PD-ACA-454

THE RESEARCH FOUNDATION OF THE STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
CENTER FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR THE STRENGTHENING OF TANZANIA'S UNION NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

CONTRACT NUMBER: 623-C-00031-00

QUARTERLY REPORT
APRIL – JUNE 2004

Submitted on 30th June 2004
by
SUNY/Tanzania

CONTENTS

SECTION ONE – NARRATIVE

1. Background to the contract and a brief analysis of the political context /enabling environment and its impact on the Program.

2. Executive Summary
   - Progress made against the overall agreed Workplan targets

3. Detailed analysis of actual accomplishments compared to planned activities together with planned activities for the next Quarter.
   - 3.1 Program Workplan
   - 3.2 Activity summary
   - 3.3 Relationships with other donors in Tanzania & establishment of relationships with other organizations.

4. Explanation of any obstacles encountered
   - during program implementation and actions taken to address them/summary of lessons learnt, and
   - explanation of and administrative/financial issues and actions.

5. Performance indicators/program outputs (including reporting of performance data compared to target and baselines)

Annexures

Executive Summary of the overall progress made against the agreed Workplan targets

A. Afro barometer research "public perceptions on democracy and governance in Tanzania."
B. Report of the pilot program of constituency level public hearings on Bills
C. Press article about the AG (June 2004)
D. CSO Exhibitors
E. Outreach report
F. Demographic research assignment
G. Draft resource manual outline/cover sheet generated by a Parliamentary Committee Clerk
H. Provision of research services in Parliament
I. Parliamentary Internship placements 2004
J. Basic budgetary training workshop papers
K. Budget Opposition Spokesman response to the Minister of Finance speech June 2004
L. Poverty Reduction Strategy briefing session for MPs held in May 2004
M. GCR 2004 Press report
N. APNAC-TI Memorandum of Understanding
O. Advisory Panel
P. Performance Indicators April –June 2004

SECTION TWO – BUDGETS

Table A – Fiscal report April – June 2004

1. BACKGROUND TO THE CONTRACT AND A BRIEF ANALYSIS OF THE POLITICAL CONTEXT /ENABLING ENVIRONMENT AND ITS IMPACT ON THE PROGRAM.

The State University of New York Center for International Development (SUNY/Tanzania), in partnership with its associates was on 11 May 2003 awarded a two-year contract to provide technical assistance for the strengthening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly.

The range of support provided under the auspices of this Project will enable the Parliament to carry out its representative, lawmaking, oversight and administrative functions more effectively and in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance. The Project team works as a partner with the Tanzanian Parliament in providing technical support to enable the national legislature to play a more central role in Tanzania's governing and development processes. The Project aims to achieve the following primary results:

1) ***Improve representation***: increased citizen access to and understanding of the legislative process;
2) ***More effective lawmaking***: Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors;
3) ***Enhance management and administration***: increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all members by parliamentary administrative support units;
4) ***More effective oversight***: increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

The Project is a component part of the USAID D&G Strategic Objective IR 3.2: *"Targeted Government Institutions are more responsive to public concerns on selected issues"* (i.e. HIV/AIDS, natural resource management & private sector development) IR 3.2.1 states: *"Government capacity to engage in the policy/law process strengthened"*. USAID defines Government in this context as the Parliament. This is the first major legislative strengthening activity launched in Tanzania and as such is a pioneer in terms of provision of technical assistance. The QMR marks the completion of the first year of the two year contract and therefore seeks to summarize the progress to date and the issues that have emerged since the inception of the project.

Although multi party democracy has been in place for almost two decades in many ways democracy in Tanzania remains very much in its infancy in terms of open political space. CCM holds roughly 90% of all 295 seats in Parliament and this some might say tight rein has been further strengthened by the various opposition parties' own internal problems. A recent Afro barometer study of democracy and governance in Tanzania makes for interesting reading and identifies that whilst very few people wish to see a return to a single party state nevertheless they are still getting to grips with multi party politics but have begun to show real signs of wanting to engage in the democratic processes. This makes the work of the Project timely especially as Tanzania heads to both Presidential and Parliamentary elections in 2005.

The work to build solid coalitions amongst reform-minded MPs that can push for changes within the Parliamentary structures enunciated by the Project are already helping to get things moving far faster than in the past. However the Project team is all too aware of the need to ensure that the coalitions being built must not isolate any MPs. The strategy has been initially to build up a solid relationship with the Parliamentary Committee Chairpersons and their Vice Chairpersons. Then through word of mouth and the fact that all the training/support provided

by the Project is in direct response to the situation on the ground (of course taking into account the Workplan Result Areas) it is clear that the importance and added value of the SUNY activities have begun to increase the overall coverage of those coalitions. The Project team seeks and exploits any and all opportunities to engage with the widest possible number of MPs.

2. Executive Summary

The Quarter has seen significant strides in the achievement of a range of Workplan activities which are detailed in tabular form at **Annex A.**

Key highlights include;

- **Result Area 1** –public hearings at constituency level. This was successfully piloted with x4 Regions which covered a total of 16 constituencies and was well received. This is discussed in greater detail later in this Report,
- **Result Area 2** –a review of the current provision of research services in Parliament reveals the situation as we expected, requires major support on a number of levels,
- **Result Area 3** –the launch of the first Parliamentary Internship program co-coordinated by SUNY got underway in June, and
- **Result Area 4** –this quarter has seen the establishment of an Advisory Panel of specialist to provide support, advice directly into the Parliamentary Committee on Finance & Economic Affairs. Also the x2 two day workshops on basic budgetary analysis skills for Members of Parliament were rolled out in advance of the formal presentation of the national estimates/budgets which earned the Project plaudits from MPs.

All these matters are discussed in greater depth in the next section of this QMR.

3. SUMMARY OF ACTUAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS COMPARED TO PLANNED ACTIVITIES.

3.1 *Program Workplan*

One of the guiding principles of the agreed Workplan is that it is both a living document and therefore liable to modification subject to the prevailing environment and also that there must be real "buy-in" and ownership of all the activities planned. This has previously entailed regular consultation and meetings with the Parliamentary Projects Co-ordinator to ensure that Parliament fully endorse the activities planned. It also provides the opportunity for the Project to receive adequate feedback on the progress being made to achieve the stated Results. However over the past quarter the Project has seen Parliament shift away from that modus operandi. It is now clear that the Clerk to Parliament personally takes the lead on all consultations with the Project team. We can only guess as to the reason for that shift but we have detected that the Parliamentary Projects Coordinator (who is based in DSM) is very reluctant to travel to Dodoma. Added to which he appears reluctant to share the information about the Project with his colleagues in Parliament which is manifested when the Project team visit Dodoma where staff often opine the fact that they are unaware of the Project initiatives. This is despite the fact that there is extensive and continuous briefings provided to the Projects Coordinator. Luckily the very good working relationships which are already in place with both the Clerk to Parliament, MPs and Parliamentary Service Heads of Department has meant that this change in modus operandi has not hindered the progress being made by the Project. As the Deputy Projects Coordinator is based in Dodoma he has proved to be far more capable and reliable in providing support, advice and guidance to the Project. His relative inexperience in legislative strengthening means that he is included in all training activities we conduct with

the MPs and staff to build his overall capacity to perform the full range of duties relative to legislative strengthening.

The regular monthly meetings with USAID and DFID continue and June saw the departure of the USAID Democracy and Governance Officer who was instrumental in designing the current Program of support to the Parliament. August 2004 sees the departure of the DFID Governance Advisor. Replacement officers are due to assume the reins in the next few months which will necessitate a thorough briefing of the current status of the Project. DFID have also advised that they intend to conduct an external review of the Project in September 2004 which will consider both the impact of the intervention to date and may also look into whether further DFID funding after May 2005 would fit within the context of the DFID strategic plans for Tanzania.

One slightly worrying issue that has emerged over the quarter is that the Project has detected that amongst Civil Society there is some reluctance to engage with the PACT/Tanzania activity. A number of CSOs have revealed to the Project that there is an unwillingness to work with PACT or even to be associated with any PACT-sponsored activities. The CSOs cite two main reasons for their reluctance. These include; the fact that PACT was at the forefront of the lobbying campaign against the NGO Bill and the CSOs believe that they (CSOs) bore the brunt of the Executive's anger when the Bill was eventually tabled in Parliament since it contained far more draconian provisions that had been expected by the CSOs. Secondly CSOs have complained that PACT seems to insist that CSOs who become a part of their partner network must comply with PACT ideologies. Whilst it would be inappropriate to comment on the veracity of those CSO assertions this has meant that the Project has had to invest far more time trying to "woo" and broader range of CSOs wishing to engage directly with the Parliament in order to ensure that the Project activities in Result Area 1 are broadcast to as wide a CSO audience as possible. The issue of perceptions and their potential negative impact is being kept under constant review and additional resources will be diverted to the Result Area 1 CSO activities as necessary.

3.2 *Activity Summary*

Workplan activities undertaken within the QR period April -June 2004and planned activities for July-September 2004

RESULT ONE: IMPROVING REPRESENTATION: INCREASED CITIZEN ACCESS TO AND UNDERSTANDING OF THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS

Improving Member-constituent relations
Workplan Activity 1.1

The situational analysis carried out in January 2004 Dar es Salaam, Morogoro, Coast Region, Dodoma, Iringa, Mbeya and Zanzibar revealed the apparent dis-connect in the perceived role and responsibilities of an MP and their constituents. The x7 constituencies selected for that analysis provided a broad insight into the current situation and helped guide the second stage of work to seek to increase citizen access to and understanding of the role of an MP. Whilst the original rationale in the Workplan was to see the issue of MP-constituents relations as uniquely separate from the issue of the interface issues between the MPs, constituents, CSOs and the Executive: the on the ground reality has revealed that the interface issues really become apparent when specific issues are addressed. This has led the Project team to seek to address these interfaces issues through the constituency level public hearings on Bills since this is both

topical and reveals in a very tangible way how best to set about improving representation and therefore to seek to meet the Result Area objective.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Therefore further work will be carried out under the subcomponent related to constituency level public hearings on Bills (details set out below).

Constituency level public hearings on Parliamentary Bills
Workplan Activity 1.2

A. Design of a generic training tool for public hearings. In order to broaden the base sample from x7 constituencies to a total of 11: four different constituencies were selected for the pilot exercise. The pilot locations included Kilolo (Iringa), Tuduru (Ruvuma), Hai (Kilimanjaro) and Singida North (Singida) [the Regions are in ()]. The pilot constituencies for the public hearings provided the Project team with a real life insight into the modalities associated with conducting such hearings at constituency level. Using the information gathered in the January 2004 scope/review assignment, the team designed a training tool and successfully ran a two day workshop for the x16 Members of Parliament of the pilot constituencies in April 2004. The training materials and Report arising from that training are attached at **ANNEX B.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The sheer size of Tanzania and the resource limitations suggest that there will only be a limited ability to conduct further public hearings with Project support. Therefore work is getting underway to devise a generic information pack specifically designed for Members of Parliament to enable them to conduct public hearings without Project support and this will also be accompanied by the development of a training video about *"how conduct a public hearing"* which can be lodged within the Parliament for future use.

B. The pilot exercise of public hearings at constituency level on Bills was conducted in four Regions these included: Kilolo (Iringa), Tunduru (Ruvuma), Hai (Kilimanjaro) and Singida North (Singida). Following the 2-day training workshop the pilot program of public hearings was rolled out to the x4 pilot constituencies and attracted a keen interest from both Civil Society and the media. As was foreshadowed in earlier QMRs, the number of significant pieces of legislation tabled by the Executive over the past quarter has not strictly been related to the USAID/DFID target thematic areas social welfare, environment, women, special interest groups, private sector development so the decision was made in collaboration with the MPs to use the recently tabled Bill about the Permanent Voters Register (PVR). The Bill was given its First Reading at the April Session and therefore the selection of the Bill was highly topical since the PVR is a major innovation within Tanzania. Indeed one of the issues that came out of both the training for the MPs and the public hearings, was the need for explanatory briefing on the potential impact of the legislation in good enough time in advance of Parliamentary debate to enable the MPs to solicit views from their constituents. Another issue was the need to have the Bills made available in both English and Kiswahili to enable the constituents and Civil Society to fully understand the aim and purpose of the Bill. The issue of English versus Kiswahili has been a constant source of debate for many years and has just recently been raised in the House as a matter of concern for MPs. The Attorney General effectively confirmed the problem in a recent press article following a Question raised on the Floor of the House. **ANNEX C** refers.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

There are some major policy issues arising from this pilot exercise which will require delicate handling. These include the issue of the need for a Parliamentary calendar which would set out an indicative timetable of when Bills are expected to be tabled within the Parliament. The creation of such a calendar would enable the legislators to have advance notice of the draft

legislation that is coming from the Executive. This may already be an issue discussed within the Steering Committee but it is not a public document and no MP has ever admitted that such a document exists since they are always surprised when draft legislation is tabled for their consideration. The Project will investigate that matter further. The second issue is the need for the MPs to have adequate background briefing or the production of explanatory notes in English and Kiswahili so that the MPs themselves have a full grasp of the impact of the Bill before they go to the constituency to discuss it and solicit views from their constituents. Thirdly there is the need to help Civil Society better understand the concept of public hearings at constituency level so that when they participate they focus on the Bill under discussion rather than get distracted with any mistrust/dislike of the MP. This matter will be addressed in the forthcoming MP-CSO joint training on relationship building which will be rolled out in the next quarter.

Increase access to Parliament by Civil Society Organizations (CSOs)
Workplan Activity 1.3

A. Following the MPs training conducted in March 2004 entitled "influencing policy skills" a number of Members of Parliament have asked the Project to identify CSOs dealing specifically with topics of interest to them for example the environmental lobby and trade/investment CSOs. In fact we learnt that the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee(PAC) approached the Project to enable him to know which of the CSOs were best able to offer him information on the continuing saga of the Tansort mining affair. The Chairperson wanted to conduct some follow up scrutiny on the Auditor Generals' Report for the period ending June 2002 and was told by Mr. Speaker that there was no money to facilitate such further investigative work and that the PAC Chairperson should approach the Accountant General for such support. That request was made and produced another negative response. However following the briefing received from the two CSOs which the Project identified as able to provide the necessary technical expertise in this case namely: Journalist Environmental Association of Tanzania (JET), Lawyers' Environmental Action Team (LEAT) & Legal & Human Rights Center (LHRC) the Chairperson made further representations within Parliament using the technical information he had managed to glean and funds were "found" to enable the PAC to undertake a more detailed investigation.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Work is underway to devise a bespoke training workshop for MPs together with CSOs as part of Phase 4 of the strategy to increase access to the Parliament by Civil Society.

CSO Exhibition
Workplan Activity 1.3.2

A. Work is now well advanced to mount the first ever CSO Exhibition within the Bunge precincts in Dodoma in July 2004. The aim is to invite some 60 CSOs who have a lobbying/advocacy agenda that they wish to promote with the Parliament to exhibit their work over two days in Dodoma. The overall aim is to ensure that MPs understand the breadth of knowledge and technical expertise available from the CSOs which would assist them in their legislative role. The Project team are all too aware that the Speaker to Parliament is very resistant to the access of what he considers to be "pressure groups" to the Parliamentarians but as it was a task agreed within the Workplan has agreed that the Exhibition can take place on 20-21 July. A list of the proposed exhibitors is attached at **ANNEX D.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Following our establishment of relationships with CSO coordinating networks other than using the PACT partners, we have been able to increase the potential coverage of the Exhibition but inevitably there were limitations on how many CSOs can be physically accommodated at the

Exhibition therefore the Project intends visiting those CSOs who will not be participating so as to assess whether there are other ways of helping them to access the Parliamentarians to lobby for their causes. These organizations can then be incorporated into future SUNY activities with the Committees or in any future public hearings activities.

Enhance Parliament's outreach activities

Workplan Activity 1.4:

A. As foreshadowed in the previous QMR a review of the Department for Public Information and Civic Education role and resources was conducted between 7-12 June utilizing the services of two House of Commons specialists (Mr. Rob Clements Head of Research in the HOC and Ms Jacqy Sharpe Senior Public Information Officer and well experienced Clerk in the HOC). The team visited the Parliament in Dodoma and was able to interact with staffers and MPs alike. The Report recommends that although there are numerous documents/booklets written by primarily Mr. Speaker, that there is a need to design some more basic, factual and easy to understand materials in order to help the average citizen to understand the role of the Parliamentarian and Parliament. They offer some easy to implement ideas for example the idea of trying to dovetail investigative work undertaken by Parliamentary Committees in the districts, with visits to local schools/colleges to get civic education messages across to a wider audience. The issue of the availability of printed material on the Parliament website is also seen as an effective means of getting messages across to the public. The report offers some very helpful and practical ideas for re-packaging the dissemination of public information about the Parliament. That report is attached at **ANNEX E.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The Report and its recommendations for the way forward are to be discussed with Parliament shortly. Thereafter, subject to Parliament's comments work will begin to help Parliament to take on a more proactive approach to public information dissemination.

Review & enhancement of the Parliamentary website

Workplan Activity 1.4.4

A. In line with the previous assessment of the parliamentary website and at the request of USAID, a further piece of research was conducted on the issue of using mobile telephones to enhance the relationship between citizens and the Parliament. The idea of voter interest in Parliament using the mobile telephone networks in Tanzania is seen as one possible means by which Parliament and voters could be brought closer together. However some analysis on the demography of mobile phone users to ensure that the users are truly representative both in terms of location and gender, has revealed that the demography of mobile users is still largely concentrated amongst the urban areas and the economically active. That research is attached at **ANNEX F.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The research is to be submitted to USAID and DFID to seek their agreement on the best way forward. As a first step the concept would need to be proposed to the Parliament to seek their views and inputs.

RESULT TWO: MORE EFFECTIVE LAWMAKING: PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEES MAKE BETTER USE OF RESEARCH AND MORE ACTIVELY SOLICIT INPUTS FROM CIVIL SOCIETY IN THE CONSIDERATION OF LEGISLATION IN TARGETED SECTORS.

Enhancing Committee operations

Workplan Activity 2.1

A. From the discussions the Project has held with both Committee Chairpersons and their Committee Clerks it is clear that neither side are entirely clear about their respective roles and responsibilities. Added to this is the fact that whilst there is a research service many MPs do not understand the role of the Research Service and how to use it properly. Also as there are only three research officers it is hard to see how they can hope to offer a fully operational research service to almost 300 MPs. Therefore work has begun to consider a range of initiatives. These include:

- introduction of a streamlined research request process with records to enable research requests to be properly tracked and measured,
- when research reports are generated the idea of the researchers producing fact sheets/synopsis of their research could be uploaded onto the website so all MPs could access the information,
- introduction of the idea of peer group reviews of the research reports generated and freely available to the public. This could easily be seen to be analogous to the concept of involving mid career professionals as in envisaged in sub component 2.3 – sources of Committee information.

One issue that is clear is that the focus of the support needs to be the Institution i.e. the staff since the MPs will require a longer more sustained level of support and given the campaigning in the run up to the elections there may be a reluctance by MPs to commit themselves to such a specialist level of skills development.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

SUNY will review the thematic areas which attract Parliamentary Questions and seek to encourage MPs to consider raising questions on the key USAID priority areas an example of which is that of HIV/AIDs. Baseline information about the scope/thematic areas of the research reports will be gathered in order to assess the overall level of information requests. Also formal working relationships will be established with research organizations within Tanzania to enable the research service to benefit from access to other research assignments.

B. Reference has been made to the pressure on both staffers and Members of Parliament to be proficient in both English and Kiswahili: since the Parliamentary Bills and Acts are in English and yet the discussions in the Plenary (i.e. in the Chamber) and the Committee are conducted in Kiswahili added to which there is the difficulty of some Committee Clerks being unfamiliar with Parliamentary terminology. Work to enhance the level of service provided by the Committee Clerks is under development. It is now clear that many of the newly appointed Committee Clerks have received little or no training on Parliamentary practices and procedures: this hinders their ability to provide a good level of service to the MPs. An English language needs assessment is being put forward to Parliament as being a requirement to better identify the extent of the problem. In addition there is real merit in training both the Committee Clerks and the Research Officers together since they invariably are tasked with similar duties: work has begun to devise a training syllabus that brings IT skills, Parliamentary practice and procedures including the preparation/compilation of research assignments within the Parliamentary context into a singleton training event.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Subject to the Parliamentary calendar it is proposed to roll out the multi-faceted training for the Committee Clerks and the Research Officers which will be co-facilitated with a senior Parliamentary staffer before the November Session.

Sources of Committee information

Workplan Activity 2.3

A. The proposed development of a best practice guide *"Parliamentary Committee Resource Manual"* put forward by the Project to Committee Chairpersons found favor amongst the Committee's so much so one of the Committee Chairpersons following attendance at the basic budgetary analysis training instructed his Committee Clerk to produce a first draft of a hybrid resource manual. **ANNEX G** refers. The rationale of producing such a manual is to provide an institutional memory/capability within the Parliament.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Work is now in hand to commence the work to design/compile manuals in close collaboration with the individual Committee Clerks for each Parliamentary Committee.

Increase access to research materials and services

Workplan Activity 2.4

A. In order to better understand the current provision of research services within the Parliament the Project commissioned research on the same subject from one of the serving Research Officers. This is attached at **ANNEX H**. The Report reveals that there is a real disconnect in terms of the research service and also a poor standard of report writing generally. The bias of the report is loaded in favor of the Head of Departments specialism (the Library) which at present can be deemed to be more of a mausoleum than a repository of up date information for the Parliamentarians. On the basis of that research report, the Project have formally suggested to the Clerk to Parliament that the Research Officers should be reassigned to form a part of the Clerks Department to enable the provision of research to be more adequately integrated into the Committee system. There are some very clear synergies between the Researchers and the Committee Clerks whose primary responsibility is to service the Committees. Invariably MPs refer matters to the Committee Clerks to take forward including requests for research reports which have to go through a tortuous and bureaucratic process before any research action is initiated. Initial feedback from the Clerk is generally positive and supportive however at the same time as our proposal, the library staff have "revolted" against their Director (who also heads the Research Service) complaining about his management style and so the Clerk is deliberating how best to deal with the problems on two fronts. Notwithstanding that, work has commenced to seek to build up the capacity of the fledgling research service supplemented by the Committee Clerks into a far more slick service provider for the MPs. That work will also be supplemented by the establishment of strong, demonstrable working relationships with some well known research organization: ESRF (Economic Social Research Foundation), REPOA (Research on Poverty Alleviation) and also the Political Science Department of the University of Dar es Salaam since these are widely regarded as authoritative sources of research. Further work to consider the possibility of establishing clear and transparent means for MPs to commission research and the focus being put on their needs as "clients" of the research service is being considered as well as trying to link Parliament into some kind of peer group review process so as to enhance its overall service. The issue of IT connectivity within Dodoma also serves to hinder the ability of the Researchers and Committee Clerks to share information and to have a network link to enable them to share information amongst the different sections. This means that when a Research Officer wants to conduct any research using the internet they are forced to use the MPs internet café which of course is very busy when the House is in Session. It also means that the Committee Clerks cannot check on Committee reports to assess consistency and standards. USAID have now agreed that an IT specialist from REDSO will conduct a needs assessment for the Parliament in early August 2004.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Work in assisting the research service will continue initially by means of the training and skills development and clarification on the modalities associated with the MPs use of the research service. The aim will be to effectively "re-brand" the research service but it is clear that this has

to be undertaken in a holistic manner to ensure there is buy in amongst the staff and the MPs. The assessment to be conducted by the USAID/REDSO IT specialist will provide a more accurate estimate of costs for the priority IT networking tasks. There will be further information about this in the next QMR.

RESULT THREE: ENHANCED MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION: INCREASED QUALITY AND EFFICIENCY OF SERVICE DELIVERY TO ALL MEMBERS BY PARLIAMENTARY ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES UNITS;

Development of holistic modernization plan for the Parliament.

Activity 3.1.

A. Action taken: in abeyance until the previous UNDP reports and interventions have been comprehensively reviewed.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Reviews to be completed and proposed way forward to be submitted to Parliament in early 2005.

Improve organizational effectiveness of Parliament.

Activity 3.1.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

C. Given that the Parliamentary Commission have already received a Human Resource Report which was funded by UNDP, SUNY has been advised that the Report makes some quite radical recommendations for change that Report will have to be reviewed to avoid duplication of effort in this area.

Internship Program.

Activity 3.2

The first ever Parliamentary Internship program commenced on 15 June 2004. The Internship Program will have 17 graduate students drawn from the University of Dar es Salaam. Unfortunately despite our earlier hopes that students from Tumaini University (Iringa) would also be able to participate their semester did not coincide with the main Parliamentary Session between June and August. The application process was through self nomination with a recommendation from the Faculty, applicants had to have a GPA of at least 3.6 to qualify and be accompanied by a personal statement in support of their application. Some 65 graduates applied for the 17 places of which 30 were selected for interview. The interviews were undertaken over two days in May and the panel comprised of two University lecturers, SUNY and a representative from the Parliament. All unsuccessful applicants were informed within two days of the deadline and successful candidates were informed within 24 hours. At the request of the Deputy Speaker to Parliament the four day orientation program, was held in Dodoma rather than Dar es Salaam to ensure that the interns were immediately imbued in the Parliamentary environment The Interns placements are attached at **ANNEX I**. Parliament is delighted at the prospect of the Program and is keen to have SUNY roll out the first iteration so that they can observe and see how best to sustain the intervention after May 2005.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Each fortnight the Interns are required to complete an individual personal development plan (IDP) which details their experiences and issues arising during the Program. Interviews are also conducted with the Intern Supervisors to ensure that the Program is proving worthwhile to both sides. At the same time the University through the Associate Dean Practicum also visits the

Interns on site in Dodoma to enable an estimation to be made on whether the Program maybe worthy of the award of academic credits in any future iterations.

Consider the establishment of a training unit for new MPs & staff.

Activity 3.3:

In discussing this element of the Workplan, Parliament was keen to ensure that due account was taken of the fact that the East African Parliamentary Institute (EAPI) in Nairobi might have an impact on the relative added value of creating a separate training unit in Tanzania. Mindful this issue from the outset, SUNY/Tanzania has been collaboration with SUNY/Kenya with a view to helping to organize a meeting between the three East African Clerks to Parliament under the auspices of the EAPI. The culmination of that collaboration was that in late April a 2 day conference in Arusha was held entitled "Conference on Parliamentary Modernization" which brought together senior legislative staff from Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and the East African Legislative Assembly. These senior staff, like the MPs who attended a regional Public Accounts Committees (PACs) event in February, used the unique occasion of a regional gathering to formally move to create a regional body – the East African Parliamentary Institute (EAPI) - to provide training, research and advisory services. The EAPI, like the EAAPAC, is to be funded by the member Parliaments. The decisions by these MPs and staff to take actions, and not just to talk, to strengthen legislative institutions were bolstered by a rare synergy. This included an acknowledgement of USAID's generous and consistent support of parliamentary strengthening in Eastern Africa, via country programs in Uganda, Kenya, Rwanda and Tanzania, deepened understanding among staff and MPs of how Parliament's contribute to good governance. Ford Foundation's decision to support regional parliamentary integration allowed the good work done by the individual country programs to come together.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Work is now in hand to follow up the actions of the Clerk to Parliament in Tanzania to assess whether there is merit in organizing a similar event to enable the Committee Clerks and Research Officers in the four Parliaments to meet and discuss issues of mutual concern.

RESULT FOUR: MORE EFFECTIVE OVERSIGHT: INCREASED LEGISLATIVE CAPACITY TO MONITOR PUBLIC EXPENDITURE AND OVERSEE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE POVERTY REDUCTION STRATEGY.

Assess the general level of budget performance analysis currently undertaken

Workplan Activity 4.1

A. Whilst there is no doubt that there are some highly qualified individual Members of Parliament it was clear from our discussions with the Chairperson on the Committee for Finance & Economic Affairs that the actual groundwork in understanding the public finance processes was scanty. Although Parliamentary Committees were given the responsibility for budgetary oversight in May 2003, they had not received any training on how public finances are managed nor indeed how budgets are formulated. The Chairperson therefore recommended starting the process with a two day workshop on basic budgetary analysis skills training should be devised and delivered in advance of the main budget Session which was scheduled to kick off in June 2004. The Chairperson recommended that a return to first principles would serve to bring the MPs onto a level playing field in terms of their understanding of public sector finance. The first workshop was aimed at the Members of the F&EA Committee and the second workshop was targeted at all other Committee Chairpersons/Vice Chairpersons. The workshops were designed in such a way so as to ensure each Committee had a critical mass in terms of the basic knowledge to better interpret the budget. Speakers were drawn from the private sector, academia, Civil Society and the Ministry of Finance. The workshops were well received

and in fact revealed that the MPs were completely unaware of the draft budget guidelines that govern the development of the Medium Term Expenditure Frameworks (MTEFs) which in turn inform each and every MDA (Ministry, Department or Agency) in Tanzania. The Ministry of Finance representative in the first workshop was fairly reticent about the importance of the budget guidelines and this proved a great source of concern for the MPs. However, happily in the second workshop the Ministry of Finance official was far more forthcoming about the existence of the guidelines although she had to concede that it was the responsibility of the MPs to request electronic copies of the guidelines since the costs of reprinting the guidelines was outside the Ministry's budgetary allocation. Therefore to ensure that the attendees benefited from access to those guidelines, the Project agreed to reprint the guidelines and distribute them to all MPs and staff in Parliament in advance of the formal presentation of the Budget to Parliament on 10 June 2004. **ANNEX J** refers. The existence of the guidelines has undoubtedly helped the MPs to better assess and comprehend the priorities set by the Executive. Indeed the guidelines were cited in the formal speech given by the Opposition on the national budget presented by the Minister of Finance. **ANNEX K** refers.

Enhance Parliaments budgetary analysis capability.
Workplan Activity 4.1.B.

A. It is intended to repeat the two day basic budgetary analysis skills workshop twice before the next Session in November 2004 to capture more MPs. Also work is in hand in to design a further budgetary analysis skills course of greater depth to assist the MPs.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The model basic budgetary analysis skills workshops will be rolled out twice in October 2004. SUNY is also collaborating with the International Monetary Fund representative in Dar to seek to dovetail activities as the IMF have been asked to host a Conference in the Autumn which will focus on international treaties and agreements (inc HIPC), management of National debt, over arching National policies and strategies, fiscal decentralization modalities. Further information about the SUNY-IMF relationship is discussed later in this QMR.

Design briefing sessions for MPs on Public Expenditure Review & annual Auditor General Reports

B. Following on from the formation of the Eastern Africa Association of Public Accounts Committees (EAAPAC) in February 2004 which is largely based on the SADC Parliamentary Forum of PACs (SADCOPAC), work has been undertaken with the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee (who is the only Opposition Party Presidential Member of Parliament) to help him to seek assistance from the Country Director of the World Bank in Tanzania to provide assistance to the PAC.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The Chairperson has now confirmed that the World Bank in Tanzania is willing to offer assistance to the PAC. The Chairperson has asked for the Project to assist him further to scope out and define the range of support that is required in order to help the PAC become more robust in its oversight/scrutiny functions. Therefore work to define the support required for the PAC will commence over the next quarter.

Develop a seminar aimed at explaining/exploring the impact of the Poverty Reduction Strategy in Tanzania

C. The Honourable Anne Makinda, Chairperson of the Committee on Environment & Natural Resources is also the Parliamentary link into the Vice President's office which has the overall responsibility for driving forward the Poverty Reduction Strategic Plan in Tanzania. Over a number of months the Project has been in discussion with Honourable Makinda about the

review of the PRSP which is underway and the interface between the PRSP and the National Budget. In the past the Parliamentarians were only provided with a two hour briefing about the PRSP when it was first introduced and were told that they had to approve the PRSP immediately to enable Tanzania to qualify for inclusion in the HIPC initiative. Thereafter the MPs did not receive any further briefing and indeed do not even attend any meeting on the public expenditure reviews which assess the implementation of a range of national, over arching policy initiatives. Earlier this year, conscious that the PRSP Review was well underway and that Civil Society had already been extensively involved in the process but Parliamentarians had not, it was suggested by the Project to Honourable Makinda that the Workplan included a component on the PRSP and therefore some technical assistance could be provided. The timing of the workshop was vital as it needed to precede the formal budget session and also the basic budgetary analysis skills training. The training took place on 18 May 2004 in Dar es Salaam and over 25 MPs (mainly Committee Chairpersons or their deputies attended the workshop). DFID and USAID also attended the workshop as observers. Guest speakers attended from the Vice President's Office and REPOA as the leading authorities on the PRSP management/development. This was then followed the next day by an action planning day which was funded by the Canadian Parliamentary Center. Honourable Makinda advised that the VPO intends to conduct Committee-specific briefings on the PRSP during the Summer Session. The papers presented and rapporteur's reports are attached at **ANNEX L**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Further follow up work is underway with Honourable Makinda and Civil Society to assess the need for further briefing and information sharing. Indeed two of the CSO networks that we are now partnering with to supplement the relatively small PACT network, used the Project to gain access to Parliament to request a formal briefing session with MPs in late July. Further details will be included in the next QMR.

Design briefing sessions for MPs on the interface between Parliament & Local Councils via decentralization

E. We are now turning our attention to the Local Authority Accounts Committee (LAAC) some Members of which attended the basic budgetary analysis skills training in May but now wants to gain more skills in order to be able to analyze the local accounts within the Districts.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

It is planned to design a three day workshop in collaboration with Mzumbe University after the August Session for the members of the Committee on Local Authority Accounts (LAAC).

Develop a workshop on anti-corruption/fraud avoidance in the Public Sector

G. A great deal of work has been undertaken to help establish a formal relationship between APNAC (African Parliamentarians Network Against Corruption) and Transparency International (TI) Tanzania Chapter. TI in Tanzania had a very commendable record of seeking to root out and deal openly with the issue of corruption in Tanzania until there appears to have been a falling out with the then Chairperson of TI Tanzania. Thereafter the organization has effectively been in a period of purdah and many of the issues they advocated for have been subsumed with the establishment of the Prevention of Corruption Bureau (PCB). The TI Board is however now taking up the cudgels again and have recently elected a well respected academic and author Professor Mukandala (Professor of Political Science & Public Administration & Chair of the Research & Education for Democracy in Tanzania Programme). The rationale of linking APNAC to TI is to have the access to information for APNAC through the TI networks and activities and for TI to house a secretariat function for APNAC. This follows a similar model which is now well established in Kenya. The relationship will be enshrined in a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) which will guide the TI-APNAC relationship. The formal

signing of the MOU in the next quarter will also provide an opportunity for the MPs to be briefed about the contents of the Global Corruption Report 2004 (GCR). The theme of this years GCR was political corruption and whilst Tanzania was not the subject of any country research nevertheless there were some important messages which TI want to report to the MPs. The press statement is enclosed at **Annex M**. Within Parliament APNAC although accepted as a worthy coalition has little tangible support from the Mr. Speaker and thus the link up with TI will enable APNAC to have a much greater degree of autonomy. The formal signing of the MOU is scheduled for July 2004 and the yet to be ratified MOU is attached at **ANNEX N.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

Following the formal signing of the MOU work will commence to design a workshop for MPs to sensitize them to the need to avoid fraud and corruption and more importantly to help them better understand that corruption can take many forms and that as elected leaders they need to be, and to be seen to be, above reproach especially with the forthcoming elections looming large.

Creation of a Panel of x5 budgetary experts who can be called upon to help MPs examine and assess draft estimates.

H. This concept has been under consideration with the Chairperson of the Parliamentary Committee on Finance & Economic Affairs which through the Standing Orders has a mandate to examine the Government proposals on estimates of expenditure and to consider Government proposals and make follow-up on the implementation of programmes and national projects. This means that the Committee has an overview of all national fiscal policies and programmes. The Chairperson asked whether a panel of specialists could be established in good enough time before the Committee began its intense deliberations on the national estimates which kick off each year at the April Parliamentary Session. The Advisory Panel consists of a range of specialists both from the private sector, Civil Society and academia and they provide, on request from the Committee impartial, independent advice on national budgetary issues and macroeconomic policies. The membership of the Panel is attached at **ANNEX O.**

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The Committee have requested that the Panel be on hand to provide assistance for the November 2004 when the actual releases made to MDAs (Ministries, Departments & Agencies) will be scrutinized. In addition the Finance & Economic Affairs Chairperson has now asked for additional assistance from the Advisory Panel to help research the issue of the macro economic policy in Tanzania to enable the Committee to gain a greater level of understanding on this topic in preparation for the IMF/World Bank conference in October 2004.

Discuss with the Finance Committee Chairperson the concept of the creation of a Parliamentary Budget Office similar to that in Uganda and South Africa

I. The Project has been advised that the World Bank/IMF are funding a study tour of a delegation of MPs lead by the Finance & Economic Affairs Committee to visit neighboring Uganda and Kenya to discuss the merits of the Tanzania considering the adoption of the concept of the establishment of a budget office type functionality within the Parliament therefore there is no further action envisaged on this sub component at this time. Information received from World Bank indicates that the study tour will not take place until after the October 2004 conference.

Politicians of the Future program

Workplan Activity 4.2

A. Cross-cutting gender considerations

SUNY has confirmed that British Council has not to date undertaken an impact assessment of the Politicians of the Future program. In anticipation of the Parliamentary elections next year where it is planned to introduce a hybrid proportional representation (PR) system there will be an increase of 100 Special Seat Women Parliamentarians entering the Parliament in 2005 the Project has been working to see the advances being made across Africa to comply with the Beijing Convention which requires the percentage of women MPs to increase from 20% to 30% by November 2005.

ACTIVITIES FOR THE NEXT QUARTER

The Project team will set about conducting an impact assessment as a means to judge the feasibility of broadening the scope of the POF program and also the likely sustainability of the program by the Parliament. The assessment will also seek to identify those components of the POF that have general applicability and consider whether these could be fed across to the East African Parliamentary Institute (EAPI) which is a task within Result Area 3 – establishment of a training unit.

3.3: Relationships with other donors/organizations in Tanzania/ establishment of relationships with other organizations.

The Project team always seeks to coordinate its activities with other donor organizations and non-governmental organizations involved in programs with the Parliament such as the Canadian Parliamentary Center, IMF/World Bank and the University of Dar es Salaam to ensure there is no duplication of technical assistance activities but also to help put the issue of the provision of information into the Parliament as a key objective of the Project.

⇒ ***Meeting with representatives from the Canadian Parliamentary Center***

Following on from the establishment of the formal relationship with the Canadian High Commission the Project has now established good working relationship with the team leading the Africa-Canada Parliamentary Strengthening Program. The Canadian Parliamentary Center has three thematic areas that they work with the African Parliaments: gender, anti-corruption and poverty. It was agreed that the CPC and the Project team would seek to collaborate wherever possible on activities that fall in any of the three thematic areas to avoid any duplication of effort in the provision of support to Parliament.

⇒ ***IMF***

IMF advised that 3 day conference is planned for October 2004 where they would be trying to dispel myths about the IMF/World Bank and their functions in terms of supporting development. The IMF had been encouraged by the work of the Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs in terms of the Committee's willingness to take on the Executive for example when the Committee did not support a line on the privatization of a Tanzanian financial institution. IMF advised that the Conference content would be determined by the MPs themselves and IMF would bring in keynote speakers from the UK/US/Australia rather than sending batches of MPs on study tours.

⇒ ***Office of the Registrar of Political Parties***

Whilst in Dodoma the Project was able to forge a relationship with the Registrar of Political Parties Honourable John Tendwa. Honourable Tendwa has the responsibility for ensuring that all political parties comply with the electoral registration legislation and was keen to learn about the Project and in particular the work that the Project has been undertaking in connection with public hearings and helping MPs to understand their role as legislators. It was agreed that the Project would seek to liaise with the Registrar when opportunities to collaborate present

themselves. Following that chance meeting a link has also been made into the Civic Education basket fund project which is managed by UNDP on behalf of a number of development partners since that team together with the National Electoral Commission may wish to benefit from the insights gleaned from the previous research undertaken on the scope and review of the relationships between MPs and their constituents carried out by the Project.

⇒ ***The Foundation for Civil Society***

The Project team has also established excellent links with the Foundation for Civil Society who have been approached by some smaller CSOs who are interested in the concept of constituency level public hearings. Such CSOs had heard about the Projects pilot program in May 2004 and are now considering the ways and means to enable them to prepare their thoughts and those of the local community in which they operate, in advance of the local MP coming to the community to discuss a Bill or topic. The Foundation learnt of the pilot program through such CSOs and therefore they are now considering the modalities to devising a fast track approach to awarding grants to such CSOs. The Project team will build on this relationship over the next Quarter.

4. Explanation of any obstacles encountered during

- **program implementation and actions taken to address them/summary of lessons learnt.**
- **explanation of any administrative/financial issues and actions taken to address this.**

As the Project implementation has gained pace and therefore the concept of the provision of technical assistance encapsulated in a Workplan designed in close collaboration with Parliament and tailored to meet Parliaments' needs, has become more familiar to both the MPs and staff. However it is clear that the communications systems within the Parliament to disseminate information are all designed to ensure that all communications come through the Speakers office which often results in limited or sporadic communications about operational issues. On purely Chamber related issues this does not cause any substantive problems however when it is concerns operational matters such as the progress being made by the Project this can result in a climate of "ignorance" insofar as MPs or staff are not fully aware of what the Project is seeking to achieve. In light of these hiccups the Project has introduced a system of brief, newsletter like summaries into the Parliamentary Service heads of division via the Clerk to Parliament so staffers are kept up to date with developments as part of the work to seek to build the capacity of the Institution of Parliament. This recognizes that the staffers need to be involved in all the reform activities associated with the Project to ensure that there is real ownership that will carry through into the next Parliament. The Project team seeks in all its interface activities with Parliament to ensure that MPs have a realistic expectation of what can be delivered but with the reassurance that the Project is always mindful of the need to attract additional funding/interest from the donor community. This has become an important mantra that is stressed now that the Project has entered its second year.

5. Performance indicators/program outputs (including reporting of performance data compared to target and baselines)

<u>ANNEX P</u> refers.

D INSTRUMENTALISM				
TITUENT RELATIONS				
ween MPs & constituents. Base samples Dar es Salaam, L, Iringa, Mbeya & Zanzibar.		ACTION COMPLETE JANUARY 2004 Two teams went out to conduct the survey in January 2004. REPORT SUBMITTED IN JANUARY 2004 QMR.	YES	
Plan to include constituent relations followed by public		Action plan designed as an integral part of the scope/review exercise.		
r MPs on the role of an MP & the interface issues SOs and the Executive. Workshops will focus on building tural resource management, HIV prevention & micro	NOVEMBER 2003-JANUARY 2004	ACTION COMPLETE: APRIL/MAY 2004: 2 day workshop held for x16 MPs i.e. those whose constituencies used as the pilot exercise to assess the viability of conducting public hearings at the local level. Regions were Kilimanjaro Hai constituency, Iringa Region Kilolo constituency, Singida region Singida North constituency and Ruvuma Region Tunduru constituency.		
nship with the Local Councils which raises development incorporated into their thinking when considering the dget.				
elected constituencies with MPs to put into practice the hops	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004			
HEARINGS ON PARLIAMENTARY BILLS				
clude defining the agenda, inviting expert testimony, colloquia and incorporating civil society into the n MPs and the Committee Clerks. Development of e	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004	ACTION COMPLETE APRIL 2004: 2 day workshop held for x16 MPs i.e. those whose constituencies used as the pilot exercise to assess the viability of conducting public hearings at the local level. Constituencies selected included Singida,Singida region Singida North constituency and Ruvuma Region Tunduru constituency.		Sep-04
MPs to understand and therefore use the public	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004	ACTIVITY COMPLETE: APRIL 2004		
ftive above target Parliamentary Committees on specific , women & HIV).	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004			Oct-04
ARLIAMENT BY CIVIL SOCIETY *SECTORS HEALTH, EDUCATION, NATURAL T & PRIVATE SECTOR DEVELOPMENT.*				
ment liaison officer to be assigned to PACT/Ts	NOVEMBER 2003-MAY 2004 TIMELINE	ROLE DEFINED AND OPEN RECRUITMENT PROCEDURES COMPLETED		
liaison officer		ACTION COMPLETE: CSO PARLIAMENT LIAISON OFFICER APPOINTED DECEMBER 2003	CSOs participating in the CSO Solution to be surveyed to assess the importance and added value of the CPLO role.	July-04

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

	Assessment of the current roles/relationships between Parliament and CSOs				
	Sensitization of CSOs to Parliamentary environment & helping them understand the work of an MP.		MULTI FACETED STRATEGY TO BRING CIVIL SOCIETY MORE CLEARLY INTO THE LEGISLATIVE ADOPTED. APPROACH ON 3 LEVELS CSO BRIEFING AND SENSITIZATION, MPS BRIEFING AND THEN JOINT MP + CSO WORKSHOPS. ACTION COMPLETE: JANUARY 2004 n4 one day bespoke workshops on increasing access to Parliament held in January 2004. Representatives from over 35 CSOs participated.	DECEMBER 2003- TWO DAY BRIEFING BETWEEN A CSO REPRESENTING CHILDREN IN DSM ORGANIZED WITH THE LOCAL MPs TO DISCUSS THE ISSUES OF GREATEST CONCERN TO CHILDREN. ITEMS INCLUDED THE IMPACT OF HIV/AIDS THE NEED TO CONSIDER REDUCING THE VOTING AGE TO 16, PROVISION OF SECONDARY SCHOOL EDUCATION.	Dec-03
	Sensitization of MPs to the CSO environment & helping them understand the valuable role performed by CSOs. Seeking to identify common areas of interest where MPs & CSOs can effectively collaborate (health, education, natural resources management & private sector development)		ACTION COMPLETE: FEBRUARY 2004 n4 one day bespoke workshop entitled "Influencing policy skills" rolled out successfully in February 2004 n4 further workshops to take place in August 2004	FOLLOWING THE WORKSHOP MPs REQUESTED THE CSOS TO ATTEND A PUBLIC HEARING WITH MINISTERS AND DEFERRED DISCUSSION ON A BILL UNTIL THE CSOS HAD BEEN PROPERLY CONSULTED. YES	Feb-04
	Joint Parliament-Civil Society workshops (at least n4) to strategize on ways of working more closely Committee/CSO issue papers & workshops.		Planned for August 2004		
	CSO EXHIBITION 2004	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TARGET	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
	Organize a CSO-Parliament Exhibition up in Dodoma to coincide with the main Parliamentary Sitting in August 2004		Given the long Parliamentary Session (June-August) it is agreed that the Exhibition will be held in July to maximize MPs participation A MINIMUM OF 30 CSOs EXPECTED TO PARTICIPATE.	In fact after SUNI/Tanzania action now 60 CSOs have confirmed their participation at the Exhibition	09-11 July 2004
	ENHANCE PARLIAMENT'S OUTREACH ACTIVITIES				
	Conduct a needs assessment & devise an Action Plan on the Parliament's Public Information Department. If approved then: Capacity building seminars for Public Information Unit staff Development of new outreach materials. Allowing time for trialling some Development of "train the trainers" program & modify to cover civic leaders & civic education teachers Launch of new, improved range of outreach tools (Sandwhili & English) Development of invigorating Youth programmes i.e. essay competition, Parliamentary tours etc		ACTION COMPLETE: Report findings to be discussed with Parliament IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS	YES YES YES YES YES YES	Jun-04
	Consideration of the establishment of a "youth parliament" based on other African experiences/examples Review of SUNISE News and continuation on the role of the newsletter & its target audience Identify means by which to amplify readership of SUNISE News through innovation		IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS IN ABEYANCE PENDING OUTPUT FROM HOU SPECIALISTS	FIRST LINE ACTION REQUIRED: IN DECEMBER 2003, THE PROJECT WAS approached by UNICEF DALAAS AND HAS WORKING WITH THE REGIONAL YOUTH TO FACILITATE A MEETING BETWEEN THE LOCAL MPs AND THE YOUTH COUNCIL TO TRY TO DEMYSTIFY THE ROLE OF MP OF YOU THE RELATIONSHIP WITH THE YOUTH. THAT MEETING CREATED A FORUM FOR DISCUSSION WHICH WILL BE ROUTED THROUGH THE LOCAL COUNCIL YOUTH REPRESENTATIVE. YES YES	Dec-03
	Review & enhancement of the Parliamentary website				
	Consideration of the scope/coverage of POLIS		UNDP have formally launched the POLIS website and have indicated that they would wish other donors to provide funds to support/broaden the scope of the POLIS	PROBLEM IDENTIFIED IN DODOMA IN THAT NO LOCAL AREA NETWORK LAN EXISTING TO ENABLE THE COMMITTEE CLERKS AND RESEARCH OFFICERS TO BE ABLE TO SHARE THEIR INFORMATION AND ACCESS THE INTERNET. SUNISE ADVISES THAT THE CABLING/TRUNKING COSTS ARE IN EXCESS OF $100L THERE ARE INSUFFICIENT RESOURCES IN THE RESULT AREA ALLOCATION SO USAID HAVE VOLUNTEERED TO SEEK IN INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT TO BE CARRIED OUT BY IT SPECIALISTS FROM RED SO. IN ABEYANCE UNTIL USAID PROVIDE THEIR INPUT	1 01/06/2004
	Review of the current Parliamentary website Develop a "window" within the website to enable caucus groups to be accessed		ACTION COMPLETE Report suggests that the use of electronic voting might be a useful means of linking Parliament with the public.	USAID/DFID requested a demographic survey to establish the distribution of mobile phone users to ensure that any SMS voting mechanisms would not be an option and therefore data gathered would be skewed.	Feb-04

	RESULT TWO: MORE EFFECTIVE LAWMAKING				
2.1	*ENHANCING COMMITTEE OPERATIONS*	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
A	Review of Committee operations- Chairpersons, Committee Clerks. Thematic areas could include how to scrutinize legislation, research methodologies & presentational skills.	FEBRUARY - NOVEMBER 2004			
B	Enhancement of C/Clerk skill sets	Feb-04	Given the pressure with the Parliamentary Sessions Parliament asked us to defer the bespoke training for Clerk Assistants and Research Officers on Parliamentary practice & procedures and Information technology.	Training to be conducted at UbSM Computing Centre and a bespoke skills enhancement workshop using the Ts Parliamentary staff and HOC specialists and will include both the Clerk Assistants and Research Officers together with the Deputy Parliamentary Projects Co-ordinator.	Sep-04
C	Development of a best practice guide on effective Committee operations	Feb-04	ACTIVITY LINKED TO WORKPLAN ITEM 2.3(i) ABOVE. GIVEN THAT THE VICE PRESIDENT'S OFFICE AND TANGO PRODUCED THEIR OWN CSO DIRECTORIES IT WAS JUDGED THAT DEVELOPMENT OF A MULTI-FUNCTIONAL MANUAL MIGHT OFFER THE BEST MEANS OF GETTING CIVIL SOCIETY INVOLVED IN THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS.	Concept submitted to Chairpersons of the Parliamentary Committee and they duly endorsed the approach. The manual will effectively create an institutional memory of Committee deliberations and will provide MPs with both policy information and contacts with Civil Society and Ministries etc.	Nov-04
D	Targeted consultancy support on specific pieces of legislation.	Feb-04	THIS FORMS AN INTEGRAL PART OF THE CSO-PARLIAMENT FUNCTION ITEM 1.3.A ABOVE. SPECIFIC USAGE OF THE WELL ESTABLISHED NGO POLICY FORUM NETWORK WILL BE USED FOR THIS ACTIVITY.	YES	[illegible]
2.2	*STANDING ORDERS*				
A	Development of a series of sensitization workshops to assist MPs to use the Standing Orders.	[illegible]	Assignment launched using the Clerk to Parliament and the Second Deputy Speaker . However pressure of work has delayed the completion of the assignment therefore activity to the reviewed and new target completion date agreed.	Standing Orders are approved at the inauguration of each new Parliament in this case November 2006. Therefore the work will focus on reviewing the current S/Orders and make recommendations through the Standing Orders Parliamentary Committee for changes to improve/strengthen the role of the MP and reduce the power of the Speaker.	Nov-04
B	Comparative analysis study tour of other Parliaments S/Orders (SALA)		PARLIAMENT DECLINED THE IDEA OF A STUDY VISIT TO UGANDA BUT ASKED ABOUT A VISIT TO AUSTRALIA WHICH WE DECLINED. THE INITIAL THINKING WAS TO USE THE BASE OF ACCESS TO THE SALA IN ARUSHA HOWEVER WE HAVE HAD IT CONFIRMED THAT THE STANDING ORDERS IN THE SALA ARE STILL GOING THROUGH A NUMBER OF AMENDMENTS AND CONSENSUS HAS YET TO BE REACHED.	SALA S/Orders found to be fraught with difficulties and therefore it seems prudent to review the current S/Orders and sensitize all Parliamentarians to underpin the importance of having draft new S/Orders for the new incoming Parliament.	
C	Consideration of the impact of the current Standing Orders via women/gender lenses		Assignment launched using the Clerk to Parliament and the Second Deputy Speaker. However pressure of work has delayed the completion of the assignment therefore activity to the reviewed and new target completion date agreed.		
2.3	*SOURCES OF COMMITTEE INFORMATION*				
(i)	Development of an MP- CSO/Public Policy Expert Directory & electronic d'base (? using POLIS)	[illegible]	LINKED TO Item 2.C.i above assets more produce than create another directory also there Vice President's Office who is responsible for coordination of Civil Society initiatives is updating its directory which could negate the need for a CSO directory. The manual will effectively create an institutional memory of Committee deliberations and will provide MPs with both policy information and contacts with Civil Society and Ministries etc.	YES	Nov-04
(ii)	Publication of the Tanzanian MP-CSO/Public Policy Expert Directory + e-copy (? using POLIS)		DITTO		
(iii)	Creation of a panel of public policy experts available to Parliament	[illegible]	See Item 2.A.i below (Result Area 4)		
(iv)	Explore the viability of involving Universities/mid career professionals in SUNY activities	[illegible]	DITTO		
(v)	Review Parliament's views on the usefulness of the expert panel concept		DITTO		
(vi)	Assess POLIS capability to enhance the electronic bill tracking/Auto management service & consider the possible impact on Parliamentary sitting time	[illegible]	To form an integral part of the Standing Orders review Item 2.2.a above	YES	Nov-04

