-22 September, 30 October to 3 November 2006 and 15-19 January 2007, as well as work from the home offices between trips.

As agreed by the ZGFCCM, a participative process was used combining individual interviews, group discussions, and work sessions on specific topics with 3-15 participants, and iterative review of draft documents and report formats by the ZGFCCM members, Principal Recipients (PRs) and Lead Sub-Recipients (LSRs). These events are described more fully later in the report. A series of ZGFCCM orientation and strengthening events were held during the visits. CCM Secretariat, PRs and LSRs data managers were trained to use the new Executive Dashboards on 18-19 January. A final presentation was made to the full ZGFCCM during its formal meeting on 18 January 2007, during which documents were presented for review and a final set of issues for decision making was presented to members. The decisions made that day were integrated into the final products. Since that time, efforts have focused on the completion of the summary reporting system and the ZGFCCM budget and work plan.

¹ This support was financed through USAID Cooperative Agreement number GPO-A-00-05-00024-00, as part of the USG technical assistance effort for the Global Fund to fight AIDS, TB, and Malaria.

Restructuring and Strengthening the ZGFCCM

Issues

The ZGFCCM was formed in 2002 and is chaired by the Permanent Secretary of the Chief Minister's Office. No Byelaws were developed, but minutes were kept. Documentation of the process of membership selection was sparse. The ZGFCCM had neither committees nor a Secretariat. The full ZGFCCM did meet periodically, principally to review and approve proposals prepared by the national disease program managers and their partners. Little oversight or problem solving was provided. Active participation in meetings was hampered by language difficulties: meetings and documents were in English, while some ZGFCCM members only speak/read Swahili or strongly prefer it. Participation was also hampered by limited knowledge of CCM responsibilities and members' rights. Civil society members and some government members could not explain the role or functions of the ZGFCCM; general understanding of the process and the diseases was weak. ZGFCCM members were frank about their need for capacity building. Nevertheless, Zanzibar has been quite successful in winning small Global Fund grants for the 3 diseases (5 grants, \$22.4M approved, \$7.4M disbursed to date), in large part because of the proactive national program managers and the Zanzibar AIDS Commission (ZAC). The ZGFCCM Chair, ZAC, and supporting donors were eager to create a "fully functional" ZGFCCM.

Solutions

Faced with this "under-developed" CCM, the MSH approach during the three visits combined re-invention with capacity building, moving from creating an understanding of CCM responsibilities, through definition of activities and procedures, to facilitation of participative decision-making. This approach received active support from the ZGFCCM Chair, Mr. Ali Juma, Permanent Secretary of the Chief Minister's Office. Capacity building was conducted through small work group sessions and guided decision-making during full ZGFCCM meetings as follows:

- Governance Working Group sessions: 12 & 14 September, 30-31 October, 1-2 November, 16 January
- CCM "Developing Governance" Workshop: 20 September
- Monitoring and reporting group sessions: 19 September, 30 October
- ZGFCCM Secretariat planning sessions: 31 October-2 November
- CCM Plenary Sessions: 11 & 18 September
- Full ZGFCCM meeting with decision making: 3 November 2006, 18 January 2007

These activities received political encouragement from the Chief Minister's Office. On 3 November, the Chief Minister held a televised meeting with the LMS consultant team to be briefed on the Global Fund activities and express his Government's commitment and thanks to the Global Fund.

Through this process, the ZGFCCM decided to create an Executive composed of the Chair, a new Vice Chair, and a new Secretary. The CCM also decided to form a number of "portfolios" (or committees) some of which should be ongoing, while others should be periodic (such as proposal development). The first two to be formed were the Framework Portfolio, responsible for completing the transformation process, including membership renewal, and the Oversight Portfolio (see below). Furthermore, the ZGFCCM membership will be renewed

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

through a rolling process and formal alternates will be named; only members or alternates and invited support persons may attend official meetings. ZGFCCM meetings can now be in either English or Swahili, although minutes will be in English.

The ZGFCCM also decided to formalize its relationship with technical expert agencies and individual consultants, by creation of an official Expert Pool and signature by individual experts of a “Letter of Commitment”.

