-TOK-
222
100739

EVALUATION AFTER FOURTH AND FINAL YEAR

of the

FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA

STRATEGIES, TRAINING AND ADVOCACY FOR RECONCILIATION PROJECT

(KNOWN AS THE DELPHI/STAR PROJECT)

managed by Delphi International

under
Cooperative Agreement, EUR-A-94-00070-00
(formerly No EUR-0016-A-00-4070-00)
originally part of the
Trauma and Humanitarian Assistance for the Former Yugoslavia Project (180-0016)

sponsored by the United States Agency for International Development

September 1994 to November 1998

Evaluator: Waneen Polly
December 1998

PD-ABR-222

DELPHI/STAR PROJECT MACEDONIA FINAL EVALUATION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 4

1 Introduction 8

1 1 Background 8

1 2 Evaluation Methodology 8

2 Project Performance 10

2 1 Context of the Project 10

2 2 Appropriateness of Delphi/STAR Scope of Work 10

2 3 Delphi/STAR's Contribution to NGO Sustainability 15

2 4 Delphi/STAR's Contribution to Multi-Ethnic Cooperation and NGO Linkages 25

3 Issues and Recommendations for USAID 28

APPENDICES

A Delphi/STAR Program Description
B Delphi/STAR Mid-Term Evaluation
C Executive Summary Final (Three Year) Evaluation
D Evaluation Terms of Reference
E List of Materials Review
F Macedonia Evaluation Contacts List
G Macedonia Evaluation Field Trip Itinerary
H Women s Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia - May 1997
I Women's Voices - Development of Individual Women Leaders
J Calendar of Events 1998
K 1998 List of Subgrants
L Delphi/STAR Regional Exchange Program

ABBREVIATIONS

BiH	Bosnia-Herzegovina
CR	conflict resolution
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
H A E S E	Humanitarian Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Education of Women, (a Macedonian women's group)
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organization
IPA	International Policy Advocacy
ISC	Institute for Sustainable Communities
LAW	League of Albanian Women
Macedonia	Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
MCIC	Macedonian Center for International Cooperation
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization (refers to indigenous Croatian Macedonian, and Bosnian organizations)
OD	organizational development
STAR	Strategies, Training and Advocacy for Reconciliation (Delphi International Project)
TOT	training of trainers
UMAM	Center for Urban and Media Action in Macedonia (Macadonia women s group)
US	United States of America
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
$	United States Dollar

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Strategies Training, and Advocacy for Reconciliation Project (Delphi/STAR), managed by Delphi International, was one of eight grantees under the Trauma and Humanitarian Assistance for the Former Yugoslavia Project sponsored by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) The cooperative agreement for the project to work in Croatia, Bosnia-Herzegovina (BiH) and the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Macedonia) was signed in September 1994 and scheduled for completion in October 1997 The Macedonia agreement was extended for nine months and was completed on 13 November 1998

The Mission Statement of the Macedonia Delphi/STAR Project for year 4 was

> To foster women's participation in the development of civil society in the Yugoslav Successor States, including Macedonia, through encouragement, technical assistance and financial support to non-nationalistic, advocacy-oriented women's NGOs and women leaders Delphi/STAR pursues this mission by supporting long-term sustainability through building capacity in public policy advocacy, democratic leadership and developing linkages '

This evaluation focused primarily on the last year of the Macedonian Delphi/STAR Project The full evaluation of year 1 to 3 can be found in the ' Final Evaluation of the Delphi/STAR Project" dated November 1997

Delphi/STAR Project Strategy and Approach

Delphi/STAR's Macedonia strategy focused on development of the capacity of women leaders and young activists from groups largely outside of Skopje A few dynamic' women and women's NGOs who demonstrated potential for leadership were targeted for additional skill development opportunities and subgrants To enhance inter-ethnic understanding and communication, Delphi/STAR made possible inter-ethnic cooperation through supporting mixed working groups and training teams and convening multi-ethnic groups around concrete issues

Delphi/STAR did not seek to direct or drive the work that women did in the community Instead, it supported the groups in identifying local needs and opportunities for civil initiatives, initiatives that the group was skilled and interested in addressing The essential element that all groups had in common was that, through the work the NGOs established themselves as contributing members of their community and in so doing positioned themselves to be seen as credible when addressing civil issues

Appropriateness of Scope of the Work - Target and Time Frame

The Delphi/STAR Project goals and plan for the year 4 extension were an ambitious vision of the possible but were not achievable in the time frame of the project

In the Macedonian context, where gender inequity and traditional customs result in women and the girl child being the most marginalized members of society, the project was appropriately targeted to facilitate the development of women and women s NGOs around issues important to the women The women's NGOs, who are uniquely positioned to gain entrance to isolated communities were able to begin the process of educating women and the communities on essential issues without raising insurmountable resistance from male led traditional structures

The target group and Delphi/STAR's step-by-step need responsive approach were appropriate but the scope of work was not reasonable for the length of the extension and the growth required of the partner NGOs

Therefore, at the end of the project, the work was not completed No Delphi/STAR partner NGO nor the collection of women's NGOs could be said to have "graduated Their sustainability, while greatly improved,

was not secure Additionally, due to the uneasy circumstance surrounding the closure of the project, there were many loose ends when the project abruptly ended

Strengthening and Sustainability of Women's NGOs

Strengthening of individual women and of the organizational capacity of women's NGOs were notable results of Delphi/STAR Project Despite the growth of women's NGOs, most did not appear to be sustainable without focused outside technical and financial support

Delphi/STAR Macedonia can be credited with successfully strengthening women's NGOs through its excellent facilitation of the subgrant process as a tool for NGO strengthening While there remain considerable areas for growth in women's NGOs organizational and financial skills, the distance the NGOs have come since the start of the project and in the 15 months since the last evaluation was impressive

Having worked with Delphi/STAR on projects which addressed needs they had identified women leaders expressed reluctance to alter their mission to gain donor funds Groups who were poised to receive grants from other donors were wisely unwilling to submit to conditions that they felt were inappropriate for their NGO and community While not having strategic plans, some NGOs did have reasonable long term visions and plans for their work

While women's NGOs had made progress in their organizational development, most were surviving from grant to grant Some were seeking larger grants from outside donors with Delphi/STAR support, but most were relying on local sources including locally based donors and group member volunteerism to support activities The closure of the STAR project left a gap in funding for small grants for women's NGOs

One of the least visible contributions of the Delphi/STAR was the one to one support given to women's NGOs and the larger NGO community in diversifying funding through private US donors Project co-directors leveraged funds for YSS NGOs from private donors who would otherwise have been unknown to them This resulted in small grant funding of over $100 000 to ten groups in the YSS in 1998, nearly one-third to Macedonian NGOs, and over $400,000 in private funds for YSS NGOs over the life of the project

Subgrant Effectiveness

Most of the grants were effective in meeting their objects The grants demonstrated the shift in NGO mission from humanitarian/charity to supporting the development and strengthening of other women and women s NGOs for social change

The growing reach and influence of several of the NGOs was impressive The women from town-based NGOs were serving and seeking to improve women's lives in villages and smaller towns in their area These NGOs were positioned to reach the rural women who are often isolated by traditions which do not allow them freedom of movement and association Women s NGOs were uniquely positioned in this cultural environment to reach, enrich and begin to emancipate the most marginalized members of Macedonian society - rural, isolated often uneducated women

Advocacy and Public Image

Recognizing that Delphi/STAR did not meet the lofty goals set in the Project plan nor did it realize the potential for contribution in the area of advocacy, the Project did lay the ground work from which future advocacy work can be based

Important first steps in establishing a milieu for women's NGOs to develop advocacy actions were taken A core of women were trained in policy advocacy and have demonstrated skills in taking advocacy actions Individual NGOs became more visible in their communities and strengthened their public image through their project work Women's NGOs expanded their use of the media

However, Delphi/STAR partner NGOs generally did not understand nor use systematic advocacy skills The Macedonian women's NGOs will need training, technical support and mentoring if they are to transform their current community education work into successful advocacy actions

Value added to a Local Base of Trainers

Delphi/STAR enhanced the skills of 16 women leaders and activists in learner-centered training methodologies Ten of the women, of various ages, major ethnic groups and different levels of educational background, worked in multi-ethnic teams and provided a few well received training workshops for local women and women's NGOs By international standards, trainers' skills were basic but by local standards some of the women have developed participatory training skills which were unusual and needed in the Macedonian context

While the women served as models for other Macedonian women, the potential for long-term service as trainers to the women's NGO community was diminished by a lack of time and professional coaching to solidify skills and lack of strategic planning for use of their skills when the Delphi/STAR project closed

Strengthening Multi-ethnic Working Relationships

An outstanding contribution of the Delphi/STAR Project in Macedonia and the YSS was the consistent creation of environments where multi-ethnic groups could meet, learn about each other, and collaborate on shared issues As a result, women developed trusting personal relationships and ad hoc collaboration among organizations across ethnic, age, and geographic boundaries which had not previously been possible

Issues and Recommendations

With the closure of the Delphi/STAR project women's NGOs lost an ally and advocate for women and the issues which affect their lives Delphi/STAR had facilitated the development of women as leaders and given them tools to play constructive roles in the development of civil society NGOs found that most other donors did not intuitively understand or easily accept the need or value of women-focused development or projects, making justification of projects difficult or impossible Most women's NGOs were not positioned to compete for grants or learning opportunities in this area For them, the closure of Delphi/STAR leaves a gap in creative personal and moral support and in funding for small, community focused projects important for women

The issues and recommendations which follow are targeted to address some of these gaps and issues which arose during the project

Support for Gender Equity through Women's NGOs

Issue - Gender inequity and traditional customs result in women and the girl child being the most marginalized members of society Women's NGOs are uniquely positioned gain entrance to isolated communities without raising insurmountable resistance from male led traditional structures Women s NGOs will need continued technical assistance and funding to continue this important work in the development of civil society

Recommendation - USAID should ensure that women s NGOs who are committed to the development of women and civil society have resources targeted to support their work

Private Grant Management

Issue - Delphi/STAR Macedonia carried out a grant management process which benefited the NGOs who fully participated In two cases, NGOs received private grants through processes which disabled the STAR staff from requiring accountability In a

comparison of results of NGO grants which benefited from STAR management and the two private grants which did not, STAR technical assistance in project conceptualization and accountability clearly improved the effectiveness of the project and the skills of the NGOs

Recommendation - Private grants awarded to less mature NGOs should comply with the high management standards in order to realize the full potential of the grant for NGO strengthening

Subgrant Funding Period

Issue - The short subgrant funding period, 5 months from approval to completion including the 2 month summer holiday lull, mitigated against NGOs learning lessons of budgeting and disbursement of financial resources over an extended period As the STAR country coordinator said, "It teaches groups to spend money fast, not make it last "

Recommendation - USAID and its partners need to support responsible NGO fiscal practices by ensuring maximum time for subgrant expenditures

Support of Advocacy Skill Development

Issue - While there were IPA graduates who have demonstrated skills in advocacy, they were not ready nor did they have the capacity to share these skills with the larger women's NGO community Without specific technical support and a neutral convening organization, it is highly unlikely that advocacy skills will be soon shared in a systematic way to empower women's NGOs to conceptualize and lead their own actions

Recommendation - USAID should encourage its partners to include women's NGOs in training, technical support and mentoring in advocacy to support them in transforming their current community education work into successful advocacy actions

Use of Local Training Resource

Issue - A core of women have basic training skills in conflict resolution, and awareness raising and confidence building of young women They have worked in multi-ethnic teams who serve as models of the potential for all Macedonian women to build and rely on their own skills They have successfully carried out training but have no clear plans or funding to provide workshops to requesting groups

Recommendation - USAID partners are urged to support the use of the trainers when they are requested to do so by other USAID supported NGOs

Support for Multi-Ethnic Cooperation

Issue - Women's NGOs have made progress in working together and women leaders are in place who have a shared experience of working together successfully across ethnic, age, umbrella and geographic boundaries Still, individuals and NGOs will need many more opportunities to work together, have conflicts and resolve them, in order to deepen and solidify their working relationship

Recommendation - Delphi/STAR provided the safe space needed for growth which allowed conflict to be a healthy tool for understanding It is vital that this space and support be forthcoming from other INGOs to support continued growth

1 INTRODUCTION

1 1 Background

USAID Project Cooperative Agreement 1994 -1998

The Strategies, Training and Advocacy for Reconciliation Project (STAR), managed by Delphi International, was one of eight grantees under the Trauma and Humanitarian Assistance for the Former Yugoslavia Project (180-0016) sponsored by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) The Cooperative Agreement, No EUR-0016-A-00-4070-00, for the project to work in Croatia, Bosnia-Herzegovina (BiH) and the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Macedonia) was signed in September 1994 and scheduled for completion in October 1997

The cooperative agreement for BiH and Macedonia was extended for one year and nine months respectively, with the completion of the Delphi/STAR projects on 18 December 1998 in BiH and 13 November 1998 in Macedonia The Program Description is Appendix A

Originally the USAID program management, project oversight and administration were shared between the USAID Washington Project Officer and the Offices of USAID Representatives in Zagreb and Skopje In 1995, more direct responsibility for project oversight was transferred to the USAID Country Office in Macedonia

Delphi/STAR Project Advocacy and Private Support

The Delphi/STAR Project played a role as an advocate for raising awareness in the Untied States (US) government and private donor community of the situation for women and partner NGOs in the Yugoslav Successor States (YSS) Delphi/STAR expanded the network of donors and activists linked to the area as well as raising significant private funding over $400,000 in four years for projects in Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY), before USAID funds were available there, as well as for grants to groups in the Macedonia, BiH and Croatia Private grants provided some of the USAID cost share requirements