1A	INCREASE ACCESS TO RESEARCH MATERIALS & SERVICES	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
A	Review of current Parliamentary Research Services provision & research tools currently available.	Feb-04	ACTION COMPLETE: (I) Review of provision of current Parliamentary Research services completed in March 2004. Report recommends the effective relaunch/rebranding of the Unit in Parliament. Report submitted to the Clerk to parliament for his consideration. SUNY recommend the split of the Research Service away from the Library Service and the researchers to be reassigned to the Clerks Department and therefore directly linked into the Committees.(II) LINKED TO ITEM E.1.B RESEARCH OFFICERS AND CLERK ASSISTANTS WILL ALL ATTEND A TWO WEEK TRAINING COURSE WHICH WILL INCLUDE IN IT SYLLABUS & A COMPONENT ON RESEARCH METHODOLOGIES.	YES	(I) Proposal submitted to Parliament April 2004 and now in abeyance pending their approval or otherwise. (II) ESAMI TRAINING SCHEDULED FOR AUGUST 2004
B	development of a multi faceted training programme for MPs about the importance of good quality research		INSPECTION OF THE PARLIAMENTARY LIBRARY REVEALS THAT IT WOEFULLY OUT OF DATE WITH THE MOST UP TO DATE PUBLICATIONS BEING THE DAILY NEWSPAPERS. THIS MEANS THAT THE MPs ARE UNABLE TO UTILIZE A WELL STOCKED LIBRARY TO HELP THEM CONDUCT THEIR RESEARCH. THEREFORE A NUMBER OF INITIATIVES TO ASSIST THE MPs INCLUDE HELPING CSOS TO HAVE ADVANCE NOTICE OF FORTHCOMING BILLS SO THEY CAN PREPARE DETAILED RESEARCH WHICH CAN BE SUBMITTED TO THE COMMITTEES.	WORK IS NOW UNDERWAY TO HELP LINK UP NGOs IN THE NGO POLICY FORUM TO USE THEIR THEMATIC BILL ANALYSIS TEAMS IN CLOSER CONTACT WITH THE COMMITTEES IN ADVANCE OF DETAILED PLENARY DISCUSSIONS.	Aug-04
C	Enhance/procure additional materials and tools for the Research Unit	Dec-03	ACTION COMPLETE: DECEMBER 2003 Items procured heavy duty photocopier, fax machine, x14 personal computers (x12 for the Clerk Assistants and x2 for the Research Officers and one laptop computer.		
D	Study tour to well established Parliamentary research units i.e. Zambia, South Africa , India or Uganda.	Jun-04	x2 of the Research officers out of the country on attachment to another legislative body therefore the study tour has had to be deferred. Study tour now confirmed to be to Uganda.		Sep-04
E	assist Parliament to establish linkages with other research bodies & public service ministries i.e. MoF P for the econometric model.	Jun-04	RELATIONSHIP WITH REPOA & SBAP UNDER DEVELOPMENT AS WELL AS LINKING ACADEMICS IN UGANDA	YES	Oct-04

	RESULT THREE ENHANCED MANAGEMENT & ADMINISTRATION				
3.1	*INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT WITHIN PARLIAMENT*	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
A	Thorough review of the need to develop a hollette Modernization Plan in the light of the UNDP/AWEPA work already undertaken in this area.		GIVEN PREVIOUS SUBSTANTIAL EXPENDITURE AND ATTENDANT ACTIVITIES LEAD BY UNDP IN THES AREA TO REVIEW THE HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT ISSUES IN PARLIAMENT, IT WAS NO LONGER APPROPRIATE TO CONSIDER FURTHER INVESTMENT IN THES AREA UNTIL AFTER THE NEXT PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS IE NOVEMBER 2005. PREVIOUS RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED WITHIN THE UNDP REPORT LOOKED AT THE NEEDS OF PARLIAMENTARIANS AND STAFFERS BUT ONLY DEALT WITH FINANCIAL ISSUES FOR THE PARLIAMENTARIANS IN TERMS OF THEIR ALLOWANCES. THE REMAINDER OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE IN ABEYANCE INDEFINETELY.	PROBLEM STATEMENT ISSUED TO USAID REQUESTING AUTHORITY TO REALLOCATE FINANCIAL RESOURCES FROM RESULT AREA 3 INTO RESULT AREA 4.	REQUEST FORMALLY SUBMITTED 01/06/2004
B	Subject the review then organise & co-ordination of a donors conference to launch the hollette Modernization Plan		*IN ABEYANCE*		
C	Review management services provided by Parliamentary Service staff		STRATEGIC PROGRAM MANAGEMENT REVIEW ASSIGNMENT UNDERTAKEN IN NOVEMBER 2003 & RECOMMENDED THAT NO MAJOR ACTIVITIES BE UNDERTAKEN UNTIL AFTER THE NEXT ELECTIONS. THE ASSIGNMENT TEAM RECOMMENDED THAT WORK & ACTIVITIES WITH THE MPs SHOULD BE WEIGHED AGAINST THE LIKELIHOOD THAT 40-60% WILL NOT RETURN TO THE NEW PARLIAMENT IN 2005. EMPHASIS THUS PLACED ON WORKING WITH MPs AND THEN THE STAFFERS FROM NOVEMBER 2004.	YES	Nov-04
D	Assessment of the operations & synergies within the existing board of managers		*IN ABEYANCE*		
E	Conduct a needs assessment of an efficient records management system		*IN ABEYANCE*	INVESTIGATORY WORK UNDERWAY TO ASSESS WHETHER THERE MAYBE SOME MERIT IN PROVIDING A BESPOKE DATA STORAGE SYSTEM SIMILAR TO A LIBRARY PACKAGE WHICH MAY MEET THES REQUEST. ONCE INFORMATION IS COLLATED THES WILL BE SUBMITTED TO PARLIAMENT FOR THEIR CONSIDERATION.	Aug-04
3.2	*INTERNSHIP PROGRAM*				
A	Establish links with the University of DSM and seek to attain academic accreditation for the internship program	APRIL-AUGUST 2004	DISCUSSIONS WITH UNIVERSITY OF DAR ES SALAAM ABOUT THE IDEA OF AWARDING ACADEMIC CREDITS FOR THE PARLIAMENTARY INTERNSHIP PROGRAM. HOWEVER IT WAS MADE CLEAR THAT SUCH CHANGES WOULD CAUSE MAJOR BUREAUCRATIC PROBLEMS WITHIN THE UNIVERSITY. THEREFORE IT WAS AGREED THAT TO ENSURE THAT THE PROGRAM DEADLINE WAS MET THAT ONLY FINALIST STUDENTS WOULD BE INVITED TO APPLY FOR THE PROGRAM.	FURTHER WORK WITH THE UNIVERSITY TO AGREE THE AWARD OF ACADEMIC CREDITS WILL BE EXPLORED TO BE USED IN ANY FUTURE ITERATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY INTERNSHIP PROGRAM.	Sep-04
B	Development of an Internship Programme	APRIL-AUGUST 2004	ACTION COMPLETE		
C	Launch of the first Internship Programme	June	Internship Program devised in close collaboration with Parliament and the University. Had originally envisaged that one of the rural Universities would also participate but unfortunately their semester did not match the proposed timeline for the Internship program. Students will be accommodated in bodoma for the duration of the Program. The orientation will comprise of a representative from Parliament, from the University and an Ugandan internship alumnus.		
D	Proposed duration on the Internship Programme	MAY-AUGUST 2004	Third Year/Master students were asked to self nominate themselves for the Programme. 48 applications were received and 20 were sifted out at the first stage and 30 were invited for interview. X17 Students were eventually identified as Parliamentary Interns. AN ORIENTATION WEEK IN DODOMA WILL LAUNCH THE PROGRAM AND THE INTERNS WILL BE IN DODOMA for the duration of the Summer Session (June-August 2004) inclusive.		
3.3	In light of the work underway within the EAPI (East African Parliamentary Institute) consider whether the creation of a central training unit within Parliament is feasible/required by Parliament	[illegible]	As originally conceived, it was envisaged that the need to institutionalise training & enhancement of skills for both MPs and staff would help encourage a greater degree of professionalism amongst the target groups. However since 2003 there have been a greater appreciation of the need for the 3 East African countries (Tanzania, Kenya and Uganda) that all share a common legislative origin based on the Westminster model to combined force to meet and share ideas and practices	Largely for that reason Parliament felt that before any commitment was made to establish a separate training unit for Tanzania that the full impact of the EAPI is assessed. The EAPI is effectively a "virtual institute" insofar as it does not have a physical home but has been created using a Ford Foundation grant to SUNY in collaboration with the US International University in Nairobi.	

BREAK FOUR: MORE EFFECTIVE OVERSIGHT

AMPLIFY THE ROLE OF PARLIAMENT IN THE NATIONAL BUDGET PROCESS & PUBLIC EXPENDITURE.	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
Assess the general level of budget performance analysis currently available	Feb-04	**ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:** x2 two day bespoke workshops for MPs on basic budgetary analysis skills rolled out in May 2004 to overflow session. The workshops revealed that MPs have effectively been excluded from any consultation on the development of the budget guidelines on the development of the medium term expenditure framework plans which will set the budgeting framework from 2004 through to 2007.	AS A RESULT OF THE WORKSHOPS MPS ASKED FOR SUNY TO REPRODUCE THE 110 PAGE BUDGET GUIDELINES FOR DISTRIBUTION TO ALL PARLIAMENTARIANS	300 COPIES PREPARED &DISTRIBUTED TO ALL MPS- JUNE 2004
Design briefing sessions for MPs on Public Expenditure Reviews & annual Auditor General reports		WORKING WITH THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE A DRAFT LETTER WAS PREPARED AND SUBMITTED TO THE WORLD BANK COUNTRY REPRESENTATIVE WITH A PLEA FOR SUPPORT TO ENABLE THE PAC TO BE OVER EFFECTIVE IN UNDERTAKING ITS KEY SCRUTINY/OVERSIGHT ROLE.	THROUGH THE SAPI THE TANZANIAN PAC IS NOW A MEMBER OF THE NEWLY ESTABLISHED EA COALITION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEES. THERE ARE NOW STRONG LINKS WITH THE SADCOPAC GROUP WHO WILL BE HOLDING THEIR ANNUAL MEETING IN TANZANIA IN JUNE 2004	Jun-04
Develop a seminar aimed at explaining/exploring the impact of the Poverty Reduction Strategy in Tanzania.		**ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:** One day briefing DESIGNED AND DELIVERED BY THE LEADING TECHNOCRATS IN THE VICE PRESIDENT'S OFFICE(VPO) & RESEARCH ON POVERTY ALLEVIATION (REPOA) TO PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE CHAIRPERSONS. THE BRIEFING WAS WILL RECEIVED BY THE MPs.	PARLIAMENTARIANS HAVE ASKED FOR FURTHER BRIEFING BY CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS	Aug-04
Design briefing sessions for MPs on HIPC, International Agreements and Treaties.		FORMAL RELATIONSHIP WITH IMF NOW ESTABLISHED AND A BRIEFING SESSION ON INTERNATIONAL LOANS ETC IS PLANNED AFTER THE BUDGET SESSION 2004.	YES	Oct-04
Design briefing sessions for MPs on the interface between Parliament & Local Councils via decentralization.		THIS ITEM WILL HAVE TO BE TAKEN FORWARD IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PO-LGRP. FURTHER INVESTIGATORY WORK IS THEREFORE PLANNED.	FORMAL APPROACH FOR ASSISTANCE RECEIVED FROM THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (LAAC) FOR ASSISTANCE IN UNDERSTANDING THE COMMITTEE'S SCRUTINY ROLE RECEIVED AND WORK TO DEVISE A WORKSHOP FOR THE COMMITTEE IS UNDERWAY.	? 01/09/2004
Design briefing sessions for MPs on the role of the MoF on the disbursement of donor funds/loans and grants.		**ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:** WORKSHOP TOPICS INCLUDED: BUDGETING ESSENTIALS, MACRO ECONOMICS, GENDER MAINSTREAMING, BUDGETING FOR SERVICE DELIVERY, GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTING & REPORTING FEEDBACK TO BUDGET.	HAVE ESTABLISHED A RELATIONSHIP WITH IMF WHO PLAN TO ORGANIZE A CONFERENCE FOR THE MPs IN NOVEMBER 2004.	Nov-04
Develop a workshop on anti-corruption/fraud awareness in the Public Sector.		RELATIONSHIP WITH APNAC (PARLIAMENTARIANS COALITION AGAINST CORRUPTION) ESTABLISHED. AND TRAINING WORKSHOP NOW UNDER DEVELOPMENT	MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING(MOU) BETWEEN TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL(TI) & APNAC. TI WILL HOUSE THE APNAC SECRETARIAT SO APNAC WILL BENEFIT FROM RESEARCH GENERATED BY TI.	Jul-04
Creation of a panel of all budgetary experts who can be called upon to help MPs examine and assess draft estimates	Apr-04	**ACTION COMPLETE APRIL 2004:** ADVISORY PANEL CONCEPT SUBMITTED AND ACCEPTED BY THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE ON FINANCE & ECONOMIC AFFAIRS. PANEL MEMBERSHIP IS CONFIRMED AS 16 INDIVIDUALS WITH SKILLS RANGING FROM ACCOUNTING, MACRO ECONOMICS, GENDER BUDGETING AND PROCUREMENT.	CHAIRPERSON HAS ASKED FOR THE PANEL TO REMAIN IN PLACE TO PROVIDE ASSISTANCE IN THE NOVEMBER 2004 PARLIAMENTARY SESSION. THE PANEL WILL BE ASSISTING THE COMMITTEE IN CONDUCTING RESEARCH IN SUPPORT OF THE IMF SPONSORED CONFERENCE DUE TO TAKE PLACE IN NOVEMBER 2004.	Nov-04
Discuss with the Finance Committee Chairperson the concept of the creation of a Parliamentary Budget Office similar to that in Uganda & South Africa		CHAIRPERSON OF COMMITTEE ON FGBA ADVISED THAT THIS IS PLANNED AND LIKELY TO BE FUNDED BY WORLD BANK AND WILL INCLUDE A VISIT TO BOTH UGANDA & KENYA	AS PART OF BRIEFING FOR THE FORTHCOMING STUDY TOUR COPIES OF THE PARLIAMENT OF UGANDA BUDGET ACT 2001 DISTRIBUTED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS	Jun-04
POLITICIANS OF THE FUTURE PROGRAM				
Explore the mechanics of broadening the scope of the "Politicians of the Future" programme	Non-response rate	SUNY activity: no independent impact assessments have been conducted on the POF program since its inception. Therefore as part of the cross cutting gender issues in the workplan SUNY intends conducting that assessment.	YES	Oct-04
preparation of a strategic plan for the women's caucus in preparation for the 2005 elections (complementary to the UNDP activities)		IN ABEYANCE		
devise initiatives to ensure the women's caucus are well versed in Parliamentary practice & procedures.	Feb-04	DC have modified to hold a workshop on the permanent voters register		Jun-04
training for women MPs on design/writing of proposals to attract more finance projects in their constituencies	Feb-04	DC have now modified this activity to focus on lobbying, fundraising, campaign management, public speaking & media relations		Aug-04
Extension of the networking initiatives between women MPs in Tanzania to other East African legislatures.		IN ABEYANCE		

SUNY/TANZANIA TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR THE STRENGTHENING OF TANZANIA'S UNION NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

PROGRESS CHART -
ATTACHMENT TO QMR APRIL TO JUNE 2004

FORWARD LOOK/NEW TASKS IDENTIFIED	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
RESULT ONE: IMPROVING REPRESENTATION				
CONSTITUENCY LEVEL PUBLIC HEARINGS ON PARLIAMENTARY BILLS				
Develop training program to include defining the agenda, inviting expert testimony, press relations,organizational techniques and incorporating civil society into the process. Separate events for the MPs and the Committee Clerks. Development of training materials including video	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004	FIRST LEVEL ACTION COMPLETE APRIL 2004: 2 day workshop held for 40 MPs in three cities constituencies used in the pilot exercise to assess the viability of conducting public hearings at the local level. Constituencies selected included Singida,Singida region Singida North constituency and Ferowa Region Tandara constituency	Work is now in hand to repeat the public hearings training to more MPs and also to design a "how to conduct a public hearing at constituency level" guide plus training videos to help institutionalise the concept.	Oct-04
Conduct x3 workshops to assist MPs to understand and therefore use the public hearings initiative	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004	FIRST LEVEL ACTIVITY COMPLETE: APRIL 2004	WORKSHOP TO BE REPEATED TO CAPTURE AT LEAST A TOTAL OF 90 MPs	Oct-04
Building on public hearings initiative above target Parliamentary Committees on specific Bills social welfare, environment, women & SIDs).	JANUARY-FEBRUARY 2004		FORMAL MAPPING OF DRAFT LEGISLATION TO BE CONSIDERED IN THE LIGHT OF THE CONSULTANT'S EVALUATION REPORT FROM THE PILOT EXERCISE. THIS WILL GUIDE THE WAY FORWARD.	Oct-04
INCREASE ACCESS TO PARLIAMENT BY CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS IN KEY SECTORS EALTH, EDUCATION, NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT & PRIVATE SECTOR DEVELOPMENT.				
Assessment of the current roles/relationships between Parliament and CSOs				
Seeking to identify common areas of interest where MPs & CSOs can effectively collaborate (health, education, natural resource management & private sector development)			MAPPING OF PLANNED LEGISLATION TO BE UNDERTAKEN	ONGOING
Joint Parliament-Civil Society workshops (at least x6) to strategize on ways of working more closely				
Committee/CSO issue papers & workshops.				Oct-04
ENHANCE PARLIAMENT'S OUTREACH ACTIVITIES				
Conduct a needs assessment & devise an Action Plan on the Parliament's Public Information Department. If approved then:	FEBRUARY-MARCH 2004	ACTION COMPLETE: Report findings to be discussed with Parliament		Dec-04
Capacity building seminars for Public Information Unit staff		Report findings to be discussed with Parliament		
Development of new outreach materials. Allowing time for trialling same		Report findings to be discussed with Parliament		
Development of "train the trainers" program & modify to cover civic leaders & civic education teachers		Report findings to be discussed with Parliament	CONCEPTS TO BE DISCUSSED WITH UNDP PROGRAM MANAGEMENT UNIT DEALING WITH THE CIVIC EDUCATION ACTIVITIES ASSOCIATED WITH THE FORTHCOMING 2005 GENERAL ELECTIONS	Aug-04
Launch of new, improved range of outreach tools (Swahili & English)		Report findings to be discussed with Parliament		
Development of Integrating Youth programmes i.e. essay competition, Parliamentary tours etc		Report findings to be discussed with Parliament		
Consideration of the establishment of a "youth parliament" based on other African experiences/examples		FIRST LEVEL ACTION COMPLETE: IN DECEMBER 2003		Dec-03
Review of SUNGE News and clarification on the role of the newsletter & its target audience		*Report findings to be discussed with Parliament*		
Identify means by which to amplify readership of SUNGE News through innovation		*Report findings to be discussed with Parliament*		
Review & enhancement of the Parliamentary website				
Consideration of the scope/coverage of POLIS		UNDP have formally launched the POLIS website and have indicated that they would wish other donors to provide funds to support/broaden the scope of the POLIS.	USAID/REDSO IT SPECIALIST TO VISIT DODOMA IN THE WEEK BEGINNING 2 AUGUST 2004 TO ASSESS THE COSTS TO CREATE A LAN FOR THE COMMITTEE CLERKS AND RESEARCH OFFICERS OFFICES.	Aug-04
Review of the current Parliamentary website		ACTION COMPLETE: Report suggests that the use of electronic voting might be a useful means of linking Parliament with the public.	USAID/DFID requested a demographic survey to establish the distribution of mobile phone users to ensure that any SMS voting mechanisms would not be an elitist and therefore data gathered would be biased.	Feb-04
Develop a "window" within the website to enable women groups to be assessed			FOCUS LIKELY TO BE ON MAKING RESEARCH REPORTS AVAILABLE ON THE WEBSITE SO ALL MPs HAVE A BETTER APPRECIATION OF THE RESEARCH REPORTS BEING GENERATED IN PARLIAMENT	Oct-04

RESULT TWO: MORE EFFECTIVE LAWMAKING

		ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TARGS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
2.1	*ENHANCING COMMITTEE OPERATIONS*				
A	Review of Committee operations- Chairpersons, Committee Clerks. Thematic areas could include how to scrutinize legislation, research methodologies & presentational skills.	FEBRUARY - NOVEMBER 2004			
b	Enhancement of C/Clerk skill sets	Feb-04	Given the pressure with the Parliamentary Sessions Parliament asked us to defer the bespoke training for Clerk Assistants and Research Officers on Parliamentary practice & procedures and Information technology.	Training to be coordinated or Clerks Computing Course and a bespoke skills enhancement workshop using the TI Parliamentary staff and HCDO specialists and will include both the Clerk Assistants and Research Officers together with the Deputy Parliamentary Projects Co-ordinator.	Sep-04
c	Development of a best practice guide on effective Committee operations	Nov-04		Concept submitted to Chairpersons of the Parliamentary Committee and they duly endorsed the approach. The manual will effectively create an institutional memory of Committee deliberations and will provide MPs with both policy information and contacts with Civil Society and Ministries etc.	Nov-04
D	Targeted consultancy support on specific pieces of legislation.	Nov-04		NEED TO ANALYSE CURRENT SYSTEM FOR ALERTING PARLIAMENT TO THE ARRIVAL OF FORTHCOMING LEGISLATION (i) OPEN UP DISCUSSION WITH THE ATTORNEY GENERAL (ii) ESTABLISH THE VIRACITY OF A PARLIAMENTARY CALENDAR BEING CREATED	ONGOING
2.2	*STANDING ORDERS*				
A	Development of a series of sensitization workshops to assist MPs to use the Standing Orders.	[illegible]	Assignment launched using the Clerk to Parliament and the Second Deputy Speaker . However pressure of work has delayed the completion of the assignment therefore activity to the reviewed and new target completion date agreed.	Standing Orders are approved at the beginning of each new Parliament in this case November 2005. Therefore the work will focus on reviewing the current S/Orders and make recommendations through the Standing Orders Parliamentary Committee for changes to improve/strengthen the role of the MP and reduce the power of the Speaker. The funding will be through the development of new S/Orders which can be tabled as a comparative analysis document for the next Parliament in 2005.	Nov-04
C	Consideration of the impact of the current Standing Orders vis women/gender issues		Assignment launched using the Clerk to Parliament and the Second Deputy Speaker. However pressure of work has delayed the completion of the assignment therefore activity to the reviewed and new target completion date agreed.		Sep-04
2.3	*SOURCES OF COMMITTEE INFORMATION*				
(i)	Development of an MP- CSO/Public Policy Expert Directory & electronic d'base (I using POLIS)	Nov-04	LINKED TO Item 2.C.i above seems more prudent than create another directory also there Vice President's Office who is responsible for coordination of Civil Society initiatives in updating its Directory which would negate the need for a CSO Directory. The manual will effectively create an institutional memory of Committee deliberations and will provide MPs with both policy information and contacts with Civil Society and Ministries etc.	DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROFESSIONAL COMMITTEE MANUAL WHICH PARLIAMENT HAS ENDORSED AND ENGAGED RESEARCH	Nov-04
(iii)	Creation of a panel of public policy experts available to Parliament	Nov-04	ENTRY POINT COULD BE THROUGH THE RE-LAUNCHED PARLIAMENTARY RESEARCH SERVICE	WORK TO HELP THE RESEARCH SERVICE TO BECOME [illegible] IN NEW MEMBERS TO REQUIRE [illegible] CONSIDERATION FOR THE INTRODUCTION OF A SYSTEM OF [illegible]	Nov-04
(iv)	Explore the viability of involving Universities/mid career professionals in SUNY activities	Nov-04	DITTO	CONSIDERATION OF THE INTRODUCTION OF A SYSTEM OF [illegible] GROUP REVIEWS AGAIN TO BE EXPLORED WITH PARLIAMENT AND IF AGREED RESEARCH PERIOD, ARRANGE TO BE MADE THROUGH THE UNIVERSITY OF DAR ES SALAAM.	Nov-04
(v)	Review Parliament's views on the usefulness of the expert panel concept	Nov-04	DITTO	IN ABEYANCE PENDING PRIOR ACTIVITIES ABOVE	Nov-04
(vi)	Assess POLIS capability to enhance the electronic bill tracking/Acts management service & consider the possible impact on Parliamentary sitting time.	Nov-04	To form an integral part of the Standing Orders review Item 2.2.a above		Nov-04
2.4	*INCREASE ACCESS TO RESEARCH MATERIALS & SERVICES*	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TARGS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
A	Review of current Parliamentary Research Services provision & research tools currently available	Nov-04		(i) Proposal submitted to Parliament April 2004 and now in abeyance pending their approval or otherwise. (ii) TRAINING SCHEDULED FOR SEPTEMBER 2004	Sep-04
B	development of a multi faceted training programme for MPs about the importance of good quality research		INSPECTION OF THE PARLIAMENTARY LIBRARY REVEALS THAT IT WORFULLY OUT OF DATE WITH THE MOST UP TO DATE PUBLICATIONS BEING THE DAILY NEWSPAPERS. THIS MEANS THAT THE MPs ARE UNABLE TO UTILIZE A WELL STOCKED LIBRARY TO HELP THEM CONDUCT THEIR RESEARCH. THEREFORE A NUMBER OF INITIATIVES TO ASSIST THE MPs INCLUDE HELPING CSOS TO HAVE ADVANCE NOTICE OF FORTHCOMING BILLS SO THEY CAN PREPARE DETAILED RESEARCH WHICH CAN BE SUBMITTED TO THE COMMITTEES.	WORK IS NOW UNDERWAY TO HELP LINK UP CSOs IN THE NGO POLICY FORUM TO USE THEIR THEMATIC BILL ANALYSIS TEAMS BY LINKING INTO THE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEES IN ADVANCE OF DETAILED PLENARY DISCUSSIONS.	Sep-04
b	Study tour to well established Parliamentary research units i.e. Zambia, South Africa , India or Uganda.		all of the Research officers out of the country on attachment to another legislative body therefore the study tour has had to be deferred. Study tour now confirmed to be to Uganda.	STUDY TOUR TO UGANDA OFFERED [illegible]	Oct-04
c	assist Parliament to establish linkages with other research bodies & public service mnemonics i.e. Mof P for the econometric model.	Nov-04		RELATIONSHIP WITH KENYA & DEBT UNDER DEVELOPMENT AS WELL AS LEGEND ARRANGEMENTS IN INDIA	Oct-04

	RESULT THREE ENHANCED MANAGEMENT & ADMINISTRATION				
3.2	*INTERNSHIP PROGRAM*				
A	Establish links with the University of DSM and seek to attain academic accreditation for the internship program	APRIL-AUGUST 2004	DISCUSSIONS WITH UNIVERSITY OF DAR ES SALAAM ABOUT THE IDEA OF AWARDING ACADEMIC CREDITS FOR THE PARLIAMENTARY INTERNSHIP PROGRAM. HOWEVER IT WAS MADE CLEAR THAT SUCH CHANGES WOULD CAUSE MAJOR BUREAUCRATIC PROBLEMS WITHIN THE UNIVERSITY. THEREFORE IT WAS AGREED THAT TO ENSURE THAT THE PROGRAM DEADLINE WAS MET THAT ONLY FINALIST STUDENTS WOULD BE INVITED TO APPLY FOR THE PROGRAM.	FURTHER WORK WITH THE UNIVERSITY TO AGREE THE AWARD OF ACADEMIC CREDITS WILL BE EXPLORED TO BE USED IN ANY FUTURE ITERATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY INTERNSHIP PROGRAM. PARLIAMENT HAS INDICATED THAT THEY MAYBE WILLING TO RECRUIT/RE-ENGAGE SOME OF THE INTERNS FOR THE NEXT PARLIAMENTARY SESSION IN NOVEMBER 2004 TO SUPPORT THE COMMITTEE WORK AS THEY ANTICIPATE A HEAVY LEGISLATIVE PROGRAM.	Sep-04
3.3	In light of the work underway within the EAPI (East African Parliamentary Institute) consider whether the creation of a central training unit within Parliament is feasible/required by Parliament.	[illegible]	As originally conceived, it was envisaged that the need to institutionalize training & enhancement of skills for both MPs and staff would help encourage a greater degree of professionalism amongst the target groups. However since 2002 there have been a greater appreciation of the need for the x3 East African countries (Tanzania, Kenya and Uganda) that all share a common legislative organ based on the Westminster model to establish fora to meet and shares ideas and practices.	FOLLOWING THE EAPI CONFERENCE HELD IN ARUSHA IN APRIL 2004 THE WORK IS UNDERWAY WITHIN THE X4 EA PARLIAMENTS TO USE THE EAPI AS THE REPOSITORY FOR INFORMATION SHARING AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT. THE INITIATIVE IS BEING TAKEN FORWARD AT CLERK TO PARLIAMENT LEVEL.	ONGOING
	RESULT FOUR: MORE EFFECTIVE OVERSIGHT				
4.1	*AMPLIFY THE ROLE OF PARLIAMENT IN THE NATIONAL BUDGET PROCESS & PUBLIC EXPENDITURE.*	ORIGINAL TARGET COMPLETION DATE	PROGRESS REPORT	NEW TASKS	NEW TARGET COMPLETION DATE
A	Assess the general level of budget performance analysis currently available	[illegible]	FIRST STAGE ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:	BESPOKE TRAINING WORKSHOPS TO BE REPEATED SHORTLY BEFORE THE NOVEMBER 2004 SESSION	Oct-04
B	Design briefing sessions for MPs on Public Expenditure Reviews & annual Auditor General reports		WORKING WITH THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE A DRAFT LETTER WAS PREPARED AND SUBMITTED TO THE WORLD BANK COUNTRY REPRESENTATIVE WITH A PLEA FOR SUPPORT TO ENABLE THE PAC TO BE OVER EFFECTIVE IN UNDERTAKING ITS KEY SCRUTINY/OVERSIGHT ROLE.	THROUGH THE EAPI THE TANZANIAN PAC IS NOW A MEMBER OF THE NEWLY ESTABLISHED EA COALITION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEES. THERE ARE NOW STRONG LINKS WITH THE SADCOPAC GROUP WHO WILL BE HOLDING THEIR ANNUAL MEETING IN TANZANIA IN JUNE 2004. A LETTER FORMALLY OPENING UP DISCUSSIONS WITH THE CONTROLLER AUDITOR GENERAL HAS BEEN ISSUED AND WORK TO SEEK TO DEMYSTIFY THE ROLE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL THROUGH BRIEFINGS AND A GREATER UNDERSTANDING OF THE ROLE OF THE NAO IS UNDER DEVELOPMENT.	Jun-04
C	Develop a seminar aimed at explaining/exploring the impact of the Poverty Reduction Strategy in Tanzania.		FIRST STAGE ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:	PARLIAMENTARIANS HAVE ASKED FOR FURTHER BRIEFING BY CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS.	Aug-04
D	Design briefing sessions for MPs on HIPC, International Agreements and Treaties.		FORMAL RELATIONSHIP WITH IMF NOW ESTABLISHED AND A BRIEFING SESSION ON INTERNATIONAL LOANS ETC IS PLANNED AFTER THE BUDGET SESSION 2004.	ADVISORY PANEL TO PROVIDE SUPPORT INTO THE PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE ON FINANCE & ECONOMIC AFFAIRS ON MACRO ECONOMIC POLICY ISSUES IN PREPARATION OF THE WORLD BANK/IMF CONFERENCE.	Oct-04
E	Design briefing sessions for MPs on the interface between Parliament & Local Councils via decentralization.		FORMAL APPROACH FOR ASSISTANCE RECEIVED FROM THE CHAIRPERSON OF THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (LAAC) FOR ASSISTANCE IN UNDERSTANDING THE COMMITTEE'S SCRUTINY ROLE RECEIVED AND WORK TO DEVISE A WORKSHOP FOR THE COMMITTEE IS UNDERWAY.	TRAINING PROGRAM TO BE DESIGNED AND DELIVERED TO THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE. LINKS INTO THE AUDITOR GENERAL'S OFFICE ESTABLISHED.	01/10/2004
F	Design briefing sessions for MPs on the role of the MoF on the disbursement of donor funds/loans and grants.		FIRST LEVEL ACTION COMPLETE MAY 2004:	[illegible]	Nov-04
G	Develop a workshop on anti-corruption/fraud avoidance in the Public Sector.		FORMAL MOU BETWEEN APNAC & TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL REACHED ON 21 JULY 2004	AREAS OF RESEARCH WHERE THEY WANT TO ASSESS WHETHER THERE IS CORRUPTION MOST RELATE TO PRIVATISATIONS AND THUS THE FIRST LEVEL OF RESEARCH WILL BE TO ASSESS THE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK WHICH ENGINEERS THE PRIVATISATION PROCESSES.	01/09/2004 ONGOING
H	Creation of a panel of MS budgetary experts who can be called upon to help MPs examine and assess draft estimates	[illegible]	FIRST LEVEL ACTION COMPLETE APRIL 2004:	CHAIRPERSON HAS ASKED FOR THE PANEL TO REMAIN IN PLACE TO PROVIDE ASSISTANCE IN THE NOVEMBER 2004 PARLIAMENTARY SESSION.	Oct-04
I	Discuss with the Finance Committee Chairperson the concept of the creation of a Parliamentary Budget Office similar to that in Uganda & South Africa		CHAIRPERSON OF COMMITTEE ON F&EA ADVISES THAT THIS IS PLANNED AND LIKELY TO BE FUNDED BY WORLD BANK AND WILL INCLUDE A VISIT TO BOTH UGANDA & KENYA	AS PART OF BRIEFING FOR THE FORTHCOMING STUDY TOUR COPIES OF THE PARLIAMENT OF UGANDA BUDGET ACT 2001 DISTRIBUTED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS	YET TO BE AGREED
4.2	*POLITICIANS OF THE FUTURE PROGRAM*				
A	Explore the mechanics of broadening the scope of the "Politicians of the Future" programme	[illegible]		SUNY activity no independent impact assessments have been conducted on the POF program since its inception. Therefore as part of the cross cutting gender issues in the Workplan SUNY intends conducting that assessment.	Oct-04
B	preparation of a strategic plan for the women's caucus in preparation for the 2005 elections (complementary to the UNDP activities)		IN ABEYANCE		
C	devise initiatives to ensure the women's caucus are well versed in Parliamentary practice & procedures.	[illegible]	BC HELD A WORKSHOP ON THE PVR (permanent voters register) IN JULY 2004		Aug-04
D	training for women MPs on design/writing of proposals to attract micro finance projects in their constituencies	[illegible]	BC HAVE SCHEDULED THIS ACTIVITY FOR OCTOBER 2004		Aug-04
E	Extension of the networking initiatives between women MPs in Tanzania to other East African legislatures.		IN ABEYANCE		

PUBLIC PERCEPTIONS ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE IN TANZANIA

By Amon Chaligha, Bob Mattes and Annie Dzenga

May 2004

We are grateful to the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs for funding this project.

PUBLIC PERCEPTIONS ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE IN TANZANIA
A REPORT BASED ON THE 2003 AFROBAROMETER SURVEY

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

There were no major political developments in Tanzania since the Round 1 Afrobarometer survey in 2001, except the Chama cha Mapinduzi (CCM) and the Civic United Front (CUF) political accord that made it possible to hold by-elections in 19 constituencies in Pemba.[1] The CCM/CUF accord is particularly important for the people of Zanzibar for it has normalized the political situation and calmed down political tempers. This second round Afrobarometer Report, asked people's opinions about democracy, markets and good governance. The report also compares the second round opinions with the first round in order to gauge and track differences in opinion if any. The main focus of this report is however on citizens' perceptions of the quality of democracy in Tanzania.

In order for democracy to nurture and sustain, there must be a clear citizen demand for democracy. Citizens must always be willing to demand for democratic institutions and practice while clearly rejecting non-democratic alternatives. The second Afrobarometer survey in Tanzania measured the demand for democracy in three different ways. First, by assessing the extent to which Tanzanians reject non-democratic alternatives for governing their country. Second, the demand for democracy is measured by examining popular support for democracy and finally by assessing the extent to which Tanzanians support key procedural elements of democracy.

It can be discerned from the findings that most people reject one party rule with only about one third still nostalgic about the old days of single party rule that dominated the politics of Tanzania for close to three decades. Moreover, a big majority reject personalized rule, specifically rule by chiefs or elders. Furthermore, four in five Tanzanians reject military rule in Tanzania while four in five people reject one-man rule. These results can be translated to mean that there is a high demand for democracy and democratic institutions in Tanzania.

Despite the high demand for democracy, there are worrying developments. It is particularly worrying that the number of people supporting democracy is declining in Tanzania. For example where as in 2001 eight in ten Tanzanians or 84 percent said democracy was the best form of government, in 2003 only close to two thirds (65 percent) of all respondents said that democracy is the best form of government.

Respondents were also asked to choose between two statements: that political parties are divisive and should be ignored and that many political parties are needed (a choice between multipartism and no party). A substantial majority (67 percent) say that many political parties are needed.

The Tanzanian constitution provides for a two-term presidency. However, there have been some voices (albeit weak and underground) demanding the constitution to be

[1] After the 2000 presidential elections in Zanzibar the CUF disputed the results which culminated in clashes between the Police and CUF followers. At least 21 people lost their lives and the CUF boycotted the Parliament and the House of Representatives. To end the stalemate CUF and CCM leaders reached a political accord known in Tanzania as the 'Mwafaka'.

amended to scrap the two-term limit for Tanzanian presidents. In this Afrobarometer Round we found it expedient to test the opinion of Tanzanians regarding this proposition. When faced with this choice of no term limits for president or two terms only for the Tanzanian President, nearly three quarters (74 percent) of all respondents said they supported limits for the presidency to two terms only. This may be a demand for limitations on absolute power, and insistence that the President respect the law and the constitution.

Afrobarometer assessed citizen satisfaction with democracy in Tanzania by looking at extent of their participation, political freedoms and perceptions of rule of law. Thus, Tanzanians were asked to evaluate the extent of democracy by asking them how democratic Tanzania was. Overall, eight in ten Tanzanians (81 percent) said Tanzania was a democracy. However, they conceded that Tanzania was not a full democracy; with half the respondents (50 percent) saying Tanzania was a democracy with minor problems. Only 12 percent said Tanzania was a full democracy, while 19 percent said it was a democracy with major problems. A small minority (8 percent) said Tanzania was not a democracy. However, it may be noted that only 12 percent now believe that Tanzania is a full democracy compared to 17 percent in 2001 who by then believed that Tanzania was a full democracy.

Democracy can only thrive and survive where citizens take an active role in the governance of their country. Indeed, the extent of democracy is reflected in their active participation in the governance of their country. Tanzanians have a high penchant for politics and this is indicated by the fact that a sizeable majority or about 67 percent of those interviewed said they discuss politics, with 36 percent saying they discuss politics a lot. Their activeness in politics is corroborated by the fact that over eight in ten (83 percent) of those interviewed said they attend community meetings, with nearly half (48 percent), reporting attending a community meeting several times. Moreover, a sizeable majority (84 percent) has interest in public affairs. The majority of those interviewed (76 percent) say that they can make elected representatives listen to them. This attitude is important for democracy because it means citizens believe they can make their elected leaders accountable.

Another form of political participation is citizen contact of their leadership. The survey wanted to know the extent to which citizens consult their leadership. The findings indicate that Tanzanians are more likely to consult local government officials (42 percent) than central government officials (33 percent). This is an improvement when compared to 2001 when only 29 percent contacted local government officials. However, most Tanzanians (56 percent) would rather contact a religious leader than a political party leader (only 34 percent contacted a political party leader) or a traditional ruler (27 percent).

Despite the upward trend in leadership consultations between 2001 and 2003, the Member of Parliament is still the least consulted public leader, with only 19 percent confirming contact with their parliamentarian. In 2001 only 12 percent consulted their Member of Parliament. A big majority (80 percent) never contacts their Member of Parliament. Of interest though is the increase of 15 percent more who reported consulting traditional leaders in 2003. There has also been more than a 50 percent rise in the citizen political party consultation jumping from 13 percent in 2001 to 34 percent in 2003.

To evaluate the extent of democracy in Tanzania, respondents were asked about their freedom of expression, freedom of association, arbitrary arrests, voting freedom and equality before the law.

It may also be pointed out that 77 percent of the respondents feel that the condition of voting freedom is now better than in the past. Indeed a third thinks that voting freedom is now much better than under the one party system. However, less than half of those interviewed (48 percent) feel that their influence on government decisions is still limited. Only 35 percent say their influence on the government is better under the current regime than under the single party system.

Despite the positive evaluation of free speech, freedom of association, and electoral freedoms, people appear to be worried. There has been a slight decline in the proportion of people who believe they can speak their mind as they wish, from 77 percent in 2001 to 76 in 2003. Whilst the same number (81 percent) of respondents still believe they can join any organization of their choice, a slightly lower number (77 percent) in 2003 believe that each person can freely choose who to vote for compared to 79 percent in 2001.

Satisfaction with the political leadership may have a bearing on legitimacy and consequently support for democracy. A leadership that appears to listen and is willing to help solve the problems of their citizens is likely to gain their support. President Mkapa still enjoys a very high performance approval with 84 percent saying they are satisfied with his performance. This rating is however slightly lower than that of 2001 (90 percent). Nevertheless, the Tanzanian president still has much higher approval rates among the elected leaders.

Levels of perceived corruption differ among public agencies and officials. About 44 percent of the Tanzanian respondents perceive the Police to be the most corrupt public institution in the country. This situation undermines the integrity and efficiency of the police force, tarnishing the image of the government among citizens. Unlike the police, the level of perceived corruption among the custodians of the law in 2003 is much higher than the level of perceived corruption of 64 percent recorded in 2001. Furthermore, there has also been a drop in the level of perceived corruption among civil servants from 82 percent in 2001 to 67 percent in 2003.

It appears that popular opposition to non-democratic alternatives in Tanzania is waning in all options except that of one party rule which has stayed the same. However, it is worrying that support for some non-democratic alternatives is picking up especially support for traditional rule which has gone up. Rejection of military rule has also declined from 96 percent in 2001 to 87 percent and that of one man rule from 92 percent in 2001 to 86 percent in 2003. The sharp drop in support for democracy indicate that people are taking democracy for granted perhaps because of the domineering ruling party which has been in power for more than three decades. The lack of serious competition from the opposition parties seems to cultivate negative attitudes to democracy in Tanzania. These developments are worth noting and corrective measures should be taken, particularly by tackling those economic reforms that hurt people the most and level the ground for political party competition.

PUBLIC PERCEPTIONS ON DEMOCRACY AND GOVERNANCE IN TANZANIA
A REPORT BASED ON THE 2003 AFROBAROMETER SURVEY

Introduction

Economic and political reforms can only be sustained if they are rooted in society. Often there are complaints that outsiders introduce from above and often through agitation reforms. Hence the intended beneficiaries of these changes would hesitate to support them because they were not consulted in the first place. The backbone of democracy, pluralist politics and a plural economy, can only be consolidated and sustained if there is a sizeable population, which demands and supports democratic ideals in any given society.

Following the 2000 elections, one of the major stakeholders in the election in Zanzibar, the Civic United Front (CUF) disputed the results and in the ensuing protests almost 31 people lost their lives. In 2002 the CUF and Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM) had roundtable discussions that resulted in the political accord (Muafaka) which has brought back peace and harmony in Tanzania as a whole and Zanzibar in particular.

There are no major political developments in Tanzania since the 1st Afrobarometer report in 2001, except the CCM and CUF political accord that made it possible to hold by-elections in 19 constituencies in Pemba. This second round Afrobarometer Report, the first after the accord, asked people's opinions about democracy, markets and good governance. Hence the report also compares the second round opinions with the first round in order to gauge and track differences in opinion if any. This report analyzes the results of a second public opinion survey conducted in Tanzania in June 2003, both for Mainland Tanzania and for Zanzibar. The main focus of this report is however on citizens' perceptions of the quality of democracy in Tanzania.

Methodology

A nationally representative sample of 1,223 Tanzanians (both mainland and Zanzibar) was interviewed between June and July in 2003. A random sample of this size allows a confidence level of 95 percent and a margin of error of plus or minus 3 percent. The survey was conducted in all the regions of the country with the number of interviewees in each region being proportional to the region's population size (See Appendix 1). The survey targeted citizens above the age of 18 years and the sample was gender balanced with half male and half female respondents. Furthermore, 30 percent of the respondents were drawn from urban areas and the remaining 70 percent were drawn from rural areas. All the interviews were conducted in Kiswahili.

Demand for Democracy in Tanzania

Tanzania is still a democracy in transition despite holding her first multi-party elections in thirty years in 1995 and second multiparty elections in October 2000. This second round Afrobarometer study reviews the attitudes of Tanzanians towards democracy. We work on the assumptions that: democracy cannot be consolidated and sustained unless a country possesses citizens who have a keen interest in politics and who are also active participants committed to democratic principles. If necessary these citizens should be willing to stand up and defend democratic ideals (competitive elections, freedom of association, free press, a multi-party political system).

In order for democracy to nurture and sustain, there must be a clear citizen demand for democracy. Citizens must always demand for democratic institutions and practice while clearly rejecting non-democratic alternatives. The second Afrobarometer survey in Tanzania measured the demand for democracy in three different ways. First, by assessing the extent to which Tanzanians reject non-democratic alternatives for governing their country. Second, the demand for democracy is measured by examining popular support for democracy and finally by assessing the extent to which Tanzanians support key procedural elements of democracy.

Rejecting Non-Democratic Alternatives

Citizen rejection of alternatives to democracy can be perceived as a demand for democracy. People who yearn for democracy would not be willing to support its alternatives. In this Afrobarometer survey, Tanzanians were asked to give their opinion on alternatives to a system of democratic governance, that is, a government with regular elections and many political parties. In particular, Tanzanian citizens were asked whether political parties should be abolished (support for one party rule), whether elections should be abolished (one man rule) and whether they would approve of rule by the army. Opinion was also sought on whether all major decisions should be made by chiefs or elders. Furthermore, respondents were also asked whether the National Assembly should make laws or whether the president should make them.

Table 1. Rejection of Non-Democratic Alternatives (percentages)

	Strongly Approve	Approve	Neither	Disapprove	Strongly Disapprove	Don't Know
Only one political party is allowed to stand for election and hold office	12.0	17.0	7.0	25.0	38.0	1.0
All decisions are made by a council of chiefs or elders	4.0	9.0	10.0	33.0	40.0	4.0
The army comes in to rule the country	2.0	4.0	5.0	28.0	59.0	2.0
Elections and Parliament are abolished so that the President can decide everything	2.0	4.0	6.0	28.0	58.0	2.0

There are many ways to govern a country. Would you disapprove or approve of the following alternatives?

A sizeable majority of Tanzanians (63 percent) reject one party rule. Thus, only about one third are still nostalgic about the old days of single party rule that dominated the politics of Tanzania for close to three decades. Moreover, a big majority (73 percent)

reject personalized rule, specifically rule by chiefs or elders. Under the colonial government Chiefs were recognized as indirect rulers. These results probably reflect the fact that the position of chiefs was abolished soon after independence in 1961. Furthermore, four in five (87 percent) respondents reject military rule in Tanzania. The army has never ruled Tanzanians and they clearly do not want to be ruled by the military.

Finally, four in five (86 percent) reject one-man rule in Tanzania. Hence the majority of the people interviewed reject the idea that parliament should be abolished and the president be allowed to decide every thing. These results can be translated to mean that there is a high demand for democracy and democratic institutions in Tanzania.

Table 2: Rejection of Non-Democratic Alternatives, 2001-2003

	2001	2003
One party rule	62	63
Traditional rule (chiefs or elders)	89	73
Military rule	96	87
Strong (One)-man rule	92	86

Popular opposition to non-democratic alternatives in Tanzania is waning in all options except that of one party rule. The percent who reject one party rule is statistically the same as in round one. Nevertheless, the rejection of other non-democratic alternatives is still high. However, it is worrying that support for these non-democratic alternatives is picking up especially support for traditional rule which has gone up by 16 percent. Thus, where as in 2001 89 percent of the respondents rejected traditional rule, in 2003 only 73 percent rejected traditional rule. Rejection of military rule has also declined from 96 percent in 2001 to 87 percent and that of one-man rule from 92 percent in 2001 to 86 percent in 2003.

Table 3: Rejection of Non-Democratic Alternatives in Afrobarometer Countries 2003 (%)

	Reject Military Rule	**Reject Traditional Rule**	**Reject Strongman Rule**	**Reject One-Party Rule**
Botswana	79	50	85	68
Cabo Verde	75	--	67	79
Ghana	83	69	82	79
Kenya	92	59	90	75
Lesotho	85	50	82	61
Malawi	84	49	78	66
Mali	65	44	66	71
Mozambique	54	32	41	47
Namibia	52	46	58	55
Nigeria	68	61	71	79
Senegal	75	45	77	76
South Africa	77	63	73	67
Tanzania	**87**	**73**	**86**	**63**
Uganda	85	48	90	53
Zambia	95	72	90	72
15-country Mean	77	50	76	67

Tanzania is amongst the leading countries that reject military rule (87 percent). However, Zambia has a much higher population rejecting military rule (95 percent) followed by Kenya (92 percent). Similarly, big majorities both in Uganda (85 percent), Lesotho (84 percent), Ghana (83 percent) and Nigeria (81 percent) also reject military rule. In this category Namibia with only 64 percent appears to be the least among those who reject military rule as a form of governance.

Regarding the rejection of strongman rule, Tanzania at 86 percent lags behind Uganda with 90 percent rejection, perhaps because of their bitter experience with strongmen leadership in that country. Table 3 also shows that there is a strong rejection of strongman rule in both Ghana (82 percent) and Lesotho (82 percent). However, Cabo Verde is lagging behind (67 percent) in the rejection of strongman rule.

Rejection of traditional rule in Tanzania is still much higher than her neighbour Uganda and Lesotho, where only 48 percent and 50 percent of the population respectively reject traditional rule. Nevertheless, when it comes to rejection of one party rule, only Mozambique at 47 percent beats Uganda (53 percent) among the least countries rejecting one party rule. On the other hand Cabo Verde (79 percent), Ghana (79 percent) and Nigeria lead countries rejecting one party rule. Thus, Tanzanians are far more likely than those in other Afrobarometer countries to reject military rule, traditional rule, and strongman rule, but less likely to reject one party rule.

Support for Democracy

Support for democracy was measured by asking Tanzanians an attitudinal question: "Which of these three statements is closest to your own opinion? A: Democracy is preferable to any other kind of government; B: In some circumstances, a non democratic government can be preferable; Or C: For someone like me, it does not matter what kind of government we have."

Table 4. Support for Democracy, 2001-2003

	2001	2003
Democracy preferable	84	65
Non Democratic government preferable in certain situations	12	13
Does not matter what kind of government we have	5	10
Don't know	-	12

Which of these three statements is closest to your own opinion? A: Democracy is preferable to any other form of government. B: In certain situations, a non-democratic government can be preferable. C; For people like me, it doesn't matter what form of government we have.

Close to two thirds (65 percent) of all respondents say that democracy is the best form of government. It is worrying that the number of people supporting democracy is declining in Tanzania (2001 eight in ten Tanzanians or 84 percent) said democracy was the best form of government. Perhaps people are disillusioned with a multiparty system that is still dominated by the ruling party and apparently disunited and ever-squabbling opposition parties.

Table 5: ***Support for Democracy, Cross-National Comparisons (percentage***

	2001 Support for democracy	2003 Support for democracy
Ghana	77	82*
Kenya	-	80
Uganda	80	75
Senegal	-	75
Mali	60	71
Zambia	74	70
Nigeria	81	67
Botswana	83	66
Cabo Verde	-	66
Tanzania	84	65
Malawi	66	64
South Africa	60	57
Namibia	60	54
Mozambique	-	53
Lesotho	39	50

In your opinion, how much of a democracy is Tanzania today?

It appears that where there has been regime change support for democracy has increased. Thus support for democracy has gone up in Ghana from 77 percent in the first Afrobarometer survey to 82 percent in the second Afrobarometer survey in 2003. There has also been regime change in Lesotho which has raised support for democracy from 39 percent in the first Afrobarometer survey to 50 percent in the second Afrobarometer survey in 2003.

On the other hand, there has not been regime change in Tanzania and Uganda. Support for democracy in these two countries has also waned a little bit from 80 percent in Uganda in the first Afrobarometer survey to 74 percent in the second Afrobarometer survey in 2003. Similarly, in Tanzania support for democracy has declined from 84 percent in the first Afrobarometer survey in 2001 to 65 percent in the second Afrobarometer survey in 2003.

Support for Democratic Processes

Support for democracy is also measured by gauging people's commitments to key components of democratic processes. Thus support for democracy was measured by giving respondents options of choosing between choices that represent democracy and those which do not. Citizens were asked to choose between elections and other methods of picking leaders, such as stating their preferences for either a one party system or for many political parties, no term limits for the presidency versus a two term limitation only and whether the National Assembly should make laws or whether the president should make the laws instead, that is, rule by decree.

Table 6. Choosing Democratic Alternatives (percentages)

	Strongly Approve	Approve	Neither	Disapprove	Strongly Disapprove	Don't Know
Choose leaders through elections vs. other methods	50.0	27.0	1.0	9.0	12.0	1.0
Many parties needed vs. Political parties divisive (not needed)	24.0	43.0	3.0	13.0	16.0	1.0
Two terms only vs. no term limits for president	49.0	25.0	4.0	10.0	11.0	1.0
National Assembly makes laws vs. president does	43.0	23.0	9.0	11.0	9.0	5.0

In a democracy, elections constitute the basis for choosing leaders, with citizens given an opportunity to decide who amongst them should be their leader. Hence, to gauge their demand for democracy, Tanzanians were asked to make a choice between choosing leaders through elections or through other methods. More than ¾ of all respondents (77 percent) supported choosing leaders through elections, with half the respondents (50 percent) agreeing very strongly to choose their leaders through elections.

In Tanzania, candidates for all ward councillors, members of parliament or presidential elections have to be political party members nominated by a fully registered political party. Respondents were therefore asked to choose between two statements: that political parties are divisive and should be ignored and that many political parties are needed (a choice between multipartism and no party). Perhaps because of nostalgia, still close to three in ten (more than a quarter or 29 percent) of all respondents still support a no party system. However, a substantial majority (67 percent) say that many political parties are needed. Such choices can be translated to mean that Tanzanian's demand for democracy is undisputable.

