



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

ZIMBABWE

Long-term Local Government Support Program

Mid-Term Review

Final Report

**Richard Martin
Oscar Musandu-Nyamayaro**

December 3, 2004

P O Box 499, Auckland Park, South Africa 2006. E-mail richmart@netactive.co.za
Tel +27 11 403 5830 Fax +27 11 403 5781 Cell +27 82 770 2734

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	iv
1. Background	
1.1 Local Government in Zimbabwe	1
1.2. LLGP Strategy	1
2. Assessment of the program: findings in respect of the seven programmatic components as stated in the contract	
2.1 The rule of law, and legislative reform	2
2.2 Training in participation	3
2.3 RAPS and Performance Management	6
2.4 Grants	8
2.5 Improving service delivery and financial management	10
3. General Assessment: an overview of the environment	
3.1 Was the strategy broad enough	12
3.2 The importance of the LLGP in complementing other USAID DG projects	13
3.3 Potential of the LLGP project to have an impact on Zimbabwe's transition to democratic governance	13
3.4 The potential for working in the public sector vs civil society vs the private sector	14
3.5 Institutionalization and sustainability	15
4. LLGP Management and UI Organization	
4.1 Overall management and performance	15
4.2 Slow response and lack of communication	15
4.3 Institutionalization and linkages	16
4.4 Grants	16
4.5 Staffing and sub-contracting	16
5. Way forward	
5.1 Overview	16
5.2 Prioritizing program activities	19
5.3 Top priority programs	20
5.4 Lower priority programs	21
5.5 On hold	23
6. Contract strategy	
6.1 Contract duration	23
6.2 Contract management	23
6.3 Contract implementation	24
Appendix 1	
The future: possible directions for future grant-making initiatives	
1. Introduction	25
2. LA/CSO Projects	25
2.1 Economic projects	25
2.2 HIV/AIDS projects	26
2.3 Infrastructure and community facilities	26
2.4 Service provision	27
3. Strengthening civil society on a sustainable basis	28

Appendix 2: Methodology	29
Appendix 3: Acknowledgements	31

Acknowledgements

We particularly wish to acknowledge with thanks the support and enthusiasm of Eliah Tafangombe, Zivanayi Manyika and Josephine Runesu of the RUDO.

In addition we wish to thank Paul Weisenfeld, Director of USAID Zimbabwe, Michael Foster, Program Officer and Joel Kolker, Team Leader of Democracy and Governance; and Israel Ndlovu and Absalom Masendege of the Urban Institute.

We also wish to thank the large number of people who participated in our meetings at both national and local level. These names are recorded in Appendix 3.

Acronyms

AULA	African Union of Local Authorities
COP	Chief of Party
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DG	Democracy and Governance
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Syndrome
LA	Local Authority
LLGP	Long Term Local Governance Program
MLGPWNH	Ministry of Local Government, Public Works and National Housing
PPLG	Pilot Program in Local Governance
RAP	Restructuring Action Plan
RDC	Rural District Council
SAP	Strategic Action Plan
SOW	Scope of Work
SUNY	State University of New York
UC	Urban Council
UCAZ	Urban Councils Association of Zimbabwe
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UI	Urban Institute

Executive Summary

1. LLGP Strategy

In spite of the program being conducted during a time of great political tension and bitter conflict in some respects, Local Authorities of both parties endorsed the concepts behind it – namely to help the Councils to improve their relationship with civil society, and to strengthen their financial and planning capabilities.

However, the major delays experienced by the program due to resistance to some of its principles by participating LAs might have been prevented by a different launch strategy.

2. Contractor performance

2.1 Rule of Law

Reform of the Local Government legislation appeared to be imminent when the program was designed. However, the political and economic environment changed rapidly, and opportunities for involvement and support by the contractor have been limited.

2.2 Share international experience in citizen participation

2.3 Train LA Officials and Councilors on the one hand, and CSOs on the other hand in participatory governance

The concept of “demand-led” training had some negative consequences. Placing the onus on the LA to make requests caused delays and created uncertainty. Also, the relationship between the program and its participants would have been strengthened if training and facilitation skills had been developed earlier within each LA.

The workshops on citizen participation conducted by the UI were professionally done, and events were set in train which changed the way that local government works. Changes in both attitude and practice were observed. These were manifested not only by fewer objections to the Councils’ annual budgets but also to citizen *support* for tariff and rates increases. In some cases there have also been improved levels of payments for rates and service charges.

2.4 CSO training

Civil society also needs training regarding the need for feedback and consultation with constituents, and in transparent and meaningful election to office. CSO training has taken two forms: support for them to make application for a grant, and support after a grant has been awarded. Progress on this component was limited, mainly because of the delays in grant-making.

2.5 Assist in developing and institutionalizing the role of CSOs in LA preparation of RAPs and Performance Management Systems

Progress has been made in developing the government prescribed strategic plans. A model Restructuring Action Plan (RAP) was developed during the pilot phase, but, as currently formulated the concept has not been widely adopted. However, many LAs are developing “Turnaround Plans” which embody most of the same principles, and which should be supported by the program.

2.6 Grants to CSOs

The delays suffered by CSOs in terms of the slow rate of approval and disbursement represent a serious shortfall in program implementation. The time taken to award grants has been excessive (only four are effective to date) and CSOs were promised grants which have not yet been disbursed.

3 Increase the ability of LAs to deliver improved services through better citizen consultation and accountable financial management

3.1 Consultation and communication

Better systems for consultation have been established under the program: this has been the program's major achievement to date.

Many concerns were expressed by LAs about the bad press and the problems they have in communicating directly with their consumers. Plans to support newsletters to deal with these problems have been made, but none had been published by the time of the review.

3.2 Accountable Financial Management Systems support

This important part of the program has still not started, even though it was ranked as a high priority in the evaluation of the PPLG. This is unfortunate as it would seem that more effective use of the PROMUN program would have facilitated improved financial management as well as more transparency.

We were also told by several LAs that they had been promised computers under the program, but had not received them or any explanation concerning why they were not supplied.

3.3 Technical assistance

The scope for technical assistance, especially in the field of financial management, was very substantial. However, although some work has been done, the component as a whole has suffered serious delays, and has not reached its potential.

4. LLGP Management and UI Organization

4.1 Overall management and performance

The UI was widely praised for the professionalism with which the workshops were conducted. However there were consistent concerns about the slow response rate, and general lack of communication between the UI and its constituents. The most serious criticism has concerned the delays in processing and disbursing the CSO grants, and in failing to communicate with the beneficiaries the reason for the delay.

4.2 Grants

We consider that the process of grant-giving could have been pursued with more speed. We fully recognize that there were great difficulties initially in obtaining the support of the LA. Another factor was that the CSOs had difficulty in meeting the requirements of the USAID grant-making process. However, these factors do not explain the lack of progress fully. More recently, the use of mini- and micro-grants has speeded up the process.

4.3 Staffing and sub-contracting

It is of concern that the PROMUN training and technical assistance program has still not been finalized. Similar factors apply to the staffing of the program. There are concerns about the high turnover of staff, especially COPs, and the reliance on part-time staff.

4 Way forward

LAs are concerned about financial distress and consequent poor service delivery. As a result some of them have embarked upon “turnaround plans”, and have successfully brought civil society into the process of formulation and implementation of these plans. The question to be answered now is what next?

4.1 Strengthening the link between civil society and Local Government

The project’s achievements in terms of involving civil society in local government should be the foundation for the remainder of the project. Training and capacity building must be continued and expanded in terms of breadth and depth to capitalize on the positive gains and institutionalize them.

4.2 Strengthening LA Operations

There is a need for more training and technical assistance in financial matters, especially in the use of the PROMUN system which most of them have installed, but do not fully utilize. There were also many requests for IT hardware.

4.3 Strengthening Civil Society

The grants, as presently designed, may create unsustainable conditions and expectations. However, there is a need for technical assistance and training to be continued with civil society, in order to help them understand Local Government better and improve their own corporate governance and financial management.

Meanwhile the recommendations in terms of grants are:

- existing commitments in terms of grants should be met
- in future, mini-grants, which can be disbursed quickly, should be the main instrument
- where projects have been prepared which can be implemented within a short time frame of about six months, there is potential for grant funded joint civil society/local government projects as a means of fostering good relations and reinforcing the interdependence of the two.

4.4 Restructuring Action Plans

The RAP concept neatly incorporates almost everything that the program is trying to do by involving civil society. Although the term RAP is rarely used, under the name of “turnaround plan” or other similar names, strategies are being developed around which the whole community can rally. The program should support these activities.

4.5 Performance Management

The concept of performance management, as referred to under the program, is, in a sense, a monitoring one. A “Service Delivery Charter” can be developed from a Turnaround Plan, which would describe the performance targets of the Local Authority under the Plan against which performance can be measured.

4.6 Contract design and management

There are the measures that should be put into place to make the above program components more effective.

Contract strategy

A strong strategy must be established in order to mainstream the system of involving civil society, reinforcing the gains that have been achieved to date, and actively engage central, provincial and district

administrations in the process. An exit strategy should be developed so that the systems that are required to maintain the momentum of civil society/local government collaboration and consultation are sustainable.

Contract duration

One of the observable implementation difficulties faced by the Contractor was the short duration of the both contracts. We suggest that in the future a longer time frame should be considered if at all possible.

Contract management

Two issues need to be addressed regarding contract management. The first is that the Harare office needs to be given the authority to take all major decisions without reference to Washington. The second, which is partially related to it, is that there needs to be a more aggressive attitude to prompt decision-making and response to stakeholders' requests. Any contract awards, whether a new contract or an extension, should require a commitment to these two principles by the contractor.

1. Background

1.1 Local Government in Zimbabwe

An analysis of local government, undertaken in 1999 as part of the Fiscal Decentralization Study¹, revealed that there were many tensions in the system. These may be summarized as follows:

1. Weak financial, budgeting and planning instruments
2. Poor salaries and conditions of service of the staff result in positions being unfilled, or filled by people of poor caliber.
3. Inappropriate controls and delays being caused by the Ministry responsible for Local Government (e.g. in the approval of tariffs, borrowing powers and budgets).
4. Lack of financial support for Local Government by Central Government, especially in relation to unfunded mandates.
5. Weak systems for recovery of debt
6. Lack of trust between Council and the staff.
7. Lack of trust between the public and the Council.

The Government of Zimbabwe acknowledged these difficulties and had been considering reforms for some time. Indeed at the time the LLGP was being designed, it was actively considering decentralization as one means of strengthening Local Government, and legislative reform to address many of the difficulties described above were in progress.

Meanwhile USAID had been undertaking credit ratings for all major local authorities in Zimbabwe. These revealed high levels of debt, a relatively high proportion of income spent on salaries, late completion of financial statements and audits, and political interference in cost recovery.

The PPLG and LLGP were conceived as partial remedies for these problems, especially the lack of trust between Councils and the community, aiming to broaden the participation of the private sector and strengthen financial management.

In its visits to participating Local Authorities, the team was confronted time and time again by the problems listed above, and noted that the PPLG and LLGP have made a meaningful contribution to helping deal with them. In our analysis below we shall try to retain the perspective of this introductory overview, for while there are many small and important matters to be considered, removal of fundamental blockages in the system must be seen as a first step in improving the performance of local government.