Final, Year Three (Final) and Mid-term Evaluations

The Delphi/STAR project had two previous evaluations In 1996, the Mid-term Evaluation reviewed all eight projects under Project 0016 The Final (Year Three) Evaluation was carried out in September 1997 at the time of the expected completion of the Delphi/STAR Project in Macedonia, BiH and Croatia A brief summary of the results of the Mid-term Evaluation is Appendix B - Summary of Delphi/STAR Midterm Evaluation The Executive Summary of the Final (Year Three) Evaluation of the Delphi/STAR Project is Appendix C

At the time of writing, evaluations of the final year of the Project have been carried out in the three original countries and an evaluation of the FRY Delphi/STAR Project was planned in 1999 This evaluation report addresses the Macedonia country program

1 2 Evaluation Methodology

The Delphi/STAR Macedonia Project external evaluation was conducted between 1 to 8 November 1998 The evaluation focused primarily on the effectiveness of the activities of year 4 of the Project and was to assess

- appropriateness of the scope of work given the time frame of the project
- Delphi/STAR s contribution to the financial and organizational sustainability of individual women's NGOs
- effectiveness of subgrants in meeting their stated objectives as well as tools for NGO strengthening
- the value Delphi/STAR added in developing a local base of trainers and facilitators

- the value Delphi/STAR added in strengthening multi-ethnic cooperation among women and women's NGOs and local institutions
- benefits of Delphi/STAR supported linkages regionally and internationally

The "Final (Year Three) Evaluation" addresses year 1 to 3 in depth The Evaluation Terms of Reference is Appendix D

The evaluator was Waneen Polly, an NGO development, women's health and gender specialist from the United States, who had been the primary evaluator for the Final (Year Three) Evaluation in September 1997

Evaluation Process

The evaluation was carried out by reviewing project and independent materials, conducting field visits with NGO leaders and group members, and interviewing third party observers, USAID and Delphi/STAR staff The List of Materials Reviewed is Appendix E

From 2 to 6 November, field visits were carried out in Skopje, Delchevo, Shtip, Sveti Nikole, Kumanovo and Gostivar To assess the Delphi/STAR contribution to the development of NGO capacity, field visits included conversations with group members, project participants, and NGO leaders Interviews were designed to provide a positive model of evaluation and demystify the evaluation process

In Macedonia interviews were held with

- 13 individual women leaders
- 40 women group members
- from 15 groups of which 11 were subgrantees
- in 6 towns
- The evaluator attended an Advisory Board meeting and met individually with 5 of 6 board members

Interviews were also held with USAID representatives, officers of international agencies, and Delphi/STAR Macedonia, regional and Washington staff E-mail and telephone interviews were held with Delphi/STAR consultants and the former co-director The Delphi/STAR Macedonia Evaluation Contacts List is Appendix F and the Delphi/STAR Macedonia Evaluation Field Trip Itinerary is Appendix G

Comment on Appraising Achievement of a Participatory, Capacity Building Project

It is difficult to attribute to Delphi/STAR, or any one organization, the achievements, results and impact in the development of capacity of individual women leaders, partner NGOs and the women's NGO networks The NGOs with whom Delphi/STAR partnered had varied levels of access to support from other donors, INGOs, the international network of women leaders their own internal networks, and their own existing resources Therefore, the evaluator looked for attribution of causality and for a demonstration of plausible association when causality was not possible, between Delphi/STAR's support and the achievements and results that can be seen in the leaders, partner NGOs and networks

2 PROJECT PERFORMANCE

2 1 Context of the Project

In Macedonia, civic initiatives were largely formed after 1991 with the first groups being ecological groups and women's clubs/organizations The environmental groups were numerous and well organized Women's organizations, especially outside the capital of Skopje, were largely traditional clubs (old style women's clubs and ethnic groups) who carried out humanitarian and community social work

Most women's organizations belonged to one of three national umbrella organizations, the League of Albanian Women in Macedonia, Union of Macedonia Women and the Organization of Women of Macedonia The umbrella organizations traditionally had strong hierarchies, links to political parties, and limited collaboration between groups belonging to different umbrellas With strong top down management, women leaders and women's organizations had little room to develop independent thinking or activities Inter-ethnic cooperation took place among organizations but there had been minimal successful in addressing ethnic divisions openly and constructively

To initiate activities, Delphi/STAR identified umbrella leaders and groups belonging to each umbrella to work with as partners While some groups were ethnically mixed, most were not All groups were, in principle, open to and demonstrated supportive behaviors regarding a non-nationalistic, democratic, advocacy-oriented purpose

As their experience in the country grew, Delphi/STAR's strategy shifted It focused on development of the capacity of women leaders and young activists from groups largely outside of Skopje A few 'dynamic" women and NGOs who demonstrated potential for leadership were targeted for additional skill development opportunities and subgrants To enhance inter-ethnic understanding and communication, Delphi/STAR made possible inter-ethnic cooperation through supporting mixed working groups and training teams and convening multi-ethnic groups around concrete issues Additionally, the Project focused on the development of young women as potential activists by providing consciousness raising and confidence building opportunities not easily accessible in hierarchically run organizations and society in general

Delphi/STAR did not seek to direct or drive the work that women did in the community Instead, it supported the groups in identifying local needs and opportunities for civil initiatives, initiatives that the group was skilled and interested in addressing The essential element that all groups had in common was that through the work, the NGOs established themselves as contributing members of their community and in so doing positioned themselves to be seen as credible when addressing civil issues The list of Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonian from May 1997 is Appendix H

2 2 Appropriateness of Delphi/STAR Scope of Work given the 9 month Project Extension

TOR Questions - Was the scope of the work appropriate for the time frame of the project?

The Delphi/STAR Project goals and plan for the year 4 extension were an ambitious vision of the possible but were not achievable in the time frame of the project

In the Macedonian context, where gender inequity and traditional customs result in women and the girl child being the most marginalized members of society, the project was appropriately targeted to facilitate the development of women and women's NGOs around issues important to the women Delphi/STAR's work with select NGOs resulted in women activists growing in confidence and competence and women's NGOs transitioning from self-centered clubs to NGOs with commitment and capacity to begin to address women's needs The women's NGOs, who are uniquely positioned to gain entrance to isolated communities, were able to begin the process of educating women and the communities on essential issues without raising insurmountable resistance from male led traditional structures

The target group and Delphi/STAR's step-by-step need responsive approach were appropriate but the scope of work was not reasonable for the length of the extension and the growth required of the partner NGOs Therefore, at the end of the project, the work was not completed No Delphi/STAR partner NGO nor the collection of women's NGOs could be said to have "graduated" Their sustainability, while greatly improved, was not secure Additionally, due to the uneasy circumstance surrounding the closure of the project there were many loose ends when the project abruptly ended

2 2 1 Level of Achievement based on the Year 4 STAR Project Goals

The Mission Statement of the Delphi/STAR Project for year 4 was

> To foster women's participation in the development of civil society in the Yugoslav Successor States, including Macedonia, through encouragement, technical assistance and financial support to non-nationalistic, advocacy-oriented women's NGOs and women leaders Delphi/STAR pursues this mission by supporting long-term sustainability through building capacity in public policy advocacy, democratic leadership and developing linkages "

Based on Delphi/STAR's assessment of the achievements of the women's groups and the NGOs' readiness and desire for development, the following goals were outlined in the proposal to USAID which was the basis for the project activities for year four

- Goal 1 - creation of a viable, sustainable network of women leaders and NGOs that are committed to democratic action for social change in their communities

- Goal 2 - more collaboration among women's NGOs which will strengthen multi-ethnic coalitions and cooperative working relationships with local governments on concrete issues such as women's health, community violence, and economic empowerment

- Goals 3 - progress towards sustainability of the NGO sector through increased success in participatory leadership, program planning, management and financial viability

- Goal 4 - enhanced problem-solving linkages between Macedonian NGOs and their counterparts on the borders, in the region, and internationally

Women's NGOs made steady and measurable progress toward meeting the general intent of the goals but achievement of the goals was not possible in a 9-month extension Highlights are listed below and discussed in more detail in later sections

- Goal 1 - The 'creation of a viable, sustainable network of women leaders and NGOs" was not possible and was not achieved While NGOs did grow in commitment and ability to carry out social change activities in their communities, they did not yet have their own vision of a network and do not have the shared values and level of trust that would draw them together

- Goal 2 - Notable achievements were made in developing linkages among women leaders who crossed ethnic boundaries but this was not always mirrored in relationships between their NGOs There was increased collaboration among NGOs from different ethnic groups around specific issues but these were not necessarily sustainable See section 2 4 1 for detailed information

- Goal 3 - Most women's NGOs who received Delphi/STAR subgrants and the accompanying high quality technical assistance made good progress toward organizational stability Progress toward financial stability was much slower, with

most women's NGOs living from grant to grant For more information see section 2 3 1

- Goal 4 - Cross-boarder exchanges were funded and facilitated by the Delphi/STAR Project but problem solving linkages were not yet evident and bearing fruit Macedonian women representing non-Skopje based groups were exposed to and brought into the circle of YSS activist women's groups See section 2 4 2 for more information

While advocacy was not specifically mentioned in any goal, it was a key theme of the regional Delphi/STAR mission and was a part of the workplan While important beginning efforts were made Delphi/STAR was not successful in the development of advocacy skills and actions among local NGOs at the level it had targeted in the project agreement The proposal vastly overestimated the commitment and ability of International Policy Advocacy (IPA) graduates to provide training and technical assistance to other NGOs It overstated women s NGOs readiness to influence public policy on issues affecting women, their families and communities " See section 2 3 3 for more information

2 2 2 Status of Activities at Closure of the Delphi/STAR Project

The work of the Delphi/STAR Project was not completed No Delphi/STAR partner NGO nor the collection of women's NGOs could be said to have "graduated" and their sustainability, while greatly improved, was not secured

USAID, Delphi/STAR and the women's NGOs agreed that the project was valuable and that the work was not yet completed Until two months before the project closed, there had been a hope that the project would be extended or a new project would be approved This hope and the uneasy situation surrounding the closure of the project led to the Delphi/STAR staff never really envisioning nor implementing an exit strategy The elements that contributed to the ineffective closure of the project follow

- the project proposal overstated the level of development of the women's NGOs, especially in the area of readiness to move forward

- there was no country designed strategic plan for the 9 month extension and no conscious exit strategy on which the original workplan was based

- the Delphi/STAR field team planned and executed activities with a belief that the project would be awarded additional funding and would continue for at least several more months This belief was based on verbal USAID support for the extension

- a change in USAID staff and direction nullified informal support of the extension

- two unsolicited proposals for the project extension, one from Delphi International and one from another firm using all the Delphi/STAR field staff, delayed the decision by USAID as to the future of the project The obvious conflict between known field staff and the contract holding organization diminished the attractiveness of either proposals for USAID Word that neither proposal would be accepted was given 2 months before the actual closure

- direction for field office administrative close out was provided by Delphi International but direction and support for field office programmatic closure were not provided

- the closure date of the project was changed backward and forward by the Washington Delphi office, leaving field staff uncertain as to the date that would finally be set

- the Delphi/STAR country staff decided to carry out planned programs to the end of the project and did not significantly facilitate planning of next steps with women leaders, informal trainer groups and NGOs

All in all, these choices and actions resulted in Delphi/STAR Project closing with many project target areas not completed and next steps not clearly articulated

Delphi/STAR staff did talk with individual women leaders and supported them in making linkages to address gaps in their support left by Delphi/STAR's closure However Delphi/STAR did not facilitate transitional planning with the advisory board, the loosely-linked training teams nor women's NGOs to articulate self-generated strategies for their individual and collective development and continued work in areas traditionally supported by Delphi/STAR Interviews revealed loose ends in the following areas

- The women who were trained in conflict resolution, a portion of whom had provided satisfactory training to other women's groups, said that they were willing to provide workshops for those who requested However, they had not made any plans or agreements among themselves as to how to do this None who were interviewed felt that they were positioned to call the other trainers together for purposes of planning, decision making or problem solving

- Three of six young women who attended the Feminist Summer School in FRY designed and delivered 5 awareness raising workshops, under the name KuKuLeLe, for 90 young women throughout the country The trainer/activists had skills and interest to continue their work but no clear plan for how they would continue Without focus, funds and facilitation the work of raising awareness and building confidence around ideas and issues important for young women were not likely to continue

- Young women had been a focus of Delphi/STAR training during year 4 with 90 women being trained by KuKuLeLe There was a final gathering of 30 young women who had seemed most promising as NGO activists Any next steps will be entirely on the individual initiative of the young women

- The Health Advocacy Network, after three meetings, had come to an initial understanding of advocacy and had begun to consider health care and legislation issues There was no plan by the NGOs for further meetings without Delphi/STAR support and no capacity for them to develop advocacy actions on their own

While no concrete plans were made, it is hoped these activists will be supported to carry out important work in conflict resolution, advocacy and development of young women activist when they are requested to do so by other USAID supported NGOs

2 2 3 Contributing Factors

Delphi/STAR had a creative, visionary management team and dedicated insightful country staff Overall, the Project was excellent in developing women s and NGO capacity and increasing their potential as strong players in Macedonian civil society development

However there were weaknesses and issues within the overall Delphi/STAR Project that hindered the Macedonia country team from reaching its potential in implementation of the Project These included

- a weakness of the overall Delphi/STAR Project in the region was a lack of development of its own management systems from the Washington to regional to country level

- the roles and responsibilities of staff, organizational structures, budgeting systems and decision making processes were never clarified

- the role of the regional director was not developed to its full potential for technical support and on-the-job training of country staff

- the financial management systems were not developed by the Washington Delphi office so that countries could track and manage their own budget

- relationship between the field and the Washington office so deteriorated that program support suffered and thus the programs for the women

The Delphi/STAR staff in Macedonia, and in all STAR countries and main offices, remained dedicated, ethical and productive even under these constraints Their work was recognized as of good quality by the NGO partners and USAID officers who worked closely with them Unfortunately the potential of the individuals and, therefore, the Delphi/STAR programs was not fully developed