Democratic governance also discourages strongman rule, where an individual gets life tenure in public office, like life term presidents. Such leaders have a tendency to be dictators. The Tanzanian constitution provides for a two-term presidency. However, there have been some voices (albeit weak and underground) demanding the constitution to be amended to scrap the two-term limit for Tanzanian presidents. In this Afrobarometer Round we found it expedient to test the opinion of Tanzanians regarding this proposition. When faced with this choice of no term limits for president or two terms only for the Tanzanian President, nearly three quarters (74 percent) of all respondents said they supported limits for the presidency to two terms only. Indeed, nearly half (49 percent) of all respondents strongly supported the two term limits, another clear indication of a high demand for democracy in Tanzania.

In all democracies, elected representatives such as Members of Parliament (National Assembly) make the laws. Tanzanians were also asked whether such people's representatives should make the laws or whether their president should make laws (rule by decree). Two thirds or abut 66 percent of the respondents preferred their parliament (National Assembly) to make laws and not their president.

Extent of Democracy in Tanzania

Democracy is an imperative precursor for any country that struggles for sustained social, economic and political development. The more democracy a country enjoys the greater are the possibilities of realizing sustainable development. Hence democracy has to be institutionalized through political institutions, the Constitution and other laws of the land. Democracy should also be a lived experience by both citizens as well as political and other government leaders. Citizens have to be satisfied with the extent of democracy in their country in order for them to support and sustain it. Thus, the Afrobarometer assessed citizen satisfaction with democracy in Tanzania by looking at extent of their participation, political freedoms and perceptions of rule of law.

Tanzanians were asked to evaluate the extent of democracy by asking them how democratic Tanzania was. Overall, eight in ten Tanzanians (81 percent) said Tanzania was a democracy. However, they conceded that Tanzania was not a full democracy; with half the respondents (50 percent) saying Tanzania was a democracy with minor problems. Only 12 percent said Tanzania was a full democracy, while 19 percent said it was a democracy with major problems. A small minority (8 percent) said Tanzania was not a democracy.

Practicing democracy is indicative of support for democracy. Support for democracy can be discerned in various ways. When the survey asked: "How much of a democracy is Tanzania today?" About 81 percent believe that Tanzania is a democracy although hi-cups exist here and there. Only 8 percent say Tanzania is not a democracy. However, it may be noted that only 12 percent now believe that Tanzania is a full democracy compared to 17 percent in 2001 who by then believed that Tanzania was a full democracy.

The extent of democracy was also measured by asking people whether they were satisfied with the supply of democracy in Tanzania. A sizeable majority (62 percent) said they were satisfied with democracy. However, only 18 percent were very satisfied compared to 44 percent who were only fairly satisfied. A rather high proportion, a quarter of the respondents (25 percent) were not satisfied with the supply of democracy in Tanzania.

Political Freedom

Political freedom expresses the extent to which democracy has taken root in a society. Limited freedoms indicate limited democracy. Likewise, if society enjoys wide varieties of freedoms, democracy also thrives. To evaluate the extent of democracy in Tanzania, respondents were asked about their freedom of expression, freedom of association, arbitrary arrests, voting freedom and equality before the law.

Table 7: Extent of Political Freedom (percentages)

	Better	Much better	Same	Worse	Much Worse	Don't know
Freedom to say what you think	53	23	11	8	3	4
Freedom to join any organization	52	29	11	3	1	4
Fear of unjust arrest	42	16	19	13	3	7
Voting freedom	46	31	13	6	2	2
Ability to influence government	35	13	19	19	8	6
Safety from crime and violence	34	9	18	26	10	3
Equal treatment for all	37	10	23	18	8	4

Let us compare the present system of government and the past one party system. Is the present system better, much better, same, worse or much worse (percentages of all respondents)

Table 7 indicates that over three in four Tanzanians interviewed (76 percent) feel that there is now more freedom of speech, with more than half (53 percent) saying the condition of freedom of speech is now better than under the one party system. Moreover, eight in ten people (81 percent), say there is now more freedom of association than in the past. This can be corroborated with the fact that there are now 17 fully registered political parties in Tanzania and more than 800 registered NGO's and civil societies. 58 percent are of the opinion that they do not fear arbitrary arrests.

It may also be pointed out that 77 percent of the respondents feel that the condition of voting freedom is now better than in the past. Indeed a third thinks that voting freedom is now much better than under the one party system. However, less than half of those interviewed (48 percent) feel that their influence on government decisions is still limited. Only 35 percent say their influence on the government is better under the current regime than under the single party system.

Table 8: Extent of Political Freedom (percentages) 2001-2003

	2001	2003
People are free to say what they think	77	76
People can join any organization they choose	81	81
Each person can freely choose who to vote for	79	77

Despite the positive evaluation of free speech, freedom of association, and electoral freedoms, people appear to be worried. There has been a slight decline in the proportion of people who believe they can speak their mind as they wish, from 77 percent in 2001 to 76 in 2003. Whilst the same number (81 percent) of respondents still believe they can join any organization of their choice, a slightly lower number (77 percent) in 2003 believe that each person can freely choose who to vote for compared to 79 percent in 2001.

Security from crime and violence is not very satisfactory with only 43 percent of the population saying security is now better. However, only 36 percent say that crime is worse now than under the one party system, 18 percent say it's the same. Furthermore, less than half (47 percent) of the respondents are felt that equal treatment for all citizens is now better than in the past. Indeed, nearly a quarter (26 percent) of the respondents is

of the opinion that equality in the treatment of citizens is now worse than under the single party system.

Political Participation

Democracy can only thrive and survive where citizens take an active role in the governance of their country. Indeed, the extent of democracy is reflected in their active participation in the governance of their country. Governance in this instance also includes decision making in economy and politics. Taking an active role means effective participation in voting, consulting the leadership and community based participation (participation in community affairs).

Tanzanians have a high interest for politics and this is indicated by the fact that a sizeable majority or about 67 percent of those interviewed said they discuss politics, with 36 percent saying they discuss politics a lot. Their activeness in politics is corroborated by the fact that over eight in ten (83 percent) of those interviewed said they attend community meetings, with nearly half (48 percent), reporting attending a community meeting several times. Moreover, a sizeable majority (84 percent) has interest in public affairs. Nevertheless, almost one in four Tanzanians, (38 percent) find politics and government too complicated. What is amazing however is that the majority (76 percent) say they can make elected representatives listen to them.

The high penchant for politics encourages Tanzanians to join others to raise an issue. Hence, a substantial majority (69 percent) report joining others to raise an issue. However, a sizeable majority does not participate in protest politics. They do not attend demonstrations or protest marches. Their support for democracy is however impeccable, with a big majority (81 percent) affirming that they would never use force or violence for a political cause. This confirms the view that most Tanzanians are a peaceful people who are unlikely to resort to violence for political causes.

Table 9. Consulting the Leadership (percentage citing at least one contact)

	2001	2003
Local government official / Councilor	29	42
Other influential person	26	32
Religious leader	49	56
Member of Parliament	12	19
Traditional ruler	12	27
Political party official	13	34
Central government official	9	33

During the past year, how often have you contacted any of the following persons for help to solve a problem or to give them your views?

Another form of political participation is citizen contact of their leadership. Citizen consultation of government leaders is important if they are to feel close to their government and support decisions made by it. Hence, the survey wanted to know the extent to which citizens consult their leadership by asking them: "In the past one year, how often have you contacted any of the following persons for help to solve a problem?" Table 9 indicates that Tanzanians are more likely to consult local government officials (42 percent) than central government officials (33 percent). This is an improvement when

compared to 2001 when only 29 percent contacted local government officials. However, most Tanzanians (56 percent) would rather contact a religious leader than a political party leader (only 34 percent contacted a political party leader) or a traditional ruler (27 percent).

Despite the upward trend in leadership consultations between 2001 and 2003, the Member of Parliament is still the least consulted public leader, with only 19 percent confirming contact with their parliamentarian. In 2001 only 12 percent consulted their Member of Parliament. A big majority (80 percent) never contact their Member of Parliament. Another category of the least contacted people is the traditional leader with only 27 percent contacting them, leaving a big majority (70 percent) not contacting them. Of interest though is the increase of 15 percent more who reported consulting traditional leaders in 2003. There has also been more than a 50 percent rise in the citizen political party consultation jumping from 13 percent in 2001 to 34 percent in 2003.

As with all the countries in the Afrobarometer survey, Tanzanians are no different when it comes to contacting officials. They are in the upper range (five countries in the 23-27 percent range) that reports the highest figures of people contacting leaders. The 15 country mean for people reporting contacting leaders is 17. However, Tanzania reports the highest figure on those who have participated in protest activities, 35 percent. In the East African region, Kenya reports 21 percent and Uganda 12 percent only.

Table 10: Cross National Comparison: Political participation 2003

	**Contacting officials	***Mass action
Ghana	15	11
Kenya	23	21
Uganda	25	12
Senegal	19	21
Mali	14	11
Zambia	18	11
Nigeria	13	23
Botswana	13	23
Cabo Verde	12	17
Tanzania	27	35
Malawi	24	9
South Africa	8	26
Namibia	10	20
Mozambique	12	14
Lesotho	25	13

**Contacting officials is the mean compiled from contacting local councilors, members of parliament, government officials, religious leaders, traditional rulers, political party officials and influential persons.
***% reported are those who attended a demonstration or protest or used violence for a political cause.

Extent of State Legitimacy

A government that delivers on its promises of democracy, goods and services to its population is usually supported by the population. The legitimacy and trust that a government enjoys from the population is indicative of its efficacy. Herein, the people must be able to perceive their government as representing their values and aspirations. Such a government is normally able to make binding decisions that all citizens respect.

In the Round 2 survey, the Afrobarometer measured the legitimacy of government by assessing citizen opinion on the Constitution, the Police, the Courts and tax departments. All these are government structures that require the trust of society, if any government is to be effective in its responsibilities to society.

Afrobarometer in this second round measured state legitimacy by asking pertinent questions about the way political authority is organized and exercised in Tanzania. Questions raised on the legitimacy of the Tanzanian State and their responses are summarized in table 10. Respondents were asked: Do citizens consider the constitution to express the values and aspirations of Tanzanians? Do the police always have the right to make people obey the law? Do the courts have the right to make decisions that people always have to abide by? And does the tax department always have the right to make people pay taxes?

Table 11. Citizen perceptions on the legitimacy of the state (percentages)

	Strongly Agree	Agree	Neither	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Don't Know
Our constitution expresses the values and aspirations of the people of Tanzania	14	43	10	10	5	18
The courts have the right to make decisions that people always have to abide by	19	49	14	10	4	4
The police always have the right to make people obey the law	20	46	15	11	6	3
The tax department always has the right to make people pay taxes	16	41	15	14	9	5

For each of the following statements, please tell me whether you agree or disagree.

The 57 percent in table 11 who say the constitution expresses the values of society is quite low compared to other countries. Moreover, this number is much lower than that of 2001 when the constitution enjoyed a much higher level (70 percent) of legitimacy among the population. Intellectuals and the opposition in Tanzania have always asked the government to review the constitution and it appears that they are making positive impressions on society regarding their perceived inadequacy of the constitution. Courts on the other hand appear to enjoy a much higher level of legitimacy with two thirds (68 percent) of the population agreeing that courts have the right to make decisions that people always have to abide by.

A substantial majority (66 percent) of the respondents also hold the view that the police have the right to make people obey the law. This means that the police enjoy a much higher level of legitimacy than the constitution. The feelings of citizens on the right to tax them are identical to their feelings on the constitution, with only 57 percent of the respondents saying that tax departments have the right to make people pay taxes.

Ability to Enforce the Law

A legitimate state is construed as having the mandate and ability to enforce its decisions. State institutions appear to enjoy positive perceptions among Tanzanian citizens. Eight in ten (82 percent) citizens of Tanzania hold the view that the police are able to enforce the law. However, at least three in ten think the police are unlikely to enforce the law if a serious crime is committed.

Table12. Tanzanian Government Enforcement Capacity

	Very likely	Likely	Unlikely	Very unlikely	Don't know
Committed serious crime	42	40	3	10	5
Did not pay tax on income they earned	37	41	3	14	5
Obtained household services without paying for them	34	36	7	13	10

How likely do you think authorities would enforce the law if a person like yourself:

When it comes to tax enforcement, over three quarters or 78 percent of the respondents hold the opinion that the government is capable of enforcing tax laws. Nevertheless, three in ten people interviewed say the government is unlikely to enforce tax laws. A big majority (70 percent) also believe that the law can be enforced if one gets services without paying. The Tanzanian government thus appears to enjoy considerable legitimacy to the extent that it is perceived by citizens to have the capacity to enforce laws. Nevertheless, over the past few years the proportion of people who think that government can enforce the law is also quite low compared to other countries. (See table 13).

Table 13: Government enforcement capacity across nations

	Committed serious crime	Did not pay tax on income they earned	Avoid paying for household services
Botswana	87	84	84
Ghana	96	93	90
Lesotho	89	73	77
Malawi	89	77	75
Mali	81	74	76
Senegal	95	84	88
Namibia	87	72	74
Nigeria	82	74	76
South Africa	85	78	75
Tanzania	**87**	**82**	**78**
Uganda	96	88	87
Zambia	96	82	81
Cabo Verde	96	82	87
Kenya	93	85	87
Mozambique	89	83	79

Satisfaction with the performance of political leadership

Citizen approval or disapproval of the political leadership may have a bearing on legitimacy and consequently support for democracy. A leadership that appears to listen and is willing to help solve the problems of their citizens is likely to gain their support.

To find out how Tanzanians are satisfied or dissatisfied with their leaders the survey asked: "how satisfied or dissatisfied have you been with the performance of the following leaders in the past twelve months (listed in Table 14)"

Table 14. Citizen perceptions on the legitimacy of the state (percentages)

	Very satisfied		Satisfied		Dissatisfied		Very unsatisfied		Don't Know	
	2001	2003	2001	2003	2001	2003	2001	2003	2001	2003
President Mkapa	61	34	29	50	6	9	4	5	1	2
Your Member of Parliament	24	14	35	44	20	25	15	11	5	6
Your Regional Commissioner	32	21	44	54	13	14	8	5	4	5
Your Ward Councillor	26	17	43	49	15	20	8	10	8	4

Do you approve or disapprove of the way that the following people have performed their jobs over the past 12 months, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

President Mkapa still enjoys a very high performance approval with 84 percent saying they are satisfied with his performance. This rating is lower than that of 2001 (90 percent). Nevertheless, other than Nujoma in Namibia and Kenya's new leader, Mkapa is the most popular president in the Afrobarometer. Regional Commissioners who are appointed by the President also enjoy very high approval, with three quarters or 75 percent of the respondents saying Regional Commissioners are doing a good job. These ratings are closer to the 76 percent approval in the 2001 survey.

Members of Parliament have received the lowest approval of their performance with 57 percent saying they are doing a good job compared to 59 percent in 2001. At least two thirds of the respondents (66 percent) are satisfied with the performance of their Ward Councilor. The positive job approval for the leadership may indicate why the Tanzanian government is afforded the required legitimacy to enforce its decisions.

Trust In State Institutions

Trust in state institutions also helps to gauge legitimacy and the extent of democracy in a country. Trust in government leaders and institutions indicate citizen acceptance and willingness to work with the leadership. Thus, high trust in government institutions is also construed as an indication of state legitimacy. Trust in public institutions is cultivated by the ability of these institutions to respond promptly to the needs and demands of the citizenry.

To evaluate the levels of trust, respondents were asked how much they trusted President Mkapa, local government authorities, the police, courts of law, political parties, the army, the National Assembly (Parliament), the National Electoral Commission and Radio Tanzania (the National Broadcaster). Results of these evaluations are presented on table 15.

Table 15: Trust in Public Institutions

	Not at all	A little bit	A lot	A very great deal	Don't know
The President	4	15	43	35	3
National Assembly	6	23	45	22	4
National Electoral Commission	10	23	41	17	9
Office of Regional Commissioner	5	23	47	19	6
Ward Councilor	8	28	43	16	5
Ruling party	10	24	45	20	1
Opposition political parties	25	37	28	8	2
The army	8	19	60	19	3
The police	14	35	39	11	2
Courts of law	10	34	41	12	4
Traditional leaders	10	26	40	14	11
Government broadcastings services (TVT or Radio Tanzania)	7	24	48	14	8
Independent broadcasting services	4	28	45	14	9
Government newspapers (daily news, Sunday news)	6	25	46	12	11
Independent newspapers(The Guardian, Nipashe, Majira)	6	31	42	11	11
Traders in local markets	6	37	39	11	7
Small business/shopkeepers	6	38	39	10	7
Big private corporations	12	29	33	8	19
Public corporations	15	26	34	10	15

How much do you trust each of the following, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

The results reveal that Tanzanians are still a very trustful society with nine in ten (93 percent) trusting their president. Trust on the president has gone up from 91 percent in 2001. After the President, the National Assembly (Parliament) is the second most trusted institution in Tanzania, with 90 percent of the respondents saying they trust this institution. The army ties with the National assembly with 90 percent of the respondents saying they trust their army. However, there has been a slight slip on the trust of the army from 95 percent in 2001 to 90 percent in 2003.

High trust in the president, the army and the national assembly is closely followed by the ruling party (CCM) with 89 percent saying they trust this party compared to 73 percent who said they trusted the Opposition Political Parties. It is however a good omen and an indicator that multiparty democracy is taking root in Tanzania when more than two thirds of the respondents say they trust opposition political parties.

It is noteworthy that Regional Commissioners who are presidential appointees have much higher trust (87 percent) than elected local (ward) Councilors with 86 percent of the respondents saying they trust councilors. Traditional leaders also now command much trust, with 79 percent of the respondents saying they trust them, a much higher level of trust than that of opposition parties (73 percent).

The National Broadcaster (RTD) is trusted by 86 percent of the respondents which is lower than the 87 percent of the respondents that trusted it in 2001. This is slightly lower than the trust of 87 percent for independent (private broadcasters). followed closely by

the National Electoral Commission with 82 percent of the respondents saying they trust the electoral authority. Trust in the National Electoral Commission has slightly declined from the 82 percent trust shown in 2001. It may also be pointed out that more people (87 percent) trust local traders and small businesses when compared to trust in big private businesses (69 percent).

There has been an improvement in the trust in the police from 62 percent in 2001 to 85 percent in 2003. Big private business is now the least trusted institution (69 percent) in Tanzania followed by public corporations (70 percent).

It may be observed further that the high trust accorded the president and other government leaders is corroborated by citizen perception that these leaders look after people's interest. Thus, when asked whether government leaders look after people's interests, over two thirds of the respondents (72 percent) are of the opinion that leaders do indeed look after people's interests. Furthermore, a big majority (71 percent) think that government leaders listen to people. This may help to explain the high trust afforded to government leaders including the ruling party.

Comparing Tanzania with other African countries, the Tanzanian president enjoys the highest levels of trust in (79 percent) the African countries surveyed in this round. He is followed by the Namibian and Mozambican presidents (76 and 75 percent respectively). Tanzania is one of the four countries that report moderate levels of trust (just over 33 percent) in the opposition parties. Its 36 percent is double the figure both its neighbours who average 16 percent. The ruling party is again highly trusted (66 percent) and the Kenyan ruling coalition enjoys just as much trust at 65 percent. In yet another important institution, the national electoral commission, Tanzania is again in the lead with 60 percent reporting that they trust it. Only two other countries, Kenya (60 percent) and Mozambique (51 percent) have at least half of the citizens trusting it.

Honesty and Corruption in Government

Legitimacy can also be promoted by perceived high sense of honesty and low level of corruption in government. Generally, trust on public officials and the legitimacy, which trusts afford the state, may be enhanced or inhibited by citizen perceptions of corruption among these officials. Corruption breeds bad governance, which undermines democracy as it eliminates accountability, transparency and equity in society. Corrupt officials have a tendency of being arrogant and are often prone to using their ill-earned wealth to trounce on the rights of the downtrodden citizens.

Table16: Public Perception on Corruption among Public Officials

	None	Some of them	Most of them	All of them	Don't Know
Office of the presidency	22	31	9	2	36
Elected leaders	13	41	14	4	28
Government officials	10	44	18	6	23
Police	6	36	28	16	14
Border officials	6	32	23	12	28
Judges and magistrates	8	44	19	8	21
Local businessmen	14	43	14	4	25
Foreign businessmen	14	37	12	5	32
Teachers /school administrators	34	37	6	1	22
Religious leaders	55	17	3	1	24
NGO leaders	23	31	6	3	37

How many of the following people do you think are involved in corruption, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

Levels of perceived corruption differ among public agencies and officials. Most Tanzanian respondents (80 percent), one percent less than 2001 (81 percent) perceive the Police to be the most corrupt public institution in the country. This situation has seriously undermined the integrity and efficiency of the police force, tarnishing the image of the government among citizens. Good governance suffers under such circumstances. However, there is hope in the fight against this vice, for there has been a drop in perceived corruption among the police from 90 percent in 2001 to the current 80 percent. Table 17 compares levels of perceived corruption between 2001 and 2003.

Table 17: Levels of perceived corruption among selected public officials 2001-2003

	None		Some corruption		Don't Know	
	2001	2003	2001	2003	2001	2003
Elected leaders	25	13	70	59	5	28
Government officials (civil servants)	14	10	82	67	4	23
The Police	7	6	90	80	3	14
Border officials (customs agents)	13	6	66	66	20	28
Judges and magistrates	16	8	64	71	20	21
Local (Tanzanian) businessmen	17	14	69	61	14	25
Foreign businessmen	18	14	58	54	24	32
Teachers /school administrators	58	34	36	45	6	21

How many of the following people do you think are involved in corruption, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

The police are followed by judges and magistrates, with over two thirds (71 percent) of all respondents perceiving these public officials to be corrupt. However, unlike the police, the level of perceived corruption among the custodians of the law in 2003 is much higher than the level of perceived corruption of 64 percent recorded in 2001.

There has been a drop in the level of perceived corruption among civil servants from 82 percent in 2001 to 67 percent in 2003. The fight against corruption in the public service has to be sustained because civil servants are still third among corrupt public officials with customs agents closely following suit as they are perceived by a two thirds (66 percent) of the respondents as the fourth most corrupt public institution.

The level of perceived corruption among local business community has dropped from 69 percent in 2001 to 61 percent in 2003. Teachers are still the least corrupt among public officials despite the rise in the level of perceived corruption from 36 percent in 2001 to 45 percent in 2003. Nevertheless, a substantial majority (58 percent) of the respondents think that teachers are not corrupt. Border officials are ranked as the most corrupt in Tanzania and this is the perception in several other countries (46 Uganda, 36 Kenya and 66 Ghana).

Government Responsiveness

The legitimacy of the state can also be assessed by evaluating government responsiveness to public opinion. Hence, in this Afrobarometer survey respondents were asked to assess the extent to which government leaders are interested and responsive to their needs and demands.

Table 18: Perceived Government responsiveness

	Never	Some of the time	Most of the time	Always	Don't know
Leaders look after people's interests	22	50	20	2	6
Leaders listen to people	22	51	19	1	7

How much of the time do you think elected leaders, like members of parliament, ward councillors, try their best to do the following?

Table 18 indicates that Tanzanians think that their government looks after their interests and listens to them. Thus more than two thirds (72 percent) are of the opinion that leaders look after the people's interests. Only 22 percent say that leaders never look after the people's interests. Furthermore, another 71 percent say that their leaders listen to people, with at least a half (51 percent) of the respondents saying leaders listen to people all the time.

Public Policy Performance

Positive citizen perception of government performance is an indicator that the government is worth their support and vice-versa. To gauge citizen perception on the performance of their leaders, respondents were asked: "How well would you say the current government is handling the following problems?" Results of public perception on government policy performance are summarized in table19.

Table 19: Public Policy Performance

	Very badly	Fairly badly	Fairly well	Very well	Don't know enough
Managing the economy	8	17	53	14	8
Creating jobs	25	30	32	7	6
Keeping prices stable	14	26	41	11	8
Narrowing gaps between rich and poor	29	27	30	7	7
Reducing crime	16	26	45	11	2
Improving basic health services	10	19	51	19	1
Addressing educational needs	8	14	52	25	1
Delivering household water	25	27	36	10	2
Ensuring every one has enough to eat	22	29	35	9	5
Fighting corruption in government	21	20	39	13	7
Resolving conflicts between communities	6	15	56	14	9
Combating malaria	6	12	53	26	3
Combating HIV/AIDS	8	12	48	29	3

How well or badly would you say the current government is handling the following problems, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

A quarter (25 percent) of the respondents is of the opinion that the government is not performing well in managing the economy. However, two thirds (67 percent) think the economy is well managed. Nevertheless, over half (55 percent) say the government is not doing enough to create jobs. However, citizen disapproval on job creation has shrunk from 65 percent in 2001 to the current 55 percent. Furthermore, half the respondents (52 percent), up from 40 percent in 2001, also say the government is doing a good job in controlling inflation. Inflation has now officially been reduced to less than 6 percent.

The majority (56 percent) say that the government is not doing enough to reduce the gap between rich and poor Tanzanians. This is an improvement given that in 2001 seven in ten (70 percent) had said the government was doing a bad job in narrowing the gap between the rich and the poor. Furthermore, four in ten (42 percent) are worried about high crime rates in the country, with only 56 percent of the respondents in 2003 satisfied with the way crime problems are being handled, compared to 63 percent in 2001. This indicates increased incidents of violent crimes in the country.

Perhaps the highest approval for the government performance is in education which has jumped from 59 percent in 2001 to 77 percent in 2003. This is followed by basic health services performance approval which has also jumped from 50 percent in 2001 to 70 percent in 2003. Government handling of HIV/AIDS is also appreciated with ratings jumping from 72 percent in 2001 to 77 percent in 2003 saying the government is doing a good job on this area.

Table 20: Public Policy Performance 2001-2003

	Badly handled		Well handled		Don't know enough to have an opinion	
	2001	2003	2001	2003	2001	2003
Managing the economy	-	25	-	67	-	8
Creating jobs	65	55	29	39	6	6
Keeping prices stable	50	40	48	52	2	8
Narrowing gaps between rich and poor	70	56	25	37	5	7
Reducing crime	36	42	63	56	1	2
Improving basic health services	49	29	50	70	1	1
Addressing educational needs	40	22	59	77	1	1
Delivering household water	-	52	-	46	-	2
Ensuring every one has enough to eat	59	51	39	44	2	5
Fighting corruption in government	-	41	-	52	-	7
Resolving conflicts between communities	-	21	-	70	-	9
Combating malaria	42	18	55	79	3	3
Combating HIV/AIDS	26	20	72	77	2	3

How well or badly would you say the current government is handling the following matters, or haven't you heard enough about them to say?

Food security is however still worrisome with half the respondents (51 percent) unhappy with the food security in the country. Tanzania has been experiencing a shortage of rainfall in the last two years, and this has resulted in food shortages. Table 20 summarizes public policy performance ratings from 2001 to 2003.

Table21: Government performance on specific issues-Cross countries 2003

	Creating jobs	Stabilizing Prices	Managing economy	Aids	Education	Basic services	Enough food
Botswana	30	29	60	75	79	71	49
Ghana	45	57	67	77	64	56	55
Lesotho	28	17	40	48	77	47	32
Malawi	16	11	29	49	51	60	39
Mali	51	39	55	70	74	58	37
Senegal	36	40	51	76	59	48	43
Namibia	46	26	73	66	83	54	41
Nigeria	22	16	31	62	38	30	22
South Africa	9	17	38	46	61	60	21
Tanzania	**39**	**53**	**68**	**78**	**78**	**46**	**45**
Uganda	29	56	59	76	83	56	39
Zambia	19	22	50	66	68	45	40
Cabo Verde	22	29	33	56	54	46	36
Kenya	52	49	83	79	94	41	35
Mozambique	23	22	45	45	66	43	36

How well or badly would you say the government is handling the following matters, or haven't you heard enough about them to say? (percent reported those saying fairly well/very well)

Tanzanian Government performance compares favourably with other countries in the region, Uganda and Kenya, as well as the rest of the surveyed countries. In particular, aids and education management are applauded considering the scarcity of resources in the country and the large population that looks up to the government for service delivery.

ECONOMIC ASSESSMENTS

Most Important Problems

In 2001 when Tanzanians were asked "in your view, what are the most important problems facing the country that government should address" both economic and social issues were reported highly. Tanzanians report the economy (31percent) as a personal problem most frequently. 29percent of Tanzanians felt that health is another personal problem that government should address. Poverty is cited by 27percent of respondents and hunger by 14percent thus further raising the economic concerns that Tanzanians feel about their personal well-being.

Table 22: Most Important Problems

	2003	2001
Economy	13	12
Health	24	32
Poverty / Destitution	28	5
Hunger (Food and Famine)	23	–
Education	23	24
Electricity	5	6
Agriculture	19	12
Discrimination	0	
Water	17	18
Unemployment	50	10*

* In 2001 the response was job creation

In your view, what are the most important problems facing the country which government should address? (Reported percent those who cite the problem as one of their three possible answers)

Since these questions on national problems were open-ended allowing for at least three answers, they prioritised what Tanzanians thought should be placed on the personal and national agenda for development. It is clear that the personal agenda included economic concerns such as hunger and poverty. What then do people think should be the national development agenda? The situation is somewhat different with more respondents in 2001 citing social problems such as health (32 percent), education (24 percent) and basic services such as water (18 percent). Economic issues are reported at 12 percent for providing loans, and job creation. There is not much change in 2003 with regard to health. It still remains one of the major public problems (24 percent), together with Aids (10 percent). Unemployment worries now plague half the citizens of Tanzania (50 percent).and poverty are on the increase at 28 percent from 5 percent in 2001.

Economic reforms

Major economic reforms were introduced in 1986 by the second phase government which came to power after 1985 General Elections following Nyerere's retirement as the President of Tanzania. Nevertheless, Tanzania is still undergoing through economic

reforms such as trade liberalization, privatization, and deregulation. The government is also still grappling with political reforms in the manner of competition for public office through a multi-party political system. Economic choices and freedoms have to be matched by political choices and freedoms. Given the importance of economic reforms in the democratization process, Afrobarometer also assesses the way people perceive these economic reforms. Successful economic reforms are a good omen for successful democratic reforms.

Choices in a free market economy also translate into demand for political choices and rights. Afrobarometer asked Tanzanians whether they prefer market or government-run economy. In the 2003 survey over half (54 percent) of the respondents support a market economy than government run economy. Furthermore, over two thirds (72 percent) of the respondents think that individuals should decide on their own what to produce, buy and sell. In addition, more people (55 percent), support user fees in exchange for quality education. Eight in ten (84 percent) of all respondents say the government should respect property rights (a cornerstone of market economy). Only 12 percent give the government the right to seize property.

Despite some support for market reforms, citizens also appear to reject those reforms which hurt them. More respondents (51 percent) for example do not support layoffs to reduce costs, but prefer civil servants to keep their jobs. This may be explained by the extended family system with a lot of families depending on incomes from their employed kith and keen. Hence, the majority (69 percent) support the idea of more jobs, even if it means paying low wages for public workers. Furthermore, slightly over a half of the respondents (54 percent) favor protectionist tariffs.

In this survey, more people (57 percent) would rather accept economic hardships than abandon the reforms because they deliver. Indeed, nearly three quarters or 74 percent of the respondents say there is now better availability of goods compared to the period before the reforms. Furthermore, nearly half (49 percent) of the respondents say that their living standards are now better than before the reforms.

Policy makers in the government should however worry about the directions the reforms are taking because there are numerous problems which make citizens unhappy. Job creation is worrying most people with a majority (62 percent) saying that it is now more difficult to find a job than in the past (worse job opportunities now). Moreover, over half of the people (57 percent) perceive that the gap between the rich and the poor is getting worse. These are economic problems that can have a bearing on the democratization process.

Economic Satisfaction

Overall, Tanzanians were pessimistic about their economic situation in 2001. Only three-in-ten said that they were satisfied with their personal economic conditions. Less than a third (22 percent) indicated that they are satisfied with the general situation in the country in 2001 compared to 33 percent in 2003. Compared to the other countries surveyed, Tanzanians seemed to outscore only Lesotho and Zimbabwe when asked about how

satisfied they are with the Tanzanian economy in 2001 (See Table 23). Moreover, in East Africa, Tanzania is behind the other countries, Kenya and Uganda by 12 percentage points. The positive note is that 10 percent more report an increase in satisfaction with the national economy.

Table 23: Satisfaction with the National Economy, Cross-National Comparisons

	2001	2003
Botswana	32	45
Cabo Verde	-	10
Ghana	32	31
Kenya	-	45
Lesotho	16	11
Malawi	29	19
Mali	34	25
Mozambique	-	51
Namibia	56	57
Nigeria	45	31
Senegal	-	22
South Africa	30	30
Tanzania	**22**	**33**
Uganda	64	45
Zambia	25	32

The gap between widespread dissatisfaction with present economic conditions, yet relative support for the reform program can be explained perhaps because people tend to associate economic reforms with declining personal fortunes. However, the difficulties they faced before economic reforms in terms of lack of adequate consumer supplies, poor health and educational services, people tend to be optimistic that the future will probably be better. Availability of consumer goods in shops promises a better future hence their continued support for the reforms despite the difficulties encountered.

Conclusion

Tanzanians continue to support both political and economic reforms in Tanzania. They complain that the economic reforms are hurting them, lower job opportunities and the widening gap between the rich and the poor. However, when asked to make a choice between the reforms and going back to the old system of a state controlled economy with empty shelves, more citizens would rather bear the pains of the reforms.

Political reforms are beginning to bear fruit with more people now supporting many political parties than in the past. A sizeable majority of Tanzanians now reject one party rule. Moreover, the majority reject personalized rule, specifically rule by chiefs or elders. Furthermore, most Tanzanians do not want to be ruled by the military and do not want one man rule in Tanzania. These results can be translated to mean a high demand for democracy and democratic institutions in Tanzania.

Popular opposition to non-democratic alternatives in Tanzania appears to be waning in all options except that of one party rule. It appears that multiparty rule is taking root although at a slow pace with more people now rejecting one party rule than in the past. However, it is worrying that support for some non-democratic alternatives is picking up

especially support for traditional rule which has gone up. Rejection of military rule has also declined from 96 percent in 2001 to 87 percent and that of one man rule from 92 percent in 2001 to 86 percent in 2003. These developments are worth noting and corrective measures should be taken, particularly by tackling those economic reforms that hurt people the most.

The fight against corruption is still a difficult one. Most respondents still perceive a high level of corruption in the public sector, especially among the police and the judges and magistrates. However, there has been a drop in the level of perceived corruption among civil servants from 82 percent in 2001 to 67 percent in 2003. Nevertheless, the fight against corruption in the public service has to be sustained because civil servants are still perceived by citizens as the third most corrupt public institution.

Appendix I Sample Demographics

Sample size	1223	**Region**	
Location		Arusha	4
Rural	70	Dar	7
Urban	30	Dodoma	4
		Iringa	4
Gender		Kagera	6
Female	50	Kaskazini Pemba	1
Male	50	Kaskazini Unguja	1
		Kigoma	4
Head of household		Kilimanjaro	4
Yes	44	Kusini Pemba	1
No	56	Kusini Unguja	1
		Lindi	2
Religion		Manyara	3
Islam	29	Mara	4
Christianity	63	Mbeya	6
Traditional	1	Mjini Magharibi	2
Other	7	Morogoro	5
		Mtwara	3
Language Used		Mwanza	9
Swahili	100	Pwani	3
		Rukwa	3
		Ruvuma	3
		Shinyanga	8
		Singida	3
		Tabora	5
		Tanga	4

55

Appendix II

SAMPLE SELECTION

REGION	DODOMA	ARUSHA	KILIMANJARO	TANGA	MOROGORO	PWANI	DSM	LINDI	MTWARA	RUVUMA	IRINGA	MBEYA	SINGIDA	TABORA
2002 Population Census Results	1699411	1291794	1381476	1641921	1760376	890126	2497882	791270	1128992	1117981	1495240	[illegible]	[illegible]	1717632
% National Population	4.91	3.73	3.99	4.74	5.09	2.57	7.22	2.2	3.26	3.23	4.32	5.99	3.15	4.96
Number of Interviews out of 1280	58.92	44.76	47.88	54.88	61.08	30.84	86.64	26.4	39.12	38.76	59.04	71.88	37.8	59.52
Number of stating Points (wards@8 inter)	7.36	5.59	5.98	7.11	7.63	8.85	10.83	3.3	4.89	4.84	6.48	8.98	4.72	7.44
Urban pop %	13	20	23.7	24	29.7	27.6	98.7	19	34	16.5	14.8	28.5	14.4	19
Rural pop %	87	59	76.3	76	70.3	72.4	9.3	81	76	83.5	85.2	71.5	85.6	81
Rural Interviews	48	32	32	40	40	24	24	16	32	32	48	56	32	48
Rural starting points	6	4	4	5	5	3	3	2	4	4	5	7	4	6
Urban Interviews	8	16	16	16	24	8	64	8	8	8	8	16	8	8
Urban starting Points	1	2	2	2	3	1	8	1	1	1	1	2	1	1
Total number of Interviews	56	48	48	56	64	32	88	24	40	40	48	72	40	56
Total Number of starting points	7	6	6	7	8	4	11	3	5	5	6	9	5	7

Appendix III: Adjusted and adapted sample for ZANZIBAR (NB: The sample size has been doubled)

REGION	NORTH UNGUJA	SOUTH REGION	URBAN WEST	NORTH PEMBA	SOUTH PEMBA	TOTAL
2002 Population Census Results	1136920	94497	390993	185994	176127	**984531**
% National Population	13.98	9.59	39.71	18.89	17.88	**100**
Number of Interviews out of 64	9	6.1	25.41	12.08	11.44	**64**
Number of stating Points (wards @ 8 Inter)	1	1	3	2	1	**8**
Urban pop %	0	0	2	1	0	**3**
Rural pop %	1	1	1	1	1	
Interviews Rural	8	8	8	8	8	**40**
Starting points	1	1	1	1	1	**5**
Urban Interviews	0	0	16	8	0	**24**
Starting Pont	0	0	2	1	0	**3**
Total Number of Interviews	8	8	24	16	8	**64**
Number of starting points.	1	1	3	2	1	**8**

Notes

The adjusted Afrobarometer sample for Zanzibar

Zanzibar Comprises of two islands, Unguja and Pemba as part of the United Republic of Tanzania. The total population is only 2.85% of the total population of the URT according to the 2002 census. This implies that the sampling framework outline above would give about 32 interviews for Zanzibar. This is fairly small given that the case of Zanzibar is politically interesting and the fact that the Islands have been always regarded to be autonomous in many aspects. To draw an effective sample, just like in the previous Afrobarometer survey, we have proposed to double the sample from 32 to 64 interviews. The adjusted sampling framework for Zanzibar is summarized in Table 2.

REPORT
ON THE
CONSTITUENCY LEVEL PUBLIC HEARINGS PILOT AT KILOLO, HAI AND SINGIDA NORTH AND TUNDURU CONSTITUENCIES

Submitted by

1. **Harold Sungusia, Legal and Human Rights Centre**
2. **Elias Mwashiuya, Lawyers Environmental Action Team**
3. **Clarence Kipobota, Legal and Human Rights Centre**

Conceptualization
The constituency level public hearing pilot work was done by two teams referred as Team A and Team B. Team A visited Iringa and Ruvuma regions covering Kilolo and Tunduru constituencies. Team B visited Kilimanjaro and Singida regions covering two constituencies namely Hai and Singida North.

Purpose
The main purpose of the constituency level public hearings was to provide an opportunity for citizens to express their views on the subject matter of bills and for legislators to convert those views into resources for their legislative and oversight roles. In addition, the pilot aimed at looking at the post training ability of MPs to conduct constituency level public hearings on bills.

The hearings were organised in variety of ways and places. Most of these constituencies organised such meetings in village centres and hired venues. The styles of presentations was regulated by the principle of first come, first serve.

The hearings processes were conducted through a number of stages, which involved a key number of actors. Among the several steps include the defining agenda, inviting expert testimony, press relations, organizational techniques and incorporation of stakeholders.

Defining agenda
This was done by MPs who were conversant with the substance and spirit of the bills. The MPs submitted and narrowed issues relevant to the bills that will eventually have to be tabled before the parliament. In their submissions, the MPs classified their presentations into three parts namely introduction of the topic and self-introductions, demonstration of the topic, and a summary of the main points and procedures for a hearing.

Expert testimony
This stage involved legal experts' analyses on the subject matter. The key role of these experts was to enlighten the audience on the legal substance and spirit of the bills and Acts and thereby enabled them to participate in the hearing proceedings with the appropriate competence.

The testimonies of experts were presented into three themes. The first theme involved the general overview of the Electoral laws inter alia, the Election Act No 1 of 1985 and the Local Authorities (Elections) Act 1979 and Election (Amendment) Act No 8 of 1995. The second theme-involved analysis of the Electoral laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill No. 6 of 2nd April 2004. The third theme involved anticipated implication of the proposed amendments and clarifications of the questions raised by the participants

Press relations
The pilot exercises were also linked with the press with the aim of receiving and hear opinion s from interested parties and the public. Some constituencies managed to televise and broadcast some stages of the hearings process, and other managed to print on local newspapers. In all, the press officials attended as observers and reports of the whole

events and gave their support for decisions that affect lives of interested parties and the general public.

Organizational techniques

There were wide ranges of formats in pilot public hearings. For instance, in Kilolo constituency public hearing was organised in a hired hall and participants stayed together in the same place. The composition of this hearing involved District Councilors, representatives from civil society organizations (CSOs), representatives from registered political parties, government officials, and representatives from villages, teachers, religious leaders, and other stakeholders.

Similarly, the Hai constituency organised their public hearings at Five Star Hotel, in Hai District, Kilimanjaro region. The meeting composed the so called "top class opinion leaders" including Honourable Justice Nathaniel Mushi, Justice of the High Court (Retired), judicial officers, members of parliament representing Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM) and Tanzania Labour Party (TLP), experts in various disciplines, representatives from CSOs, teachers and other stakeholders.

On the other hand the Singida North constituency was organised at Mtinko Mission Centre. The meeting mainly composed of villagers and local people from various angles of the constituency.

The organizational techniques in all the three constituencies were wholly or partly lined with key principles enunciated under the public hearing trainings manual.[1] The public hearing meetings were preceded by notices to the invited participants and then followed by group formations. The legal experts explained key provisions of Acts and those found in the amending bill. The group proceeded to brainstorm on basis of their local scenario and Tanzania in general. Each participant reserved his or her opinion and submits it on the next day. The only exception was that there was no grouping in Hai constituency.

The main hearing events were technically organised to distinguish a democratic public hearings and political rally. Members of Parliament introduced agenda in fashionable style of introducing subject matter, demonstration of the hearing steps, brief repetition of major points and allowed the public to ask questions. The hearings techniques involved speaking orders from interested participants. The speakers were divided into three categories namely those favoring the bill, those against the bill and those neither for nor against the bill.

Speakers introduced their names, position, and representation and then presented summary of issues concerned to the subject matter. Time was effectively maintained to give more opportunity to participants to comment on the bills. The other interesting this was that MPs and their secretaries were keenly reducing oral presentations into writings.

[1] . Mmuya M, Nyirabu M. and Killian, B. A Trainings Tool for Constituency Level Public Hearings on Bills in Pilot Constituencies. Trainings facilitated at Court Yard Hotel to Members of Parliament (Tanzania) on April 27th – 28th 2004.

The recorded proceedings were read on the last day of the hearings to give room to participants to clear some issues before the MPs took them to the parliament.

The programme ended with own assessment discussions on the way forward

Observations

Kilolo constituency

General observations

- That the notice and invitations to participants to the meeting was sent within shortest period of time as a result the whole event was poorly organised
- That participants expected more training than to give their views on the bills
- That there is no communication between Hon. MP and constituents at the time of preparing the bill
- Time for speakers was improperly managed
- The recorders were not competent enough as a result they missed lot of information presented by the public
- That there were lot of interruptions from MPs and District Commissioner who on these hearings were not supposed to comment on the bill
- That the participants were unevenly invited. There were few representatives from CSOs, political party, youth and female participation (Out of 50 4 were women)
- That illiteracy was the main problem. The public were not aware of their rights and role of MPs in the constituency
- The style of presenting opinions were dominated by the so called "group philosophy" as a result majority of the participants who also represented the ruling party appeared to defend interest of the government rather than pointing out the way forward
- That the hearings were intervened by number of activities including the CCM rally in the nearby villages. This interventions delayed process of hearings. Similarly, the hearings was intervened with a short presentation by Marco Vingillah on means community bank development
- That language barrier is the key problem to most of the participants and Tanzanian in general
- That all participants enjoyed the procedures of the public hearings and proposed to train others as well
- That the MPs were not acquainted with the training and procedures on how to run on their own constituency level public hearings
- That the press relation was not sound at the beginning however the situation changed at the end. As a result information was not well disseminated to the rest of Tanzanians

Recommendations

- That notice and invitations should be sent to the participants three weeks before the hearing event

- That there is a need to provide civic education prior conducting a public hearing on the bills at all levels.
- That the composition of the participants should compose even number of participants who represent different interest of the society
- That in any public hearing on the bills participants should avoid political elements as they tends to divert the whole meaning of public hearing
- That since public hearing is a voluntary things, participants should be informed to organise themselves and sort out their opinion without any costs
- That the English language and Swahili languages should be applied together to solve the problem of wrong interruptions
- That MPs should equipped with additional training on the same subject matter so as to coordinated constituency level public hearings on their own
- That the Parliament should change its standing orders to allow members of parliament to present bills to their constituents
- Etc

Hai constituency

General observations

- That the concept of constituency level public hearing was new to all stakeholders as participants sought reflected to public rallies
- That the composition of participants involved only opinion leaders, people with vision on the subject matter
- That participants were competent to analyse issues and give independent opinion without regarding political sides
- That there is low level of illiteracy compared to other pilot constituencies
- That invitations and notices were timely tendered
- Participants were tired early in the process of hearings of opinion as a result they proposed the hearing to be done in few days and in different places
- That the Hai constituency is the best practice on this process as the MP and his constituents adhered almost all principles stipulated under the training manuals
- That invited MPs presented very well their parts as they encouraged they guided the public to give opinions.
- Etc

Recommendations

- That there is a need to invite individuals who are not opinion leaders and collect their opinion
- That Bills should reach stakeholders within a reasonable time for them to read and comment before the hearing event
- etc

Singida constituency

General observations

- That the level of the literacy is very low
- That most of people are still ignorant of their civic rights.
- That still political ideologies are shaping the analysis
- That patriarch system is very dominant to the extent of making the ratio of women very low 4% ie among 50 participants only 2 were women
- That press relations with the MPs was quite okay
- That the composition of the participants was fairly balanced save that there was no representation from youth groups and women
- Etc

Recommendations

- That notice and invitations should be sent to the participants three weeks before the hearing event
- That there is a need to provide civic education prior conducting a public hearing on the bills at all levels.
- That the composition of the participants should compose even number of participants who represent different interest of the society
- That in any public hearing on the bills participants should avoid political elements as they tends to divert the whole meaning of public hearing
- That since public hearing is a voluntary things, participants should be informed to organise themselves and sort out their opinion without any costs
- That the English language and Swahili languages should be applied together to solve the problem of wrong interruptions
- That MPs should equipped with additional training on the same subject matter so as to coordinated constituency level public hearings on their own
- That the Parliament should change its standing orders to allow members of parliament to present bills to their constituents
- Etc

ISSN 0856 - 035X

THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA

BILL SUPLLEMENT

No. 6 *2nd April, 2004*

to the Gazette of the United Republic of Tanzania No. 14 Vol. 85 dated 2nd April, 2004
Printed by the Government Printer, Dar es Salaam, by Order of Government

NOTICE

The following Bill to be submitted to the National Assembly is published for general information with a statement of its objects and reasons.

Dar es Salaam,
30th March, 2004

MATERN Y. C. LUMBANGA,
Chief Secretary

A BILL
for

An Act to amend Electoral Laws in order to facilitate the establishment of the National Permanent Voters' Register and for other related matters.

ENACTED by the Parliament of the United Republic of Tanzania.

PART I
PRELIMINARY PROVISIONS

1. This Act may be cited as the Electoral Laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Act, 2004. **Short title**

2. This Act shall come into operation on the date of publication in the *Gazette*. **Commencement**

PART II
AMENDMENT OF THE ELECTIONS ACT, 1985

3. This Part shall be read as one with the Elections Act, 1985 in this Act referred to as the "principal Act". **Construction Act No. 1 of 1985**

4. Section 2 of the principal Act is amended- **Amendment of section 2**

(a) by deleting the definition of the term "Certificate of registration";

(b) by inserting in its respective alphabetical order the following new definitions:

"Provisional Voters' Register" means a register established under section 11A;

"Registration Officer" means a Registration Officer appointed under section 7A and includes an Assistant Registration Officer;

"voter's card" means a card issued under the provisions of this Act verifying that the person named in such card has been registered as a voter;

Amendment of Parts II, III and IV of Chapter II

5. The principal Act is generally amended by deleting the words "Returning Officer" and "Assistant Returning Officer" wherever they appear in Part II, III and IV of Chapter II of the Act and substituting therefor the words "Registration Officer" and "Assistant Registration Officer", respectively.

Addition of section 4C

6. The principal Act is amended by adding immediately after section 4B the following new section:

"Voters education

4C. The Commission shall be responsible for providing voters' education throughout the country and shall coordinate persons who shall conduct such education".

Addition of section 7A

7. The principal Act is amended by adding immediately after section 7 the following new section:

"Registration Officers

7A.-(1) For the purposes of registration of voters under this Act, every City Director, Municipal Director, Town Director and District Executive Director shall be a registration officer for the purposes of registration of voters in a constituency and such Registration Officer may be for one or more than one constituency.

(2) The Commission may, from amongst public officers, appoint by office or name such number of Assistant Registration Officers.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1), the Commission may, where circumstances so require, by notice published in the *Gazette* appoint any person holding a public office by name or by office to be a Registration Officer in any Constituency instead of the one referred to in subsection (1) and where such person is so appointed the City Director, Municipal Director, Town Director, District Executive Director shall cease to be a Registration Officer in the respective constituency.

(4) The Registration Officer may, subject to the directions of the Director of Elections, appoint such staff as may be necessary for the purposes of conducting registration of voters in the constituency.

(5) Every Registration Officer and Assistant Registration Officer shall, before embarking on the functions of that office take and subscribe to an oath of secrecy in the prescribed form before a magistrate.

(6) The Registration Officer shall be responsible for all matters relating to the registration of voters within the area of his jurisdiction."

8. Section 10 of the principal Act is amended by: **Amendment of section 10**

(a) designating the contents of section "10" as subsection "(1)";

(b) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

"(2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (1), any Tanzanian, not disqualified by this Act or any other

written law, who on or before the date of election shall attain the age of eighteen years, shall be entitled to be registered as a voter under this Act."

Addition of section 11A

9. The principal Act is amended by adding immediately after section 10 the following new section:

"Provisional Voters' Register

[redacted] may, for the purposes of preparation of a Permanent National Voters' Register, establish a Provisional Voters' Register.

(2) The Provisional Voters' Register shall be used for -

(a) displaying for inspection by the public;

(b) amendments regarding change of residence or any other particulars of the voter;

(c) making objection against registration of any voter;

(d) inclusion or deletion of the name of the voter in the register; and

(e) effecting any other correction or amendment as may be required under this Act."

Amendment of section 12

10. Section 12 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) deleting subsection (2) and substituting for it the following:

"(2) The Director of Elections shall keep, maintain and up-date the register established under subsection (1)."

(b) deleting subsection (5) and substituting for it the following new subsection:

"(5) The Commission shall be a custodian of the register established under subsection (1)"; and

(c) inserting immediately after subsection (6) the following new subsections:

"(7) The Director of Elections may give directions to the Registration Officer or Assistant Registration Officer on matters relating to registration of voters, contents of a voters' register, or any other related matters.

General amendment of the principal Act

11. The principal Act is generally amended by deleting the words "Certificate of registration" and "certificate" where they are related to registration of voters, wherever they appear in the Act and substituting for them the words "voter's card".

Amendment of section 12A

12. Section 12A of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) designating the contents of section "12A" as section "(1)";

(b) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

"(2) The Commission shall register any person in Tanzania Zanzibar who is only entitled to be registered as a voter for election of the President of the United Republic".

Amendment of section 15

13. Section 15 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) deleting subsection (1) and substituting for it the following:

"(1) The Commission shall be responsible for setting time and update of registration of voters in every polling district within the constituency".

(b) deleting the phrase "in view of the fact that an election is not likely to take place in such constituency in the near future or for any other reason" appearing in the sixth to eighth lines of subsection (3).

Amendment of section 17

14. Subsection (1) of section 17 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (b) by deleting the words "register the application in the register for the polling district and issue to that applicant a new certificate of registration for that polling district" and substituting for it the following:

69

"register the applicant in the prescribed form for the polling district and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing of a new voter's card".

Amendment of section 18

15. Section 18 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) deleting the words "for the issue of a new certificate of registration" appearing at the end of subsection (1) and substituting for the them the words:

"register the applicant in the prescribed form and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing of another voter's card to be marked "duplicate".

(b) by deleting the words "issue th. applicant with a new certificate of registration "appearing in th third and fourth lines of subsection (2) and substituting for the n the words "cause to be issued another voter's card".

Amendment of section 19

16. Section 19 of the principal Act is amended by deleting the phrase "issue to the applicant a new certificate of registration" immediately after the word "registration" appearing in the ninth line of that section and substituting for it the phrase:

"register the applicant in the prescribed form and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing of another voters' card."

Amendment of section 21

17. Section 21 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) designating the contents of section"21" as subsection "(1)";

(b) deleting the phrase "twenty one days after receipt of such statement, appeal against such refusal to a court presided over by a resident magistrate" appearing after the word "within"; and substituting for it the phrase "fourteen days after receipt of such statement, appeal against such refusal to a district court."

(c) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection :

"(2) The district court shall determine such appeal within fourteen days from the date of submission of an appeal."

18. Section 22 is hereby repealed and replaced with the following:- **Repeal and Replacement of section 22**

"Inspection of a Provisional Voters' Register

22. (1) Any person may inspect the provisional Voters' Register of any polling district on such day and at such time as the Registration Officer or, as the case may be, the Director of Elections, may determine.

(2) The Registration officer shall display the Provisional Voters' Register in every ward and may amend it, if necessary, in the manner as may be prescribed by the Commission."