1.2 LLGP Strategy

The LLGP evolved directly from the PLGP. An internal evaluation of the PLGP had proposed the following 11 program actions for the LLGP:

Fostering local "ownership" of the program start-up – begin the LLGP with a demand-driven selection process for adding new LAs. Increase contact with each LA during the first six months of the program to ensure their support and to maintain the momentum.

Keeping the MLGPWNH informed and involved – the LLGP should involve the middle level management staff in the inception meetings with LAs, or involving some of them in training meetings.

¹ Dennys Pasipanodia, Jesper Steffensen, Svend Trollegaard, Richard Martin, Clever Khumalo, Victor Chando and Daniel Ncube: Fiscal decentralization and sub-national government in relation to infrastructure and service provision in Zimbabwe: World Bank, Washington, March 2000.

Data collection – simplify the data collection to focus on critical pieces of data. This should be a rapid intensive effort at the beginning of the program.

Identify a driver – the program should identify an interested and motivated champion to serve as the program’s contact point in the LA.

Use the RAP process as an action tool – RAPs should be used to help councils and the community to understand the overall financial picture and to begin looking at options for closing the budget gap.

Coordination with other programs – the LLGP should take responsibility for coordination with international and local programs in local governance

Citizen participation in local governance – the LLGP should acknowledge local governments’ efforts in this regard, but should involve citizens at earlier stages, as public hearings amount to little more than information dissemination. The transparency requirements of legislation such as the Urban Councils Act should be the focus of the new program. Through grant-making to CSOs and support to LAs for training materials the LLGP could explore ways to strengthen accountability and transparency to their communities and increase stakeholder participation.

The RAP process – the LLGP should set aside grant support to help CSOs prepare for and carry out the RAP process. They should be encouraged to identify how current local authority budget deficits can be reduced, to come up with a policy for collecting delinquent service charge and rates accounts, or facilitate community choice of priorities for small projects in the community.

Standardization of accounts – the LLGP should provide help to participating LAs to restructure their accounts to the standards in the Manual of Standardized Budgeting and Accounts

PROMUN – The LLGP should provide technical assistance in the resolution of problems relating to PROMUN. They should put in place a monthly financial reporting system. The program should provide logistical and financial assistance to the Users’ Group.

Assistance to Treasurers – The program should provide on-site assistance to Treasurers and their staff to build capacity in updating accounts, debt collection, budgeting etc in order to move to greater financial viability.

These recommendations, when considered with the introductory comments above are included to provide a backdrop against which the overall design of the LLGP can be assessed.

The report that follows is structured as follows:

- Program implementation: analysis of the LLGP in respect of each of the programmatic components.
- The impact of the program in terms of the broader environment
- Contractor performance
- Recommendations for the remainder of the contract

2. Assessment of the Program: Findings in terms of the seven programmatic components as stated in the contract.

2.1 Rule of law, and legislative reform

2.1.1 Task

This component is summarized in the contract as follows:

Promote regulatory framework that advances market-based LA finance through facilitating the Action Plan of the public-private sector working group.

2.1.2 Activity

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q3, 2003: Attended meeting of Working Group on Expanding Municipal Finance and Local Governance, and held discussions with SUNY and UCAZ about amendments to the Urban Councils Act.

Q4, 2003: UI participated in MLGPWNH workshops on “Empowering Communities” and “Empowering Local Authorities”, 2 of the 4 “pillars of decentralization”.

Q1, 2004: Met Parliamentary Committee on Local Government, and promised to facilitate review both Acts. USAID pledges assistance to Government that UI assist will assist with decentralization policy.

One of the proposed foci of the program recommended by the PPLG review team was to develop the transparency requirements of legislation such as the Urban Councils Act. Indeed, reforms of the Local Government legislation were expected to be under active development at the beginning of the program. However, for a variety of reasons, government’s interest in local government reform appears to have waned, probably because of the increasingly bitter conflict between ZANU PF and the MDC. As a result, the opportunities for involvement and support by the contractor have been limited, and may not have been welcomed. For example there was no follow up on the offer referred to in Q1, 2004.

2.1.3 Relevance of this component

In the current economic and political climate the government’s attention has shifted from decentralization reforms that had been proposed and were under active consideration when the program was designed. Thus, while decentralization reforms are desirable, it is not a matter which is likely to receive much attention from the Government at this stage.

This changing environment was reflected in the contract amendment dated September 27, 2004, as follows:

Omitted: amendments to LA By-laws to strengthen accountability and citizen participation, and amendments to the Urban Councils Act and Rural District Councils Act that increase LA access to capital markets.

Added: “support local efforts to promote decentralization and identify amendments to the legislative framework”

2.2 Training in participation

Two components of the project are closely linked and therefore are treated together here.

2.2.1 Tasks

- Train LA officials and Councilors on the one hand, and citizen groups including local CSOs in participatory local governance.
- Share international experience in citizen participation in democratic Local Governance, especially in decision-making and operations.

This component was modified in the contract amendment dated September 27, 2004, as follows:

Omitted: Code of conduct, democratic local governance guide for councilors, LA financial disclosure regulations; performance measurement standards, oversight mechanisms to minimize corruption, improved cooperation among residents for LA socio-economic growth.

Added: Assist and train LAs to strengthen their capability to open up to constituents input in policy making, strategic planning, financial management and improved service delivery. Assist LAs to improve credit-worthiness through application of credit ratings, restructuring action plans, improved financial management and regulatory reform.

2.2.2 Activities

The complementary activities of CSO training and LA training are considered individually below.

2.2.2.1 LA Training

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Introductory workshop

Q4, 2003: Kick-off workshop for LLGP participants Mutare, Chitungwiza, Kwekwe, Chinhoyi, Bulawayo and Victoria Falls

Councilor orientation

Q2, 2003: New councilor orientation, Mutoko RDC

Q3, 2003: New councilor orientation, Chipinge RDC

Q4, 2003: Assisted UCAZ in national Councilor Training Program

Effective Council meetings

Q3, 2003: Training in holding effective council meetings: Mutoko and Chipinge RDCs,

Q3, 2003: Training in use of traditional leaders: Mutoko RDC, Chipinge RDC, Chipinge UC

Q4, 2003: Training in holding effective council meetings held Chipinge UC and Kariba

Participation in the budget process/LG affairs

Q3, 2003: Training in participation in the budget process: Mutoko and Chipinge RDCs, Chipinge UC, Kariba and Gweru

Q1, 2004: Facilitated stakeholder broader meetings in Gweru and Chitungwiza

Q1, 2004: Facilitated Ward Development Committee training in Kariba

Q1, 2004: Facilitated LA/stakeholder budget monitoring session in Kariba

Q1, 2004: Planning sessions to prepare for broader stakeholder meetings with Bulawayo, Mutare, Kwekwe, Chitungwiza, Victoria Falls and Chinhoyi

Study visits

Q4, 2003: Delegations sent to AULA conference and Durban Colloquium

The above programs represent the core activities of the program. In our discussions with LAs it was reported by all of them that the workshops conducted by the UI had been professionally done, that the need for participation by civil society in Local Government had been well articulated, and that events had been set in train which had changed the way that local government works. The

workshops seemed to have worked at two levels. The first is that of attitudinal change, and the second is to change the way that business is done.

Participating LAs have had dramatically different degrees of exposure to the process – as the above activity reports show, some have effectively only just begun, while others have benefited from the program for two years. Even so, in almost every LA that we visited we were told that there has been a very noticeable change in relationships between the community and Council, which has not only resulted in reduced or no objections to the budget but also even to support for tariff and rates increases. This is in marked contrast to the bitter conflicts and name-calling that used to characterize relationships between the two sides. This positive attitude has even been reflected in improved levels of payment of rates and service charges in some cases, and a new spirit of collaboration between the community and authority which is reflected in reduced vandalism and offers of support by civil society in terms of maintenance and development.

We were observers in two meetings (in Kwekwe and Mutoko) convened by the LA to discuss next year's budget with their stakeholders. We also enquired about relations between civil society and LAs in our field trips. From this it emerged that there is still a long way before good practice is used in all participating LAs. Even some of those who have been participating for a long period have been tempted to manipulate the procedures to avoid what might be considered a fully transparent process. Devices used to control the process have included withholding printed information about the budget from stakeholders, or providing only part of it; giving short notice regarding meetings; being inconsistent regarding who is invited to meetings, and using political means of preventing participation. But, in general, there was a very clear difference between working relationships of those LAs which had been in the pilot program, and those which have only benefited from the LLGP.

Civil society also has much to learn, especially in terms of the need for feedback and consultation with constituents, and in transparent and meaningful election to office. Questions are also asked about whether the participating CSOs are representative, or the most representative, of the constituencies they purport to represent. This was a matter which had to be considered in the process by which CSO were selected to receive grants. The feedback was generally positive in this respect – only in one LA was there the allegation that the residents association was not representative.

But although both sides have much to learn, we have no doubt that the program has made a very substantial impact in all the LAs that have participated. While there will be setbacks on the road towards developing a fully effective system of participation, we feel that, at least, the path has been set. However it has not yet reached the stage that it is irreversible. We cannot ignore the fact that participation can be threatening – especially to Council Officers of the old school – it can be slow, and it can be frustrating. There is therefore the potential for a coalition between officers and councilors to revert to the old system.

2.2.2.2 CSO training

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

*Q3, 2003: Training Chipinge Ratepayers Association and Chipinge UC
Q1, 2004: Advocacy index ratings conducted in Mutoko and Chipinge RDC
and Chipinge UC.*

We met the Chipinge Ratepayers Association, the only grantee that is effectively up and running and representing broader civil society. They told us of the training and technical assistance they received in setting up their office and systems, and in revising governance principles etc. It would appear that this was well done and was a very useful activity.

Other CSOs have received mini-grants and other support from the program to help them put in place the systems essential if they are to receive a grant. We cannot really comment on this further in view of the fact that the grants have not yet been made.

The terms of reference also require us to comment on the relevance and effectiveness of the advocacy index tool as both a capacity building and monitoring instrument.

We received a copy of the July 2004 Advocacy Index from PACT, which uses it in connection with their support for national NGOs. After meeting many of the CSOs which are benefiting or hope to benefit from the program we feel that, as it stands, the Advocacy Index, while a very useful check list, should be modified to reflect the conditions applying in the majority of local CSOs. This is not to disparage many of the objectives of the Index. It provides a useful indicator of growth and stature in the field. However, we fear that many very worthwhile organizations would fail the test set by the Index, even though they are, in themselves, highly effective and efficient. We feel that by suggesting that a highly formalized management system and office structure is desirable, the Index could be shoe-horning organizations into an unsustainable form.

On the other hand the concept of a standard by which to evaluate an organization's performance has been found useful for both the beneficiary CSO and those trying to support it.

2.2.3 Relevance of these components

These have been the cornerstones of the program. Joint workshops between LAs and CSO have resulted in an acceptance of the value of citizen participation, especially as far as budgeting is concerned.

The concept of strong civil society has now been fully accepted by most LAs. It is now agreed, almost unanimously, that training which will help civil society act more accountably, democratically and effectively is required and welcomed. Likewise training for Councilors and Council staff in management of the participatory process would be very welcome.

In summary, it is our view that the contract amendments listed at the head of this section reflect the changes in the sphere of governance, and have been appropriate and pragmatic responses to the situation. They allow the contractor to respond more effectively to the demands from the participating LAs.