2 2 4 Issues and Recommendations

2 2 R1 Support for Gender Equity through Women's NGOs

Issue - Gender inequity and traditional customs result in women and the girl child being the most marginalized members of society Women's NGOs are uniquely positioned gain entrance to isolated communities without raising insurmountable resistance from male led traditional structures Women's NGOs will need technical assistance and funding to continue this important work in the development of civil society

Recommendation - USAID should ensure that women's NGOs who are committed to the development of women and civil society have resources targeted to support their work

2 3 Delphi/STAR Contribution to NGO Sustainability

TOR Questions

- **What elements has Delphi/STAR contributed to the financial and organizational sustainability of individual women's NGOs?**
- **In what ways have subgrants been effective in meeting their stated objectives as well as their effectiveness as tools for NGO strengthening?**
- **What value has Delphi/STAR added in the development of a local based of facilitators and trainers?**

Strengthening of individual women leaders and of the organizational capacity of women's NGOs were notable results of Delphi/STAR Project

While there remain considerable areas for growth in women's NGOs organizational and financial skills, the distance the NGOs have come since the start of the Project and in the 15 months since the last evaluation was impressive Select non-Skopje based women's NGOs had grown from more traditional women's clubs to NGOs which demonstrated skills in designing and successfully executing community responsive projects Leaders had grown in their confidence and sense of direction Some women who had worked closely with Delphi/STAR expressed unwillingness to shift their goals and mission to meet donor criteria for grants While not having strategic plans, a few women's NGOs had longer-term, realistic visions and plans for their work

Despite the changes, most women's NGOs did not appear to be sustainable without focused outside technical and financial support

2 3 1 Organizational Sustainability

During the first three years of the project, Delphi/STAR supported NGO capacity building through skill development workshops in organizational development (OD) leadership training, and conflict resolution training Electronic mail training and computer equipment were provided to NGOs but were only successfully used in 1 of 6 NGOs Delphi/STAR staff provided ad hoc assistance and encouragement of women leaders, subgrantees and the other women's NGOs The majority of this assistance was provided to groups outside of Skopje

At the time of the Final (Year Three) evaluation, it was clear that Delphi/STAR supported activities had strengthened the organizational capacities of the women leaders and groups with whom it had worked most closely Most NGOs had started with traditional hierarchical management structures, dominant leaders, limited participatory learning experiences and humanitarian or social missions With STAR sponsored training and support, NGOs became more democratic in their structure and more developmental in their activities if not in their stated missions The contribution was described in the Final (Year Three) Evaluation as follows

> ' Leaders who participated in a series of four organizational and leadership development workshops were universally positive about the workshops providing a forum to deal with real, current, issues for leaders, noting that they gained self-confidence and energy for continuing their work Several women leaders provided examples of how they had used the skills acquired in this workshop to positively effect changes in their own groups '

For an in-depth review of the growth of women leaders, see Appendix I - Women's Voices

During the last year, Delphi/STAR carried out organizational and financial strengthening primarily through its subgrant program Macedonia's effective subgrant process has been outlined in sections 2 3 1 1 and 2 3 1 2

Additionally, Delphi/STAR carried out activities in the areas of enhancing the based of local trainers (see section 2 3 4) and support for development of advocacy skills (see section 2 3 3) For the longer term development of activist, STAR focused on the awareness raising and confidence building of young women leaders (see section 2 4) Delphi/STAR-Macedonia Calendar of Events 1998 is Appendix J

2 3 1 1 Subgrants - A Process for NGO Organizational and Financial Strengthening

The Macedonia Delphi/STAR team realized the potential to strengthen NGOs through the grant management experience and made the subgrant process a top priority of their work Their goal for the grants was clearly stated in their request for proposal letter, which read, ' We feel that when groups realize their own projects, the organization has a chance to develop skills through experience Our policy is to encourage organizations to build their own capacity as they work We will be looking in your proposals for ways in which active members of your organization can develop their own capacity as project managers and leaders, and so strengthen your NGO "

To support NGOs in strengthening their organizations, STAR designed and carried out the 1998 subgrant process which included

- announcing the request for proposals within the first month of the 9 month project extension
- mailing grant program information to 50 women's organizations in an open and transparent process
- modeling a clear grant application process with the kind and quality of information NGOs need to present for competitive grant applications
- assisting applicants to refine their grant proposal and budget
- providing timely targeted technical assistance, monitoring and feedback to grantees throughout the process through regular site visits, telephone calls and office visits
- assisting NGOs to make the connection between the reporting process and the groups self-evaluation of the work
- sponsoring a well timed evaluation workshop which focused on on-going, inter-group monitoring and reporting of results and lessons learned
- reviewing reports and making recommendation to strengthen the assessment of results of the subgrants

Twenty-one NGOs submitted proposals STAR staff supported 17 groups in developing and revising their proposals 8 of which were submitted to USAID Delphi/STAR awarded $67,874 in 14 grants of which

- $24,874 in USAID funds to 7 groups and
- $45 000 in private donor funds to 7 group

See Appendix K for 1998 Subgrants Awarded STAR Project Macedonia

A 25% cost share was a subgrant requirement to encourage grantees to establish a broader resource base and to understand the value of their own project contributions NGOs covered cost share requirements with contributions of volunteer time, media coverage, in-kind donations of space, food, and transport, and grants from other donors Reconciliation of accounts was not available at the time of the evaluation, but it appeared that STAR technical assistance had helped NGOs to understand cost share from the context of mobilizing available local resources This seemed a valuable concept and practice in the current resource scarce economic and donor situation

In order to assess NGO growth and the quality of the subgrant activity, the evaluator visited 9 of 14 NGOs subgrantees, 7 of these NGOs had been visited during the previous evaluation Additionally, 11 project proposal and 10 interim or final reports were reviewed

While it is not possible to attribute NGO growth in areas of financial and organizational sustainability exclusively to the Delphi/STAR Project, it is reasonable, based on conversations with subgrantees, to see positive changes as being a contribution of the Project Improvements since the evaluation 15 months earlier are highlighted below

Improvements

Project Proposals

- subgrant projects were noticeably more clearly conceptualized and fleshed-in, including ideas about evaluation and use of the media
- subgrant budgets were linked to project activities and detailed to cover reasonable costs
- cost share contributions were precise including number of volunteer hours and the value of volunteer time, which seemed under-estimated and under-valued

Project Reports

- subgrant reports went beyond a narrative report of activities
- 6 of 10 included numbers of persons attending and/or names of trainers, dates and topics for training courses
- 7 of 10 reported on media coverage for public announcement of the activities and coverage of the events
- 4 of 10 had carried out assessments of needs of the participants and/or pre- and post-assessments of learning
- 4 of 10 analyzed the activities on the basis of effect on the participants, the project holding NGOs and/or the community lecturers and participants

Project Process

- 3 of 9 groups visited reported having carried out a group assessment of the project in order to evaluate the project
- while NGO leaders were usually in clear leadership roles for the project, interviewees also indicated that more authority had been delegated and that group members had served as leaders and active facilitators of parts of the project process
- in meetings with NGOs, the democratic nature of groups was more evident as group members spoke freely and not always in confirmation or even agreement with leaders about the project and other elements of their work
- several projects worked for and with women and NGOs from other ethnic groups or, if not across ethnic groups, the projects bridged gaps and shifted traditions within their own ethnic group
- 8 NGOs in interviews and/or reports demonstrated an ability to distinguish between activities, outcomes and results of projects, which would have been rare during the evaluation 15 months earlier

There were also weakness in the grant process These include

Weaknesses in the Process

Private Grants

- In two cases, the NGOs receiving private grants had not solicited the money through the regular proposal process In both cases, the project plans outlining the use of funds, which the NGO knew they had already been awarded, were well below the

standard of other project proposals and would not have been considered for funding One NGO submitted an unacceptable interim report and the other had not bothered to report In both cases, the quality or quantity of the program delivered was well below what would have been expected for the funds received

- The process by which the NGOs received funds sometimes disabled the Delphi/STAR staff in providing effective technical assistance because the groups did not need to responsibly participate in the grant process This was a disservice to the NGOs for their own development

Timing of Subgrant Process

- The short subgrant funding period, 5 months from approval to completion including the 2 month summer holiday lull, mitigated against NGOs learning lessons of budgeting and disbursement of financial resources over an extended period As the Delphi/STAR country coordinator said, 'It teaches groups to spend money fast, not make it last " Short subgrant funding periods were also a problem in other Delphi/STAR Project countries USAID and its partners need to support responsible NGO fiscal practices by ensuring maximum time for subgrant expenditures

- Planned follow-up to assist NGOs in their self-evaluation of project process and outcomes was not carried out due to a lack of time at the close of the Delphi/STAR grant

Delphi/STAR Macedonia can be credited with successfully strengthening women's NGOs through its excellent facilitation of the subgrant process as a tool for NGO strengthening While there remain considerable areas for growth in women's NGOs organizational and financial skills, the distance the NGOs have come since the start of the project and in the 15 months since the last evaluation was impressive

Having worked with Delphi/STAR on projects which addressed needs they had identified, women leaders expressed reluctance to alter their mission to gain donor funds Groups who were poised to receive grants from other donors were wisely unwilling to submit to conditions that they felt were inappropriate for their NGO and community While not having strategic plans, some NGOs did have reasonable long term visions and plans for their work All of these are significant signs of grown in confidence and capacity of women leaders and NGOs

In a comparison of results of NGO grants which benefited from STAR management and the two private grants which did not, STAR technical assistance in project conceptualization and accountability clearly improved the effectiveness of the project and the skills of the NGOs

2 3 1 2 Subgrant - Effectiveness in Meeting their Objectives

The 1998 subgrants were intended to support women's organizations in their work to carry out campaigns, raise public awareness, and bring about positive social change in their community on issues that effect women " (from the request for proposals letter)

In the time allotted for the evaluation, a limited assessment of subgrant effectiveness was made through conversations with NGOs, interviews with Delphi/STAR staff and review of written reports This can not be considered a full appraisal but an independent bird's eye view Delphi/STAR's own assessment of subgrant effectiveness was not available at the time of the evaluation

Most of the grants were effective in meeting their objects They reached the designated communities, providing learning opportunities and sometimes, services for participants Notable successes included a project focusing on girls' rights to education resulted in a doubling of the number of Albanian girls who went on the secondary school following the education and encouragement of teachers and parents to support girls' education Three health service and education projects effectively addressed the physical,

psychological, and social needs of women, resulting in women seeking otherwise sensitive cancer prevention exams

It was impressive that NGO understanding of the results of their work had shifted from being self-centered to being participant-centered In earlier projects, NGOs reported project success when lectures" in neighboring rural communities expanded their NGO's membership and when their presenters and members had been well received When the NGOs described recent projects, they measured results by the actions participants had take following workshops and by changes in the community served

The grants demonstrated the shift in NGO mission from humanitarian/charity to supporting the development and strengthening of other women and women's NGOs for social change The growing reach and influence of several of the NGOs was impressive The women from town-based NGOs were serving and seeking to improve women's lives in villages and smaller towns in their area These NGOs were positioned to reach the rural women who are often isolated by traditions which do not allow them freedom of movement and association Women's NGOs which ran programs for women by women did not come under insurmountable scrutiny or censorship from husband, fathers, male relatives, or traditional institutions Women's NGOs were uniquely positioned in this cultural environment to reach, enrich and begin to emancipate the most marginalized members of Macedonian society - rural, isolated, often uneducated women

Subgrants were awarded to support advocacy activities The activities demonstrated what could be considered first steps in advocacy skill development, local use of media, public education and personal outreach to local institutions However, NGOs lacked a systematic understanding for developing strategic advocacy actions (See section 2 3 3)

2 3 2 Delphi/STAR's Contribution to Financial Sustainability

Delphi/STAR's activities in supporting financial sustainability of the women's NGOs were primarily in the areas of technical assistance and training in resource mobilization and in the support of NGOs through Delphi/STAR subgrants While women's NGOs had made progress in their organizational development, most were surviving from grant to grant Some were seeking larger grants from outside donors with Delphi/STAR support, but most were relying on local sources including locally based donors municipal institutions for space, small government funds, and group member volunteerism to support activities The closure of the Delphi/STAR Project left a gap in funding for small grants for women's NGOs

Over the life of the project Delphi/STAR subgrants were important in the stabilization of emerging advocacy-oriented NGOs outside of Skopje and one Skopje NGO Delphi/STAR grants were more flexible than most other funding and supported essential operating costs as well as projects Most groups who had grants for operating costs reported that the grants allowed them necessary "breathing space" to establish or stabilize the group More mature NGOs were able to leverage additional funds based on the grants from Delphi/STAR

During the year 4 of the Project, Delphi/STAR's key support for NGO financial sustainability was through the subgrant process (see above sections) and one to one support to groups who were seeking to stabilize and diversify resources and funding Additionally, a half-day resource mobilization training the Regional Exchange Program and the *Delphi/STAR International Funding Guide"* contributed resource mobilization insight for a small number of women

Delphi/STAR wisely did not continue to program women's economic empowerment activities Instead, they lobbied Opportunity International to support women s micro-credit programs and supported NGOs in developing sound planning and cost analysis for proposals for other donors

As part of the regional project activities Delphi/STAR printed the *'Delphi/STAR International Funding Guide"* in local languages and in English For those with sufficient skills in project conceptualization it

opened doors to new funders The guide was not valuable to most Macedonian NGOs because they had not yet reached a level of competence to solicit funds independently from international donors

One of the least visible contributions of the Delphi/STAR International and the Regional Co-Directors was the one to one support given to women's NGOs and the larger NGO community in diversifying funding through private US donors Both co-directors leveraged funds for YSS groups through developing relationships with donors and then lobbying them to support YSS NGOs who would otherwise have been unknown to them Delphi/STAR played a role in educating private US donors about the kinds of grants which could be helpful to small groups and provided donors with a process for transmitting funds through Delphi International