Using the “functional analysis” process developed by LMS for CCMs, ZGFCCM members were assisted to assign an extensive list of functions, activities, tasks, and responsibilities among the Portfolios, the full ZGFCCM and the new Secretariat (see below). Deadlines and calendars were defined to regulate the process and also to be used to measure performance. Furthermore, a detailed generic pathway for development of a Global Fund national country coordinated proposal was prepared.²

These clarifications were documented for the ZGFCCM through new framework documents:

- **Product 1:** “Byelaws of the Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism”
- **Product 2:** “Governance Manual – Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism”

These documents were approved and adopted by the ZGFCCM on 18 January 2007. During that meeting, the ZGFCCM elected Mr. John Eyobo, Anglican Church representative of FBOs, to the position of Vice Chair. The new ZGFCCM Executive Committee met for the first time that day and again on 25 January. At the same meeting, the Framework and Oversight Portfolios were formed, chaired respectively by the new ZGFCCM Secretary (see below) and the Clinton Foundation representative on Zanzibar.³

- **Product 3:** At the request of the ZGFCCM, terms of reference for the Framework and Oversight Portfolios were drafted as “How to Get Started with the ZGFCCM Portfolios”. This document was transmitted to the ZGFCCM Secretary on 20 January.

Creation of the ZGFCCM Secretariat

Issues

Since 2002, support to the ZGFCCM had been provided by the Zanzibar AIDS Commission (located under the Chief Minister’s Office) and occasionally by the Zanzibar AIDS Control Program, Zanzibar Malaria Control Program, and Zanzibar TB & Leprosy Program. ZGFCCM had neither a work plan nor an MTEF budget for its activities. UNDP provided a small budget for CCM meetings and some documentation through its support to the Zanzibar AIDS Commission. WHO also provided occasional support through ZAC. ZAC generally acted as ZGFCCM secretariat, but was finding this work excessive on top of its many other responsibilities.

² This pathway is based upon Helfenbein, Severo, “Scaling up national HIV/AIDS programs: a manual for multi-sectoral planning”, MSH 2004, developed under the Management & Leadership Project.

³ Framework portfolio members: ZANGOC (Portfolio Coordinator and ZGFCCM Secretary), ZAC, UNICEF, Chief Minister’s Office. Oversight Portfolio members: Clinton Foundation (Portfolio Coordinator), Save the Children UK, Aga Khan Foundation, PS-MOHSW/Z.

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

Solutions

Work sessions were conducted with the ZGFCCM Chair, planning officers from the Chief Minister's Office, officers from the Zanzibar AIDS Commission, and ZGFCCM members. Basic duties and expectations were defined with them. In November, the ZGFCCM members decided:

- to create the office of ZGFCCM Secretary as an elective position for a ZGFCCM member, this member to become part of the new Executive Committee;
- to create a ZGFCCM Secretariat within the Chief Minister's Office, responsible to the Permanent Secretary – CMO (the ZGFCCM Chair), and overseen by the ZGFCCM Secretary;
- to create four positions, the later two of which may be part-time responsibilities: 1) Planning and Administration Officer, 2) Finance and Budgeting Officer, 3) Data Management Officer, 4) Information & Communication Officer.

At the ZGFCCM meeting of 18 January, Mr. Hadji Khatibu, ZGFCCM member from the NGO umbrella organization ZANGOC, was elected to the position of Secretary.

Creation of the Secretariat is set out in the Byelaws document (Product 1). The full set of Secretariat duties and job descriptions are defined in the "Operations Manual" document and associated plans.

- **Product 4:** "Operations Manual: Secretariat to Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism". This document was approved by the ZGFCCM on 18 January 2007.
- **Product 5:** A work plan and preliminary budget were developed based on the Framework documents (Products 1-3) and shared with the ZGFCCM Executive Committee on 18 January. A revised work plan and budget for the ZGFCCM and the ZGFCCM Secretariat were prepared and transmitted on 2 February.

The Chief Minister's Office affected four staff persons to the Secretariat as of late January and they have begun work. The process of handover of ZGFCCM documents to the new Secretariat by ZAC, ZACP, and ZMCP will be supervised by the Framework Portfolio.

The work plan and budget will be used for mobilization of resources (principally staff salaries and office space) from the Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar (through the MTEF), from the Development Partners' Group, and from the Global Fund through reprogramming of support in existing grants or new requests. The UN Theme Group has already committed \$15,000 to the ZGFCCM for 2007.

Strengthening grant oversight and improving information

Issues

The ZGFCCM received some oral and written reports from the Principal Recipients (the national program managers and ZAC) but did no active oversight. Some CCM members apparently did not understand that they had an oversight role, rather than simply an "information reception" role. Several ZFCCM members had little or no experience with health statistics and expressed a need for guidance in

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

oversight. Therefore, the ZGFCCM had never been a partner to the PRs in problem identification and resolution.

