

PD-ABR-086

100298

Final Report

Enterprise in Community Development
A Final Evaluation

Submitted to
USAID/Philippines

By the

UP Social Action and Research for Development Foundation, Inc
College of Social Work and Community Development
University of the Philippines, Quezon City

29 December 1998

A

UP Social Action and Research for
Development Foundation
Project Evaluation Team

Dr Sylvia H Guerrero
Team Leader

And

Dr Carolyn I Sobritchea
Co-Team Leader

Dr Romeo C Quieta
Prof Jeremias T Leones
Prof Emmanuel M Luna
Team Members

Marilou B Cerilla
Estrella G Hilomen
Research Associates

With the assistance of

Victoria R Bitanga
Carina C David
Ma Carla Trinidad G Foronda
Laniza R Lacsamana
Peach P Mondiguing
Neilda F Sioson

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
<i>Executive Summary</i>	I-XIV
1 0 INTRODUCTION	
1 1 Background	1
1 2 The ECD Project	2
2 0 ECD FINAL EVALUATION Problem, Framework and Methodology	3
2 1 Problem and Objectives	3
2 2 Framework	3
2 3 Methodology	4
3 0 EVALUATION FINDINGS	6
3 1 Role of the Private Sector in Social and Community Development	6
3 2 Role of ECD in Raising Awareness of Private Sector Management on the Value of Community Development	12
3 3 Role of ECD in the Application of Managerial and Technical Expertise to Community Development	18
4 0 PROGRAM and PROJECT BENEFITS and IMPACTS	22
4 1 Socio-Economic Impact	24
4 2 Socio-Psychological Impact	25
4 3 Environmental Impact	26
4 4 Impact on Women	26
4 5 Impact on the Community at Large	26
5 0 TECHNICAL SOUNDNESS OF STRATEGY/APPROACH	28
6 0 SUSTAINABILITY	31
7 0 ENABLING FACTORS AND OBSTACLES	34
8 0 LESSONS LEARNED	42

References

Annexes

- Annex A** ***Distribution of Grantees By Year Project Implementation Started and By Duration of Project***
- Annex B** ***List of Informants***
- Annex C** ***Summary of Program and Project Accomplishments***
- Annex D** ***Summary of Program and Project Results and Impacts***
- Annex E** ***Consolidated Project Impacts and Benefits of ALSONS and DOLE-STANFILCO ECD Projects***

d

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ALSONS	- Alcantara and Sons, Incorporated
ANSCOR	- Andres Soriano Corporation
ASJRF	- Andres Soriano, Jr Foundation
ARMCO	- Asia Rattan Manufacturing Company
AIDAB	- Australia Development Assistance Bureau
AFI	- Ayala Foundation, Incorporated
BCI	- Bacnotan Cement Industries, Incorporated
BHW	- Barangay Health Worker
BIDP	- Barangay Integrated Development Program
BOD	- Board of Directors
CBO	- Community-Based Organization
CLAP	- Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project
ComRel	- Community Relations
DUCC	- Davao Union Cement Corporation
DAR	- Department of Agrarian Reform
DA	- Department of Agriculture
DENR	- Department of Environment and Natural Resources
DOH	- Department of Health
DTI	- Department of Trade and Industry
DOLE-STANFILCO	- DOLE- Standard Filipino Corporation
ECD	- Enterprise in Community Development
LGU	- Local Government Unit
FGT	- Fast Growing Tree
FBT	- Fruit Bearing Tree

IGP	- Income Generating Project
ICC	- Indigenous Cultural Community
IRTP	- Integrated Recruitment, Training and Placement
KSBank	- Kooperatiba ng Sambayanan ng Banal na Krus
LMPCI	- Liputan Muti-Purpose Cooperative, Inc
LCF	- League of Corporate Foundations
LGU	- Local Government Unit
MDP	- Makati Development Program
MNN	- Makati NGO Network
MOA	- Memorandum of Agreement
MPC	- Multi-Purpose Cooperative
NAMFREL	- National Movement for Free Elections
NGO	- Non-Governmental Organization
NGMS	- NORKIS Group Management Services
PO	- People's Organization
PBSP	- Philippine Business for Social Progress
PHINMA	- Philippine Investment Management Consultants, Incorporated
PRAP	- Participatory Rural Appraisal Planning
PVO	- Private Voluntary Organization
RAFI	- Ramon Aboitiz Foundation, Incorporated
RHU	- Rural Health Unit
SALT	- Sloping Agricultural Land Technology
SWOT	- Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The Enterprise in Community Development (ECD) was designed by USAID/Philippines in 1986 when the lagging economic growth of the country seriously hampered the government's ability to provide essential services to its growing population. Its purpose was to assist the Philippine private sector in promoting participatory and sustainable development activities. USAID/Philippines provided grants up to 50% of total program costs while participating grantee-companies provided cash and non-cash contributions amounting to at least 50% of total program costs.

Authorized on September 9, 1986 with a funding of \$4.5 million and a life of project (LOP) of six years, the ECD Project initially targeted only the rural communities. Later amendments increased the funding to \$14 million with LOP extended to September 7, 1998 and included urban communities. The ECD Project has provided in its last 12 years of operation 24 grants and 13 sub-grants for community development activities amounting to more than \$11.4 million.

Purpose of Evaluation

The study determined whether ECD has achieved its purpose of assisting and promoting the expanded involvement of the Philippine private sector in social and community development. It identified the impacts of the ECD project on the people, local communities, organizations and the private sector participants. It analyzed the factors that contributed to the success or failure of the projects and presented the lessons learned in this endeavor.

The evaluation is guided by a participatory development and empowerment framework which affirms the value of ordinary people's participation defined as "the organized efforts to increase control over resources and regulative institutions in given social situations on the part of groups and movements hitherto excluded from such control" (Wolfe 1983). Development from this perspective, entails not just increased

access to resources and improved welfare but also enhancement of people's potentials and capabilities, which significantly affects their participation in their own development and transformation

Methodology

The methods and techniques used in the data collection to answer the research questions include i) review of relevant USAID technical management documents and various project reports of partners, ii) field visits to selected project and sub-project sites and iii) interviews with key informants and selected beneficiaries i.e., the USAID ECD project coordinator, project partners and beneficiaries, program personnel as well as key officers of the companies included in the evaluation

The criteria used in choosing selected projects were the following (a) size of project (i.e., small as against big ones) defined according to amount of funding support, and (b) geographic location (i.e., two sites per major island - Luzon, Visayas and Mindanao or a total of six areas outside Metro Manila - A project partner based in Makati was the seventh organization included in the evaluation), and (3) type of project

Based on the foregoing criteria, the following companies were chosen for the evaluation visits: Andres Soriano Corporation, Ayala Corporation, Bacnotan Consolidated Industries, Inc., Norkis Group Management System Inc., Abotiz and Co., Asia Rattan Management Corporation, Alcantara & Sons Inc., and Dole Stanfilco

Evaluation Findings

Has ECD achieved its overall purpose?

The ECD assistance increased the geographic reach of the grantees' programs, strengthened the networks of organizations engaged in development activities, and provided the impetus for other agencies to participate and collaborate with the grantees in helping to uplift communities

With the ECD assistance, the sample grantees were able to accomplish the goal of initiating conservation and rehabilitation measures to prevent degradation of target areas and improve the socio-economic conditions of the resident beneficiaries. Other grantees like DOLE STANFILCO and ALSONS even exceeded their performance targets by 169% and 253%, respectively due to coverage of additional beneficiaries interested in the program.

On top of these, potable water systems, primary health care and day care centers were constructed, and income-generating projects, agro-forestry, community-based training, micro-lending, and community organizing activities were implemented. What the ECD grantees did was to expand the geographic and sectoral reach of the programs and services that many of the corporate-grantees were already providing through their foundations.

The ECD project provided funds for the MDP which enabled AFI to mobilize the resource-rich private sector and their foundation/NGOs to form partnerships with the resource seeking communities to pursue socioeconomic projects and socio-political programs with the long-term goal for "empowering the poor through a process of building up community institutions which would address basic needs."

The grantees continued to allocate funds from their company budget and respective corporate foundations to provide financial and personnel assistance to its projects under the ECD program. Some community organizers and coordinators were retained to assist community associations in managing project operations. They visit communities to monitor and provide technical and/or consultancy assistance. The development principles and approaches learned from the ECD experience were adopted.

The ECD enhanced the social responsibility, consciousness and involvement of the corporations in responding to special groups like the victims of the Mt. Pinatubo eruption and the Manobo-Aytas of Davao del Norte. At the time when the people lost their jobs due to the Mt. Pinatubo eruption and the closure of the US military bases, the ECD program provided a temporary relief to the lack

of employment in Central Luzon. The ECD contributed to the shift of the corporate grantees' approach, from traditional philanthropy to community empowerment.

Has ECD raised the awareness of private sector management on the value of community development? Has it raised their level of skills in community organizing?

A number of the grantees evaluated in the study have long been involved in socio-civic and development work. What the ECD provided to the program implementors was the experience in putting into action, in testing and adjusting to real life conditions, the principles of participatory or bottom to top community development and the injection of the corporate world's entrepreneurial perspective in the context of social development.

Another milestone in the ECD grantee's assistance is the operationalization of the civil societies' participation in local governance. For instance, part of the MDP grant modifications that USAID approved, provided for the transfer of the implementation of the local governance and civic education components to MNN. Under the new set-up, MNN took responsibility in organizing NGO and PO participation in local governance through the Barangay Development Councils, promoting active people's participation in barangay development through civic education and enhancing barangay officials' capability. This is a facilitating step in achieving community empowerment.

Some ECD grantees have also been instrumental in encouraging other corporations to establish foundations that would undertake community development. For example, ANSCOR, being the mother company of about 25 corporations and other subsidiaries had significantly influenced its sister companies and affiliate corporations in promoting community involvement.

Another significant impact in the awareness-building process of the ECD and related participatory and sustainable programs is the formation and the strengthening of the League of Corporate Foundations. At present, the League envisions itself "to be the driving force in the formation of a highly committed

business sector working effectively with communities and partner institutions towards the attainment of equitable and sustainable development ”

Has ECD led to the application of managerial and technical expertise to community development?

This is probably one area where the ECD contribution is remarkable. Findings reveal that a good percentage of the ECD funds was devoted to community organizing, training, and capacity building. Both the grantees and sub-grantees benefited a lot from the different skills enhancement trainings and value formation workshops.

Other grantees were able to impart to their community partners the skills in project development, group consultation processes, simplified bookkeeping and financial management, and participatory planning. A good example is the BCI personnel who initiated a series of meetings with the Barangay Council of Pandayan, Meycauayan that resulted in the drafting of the first Barangay Development Plan. In other sub-projects, some regular personnel of the corporate grantees such as BCI, ALSONS, and DOLE Stanfilco, among others, were mobilized to assist in the design and monitoring of ECD projects such as potable water systems.

The most significant contribution was in the area of financial management. Company accountants and auditors were also occasionally asked to backstop the officers of the community associations in preparing financial statements such as cash flows, balance sheets, and income/loss statements. These personnel also helped in computerizing the data and information system of the cooperatives and trained the people in accounting procedures particularly in the micro-credit and enterprise development projects. The corporate financial managers transferred their skills to the Foundation and the peoples organizations on how to identify, develop, and engage in micro-enterprises that are viable and sustainable. Other grantees like ANSCOR assisted some of the community enterprises in designing quality control to enable their products become globally competitive.

What results and impacts did ECD have on the beneficiary population (i.e., the poor and the marginalized rural and urban families, women), the community-based organizations and the communities (both geographic and sectoral)?

In quantitative terms, the results have been substantial. End-of-project reports substantiate the major benefits derived by the target beneficiaries as a result of the ECD assistance from USAID matched by the corporate grantees' own contribution in cash and in kind. The benefits ranged from the socioeconomic, sociopsychological, technical, educational, managerial, organizational to rehabilitative and environmental.

The beneficiaries interviewed claimed that the program has improved their living conditions. It provided them potable water systems, day care facilities, community-based health programs and other basic services. Moreover, the community organization program enabled the beneficiaries to organize themselves for self-help through cooperative action, access support services from LGUs, and liberate themselves from the clutches of loan sharks.

The agro-forestry, income-generating projects and the trainings provided by the projects increased their productivity and income levels. Majority of them were able to increase their income from a range of PhP 1,000.00 – PhP 1,566.00/month before the project to PhP 1,200.00 to PhP 2,886.50 at present, as shown in the Davao del Norte ECD program. Other economic benefits will become evident in the next five years when they will be harvesting their planted timber trees projected to be around PhP 1,500/cubic feet. Majority of them planted more than 625 timber trees in addition to fruit-bearing ones.

The beneficiaries also have improved relationships due to better communication. Their organizational meetings, group works, and trainings attended facilitated this. In areas where both the tribal groups and Christians reside, relationships also improved. The training programs also developed local leaders who can facilitate meetings and effect participatory discussions, among

other skills. On top of all these, the beneficiaries take pride in their accomplishments.

Because of the ECD projects in Davao and Cebu, the denuded forests have now been replanted with timber trees and fruit-bearing trees. The soil is gradually being regenerated. In the next few years, the tall, gigantic trees will again rise towards the blue skies and children shall rejoice to see the flock of chirping birds back in their habitat.

The ECD project benefited the whole family including women and children. However, of all the project components, it is the day care center, health centers, micro-lending, and the potable water system that responded to the practical needs of women. With the potable water system, for instance, each beneficiary family is able to save at least one hour per day from the difficulties encountered in fetching water. The women are delivered from family problems brought about by water-borne diseases.

On top of all these, the project pumped prime the economy of the areas covered. With the increase of productivity and purchasing power of the people, business establishments like sari-sari stores increased tremendously. Investors and traders from other places now operate in the area. Transportation services likewise improved resulting in increased employment opportunities.

Sustainability

Did the corporate grantees continue to pursue direct assistance to development activities after the grants were completed?

Are subproject activities funded through ECD self sustaining? What mechanisms are in place?

What are the issues that affect program sustainability?

All the corporate grantees included in this evaluation continued to provide direct assistance to their community partners after the grant period. To this day, representatives from their companies and foundations provide monetary and

human resource assistance to their community partners. Funds have been given either for continuation of ECD projects and/or development of new ones. Mechanisms were established to ensure program sustainability. Corporations which could not accommodate the ECD program into their organizational structure, established a foundation to carry on community development work. This was the case of Davao Union Cement Company (DUCC), ANSCOR and RAFI. Those that already had their foundations before ECD such as AFI and BCI provided the necessary support to adopt the framework and project strategies of ECD.

USAID-ECD support for the establishment of the League of Corporate Foundations and other networks of corporate foundations is one of the most significant strategies for ensuring that ECD philosophy and workable approaches would be sustained and mainstreamed in the private sector.

At the subgrantee level, it is heartwarming to see that the majority of the community projects developed with ECD funds are doing very well. While some still have serious organizational problems, others have successfully institutionalized their work. The following mechanisms and processes account for project sustainability: a) formation of people's organizations which took over project management, b) inclusion of other community stakeholders (e.g., political leaders, NGOs) into the projects, c) continuous monitoring and mentoring by foundation or company personnel, d) provision of additional financial support by foundation or company (i.e., payment of salaries of health and day care workers, maintenance of buildings, technical assistance in agro-forest development).

Many factors will continue to influence the future of ECD initiatives. The more important ones are: (a) the ability of the core group of ECD advocates to continue influencing their peers in the private sector, (b) the extent of institutionalization of ECD framework and strategies, (c) ensuring the technical feasibility of program/project designs, and (d) the extent of reorientation of people's values.