2.3 RAPs and Performance Management

2.3.1 Task

Assist in developing and institutionalizing the role of CSOs in LA restructuring action planning and performance management systems

2.3.2 Activity

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q1, 2003: assistance to Gwanda with strategic plan

Q2, 2003: assistance with Chipinge and Gweru strategic plans

Q3, 2003: assistance to Chipinge UC to help finalize its strategic plan

Q4, 2003: assistance to Gwanda, Masvingo and Kariba in finalizing strategic plan

Q1, 2004: Mutoko finalize RAP.

Slow but steady progress has been made in developing strategic plans in the MLGPWNH format. The resulting plans have generally been useful points of reference in the budgetary process. The support of the UI has been acknowledged as being very helpful in the process.

There has been ambiguity in the program, however, about the distinction between a Strategic Action Plan (SAP) and a RAP, and the term RAP has been little used even though many of the components of a RAP are, in fact, being developed.

Part of the confusion lies in the fact that, as characterized in the PPLG evaluation², the RAP is envisaged as a product and a process. As a process the document states that it should be applied to activities such as:

- The preparation of Master Plans
- The preparation of Strategic Plans
- Annual budget preparation and monitoring
- Prioritization of medium to long term development choices
- Financial Recovery Plan preparation and monitoring
- Setting service delivery priorities

As a product it should, as we understand it, incorporate the components of all the above bulleted points into a single annual strategic document which represents, as the report puts it, “a strategy for meeting priority community goals within a balanced budget.” The project team have found that introducing a new label – that is to say changing the “Budget Preparation” to a “Restructuring and Action Plan” is not helpful. It is also apparent that the model RAP included as Annex 3 of the PPLG evaluation is inappropriate for the current political and economic environment.

The SAPs that we have seen represent useful documents which prioritize the development needs of the community, and package development into projects, thus acting as a source for annual budgeting. However, there are two important problems in the SAPs. The first is that they do not contain budgetary data: in other words capital expenditure projections are not based on actual trends, nor do they make any attempt to cost projects. We were told that, in such an inflationary environment this would be impossible. We do not agree: even in such conditions it is possible to use constant figures against which a currency can be measured. For example, make all cost projections in “2004 figures”, and have a series of alternative scenarios which would show how such figures would be inflated for each year in the plan. Similarly an attempt should be made to construct scenarios regarding income and expenditure, which would yield a framework within which projections can be made.

² Annex 3. All the quotations regarding RAPs are taken from that source.

The second criticism of the strategic plans that we have seen is that while there are annual project targets – e.g. to start a certain project in year 2007, or to construct so many houses per year – the targets are not grouped and presented in an annual program which will indicate whether they are within the implementation and financial capacity of the council; nor are priorities stated in case of resource constraints.

This is what we consider a RAP can do, and what has not been achieved. We were shown the Mutoko RAP – the one and only finished such document. While endorsed by a signed social compact, it lacks the detail and specificity that would make it an effective program of financial recovery.

2.3.3 Relevance of this component RAPs

If, as outlined in the PPLG evaluation report, Annex 3, the RAP is intended to unite planning and budgeting within a single document jointly produced by the LA and civil society (and the SAP is seen as a component in the RAP process), then the RAP is an important concept which should be pursued more vigorously. Whether through delay or a change of course the language and practice of RAPs appears to have been de-emphasized under the program, but the concept (as commonly labeled “Turnaround Plan”) is widely accepted. We therefore consider that the support for the process is valuable.

Performance management

Regarding performance management, this might be an appropriate point to comment on the state of Local Authority staffing. Two comments were made to the team during field visits. The first is that it is very difficult, within prevailing local government salary levels, to retain good staff. As a result almost none of the Councils visited had a full complement of staff, and in one case there wasn't a single substantive Chief Officer – all were in Acting positions. The second point was that there is an excess of staff at junior levels. The position is exacerbated by budgetary constraints which mean that, in some cases, employees are kept idle because there are no tools with which they can work³.

We understand that one workshop on performance management has been held, but that follow-up activities have not yet taken place. Judgment must therefore be reserved. However, it is notable that none of the LAs referred to this when asked about what they had gained from the program, which could be an indicator that, as a topic, it is ahead of its time within the current context.

We heard about one Local Authority, Kariba, which had undertaken a job evaluation study which is intended to rationalize the management and pay structure of the Council. This would be a useful precursor to a performance management system. For the rest, however, it would appear that simply maintaining operations is a major challenge, and there is not much interest in higher-order management tools at this stage.

However, we feel that the concepts inherent in the RAPs and aspects of performance management remain relevant, and have the potential for development under the project.

³ An obvious example is in solid waste collection, where, say, the establishment provides for staffing for ten refuse trucks, but only two such trucks are in working order. The staff for the remaining eight therefore have *employment* but no *work*.

2.4 Grants

2.4.1 Task

Provide small grants to selected CSOs to strengthen their capabilities and support their advocacy programs to promote a participatory culture.

Under the contract amendment dated September 27, 2004, the contractor may “award “micro grants” (up to US\$ 1000 and for discrete activities, not as a precursor to a larger grant) without prior approval of the CTO” in order to speed up grant making process and assist capacitate CSO for receipt of grants.

2.4.2 Activity

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q2, 2003 Chipinge CSO grant recipients identified

Q2, 2003 Mutoko CSO grant applications received

Q3, 2003: Short listed grant applications in Mutoko

Q4, 2003: Grant to CSO in Chipinge RC

Q4, 2003: Mutoko grantees selected

Q4, 2003: RFAs for grants advertised in Gwanda, Masvingo and Kariba

Q1, 2004: Chipinge CSO sub-grant awarded and funds disbursed

Q1, 2004: Chipinge RDC sub-grant funds disbursed

Q1, 2004: Grant applications received in Kariba, Gwanda and Masvingo

The above program is a testament to the delays suffered by CSOs in terms of the slow rate of approval and disbursement. A period of nine months for the disbursement of a small grant would appear to be difficult to justify, more particularly as the grantees were promised payment within a few weeks⁴.

More recently the award of grants was communicated, but no funds were disbursed. We were told that this was because regulations prohibit a contractor from making sub-grants beyond the end of its own contract, and the contract extension process was delayed by lengthy negotiations between UI Washington and USAID. However, we may now to get into exactly the same position again, as most of the grants were foreseen as 8 month grants, and the current contract has only been extended until May 31, 2005.

2.4.3 Relevance of this component

This component has gone very slowly. Delays have been attributed to objections by Local Government to the concept of civil society receiving funds where they do not, and to the weakness of the civil society organizations concerned, which has necessitated training and technical assistance in order to prepare them for the grant process. It is possible that the grant-making process imposed inappropriate conditions on them, and/or that the project objective of making grants subsumed the wider objective of strengthening their ability to represent the interests of their constituents and work with local government.

Our concern about the grants is whether a short term injection of cash will yield the results, in terms of sustainability of CSOs, that is sought. This view is based on the

⁴ There is evidence that delays were caused by both sides, i.e. UI and USAID. This is not the place to determine whether these were due to disagreements on principle, miscommunication or negligence. However, we think that to remedy this difficulty, weekly meetings should be held in future so that any difficulties can be resolved quickly (see section 6.2 below).

dual perception that the grant is too small to buy any long-term financial security, and too big to be replicated on a sustainable level from conventional community sources. Thus the grant process appears to have created expectations and in some cases put in place non-sustainable systems with grant funds. We recognize that this phenomenon affects very many organs of civil society at local, national and regional level, but the impact of grant funds within comparatively poor communities is relatively greater: therefore funding for a few months of plenty (eight is the figure most often used) to be followed only by financial famine could create problems.

It is notable that only two full grants and two mini-grants have been paid out after a period of over three years⁵. This therefore begs the further question – in light of the comparative success with which civil society has participated in the program without such grant funds – whether they are necessary.

2.5 Improving service delivery and financial management

2.5.1 Task

Increase the ability of LAs to deliver improved services through better citizen consultation and accountable financial management

2.5.2 Activities

Better citizen consultation

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q3, 2003: Worked with Gwanda on service delivery handbook

Q4, 2003: Worked with Gwanda on service delivery handbook

Q4, 2003: Discussions with Kariba and Masvingo on newsletters

Q1, 2004: Discussions held with Gwanda on service delivery handbook

Q1, 2004: Discussions held with Kariba on Newsletter

The issue of communicating with residents was raised by many LAs. They feel that there are two points – the first is that the press misrepresents their case, and that they need to have an alternative voice. The second is that they need to have a vehicle by which they can communicate directly with their residents and ratepayers concerning all matters of local government. They felt that both of these objectives might be met by the publication of a newsletter which would be distributed free of charge to all residents and businesses. In Masvingo, a CSO – the Masvingo Publicity Association – requested a grant for such a purpose. This was approved, but no funds had been disbursed at the time of the review, so it is too early to know whether the resulting publication will meet the needs of the LA in respect of the issues described above.

Kariba consider that they were promised funds for their newsletter, which have not materialized.

Meanwhile, the threat of misrepresentation of local authority matters by the press remains, and the program has not addressed it. In view of the fact that the program has revealed the depth of misunderstanding and suspicion about Local Government affairs, we consider that this matter could have received more attention, for example by training journalists in the same matters that Local

⁵ Here we are including the period of the PPLG. In the Workplan dated July 2001 it was stated: “All grantee activities to be completed with final report by October 2002”. We know that this element of the program was delayed due to objections by Local Authorities, but the sluggishness of the grant program cannot be explained simply by that. This is discussed in more detail elsewhere.

Government and Civil Society were trained. This could have been achieved either by inviting them to the same workshops, or holding one especially for journalists. Experience in other sectors has suggested that training journalists would be welcomed by them – especially as it, in fact, empowers journalists to perform better. We also fear that newsletters may not be as effective as many expect. This may be partly due to problems in terms of a lack of journalistic skills at the local authority level, and also because of an inherent suspicion felt by readers all over the world in relation to “official” communications.

Accountable financial Management

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Systems support

*Q2, 2003 Strategy to assist LAs with implementation of PROMUN developed
Q1, 2004: Finalized scope of work on PROMUN Project*

At the beginning of the fourth quarter of the year 2004, this important part of the program has still not started, even though it was ranked as a high priority in the evaluation of the PPLG. This is unfortunate as it would seem that the more effective use of the PROMUN program would have facilitated improved financial management as well as more transparency.

We were also told by several LAs that they had been promised computers under the program, but had not received them or any explanation concerning why they were not supplied. This has had a negative impact on the program and USAID⁶.

Procurement

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q3, 2003: Model procurement regulations project started

There is no further mention of any activity under this component.

Technical assistance

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q1, 2004: Funded four temporary bookkeepers for Chipinge UC

The scope for technical assistance under the project was very substantial. It can take several forms: whether it is a form of direct managerial support, such as the work in Chipinge; or to help to improve systems (or the skills by which systems are applied), technical assistance and training can yield direct and tangible benefits which are usually widely welcomed.

However, even though this was foreseen as a component of the program⁷ it seems to have received little attention. It is also worth noting that the technical assistance and

⁶ In an environment of great financial stringency a comparatively small amount of money can seem very important. Thus if a CSO, which has very modest operations, receives funding for a computer, while the City Treasurer has only one working machine and one printer on which to print the monthly accounts, and is desperate for a back-up facility, it is understandable how this matter created bad feeling.