Quality of information reported by the PRs was variable. HIV/AIDS Sub-Recipients had often reported in narrative style, rather than using indicators or reporting against the work plans. This was about to change however. ZACP and ZAC were receiving technical assistance from the World Bank GAMET program to create a national HIV/AIDS MIS system (ZHAPMoS). ZAC was taking the lead in introducing the new ZHAPMoS reporting forms and they were now being used by HIV/AIDS grant Sub-Recipients for reporting. ZAC and some Sub-Recipients reporting finding the new forms easier to use, providing better quality information. No results were reported for some of the TB indicators; the Zanzibar Tuberculosis and Leprosy Programme appeared to need capacity strengthening in reporting, data quality, and oversight of its GF grant. The former Local Fund Agent had reported that he spent an unusual amount of time working with the PRs on their quarterly progress reports. The Global Fund had concerns about the technical results reports. Malaria results seemed to be the best documents and the malaria reporting system is strong.

Some ZGFCCM members, including the new Oversight Portfolio Coordinator and senior Ministry of Health staff, were aware of these data and reporting issues (including the weaknesses in the TB program) and were quite concerned by them.

Solutions

Strengthening oversight required interventions with the ZGFCCM and creation of a simplified information packaging process, called the Executive Dashboard, in order to provide information that could be used easily by ZGFCCM members.

Strengthening oversight at ZGFCCM level

The creation of the Oversight Portfolio and the selection of engaged, capable Portfolio members, including the Permanent Secretary of the MOHSW, are essential steps for oversight. Detailed procedures and activities were proposed for the Portfolio supported by the Secretariat in the "Governance Manual", (Function 4), and the "Secretariat Operations Manual", (Function 4). Decision trees and guides to analyzing problems are provided in Annex 3 of the Governance Manual as well. Among the procedures proposed are:

- Building capacity for oversight through additional TA;
- Gathering information on GF grants through use of reports and repackaging of available data (see below);
- Gathering information of GF grants through site visits and through investigation of specific issues arising;
- Information analysis to identify problems and bottlenecks requiring CCM attention;
- Problem resolution for issues requiring CCM attention.

It is expected that the Oversight Portfolio will work closely with the PRs to begin this oversight process.

Improving the quality of information about grant performance

The most innovative effort for improving information for oversight consists of the introduction of Executive Dashboards for tracking progress on each grant. Executive Dashboards use Excel software to repackage information from the Principal Recipient and SRs. The Executive Dashboard consists of a three-page

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

summary in graphic form of quarterly information for each grant. A 1-page cover sheet summarizes comments on the results and recommended actions.⁴

The Executive Dashboards refocus oversight on three areas of performance: 1) financial management of grant funds, 2) grant implementation, including reporting, procurement and HR recruitment, and 3) technical results using national indicators. The introduction of financial and grant implementation indicators into oversight will enable the ZGFCCM to spot warning signs of problems earlier and monitor the biggest expenditure areas on a quarterly basis. The Executive Dashboards will also be used by the PRs as management and information tools with their Sub Recipients.

Development of the Executive Dashboards has been conducted in parallel on Zanzibar and on Mainland Tanzania. The Zanzibar Dashboards are less complicated than those for the Mainland, as the number of SRs, objectives, and the volume of funds are much less. The Zanzibar Dashboards were developed through intensive work sessions with the PRs' data managers and national program managers, and with help from the University Computing Centre Limited (UCC). The PRs' data managers will fill the quarterly Dashboards and transmit the files to UCC. It is expected that the PRs will use the Dashboards actively in the SR management and communications.

UCC will provide ongoing support of the Executive Dashboards at the level of the Secretariat. A draft scope of work has been defined, but the modalities for financing of this support must be finalized. Fortunately, UCC has existing contracts for support with the Zanzibar AIDS Commission for ZAPHMOS and with the Ministry of Finance which give UCC frequent access to Zanzibar.

It is expected that the first complete Executive Dashboard for each grant will be available for the next regular quarterly cycle of oversight.

- **Product 6: Executive Dashboards**
 - **Round 2 HIV/AIDS:** final draft was shared with ZAC, ZACP, and ZCFCCM on 25 January;
 - **Round 3 TB:** final draft was shared with ZTLP and ZCFCCM on 25 January;
 - **Round 4 Malaria:** final draft was shared with ZMCP and ZCFCCM on 25 January;
- **Product 7: "Guide for Using Executive Dashboards"**
- **Product 8: Draft terms of reference for UCC.**

All spreadsheets have been handed over to the National Program Managers as well as to the University Computing Centre Ltd (person in charge: Graham Wilson). CCM Secretariat, PRs and LSRs data managers were trained to produce and use the new Executive Dashboards on 18-19 January.

Data quality will continue to be an issue for the Zanzibar PRs. Assistance from the World Bank GAMET, WHO and USAID will be needed over time to assist the PRs to improve their financial and technical information. It will be important to differentiate between the Dashboards as a tool and the quality of the first Dashboard reports. However, the commitment of the PRs to the Dashboards as a management tool is promising.

⁴ The CCM Executive Dashboard tool was first developed for the PR and CCM in Nicaragua with similar OGAC support.