This relationship building and lobbying resulted in small grant funding of over $100,000 to ten groups in the YSS in 1998, nearly one-third to Macedonian NGOs Additionally, the Resourceful Woman award of $10 000 was given to a group in Kosovo and continued interest was shown by private donors such as the Tides Foundation, Shaler Adams Fund, Caritas, Dougherty, and the Hague Peace Appeal in YSS NGO work

This funding process had value on the local as well as international level Leveraging private funds to work with federal funds offered a positive opportunity for private donors to work in partnership with the US government On the local level, it modeled cost sharing and resource mobilization strategies for NGOs

2 3 3 Advocacy, Use of Media and Public Image

Advocacy was an integral component of the Delphi/STAR year 4 program, as noted by "advocacy" being an element of the title of the project, "Strategies, Training and Advocacy for Reconciliation" The Delphi/STAR long term strategy was to support women advocates to gain confidence and skills to make their actions more effective and to support NGOs who showed commitment to civil society development and social change Thus, over time, it was hoped a critical mass of women who understood advocacy well and of women s NGOs who were positioned to work in coalition on advocacy actions would develop

Delphi/STAR was not successful in the development of advocacy skills and actions as envisioned in the regional project and as stated in the Macedonian project agreement The proposal vastly overestimated the commitment and ability of International Policy Advocacy (IPA) graduates to provide training and technical assistance to other NGOs It overstated women s NGOs readiness to ' influence public policy on issues affecting women, their families and communities " Additionally, none of the Macedonia Delphi/STAR staff were sufficiently skilled in advocacy to provide vision and support for the advocacy initiative Regional Delphi/STAR supervision of the activities was not sufficient to make-up for lack of local expertise

Recognizing that Delphi/STAR did not meet the lofty goals set nor did it realize the potential for contribution in this area, the Project did lay the ground-work from which future advocacy work can be based STAR advocacy activities in the area included

- five Macedonian women (among 18 women in the YSS) participated in the International Policy Advocacy (IPA) course in the United States The training provided a systematic approach to activism and demonstrated how NGOs can influence policies of international institutions

- after three years of women receiving IPA training, Delphi/STAR facilitated a workshop with YSS IPA graduates to share advocacy work experiences, identify localized advocacy tools and plan future activities

- during year 4, one to one consultations with IPA graduates to assist them with individual advocacy work was provided by Kathleen Sheekey co-director of the Advocacy Institute, Washington, D C

- also in year 4, subgrants were awarded for advocacy and education related activities, including an emphasis on productive use of the media

- the IPA graduates from the YSS authored the *"Public Policy Advocacy Women for Social Change in the Yugoslav Successor States"* workbook which contains case studies from NGOs and communities in the region The workbook was made available in Macedonian and Albanian languages at the close of the Project

Delphi/STAR's plan that the IPA graduates form teams to train Macedonian women in advocacy skills was not realized but 4 of 5 IPA graduates used their skills within their own NGOs and 3 of 5 carried out advocacy activities in the larger community Concrete actions and training by IPA activists follow

- A nation wide campaign to raise consciousness about domestic violence was carried out including round tables in smaller cities, poster campaign, national media coverage and distribution of in-depth domestic violence research The campaign drew in women's groups from smaller communities to promote education on the issues in their communities The action provided a small group of NGOs with an important experience in working together to addresses a contentious issue in their communities Additionally, the NGO HAESE was taking the lead in changing the domestic violence laws

- Two IPA activists collaborated, with the support of Delphi/STAR staff, to provide the Delphi/STAR sponsored Health Advocacy Network members with workshops on strategic use of media and basic advocacy skills The second workshop, the only one where a systematized advocacy concept was presented, did shape advocacy ideas in related projects Designing an advocacy strategy would have been a useful next step but the Delphi/STAR Project ended with no group generated plan to follow-up the training

- Three media workshops were provided for NGOs by an NGO who had an IPA graduate as a member There was no evidence that the media training consciously supported the development of overall advocacy strategy and skills

- Six prime-time local TV broadcasts, which highlighted issue-based NGO activities such as discussion of domestic violence and children's human rights, were produced by an IPA graduate This included interviewing women from other NGOs about their organizations' work

While there are a core of women who were trained in IPA and have demonstrated skills in taking advocacy action, the IPA graduates were not ready to share these skills with the larger women's NGO community They seemed to be necessarily focused on the stability and work of their own NGOs No individual or group had the confidence of the wider community Therefore, without specific technical support and a neutral convening organization, it is highly unlikely that advocacy skills will be soon shared in a systematic way to empower women's NGOs to conceptualize and lead their own actions

Important first steps in establishing a milieu for women s NGOs to develop advocacy actions were taken Overall, women's NGOs made progress in positively positioning themselves in their communities Individual NGOs strengthened their public image through their project work NGOs became more visible in the community by holding lectures, facilitating the provision of valued services, appearing in the media, and carrying out public service activities NGOs reported greater acceptance and respect by citizens, other NGOs and some local institutions Women's NGOs expanded their use of the media

However, Delphi/STAR partner NGOs generally did not have systematic advocacy skills They were unable to articulate how to change local conditions through advocacy activities They did not have strategies or skills for using the media to advocate on issues Some have been willing to join an ad hoc coalition but few could generate an effective local action in support of a larger campaign

The ability of an NGO to advocate on an issue and use the media effectively comes with maturity and having clear objectives and experience The Macedonian women's NGOs will need training, technical support and mentoring if they are to transform their current community education work into successful advocacy actions

2 3 4 The Value Added by STAR to local base of Trainers and Facilitators

Delphi/STAR enhanced the skills of 16 women leaders and activists in learner-centered training methodologies For a few, Delphi/STAR training enhanced existing skills and expanded areas of competence For most, the training opportunities exposed the trainees to technical information and trainer skills in which they had little formal experience Over the life to the project

- 5 women participated in the month long IPA course in the United States
- 6 young activists participated in the Feminist Summer School in FRY
- 3 NGO leaders participated in two STAR workshops for advanced training in organization development
- 9 leaders and young activists participated in a trainer training in conflict resolution and communication skills

Except for the OD training, the formal development of trainer skills (TOT) was minimal in these programs The TOT for the Conflict Resolution training was three days, followed by a 3 day, professionally coached training experience The KuKuLeLe trainers, an awareness raising program for young women which grew out of the feminist training, conducted 5 training programs of their own design, with minimal professional trainer mentoring IPA graduates received limited support in transforming their advocacy knowledge into training designs for others

Still, with basic skills as trainers, some of the women have designed or adapted workshops and conducted training programs which were positively evaluated by participants The 2 conflict resolution workshops, 5 KuKuLeLe workshops and 2 health advocacy network meetings facilitated by 2 IPA graduates were well received Some non-Skopje based NGOs have been recognized for their skills by their umbrella organizations, with one non-Skopje based leader providing training for other groups by invitation of the umbrella organization Unfortunately, most women trained as trainers did not have adequate opportunity to practice their skills nor did they receive adequate coaching before the closure of the STAR project

By international standards, trainers skills were basic but by local standards some of the women have developed participatory training skills which were unusual and needed in the Macedonian context The value added to the local base of trainers and facilitators by the STAR project was that there are now

- a loose network of local activists who share a value for multi-ethnic cooperation and experience with each other which has developed a level of personal trust

- women of all ages, educational backgrounds, and major ethnic groups based in communities throughout Macedonia who have basic participatory, learner-centered training skills

- some women trainers who are able to deliver established training workshops for NGOs

- a few trainer who are able to design and deliver their own training workshops

- non-Skopje based women leaders who are more confident if not fully able to participate on a more equal footing with Skopje-based women NGO leaders

- multi-ethnic trainer teams who serve as models of the potential for all Macedonian women to build and rely on their own skills

Most of the women trained were prepared to share their knowledge and to provide training to other NGOs on request Unfortunately, Delphi/STAR did not facilitate the trainers in developing individual or groups strategies for continued service Interviews with trainers indicated some had ideas of how they would individually use their skills, but none felt positioned to convene other trainers for purposes of advancing or promoting their work Relevant INGOs were not fully aware of trainers' skills or capacity, making use of the trainers less likely It is hoped the women will be supported to carry out important work in conflict resolution, advocacy and development of young women activist when they are requested to do so by other USAID supported NGOs

Since most opportunities for training had traditionally gone to women from Skopje based NGOs, STAR Macedonia chose to equalize opportunities for women and women's NGOs outside of Skopje, by focusing its support on these groups Therefore, 12 of 16 women chosen to receive advanced trainer skills were not from Skopje While this was a worthwhile strategy in general, the opportunity to enhance the skill base of two women's NGOs who have the potential to become indigenous intermediary women's NGOs was lost when qualified women from the Skopje-based NGOs were not chosen to participate in advanced organizational development training The non-Skopje based women leaders who received OD training were not adequately skilled to take full advantage of the Delphi/STAR training nor were they positioned to use the skills to serve the wider women's NGO community as consultants

For the core of women leaders who participated in multiple Delphi/STAR-sponsored training workshops, meetings, conferences, advisory board meetings and training of trainer activities, there were benefits However, their potential for long-term service as trainers to the women's NGO community was diminished by a lack of time and professional coaching to solidify skills and lack of strategic planning for use of their skills when the Delphi/STAR Project closed

2 3 5 Issues and Recommendations

2 3 R1 Private Grant Management

Issue - Delphi/STAR Macedonia carried out a grant management process which benefited the NGOs who fully participated In two cases, NGOs received private grants through processes which disabled the STAR staff from requiring accountability In a comparison of results of NGO grants which benefited from STAR management and the two private grants which did not, STAR technical assistance in project conceptualization and accountability clearly improved the effectiveness of the project and the skills of the NGOs

Recommendation - Private grants awarded to less mature NGOs should comply with the high management standards in order to realize the full potential of the grant for NGO strengthening

2 3 R2 Subgrant Funding Period

Issue - The short subgrant funding period, 5 months from approval to completion including the 2 month summer holiday lull mitigated against NGOs learning lessons of budgeting and disbursement of financial resources over an extended period As the STAR country coordinator said, It teaches groups to spend money fast, not make it last

Recommendation - USAID and its partners need to support responsible NGO fiscal practices by ensuring maximum time for subgrant expenditures

2 3 R3 Support of Advocacy Skill Development

Issue - While there were IPA graduates who have demonstrated skills in advocacy, they were not ready nor did they have the capacity to share these skills with the larger women's NGO community Without specific technical support and a neutral convening organization, it is highly unlikely that advocacy skills will be soon shared in a systematic way to empower women's NGOs to conceptualize and lead their own actions

Recommendation - USAID should encourage its partners to include women's NGOs in training, technical support and mentoring in advocacy to support them in transforming their current community education work into successful advocacy actions

2 3 R4 Use of Local Training Resource

Issue - A core of women have basic training skills in conflict resolution, and awareness raising and confidence building of young women They have worked in multi-ethnic teams who serve as models of the potential for all Macedonian women to build and rely on their own skills They have successfully carried out training but have no clear plans or funding to provide workshops to requesting groups

Recommendation - USAID partners are urged to support the use of the trainers when they are requested to do so by other USAID supported NGOs

2 4 Delphi/STAR's Contribution in Strengthening Multi-Ethnic Cooperation and Regional and International Linkages

TOR Questions

- What value has STAR added in strengthening of multi-ethnic cooperative working relationships among women and women's NGOs and other local institutions on concrete issues?

- What has been and are the expected benefits of individual and group linkages nationally, regionally and internationally?

An outstanding contributions of the Delphi/STAR Project in Macedonia and the YSS was the consistent creation of environments where multi-ethnic groups could meet, learn about each other, and collaborate on shared issues As a result, women began to develop trusting personal relationships and ad hoc collaboration among organizations across ethnic, age, and geographic boundaries which had not previously been possible

2 4 1 Strengthening Multi-Ethnic Working Relationships

Delphi/STAR s strategy to strengthen multi-ethnic working relationships was one of "functional cooperation" In all activities, Delphi/STAR convened a diverse group of women, crossing age, geographic, umbrella organization and ethnic groups Women were gathered around topics of shared interest and not for the express purpose of inter-ethnic exchange In as much as possible, the activities sponsored by Delphi/STAR modeled cooperation across the boundaries (age, ethnic, geographic and umbrella organization) by having mixed group trainers and participants interpreting of workshops in the languages of participants, translating written materials into Macedonian and Albanian, and carrying out workshops through out the country Most importantly, they encouraged differences of opinion in an environment where facilitation skills for addressing conflicts were always ready

Women who have worked closely with Delphi/STAR have had repeated, supported opportunities to work among themselves Many of these women leaders have established personal and working relationships but this was not necessarily mirrored in relationships between their NGOs Some believed they could not publicly support each other as individuals nor organizations because of ethnic tension Some NGOs working with health, education and domestic violence, worked with local institutions but this was not necessarily a cross-ethnic activity

While remaining ad hoc and fragile, cross-ethnic cooperation by Delphi/STAR supported women leaders and women's NGOs showed notable results

- 9 women activists, who were trained to conduct conflict resolution workshops, self-created 3 multi-ethnic teams, 2 teams successfully conducted workshops

- women leaders and groups demonstrated readiness to name and deal with issues of communication and conflict in workshops provided by STAR, this being a marked change from three years previous where ethnic tension was palpable but denied by the women

- in Gostivar a Macedonian women leader convened Macedonian Turkish and Albanian women to raise issues of domestic violence and how women and the community can address the issues

- the same leader provided training to the Turkish Albanian and Macedonian women's group on the sensitive topic of proposal writing, a secret not easily shared

- in Sveti Nikole, a Macedonia women's NGO, made up of professional women, highly evaluated a conflict resolution workshop provided by a team of Roma Albanian and Macedonian trainers who did not share their professional backgrounds

- many of the 90 young women, from around the country and from the many Macedonia ethnic groups, who participated in awareness raising workshops gained first hand experience and information that challenged their amazingly uninformed and biased views of each other

- the team of younger women trainers worked together successfully across geographic and ethnic lines, even successfully overcoming crises of trust