Success and Failure Factors of ECD

A number of factors contributed to the success and failure of the ECD program and its subproject components. The key success factors include the following:

1. The pursuit of this development approach. Private corporations were encouraged to shift from giving dole-outs and fostering dependency to creating self-reliant and self-propelling communities.
2. Top management endorsement and support for ECD not only through provision of matching grants but also through the creation of policies, structures and mechanisms that ensured ease of project implementation and achievement of positive results.
3. There was strong emphasis on capability building and social preparation of program partners.
4. The establishment of mechanisms for needs assessment and problem identification made the program more responsive to the needs of the beneficiaries and therefore facilitated greater cooperation from the beneficiaries.
5. Requiring matching funds from grantees and counterpart support from community beneficiaries expanded the involvement of the private sector and developed among the beneficiaries the sense of ownership to the project.
6. Regular and close monitoring of projects and subprojects ensured attainment of goals and accomplishment of tasks.
7. Establishment of strong networks with government and non-government institutions facilitated resource pooling and complementation.

The factors that accounted for project failure and/or constrained the achievement of desirable results and impacts are

- 1 *Overemphasis on meeting targets or outputs at the expense of focusing on the attainment of desirable results and impacts*
- 2 *Some corporations remained very output oriented*
- 3 *Some corporations have given less value and importance to the work of their foundations*
- 4 *Some corporations did not apply the same standards of work performance and service delivery to their ECD projects*
- 5 *Conflict or lack of cooperation between the grantee or sub-project implementors and local political leaders*
- 6 *Rigid and "inflexible" requirements of USAID*
- 7 *Shift in ECD direction and frequent change of leadership*
- 8 *Inadequate support to ensure project success and sustainability*
- 9 *Inability of LGUs and community organizations to sustain their commitment*
- 10 *Lack of competent and qualified program and project personnel*

Lessons Learned

The following are the valuable lessons and insights gained from the evaluation findings

Private-sector-community partnership is workable and effective. The beneficiary community is able to access the resources and technology of the private sector and also imbibe their corporate perspective in managing income-generating projects and community-based enterprises. The LGU political factor can greatly facilitate project implementation or retard it when conflicts arise owing to differences in interests of the parties concerned.

Equal concern for socioeconomic benefits and community organizing increases program success especially in marginalized communities. Capability

building and consciousness raising among grantees and sub-grantees is a continuing concern that goes beyond the classical life of project

Corporate management culture is important in community development work. It made planners and implementors conscious of value-addition, i.e. value of outputs must be greater than the input, respect for process in managing of social enterprises should be fostered, time should be devoted to awareness raising, value formation, training in relevant skills and the like

Gender and development perspectives taking into consideration both the practical and strategic needs of women is an important component of any community development project. Without this, programs and projects may unwittingly intensify the women's workload instead of easing their multiple burden

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The ECD project was a direct response of USAID/Philippines to the private sector's clamor for assistance in planning and carrying out community development activities. It was designed in 1986 - - the year of people's power revolution at EDSA which led to the dismantling of the Marcos regime and the installation of a new government under Corazon Aquino.

The years immediately preceding (1983-1986) were crisis-filled years as economic performance declined consistently and poverty worsened. In 1985 World Bank estimates placed the numbers of Filipinos living in absolute poverty at 30 million out of 56 million people. This constituted 52% of the population - - up from 45% in 1975.

The economic crisis of the '80s and the political turbulence of the '70s however, also saw the flowering of creative and innovative responses to societal problems. Significant shifts occurred in the approaches and methods of effecting social change and transformation.

It must be noted that in the latter half of the Aquino administration, NGOs emerged as an important sector in Philippine development. NGOs and the private sector achieved high visibility and recognition for public advocacy, socioeconomic, educational and organizational work with the poor and the marginalized communities and expanded their activities into participatory planning and social action. The Local Government Code enacted in 1992 operationalized the Constitutional recognition of the NGO's importance through a specific provision which requires NGO representation in development planning councils at municipal, provincial and regional levels.

From top-down planning and government-sponsored programs, the focus shifted to "ordinary people" and grassroots communities as subjects of development. New approaches emphasized people-oriented participatory programs and multi-sectoral involvement with GO, NGO, PO and the private-sector as partners in development.

The post-1986 period offered opportunities for organizing work and projects that stressed people's initiatives and demands. Private sector participation in social development also expanded during this period as the nation pursued its goals of economic and moral recovery.

1.2 The ECD Project

The ECD Project objectives were formulated against the backdrop of a private sector that had become increasingly active and involved in community and social development in the Philippines.

To promote private sector participation in development activities, USAID provided grants of up to 50% of total program costs while participating grantee-companies provided cash and non-cash contributions amounting to at least 50% of total program costs.

Authorized on September 9, 1986 with a funding of \$4.5 million and a life of project (LOP) of six years, the ECD Project initially targetted only the rural communities. Later amendments increased the funding to \$14 million with LOP extended to September 7, 1998 and included urban communities. The ECD Project has provided in its last 12 years of operation 24 grants and 13 sub-grants for community development activities amounting to more than \$11.4 million.

Through ECD, USAID provided incentives to companies, through financial and technical assistance, to implement development activities throughout the Philippines. The aim was to share this managerial and technical experience of the private sector with grassroots communities to enable them to improve their lives.

Tables in Annex A show the distribution of grants by type, location and duration.

ECD FINAL EVALUATION Problem, Framework and Methodology

2.1 Problem and Objectives

This evaluation will determine whether ECD has achieved its purpose of assisting and promoting the expanded involvement of the Philippine private sector in community development. It will identify the impacts of the ECD project on the people, local communities, organizations and the private sector participants. It will analyze the factors that contributed to the success or failure of the projects and present the lessons learned in this endeavor.

2.2 Framework

The evaluation is guided by a participatory development and empowerment framework which affirms the value of ordinary people's participation defined as "the organized efforts to increase control over resources and regulative institutions in given social situations on the part of groups and movements hitherto excluded from such control" (Wolfe 1983).

Development from this perspective, entails not just increased access to resources and improved welfare but also enhancement of people's potentials and capabilities, which significantly affects their participation in their own development and transformation. Through education and training, community organizing, networking/partnering and alliance-building, communities gain confidence and support for their concerns, as well as their advocacy of policies, plans and programs that benefit them.

In analyzing project outcomes and impacts, the following framework is used

INPUTS	→ OUTCOMES/RESULTS (immediate/short term)	→ IMPACTS (long-term)
USAID/ECD funds and support structures/ activities	Improved levels of skills and capabilities	Improved welfare
	Increased income generating activities/expanded coverage/reach	Improved quality of participation
Private Sector/grantee counterpart funds, organizational expertise and resources	Improved organizational capability/management practices	Strengthened community organizations/networks and alliances
	Increased access to resources	Self reliant/financially stable organizations
	Increased level of organizational membership and resources	Sustainable CD programs
		Empowered communities

2.3 Methodology

Several methods and techniques of data collection were used to answer the research questions. These include

- Review of relevant USAID technical management documents and various project reports of partners,
- Interview with USAID ECD project manager,
- Field visits to selected project and sub-project sites chosen on the following criteria (1) size of project (i.e., small as against big ones) defined according to amount of funding support, (2) geographic location (i.e., two sites per major island - Luzon, Visayas and Mindanao or a total of six areas outside Metro Manila. A project partner based in Makati was the seventh organization included in the evaluation), and (3) type of project

Based on the foregoing criteria, the following companies were chosen for the evaluation visits

Funding/ Geographic	LUZON	VISAYAS	MINDANAO
SMALL/ LOW	<p>Andres Soriano Corp</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mt Pinatubo Resettlement Program Region III • \$496,643 00 	<p>Norkis Group Mgmt System Inc</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compostela Micro enterprise Project • Compostela, Cebu \$83 767 00 	<p>Alcantara & Sons Inc</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Upland Agroforestry Development Project • Davao del Norte \$96,696 00 • Davao Union Cement Corporation Social Development Project \$237,103 00
BIG/HIGH	<p>Ayala Corporation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Makati Development Program Makati \$859,628 00 <p>-and-</p> <p>Bacnotan Consolidated Industries, Inc 1] Luzon Packaging Products Inc Community Org & Livelihood Development Bulacan \$2 094 624 00</p>	<p>Aboitiz and Co</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ecosystem Cebu • Cebu Province • \$3 001,973 00 <p>Asia Rattan Man Co</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Microenterprise Development/ Community Agroforestry • Tarlac, Pampanga • \$200 000 00 	<p>Dole Stanfilco</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation & Soil Conservation Project • Davao del Norte • \$250,260 00

During the field visits, the members of the research team conducted focus group discussions and key informant interviews with various project partners and beneficiaries, program personnel as well as key officers of the companies included in the evaluation

Annex B shows the number and types of interviews, FGDs, and field visits conducted, by corporate grantees and location of ECD project

EVALUATION FINDINGS

3.1 Expanding the Role of the Private Sector in Social and Community Development

Has the ECD Project achieved its overall purpose?

The answer is an unqualified yes for all the programs surveyed. The ECD assistance increased the geographic reach of the grantees' programs, strengthened the networks of organizations engaged in development activities, and provided the impetus for other agencies to participate and collaborate with the grantees in helping to uplift communities.

The following experiences elaborate on this assessment.

With an ECD grant of \$3 million in 1990, the Ramon Aboitiz Foundation (RAFI) implemented the five-year ECOSYSTEM Cebu Project aimed at initiating conservation and rehabilitation measures to prevent environmental degradation and improve the socioeconomic condition of the Cebuanos. The Foundation engaged in the following activities: development of potable water systems, primary health care services, construction of daycare centers, income-generating projects, forestry activities, community-based training, and community organizing.

Total project cost was P173.4 million with RAFI providing 54% of the total costs together with its partners: 52 community organizations, the provincial government and the DENR. Supplementary funds came from the German Development Services, Agency for Technical Cooperation through the Water Resource Center of the University of San Carlos, Aboitiz Group Foundation, the Australian Development Assistance Bureau (AIDAB) through the Central Visayas Water and Sanitation Project and the City Trust Foundation.

Most of the funds (82%) were used for programmed activities and expected outputs (e.g., plant 6,000,000 fruit-bearing and timber trees in an area of 3,000 hectares,

provide credit assistance to 3,600 beneficiaries, etc (See Annex C for details of accomplishments)

Ayala Foundation Inc (AFI), the development arm of the Ayala Corporation of Makati, initiated the Makati Development Program (MDP) as its response to the increasing number of poor households in the city of Makati, the premier city of the Philippines serving as corporate headquarters to many of the biggest companies and home to most of the wealthiest families. The municipal government identified 18 out of 32 barangays as depressed communities with 3,559 squatter families in 1989.

The ECD project provided funds for the MDP which enabled AFI to mobilize the resource-rich private sector and their foundation/NGOs to form partnership with the resource seeking communities to pursue socioeconomic projects and socio-political programs with the long-term goal for "empowering the poor through a process of building up community institutions which would address basic needs."

The MDP had the following components: vocational/technical skills training and job placement, vocation and technical scholarships, enterprise development, environmental management and the barangay integrated development program. (See Annex C for details of accomplishments)

A substantial part of the grant (60%) was used for training and skills development. The MDP strategy stressed capability-building for greater self-reliance. What was remarkable was the transfer of skills, particularly financial and management skills to cooperatives and related community organizations that enabled the micro-enterprises to grow and blossom into "mini corporations."

What the ECD grants did was to expand the geographic and sectoral reach of the programs and services that many of the corporate-grantees were already providing through their foundations. AFI (formerly called Filipinas Foundation) was founded in 1961 and had for its mission, to "improve the quality of life of the Filipino by contributing towards the eradication of poverty in all its forms." As a USAID-accredited PVO it had also received grants for assisting farmer-cooperatives before the ECD project implementation.

Bacnotan Consolidated Industries Inc (BCI) continues to provide financial and personnel assistance to its projects under the ECD program which ended in 1995. It has community organizers and coordinators assisting community associations in managing project operations. A community relations coordinator of PHINMA visits the communities regularly to monitor and facilitate problem-solving sessions. Additional project activities were developed to strengthen the ECD initiated activities (e.g., sponsorship of workshops and consultation meetings).

The PHINMA Group, through its Community Relations (Com Rel) Office, continues to undertake community programs following the development principles and approaches learned and adopted from the ECD experience. In its summary of plans and programs for Fiscal year 1998-1999, the Com Rel Office reported that the PHINMA Cement Group allocated P1,978,759.00 for various community programs namely: a] adopt a school (P789,759.00), b] community services (P669,000.00), c] livelihood projects (P500,000.00), and d] skills training (P20,000.00). The other PHINMA groups have also located funds for their continuing community development programs. Davao Union Cement Corporation has allocated P2,187,498 for programs like "adopt a school (P230,000), community services (P1,211,498), livelihood programs (P700,000) and skills training (P46,000). Meanwhile, the budget of the Hi Cement Corporation for Fiscal Year 1998-1999 for community relations amount to P2,507,730.00.

Despite the current financial crunch and closure of two of its plants in Meycauyan, the PHINMA Group has allocated a total amount of P6,673,987.00 for community projects this fiscal year. Around one-third of the amount are company funds and the rest are raised by their foundations.

Strong advocacy for community development and corporate social responsibility by the ComRel director is supported by Mr. Rene Lawenko. Mr. Lawenko is one of the moving spirits behind the "movement" to instill corporate social responsibility among the owners and managers of big corporations based in Metro-Manila. He is frequently invited in business conferences and workshops to speak about PHINMA's community relations programs. He also serves as consultant on community relations for companies establishing similar programs. Mr. Lawenko is active in networks of companies with

community programs - - the Corporate Network for Disaster Response and the Network for Environment and Education and Development

BCI undertook community development projects in 42 depressed barangays and sitios in nine provinces across six regions of the country (Annex C) With its ten subsidiary and affiliate companies as sub-grantees, BCE ECD budget totalled P45 million with USAID providing P22.8 million and BCI P23 million The project aimed to transform target communities into organized associations to improve the delivery of basic and social services, assist selected marginalized groups in increasing their incomes and upgrade the technical and managerial skills of project and sub-project staff in community development management The basic services and facilities included health centers, day care centers, potable water systems and low-cost sanitary toilets The environmental rehabilitation sub-component called for the rehabilitation of 500 hectares of alienable and disposable land through the procurement of seedlings of certified agro-forest species with high economic and environmental value, establishment of community nurseries to provide an adequate supply of seedlings for the reforestation of environmentally critical areas

Both the Alcantara and Sons Inc (ALSONS) and the DOLE STANFILCO grantees engaged in projects that generated income for their beneficiaries through agro-forestry and micro-enterprise programs ALSONS through its Alcantara Foundation organized cooperative stores for non-employees and a credit union for employees, and the Kapalong Cultural Development Foundation (KCDF) which is implementing arm of the 3-year USAID-supported Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project in the municipality of Talaingod, Davao del Norte

The project was designed to develop a minimum of 120 hectares of idle land within the Integrated Social Forestry (ISF) concession of DENR and at the same time improve the socio-economic conditions of 60 beneficiaries Long before the ECD project was implemented, the KCDF had already undertaken livelihood projects The project cost of P4,659,885.00 was beyond the capability of ALSONS It was only when USAID provided the ECD grant that ALSONS was able to realize its dream to help the area and its people The project ran for three years starting July 16, 1993 to July 15, 1996

The project funds were used for the 1] salaries and wages of project staff, 2] organization of project beneficiaries into associations, 3] training, 4] farm development, 5] use of "living tree approach" incentive scheme, 6] provision of marketing assistance, 7] monitoring and evaluation, and 8] capital-build up for income generating projects

At the end of the life of the project, ALSONS was able to accomplish an average of 253% of its target. At the end of the life of the project, ALSONS was able to accomplish an average of 253% of its target. One hundred twenty six percent (126%) of the 120 hectares of idle and underutilized ISF lands were developed into productive agro-forestry farms. Four peoples' organizations were organized. One hundred sixty seven percent (167%) of the target 60 farmer beneficiaries were trained in collective farming development and appropriate upland forestry technologies. For the agro-forestry programs, ALSONS distributed 625 gemelina trees, 250 grafted durian and cacao trees, among others, to 100 beneficiaries. Survival rate was 90%. Beneficiaries' income were increased by 167%. A total of 15 sub-nurseries (750%) were established instead of the two central nurseries. On top of these, ALSONS had extended microlending assistance to 60 women.