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

Final Status

The products and decision points described above were presented to the ZGFCCM on 18 January 2007. The documents were approved as working documents, pending the final small changes. Elections of new officers and Portfolio members were held as described above. Donor partners agreed to take the draft budget and work plan to the DPG for review. (These decisions should appear in the ZGFCCM minutes.)

The definitive copies of Products 1, 2, 3, and 4 were transmitted to the ZGFCCM on a CD on 20 January 2007.⁵ The preliminary work plan and budget were presented to the ZGFCCM on 18 January; the final budget was transmitted to the Executive Committee by email on 2 February 2007. The various spreadsheets for Product 6 as well as Product 7, with their data collection tool, data management tool, and instructions were transmitted electronically to the PRs, UCC, and the ZGFCCM Secretariat between 25 and 29 January. Efforts to assist the ZGFCCM with reprogramming of funds to cover the new budget were carried out by Deloitte during a visit to Stonetown on 26 February, however an additional follow-up call will be required.

It is now up to the ZGFCCM and the PRs to carry forward the changes created during this consultancy. Although the Executive Committee began meeting in January, the Oversight Portfolio has yet to meet for the first time.

Suggested Local Follow-up

This short-term consultancy has assisted the ZGFCCM to move from an embryonic phase to a potentially fully-functional governance body with adequate support resources. Enabling the ZGFCCM members to understand the full scope of their responsibility and authority kindled an excitement and eagerness for involvement that was not there before. These are very hopeful signs.

Because the ZGFCCM is taking on so many new responsibilities for the first time, several forms of follow-up are recommended. It is hoped that UNDP, as Zanzibar "officer" for the Tanzania Development Partners' Group on AIDS, will take the lead in mobilizing additional support for the ZGFCCM. USAID, WHO, the Clinton Foundation, and DANIDA will be crucial partners in that process.

Additional support is recommended to complete the following changes:

1. Membership renewal, including clarification of constituencies and selection of members for Pemba. It is suggested that the UN Theme Group mobilize some of the same expert team that has done similar work successfully in Nigeria.
2. Mobilization of financial and in-kind support for the new ZGFCCM and/or assistance with reprogramming of funds from one of the grants to support this budget;
3. Support for the first meeting of the Oversight Portfolio of ZGFCCM, possibly from WHO and UCC;
4. Additional capacity building for the Oversight Portfolio of ZGFCCM, possibly by WHO or PACT or another technical support agency;
5. Identification and resolution of cross-cutting problems and bottlenecks affecting the performance of the grants, including two priority problems:

⁵ A final CD of all materials will be sent to OGAC Washington and to USAID Tanzania. See Annex 1 for the list of products on the CD.

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

the quality of financial reporting and issues regarding pharmaceutical management and the Central Medical Stores (ref. DANIDA).

MSH Tanzania might be asked to provide the following kinds of on-going support:

1. Technical support to the ZGFCCM and to UCC for completion of the Memorandum of Understanding for the Executive Dashboards. Proposed deadline: 30 March 2007;
2. MSH could facilitate with UCC a “Using the Executive Dashboard” session with the Oversight Portfolio to orient members to the various indicators and warning signals. Such sessions could be planned for March-April 2007;
3. Similarly, for the full ZGFCCM, MSH could facilitate a “Using the Executive Dashboard” session;
4. Facilitation of an orientation session for new ZGFCCM members when they are selected;
5. For the rest of 2007, quarterly follow-up with UCC and the PRs on preparation of the Dashboards and use of the information as a management tool. This should begin by mid-May at the latest.
6. Finally, should the ZGFCCM and PRs find the Executive Dashboards useful, MSH may be asked to work with UCC to develop a Dashboard for the new Round 6 grant and its two Principal Recipients.

Final report – LMS/MSH support to Zanzibar

7. Annex 1: Final products of this consultancy

The following products will be transmitted to OGAC Washington and to USAID/Tanzania by CD:

| | |
|---------------------|--|
| Product 1: | “Byelaws of the Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism” |
| Product 2: | “Governance Manual – Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism” |
| Product 3: | “How to get started with ZGFCCM Portfolios” |
| Product 4: | “Operations Manual: Secretariat to Zanzibar Global Fund Country Coordinating Mechanism” |
| Product 5: | Work plan and budget for the ZGFCCM Secretariat |
| Product 6: | Executive Dashboards and related materials |
| Product 7: | Guide for Using Executive Dashboards |
| Product 8: | Draft terms of reference for UCC |
| Other presentations | <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The Portfolio Mechanism: a new approach to CCM Oversight (Visit 2 document)2. Presentation to the Chief Minister, 6 November 20063. Final Presentation to the ZGFCCM, 18 January 2007 |