

PD-ABO-127
96469

**OFFICE OF CENTRAL AND COASTAL
WEST AFRICAN AFFAIRS**



**REVIEW OF FY 1993
ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT
JANUARY 11, 1994**

CS

OFFICE OF CENTRAL AND COASTAL WEST AFRICAN AFFAIRS

FY 1993 API REVIEW

11 JANUARY 1994

THE PROGRAM

Introductory Remarks and
Sectoral Overview. Donald Clark
Dina Esposito and Cheryl Williams

Country Presentation/Discussion

Cote d'Ivoire. Cheryl Williams
Cameroon. Dana Mansuri
Nigeria. Neil Woodruff
Ghana. Adolph Wilburn
Guinea. Dina Esposito

FY93 APIS - AN AFR/CCWA PROFILE.

3

Country	Average of Strategic Objectives *	Quality of.....			Status of Mgmt. Contract	Highlights
1. Guinea	M	Narratives M	Indicators M	Data M	Valid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dramatic impact in ed sector - Lack of data - agriculture sector - Need to refine some indicators
2. Ghana	H/M	H	H/M	H	Valid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dramatic increase in the CPR rate - Policy & Legal changes have been made to enhance non-traditional exports - Suggestions to further refine some indicators
3. Nigeria	L/M	M	M	L	Valid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dramatic progress in private sector involvement in health/pop sector. - Need to show indicators that are more realistic to track and narrow data to geographic areas where USAID is working. - \$9 million reduction in Mission OYB will severely disrupt progress in the target of opportunity for AIDS prevention as well as other ongoing programs - CPR has increased significantly
4. Cameroon	H	H	M/H	M/H	Valid, however Mission is closing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Among programs with strongest impact in region - Dramatic impact in health/pop sector - should be written up as case study for other country programs
5. Cote d'Ivoire	L/M	M	N/A	N/A	No CP or CPSP, and Mission is closing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No indicators were provided - Mission reports that a DHS survey will be completed in 4-6 months on the FHP project - Increased support from the MOH in the area of family planning - Design weaknesses in the MCH project have led to less satisfactory progress to date than anticipated

*This is an average of all grades applied against the individual country strategic objectives.

H= High; M= Medium; L= Low

o:\ccwapub\pdea\apitbl

AFR/CCWA
 FY 1993 APIS
 Summary of Progress Against Strategic Objectives

USAID FOCUS AREA	STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE	High	Medium	Low	No Rating	COMMENTS
Health/population	Family Planning	Ghana Cameroon	Nigeria Guinea		Cote d'Ivoire	<p>Region shows a downward trend in total fertility rate, however the population growth rates still remain high</p> <p>CPR has increased in some countries</p> <p>The no. of CYPs has increased sharply; FP service delivery and the distribution of FP commodities have risen during recent years</p> <p>Overall increase in the no. of private providers of FP services</p>
Health/population	Improve Primary Health Care	Cameroon		Nigeria	Cote d'Ivoire	<p>The region is characterized by relatively high infant and child mortality rates</p> <p>Nigeria has had a decrease in the immunization coverage rates.</p> <p>Cameroon has seen an increase in childhood vaccination</p>
Economic Growth	Increase enrollment /improve quality of education	Guinea	Ghana			<p>Relatively young programs, w/NPA components, show positive results</p> <p>Govts. show serious commitment to education reform</p> <p>Both promote increase of girls' enrollment in rural areas - w/some success</p>

Economic Growth	Increase growth & efficiency in private sector markets, (incl: export market)	Cameroon	Ghana	Guinea		<p>Programs improving enabling environment by promoting policy and regulatory changes; e.g. new land tenure code (Guinea); new investment code (Ghana); new cooperative law (Cameroon).</p> <p>Guinea/Cameroon programs significantly increase credit to small business.</p> <p>Guinea/Ghana road building projects - anecdotal evidence of positive impact</p>
Democracy/ Governance	Improve governance at local & central levels				Cote d'Ivoire	<p>USAID has been successful in using the Donor Decentralization Coordination Committee to bring about change within the GOCI in its tax system</p> <p>Increased training of local government officials and the growth of community action groups have resulted in greater exchange of views and collaboration</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
I. Program Impact	Progress (1-5) Impact (L/M/H)	Narrative (examples from the data)
Goal	n/a	Given the recent formulation of their program goal, the relatively small size of the bilateral program and the greater importance of external factors on macroeconomic growth, the Mission states that it is unrealistic to try to attribute any changes in goals or sub-goals to their program.
Sub-Goal	n/a	see above