BEST AVAILABLE

19. The principal Act is amended by inserting the words "provisional voters" between the words "the" and "register" wherever they appear in section 19 and Parts III and IV of Chapter II of this Act. **Amendment of section 19 and Parts III and IV of Chapter II**

20. Section 26 of the principal Act is amended by: **Amendment of section 17**

(a) deleting the word "fourteen" between the words "than" and "clear" appearing in that subsection and substituting for it the word "seven";

(b) deleting paragraphs "(a)" and "(b)" of subsection (3) and substituting therefor the following:

(a) if such person's qualification is not proved to the satisfaction of the Registration Officer, the Registration Officer shall inform the Director of Elections of the same and the Director of Elections shall delete or cause to be deleted such person's name in the Provisional Voters' Register"; or

BEST AVAILABLE

(b) if such person's qualification is so proved, the Registration Officer shall inform the Director of Elections of the same and the Director of Elections shall retain, or as the case may be, include or cause to be retained or included, such person's name in the Provisional Voters' Register;

(c) adding immediately after subsection (8) the following new subsections:

"(9) The Registration Officer shall decide on the objection under this Part within seven days from the last day of the issuance of the notice of inquiry".

Amendment of section 27

21. Section 27 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) designating the contents of section "27" as subsection "(1)";

(b) deleting the word "twenty" between the words "within" and "days" and the words "presided over by a resident magistrate" appearing in subsection (1) as designated, and substituting for them the words "seven" and "district court" respectively;

(c) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated, the following new subsection.

"(2) The district court shall determine such appeal within fourteen days from the date of submission of an appeal."

Amendment of section 28

22. Section 28 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) deleting the words "Resident Magistrate" wherever they appear in section 28 and substituting for "district magistrate"

(b) deleting the phrase "amend or cause to be amended the register and issue such certificate of registration, accordingly" appearing in the seventh and eighth lines of subsection (3), and substituting for it the phrase:"inform the Director of Elections on the result of the appeal, and the Director of Elections shall amend or cause to be amended the register and issue a voters card, accordingly:";

72

(c) deleting paragraphs (a) of subsection (3) and substituting for it the following:

"(a) the District Magistrate shall not require the Registration Officer to cause the issuance of another voter's card where the previous voter's card has been lost or destroyed, unless such person shall have made a declaration to the Registration Officer as required under section 20"; and

(d) by deleting the words "Returning Officer may refuse to issue a new certificate of registration until the previous certificate of registration concerned has been surrendered" appearing in paragraph (b) of subsection (3), and substituting for them the words:"the Registration Officer may refuse to cause the issuance of another voters card until the previous voter's card issued to the person concerned has been surrendered".

Amendment of section 29

23. Section 29 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (2), by deleting the word "cancel" between the words "shall" and "any" appearing in the closing words of that subsection and substituting for it the words "cause to be cancelled".

Amendment of section 38

24. Subsection (3) of section 38 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (a) by adding immediately after the word "election" appearing at the end of that paragraph the phrase: "except that, statutory declaration of the candidates for the office of the President and Vice-President of the United Republic shall be made before a Judge".

Amendment of section 38A

25. Section 38A is amended in subsection (2) by inserting the word "valid" between the words "of" and "votes" appearing in the fourth line of that subsection.

Amendment of section 46

26. Section 46 of the principal Act is amended:

(a) by deleting the phrase "being a day not less than sixty days and not more than ninety days for the parliamentary election and not more than thirty days for the by election as the case may be after the revocation or after the occurrence of the event to be an election day" appearing in the fourth line to eighth line of subsection (3);

(b) by adding immediately after subsection (3) the following new subsections:

"(4) The Commission shall, on the election day, upon the occurance of an event that prevents an election to take place appoint another day of election for a particular constituency or constituencies.

(5) Where the polling is adjourned under subsection (4), the time, procedure and manner of the subsequent polling shall be as on the original polling day".

Amendment of section 48

27. Section 48 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) inserting immediately after subsection (1), the following new subsection:

"(2) Every withdrawal notice under subsection (1) shall be accompanied by a statutory declaration in the prescribed form, made and signed by the candidate before a magistrate."

(b) by renumbering subsections (2) and (3) as (3) and (4);

Amendment of section 51

28. Section 51 of the principal Act is amended by deleting subsection (4) and substituting for it the following:

"(4) For purposes of ensuring peaceful and orderly meetings during the campaign period, the Returning Officers shall call a meeting of all candidates or party agents and scrutinize the campaign programmes of all the candidates and if necessary advice the candidates to make changes for their programmes in order to avoid conflicting meetings."

Amendment of section 56

29. Section 56 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (e) by deleting the phrase "addresses, occupations, a photograph and a representative symbol, if any, of the candidate" appearing immediately after the word "direct" and substituting for it the phrase:

74

"the full name of a candidate, a recent passport size photograph taken within three months and acronym or logo of the political party sponsoring the candidate;"

Amendment of section 61

30. Section 61 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (a) of subsection (3) by deleting the phrase "such documentary evidence as to his identity as the presiding officer or polling assistant may find satisfactory" immediately after the word "producing" and substituting for it a phrase "a voters card or any other documentary evidence as the Director of Elections may direct".

Amendment of section 67

31. Section 67 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (1) by inserting the words "while there remains voters who have not completed the polling process" between the words "violence" and "the".

Amendment of section 74

32. Section 74 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) designating the contents of section 74 as subsection (1);

(b) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

"(2) Any vote which shall be caste in respect of any candidate who has withdrawn his candidature under this Act shall be treated as a spoilt vote."

Amendment of section 81

33. Section 81 of the principal Act is amended by inserting the word "valid" between the words "of" and "votes" appearing in paragraph (a).

Amendment of section 104

34. Section 104 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (1) by deleting the word "person" appearing in the first line of that subsection and substituting for it the words "No person".

Amendment of section 107

35. Section 107 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) adding the word "and" immediately after the word "registered;" appearing at the end of paragraph (a);

(b) deleting the "semicolon" immediately after the word "deletion" appearing at the end of paragraph (b) and substituting for it a "fulstop";and

(c) deleting paragraph "(c)"

75

Amendment of section 114

36. Subsection 1 of section 114 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) adding the word "and" immediately after the word "registered" appearing at the end of paragraph "(a)";

(b) deleting the "semicolon" immediately after the word "deletion" appearing at the end of paragraph "(b)", and substituting for it a "fulstop"; and

(c) deleting paragraph "(c)".

Amendment of section 116

37. Section 116 of the principal Act is amended by -

(a) deleting subsection (2);

(b) renumbering subsection "(3)" as "(2)".

PART III

AMENDMENT OF THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES (ELECTIONS) ACT, 1979

Construction Act No.4of 1979

38. This Part shall be read as one with the Local Authorities (Elections) Act, 1979 hereinafter to be referred to as the "principal Act".

Amendment of section 2

39. Section 2 of the principal Act is amended by inserting in their respective alphabetical order the following new definitions:

"Provisional Voters Register" means a register established under section 15A;

"register" means the register established under section 15B;

"voters card" means a card issued under the provisions of this Act verifying that the person named in such card has been registered as a voter".

General amendment of the principal Act

40. The principal Act is generally amended by deleting the words "certificate of registration" wherever they appear in the Act and substituting for them the words "voter's card".

Amendment of Part IV

41. Part IV of the principal Act is amended by deleting the word "register" wherever it appears in sections 25, 29, 30, 31, 32, 34 and 35 and substituting for it the words "Provisional Voters' Register".

76

42. Section 9 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (1) by deleting the word "Deputy" between the words "every" and "Director" appearing in the second line of that subsection.

Amendment of section 9

43. Section 10 of the principal Act is amended:

Amendment of section 10

(a) deleting subsections (1) and (2) and substituting for it the following:

"(1) For the purposes of registration of voters under this Act, every City Director, Municipal Director, Town Director and District Executive Director shall be a Registration Officer for the Local Government Authority in respect of which he is such Director.

(2) The Commission may from amongst public officers appoint by office or name such number of Assistant Registration Officers for the purpose of registering voters.

(3) Notwithstanding subsection (1) and (2) the Commission may, where circumstances so require, by notice published in the Gazette appoint any person holding a public office by name or by office to be a Registration Officer in any Local Government Authority instead of the one referred to in subsection (1), and where such person is so appointed the City Director, Municipal Director, Town Director, District Executive Director shall cease to be a Registration Officer of that Local Authority.";

(b) by renumbering sections (3) and (4) as (4) and (5).

44. Section 15 of the principal Act is amended by:

Amendment of section 15

(a) designating the contents of section "15" as subsection "(1)";

(b) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

77

Act No. 1 of 1985

"(2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (1), any Tanzanian, not disqualified by the Act or any other written law, who on the date of election will attain the age of eighteen years, shall be entitled to be registered as a voter in accordance with the provisions of the Elections Act, 1985."

"Provisional Voters Register

45. The principal Act is amended by adding immediately after section 15 the following new sections:

Addition of section 15A

15A.-(1) The Commission may, for purposes of preparation of a Permanent National Voters' Register, establish a Provisional Voters Register.

(2) The Provisional Voters' Register shall be used for:

(a) displaying for inspection by the public;

(b) amendments regarding change of residence or any other particulars of the voter;

(c) making objection against registration of any voter;

(d) inclusion or deletion of the name of the voter in the register.

(e) effecting any other corrections or amendments as may be required under this Act."

"Register of voters

15B.-(1) Subject to this section, there shall, for the purposes of this Act, be a Permanent National Voters Register which shall be in such parts, chapters or divisions as the Commission shall determine.

Act No. 1 of 1985

(2) The Director of Elections shall keep, maintain and up-date a register in accordance with the provisions of the Elections Act, 1985.

(3) The Director of Elections may give directions to the Registration Officer or Assistant Registration Officer on matters relating to registration of voters, contents of a voters register, or any other related matter."

46. Section 18 of the principal Act is hereby repealed. **Repeal of section 18**

47. Section 19 of the principal Act is amended by- **Amendment of section 19**

(a) inserting the following phrase "any person who is entitled to be registered as a voter under this Act, shall be registered as such; and" between the words "Act" and "a person" appearing in subsection (1) of that section;

(b) deleting the words "such other proof of his identity as the Registration officer may for the time being direct to be a sufficient proof of identity of the person claiming to be entitled to vote" and substituting for it the phrase "a voters card or any other document as the Commission may direct;

(c) deleting the words "in the word" appearing between the words "be" and "specified" and the words "in that word" appearing at the end of subsection (4) and substituting for them the words "in the polling station" and "in that polling station" respectively.

(d) by deleting the word "ward" appearing in the sixth and seventh lines of subsection (5) and substituting for it the words "polling station.

48. Section 21 of the principal Act is amended by: **Amendment of section 21**

(a) deleting subsection (1) and substituting for it the following:

"(1) The Commission shall be responsible for setting the time and up-date of registration of voters in every ward in a local authority";

(b) deleting the phrase "in view of the fact that an election is likely to take place in that ward in the near future or for any other reason" appearing in the seventh and eighth lines of subsection (3).

Amendment of section 23

49. Section 23 of the principal Act is amended by -

(a) deleting the phrase "forthwith register the applicant in the register for the ward and issue him a new certificate of registration for that ward" appearing as closing words of subsection (1) and substituting for it the phrase:

> "register the applicant in the prescribed form for the ward and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing of a new voters card;"

(b) deleting the words "Executive Officer" appearing in paragraphs (a) and (b) of subsection (2) and substituting for them the words "Director of Election".

(c) deleting the words "Registration Officer" between the words "the" and "shall" appearing in the sixth line of paragraph (c) of subsection (2) and substituting for them the words "Director of Elections".

Amendment of section 24

50. Section 24 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (2) by deleting the phrase "issue the applicant with a new certificate of registration" and substituting for it the phrase:

> "register the applicant in the prescribed form for the ward and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing of another voter's card marked "duplicate"."

Amendment of section 25

51. Section 25 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) designating the contents of section "25" as subsection "(1)";

(b) deleting the phrase "issue to the applicant a new certificate of registration, and shall make any necessary amendments to the register" appearing in the ninths to eleventh lines of subsection (1) as designated, and substituting for it the phrase:

> "shall register the applicant in the prescribed form for the polling district and forward the form to the Director of Elections for processing another voters card";

(c) deleting the proviso to subsection (1) as designated;

(d) adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

80

"(2) No new voter's card shall be issued under this section unless the applicant surrenders his voter's card or satisfies the Registration Officer that it is lost or destroyed and pays the prescribed fee, if any."

52. Section 27 of the principal Act is amended by:

Amendment of section 27

(a) designating the contents of section "27" as subsection "(1)";

(b) deleting the words "Resident Magistrate" appearing at the end of that subsection and substituting for them the words "district court"; and

(c) adding immediately after subsection (1) the following new subsection:

"(2) The district court shall decide on such appeal within fourteen days from the date of submission of an appeal."

53. Section 28 is hereby repealed and replaced with the following:-

Repeal and Replacement of section 28

"Inspection of a Provisional Voters' Register

28.-(1) Any person may inspect the Provisional Voters' Register of any ward on such day and at such time as the Registration Officer or, as the case may be, the Director of Elections may determine.

(2) The Registration Officer shall display the provisional voters' register in every ward and may amend it, if necessary, in the manner as may be prescribed by the Commission."

54. Part IV of the principal Act is amended by deleting the words "Executive Officer" wherever they appear in that Part and substituting for them the words "Director of Elections".

Amendment of Part IV

55. Section 32 of the principal Act is amended:

Amendment of section 32

(a) by deleting the word "fourteen" between the words "than" and "clear" appearing in subsection (1), and substituting for it the word "seven";

81

(b) in paragraph (a) of subsection (4), by deleting the words "delete or" between the words "shall" and "cause" appearing in that paragraph; and

(c) in paragraph (b) of subsection (4), by deleting the phrase "retain, or as the case may be, include, or" between the words "proved" and "cause" appearing in that paragraph.

Amendment of section 33

56. Section 33 of the principal Act is amended by deleting the words "twenty" and "Resident Magistrate" appearing in that section and substituting for them the words "fourteen" and "district court" respectively.

Amendment of section 34

57. Section 34 of the principal Act is amended by:

(a) deleting the words "Resident Magistrate" wherever they appear in subsections (2), (3), (4), (5), (6) and (9) and substituting for them the words "district magistrate";

(b) deleting the phrase "amend or cause to be amended the register and issue" between the words "shall" and "the" appearing at the eighth line of subsection (3), and substituting for it a phrase "cause to be amended the Provisional Voter Register and to be issued";

(c) deleting the words "to issue" between the words "refuse" and "a new" appearing in paragraph (b) of subsection (3), and substituting for it a phrase "to cause the issuance of";

(d) deleting the phrase "and any sum so awarded shall be recoverable as though the order was a decree of a district court for the recovery of money" appearing at the end of the proviso to subsection (5);

(e) by deleting the phrase "any sum ordered to be returned shall be recoverable as though the order was a decree of a district court for the recovery of money" appearing at the end of subsection (6);

(f) adding immediately after subsection (9) the following new subsection:

"(10) Any appeal lodged under this section shall be determined within fourteen days from the date of submission of an appeal".

58. Section 48 of the principal Act is amended by- Amendment of section 48

(a) deleting paragraph (b) of the proviso to subsection (1) and substituting for it the following:

"(b) the Commission may for a reasonable cause or upon the occurrence of an event preventing an election to take place, revoke the day previously appointed and appoint another election day."

(b) adding immediately after subsection (1) the following new subsections:

"(2) Where candidates are nominated for a by-election in a constituency, the Commission shall by notice in the *Gazette* appoint a day not more than thirty days after the day on which they have been nominated to stand as candidates for election in the ward.

(3) Where on the election day, there is an occurrence of an event that prevents an election to take place, the Commission shall appoint another day of election.

(4) Where the polling is adjourned under subsection (3), the time, procedure and manner of subsequent polling shall be as on the original polling day."

(c) by renumbering subsection (2) as subsection (5).

59. Section 50 of the principal Act is amended by- Amendment of section 50

(a) inserting immediately after subsection (1) the following new subsection:

"(2) Every withdrawal notice under subsection (1) shall be accompanied by a statutory declaration in the prescribed form, made and signed by the candidate before a magistrate".

(b) renumbering subsection (2) as (3).

Amendment of section 55

60. Section 55 of the principal Act is amended -

(a) by deleting the figure "(1)" appearing after the figure "55".

(b) by deleting subsections (2), (3) and (4).

Amendment of section 57

61. Section 57 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (e) by deleting the phrase "addresses, photographs, the name in acronym of his party and occupations, if any, of the candidates and stating the number of candidates for whom the voter may vote" and substituting for it the phrase:

"the full name of a candidate, a recent passport size photograph taken within three months and acronym or logo of the political party sponsoring the candidate."

Amendment section 62

62. Section 62 of the principal Act is amended in paragraph (a) by deleting the phrase "of such documentary evidence as to his identity as the officer or assistant may think satisfactory" and substituting for it the phrase "a voter's card or any other documentary evidence as the Commission may direct."

Amendment of section 68

63. Section 68 of the principal Act is amended in subsection (1) by inserting the words "while there remains voters who have not completed the polling process" between the words "violence" and "the".

Amendment of section 75

64. Section 75 of the principal Act is amended:

(a) by designating the contents of section "75", as subsection "(1)";

(b) by adding immediately after subsection (1) as designated the following new subsection:

"(2) Any vote which shall be casted in respect of any candidate who has withdrawn his candidature under this Act, shall be treated as a spoilt vote."

85

OBJECTS AND REASONS

The Bill is intended to amend the Elections Act, 1985 and the Local Authorities (Elections) Act 1979. The proposed amendments intend to enable the Electoral Commission to establish the Permanent National Voters' Register and to make better provisions pertaining to the registration of voters in the Register, roles and powers of Electoral Commission and Registration Officers in the process of registering voters in the Register. Other amendments are intended to address and correct various shortfalls and anomalies experienced during the 2000 general elections.

The Bill is divided into three Parts.

The First Part deals with preliminary matters.

The Second Part deals with amendments in the Elections Act, 1985. Under the Elections Act new concepts are defined in view of the establishment of the register of voters; and matters relating to registration, establishment, maintenance and updating the Register are proposed. The concept of issuance of voters' cards to voter instead of the registration certificates and conditions for issuance of voters cards and replacement of lost and destroyed voters cards are also proposed. It is also proposed to empower the Electoral Commission to appoint Registration Officers and Assistant Registration Officers. A new section 4C is introduced in order to assign the responsibility of providing voter education to the Electoral Commission. Amendments in section 10 proposes to enable persons who on the date of election will have reached the age of eighteen years to be registered in the Register of voters in 2004.

Amendments in section 12A propose to empower the Commission to register persons in Zanzibar who are entitled to vote only for the election of the President of the United Republic. Reduction of period for appealing against refusal to register or deletion from the register of

85

voters from twenty one days to fourteen days is also proposed. Such appeals are now proposed to be lodged before the District Court.

Section 22 is proposed to be amended so as to impose the duty to the Commission to display the Register for inspection. The amendments in section 26(3) propose to empower the Director of Elections to amend the Register upon receipt of determinations of objections from the Registration officers and decisions of magistrates pertaining to appeals. Initially the Director of Elections did not have such powers.

It is also proposed to introduce amendments that require the Presidential election candidates to make statutory declaration of their qualifications before judges. Amendments in section 46 are intended to empower the Commission to appoint another election date in case of failure of an election to take place on the appointed date due to unpredictable situations. The amendments in section 48 are intended to introduce a condition for withdrawing from candidature by declaring the same before the Magistrate.

The amendment in section 56 is proposed so as to reconcile with the contents of ballot paper under section 59 which was amended in 2000. The amendments in section 74 are intended to introduce another category of spoilt votes arising out of votes casted in respect of a candidate who has withdrawn. Subsection (2) of section 116 is proposed to be deleted so as to reconcile with section 65 which was repealed in 2000 on matters relating to tendered ballot.

Part III of the Bill deals with the amendments of the Local Authorities (Election) Act, 1979. The amendments which are proposed in this Bill in relation to the Local Authorities (Election) Act are generally intended to take on board the spirit of the amendments proposed in the Elections Act, 1985.

A REPORT ON THE CONDUCT OF PUBLIC HEARINGS AT CONSTITUENCY LEVEL - MAY 2004

MAX MMUYA
and
BERNADETA KILLIAN

JULY 2004

List of Acronyms

BC	British Council
CCM	Chama cha Mapinduzi
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
CT	Consultancy Team
LEAT	Lawyers Environmental Action Team
LHRC	Legal and Human Rights Center
MPs	Members of Parliament
NEC	National Electoral Commission
SUNY	State University of New York
TLP	Tanzania Labour Party
UDSM	University of Dar-es-Salaam

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Public Hearing on Bills at Constituency Level in Tanzania.

Constituency-level public hearings on bills are part of a series of activities designed by SUNY/Tanzania. They are geared at strengthening the Tanzania's National Assembly. In particular, these public hearings are intended to improve the extent of representation by increasing citizens' access to and understanding of the legislative process. In addition, the program is intended to enhance MPs-constituency relations through periodic and systematic interaction during public hearings events.

The current effort arises from the realization that for many years, a majority of Tanzanians were not taking part in influencing the law-making process. This was largely due to a one-party monopolistic political system that restricted the law-making process to the few, the ruling elites. With the introduction of the pluralist competitive system in mid 1992, the arena of law-making process has been open to the general public through various ways including parliamentary public hearings at the committee levels. The public hearings at the constituency level are part of this process of not only enhancing MPs' representation capacity but also to enable the general public to make significant contributions to the law-making process.

Whereas the importance of holding public hearings at the constituency level cannot be overemphasized, the practicability of this undertaking is the central purpose of this report. This report presents the findings from a series of public hearings that were conducted in four different constituencies of Tanzania. They include Kilolo (Iringa), Tunduru (Ruvuma), Hai (Kilimanjaro) and Singida North (Singida). These were selected as pilot constituencies to carry out public hearings in order to determine various modalities of their implementation. Based on the four pilot constituencies, the report presents the outcome of the exercise, lessons learnt, complexities and challenges faced and derives recommendations so as to make constituency-level public hearings more effective in future and larger setting.

1.2 A Precursor to the Hearing Process in the Pilot Constituencies

Training Workshop for MPs for the Hearings Process.

In preparation for the hearing process in the four constituencies, a two-day workshop of a designated group of MPs was conducted on the 27th – 28th April, 2004 in Dar-es-salaam. This seminar aimed at leading the MPs on how to conduct the public hearings on bills in their respective constituencies.

Besides the MPs, the seminar also drew the participation of representatives from various civil society organizations (CSOs), as well as officials from government agencies such as the National Electoral Commission (NEC) etc. The involvement of NEC and CSOs was essential in order to capture the image of the setting of the envisaged hearings at the constituency levels. Also, the representatives would hopefully send the message downwards to respective organs at lower levels encouraging others to organize themselves and participate in the process in the respective areas when the opportunity arose.

The following topics were covered at the workshop:

- The concept of the constituency level public hearings on bills;
- How to define the agenda at the hearing;
- Inviting expert testimony;
- Press relations for public hearings;

- Organizational techniques (Best Practices) on public hearings at constituency level ; and
- Incorporating CSO inputs.

It was expected that after the training session the MPs would be able to execute and steer the hearing process on their own in their respective constituencies through an application of the concepts and principles taught . At this workshop the MPs were given copies of the bills to be discussed by stakeholders in their constituencies.

Selection of Pilot Constituencies

Four pilot centers were identified by both SUNY/Tanzania and the consultancy team. The former selected three centers and the later was given an opportunity to select the fourth constituency. However, the list of constituencies was revised due to the fact that some MPs would not be able to participate in the public hearings events. Originally, SUNY/Tanzania selected Tunduru, Iringa Urban and Singida Urban. Due to unavailability of the MP of Iringa urban, Kilolo was selected as a replacement. The consultancy team's first choice was Kigamboni. However, due to the fact that the Kigamboni MP was not available, SUNY/Tanzania identified Hai as a replacement.

Facilitation Team.

- Lawyers (Legal Experts)

SUNY/Tanzania hired legal experts to accompany the MPs and other members of the team to the constituencies in order to assist in providing expert testimonies pertaining to various issues in the selected bill. The legal experts came from Dar-es-Salaam-based CSO namely Lawyers Environmental Action Team ([redacted]) and Legal and Human Rights Centre (LHRC).

- Consultants

Besides the legal experts, consultants who had designed the training tool accompanied the MPs and the lawyers. Their role was to observe, and evaluate the process and assess its viability/potential for a possible roll out to other constituencies.

- Logistics Support

There also was a field facilitator who was assigned the task of dealing with logistics in preparation of the events.

- Sponsors

The field facilitator was accompanied with two representatives from SUNY/Tanzania and British Council in order to help in the administration and the management of the events.

Invitation of Participants (Stakeholders)

The host MPs were responsible of inviting various stakeholders to the public hearing events. They also identified the venue for the public hearing event. Specific invitations were sent to specific individuals. Being a controlled event (pilot), no public notice was posted some days prior the hearing inviting the general public to attend the event. Only those who received invitation letters were supposed to attend.

The structure and composition of the stakeholders fairly complied with the instructions presented to the MPs by the sponsors. In response, the participants were drawn from civil society organizations located in the area, political parties, religious organizations, the government and the general public. This created a good mixed group of CSOs, leaders of political parties from both the opposition and the ruling party,

heads of district council administration, leaders of religious organizations, professionals (e.g. medical doctor) and retired professionals such as judges and magistrates, accountants, etc.

The competence of the stake holders however varied within individual constituencies and between them. Within the constituencies, some participants had as much as University education when others hardly had any formal education. Between the constituencies, the Hai constituency represented a more informed audience compared to that of Tunduru, Singida and Kilolo. With the exception of Hai, a majority of the participants in other 3 centers came from the ruling party who included ordinary CCM members, councilors, ward and district leaders. This is indeed a reflection of the political configurations in Tanzania whereby a majority of the electorate tend to belong to the ruling party, CCM.

1.3 Structure and Organization of the Report.

The report is divided into the following sections. Immediately following this introduction, the report presents an account of the proceedings of the public hearings as they took place in each of the four selected pilot constituencies, detailing how the public hearings were actually conducted in the constituencies. The next section is a consolidation of the "theatrical" process of the hearings drawing out outstanding issues, patterns and trends. The last section offers recommendations on the emerging patters for further follow-up action and possible rolling out of the program to a larger setting .

2.0 Public Hearings at Constituency Level: A Recount of the Proceedings at the Centers

2.1 Kilolo Center

2.1.1 Pre-Public Hearing Highlights at the Kilolo Centre

The Kilolo constituency centre for the public hearing exercise was an alternative to the previously designated centre, Iringa Urban of the Honorable *Monica Mbegga (MP) CCM* in Iringa Region. As an electoral district, Kilolo is a new constituency with its new member of Parliament, the *Hon Venance Methusalah Mwamoto (CCM)*.

The hearing was held at the Comfort Hotel, on the foot of the Kitonga hills towards Iringa town. The centre proved to be an ideal location in so far that it was very well furnished with accommodation of participants as well as receipt of attendant essentials. Even more important, the location was not prone to the usual obstructive interventions where participants would be inclined to step out of proceedings so as to attend to issues usually offered by a more built up and accessible environment. Kitonga is very confined without reach by any mode of present popular communication such as cellular phones or fax. It is nevertheless very well served by road to Iringa town. But being on the foot of very sharp undulating hills, sneaking out to town was self denied.

In its original design, where the hearing was to be held in Iringa Urban constituency, the following members of Parliament were expected to attend:

- Hon. George Mlawa –CCM *(Kalenga)*
- Hon. William Lukuvi –CCM *(Isimani, Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office)*
- Hon. Hon.Venance Methusalah Mwamoto- *CCM (Kilolo)*

With the change to Kilolo, the Hon. Mwamoto became the host and of the other three members of parliament, it was only the Hon. George Mlawa that attended the hearing and only arrived at the centre in the late Morning of the third day (May 7th, 2004).

The Pre-Hearing Proceedings at the Kilolo Centre: Organizational Challenges

Prior to the planned tasks for May 4th-8th, 2004, the facilitation team considered it necessary to hold consultation meetings on the arrival day to determine the extent to which the forum was ready for the hearing.

Consultation Meeting 1.: May 4th, 2004 (Evening - Arrival Day)

In attendance:

- Mr. Danford Kabiki (Assistant to the Host Member of Parliament- Hon. Mwamoto)
- Mr. Mkono Babili (BC)
- Ms. Neema Kiula (Logistics- Bunge Foundation)
- Mr. Elias Mwanshiuya (Legal Expert - LEAT)
- Prof. Max Mmuya (Consultant) University of Dar es Salaam

From the meeting it was immediately evident that:

- On this arrival day, the host MPs was not at the centre. He was scheduled to appear on the first day of the hearing. The host MP had however stationed his assistant to take care of the appropriate preparations for the meeting.
- The office of the MP was not clear about the purpose of the meeting[1].
- The program of the day(s) was not even in the drawing board.
- Other MPs who were to take part in the hearing event at this centre were also not present.
- On another score. the materials, notably the bill that was to be discussed was yet to be made available to the Public that was to give views on. In fact, the facilitation team had brought the bill and was yet to distribute them to the public.

  What this practically meant was that the constituents did not have prior, knowledge of the bill they were to give their opinions on during the following and subsequent days, as rules of the hearing process require.

- Regrettably, there was also varied levels, at this starting point, among members of the facilitation team of understanding with regard to the concept and process of what was to take place the following and subsequent days (a problem which diminished in intensity as time went by)[2].

Decisions and Actions taken.

Arising from the above limitations, it was agreed that:

- The actual public hearing process should be deferred to the second day, that is May 6th and following.
- Have a review session with the host MP and his assistant the following morning on the concept. objectives, process of a public hearing meeting. At the morning session remind the host MP of his obligations at the hearing sessions.
- Require the host MP and his assistant to draw a program of day 1 providing for space for a summary presentation to the participants on the concept, importance and functions of Public Hearings and the role of constituents at such hearings
- Secondly devote the rest of the day for the participants to read and discuss in groups the content and spirit of the Bill so as to establish a knowledge base for the presentation of their opinions on it the following days.
- May 5th, which was to be the starting day of the public hearing be used to do the following:

  ** Distribute copies of the bill to participants*
  ** Conduct a summary teach – in of the concept, process, requirements, etc of a public hearing on bills*
  ** Organize participants into groups to study the bill they would give views on during the following days.*
  ** The last day (May 8th, 2004) be devoted to an evaluation of the process and chart the way forward on public hearings on bills, and specifically on the current bill.*

[1] Letters of invitation to participants erroneously invited them to a seminar not a public hearing.
[2] This is understandable. Please refer to the structure and composition of the facilitation team above, and the roles they each were to play.

Consultation Meeting 2. May 5th,2004

Since the Host MP was not available at the first consultation meeting, and realizing that the process and roles of each person at the hearing was not yet clear, as was agreed during the first consultation meeting, it became necessary to have a second meeting and additional person to person consultations on the process of the hearing.

In Attendance

- Hon. Venance Mwamoto, MP
- Mr. Danford Kabiki (Assistant to the Host Member of Parliament- Hon. Mwamoto)
- Mr. Mkono Babili (BC)
- Ms. Neema Kiula (Logistics - Bunge Foundation)
- Mr. Elias Mwanshiuya (Legal Expert - LEAT)
- Prof. Max Mmuya (Consultant) UDSM

At this meeting, decisions arrived at the previous night were re-emphasized. Specific tasks and assignments were issued especially those related to what the host MP and his assistant were to carry out.

2.1.2 Hearing Proceedings at the Kilolo centre. Participants

- *MPs in Attendance*

1. Hon. Hon.Venance Methusalah Mwamoto *(CCM)* (Host)
2. Hon. George Mlawa *(Kalenga)* (From May 7th, 2004)

- *The Constituents.*

The List of constituents that were to give views on the bill is provided at the end as an appendix. In any case, the participants identified themselves as coming from a spectrum of the population within the constituency. These included notables from the government such the Kilolo District Commissioner. Mr. B. K. Minja, Officials of the party in office, eg. District CCM publicity secretary, councilors all of whom were from the CCM, representatives from the opposition parties: CUF, Chadema, and TLP. Church and Muslim Leaders. Among these were a handful of women participants. In all, there were 43 participants.

- *Facilitators*

For the running of the public hearing the following were in attendance as facilitators in their various capacities:

1. Mr. George William (SUNY) } *Sponsors*
2. Mr. Mkono Babili (BC) } *Sponsors*
3. Ms. Neema Kiula (Bunge Foundation -BF) *Logistics*
4. Mr. Elias Mwanshiuya (LEAT) Lawyer
5. Prof. Max Mmuya (UDSM) *Consultant*

Proceedings of the Hearing

Arising from the limitations observed during the pre-hearing consultation meetings, the proceedings had to be conducted on close guidance of the facilitation team for them to yield at least some of the basic expectations. The guidance demanded adherence to the sequential steps as were introduced to the members of the then envisaged constituencies at the teach-in seminar held at the Courtyard Hotel from April 27th-28th, 2004 in Dar es Dar es Salaam. These steps involved:

- Defining of the Agenda
- The Public's presentation of views.
- Conclusions.

Based on these sequence of activities, the constituencies raised a number of issues related to the Agenda, that is the bill on the amendment of the electoral laws. Among the key issues raised were the following:

- The language of the bill and subsequent acts.

This was probably the loudest voice. Almost every speaker raised the issue that if the public hearing institution was to take effect, the bill had to be in a language that can be understood by those that had to their opinion on.

There then followed issues related to

- the need for civic education on public hearings.
- Limitations of the National Electoral Commission as the organ charged with the preparation of the permanent Voter Register, etc.

2.1.3 An Analysis of the Public Hearing on Bills at the Kilolo Centre.

Under this section we are going to make evaluation statements on the features of the hearing and make some tentative recommendations where it applies.

Setting of the "Stage"

In the setting of the stage we would like to comment on the issues raised above. These issues are in respect to the background to Kilolo and on the pre-hearing proceedings. The issues that came out were:

Change of host centre from Iringa Urban constituency to Kilolo; late arrival of the host MP; lack of clarity on the side of the MP and his assistant on what a public hearing entailed; lack of program of the day(s); an almost complete absence of the other MPs who were to take part in the hearing event at this centre; non availability of the bill that was to be discussed; the varied of levels of understanding of the concept and process of a public hearing process among members of the facilitation team.

In our judgment, the stage for the "theatrical" performance of the public hearing "event" fell far short of the prior requirements which involves such things as prior notification, prior invitations, prior availability of the bill, etc. Obviously, the intended results would have been, as was the case, impacted by such a limited setting.

However, thanks to the rescue efforts by the facilitation team that enabled the program to continue to the degree it did. The team evolved a strategy that adequately responded to the limitations as narrated above. In retrospect, there is an intended positive side to it. The rescue efforts are a learning experience that

provides the basis over how to appropriately respond to cases of limited advance preparations should these problems resurface then. *(See decisions and actions taken. above*). In fact, in the execution of the current process, these ideas were shared out by phone for possible application to the other team that was about to execute the program in the northern part of the country, in Hai and Singida. It is gratifying that where it happened this was the nature of the response, as it is recounted under the relevant sections below.

Structure and Composition of the Public and other participants.

- ***The MPs***

Above, we have alluded to the triangle of the components of the groups of people in attendance at the hearing at the Kilolo centre as the members of parliament, the spectrum of the constituents and the team of facilitators.

Like we said above, there was a significant short fall in the number of MPs that were to participate in the proceedings at this centre. Besides the host MP, only one more MP attended the session and towards the end at that. We are yet to determine what may have accounted for this short fall. In any event, if the other two or three MPs were envisaged to serve as frontrunners in the crusade for the spread of the democratic virtues inherent in a public hearing exercise, then their non-availability does not augur well for the onward transmission of the practice presumably beginning with their constituencies.

- ***The Participants***

Turning to the spectrum of the public, first, it was heartening that the attendance represented a rainbow of political opinions and shades of social position and status. The presence of the District Commissioner within the group leaderships of religious persons added a sense of seriousness and solemn to the envisaged proceedings. In fact, it was very instructive that the actual hearing proceedings were graced by prayers from both the church and mosque leaderships.

However, reflecting on the political and socio cultural configurations of Iringa as a region, the publics were dominated by those from the dominant party in the region, CCM and dominated by men. But what was refreshing, where the opportunity arouse, the participants addressed themselves to issues purely on a subject matter basis than along partisan lines.

However, considering how the participants from "different parties" articulated their views, we wondered whether or not the representatives from the opposition parties indeed came from them or may just have assumed that mantle. They for example showered a lot of praise on the incumbent MP (CCM) for having been singled out by the sponsors among the many MPs in the country as one in whose constituency the pilot exercise would start. As for the religious leaders, they just fell short of invoking their heavenly spirits to reward the incumbent MP with more terms of office.

Also, the dominance of office holders (from parties, etc.) also did not reflect what could actually take place. In a real practical setting, one can assume that this composition of the public will significantly be moderated with more of the non-office, private individuals forming part of the constituents.

The Team of Facilitators.

The presence of a team of "facilitators" was fitting for the event as a pilot one. The facilitators were important for several reasons. First they served as a back up organ for any shortfalls in the actual proceedings of the hearing. This became very important within the context of the limitations presented

above. Secondly, like the distinctive participants from the larger constituents above, the facilitators as sponsors, legal experts, etc. conferred even higher status and weight to the institution of public hearing on bills that was being experimented at the centre, and by extension in the country. To this end, we trust that the event as was represented, notably by the facilitation team and others, will serve as a reference point and icon of efforts at carrying the frontiers of democracy further.

On the other hand, the way the facilitation team participated in the process may have, without intentions, added another panel in the mindset of the constituents that they are
" **recipients**" and the **MP** as supported by the sponsors were the " **providers**" In the literal sense, this surrounded the issue of "allowances and other benefits" the constituents enjoyed for their participation in the public hearing meeting. A non-established yet not unfounded word had it that constituents to the hearing meeting were invited with due consideration that favors were being extended to them for possible exchange for political support in due course or previously offered to the political entrepreneurs[3]. In this regard, the allowances were translated as **deserving** receipts expected from the MP (and Sponsors). Unfortunately as indicated in the first field report, the MP accepted this as the case. He did not mince words when in very subtle political language wherever the opportunity emerged during the entire meeting, acknowledged with appreciation remarks from some members of the constituents that efforts associated with him indeed resulted in the event that was taking place with the benefits that went along with it.

- *MPs in Attendance*

1. Hon. *Hon. Venance Methusalah Mwamoto (CCM)* (Host)
2. Hon. George Mlawa *(Kalenga)* (From May 7th, 2004)

- *The Constituents.*

The List of constituents that were to give views on the bill is provided at the end as an appendix. In any case, the participants identified themselves as coming from a spectrum of population within the constituency. These included notables from the government such the Kilolo District Commissioner, Mr. B. K. Minja, Officials of the party in office, eg. District CCM publicity secretary, councilors all of whom were from the CCM, representatives from the opposition parties: CUF, Chadema, and TLP. Church and Muslim Leaders. Among these were a handful of women participants. In all, there were 43 participants.

- *Facilitators*

For the running of the public hearing the following were in attendance as facilitators in their various capacities:

1. Mr. George William (SUNY) } *Sponsors*
2. Mr. Mkono Babili (BC) } *Sponsors*
3. Ms. Neema Kiula (Bunge Foundation -BF) *Logistics*
4. Mr. Elias Mwashiuya (LEAT) *Legal Expert*
5. Prof. Max Mmuya (UDSM) *Consultancy Team (CT)*

[3] The proceedings meeting almost came to a halt based on what the constituents judged as insufficient daily allowance they were to be provided with for their evening meals. They negotiated for an allowance that would meet both their daily provisions as well as fend for the families they left at home in order to take part in the proceedings.

Issues Raised:
When the time for presentation of views came, the constituents expressed a lot of enthusiasm to present those views.

A very recurring view brought by more than half of the constituents was on the language of the bill. They argued that the English language in which the bill was written, impaired their ability to understand the substance of the bill and raise issues on it. They recommended that if the institution of the public hearing is to bear its intended objectives, the bill and subsequently the law emanating from it should be in the language of the understood by people, the Swahili language[4].

Besides the language issue, the constituents went about expressing both appreciation and concern on the institution of the public hearing as well as the bill.

With regard to the bill, the high lights were on:

The security of the voters register which was the central piece of the bill. The constituents expressed their concerns over the process of establishing the permanent voters register, the authenticity of the ID cards that are to support it use, custody of the register and cards when established etc.

In addition, most of the participants expressed very committed wish that the institution of introducing a public hearing on bills been preceded by a civic education program.. They argued that such prior understanding of the institution of public hearing would have generated increased interest in the public to come out and participate in the process. In addition they claimed that such was the zeal on the institution now that before their MP calls for another hearing on bills, they now consider initiating the process by inviting their MP for similar future exercises on other bills.

Coming to the subject matter of the bill, the constituents had the general feeling that the establishment of the permanent voters' register was the right direction in assuring freer and fairer elections. By and large, the constituents were positively inclined to participate in the presentation of their views on the bill. They in fact wondered why the practice came so late. They wished it was instituted alongside the re-introduction of the multi-party competitive system.

Apart from this positive look, it was evidently clear that the constituents could have been more articulate in making contributions to the bill had it been made available to the constituents well in advance of the hearing process. It was also evident that the contributions would have been more profound if the bill was in a language they could more easily express themselves in.

Managing the "Stage"

A key and very central feature of the hearing process was undoubtedly the management of the process, or what we may want to refer to as the "stage". This process, as per procedures presented at the teach-in workshop prior to the hearing process is the immediate responsibility of the host MP (and his assistants) and in anticipation of the process being replicated in the adjacent constituencies, it could have been shared out in a co-chairing arrangement with the MPs from the sister constituencies in attendance.

[4] It has come to our attention, that officially the language of bills and law in Tanzania is English. The bills can a summary of the main issues in it in Swahili.

The actual process of managing the stage, as per the teach-in exercise had at least three main parts: The preparatory pre-hearing process discussed above, steps in the hearing process including the actual handling of the proceedings of the meeting, and relatively minor, the conclusion of the process. Of these three parts, the second one is the most important. Managing the " stage" would involve adherence to the step by step of conducting the hearing process and the actual steering of the proceedings. The steps being referred to here are as were discussed at the teach-in forum were the following:

- Defining of the Agenda
  Presentation of the contents of the bill
  Presentation of Testimonies (Subject Matter, legal, etc.)
- Sequential call out of presenters of Views
- Time allocation and management
- Courteous Handling of the presenters and Audience
- Recording of Proceedings
- Concluding the Process
  Adjournment or Closing

Many related issues on the current subject have been raised above notably under
1.1 b) Pre-Hearing Proceedings at the Kilolo Centre, 1.3 Hearing Proceedings at the Kilolo centre and preceding parts of this sub-unit. In that case we would here like to raise only one gross issue.

The presentation part of the bill by the host was very inadequate, in fact not done at all. The other aspects of the process was fairly well handled by the host MP. On both of them however, the *"facilitation team"* organized itself to fill the gap, and often intervened to steer the course of the proceedings along the proper path.

If one were to speculate on the reasons in regard to the rather weak performance of the host MP, there perhaps could have been several among which are:

- The MP(s), like the constituents may not have had ample time to study and subsequently be able to present the bill to the audience during the hearing process.

- The induction on the contents of the Training and handling tool at the seminar at the Courtyard Hotel (April 27th-28th, 2004) may not have sunk in to enable the MP(s) apply them during the hearing process.

2.1.4 Issues in the Way Forward.

On the last day of the hearing, the audience made an evaluation of the entire exercise, making comments on the following areas:

- Objectives of the Public Hearing,
- Proceedings of the public hearing,
- The way forward.

In the evaluation process, the public were very appreciative of the introduction of the institution of the public hearing at the constituency level. Emanating from the issues above, among other things, the participants raised the following issues:

- The importance of advance distribution of the bills to the public for their studying so that they can present more meaningful views to their MPs.

- That presentation of views on bills will be constrained should they continue to be in a language not familiar to the public;

- That hearings should spread out to other areas in the constituency;

- That participants should financially be facilitated for their participation in the presentation of views on bills. They likened themselves to members of the Parliamentary Sub-Committees that receive allowances when they sit to hear views on bills or when they exercise their oversight roles on, for example, government spending.

The last statement raised concern among the members of the facilitation team
The issue of demand for allowances for participation in seminars, workshops and now meetings for public hearings on bills raises a number of issues. The cross-cutting one goes back to the " **provider" / "recipient"** syndrome in the MP/Constituent relationship, which needs no further elaboration here. But we would like to register it now because of the implication this syndrome has for the smooth implementation and sustainability of the public hearing institution and other related opportunities.

At the back of one's mind, the syndrome as it appears here may be alluding to the problem of ownership of the process through which this and previous well meaning institutional reforms have "landed" on the stakeholders. When one looks at them closely, these reforms and their attendant institutions building have been brought to the stakeholders, and the stakeholders were brought at fora like the public hearings on bills to receive them. The stakeholders did not plan for them. They did not budget for them. Even worse, they now have them but may not know what to do with them. We suspect that if the constituents were to be asked if these reforms and their accompanying institutions would make any significant difference in their life routines should they have abandoned them at the threshold of the conference hall of the Comfort Hotel, the response would probably be an ambivalent one if not a complete, "NO"!

This raises the same and long standing issue regarding the need to prepare the mind of the stakeholders on the significance and need of the institution(s), plan with them, budget for it with them, and discuss what difference it would make tor them with or without it. We suspect that haste and the drive to be on track in accordance to dead lines may be at the heart of the current problem.

To us as consultants, the push to adhere to deadlines before the ground was prepared, with all its noble reasons, was professionally very challenging when it was already evident to us that the results would not be optimal. There is the critical need to reflect on how to handle this issue before the program is rolled out.

2.1.5 Conclusion.

The "Theatre" was not well set. It does not provide the pilot model that it was to be. It hardly therefore can provide a sound basis for making generalizations upon which the program can be rolled out to include other constituencies. A number of critical steps could have been taken care of in advance of the exercise to have generated the theatrical example the exercise was intended to be.

However, on the other hand, a faulty example can serve as a lesson in various fronts. From the experience of Kilolo and later Tunduru and elsewhere inn the pilot centers as will be shown below, we can flush out the following experience which can serve as a resource in the execution of program in the outer sphere. These are:

1. How to respond to cases of non availability of appropriate documents (the bills) in advance of the hearing.

(Teach ins on the substance and spirit of the Bill beyond the normal subject matter expert testimony-presentation)

2. Lack of full capacity to manage the stage *(Guidance by an expert)*
3. Speedy and appropriate adjustment by non- subject expert facilitators to the demands and process of the hearing process. *(The accompanying facilitators,*

Who by their roles had not had sufficient exposure to the elements of a public hearing at constituency level were prompt to familiarize themselves with the process as to participate in the provision of guidance when situations arouse)

2.2 Tunduru Center

2.2.1 Pre-Public Hearing Highlights at the Tunduru Centre

The Tunduru centre was one of the originally designated hearing centers. It was to have been the "curtain-raiser" of the overall pilot project in the four constituencies. On the request from the host MP, the Honorable Juma Akukweti, MP and Deputy Speaker, the proceedings at this location took place from May 11-14th, immediately after the proceedings at the Kilolo centre. In the planning processes, the hearing exercise at the Tunduru centre went concurrently with that in Hai, in Kilimanjaro Region, in the North of Tanzania.

The hearing took place at the Skyway, Roman Catholic Church Conference Hall, in the heart of Tunduru town. The centre proved to be an ideal location in a different sense from that of Iringa. Tunduru is a small township with least obstructive demands that could have motivated the participants to stay away from the proceedings. Instead, it was within reach of the invited constituents.

The invitees were enviously looked at by other town residents that were not part of the constituents for the hearing process. Town dwellers were following the proceedings very closely through the local television station that transmitted the proceedings every evening of the scheduled dates. Resulting from that watchful eye, participants strived to make improved contributions to the proceedings on subsequent days as will be recounted below.

In its original design, other Members of Parliament that were to take part in the proceedings of this centre were:

Hon. Prof. Simon Mbilinyi, *(MP, CCM from Peramiho)*
Hon. Prof. Pius Mbawala *(MP, Deputy Minister for Agriculture from Namtumbo)*, and Hon. Dr. Lawrance Gama *(MP, CCM from Songea Urban)*

Of all these, it was only Hon. Simon Mbilinyi who was in attendance

The Pre-Hearing Proceedings at the Tunduru Centre: Organizational Challenges

Like at the Kilolo centre, prior to the planned tasks on May 11th- 14th, 2004, the facilitation team considered it necessary to hold consultation meetings on the arrival day to determine the extent to which the forum was ready for the hearing.

In attendance at the meeting were:

- Hon. Juma Akukweti *(Host-MP, Deputy Speaker)*
- Mr.Saidi Masisima *(Assistant to the Deputy Speaker)*
- Mr. George William (SUNY) } *Sponsors*
- Mr. Mkono Babili (BC)
- Ms. Neema Kiula (*Logistics - Bunge Foundation -BF*)
- Mr. Clarence Kipobota *(Legal and Human Rights Centre who had replaced Mr. Elias from LEAT, who had travelled with the team that went to Hai and Singida North)* and
- Prof. Max Mmuya (Consultant, UDSM)

Emerging issues:

- Like at Kilolo, the materials, notably the bill that was to be discussed was yet to be made available to the Public that was to give views on. Also, like in Kilolo, the facilitation team had brought the bill and was yet to be even distributed to the public.

  What this practically meant again was that the constituents did not have prior knowledge of the bill they were to give their opinions on during the following and subsequent days.

- Unlike Kilolo, from the experience and involvement at the Kilolo centre, members of the facilitation team had developed a deeper level of understanding with regard to the concept and process of what was to take place at a public hearing event the following days

  This was further enhanced by the adequate understanding of the process by the host MP, the Deputy Speaker as much as his demonstrable commitment and appreciation for the central importance of the institution of public hearings in the legislative process.

Decisions and Actions taken.

Arising from the above limitations, and taking advantage of the spirit of the host MP, it was agreed that:

- The actual public hearing process should be deferred to the second day, that is May 12th and following.
- Require the host MP and his assistant to draw a program of day 1 during which, there would be a summary presentation to the participants on the concept, importance, function etc of Public Hearings and the Role of Constituents at such hearings
- Secondly devote the rest of the day for the participants to read and discuss in groups the content and spirit of the Bill so as to establish a knowledge basis for their presentation of their opinions on it the following days.
- May 12th, which was to be the starting day of the public hearing be used to do the following along the lines of the Kilolo centre:

  ** Distribute copies of the bill to participants*
  ** Conduct a summary teach – in of the concept, process, requirements, etc of a public hearing on bills*

** Organize participants into groups to study the bill they would give views on during the following days.*
** The last day (May 14th, 2004) be devoted to an evaluation of the process and chart the way forward on public hearings on bills, and specifically on the current bill.*

Prior to the proceedings of Day one, the team from Dar, led by the Host, the Deputy Speaker of the Tanzania National Assembly, Bunge, were invited to pay a courtesy call to the Tunduru District Commissioner, Mr. Ole-Telele, who they were informed had keen interest on what was to take place later on in the day and subsequent days.

2.2.2 The Proceedings

In Attendance

Like the Kilolo centre, there were three main categories of participants at the Tunduru centre: Tunduru public officials and dignitaries, facilitators from Dar es Salaam and the constituents.

The Tunduru Officials and dignitaries were

- The .Hon. Juma Akukweti, (MP, Deputy Speaker, Host)
- Hon. Prof. Simon Mbilinyi, (Peramiho)
- Mr. Olle - Telele, (Tunduru, District Commissioner)
- Mr.Mfaume Asiya (CCM District Treasurer)

The Facilitators

- Mr. Mkono Babili (BC)
- Mr.George William (SUNY)
- Ms. Neema Kiula (Logistics - Bunge Foundation)
- Mr. Clarence Kipobota (Legal and Human Rights Centre)
- Prof. Max Mmuya (CT) Univ. of Dar es Dar es Salaam

The Constituents:

The Constituents were sourced from an variety of institutions and these were represented by the following categories.

- Political Parties
- Peasant farmers
- Officials of NGOs
- Councilors
- Public Sector Officials
- Other Private Sector Officials

The Total Number was 40 participants

The Hearing Process:

Like at the Kilolo centre, arising from the limitations observed during the pre-hearing consultation meetings, the proceedings had to be conducted on close guidance of the facilitation team for it to yield at least some of the basic expectations. The guidance demanded adherence to the sequential steps as were introduced to the members of the then envisaged constituencies at the teach-in seminar held at the Courtyard Hotel from April 27th-28th, 2004 in Dar es Dar es Salaam.

These steps involved: *(See Basic Procedures and Steps in the Running of a Public hearing)*

- Defining of the Agenda
- The Public's presentation of views.
- Conclusions.

Based on these sequence of activities, the constituencies raised a number of issues related to the Agenda, that is the bill on the amendment of the electoral laws. Among the key issues raised were the following: Like at the Kilolo centre, there was the issue on the language of the bill and subsequent acts. The loudest and very articulate voice at the Tunduru centre was however on the suggestive central role, as per the bill, of the National Electoral Committee (NEC) in the preparation and onward management of the permanent voter register. In a very scathing attack, some very well versed participants at the hearing were averse to the role of the NEC to assume such roles on the grounds that it was not an "independent" body and that by extension the voter register was not going to be "independent" (authentic). Alongside their Kilolo colleagues, the Tunduru participants, went on to recommend the need for increased civic education, advance supply of bills before the hearing process, etc.

2.2.3 An Analysis of the Public Hearing on Bills at the Tunduru Centre.

Setting the Stage

The setting of the stage at the Tunduru centre was a close mirror of the situation at the Kilolo centre. In summary the stage for the "theatrical" performance of the public hearing "event" fell short of the prior demands. Obviously, the intended results would have been, as was the case, impacted by such a limited setting as well.

But, from the experience at the Kilolo centre, the facilitation team already had a formula on how to handle such a case. And as has been described above, that formula was applied and worked well. Of course, in both cases, the allocation of one day for the preparation which was to be have been done earlier, meant that part of the time that was to have been devoted for the hearing process, was eaten away for an activity that was not intended, albeit, it proved very useful.

Structure and Composition of the Public and other participants.