- the health advocacy network resulted in women from across the country and of different ethnic groups gaining an appreciation for shared women's health issues and potential for future collaboration on projects

- a Kumanovo women s NGOs, Macedonian, Roma and Albanian, carried out joint education including a joint press conference to support women and politics issues and confronting domestic violence

- a Kumanovo women's NGO, at the invitation of an international sponsor, facilitated problem solving around a community education issue

- and, perhaps, most sustainably, individual women overcame their own fear and biases by crossing boundaries to learn about others different from themselves, sometimes forming bonds of friendship and working relationship

Women's NGOs have made progress in working together and women leaders are in place who have a shared experience of working together successfully across ethnic, age, umbrella and geographic boundaries Still, individuals and NGOs will need many more opportunities to work together, have conflicts and resolve them, in order to deepen and solidify their working relationship Delphi/STAR provided the safe space needed for growth which allowed conflict to be a healthy tool for understanding It is vital that this space and support be forthcoming from other INGOs to support continued growth

2 4 2 Benefits of Regional and International Linkages

By not being a party to the wars in the YSS and traditionally not having a strong women's movement Macedonian women were often not included in cross-boarder peace and women's initiatives The Delphi/STAR Project supported Macedonia women's inclusion in the YSS regional and international women's community by including them in STAR funded regional activities and sponsoring their participation in regional and international conferences

Delphi/STAR funded regional issue oriented change activities were assessed as particularly valuable for long term cooperation by local women s groups Valuable linkages were made when YSS resource persons facilitated targeted workshops on women s health, project evaluation use of the media, conflict resolution and domestic violence The Regional Exchange Program was also a model for practical hands on learning for Macedonian women See Appendix L for information on the Regional Exchange Program

Cross border activities were useful when participants held a common interest and had similar situations or level of expertise so that the activity was relevant When these conditions were not met as in the training of organizational development resource persons, the events were not successful

Through Delphi/STAR co-director's own linkages with the US philanthropy and international communities, Delphi/STAR was able to gain entrance for YSS women leaders to Central European, US and international conferences and workshops Through Delphi/STAR's advocacy Macedonian women participated in the a

special Women and Politics international visitors program, the Beijing Women's Conference, and a young Roma woman will participate in 1999 -2000 Global Meeting of Generations of the International Development Conference These linkages exposed the international community to YSS issues and the capable women who are seeking to address them They also offered the women participating opportunities to develop linkages which have the potential to reap dividends for years to come

In general, Macedonian women were less able than other YSS women to capitalize on regional and international links as many were not able to visualize the long term value for their future work The well managed YSS exchanges which offered hands on, personal contacts and ideas which could be adapted and applied locally provided the greater immediate results and promise for future, self-initiated linkages

2 4 Issues and Recommendations

2 4 R1 Support for Multi-Ethnic Cooperation

Issue - Women's NGOs have made progress in working together and women leaders are in place who have a shared experience of working together successfully across ethnic, age, umbrella and geographic boundaries Still, individuals and NGOs will need many more opportunities to work together, have conflicts and resolve them, in order to deepen and solidify their working relationship

Recommendation - Delphi/STAR provided the safe space needed for growth which allowed conflict to be a healthy tool for understanding It is vital that this space and support be forthcoming from other INGOs to support continued growth

3 Issues and Recommendations

The report reflects the significant contribution Delphi/STAR made to the strengthening of women's NGOs in Macedonia Delphi/STAR succeeded in developing partnerships that contributed to the empowerment of the women and women's NGOs While not successful in meeting all the goals of the project plan, they were successful in addressing the general intent of the project in the time allotted

Since the Delphi/STAR project has closed and at the request of USAID, issues and recommendations have been identified for USAID to consider as it manages its democratic and civil society development portfolio

2 2 Appropriateness of Delphi/STAR Scope of Work given the 9 month Project Extension

2 2 R1 Support for Gender Equity through Women's NGOs

Issue - Gender inequity and traditional customs result in women and the girl child being the most marginalized members of society Women's NGOs are uniquely positioned to gain entrance to isolated communities without raising insurmountable resistance from male led traditional structures Women's NGOs will need continued technical assistance and funding to continue this important work in the development of civil society

Recommendation - USAID should ensure that women's NGOs who are committed to the development of women and civil society have resources targeted to support their work

2 3 Delphi/STAR's Contribution to NGO Sustainability

2 3 R1 Private Grant Management

Issue - Delphi/STAR Macedonia carried out a grant management process which benefited the NGOs who fully participated In two cases, NGOs received private grants through processes which disabled the STAR staff from requiring accountability In a comparison of results of NGO grants which benefited from STAR management and the two private grants which did not, STAR technical assistance in project conceptualization and accountability clearly improved the effectiveness of the project and the skills of the NGOs

Recommendation - Private grants awarded to less mature NGOs should comply with the high management standards in order to realize the full potential of the grant for NGO strengthening

2 3 R2 Subgrant Funding Period

Issue - The short subgrant funding period, 5 months from approval to completion including the 2 month summer holiday lull, mitigated against NGOs learning lessons of budgeting and disbursement of financial resources over an extended period As the STAR country coordinator said, "It teaches groups to spend money fast, not make it last

Recommendation - USAID and its partners need to support responsible NGO fiscal practices by ensuring maximum time for subgrant expenditures

2 3 R3 Support of Advocacy Skill Development

Issue - While there were IPA graduates who have demonstrated skills in advocacy, they were not ready nor did they have the capacity to share these skills with the larger women's NGO community Without specific technical support and a neutral convening organization, it is highly unlikely that advocacy skills will

be soon shared in a systematic way to empower women's NGOs to conceptualize and lead their own actions

Recommendation - USAID should encourage its partners to include women's NGOs in training, technical support and mentoring in advocacy to support them in transforming their current community education work into successful advocacy actions

2 3 R4 Use of Local Training Resource

Issue - A core of women have basic training skills in conflict resolution, and awareness raising and confidence building of young women They have worked in multi-ethnic teams who serve as models of the potential for all Macedonian women to build and rely on their own skills They have successfully carried out training but have no clear plans or funding to provide workshops to requesting groups

Recommendation - USAID partners are urged to support the use of the trainers when they are requested to do so by other USAID supported NGOs

2 4 Delphi/STAR's Contribution in Strengthening Multi-Ethnic Cooperation and Regional and International Linkages

2 4 R1 Support for Multi-Ethnic Cooperation

Issue - Women's NGOs have made progress in working together and women leaders are in place who have a shared experience of working together successfully across ethnic, age, umbrella and geographic boundaries Still, individuals and NGOs will need many more opportunities to work together, have conflicts and resolve them, in order to deepen and solidify their working relationship

Recommendation - Delphi/STAR provided the safe space needed for growth which allowed conflict to be a healthy tool for understanding It is vital that this space and support be forthcoming from other INGOs to support continued growth

Appendix A
PROJECT DESCRIPTION

WORK PLAN FOR DECEMBER 1997 - AUGUST 1998
THE STAR PROJECT OF DELPHI INTERNATIONAL
MACEDONIA

M ssion Statement

To foster women's participation in the development of civil society in the Yugoslav Successor States including Macedonia, through encouragement, technical assistance and financial support to non-nationalistic, advocacy-oriented women's NGOs and women leaders Delphi/STAR pursues this mission by supporting long-term sustainability through building capacity in public policy advocacy, democratic leadership, and developing linkages

I PUBLIC POLICY ADVOCACY TRAINING FOR NGOS

ACTIVITIES

A **IPA and Women in Politics** Summation and planning for future action of International Policy Advocacy (5) and Women in Politics (10) participants from Macedonia 15 women who have been trained in the US on advocacy and issue action will meet with Delphi/STAR co-directors and Macedonia coordinator to apply lessons to Macedonian environment and set plans for action campaigns and trainings in citizen action during the upcoming 9 months

B **Subgrants** (December-June, ongoing) Delphi/STAR will make subgrants up to $10,000 for advocacy campaigns, publishing/disseminating issue-based materials, specific training needs, exchanges/internships in region and ENI countries

C **Advocacy Training** The advocacy training team, 6 IPA graduates, will conduct 3 on-site training workshops for all members of selected Macedonian NGOs The selected NGOs will learn elements of advocacy, including strategic planning of issue action campaigns, to educate public, publicize concrete issues in media, and ultimately involve citizens to influence local government on specific targeted issues (examples domestic violence, women's health, employment action for single mothers)

D **Health Advocacy Network** This group of NGOs had been identified by Delphi/STAR staff and will convene 2 meetings NGO leaders will share approaches to community-based health projects breast cancer prevention *Iskra Bitola* and *Zivotna Iskra Skopje*, community health education, *LAW Tetova LAW Zhitoshe OZ Gostivar*, and *Daja Kumanovo* and domestic violence as a health issue, *SOS Telephone Skopje*, *SOS Kumanovo* and *HAESE*

E Media Training Local trainers from UMAM will provide 2 trainings to local NGOs to learn how to use media to support issue action campaigns

II Participatory Leadership and Organizational Development

A Local trainers will offer 2 conflict resolution training sessions for local women's organizations

Appendix A - Project Description 1

III SUSTAINABILITY

ACTIVITIES

A **Resource Development** Lael Stegall, Co-director of the Delphi/STAR project will provide resource development consultations to 4 partner NGOs These NGOs will be identified by the Delphi/STAR in consultation with the Advisory Board

B **Financial Management of Subgrants** Delphi/STAR Croatia coordinator Zvijezdana Schulz will conduct workshop and/or technical consultations in budgeting for subgrant applicants and will work with Delphi/STAR Macedonia staff in subgrant budgeting and financial reporting, further equipping the Macedonia staff to provide technical assistance to local NGOs

IV LINKAGES

ACTIVITIES

A **Advisory Board** Delphi/STAR Macedonian Advisory Board, comprised of 8 women from various NGOs around the country representing all the key ethnic groups, will meet with Delphi/STAR Macedonia staff and regional field director to monitor, evaluate and plan future Delphi/STAR activities in Macedonia There will be 3 meetings

B **East-East exchanges,** using subgrant funds and additional private funds, to finance participation of Macedonian women in apprenticeships, internships, and mentorships in specific projects on human rights income generation, single mothers' organizing and violence prevention in Yugoslav Successor States and neighboring countries

C Delphi/STAR **Regional Conference, May 1998** This third Delphi/STAR regional conference will focus again on Public Policy Advocacy 15 participants from Macedonia, selected by Delphi/STAR staff in conjunction with the Advisory board members, will attend the conference

D 200 copies of Project newsletter, STAR Tracks, will be translated into local languages

Appendix A - Project Description 2

Appendix B

SUMMARY OF DELPHI/STAR MIDTERM EVALUATION

In 1996, the Mid-term Evaluation reviewed all eight projects under Project 0016 The Delphi/STAR Project was acknowledged as differing from other projects in its potential for substantial outreach through its emphasis on communication projects, e-mail training and wide ranging networking, which was expected to reach women's groups and through the group, to families and the community

Delphi/STAR was seen as the strongest among the eight grantees in asserting that women should be viewed and treated not as victims but also as survivors, family and community leaders, and eventually, policy makers "

In addition, Delphi/STAR was recognized as one of four organizations identified as "seed planters (those who attempt to bring about far-reaching changes by working within existing structures)" Delphi/STAR was also recognized as one of two organizations contributing to peace through the development of civil society through advocacy

The evaluation noted that Delphi/STAR had no previous experience managing USAID contracts and while this had caused difficulties Delphi/STAR staff had managed to develop effective financial management systems The evaluators advised Delphi/STAR to continue to develop skills in making the approach and work of the project understood to the donor and the larger community

The evaluators observed that "dramatic under-staffing should be more crippling than it is" in carrying out effective projects in three diverse countries They credited the co-director's knowledge of local and regional culture, politics, ethnic issues, and pre-war government and economic systems as valuable in expediting efficient project implementation

Recommendations for all 0016 projects included encouraging greater collaboration among groups, clarification of objectives, improving evaluation skills to look at effects of activities, and seizing opportunities to realize greater short term effect and long-term impact

Specific recommendations for Delphi/STAR included

- focus on its existing objectives for the remainder of the grant period rather than seeking ever-new horizons
- continue and expand the process of women's empowerment through media to provide women with sources of support and information sharing
- reexamine its models to determine the level at which staff members assume responsibility for project activities and project evaluation
- work with grantees to delineate the ultimate aim of activities and make an effort to verify achievements

Appendix C

FINAL EVALUATION of

THE STRATEGIC TRAINING FOR ADVOCACY AND RECONCILIATION (STAR) PROJECT

Cooperative Agreement, EUR-A-94-00070-02
(formerly No EUR-0016-1-00-4070-00)

managed by Delphi International

part of the
Trauma and Humanitarian Assistance for the Former Yugoslavia Project (180-0016)
sponsored by the United States Agency for International Development

September 1994 to October 1997

Evaluators Waneen Polly
Marina Skrabalo

November 1997

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Strategic Training for Advocacy and Reconciliation Project (STAR) implemented by Delphi International was one of the eight grantees under the Trauma and Humanitarian Assistance for the Former Yugoslavia Project sponsored by USAID The three year project was carried out in Croatia, Bosnia-Herzegovina (BiH) and the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Macedonia) with USAID funds and the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY) with private funds

To support additions activities in the region including the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia, STAR expanded the network of donors and activists linked to the area as well as raising over $500,000 in private funding in three years for projects and leadership development

The project was designed to support emerging, indigenous women's organizations and women leaders in their capacity to develop sustainable, democratic, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) which were to serve as advocates for building civil society Delphi/STAR was to provide support through encouragement technical assistance training and provision of subgrants Areas targeted for support included networking for social change, organizational development, women's health, self-financing and micro-enterprise development, and citizen participation and democracy building

STAR successfully supported the development of targeted NGOs and women leaders and can be credited with significantly contributing to the overall sustainability of this loose network of women's NGOs STAR identified 51 non-nationalistic, advocacy-oriented women's organizations in the three USAID funded countries, 33 of these groups received STAR subgrants