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
Strategic Objective One Increased Use of Modern Contraceptives and Essential Health Services	n/a	Progress to date: The MOH has established a national family planning coordinator's office at a high level within the Ministry to increase awareness; the simplification of the import and distribution process of contraceptives by a local NGO (AIBEF) and PSI have increased their availability; AIBEF has a new building in Abidjan that will be used as a high-caseload clinic; Ten (out of 30) family planning MOH clinics are being established in urban centers nationwide; an HIV/AIDS counseling and testing center was opened with technical assistance being provided by CDC in Abidjan; in malaria control, USAID played a key role in assisting the MOH to produce a national policy on malaria prevention and treatment and a five-year workplan. Similar work was done in the area of diarrheal diseases.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
Strategic Objective Two Improved Governance at Local and Central Levels	n/a	Progress to date: A proposal is with the National Assembly to institute a 10% point increase in the percentage of locally generated property taxes that must be returned to the municipalities by the Treasury. This law will go into effect by the end of CY 93; the Dept. of Cadastral Surveys has, on its own initiative, utilized the methodology and computer materials provided by USAID to undertake additional simplified cadastral surveys using its own resources in other Ivorian municipalities; some 1,230 units of management training instruction have been provided over the past 18 months to central and local level elected officials and agents in resource mobilization and service provision topics, preparatory studies and reinforcement, monitoring, and evaluation interventions; 20 neighborhood community action groups comprising 350 individuals in five core project communes are now involved in community-wide solid waste management activities; and solid waste management and collection has been improved in five towns through various interventions.

5

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
Target of Opportunity One Environment and Natural Resources Management	n/a	The World Bank has begun to work with the GOCI and donor agencies on the preparation of a National Environment Action Plan (NEAP). Supporting the development of the NEAP, and helping to form a multi-donor consensus for policy reforms, will provide USAID with an avenue for ultimately playing a more central role in natural resources policy formation. USAID has begun their involvement by sending three key Ivorian officials on a NEAP study tour to France, the US, and Madagascar.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
II. Quality of API	API Quality (L/M/H)	Narrative Commentary on API
Narratives	M/H	Given the lack of an approved CPSP or Concept Paper, and with no MER system, the Mission has provided information that while not complete, gives some insight on the progress made in the various project areas.
Indicators	n/a	n/a
Data	n/a	n/a

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire		
III. Status of Mgmt. Contract	Date of contract	Narrative Commentary on Management Contract
CPSP or Concept Paper	n/a	The Mission will prepare a closeout plan and work with USAID/W and REDSO/WCA to decide which projects/programs to continue under the reorganization's management guidelines.

21

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Cote d'Ivoire

Suggestions for the Mission:

- A weakness of the API is the Mission's failure to show gender impact and provide a logframe.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Suggestions by the Mission:

- The MCH component of the Health and Family Planning Program (HFP) must either be eliminated or re-designed to rationalize the choice of interventions, focus energy, and ensure measurable impact.
- Alternate arrangements will be needed to implement the HFP Project under a scenario of reduced FTEs. REDSO/WCA is examining options, including possible restructuring of the activity for implementation under the auspices of an institutional contractor or US PVO.
- A regional health and population project should be designed if program activities are to be continued in WCA countries where a bilateral presence is phased out.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON		December 16, 1993
I. Program Impact	Progress (1-5) Impact (L/M/H)	Narrative (examples from the data)
Goal: to contribute to the establishment of enabling conditions for sustainable, broad-based, market-oriented growth.	N/A	Outside factors continue to prevail: Cameroon is in its seventh year of economic decline. The GRC has failed to have an IMF agreement in place, World Bank SAL disbursements suspended, 1992 presidential election deemed fraudulent, continued repressive political environment/human rights violations, drop in oil revenues, drop in non-oil tax revenue, USAID, after suspending \$14 million of its OYB has been placed on the list of missions to be phased out. Mission plans to be completely closed out as of Dec. 31, 1994.
Sub-Goal: 1) develop potential for long-term increases in productivity 2) strengthen competitive markets to provide a conducive environment for private sector led growth.	N/A	See narrative under Program Goal.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON		December 16, 1993
Strategic Objective One: Increased access to and use of financially sustainable, effective and efficient primary health care.	Progress 3-4 Impact High	The overall impact of this program was high in spite of the prevailing economic and political situation. Health services were extended to an additional 450,000 people in targeted provinces, continued growth of financially sustainable community co-financed and co-managed health services centers, significant increase in childhood vaccination, well child, prenatal care, family planning services, HIV seroprevalence rate of 2% - one of the lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa. Possible downside to future sustainability is dependency on GRC for salaries and investment financing - with budget support declining and proposed civil service wage cuts of up to 50%, how will these facilities continue to fare?
Strategic Objective Two: Improved conditions for sustainable natural resources utilization.	N/A	This Strategic Objective was included in an annex per agreement with AFR/DP as part of an agricultural sector impact summary. The PP design for the Cameroon Project for Environmental Reform (CAMPER) was canceled due to impending mission close-out. A note on the annex, although USAID Cameroon has a long and rich history in the agriculture sector with a number of impressive success stories, Cameroon's present economic and political crisis has seriously hampered both program implementation and prospects for program sustainability. As stated in the text "due to inadequate GRC and/or donor resources to support these programs, the significant capacity developed with USAID support in agricultural statistics, policy analysis, sector planning and monitoring is currently under utilized."