⁷ “The Contractor shall replicate the useful lessons of the PPLG through. . . strengthening LA capacity to make optimum use of their PROMUN software” (Task A in the contract).

training proposed in the contract was supposed to be supplied to “all selected LAs”, not just to those who had asked for it.

2.5.3 Relevance of this component

It would appear that at an early stage the concept of “demand-driven” training and technical assistance was made central to the program; although the SOW for the contract states that training activities shall be proposed by the contractor. The concept of “demand-driven” can be interpreted in different ways. On the face of it, it requires that training and technical assistance is made available to LAs who specifically request it. It is a matter of management style whether the request has to be formalized, and justified in terms of specific surveys and analysis. The participating LAs had the impression that training events and technical assistance would only be made available under the program if a fairly detailed request was submitted which substantiated the need. Our impression was that the tail was wagging the dog in this respect – waiting for a formal submission caused procedural delays which eventually prevented the training from taking place.

Financial management training for LAs continues to be extremely important, and support in this sector is likely to yield results.

2.6 Disseminate the LLGP results and recommendations to all stakeholders

2.6.1 Task

Disseminate the LLGP results and recommendations to all stakeholders

2.6.2 Activities

The following is a summary of the activities under this item of the contract as reported in the quarterly reports:

Q4, 2003: Hold discussions on host for local governance website

Q1, 2004: Worked with UCAZ as the host for a local governance website for Zimbabwe.

This aspect of the work appears to have made no progress since the UCAZ meeting.

2.6.3 Relevance of this component

Hitherto dissemination has been done through workshops. We feel that the time has come for success stories to be told, so as to institutionalize the concepts and practices that have been pioneered in the program so successfully.

Plans to construct a web site have been proposed but not completed. In this context it may be noted that internet usage at the local government level in Zimbabwe appears to be low, so we cannot expect this component to have a major impact at this stage, but feel that it would be useful for the concept to be pioneered and tested.

3. General Assessment: an overview of the environment

3.1 Was the strategy broad enough?

The program has the reputation of concentrating on the link between Local government and Civil Society, and while, in retrospect, it is considered to have exceeded expectations in this regard, the concept appeared revolutionary at the time. At this point, in response to our questions at the Local Authority level, we received clear indications that the fundamentals of the design were considered very

“The Contractor shall assist and train all selected LAs to strengthen their capability to . . . apply credit ratings and restructuring action plans to improve creditworthiness . . . and to meet citizens’ service delivery needs.” (Task D in the contract).

appropriate. In spite of the project being conducted during a time of great political tension and bitter conflict in some respects, Local Authorities of both parties endorsed the concepts behind the project – namely to help the Councils to improve their relationship with civil society, and to strengthen their financial and planning capabilities.

Nevertheless, hindsight allows us the opportunity to examine the strategy by which the project was launched, and to ask whether the correct approach was taken. On the face of it, the components of the program had little attraction for local government. The following is a characterization of the questions that LAs were being asked by the project to accept, as perceived by the staff, and possibly the Councilors:

- Do you want to open up your procedures to the residents associations and other arms of civil society with whom you've been fighting for years?
- Do you want to see these CSOs strengthened through grants, while you will get nothing?
- Do you want to have to prepare elaborate plans on which you can be evaluated to replace the current system which allows you to bamboozle the public and councilors alike?

Other dimensions came into the issue

- If the program is supposed to support the democratic process, why are civil society organizations who are not elected by universal suffrage given precedence over Councils which are?
- At a time of economic hardship, such as the present, why should civil society be given funds to set up modern offices when local government is desperately short of the same facilities?

We ask the question, if a different strategy had been adopted would the delays and resistance have been reduced or eliminated? A starting point could have been internationally agreed principles, to which Zimbabwe is a signatory, as incorporated in Habitat and other UN Declarations. For example, if it had been labeled “Modernizing Local Government”, or “Strengthening Local Government”, or taking “Local Government into the New Millennium” it could have been, we believe, embraced more easily. Indeed if correctly characterized, involvement of civil society “to address the problem of lack of trust of local government by the community” is a principle that all can agree to. These changes would not have derogated in any way from the principles that the program aimed to support, but rather would have placed it into an acceptable package.

However, although slow acceptance of the program led to serious delays, eventual acceptance of the principles of community involvement in local government has, however, vindicated the design in itself.

3.2 The importance of the LLGP in complementing other USAID funded DG projects

In respect of the program's objective to promote the rule of law through a regulatory and policy framework, and support decentralization, the potential for synergy between the different USAID funded programs was clear. Although meetings took place to explore this aspect, it seems that it was de-emphasized in line with the apparent decline in political will to decentralize. Thereafter attention was concentrated on support for reform at the local level.

The DG programs being implemented at the same time as the LLGP included the SUNY support for the parliamentary process and PACT support for national NGOs. Events have shown that there is a danger of trying to replicate support programs for national NGOs at the local level because civil society as it presents itself at the national level is very different from that at local level – at least in most of the small LAs within the program. This is not to say that there was not a useful synergy in working at both national and local level, and we consider that very useful experience has been gained for applying a similar process at both levels. However the difficulties of working at the local level had clearly been underestimated by all concerned, and cannot be ignored, and in the end it must be recognized that there was little effective transferability between the PACT program and the LLGP.

3.3 Potential of the LLGP project to have an impact on Zimbabwe's transition to democratic governance

The view of the team is that the project has great potential to strengthen democratic practice in Zimbabwe. In the majority of the LAs that we visited, attitudes regarding the idea of involvement of the community in the affairs of Council have moved from opposition or skepticism to enthusiastic support. It is clear that (even allowing for the rosy glow that evaluations attract when there is a hope of more funds from the same source) real change has occurred and that, given continuing support, this will become institutionalized in the Local Government system of Zimbabwe. We are talking here of style *and* substance. In other words, not only are communities being given a nominal role in decision-making, they are being – in some cases – actively engaged, even courted, by Councils. Without the LLGP it is very doubtful if this would have taken place; or even if the intention had been present, implementation would not have been as successful as it was.

3.4 The potential for working in the public sector vs. civil society vs. private sector – identifying targets of opportunity for maximizing impact.

We made a point of asking Local Authorities their views on working with the private sector and civil society. They all embrace the concept, while not always having a clear idea of the most effective ways of doing so. Some LAs have already established such linkages, however, and their experiences – mostly very positive – may form the basis of very useful exchanges of information. It is to be noted that the initiative for this co-operation has primarily economic roots: where funds, skills and even labor are scarce then it makes sense to use all available sources.

New modes of cooperation are emerging where civil society, either through the medium of business interests or ordinary residents, is willing to assist local government in the provision or maintenance of facilities. Equally, local government has now begun to understand the advantages of bringing other actors into the development or management of its facilities. For example in Chipinge RDC we were told about two civil society/LA road improvement projects; in Bulawayo we heard about experiments in the management of community facilities by community groups; in Gweru a private company is assisting with maintenance of the water pumps, while a voluntary group is maintaining public open space, and there might be many other cases which we were not told about elsewhere.

We therefore consider that there are important opportunities in this regard, but note that LA/private/CSO projects will probably be most likely to succeed if they are kept to a small scale. The constraints imposed by the short duration of the contract mean that there will be limited opportunities under the LLGP. If such a project has already been developed, and needs only a small grant to kick start it, then it should go ahead. Otherwise, the concept of joint LA/CSO projects will have to be developed under a

new program. Suggestions regarding how this might be done are included in Appendix 1 of the report.

3.5 Institutionalization and sustainability

Paradoxically the demand-led approach results in a dependency – placing the LA in the role of supplicant waiting for hand-outs from above. While we fully accept the principles that “demand-led” represented, especially in light of a tendency for so much public sector training to be supply led, we feel that the program would have benefited from greater involvement by Council staff in the process of deciding the timing and content of training and technical assistance under the program. In other words, the relationship between the program and its participants would have been strengthened if training and facilitation skills had been developed earlier within each LA. It is noted that recently, following an initiative from Gweru, “engines for change” are being institutionalized⁸. Such an approach involves senior, (and possibly Chief – this would depend on the size of the LA) officers being trained as facilitators in the process of helping staff and councilors alike re-think their traditional behaviors and practices. Representatives from each of the major departments would receive such training and constitute a task team.

The UI will be able to support the Gweru initiative and should consider extending the concept to other LAs. This will, we consider, result in greater depth in the program and a healthier relationship between the UI and the LA. It will help to internalize the values of the program within the LA staff, and institutionalize the program in a sustainable way.

4 LLGP Management and UI Organization

4.1 Overall management and performance

In our meetings with the participating LAs we heard much praise for the Urban Institute in terms of the professionalism with which the workshops were conducted, and the effective communication of the message regarding the involvement of civil society in Local Government. The workshop on the conduct of Council Meetings was also praised.

One of the observable implementation difficulties faced by the UI was the short duration of the both contracts. The problems of operating what was essentially a long-term capacity building program (as suggested in the program name) within a short-term time frame were exacerbated by serious setbacks, such as the rejection of the CSO program by most LAs, and the delays in approving the selection of participating LAs by the Ministry⁹.

As far as we can tell the constraints of the contract were not openly discussed with the participating LAs, and as a result targets, relating to – for example – grant-giving were not shared. CSOs were left in the dark as to why grants that had been promised were not disbursed.

4.2 Slow response and lack of communication

However there were consistent concerns about the slow response rate, and poor communication by the UI with its constituents. In other words, the communication and

⁸ Task A in the contract reads as follows: “The Contractor shall replicate the useful lessons from the PPLG; including the establishment of change catalysts or focal points in each LA . . .” We consider that the approach described here is one method by which this objective could have been realized.

⁹ Approvals were received in the third quarter on 2003, about nine months after the contract extension which launched the LLGP.

transparency that the UI was preaching to local government and civil society did not appear to be being practiced by the UI.

The most serious criticism has concerned the delays in processing and disbursing the CSO grants, and in failing to communicate with the beneficiaries the reason for the delay.

4.3 Institutionalization and linkages

The observations made above regarding poor communication point to another weakness in the management of the program. While the UI asked for a point person within the LA concerned, it did not appear to have a counterpart within its own organization, in spite of stating the intention to do so in the Work Plan¹⁰. This link person would act as a champion for that LA within the UI, chase up decisions, arrange events etc etc. We consider that if this had been the case, communications could have been strengthened and decisions expedited.

4.4 Grants

We consider that the process of grant-giving could have been pursued with more speed. We fully recognize that there were great difficulties initially in obtaining the support of the LA – as described above. Another factor was that the type of grass-roots CSOs which the program dealt with have difficulty in meeting the requirements of the USAID grant-making process. However, these do not explain the lack of progress fully.

We were informed that contracts and grants were handled in Washington which was a matter of surprise in relation to a project such as this, where very small sums are at stake and a standardized grant agreement is appropriate. Alternatively, if the UI were to insist that contracting be undertaken in Washington, it is to be hoped that the turnaround period could have been kept to no more than a day or two. It appears from the records that delays amounting to months have been experienced. It is not possible to track the exact cause of the delays, but we consider that UI and USAID should examine the process in more detail and determine performance criteria for originating, preparing and approval of grants and sub-contracts. Possibly a more flexible attitude to the process – whether in terms of the requirements which should be met, or the manner by which the CSOs were assisted to meet the requirements – might have helped.