The MPs

At the Tunduru centre, as was the case at Kilolo, there was a significant short fall in the number of MPs that were to participate in the proceedings. Besides the host MP, only one more MP attended the session, the Hon. Prof. Simon Mbilinyi. The participation of Prof. Mbilinyi however very uniquely appreciated in so far that unlike in the Kilolo case, Prof. Mbilinyi was in attendance every day and throughout every session. He additionally chaired, sometimes concurrently with the host MP, a factor which attached weight to the introduction of the institution of public hearing. In addition, Prof. Mbilinyi's presence and especially the role he assumed as the sessions chairman presented a sense of anonymity to the obviously publicly recognized excellent institution which in the previous case was politically exploited through its association with individual and personal efforts of the incumbent MP. The presence of the District Commissioner within the group also added another sense of seriousness to the proceedings .

Regrettably, the non attendance of two of the MPs whose reasons we are again yet to establish, does again not augur well for the onward transmission of the practice of the public hearing institution if the missing two MPs were expected to carry the practice forward by applying it in their respective constituencies after the Tunduru exercise.

The absence of Dr. Gama, MP for Songea, in particular was a significant one considering that at the training forum in Dar es Salaam, he was not only among the very few MPs that was in attendance every day and during all sessions, but his interventions were significant and profound. His presence at the actual "theatre" was likely going to raise more practical issues related to the application of what was otherwise a theoretical construct.

The Constituents

Turning to the spectrum of the public, like in the Kilolo case, it was heartening that the attendance represented a rainbow of political opinions and shades of social position and status. Thanks to the instructions on invitations organized by the sponsors, SUNY and BC. They were definitely adhered to although sometimes with questionable motives.

The Facilitators.

We would like to restate the point that presence of a team of "facilitators" was fitting for the event as a pilot one: they served as a back up for any shortfalls in the actual proceedings of the hearing; they also conferred higher status and weight to the institution of public hearing on bills by their mere presence. However, this should be looked at as a temporary facility that cannot replicated and that the MP, dignitaries in the constituency and especially the public must own it as we presented the point above. The facilitators took it upon themselves to drive this point home during the evaluation exercise on the last day of the hearing. It was obvious to the team of facilitators that the constituents considered the event as a forum where they could be provided for monetarily. It was feared by the facilitators that such an attitude would not enable other hearing sessions to take off and the program be sustained.

Issues Raised:

The issues raised by the constituents at this centre have been summarized above. At this point we just would like to focus on the disposition of the constituents to present their views during the hearing process. On this we would like to raise the significant added impact the media quoted above had to the hearing process. In a very summarized way, the public were nearly numb and could hardly make any contribution worthy recognizing on the first day of the hearing process. We suspect a number of reasons could have been behind that. But whichever were those reasons, the team of facilitators expressed their dissatisfaction with their performance in the full view of Television cameras whose program was locally transmitted that evening. The public that watched the program challenged the participating audience in a variety of ways lashing at them through ridicules wherever they could find them[5].

The situation was qualitatively changed the following day as every participant sought to make a contribution to the bill. As recognized above, some of those views were very well expressed and focused on the subject of the bill.

At the end of the hearing during the evaluation, the constituents were positively inclined to actively participate in the presentation of their views on the bill. And like at the Kilolo centre, they wondered why the practice came so late. They wished it was instituted earlier so that it grew as a common practice.

Besides being induced by the larger public through the television program, it was evidently clear that the constituents could have been more articulate in making contributions on the bill had it been made

[5] As indicated elsewhere, Tunduru is a small town. Residents can easily identify one another, especially those holding some kind of public or even private office. Thus those attending the hearing were easily nabbed for ridicule.

available to them well in advance of their invitation to contribute to its deliberation and if the bill was in a language they could more easily express themselves in.

Managing the "Stage"

Unlike the Kilolo case, with minor lapses along the hearing process, the conduct of the public hearing at the Tunduru centre was very well managed. The reasons are not hard to find. At the Tunduru centre there were two very experienced people that steered the hearing process. These were, a Deputy Speaker and a long serving MP who had led very critical and central cabinet positions before. Having been reminded of their roles at the beginning of the session, they very ably proceeded with the process smoothly. They may have just needed a little more familiarization with the details of the bill for them to have presented it more comprehensively to the public before it was invited to contribute to the proceedings.

2.2.4 Issues in the Way Forward.

The last day of the public hearing was devoted to charting the way forward the institution of constituency level public hearing was going to take. Along the lines of the Kilolo centre, the participants raised the following issues:

- The importance of advance distribution of the bills to the public for their studying so that they can present more meaningful views to their MPs.
- That presentation of views on bills will be constrained should they continue to be in a language not familiar to the public;
- That hearings should spread out to other areas in the constituency;
- That participants should financially be facilitated for their participation in the presentation of views on bills.

Most of the issues raised are routine and anticipated. We however would like to reinforce our statement to the question of financing the public hearing process at the constituency level which triggers off the major subject of sustainability of the program. We stand by our view that an ownership process of the institution is key to the resolution of the problem and give real meaning to the institution. A program for the preparation of the mind of the stakeholders on the significance and need of the institution then plan and budget for it must be embarked upon.

2.2.5 Conclusion.

The Tunduru event provided another example of what could be possible given the limitations surrounding the pilot exercise. In a unique way, the Tunduru pilot case provided a live example of what the media can assist to accomplish in the hearing process if they are part of it.

2.3 Hai Center

Host - Honourable Freeman A. Mbowe (MP) Chadema
Facilitation Team Members:

- Flora Mahika (BC)
- Theo Macha (SUNY/T)
- Elias Mwanshiuya (LEAT)

- Dr. Bernadeta Kilian (Consultant- UDSM)

2.3.1 The Proceedings

The public hearing event was held on the 11th-13th May, 2004. The event took place at the Five Star Conference Hall. In all three days, the event started by the arrival and registration of the participants, which took place for about one hour.

The Chair of the whole process was the host MP, Hon. Mbowe. On the first day, the event began by introduction of participants including the logistical and the expert team from Dar-es-Salaam. This was facilitated by Hon. Mbowe who also explained the purpose of the meeting. Then, SUNY/British Council presented Opening remarks, introducing the project and its objectives in Tanzania. This was intended to set the scene for the actual beginning of the hearings.

It is important to point out that the theater for the actual public hearing event had to be modified due to the fact that copies of bills were not distributed to the participants prior the public hearing day. As stated above, the bill for discussion was made available to the participants on the very day of the public hearing event. Thus, it was then decided that the participants be given time to go through the bill and be able to present their views on the second day. In so doing, the meeting lasted for only half a day and the chair adjourned the meeting at around 2pm.

Defining the Agenda

In principle, defining the agenda involves a systematic submission and explanation of the elements of the bill to the public. In this case, it is Hon. Mbowe who was supposed to submit the bill to be discussed to the audience. Hon. Mbowe started by first introducing the concept of public hearing at the parliamentary level, linking it with the legislative process in Tanzania. This was an excellent account of the law-making process, highlighting sources of bills, procedures to be followed before a bill becomes law, the committee system and the complexity of lawmaking in Tanzania.
However, Hon. Mbowe fell short of submitting the content of the bill and instead he invited the legal expert to deliver the expert testimony. Thus, rather than introducing the bill to the audience so that they could first grasp the content of the bill, the participants were immediately introduced to the analysis of the bill as presented by the legal expert.

Invited MPs

Hon. Mbowe then invited the two MPs from nearby constituencies to say a few words to the audience in relation to the objective of the meeting. These were Hon. Thomas Ngawaiya –Moshi Rural (TLP) and Hon. Mwanri- Siha (CCM). They both expressed their strong support towards the process of holding constituency-level public hearings. However, the presence of both the opposition and the ruling party MPs gave room to partisan speeches and propaganda. All MPs including the host MP could not avoid the trap of partisanship by either reacting to each other or just praising themselves in order to maximize their electoral credibility.

Expert Testimony

In principle, the expert testimony is presented in order to unravel the insights and meanings of issues to the subject underlined in the bill. This enables the audience to become more enlightened on the substance

and the spirit of the bill and therefore being able to participate in the hearing proceedings. It is important to note that in the four pilot constituencies, there was no subject matter expert on issues of elections and the electoral process in general. Instead, there were legal experts who focused largely on the interpretation of the various provisions of the bill. In Hai, the legal expert presented his analysis of the bill for about 30 minutes highlighting important provisions and their interpretations.
This session was also accompanied with questions for clarifications. It was interesting to note that after the expert testimony only a very few questions with regards to the content of the bill itself were asked by the participants.

Discussion on the Modality of the Hearing

The Chair invited the participants to discuss how they would like to give their views on the bill presented before them. This created a certain sense of confusion to the participants due to the lack of a clear timetable and procedural programme. In any case, some of the participants were in favor of having a meeting for only two days (the Chair seemed to be very much in support of this view). Some were of the opinion that they should concentrate on the discussion of the bill rather than on how many days the event would last. It was then agreed that the participants should use the afternoon to read the bill and the second day devoted to the presentation of views on the bill. This ended the first day.

Public Hearing Session: Presentation of Views

The Chair invited any participant who wanted to speak to raise his/her hand and the speakers were given a chance to speak sequentially according to the Chair's ordering. The speakers were also asked to introduce themselves before they present their views.
Overall, the presentation of views on the bills took only about half a day. Indeed, though it was a very brief session, the views were very insightful and substantive. Several participants expressed their strong opinion on various sections of the bill. Some of the comments with regards to the bill were as follows;

- Some participants were of the view that the role of providing voter education as suggested in the bill should not be vested in NEC as it has too many responsibilities more than it can handle. Instead, other organizations, e.g. CSOs, religious organizations should be assigned with this important role.
- The composition of NEC needs to revised by including members from various political parties
- The process of recruiting registration officers should be impartial. Currently, there is undue interference by the ruling party.
- NEC should not be given an authority to postpone or cancel elections. This power can be used in a partisan way.

Evaluative Comments about the Practicability of the constituency-level Public hearings

Apart from just discussing the bill, the Chair also invited the participants to give their views about the idea and the practice of holding public hearings at the constituency level and how they would like it implemented in future. Below are participants' views on how constituency level public hearing should be conducted in future.

First of all, many participants expressed their strong support for the constituency level public hearings. To many, this was an excellent opportunity not only to provide their views about specific bills but also to meet their government and elected leaders.

Secondly, there was the question of the timing of the constituency-level public hearings i.e. at what point in time should public hearings at the constituency level be held. One of the most influential participants

was the retired judge who expressed his suspicions about the law-making process in Tanzania saying that, holding public hearings after the first reading in parliament is not a good idea largely because at this stage, relevant authorities have already collected a great deal of opinion about the bill through research and expert consultation. Thus, the constituency level public hearings are held while the bill is at the second stage of the law-making process, making it rather difficult to make substantive changes to the content of the bill at this stage. He suggested that people should be involved at the early stage in the construction of the bill itself.

Thirdly was the issue of the entry point for the public hearings i.e. should they be conducted at the village, ward, division or district level? Many participants preferred the village as the entry point. Some participants were of the view that using the village as the entry point will be very expensive as there are thousands of villages in Tanzania. Instead, wards should be used. Some suggested for the increasing use of the CSOs to organize and conduct public hearings at various levels in the district. It was also strongly suggested that the constituency level public hearings should not be organized within the government structures. Instead, it should involve the diverse of stakeholders and interests. In relation to this, it was suggested that the government set aside a budget in order to facilitate the holding of public hearings at the local level.

Fourthly, many participants suggested on the need of educating the general public and leaders about the concept of the constituency level public hearings on bills so that they understand what it is and its importance. These leaders include councilors, chairs of streets and the MPs.

Fifthly, the government should make sure that bills are available to the wider public through various offices. In addition, it was noted that the government gazette is not accessible at all to the general public especially in the rural areas. In so doing, bills should also be published in ordinary newspapers for the general public to see and seek/or present information about the bill.
Sixthly was the issue of language. Many participants suggested that the bills should be written in Swahili language which is widely understood by a majority of Tanzanians. Lastly was the question of kinds of bills to be discussed. Some suggested that not all bills that have been tabled in parliament need to be discussed. Rather, only those that are relevant to the local realities and circumstances can be presented before the public.

Press Relations
This was an area that received a great deal of attention by the respective MPs. Hon. Mbowe made sure that the press was invited and stories about the events were aired on television and radio.

Presentation of the Participants Views by the Recorder of the Proceedings

The last day involved the presentation of the participants' views by the Recorder and closing remarks. The Recorder was the MP personal assistant who did an excellent job of recording almost everything that was said by individual participants. This exercise was done in order to assess the competence of MP assistants who normally assist the MP in record taking and gathering of information. The chair then invited Dr. Killian to give evaluative comments of the event. Then, SUNY/Tanzania was also invited to give closing remarks and to thank the participants. Finally, the Chair gave closing remarks by thanking the participants and invited two participants to say a few words. These were the retired judge and the CCM District Chair.

2.3.2 Conclusion
The public hearing event in Hai portrayed two contrasting pictures. On the one hand, the presence of the informed citizenry made it possible to have an impressive public hearing in terms of presentation of

insightful and informed comments from the participants (stakeholders). On other hand however, lack of competence on the part of the MP to conduct a public hearing accompanied with inadequate logistical preparations significantly undermined the opportunity of having a theatrical model of an effective public hearing. This was indeed an example of a missed opportunity.

2.4 Singida Urban Center

Host - Hon. Lazaro Nyalandu (MP)
Facilitation Team Members:

- Linda Madeleka-Lusajo (SUNY/T)
- Theo Macha (SUNY/T)
- Flora Mahika (BC)
- Elias Mwanshiuya (LEAT)
- Harold Sungusia (LHRC)
- Neema Kiula (Field Facilitator)
- Dr. Bernadetta Kilian (Consultant – UDSM)

2.4.1 The Proceedings

The public hearing event was held on the 19th-21th May, 2004. The event took place at Mtinko Catholic Center. The event was conducted from 10.00am-3.30pm. In all three days, the event started by the arrival and registration of the participants.

The first day was clouded by a certain degree of confusion due to the absence of the host MP Hon. Nyalandu who arrived on the second day. Given his absence, Hon. Nguli chaired the meeting on his behalf. He started the meeting by introducing the concept of the constituency level public hearings and the purpose of the meeting. There was no official opening remark by SUNY/British Council on the first day. Other invited MPs were not able to attend. These were Hon. Leonard Shango, CCM MP of Iramba West and Hon. Mohamed Missanga, CCM MP of Singida South. At the beginning of the public hearing, there were some elements of partisanship by trying to turn the event into a CCM campaign meeting. The field facilitator provided some clarifications that the meeting was not a party meeting but comprises of people from various parties, ideologies and diverse interests and urged the participants to refrain from making partisan statements and propaganda.

In terms of replicating the actual theater of conducting a public hearing on bills, the realities on the ground called for the modifications of the rules. First, the bills for discussion arrived to the scene on the very day of holding a public hearing on that particular bill. Secondly, as stated somewhere above, a majority of the participants in Singida North were of low level of education and therefore not highly informed of various legal and civic issues. Thus, rather than begin by receiving their views on the bill, the participants were asked to discussed the bill in groups in the first day and then present their views in the following day. This turned the session to appear more like a seminar than a public hearing event.

Defining the Agenda

The process of defining the agenda was indeed rather inadequate. Neither the acting chair, Hon. Nguli nor the host MP, Hon. Nyalandu took time to do a systematic submission and explanation of the elements of the bill to the public. Just like in Hai constituency, defining the agenda stage was fused with expert testimony. Thus, after introducing the concept of the public hearing, the Chair invited expert testimony to give various interpretations of various section of the bill.

Expert Testimony

There were two legal experts in Singida North. The participants were divided into three groups so that they could discuss and analyze the bill. The legal experts were visiting each group to give more clarifications over certain sections of the bill. In these groups, the legal experts provided not only

clarifications about the bill but also civic education by highlighting about various political and legal questions raised by the participants. Many of the questions were general rather than specific to the bill. Thus, a kind of civic education preceded the actual public hearing on a bill. Also, it is important to point out that, the discussion in the groups was limited due to the fact that many of the participants were not conversant with the English language. This somehow lowered their morale of wanting to know more about the bill. Through observation of the group discussion, many participants were just passive listeners rather than active participants. The session took the whole day and the participants were then asked to go and read more about the bill and meet the second day for the presentation of their views.

Presentation of Views

The second day was indeed regarded as the official opening of the event. Hon. Nyalando took over the chairmanship from Hon. Nguli. The Chair started by recognizing the presence of important guests in the audience including the logistical and expert team from Dar-es-Salaam. This was followed by the Opening remarks from SUNY/British Council, explaining the background of the project of strengthening the National Assembly. The chair then invited Dr. Killian to give a brief presentation of the concept and the practice of the constituency-level public hearing and the manner of conducting the actual proceedings. The chair then invited the legal expert to highlight over main issues which need a great deal of attention.

Thereafter, the chair invited participants to give their views and opinion about various section of the bill. The chair asked anyone who wanted to speak to raise his/her hands. Then, the Chair selected one participant after another to come forward and present his/her views. It was agreed that each speaker should spent up to 5 minutes. In order to enforce this rule, the Chair appointed the Time Keeper from among the audience who was supposed to stand up after every five minutes are over. This system of time keeping worked out very well in enabling speakers to adhere to the 5-minute rule.

Presentation of views on the bill continued on the third day. Major issues from the bill were again identified and written on the blackboard. Several participants were given an opportunity to speak on various issues including the authority and power of NEC, the president's power to appoint NEC commissioners, the use of government officials such as DED and others as election officers, etc.

Some of the key views from the participants were as follows;

- Many participants gave their views about voting age of 18 years old. Some were of the view that the voting age should be lowered to 15-16 years old so that to allow more young people to exercise their rights to vote. It was argued that after all , at age 15 or 16, many youths in rural areas are married and already have become responsible citizens with broader understanding of issues. Other expressed their objections on this issue arguing that the voting age should remain the same. One of the participants suggested that secondary school students from a nearby school should be called to testify before the hearing about their views on this matter. Three secondary students and their teacher were brought on the third day to testify and made their case for the lowering of the voting age to 15 or 16.
- Some participants suggested that lost voter identity cards should be replaced free of charge due to the fact that many people in the rural areas are poor and therefore would not afford to pay for the lost cards.
- Although it is a good idea to have a permanent voter registry, some participants expressed their concerns that this might be a deterrent to voting. The previous system of periodic registration was acting like a reminder to register and show up for voting.
- Citizens' identity cards must be developed prior the introduction of voter identity cards.
- Rather than employing government officials, the retired officers should be hired as registration officers in their respective areas of residence.

It is important to note that unlike Hai, a majority of participants in Singida urban raised more questions seeking for clarifications. Many of these questions were indicative of lack of civic education.

Evaluative Comments about the Practicability of the constituency-level Public hearings

The participants were asked to give their views about the idea and the modality of implementation of the constituency-level public hearings on bills. The following were the main suggestions;
First, many participants were very much excited about the exercise of gathering citizens' views about the bills before they become laws. They therefore suggested that the government should allocate some funding specifically for this exercise.
Secondly, many of the participants emphasized the importance of providing civic education with regards to the importance of participating in the public hearings events. This widespread civic education programme should precede public hearings on bills.
Thirdly, unlike the Hai participants who cautioned about the use of government structures in organizing constituency-level public hearings on bills, many of the participants in Singida North proposed that existing government offices at different levels including villages, wards, divisions and districts, should be used as entry points to conduct public hearings events on various bills. For instance, the MP can initially hold a public hearing event with the councilors who will then go to their area of jurisdiction and do the same. As stated somewhere above, many of the participants in Singida were members of CCM and therefore expressed support of the status quo and its structures.
Fourthly, some of the participants suggested that there should be another 'experimental' public hearing in Singida urban in order to add on their understanding of the whole process.

Press Relations
Just like in Hai, Hon. Nyalandu, who came with a team of reporters from Dar-es-Salaam, made sure that the press was invited and stories about the events were aired on television and radio.

Presentation of the Participants Views by the Recorder of the Proceedings

The MP assistant was asked to present the views of the participants about the bill. However, unlike Hai, the assistant demonstrated lack of capacity to do so and the presentation was cut short before it was over. The third day was also a closing day. The chair invited Hon. Nguli, the District Commissioner , Dr. Killian and SUNY/Tanzania Deputy Director in that order to say a few words. Then the chair closed the meeting thanking all the participants for attending and for being calm throughout the event.

2.4.2 Conclusion
Experience from Singida North sheds some light on the importance of civic education prior the introduction of public hearings on bills at the constituency level. However, we cannot conclude of what would have happened if the bills were made available to the participants some few days before the event. Inadequate preparations coupled with the late arrival of the host MP made things even more difficult. However, the fact that the participants were able to give their views on the bill even amidst these shortcomings is a clear indication of the unrealized potential that can be tapped in the future undertakings.

3.0 Public Hearings Proceedings: Outstanding Issues, Patterns and Trends in all the Pilot Centers

Under this section, we present, in a summary way, shared but also unique features that emerged from the hearing processes at the four pilot constituencies under a select set of topics.

3.1 Public Reaction Towards the Constituency Level Public Hearings on Bills

The public reacted variously to the institution of the Public Hearing at constituency level. Those that we consider as significant in the rolling out of the program are summarized below;

- In all four constituencies, the holding of public hearing on bill was well received and greatly appreciated by the participants. To some participants, this was the first time that they had actually participated in influencing the legislative process in the country. This was expressed in no better language than that presented by a participant at the Tunduru centre who remarked on the significance of the hearing. He said in Swahili: " Wananchi wamethaminiwa; Na sasa, dhana ya uwakilishi imetimia" Literary, " ***(By this practice) "The constituents have been accorded due regard. The concept of representation has now assumed its due meaning")***
- Meaningful participation in the discussion of the bill was greatly hindered by the use of English language. Many expressed their concerns on whether a majority of Tanzanians can indeed play a substantive role in this exercise if bills will continue to be written in English.
- The tendency to expect allowances/payment in return for attendance was observed in all constituencies (with the exception of Hai). This might have set a bad precedent for the future events. This emphasizes on the need for a wide-spread civic education on the intrinsic value of public hearings (and other similar interventions) on bills which goes beyond immediate monetary gains.

3.2 Competence in handling the Proceedings

MPs

- The competence to conduct a public hearing event was lacking in almost all the four centers(with some modification for the Tunduru centre) . They could not avoid being partisan and focus more on maximizing their electoral credibility than discussing the bill. The situation was made even more complicated where both the opposition and ruling party MPs were together in the hearing event. There were occasional episodes of partisan attacks and propaganda, diverting the session away from discussing the bill.
- The stage of defining the agenda was skipped by almost all MPs. The MPs did not take time to systematically submit the bill to the audience. This might be due to the fact that the honorable MPs did not read and prepare for the presentation of the bill to the audience. Instead, they relied exclusively on the legal experts to submit and define the agenda. In addition, the MPs did not appear competent to conduct the public hearings as required in the Manual. Indeed, the fact that many MPs could not be able to consecutively attend the training session for two days, it is possible that they did not fully comprehend the nuts and bolts of conducting constituency level public hearings.
- Moreover, the timing of conducting the constituency level public hearings might have affected the competence of the MPs to carry out the events. Being a year before the general elections in the 2005, many MPs are highly preoccupied with their re-electability than anything else. In so doing, rather than discussing the bill, the host MPs were more inclined into giving long speeches and propaganda. Rather than listening to peoples' views, the host MPs were in a hurry to make the event shorter and attend to matters perceived to be critical for their re-election.

Participants (stakeholders)

- Composition of participants to a public hearing events is indeed a determinant factor to a successful public hearing where there is effective and meaningful citizens' participation. In Hai, majority of the participants demonstrated a high level of political/civic knowledge which enabled them to remain focused on the bill, being precise and straight to various sections of the bill. Indeed, there was no need of having group discussions for the collective discussion of the bill. Elsewhere however, the situation was different where a majority of participants demonstrated a very low level of civic and general education competence. Thus, some of the contributions made were indicative of the lack of civic and general education.
- In general, there is lack of knowledge among the public about the essence of constituency level public hearings on bills. Whereas the training seminar was conducted for the designated MPs, no similar measures were taken to inform the public about what constituency public hearings are and why they are important.
- Attempts to combine both the civic education about legislative process and the actual holding of the public hearings did create some confusions to some participants who raised the question on whether they were invited to discuss the bill or receive some training on other issues.

3.3 Preparations

- In general there was inadequate preparation done for the public hearings at the constituencies. Participants received the copies of the bill to be discussed on the very day of the public hearing event and as a result, the extent of public discussion on the bill was somehow restricted. Had the copies of the bill been made available at least a week earlier, (the standard procedure is at least three (3) weeks in advance) the extent and the quality of stakeholders' participation would have been improved.
- There was limited advertisement of the public hearing event. At least a two -week notice is needed for the invited stakeholders to get information and material for the discussion.

4.0 Recommendations

The pilot exercise was carried out in anticipation of rolling it out to a larger setting, hopefully countrywide. These recommendations, derived from what transpired in the four constituents, are made in the context of that direction. Most of them are scattered throughout the text. Under this section we summarize them for easy reference.

- The findings from the pilot constituencies indicate that a programme aimed at strengthening the parliament or the MPs in particular cannot be carried out in isolation from what has to be done on the constituents. In the case of the current undertaking, in order to have an effective and a meaningful system of constituency-level public hearings, both the MPs and the general public need to be informed about the essence and the practice of the concept of the constituency level public hearing. Any considerations for a rolling out of the program to the larger setting, must take due regard of this concomitancy for it to attain optimal and meaningful results.
The CT is aware that this has implication for the time frame within which to realize the scheduled program. Yet, the relationship between the constituency level public hearings and the civic education is just too critical to be ignored. In dealing with this issue, the CT is of the view that there is a need to draw up an action plan for strategic sequencing of the intervention on both sides.

- Civic education programme is a prerequisite to effective peoples' participation to constituency level public hearings.
- The institution of parliament needs to put some mechanisms in place in order to enable the MPs to carry out public hearings on bill in their constituencies. These mechanisms include early release of copies of bills tabled in parliament, production of bills' summaries written in both Swahili and English to be distributed in the respective constituencies, dissemination of the Government gazette to the general public, etc.
- The manual and handling tool on how to conduct constituency level public hearings should be made available to the MPs for their reference. It must however be emphasized that the manual and handling tools already developed will only provide a guide to the practice. These have to be creatively applied in the actual settings.
- There is the need to use experts who are present in the constituency/district to provide expert testimonies to various public hearings events. These may include government officials, CSOs, retired professionals, etc. Such a practice will not only allow for sustainability of the practice through utilization of local resources, it will also establish the synergy between the various institutions in the constituencies and the publics.
- In addition to inviting specific stakeholders to a public hearing event, public notice should be put to invite any interested citizen to attend. This will widen the extent of participation.
- It looks as if the already trained MPs require more practical exposure on how to conduct the hearings. It certainly is necessary for those that want to run hearings, in the event that the program is rolled out, have to receive such practical training.

- There should always be a review of the scope of work especially as related to deadlines for the execution of tasks in order to incorporate on ground exigencies that are pre-conditional for the attainment of optimal results of the project.

Appendices

Appendix 1
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS AT THE KILOLO CENTRE

No.	Name of Participants	Day one 5/05/2004	Day two 6/05/2004	Day three 7/05/2004	Day four 8/05/2004
1.	Dani Kibiki	✓	✓	✓	✓
2	Charles Mgongalwa	✓	✓	✓	✓
3	Edson Kivelege		✓	✓	✓
4	Ray Mwangwala	✓	✓	✓	✓
5	Jane Mdimbwa	✓	✓	✓	✓
6	Fanuel Magava	✓	✓	✓	✓
7	Jane Mbeve	✓	✓	✓	✓
8	Marco Vingilah	✓	✓	✓	✓
9	Godwin Maketa	✓	✓	✓	✓
10	Lt B.K Minja	✓	✓	✓	✓
11	L. Donanda	✓	✓	✓	✓
12	Ahamed Mwikoki	✓	✓	✓	✓
13	Luputiko Nyamba	✓	✓	✓	✓
14	O.M Mkwama	✓	✓	✓	✓
15	M.M. Kihongo	✓	✓	✓	✓
16	Lazaro Mamba	✓	✓	✓	✓
17	Japhet Kibiki	✓	✓	✓	✓
18	James Amo	✓	✓	✓	✓
19	Osolina Mkembela	✓	✓	✓	✓
20	Amidu Kilamba	✓	✓	✓	✓
21	Bakari Kipopele	✓	✓	✓	✓
22	Sr. Barberina Mhagala	✓	✓	✓	✓
23	Deo Isaac Kapufi	✓	✓	✓	✓
24	Abdul Mdee	✓	✓	✓	✓
25	Issidory Kiyenge	✓	✓	✓	✓
26	John Kihongozi	✓	✓	✓	✓
27	Zuwena Nyalubi	✓	✓	✓	✓
28	Timu Mwakikoti	✓	✓	✓	✓
29	Elias Mfungwa	✓	✓	✓	✓
30	Argentina Myovela	✓	✓	✓	✓
31	A. Kisoma	✓	✓	✓	✓
32	Edward Chuma	✓	✓	✓	✓
33	Aston Kihwele	✓	✓	✓	✓
34	Hassan Mabeva	✓	✓	✓	✓
35	J.K. Ulaya	✓	✓	✓	✓
36	Obadia Sinzila	✓	✓	✓	✓
37	Shipella James	✓	✓	✓	✓
38	Y.G. Mgohamwende	✓	✓	✓	✓
39	Mario Mbugi	✓	✓	✓	✓

40	Evaristo Mhando	✓	✓	✓	✓
41	Ernest Mhula	✓	✓	✓	✓
42	Jacob Ngusulu		✓	✓	✓
43	Michael Haule		✓	✓	✓

Appendix 2

BILL STUDY GROUPS AT THE KILOLO CENTRE

GROUP A

1. Dani Kibiki
2. Odilia Mkwama
3. Angentina Myovelah
4. L.t .B Minja
5. Charles Mgongolwa
6. A.Kisoma
7. Hassan Mabeva
8. Edward Chuma
9. L.Dononda
10. Aston Kihwele
11. A. Mwikoki
12. Kilamba

GROUP B

1. Sr.Bauberina Mhalala
2. Abdul Mdee
3. Deo Kapufi
4. Lazaro Mamba
5. Timu Kikoti
6. John Kihongozi
7. Japhet Kibiki
8. Osalina Mkenbela
9. Bakari Kipopele
10. Zuezi Nyalusi
11. Kihenga

GROUP C

1. Godwin Makete
2. Shipella James
3. Ray Mwabgwale
4. E. Kivelege
5. Obadia sinzela
6. Jane Mdimbwa
7. Y.G.Mgohamwende
8. Jane Mbeve
9. Fanuel Magava
10. Vingila
11. Mbugi

Appendix 3

NAMES OF CONSTITUENTS THAT PRESENTED THEIR VIEWS ON THE BILL AT THE TUNDURU CENTRE.

1. Sekula Matumula Sekula
2. Lukas Josoph Mahamba
3. Ester Akukweti
4. Nassor Malenga
5. Mohammed Kassim Abdalla
6. Liviga
7. Athumani
8. Mama Amina Kitambi
9. Hassan Kindamba
10. Burhani Shamte
11. Hassan Loya
12. Anza Wewe Mbilinyi
13. Emanuel Kalembo
14. George Mataka
15. Sudai Chikawe
17. Mtamila Chikuo
18. Bi Fuso Makangila
19. Amina Chimata
20. Rajabu Mohamed
21. Amina
21. Sekula Matumla Sekula
22. Mkwanda Sudi
23. Athumani Iddi Milanzi.
24. Hassan Kuyamba.
25. Hamida Kitambi
26. Shamte.
27. Charles
28. Juma
29. Bi Husna Makanjila
30. Kabora
31. Salum Makumbusya
32. Rajabu Mohamed
33. Selemani Shaibu
34. Simbili Makanyaga Simbili
35. Amiri Mpole
36 Stevie Agustino
37. Millanzi
38. Sultani Kipambo
39. Sudi
40. Mr. Mfaume S. Asiya.
41. Matumla
42. Mbilinyi
43. Sambole
44. Rajabu Mohamed
45. Hamida

Appendix 4

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS AT THE HAI CENTRE

NO	NAME	POSITION	ORGANISATION	CONTACT ADDRESS
1	Freeman Mbowe	Member of Pariament	Hai	0744 263200
2	Desmond Mfuru	Secretary MP Hai	Hai	Box 202 Hai
3	Basilla Urassa	Chairperson	NAFGEM	0748 34 2174
4	M J Kileo	Chairperson	CCM party	Box 100 Hai
5	Joel Nkya	Influencial		Box 210 Hai
6	Saumu Swai	Secretary	MEWUNGO	O745 636987
7	Leah John	Influencial	Youth	Box 1954 Hai
8	Florence Meela	Secretary	CHADEMA	Box 8 Hai
9	M. Kundaeli	Programme Officer	DEV Hai Associaiton	
10	Ana Chole	Officer	KIWAKUKI	Box 235 Hai
11	Hamad Juma	Imam	BAKWATA	Box 57 Hai
12	Boniface Mariki	District Executive Officer	TCCIA Hi	Box 272 Hai
13	Nathaniel M. Mushi	Judge (Retired)		Box 8934 Moshi
14	W. Nathan	Magistrate	Government	Box 8 Machame
15	Joyce Kimatare	Doctor	KIA	Box 12 KIA
16	Sarah Ndossi	Councillor	District Council	Box 1346 Moshi
17	Upendo Mshigati	Councillor	District Council	Box 249 Hai
18	Rehema Mzava	Councillor	District Council	Box 192 Hai
19	Elisa V. Silaa	Councillor	District Council	Box 8639Moshi
20	J. K. Kitto	Chairperson	Hango	Box 192
21	R. kagusha	Teacher	Lyamungo High School	Box 3020 Moshi
22	Muhidin Saehe	Councillor	District Council	Box 258 hai
23	Wilfred Massawe	Chairperson	TLP	Ox 1899 Moshi
24	Patrict Chambo	Journalist	Nipashe, Guardian	Box 1137 Moshi
25	Anderson Ntindi	Influencial		Box 146 Hai
26	Elais marunda	Vice Chairpesron	District Council	Box 546 Moshi
27	Fred Njama	Reverend	ELTC Hai	Box 146 Hai
28	Clement Kwayu	Consultant	BUMACO	Box 1747 Moshi
29	Fatuma Mushi	Katibu mwenezi	CHADEMA	
30	Ally Sonda	Journalist	Mwananchi	Box 1589 Moshi
31	Andwerd Masam	Program Co-ordinator	Sanya ADP/Muvimaha	Box 274 Hai
32	Helga C.	Councillor	District Council	Box 8599 Moshi

	Mchomu			
33	Shilly Nuya	Councillor	District Copuncil	Box 8599 Moshi
34	Nestory L. Kobero	District Manpower Management Officer	District Commissioner office	Box 27 Hai
35	Eng. Prosper Shoo	Chief Engineer	Uroki Bomang'ombe water supply trust	Box 200 Hai
36	Godbless A Uroki	Councillor	Machame Uroki	Box 35 Hai
37	Miti F. C.	DED	Hai	Box 27 Hai
38	Leonard Ulotu	Chairperson	Municipal Council	Box 35 Hai
39	Awadhi M. Oronu	Youth	CHADEMA	
40	Michael Kimemeta	Assistant to MP	HAI	
41	Dr Swai E.		Machame Hospital	Box 3044 Machame
42	Grace Macha	Jouranlist	Habari Corporation	Box 1140 Moshi
43	Eng I. Raphael	District Water Engineer	Hai District	Box 27 Hai
44	Aziki Said	Journalist	Radio One	Boix 1140 Moshi
45	A.S. Mshamu	Distrcit Planning Officer	Hai	Box 27 Hai
46	Hon Thomas Ngawaiya	MP	Moshi rural	
47	Hon Aggrey Mwanri	MP	Siha	Box 33 Sanya Juu
48	Zainab Sadru	Influencial		Box 8130 Moshi
49	Adris Mwandrai	Councillor	District Council	
50	Ephras Urassa	Manager	Losaa-KIA water supply registered trustees	Box 171 Hai
51	Mtui Augustine	Manager	Magadini Makiwaru water supply	Box 262 Hai
52	Ally Sonda	Jouirnalist	Mwananchi	Box 1589 Moshi
53	Getrudi Mushi	Special seats		0748 688972
54	Flora Mushi	TLP		
55	Rashid Kimaro	CHADEMA		Box 8 Hai
56	Adolf Mwang'amba	Secretary	CCM	Box 100 Hai
57	Joyce Kimatare	community	KIWAKUKI	0744 814089

Appendix 5

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS AT THE SINGIDA NORTH CENTRE

NO	NAME	POSITION	ORGANISATION	CONTACT ADI
1	Lazaro Nyalandu	Member of Parliament	Singida North	0744 382625
2	Flora Nzema	Journalist	ITV Radio one	*Box 43[illegible]4 Dar*
3	David Ramadhan	Journalist	DTV/Channel Ten	07487 35 95 55
4	Solomon Olemwaipisi	Programme Officer	Touch Tanzania	0744 271281
5	Emmanuel Michael	Journalist	Radio Free Africa	0744 596339
6	Natahniel Lime	Journalist	Habari Coorporation	0745 417789
7	Elisantre John	Journalist	Uhuru publications	0744 031034
8	Nanumba Hanje	Chairperson CCM	CCM Singida	0744 530988
9	Hamisi J. Nguli	MP	Singida urban	0744 5493105
10	Sombi J. Sombi	Chairperson YADEC	YADEC	Box 27 Singida
11	Idd Mussa Kitreu	Chairperson	CCM Ward Mtinko	Box 35 Singida
12	Yesaya Ntandiu	Secretary	Mtinko	Box 139 Singida
13	Athmani Hamisi	Publicity secretary	CCM, Ughandi	Box 233 Singida
14	Selemani Kombora	Chairperson	CCM, Ward Ughandi	Box 233 Singida
15	Sara Wawa	Councillor	Ughandi	Box 233 Singida
16	Idd Mnyapanda	Village Chairperson	Mtinko	Box 35 Singida
17	Hamis Sempanga	Secretary to MP		Box 1 Singida
18	Mohamed Kisija	Councillor	Mudida	Box 233 Singida
19	Ramadhani Ntandu	Secretary	Ughandiward	
20	Ibrahim Omngiti	Secretary	CUF	Box 59 Singida
21	Juma Idd	Chairperson	TLP	Box 326 Singida
22	Frank Nyekele	Councillor	District Council	Box 27 Singida
23	Maulid Njambi	Publicity secretary	Msisi ward	Box 233 Sinmgi[illegible]
24	Mandi Mwiru	Councillor	Msisi ward	"
25	Shabani Nkuku	Publicity secretary	Mudida	Box 95 Singida
26	Jackson Lyanga	Regional Chairperson	UDP	Box 35 Mtinko
27	Mariam Nkindwa	Publicity secretary	CCM, Makuro	Box 66 Makuru
28	Jumanne Salum	Secretary	Makuro ward	Box 56 Singida
29	Elia Digha	Treasurer	CCM	Box 99 Singida
30	Abbakari Iringika	Chairperson	CCM, Makuru	"
31	Athumani Linja	Councillor	Makuro	Box 27 Singida
32	D. A. Senge	Councillor	Mtinko	"
33	Swalehe Satu	Chairperson	Mudoda ward	Box 27 Singida
34	Said Nkindwa	Ward secretary	Mudida	"
35	A. Y. Isinika	Deputy secretary to MP	Mtinko	Box 1 Singida
36	Ahmed Issah	Village Executive Officer	Mtinko	Box 35 Singida
37	Yesaya Sinda	Chairperson	UDP	Box 37 Singida
38	Jacob Samwel	Programme Coordinator	Touch Tanzania	Box 737 Singida

39	Jumanne Nguruku	Ward chairperson	Msisi	Box 537 Singida
40	Mohamed Msaghaa	Councillor	Ughandi	Box 233 Singida
41	Swalehe Masudi			
42	Philipina Labia	AFNET		Box 1090 Singid
43	Mwanahamisi Dia	Chairperson	DEGCC	Box 35 Mtinko
44	Ahmed Issah	VEO		Box 35 Mtinko
45	Abby Nkunghu	Journalist	Daily News	Box 1097 Singid
46	Dr A. Mburu	Medical Officer	Mtinko Hospital	Box 648 Singida
47	Ibrahim Mngiti	Secretary	CUF	Box 59 Singida
48	Aziz Mwamakula	Farm Manager	Agriculture	Box 26 Singida
49	Hamisi Nguli	Member of Parliament	Singida urban	
50	Abraham Gonie	Ward Secretary	CCM, Malolo	
51	Yunga Swalehe	Chairperson	WAZAZI	Box 35 Mtinko
52	Anjelina Jackson	Special seats	UDP	Box 35 Mtinko
53	Elimwesya Sima	Community	Mtinko	Box 35 Mtinko
54	Juma Shabani	Secretary	TLP	Box 35 Mtinko
55	Fatuma Mhando		UWT	Box 35 Mtinko
56	Sr Maria Carola	Clinical Officer	Sister of Charity	Box 648 Singida
57	Hussein Sungi	Ward Chairperson	WAZAZI	Box 955 Singida
58	Stephen Mnyampanda	Ward chairperson	CCM	Box 35 Singida
59	M. Ghamayu	Publicity secretary	CCM	
60	R.I. Samwi	Deputy Chairman	District Council	0744 489889
61	A. Shimba	Youth secretary	CCM	0744 572764
62	Yesaya Mwimi	Pastor	Mtinko	
63	Fatuma Nyuha	Publicity secretary	Ikiwu	Box 271 Ikiwu
64	Sara Charles	Secretary	Women wing TLP	Box 18 Malolo
65	Daudi Chale	Magistrate	Mtinko primary court	Box 93 Singida

Appendix 6

BASIC PROCEDURES AND STEPS IN THE RUNNING OF A PUBLIC HEARING AT CONSTITUENCY LEVEL

I. PREPARATION

Announcing the Hearing

- Frequency(At least three weeks in advance and repeated at least once every week
- Subject Matter
- Venue
- Time

Advance Circulation of the Agenda
Involving Civil Society.
Special Invitees
Media Involvement
Recorder of Proceedings

2. STEERING THE PROCEEDINGS

- Defining of the Agenda
  - *Presentation of the contents of the bill*
  - *Presentation of Testimonies (Subject Matter, legal, etc.)*
- Sequential call out of presenters of Views
- Time allocation and management
- Courteous Handling of the presenters and Audience
- Recording of Proceedings

3. CONCLUSION.

- Concluding the Hearing
  - *Adjournment or Closing*

DAILY NEWS TUESDAY, JUNE 29, 2004

Bills to appear in Kiswahili, says Attorney-General

From GABBY MGAYA in Dodoma

ATTORNEY-GENERAL Andrew Chenge yesterday said the translation section in his office is being strengthened to enable the translation of various bills into Kiswahili.

Mr Chenge, however, defended the use of English in various sectors, saying use of the language facilitated communications with many nations in the world.

He said in response to a question from Mr Leonard Shango (Iramba West-CCM) that the bills are written in English in accordance with the constitution and [illegible] the attorney-general said he was not sure whether the continued use of English to produce bills will deny people the right to comprehend and contribute ideas to the bills to improve them before they become law.

MR Andrew Chenge

"The truth is that although the bills are written in English, debate on them in the House is conducted in Kiswahili. Furthermore, each bill is accompanied by a Kiswahili translation of the aims of the bills," Mr Chenge observed.

He said the system gave the people an opportunity to understand the bills better through the numerous radio and television programmes.

Mr Chenge agreed that it was important that the bills be translated into Kiswahili and distributed to the people after being passed in the House. Mr Shango [illegible] bills are [illegible] English, saying this denied the people their right to understand them.

CONFIRMED CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANISATIONS

No.	NAME OF THE ORGANIZATION	LOCATION	THEMATIC AREA	REPRESENTATIVES
1.	Campaign for Good Governance (CGG)	Dar es Salaam	Democracy & Good Governance	Mariam Akram Baumba A. Chogero
2.	JUVINZA	ZANZIBAR	Youth	Said Alawi Hassan Mwantatu Hassan
3.	Kilimanjaro NGO Cluster for STD/HIV/AIDS Interventions & Reproductive Health (KINSHAI)	MOSHI	Cluster of NGOs	Veronica Shao, Ibrahim Mollel
4.	Private Nurses and Midwives Association of Tanzania (PRINMAT)	DAR-COUNTRYWIDE	Health	Rita Kulwa, Yohana Maria Majina
5.	PAMOJA Joint Action Tanzania	MOSHI	Community Development	Peter Kangwa Essore M. Essore

6.	HAKIKAZI Catalyst	ARUSHA	Democracy and Good Governance	Bernadette Bachubila Allan Nswilla Abukarim Hamisi
7.	Lawyers' Environmental Action Team (LEAT)	DAR ES SALAAM	Environment	Yassin Mkwizu, Secelela Balisidya
8.	Legal and Human Rights Centre (LHRC)	DAR ES SALAAM	Human Rights	**Shannon Howard Harold Sungusia Imelda Urio
9.	Zanzibar NGO Cluster (ZANGOC)	ZANZIBAR	Cluster-HIV/AIDS	Maryam Khamis Nuhu Salanya Asha Ahmed Saida Hassan
10.	MAASAI Advancement Association (MAA)	ARUSHA	Pastoral Rights & Community Development	Jacob T. Porokwa Isaya Naini
11.	WEGCC	SINGIDA	Community Development	Mwanahamisi Hashim Nyaso Masamalo
12.	Women Wake up (WOWAP)	DODOMA	Gender	Fatma Tawfiq Fortunata Makafu **Elizabeth Himelfarb **David Hurwitz

13.	Multi-Environmental Society (MESO)	KARATU-ARUSHA	Environment	Petro P. Ahham Claire Delmane Angel Lucumay
14.	National Network of NGO on Children's Rights (NNOC)	DAR	Youth	Abdallah Ibrahim George Kayombo
15.	Journalists Environmental Association of Tanzania (JET)	DAR ES SALAAM	Environment	Jim Mdoe, John Chikomo
16.	Network Against Female Genital Mutilation (NAFGEM)	MOSHI	Gender Issues	Bassilla Renju-Urasa Romana Olomi Grace Mwalugulo
17.	Pastoralists and Indigenous NGOs Forum (PINGOS)	ARUSHA	Pastoral Development	Edward Porokwa William Olenasha Claude Kawawa Steven Shito
18.	Maasai Women Development	ARUSHA	Gender	Sophia Pakipuny Seiyan Toure

	Organization (MWEDO)			
19.	TARWOC	IRINGA	Rural Development	Justina Semlelwa Jane Mpulya
20.	Tanzania Gender Network Programme (TGNP)	DAR ES SALAAM	Gender	Gemma Akilimali Rebecca Muna
21.	Iringa NGO Network (INGONET)	IRINGA	HIV/AIDS	George Mung'ong'o Nelson Chirisa
22.	HAKIELIMU	DAR ES SALAAM	Community Development	Godfrey Telli Rahma Banana
23.	AFNET	DODOMA/SINGIDA	GENDER	Dina Karama Alice Dani
24.	TANGO	DAR ES SALAAM	Umbrella NGO	Mary Daffa Aileen Chuma
25.	Service,Health&Dev.for People Living Positively with HIV/Aids-(SHDEPHA+)	DAR ES SALAAM	HIV/AIDS	Joseph Kato William Muhemu

26.	Tabora NGO Cluster	TABORA	Umbrella NGO	Pascal Kilagula Tedy Nzobola
27.	Tanzania Disabled Persons Movement (TDPM)	DAR ES SALAAM	Disabled	Amin Mussa Dunstan Shemsanga
28.	Umoja wa Wanawake Wawakilishi Zanzibar (UWAWAZA)	ZANZIBAR	Democracy & Good Governance	Riziki Juma Simai Hon. Thuwaybab E. Kissasi
29.	Shinyanga Foundation Fund (SFF)	SIINYANGA AND KAGERA	Youth	Elizabeth P. Myega Paul Sangija
30.	Mwanza NGO Network (MNGON)	MWANZA	Umbrella NGO	Adam Ndokeji Nicas Nibengo
31.	Women Legal Aid Centre (WLAC)	Nationwide	Gender	Grace Daffa Jane Magigita **Rosemary Thomas **Kathryn Eidmann **Keren Michaeli
32.	TANEPHA	Nationwide	HIV / AIDS	Alex Margery Mpendwa Chihimba

33.	Kivulini Women's Rights Organization	MWANZA	Gender	Yusta Ntibashima Yassin Ally
34.	Tanzania Public Health Association	DAR ES SALAAM/ Dodoma	Health	Dr. Jacob Chembele Dr. Mahmoud Ndenge
35.	DOLASED	DAR ES SALAAM	DISABLED	Godwin Mutahangarwa Gidion Kaino Mandesi Sauda Abdallah
36.	The Foundation For Civil Society	DAR - COUNTRY WIDE	Community Development	Liwima Ahungu January Basela Amon Mrutu
37.	Training & Facilitation Centre for CSOs (TRACE)	Dar es Salaam	Community Development	Caroline Henrich Daudi R.N. Kweba
38.	Human Rights Education and Peace International (HUREPI-TRUST)	Arusha - Nationwide	Human Rights	Peter O.B. Mcomalla Dorah P. Kyamba Halima Jaffari Kissibi
39.	Men in Movement Against AIDS in Tanzania (MMAAT)	Nationwide	HIV/AIDS	Andrew Joseph Mashimba Shija

40.	Women Fighting AIDS in Tanzania Trust Fund (WOFATA)	Dar es Salaam	HIV/AIDS	Renatha Ntabagi Grace Bernard
41.	Association of AIDS Widows in Shinyanga (AWISH)	Shinyanga	HIV/AIDS	Elizabeth Lubasha Ana Patick
42.	Tanzania Women Living with HIV/AIDS (TAWOLIHA)	Dar es Salaam	HIV/AIDS	Prisca Kalinga Zera Tyazo
43.	Maarifa Ni Ufunguo (Knowledge is the Key)	Arusha	Community Development	Nicodemus Shauri Eatlawe Boniface Lyimo
44.	Urban Environmental Development Association (UEDA)	Manyara Region	Community Development	Elibariki Malley Caroline Welwel
45.	Vunjo Development and Conservation Organization (VUDECO)	Arusha - Moshi Rural	Rural Development	Dr. John Kessy Joachim Peter
46.	Mapogoro Beekeepers	Iringa	Rural Development	Yolanda Kitindi

	Community Based Organization			Maryo Uaundane
47.	Intermediary Gender Network (IGN) / Majengo Group	Rukwa	Gender	Theresia A. Suwi Edes A. Msemakweli
48.	Health Actions Promotion Association (HAPA) - Singida	Singida	Health	Harriet Mkilya Noel Makyao
49.	The Gehandu FGM/HIV/AIDS	Arusha Mbulu	HIV/AIDS	Agnes C. Lowri Juliana Tahhani
50.	Arusha NGO Network (ANGONET)	Arusha & Manyara Regions	Umbrella NGO	Peter Bayo Lilian Adomson Lucy Charles
51.	Youth Partnership Countrywide	Kibaha Coast Region	Youth	Robert Kishili Kategile Karange
52.	Women Advancement Trust (WAT)	Dar es Salaam -- Nationwide	Gender	Lucy Tesha Rose Daudi
53.	The Christian Spiritual Youth Ministry	Mbulu	Youth	Siayi Axwesso Nicodemus Jackson Sulloo

54.	Tanzanian Disabled Persons Movement (TDPM)	Dar es Salaam	Disabled	Amin Mussa Dunstan Shemsanga
55.	Kigoma Kasulu Non-Governmental Organizations Network (KIKANGONET)	Kasulu Kigoma Region	Umbrella NGO	David Yanga Hassan Yanga
56.	Kibondo Non-Governmental Organizations Network (KINGONET)	Kibondo Kigoma Region	Umbrella NGO	Isabella Nyumayinzu Abel Nubha
57.	Juhudi Art Group	Kisarawe Coastal Region	Community Development	Mathias Kirumbi
58.	Research, Community and Organizational Development Associates (RECODA)	Arusha	Rural Development	Dominick Ringo Catherine Maguzu
59.	The National PLHA Taskforce + Network on Equity in Health and Health Care, Tanzania	Dar es Salaam - Nationwide	HIV/AIDS	Juma Kilongozi John Solanya Devota Mkumbura Gleta Marcelli

	(EQUINETA)			
60.	Equal Opportunity Trust Fund (EOTF)	DAR-COUNTRYWIDE	Community Development	Juma Mohamed Elizabeth Lyimo

**Covering their own costs

Tanzania
Parliamentary Outreach Activities

1. Introduction

1.1. The Parliamentary Outreach Activities Project is part of a project supported by the Center for International Development of the State University of New York (SUNY/Tanzania) awarded to Tanzania for a period of two years to provide technical assistance for the strengthening of the Union National Assembly. The range of support provided under the auspices of this Project is intended to enable the Parliament to carry out its representative, lawmaking, oversight and administrative functions more effectively and in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance.

1.2 The entire Project aims to achieve the following primary results:

- *Improve representation*: increased citizen access to and understanding of the legislative process;
- *More effective lawmaking*: Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors;
- *Enhance management and administration*: increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all Members by parliamentary administrative support units;
- *More effective oversight*: increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

1.3 This report is a response to Result Area 1 which focused on "***Enhancing Parliament's outreach activities***" with the aim of increasing civic understanding of the Institution and its functions.

2. Objectives

2.1 The specific objectives of this Project were:

- To review all current materials issued by the Parliament and issued to the public at large
- To review the role of the Department of Public Information and Civic Education in outreach programs of youth groups and schools

140

5. Printed materials

5.1.1 The Parliament currently produces a limited range of printed materials that are primarily seen as documents for the public. These are issued in printed form, in a variety of formats, and some of them are available on the Bunge's website, though not all appear to be downloadable. Also on the website are parliamentary publications such as *Hansard*, Bills and Order Papers, which are not the subject of this report; and certain factsheets prepared by the staff of the Parliament to assist Committees and individual Members are also made available to the public. The various publications are briefly discussed in the following paragraphs.

5.1.2 Several booklets on aspects of the Parliament and Tanzania's democracy written by the Speaker, Hon Pius Msekwa. These are

- Essays on the Transition to Multi-Partism in Tanzania
- Reflections on Tanzania's First Multi-Party Parliament 1995-2000
- Parliamentary Privilege in Tanzania
- An assessment of the Tanzania Parliament's performance in enhancing the role of Committees

5.1.3 These booklets, which vary in length from 20 to 155 pages, are well-produced studies which are substantial contributions to the literature on parliamentary democracy in Tanzania. They are clearly of value to the academic community and some others, but they are unlikely to be of more widespread use for promoting engagement with the Parliament among the wider, and very diverse, public, whether specialist or 'general'.