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON		December 16, 1993
Strategic Objective Three: Improved conditions for private sector trade. (Increasing the role and efficiency of private markets).	Progress 3-4 Impact High	<p>FSSRP - despite obstacles, continued growth of private sector fertilizer distribution system, distributing the right type of fertilizer when and where the farmers need it, AT COMPETITIVE PRICES. The farmgate price continues on a downward trend, reducing costs for the farmer.</p> <p>PRAMS - full price liberalization, farmers now profit from price increases in world market, abolished the monopoly permitting licensed buying agents into arabica producing region, launched AMIS thereby empowering the producer to better negotiate sale prices and achieved an outstanding quality discount of 2.86%. FY93 showed outstanding sales performance in a depressed market and producers will get bonuses for the first time. Coffee cooperative, NWCA, is now motivated to satisfy membership and be responsive with payments due to competition. Lower costs will ensure producers get an increased percentage.</p> <p>PREPS - increased number of companies now have Special Industrial Free Zone status, generated further employment (1,012 jobs), project terminated due to Section 599 of the Foreign Assistance Act on export processing zones.</p> <p>CAMCULL - increased number of credit unions, members and share/savings indicating constant people-level impact.</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON		December 16, 1993
II. Quality of API	API Quality (L/M/H)	Narrative Commentary on API
Narratives	Quality High	The mission is to be commended on it's excellent job of achieving and demonstrating a positive impact given the uncertain future of Cameroon and the imminent closure of the mission. The narrative was clear, well-organized and consistent. However, in Section III, it might have read better under S.O. 3 to have each indicator table follow its respective narrative rather than reading the same information twice. A little more might have been said regarding the free zone project and what the future possibly holds given AID's early withdrawal.
Indicators	Quality M-H	The narrative was very effective in presenting people level impact across the board, from those who benefitted from access to health care and preventive services to the farmers and producers who benefitted from the achievements under PRAMS and FSSRP. Although a couple of the indicators under both S.O. 1 and S.O.3 were not entirely consistent with the statements made in the narrative, overall the indicators were appropriate.
Data	Quality M-H	For the most part the data presented was meaningful and clear. However, little to no gender disaggregation was provided.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON		December 16, 1993
III. Status of Mgt. Contract	Date of contract	Narrative Commentary on Management Contract
Concept Paper	June 1993	Cameroon's Concept Paper was approved in Washington, June 1993. Two strategic objectives were approved in health and natural resources management as well as a target of opportunity in democracy and governance. Unfortunately, it was announced publicly on November 19, 1993 that the USAID Mission would be closed. All design work on the two new projects, D/G and CAMPER, was halted. After a comprehensive review of the mission's Close-out Plan in AID/W on November 18-19, the Mission Closeout Plan was approved officially on December __, 1993. USAID/Cameroon will be completely closed on December 31, 1994.