4.5 Staffing and sub-contracting

Similar criticisms would appear to apply to the speed at which other components of the project were managed. We were informed that the PROMUN training and technical assistance program, which was referred to directly in the contract signed in December 2002, had still not been finalized 34 months later. We understand that there were protracted negotiations between UI Washington and the Regional Contracting Office, and evidently there was a communications breakdown. Even so, a delay of this magnitude is remarkable.

Similar factors apply to the staffing of the program. Ever since the PPLG there has been a substantial amount of part-time input, and there have been many changes at the top (with the fourth COP now in place). While all projects are vulnerable to resignations and changes, and many USAID NGO partners are experiencing similar problems, it appears that the matter of a strong and stable staffing structure could have received more priority.

¹⁰ On p 2 of the Work Plan (dated September 2003), it notes that one of the lessons learned from the PPLG was “the need for continual contact in the communities by UI staff”, and on the following pages responds by stating “we plan to maintain a consistent presence in each of our communities.”

5 Way forward

5.1 Overview

5.1.1 Introduction

This section looks forward to what can be achieved within the limited funds and time horizon available. Before going into specifics, it is necessary to discuss the team's interpretation of the background against which the program will have to be implemented.

5.1.2 The financial and administrative environment

In our visits to LAs we asked chief officers to describe their most pressing needs. The presentations we received were not about efficient planning, sound management or any such higher-order needs. They were almost exclusively centered on one burning issue: the collapse, or danger of collapse, of service delivery within their jurisdiction.

Closely linked with service delivery constraints has been financial distress. This may be measured in two ways – in terms of a debt burden which has the potential to bankrupt the council, and a shortage of income to fund the approved budget.

Paradoxically, the current inflationary environment has provided a powerful incentive to pay off short term debt (typically a bank overdraft), because of the crippling effect of the current very high interest rates. Thus the LAs have every incentive to, at the very least, bring their bank account into surplus. This has required a careful analysis of income, expenditure and financial management in general. Many found the recommendations of the credit rating agency an excellent guide regarding what steps should be taken to turn around their finances. Whether they gave their strategy a name (e.g. in Bulawayo their "turnaround strategy") or not, the need to act rapidly and decisively gave LAs a focal point around which to rally their creditors. They were able to convince ratepayers and residents that without a response their services would collapse completely. These stakeholders have encouraged the public to pay promptly and even supported the LA regarding the necessity of regular – even quarterly – tariff increases.

But while paying off an overdraft eliminates the wasted expenditure of interest charges, it does not, per se, provide the funds for service delivery. Thus there is a need for support from the public for tariffs which will provide at least a basic minimum level of service. The rate of increases required to stay ahead of inflation can sound unreasonable, so it has not been an easy task for Councils to persuade the residents that increases of such magnitude are essential. The Minister of Local Government has taken a stand against such increases which has placed the LAs into an even more difficult position. Furthermore, wage increases awarded in arbitration proceedings may be outside budget ceilings, posing further threats to financial security (e.g. Bulawayo).

In some cases their only way of generating the necessary income has been to appeal to the residents and businesses within the community to pay their rates, supplementary charges and water accounts. What is important to note here is that the old method of threatening non-payers with legal action, and cutting off water, has largely been replaced by a consultative approach. And whereas legal threats may have worked in some cases, it is well known that political intervention against such "victimization" is often easy to obtain, and therefore the tactics often fail. By contrast, the residents of most of the LAs we spoke to, when the Council appeals to them for help, have responded favorably. This speaks of a new relationship between the Council and the residents, replacing the bitter confrontations and resistance of the past with a new spirit of cooperation and understanding¹¹.

¹¹ Another approach has been to ask the residents to participate in service delivery, for example, by keeping their area clean, cutting the grass etc. Or by appealing, as Gweru has successfully done, to private enterprise

The significance of this, to us, is that such collaboration is new, and it is almost certain that a major factor in this turnaround of council/public relations has been the LLGP. Time and time again we heard the same story – since this or that workshop, when we were brought together with the community representatives, we have started to understand each other’s position, and can now work together effectively. This strength must be built upon and consolidated.

5.1 3 The legislative and political environment

The program is operating within a specific political and legislative environment. To understand this environment and its implications, it is useful to refer to the pre-requisites for effective decentralization as listed in the draft report “Framework for the Revised Decentralization Implementation Strategy”.¹² The table below summarizes these points.

Pre-requisite for successful decentralization (1)	In place (2)
Legal framework that spells out clearly the roles of the various key actors in the process	No
Institutional framework for planning, implementation, coordination and monitoring at national, sub-national, district and sub-district levels, with the roles, responsibilities and powers of each defined	No
Availability of adequate and competent staffing of decentralized governance structures, in terms of both managerial and technical/specialist staff	No
Provision of adequate funds for both decentralized structures and the activities they are expected to carry out. For local governance structures, in particular, reliable sources of funding in place	No
Adherence to planning and implementation systems that promote integrated and coordinated development	No
Capacity of community organizations to enable communities to play an effective role in realizing the objectives of decentralization, to make effective demands for support from their government, and to monitor program implementation	Starting

Notes: (1) As listed in the report
 (2) Our appraisal of the situation

If we accept the validity of these indicators, Zimbabwe has a very long way to go before government is effectively decentralized. The general view in this regard is that this is not the right time to push this particular agenda, as the nation’s attention at both national and local level is on the pressing problems of trying to maintain a basic minimum of service delivery.

Budgetary and managerial challenges are being advanced as the reason for the policy to decentralize government being deferred until the economy is stronger. For example, the current serious foreign exchange shortages have created difficulties in the supply of

to assist in the maintenance of utilities. And by educating the community, as almost all councils have been doing, the program has helped communities to see the Council and its assets as their property, thus motivating the community against vandalism and other abuses. For example in Chitungwiza the residents were acting as watchdogs regarding abuse of Council vehicles, and reported several different examples of such abuse.

¹² Andrew Mlalazi, Ahmed Jama and Walter Dingani: Framework for the revised decentralization implementation strategy (draft), Ministry of Local Government Public Works and National Housing, Harare, December 2003.

chemicals for water purification; the repair of, or replacement of refuse removal vehicles, and the maintenance of water and sewerage systems. As discussed above, inflation has caused serious budgetary shortfalls. The remedy of substantial tariff increases have usually been implemented ex post facto, and have typically been too little and too late.

Moreover, the tendency has been for central government to involve itself more, not less, in local government. Most LAs that we spoke to referred to the Minister's statements which effectively prevented tariff increases, and thereby placed the finances of some LAs in jeopardy.

Similarly, delays in approving the LA budgets, which are supposed to come into effect in January, but which may be approved only in March or April, have the effect of delaying the increased tariffs on which those budgets are based. Whereas a delay of a few months in tariff increases within an environment of moderate inflation can possibly be accommodated, in an environment of hyperinflation, the consequences of such delays may be disastrous.

The comments that have been received about this aspect of the project is that one single act by central government would be enough, for the time being, to advance the cause of decentralization – legislation which would guarantee, on the South African and Ghanaian models – a percentage of the national budget being paid on an annual basis directly to Local Government. This would allow breathing space, so to speak, for a more comprehensive framework to be legislated in due course, but even so would represent a major reform which is unlikely in the present economic climate.

It is therefore our view that this aspect of the project, which has, to some extent gone into the background at this stage, be allowed to stay there unless and until the Government asks for specific support in this matter.

5.2 Prioritizing program activities

This section contains recommendations for prioritizing program activities. Four main criteria have been used in so doing.

- What program activities need to be completed or consolidated?
- What are local government priorities?
- What can be achieved within the limited time frames of the contract?
- What can be achieved within the limited budget of the contract?

We were also asked to look at future activities which could build upon the strengths of the program and take the concepts further. Our recommendations in this matter are included in Appendix 1.

During this review we have been struck how some aspects of the project have struck a response with the participating LAs, while others have not. We can characterize these elements as follows

Task, as in the contract	Comment
B. Rule of law	This is perceived as being the purview of the MLGPWNH, and is of little progress has been made in this respect. In the current climate this aspect of the project is of low priority for most LAs as they do not perceive change as being likely in the near future
C. Strengthening civil society	After initial resistance this element has been

organizations, grants to CSO, application of the advocacy index	understood and broadly welcomed
D. (1) Training LAs in working with civil society	Strong need for training in citizen participation
D. (2) Strengthening LA Operations	Technical assistance in terms of support for LA operations especially in financial management
E. Restructuring Action Plans	Strategic plans have been prepared, but lack links to budgetary process. Conducting annual budget consultations has started a process that is similar to the RAP concept: this can and should be built upon
F. Performance management	Of interest, but not a major priority in light of the lack of qualified staff, many unfilled positions and cash shortages.

The characterizations of the program above may miss many nuances which those close to implementation might consider important. However, we have simplified the situation in order to highlight the major issues. Below, we comment on the tasks listed above in order of importance, and discuss the points in more detail.

5.3 Top priority programs

5.3.1 Task D (1): Training LAs in working with civil society

The project has made very important contributions in the field of involving civil society in local government, and in strengthening civil society to represent its constituencies. In our view this is a strong foundation on which the remainder of the project and future work can be built.

We are currently at the stage where the practices of involving civil society are beginning to be institutionalized. However, we must not underestimate the risks of such practices fading away if they are not supported for a longer period of time. This is because while all actors seem to appreciate that the process has yielded important gains in terms of governance, there are nevertheless incentives for them to revert to the old way. These are simply that, from the point of view of Council staff, participation can be threatening to their authority, it can be awkward, it can be seen as delaying important decisions etc. From the point of view of Councilors it can be seen to be undermining their role as elected representatives, it can be a vehicle for political opposition, and may be a means by which aspiring politicians gain public recognition and thereby get elected to Council in the next election.

These threats to the process were discussed freely by LAs. We consider that while such difficulties will never be eliminated they can be managed effectively through continuing support and successful implementation of cooperation – as is currently happening in many LAs. The support of the program in this matter, as a funder and as a neutral party, is very important.

An area of training in which specific support was requested was to help Senior Officers of the LAs to deal with the pressures and demands of public participation.

5.3.2 Task D (2): Strengthening LA Operations

Several LAs articulated a need for more support in terms of training and technical assistance, especially in financial matters. This should be made a priority for the program.

A frequent request was for funds for hardware and software for their accounting systems, as well as training in the use of the PROMUN system which most of them have installed, but do not fully utilize. Technical assistance is also required in some other selected specialized activities, such as billing and reporting systems. In addition there might be a demand for support in the management of water and sewerage services and roads maintenance etc.

Regarding tools for the enhanced involvement of civil society in local government affairs, such as newsletters, commitments have been made and should be honored. The impact of newsletters should be monitored and the results evaluated.

5.3.3 Task C: Strengthening civil society organizations, grants to CSO, application of the advocacy index

The original program experienced delays due to capacity constraints within CSOs and slow administrative procedures. In light of the successful involvement of civil society in the budgetary process, turnaround plans etc, with or without grants, we consider that the program should respond as follows:

- existing commitments in terms of grant awards should be completed
- future support for civil society should preferably be in the form of mini-grants which can be disbursed quickly and provided to put in place basic systems such as books of accounts, constitutions etc.
- that wherever possible support should be in the form of technical assistance which can be provided quickly and without creating the expectations that cash grants tend to create.
- where projects have been prepared which can be implemented within a short time frame of about six months, there is potential for joint civil society/local government projects as a means of fostering good relations and reinforcing the interdependence of the two¹³.