STANFILCO, a division of Dole Philippines is another grantee of USAID'S ECD. It produces an average of 25 million boxes of Dole bananas per year for the biggest market in Asia, Japan. And other markets abroad. The damage to Libuganan watershed adversely affected the agricultural production of local farmers and most particularly Dole STANFILCO. STANFILCO thought that something had to be done. In August 1989, STANFILCO incorporated in its company philosophy the need "to act in a responsible manner to ecology in areas it operates"

At the turn of the decade, STANFILCO went into implementing and observing several small environmental programs limited within the confines of the corporation's banana plantation sites. In June 1993, in an effort of institutionalizing the company's concern on ecology preservation, it created a new department named Housing and Environmental Affairs Department. It sought technical advice from the DENR provincial office in Davao del Norte for its programs.

In July 1993, the company found a 500 hectare desolate portion of the Libuganon River Watershed which it decided to focus its reforestation program. The company theorized that tapping the support of the local residents as partners in the program was became imperative. The P14M project cost also forced STANFILCO to tap funding support from concerned donor agencies like USAID. In February 16, 1994, STANFILCO and USAID signed a contract using a 50-50 matching to implement the "Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project". The objective was to respond to the environment degradation and socio-economic problems of the people of Barangay Sua-on, a remote and depressed community of Kapalong, Davao del Norte. The rest became history. USAID approved the life of the project to full 3 years covering February 1994 to February 1997.

The component of the project include 1] community organizing and awareness raising, 2] environmental rehabilitation, and 3] provision of basic social services which include the rehabilitation of existing health center and improvement of health care delivery systems, the operation of day care centers for the pre-school children, and the construction of potable water system.

After the life of the project, DOLE STANFILCO accomplished an average of 169% vis-a-vis targets. One hundred percent of the targetted 500 hectares of Libuganon River Watershed was rehabilitated, 371% of the beneficiaries participated in various training programs conducted such as leadership, value formation, environmental awareness, agro-forestry technology transfer, simplified bookkeeping and financial management, 100% of the target day care and health centers were renovated and/or constructed which are supported by the LGU officials using LGU funds, 100% of the target four organizations organized and registered with CDA, four water impounding projects constructed, and 127 beneficiaries received binding certificates making them official caretakers of the Libuganon River Watershed in the next 25 years.

The ECD also enhanced the social responsibility, consciousness and involvement of the corporations in responding to special groups like the victims of the Mt Pinatubo eruption. The community-based approach to disaster response is a concrete manifestation of the expanding role of the private sector in social and community development. This is a milestone in the shift of the approach, from traditional

philanthropy to community empowerment. Whereas before, the response of the corporate world to disaster events was by donating cash and goods for relief and emergency purposes, the experience of ANSCOR which focused on the provision of livelihood activities brought a new dimension to the corporate response to disaster. Through the Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Program (CLAP), ANSCOR was able to implement 20 projects from 1992-1996. The figure exceeds the target set by the project, namely five established enterprises and five communities organized into cooperatives. Of the 20 assisted enterprises, five were into cooperatives and the rest were associations/partnership and single proprietorship. The project generated 916 jobs against the target of 1,375. At the time when the people lost their jobs due to the Mt Pinatubo eruption and the closure of the US military bases, the ECD program provided a temporary relief to the lack of employment in Central Luzon.

Although a number of the livelihood projects initiated by ANSCOR closed down for a number of reasons including market constriction, the ECD left a legacy of corporate responsiveness to disaster, among the private sector participants. The succeeding events led ANSCOR to spearhead the establishment of the Corporate Network for Disaster Response (CNDR). The CNDR is composed of 28 corporate members and is now very active in disaster prevention, mitigation and preparedness. These are indirect outcomes of the ECD's support for disaster response projects of ANSCOR.

3.2 Has ECD raised the awareness of private sector management on the value of community development? Has it raised their level of skills in community organizing?

A number of the grantees evaluated in the study have long been involved in socio-civic and development work. AFI and the PHINMA Group (BCI) have more than three decades of experience in ECD-type programs. Thus, ECD assistance helped in further deepening the commitment of members of this sector as a result of the experience and infecting others with this commitment to help in community transformation.

Mr. Rene Lawenko, BCI Director captured this ECD impact when he described the genesis of PHINMA's own concerns in a 1994 paper delivered at a National Conference on Corporate Community Relations: PHINMA's Early Comrel (1950-1960).

"Thirty-seven years ago, barely a few corporations bothered with social responsibility PHINMA's commitments to help the poor community then may not have been articulately started and well-crafted as the statements we heard in this conference, but that commitment was just as strong today - - if not stronger In 1956, when PHINMA started operating the Bacnotan Cement Plant in Bacnotan, La Union, we also started implementing some sort of community relations Only it was then known as public relations or PR Under this set up, in fact there was no formal set up to speak of- - the plant manager was also the PR man

It was to the plant manager that the barangay captain or the parish priest, the youth leader and other solicitors would go for the funding of a waiting shed, sponsoring a beauty contest, hiring a brass band for the barangay fiesta, etc Depending upon the bottomline of the company's financials, the plant manager would either grant or turn down a request During good times when the company was making money, these requests would be granted and the plant manager would be a hero to the community Conversely, he becomes a villain the moment he turns down the requests because the company finances are on the red This function did not require a ComRel officer

The plant then hired a Community Relations Officer, who, driven by sheer enthusiasm to "get the show on the road," immediately plunged into hatching up all sets of ideas for Comrel Projects After these projects were approved and funded by management, the ComRel officer, for the first time, went down to the community in search of implementors

To his dismay, the well-planned projects did not succeed After three months, he found that the pigs and chickens he had distributed were butchered during birthdays or during barangay fiesta He was also left with an inventory of community-produced native baskets lying idle in a storehouse waiting for a market that wasn't available A lot of lessons were learned out of this exercise

Policy Leap Beyond Bottomline

In mid-1985 PHINMA top executives and plant managers gathered for a two-day conference to take a second and deeper look at the Group's Community Relations Program At this time, ComRel in the plants was under the Personnel Department They realized that the projects fostered dependency from the implementors - - and strained the relationships between the community and the company when this dependency could not be satisfied The community under this set-up merely perceived the company as a provider with a cornucopia of an inexhaustible supply of goodies and free services

The workshops and policy-setting exercises during the two-day conference led to a major policy leap that went beyond the bottomline agenda of the Group In short, we have totally reinvented our ComRel functions'

The “policy-leap” and shift in paradigm from dole-out to an empowerment approach must be linked to the political and cultural climate of the mid-80’s. This was the period of intense participation of the middle and upper classes in the movement to oust former President Marcos and restore democratic governance. The growth of corporate social responsibility at that time was fostered by this development.

The management and ComRel personnel of BCI were already imbued with a very strong sense of corporate social responsibility even before the ECD program began. What ECD have the program implementors was the experience in putting into action, in testing and adjusting to real life conditions, the principles of participatory or bottom to top community development.

A major contribution of the ECD is further exemplified in the case of Makati. AFI has carried out programs and services in Metro Manila and 12 provinces of the country. In Makati, these programs include training in industrial skills, scholarships, micro-credit, small business assistance bureaus, temporary shelters for streetchildren, environmental management, barangay integrated development project and a network of Makati-based NGOs and POs (MNN). The ECD assistance strengthened in particular the MNN - - an urban network founded in 1992 with 124 members.

What makes the MNN development noteworthy is that this network was formed in 1992 to facilitate the accreditation of NGOs with the Sangguniang Bayan to enable NGOs, and POs to participate in local government planning and decision-making as provided for in the Local Government Code of 1992. This operationalized the principle of participation in local governance -- a concrete step in achieving community empowerment.

Part of the MDP grant modifications that USAID approved, provided for the transfer of the implementation of the local governance and civic education components to MNN. Under the new set-up, MNN took responsibility in promoting NGO and PO participation in local governance through the Barangay Development Councils, promoting active people’s participation in barangay development through civic education and in enhancing barangay officials’ capability.

In a span of seven years MNN has doubled its membership in the 11 sectors that compose it, namely business (10), cooperatives (55), education (19), people with disabilities (4), foundations (23), homeowners' association (8), people's organization (28), religious organizations (24), socio-civic organizations (9), youth (24) and women (15)

The corporations which implemented the ECD program have been instrumental too in encouraging other corporations to establish foundations that would undertake community development. For example, ANSCOR, being the mother company of about 25 corporations and other subsidiaries had significantly influenced its sister companies in promoting community involvement. Through the leadership and example of the foundation's president, ANSCOR was able to stimulate its sister and affiliate corporations to find ways by which the firm can integrate community development into their program. To illustrate, the El Nido Resort in Palawan is currently engaged in community-based coastal resources management. At the ANSCOR aviation office, the Andres Soriano, Jr Foundation holds its office in the building, together with six other foundations related to ANSCOR affiliates. The ECD enhanced the awareness of the companies as ANSCOR promoted their enterprise development activities. These were also incorporated in the corporations' annual report, posing a challenge to other corporations to engage in community development as an expression of their social responsibility.

Another significant impact in the awareness-building process of the ECD and related participatory and sustainable programs is the formation and the strengthening of the League of Corporate Foundations. The idea of forming a sector within the Association of Foundations grew out of informal meetings among representatives as early as 1991. The formal organization came about in 1992 with thirteen corporate foundations constituting the core membership. It has now grown to include 45 member-foundations.

The League envisions itself "to be the driving force in the formation of a highly committed business sector working effectively with communities and partner institutions towards the attainment of equitable and sustainable development"

Corporate social responsibility is a major theme of the League and its programs and activities are intended to heighten members' social awareness and to elicit support for the integration of business and national objectives, to enhance members' capabilities in development management and to share the expertise of corporate foundations and corporation for effective partnership with development institutions. The key is to network, partner and build consortiums to achieve common goals.

The League, together with LCF members AFI, PBSP, CNDR, has responded to more recent crisis brought about by the El Nino phenomenon. This included the Tabang Mindanaw (Help Mindanao) fund-raising campaign. Other programs being undertaken by some members of the League are the building of multi-grade schools in various provinces of the country and environmental awareness, protection, and rehabilitation programs.

Also significant is the heightening of the social consciousness of the management of the Asia Rattan Manufacturing Co. Inc. AWECA Foundation, especially Mr. Angelo Baltazar, owner and Board Chairman of the corporation, to engage in development work. The principal reason is the fact that even before the introduction of ECD, the company officers were already serious and active in performing its corporate role as a change agent in the development of human beings and communities. The Final Project Report clearly indicated the role of ARMCO:

- *The Asia Rattan Manufacturing Company, Inc. started as a small unit. With a meager capital of only about P70,000 and a work force of 20 and sales of P 8 million, ARMCO was able to grow with an asset of about P50 million, a work force of about 1,000 and with sales contracts of about US \$5.5 million. ARMCO had wished to share its blessings to the people who in one way or the other have contributed to its success.*
- *ARMCO manifested its corporate social responsibility through the Lingap Project of the AWECA Foundation, Inc. the social arm of the Aweca family which is composed of a group of 13 (previously 6) Filipino owned companies where ARMCO is a member. The Lingap Project renders basic health services as well as training to the group's employees and adjacent communities. Since ARMCO's business is the rattan furniture export industry, the company contemplates with compassion the plight of the indigenous people who, in their own little ways, have also contributed, in one way or the other, to the economy by gathering raw materials within their habitat for employment generation through export.*

- *ARMCO believes in the holistic approach of development. Together with its employees, it knows fully well the sufferings and devastation Mt Pinatubo had wrought. For they are also victims. Knowing that 90% of the evacuees returned to their respective communities, ARMCO responded by expanding its corporate social responsibility through the "Enterprise for Community Development (ECD) project". These people, settlers and indigenous alike, were chosen to be the beneficiaries of the ECD project. With the USAID support of US \$200,000.00 in the form of a grant signed on May 4, 1992, and ARMCO's counterpart of the same amount, this three (3) year project was started and was completed after eight months of extension on December 31, 1995.*

The problems of the poor are important to ARMCO Inc

- *Barangay Maruglo and Sta Juliana (one of the last frontiers), are the two most remote barangays in Capas, Tarlac. These barangays are within the proximity of Mt Pinatubo. The eruption of this volcano shattered the economies of these communities. The residents were evacuated to Camp Aquino, Tarlac, leaving their properties behind during and after the eruptions which destroyed or damaged most of their houses, farms and natural resource base of these areas. Before the eruption, majority of the laborers in the area was dependent on military base-related occupations. Left with almost nothing and as the US bases began pulling-out, food became scarce. Many upland Aeta residents who continue to rely on rations even suffered deaths in the family while in the evacuation centers.*
- *90% of the residents have returned to their communities when Mt Pinatubo began to calm down. They started rehabilitating their houses using whatever materials are available. Relying merely on rains and a land covered with thick ash and therefore requires deep plowing, the residents have not planted anything on their farms. In addition, there is a lack of simple farming tools, planting materials, and access to agricultural extension and credit.*
- *Faced with the lack of necessities, livelihood, and amenities provided by an organized community, and severely damaged infrastructures, these upland residents' hope for a decent survival have begun to painfully diminish.*

In DOLE STANFILCO and ALSONS, the senior management people not only participated community development planning but also saw to it that needed resources were provided the project. Community development perspectives have now been incorporated in their corporate vision and mission. Both corporate foundations also retain community organizers to provide monitoring and support services after the phase-out. Operations expenses are taken from the corporate foundations' fund.

3.3 Has ECD led to the application of managerial and technical expertise to community development?

Definitely yes. This is probably one area where the contributions are quite remarkable.

AFI for instance devoted 60% of ECD funds to capability-building and training. In interviews with the AFI program management team, what stood out was the relative ease with which a number of activities were carried out and targets accomplished because of the structure and systems that were in place. Mr. Cabrera, AFI Director for Operations and a chemical engineer, shared some of the strategies that were effective - - e.g., integrated training, recruitment and placement strategy. Thus, a lunch meeting with catcher companies - - i.e., those that would employ the personnel that the AFI-ECD program trained, usually facilitated the process of placing the graduates. What impressed us was the positive attitude of the team - - as they shared with us the major successes of the program and looked forward to meeting more challenges. A question on problems and difficulties was initially met with silence and a puzzled look. What stood out in their minds were the possibilities for change and the opportunities to do more with the organized groups. One leaves with the feeling that wealth makes a difference. And Makati is different - - with its vast resources, so much can be done.

In the BCI case, since ECD was strong on capability-building, both the intermediary (grantee) and subproject partners benefited a lot from many skills enhancement training. Funds were allocated for workshops and training in project related skills (e.g., bookkeeping, financial management, repair and maintenance of water systems, community organizing, etc.). Mr. Lawenko and other program officers even went to Bangladesh to observe the operations of the Grameen banking system. Others were taken on exposure visits to communities undertaking similar projects.

BCI ComRel personnel, for their part, were able to impart to their community partners the skills in project development, particularly the process of group consultation, planning and monitoring. A very interesting and worthwhile

undertaking, for example, was the series of meetings initiated by the ComRel coordinator for the Pandayan, Meycauyan barangay council that led to the drafting of the first barangay development plan

With the training provided, the project sector personnel, especially the technical people of ALSONS and DOLE STANFILCO started to appreciate the need for participatory processes. With greater involvement in project planning and discussions, they realized community organizing as an important factor in ensuring the success of a project.