5.1.4 A *Handbook for new Members of Parliament*, also written by the Speaker. Although this is clearly aimed primarily at Members, it is a useful summary of the roles and functions of the Parliament that provides helpful material, again at a fairly academic level, for others. However the book also contains comment which some readers might feel detracts from its value as an impartial text. For example it says "A relevant question which could be asked with regard to Tanzania's parliamentary opposition is whether the current official opposition is indeed endowed with these attributes which would make it really vibrant?" There is a need for a similar but shorter and purely factual guide to Parliament which may well be fulfilled by the new booklet referred to in paragraph 5.1.6.

5.1.5 Two smaller and simpler colour booklets:

- The Legislative Process
- Bunge la Tanzania

which are straightforward descriptive material with wider appeal. The Bunge booklet illustrates the structure and responsibilities of the Parliament and the manner in which those responsibilities are addressed. The booklet is in Kiswahili; the use of appropriate

141

language is important in educating the public and in particular pupils in primary and secondary education.

5.1.6 A new booklet – *A Guide to the Parliament of Tanzania* – which is currently in draft. It is planned that this will be published shortly in a good quality format similar to that of the other publications listed above. This booklet, which is in reasonably straightforward language, summarises a number of aspects of the Parliament's role and work (procedure and practice; the legislative process; the Mace; leadership of the Parliament; administrative services; the parliamentary calendar; inter-parliamentary associations; and a visit to Parliament). It looks to be a valuable addition to the Bunge's portfolio of printed materials with a range of potential uses. For example, it will help prepare visitors for a visit, or help them understand the Bunge while they are visiting; but also provides useful background and detail that can be sent out to anyone interested.

5.1.7 A number of newsletters, some of which (volumes 3, 4, 5, 6 and 8) are available from the Bunge website, again on largely 'academic' topics. The latest, for example, is entitled *The Power of Parliament to punish a Member*. No newsletters appear to have been produced since the late 1990s.

5.1.8 *Bunge News*. This is seen by many in the Parliament as its key publication for the public. It is an A4 magazine format publication with (in common with the Parliament's other publications) high production standards. 16 editions have been produced (of which eight are on the Bunge website) between 1996 and the latest, which was published in July 2002.

5.1.9 Some 2,000 copies of each *Bunge News* are printed and are sent, free of charge, to all Members of Parliament, senior Bunge officials, libraries in Tanzania, and selected Embassies and High Commissions. It is also used in conjunction with youth outreach sessions (see below) in schools and teacher training colleges.

5.1.10 No edition of *Bunge News* has been produced since July 2002 because of resource constraints. The Information and Civic Information Unit hopes to publish at least one edition in the forthcoming year.

5.1.11 *Bunge News* has a mix of articles in English and Kiswahili and has covered a diverse range of topics with a broad parliamentary connection, from the re-establishment of the East African Community to the relationship between Parliament and the media, and from the role of parliamentary committees to the impact of IT on parliamentary business. There have also been special editions: the last (No 16, July 2002)[1] was entirely about the separation of powers between the legislature and the judiciary and arose out of a judgement by the Court of Appeal of Tanzania.

5.1.12 *Bunge News* typically also covers educational gatherings and national and international visits and includes colour photographs of these events, members of the government, the Speaker, Members of Parliament and senior parliamentary officials, as well as occasional lists, for example of the Cabinet or opposition spokespersons. Authors of its

[1] the printing of which depended on a grant from the Friedrich Ebert Foundation.

resources available, the printed versions should primarily be in Kiswahili, which would make it more accessible to more people. An English language version could be limited to the website, thus enabling access to most likely readers without incurring unnecessary costs.

5.2.6 The various factsheets and background briefings for Members are written in simpler language and are also more plainly produced than many of the other publications. Correctly focused, they could be cheap to produce in larger numbers and provide a useful source of information for the public though, again, they will meet the needs only of a specialised readership.

5.3 Gaps – and possible new material

5.3.1 Most publications that the Bunge currently provides for the public are quite long, fairly complex and deal with issues that are not within the normal range of interests of most of the population. Of course, information and explanation targeted at opinion formers is important, and the existing publications, along with the other material made available (such as Hansard), fulfil this role up to a point, both by informing those opinion formers and by helping them communicate any messages about the Parliament to a wider audience (see para 5.2.4).

5.3.2 There is a gap, however, and the Parliament has very little material that conveys a simple message about the Bunge that might promote engagement by a wider range of people, whether schools, adults in urban and rural areas or, for that matter, some of the more specialised audiences. We therefore recommend that the Parliament should consider some new publications, perhaps more similar to the factsheets and briefing material produced by parliamentary staff, that convey simpler and more accessible messages about the Parliament's work and relevance in a readable and straightforward fashion. The aim should be to produce these in larger quantities much more cheaply than the present limited-access publications, and therefore distribute them more widely. Simple and accessible language is key – the more complex material will be read by only the small minority of citizens.

5.3.3 The issues that should now be considered include:

(a) The recently produced fieldwork report on improving member-constituent relationships noted that "the awareness of legislative activities among ordinary voters is somehow low." Focusing on the role of Parliament and its relevance to citizens, and perhaps on the role of MPs, about which many constituents are insufficiently informed, would be likely to increase ruling party and opposition support for the Bunge's material (about which there is currently some scepticism). One way of doing this would be via newsletter-type publications that related the work of the Bunge (whether legislative, representative or scrutiny) to issues of real interest: the Budget, HIV/AIDS, schools etc – in other words, describing briefly and in accessible language how the Bunge has been

5.4.3 Cross-departmental co-operation could be beneficially enhanced in another way too. At present, there is a substantial largely untapped but willing, and able, resource in the shape of the Committee Clerks and research service staff who have considerable expertise and knowledge, and writing skills, that would be of great use in the creation of new material for the public, especially if that focused on the work of the Bunge and its relevance to the public. They should be involved more in the production of this material, and in peer review, under the guidance of a general editor (who would presumably be Mr Zulu or Mr Ponella). Such an approach would also help build the confidence of Bunge staff, and this should have wider beneficial effects. Production of impartial material about Parliament and its operations should also help to reassure Members about the staff's neutrality and commitment to the institution of Parliament. As the Library and Research Department of the Bunge has itself pointed out "Researchers especially in the Parliaments of Westminster Model in this era of multiparty system are needed to offer Honorable Members of Parliament services on an equitable basis for both opposition members as well as those of the governing party or coalition."

6. Distribution of material

6.1 How material can best be distributed depends on the intended recipient and the method of distribution available.

6.2 One group of recipients is visitors to the Parliament. We recommend that the new Parliament building should include a display rack near the entrance with relevant material for visitors. The publications should include a brief guide to what Parliament does, short factsheets on various issues such as the Budget or work of Committees, the newsletter and information on future business. Information on future business should also be posted outside the building, especially in the areas where citizens can sit to listen to debates relayed from the Chamber. Arrangements will need to be made to ensure that suitable members of staff take responsibility for restocking the rack and ensuring that the business information is up-to-date.

6.3 More generally, we suggest that the newsletter we recommend is sent to local councils and to the local offices of NGOs and religious organisations as well as to any individuals who request it. It should also be made available to schools and other educational establishments (see below). A mailing list should be developed and kept up-to-date.

6.4 Relations between the Bunge administration and the news media generally appear to be good. The administration should exploit this good relationship by feeding any new materials to the press and thereby getting good publicity for the Parliament. Attempts should also be made to encourage newspapers to print factual information on Parliament's activities, perhaps in a regular column, and short articles on some of its procedures. The Parliament might also consider funding a factual supplement about its work which could be given out with newspapers.

6.6 As we have already mentioned, more information on Parliament's activities and articles on aspects of its procedures and functions should be published on the parliamentary website.

6.7 Schools outreach and Members themselves are another important factor in the distribution of material (see below).

7. Youth Outreach

7.1 The Bunge runs an outreach programme which has so far visited schools in 17 or 18 of the country's 26 regions, though by no means all of them. Bunge staff visit schools, and invite other local schools to join them, and give talks about roles and responsibilities and how the pupils can, in the future, become Members themselves. They also provide parliamentary material and information and answer questions. The initiative clearly engenders a lot of interest as the talk and subsequent questioning may go on for several hours. The programme still exists but it is dependent on a small number of busy staff plus the need to provide funding for travel. One possibility would be for staff visiting family or friends throughout the country occasionally to visit a local school both to talk about Parliament and to provide some written material. The personal approach is a particularly valuable tool in getting people interested.

7.2 New, simpler, publications, such as we have recommended, would also help; and more outreach via MPs' normal constituency and parliamentary activities might mitigate the need for some staff outreach, though it will remain valuable if it can be funded. We recommend that when committees travel to a region they also include in their programme visits to local schools. This should incur only marginal additional expenditure but would help schools to get a clearer understanding of what Parliament and its committees do. It would of course be essential that talks in schools should concentrate on the institution of Parliament and that the information given should be impartial and factual.

7.3 Schools and youth groups are invited to visit Parliament in session at their own expense. The programme entails provision of direct support to youth through involvement in a number of programmes intended to inform and sustain their knowledge and help them take their first step in the democratic process. They view a session of Parliament and have a discussion afterwards with some young MPs, representatives of the women's caucus group and other social groups, eg one concerned with HIV/AIDS, and with the PR personnel. Typically, about eight such groups visit in a two-week sitting period and about 20 in the longer post-Budget session. They come from as far afield as Dar es Salaam and other non-local areas. The staff tell MPs when schools from their constituencies are visiting and the Members are keen to meet the groups and provide photographs for use in the media. It is important however that Members talk about the role of Parliament and MPs in general and do not use such visits to promote party political views.

7.9 It should be acknowledged that some MPs are sceptical about their role in outreach, and feel that the constituents and others they speak to are really interested only in education and jobs, with Parliament as a marginal interest at best. That may be a realistic attitude, but even marginal improvements in engagement will be positive; and the fact that Members by definition communicate with the public, and would benefit from a wider and easier availability of accessible material, means that this should be tried. Some MPs we spoke to agreed that more could be done to explain the role of Members, not least that they were unable to do everything.

7.10 Any process that involves Members in reaching out to schools will need to be transparently supported by the Bunge administration. Organising programmes, and the production and distribution of support material, should be one of the tasks of the committee we recommend in paragraph 5.4.2.

7.11 If this approach proved successful, consideration should be given to the development of more formal packs of material that support MPs in their activities in schools. Very successful examples of these have been developed in the United Kingdom by the Hansard Society, which produces packs that include 'everything you need to prepare for a successful meeting between MPs and schools': including ideas for MPs, information for teachers and several suggested activities for students. Further information is available from the Hansard Society. (http://www.hansardsociety.org.uk/programmes/citizenship_education?from=5)

8 Funding

8.1 Clearly, few of the above recommendations will be achievable without some expenditure. There are several possible sources of support or co-funding that should be explored, including those summarised in the following paragraphs.

8.2 The Electoral Commission has responsibility under the new Electoral Laws (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill/Act for 'providing voters' education throughout the country and shall coordinate persons who shall conduct such education.' This is in connection with the new voters' register and new electoral system. There is a clear connection between voter education and better understanding, even at a simple level, of the Bunge's role and work and exploring the possibilities for cooperation could provide benefits for both the Electoral Commission's education and Parliament's outreach programmes.

8.3 The Bunge Foundation for Democracy was established in 1998 with the purpose of enlightening 'the general public on Tanzania's new system of multiparty democracy, through civic education.' Many of its specific objectives complement Parliament's outreach programme. The Foundation itself is working closely with the Election Commission, for example in developing an ABC of the new register, and can potentially pull in funds.

8.4 The regional approach. We note that the SADC Parliamentary Forum has various programmes to enhance the capacity of member Parliaments to play their roles efficiently and effectively. The programmes include production and dissemination of educational material to the public. Learning from others is good practice.

8.5 We have already referred to the role of NGOs and CSOs in helping Parliament promote its message as well as their own, especially if parliamentary outreach material is better focused on issues of relevance to them. There might be some scope for co-funding or co-authorship that should be explored. The same might apply to business but we have given no detailed consideration to this.

8.6 The Commonwealth Parliamentary Association offers assistance with professional parliamentary development. The CPA website now carries the first module in the CPA Learning System for Professional Development which is 'intended to provide Parliamentarians with the background knowledge required to translate their aspirations into actions of direct practical value to themselves and those they serve.' It also offers support through regional groups, regional seminars and attachments of senior Members and officials to other Parliaments. The Parliament may wish to explore the possibility of support for its outreach initiative with the CPA. (www.cpahq.org)

9 Other issues

9.1 The following lie outside our specific project but could be worth exploring. Further information could be provided if required.

9.2 Petitions Committee. Public petitions offer a means by which the views of members of the public can be heard in Parliament.

9.3 Separate Explanatory Memoranda on Bills.

9.4 Availability of Constitution. Schools are keen to have copies of the Constitution. Parliament could produce an inexpensive edition of the Constitution and could also ensure that a copy of the Constitution is easily accessible on its website.

9.5 Scope for media/communications officers to travel with Committees into Tanzania and disseminate/promote knowledge and understanding more generally.

9.6 Allowing media more access to the work of Committees.

9.7 Phone-ins on radio programmes.

9.8 Although our programme did not initially involve any consideration of non-print material we were soon made aware of the importance of radio in achieving parliamentary outreach. A weekly review of Parliament and its committees would help people to become engaged in the parliamentary process and some programmes

targeted on issues of interest to the general public such as schools or the AIDS programme would help people to become more aware of the importance of Parliament.

Summary of recommendations and suggested timescales

Para	Recommendation	Timescale	Comments
5.2.2	'Bunge News' type articles to be on website only	Any new commissions from July 2004.	
5.2.4	Ensure all outreach publications are on Bunge website	By September 2004	
5.2.5	Print new guide in Kiswahili and make it and English version available on website	By September 2004	
5.3.2	Consider new simpler publications	Planning to be completed by December 2004	Aim should be for all new materials to be available by 2005 election
5.3.3	Newsletter-type publications	Ditto	Ditto
5.3.3	Simple messages	Ditto	Ditto
5.3.4	Youth video and audio cassettes	Ditto	Ditto
5.4.2	Cross-departmental planning committee	September 2004	See also para 7.10
5.4.3	Involvement of staff in production of new material	October 2004	
6.2	Publication distribution in new building	When building opens	Should be incorporated in planning now
6.2	Business displayed outside Bunge buildings	October 2004	
6.3	Development of mailing list and wider distribution of newsletter	Mailing list from September 2004; distribution asap thereafter	
6.4	Build on relationship with news	Continuous from	

147

	media	now	
6.5	Consideration of radio broadcasts	Build relationships with appropriate stations from now	
7.1	Support for staff visiting other areas	From September 2004	
7.4	Collaboration with Ministry of Education	January 2005	
7.5	Teacher training	Depends on outcome of previous recommendation	
7.5	Priority for teachers in visiting Parliament	From next session	
7.8	Incorporate work with schools into post-election induction training for MPs	Plan from August 2005. Implement immediately post-2005 election	Will require staff training beforehand

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK/TANZANIA

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR THE STRENGTHENING OF

TANZANIA'S UNION NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH ON THE COVERAGE OF THE

CELLULAR SERVICE IN TANZANIA BY VODACOM, MOBITEL

AND CELTEL

CONDUCTED BY:

KIKULI LULU
UNIVERSITY OF DAR-ES-SALAAM

TABLE OF CONTENT

CHAPTER ONE

	Pages
1.0 GENERAL INTRODUCTION	2
1.1 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM	2
1.2 OBJECTIVE OF THE RESEARCH	2
1.3 METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION	2

CHAPTER TWO

RESEARCH FINDINGS

2.0 INTRODUCTION	3
2.1 CELTEL TANZANIA	3
2.1.0 COVERAGE AREA	4
2.1.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED	5
2.1.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS	5
2.1.3 CHARGES	5
2.2 VODACOM TANZANIA	
2.2.0 COVERAGE AREA	9
2.2.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED	10
2.2.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS	10
2.2.3 CHARGES	10
2.3 MOBITEL TANZANIA	
2.3.0 COVERAGE AREA	12
2.3.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED	13
2.3.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS	13
2.3.3 CHARGES	14

CHAPTER THREE

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION	16
3.1 RECOMMENDATION	16
3.2 CONCLUSION	16

CHAPTER ONE

1.0 GENERAL INTRODUCTION

Tanzania is among the African Country, which in the recent years has taken the tremendous jump on the cell phone network. These cellular phone networks contribute the development of communication sector as well as economic development of the Country.

This research is designed to establish the demographic coverage on the cell phone service in Tanzania. It also aim to determine if this cell phone providers have the intention of reducing the tariffs to their subscribers to increase the accessibility to many people so as to enable them (customers) to participate in the issues relating to the Parliament.

The result of the research done at Mobitel Company, Celtel Company and Vodacom Company

1.1 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The major problem, which prompted this research, is the issue of coverage of the cellular service provided by mobile operators and how the mobiles Companies can be used to spread information to subscribers on the issues relating to the Parliament.

1.2 OBJECTIVES OF THE RESEARCH

- To establish the coverage area of each of the cellular Companies in Tanzania mainland and Zanzibar
- To establish the population being served by each cellular Companies
- To establish number of active subscribers geographically
- To establish the preferred service mostly used by subscribers
- To access if the Companies have the intention of reducing the tariff to its customers

1.3 METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION

The research was conducted through personal interview and by the use of secondary source of data i.e. Internet

CHAPTER TWO

RESEARCH FINDINGS

2.0 INTRODUCTION

The findings of the research have been grouped into three cellular Companies, which are, Celtel, Vodacom and Mobitel.

2.1 CELTEL TANZANIA

Celtel Tanzania Ltd was launched in November 2001 and was the fifth entrant into the highly competitive cellular market in Tanzania.

In little over a year, Celtel is now the 2nd largest mobile operator in terms of market share.

Celtel Tanzania Ltd is part of the Pan African Celtel Group, which has a presence in 13 African countries. That is, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia, Malawi, Congo B, Gabon, Sierra Leone, Chad, DRC, Burkina Faso, Niger, Mobitel – Sudan.

Dutch based MSI Cellular Investments, which brings together the best in telecoms on the African continent, owns the Celtel brand. Celtel is uniquely placed to build on MSI's pan African vision that is – to become the most successful pan-African telecommunications service provider.

MSI's non-cellular interests on the continent include Infocom-Uganda, TTCL, Sudatel and Link Africa. Link Africa is an international telephone carrier providing synergies to the whole group by hubbing international traffic from MSI's various subsidiaries

OWNERSHIP

Celtel is a 100% subsidiary of TTCL. MSI CI owns 35% of TTCL and has management control of the company.

2.1.0 COVERAGE AREA

Celtel has been at the forefront of providing access to rural areas, which in the past did not have access to such services. Celtel's world-class network covers all the regions of the Mainland and Zanzibar.

Coastal Region

Bagamoyo, Chalinze, DSM, Dodoma, Ifakara, Kibaha, Kilombelo, Kisarawe, Lindi,Manyoni,Masasi,Mikumi,Ngorongoro,Mpwapa,Mtwara,Pemba,

Road DSM-Arusha, DSM-Morogoro, Kilombero-Ifakara, Mikumi-Kilombero, Morogoro –Dodoma, Morogoro-Mikumi

Northern Region

Arusha, Babati, Handeni, KIA,Kibosho, Korogwe, Lushoto, Marangu, Mererani, Moshi, Muheza, Mwika, Namanga, Ngorongoro,Pangani, Pongwe, Rombo, Singida, Tanga

Road Arusha-Namanga, Arusha-Ngorongoro, Segera-Tanga,

Lake Region

Bariadi, Bukoba, Bunda, Geita, Iaska, Kahama, Kahama mine, Kigoma, Magu, Musoma, Mwadui, Mwanza, Ngara, Nzega, Sengerema, Shinyanga, Sirari, Tabora, Tarime,

Road Bunda-Musoma, Magu-Bunda, Musoma-Sirari, Mwanza-Magu

Southern Region

Iringa, Kyela, Mafinga, Makambako, Mbalizi Mbeya, Mbeya, Mbinga, Njombe, Songea, Sumbawanga, Tukuyu, Tunduma,

Road Iringa-Makambako, Makambako-Mbeya, Makambako-Njombe, Mbeya-Tunduma

Celtel is soon expecting to cover the following areas
Tarekea, Igunga, Bukori near Kahama, Kasulu, Nyamongo,

2.1.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED

Celtel has been at the forefront of providing access to both urban areas and rural areas. The types of customers served are individuals and corporate whose charges of this customers differs depending on their usage.

2.1.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS

Number of subscribers is estimated to be 200,000-250,000 in total up to March 2004

2.1.3 CHARGES

Celtel is committed to providing high quality and affordable services to the Tanzanian public so as to grow the cellular market in the country.

AIRTIME CHARGES

Own Network	Peak	TSH 265.00
	Off Peak	TSH 225.00
	Late Night	TSH 45.00
Other Local Mobile Networks	Peak	TSH 340.00
	Off Peak	TSH 340.00
TTCL 0 to 50 km	Peak	TSH 315.00
	Off Peak	TSH 225.00
TTCL 51 km to 500 km	Peak	TSH 350.00
	Off Peak	TSH 275.00
TTCL > 500 km	Peak	TSH 425.00
	Off Peak	TSH 350.00
East Africa	Peak	TSH 400.00
	Off Peak	TSH 400.00
Zone A	Peak	TSH 1400.00
	Off Peak	TSH 1400.00
Zone B	Peak	TSH 1550.00
	Off Peak	TSH 1550.00
Zone C	Peak	TSH 1750.00
	Off Peak	TSH 1750.00
Zone D	Peak	TSH 1100.00
	Off Peak	TSH 1100.00
Zone E	Peak	TSH 1200.00
	Off Peak	TSH 1200.00
All rates VAT exclusive.		

Own Network	Peak	TSH 5.00
	Off Peak	TSH 4.17
Other Local Mobile Networks	Peak	TSH 5.00
	Off Peak	TSH 5.00
TTCL 0 to 50 km	Peak	TSH 5.00
	Off Peak	TSH 5.00
TTCL > 50 km	Peak	TSH 7.50
	Off Peak	TSH 7.50
East Africa	Peak	TSH 10.00
	Off Peak	TSH 10.00
Zone A	Peak	TSH 25.00
	Off Peak	TSH 25.00
Zone B	Peak	TSH 27.50
	Off Peak	TSH 27.50
Zone C	Peak	TSH 30.00
	Off Peak	TSH 30.00
Zone D	Peak	TSH 18.34
	Off Peak	TSH 18.34
Zone E	Peak	TSH 20.00
	Off Peak	TSH 20.00
**All rates VAT exclusive.*		

Postpaid

Postpaid is Celtel's contract package for those who do not want to be restricted by prepaid account credit availability or the hassles of recharging their accounts now and then. Postpaid subscribers need simply pick up their phone and dial away; call charges are billed on a monthly basis in addition to a monthly access fee.

Tariffs

Own Network	Flat Rate#	TSH 190.00
Other Local Mobile Networks	Flat Rate#	TSH 250.00
TTCL 0 to 50 km	Flat Rate#	TSH 250.00
TTCL 51 km to 500	Flat Rate#	TSH 310.00
TTCL > 500 km	Flat Rate#	TSH 380.00
East Africa	Flat Rate#	TSH 440.00
Africa COMESA	Flat Rate#	TSH 1350.00
Africa non-COMESA	Flat Rate#	TSH 1610.00
Rest of the World	Flat Rate#	TSH 1800.00
**All rates VAT exclusive.* *#Same flat rate 24 hours a day*		

SMS CHARGES

Celtel lets you send SMS messages within the Celtel network, to all other mobile networks in Tanzania and to over 400 networks in more than 100 countries worldwide at a fraction of the cost of a voice call.

Celtel to Celtel	TSH 45.00
Celtel to Other Mobiles in Tanzania	TSH 45.00
Celtel to Rest of the World	TSH 45.00

All rates VAT exclusive

- *The preferred most service by the mobiles phone users is SMS or "short message service" is a technology that enables subscribers to send short text messages of up to 160 characters to each other. These 160 characters can comprise of words, numbers or an alphanumeric combination in any language*

2.2 VODACOM TANZANIA LTD

In July 1999, Vodacom won a ten-year license to operate Tanzania's second GSM cellular network.

At that time, there were three cellular networks operating in Tanzania, but only one was a GSM network. Within three months following the completion of its state-of-the-art GSM infrastructure on 31 August 2000, Vodacom Tanzania became the largest digital cellular network in that country.

OWNERSHIP

Tanzanian shareholders own 35% of Vodacom Tanzania and include Caspian Construction and Planetel Communications. The Vodacom Group (Pty) Ltd has a controlling interest of 65%

2.2.0 COVERAGE AREAS

Vodacom Tanzania Ltd provides cellular coverage in the tourist areas of the Serengeti, Zanzibar, Pemba Islands and the International Airports of Dar Es Salaam, Kilimanjaro and Mwanza. Coverage also extends to greater Dar Es Salaam as well as Morogoro, Dodoma, Tanga, Arusha, Moshi, Mbeya, Mwanza, Shinyanga, Unguja and, more recently, to Iringa and Tabora.

Vodacom Tanzania also covers the summit of Africa's tallest mountain and the highest free-standing mountain in the world. At 5 895 meters, the summit of Mount Kilimanjaro is the highest point on the planet covered by GSM.

Vodacom Tanzania has also reached agreement with Safaricom in Kenya to cover the highway from Arusha to Nairobi.

Vodacom Tanzania is also helping to open up the globe for Tanzanians. The company has signed international roaming agreements with cellular networks in more than 30 countries worldwide, including South Africa, Mozambique, Hong Kong, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, Kenya and the United Arab Emirates.

2.2.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED

Vodacom Tanzania has been providing access to both urban areas and rural areas. The types of customers served are individuals and corporate.

2.2.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS

The company had connected 120 000 customers in year 2000 and this has since grown to 250 000 customers in year 2004

2.2.3 CHARGES

AIRTIME CHARGES

Services	Old Rate*		New Rate*
Vodacom to Vodacom	Peak**	0.35	0.25
	Off-peak	0.25	
	Late Night	0.09	0.09
Vodacom to Other Mobile Networks	Peak	0.45	0.35
	Off-peak	0.35	
Vodacom to Fixed Network (0 to over 500km)	Peak	0.40	0.35
	Off-peak	0.40	
Vodacom to East Africa (Kenya/Uganda)	Peak	0.50	0.40
	Off-peak	0.40	
To International A: Africa (COMESA)	Peak	1.45	1.45
	Off-peak	1.30	
To International B: Africa (Non-COMESA)	Peak	1.65	1.65
	Off-peak	1.50	
To International C: All Other Countries	Peak	1.85	1.85
	Off-peak	1.70	

* All tariffs are quoted in US$, exclusive of VAT, for one

Minute duration, applicable 24 hours a day, except where indicated.			
Days	****Peak Hours**	**Off-Peak**	**Late Night**
Mon to Fri	**0500h – 1900h**	**1900h – 000h**	**000h – 0500h**
Sat, Sun & Public Hols.	**0500h – 1400h**	**1400h – 000h**	**000h – 0500h**

SMS CHARGES

SERVICES	**RATE* (US$)**
Vodacom to Vodacom	**0.05**
Vodacom to Other Mobile Networks	**0.10**
Vodacom to International	**0.15**

*** All tariffs are quoted in US$ (exclusive of VAT), applicable 24 hours a day.**

- *The preferred most service by the mobiles phone users is SMS or "short message service" is a technology that enables subscribers to send short text messages of up to 160 characters to each other. These 160 characters can comprise of words, numbers or an alphanumeric combination in any language.*

2.3 MOBITEL TANZANIA

Mobitel Tanzania started the GSM in July 2000 under the 'MIC' Millicom International Cellular with the intention of providing access to cover rural and urban areas in Tanzania with quality services and affordable price to its subscribers

Mobitel's core competitive advantages are:-

- Coverage
- Quality
- Value

2.3.0. COVERAGE AREA

Mobitel Tanzania covers the following areas;

- Dar es Salaam; all districts
- Coastal region: Bagamoyo, Kisarawe, Kibaha (Mlandizi, Chalinze, Ubena),
- Tanga; Muheza, Kongowe,
- Zanzibar excluding Pemba,
- Moshi town; TPC, Machame, Sanya Juu, Himo, Uru, Kibosho,
- Arusha town; Mererani, Tengeru, Tanapa Airport Road Ngorongoro,
- Morogoro; Morogoro town, Mzumbe, Mikumi national Park, Mazimbu, Pangawe,
- Dodoma; Dodoma town, Msalato,
- Iringa; Iringa town, Tumaini University, Njombe, Makambuko,
- Mbeya; Mbeya town, Mbeya Forest,
- Songea town,
- Mtwara town,
- Sumbawanga town,
- Kigoma town, Kamachumu, Muleba district,

- Shinyanga town, Kahama, mwadui, Isaka,
- Mwanza; Mwanza town, Nyegezi, Nyakato, Mkuyuni, Sengerema, Geita, Ukerewe,
- Mara; Musoma town, Tarime, Sirari, Nyamongo Mine,
- Soon they will provide services to Maramba JKT, and Segera (Tanga), Kibondo (Kigoma).

After election 2005, they will expand their services, to double the areas covered now.

2.3.1 POPULATION BEING SERVED

Mobitel segment its market on geographically basis, they covers almost all the cities and now they concentrating to move to the rural areas. Populations being served are both corporate customers and individuals.

2.3.2 NUMBER OF SUBSCRIBERS

Active subscribers served by Mobitel are in total of 200,000.

2.3.3 CHARGES

AIR TIME CHARGES IN TSH

Buzz to Buzz	Peak	250
	Off peak	220
	Late	80
Buzz to other networks	Peak	300
	Late	240
Buzz to TTCL-local calls	Peak	270
	Late	200
Buzz to TTCL-more than 50 km	Peak	300
	Late	300
Buzz to Kenya/Uganda	Peak	500
	Late	500
Buzz to COMESA Countries	Peak	1450
	Late	1450
Buzz to other African Country	Peak	1650
	Late	1650
Buzz to UK, EU, USA	Peak	1100
	Late	1100
Buzz to India/Pakistan & Lebanon	Peak	1300
	Late	1300
Buzz to the rest of world	Peak	2000
	Late	2000

All rates VAT exclusive

SMS CHARGES

Buzz to Buzz	TSH 40.00
Buzz to Other Mobiles in Tanzania	TSH 40.00
Buzz to Rest of the World	TSH 40.00

- *The preferred most service by the mobiles phone users is SMS or "short message service" is a technology that enables subscribers to send short text messages of up to 160 characters to each other. These 160 characters can comprise of words, numbers or an alphanumeric combination in any language.*

CHAPTER THREE

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

3.1 RECOMMENDATION

Recommendations given here based on the statement of the problem research objectives and research findings.

It has been observed that Mobitel and Celtel can work with the Organization such as SUNY/TANZANIA and these Companies are able to spread information to its subscribers on issues relating to Parliament and keep on up dating the news.

However in assessing the coverage between these three mobile service providers, Celtel seems to cover the large part of Tanzania mainland and Zanzibar than other two companies with affordable services.

Due to the fact that mobile phones are not a luxury but a necessity, Mobitel, Celtel and Vodacom should rollout their plans to rural areas. This is evidenced by the fact that areas, which in the past did not have access to cellular services; generate a lot of traffic on the Mobitel, Celtel and Vodacom network.

3.2 CONCLUSION

With the use of the cellular phones information can widely spread, this depends on the coverage area that these mobile operators are able to reach. Issues relating to the social, political, economic, health (H.I.V/Aids) and culture are being spread by these operators. Their services toward public should be appreciated.

CONTENTS

		PG.
1.0	STRUCTURE AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	1
1.1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.2	LEGITIMACY OF THE COMMITTEE	1
1.3	STRUCTURE OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	2
1.4	AIMS ESTABLISHING THE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	2
1.5	RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE COMMITTEE	2
1.6	HOW THE COMMITTEE WORKS	2
1.7	GENERAL AFFAIRS OF THE COMMITTEE	1
2.0	MEMBERS OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	4
3.0	MINISTRIES MANAGED BY THE INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	
3.1	MINISTRY OF WORKS	5
3.1.1	VISION OF THE MINISTRY	5
3.1.2	OBJECTIVES	5
3.1.3	RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE MINISTRY OF WORKS	5
3.1.4	STRUCTURE OF THE MINISTRY	6
3.1.5	INSTITUTIONS MANAGED BY THE MINISTRY	6
3.1.6	REFORMS WITHIN THE WORKS SECTOR	7
3.1.7	DIVISION OF THE MINISTRY'S DUTIES IN ROAD MANAGEMENT	9
3.1.8	CONCLUSION	9
3.2	MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION AND TRANSPORT	10
3.2.1	INTRODUCTION	10
3.2.2	VISION OF THE MINISTRY	11
3.2.3	INSTITUTIONS/DEPARTMENTS MANAGED BY THE MINISTRY	11
3.2.4	DUTIES OF THE MINISTRY	12
3.2.5	OBJECTIVES OF THE MINISTRY	14
3.2.6	DIVISION OF THE MINISTRY'S RESPONSIBILITIES IN ITS DEPARMENTS	15
3.2.7	DUTIES OF INSTITUTIONS WITHIN THE MINISTRY	17
3.2.8	LEARNING INSTITUTIONS	22
4.0	TABLES	23

PROVISION OF RESEARCH SERVICES

IN THE

PARLIAMENT OF TANZANIA

Prepared by Brown Gideon Mwangoka
Research Officer
Parliament of Tanzania

A paper submitted at The State University of NewYork/Tanzania, March, 2004.

17X

TABLE OF COTENTS page

1 Chapter one——————————————————————1
Background and introduction

2.Chapter two——————————————————————2
Department of research and library services

3.Chapter Three——————————————————————10
Experience from other Parliaments

4.Chapter four——————————————————————18
Conclusion

5.References——————————————————————19

CHAPTER ONE

1.0 Background and Introduction.

As I write this paper in March the Prime Minister of the Republic of Tanzania, Hon .Fredrick Sumaye, was officially inaugurating parliamentary on line information systems (POLIS). Speaking the truth the system is a corner mile stone in creating a paperless electronic parliament which will enable our parliament to perform its activities in accordance with the principle of good governance and openness. Apart from that Iam confident that the flow of well researched information from all over the world will help to speed up the development of our country.

This paper is intended to tackle the current problems facing the members of parliament and parliamentary committees in Tanzania union national assembly that of lacking access to quick, reliable and perfect information on issues of development.

The project will succeed this goal through doing research and keeping records of papers put on the table during and after the proceedings of the national assembly.

With technical assistance from State university of New York /Tanzania whose objectives are to:
1. Improve representation: increased citizen access to understanding of the legislatives process.

2. More effective law making. Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors.

3. Enhance management and administration: increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all members by administrative support units.

4. More effective oversight. Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of poverty reduction strategy

When all of these objectives are achieved, we are sure beyond the shadow of doubt that targeted mission of enabling the parliament to carry out its representative, law making, oversight and administrative functions in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance will benefit all Tanzanians.

Parliament is where the people who represent the citizens of a country come together to debate, discuss, reflect, and make decisions about how the country's policies, laws and finances work to reflect the public will and the public interest. It is a vital democratic institution serving as a bridge between the state and the civil society carrying out its legislative oversight and representative function that strengthen governance.

The history of Tanzanian parliament can be traced back as far as during the colonial era. In 1961 the country attained her independence from Britain. The first constitution of Tanzania was written in 1977.The constitution provides the level of democratic and parliamentary procedures of the country.

In Tanzania the members of parliament have the following functions;

To legislate/to make laws

To present their electorate.

To supervise government work and monitor expenditure of ministries and parastatals.

To debate on the president speech made in the parliament.

To contribute to debates on national issues.

To work closely with their communities and attend to socio-economic and political development issues.

1.1 COMPOSITION OF Tanzanian Parliament.

The total numbers of the current parliament of Tanzania is 295.These legislators represent all Tanzanians who are estimated to reach 34 millions according to the national census which was held in August 2002.

CHAPTER TWO

2.0 Department of Research and Library services.

The department of research and library services apart from offering library services attempts to respond to requests made by the members of parliament on any subjects of their interest. The information can be requested by the members of parliament in form of talk notes, short assignment and sometimes may require a detailed research work.

The department of research and library is one of the five departments of the office of the national assembly .Other departments and units include: The department of administration and personnel, the department of Hansard, the department table office, the department of parliamentary committee. In addition, there are six units which reports directly to the clerk of the national assembly. These units are the unit of internal Audit, finance and accounts, unit of defence and security information and mass education and the units of catering services.

2.1. Staff establishment of the parliament of Tanzania

The library and research has an establishment of 11 officers as indicated below.

The director of Library and research ——————————1
Librarian————————————————————4
Library assistant————————————————————1
Librarian attendant————————————————————1
Secretary————————————————————1
Research Officer————————————————————3

2.2 The section of research

In July 2000 for first time of the History of the Tanzanian parliament, the office of the national assembly recruited three researchers to assist members of parliament and office at large to perform the following duties and responsibilities.

a). Anticipatory research.

This kind of research is done in order to have strong data base on likely issues to be discussed by the house. The criteria used in choosing the topical issues include a burning issue prevailing at that time.

b). Preparing background papers

The documents are prepared in order to inform the legislators the vital information on subjects that may appear on agendas of parliamentary workshops, seminars and conferences.

c). Speech writing.

The section of research also prepares speeches for the members of parliament whenever they wish to address in any occasion regardless in the country or abroad. Such speeches are prepared in order to allow them to have authority whenever they speak.

d) Offering consultancy services

The section offers consultancy services to the members of parliament in order to provide factual and processed information to members of parliament in the house or elsewhere.

e) Special assignments.

Staff in the section of research may be required by the clerk of the national assembly to do any job in the office .For instance one of the researchers of Tanzanian

parliament has been assigned by the clerk to provide special research services to the opposition members of parliament.

2.3 ACHIEVEMENT OF THE RESEARCH DEPARTMENT.

1. Currently, all researchers have personal computers
2. There is accessibility of internet and e-mail services in the offices.
3. Researchers are able to conduct research scientifically.

2.4 PROBLEMS FACING THE RESEARCH SECTION

1. Under funding from the government.
2. Shortage of man power
3. More requests from the parliament are investigative in nature rather than professional ones.
4. Late research requests from members of parliament which need quick answers during parliamentary sessions
5. over politicisation of the research request
6. Lack of strong Data base in the department.
7. Lack of Transport
8. Lack of local and international exposures among the researchers

2.5 MAJOR CONSTRAINTS NEEDING IMMEDIATE REFORMS IN RESEARCH SECTION.

1. Researchers should be attending local and international workshops and workshops on poverty reduction schemes, public expenditure review, democartisation &good governance and environment.

2. Research should be working closely with think tanks such as Research on poverty alleviation (REPOA), Economic and Socio-research Foundation, local and international universities.

3. The present number of researchers should increase from 3 to 10 so as to have a good number which will sufficiently and efficiently server better the Members of Parliament. Due to cumbersome procedures of obtaining a permit from civil service department of recruiting new staff, I recommend to the clerk of the national assembly to transfer (re-allocate) staff within the organisation and re-allocate them to the research and work as research assistants and later on receive proper training to be researchers officers.

4. Researches should be attending parliamentary committees so as to enrich them with crucial issues such bills sctrunizing process which are discussed in depth in the parliamentary committees before they are brought to the house.

5. Researchers should be trained frequently so as to catch up with major changes taking place in the World. Preferably all researchers should have a PhD .In order to comply with most of education standard of members of parliament who most of them have masters degree and PhD.

2.6 STEPS TOWARDS ACHIEVING IMPARTILITY IN OFFERING RESEARCH SERVICES FOR THE MEMBERS OF PARLIAMAENT.

Through my experience as the one of the first researchers of the parliament of Tanzania, I remember one day this was sometimes February 2001,one of the member of Opposition(name and party withheld) asked me "Brown kuna wafanyakazi wa Bunge ambao wako CCM?na wangapi wako Upinzani"? I answered him that civil servants are non partisan. The sentence can be translated as thus in Swahili: one of the member of parliament from opposition asked Brown how many parliamentary staff are members of the ruling party (CCM) and OPPOSITION?THE ANSWER WAS civil servants are non –partisan. The conclusion I want to draw from the discussion is that It will be proper to educate all members of the parliament and parliamentary staff frequently on issues of good governance.

Again, I remember one of Member of Parliament saying that MR X Is purely an opposition man.

At this juncture, I wish to point out that seminars, workshop and training for members of parliament on ethics of public servants should be provided in order to make the parliamentarians to work in a team manner with the parliamentary staff.

Also, I wish to recommend study visits comprising researchers, key parliamentary staff and parliamentarians to world parliaments which had establishment of research department for number of years.

During two weeks of this research of "Provision of the research services in the parliament of Tanzanian". I had exclusive informal discussions with some legislators from opposition and ruling party. Many of them seem to be not aware of function of the department of research and library and also most of them have no culture of using Data when they want to make contributions in the house.

Some of them complained about long procedures of getting the research requests to be approved. The research requests have to be approved by the clerk himself before undertaken, this is done purposely because most of the research requests have financial implication and the clerk of the national assembly is an accounting officer of the national assembly office.

In concluding this section, I wish to point out that through strengthening program by donor community such as SUNY/CID, If the research service department is provided with financial and material support will be able to build strong and reliable data base which the department is lacking, the department will be able to organise seminars for the benefit of the staff and parliamentarians and public at large the resources will be used to train the researchers for short courses and further studies.

2.7 THE SECTION OF THE LIBRARY.

The parliamentary library a (Bunge library) is an important resource of information for parliamentarians, staff and other outside individual's and institutions engaged in research and consultancy.

The library is designed to provide superior up-to-date information about Tanzania and outside the world on all issues related to parliament and general knowledge.

The members of parliament serve in multifarious capacities and the Bunge library takes this into account in its aim to provide ideal services.

Informed members of parliament who know their facts and who have up to date knowledge on what is going on in their countries and the world around them are able to effectively represent and govern the people since they are already equipped with the information needed for them to perform their duties in the house and outside.

The library acquires, processes arranges and preserves the main collections of books, periodicals, pamphlets and newspapers.

It also stores and indexes all officials' publications as well as parliamentary documents.

In a nutshell, the library is indispensable to the effective function of the parliament. Thus its collections of information have to open to accurate complete searching so that they are incorporated into the process of design making in the parliament.

2.7.1 MAJOR CONSTARINTS NEEDING IMMEDIATE REFORMS IN THE LIBRARY SECTION.

For the Bunge library to continue performing effectively and efficiently, there are about six areas which need immediate rehabilitation.

2:7:2. Periodicals section

This is a very vital information resource of the library collection. Currently there are only 290 periodicals titles but almost all of them are out of date and mostly are kept in the storeroom since the are no longer in use. This tantamount to denying members of parliament the most current information they so badly need.

For some years now the library does not subscribe even to the most important periodicals on demand due to the persisting financial constraints being faced by many institutions in the country; ours, the national assembly office being one of them.

Currently, the library receives some journals as a donation from international organisation. These journals do not meet the ever growing demand of information from our members of parliament. And yet the parliamentarians need periodicals more than books in their daily operations.

The Bunge library therefore needs financial assistance to enable us subscribe to 200 periodicals titles which would cost a total of U$ 40,000.

2.7.3. Library automation program (computerisation)

This is another major aspect of envisaged reform process of the Bunge library.

For a start, the intention is to computerize the following services.

A :The acquisition/card catalogue and indexes

B:The local information retrieval system and

C.:Circulation

The library needs 8 personal computers with a local area network and 6 printers.

LIBRARY MANAGEMANT SYTEM SOFTWARE

THE library needs library management system software. One of the following application software is most appropriate.

-book worm (library software)
-in magic plus or
-card box plus (for database management

In magic plus or book worm software US $ 30000 hire training for library staff to man would cost about U$ 5000 including travel, fees and accommodation expenses in say, South Africa.

The total estimated cost for computers is US $ 25,000 while the printers will cost US $ 17,000.

To supplement the internet service; there is a need to have audio-visual facilities in the library.

Parliamentary lack of television and radio services.

This is very beneficial to parliamentarians as far as current awareness is concerned. The cost of television set, disks, video cassette recorders, DVD etc would range between US $ 5000 and US $ 6,00O.

2.7.4 Strengthening the book collection i.e. Text and referencing books:

a. References and textbooks.

The current stick stands at 8500 volumes. But a big portion of the stock is obsolete. There is urgent need to Up to date the collection particularly the reference section so that members of parliament can be served with accurate and up to date information.

b.Publications on parliamentary proceedings and other related issues like Hansard, speeches, state laws, (Bills, ACTS) and all other government publications, are the bedrock of the library collection.

Despite of the importance been attached to the collection, very little efforts have been exerted to improve its services availability of most the documents on the above noted disciplines.

To rehabilitate this collection, the library needs funds to pay for reprints, and bindery of the documents since many such documents are missing in the library collection. It estimated the exercise would cost 12,000(US $)

2.7.5 Rehabilitation of the parliamentary library at national assembly offices in Dare s alaam.The former one was relatively a small library compared to the main library in Dodoma, But one which its services were increasingly on high demand by both parliamentarians especially when they were attending their committee in Dareslaam; and the society in general particularly foreign missions and other international organizations based in Dare S laam; and the society in general. Its importance emanates from the fact that the main library in Dodoma is remotely situated from the city of Dare salaam where most of the government ministries and foreign missions are situated.

2.7.6 Transport.

The absence of a reliable and convenient means of transport continues to be a draw back to deliver accurate and timely information services to the parliamentarians.

Thus, the department of library and research needs a vehicle which would help to emaciate transport problem being experienced by the staff when travelling within Dodoma Officers earmarked for training program could join some of the well established library colleges in Dodoma municipality and other parts like dare salaam on the follow up missions. A land lover or pick up type of vehicle is most suitable fort the department's nature of work. The service would greatly help tom strengthen the both the library and research sections operation

2.7.6 Professional needs for the library training

To achieve excellence in library services provisions, library professionals need to learn from other well established parliamentary libraries about the type and the quality of services those libraries provide to their members of parliament. Officers earmarked for training program could join some of the well established library colleges.

CHAPTER THREE

3:0: Experience from other parliaments.

Research work within the parliaments in different countries has been found to be a backbone for the daily operations amongst members of parliaments as well as other workers. In some countries research works in the parliaments are being conducted under coordination of either a research unit within the department of library and research or an independent department of research. The key role played by these units/departments is handling of the information through gathering of the data, processing and disseminating in a proper manner. In some cases parliamentary researchers do collaborate with fellow researchers working in other institutions in both private and public sectors to ensure that members of parliament as well as the public use the right information carefully. In building capacity for the parliament of Tanzania research department, an insight to the similar departments in the parliament of the other countries has been carried out.

3:1 Experience from Uganda

Department of Library, Research and Information Services
The members of parliament, committees and staff of Ugandan Parliament get support of information needs and computer based information through the department of Library, Research and Information Services. This Department offers the following services;

3.1.2 Research Services

Under the research section members of parliament and the related staff are given assistance of researchers from multidisciplinary, that is specialist in fields of Accountancy, Economics, Statistics Social work, Law Science and engineering and political science are available always to provide information to assigned member .

3.1.3 Function of Research section

a) Provide and coordinate research services for members of Parliament and Parliamentary committees.
b) Assist Committees of Parliament with investigation
c) Carry out services delivery surveys

3.1.4. Library

All papers discussed and passed in the Ugandan Parliament are deposited in the Library. Thus members of parliament and Parliamentary Committees are encouraged frequently to make references in the Library so as to keep the up-to-date.
A wide range of collection are kept in the Library section including Parliamentary proceedings, Government reports, Guidebooks, Encyclopaedias, yearbooks and newspapers which reflects people's perception of what discussed and passed by the House.
The Library section is responsible for;

a) provision and maintenance of library services
b) custody of library holdings and facilities
c) provides photocopy services
d) internet surfing services

3.1.5 Information Technology (IT) Services

This section is responsible for providing IT systems to all departments.
Any breakdown of computer hardware or introduction of IT infrastructure the section is responsible
Members of parliament are also given IT training and support services. Specifically in the internet and email services.

3.2 Experience from the parliament of Zambia

3.2.1Introduction

In15th May 1971, the Research Department of Zambian parliament was established with the appointment of the Research Officer in accordance with Circular No. 15 of 1971 issued by the Speaker of the National Assembly of Zambia. The Hon. Mr. Speaker sent this circular to all Hon. Members of Parliament informing them in his capacity as Chairman of the Standing Orders Committee about the new department and the services it was intended to render. The circular included the following duties as part of the job description of the department:

(i) Provision to Members of Parliament of precise information connected with their duties, which normally would require a written reply;

(ii) Provision to Members of Parliament of oral or written information on the multifarious matters or subjects that come before the House; and

(iii) Provision of research work on international affairs and preparation of background papers on any legislation due to be introduced in Parliament.

In order to realize the objectives set out in Mr. Speaker's instructions and in order to meet the growing demand for processed information in recent years, the functions of the Research Department have expanded to include the following duties:

Information request
Background papers
Speeches
Exchange of views
Country brief
Sessional reviews and Anticipatory research
Documentation
Press clipping
Miscellaneous research.

The significance of the role of the Research Department in the National Assembly

In a parliamentary democracy, Members of Parliament need not only to be informed but also to have readily processed and factual information to enable them carry out their duties, especially that they tend to be too busy carrying out their own research given their multifarious functions.

Furthermore, information is power, because it is essential in decision-making. Research services are, therefore, weapons that Parliamentarians can use against the challenges that threaten parliamentary democracy. Thus, the pioneers of the idea of providing research services to Members of Parliament in the National Assembly of Zambia were motivated by the need to improve the decision-making process of the legislative body by making an individual Member of Parliament, especially the back-bench, relatively well and accurately informed in order that he discharges his responsibilities effectively.

As the situation stands today, there exists disturbing disparity in the flow of information to Hon Members of Parliament. The Minister has all the bureaucrats, that is, the Parliamentary Secretary and all professional staff in the Civil Service at his disposal to tell him what he needs to know in order for him to make his contribution in the House. The private Member, on the other hand, has nobody to turn to, at least those in the Government posts do not want Private Members to be equally informed with the same information. Yet a Private Member of Parliament has the need and right to have the widest range of information to enable him not only to make intelligible contributions in the House but to keep more effective vigil or scrutiny over Government activities.

The task of the Research Department, therefore, is to keep a Member of Parliament sufficiently informed and aware of his role as a legislator and a decision-maker so that he is able to make right decision in the House and elsewhere.

The Research Department operates like a consultancy wing of Parliament, offering varied types of information and advice to Hon Members of Parliament as well as providing background papers for Parliamentary Seminars, Conferences and other functions.

Staff Establishment of the Parliament of Zambia

The Research Department has an establishment of fifteen officers as follows:
Chief Research Officer.....1
Deputy Chief Research Officer.....1
Research Officers.....2
Assistant Research Officer..... 3
Senior Research Assistant.....1
Research Assistant.....2
Clerical Officer.....2
Secretarial Staff.....3

3.3 Experience from the parliament of Ghana

Most of the members desert the house apparently because debates on bills are dominated by legal jargons and procedures that confuse them". This suggests that Parliament in Ghana is not living up to its potential. It is far from providing an effective oversight and representation.

This also brings into sharp focus the caliber of the people Ghanaians elect to Parliament, the reasons why people offer themselves for parliamentary duties, structures in place to assist parliamentarians in carrying out their duties effectively and efficiently e.g. the role of the Clerk of Parliament and members of the civil service working in the various Ministries and Departments. It is necessary to examine why Parliament is not living up to its potential and to find out how it could be assisted to get there.

3.3.1 Role of Parliament

Parliamentarians must fulfil many roles: a legislative function (law making and participation in the making of public policy); an oversight function (holding governments accountable for their actions); and a representative function (representing citizens and, in effect, giving a voice to civil society at the level of the state). One of the main planks of their work is the careful deliberation and debate of issues. This is the fundamental guarantee the public have that decisions are well considered and that key issues are brought to the attention of the people they serve. In fact, most of the daily debate in the Parliament and much of the work in parliamentary committees concerns legislative initiatives. It is therefore disturbing if parliamentarians in Ghana are unable to carry out this most important duty because of the perceived "excessive use of legal jargons."

3.3.2 Structures to support work of Parliamentarians.

The administrations of Parliaments of Ghana provide comprehensive services to support the legislative process and parliamentarians. Procedural and legal specialists research and review draft legislation. Most Parliaments have a Library and specialists

at the Library of Parliament provide research and advice on policy aspects of legislation, as well as

1. Analysis and background information on government bills.

2. They support the work of parliamentarians through issuing briefings,
3. Background analysis,
4. Proposals for studies
5. And report drafting, along with more conventional information products.

The Clerk of the House is also normally experienced in procedural matters and can be consulted for advice on such matters. It would be interesting to know how many of the parliamentarians in Ghana have consulted the Clerk for advice on the complex procedural matters they complain of. The Table Office also has responsibility for the procedural and administrative support necessary for the effective conduct of the business of the House and there is always procedural information for MPs to consult.

In conclusion if Government and Parliament are serious about strengthening the parliamentary process they will have to have adequate resources, qualified and knowledgeable staff and a well resourced library. Parliamentarians should also be provided with adequate resources, offices, staff or a pool of staff for the government members and a pool of staff for the opposition and cross benches, supported by a functioning and effective Public Service. Where necessary there should be education programs and seminars organized specifically to help parliamentarians engage effectively in the legislative process. Orientation and induction programs if not already in place must be instituted.

The parliamentarians on their part should ensure that they will devote their undivided attention to the work of Parliament, build significant expertise in their areas of investigative interest, acquire a thorough procedural knowledge of the legislative process, avoid conflict of interest or declare any conflict of interest and take appropriate action required when they do so, eg abstain from the debate/decision. They must remember they are there to serve the people who elected them and not to "lord" over them. The party machinery should also be able to provide support to their parliamentarians. Where is the money coming from?

The resources could be found by reallocating priorities and reducing government expenditure, eg the President and Ministers can cut down on overseas trips, reduce the number of Minister's and Deputy Ministers, avoid waste and duplication in the system by eliminating the ghost names on pay rolls and above all reducing the level of corruption in the system. If we are able to reduce corruption we might increase the nation's ability to raise revenue, which will assist in meeting the many needs of the country.

Having said much on the countries within Africa, a selection of other countries in the world is being conducted. Experiences from Australia and Denmark are hereby presented reflecting developed countries with highly practiced democracy such that their research departments cater for wider range of researches.