Concerning the advocacy index, a useful technique would be to invite the CSOs to construct their own index. We would suggest that this would concentrate more on having regular and well advertised elections to office, regular meetings of the committee/board, following good practice in terms of communication with the membership, transparency in the conduct of business, reliable accounts, etc. The new version should not discriminate against word of mouth communication in favor of written communication; it should not require sophisticated data collection methods, nor presuppose that an organization without a formal office is necessarily less effective than one which has.

The three elements of the project listed above represent very important targets of opportunity, building on the successes of the project as currently designed.

5.4 Lower priority components

5.4.1 Task E Restructuring Action Plans

The RAP concept neatly incorporates almost everything that the program is trying to do by involving civil society in local government affairs. It requires local government to work with civil society in planning a realistic expenditure framework which reflects the priorities of the residents and ratepayers while also working within realistic expenditure ceilings. Moreover, in the current inflationary environment in which LAs are in greater financial stress than ever before, the “restructuring” element of the plan is even more important. As

¹³ There are examples of this in Chipinge RDC and Gweru which could be replicated at low cost to yield quick and positive results.

noted elsewhere, many LAs are already undertaking a quasi-RAP under a name such as a “turnaround plan”.

It is therefore suggested that using the widely accepted concept of the “Turnaround Plan” the concept of the RAP should continue to be used. There is tremendous merit in having a strategy and a document around which the whole community can rally. This document would be prepared with the full participation of all stakeholders and would have the components of a RAP, namely financial and service provision analysis, identification of special measures to address these points, and budgetary proposals. This could be a rallying point around which both Council and the community would mobilize to put the program into effect.¹⁴

5.4.2 Task F Performance management

The concept of performance management, as referred to under the program, is, in a sense, a monitoring one. Given a Turnaround Plan which has identifiable targets, the community and Council can then monitor the efficiency with which the plan has been implemented. This might be characterized as a “Service Delivery Charter” which would describe the performance targets of the Local Authority against which performance can be measured. The charter would also spell out the responsibilities of the residents and ratepayers. For the Council the Charter would help to impose discipline and responsibility, while for the public it would represent a standard against which service should be judged. They would have the right to explanations for failure to meet the standards set. These standards could be at a variety of levels, ranging from, e.g. a supply of purified water at all times, to telephone calls to the Council being answered within ten rings. Typically such documents specify the time within which repairs will be done to infrastructure, the procedures for dealing with complaints and the time that will be taken to respond to a complaint and so on.

The theory is that this would bring about more responsible planning on the one hand, and more effective management on the other. These are good principles which are, in any case, implicit in the RAP process.

Performance management has other connotations, for example placing staff on performance management contracts¹⁵. Such management principles have been widely adopted in Britain’s public service, and are a feature of South Africa’s Local Government legislation. While many of the principles of performance management are useful in achieving results, we do not consider that the institutional environment at this time is appropriate for such a move.

5.4.3 Dissemination of Program achievements

There is scope for expanding this side of the project to local government throughout Zimbabwe, through peer education methods. The support of the MLGPWNH is crucial in this matter, but it is considered that the stage has been reached where success stories should start to be told.

Resource center

¹⁴ Hence, the proposal, in the PPLG evaluation Annex 3, that both sides should sign a “Social Compact”. This concept, while highly commendable in principle, seems to have the effect of scaring the parties due to its quasi-legal format. There may be other ways in which such social accords can be formalized.

¹⁵ The most notorious example of this in the region has been the management of Johannesburg’s turnaround plan where all the senior staff had explicit targets who, if they met them, would receive bonuses. This required the abolition of permanent appointments and other structural adjustments which have been vociferously resisted by trades unions.

One of the tasks stated in the contract was that the contractor “share international experience in citizen participation in democratic Local Governance, especially in decision-making and operations”. It is not clear how important international experience has been as a pedagogical tool. However, we think that there is an important opportunity here for the project to make available materials, either hard copies, or, if need be, on CD ROM, which would be collected in a Resource Center in UCAZ, provided that they share interest. It is recommended that the person/s responsible for the material in UCAZ should also be trained with regard to their content, so that they understand fully how the materials could be used. The materials could be a source of guidance and/or inspiration to those within the LAs and also help officers and even councilors address some of the concerns which might be raised about the program. The materials would cover the field of citizen participation and local governance generally, taking local, regional and international examples, and examples from the program itself.

5.5 On hold

Rule of law, and legislative reform

As stated above, circumstances have made it difficult to make progress on this element, and we consider that it should not be actively pursued.

6. Contract strategy

We believe that a notable contribution of the program has been to bridge the gaps between the three cornerstones of local government: organized civil society, the Council and their staff. The most important aspect of this, and the most successful to date, has been the active participation of civil society in local governance.

The overall future strategy should be to mainstream the system of involving civil society, reinforcing the gains that have been achieved to date, and actively engage central, provincial and district administrations in the process. Mainstreaming must institutionalize systems for consultation and cooperation in respect of issues such as budgeting, implementation of turnaround plans, and strategic planning. It must assure that the concept is both understood and embraced: our meetings have suggested that in several quarters neither of these applies.

In order to do so, the participating LAs should be brought together, so that they can develop a strategy which will be achievable within the time frame. The strategy should be developed in a consultative and cooperative way, and must use the experience of the successful Local Authorities to guide those which are not doing so well.

An essential part of the process must be to incorporate an exit strategy so that the systems that are required to maintain the momentum of civil society/local government collaboration and consultation are sustainable, and any obstacles that might exist for doing so are identified early so that they may be removed in time.

6.1 Contract duration

It is an unfortunate by-product of the current realities in Zimbabwe that the magnitude and duration of funding for the LLGP cannot be predicted over a long time frame. This imposes serious constraints on the management of the program, a fact that is exacerbated by the sense that such constraints cannot be shared with the beneficiary institutions. Nevertheless, we consider that implementation tactics are bound to be influenced by the short time horizon, and management of the contract must be adapted to working within it.

6.2 Contract management

Two issues need to be addressed regarding contract management. The first is that the Harare office needs to be given the authority to take all major decisions without reference to Washington. Alternatively, that decisions in Washington are taken promptly.

The second issue, which is partially related to the first, is that there needs to be a more aggressive attitude to prompt decision-making and response to stakeholders' requests within the Harare office.

Any contract awards, whether a new contract or an extension, should require a commitment to these two principles by the contractor.

The implementation record suggests that communication breakdowns have caused delays in the past. To remedy this we would suggest weekly meetings between UI and USAID which could be used to address contract administration issues and implementation delays.

6.3 Contract implementation

We have alluded above to the need for more effective communication between the contractor and the participating LAs. We also reported many examples of what the beneficiaries regard as broken promises.

It is considered essential that these issues be dealt with frankly and promptly. We suggest that each participating LA, and the related CSOs, should have a contact person in the UI who will deal with such issues, and be responsible for acting on their behalf vis-à-vis project management.

There is also a need to be more systematic about the provision of generic training and capacity building activities, so that synergies and economies can be achieved.

Appendix 1

The future: possible directions for future grant-making initiatives

1. Introduction

We have described above how the grant-making component of the project has faced problems in respect of delays in the disbursement of grants, and the objections to the concept by Local Government. Other aspects over which we have concerns are the sustainability of the systems which grants have been used to establish, and the difficult question of which organizations should be selected to receive the grants. In general, therefore, our conclusion has been that, as presently operated, the CSO grant system has not been a success, and has tended to divide, rather than unite, local government and civil society. There is also a need to identify sustainable modes of support for CSOs at the local level

2. LA/CSO projects

We therefore propose that, if there is an opportunity in future for a follow-on program, that a different strategy be used. This is one which provides grants for projects which are developed jointly between civil society and local government. We have already referred to some such – for example road repairs and construction, operation of community facilities and maintenance of public open space.

Criteria for such projects would include the following:

- Both parties should put resources into the project.
- The resources could be in the form of cash, labor, machinery or materials
- Implementation and management of the project should be spearheaded by a joint team of civil society and the LA, chaired by the Mayor, with vice Chair from Civil society.
- The grant should be related to the amount of resources that are being used, e.g. three times as much. (i.e. total project funds would be 25% local resources and 75% USAID grant).
- Projects would be proposed by civil society and would be jointly appraised by the committee referred to above.

Projects would probably fall into four categories. The project might choose to use all four, or only some of them. These categories would be:

- Economic projects, designed to enable employment generation, the growth and development of small business etc.
- HIV/AIDS related projects which will mainstream a role for Local Government in the sector
- Infrastructure and community facility projects
- Service provision

We describe typical projects under each of these headings below.

2.1 Economic projects

This is a sector which created much interest in Local Government circles, and many CSOs represent the informal sector, marketers, small industry etc. The problems which local authorities face include a proliferation of informal trading which congests streets, creates a solid waste problem, and is associated with increased street crime.

Any project which supports the sector through the provision of low-cost facilities, in an appropriate location, would therefore be very welcome by all parties. If this provision is linked to the provision of technical assistance and small loans to help businesses grow, that would be doubly welcome. There might be opportunities for working with using existing donor-funded projects and NGOs in this sector, which would reduce the administrative burden.

There are pitfalls: if such developments are in the wrong place or are too expensive for the traders they will not be used. Similarly, a distinction must be made between retail operations and small scale manufacturing (such as furniture manufacture, tinsmiths etc). The latter, while a good location is important, typically needs more space, electricity and may benefit from shared services, while for the former location is all important and only a very minimum of facilities are needed. For example, in Zambia, the trader usually erects his or her own structure: this can be done to a standard design and very simple materials, but creates the concept highly replicable.

2.4 HIV/AIDS related projects

Local Government has not played a major role in relation to HIV/AIDS. However, they can make a very tangible contribution to the needs of affected families in terms of both health and income.

One example of such projects is to support vegetable gardening. In many cases LAs have the land: they also have the water. Examples already exist of such schemes associated with sewerage treatment works where the land is very fertile and abundant cheap water is available¹⁶.

There have been very successful cases in South Africa where trickle irrigation is used for vegetables. Trickle irrigation has three advantages: low cost, no moving parts, and minimal losses through evaporation.

Such a project would fund the purchase of trickle irrigation pipes through the grants, supported by technical assistance in respect of vegetable growing.

Allocation of the plots would be to families who have been identified by the home-based care teams working in the community. They would be free to use or sell the produce they grow.

The scheme could be extended to the wider community. If so, the funds to buy the irrigation pipes could be loaned, thus creating a revolving fund. In a project such as this which is working well in South Africa, the initial such loan is only about \$30, to be repaid over one year, which is sufficient to make a viable enterprise.

In addition to funds for irrigation pipes expenses for fencing, water pumps and a reservoir would be met from a grant.

2.3 Infrastructure and community facilities

We heard proposals for two fairly different types of project.

The first is the maintenance, repair or reconstruction of infrastructure such as roads and bridges, street lighting and facilities such as community halls, clinics

¹⁶ While it might be necessary, in some cases, to exclude root crops for health reasons, that could be assessed in the light of the quality of the water supply on a case by case basis.

and primary schools. These are projects which typically require comparatively modest sums, and can be executed by comparatively unskilled labor.