The project staff, also realized the need to balance the technical and community organizing demands of the project. For instance, they used agro-forestry and poverty alleviation concerns as a point of entry for community organization and assisted organized beneficiaries to accomplish agro-forestry and socioeconomic targets of the program. For project staff with previous community organizing experience and/or professional training, the ECD training programs helped enhance their skills.

In other sub-projects, some regular personnel of BCI, Alcantara and Sons, DOLE Stanfilco were requested to assist in completing or monitoring the completion of some technical components of the project. For example, in BCI, in-house engineers were requested to oversee the construction of the training centers and the water systems. Company accountants and auditors were also occasionally asked to backstop the officers of the community associations.

Direct supervision of sub-projects was the responsibility of the plant manager. He chaired the project management team, which normally consisted of the plant accountant, the ComRel officer, a bookkeeper and a representative from PHINMA (main) office. The team could call upon any of the plant employee to provide technical support to the community projects.

A most significant contribution was in the area of financial management. AFI, ALSONS, DOLE Stanfilco, for instance, helped in computerizing the data and information system of the cooperatives and trained the people in accounting.

procedures, particularly in the micro-credit and enterprise development projects. This was shown in the RAFI project where the financial expertise of the corporation helped in strengthening the CBOs. The financial managers transferred their skills to the Foundation and the peoples' organizations. They taught them how to identify, develop, and engage in micro-enterprises that are viable and sustainable and not just livelihood activities for subsistence. The corporation discouraged the partners and the communities from engaging in just backyard hog raising. Instead, they encouraged them to engage in projects that are viable, employment generating, and activities that can generate savings and spread more benefits.

The Asia Rattan Board of Trustees, as well as the officers of the corporation, are all conscious of their role and contribution to society particularly in the areas being served by the foundation. They were very eager to share the resources of the corporation. As reported, they are involved in the planning of projects, in the formulation of strategies, and in the preparation of the budget for the community development projects. It is for this reason that the foundation did not encounter so much difficulty in the financial management of the ECD projects.

Changes in the management of community development projects are always done in consultation with Mr. Gerardo Porta of USAID. It appears that the effective monitoring and control system adopted by USAID and the practical requirements in the field has brought about some flexibility that serves the mutual interest of the sponsor and the grantee. They call this constant consultation and coordination as the "PORTA-PALO" system (Porta referring to Mr. Porta of USAID and PALO referring to Mr. Palo of AWECA Foundation).

In implementing the Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project, the executive of the Andres Soriano Jr. Foundation saw the roles of ANSCOR and their affiliate corporations in community development work. The executives and personnel of private corporations were involved in providing assistance and advisory services in marketing of the products of the enterprises, capability building of the target beneficiaries, establishing linkages for resource generation.

The staff of the corporations were tapped as resource persons and advisers in the program. Among the capability building activities done to strengthen the organizations were SWOT analysis, personality and development training, vision, mission, and goals, management and leadership training, organizational mechanics and skills training, participatory planning seminar, organization and coop development, and value orientation.

The program beneficiaries were trained in skills in food production and processing, decoration making, wrought iron and tinsmith craft, candle making, cross stitch and crochet, garment production, mushroom production. In addition to these, the ANSCOR group was able to assist too in marketing, by encouraging the enterprises to participate in bazaars and fairs and by training of marketing officers. They established a system for quality control for the products that enabled some of the community enterprises to export their products.

ECD PROJECT BENEFITS AND IMPACTS

What results and impacts did ECD have on the beneficiary population (i.e., the poor and the marginalized rural and urban families, women), the community-based organizations and the communities (both geographic and sectoral)?

In quantitative terms, the results have been substantial. End-of-project reports substantiate the major benefits derived by the target beneficiaries as a result of the ECD assistance from USAID matched by the corporate grantees' own contribution in cash and in kind. The benefits ranged from the socioeconomic, sociopsychological, technical, educational, managerial, organizational to rehabilitative and environmental (See Annex D for benefits and impacts).

The AFI-MDP Project illustrates some of these outcomes. As an innovative approach to urban poverty through social resource build-up, the AFI-MDP project succeeded to a large extent in improving the welfare of thousands of poor families in affluent Makati.

For the beneficiary families and communities this meant improved welfare, in terms of better health, nutrition and socioeconomic conditions. It also meant increased access to resources - to education, skills training, jobs and for women, access to paid employment as well as income-generating activities. Beyond these, the project also helped in strengthening the capacities of CBOs to manage and sustain the projects. The capability building/training components revitalized some of the CBOs which had been dormant for years prior to MDP and allowed them to define, focus, and pursue their objectives in the context of MDP.

The strengthened CBOs helped in institutionalizing the MDP interventions and the personnel learned the corporate approaches and methods particularly in managing funds, mobilizing community action and resolving conflicts. The MNN which benefited from the MDP now serves as the focal structure for partnering and linking among the different sectors and organizations in Makati. This assures sustainability of the programs for community development and transformation.

The MDP Enterprise Development component provided support to 18 corporations and 31 individual and group enterprises in 20 barangays of Makati. Benefits from the financial and technical assistance provided accrued to about 2,000 individual coop members and entrepreneurs.

All the cooperatives had credit assistance as their principal service to their members. We had the opportunity to visit two KSBank which has the highest number of members and capital-build-up of close to P13 million from a starting capital of P100,000 and the Palanan Multi-purpose Cooperative which started in 1992 with P700 contributions from a predominantly female group and has now a total capital build-up of close to P2 million.

KSBank was already operating for four years before AFI came to assist by providing training in proposal writing, financial management and fund raising, computerization and financial assistance in the form of loans. They started as a parish-based and affiliated group engaged in political and social action (the core group was composed of NAMFREL volunteers) with Fr. Andrew Fabio, the parish priest in the barangay taking a lead role. Fr. Andrew continues to serve on the Board of KSBank.

Other impacts are at the attitudinal and sociopsychological level. Two cases exemplify this: the ARMCO and the PHINMA projects.

A case in point is the Asia Rattan Manufacturing Company, Inc. (ARMCO). Their experience in the project bolstered their morale in sharing their blessing with the people who in one way or another have contributed to their success. At present, it has increased its involvement in community development by expanding its operations to barangays Maruglo and Sta. Juliana in the municipality of Tarlac through several integrated socioeconomic activities. The corporate managers and Board of Trustees are now actively involved in community development planning and in the preparation of budgets to support project staff. Also, a dozen of its member companies now regularly contribute to the fund requirements of the foundation. This heightened social consciousness also led to the retention of some project staff after the project's phase-out to extend monitoring and consultancy support services.

The value of the need to get involved in community development is now mainstreamed in the corporate fabric, at the least, in corporations that participated in the ECD program. While most of them had previous involvement in community development, the program experience further increased their resolve to pursue the noble program. PHINMA articulates the company's policy on corporate social responsibility as follows: "Our responsibility to our publics, beyond managing our business well, is to contribute to helping the least of our neighbors to help themselves. This will be achieved by helping them to acquire the skills to organize, to improve their quality of life, and develop strong community – society- oriented values." The Bacnotan Consolidated Companies Inc (BCI) expanded its involvement in development work by adding financial and human resource assistance to support sub-project beneficiaries even after the end of the ECD program by fielding community organizers and coordinators to backstop the community associations formed which took over the management and operations of the project.

The project enabled the grantees to see the imperatives of participatory approaches in community development. The experience provided them lessons that showed among others, that project success and virtual sustainability is linked with people's organized participation. This led to a policy leap and shift in paradigm from dole-out to empowerment approaches. They learned to value empowerment processes. Social preparation through community organizing and capability building become an integral part of their operations in outreach work. Likewise, the policy requiring beneficiaries to provide equity counterpart, ensures that beneficiaries get to own the project and develop a stake in it.

4.1 Socio-Economic Impact Majority of the beneficiaries interviewed claimed that the program has improved the living conditions of the beneficiaries. Among others, these are expressed in the following indicators:

- The community organization program enabled the beneficiaries to complement each others' resources. It facilitated the development of a common vision for their communities and improved stakeholders' working relationship. Through their organized associations, the beneficiaries are able to collectively avail of the support services needed from line agencies and local government units such as availment of credit and advocacy for better infrastructures. The setting up of "centralized operations" especially on economic activities like bulk buying and selling to members are competitive.

prices by cooperatives formed, mostly multi-purpose cooperatives, afforded them of not only services right at their communities but also transportation savings in going to and from markets. It also provided them a bargaining power for better prices of their products.

- The agro-forestry, income-generating projects and the trainings provided by the projects increased their productivity and income levels. Illegal logging activities were dramatically decreased. In terms of income increases, before the project, the beneficiaries were getting a range of P1,000.00–P1,566.00/month. After the project, they were able to increase it to P1,200.00 to P 2,886.50 as in the case of Davao del Norte. The tremendous economic benefits of the project will be seen when the beneficiaries are able to harvest the trees they planted.
- The potable water systems greatly improved their physical well-being. It greatly reduced the workload of family members, especially women and children who normally fetch water from sources several kilometers away. This also eliminated conflicts. The incidence of waterborne diseases has been greatly reduced. Hygiene and sanitation are much improved. The water users now own, maintain, and operate their water supply.
- The health care programs through the deployment of health workers and the provision of health care consciousness enabled the beneficiaries to improve their health conditions. Due to preventive health care systems and the setting up of community herbal medicines, the beneficiaries are able to save their income for other purposes than medical care.
- The daycare centers, which are now sustained by the local government units through the payment of day care center honoraria, are able to help children to learn to read and write. The daycare center workers interviewed claimed that many of the children who attended the classes are able to perform better when they get to the elementary grades. The center also taught good family and social values necessary for a peaceful and loving society thereby ensuring the wellbeing of future generations.
- Despite the fact that most of the ECD grantees' program did not include gender in the framework, the women assert that they too benefited from the project. To them, whose values center on the family, whatever benefit the family gets also redound to their own.
- The program provided employment to people in the area. The demands for local labor for farming, the need for transportation, and marketing enabled the local people to land jobs. Most important is the project's provision of a sustainable source of livelihood in the area. Others are able to imbibe the values of corporate entrepreneurship.

4.2 Socio-Psychological Impact The beneficiaries now have better relationship especially between Christians and the Aetas. Due to the various training programs, many beneficiaries can already communicate effectively. The training programs also developed local leaders who can facilitate meetings and effect participatory discussions,

among others. On top of these, the beneficiaries take pride in their accomplishments. Without the program, they said, they would not be what they are now.

4.3 Environmental Impact The denuded forests are now gradually replaced by timber trees and fruit trees. Soil fertility is gradually restored. These will redound to productivity improvement of the beneficiaries' lands. The reforested areas now serve as the buffer zones to protect the remaining patches of forest lands. In a few years to come, the tall, gigantic trees will again rise towards the blue skies. The thick, misty, and green foliage and shrubbery will serve as a carpet to the landscape in the area. The flock of chirping birds joyfully bathing in the crystal clear water flowing from a stream of the mountain will again be seen by the children. The good life in the lowlands that was cut short by environmental destruction and depleted natural resources will be renewed. (From Project Report)

4.4 Impact on Women Generally, the project benefited the whole family including women and children. However, of all the project components, the day care center, health centers, micro-lending, and the potable water are the ones that gave women, especially the mothers, a breather from their multiple burdens. The day care centers lessened the mothers' burden of attending to their children while working. The health centers provided women greater access to primary health care such as medical consultations which is costly and time-consuming to them if they still had to go to the town centers for medical check-ups. The potable water systems also lightened the burden of women. In the past, fetching water had been a family irritant. This time, with a water system, each beneficiary family is able to save at least one hour per day. With the potable water systems, the women are also unsaddled of family problems brought about by water-borne diseases. Because of these, they are able to use the time saved for activities they consider worth doing.

Micro-lending has positive and negative impacts on women. Economically, it helped women empower themselves owing to the fact that they are able to have income of their own to augment their husbands' meager income. Women with income appear to have gained status and respect from their husbands. Their economic empowerment also made women feel their dignity as human beings.

Majority of the women availing of micro-lending projects use the loans for small scale income generating projects. Since the main burden of household and family management is on their shoulders, the women's working time had been doubled.

Household chores and care of children generally continue to be solely the women's work. The existing programs responded to the issue of women's productive and community concerns. Strategic gender issues have yet to be addressed. Only a few programs such as the AFI, MDP have addressed some of these gender concerns through training of women in non-traditional occupations and through gender sensitivity sessions.

4.5 Impact on the Community at Large The project pumped prime the economy of the areas covered. In Davao del Norte, sari-sari stores increased tremendously. Investors and traders from other places now operate in the area. Transportation frequencies have increased and roads are now relatively better than before.

Majority of the women availing of micro-lending projects used the loans for small scale income generating projects. This was true for ALSONS, ANSCOR, DOLE and RAFI. Women who used to work only at home began to work in livelihood projects. In a garment enterprise in Pampanga supported by ANSCOR's CLAP project, it was the women who were trained and employed in the factory. Because of the lack of job opportunities for their husbands who had been displaced by the Mt. Pinatubo eruption and closure of the US bases, it was the women who became the breadwinner for the family. These productive activities added to the work load of the women who continued to perform their housekeeping and family management roles. This would have been a propitious time for gender awareness programs for both men and women to discuss equitable distribution of tasks and responsibilities at home.

TECHNICAL SOUNDNESS OF STRATEGY/APPROACH

5.1 Was the ECD program designed in a manner sufficiently feasible to permit effective implementation?

The design of the ECD program sufficiently allowed for its effective implementation. The strategies were generally appropriate in achieving the overall goals of improving the living conditions of poor people and fostering business and civic involvement in participatory community development.

The strategies that contributed to ECD program effectiveness were a] the co-financing scheme which allowed for mutual sharing of responsibility and accountability between USAID and grantees, b] appropriate criteria for access to ECD grants, and c] channeling of funds to intermediaries (grantees) which helped in project monitoring and providing outside technical assistance. The other equally effective strategies were the substantial investment in capability building, both at the grantee and subgrantee levels, and establishment of various mechanisms to ensure project life beyond grant period.

A number of issues, however, affected the flow and results of the projects. Some grantees mentioned their initial difficulties in coping with the many requirements of USAID-ECD and strict application of policies. Some found the financial and monitoring processes too rigid and time-consuming. At the start, there was too much emphasis on meeting targets at the expense of ensuring sustainability. Some partners also noted that at the early stage of ECD, coordinators did not provide clean and unified direction which caused some problems in project coordination and implementation. These problems were partly caused by the fast turnover of ECD personnel and their varying interpretations of the rules and guidelines. In the words of a USAID officer, the early "grant agreements were written like contracts."

The cases of two corporations (ARMCO and RAFI) and their respective foundations show how the initial partnership with ECD was fraught with some difficulties. ECD was at first very rigid in the sense that the partner agencies were required to follow the blueprint and rules even if they were not compatible with field conditions. This was the reason why RAFI had to revise its plan after three years (1990-1993). The original project design was not sensitive to the needs and problems of the communities. For

instance, the day care and nutrition components of the projects were rejected by the people since these were not among their most pressing needs

The management and staff of ARMCO-ECD also found the program guidelines too strict and output-oriented. Despite the perceived strictness of USAID, the foundation was found to have failed in effectively managing the project and its funds. Project activities were subcontracted to other groups which made all the decisions including disbursements of funds. It was during the second half of the project cycle (1994-1996) that the project was redesigned to respond to its initial flaws and shortcomings. The new design was more responsive to community needs and concerns. It provided greater flexibility and autonomy to the corporations and their foundations to make appropriate modifications in their activities.

Nearly all the grant agreements examined for this evaluation put a great deal of emphasis on quantifiable outputs and fixed (e.g., three-year) project cycles with little consideration of the diversity of community and enterprise conditions and readiness of partners to go into community development. This has resulted in the fast tracking of many essential start-up strategies or inadequate attention to activities that could have enhanced the achievement of desired results and impacts. Some expected outputs were unrealistic, given the nature and duration of the projects.