3.5.0 Experience from Australia

Department of the Parliamentary Library Mission

"To support the parliamentary process by providing Senators and Members with quality information services, analysis and advice".

3.5.1 Organizational Structure of the parliament of Australia

The Library is structured into two Programs:
Information and Research Services (IRS) - provides a range of information and document delivery services, and analysis, interpretation and explanation through personal consultation and the preparation of research papers.
Resource Management Services (RMS) - builds and maintains the information resource required by clients and staff, provides cost-effective departmental information technology services and support and creates the operational environment to support the performance of the department.

3.5.2 Staff composition

Secretary - Department of Parliamentary Services

Information and Research Services
Assistant Secretary
Head, Information and Research Services
Deputy Head, Information and Research Services
Director, Economics, Commerce and Statistics
Director, Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
Director, Law and Bills Digest
Director, Politics and Public Administration
Director, Science, Technology and the Environment
Director, Social Policy
Director, Statistics
Manager, CEP
Manager, Client Relations

3.6.0 Experiences from Denmark

In Denmark the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation (Ministries for Videnskab, Technology og Udvikling) is the most influential government body with HLT policy. This Ministry is behind most research agencies, research councils and research programmes related to HLT.
The Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation was created in November 2001 in extension of the former Ministry of Information Technology and Research to comprise the universities (research and education), industrial research and Denmark's policy on technology and innovation.
The object of the Ministry is to promote the interaction of trade and industry, centres of research and education and to strengthen coordination in pursuance of industry and research policy.

Below the most HLT-relevant departments and divisions within the Ministry of Science Technology and Innovation are described.

4.6.1 Research Department

The Research Department is responsible for co-coordinating Danish research to ensure high quality and large benefits while at the same time promoting knowledge based production

Analyses and Strategies Division This Division carries out strategic analyses of Danish research. The Division is in charge of drawing up technical strategies and result-oriented contracts, and it participates in international work on research policies.

Research Policy Division This Division draws up proposals for national and international research policy - not least in relation to the EU. Furthermore, the Division services a number of councils and committees under the Government and the Folketing (the Danish parliament), and is responsible for annual reports to the Folketing and for co-coordinating Government-financed sector research.

Innovation Department

The Innovation Department is designed to provide optimum conditions for the technological development, innovation and competency building of the Danish corporate sector. One of this department's tasks is to bridge the gap between research and the private sector through establishment and financing of projects.

IT Department

The IT Department contributes towards the realization of the Government's objective that Denmark should become a pioneer country in the areas of IT and telecommunications. The Department, which takes care of its tasks within a matrix organization, is divided into three divisions: IT-political Division, Division for IT and Telecom and International Division for IT and Telecom.

IT-political Division This Division is responsible for the Danish Government's national IT policy as well as responsible for a number of central IT projects including:

o E-government
o IT Government
o IT Security
o Inclusion in the Information Society
o Electronic Commerce
o Digital Economy and IT Statistics
o IT and Society

Parliamentary research departments present factual information to members of parliament and ex-members. Research department works under the manager who is accountable to the Clerk of parliament or the Speaker. They also have either a commission or body that set the nature of the research works and regulates works to ensure mass representation, preventing biased findings due to political affiliation, etc. Members of this commission/body are being drawn by clerk of parliament or the speaker and constitute of members of parliament representing all political parties and other dignitaries having research qualifications. This creates impartiality between ruling party and oppositions in the parliament and the public at large. The commission/body formulates strategic plans that provide an overall framework for the research works to be implemented in a certain period. The plan includes statements about the research's role and how it expects to carry out its various functions and tasks. For an example in New Zealand the parliamentary service act 1985

established the parliamentary service commission as a statutory body independent of the executive, to determine and administer the resources available to support members of parliament.

The research department has a role of coordinating valuable research works being conducted by individual and/or research institution/organization including education/learning canters such as university and colleges through delivering notes to members of parliament. This includes arranging seminars/workshops to be attended by members of parliament. In the United Kingdom parliament Loughborough University participated to the showcase of British Science, Engineering and Technology Research (SET 99) held at the House of the Parliament

3.6.3 Limitation of the study.

The time allocated for the study was not adequate but it was possible because the researcher had to use even weekends to perform this very important task. Problems associated with clarity of the language are highly regretted, since the author had no enough time to edit properly. But it's my hope the findings will be conveyed for further action.

The study obtained much of the international experience from internet sources rather books or physical site visit, sometimes internet information is not reliable. I recommend that the study should be expanded and in future preferably an intensive study should start when the researcher will beginning his study tour to Uganda scheduled to start sometimes in August this year. The study will be useful if will include physical study visits to other parliaments such as Zambian parliament (which has more than 30 years in offering research services.)Study visit to Ghanaian parliament and one of the following parliaments either united states or United Kingdom or Australia or Canada.

The proposed study of the detailed research work. I suggest to begin after the end of this year marathon budget which ends early August and the study should come to an end late October.

I read in SUNY'S brochure and internet about SUNY/CID mission to Tanzanian parliament, that SUNY's Mission to Tanzania will come to an end in the period of two years beginning may 2003 to may 2005.As a consultant of this project of improving provision of research services in the parliament of Tanzanian" recommend that SUNY/CID be given an extension of more than five years in order to accomplish this important mission in an African environment.

CHAPTER FOUR

4.0 CONCLUSION.

From the experiences of other countries on their parliamentary system and by enlightenment of SUNNY's project of aiming at assisting technically in strengthening Tanzanian union national assembly, definitely there is a need now of changing the perspectives of Tanzanian parliament.

To start with this long journey the department of research and library should be strengthened.

Hopefully by experimenting what this paper has proposed, majority Tanzanians who are represented by MPS will now get well researched information which is a key ingredient in planning development of our nation.

4.1 REFERENCES.

http://www.parlizim.go.zw/About_parliament/p_functions/body_p_functions.htm#acce ssed 27/03/2004.

http://www.parliament.gov.na/NA/Administration/Administration.htm #

Accessed on 26/03/04

http://www.parliament.gov.zm/research-depart.htm#

accessed on 28/03/04

http://www.parliament.go.ug/library7.htm#

Accessed on 25/03/04

http://www.parliament.go.tz #

accessed 23/03/04

katiba ya jamhuri wa muungano wa Tanzania.

SUNY,s brochures –"Technical assistance for strengthening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly"

PARLIAMENTARY INTERNS 2004 - FINAL PLACEMENTS

NO:	NAME	ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE	GENDER	SUBJECT TO PARLIAMENTS AGREEMENT	C/CLERK OR LINE MANAGER ATTACHED TO:
1	RICHARD FAUSTINE	SOCIOLOGY	M	COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE	Ms. Angelina Sanga
2	SALUM AWADH	GEOGRAPHY & ENVIRONMENT STUDIES	M	ENVIRONMENT & NATURAL RESOURCES	Mr. Sam Manamba
3	JOHN RWEZAHURA	POLITICAL SCIENCE/PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	M	LOCAL AUTHORITY ACCOUNTS	Mr. Kheri Maulid
4	DINNER NGAIZA	SOCIOLOGY/HEALTH & POPULATION STUDIES	F	PROTOCOL OFFICE	Mr. Leo T. Mnyanga
5	ALEXANDER MAKULILO	POLITICAL SCIENCE/PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	M	DEFENCE & SECURITY COMMITTEE	Mr. Mathew Kitundu
6	PAMELLA PALLANGYO	SOCIOLOGY	F	PERSONNEL & ADMINISTRATION	Mr. Leo T. Mnyanga
7	ISMAIL SULEIMAN	ECONOMICS-URBAN & RURAL PLANNING	M	ECONOMIC INFRASTRUCTURE COMMITTEE	Ms. Justina Shauri
8	SUZANNA MAGOTI	SOCIOLOGY/SOCIAL WELFARE & ADMINISTRATION	F	AGRICULTURE & LANDS COMMITTEE	Ms. Neneiwa Mwihambi
9	EMMANUEL PETER	SOCIOLOGY	M	INVESTMENTS & TRADE	Mr. Daniel Eilufoo
10	BEATRICE MASSAWE	SOCIOLOGY/HEALTH & POPULATION STUDIES	F	TABLE OFFICE	Mr. Japhet Sagasii

11	ALINUNE NSEMWA	SOCIOLOGY/HEALTH & POPULATION STUDIES	F	SOCIAL SERVICES COMMITTEE	Mr. Theonest Ruhilabake
12	KELVIN NJUNWA	POLITICAL SCIENCE/PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	M	FOREIGN AFFAIRS COMMITTEE	Mr. Lawrence Makigi
13	CHARLES SAMA	ECONOMICS	M	PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE	Mr. Anselm Mrema
14	PETER STANSLAUS	ECONOMICS	M	FINANCE & ECONOMIC AFFAIRS	Mr. James Warburg
15	GODFREY MWAKYOMA	SOCIOLOGY/SOCIAL WELFARE & ADMINISTRATION	M	CONSTITUTIONAL, LEGAL & PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION	Mr. Ernest Zulu
16	GIUSY MBOLILE	SOCIOLOGY/HEALTH & POPULATION STUDIES	F	PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICE	Mr. Cletus Ponella
17	LULU KIKULI	INTERN SUPERVISOR	F	DIRECTOR OF COMMITTEE OPERATIONS	Ms. Phoebe Mmbaga

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK/TANZANIA (SUNY/TANZANIA)

(SESSION ONE)

ACTIVITY REPORT

Budgetary Analysis Skills Training Workshop

Held on 19th – 20th May 2004

At Mbudya Conference Hall - Sea Cliff, DSM

Compiled by:
John J. Mnyika
Freelance Documenter

List of Contents

0.0 Abbreviations

1.0 Background information

2.0 Introduction
- 2.1 Overview
- 2.2 Aim and expected outcome
- 2.3 Profile of participants
- 2.4 Workshop methodology and process
- 2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

3.0 Results
- 3.1 Programmatic results
- 3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward

4.0 Summary of the proceedings

4.1 Day one - 19th May 2004
- 4.1.1 Opening remarks
- 4.1.2 Keynote address
- 4.1.3 Budgeting Essentials
- 4.1.4 Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective
- 4.1.5 Budgeting-Gender Perspective

4.2 Day two - 20th May 2004
- 4.2.1 The Budgeting Process in Tanzania
- 4.2.2 Budgeting for Service Delivery
- 4.2.3 Next steps-follow ups
- 4.2.4 Closing remarks

5.0 List of Annexes
- Topical presentations
- Workshop programme
- Registration book
- Workshop photographs

Abbreviations

SUNY-State University of New York

MP-Member of Parliament

PRSP-Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

IMF-International Monetary Fund

PER-Public Expenditure Review

PSRC-Parastatal Sector Reform Commission

USA-United States of America

CSOs-Civil Society Organisations

TGNP-Tanzania Gender Networking Programme

UDSM-University of Dar es Salaam

GDP-Gross Domestic Product

TRA-Tanzania Revenue Authority

HIPC-Highly Indebted Poor Countries

APNAC-African Parliamentarians Network Against Corruption

1.0 Background Information

The Center for International Development of the State University of New York (SUNY/TANZANIA), in partnership with the British Council and associates, Pact/Tanzania and Bunge Foundation for Democracy (the SUNY/TANZANIA Team), was on 11 May 2003 awarded a two-year programme to provide technical assistance for the strengthening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly (Parliament). The range of support to be provided under the auspices of this Project is to enable the Parliament to carry out its representative, lawmaking, oversight and administrative functions more effectively and in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance. This Project team is to act as a partner with the Tanzania Parliament in providing institutional support to enable the national legislature to play a more central role in Tanzania's governing and development processes.

The Project aims to achieve the following primary results:

1. **Improve representation:** Increased citizen access to and understanding of the legislative process.
2. **More effective lawmaking:** Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors.
3. **Enhance management and administration:** Increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all members by parliamentary administrative support units.
4. **More effective oversight:** Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

As an integral part of result area 4, the project work plan indicates the following:
Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure. This activity is focusing on Project Result Area 4.1 **"Enhance Parliaments Budgetary Analysis Capability".**

Implementation strategy: The current performance environment is to be reviewed and MPs are to be equipped with relevant skills and information for more effective oversight. Briefing workshops on HIPC, the PRSP and their implications for the national budget and poverty policy are among the key outputs.

As an immediate initiative SUNY/Tanzania has formed a consultant team to develop and deliver awareness training to assist the Chairpersons and Members of Parliament on a select number of financial issues for Standing Committees to examine and assess draft estimates during the Budget Session in 2004. Key output includes the development of training sessions for the above on basic budget analysis.

2.0 Introduction

2.1 Overview

The two-day training workshop-session one for the Members of Parliament of Tanzania on budgetary Analysis Skills was held from 19th to 20th May, 2004 at Mbudya Conference Hall-Sea Cliff Dar es salaam.

The report is divided in four parts. The first recaps background on the SUNY Project and this activity; the second provides an introduction about the workshop; the third part presents the results and key findings of the workshop and the last part recites the summary of the workshop proceedings.

2.2 Expected outcome and objective

Expected outcome: To assist Parliament to more effectively oversee both the development and the implementation of the national budget.

Objective: Increasing the understanding and the effectiveness of MPs through Committees to monitor public expenditure.

2.3 Profile of participants

The 32 participants of the session-one workshop were the MPs who are members of Finance and Economic Affairs committee together with their committee clerk.

2.4 Workshop methodology and process

The workshop focused on delivery of topical specialist presentations followed by plenary discussions and Q&A. The participatory and interactive discussions were allowed to provide room for participants to address issues corresponding to their knowledge and experiences. The Q&A session enabled the presenters to make clarification on pertinent areas.

2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

The workshop was facilitated by Mr Ray Smith-Consultant. The Guest Speakers came from Grant Thornton Tax Consultants, University of Dar es Salaam (UDSM), Tanzania Gender Network Programme (TGNP) and Ministry of Finance.

The workshop covered the following topics:

- Budgeting Essentials
- Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective
- Budgeting-Gender Perspective
- The budgeting Process in Tanzania
- Budgeting for Service Delivery

3.0 Results:

3.1 Programmatic results

Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure.

Outcome: Contributed to assist Parliament to more effectively oversee both the development and the implementation of the national budget.

Objective attained: Increased the understanding and the effectiveness of MPs through Committees to monitor public expenditure.

Awareness training to assist the Chairpersons and other Members of Parliament on a select number of financial issues was done in order to enable standing Committees to examine and asses draft estimates during the June-August 2004 Budget session.

Part of the activity to ***amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure*** was implemented. The activity contributed to ***enhance Parliaments budgetary analysis capability***.

The Chairpersons of Parliamentary Committees were **adequately briefed in advance of the formal Budget session so that the contents and priority areas set out in the PRSP** were to be considered when the Committees were considering drafting sectoral budgetary estimates.

This has contributed to achieve the following primary result: Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (**More effective oversight**)

3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward:

- It is recommended that before the budget is presented in plenary it should be presented in full during the committees' sessions.
- It was maintained that the budgetary objectives should be jointly set between the executive and legislature. Otherwise the MPs are to be left vulnerable to the voters.
- There is a need to rethink on the re-establishment of the Planning Commission.
- There is a need to revive the contingency fund and set rules and regulations to ensure accountability of its finances.
- The geographical features should be taken into consideration when setting criteria for budget allocation.
- It was recommended that there should be a full independent research on the implementation of the previous years' budget.
- It was advised that the academicians should be involved in the public hearings to advice, suggest and give ideas on some important issues.
- It was maintained that there is a need for the legislative to influence the executive to involve the MPs in the budget formulations from the initial stages. The committee of Finance and Economic Affairs need to see the budget structure as early as January and see the actual budget in figures in April.
- The MPs should utilise the Parliamentary research services available. However this service should be equipped and provided with researchers competent in finance and economic fields in order for the service to meet the needs of the MPs.
- There is a need to speed up the budget analysis from the Panel of Advisors on what was voted on the previous year and the actual expenditure.
- The Advisory Panel should compile a catalogue of all the documents that have been or ought to be distributed pertinent to budget and budgetary analysis from al least January.
- Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS) should be provided to the African Parliamentarians Network Against Corruption (APNAC).
- A series of brief presentations from the Advisory Panel should be conducted on pertinent issues.

4.0 Summary of the proceedings:

4.1 Day one-19th May 2004

4.1.1 Opening remarks:

Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ underscored the following:

- Reiterated that the SUNY project was brought by USAID and DFID to provide a range of assistance to the Parliament.
- Highlighted that the MPs in Tanzania are performing a diverse of roles necessitating abilities and skills to perform the legislative role well.
- Explained that the committee clerk has been involved to enable him to understand the issues and assist the MPs as per needs.
- Asserted that the timing of the workshop was critical as the MPs are heading to the committees sessions and thereafter to the Parliament in Dodoma.
- Clarified that the training was to assist the government to see if the budget fits with the overall government policies and plans.

4.1.2 Keynote address:

Mr Ray Smith, SUNY consultant highlighted the following:

- Maintained that the programme in mainly on budgeting thus it was referring to what the Finance and Economic Affairs Committee is doing.
- Underscored that the focus of the training is to assist the MPs to look at the budget, examine and understand what the government is doing or intends to do.
- Explained on the importance of looking at the budget preparations now than later; although the auditing role which is also important will always be there.
- Emphasized that budget analysis skills help to look at various important issues in advance and determine how these same important issues should be solved.
- Revealed that the Constitution of Tanzania allows MPs to object on what the government is putting before them but in reality what is happening now is quite different.
- Empasized on the importance of the legislative to have skills that will help them look and understand the budget before it is passed.

4.1.3 Budgeting Essentials:

Presentation by Mr Chris Msuya-Grant Thornton Tax Consultants *covered the following in his presentation:*

- Meaning of budget
- Purposes of budget
- Importance of budgeting
- Objectives of budgeting
- Types of Budgets
- Setting up of budgets
- Behavioural implications of Budgeting
- Budgetary Slack
- Budget systems
- Performance Indicators
- Reporting on budgets

Discussion, Q&A

- ***How can appropriation budget be analysed?*** It was answered that the mechanics of appropriation budget were a bit beyond the presentation. However it was explained that appropriation budget is relevant when input and output can not be measured at the same time. Budget is prepared on requirements. But when confronted with situation of limited resources the resources that are needed must be scaled down (appropriated) to the amount of resources that are available. This involves departing requirement budget to budget according to appropriate resources. In this process priority sector is looked upon in accordance to national policies and programs. Of course, this priority sectors are established according to needs.
- ***To what extent does the government of Tanzania conform to the definition and standards of budgets presented commensurate to our change from public sector to private sector controlled economy? Have we been budgeting to see the policy change envisaged? How do you compare defence budget with agriculture? In 1997 the budget of industry and trade was smaller that the budget of registrar of political parties-How do you apply the criteria to our system of budgeting? Our national budget is donor oriented and it does not conform to what we have budgeted-why then do we budget?*** It was underscored that having is one thing but having a good budget is another. As Tanzania is now in a mixed economy, the budget system should reflect the mixed economy. The budgeting should address or finance the core functions of the government. The MPs can influence this as the experiences from other countries shows that a shift from socialist economy can best be affected with the changes in budgeting.

20

- ***The president is advising that there is macro economic growth in the country for the past ten years. The task now is to improve micro economic management-how can the budget assist to achieve the end? Are there international standards that can be applicable to Tanzania?*** It was responded that this questions should not be answered by the consultants alone. They should be pondered by the sectoral committee since according to the Parliamentary Standing Rules, the committees have a mandate to scrutinize the budget and submit their concerns and recommendations. It is the MPs who must be acquainted with the objective of policy priority issues in order to advocate for them. The window is the sectoral committee which has that legislative role. Other stakeholders such as the academicians can provide inputs in that endeavour.
- It was maintained that the role of the executive is currently very dominant while the role of the legislature is dormant.
- It was noted that the country can not always start from zero budget-it should start from past, experiences and trends.
- It was shared that in Uganda, enactment of Budget Act and establishment of the Budget Committee provided room to obtain independent information on budgeting and empowered the MPs to question.
- It was revealed that another seminar on economic issues and budgeting will be held in October with the support from IMF.
- It was emphasized that presently the committee is not formulating the budget but rather the budget is imposed by executive. It was therefore recommended that before the budget is presented in plenary it should be presented in full during the committees' sessions.
- ***Who sets the objectives? Is it the executives? What is the role of the parliament in this end?*** It was exposed that most of the objectives including the budgetary objectives are currently set by the executive. The objectives should be jointly set. Otherwise the MPs are left vulnerable to the voters. This is because the Tanzanian Parliament is still evolving.
- It was argued that in the past Tanzania used to have the Planning Commission. But later the Budget Commission was established at the Ministry of Finance. Meanwhile a department of Planning and Privatisation has been established at the Vice President's Office. There is a need to rethink on the re-establishment of the Planning Commission.

205

4.1.4 Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective Presentation

Professor Nehemia Osoro-UDSM presented the following:

- The objectives of macroeconomic policy
- Macro economic policy in Tanzania
- Macro economic policy and budgeting
- Existing bottlenecks and challenges to budgeting

Discussion, Q&A

- ***The level of foreign exchange has increased but this raise has come from export. It is through donor support-how can this be viewed economically?*** It was recapped that some years back the country had import support cover. There was only one month of import but today there is nine months cover that is mainly from donor. Traditional export crops have declined and the manufacturing sector is also stagnant at 7% of GDP.
- It was maintained that presently the deficit budget versus the current budget in the recurrent budget has been declining.
- It was observed that although it is said that there is a tremendous increase in budget collection since the formation of TRA the fact is there is only slight improvement. Prior to 1996 the tax revenue as a percent of GDP was 11 percent and now has increased to 12 percent.
- ***Taking an example of an economy where some sectors of the economy are tax exempted; wouldn't an economy portray a more realistic picture if the exempted sectors are removed when calculating the tax to GDP ratio? What would tax to GDP be?*** It was revealed that there is an argument that the country's GDP ratio is inflated that is why the GDP to tax ratio is low. Technically, the sector can not be removed since once it is removed the resulting total is no longer the GDP. If the imports coming to this country are taken for calculation only 10 percent will be taxed. The collection is very low; and this contributes to low tax compared to GDP ratio. Further more the GDP obtains a larger amount due to mining; that on the other hand does not add much to the tax revenue.
- ***Our import is said to be 4.5%-does this includes imported inflation?*** It was responded that this is the overall inflation figure.
- It was exposed that in Tanzania the banks have introduced multiple of charges and commissions that is why they are making profit despite minimal lending. They are non interest income is higher that interest income which is accrued from their core function.
- ***To what extent has the country conformed to the micro economic objectives presented?*** It was asserted that there is a need to review

the objectives in Tanzania's context. The objectives cited do not conform to the realities of the majority of population. They need education, employment and the growth process that is contributing to poverty eradication. The growth rate is 6 percent. However, unemployment is increasing. What is important is distribution policy. In the developed countries employment is the key to all electoral campaigns. But in Tanzania this is not a crucial priority at policy level. Policy should be revised/ reviewed to accommodate this at macro economic level. There is a need to refine this policy or come up with a new policy.

- ***The success in achieving the macro economic objectives depends on sound budget system-do we have this? If not, how can a way for changing the existing system of budgeting be devised?*** It was clarified that what was presented is an ideal situation. Opinion was shared that the budget process in Tanzania is not adequate. MPs should have relevant information and be equipped with skills to enhance their capacity to analyse the budget. This should also include that there is access to interact with the government before hand.
- It was revealed that as a result of the macro economic monetary policy a large some of deposit lay un-lent for instance 300 billion in NMB, such funds are not contributing to development. It was however argued that the main concern of the monetary policy is stabilisation. The monetary authority as achieved that goal of controlling inflation as now the government is borrowing less that what it used to. It was further underscored that this is not the only goal of monetary policy. There are other goals that the government have not been able to achieve much which include growth and poverty eradication.
- It was maintained that the academicians are not giving critical academic positions to assist the MPs. Most of the academicians are either supporting the existing policies blindly or have turned into politicians. Hence MPs are now stranded without being fully equipped with skills and/or information.

4.1.5 Budgeting-Gender Perspective

Presentation

Ms Gema Akilimali-TGNP underscored the following:

- Background and main focus of gender budgeting
- Why was it developed
- The objectives of gender budgeting
- The concept Gender budgeting and concepts related to gender
- Issues in gender budgeting
- Role of parliamentarians in promoting Gender budgeting

- How to ensure budgets are gender responsive
- Rationale of Gender budgeting

Discussion, Q&A

- ***Is the paper biased in terms of women? Is gender budgeting viewed as women budgeting?*** It was clarified that the gender budgeting is focusing on the poor, it concerns the majority. There is much mention of the women because they are the most disadvantaged thus it is the group whose interests are often not met. Gender budgeting is looking at critical needs and to whom these critical needs are aimed at.
- It was pointed out that women include social groupings such as disabled, vulnerable groups etc whenever they have discussion on gender issues. The principal issues should be that the women are the most disadvantaged group.

4.2 Day two-20th May

4.2.1 The Budgeting Process in Tanzania

Presentation

Mr Nashon Magambo-Commissioner for Budget, Ministry of finance revealed the following in his paper:

- The legal base
- The role and functions of government budget
- The structure of government budget
- The budget process and its execution
- Control and budget management problems
- Budget improvements and reforms

Discussion, Q&A

- ***We are keeping our money in Tanzania Shillings (Tshs) that is still devaluating-is it not better to keep our money in dollars for easier disbursement and control?*** It would not be prudent to peg the countries finances in foreign currency. But for servicing the foreign debt the finances are put in dollars and then converted into Tshs. People should not be paid in other currencies than what they use in their purchasing.
- ***How effective is the budget process in Tanzania?*** It was responded that in some degree the budget is effective as all key players such as the donors, ministries, and Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) are involved and the needs are identified. But there are some challenges confronting the budgeting in Tanzania mainly being

inadequacy of resources to meet the needs of majority of the sectors.

- ***What is the relevancy of having the budget while it is donor dependent?*** It was admitted that dependency is not favourable as it reduces the ability to control. In such circumstance it is difficult for the government to do strategic things in its own decisions and approaches. What is important is to improve the economy and raise the amount of National income.
- ***For the past five years there has been a trend of budget deviation-what kind of mechanisms are there to ensure that the budget is implemented as agreed?*** It was indicated that originally there were such deviations but now implementation is primarily according to the budget. That is why the Medium Expenditure has been established. These include improved monitoring and efforts to ensure that donors are honouring their commitments. Currently the government is striving to solve the problem of divergence.
- ***Do we really need to have contingency or mini budget? What is the meaning of having a budget without contingency component?*** It was clarified that sometimes unforeseen needs may arise that require resources beyond what is set for contingency. Under such circumstances supplementary budgeting is unavoidable.
- ***Can't it be logical to establish special fund for contingency that can be accumulated when the contingency money is not spent?*** It was observed that such proposal is substantial. It was underscored that such fund was existing and it should therefore be revived. But it seems it was scraped off due to misuse of contingency funds. Thus rules and regulations should be set to ensure accountability of such funds.
- ***Tax revenue is the main source for financing budget expenditures-How does the ministry of finance view the private sector: as a cow to be milked or a horse to pull the cart?*** It was responded that the government is moving away in terms of production; thus the tax payers are important key players and that is why even in the drafting of the new tax act they have been considerably involved. Likewise the government is involving the private sector in the committee for ongoing budget preparation process to accommodate their interests.
- ***The world is like a book, if you do not travel you will end up reading one page-can the ministry arrange study visit for MPs to learn budgeting processes of other countries?*** It was proposed that the MPs should plan and see how best these studies can be conducted and submit their proposals to the relevant authorities.

- ***It is quite evident from the presentation that the budget process in Tanzania is following a top-down approach-is this appropriate?*** It was argued that the budgeting process in Tanzania follows both top-down and down-top approaches. At the top the macro economic framework policy is developed in terms of resources availability consistent with sectoral priority determined at the centre. On the other hand the institutional strategic plans are developed at the grassroots then basing on these the budgets are prepared and sent to the top. But it could be true that in most cases the top-down approach presides.
- ***For instance Dar es Salaam region is smaller than Rukwa but it gets the largest share in the budget-what criteria is the government using to allocate the budget in various regions?*** It was explained that the government ensures that the public debt and salaries are paid first; then the regional allocation follows. A new criterion has been instituted by which the resources are allocated taking into account factors such as population size, number of schools and level of poverty.
- ***How successful has the performance budget been?*** It was maintained that there is a little improvement as when the incremental budget was in use; focus was on importation of cars, payment of per diems etc. But now the situation has changed and instead the implementers are asked for qualitative and quantitative delivery because tax payers are expecting good services now. Thus every ministry is asked to prepare targets and activities; this results into more accountability.
- Population only can not suffice. Geographical terrain should be taken into consideration. For instance in Rukwa and Kigoma though the population is small the terrain results into higher transportation costs-why shouldn't the geographical feature be taken into consideration in budget allocation? It was agreed that depending on contribution the geographical features may be taken into consideration.
- ***In what ways has the budget for the last ten years been used for planning investment?*** Has the Government budgets been used as tools for reform? It was revealed that the budgets have not been able to achieve all that was set in the plans due to resources limitation and inadequate management.

4.2.2 Budgeting for Service Delivery

Presentation

Dr Silvia Temu-Department of Accounting, UDSM *presented the following:*

- Service delivery and the government
- Budgeting for Service Delivery
- Review of 2003/04 Budget
- Emerging issues for budgeting for year 2004/05
- Reasons for discrepancy
- Areas of controversy in budgeting for service delivery
- Possible Questions in Reviewing the Budget for Service Delivery 2004/05

Discussion, Q&A

- It was exposed that monitoring and evaluation of the work done from the previous budget is a critical challenge. It is only this year that the Parliamentary Committees have done visits to cross check.
- It is very difficult to get quality of services into numbers-how can service indicators be converted into numbers? It was admitted that this is a critical challenge. For example one of the indicator is the expansion of schools where by new schools have been built. But how can their quality be measured? There is a system of contracting independent evaluators. Such system can be instituted in Tanzania to ensure the quality of services is checked.
- It was emphasised that the government should perform its role of effective and strong oversight institution. But it lacks relevant systems, structures and expertise. For instance the committee of finance and economic affairs does not have even a secretariat or research unit. Universities should supplement this role as they are given public funds and one of their major roles is researching.
- It was admitted that the majority of the MPs are from the ruling party and thus sometimes it is very difficult for them to challenge as it is tantamount to challenging their party's policies. But party interests should be put aside to allow the MPs to think in terms of protecting the interests of majority.
- It was revealed that in Uganda the MPs through the private members bill drafted and presented the Budget Act. It will take long for such move to be staged in Tanzania as private members bill are often either lost in the long grass or taken by the executive.
- It was recommended that there should be a full independent research on the implementation of the previous years' budget.
- It was explained that the difference that is seen in the budget of Tanzania is as a result of reform processes in Tanzania. The entire

planning process of Tanzania failed when reform started taking place as there was divergence between the planning commission and the treasurer resulting from the halting of budgeting role from the planning commission. But the responses from the government are encouraging as it has agreed that there are some weaknesses in the planning machinery.

- It was declared that the responsible committee will have the opportunity of looking at the budget structure before it is presented and thereafter.
- It was agreed that although the government is moving well there is a need of strengthening planning which will also strengthen the resource allocation role and then move forward to strengthen the economy. The Parliament should be able to shape the degree of accountability and improve the level of integrity.
- ***How does the parliament do monitoring and evaluation? Is there a committee for that? Is there a unit of the committee responsible for that?*** It was advised that the committees should press to be provided with relevant facilities that will enable them to monitor and evaluate the budget and this includes having access to the internet etc
- ***What does SUNY project do to improve the capacity of CSOs to provide researching and budgetary analysis skills or tools?*** It was replied that SUNY has conducted workshops to increase CSOs/Parliamentarians interaction. But the wider role of capacity building is under another sister project called PACT.
- It was appealed that the budget guide should be provided to the MPs in advance.
- It was maintained that there is a need for the legislature to influence the executive to involve the MPs from the budget formulations-initial stages. The committee of finance and economic affairs should see the structure of the budget as early as January and see the budget in figures by the month of April.
- It was observed that the arrangement for the ministerial technocrats to meet the committees directly is not feasible since they prefer providing clarification through their respective Ministers.

Unanswered Questions

- *Parliamentarians should ensure that the budget estimates fit with the national strategies and policies. For instance in PRSP agriculture is a priority sector but is the budget accorded to this sector adequate?*
- *The MPs should provide oversight of whether the expenditures anticipated are helping to achieve the set national goals. If MPs do not have information on the national policies how can they perform this role?*
- *Why shouldn't the government have three years budget instead of one year budget?*
- *What is the difference between the East African Countries (EAC) in their budgeting processes?*
- *If you have your plans in place you will prepare your budgets according to plans. We killed the planning commission as a result our budgetary allocation depends on the budgetary power of the ministers-what must we do in order to change the situation?*
- *How can the legislature reduce the control of the executive on it?*
- *How can the parliament ensure that the governance and the rule of law are practiced?*
- *What budgetary analysis skills do the MPs need? What should be the interpretation of MPs performance indicators versus the national budget?*

4.2.3 Next steps-follow ups

The following next steps surfaced:

- The MPs should utilise the Parliamentary research services available. However this service should be equipped and provided with researchers competent in finance and economic fields in order for the service to meet the needs of the MPs.
- The Parliamentary Research Service should be linked to the research institutions.
- An Advisory Panel of six Tanzanian experts has been formed for the committee. Their first task is to analyse what was voted on the previous year and the actual expenditure.
- The Advisory Panel is to come up also with a catalogue of all the documents that have been or are to be distributed pertinent to budget and budgetary analysis from at least January.
- Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS) are to be provided through the African Parliamentarians Network Against Corruption.
- A series of brief presentations from the Advisory Panel are to be conducted on pertinent issues.

4.2.4 Closing remarks

Closing was done by Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ who thanked all the presenters and the participants for the informative and insightful workshop. She also informed the MPs about the group of third year students-interns from University of Dar es Salaam who are expected to work in each committee. Thus she appealed to the MPs to provide the premier cooperation to these learning politicians of tomorrow.

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK/TANZANIA (SUNY/TANZANIA)

(SESSION TWO)

ACTIVITY REPORT

Budgetary Analysis Skills Training Workshop

Held on 21st – 22nd May 2004

At Mbudya Conference Hall - Sea Cliff, DSM

Compiled by:
John J. Mnyika
Freelance Documenter

214

List of Contents

0.0 Abbreviations

1.0 Background information

2.0 Introduction
- 2.1 Overview
- 2.2 Aim and expected outcome
- 2.3 Profile of participants
- 2.4 Workshop methodology and process
- 2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

3.0 Results
- 3.1 Programmatic results
- 3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward

4.0 Summary of the proceedings

4.1 Day one 21st May 2004
- 4.1.1 Opening remarks
- 4.1.2 Keynote address
- 4.1.3 Budgeting Essentials
- 4.1.4 Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective

4.2 Day two-22nd May 2004
- 4.2.1 Budgeting-Gender Perspective
- 4.2.2 The Budgeting Process in Tanzania
- 4.2.3 Budgeting for Service Delivery
- 4.2.4 Next steps-follow ups
- 4.2.5 Closing remarks

5.0 List of Annexes
- Topical presentations
- Workshop programme
- Registration book
- Workshop photographs

Abbreviations

SUNY-State University of New York

MP-Member of Parliament

PRSP-Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

IMF-International Monetary Fund

PER-Public Expenditure Review

PSRC-Parastatal Sector Reform Commission

CSOs-Civil Society Organisations

TGNP-Tanzania Gender Networking Programme

UDSM-University of Dar es Salaam

HIPC-Highly Indebted Poor Countries

1.0 Background Information

The Center for International Development of the State University of New York (SUNY/TANZANIA), in partnership with the British Council and associates, Pact/Tanzania and Bunge Foundation for Democracy (the SUNY/TANZANIA Team), was on 11 May 2003 awarded a two-year programme to provide technical assistance for the strengthening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly (Parliament). The range of support to be provided under the auspices of this Project is to enable the Parliament to carry out its representative, lawmaking, oversight and administrative functions more effectively and in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance. This Project team is to act as a partner with the Tanzania Parliament in providing institutional support to enable the national legislature to play a more central role in Tanzania's governing and development processes.

The Project aims to achieve the following primary results:

1. **Improve representation:** Increased citizen access to and understanding of the legislative process.
2. **More effective lawmaking:** Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors.
3. **Enhance management and administration:** Increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all members by parliamentary administrative support units.
4. **More effective oversight:** Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

As an integral part of result area 4, the project work plan indicates the following:
Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure. This activity is focusing on Project Result Area 4.1 **"Enhance Parliaments Budgetary Analysis Capability".**

Implementation strategy: The current performance environment is to be reviewed and MPs are to be equipped with relevant skills and information for more effective oversight. Briefing workshops on HIPC, the PRSP and their implications for the national budget and poverty policy are among the key outputs.

As an immediate initiative SUNY/Tanzania has formed a consultant team to develop and deliver awareness training to assist the Chairpersons and Members of Parliament on a select number of financial issues for Standing Committees to examine and assess draft estimates during the Budget Session in 2004. Key output includes the development of training sessions for the above on basic budget analysis.

2.0 Introduction

2.1 Overview

The two-day training workshop-session one for the Members of Parliament of Tanzania on budgetary Analysis Skills was held from 19th to 20th May, 2004 at Mbudya Conference Hall-Sea Cliff Dar es salaam.

The report is divided in four parts. The first recaps background on the SUNY Project and this activity; the second provides an introduction about the workshop; the third part presents the results and key findings of the workshop and the last part recites the summary of the workshop proceedings.

2.2 Expected outcome and objective

Expected outcome: To assist Parliament to more effectively oversee both the development and the implementation of the national budget.

Objective: Increasing the understanding and the effectiveness of MPs through Committees to monitor public expenditure.

2.3 Profile of participants

Total number of participants on session-two workshop was thirty eight (38); these were mainly the Chairpersons of the Parliamentary committees and other MPs who are also members of Finance and Economic Affairs committee.

2.4 Workshop methodology and process

The workshop focused on delivery of topical specialist presentations followed by plenary discussions and Q&A. The participatory and interactive discussions were allowed to provide room for participants to address issues corresponding to their knowledge and experiences. The Q&A session enabled the presenters to make clarification on pertinent areas.

28

2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

The workshop was facilitated by Mr Ray Smith-Consultant. The Guest Speakers came from Grant Thornton Tax Consultants, University of Dar es Salaam (UDSM), Tanzania Gender Network Programme (TGNP) and Ministry of Finance.

The workshop covered the following topics:

- Budgeting Essentials
- Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective
- Budgeting-Gender Perspective
- The budgeting Process in Tanzania
- Budgeting for Service Delivery

3.0 Results

3.1 Programmatic results

Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure.

Outcome: Contributed to assist Parliament to more effectively oversee both the development and the implementation of the national budget.

Objective attained: Increased the understanding and the effectiveness of MPs through Committees to monitor public expenditure.

Awareness training to assist the Chairpersons and other Members of Parliament on a select number of financial issues was done in order to enable standing Committees to examine and asses draft estimates during the June-August 2004 Budget session.

Part of the activity to ***amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure*** was implemented. The activity contributed to ***enhance Parliaments budgetary analysis capability***.

The Chairpersons of Parliamentary Committees were **adequately briefed in advance of the formal Budget session so that the contents and priority areas set out in the PRSP** were to be considered when the Committees were considering drafting sectoral budgetary estimates.

This has contributed to achieve the following primary result: Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (**More effective oversight**)

3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward

- There is need to harmonize more the work of Planning Commission, PRSC and the Ministry of Finance. A suggestion has been put forward for SUNY project to play part in this endeavour.
- A debate should be open on what kind of budget fits the country at the present. A suggestion has been put forward for SUNY project to provide forum for such discussions.
- It was suggested that the presentations of the workshop should in future be done in the presence of ministerial technocrats and officials.
- The MPs should ensure that funds are set for inviting experts in the committees' sessions. SUNY can provide support to this end.
- The MPs should strive to ensure that the process of drawing the budget guidelines should be passed to the committees' when in session and then approved by all the MPs in the plenary.
- There is need to spearhead the amendment to the procurement procedures that is to be tabled. This should include enabling the MPs to understand the public procurement Act and why amendments are needed. SUNY can play active role in this effort.
- There is a need to publish the budgets in simpler versions that can easily be understood by the majority. The MPs should advocate this in collaboration with the development partners.
- There is a need to increase the involvement of MPs in the Public Expenditure Review (PER). SUNY can organise briefing sessions for the MPs on PER.
- There is a need for all committees to have a common board where all committees in the Parliament will get a chance to meet together. This is an issue that has to be advocated by the MPs themselves in the Parliament. The chairpersons of the committees agreed to meet the Speaker on the matter. SUNY should accord relevant support in the process.
- It is recommended that before the budgetary work is carried out there should be a review of the services delivered on the previous budget.
- It is asserted that it is high time that the chairpersons of various Parliamentary Committees should establish a formal network where they can sit and discuss issues and then act as a pressure group to ensure among other things that the Bunge Commission performs its roles. SUNY can facilitate this development.
- A possibility of MPs to receive independent reports of the performance of the economy from the treasury can be explored.

- Building the capacity of Parliamentary research officers and services is essential. It should include ensuring the research officers are linked to the committee's clerks. Links between the researchers and the experts from academic institutions will also be enhanced.
- A resource manual to enable the MPs to know where the expertise on a certain field is available should be developed.
- The MPs should be provided with workshop report containing the issues noted to easy follow up.
- The idea of the Parliament making its own budget should be advocated to make the body more independent and strong. The Parliament should be adequately funded to empower it to perform the oversight roles. SUNY project should support this attempt.
- The budget guidelines should be printed and provided to the chairpersons of committees (two copies each).Arrangement should be made to provide other remaining MPs with the respective guidelines during the budget session.

4.0 Summary of the proceedings

4.1 Day one-20th May 2004

4.1.1 Opening remarks

Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ underscored the following:

- Observed that the session was timely as in few weeks time the committees are to meet for preparations and approval of the overall budget in June.
- Revealed that the workshop was to identify problems in the budgeting process and how to move forward.
- Noted that the MPs are having much power but are lacking adequate information particularly on budgeting.
- Recapped that it was exposed in the past session that the MPs were not involved in PRSP and asserted that similar problem is with budgeting.
- Maintained that the committee clerk has been involved in the program to institutionalise the workshop's findings.
- Emphasized that the MPs are the key actors who can provide a check to the executive and thus they must be adequately empowered to make informed comments.
- Declared that between the months of October and November another similar training will be conducted for MPs.
- Thanked USAID and DFID for funding the project and the participants for attending.

221

4.1.2 Keynote address:

Mr Ray Smith-SUNY consultant addressed the following:

- Clarified that the workshop was not giving skills per se but it was rather helping the MPs to explore new approaches.
- Reiterated that in Tanzania the committees have a chance to look at the budget and the standing orders allows the MPs to object on the budget.
- Indicated that the challenge was that most of the things (problems) are always seen after they have happened and not before they happen.
- Highlighted that the workshop's aim was to equip the MPs with tools that will enable them to know what to do when they have a budget proposal at hand with limited time.
- Argued that often no matter how experienced people are the basics tend to be forgotten thus the workshop was also to remind the MPs on the basics of budgeting.

4.1.3 Budgeting Essentials

Presentation:

Mr Chris Msuya-Grant Thornton Tax Consultants covered the following in his presentation:

- Meaning of budget
- Purposes of budget
- Importance of budgeting
- Objectives of budgeting
- Types of Budgets
- Setting up of budgets
- Behavioural implications of Budgeting
- Budgetary Slack
- Budget systems
- Performance Indicators
- Reporting on budgets

Discussion, Q&A

- ***With the cash budget is there a prospect of investing for the future?*** Cash budget was introduced to curb run-away expenditure (spending what is not present).Since the principle is to spend on what is at the present; it may be spent on investment.
- ***Cash budget is the control of disbursements rather than commitment but MPs are dwelling on commitment-will it not bring non fulfilment at the constituency level?*** It was clarified that commitment is made on understanding of what is available. The way out is to make sure that the basis of your commitment is

attained. Experience in Uganda and Zambia on cash budgeting is that the main focus of cash budget is to control spending but it did not control the making of the commitment. It would be better to make commitment inline with what is there.

- It was exposed that in some areas projects have not been implemented due to lack of funds due to inadequate outlay collection. It was admitted that the disadvantage of cash budget is that it can affect the expenditure pattern and therefore bring some irregularities. In such cases spending can not be done as expected because collection has not been done as expected. In Zambia this happened because the collection was very low. On the other hand in Uganda it succeeded because of higher collection. But it should be understood that if cash budget is abandoned the spending more than what is earned will frequently result into inflation.
- It was maintained that the nature of control is very wild due to diversity of foreseers; the planning commission versus the PRSC and the ministry of finance.
- It was propounded that in Tanzania there is no goal congress as there is a difference between national and sectoral goals.
- It was argued that the cash budget is limiting the efforts of the country to look for money because the focus is to spend on what is available. This becomes even worse when there is a shortfall in taxation. There is a need to devise measures to ensure that the cash budgeting systems does not become permanent.
- It was suggested that the presentations of the workshop should in future be done in the presence of ministerial technocrats and officials.
- ***It was underscored that the workshop should have given the MPs relevant inputs for the budget session. For instance, how can the MP push for more allocation of budget to the agriculture sector?*** It was replied that the purpose of the workshop was to equip the MPs with tools to analyse the budget and influence the government. The MPs should then use the knowledge to initiate the envisioned changes in the government and improve MP's performance. The objectives of the sessions are to make the MPs at least understand the budgeting process and to enable them to know the shortfalls existing.

4.1.4 Budgeting-Macro Economic Perspective Presentation

Professor Nehemia Osoro-UDSM presented the following:

- The objectives of macroeconomic policy
- Macro economic policy in Tanzania
- Macro economic policy and budgeting
- Existing bottlenecks and challenges to budgeting

Discussion, Q&A

- ***What is the interest of macro economic controlling residing? Is it only on the setting of interest rates?*** It was answered that earlier only central Bank determined interest. But today it's the market that is determining the interest rate. This is much influenced by IMF and World Bank liberalisation process. It is however very important for Central Bank to intervene when matters are out of control. In United States of America, for example, the Federal Reserve does intervene when the interest is very low.
- ***Since 1980s the inflation has gone down from 36 to 6.5 percent but interest rate remains high over 16 percent-why?*** It was recapped that the government was not borrowing money from Central Bank but much depended on aid and selling treasury bills which by itself is not healthier. Meanwhile the collaterals are not certain and people do not pay debts. So the Central Bank has to take more risk hence raising the rate of interest. It was also revealed that inflation is going down but the rate is sluggish.
- It was highlighted that the growth and distribution are two different phenomena that is why due to the problem of distribution the income gap increasing and the majority of Tanzanians are poor.
- It was observed that there is liquidity problem in the country due to money received through the donor projects which can not be well absorbed. This is a time bomb that may result into serious problems to the economy in the future because people do not borrow or lend. As a result even the bank charges are increasing which calls for intervention that will regulate the commercial banks operations to reduce rate and charges of their services.
- ***What are optional policy approaches to deal with financial institutions?*** It was maintained that the government can play major role through the Central Bank.
- ***There is an idle group of ages between 15 and 30-how can the unemployment problem be approached?*** It was advocated that unemployment is a very crucial issue. An explicit and well designed employment policy is needed to reduce poverty. So far such policies are lacking at macro economic level. Any Presidential candidate has to make a statement on how many job opportunities should be created in his/her term.
- ***Why is the value of our money not increasing?*** It was argued that when the value of money is lower the export become cheaper and the imports become more expensive. So the best way is to have the value of Tanzania Shilling be over dollar to create more demand for the export and export more.

224

4.2 Day two - 21st May 2004

4.2.1 Budgeting-Gender Perspective

Presentation:

Ms Gema Akilimali-TGNP underscored the following:

- Background and main focus of gender budgeting
- Why was it developed
- The objectives of gender budgeting
- The concept Gender budgeting and concepts related to gender
- Issues in gender budgeting
- Role of parliamentarians in promoting Gender budgeting
- How to ensure budgets are gender responsive
- Rationale of Gender budgeting

Discussion, Q&A

- It was remarked that the involvement and consultation on policy issues at the grassroots is minimal. Experience shows that it is the experts who are drawing the policies and push them to the relevant authorities. This pattern should be changed so that there is real consultation. For instance the policy reduction policy was imposed due to a push from the outside countries.
- MPs think that it's very difficult for them to be involved in the early stages of budget planning. Thus Civil Society Organisations should do the researching and planning as they can be involved in the early stages.
- ***How much are the MPs informed about the gender budgeting issues so that they may be able to give informed inputs?*** It was replied that there are real gaps in dealing with gender budget issues. It is true that some sectors are forgotten. Efforts are being done at grassroots level by some organisations for instance the Intermediate Gender Networks (IGNs).
- It was revealed that another constrain to working with the committees is the inability of the committees to invite experts because there is no financial provision for such arrangement at the committee level. However, it was observed that the MPs can influence the provision of funds for this purpose.
- ***At what stage do MPs intervene in the budgeting process?*** It was indicated that apparently there is a problem since the MPs can not intervene in the early stage since the government has the responsibility to prepare through all the major stages and present the document to them as a government document.
- It was emphasized that it is necessary to seek for equality rather than looking at issues from one side which may result into men segregation.

225

- It was underscored that issues that fall under gender budgeting are the most important issues that affect the majority.

4.2.2 The Budgeting Process in Tanzania

Presentation:

Ms Monica Mwamnyange-Assistant Commissioner for Budget, Ministry of finance revealed the following in her paper:

- The legal base
- The role and functions of government budget
- The structure of government budget
- The budget process and its execution
- Control and budget management problems
- Budget improvements and reforms

Discussion, Q&A

- ***There have been attempts to involve the Parliamentary Committee on drawing the budget guideline but it seems there is reluctance-don't you think that if the MPs are involved from the lower levels (budget guidelines preparations) they will then play active role in other processes?*** It was emphasized that there is a need to come up with mechanisms to involve the MPs in budget guidelines preparations.
- It was argued that the MPs are emphasizing their involvement because they're involved in both the revenue and expenditure level. Thus they should be involved in the setting of the basis for budget allocation.
- It was recommended that the process of drawing the budget guidelines should be passed to the committees when in sessions and then approved by all the MPs in the plenary.
- It was mentioned that some of the ministries and regions are not interested in guidelines they are more interested with the ceiling budget.
- ***Don't you think that poor implementation of projects funded by foreign currency can influence the foreign currency stability?*** It was explained that the Procurement Act slowed down the implementation of the project. The amendments to the procurement act will soon be tabled.
- ***Why is our country still using cash budget?*** It was clarified that the country has not gone completely away from cash budgeting. Cash budgeting was introduced when it was difficult to control the budget revenue collection and expenditure. Cash budgeting has ensured that what is spent is what is obtained and hence improved accountability. Meanwhile the current leadership is concerned on

overpayment of what is present and hence avoiding a lot of supplementary budgeting. The past government did overspend and resorted to borrowing in domestic banks resulting into inflation.

- It was further explained that all priority sectors are to date getting funds in quarterly basis and subventions are going to the districts. The remaining institutions get their money in cash basis are armed forces and some very few recurrent budget based expenditures. The development budgets particularly those under Poverty Reduction programme are getting quarterly. Currently, all the institutions get what they have been allocated.
- It was observed that the budget in Tanzania is of no concern to majority of people because it is too technical. The government should thus make effort to promote citizens awareness and involvement on the budget and its processes. It was advocated that the government should not work alone. Other development partners and CSOs should help the government in the process of sensitizing the mass. The CSOs should play a big role of not only sensitizing the citizens but also empowering the citizens to give critical deliberations. The client service charter should inform the citizens what they should expect from institutions. It is also the responsibility of the MPs as they are the ones who are serving and are with the common citizens.
- ***How has the ministry ensured that the gender budget is prepared from bottom up?*** It was explained that gender budgeting was pioneered by TGNP and the government accepted the move. Currently, the government is sensitizing the ministerial officials on the processes. However, there has been little sensitization to the regional offices and district authorities. The government is further in the process of establishing a tool for gender budgeting.
- It was appealed that the Public Expenditure Review (PER) information should be given out well in advance to MPs for effective involvement.
- It was revealed that the Tanzanian Embassies in foreign countries are spending funds that are not budgeted. Such money is not only unaccounted but is also spent without Parliamentary approval which is against the law. The oversight role of the country is thus bypassed. There is no Revenue Intelligence Unit in the country to reveal such violations.

4.2.3 Budgeting for Service Delivery

Presentation:

Dr Sylvia Temu-Department of Accounting, UDSM presented the following:

227

- Service delivery and the government
- Budgeting for Service Delivery
- Review of 2003/04 Budget
- Emerging issues for budgeting for year 2004/05
- Reasons for discrepancy
- Areas of controversy in budgeting for service delivery
- Possible Questions in Reviewing the Budget for Service Delivery 2004/05

Discussion, Q&A

- It is high time to adopt the approach that is being used by Uganda, Kenya and Nigeria for the MPs to make own budget for the Parliament instead of it being made by the Ministry of Finance. Unless the government is serious in funding the Parliament the national policies will not be realised.
- It was revealed that the Bunge commission has been established long time ago and its main work is to prepare the budget and make consultation with the prime minister.
- It was suggested that before the budgetary work is carried out there should be a review of the services delivered on the previous budget.
- It was asserted that under good governance the fight against corruption should feature because without addressing these services delivery will not be attained. The war against corruption should also ensure accountability and the rule of law.
- It was maintained that the idea of having an independent body to supervise monitoring and evaluation is very healthy. But it seems in Tanzania it is difficult to do that due to lack of resources-***Question: How are other countries doing? Are such bodies in those countries funded by the government?*** In Kenya and Uganda the Parliament is making its own budget and thus the oversight role is maintained. In some other countries CSOs are given funds from central government and other development partners to conduct surveys and analysis and issue independent reports. MPs should pressurize to ensure that resources are set for this function.
- It was proposed that it is high time that the chairpersons of various Parliamentary Committees establish a formal network where they can sit and discuss issues and then act as a pressure group to ensure among other things that the Bunge Commission performs its roles.
- It was observed that in Uganda the MPs receive independent reports of the performance of the economy from the treasurer.