12

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: CAMEROON
Suggestions for the Mission
Not applicable, there will be no API submission from USAID/Cameroon in 1994.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
I. Program Impact	Progress (1-5) Impact (L/M/H)	Narrative (examples from the data)
Goal More productive society contributing to market oriented economic growth		<p>Political tension and uncertainty resulting from Nigeria's inability to evolve to a representative democratic government have negatively affected progress toward the country program goal. The current high inflation, declining value of the naira versus the dollar, the pressure of high international debt and unwise economic policies such as petroleum and fertilizer subsidies have produced a weak economy which also negatively affected progress toward the country program goal. These factors are largely beyond the control of the USAID country program. Better health and reduced fertility will not of themselves induce economic growth but they can enhance the potential for higher levels of economic performance at local and eventually national levels.</p> <p>The Mission has been unable to monitor the selected benchmark indicators for the country program goal due to tardiness of release of data or unavailability of the data. They state in the API that the goal indicators will be rethought and new indicators will be proposed to AID/W prior to submission of the 1994 API.</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Sub-Goal		Nigeria still has a high fertility rate but progress has been made. TFR was estimated at 7.5 in 1984 and was down to 6.0 in 1990. Much of this progress can be attributed to the USAID supported population program in Nigeria during those years and the Mission should receive credit for putting emphasis on the private sector approach and the success that this approach has generated. (See page 6 of API document.) Nigeria still has high rates of infant, child and maternal mortality as well. Measurable progress has been made since a 1960 World Bank Report indicated a child mortality rate of 204/1000.
Reduced Fertility and Decreased Morbidity and Mortality		<p>A review of indicators at the strategic objective level (see below) show significant progress in those areas that contribute directly to achievement of the sub-goal of fertility reduction (such as contraceptive prevalence) and less progress toward the sub-goal of reduced morbidity and mortality (immunization rates are currently way down from previous levels.)</p> <p>The 1994 NDHS will provide an indication of progress made since the last survey in 1990 in both fertility reduction and morbidity/mortality reduction.</p>

22

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Strategic Objective One Increased Voluntary Use of Family Planning	Progress (3) Impact (M)	<p>Contraceptive Prevalence has clearly increased significantly since 1990. Use of modern and traditional methods has increased in approximately equal proportions. In two years the CPR for modern methods has increased from 3.5 % to 7.8%. At this rate the API objective of 16% in the year 2000 would be slightly surpassed.</p> <p>Mixed progress is noted among the factors which contribute to increased CPR. Outstanding progress has been made in knowledge and awareness levels of modern contraceptive methods in the general population with the most recent survey showing that 77% of the population had heard of family planning. Significant progress has been made in expanding the number of public and private outlets providing family planning services and in the range of contraceptive options potentially available. However, a good deal of progress remains to be made in guaranteeing the reliable availability of contraceptives (eliminating stockouts) and in quality control of provision of family planning services. The current reported drop out rate for family planning clients (70% in one year) is unacceptable.</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Strategic Objective Two Improved Maternal/Child Health Care Practices	Progress (1) Impact (L)	<p>National immunization rates have seriously plummeted in 1993 even though measles and pertussis disease incidence rates are reported to have decreased by 28% and 21% respectively. The decline in immunization rates may be attributed to several factors beyond the immediate control of USAID including a drastic reduction in funding from UNICEF for the immunization program, the recently adopted national decentralization strategy in which local governments are responsible for public health programs in their jurisdictions and to the political turmoil and persistent economic deterioration in the country.</p> <p>The USAID child survival program only works in particular states so it is highly recommended that the Mission provide state specific information in future API's so that impact over which USAID has a more reasonable amount of influence can be measured.</p> <p>No meaningful data or information is provided in the API that provides any indication of the impact of the program in other areas of child survival such as diarrheal disease control, acute respiratory infections and nutrition although progress has been reported in developing and promulgating a multi disciplinary case management approach to child survival programs, and significant training activities have taken place.</p>

2

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Target of Opportunity Improved HIV/AIDS/STD Prevention and Control	Progress (1) Impact (L)	<p>The HIV/AIDS situation as described in the API is very serious with the potential to become even worse. Reliable data on HIV/AIDS infection rates is not available, blood screening is not being routinely done, public awareness implies that Nigerians often feel they are immune to the disease and selected high risk groups already demonstrate very high rates of infection. On the positive side, a recent survey showed that 54% of Nigerians reported making some changes in life style to avoid contacting AIDS.</p> <p>Some progress is reported in administratively gearing up to fight the pandemic including a promising role for AFRICARE in the private sector and the development of a condom social marketing program monitored by PSI.</p> <p>The recent withholding of 50% of Nigeria's FY 94 budget has prompted the Mission to temporarily suspend all planned assistance to the HIV/AIDS program. If the funds are not restored, this situation could seriously reduce their ability to produce a positive impact in this very important target of opportunity.</p>