STAR employed a participatory, needs-responsive approach to project planning and implementation This resulted in STAR project focus and technical assistance appropriately evolving as NGO partners and STAR matured and the social/political conditions and NGO environment changed In addition, STAR's partnership' approach to working with NGOs was seen by many NGOs as a model for other international NGOs to follow

Each USAID country office expressed overall support for the STAR project Concrete evidence of this support was demonstrated by the Croatia mission's award of a grant for a fourth year for the project, the extension of the cooperative agreement for Macedonia and BiH, and a expansion of the project with USAID funds in FRY

The STAR project significantly contributed to the overall sustainability of partner women's NGO in the areas of support of NGOs during the war crisis period, organizational and financial sustainability, network-building for social change and enhancing capacity for long-term local technical assistance STAR also effectively supported the development of public policy advocacy capacity of partner NGOs The STAR project can be credited with clearly contributing to the development of the NGO sector in each country in three aspects of the ENI Bureau NGO Sustainability Index, organizational capacity, financial viability, and advocacy

STAR's support of partner NGOs during the wars was an important contribution to partner NGOs' survival and growth By starting capacity building activities during the war, partner NGOs were better prepared to carry out the structural and programmatic transformation processes required to operate under the new funding conditions of the post war period While the impact of STAR support will be evidenced in the medium-term viability and contributions of participant NGOs and leaders, it appears that investing in NGO organizational strengthening during the crisis period can contribute to establishing a base for the development of civil society following the secession of conflict

STAR significantly contributed to the potential for financial sustainability of partner NGOs Many NGOs who participated in STAR s subgrant program or received self-financing technical assistance were better able to manage project funds, to realistic make and appraise business plans and to access a broader resource base Thirty percent of NGOs funded by STAR subgrants increased their sustainability by applying for and receiving additional grants from European donors and US private funding sources as well as local community and government contributions

STAR's work in the area of organizational development may be its most direct contribution to the development of sustainability of partner NGOs STAR addressed critical organization and leadership issues of NGO leaders as they arose through a series of excellent workshop Leaders reported applying newly acquired skills and models to develop more effective organizations Partner NGOs sought and received tailor-made assistance in meditation of conflicts and organizational management which allowed the organizations to address potentially crippling problems and move forward

On the whole, STAR sponsored subgrants contributed to organizational sustainability Subgrant projects strengthened individual NGO's credibility in their communities by addressing community needs Some NGOs, through these activities, positioned themselves to serve as advocates and activists for issues of

women's health, reconciliation, women in politics, and issues of local importance Of special note, was STAR's timely financial and technical support of projects which provided effective vehicles for trust-building among women, and in divided communities, served as models , and often first experiences, of citizen action for reconciliation

STAR did not create women's networks for social change, much to its credit, it did, however contribute significantly to strengthening and broadening the network of non-nationalistic, advocacy-oriented women's NGOs in each country The growth and deepening of the linkages between NGOs locally, nationally, regionally and internationally was a clear STAR contribution to the overall sustainability of women's NGOs

With an eye on the long-term local provision of technical support to less developed women's NGOs, STAR strengthen the capacity of local trainers/consultants and expanding the range of services NGOs were qualified to deliver This approach was seen as effective and was valued by local NGOs and consultants While STAR made a clear contribution to development of locally sustainable capacity building, it is important to note that of the 51 NGOs listed by STAR as network NGOs, only four, three from Croatia and one from BiH were positioned to provide technical assistance to other NGOs in the network through STAR subgrants and qualified local consultants had limited availability to provide external consultation

In the third year of the project, public policy advocacy was explicitly position as a central initiative for NGO capacity development While public policy advocacy was successfully carried out by local NGOs prior to STAR involvement, STAR's contributions could be seen in the development of a cadre of local leaders and potential leaders who had enhance skills in public policy advocacy There was greater general understanding of the meaning and effectiveness of advocacy as a global civic tool for social change In addition, there was an increase in partner NGOs who were supporting or carrying out local public policy advocacy actions

Areas of the STAR project that were underdeveloped included monitoring and evaluation in all areas management information and documentation systems, STAR team development and field staff mentoring, and serving as an advocate for women's NGOs and related policy in each nation's international development and government communities

The concerns raised by partner NGOs can be summarized as issues of transparency in operation, clarity of communication and problem solving, and formalization of processes and policies STAR has recognized and begun to address these issues through development of a field policy and procedure manual and changes in management structure and systems for the fourth year of the project

Recommendations for STAR Project Extension

Even with the tenacious energy of many of the NGOs and the solid contribution of the STAR Project, the work of the supporting women's NGOs to be sustainable effective players in the development of civil society is far from over There will continue to be a place for an evolving portfolio of STAR support for a period in each country It is the hope of the evaluation team that the STAR project can negotiate secured support from USAID and other donors to complete the essential elements of the work before closing the project

Key recommendations for the STAR Project s extension follow

> STAR need to model the practices of organizational management, transparency, leadership, group facilitation advocacy and conflict resolution that STAR promotes in its training workshops for NGO partners To enhance effectiveness, STAR should consolidate staff experience and articulate refined approaches in grant management and project development, especially in the areas of micro-enterprise and health, which address the changing needs of the maturing women's groups STAR staff should be provided with opportunities to enhance their skills in these areas
>
> In order to expand partner NGOs access to resources for long term sustainability and influence the evolution of the NGO sector, STAR needs to articulate its role as an international NGO and to position

itself in the international community in each country STAR needs to ensure that country staff enhance or obtain skills required to represent STAR and advocate for STAR partner NGOs in governmental and international circles

While STAR's informal monitoring processes may have been adequate for determining strategies and directions in the past, maturation of NGOs and the addition of country level staff teams make the formalization of the monitoring and evaluation systems a requirement for the program STAR staff need to be comfortable and competent at monitoring and evaluating their country programs, and in supporting NGOs in the development of ongoing monitoring and project evaluation skills

Given the effectiveness of training workshops, issue-oriented exchanges, and regional conferences as a mechanism to enhance leadership skills, build networks for social change and contribute to reconciliation, donors should continue to support these activities if STAR and the women leaders believe that a specific agenda would benefit from being carried out in a local or regional forum

As STAR's focus and approach to public policy advocacy have generated and enriched local advocacy work and contributed to regional cross-fertilization, the continuation of the program both on national and regional level is a logical next step STAR has shown commitment to the adaptation of American-based advocacy skills and tools to local conditions and should continue to support this action as well as to support NGOs in considering the culturally closer European models

STAR needs to better record advocacy processes and outcomes so that it can document the contributions to the development of civil society building by women's NGOs and use this to advocate for support of women's projects with the international community

STAR has managed grants effectively and should, since local women's NGOs are not yet positioned or desirous of the task, continue to manage a fund portfolio However, STAR must formalize its subgrant evaluation process, document subgrant results and model the evaluation process to NGO partners

USAID should streamline its grant approval procedures to a support a cost effective, time efficient country level process

NGO financial sustainability support should continue to be part of the full portfolio for STAR's future work However, each country's economic environment and the limitations of NGOs are serious constraints to effectiveness of micro-enterprise ventures in the short run Therefore, STAR should focus its efforts on activities that empower NGOs to be effective in fundraising internationally and locally

If STAR chooses to work in the area of micro-enterprise as part of the advocacy mandate, STAR must provide a more clear and coherent economic empowerment program based on the lessons learned from past experiences and current local and global trends STAR should access qualified technical resources to carry through such a program, through contracts with local resources and linkages with economic empowerment projects

If donors are interested in identifying models for effective transformation of NGOs created in crisis to the post war situations, STAR s work should be looked to for examples

In Macedonia, STAR needs to include conflict resolution as key part of its portfolio of activities, seeking to engage the Advisory Board and other prominent women leaders in strategic planning, and to build local resources for long-term meditation support

As part of the STAR exit strategy and in its work with the international community, sustainable systems for compensation for capacity building services rendered by one NGO or individual for another need to be developed STAR needs to identify resource NGOs and consultants who are

interested and available to carry out more central roles in long-term NGO network support and support these groups and individuals

Since the consultation role is new to many STAR supported consultants, professional ethics need to be discussed, clearly articulated and agreed upon by groups and individuals providing and receiving support through STAR

Appendix D

TERMS OF REFERENCE

MACEDONIA FINAL PROJECT EVALUATION

1 - 7 November 1998

Questions to be addressed include

- What value has Delphi/STAR added

  - in strengthening of multi-ethnic cooperative working relationships among women and women's NGOs and other local institutions on concrete issues (such as women's health community violence, leadership development of young women and conflict resolution)

  - in the development of a local base of facilitators and trainers

- In what ways have subgrants been effective in meeting their stated objectives as well as their effectiveness as tools for NGO strengthening

- What elements has Delphi/STAR contributed to the financial and organizational sustainability of individual women's NGOs?

- What has been and are the expected benefits of individual and group linkages locally, nationally, internationally and regionally?

- Was the scope of the work appropriate for the time frame of the project?

Appendix E

Delphi/STAR MACEDONIA MATERIALS REVIEWED

Project Subgrant Proposals and Reports

Association of Single Mothers of Shtip - 98 proposal and report
Center for Urban and Media Action of Macedonia - 98 proposal
League of Albanian Women of Macedonia - Gostivar Branch - 98 proposal and report
League of Albanian Women of Macedonia - Struga Branch - 98 proposal and report
Organization of Roma Women "Daja" - 98 proposal, 97 and 98 report
Organization of Roma Women "Daja" - Delchevo - 98 proposal and report
Organization of Women of Commune in Gazi Baba - 98 proposal, 97 and 98 report
Organization of Women of Commune of Sveti Nikole - 98 proposal and report
Organization of Women of Gostivar - 98 proposal, 97 and 98 report
Union of Albanian Women of Macedonia - Skopje Branch - 98 proposal and report
Women's Organization of Bitola - 98 proposal, 97 and 98 report
Women's Organization of Probistip - 98 report

Delphi/STAR Publications

Public Policy Advocacy Women for Social Change in the Yugoslav Successor States
International Fundraising Guide

Delphi/STAR Reports

Advocacy Report by Kathleen Sheekey
MoR Workshop Facilitators Communication and Internal Evaluation
Regional Exchange Program reports and application process
Resource Mobilization - Fundraising Issues in Training Workshop outline
Staff Meeting Agenda (Jan) and minutes April and October
STAR Tracks - Winter 1997, Summer/fall 1997
Subgrant announcement

Others

Hyatt Jenny, with Cooper, Libby and Knight, Barry	*From transition to development the non-profit sectors of Central and Eastern Europe* Charities Evaluation Service March 1998
ISC	Institute for Sustainable Communities - Report 1997
MCIM	Macedonian Center for International Cooperation - Annual Report 1997 NGO Bulletin" - Year I Number 2

Year II Number 3
Year II Number 5

Stubbs, Paul — Social Reconstruction and Social Development in Croatia and Slovenia the role of the NGO sector " Abstract, Summary and Research Report for the Economic and Social Committee for Overseas Research of the Overseas Development Administration June 1996

USAID Reports — 1998 December NGO Sustainability Analysis

Appendix F

Delphi/STAR MACEDONIA EVALUATION CONTACTS LIST

Skopje

Delphi/STAR - Macedonia	Edith Johnson, Country Project Coordinator Natasa Milenkovic, Project Assistant
USAID - Macedonia	Brad Fujimoto, Program Officer Melita Cokrevska, Asst Program Officer
Institute for Sustainable Communities (ISC)	Terry Armstrong, Country Director
Macedonia Center for International Cooperation (MCIC)	Saso Klekovski, Program Director Lucija Popovska, Civic Society Program Coordinator
Center for Urban and Media Action in Macedonia (UMAM)	Biljana Bejkova, IPA participant, group leader Kornelija Bukleska Natasa Todorovska Eli Bejkova
Organization of Women of Gazi Baba	Dragica Ristovska, President Jule Trajkovic, Coordinator Maja Dilberova Sanja Ristovska
KuKuLeLe	Lindita Azizi, Town of Ohrid youth leader, CR Trainer Violeta Ristovska, leader of Iskra at Bitola, Advisory Board, CR Trainer Nedmije Asani, member of League of Albanian Women Zhitoshe
Roma Rights Center	Azbija Mehmedova, Director, IPA participant, Advisory Board
Humanitarian Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Equality (HAESE)	Mjellma Mehmeti, IPA participant Dr Biljana Gerasimovska, Group Leader, Advisory Board
Delphi/STAR Advisory Board	Violeta Ristovska, Kristina Al-Jarrah, Azbija Mehmedova, Dr Biljana Gerasimovska Aneta Jordanovska, Safie Deari

Gostivar

Organization of Women of Macedonia - Gostivar	Kristina Al-Jarrah, group leader, Women and Politics Participant, Advisory Board OD trainee, CR trainer Mara Nezir Kostadinka Palazova Persa Dukovska Rumena Jovanoska
League of Albanian Women Gostivar	Safie Deari, group leader, Women and Politics Participant, Advisory Board, CR trainer Merita Emullai

	Diturije Mustafi Drita Kaprolli Selvie Saliu Magbule Vreskalla Ejupi Lafime Adifete Kaprolli
Turkish Women's Association	Sadika Aga, group leader
Shtip	
Association of Single Mothers of Shtip	Pavlina Temelkova, group leader, OD trainee Aleksandra Srbinovska, Women in Politics Participant Ratka Stosanova Puzica Ilievska Blaga Miceva Lidija Ristova
Kumanovo	
Organization of Women of Kumanovo	Mladeva Jacimovska group coordinator Aneta Jordanovska, Advisory Board CR trainer Nezakete Saliu
Organization of Roma Women - "Daja"	Dilbera Kamberovska, group leader CR trainer Alma Sakipovska Remzija Ramadanova, Secretary Meleka Zekirovska Elvira Skenderovska
Delchevo	
Organization of Roma Women - Delchevo	Anifa Demicovsna, leader of Organization of Roma Women, lawyer for Women's Legal Counseling Center Desa Hristova, lawyer for Women's Legal Counseling Center
Sveti Nikole	
Organization of Women - Sveti Nikole	Vera Zlateva, group leader Pavsina Stojanova Violeta Miseva Zona Naskova Slobodenka Spomenkova Mirjana Zineva Biljana Dimova Vroska Stojevska Violeta Ristova Biljana Domova
Regional Programs	
Delphi/STAR	Allison Campbell, Program Administrator Jill Benderly, Regional Director
Advocacy Institute	Kathleen Sheekey, Co - Director
Consultants	Vesna Terselic, organisation development trainer Marina Skrabalo, evaluation consultant