In such projects, the grant would normally be used to purchase the materials necessary, or possibly the hire of equipment such as road graders etc. (Where the LA already owns such equipment, it would provide it. There might be cases where the equipment is out of service due to the need for repairs, in which case the project could be used to repair the equipment thereby leaving an asset for the Local Authority.)

The other type, which is different in degree, but not fundamentally different in kind, is the completion of the construction of community facilities that had been abandoned due to lack of funds. These major assets lie unused and subject to deterioration due to the effects of the weather and vandalism, but could, in some cases, be brought into use for a comparatively modest amount of money. Completion of such buildings is more than a physical act: it has the potential as a very important symbol of the determination of community and Local Government to work together for their mutual benefit.

2.4 Service provision

The solid waste removal services of almost all local authorities have suffered serious problems due to a lack of funds to buy vehicles or even to maintain and repair their existing ones. This has resulted in the growth of illegal rubbish dumps which pose serious health risks, are unsightly, and are symbols of the collapse of local governance.

While the LAs preferred option would be to buy new modern compactor trucks, there are intermediate steps that may be taken to ameliorate the situation.

The first is to educate the residents regarding refuse disposal, recycling, and composting. Substantial reductions in the volume of refuse are possible if:

- Organic material is composted – since a very large proportion of residents live in houses within their own plot of land, this is not a problem.
- Paper and metal are separated for recycling

Employment opportunities exist in terms of recycling, and it might be possible to fund recycling containers, and/or support community groups in terms of recycling operations. For example, if all paper were deposited in special containers which were then collected by paper mills, the funds could be paid to the Residents Association.

The second is that in order to reduce the burden on the LA, the residents would take their refuse to a nearby transfer point¹⁷. This could be done by local members of the community on a nominal allowance, using small trolleys provided through the grant. Alternatively, at a larger scale, they could take the material to the landfill site using tractors. Both of these schemes have the advantage of creating employment while also addressing the health risks, but cannot be attempted unless there are strong structures at the local level which can take responsibility for managing them.

A much more ambitious concept which has worked well in South Africa would create a fund for the purchase of vehicles by community members. With such funds, refuse trucks would be purchased and provided on lease to community-

¹⁷ This has been done successfully in Lusaka under a CARE/DfID project in the peri-urban areas.

based operators who have a proven record in transport operations, but insufficient capital. These operators would then enter into a contract with the LA to provide solid waste removal services. They would employ their own labor to load the material onto the truck.

Each month the operator would receive payment from the LA for his services, from which would be deducted the repayment installment and maintenance costs of the truck. Within five years he would then have acquired a truck and be in business as a solid waste company. Such concepts have worked very well in South Africa, but clearly require a commitment from the LA to support the principle over the long term.

Another area in which the community can play a part is maintenance of the environment – in the wider sense of the word. This includes, for example, keeping grass in public open space trimmed, planting and maintaining trees, keeping streets litter free, looking after facilities for sports and games, etc. It is possible to build very visible and satisfying projects around such causes with very modest funds.

3. Strengthening Civil Society on a sustainable basis

We are not convinced that the current format of the grants is appropriate as it may create unsustainable conditions and expectations. However, there is a need for technical assistance and training to be continued with civil society. The objective of this would be to help them understand better the principles and practice of Local Government, including reading financial statements, budgeting etc. It would also be directed at helping them become more effective in terms of consulting more widely and effectively with the constituency, holding regular and well publicized elections for office, good financial management etc.

To us, however, sustainability is the core, and therefore an ideal would be to establish a fund which would capitalize the civil society movement and provide funds for very modest but sustainable grants which would have three characteristics:

- They would be given to umbrella organizations, i.e. ones which typically act as unifying bodies for the residents of a LA.
- They would must encourage financial prudence and efficiency, and reward local fund-raising efforts.
- They would have a long-term time horizon.

Such a grant would typically be available for all umbrella organizations representing residents and ratepayers in the urban areas.

The system would be capitalized through a Trust, of which the board members might include equal representation from UCAZ, national NGOs and the private sector. The Trust would administer a fund from which the interest would be available to pay for operating costs of one CSO per Local Authority. The amount paid would be a matching grant, or in some way related to, the amount raised by the applicant, and would be payable yearly. Financial administration of the Trust would be by the Trustee Department of a bank or finance house, but authorization of the grants payable would be done by the board of trustees which would only need to meet, say, twice yearly. Thus administrative overheads would be kept to a very modest level. It is estimated that, with a real yield of 6% per annum, a fund of about US\$3 million would be required.

Appendix 2

Methodology

In fulfilling the assignment the consultants used the following methodology:

1.1 Receive briefing from USAID staff

The first and part of the second day were used to familiarize the consultants with the program by briefings from USAID staff, including the Mission Director, Paul Weisenfeld; the Head of the Democracy and Governance Team, Joel Kolker; the Program Manager, Elisha Tafangombe; the D&G Advisor, Zwanayi Mwanyika; and the Program Management Assistant, Josephine Runesu.

1.2 Study written materials

Those parts of the first few days that were not devoted to meetings were used to read and assimilate the material.

1.3 Conduct Interviews

Interviews were conducted with the organizations listed below. They were structured around the following topics, as indicated in the table below.

Main theme	Sub-theme	Central Govt	Local Govt	CSOs/ donors
Legislation	Urban Councils Bill			
	Pvt Sector involvement			
	Participation			
	Transparency			
Financial Mgmt	Impl. of credit rating report			
	RAP prepared			
	Revenues and expenditure			
	Accounts management			
	Audits			
Action planning	Conducted?			
	Experience			
	Recommendations			
Partpn in budget	Conducted?			
	Experience			
	Recommendations			
Partpn – other	Experience			
L G Training	Councilors and Mayors			
	Finance			
	Action planning			
	Participation			
CSO Training	Purpose			
	Results			
	Management			

Key

Topic to be discussed in interview



Schedule

Month	Date	Day	Activity
Sept	27	M	Briefing by USAID, study of documents
	28	T	Briefing by USAID, Urban Institute
	29	W	PACT SUNY
	30	T	ITDG, UCAZ
Oct	1	F	
	2	S	
	3	S	Depart for Chipinge
	4	M	Meetings Chipinge UC and Chipinge RDC
	5	T	Meetings Mutare
	6	W	Return to Harare
	9	S	
	10	S	Depart for Masvingo
	11	M	Meetings Masvingo
	12	T	Attend Kwekwe budget workshop
	13	W	Meetings Gweru
	14	T	Meetings Bulawayo
	15	F	Meetings Gwanda, return to Harare
	16	S	
	17	S	Depart for Kariba
	18	M	Meetings Kariba
	19	T	Meetings Chinhoyi, return to Harare
	20	W	Meet MLGPWNH
	21	T	Meetings Mutoko
	22	F	Meetings Chitungwiza
	23	S	Draft Report writing
	24	S	
	25	M	Oral presentation of Draft Report

Appendix 3

Acknowledgements

In addition to the support given by staff from USAID and the Urban Institute, we met a large number of people at the national and local level. We wish to record our sincere thanks to them for giving up their time, and for being so willing to discuss matters freely. They are as follows:

Rene Hansen, Shobna Chakrawati, Killron Dembe, Synodia Chikanza and David Kanopuwa of PACT,

John Makamure, Lesley Manika Mukurazhizha and Israel Chilimanzi of the State University of New York.

Stakeholders at the local level as follows:

CHIPINGE TOWN COUNCIL (CTC)			
NAME	ORGANIZATION	POSITION	TELEPHONE
G. Goko	CTC	Ward 3 Councilor	011 747 077
J. J Mtetwa	CTC	Town Treasurer	027-5631-5
C Dzambo	CTC	Town Secretary	027-5631-5
E. Nyatito	CTC	Director of Housing	027-5631-5
A Magwambi	CTC	Ward 2 Councilor	027-5731
M.M mbandure	CTC	Ward 1 Councilor	027-5700
M . Chivayeraye	CTC	Committee Clerk	027-5731-5
Rev K Mhlanga	Chipinge Urban Residents Association (CURA)	Chairperson	027-2342/4443
S.Marifuke	CURA	Coordinator	027-4443
Dr S.Matsanzike	CURA	Founder Member	027-4443
T Kutamahofa	Loc Govt	Assistant DA	027-2546
Mrs J Mhlanga	CURA	Member	027-2622
A.Njobo	CTC	A/O	027-5631-5
T.Kusena	CTC	Town Engineer	011753555
A Mlambo	CTC	Councilor	027-5631
Mrs V Gabaza	CURA	Vice-Sec. Publicity	027-4443

CHIPINGE RURAL DISTRICT COUNCIL (CRDC)			
NAME	ORGANIZATION	POSITION	TELEPHONE
J .C. Mundoma	CRDC	CEO	027-5631-3
T.Kutamahofa	Local Govt	Assistant DA	027-2546
A.S Maraura	CRDC	S/ Admin Officer	027-5631-3
C. Simango	Zimbabwe Farmers Union (ZFU)	District Officer	027-5631-3
R.Dembaremaba	CRDC	A/ Education Officer	027-3378
A. Nyanhete	CRDC	A/CSO	027-3378
P . Mashapa	Agricultural Engineering	Economist	027-2915
J. Mudyano	CRDC	Councilor	027-3324
F. Mlambo	CRDC	Senior Admin Officer	027-5631-3
G.G. Dunga	Dept Social Welfare	Senior Welfare Officer	027-2372
S. Nyabereka	Ministry of Transport	Supt	027-2857
R. Makaza	Zimbabwe National Water Authority	River Inspector	027-2309
W. Zirabada	CRDC	ADE	027-5631-3
Mrs T .Murekwa	CRDC	Admin Officer	027-5631-3
.I.C.G Stone	Commercial Farmers Union (CFU)	Vice-Chairperson	027-2442/ 011430027
Pastor A. Murahwa	Church Representative	Chairperson	027-2837
A. Bere	Women in Business	Chairperson	027-2750

CITY OF MUTARE CITY (MC)			
Dr M Chawawa	MC	Town Clerk	020-64412
F.A. Rutura	MC	Councilor	020-64412
J. Nyamana	MC	Councilor	020-64412
E. Manzinde	MC	Councilor	020-64412
I. Takana	MC	Councilor	091904513
G.Gweru	MC	Councilor	023251494
L Karenyi	MC	Councilor	023250307
D. Panganai	MC	Councilor	023285814
E Madziire	MC	D/Director Housing	091920195
C.Chatara	Mutare Informal Traders Association	Chairperson	024-61300
M. Mtiashe	MC	Councilor	020-64174
W.M. Chimbetete	MC		020 -61841
B.M Mutenda	MC		020-64412
E.Z. Tekere		Senior Citizen	020-60058
C.Chimhanda	Mount View Hotel		020-66101
D.Kudumba	TGWU	Representative	020-68615
S. Manyumwa	MC	A/Chief Civil Engineer	020-64412
Pastor P. Rose	Pastor		020-63087
N. Togara	MC	Councilor	091919491
G.T Matsikenyiri	Women in Business	Officer	020-67502
T..S. Mashababe	MC	Officer	020-64412
Mr Chitima	MC	Chief Admin Officer	020-64412
S. Mupindu	MC	Deputy City Treasurer	020-64412