The experience of NORKIS is a good example. The project objective was to assist a cooperative "in entering the private and profit-making sector" in the manufacture of stonecraft. The agreement called for the establishment of the cooperative, training of members in stonecraft production, and immediate manufacture of commercially viable products. These activities were expected to be completed on the first year of project implementation. The "business was to earn sufficient funds by the end of the second year to cover all operating capital requirements". It was expected to make profit in the third year.

The expected outputs and results were not achieved at the end of the grant period. The terminal evaluation in 1993 showed that the cooperative managing the business was very weak. The leaders had difficulty getting members to attend general meetings. Many had limited understanding of cooperativism and the importance of

collective work. The evaluation team recommended the “development of a strategic plan, conduct of market survey and strengthening of networks, and more intensive training of members in entrepreneurial skills

In the case of ANSCOR, the CLAP was designed to provide livelihood and employment opportunities for Mt. Pinatubo victims. Of the 20 enterprises assisted or established by the program, only five remain operational. The tendency of the beneficiaries to prefer being hired workers, rather than being entrepreneur or manager is one reason why they ceased to operate. Despite the capability building inputs by the program, value formation and inculcating the necessary skills for entrepreneurship can not be achieved within the project duration. Furthermore, the suitability of the project to the market demand explains why a number of enterprise closed down. They could not find a viable market for their products.

SUSTAINABILITY

6.1 Did the corporate grantees continue to pursue direct assistance to development activities after the grants were completed?

Are subproject activities funded through ECD self sustaining? What mechanisms are in place?

What are the issues that affect program sustainability?

All the corporate grantees included in this evaluation continued to provide direct assistance to their community partners after the grant period. To this day, representatives from their companies and foundations provide monetary and human resource assistance to their community partners. Funds have been given either for continuation of ECD projects and/or development of new ones. Mechanisms were established to ensure program sustainability. Corporations which could not accommodate the ECD program into their organizational structure, established a foundation to carry on community development work. This was the case of Davao Union Cement Company (DUCC), ANSCOR and RAFI. Those that already had their foundations before ECD such as AFI and BCI provided the necessary support to adopt the framework and project strategies of ECD.

USAID-ECD support for the establishment of the League of Corporate Foundations and other networks of corporate foundations is one of the most significant strategies for ensuring that ECD philosophy and workable approaches would be sustained and mainstreamed in the private sector.

At the subgrantee level, it is heartwarming to see that the majority of the community projects developed with ECD funds are doing very well. While some still have serious organizational problems, others have successfully institutionalized their work. The following mechanisms and processes account for project sustainability are: a) formation of people's organizations which took over project management, b) inclusion of other community stakeholders (e.g., political leaders, NGOs) into the projects, c) continuous monitoring and mentoring by foundation or company personnel, and d) provision of additional financial support by foundation or company (i.e., payment of

salaries of health and day care workers, maintenance of buildings, technical assistance in agro-forest development)

However, both external and internal factors continue to threaten the viability of ECD initiative. Economic and political conditions at the national and local levels have a decisive influence on its future. The specific factors that will influence program sustainability are

1 *Ability of the core-group of ECD advocates to continue influencing their peers in the private sector*

A crucial factor in ensuring the sustainability of the private sector's participation in community development is the ability to maintain the current momentum of involvement. Unless the ECD grantees forcefully carry on the work of influencing their peers, ECD philosophy and values may not be mainstreamed into the private sector.

2 *Continuous institutionalization of ECD framework and strategies*

Unlike ordinary NGOs which are very dependent on outside funding to carry out their programs, the private corporations have resources which they can easily allocate for community development purposes. Their annual contributions to their foundations provide regular funds to support the basic expenses of the foundation's programs.

In addition to the financial contributions, there are material resources like depreciated equipment that are usually donated to the foundations for social and community development. The office and space made available by the corporation for the secretariat and administration enable the latter to have, at least, physical sustainability. These advantages augur well for the viability of private sector engagement in ECD. What is critical however, is private sector commitment to continue adopting the participatory and empowerment framework of development.

3 Ensuring the technical feasibility of program/project designs

At the grantee and sub-grantee levels, economic enterprises and community-based social projects cannot be sustained if there are technical defaults in the project design. Program/project design has to appropriately match the capabilities and needs of both implementors and beneficiaries. It has to carefully balance the amount of inputs with the desired results. One example is the mushroom project in Pampanga under the CLAP program of ANSCOR. The mushroom had a very nice production but the market was technically defective. There was no adequate market for the mushroom and this caused the closure of the project.

4 Continuous re-orientation of the people's values

The people in many communities visited were still tied to traditional values and practices. Some still go for dole-outs, refusing to cooperate or do their share of the work. Others who were into enterprise development could not see themselves as entrepreneurs, preferring instead to remain hired workers. The future of private sector involvement in ECD rests also on the ability of all partners to change values and practices. For poor communities, it means continuous consciousness raising about the politics and praxis of empowerment.

ENABLING FACTORS AND OBSTACLES

A number of factors facilitated and hampered the effective delivery of program inputs and achievement of desirable results and impacts. These are the following:

7.1 Enabling Factors

7.1.1 Pursuit of Empowerment Approach to Community Development

Although ECD commitment to empowerment approach is more discernible in later projects (e.g., NORKIS in comparison to ALSONS, BCI and ANSCOR), there is no doubt that the pursuit of this development approach has greatly contributed to the overall success of the program. Private corporations were encouraged to shift from giving dole-outs and fostering dependency. They were shown the value of community organizing, the incorporation of felt needs of people into project designs, and participatory project implementation and management.

7.1.2 Top management commitment and support ECD received the highest level of endorsement and support from management

Support came not only through provision of matching grants but also through the creation of policies, structures and mechanisms that ensured ease in project implementation and achievement of positive results. All the grantees interviewed by the research team gave their material and moral support during and beyond the grant period. Some institutionalized the ECD program by establishing a unit (e.g., separate office within the company or a foundation) to sustain the work. Davao Union Cement Corporation, for instance, established a foundation after the project period and rehired all the project staff. To this day, DUCC through its foundation, continues to undertake community projects with the support of personnel who trained under the ECD program. The Aboitiz family continues to play an active role in the management of its foundation. Two of the three seats in the Executive Committee and three of the five

positions in the Board of Trustees are occupied by members of the Aboitiz family

The Board of Directors, the President, as well as the managers of ARMCO Inc have all been involved in ECD by giving policy advice and technical assistance in the areas of finance, agriculture and forestry. Recently, they were able to tap and match the grant from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) to carry on the foundation's community development activities

- 7.1.3 Strong Emphasis on Capability Building and Social Preparation of Program Partners** What is perhaps one of the key factors for the success of ECD was the emphasis on building the capability of program partners, both at the grantee and subgrantee levels, to successfully implement projects. Various skills enhancement and awareness raising methods were used like training in project design and development, financial management, microcredit, agro-forest development, etc. ECD organized periodic meetings of grantees (senior management and subproject implementors) for all to share their experiences and learn lessons from each other. There were also exposure trips here and abroad to hone project management and implementation skills of partners.

To enable community organizations to implement and manage their respective projects, ECD also invested a sizeable amount of funds in training. All the grantees interviewed for this evaluation commenced their community projects with relevant skills enhancement courses like bookkeeping, operation of water system, leadership, community organizing and the like. The overall impact of these trainings is very positive since most of the projects are still alive and are being managed by the beneficiaries themselves.

7 1 4 Establishment of Mechanisms for Needs Assessment and Problem Identification Although some of the grantees (e g , ARMCO and RAFI) complained about the initial insensitivity of ECD program personnel to the articulated needs of the communities, the majority were generally satisfied with the process by which people's needs and concerns served as springboard for the design of project proposals. The strategies for needs assessment and problem identification came in the form of baseline surveys (e g , BCI), social soundness analysis and regular community consultations (e g ALSONS and DOLE STANFILCO)

7 1 5 Requiring Matching Funds from Grantees and Counterpart Support from Community Beneficiaries This program strategy was very effective in achieving the purpose of expanding the involvement of the private sector in social and community development. The grantees took their involvement very seriously, they installed the necessary enabling mechanisms and policies to ensure that their own resources were well utilized.

At the community level, the provision of counterpart funds and other forms of support ensured greater cooperation and sustained the interest of beneficiaries and people's organizations. The concept of "owning the project" strengthened the people's commitment to make the projects succeed. It is worth noting in this report, however, the difficulties that some community organizers had to go through to convince the people to have their stake in the projects. In the case of BCI and DUCC, for instance, the community organizers had a hard time convincing the residents at the onset to contribute their labor to the construction of the multi-purpose centers. While people's confidence in people-initiated projects is improving many are still suspicious and wary that their cooperation will not redound to any good in the long run. The culture of patronage politics is still alive in many poor communities such that some people expect to be served and be given dole-outs without them doing anything in return.

7 1 6 Regular and Close Monitoring of Projects and Subprojects While there were varying opinions about the importance on monitoring processes to account for program and project-level success, many partners considered this partnership with USAID-ECD as helpful in attaining project objectives. They recognized that it was through close and periodic monitoring that problems were readily identified and given solutions before they could get worse. A number of subproject designs (e.g. ARMCO, BCI, NORKIS, and RAFI) were, in fact, modified and strengthened on the basis of monitoring findings and recommendations. The shift of ECD monitoring and evaluation focus from outputs to results, during the later part of the program, allowed grantees greater flexibility to make necessary modifications in implementation strategies and requirements, to respond to partners' feedback and changing project contexts.

7 1 7 Establishment of Strong Networks with Government and Non-Government Institutions The establishment of strong private sector collaboration with government and various civil society groups has greatly contributed to the success of ECD and many of its subprojects. At the community level, for instance, the welfare facilities established under the ECD program are now closely supervised by local government units. Day care service is monitored and backstopped by the Department for Social Welfare and Development (DSWD), and the Department of Culture (DECS) while the health services are under the close supervision of the Department of Health (DOH). The agro-forestry and environmental rehabilitation projects of ALSONS, DOLE STANFILCO, RAFI were carried out in close coordination with agencies like the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) and Department of Agriculture (DA). In some cases, the barangay councils now provide the funds for the salaries of the health and day care workers. The funds come their Internal Revenue Allotment (IRA).

7 2 Obstacles to Effective Project Implementation

Mr Gerry Porta, the ECD Program Coordinator, some grantees and their community partners also identified a number of factors that hampered, in varying degrees, the smooth implementation of projects. These are

- 7 2 1 Overemphasis of ECD of meeting targets or outputs at the expense of focusing on the attainment of desirable results and impacts** As mentioned earlier, all the grant agreements examined for this evaluation put a great deal of emphasis on quantifiable outputs and fixed (e.g., three-year) project cycle with little consideration of the diversity of community conditions and readiness of partners to go into community development. As a result, some projects failed to give, more if not as much, attention to achievement of positive results and impacts.
- 7 2 2 Some corporations remained very output oriented** Although the later part of the ECD program has put emphasis on results and impacts, some of the grantees remained heavily output oriented. They followed fixed deadlines and schedules at the expense of ensuring project sustainability. It is important that the private sector be continuously influenced and motivated to put equal if not more emphasis on results and positive impacts when doing community-based work.
- 7 2 3 Some corporations have given less value and importance to the work of their foundations** Foundation employees have been paid less than regular company personnel. This practice can easily send the signal to officials and employees that their outreach programs are less important than technical and profit-making activities. It can jeopardize or weaken the efforts that have gone into infusing greater corporate social responsibility in the private sector.

- 7 2 4 Some corporations did not apply the same standards of work performance and service to their ECD projects** While some grantees were very output oriented, others adopted a more “patron- client” perspective and tolerated the unnecessary “failings” of their subproject partners For example, the credit program in Pandaya, Meycauyan, Bulacan failed because the officers were not able to enforce the repayment of loans The community organizer and another program implementor explained that many of the borrowers could not pay their loans because of poverty The loans were used for the purchase of public utility tricycles An efficient collection system and close monitoring by ECD project coordinators could have easily solved the problem since tricycle driving is a very viable income generating livelihood
- 7 2 5 Conflict or Lack of Cooperation Between the Grantee or Subproject Implementors and Local Leaders** The ECD experience shows clearly the importance of getting the cooperation and support of local political leaders The latter could easily jeopardize project activities through use of their executive and legislative powers, or by simply forging dissension among community residents This problem came out in the documentation of the AFI experience in Makati, BCI and the RAFI subprojects
- 7 2 6 Rigid and “Inflexible” Requirements of USAID** Some grantees recalled their difficulty with the many and inflexible requirements of USAID The NORKIS experience, for example, called for the infusion of additional capital to get the stonecraft business on competitive ground However, USAID was said to have strictly enforced the grant agreement which prevented the cooperative from getting additional capital from other sources and from incurring any debt According to some grantees their requests for modification of project activities and for budget realignment were turned down even if these were necessary and relevant

- 7 2 7 Shifts in ECD Direction and Frequent Change of Leadership** Some grantees noted that during the duration of their projects (1987-1994), there was no clear and unified direction given by the ECD coordinators. There was frequent change of leadership and technical staff. This caused some difficulties in project coordination and implementation. Subproject plans were designed with zero or limited community participation. For example, USAID insisted on the establishment of health, day care and feeding centers, when what the community wanted most was the construction of a water system.
- 7 2 8 Inadequate Support to Ensure Success and Sustainability** In some of the subprojects that failed or had difficulty getting off the ground (e.g., ANSCOR, BCI, DOLE STANFILCO, and NORKIS) the problem had to do with inadequate skills of community partners to implement projects well and respond to unintended developments and problems. Basic courses in bookkeeping, accounting or production of quality crafts were often inadequate to ensure efficient work. Microenterprise (i.e., ANSCOR) suffered from lack of viable marketing plan or strategy. Credit programs on the other hand, were affected by weak leadership and wrong attitude of members. The culture of patronage politics and "dole-out" orientation have also caused among the people and subsequent problems for project implementors. Only sustained awareness raising and community organizing could have helped overcome these obstacles.
- 7 2 9 Inability of LGUs and Community Organizations to Sustain their Commitment** While many of the projects visited by the research team are still operational, some have problems related to the capacity of LGUs and PO partners to sustain their support. The multi-purpose centers (buildings) built through ECD grants and visited by the researchers for instance, need repair and upkeep. The community associations and barangay councils who were entrusted with the care of these infrastructures did not have the resources and commitment to carry out their obligations. Some agro-forestry projects have experienced some

problems due to inadequate monitoring visits and technical support from DENR and DA personnel

7.2.10 Lack of Competent and Qualified Program and Project Personnel A member of the program and project partners interviewed for this evaluation noted that some implementation problems had to do with project personnel who were not qualified or competent enough to do their work. The ANSCOR experience, for instance, showed that skills in community organizing and awareness raising are very critical to ensure that projects are carried out well. Community organizers must have both the professional preparation and practical experience to ensure high level of performance. The NORKIS experience, on the other hand, showed the lack of fit between the qualifications of the project officers and the demands of the job. All had accounting background, yet their work necessitated knowledge and experience in community organizing and networking. In other cases, project personnel were not imbued with the proper values and commitment such that precious funds were lost due to mismanagement.

LESSONS LEARNED

8 1 What are the lessons learned from the ECD experience? What was innovative and cross-cutting? What can and should be replicated? What lessons can planners of similar programs in the country or the region learn from the ECD experience?

What was innovative about ECD?

8 1 1 *Relevance of ECD to Current National Situation*

The most important lesson learned from the ECD experience is the relevance of the program concept in countries like the Philippines where the gap between the rich and the poor remains very wide. The program is likewise appropriate in this country since business corporations have ample resources and technical expertise to engage in sustainable development work in partnership with basic communities and organized people's organizations. Globalization and liberalization will continue to concentrate wealth in the hands of fewer individuals and groups. As a countervailing strategy, it is important to continue advocating for greater corporate social responsibility.