Lael Stegall former Delphi/STAR Co-Director

Appendix G

Delphi/STAR MACEDONIA EVALUATION FIELD TRIP ITINERARY

November 2, 1998, Monday

Skopje	Delphi/STAR Macedonia KuKuLeLe USAID Advisory Board

November 3, 1998, Tuesday

Delchevo	Organization of Roma Women - Daja
Shtip	Association of Single Mothers
Sveti Nikole	Organization of Women of Sveti Nikole

November 4, 1998, Wednesday

Kumanovo	Roma Women's Organization of Macedonia Daja" SOS Telephone Kumanovo

November 5, 1998, Thursday

Skopje	Organization of Women Gazi Baba
Gostivar	Organization of Women Gostivar League of Albanian Women Turkish Women's Group

November 6, 1998, Friday

Skopje	Humantarian Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Education (HAESE) Center for Urban and Media Action of Macedonia (UMAM) USAID Institute for Sustainable Communities (ISC) Macedonia Center for International Cooperation (MCIC)

November 7, 1998, Saturday

Skopje	Delphi/STAR Macedonia Travel to Sarajevo

Appendix H

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱

Organization	
Contact Woman	Teuta Arifi
Telephone	(389)-621-374, **Ext**
Fax	226-365
Home Telephone	276-961
Address	Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Association of Roma Women "Cherenje"
Contact Woman	Enise Demirova
Telephone	(389)-092-384-248
Fax	
Home Telephone	092-329-17
Address	Home Pirinska 67 Shtip / 92000 MK

Organization	Association of Roma Women "Esma"
Contact Woman	Ramiza Sakip
Telephone	(389)- **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Association of Roma Women "Esma'
Contact Woman	Nadire Selman
Telephone	(389)-116-113, **Ext**
Fax	234-815
Home Telephone	
Address	Samoilova bb Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Association of Single Mothers
Contact Woman	Todorka Slaveva
Telephone	(389)-092-443-955 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	092-441-464
Address	Kocho Racin 43-2/1 Sveti Nikole / 92220 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

✩★✩✱✱✱✱✲✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✲✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✲✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✲✣✱✱

Organization	Association of Single Mothers
Contact Woman	Pavlina Temelkova
Telephone	(389)-092-390-966, **Ext**
Fax	092-390-966
Home Telephone	092-390-425
Address	Home Ante Banina 5/19 Shtip / 92000 MK

Organization	Association of Single Mothers of Macedonia
Contact Woman	Jagoda Kostovska
Telephone	(389)-236-313 **Ext**
Fax	236-313
Home Telephone	365-125
Address	Vasil Gjorgov br 39 baraka 2 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Association of Single Parents "Nadezh"
Contact Woman	Violeta Pavlovska
Telephone	(389)-090-321-252 **Ext**
Fax	090-321-252
Home Telephone	090-321-508
Address	Nikola Karev br 8 Kochani / 91000 MK

Organization	Association of Vlah Women
Contact Woman	Vanja Mihajlova Sterjova
Telephone	(389)-269-610 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Home Bul Jane Sandanski 77/III-39 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Centre for Urban and Media Action of Macedonia
Contact Woman	Biljana Bejkova
Telephone	(389)-117-096, **Ext**
Fax	117-586
Home Telephone	421-139
Address	Maksim Gorki 14-9 Skopje / 91000 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱✩★✩✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱

Organization	Flaka
Contact Woman	Syzana Ahmeti
Telephone	(389)-116-366 **Ext** 283
Fax	224-829
Home Telephone	
Address	Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	HAESE (Hum Asoc za Emc , Solid , i Ednakvost
Contact Woman	Biljana Gerasimovska
Telephone	(389)-224-823, **Ext**
Fax	224-823
Home Telephone	
Address	Partizanski odredi 37/1/24 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Humanitarian Organization "Majka"
Contact Woman	Gordana Mitrovska
Telephone	(389)-090-122-525, **Ext**
Fax	090-122-525
Home Telephone	090-127-450
Address	Narodna Revolucija 12 Tode Mendol 21 Kumanovo / 91300 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women
Contact Woman	Myqereme Rusi
Telephone	(389)-094-293-05, **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	094-201-76
Address	c/o Drita Selmani ul 175 br 31 Mala Rechica Tetovo / 91220 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱

Organization	League of Albanian Women
Contact Woman	Drita Selmani
Telephone	(389)-, **Ext**
Fax	094-249-76
Home Telephone	094-251-98
Address	ul 175 br 31 Mala Rechica Tetovo / 91220 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Bitola
Contact Woman	Lirije Nexhipi
Telephone	(389)-097-475-64 **Ext**
Fax	097-221-224
Home Telephone	097-225-978
Address	Bitola / 91000 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Bitola
Contact Woman	Fatmin Taipi
Telephone	(389)-097-416-18, **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Home Ohridska 130 Bitola / 97000 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Debar
Contact Woman	Qauser Axhiregja
Telephone	(389)-096-815-26, **Ext**
Fax	096-815-26
Home Telephone	096831526
Address	Home Leninova 29 Debar / MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Krushevo i Prilep
Contact Woman	Ajsere Asani
Telephone	(389)-098-473-089, **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	091-327-817
Address	ul Smileska 5B 91060 Skopje s Zhitoshe, Krushevo / 97526 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱

Organization	League of Albanian Women Ohrid
Contact Woman	Lindita Azizi
Telephone	(389)-, **Ext**
Fax	096-759-88
Home Telephone	096-341-51
Address	Ohrid / 96000 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Skopje
Contact Woman	Nurije Kadriu
Telephone	(389)-266-000 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Home Gjorgji Pop Hristov, blok 6-7/7 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women - Krushevo and Prilep
Contact Woman	Sabaxeta Mersimi
Telephone	(389)-098-730-98 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Zhitoshe / MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women, Gostivar
Contact Woman	Safie Dexari
Telephone	(389)-094-626-76, **Ext**
Fax	094-683-11
Home Telephone	094-668-88
Address	Home Belichica 41a Gostivar / 91230 MK

Organization	League of Albanian Women Ohrid
Contact Woman	Myqereme Hidri
Telephone	(389)-096-370-47 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Ohridski brigadi 58 Ohrid / 96000 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✱✣✱✱

Organization	Macedonian Center for Int'l Cooperation
Contact Woman	Lucija Popovska
Telephone	(389)-365-381, **Ext**
Fax	365-298
Home Telephone	
Address	Nikola Parapunov bb P O Box 835 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Organizacija na zhenite na Bitola "Iskra"
Contact Woman	Marica Veljanoska
Telephone	(38)-09-721-453 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Partizanska 122/101 Bitola / 97000

Organization	Organizacija of Women Struga
Contact Woman	Dragica Poposka
Telephone	(389)-096-735-78 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Gjuro Salaj 2 Struga / 96500 MK

Organization	Organizacijata no zhenite na Skopje
Contact Woman	Evka Topuzovska
Telephone	(389)-332-219, **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	ul Visil Gorgov bb Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Organization of Single Parents "Nadezh'
Contact Woman	Stanka Apostolova
Telephone	(389)-090-325-117 **Ext**
Fax	090-321-074
Home Telephone	
Address	Aleksandar Makedonski 3 Kochani / 92300 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✲✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✲✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✲✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✲✢✱✱

Organization	Organization of Women of Gostivar
Contact Woman	Kristina Al-Jarrah
Telephone	(389)-094-651-76 **Ext**
Fax	094-686-45
Home Telephone	094-651-76
Address	Home Mara Ugrinova 52/7 Gostivar / 91230 MK

Organization	Organization of Women of Gostivar
Contact Woman	Silvana Tomecka
Telephone	(389)- **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	094-664-48
Address	Mara Urginova 56 Gostivar / 91203 MK

Organization	Organization of Women of Kumanovo
Contact Woman	Jagoda Gligorovska
Telephone	(389)-0901-27-314 **Ext**
Fax	0901-24-161
Home Telephone	0901-26-923
Address	Done Bozhinov 24 Kumanovo / 91300 MK

Organization	Organization of Women of Probishtip
Contact Woman	Vinka Angelovic
Telephone	(389)-092-483-137, **Ext**
Fax	092-483-137
Home Telephone	092-483-220
Address	Home Jordan Stojanov 17 Probistip / 92220 MK

Organization	Organization of Women of Skopje
Contact Woman	Krstina Delceva
Telephone	(389)-233-827 **Ext**
Fax	234-815
Home Telephone	211-708
Address	11 Oktomvri 17 Home Naroden Front 27/5 Skopje / 91000 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✱✢✱✱

Organization	Organization of Women of Struga
Contact Woman	Uranija Popovska
Telephone	(389)-, **Ext**
Fax	096-710-28
Home Telephone	096-713-93
Address	Home Pablo Neruda 21 Struga / 96500 MK

Organization	Organization of Women of Veles
Contact Woman	Mirjana Trajkova
Telephone	(389)-093-222-59, **Ext**
Fax	093-339-41
Home Telephone	
Address	Home Orce Martinov 27 Veles / 93000 MK

Organization	Organization of Women Opshtina Gazi Baba
Contact Woman	Dragica Ristovska
Telephone	(389)-618-303, **Ext**
Fax	618-303
Home Telephone	172-093
Address	Petre Georgiev b b (Gazi Baba) Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Roma Women's Org of Macedonia "Daja"
Contact Woman	Dilbera Kamberovska
Telephone	(389)-090-130-691 **Ext**
Fax	090-130-691
Home Telephone	090-126-444
Address	Bajram Shabani b b Kumanovo / 91300 MK

Organization	Roma Women's Org of Macedonia "Daja" branch
Contact Woman	Vasvie Ahmed
Telephone	(389)-092-441-736 **Ext**
Fax	
Home Telephone	
Address	Vera Cirivin 27 Sveti Nikole / 92220 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✱✣✱✱

Organization	SOS Telefon
Contact Woman	Azbija Memedova
Telephone	(389)-618-575 **Ext**
Fax	618-575
Home Telephone	268-840
Address	Branislav Nusic 7/11/11 Metodija Mitevski 1/6/11 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	SOS Telephone, Women and Child Victims of Viol
Contact Woman	Nadezhda Mitkovska
Telephone	(389)-9700, **Ext**
Fax	613-073
Home Telephone	424-829
Address	11 Oktomvri 17 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Spark of Life
Contact Woman	Violeta Tomovska
Telephone	(389)-163-638, **Ext**
Fax	163-638
Home Telephone	234-089
Address	Dame Gruev 3-7/3 Skopje / 91000 MK

Organization	Union of Women's Organization of Macedonia
Contact Woman	Savka Todorovska
Telephone	(389)-126-185, **Ext**
Fax	126-185
Home Telephone	255-261
Address	Vasil Gjorgov br 39 baraka 4 Skopje / 91000 MK

Delphi International STAR Project
Women's Organizations in the Republic of Macedonia

This is a listing of the women's organizations in Macedonia who have received training or received grants from Delphi/STAR

☆★☆✱✱✱✲✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✲✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✲✣✱✱☆★☆✱✱✱✲✣✱✱

Organization	Women's Humanitarian Organization "Bisera"
Contact Woman	Marija Mladenovska
Telephone	(389)-096-264-469, **Ext**
Fax	096-264-469
Home Telephone	096-242-70
Address	Dimitar Vlahov 52 Ohrid / 96000 MK

Organization	Women's Union "Iskra"
Contact Woman	Violeta Ristovska
Telephone	(389)-097-333-71 **Ext**
Fax	097-354-83
Home Telephone	097-227-264
Address	Bitola / 97000 MK

Appendix I

WOMEN'S VOICES for the 1997 September Final Evaluation, Section 2 8

Delphi/STAR's Contribution to Development of Individual Women Leaders

Based on interviews with women and the STAR evaluation questionnaires, STAR's programs and approaches to women contributed to individual women leaders skills, self-confidence, political awareness community status and sense of being connected with other women from the region and internationally

Skill Development

NGO leaders and members reported gaining skills, the development of which some women attribute to STAR's programs, including leadership, facilitation, public presentation, non-violent communication, financial management, grant writing, training of others in advocacy, program development, and strategic thinking Below are examples of women's experiences

Skill Development Credited to STAR

- *Quotes from women leaders and groups members*

I gained a lot from STAR I gained experience in terms of very basic skills - how to budget how to work with people how to do training with women I also gained willingness to work in this field

- *A young Bosnian woman, currently an INGO program manager who worked as STAR staff when she was a refugee in Macedonia*

Four years ago we would not have been able to do this work because we literally did not know how to listen to others We still need workshops organized by STAR to work on our communication and tolerance of others "

- *A Bosnian advocacy trainer who started her work in a women's NGO as a translator*

Leadership training provided me with an opportunity to see what kind of a person I am and what problems I have as a leader They contributed to my self-understanding

- *A Bosnian Project Leader*

A husband of one of our members of the inter-ethnic co-operation project in, Eastern Slavonia visited one of our meetings He was surprised that we were apparently able to communicate democratically listening and respecting each other He said that he and other men he knew were not able to do it and expressed a wish to join us

- *A group leader from Osijek*

"Had it not been for Delphi/STAR I would not be where I am now in my life I just got a job to run the first Roma Human Rights Center in Macedonia 90% of such an outcome can be attributed to the skills I gained thanks to my participation in IPA Training for which I was selected by STAR STAR knows how to spot out and stimulate quality