MASVINGO CITY			
A. Mutambasere	Masvingo City	City Treasurer	039-62431
Z. Munnganasa	Masvingo City	Chief Health Officer	011 206 056
S.C. Mushandikwa	Masvingo Urban Rate Payers and Residents Association (MURRA)	Chairperson	039-52433
Y Mabasa	Masvingo City	Councilor	039-62431
I Tagarira	Mutangiri Transport	Manager	039-63266
H.B.Nyangwa	Vurombo School	SDC Secretary	039-52329
E Dube.	Masvingo City	Engineer	039-62431
N.I Tsere	Masvingo City	Alderman	011865434
F Chakabuda	Masvingo City	Councilor	039-622535
L.R. Vandirai	Masvingo City	DDH& CS	011214355
L. Vudzijena	Don Bosco School	D/ Head	039-62791
L.S.Tanyanyiwa	Masvingo city	Chamber Secretary	039-62431
B. Hadzirabwi	Local Govt	Assistant DA	039-62076
A.K Guzha	Masvingo City	Town Clerk	039-62431
I.Pedisayi	MURRA		039-62167
Mrs C Chikukwa	Resident	Lecturer Bondolfi Teachers College	011218624
Mrs Ndamba	Resident/ Masingo Trs College	A/Principal	039-63529
S.Madungure	Masvingo City	Deputy Mayor/ Councilor	039-62431
D.Mumpande	Masvingo Publicity Association		039-62643

GWERU CITY			
N.Jiri	Gweru City	Councilor	091924081
G.B. Dhlamini	Gweru City	Councilor	054-50626
C. Kwaru	Gweru City	Councilor	054-55733
S.Mhuru	Gweru City	Secretary W.16	054-56512
P.Ziyambi	Gweru City	Councilor	091404395
J. Tsuru	Gweru City	Councilor	054-50226
G.Katiji	Gweru Residents	Chairperson W-8	054-24454
M.Mawenya	Gweru Residents	Chairperson W.15	011752809
E.M. Muchere	Gweru Residents	Task Force Chairperson W.4	091362072
S.Tayali	ZUCWU	President	091342521
U.Jaji	Gweru City	A/Director of Housing	011862586
C.Msindo	Women in Business/ Horticulture	Resident	054-24571/9
C.Harunashe	Consumer Council of Zimbabwe	Regional Officer	054-21061
L. Mupeta	Local Govt	A/ District Administrator	011766644
W.Mugabe	Padare Gender Forum	Chairperson	064-23295
J.B Sibindi	FERDA	Chairperson	054-33025
S.C.Ruwodo	Gweru city	A/Director of Health	054-24071
P. Muringani	Zimbabwe National Chamber of Commerce (ZNCC)	Vice-President	054-23422
T.Ncube	Gweru City	Councilor	011419897
G.Nyoni	The Business Express	Reporter	054-21547
J.V. Chilimbe	Gweru City	A/Chamber Secretary	054-24071
J.D.Matawu	Gweru City	Chamber Secretary	054-24071
S. Zvidzai	Gweru Rate Payers and Residents Association (GRRA)	Chairperson	054-24071
J.R Mwedzi	Gweru City	City Treasurer	011424 945
J Nanthambwe	Gweru City	City Engineer	054-24071

CITY OF BULAWAYO			
Rev. O. Shatai	Ministers Fraternal	Chairperson	09-420420
M.Ndlovu	City of Bulawayo	Town Clerk	0
J. Ntabeni-Ncube	City of Bulawayo	Mayor	
D Sithole	MAL	Director	023780503
N Ndlovu	Zimbabwe Coalition on Debt Relief (ZIMCODD)	Programme Officer	09-886594
W.Sibanda	Catholic Development Commission	Projects Financial Advisor	09-69218
M.M Hlalo	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W8	091390325
A Mpofu	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W2	09-214226
A.M Nkomo	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W6	09-473353
P.Nyathi	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W10	09-403647
I Mabaleka	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W15	09-52440
C.K.N. Nceгани	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W4	09-2889477
S.W. Moyo	Bulawayo Residents Associations (BURA)	Chairperson	09-473392
W. Dube	BURA	Secretary	09-473392
A.G. Ndlovu	City of Bulawayo	Deputy Mayor	091332989
I Dhlamini	City of Bulawayo	P.A	09-75011
J..J. Ndebele	City of Bulawayo	D/ Director Engineering Services	09-75011
Z. Hwalima	City of Bulawayo	Director Health Services	09-71405
M.T. Ncube	City of Bulawayo	Director of Housing & Community Services	09-75011
O Dube	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W18	091953541
L.H Keswa	City of Bulawayo	Councilor W24	091424479
S.M Ndebele	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-217448
G. Mahlangu	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-523058
E. Mpofu	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-406229
M. Nyoni	City of Bulawayo	City Treasurer	09-75011
S. Dube	City of Bulawayo	A DES (R)	09-75011
S. Donga	City of Bulawayo	Deputy City Treasurer	09-75011
J.M Madubeko	City of Bulawayo	Human Resources Manager	09-75011
P Ikeougu	City of Bulawayo	Program Coordinator	09-75011
T. Khumalo	Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU)	Secretary	091257276
Philamula	City of Gweru	CRL	091333065
P Ncube	CMB	Chairperson	0111868747
K Kwangwari	Radio Dialogue	Finance Manager	011618873
S.Masuku	Affirmative Action Group (AAG)	Executive Member	091404681
S.Ncube	AAG	President	011400908
D.Khumalo	City of Bulawayo	PTP	091312232
D.P. Ncube	Bulawayo Urban Transport Association (BUTA)	Secretary General	011761900
K.Z Ndimande	City of Bulawayo	Chief Internal Auditor	09-75011
S.Zhou	City of Bulawayo	Principal Legal Officer	09-75011
S.Sithole	City of Bulawayo	S/Auditor	09-75011
J.Mpala	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-482118
P.Z.Ndlovu	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	091340639
N.Moyo	D.P.Foundation	Youth Programs Officer	09-882880
S.Sidambe	Women in Business	Chairperson	09-885028
L.Manjengwa	Bulawayo Metro	PAO	09-887596
OJZ Sibanda	ZNCC	Chairperson	011201166
D Masuku	City of Bulawayo	Project Officer	09-75011
G.Nyoni	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-4011161
J.Ncube	BUPTA	Treasurer	023830736
S.S. Ndlovu	BUPTA	Chairperson	091354088
C.Ncube	BUPTA	Treasurer	091392277
G.Nyamambi	BUTA	Commuter	011415987
G.Marambakuayana	BUTA	Commuter	
R Sibanda	City of Bulawayo	Councilor	09-421031

GWANDA MUNICIPALITY (MoG)			
A.B. Naik	MoG	Councilor Ward 2	084-22228
P.Z. Mnkandhla	MoG	Executive Mayor	084-22385
K .Mkwananzi	MoG	Councilor	091377316
V. Ndhleza	Resident	Resident Ward 6	023272107
M. Ndhlovu	MoG	Councilor	084-22519
T.Nyoni	MoG	Councilor	084-20838
I.Dube	Resident	Resident Ward 4	084-20543
L Pahla	MoG	Town Treasurer	084-22240
M. Sigola	MoG	Acting Town Engineer	084-22278
J. Sibanda	MoG	Councilor Ward 4	084-22359
S.Manda	Fidelity Life Assurance	Resident	084-23001
S. Mdlongwa	MoG	Director of Housing & Community Services	084-20572
E.M.Ndlovu	MoG	Chamber Secretary	084-22838
G.J. Mlilo	MoG	Town Clerk	084-22385
E.Nyathi	MoG	Councilor Ward 7	084-20464
P.T. Mukwena	MoG	Councilor Ward 6	084-22781
S. Mguni	MoG	Committee Officer	084-22278
L. Moyo	Resident	Ward Chairperson	084-21159

KARIBA MUNICIPALITY			
J. Houghton	Kariba Municipality	Mayor	061-2737
G Makunde	Kariba Municipality	Town Clerk	061-2737
S. Mawawo	Kariba Incorporated Area Resident & Rate Payers Association (KIARRA)	Chairperson	091943432/ 061-2700
L Chidzenga	CSO	Kariba Resources Centre	061-2737

CHINHOYI MUNICIPLAITY			
Mr Gotora	Chinhoyi Municipality	Chamber Secretary/ Acting Town Clerk	067-24079
W. Mayama	Chinhoyi Municipality	Director of Health Services	067-24000
T. Maregere	Chinhoyi Municipality	Chief Town Planner/ Acting Engineer	067-24000
E.Muringani	Chinhoyi Municipality	Director of Housing & Community Services	067-24000
M. Shamuyarira	Chinhoyi Municipality	Acting Town Treasurer	067-24000
R. Ruziwe	Chairperson, Chinhoyi Wood Workers Association (CSO)	Chairperson	091-376 267
J. Takawira	Zimbabwe National Chamber of Commerce (ZNCC)- Stakeholder	Chairperson	067-22342
Rev. E .Gweshe	Church-Stakeholder		091391924

MUTOKO RDC (MRDC)			
R.K. Makore	MRDC	Engineer	072-2905
Z. Mhidza	MRDC	E.O. Social	072-2905
E. Mukwekwe	MRDC	Planning Technician	072-2905
S. Zulu	MRDC	E/O Finance	072-2905
G. Kakomwe	MRDC	District Aids Coordinator	072-2905
L.M.G Kakomwe	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
G. Hungwa	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
L. Mutema	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
O Nyabani	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
D. Chimunya	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
D. Masarievhu	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
L. Nhengu	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
F. mabota	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
P. Munetsi	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
S. Chikuse	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
B. Mutanga	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
J. Chinogureyi	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
M. Hodzi	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
C.T. Makoni	MRDC	Councilor	072-2320
V. Nyamanzi	MRDC	Councilor	023 247319
G. Chiziwe	MRDC	Councilor	072-2905
B. Muwirimi	MRDC	Councilor	072-2663
C. Gambara	Mutoko District Centre	Chairperson	072-2668
T. Mupfumi	Mutoko Residents Association	Secretary	072-2336

CHITUNGWIZA MUNICIPALITY			
A. H. Tawanda	CHIRRA	Secretary Projects	091259620
M.Masitera	CHIRRA	Secretary General	07021580/ 750313
L. Muchena	CHIRRA	Committee Member	091268017
D. Nota	Chitungwiza Municipality	Councilor	070-23001
P. Muderede	Chitungwiza Municipality	Councilor	091352151
R. Tongoona	National AIDS Council	District Aids Coordinator	023820013
F. Bwanya	Manyame Park Residents Association	Member	
O. Chigwaza	Manyame Park Residents Association	Representative	011759198
C. Batista	Manyame Park Residents Association	Representative	091963005
E- Rutanhira	CHIRRA	Member	
M. Mazenge	CHIRRA	Member	House 25879 Unit M
R. Ndlovu	CHIRRA	Member	535 St Mary's
S. Thandi	Social Welfare	Probation Officer	070-24923
Rev. P Benson	Chitungwiza Ministers Fraternal	C/Person	091357856
Rev. J. Masamba	Chitungwiza Ministers Fraternal	Treasurer	091355166
A.J Taderera	CHIRRA	Chairperson	