However, the capacity of the private sector to sustain its support for community development largely depends on the country's economic situation. The current financial crisis had already reduced business profits and allocations for socio-civic work. The private foundations, established or strengthened through the ECD program have to be continuously encouraged to expand their networks and intensity resource generation. The League of Corporate Foundations, for example, can have parallel counterparts at the regional, provincial and even municipal levels.

8 1 2 *Spread Effect of ECD Values*

As mentioned earlier, one of the success factors of the ECD program was the support from the owners and top management of partner corporations. However, the appreciation of ECD goals and consciousness about corporate

social responsibility seem limited to them and a few other leaders in the private sector. For ECD to expand and grow, it is important that the succeeding generation of corporate leaders be "infected" with the same passion and commitment of their predecessors.

8.1.3 Empowerment Approach to Sustainable Development

ECD demonstrated workable approaches to community development and transformation at local and regional levels of implementation. More than this, it showed quite persuasively, the value of partnering and linking in community work by focusing on the strengths of each stakeholder against the backdrop of a people-oriented strategy of development.

Past experience has shown the problems inherent in pursuing a development strategy that puts an inordinately singular focus on factors of development without considering equally important forces. The participation and sustainable development perspective thus places critical emphasis on the process of linking together the different factors (i.e., organizational support, policy mandate) and forces (i.e., socioeconomic and political climate) that make possible the attainment of short-term objectives and long-term goals.

The empowerment approach puts a premium on equal participation of all partners in all stages of the program/project cycle - - from needs assessment and problem identification to preparation of project plan, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. It is sensitive to the different needs and capabilities of women and men, of organizations and communities. The ECD experience has effectively demonstrated how the approach can truly improve the quality of life of poor people if carried out well.

The diversity of project components and activities reflect the enormity of problems and needs of grassroots communities. While some outputs responded to very basic needs of people for clean water, toilet facilities, and day care centers, others pursued more strategic objectives like enterprise development and economic production. What was the key to the success of many of these

initiatives, however, was the process of moving people from the level of attaining improved welfare to gaining greater access to resources that could in turn enhance their participation in their own development. This was made possible through the emphasis on community organizing and building capabilities of the beneficiaries in project management and implementation. Some cases dramatize the capacity-building interventions as others show the linking-partnering advantages. As the AFI and BCI cases demonstrate, resource + management + social commitment yielded bountiful results.

Other winning combinations of factors are shown by the DOLE STANFILCO, ALSONS and ANSCOR. These include combinations of community organizing + training, micro-lending living tree approach, setting-up of cooperative construction and/or renovation of basic services like day care and health care centers and potable water systems.

Concern for community organizing without socioeconomic improvement on the lives of the beneficiaries will have lower chances of success. Without tangible socioeconomic results the beneficiaries will not be interested in the projects. This was shown in the experiences of ANSCOR, DOLE STANFILCO and ALSONS.

8.1.4 *Emphasis on Process to Ensure Sustainability*

The value of process as against outputs can not be over-emphasized. While efficiency and meeting well-defined targets are central to project performance they should be tempered by respect for processes. For instance, the Benguet Consolidated Industries Community Relation personnel talked at length about their experience of having to listen and consult many groups in the communities they worked with. They had to patiently intercede in group conflicts and get the people to work together. The project implementors of ANSCOR, DOLE STANFILCO, AFI, ARMCO and ALSONS also emphasized the need for continuous coordination and consultation with various partners - - LGUs, people's associations, community residents and political leaders, to get their cooperation in meeting project targets.

Social preparation and capability building of program/project partners are equally important. People become more committed to the project and become responsible for its care if enough time is devoted to awareness raising, value formation and training in relevant skills. The NORKIS experience is a very good example of how a project fails because of inadequate attention to social preparation.

8.1.5 Integration of Corporate Work Ethic and Management Systems into Community Development

If the ECD program has influenced the private sector to put emphasis on participatory processes, it has also influenced the praxis of community development by insisting on the merits of sound financial management, close supervision, intensive monitoring and continuous project review as well as replanning. By weaving into the fabric of CD work the corporate standards of efficiency and technical expertise, the ECD program has shown that it is possible to combine the best elements of the "two worlds". Desirable results can be achieved indeed by combining the standards of efficiency and professionalism with empowerment approaches.

For instance, the member of the research team who visited the projects of DOLE STANFILCO and ALSONS noted the high level of efficiency in which the corporate foundations and their partner organizations have implemented the subprojects. He observed that the groups' financial records were all in order; they had good filing systems from the main office down to the field offices. Even the field offices used the Form 201 - a background file of individual beneficiaries complete with up-to-date data on their project involvement. ARMCO and RAFI also benefited a lot from the timely monitoring feedback of ECD technical staff. As project problems and constraints were identified, the two grantees were able to redesign their work and eventually turn what could have been the worst-managed projects into highly successful ones.

ANSCOR, for its part, was most generous in sharing with their community partners all the skills necessary to sustain organizations and livelihood projects. Company staff served as resource persons in such skills training as SWOT

analysis strategic planning (i.e. formulation of vision, mission and goals) management and leadership and marketing. The lesson learned here however, is that the provision of training and other capability building skills are not enough to ensure project sustainability. They have to be supplemented by continuous mentoring or "on field" learning activities (i.e. through monitoring) and values orientation. For the livelihood projects, ANSCOR assisted its partners in marketing their products. It helped them establish quality control of products which eventually enabled them to enter the export market. The other grantees that engaged in microenterprise and credit projects transferred to their community partners the necessary skills and orientation to ensure profitability and return of investments. While there were many mistakes and failures along the way, the ECD experience has clearly shown that such ventures can succeed and become viable with enough dosage of commitment and professionalism.

The RAFI-ECD and BCI-ECD experiences also substantiated the value of systems and procedures in project implementation. They learned to improve their systems and procedures especially in the following functional areas: personnel and human resource development, administration, management of information system, and project management. It is now using a Project Team approach in the execution of projects. This approach has been found to be creative, innovative and effective.

8.1.6 *Establishment of Strong Linkages with LGUs, NGOs and other Development-Oriented Groups*

The importance of working closely with various development-oriented groups, especially local government units in the project sites, was demonstrated by all the projects evaluated. The RAFI experience, for instance, highlights the critical role of various interest groups in ensuring project success and sustainability. Initially, there were a lot of animosities surrounding the project. The people and organizations were at odds with each other since the local government officials were not part of the project. They were only tapped whenever the foundation and its partners were asked for LGU counterpart support. What was disturbing was the perception that the partners and the people's organizations were considered as threats to the local government units.

In the light of these experiences, the foundation learned that it is important to work closely with the LGUs. Through use of the Participatory Rural Appraisal Planning (PRAP) approach, the foundation was able to help strengthen the role of LGUs in governance. It enabled them to assume greater responsibilities. It taught them how to prioritize, collaborate, coordinate, complement and pool resources with the GOs, NGOs, the foundation and their local constituents. This approach also demonstrated that local governance, accountability, transparency and realistic leveling of expectations by the stakeholders are key to community development.

The LGU political factor can greatly facilitate project implementation or retard it, when conflicts arise owing to differences in interests of the parties concerned. In the Makati case, the rivalry between two powerful groups affected the successful implementation of programs in two pilot barangays, when the mayor issued a 'cease all coordination with the Ayala Foundation until further notice' memo. What could have normally derailed development efforts did not work in this case because of an equally powerful force based on wealth and resources. Thus, other pathways were taken and other barangays were assisted.

8.1.7 Gender Policy to Promote Women's Strategic Role in Development

While many practical needs of women were addressed by the ECD subprojects, they did not address women's strategic interests (e.g., access to high income and nontraditional occupations, equality in decision-making). Many community associations remain male-dominated. While women are indeed very visible and active in project activities, majority are confined to stereotyped positions and roles. This observation is borne out by experiences of BCI, ANSCOR, DOLE STANFILCO, RAFI and ALSONS. Future programs of this nature must have a gender policy to ensure the integration of gender principles and objectives in all phases of the program/project cycle. Additional resources and activities may be incorporated in project designs to ensure women's greater participation in leadership positions. Access to credit, welfare services and income generating

projects must be carried out in ways that do not intensify women's workload or lead to other problems like domestic violence

On the whole the ECD program was relevant and appropriate to the needs of the country. The program strategies were generally effective in achieving the overall goal of expanding the role of private sector in community development. Its most valuable contribution lies in integrating into the world view and praxis of the private sector the philosophy and workable strategies of participatory development. ECD was also able to show the many possibilities of combining the principles of efficiency and professionalism with consultative approaches, of decisive leadership with sensitivity to differences in needs and interests.

Empowering ordinary people and communities will enable them to negotiate their own interests in a situation of competing forces and interests. What is needed is to continue strengthening people's organizations so that they can work for their own interests and concerns. It is common knowledge that the state performs 'public action for the public good' and the market sector pursues 'private action for private good' civil society forces undertake 'private action for the public good'. Yet the ECD experience validates the possible convergence of the three actors in the area of community development. In the spirit of critical collaboration and dynamic negotiations the three can work together to contribute to lasting peace and economic growth.

REFERENCES

Andres Soriano Corporation (ANSCOR)

Terminal Report Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project (CLAP)

The Center for Institutions' Participatory Development, Inc , Final Report Impact Evaluation of the ASJRF Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project in Pampanga, Tarlac and Zambales, Nov 15, 1996

ARMCO-USAID Enterprise for Community Development (ECD) "Community Agro-Forestry and Microenterprise Development Project" Final Project Report, May 04, 1992-December 31, 1995

Bataro, Red, Alvarez, Girlie S , et al , "Tales of Travail and Triumph A PHINMA ComRel Casebook on Transforming Communities," 1996 (Research Report)

BCI-CDAP, Main Grant of Agreement - Grant Aid No 492-0395-G-SS-2056-00, March 24, 1992

Brochure on League of Corporate Foundations

Brochure on the Makati NGO Network

Brochure on Ramon Abotiz Foundation, Inc "Touching People Shaping the Future," Cebu City, 1998

Brochure on C Alcantara & Sons, Inc , Davao City "The Truth About ALSONS IFMA"

C Alcantara & Sons, Inc

Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project Field Trip Reports

Porta, Gerardo A , Field Trip to C Alcantara and Sons, Inc (ALSONS), April 29, 1994

"Notes on the Monitoring Review Conducted on April 27-May 2, 1996"

Parado, Rosamund, Letter dated June 3, 1996
re Grant No 492-0395-G-SS-3083-00

Modification 2, VS Mod 1

Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project Progress Reports

Solar Dryer Inauguration Report

Progress Report as of June 30, 1994

Cumulative Project Accomplishment To-date 1st Quarter, Prepared October 22, 1993

Cumulative Project Accomplishment To-date 3rd Quarter, Prepared April 26, 1994

Cumulative Project Accomplishment To-date 2nd Quarter, Prepared Jan 28, 1994

Quarterly Progress Report July 16 to September 30, 1996, Prepared October 22, 1993

Upland Agro-forestry Development Project Grant Files, FY 1993

Davao Union Cement Corporation

A Terminal Evaluation Study of Project Damayan Para sa Kaunlaran (PDPK), July 1993

A Mid-Program Evaluation Study of Project Damayan Pars sa Kaunlaran (PDPK), October, 1991

Newsletter "Community Relations," November 1998

Demborski, Donald E , Robles, Eliodoro G , and Vourvoulis, "Final Report Enterprise in Community Development Mid-Term Strategic Assessment," (Development Associates, Inc June 20, 1991)

Development Associates, Inc , "Final Report on Enterprise in Community Development Project Mid-Term Strategic Assessment, (Contract No OTR-000-0-00-0035-00, Work Order Number 4)," Virginia, U S A , June 20, 1991

Dole Stanfilco

Progress /Implementation Reports on Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project

Cumulative Project Accomplishment To-Date 3rd Semester, 1994

Cumulative Project Accomplishment To-Date 5th Semester, 1994

Project Implementation Plan 1st Quarter, February 16-March 31, 1994

Project Implementation Plan 2nd Quarter, April 1-June 30, 1994

Semi-Annual Progress Report January 1995-June 1995

Stanfilco/USAID Funds Financial Status as of December 31, 1996

Semi-Annual Progress Report January 1996-June 1996

Semi-Annual Implementation Plan July 1996-February 1997

Financial Report FY 94

Final Inventory Report February 28, 1997

Community Baseline Report FY 1994

Financial Close-out Review for DOLE Stanfilco (DOLE)
Grant No 492-0395-G-SS-4019-00

Enzio Business Clinic, "Terminal Report of the USAID-RAFI Ecosystem Project," Cebu City, 1996 (Research Report)

Institute for Small Farms and Industries (ISFI), Ateneo de Davao University "An Evaluation Report on the Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project," June 4, 1996

_____ "An Evaluation Study of the Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project of DOLE Stanfilco," June 11, 1997

_____ "Project Evaluation Conducted for Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project of ALSONS," July 20, 1996

Inocian, Jeremy F , "Ecosystem Cebu Project Undertaking an Integrated Community Development Program," Cebu City, 1996

Lamug, Corazon B , Ph D , and Cardenas, Virginia R , Ph D , "Final Report of the Social Soundness Analysis of Enterprise in Community Development II," University of the Philippines, Laguna, Philippines July 1993

Lawenko, Rene C , "PHINMA Practices in Comrel Program Management Through Internal Units/Departments of the Corporation," Paper delivered at the National Conference on Corporate Community Relations held on 17-18 March 1994 at the Cebu Plaza Hotel

League of Corporate Foundations Environment Committee Report, June 23, 1998

League of Corporate Foundations, Inc , Corporate Citizens, Volume 2, Number 2, July 1998

Makati Development Program A Response to Urban Poverty, A Final Evaluation Report, Makati City, November, 1997

Makati Development Program Annual Evaluation and Planning Workshop 1995 Proceedings Caliraya Recreation Center Lumban, Laguna, August 9-11, 1996

_____ Mid-Term Evaluation Report, August 1993-July 1995

_____ Annual Report, December 31, 1994

_____ Annual Report, October 1994-September 1995

_____ Annual Report, October 1995-September 30, 1996

Makati Network Annual Report, 1996-1997

Makati Network Annual Report, 1997-1998

Makati Network Newsletters, 1992-1995

Memorandum to Ms Liza P Magno on "Financial Close-Out Review for Dole-Stanfilco Grant No 492-0395-G-SS-4019-00 dated July 25, 1997

Norkis Group Management Systems, Inc ,

Grant of Agreement dated September 6, 1989 (Grant No AID 492-0395-G-SS-9062-00

Social Development Desk, Southwestern University, Cebu City, "Terminal Evaluation Report of a Micro-Enterprise Project," Norkis Group Management Services, Compostela, Cebu, n d

PHINMA-COMREL Briefing Materials, n d

PHINMA Cement Group Community Relations, "Project Beneficiary and Cost Summary January-June, 1998"

Stanfilco Project Implementation Plan, March 28, 1994

UICI, Asia Rattan Project, Final Project Report on the Community Agro-Forestry and Microenterprise Development Project, Pampanga, 1995

USAID and Stanfilco Division of Dole Philippines, Inc " Ang Tanum sa Libuganon The Success Story of Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project," n d

USAID-RAFI Ecosystem Project "Executive Summary of the Terminal Report of the Evaluation Conducted on the USAID-RAFI Ecosystem Project (Period Covered 1990-1996)"

Urban Integrated Communities, Inc "Community-Based Agro-Forestry Development Dole-Stanfilco Experience "

_____ Monitoring Report, June 1994, DOLE Stanfilco (Phils), Inc

_____ Monitoring Report, VI-1 68 01

_____ Training Report, April 1994

Distribution of Grantees by Year of Project Start And by Duration of Project Implementation

Table 1 Distribution of Grantees by Year of Project Start

Year Started	Number	Percent
1988	3	8%
1989	8	22
1990	1	3
1991	2	5
1992	11	30
1993	9	24
1994	3	8
Total	37	100%