- *A young Roma leader from Macedonia*

At the Regional Conference on Hvar I attended a workshop on advocacy for women s health The last day we were asked to write a project proposal for an idea of our own We were given 30 minutes to do it As project proposal writing and program development are highly mystified in all organizations, and only one woman is usually considered knowledgeable that exercise gave me a great sense of security and confidence that I was able to do it myself I feel competent to design a small project myself and send it to any foundation "

- *A journalist and activist from Sarajevo*

"STAR played a crucial role in enhancing financial management skills of the Women's Club Pakrac In a small destroyed ethnically still divided xenophobic town in Western Slavonia a woman is running a public panel discussion on abortion It is remarkable and highly unusual The leader of Women's Club has advanced her skills incredibly in the course of the last three years She negotiates with funders on her own she learned English she is openly politically engaged in peace and women s issues she is a great facilitator and conflict manager Some of it is her own

willingness and talent but also there is contribution of STAR other training and general support of other women "
- Various women leaders from Croatia

"On Hvar the workshop on political advocacy was very useful We were pushed to think and present our knowledge to others We also facilitated the workshop We were not degraded to persons who can only be taught by international women "
- An established civil leader in Bosnia

STAR helped me personally I m the leader and I guide the group STAR guides me It has saved us ten years in time it would have taken us to develop
- Leader of a rural group in Macedonia

The women's voices confirm that acquisition of new skills stimulated women leaders' self-confidence and sense of power in influencing their social environment

Leadership and Political Awareness

A major obstacle to social action has been, in the view of many women from different post-Yugoslav countries, resistance on the part of women activists to recognize their work as political Traditionally political action has been reduced to political party and Government politics Since political parties and the politics of national leaders were often seen as a central causes for the hatred that fueled regional conflicts women have been seeking paths different from the social mainstream and are exploring new definitions of political action

Similarly, leadership has been associated with power relationship and behaviors which women did not wish to emulate In the absence of knowledge and experience with alternative models, women often did not recognize the potential nor the benefits of leadership

Women's acceptance of political action and leadership as tools they can employ to achieve alternative political and social agendas is a key shift in thinking and behavior that can contribute to the process of building civil society and democracy in the region Some women shared their experience of overcoming their misgivings about politics and leadership The quotes following reflect STAR's contribution to this process

Accepting Leadership and Political Action as Tools
- Quotes from women leaders during field interviews

Through STAR Leadership training I and other women managed to overcome our resistance and sense of dependence on politics We started thinking in different terms and about different issues '
- An activist from Banja Luka Republic Srpska BiH

I remember the first meeting of the Advisory Board Jill mentioned politics and I screamed immediately Move politics away from me! We were at that time all frightened to speak out In the meantime we have grown '
- A Croatian activist

'I always related leadership to politics It took me half an hour at a seminar to stop rebelling against such a notion later I took it seriously because I finally understood what it really meant
- An activist from Sarajevo

At a women's human rights training maybe there were three of us who knew what women's human rights were It was helpful to me to understand the course of events and that my energy invested in this kind of work will be of use and benefit to my grand- daughter '
- A journalist activist from Sarajevo

I was in the US (on the women and politics program) and saw women s NGOs who had been fighting for 20 years for rights I realized that I am not alone in my thoughts I am not an alien There are other women like me '
- A Macedonian political activist

Community Respect, Self-Confidence and Credibility

Women reported that their organizations and, therefore, they themselves, have gained respect, confidence and credibility in their communities Single mothers felt this respect had a positive impact on their children STAR's support, both technical and through subgrants, has contributed to the growth and success of these organizations

Gaining Self-Confidence, Community Respect and Credibility
- *Quotes from women leaders and members*

"It is most important to become aware that a woman can succeed that she can lead a group that if a man can do it, a woman can do it too There is a great dependence on men in our society women ask for permission to act, so STAR training, e g leadership and all the contacts and exchange of information and support are of great value "
- *A group leader from Osijek*

"I have support from young people and male friends I always felt equal to my male friends Now the men say I am leading them They are afraid for me I don t care what (group) I am in (or if they send me out of the group) We are all nothing I can work (with the youth) as nobody
- *Youth leader in Macadonia*

Seven years ago women who were not married were seen as whores We needed to show this town that we were equal with married women We needed to show that we were strong and show by our work what we could do in the interest of women the community and citizens We feel the respect of the community by a greater number of women joining - we now have 20 or 30 married women Our name was accepted and it is easier to find sponsors for our work The effect on the children is that we tell them the truth so they do not have to feel ashamed we talk a lot about out kids and make them feel special
- *Leader of a group that has many single mothers in Macadonia*

Regional Links and Networks

Empowerment which is closely related to the change of attitudes and acquisition of skills is also linked with the establishment of connections between women from different areas of ex-Yugoslavia, whose societies have been at war or in conflict with each other STAR had a clear commitment to building in-country and regional networks of women who are showed readiness to meet the "other side" despite fear of the contact and disloyalty to one's own side Such opportunities were appreciated by the women

"At the regional conference in Struga while the war was still going on in Bosnia I met women from Serbia for the first time (since the beginning of war) I was delighted by their way of thinking It was truly important to me I did not know they existed "
- *A Sarajevo journalist*

I will never forget a sentence of a woman from the Republic Srpska that she and other women experienced great anxiety and fear of the first encounter ever with women from the Federation and that anxiety and fear dissolved five minutes into the encounter We also manage to exchange authentic information as many of us did not know what was happening on the other side for real due to the fact that media are just a huge propaganda machine
- *A journalist from Sarajevo*

The dialogue between Zagreb and Belgrade feminists sponsored by STAR in 1995 was the first time for us to really have a deep dialogue as opposed to the "road visits" - the show that usually happens when you need to represent a nice picture to internationals, how despite the war we get along It was really meaningful "
- *An established feminist and group leader from Zagreb*

"The conflict resolution training organized by STAR was my first encounter ever with the notion of conflict which was not automatically negative For the first time I actually communicated with Macedonian women It did not happen immediately and it is of course not enough lots of mistrust exists but I felt I could communicate with them That seminar made a deep impact on me "

- *An Albanian activist in Macedonia*

One aspect of STAR's democratic leadership approach to local women's NGOs has been to view NGOs as groups of individuals who all brought their personal histories and future hopes into the co-operation with STAR Such acknowledgment of the person, not only the project or idea enabled STAR to facilitate processes which had impact on women as growing individuals While STAR efforts were inter-related with women networking on their own, other seminars, and in-group support the evaluation shows that local women acknowledged STAR as a force to be credited with making a significant contribution to individual women's empowerment

Based on the information gained through this evaluation, it can be suggested that respect and readiness to assist individuals in their development as leaders seems to be an effective element in the development of local capacity for building civil society

Recommendation

USAID should regard the individual development of local partners as a relevant indicator of a capacity building project's success

Appendix J - Calender of Events 1998

STAR Macedonia Calendar of Events
1998

	JAN	FEB	MAR	APRIL	MAY
Advocacy	Health Advocacy Network 1 Igballe Rogova Rachel Wareham fac 13 NGOs		IPA Kathleen Sheekey fac individuals meetings with 5 IPA women in Mac		HAN2 Morana Palikovic Biljana Bejkova fac on media training, same pps
Advocacy			BaBe workshop on women's part in elections, we suggested pp's		
Org Dev		Reg TOT, Org Dev Ajsere Kristina Safie Stephanie facilitated, Banja Luka			Con Res Awareness fac training, 9 pp, Mali Korak, fac's then Team 1 led wkendtraining, 10 NGOs, 20 pps
Links	(Staff meeting)			Mak Advisory board - old and new boards convened in Shtip, 1-day	Res Mob pilot workshop
YW			KuKuLeLe 1, Zhitoshe Nexhmije led	KuKuLeLe 2, Shtip Liljana	KKLL 3 Kumanovo, Lil&Nexh
Grant	Grants application and rev	Grant application and revision		Grants distributed	

	JUN	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT
Adv		HAN 3 Biljana Bejkova and Azbija Memedova fac , same pp's		SOS Training, Slovenian SOS fac for 2SOS NGOs	
Org Dev	MOR II, Struga, Stephanie fac				ConRes team 2 site visit Sveti Nikole
Link	Advisory Board 2 Gostivar with Turkish Org of W (Staff meeting)				Advisory Board (Staff meeting)
Link			Exchanges including Fem Summer School	Exchanges including Porec conf	Young Women
YW		KKLL4 Ohrid Lindita	KKLL 5 Ohrid Violeta		KKLL 6 30 repeat young women Gostivar
Grants				Interim grant reports due Sep 1	Final grant reports due Oct 30

Appendix J - Calender of Events - 1

APPENDIX K

1998 Subgrants Awarded STAR Project Macedonia

Group	City	Project Description	Money Granted	Private/ USAID
Organization of Single Mothers	Shtip	General support	5 000	P
	Kumanovo	General support	5 000	P
Urban and Media Action in Macedonia	Skopje	Training women in media relations	15 000	P

1998, Second Quarter Grants

Iskra	Bitola	Preventive breast cancer, follow-up on grant, with expanded outreach into Roma and Albanian communities in Bitola - Violeta	2 440	U
Org of Women of Gazibaba	Skopje	Training 100 women in employment enhancing computer skills	5 083	U
Org of W of Gostivar	Gostivar	Workshops on domestic violence and organizational devel't among local Gostivar women's organizations	3 608	U
Organization of Roma W Daja	Kumanovo	Developing a country-wide network of Roma women professionals	3 141	U
Org of W of Kumanovo	Kumanovo	Increasing women's issues coverage on private local television through a regular interview show run by the women's NGO	3,700	U
Org of Roma Wmn Daja branch	Delchevo	Legal counselling center for marginalized women staffed by a Roma-Macedonian team of women lawyers, with outreach to the Roma and Macedonain communities	5 372	U
League of Albanian Women	Gostivar	Increasing the number Albanian girls in surrounding villages who take the examination and register for secondary school in Gostivar	5 000	P
Org of W of Probishtip	Probishtip	Women's health education - women and cancer	5 000	P
Org of W Sveti Nikole	Sveti Nikole	Lectures on cancer for rural women	1 530	U
League of Albanian Women	Struga	Broadening health education among Albanian women and young Albanian women in Struga and the surrounding villages	5 000	P
League of Albanian Women	Skopje	Health lectures for Albanian women, Sat afternoons, in 4 neighborhoods First outreach to marginalized Albanian women through the schools	5,000	P
TOTAL			69 874	

Appendix K - Mac Subgrant

Appendix L

THE DELPHI/STAR REGIONAL EXCHANGE PROGRAM

The Regional Exchange Program was a new program of the Delphi/STAR Project in 1998 It sought to "support the establishment of cooperative program links among the region's NGOs"

Through this flexible program, Delphi/STAR offered women the opportunity to learn directly from other NGOs who had successful projects underway or to participate in each other's conferences Transforming experience into concrete results will take time and were not yet evident at the time of the evaluation However, women's reports of their experience were full of visions of the possible and practical ideas that could enrich their own programs

The Exchange Program consisted of exchanges of activists to groups within their own country or the YSS, visits between in-country groups, and internships to education programs and conferences More than 40 exchanges and internships with more than 60 women participating were supported (the final number not yet available from the Delphi/STAR Project because the FRY exchanges are not completed)

Funding for the new program came from a variety of sources A private funder provided $2000 per country to start the Exchange Program Delphi/STAR used these funds to leverage additional funds from USAID, the Shaler-Adams Foundation and other private donors Delphi/STAR, seeing that YSS women were organizing their own conferences, canceled plans for a Delphi/STAR regional conference and supported local efforts by reassigning Delphi/STAR funds to cover women's participation in YSS initiated conferences

Responsibility for initiating the exchange lay with individual applicants and NGOs who offered to host Each participant was responsible for exchange budgeting, logistics, and reporting Delphi/STAR matched and negotiated exchange requests, paid cost for travel, food, accommodation and visas

The evaluator spoke with thirteen women who had participated in exchanges and to six groups who had hosted exchanges in Croatia, Macedonia, and BiH The FRY exchange Program was scheduled for review in February Additionally, written reports were reviewed Delphi/STAR had not done its own summary and review of the Exchange Program at the time of in - country evaluation

Participants reported that the visits had been valuable Many believed they had established linkages that would assist them in their future work Examples of exchanges follow

- A Croatian women visiting Bosnia was encouraged to see how the coalition of women's NGOs which educated women about women's voting rights resulted in more women candidates being elected and how people living in difficult circumstances help each other

- Croatian exchanges resulted in a groups gaining guidance on proposal writing and fundraising, and built links for further assistance

- Groups working with refugees and returnees exchanged information on legal issues and processes that would help the other

- Bosnian women who attended the Women in Black gathering in FRY gained an understanding of the power of coalition and saw the impossible, standing publicly for your beliefs, as possible

59

- Macedonia women visiting the Split Breast Cancer Club learned how to raise funds from local businesses and provide support services for clients

- A Roma lawyer from Macedonia saw mechanism for institutionalizing legal services to disadvantaged communities in a legal support office which is one part of a highly effective Bosnian NGO

- A Croatian women's group working in domestic violence, who was well established internationally but had limited local linkages, used the opportunity to establish professional contacts with groups carrying out similar work in Zagreb This also linked the group into a YSS network of those working on domestic violence

- A Bosnia women visited a FRY SOS hotline, later using her contacts in the FRY to provide training for many of the SOS hotlines in BiH The trainers from FRY, Croatia and Slovenia, donated a portion of their honoraria as seed money for the planned next meeting of the BiH SOS Hotline groups

In cases where the participant's objectives were clear and matched with the host NGO's program, visits were reported as effective Difficulties arose when the host NGO demonstrated a lack of normal hospitality due to what appeared to be ethnic prejudice and when the host NGO was less mature than the visitor's own group