Unanswered Questions:

- *We had all kinds of budgets-which one has shown performance? Which is the best?*
- *In a developing country the main economic sector is agriculture and price is determined elsewhere-how then can the government of Tanzania have effective policy?*
- *When the budget documents are presented what specific criteria can the MPs use to determine whether the budget has responded to the gender budgeting issues and requirements?*
- *How can the gender budgeting and equality of women be put together?*
- *In Tanzanian culture is it practical for a woman to lead a house with the husband around?*
- *How do you prepare budget classified expenditure? Who prepares? Who approves?*
- *How do you investigate resources? Do you do resource intelligence?*
- *Our economy is becoming expensive day by day while poverty is increasing-what can you comment?*
- *Is there an appropriate relationship between the planning commission on one hand and the treasury on another hand?*
- *There are complains from donor community that there is little absorption of donor funds in Tanzania. This has effect to foreign currency-what can you comment?*

4.2.4 Next steps-follow ups

Ms Donna Bugby presented the following next steps:

- MPs should seek to be included in the PER consultative forum
- Building the capacity of Parliamentary research officers and services. Also ensuring the research officers are linked to the committee's clerks. Links between the researchers and the experts from academic institutions will also be enhanced.
- Resources manual is to be developed to enable the MPs know where the expertise is available.
- A pilot Advisory Panel of Experts has been established to support the work of the Finance and Economic Affairs committee. The panel will be working according to the requirements of the committee.
- The committee's chairpersons have to make arrangement to ensure that the findings of the matters emanating from the workshop are discussed in the steering committee.
- The MPs are to be provided with workshop report containing the issues noted to easy follow up.
- The idea of the Parliament making its own budget should be advocated to make the body more independent and strong.
- The budgets guidelines are to be printed and provided to the chairpersons of committees (two copies each). Arrangements are to be made to provide other remaining MPs with the respective guidelines during the budget session.
- There is a need for the MPs to understand the public procurement Act and why amendments are needed.

- Informed the MPs about the Internship program that will involve 14+ third year students from University of Dar Es Salaam from different fields.

4.2.5 Closing remarks

Closing was done by Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ who among other things:

- Recapped that SUNY is measured on its efficiency and ability in responding to the needs of the legislature.
- Appreciated that objectives of the workshop has been adequately achieved.
- Emphasized that SUNY and others can mainly identify the problems but the final work to make reforms in the parliament lies in the hands of the MPs.
- Declared that a meeting to strategize on how to materialise the given inputs is to be organised.
- Thanked the Chairperson of Finance and Economic Affairs Committee and other MPs for attending the workshop.

SPEECH OF THE OPPOSITION CAMP SPOKESMAN, HON. HAMAD RASHID MOHAMED (MP) SHADOW MINISTER, FINANCE, PLANNING AND PRIVATIZATION.

CONCERNS ESTIMATES OF REVENUE AND EXPENDITURE, PRESIDENT'S OFFICE (PLANNING AND PRIVATIZATION) MINISTRY OF FINANCE 2004/2005

13 JUNE 2004

INTRODUCTION

1. **Hon. Speaker**, first of all on behalf of the opposition camp I would like to thank you for the opportunity you have accorded me to air the views of the opposition camp on the budget speech by the State Minister, President's office, Planning and Privatization for the year 2004/05 in accordance with parliament Regulations section 43(5)(b) 2003 issue.

2. To begin with, on behalf of the opposition camp I would like to extend our heart felt condolences to the families of Hon. Abdallah Kigoda and Hon. Dr Aisha Kigoda for the death of their father. May the almighty God rest his soul in eternal peace, Amen.

3. Hon. Speaker, before I go deeper may I remind Hon. MPs the statement of President Mkapa that he gave in this parliament on 12 February 2004 on the political problems in Zanzibar following the last general elections. He said, "The events of January 26-27 2001 have remained as a shortfall and do not reflect the character of Tanzanians. We would like to have a sustainable civilized system, free and peaceful in Zanzibar and Tanzania in general" end of quote. Hon. Speaker, in the budget speech of the Minister for finance page 40 he says," due the increase of banditry events in the country, preparations for the next year general elections and other law breaking events, the budget for the fiscal year 2004/05 has increased the budget for defense and security forces."

4. Hon. Speaker, this statement which mixes election issues with issues of banditry and law breaking in simple words, and from our experience of the 26-27 January 2001 and the event of Bariadi where the car of CUF leaders was broken by CCM leaders and , the establishment of volunteer squads in Zanzibar where one of their camps is called torture camp which is contrary to the constitution of the United Republic of Tanzania, are enough evidences that Tanzanians should not expect to have fair and peaceful elections.

5. Hon. Speaker, let us remember the President's speech because there is no Tanzanian who knows his rights and is ready to accept to be deprived of those rights. We are saying this because we would like to see our country to remain peaceful and calm.

6. Hon. Speaker, on behalf of the opposition camp, let me congratulate Hon. MPs we elected to represent us in the African Union Parliament. Special appreciations should go to Ambassador Getrude Mongela for being elected the President of the first African Union Parliament. It is my expectation that the people of Ukerewe will safeguard this honor for the benefit of the nation. Furthermore, I congratulate Hon. D Makanga MP for coming back to the parliament but I would like to remind him that it is not only the opposition parties that chase their members elected by the people from the parliament but also CCM as they did to me in 1988 when I was the MP for Wawi constituency.

7. Hon. Speaker, I also would like to congratulate Hon. Minister of State, President's office (Planning and Privatization) Hon. Abdallah Kigoda and Hon. Minister for Finance, Hon. Basil Pesambili Mramba, MP, Deputy Ministers, Principal secretaries and their deputies together with heads of departments and sections for coordinating economic plans and collecting revenue that has brought our country fame and made it acceptable to investors.

8. Hon. Speaker, I now request them to direct their efforts towards emancipating Tanzania form the scourge of poverty because that is what is being done now for the benefit of Tanzanians. Right now many Tanzanians are poor. Tanzanians are yet to see the fruits of their resources like minerals, sea products, wildlife etc. Are these here for the benefit of foreigners or for their own development?

9. President Mkapa in his end of month speeches said," Budget is the thermometer of a person's life and health of the economy of the nation...." "A good economist will make use of the budget to prescribe treatment to combat poverty and to promote economic growth"

   Hon. Speaker, according to analysis done by the Bank of Tanzania on the average income of a Tanzanian using USD and prices of 1992 per capita income of a Tanzanian dropped year after year from USD 85.2 in 1995 to USD 57.2 in 2002.

Average per capita income per USD for prices of 1992, 1995, and 2002								
Year	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002
USD	85.2	85.5	81.3	75.5	68.5	64.8	60.7	57.2

   Hon. Speaker, as I said earlier, the international criterion for one to survive in the last budget was one USD while the government" s criterion was Tshs 330 for the city of Dar es Salaam. Hon. Speaker, due to this decline in the per capita income of Tanzanians is the 2004/05 budget helping to combat poverty?

10. Hon. Speaker, Minister Kigoda in his speech for 2004/05 mentioned his ministry's responsibilities adding that they emanated from the vision 2025 and other policies aimed at promoting the economy and remove poverty.

II MEDIUM-TERM PLAN

1. Hon. Speaker, we have seen the Working Draft of the preparations for medium term plan and the budget perspective for the years 2004/05-2006/07.

2. Hon. Speaker, I beg the Hon. Minister to tell this parliament when this plan will be come effective because without such a plan is tantamount to speculation that the long term plan will be realized.

Hon. Speaker, the opposition camp recommends that the medium term plan should be hastened so that the people can judge if it is true that they can do away with poverty by the year 2025.

III IMPLEMENTATION OF OUR PLANS

Hon. Speaker, the biggest problem that we have in Tanzania is the failure to implement our plans and resolutions.

1. Our policies are meant to emancipate Tanzanians from the scourge of poverty; however, the implementation does not commensurate with the policy. For example we cannot do away with poverty if to date Tanzanians whether individually or in groups cannot own mineral resources. I am happy that on the side of hunting there are indications of inviting Tanzanians. However, there is a need to increase pace.

2. Honorable Speaker, mineral resource would have been the fastest savior and means to attain the vision 2025 if the implementation of the medium term was planned with a view of the mineral sector to contribute 20 to 30 per cent of the national income. Currently, the government has planned for the mineral sector to contribute to the national up to 10 per cent by 2025.

3. Hon. Speaker, I understand why the government has planned that way – it is a problem of mind set. There is that feeling that Tanzania is not conversant with mineral issues which, is not true. What is lacking are good plans to harvest the mineral wealth and, right now there are Tanzanians who have invested in gold (like the 2 Drums) and diamond (El Hilal Minerals) who need government support.

4. Honorable Speaker, if the government invested 50 per cent in the mineral sector and could not get dividends for a period of 35 years and finally sold 25 per cent of its shares for USD one million(1,000,000.0) and remained with 25 per cent for ten years without getting any dividends but only to be told that the mine was operating at a loss and the investor continued operating on loan basis (24 million USD loan) and is not stopped, it is a sure sign that the government believes that this a problem of mind set. This is a mine that the government has shares. How can Tanzanians benefit from gold mining? According to expert information Tanzania has the ability to produce 25m oz of gold. Currently it is producing 1m oz per year. Hon. Speaker, we should remember that minerals are a resource that has an end. For example, Geita Gold Mine started in 1938 and was producing 900,000 oz. In 1966 (28 years later) the mine was closed. We should remember that by the technology used was old technology. Now in this era of new technology wouldn't the mine close in 10 years time?

235

5. Honorable Speaker, oil exploration is the most difficult one (risk investment). However, its contracts show that it is a much better investment to the people than mining sector as indicated by statistics below. Furthermore, the profit gained from mining is not taxed and hence benefiting the miners, while, with petrol there tax accounts that must be shown. There is no profit sharing in the minerals sector while there is profit sharing in the petrol industry depending upon increases in production.

Honorable Speaker, if you compare the revenue that the government is getting from petrol exploration and drilling of petrol is as follows:

	MINING	PETROLEUM
ROYALTY	3-5%	121/2%
INCOME TAX	30%	30%

IV Honorable Speaker, comparison of direct revenue of the mineral sector in Ghana, Namibia and Cambodia indicate that at least our colleagues have rates that protect their resources contrary to the hospitality given by our country at the expense of our people. We are very generous.

Country	Royalty	Income Tax	Resource Rent tax	State equity
Ghana	3-12%	35%	25%	10-30%
Namibia	Formula	Formula	25-45%	-
Tanzania	3-5%	30%	-	-
Cambodia	5-12%	30%	-	-
Zambia	2%	Yes	35%	Formula
Khazasktan	Negotiable	Yes	30%	4-30%

Honorable Speaker, despite the government's efforts in tax collection, the total tax collection is 12.1% of the national income while the government depends on aid and loans by 40 per cent. In order to reduce depending upon aid and loans we need to collect at least 20 per cent of the national income.

2 Honorable speaker, half of our sales abroad is minerals particularly gold and diamond. As indicated on the table above, why don't we follow the example of Botswana, South Africa and Ghana whose revenue from mineral sales is not less than 30 to 40 per cent as government tax?

3. The opposition camp would like to know why the government fails to conduct an in depth research before (a) reviewing other acts e.g. Petroleum exploration act which to a certain extent protects interests of the nation (b) at other countries like Ghana which has gold like ourselves? Or are we giving people royalty?

V FORGERY OF BIG COMPANIES.

136

1. Honorable Speaker, due to forgery of foreign companies and our added value industries of our minerals we lose USD 1,321,844.94 from exporting minerals weighing 4376.97 ounces. This is for gold only; still there is diamond and other minerals.

2. The opposition camp recommends that we should have minerals processing industries like the defunct TANCUT in Iringa. We should start our own gold refinery so that we prohibit the selling of raw gold. This move would increase the value of our mineral resources and hence increase our national income.

3. Honorable Speaker there is big forgery in the mineral sector. Before the government implements its decisions it is better for it to prepare itself by co-opting experts to conduct in depth research and not to enter into contracts after the investors have benefited from our minerals. Because the parliament is here on the people's endorsement it should be incorporated in order to avoid such issues as happened to IPTL and TTCL which are escalating poverty due to their costs and debts.

Hon. Speaker, the following steps if, taken would help to prevent forgery

4. Investors should borrow from our banks and if they have no enough money to lend the bank of Tanzania should intervene to facilitate the availability of such loans I order to avoid to have poor circulation of money and our reserve to be limited. Furthermore, we will be able to control the flow of our currency which was Tshs 966.6 per USD in 2002 and now it is Tshs 1038.6 per dollar which is 7.4 less for the year 2003.

5. Conditions for new investors should be reviewed in order to protect national interests. It is wise for the government to incorporate the MPs through the sectoral committees to get their advice.

6. Where the government has shares it should end at having representatives in the board but also at the point of production.

7. The procedure of letting investors to borrow without evaluating the loans and, following up the goods purchased, gives a loop hole to the investors not to pay taxes until the mine is exhausted and, have endless debts like Williamson Diamond.

VI ARTISANS

1. Honorable Speaker, in the medium term plan for this fiscal year you are talking of artisans whose number is estimated to be between 500,000 to 750,000 (there is doubt on the correctness of these statistics). However, let us

assume that they are correct. Honorable Speaker, to date the government ha s failed to

(a) allocate plots for these artisans and as a result they invade big mines – particularly in areas where there is gold and diamond.

(b) Avail them tools which would have assisted them to increase their income

(c) Avail them soft loans in order to enable them to invest - instead they are being funded by unregistered businessmen and are being given small rates for their products.

2. Honorable Speaker, in the medium term plan it is not explained if small miners will be provide with loans. Is it true that we have concrete plans to eradicate poverty?

3. The opposition camp recommends that in order to increase revenue from minerals and income of artisans, the first duty of the government should be to allocate areas for them and those areas should be evaluated so that if they get investors they can enter into partnership.

4. Honorable Speaker, from the way the government is implementing this, it is obvious that there are too many sweet words but no action.

VII ENERGY

1. Honorable Speaker, energy is a very important input in our plans to promote our economy. Honorable Speaker, if you go through all our budget speeches they talk about alternative energy source but there no an instance you were given statistics to show to what extent does the use of alternate energy has reduced the use of petrol and water.

2. Honorable Speaker, wind energy, which is readily available in Karatu(5.5 m/s na Mkumbara 4.9 m/s and Pemba North, if developed, we would have reduced the use of petrol and water energy. The electricity we are using costs 0.05 USD per k.Wh. Therefore, we could reduce birth rate and poverty due to the cheapness of this energy.

3. Honorable Speaker, the issue of coal has been talked and written daily but the government prefers to pay IPTL three billions monthly than to establish the Mchuchuma project. It is high time now the government gave its stand on this project.

Hon. Speaker, the reason for changing TANESCO leadership was to enable the corporation

235

(a) to have reasonable charges

(b) to render better services to the public

(c) to be operated on commercial lines so that the government was not forced to provide it with a subsidy. Hon, Speaker, up to May 2004 TANESCO had received not less than Tshs 60 billion as subsidy.

Hon. Speaker, is the policy of denying paying subsidy to corporations dead? Has the price of electricity been reduced? Is TANESCO increasing its capital by getting subsidy from the government?

The opposition camp asks the government to look at the process of giving subsidy to TANESCO and the objectives of the foreign management which is increasing electricity prices daily.

VIII WAR AGAINST CORRUPTION

1. Honorable Speaker, despite having PCB and other plans to combat corruption, yet the wave of corruption is becoming stronger and stronger to the extent of hampering the sustainability of our economy and even endangering national peace.

   A vivid example is when we failed to satisfy the conditions for the grant of the Millennium Challenge Account which demand that in order to qualify for the grant a country should comply with the criteria of good governance, fight against corruption, to promote education and health and to promote the private sector. In this program called Millennium Challenge account Tanzania could not be nominated to benefit from this account because of corruption. Countries that benefited form the Millennium Challenge account include Cape Verde, Ghana, Senegal and Mozambique.

2. Hon. Minister for State, Planning and privatization explained the government's determination to combat corruption. However, I think, the first step that the government should have taken was to remove the act of royalty because this gives a loop hole and degrades the power of the act to combat corruption.

3. The second step is to fight political corruption; to attain political position by using money or government organs. Any leader getting into power through this means cannot combat corruption

4. The third step is to facilitate parliamentary committees and the parliament itself to be transparent and to allow journalists and wananchi to be present during all bunge sessions.

5. Honorable Speaker, the fourth step is for Anti-Corruption institutions and the Controller and Auditor general to report directly to the parliament instead of reporting to the President.

   Another step is to ratify the African Peer Review Mechanism and to incorporate civil society organizations in following up corruption.

6. Honorable Speaker, these steps and those explained by the Minister will greatly facilitate the fight against corruption. Therefore, the opposition camp recommends that the government should take these steps if it is really serious to combat corruption.

IX CASH BUDGET

1. Honorable Speaker, in the 2003/04 budget we advised the government that it was high time we did away with cash budget because expenditure in some sectors were planned according to availability of funds and do not follow the budget. This procedure hampers the implementation of development projects as acknowledged by the Minister in his speech on the objectives of expenditure.

2. Honorable Speaker, because inflation is being controlled by the government and the government can stop borrowing from IMF and , because what the government needs from IMF is just a stamp instead of loans, the opposition camp recommends that the government should stop using cash budget system.

X AVAILABILITY OF LOANS.

1. Honorable Speaker, all ministers have expressed the government's intention to establish agricultural bank, however, Hon. Speaker, the opposition does not understand why the government wants to establish this bank while there are government banks like NMB, TIB etc.

2. Honorable Speaker, let us remind the government that in principle the value of bank loans is greater than deposits. However, in Tanzania the value of deposit is greater than credit. In 2003 it was twice as much as loans and that is why we were firm that it was only the government that could serve our farmers. That is why the government established CRDB so that it could provide loans to rural people and NMB was expected to deal with small business development. Today we want to privatize NMB and establish another bank. This step would delay us and it will be the same as we did away with NBC whereby their buildings were leased by the Ministry of Water and Livestock development.

XI MUNICIPAL COUNCILS"REVENUE

1. Honorable Speaker, recently there happened a practice whereby the central government prohibited taxes without consultations and preparations with other stakeholders and particularly Municipal and District councils. In one way or the other this practice is against the concept of giving authority to local government because removing the sources of income to these councils makes them depend upon the central government and denies them to have sustainable development plans.

2. The opposition camp is of the opinion that for these plans to succeed there should be a procedure of dividing the taxes by a special formula that is known to all councils. By this procedure the councils will not depend upon the central government and will collect their revenue at the right time.

XII DIVIDENDS RECEIVED BY THE GOVERNMENT

1. Honorable Speaker, according to the Minister for Finance, Dividend Private and Public Financial Enterprise, sub vote 080402, the Bank of Tanzania paid 7.5 billion in 200/03, 9.5 billion 2003/04 and it was estimated to be 2.8 billion 2004/05. Why should the dividend fall from 9 billion to 2.8 billion?

2. How much does Zanzibar which has 11.5 per cent with BOT receive as dividend? Hon. Speaker, I the Hon. Minister knows that this dividend is different from that of 4.5 per cent whose formula waits for the Union Finance Commission.

3. Hon. Speaker, we expected mining royalties to increase instead of declining. For example in 2002/03 royalties were 14 billion when mines were starting. In 2003/04 royalties dropped to 4.5 billion and this year's estimates is 9 billion. Hon. Speaker, why is that mineral sector's contribution to the national income (a) is not stable while production is increasing? (b) What should Tanzanians expect from this resource if even the royalty of 3% is not trustworthy?

   Honorable Speaker, the opposition camp would like to know the cause of all these changes.

4. Honorable Speaker, Mineral Sorting fee was not provided for in 2003/04 but has been provided for in 2004/05 – not estimates but the amount queried by the Auditor General. This shows that the government has no revenue from sorting fees for diamond. Wouldn't the difference be too big in 2005/06 when the government gets the correct statistics?

5. Honorable Speaker, despite the Finance Minister's reduction of taxes for agriculture and small businesses, the budget for agriculture is low compared to last year's budget (31.5 billion to 29 billion). Is there any explanation? We would like to know that.

XIII FISHERIES

1. Honorable Speaker, if those areas where fishing is done are developed by building fish processing industries like those in Mwanza, nutrition would increase and people's income would also increase. It is painful to see TAFICO being privatized to a person who does not know fishing and as a result the industry is being eroded by the sea instead of producing fish.

2. Honorable Speaker, those are our problems. We are waiting for the ship to fall before taking action.

   Honorable Speaker, however good our policies are, without implementation it makes no sense.

XIV HIV/AIDS

1. Honorable Speaker, AIDS is one of the problems in our efforts to combat poverty and our target to reach the Millennium Development Goals. The government after realizing that there were not less than two million aids victims has aimed at (a) fighting aids generally (b) taking steps to prevent further infections and (c) treating and assisting the victims.

2. Honorable Speaker, all these aims sound very good, however, there has been a tendency of using funds provided by the government and other donors for fighting AIDS to conduct workshops and seminars. Sometimes some of these workshops and seminars were not done. Honorable Speaker, a live example is the expenditure of Tshs 73 million (2002/03) which was undocumented but sent to Arumeru, Kiteto, Hai, Lushoto, Mkuranga, Chunya, Mbarali, Rungwe, Muleba and Bukoba districts. In spending this money seminars were arranged but the list of participants is not available and there aare suppliers who were given orders to supply goods and items without quotations – for example the printing of IEC materials costing Tshs. 1,400,000.00 in Kiteto. Furthermore, tenderes were awarded to tenderers who did not qualify- like the printing of 5,660,000 books which costed Tshs. 1,167,376,000.00. The Government Printer was the one chosen to print the books but instead the work was given to M/S Ramejas Ltd who printed poor quality books that could not be used by schools because they did not meet the conditions of the Educational Material Approval Committee.

3. Honorable Speaker, the supervisors are aware of this embezzlement. The opposition camp is not satisfied with the expenditure of funds in vote 92; hence, we need explanation on the steps taken to the defaulters of the Procurement Act and Finance Act. This embezzlement is an indication of corruption.

4. Honorable Speaker, despite providing drugs to AIDS victims still there is the problem of nutrition which has not been dealt with adequately. The opposition camp would like to advise TACAIDS and other institutions engaged in the fight against AIDS to collect data on the nutritional requirements of the AIDS victims

instead of dealing with workshops and seminars only. Furthermore, AIDS victims should be visited and encouraged instead of leaving them to despair.

5. Honorable Speaker, the opposition congratulates religious institutions for their good job in educating the community on the scourge of AIDS. We request them to do so to all Tanzanians.

XV CONCLUSION

1. Honorable Speaker, according to National Payment System and Stock-Taking Exercise through the FIVE CLEARING HOUSES of Dar Es salaam, Mwanza, Zanzibar and Mbeya Tsh. 7.3 billion are collected per day. But when a person or company sends a cheque to be entered into his account it takes about 5 days to be cleared. This means that an average of Tshs 36.4 billion will be on circulation of the clearing houses for 30 days, an average of Tshs 218.0 billion which is 10% of the GDP – this is very dangerous to the national economy because by using new technology this money could be diverted to somewhere else.

   Honorable Speaker, the opposition would like to know what precaution has been taken to safeguard people's and government funds taking into consideration the current wave of armed robbery theft using computers

2. Honorable Speaker, I request the Minister for Finance to elaborate on the steps taken by TRA in solving problems faced by Zanzibar businessmen. The goods of businessmen form Zanzibar are being inspected in Zanzibar but when they come to the mainland they get problems with TRA. Why is this so while Tanzania is one country and there is only one TRA?

3. Currently, people from Pemba are using Tanga and Zanzibar ports. This increases the cost of transporting their goods and hence an increase in the price of these goods. Due to poverty, which, to some extent is caused by the government of Zanzibar which insists on controlling the sale of cloves outside Tanzania contrary to globalization policies, what happened to the government's promise of putting Pemba on the list of Tanzania's ports?

   Honorable Speaker, I beg to submit.

HONORABLE HAMAD MOHAMMED RASHID, MP
CHIEF SPOKESMAN – THE OPPOSITION
FINANCE, PLANNING AND PRIVATIZATION
14 JUNE 2004

243

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK/TANZANIA
(SUNY/TANZANIA)
(In collaboration with Vice President's Office and REPOA)

ACTIVITY REPORT

Briefing on PRSP for Parliamentarians

The report of the briefing workshop on Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) for the Parliamentary Committees' Chairpersons held on 18th May, 2004 at Mbudya Conference Hall-Sea Cliff Hotel, Dar es Salaam

Compiled by:
John J. Mnyika
Freelance Rapporteur

245

List of Contents

Abbreviations

1.0 Background information

2.0 Introduction
- 2.1 Overview
- 2.2 Aim and expected outcome
- 2.3 Profile of participants
- 2.4 Workshop methodology and process
- 2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

3.0 Results
- 3.1 Programmatic results
- 3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward

4.0 Summary of the proceedings
- 4.1 Opening
- 4.2 Presentations
- 4.3 Discussions, Q&A
- 4.4 Next steps
- 4.5 Closing

5.0 List of Annexes
- Topical presentations
- Workshop programme
- Registration book
- Workshop photographs

Abbreviations

SUNY-State University of New York

PRSP-Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

MP-Member of Parliament

REPOA-Research on Poverty Alleviation

HIPC-Highly Indebted Poor Country

VPO-Vice Presidents Office

PRS-Poverty Reduction Strategy

PMS-Poverty Monitoring Systems

EU-European Union

ADB-Africa Development Bank

TAPAC-Tanzania Parliamentarians AIDS Coalition

PEDP-Primary Education Development Programme

MDGs-Millennium Development Goals

AU-African Union

IMF-International Monetary Fund

1.0 Background information:

The Centre for International Development of the State University of New York (SUNY/TANZANIA), in partnership with the British Council and associates, Pact/Tanzania and Bunge Foundation for Democracy (the SUNY/TANZANIA Team), was on 11 May 2003 awarded a two-year programme to provide technical assistance for the strengthening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly (Parliament). The range of support to be provided under the auspices of this Project is to enable the Parliament to carry out its representative, lawmaking, oversight and administrative functions more effectively and in accordance with the spirit of democratic governance. This Project team is to act as a partner with the Tanzania Parliament in providing institutional support to enable the national legislature to play a more central role in Tanzania's governing and development processes.

The Project aims to achieve the following primary results:

1. **Improve representation:** Increased citizen access to and understanding of the legislative process.
2. **More effective lawmaking:** Parliamentary committees make better use of research and more actively solicit inputs from civil society in the consideration of legislation in targeted sectors.
3. **Enhance management and administration:** Increased quality and efficiency of service delivery to all members by parliamentary administrative support units.
4. **More effective oversight:** Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy.

As an integral part of result area 4, the project work plan indicates the following:
Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure.

Expected outcome: To assist Parliament to more effectively oversee both the development and the implementation of the national budget.

Implementation strategy: The current performance environment is to be reviewed and MPs are to be equipped with relevant skills and information for more effective oversight. Briefing workshops on HIPC, the PRSP and their implications for the national budget and poverty policy are among the key outputs.

2.0 Introduction:

2.1 Overview:

The briefing workshop on Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRSP) for the Parliamentary Committees' Chairpersons was held on the 18th May, 2004 at Mbudya conference Hall-Sea Cliff Hotel, Dar es Salaam.

The report is divided in four parts. The first recaps background on the SUNY Project and this activity; the second provides an introduction about the workshop; the third part presents the results and key findings of the workshop and the last part recites the summary of the workshop proceedings.

2.2 Expected outcome and aim:

Expected outcome: To equip Parliamentarians with the background, content and status of the PRSP and also update them with information about the review process currently underway.

The overall aim of the workshop was for the *Chairpersons of Parliamentary Committees to be adequately briefed in advance of the formal Budget session so that the contents and priority areas set out in the PRSP are considered when the Committees consider draft sectoral budgetary estimates.*

2.3 Profile of participants

The participants of the workshop were the Chairpersons of the Parliamentary Committees and some members of parliaments. The workshop was also attended by DFID and USAID representatives.

2.4 Workshop methodology and process

The workshop focused on delivery of topical presentations followed by plenary discussions and Q&A. The participatory and interactive discussions were allowed to provide room for participants to address issues corresponding to their knowledge and experiences. The Q&A session enabled the presenters to make clarification on pertinent areas.

2.5 Presenters, facilitator and topics covered

The workshop was facilitated by Mr Ray Smith-Consultant. The presenters came from REPOA and Vice Presidents Office. The presenters were coming from organs responsible for poverty reduction initiative particularly the PRSP.

The workshop covered the following topics:

- Background to the PRSP and its relationship with the HIPC.
- The Responsibilities of the Vice Presidents Office in the management of PRSP.
- The PRSP review process-current state of play.

3.0 Results:

3.1 Programmatic results

Activity 4: Amplify the role of parliament in the national budget process and public expenditure.

Outcome: Parliamentarians equipped with the background, content and status of the PRSP and also updated with information about the review process currently underway.

The Chairpersons of Parliamentary Committees were adequately briefed in advance of the formal Budget session so that the contents and priority areas set out in the PRSP are to be considered when the Committees consider draft sectoral budgetary estimates.
This has contributed to achieve the following primary result: Increased legislative capacity to monitor public expenditure and oversee implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy (**More effective oversight**)

3.2 Key findings, recommendations and way forward

- There is a need to ensure that the MPs are fully involved or consulted in the remaining stages of the PRSP review process. This should include institutionalisation of the involvement of the MPs rather than making it a one day event. The SUNY project should conduct activities to contribute to this endeavour.
- There is a need to improve implementation, monitoring and accountability of PRSP. The proposal to extend PRS&PRM technical committees down wards should be considered. Another technical committee should be established at parliament level.
- There is a need to include the step of Parliamentary approval in the set PRSP review stages. MPs should also be involved in the launching of the PSRP at the Poverty Policy Week in October, 2004.
- It was recapped that Party, Executive and Speaker's dominance are paramount in the current Parliamentary Standing Orders necessitate a review. Thus the SUNY Project and other development partners should support this endeavour.

250

- Follow up should be done by the relevant authorities to ensure that Tanzania is in the African PRM.
- Public education about PRSP and its processes should be enhanced by all actors and stakeholders. There is a need of all the actors to make the timetable and programs of the PRSP review process public.
- It was speculated that the PRS is doomed to a complete failure in the presence of: distorted economy including inequitable distribution; economy imbedded by corruption particularly grand corruption; high cost of production particularly energy costs; incorrect prioritisation of sectoral development; inadequate human capital investment and the HIV/AIDS problem.
- It was appealed that the programs and projects from the development partners should consider ensuring that the MPs are given mandate to supervise and oversee part of the support offered.
- There is a need do discuss devaluation in lengthy including its key concepts. The SUNY panel of experts established can be very instrumental in this venture.
- The Chairpersons of the Committees should be supported in their commitment to spearhead the process of seeking recommendations from their respective committees. Therefore there should be some committee meetings before the June session.
- There is a need to for all actors and development partners to support the quest of the MPs to change the Parliamentary Standing Orders.
- There must be two roles: The role of the Parliamentarians at the Parliament and at the Parliamentary Committees level and the role of individual MPs at the constituencies' level. The SUNY project should play a role in this pursuit.

4.0 Summary of the proceedings:

4.1 Opening

Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ underscored the following:

- Thanked USAID and DFID for funding the project and the participants for attending.
- Reiterated that the workshop is part of the ongoing commitment of the project to give MPs tools and information to enable them to perform the legislative role better.

251

- Emphasised that interaction was necessary as the training was never expected to cover everything. MPs should speak all the issues which confront them as they face the society.
- Noted that the workshop will assist the MPs to demystify the complicated documents such as the PRSP.
- Revealed that a report of the workshop will be produced and provided to the MPs to act as a handbook for furthering the key findings, recommendations and a way forward.

Hon. Anna Makinda indicated that:

- PRSP has been in the country for some time although it is not known by the majority.
- Poverty should be viewed as the multi sectoral phenomenon during the discussions and policy formulation.
- In the next day the MPs were to have another orientation on how to engage on oversighting and monitoring of PRSP.

4.2 Presentations

4.2.1 Background of PRSP and its relationship with the HIPC

Prof. Semboja, The Executive Director of REPOA covered the following in his presentation:

- The HIPC Initiative
- PRSP and the HIPC
- Tanzania's PRSP
- PRSP preparation process
- PRS monitoring& institutional framework

4.2.2 The Role and responsibilities of the VPO in management of PRS

Dr SB Likwelile, Director of Poverty Eradication VPO presented the following:

- VPO and its responsibility
- Poverty Eradication Division
- Management of PRS
- Management of PMS
- Ministry of finance/VPO links
- Stakeholders roles and responsibilities
- PRS implementation
- Links with local authorities
- General observations on PRS
- PRS review timetable
- Parliamentary Committees and PRS

4.2.3 The PRSP review process-Current state of play

252

Mr Pascal Assey, VPO revealed the following in his paper:

- Essence of PRS review process
- Objectives of the review
- Key principles for the review
- The Pillars of the PRS
- The review process and the current status
- Key stakeholders

4.3 Discussions, Q&A

- It was admitted that the participation of the MPs in formulation of PRSP-1 was very limited. Thus it is high time for MPs to engage themselves in PRSP-2.Parliamentarians have the role to play in the PRSP as they are dealing with the poor people at their constituencies.
- *How can the role of MPs in monitoring the PRSP at the community level be institutionalised? Where and at which level can the MPs be involved in the technical committees?* The MPs have been less involved in monitoring and accountability of PRSP. It was therefore proposed that the technical committees on PRS&PMS should be extended down wards (district and village).Another technical committee should be established at parliament level. It was further made clear that some committees are at the implementation/operational level in which if the MPs are fully involved they become part and parcel hence limit their accountability role. Perhaps distinction should be made between the steering committees and technical committees. Yet it is crucial for MPs to be involved in monitoring and evaluation.
- *Is TAS still a strategic document or it has been subsumed by HIPC?* It was answered that TAS is still a strategic document. The idea is to have a predicable and coordinated frame. An action plan has been prepared to implement TAS. Operationalisation is underway under the coordination of the Ministry of finance inline with the Lome agreement. It is further observed that the HIPC is an initiative of the World Bank and the IMF. The Paris Club has agreed to support it .However other Bilateral donors have not yet agreed fully to support the HIPC initiative.
- *Which are the development partners' supports on PRS?* Poverty Reduction Budget Support(PRBS) under about 13 donors including EU (about 16 million pounds);Poverty Reduction Support Credit(PRSC) under the World Bank(about 360 million dollars) and Poverty Reduction Support Loan(PRSL) under the ADB. But it was revealed that the PRBS and PRSC are not funds dwelt direct to PRSP but are funds channelled to support the national development agenda.

- It was admitted that it is unfortunate that the first round of the PRSP process has not involved the stakeholders such comprehensively. MPs should have been involved from the first stage of PRSP review. It is too late to involve the MPs in July! There is a need to institutionalize the involvement of the MPs rather than making it a one day event.
- It was emphasized that if the government and other development partners want to reach the grassroots they must involve the representatives of the people particularly the MPs.
- The fourth proposed pillar of equity (equitable distribution) is very essential.
- The PRS review timetable presented should be made public for contributions from majority.
- Much money has been spent on the priority sector such as education and roads with minimal accountability at lower level. Plans should be laid to ensure accountability and ownership.
- The review process presented has eight steps. One step was noted to missing-The Parliament. There should be a step of Parliamentary approval.
- The MPs indicated the need to be involved fully in the launching of the PSRP at the Poverty Policy Week in October, 2004.
- It was noted that if the MPs will be sought on the later stage for consultation it will be very expensive to accommodate their views and some of them will be left out.
- *Did the PRSP had and continue to have impact on the GDP? How much is it going to affect GDP? What transition mechanisms are there to reach the majority?* It was revealed that the Tanzania has the economic growth of 6.2 percent and inflation has been reduced to about 4.2 percent. However, growth is more evident in mining and tourism sectors which reaches a few. So the growth should be speeded up to 8 percent. Other indicators of performance include the improvement of roads, health system and primary education. On the other hand, it was explained that the considerable amount of money for the PEDP is a loan from the World Bank. The challenge at hand is to ensure equitable distribution. If we take a welfare approach equitable distribution will require as to distribute what we have which necessitate the growth of the economy. Another approach is to make people participate and enjoy the growth. For instance by developing the agriculture and benefit the majority in the process.
- *How much has the increase in funds through PRSP helped to fight corruption across the ranks?* It was replied that despite the efforts done corruption is still there that is why good governance has been included in the PRSP as a key area.

254

4.5 Closing

Closing was done by Ms Donna Bugby Smith, Country Director-SUNY/TZ who thanked all the presenters and the participants for the informative and insightful day.

PRESS RELEASE

Media Contact:
(Berlin):
Sarah Tyler / Jana Kotalik
Tel: +49 (0) 30 3438 2019/61
press@transparency.org

(London – from 22 to 26 March):
Jeff Lovitt/ Diana Rodriguez
Tel: +44 (0) 20 7610 1400
Jeff Lovitt (mobile): +49 162 419 6454

http://www.transparency.org

Otto-Suhr-Allee 97-99
10585 Berlin, Germany
Tel: +49-30-3438 2061/19
Fax: +49-30-3470 3912

Embargoed until 12 noon GMT, Thursday 25 March 2004

FOR PRESS: to request a review copy of the *Global Corruption Report 2004* or to view the report electronically, contact gcr@transparency.org or visit www.globalcorruptionreport.org. For interview requests, please contact press@transparency.org.

Plundering politicians and bribing multinationals undermine economic development, says TI

Transparency International's new *Global Corruption Report 2004* charts the flow of stolen assets, recommends ways to recover money looted by despots, and sets out new Standards on Political Finance and Favours

London, 25 March 2004 — "Political corruption undermines the hopes for prosperity and stability of developing countries, and damages the global economy," said Peter Eigen, Chairman of Transparency International (TI), launching the *TI Global Corruption Report 2004 (GCR 2004)* today. "The abuse of political power for private gain deprives the most needy of vital public services, creating a level of despair that breeds conflict and violence. It also hits the pockets of taxpayers and shareholders worldwide. The problem must be tackled at the national and international level," he said.

"The *GCR 2004*, with a special focus on political corruption," said Eigen, "is a call to action to bring integrity and accountability into governance, to stop bribery by multinational companies, and to curb the flow of stolen assets into secret bank accounts in the west." TI is the leading international non-governmental organisation combating corruption worldwide.

"Democracies can no longer tolerate bribery, fraud and dishonesty," states former US President Jimmy Carter in a foreword to the *GCR 2004*, "especially as such practices disproportionately hurt the poor."

The *GCR 2004* details funds allegedly embezzled by political leaders of the past two decades. During his misrule, Mohamed Suharto, President of Indonesia from 1967-98, is alleged to have stolen US$15-US$35 billion in a country where the GDP per capita hovers at around US$700. Suharto tops the table of corrupt politicians.

Where did the money go? – The top 10

Head of government		Estimates of funds allegedly embezzled	GDP *per capita* (2001)
1. Mohamed Suharto	**President of Indonesia, 1967-98**	**US$ 15 to 35 billion**	**US$ 695**
2. Ferdinand Marcos	President of the Philippines, 1972–86	US$ 5 to 10 billion	US$ 912
3. Mobutu Sese Seko	President of Zaire, 1965–97	US$ 5 billion	US$ 96
4. Sani Abacha	President of Nigeria, 1993–98	US$ 2 to 5 billion	US$ 319
5. Slobodan Milosevic	President of Serbia Yugoslavia, 1989-2000	US$ 1 billion	n.a.
6. Jean-Claude Duvalier	President of Haiti, 1971–86	US$ 300 to 800 million	US$ 460
7. Alberto Fujimori	President of Peru, 1990–2000	US$ 600 million	US$ 2,051
8. Pavlo Lazarenko	Prime Minister of Ukraine, 1996–97	US$ 114 to 200 million	US$ 766
9. Arnoldo Alemán	President of Nicaragua, 1997–2002	US$ 100 million	US$ 496
10. Joseph Estrada	President of the Philippines, 1998–2001	US$ 78 to 80 million	US$ 912

257

"Political corruption deprives millions of health care, education and the prospects of a sustainable future," said TI-Zimbabwe Chair John Makumbe at the launch of TI's *GCR 2004* in London today. "The fight against corruption requires sustained political will at the highest levels, and not only in countries recovering from the legacy of Moi, Suharto, Duvalier or Abacha," said Makumbe, a member of TI's international Board of Directors.

"There has to be a commitment," he continued, "on the part of governments to implement the new African Union Convention on Combating and Preventing Corruption and the UN Convention against Corruption, in particular the measures to curb the outflow of assets stolen by corrupt elites into foreign bank accounts. Bribe-paying is a crime against humanity, a fact made clear by the legacy of poverty and distrust left behind by corrupt politicians."

"International financial institutions and donor governments must engage with developing country governments that demonstrate the political will to fight corruption," said Eigen. "To make sure that this will can be realised, donor governments must insist on adequate civil society monitoring of good governance in recipient countries."

To mark the publication of the *GCR 2004*, today TI launched its Standards on Political Finance and Favours, setting out a blueprint for transparency in political and campaign finance in a year which sees key elections in countries where political corruption has been a persistent problem. Elections will be held in the coming months in Indonesia and the Philippines, two countries still reeling from the corrupt legacy of Mohamed Suharto, and both Ferdinand Marcos and Joseph Estrada respectively.

The TI Standards include conflict-of-interest legislation, and independently monitored annual disclosure of party income and expenditure. The recommendations include a diversified funding base, fair access to the media and provisions for civil society monitoring of political finance.

The special focus of the *GCR 2004* on political corruption includes expert reports on the regulation of political finance, the disclosure of money flows into politics, and the repatriation of wealth looted by politicians. Two industry case studies – on the arms and oil sectors – demonstrate the role of the private sector in supplying corrupt political funds.

The *GCR 2004* includes detailed assessments of the state of corruption in 34 country reports, accompanied by analyses of recent global and regional developments, including the UN Convention against Corruption and the impact of EU expansion on corruption. The report also includes the findings of the latest research into corruption and ways to combat it.

Transparency International Standards on Political Finance and Favours

1. Donations to political parties and candidates to elected office must not be a means to gain personal or policy favours. Parties and candidates must practise transparency. Governments must implement adequate conflict-of-interest legislation.

2. Political parties, candidates and politicians should disclose detailed information about assets, donations, in-kind donations, loans and expenditure, on an annual basis as well as before and after elections, to an independent agency.

3. Independent public oversight bodies endowed with the necessary resources must effectively supervise the observance of regulatory laws and measures. Together with independent courts, they must ensure that offenders are held accountable and duly sanctioned.

4. Diversified funding should be sought through: state funding and subsidised access to the media; the encouragement of small donations and membership fees; and controls on corporate, foreign and large individual donations. Spending limits should be considered.

5. Candidates and parties must be given fair access to the media. The media should play an independent role, free from political interference, both in election campaigns and in the broader political process.

6. Civil society should have the opportunity to actively participate in promoting adequate legislation in the field of political finance and in the monitoring of political finance and its impact on political representation.

The full text of the TI Standards is available in the *TI Global Corruption Report 2004*

The *TI GCR 2004* can be downloaded free at www.globalcorruptionreport.org. Alternatively it may be ordered (price $24.95, £15.99) through online booksellers, local bookshops (ISBN 0 7453 2230 1) or the publisher (www.plutobooks.com).

258

MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING

BETWEEN

TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL- TANZANIA

AND

AFRICAN PARLIAMENTARIAN NETWORK AGAINST CORRUPTION

TANZANIA CHAPTER

(APNAC-TANZANIA)

2004

262

This MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING is entered into between TRANSPARENCY INTERNATIONAL-TANZANIA (hereinafter referred to as "TI- Tanzania ") of PO Box 5750 Dar es Salaam, and

AFRICAN PARLIAMENTARIAN NETWORK AGAINST CORRUPTION-Tanzania Chapter (hereinafter referred to as "APNAC") of P.O. Box 941 Dodoma.

WHEREAS TI-Tanzania Chapter is an organization dedicated to fostering and promoting Government's Accountability and Transparency in the conduct of public affairs, and

WHEREAS TI-Tanzania Chapter and APNAC share the common vision of a Zero- Tolerance for Corruption society in Tanzania, and

WHEREAS TI-Tanzania and APNAC are committed to harnessing their respective resources for the achievement of common aims and objectives,

NOW THEREFORE TI-Tanzania and APNAC affirm that the following terms and conditions shall form the basis for a continued collaborative working relationship between the organizations:

The African Parliamentarian Network Against Corruption-Tanzania (APNAC) will

1. Prioritise activities and programmes that strengthen systems of accountability, transparency and greater public participation in governance in Tanzania.

2. Focus on educating Tanzanians on the direct connection between corruption in any form and poverty.

3. Campaign for the inclusion of anti-corruption initiatives and measures in legislation coming before Parliament.

4. Strive to equip other Members of Parliament who are not already Members of APNAC with the intellectual resources required to achieve APNAC's agenda in
Parliament.

5. Work with and co-operate with TI-Tanzania in the achievement and implementation of programmes and initiatives geared towards realizing the common vision of a Zero-Tolerance society.

6. Fund-raise continuously for the purpose of supporting APNAC's programmes and ensuring APNAC's institutionalization.

MANAGEMENT

7. Conceptualization, planning, implementation, review and evaluation of all APNAC activities, projects and programmes shall be undertaken by APNAC's Programmes Committee in collaboration with an assigned officer from TI-Tanzania.

8. APNAC's Finance Committee shall oversee, manage and be responsible for the proper use of all monies in order to ensure the successful implementation of APNAC's projects. All financial transactions shall be authorized by three signatories, being APNAC's Chairman, APNAC's co-ordinator/secretary and one member of APNAC's Finance Committee.

9. APNAC's Legal committee shall act as APNAC's legal advisors. The Legal Committee shall also be responsible for the drafting and promotion of Legislative Initiatives and Bills as necessary for the achievement of APNAC's goals and objectives.

10. TI-Tanzania and APNAC shall be at liberty in consultation with each other to engage external legal experts to assist APNAC's Legal Committee in the modification, abridgement or re-drafting of Bills and other Legislative Initiatives.

11. APNAC's Programmes, Finance and Legal Committees shall meet at least once a month or as frequently as may be required.

12. TI-Tanzania shall provide secretarial and administrative support to the APNAC Secretariat for the duration of this agreement. TI-Tanzania shall be responsible for the co-ordination and organization of APNAC's workshops, seminars, tours, activities and dissemination of information.

13. Any equipment and material purchased by TI-Tanzania for the use of APNAC in its activities shall be handed over to APNAC at the cessation of this agreement.

RESOLUTION OF DISPUTES

The co-operation between APNAC and TI-Tanzania shall be on the basis of utmost good faith for the attainment of the common vision. Any disputes or misunderstandings between the two parties will be resolved first by mutual agreement between the two parties. Failing mutual agreement, an arbitrator

mutually agreed upon and acceptable to both parties shall be engaged, whose decision on the matter in question shall be final on the matter in dispute.

Any decision by either party consequent upon the arbitrator's decision to go to litigation shall constitute an automatic cessation of this agreement.

This Agreement is for one calendar year in the first instance. However, either party is at liberty o terminate the Agreement upon giving the other party 3 months Notice in writing of intention to terminate.

REASONS WHEREFOR the parties above-mentioned have put their hands to this Agreement this day of 21st July 2004.

SIGNED:_____**Signature:** _____

On Behalf of African Parliamentarian Network Against Corruption - Tanzania Chapter

AND

SIGNED:_____**Signature:**_____

On behalf of Transparency International- Tanzania

FINANCE & ECONOMIC AFFAIRS COMMITTEE – ADVISORY PANEL (PILOT)

Panel Members	Contact Details	
Dr GD Mjema	Director Economics Research Bureau, UDSM University of Dar es Salaam P.O. Box 35096 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	T: +255 22-2410134 F: +255 22-2410212 M: +255 744-461790 E: gdmjema@hotmail.com E: erb@udsm.ac.tz
Chris Msuya	Managing Director, Grant Thornton Grant Thornton 2nd Floor, Osman Towers Zanaki Street Dar es Salaam	T: +255 22-2115 252 F: +255 22-21 30519 M: +255 748-262627 E: tax@mbn.co.tz
Murtaza Nasser	Managing Partner, Grant Thornton Grant Thornton 2nd Floor, Osman Towers Zanaki Street Dar es Salaam	T: +255 22-2115252 F: +255 22-2130519 M: +255 748-449045 E: murtaza@mbn.co.tz
Prof. Nehemia Osoro	Faculty of Economics, UDSM University of Dar es Salaam P.O. Box 35045 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	T: +255 22-2410266 (Office) T: +255 22-2650166 (Residence) F: +255 22-2410227 M: +255 744-276044 E: osoro@udsm.ac.tz E: neosoro@hotmail.com
Mary Rusimbi	Programme Coordinator Tanzania Gender Network Programme Gender Resource Centre Mabibo Road PO Box 8921 Dar es Salaam	T: +255 22-2443205 /3286 /3450 F: +255 22-2443244 M:+255 744-783659 E: mary.rusimbi@tgnp.co.tz
Raymond Smith	Project Consultant SUNY Tanzania SUNY/Tanzania 3rd Floor, International House PO Box 13304 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	T: +255 22-2120750 F: + 255 22-2120753 M: +255 748-703210 E: rsmith@sunytz.or.tz
	Saba Consulting 29 Woodland Grove Bembridge, Isle of Wight, UK	T/F: +44 1983 875885 E: raysmith46@hotmail.com UK: +44 7967 496 313
Dr Sylvia Temu	Senior Lecturer, Department of Accounting, UDSM University of Dar es Salaam P.O. Box 35046 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania	T: +255 22-2410500 ext. 2560 (Off) T: +255 22-2807060 (Home) F: M: +255 744-48450 E: shayo@fcm.udsm.ac.tz E: coned@udsm.ac.tz E: sylviatemu@yahoo.com

265

Strategic Objective 3: Civil Society and Government are more effective Partners in Governance

IR 3.2: ***Targeted Government (Parliament) is more responsive to public concerns on selected issues.***

Expected outcome: laws in place that have better public inputs.

A. Number of public hearings on Bills.	Indicators	Target	Progress/ Reporting Period
Baseline: **number of MP/Parliament initiated public hearings held in 2003** ▪	▪ Number of public hearings initiated by either the MPs or the Parliamentary Committees (quantity) ▪ Number of actions or recommendations submitted and agreed to be taken forward by the Parliament, (quantity) ▪ Are those actions recommendations of substance (i.e. question the viability of the Bill or merely grammatical)? ▪ Number of CSO issue papers submitted to Committees which prompt the Committee to invite the CSO to provide expert testimony, (quantity and quality) ▪ Review of the current Standing Orders to assess whether they deter the public from getting involved by no later than the 3rd quarter of the 2004 Session.		As far as can be ascertained no MP-initiated public hearings at constituency level were conducted in 2003. The tradition has been for the Executive to agree the date for a public hearing and invite the MP/Committee to attend along with the public. As such there is no formal mechanism for recording actions/recommendations follow up. In April 2004 x16 MPs covering 16 constituencies received bespoke training on conducting public hearings at constituency level. This has now created a mechanism which links the public and Civil Society with the local MP (Result Area 1 activity). At present the S/Orders prohibit Parliament making substantive changes on Bills they are merely allowed to put forward recommendations for amendments to the Minster.

METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION

- Clerk Assistants
- Through the CSO-Parliament Liaison Officer

Strategic Objective 3: Civil Society and Government are more effective Partners in Governance

IR 3.2.1. Government (Parliament) capacity to engage in the policy/law process strengthened.

Expected outcome: Parliamentarians are better able to understand the implications of the legislation tabled.

B. National budget formulation – helping Parliament to play a more prominent role in the design of the national budget by involving them in the initial stage.	**Indicators**	**Target**	**Progress/ Reporting Period**
Baseline: number of Bills submitted and amended during 2003. (Key Committees will be those with x3+ Bills submitted for consideration in the last year. Priority will be aimed at Finance, PAC, LAAC, Community Development, Natural Resources & Environment, Social Services, Agriculture and Land PAC, LAAC, Community Development, Natural Resources and Environment, Social Services, Agriculture and Land Development, Economic Infrastructure).	• Number of substantive amendments made on Government sponsored Bills submitted to the Parliament Committees,		The current budget cycle has 16 steps and Parliament is not involved in the budget formulation until Step 9. The responsibility for considering the draft estimates lies in the Committee on Finance & Economic Affairs therefore the support is being directed into that Committee. Work to help strengthen the relationship between PAC & LAAC to the Controller Auditor General is underway.
Baseline: Number of times during 2003 when the Parliament was invited to attend and actively participate in the meetings with the PER and PRSP secretariat.	• Initially helping the PAC, Finance Committee, Local Authority Accounts Committee and Economic Infrastructure Committees to gain access to the PER/PRSP secretariat located within the Vice President's Office.		At present only one MP has a role within the context of the VPO PER/PRSP Secretariat. Work to sensitize all MPs on the impact of the PRSP was held in May 2004. Work is underway to explore the feasibility of running a workshop on the PER function in the next quarter

METHOD OF DATA COLLECTION

- Clerk Assistants
- Records of the number of times Parliamentarians attend such meetings in the VPO
- Devising post training questionnaires (interviews or focus group discussions for MPs with the aim of identifying whether the links have made between the Committees and the Executive branch.

FISCAL REPORT FOR THE QUARTERLY MONITORING REPORT FOR THE PERIOD COVERING APRIL TO JUNE 2004

SUNY/Tanzania

Quarterly Financial Report Summary
Research Foundation of State University of New York
Technical Assistance for the Strenghtening of Tanzania's Union National Assembly
Contract Number: 623-C-00031-00

Line Item	Year 1 Budget	Year 2 Budget	Budget Total		Total Expenditure from May 03 - Jun 04
Result Area 1	$422,659.44	$368,231.48	$790,890.92	$104,629.00	$353,879.00
Result Area 2	$295,673.31	$81,139.48	$376,812.79	$49,849.54	$168,602.43
Result Area 3	$125,275.89	$128,768.68	$254,044.57	$33,607.81	$113,669.25
Result Area 4	$82,046.37	$195,965.01	$278,011.38	$36,778.84	$124,394.39
Indirects Charges	$173,092.37	$127,085.37	$300,177.74	$36,644.93	$173,718.59
Fixed Fees	$0.00	$0.00	$0.00	$0.00	$0.00
Grand Total	$1,098,747.38	$901,190.02	$1,999,937.40	$261,510.12	$934,263.66

SUMMARY

Total Funds Obligated as of May 11 2003:	$800,000.00
New Obligated Funds as of March 17, 2004:	$428,625.00
Total Obligated Funds:	$1,228,625.00
Total Funds Spent as of June 30, 2004:	$934,263.66