Table 2 Distribution of Grantees by Duration of Project Implementation

Duration in Years	Number	Percent
1	1	3%
2	12	32
3	15	40
4	4	11
5	4	11
7	1	3
Total	37	100%

Source Enterprise in Community Development (ECD) Co Financing Portfolio (As of June 17 1998)

Table 3 Distribution of Grantees by Location by Total Amount of ECD Grant

Areas	Number	Percent	Amount of ECD Grant in US \$	Percent
Luzon incl NCR	9	38%	3 096 210 00	27%
Mindanao	8	33	1 536 720 00	14
Visayas	5	21	5 411 070 00	48
Nationwide	2	8	1 279 648 00	11
Total	24	100%	11 323 648 00	100%

Source Enterprise Community Development (ECD) Co Financing Portfolio (As of June 17 1998)

Note Total amount released by USAID for ECD projects amounted to US \$11 4M for 24 grantees and 13 sub grantees
P28 00 to US \$1 was used as conversion rate for amount reflected in Peso

ANNEX B

LIST OF INFORMANTS INTERVIEWED/CONSULTED FOR THE USAID ENTERPRISE IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT EVALUATION

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
Gerardo A Porta	USAID-ECD	Program Coordinator	Manila Office
Dominica B Chua	Aboitiz and Company, Inc and Ramon Aboitiz Foundation, Inc	Chief Operating Officer	Cebu City
Zenaida Mira	-ditto-	Development Worker	Cebu City
Officers and Members of the Cooperative in Brgy Daruhan Minglanilla Cebu	-ditto-	Officers and Members	Brgy Daruhan, Cebu
Lemia Simbulan	Andres Soriano Corporation and Andres Soriano Jr Foundation	Officer-in-Charge	ANSCOR Office, Pasay City
Nidia Mingon	-ditto-	Project Officer	Pampanga
Gina Bautista	-ditto- Brgy Anunas Multipurpose Coop	Secretary	Anunas, Angeles, Pampanga
Vic Torres	-ditto- Phil Business for Social Progress	Project Officer	Angeles, Pampanga
Margie Quinsay	-ditto- Mother Rosa Foundation	Project Officer	Pampanga
Joven Chua	-ditto- Tinsmith Project	Worker and Owner	Brgy Buensuceso, Pampanga
Adelina Cortez	-ditto- Buensuceso Garment	Quality Control Supervisor	-ditto-

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
Ma Neriza F Palo	Asia Rattan Manufacturing Company (ARMCO)/ AWECA Foundation	Assistant to the President	Angeles Pampanga
Romeo N Sicat	ARMCO/ AWECA Foundation	Project Manager	-ditto-
Mary Grace T Sandico	ARMCO/AWECA Foundation	Training Program Specialist	-ditto-
Jovita A David	ARMCO SAMAKACT/MPC	Chairperson	-ditto-
Ricardo Salazar	-ditto-	Vice-Chairperson	-ditto-
Maximo Balagtas	-ditto-	General Manager	-ditto-
Carlota Guanlao	Barangay Health Workers Ass n	Volunteer Health Worker	-ditto-
Violeta Santos	ARMCO SAMAKACT/MPC	BOD Member	-ditto-
Merle Guanlao	-ditto-	BOD Member	-ditto-
Marites Salazar	-ditto-	BOD Member	-ditto-
Lucia Guarla	-ditto-	Volunteer Health Worker	-ditto-

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
Carmelo Cabrera	Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc (Social Development Division)	Director for Operations	Greenbelt Drive, Makati
Ma Margarita Bongon	-ditto-	Senior Development Specialist	-ditto-
Cecille Tan	-ditto-	Accountant	-ditto
Roy Micalat	-ditto- Makati NGO Network Secretariat	Secretariat	Metro South Coop Bldg , Makati City
Fr Andrew Fabio	Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc MDP – KS Bank	BOD Member	Tejeros, Makati City
Eduardo T Martelino	-ditto-	General Manager	-ditto-
Roberto T Magdamit	-ditto-	BOD Member	-ditto-
Obdulla Gealogo	-ditto-	Treasurer/Asst Gen Manager	-ditto-
Ana Marisa V Sarroca	Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc MDP – Palanan Multi-Purpose Coop	General Manager	Palanan, Makati
Petite dela Rosa	-ditto-	Treasurer	-ditto-
Women Vendors	Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation Inc MDP – SAPIKARIN	Vendors	Coryville, La Paz, Makati
Joel Canuel	Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc (Social Development Division)	Development Officer	-ditto-

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
Rene C Lawenko	Bacnotan Consolidated Industries, Inc (BCI)	Director Community Relations Office	Makati Office
Lito Rodriguez	BCI, PHINMA Group	Com Rel Coordinator	Makati Office
Base M De Villeres	Davao Union Cement Co (DUCC)	Com Rel Coordinator	Davao City
Charito Dumalay	BCI Liputan Multi-Purpose Cooperative Inc (LMPCI)	Secretary	Meycauayan, Bulacan
Mylene Hilario	BCI LMPCI	Collector	-ditto-
Emily Dumalay	-ditto-	Barangay Health Worker	Liputan Island Meycauayan, Bulacan
Luis Torres, Jr	-ditto-	Chairperson	-ditto-
Hermia Villarco	-ditto-	Day Care Worker	-ditto-
Barbara Torres	-ditto-	BookKeeper	-ditto-
Rodrigo Legaspi	-ditto-	Barangay Captain	-ditto-
Zeny Go	-ditto-	Barangay Councilwoman	-ditto-
Jose R Legazpi	-ditto-	BOD /Member – LMPCI	-ditto-
Eddie Cervantes	-ditto-	BOD - LMPCI	-ditto-

LS

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
Guillermo Reyes	BCI LMPCI	Water Pump Operator	Liputan Island, Bulacan
Jose Gutierrez	-ditto-	Barangay Councilor	-ditto-
Barbara Torres	-ditto-	Treasurer	-ditto-
Norma Sanggalang	-ditto-	Barangay Councilwoman	-ditto-
Regina V Wage	Rural Health Unit – RHU	RHU Personnel	Pandayan, Meycauayan, Bulacan
Micahelle G Villaverde	-ditto-	-ditto-	-ditto-
Lucita Alcilo	Barangay Health Workers Ass n	Barangay Health Worker	-ditto-
Angelita Espirtu	-ditto-	-ditto-	-ditto-
Lucia Rivera	-ditto-	-ditto-	-ditto-
Eleuterio Batungbakal	Pandayan Barangay Council	Chairperson	-ditto-
Lena Eomenes	Barangay Health Workers Ass n	President of BHW	-ditto-
Carmen Bugash	Norkis Group Management Systems, Inc	Executive Director	Cebu City
Joselita L Obejero	Norkis Trading Co , Inc	Former Program Officer	A S Fortune St , Mandaue City
Ma Theresa P Acelo	Norkis Trading Co Inc	Current Program Officer	-ditto-

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
No names (2 informants)	Alcantara and Sons	Project Manager Auditor	Lanang, Davao del Norte
No names (2 informants)	-ditto-	Field Operations Manager Community Organizer	Mun of Talaingod, Davao del Norte
No names (7 informants,FGD)	-ditto-	Officers and members of the Talaingod Women's Association, Inc	Sto Nino Talaingod, Davao del Norte
No names (10 informants, FGD)	-ditto-	Officers and members of the Dagohoy Multipurpose Cooperative	Dagohoy Talaingod Davao del Norte
No names (15 informants, FGD)	-ditto-	Ata Beneficiaries (10 males and 5 females)	Salawaw Talaingod, Davao del Norte
No names (2 informants)	-ditto-	President and Treasurer of the Dagohoy Small Farmers Association	Dagohoy, Talaingod, Davao del Norte
No names (3 informants)	DOLE-Stanfilco	Project Manager Community Organizer and Auditor	Lanang Davao del Norte
No names (15 informants FGD)	-ditto-	Leaders and Members of Kapunongan sa Ginsawaan nga Nagkahiusang Coop	Libuton Kapalong, Davao del Norte
No names (14 informants FGD, 15 men 4 women)	-ditto-	Nagkahiusang Mag-uuma sa Lagandang (NAMALA)	Sitio Lagandang Sambayon Suaon Kapalong, Davao del Norte

NAME OF INFORMANT/ RESOURCE PERSONS	CORPORATION/FOUNDATION/ ORGANIZATION	POSITION	AREAS VISITED
No names (3 informants)	DOLE-Stanfilco (LGUs/Other Stakeholders)	Barangay Health Workers	Sambayon Suaon Kapalong Davao del Norte
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	Day Care Center Teacher	-ditto-
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	Barangay Captain	-ditto-
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	PENRO DENR	Panabo Davao del Norte
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	Municipal Agriculturist DA	Talaingod Davao del Norte
No names (4 informants)	-ditto-	Vice-Mayor and 3 Sanggunian Bayan Members	Kapalong Davao del Norte
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	Municipal Agriculturist DA	-ditto-
No name (1 informant)	-ditto-	Municipal Social Welfare and Development Officer	-ditto-

SUMMARY OF PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS

**1 Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc
Makati Development Program Accomplishments (1993-1997)**

Project Components	Accomplishments
1 1 Vocational and technical scholarships provided (computers, electronics, automotive, apparel, etc)	357 scholars assisted task forces on education created in barangays program orientation conducted MOAs forged between scholars, AFI, schools values formations and leadership seminars alumni association formed
1 2 Vocational and technical skills training and placement (info tech outreach, high speed sewing computer literacy, food and beverage, etc)	1,564 trained (78% placed in jobs) Kabisig Workers Guild-Integrated Recruitment Training Placement (IRTP)
1 3 Environmental Protection	Training courses (donor beneficiary approach) - Partnerships forged with 12 donor- "building" and 6 beneficiary organizations - 6 barangays - 63 trainings Pilot-test zero waste management MOAs with 51 organizations Recycling Equipment Waste Segregation Closed-loop Concept
1 4 Enterprise Development	Coop assistance/support - Assisted/supported 18 coops, 31 individual/ group enterprises Credit Assistance - 14 conduit NGO/PO coops and 27 individual enterprises Training for cooperatives and microenterprises - 69 training seminars/workshops attended by 1917 participants - Conducted trainings for 11 cooperatives and 4 enterprises, 14 institutions as consultants Consultancy services (accounting systems, financial audit organizational development, market and product development, etc)

Project Components	Accomplishments
1 5 Barangay Integrated Development Program	Planning workshop - 1 in de la Paz
	Comprehensive baseline survey (75% of Makati earn below the poverty threshold 60% had difficulty meeting daily needs, etc) - 18 barangays
	Capacity building (organizational management, networking and multisectoral linkages, fund management) - 11 CBOs strengthened and/or organized - 4,491 beneficiaries reached
	Community building seminar - 2,523 participants benefited from 89 trainings
	Accessing knowledge /information and services (maternal and child survival, family planning, immunization, oral dehydration therapy, etc) - 8 trainings benefited 217 individuals - 196 benefited from supplemental feeding - 190 immunized for Hepa B
	Enhanced capability of youth organizations - scholarship (free tuition fees, uniforms, school supplies) - 142 indigent children benefited, assisted 150 elementary students and 100 high school students
1 6 Makati NGO Network – Local Governance and Civil Education	Training to promote awareness building on local governance conducted - 37 trainings with 1282 participants
	Civic education trainings conducted - 23 trainings benefited 2461 participants
	24 trainings conducted on LGU capacity building - technical writing, livelihood development and management, facilitator's training for SK etc
	Facilitated GO-NGO consultative meetings - 1621 participants benefited from 64 activities
	Organizational development interventions (committee and sector-based meetings, general assemblies and planning workshop, publication of the MNN newsletter) - 328 activities conducted with 3696 participants
	- 160,000 copies of MNN newsletter circulated

Source Makati Development Program A Response to Urban Poverty – Final Evaluation Report (Ayala Makati City November 1997)

2 Bacnotan Consolidated Industries, Inc (BCI), Community Development Assistance Project (1992-1995)

Project Components	Accomplishments
2 1 Baseline Survey	Statistical profile of the beneficiaries established through baseline survey
2 2 Installation of potable water systems	24 potable water installed 2200 families benefited
2 3 Construction of low cost toilets (training on proper sanitation, waste disposal management, toilet repair and maintenance)	1000 sanitary toilets constructed for 1000 families
2 4 Infrastructure Development	Established health centers where trainings were conducted for BHWs with technical assistance from DOH - 6 health care centers constructed - 2500 beneficiary families
	Established day care centers - 20 day care centers constructed benefiting 1200 children Organized mothers of participant children
2 5 Environmental Rehabilitation	24 trainings conducted Procurement of seedlings of certified agro-forest species with high economic and environmental value
	2 community nurseries established Conducted workshops on environmental assessment and planning
2 6 Credit Facilities	Provision of revolving fund
	Skills training of ECD staff and beneficiaries (development management, community organizing, bookkeeping, training of trainers, coop development, financial management)
	Exposure programs to other ECD projects
	2 training centers constructed

3 Andres Soriano Corporation (ANSCOR) and Andres Soriano, Jr Foundation (ASJRF) Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project (CLAP) Accomplishments (1992-1996)

Project Components	Accomplishments
3 1 Social Preparation and Organizational Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exploratory talks, consultations and program orientation • Cooperative pre-membership seminar for women/youth • Coop reorientation seminar • Trainings (SWOT Analysis, Personality Growth and Development Training, Management Leadership Training, Organizational Mechanics, Coop development values orientation, etc)
3 2 Market Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local foreign market linkages established • Job orders secured, product promotion • Development of marketing strategies and plans
3 3 Product Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Product planning • Production of good quality products
3 4 Enhancement of Skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provision of technology and skills training (tapped buyers/contractors, engaged services of other entrepreneurs/organizations, training on decorative items-making and other accessories, candle making, mushroom growing) • Training of the marketing representative
3 5 Business Enterprise Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff development trainings (simple bookkeeping and accounting) • Assessment meetings among coop/group leaders and officers
3 6 Provision of Seed Funds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Release of 4 0M seed fund in the form of loan or grant (purchase of tools/equipment as additional working capital, improved work area • 20 enterprises benefited
3 7 Family Income Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capital build-up through 15% share of member's earnings (not imposed)

Source Terminal Report, Community-Based Livelihood Project by the Andres Soriano, Jr Foundation, Inc (no date)

4 Norkis Group Management Systems Inc – Compostela Microenterprise Project (First year) and Pasaka Cooperative (2nd & 3rd year)

Project Components	Accomplishments
4 1 Organizational Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 170 community residents organized as members of the cooperative
4 2 Capability Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On-the-job training in stone craft production and marketing for workers/members • Training of only a few officers on principles of cooperative development, values, values education

5 **Aboitiz and Company, Inc and Ramon Aboitiz Foundation, Inc (RAFI) – Ecosystem Cebu Project (1990-1995)**

Project Components	Accomplishments
5 1 Establishment of community organization in 52 communities with capability to (a) design plan, implement and evaluate community-based development programs (b) develop linkages with external resource agencies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 40 community organizations able to formulate community-based development plans • officers and leaders received training on project and organizational management, value formation, rapid rural appraisal (PRA), project study preparation, basic livelihood skills, cooperative development primary health care, water utilities management, disaster management and cross visitations • 40 community organizations increased membership up to 44 25% from 1993-1996 • linkages established with various GOs, LGUs and NGOs
5 2 Provision of Basic Services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 49 health centers constructed • health services provided in 39 project sites • supplemental feeding in 46 project sites benefiting 2300 malnourished children • health advocacy campaign conducted • construction of potable water systems in 47 project sites • construction of 1390 low-cost toilets in 30 project sites • construction of daycare centers in 27 project sites
5 3 Economic Productivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • established livelihood projects with 46 community organizations • forest protection activities in 9 project sites covering a total of 213 hectares • contour farming practices in 13 projects sites covering a total of 75 hectares • shrub conservation practices in 15 project sites covering a total of 60 hectares • mangrove reforestation covering one hectare in one project site and a total of 3485677 trees planted covering an area of 1908 60 hectares in 52 project sites •
5 4 Community-Based Training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a total of 973 trainings were conducted in 46 project sites
5 5 Network and Linkage Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • allocation of P800,000 by provincial government as local counterpart for various potable water projects • construction of three photo voltaic (solar-powered) potable water systems

**6 DOLE Stanfilco – Libuganon
Rever Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project**

Project Components	Accomplishments
6 1 Organizing, Advocacy and Networking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • environmental awareness seminars conducted among target beneficiaries • information drive in the importance of environmental protection conducted • formed 9 farmers and women's organizations
6 2 Capability Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • conducted seminars on environmental awareness, value formation, leadership and project management • visits of selected beneficiaries to successful Reforestation projects in other areas of Mindanao
6 3 Area Rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 500 hectares of watershed hectares covered for area rehabilitation • 300,000 various species of forest and fruit trees and cover crops planted • establishment of a seedling depot in Baku-Baku and 3 smaller nurseries
6 4 Economic Productivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • introduced environment-friendly farming practices like the Sloping Agricultural Land Technology (SALT), crop diversification integrated farming and integrated pest management • community residents provided monetary incentives for tree planting thereby providing additional source of family income
6 5 Provision of Basic Social Services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • four water impounding projects constructed • renovation of a existing daycare center and health center • construction of 2 daycare centers and 1 health center • provision of medical equipment and supplies • supplemented health services with seminars on proper health care and sanitation
6 6 Security of Tenure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 281 forest occupants were awarded Certificate of Stewardship Contracts (CSC)

**7 Alcantara and Sons, Inc Kapalong Cultural Development Foundation (KCDF)
Upland Agro-forestry Development Project**

Project Components	Accomplishments
7 1 Community Organizing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • established people's organizations or strengthened existing ones • organizations effectively managing various income generating projects
7 2 Capability Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • conducted various workshops in value formation, leadership, communication, problem identification and situation analysis • model farm sites and nurseries established • field trips by selectes beneficiaries to medel agro-forestry projects
7 3 Farm Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • training in crop productivity • provision of loans for purchase of farm animals and implement high yielding • introduced farm technologies – inter-cropping, multi-cropping, crop rotation SALT, etc
7 4 Medium-and-Long-term Income Generating Projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planting of medium-term gestating trees • Inter-planted medium term gestating trees with short-term crops
7 5 Marketing Assistance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • marketing networks established

8 Davao Union Cement Corporation (DUCC)

Project Components	Accomplishments
8 1 Economic Productivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • provided productivity loans to 217 fishing households
8 2 Health Improvement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • constructed 13 water pumps • constructed 2,050 low-cost toilets • trained 53 para-extension workers
8 3 Welfare Services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • established 7 daycare centers • established linkage of daycare centers with DSWD and DECS

9 Alcantara and Sons, Inc – Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project (1993-1996)

Project Components	Accomplishments
9 1 Socio-economic Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• New and improved corn varieties were introduced• Conducted technical trainings and exposure trips• Provision of farm tools and work animals• Installed support systems such as water system and post harvest facilities
9 2 Environmental Rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Introduced environmentally sound technologies, i e , SALT and organic farming

Source Evaluation Report ALSONS-USAID ECD Project 1996

SUMMARY OF PROGRAM/PROJECT RESULTS AND IMPACTS

1 Enterprise in Community Development Program

Program/Project Components	Results/Impacts
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • League of foundations and other corporate Networks established • Corporate foundations established and/or Strengthened • Expanded geographic reach of private sector in Community development
	Increased material and human resource investment of private sector in community development
	Spread of ECD values and workable approaches to other corporations
	Lessened dependency of communities on "dole-outs"
	Improved company relations with communities

2 Ayala Corporation and Ayala Foundation, Inc - Makati Development Program

Project Components	Results/Impacts
2.1 Workforce Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Generated employment opportunities (training and job placement) -77% company employed • Increased incomes (able to shoulder part of HH expenses, able to pay personal bills) – 76% able to augment their HH incomes • Developed self-confidence in self-capacities (developed participants sense of social responsibility and understanding of their role in CD) – 92% with stronger sense of security and self-confidence
2.2 Environment Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased environmental awareness among Makati populace (served as the foundation for the involvement of Makati community in environmental activism) • Access to income sources (project participants managed to lead more comfortable lifestyles, project debunked the traditional dole-out intervention scheme)

Project Components	Results/Impacts
2.3 Enterprise Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guaranteed support for basic HH needs (enterprises served as main source of income and livelihood, income was used to support and send children to school, and for meeting other basic needs) • Gained access to credit at low interest (enabled beneficiaries to increase their capital and expand their business) • Increased earnings and more clients • Enhanced organizational and management capability of cooperatives (improved financial and business management capacities, increased confidence and capacity of the coop leader to govern and manage, beneficiaries have higher sense of organization) • Some businesses experienced losses
2.4 Barangay Integrated Development Program (BIDP)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strengthened spirit of collectivism among urban poor as manifested in the formation of sectoral groups and other CBOs and implementation of various community development projects (CBOs linked up with barangay councils, developed capacities necessary for organizational management) • Improved health conditions (children protected from life-threatening illnesses, couples informed about family planning, women given pre and post natal care) • Greater access to formal education (beneficiaries were able to complete their education through scholarship assistance project) • Issue-based dormant when there is no common issue • Operations not sustained because of poor management and lack of funds

Source: *Makati Development Program: A Response to Urban Poverty – Final Evaluation Report* (Ayala Makati City, November 1997)

3 Bacnotan Cement Industries (BCI) - Community Development Assistance Project (1992-1995)

Project Components	Results/Impacts
3 1 Potable Water Systems	Reduced workload
3 2 Health Centers	Improved Health
3 3 Sanitary Toilets	Reduced incidence of water-borne diseases
3 4 Day Care Centers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased time of adults especially women for livelihood projects • Better performance of children in higher grades
3 5 Multi-purpose Centers	Improved service delivery of local government units and other users of the centers

4 Davao Union Cement Corporation (DUCC) – Social Development Projects

Project Component	Results/Impacts
4 1 Economic Productivity	Increased Household Incomes by 20%
4 2 Health Services (water systems, toilets, etc)	Decreased incidence of parasitism and other water-borne diseases by 80%
4 3 Day Care Centers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased time of adults especially women for livelihood and other productive work • Better performance of children in higher grades • Forged better relationship among community residents

5 DOLE STANFILCO – Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project (1994-1997)

Project Components	Results/Impacts
5 1 Environmental Protection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased environmental awareness (beneficiaries realized the importance of environmental protection) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - area rehabilitation - restored biodiversity in the protected area - decreased incidence of landslides and soil erosion • Improved farm cultivation method <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - reduced "slash and burn" method of farm cultivation - decreased incidence of soil erosion and increased farm productivity through SALT
5 2 Upliftment of Socio-Economic Condition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased income through the living tree incentive scheme and the various livelihood activities • Improved farm productivity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - food sufficiency for family consumption is already being experienced - boosted/increased farm production and income • Improved health and sanitation condition <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - reduction of health problems - beneficiaries acquired the necessary knowledge and proper attitude towards health and sanitation • Security of Tenure <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sense of land ownership affirmed through issuance of the Certificate of Stewardship Contract (CSC) • Organised Communities <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - functional community-based organizations formed - beneficiaries were empowered to respond to their own needs

Source Evaluation Study Libuganon River Watershed Reforestation and Soil Conservation Project DOLE-STANFILCO

12

6 Andres Soriano Corporation (ANSCOR) and Andres Soriano, Jr Foundation (ASJRF) – Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project (1992-1996)

Project Components	Results/impacts
6 1 Social Preparation and Organizational Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expanded linkages with various government and non-governmental organizations (Social Action Center of Pampanga, DTI, DA, DAR, etc)
6 2 Market Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Established local and foreign market linkages • Some enterprises were able to produce good quality products • Increased Sales
6 3 Enhancement of Skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participants gained skills in food production and processing, decoration-making, wrought iron and tinsmith, mushroom production • Increased women's participation in enterprise development
6 4 Business Enterprise Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved organizational development aspect of some of the enterprises • Beneficiaries learned how to prepare business plans
6 5 Family Income Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CLAP provided livelihood during the emergency period (after Mt Pinatubo eruption) • * no significant change in income (beneficiaries' earnings not enough to provide for capital build up)

Sources

- 1 *Impact Evaluation of the Andres Soriano Jr Foundation Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project (CLAP) in Pampanga Tarlac and Zambales, by the Center for Institutions Participatory Development Inc November 15 1996*
- 2 *Terminal Report Community-Based Livelihood Assistance Project (CLAP) implemented by the Andres Soriano Jr Foundation A Soriano Aviation Hangar Andrews Avenue Pasay City*

7 Asia Rattan Manufacturing Company (ARMCO) – Community Agro-Forestry and Microenterprise Development Project (1992-1995)

Project Components	Results/Impacts
7 1 Agriculture and Natural Resource Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Farmers associations formed and strengthened • Developed idle lands into food production showcases (helped solve acute food shortage, served as venue for skills training on modern farm techniques, source of continuous supply of planting materials, commercial farming strategies introduced) • Agricultural produce in the demo farm/ showcase shared among beneficiaries • Established market linkage
7 2 Reforestation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased environmental awareness (importance of environmental protection and conservation flourishment of wildlife as source of livelihood and food solution to draught, etc) • Targets were doubled with minor budget revisions • Intensified research and enhanced linkages (with Pampanga Agricultural College on Training and Technical Assistance) • Sustainable use of miscellaneous forest products
7 3 Livelihood	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strengthened community participation in community development
7 4 Health and Water Sanitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BHWs can negotiate and link directly with the Rural Health Units (RHUs) and Local Government Units (LGUs) • Water associations actively participate in the design and implementation of their water systems • All water systems constructed produced potable water • Improved beneficiaries' physical well-being • Working relationships with the RHU and LGU towards sustainability has been maintained

Source *Final Project Report ARMCO-USAID Enterprise for Community Development (ECD), Agroforestry Microenterprise Development Project (1995)*

8 Norkis Group Management Systems, Inc – Compostela Microenterprise Project

Project Components	Results/Impacts
8 1 Community Organizing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Weak Organization • Inactive Members
8 2 Capability Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Production skills not adequate to improve quality of products • Poor Sales • Some officers and members acquired skills in leadership and project management • Increased income of workers

9 Alcantara and Sons, Inc – Upland Agro-Forestry Development Project (1993-1996)

Project Components	Results/Impacts
9 1 Socio-economic development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved productivity • Increased income • Converted idle/grasslands to productive lands • Improved farming practices • Strengthened community support systems such as "bayanihan" • Honed leadership capabilities of the farmers
9 2 Environmental Rehabilitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved soil quality • Rehabilitated denuded and unproductive land

Source Evaluation Report Alsons-USAID-ECD Project 1996

**Consolidated Project Impacts and Benefits of
ALSONS and DOLE STANFILCO ECD Projects**

Before the Project	Two Years After Phase-Out (Results and Impacts)	Remarks
A Socio-Economic		
Bio-faith gardening and livestock raising in the area was very limited. Arable lands were left barren. There is not much vegetable supply in the area.	More and more residents, both direct and indirect beneficiaries indulged in bio-faith gardening, backyard production and livestock raising.	Non-beneficiaries and beneficiary like Anafe Carmen does not mind having much money to buy basic needs in supermarkets. They have what they need right in their own backyard.
Only two stores available	10 stores	400% increase
Few investors/traders	Many investors and traders operate in the area	These are signs of emerging economic progress in the area.
Average household income of beneficiaries was P1,200.00 a month	P1,400.00 average household income of beneficiary households	This 17% incremental increase in income does not include other non-financial benefits.
B Water Supply		
<p>People got their drinking water in open wells and springs which were unsafe. Malaria, diarrhea, and other diseases were prevalent.</p> <p>Many people had to walk two kilometers away just to fetch water. Time for fetching water consumed a lot of energy, especially among women.</p>	<p>The water impounding facilities (Level 1, 11, and 111) constructed in strategic areas of the beneficiary communities reduced the prevalence of malaria diseases; they now have potable water supply hosed from the reservoir to their backyards and/or homes. Women reduced time for fetching water, averaging 2 hours/day/household, 60 hours/month/household, or 720 hours/year/household.</p> <p>Water users are now organized into independent associations and are already running the maintenance by themselves.</p>	<p>Women have already more time for themselves for rest or for other productive activities.</p> <p>Children are now cleaner than before the project.</p> <p>Family relationships are improved since the irritant on who will fetch water is no longer existent.</p>

Before the Project	Two Years After Phase-Out (Results and Impacts)	Remarks
C Health Centers		
Only few health centers were functional with midwives visiting weekly	<p>Trained barangay health workers are already actively delivering health care delivery services rural health workers and midwives frequently visit the community</p> <p>Lots of households have herbal gardens in their backyards Botica sa Barangay (Barangay Drug Stores) are also seen in some barangays covered by the project</p>	<p>Barangay health workers are provided an honorarium of P150 00/month by the LGUs</p> <p>People have access to fast primary health care services</p> <p>ECD construction-assisted health centers are well-maintained</p>
D Trainings		
Beneficiaries had no trainings on livelihood programs, environmental awareness, value formations, project feasibility studies, leadership, and agricultural technology	Beneficiaries had trainings on livelihood programs, environmental awareness value formations, project feasibility studies, leadership and agricultural technology among others	<p>Pens made of indigenous materials for goat and pig raising stand beside the demo sloping agricultural land technology (SALT) to hasten production of cash crops like corn</p> <p>People applied the learnings in their livelihood projects and community affairs</p> <p>Some trainings like SALT not massively adopted by the participants Basically in Barangay Sua-on, of the 104 beneficiary households, only 15% applied the SALT technology</p>
E Daycare		
Some existing day care centers need renovation, others have to be constructed	Day care or child minding centers are operational in the beneficiary communities They have day care centers with day care teachers funded operationally by the barangay coming from the LGUs Internal Revenue Allotments (IRA) and with counterpart of P20 00 per month/family	<p>Prep school children have the opportunity to learn how to socialize, pray respectful and read and write the alphabet</p> <p>Due to the effects of El Nino to the productivity of the beneficiary community many parents had difficulty paying the P20 00 monthly counterpart This reduced the pupils of day care centers by 50%</p> <p>The LGUs are sustaining the day care teachers</p>

Before the Project	Two Years After Phase-Out (Results and Impacts)	Remarks
F Socio-Psychological		
People were not organized, feeling of 'minding my own business" was prevalent	The people's organization facilitated a "we feeling in the community They already have better relationships including LGU leaders	
G Access to Social Services		
People had limited access to education, health, and livelihood support services	They already have potable water systems, day care centers, health centers, and many areas are already passable	Support services on agro-forestry and agriculture, market support services, and good infrastructure to facilitate transport of goods to markets are still very wanting
H Environmental		
Residents were not mindful of the ecological destruction	People are now concerned about the ecology	The trees are now making the area green and beautiful
No soil conservation projects	With soil conservation projects already	Soil erosion reduced in the area
	Soil fertility is gradually coming back Humidity becomes cooler unlike in the past	
I Impact to Grantees		
Not so conscious of the role of institutional development and the employment of community organizers	They are maintaining community organizers to sustain the development work in tandem with technical staff who have professional background on agro-forestry	
J Impact to LGU officials		
LGU leaders and officials were not active in the delivery of basic social services	LGU leaders and barangay officials already have clear plans on community development projects, i e infrastructure sustainability of day care centers and health centers	LGU leaders are now closer to the people However other support services such as infrastructure marketing support agro-forestry technical support are still wanting

TB