12

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
II. Quality of API	API Quality (L/M/H)	Narrative Commentary on API
Narratives	M	The narrative of the API is well written and gives a good picture of the present situation in Nigeria. It gives an excellent history of the program and health/population indicators over a period covering many years. Improvement could be made by focussing more on recent progress toward strategic objectives rather than on approaches and interventions selected which are already adequately covered in the CPSP. The narrative could also discuss in more detail the Mission's assessment of the reliability of the data sources which are provided as well as the feasibility of relying on current reporting systems for data collection.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Indicators	M	<p>The indicators appear to be well selected and to offer an accurate measure of the desired progress and impact in every area. Several proposals for further refinement of the indicators will be provided in an annex to be sent to the Mission. However, the key question is whether the indicators are national or specific for regions in which USAID is supporting program interventions. For example the child survival immunization program operates in about nine states while the maternal health care and nutrition activities are only being carried out in two states. In order to realistically assess the impact of USAID program interventions, the indicators should probably be regionally specific for the area of project intervention.</p> <p>The indicators may also be too numerous for efficient yearly monitoring in the API. Many of the indicators also depend on large expensive national surveys such as the NDHS which are not undertaken on a yearly basis. The review committee particularly recommended the adoption of one immunization indicator (measles vaccination coverage) and one family planning indicator (unmet need) that should be emphasized.</p> <p>The API indicates that Nigeria may be converting from a "data poor" to a "data rich" country by undertaking smaller but more frequent surveys of the current health/population situations e.g. FOS semi-annual CPS and Nigerbus. These new ongoing data collection systems could greatly benefit future API preparations by making</p>

12

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
Data	L	Data that illustrates progress and impact of the USAID program is very sparse in the API, particularly in the child survival area. Collection of data must be institutionalized on a year-round basis if the API exercise is to serve its purpose of measuring progress and impact of the USAID program.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria		
III. Status of Mgt. Contract	Date of contract	Narrative Commentary on Management Contract
CPSP	8/92	The API is completely consistent with the approved CPSP for Nigeria. Progress toward CPSP goals and objectives has been slowed by the internal political and economic crises in Nigeria. One approved project had to deobligate \$11 million of planned NPA/ESF assistance to the Federal Ministry of Health and Social Services which will have a definite negative impact on achievement of the CPSP goal, sub-goal, and strategic objectives. Currently one half of Nigeria's planned FY 94 OYB is being withheld which if not restored would also have a serious negative influence on achievement of CPSP objectives.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: Nigeria
Suggestions for the Mission
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Careful planning and collection of data must be initiated at the beginning of the year and all USDH and contractor personnel need to play a continuous role in data collection and analysis for the API to serve a useful role in demonstrating the progress and impact of the USAID Program and to justify continuing expenditures in a particular country. The Mission may wish to assign one person the primary responsibility for the API as a large part of their official job duties and take steps to involve all personnel in the API preparation throughout the year.2. More data collected in the geographic areas of USAID programmatic interventions is essential for future API presentations.3. The Mission should ensure that the NDHS survey instrument to be used in 1994 provides for the collection of all information relating to indicators in the API. This exercise might lead the Mission to drop some of the API indicators which may be duplicative or unnecessary.4. The reasons for the significant decline in immunization rates need to be discussed in greater depth and possible courses of action proposed. In addition, the table for immunization rates could be reformulated to report only on indicators in the logframe and to more clearly present annual trend data for both national and NCCCD states.5. Recommend the use of CPR for MODERN methods of contraceptives as the key indicator in strategic objective one. Use of a second CPR indicator (overall CPR) which includes unreliable traditional methods is confusing and often leads the reviewer to assume greater progress is being made than is actually the case and can lead to confusion in comparing results over time.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
I. Program Impact	Progress (1-5) Impact (L/M/H)	Narrative (examples from the data)
Goal: PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE, MARKET-ORIENTED ECONOMIC GROWTH.		<p>The performance indicators are: Annual % change in real GDP percapita; Private sector investment as a % of GDP and Life expectancy. The economy grew at a rate of 3.9% in 1992(0.8% GDP per capita), down from 5.3% in 1991 due to a 0.6% decline in agricultural output(resulting from unfavorable weather's lowering the cocoa harvest) as well as low world prices for gold and cocoa. After five consecutive years of budget surplus, the GOG recorded a deficit equal to 6.0% GDP. This deficit, due in part to GOG spending, effectively crowd out private sector investment in 1992, and high interest rates and tight money policies adopted by the GOG have inhibited private sector investment in 1993. Private sector investment fell from 13.9% of GDP in 1991 to 12.5% of GDP in 1992. Nevertheless the Mission reports that 1993 prospects are good- rainfall is adequate and the outlook for cocoa has improved. Hence, for 1993 the GOG projects 4.5% growth in real GDP or 1.4% growth in per capita GDP. Life expectancy will remain at 55 years for the next several years.</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
Sub-Goal 1: INCREASE INCOME AND EMPLOYMENT IN THE NON-TRADITIONAL EXPORT SECTOR.		<p>The performance indicators are the number of new jobs created in the NTE sector and the percentage change in per capita income of workers (FTE) in the NTE sector. It is too early to measure jobs created in the NTE sector but a mid-1993 baseline report determined that income per employee in the export area is roughly \$200/month. Males working full time in export firms earn 27% more than males in non-export firms. Females in export firms earn 42% more than females in non-export firms and 20% more than males in export firms. Why? Percentage of export firms owned by females is greater than the percentage of those working in exports who are female as well as the nature of export firms themselves.</p>
Sub-Goal 2: IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF THE HUMAN RESOURCES BASE		<p>The performance indicators are the adult literacy rate and the population growth rate. It is still too early to measure the impact of the Mission's efforts at the subgoal level. Adult literacy, defined as those 15 years and older, was measured in 1991 at 60% overall (51%female) and the Mission's PREP program deals with children 6 to 12 years of age. It will take several more years before change in literacy will be noted. The population growth rate was 3.1 in 1990 and is not expected to decline measurably until 2010, even though contraceptive prevalence went from 5% in 1988 to 15% in 1993.</p>



REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA											
Strategic Objective One: Increase Private Sector Non-Traditional Exports	1, High	<p>The performance indicators are: \$ value of NTEs and NTEs as a % of total exports.</p> <table><thead><tr><th>1991</th><th>1992</th><th>1993</th></tr></thead><tbody><tr><td>\$62.6</td><td>\$68.4</td><td>\$75.0 est</td></tr><tr><td>6.3%</td><td>6.9%</td><td>7.4% est</td></tr></tbody></table> <p>Now that policy and legal changes have been made to enhance NTEs, exporters are beginning to benefit, but measured changes are small.</p> <p>Targets: Improve infrastructure for export expansion (feeder roads): Improve enabling environment for export expansion (reduction in days required to register foreign export firms, to clear NTEs shipments as well as increase in use of duty relief system by NTE exporters. Too early to measure any change.</p>	1991	1992	1993	\$62.6	\$68.4	\$75.0 est	6.3%	6.9%	7.4% est
1991	1992	1993									
\$62.6	\$68.4	\$75.0 est									
6.3%	6.9%	7.4% est									

23

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
Strategic Objective Two: Reduce Fertility.	3,High	<p>The performance indicator is the total fertility rate. In 1988 it had a value of 6.4 and in 1993 it is expected to have a value of 6.0. However, the Mission does not have any means of accurately measuring fertility until the demographic and Health Survey is completed at the end of 1993. The DHS will be used as a baseline for future studies to enable annual estimates of fertility to meet people-level impact reporting requirements.</p> <p>Targets: Increase the use of modern methods of family planning (contraceptive prevalence rate, CYP and % of unmet need). The CP rate went from 5.2% in 1988 to 14.8% in 1993. More appropriate contraceptive method mix(% of modern methods CPR derived from longer acting methods and % of CYP derived from longer acting methods)</p> <p>Sub Target 1: Increase availability of family planning services and commodities.</p> <p>Sub Target 2: Increase family planning knowledge and approval.</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
Strategic Objective Three: Improve The Quality of Primary Education.	2, Med	<p>The performance indicators are: % of children completing P6 who pass a criterion referenced test for English and Math.</p> <p>For 1993 baseline: English; Boys 28% Girls 25% Math; Boys 24% Girls 19%</p> <p>Only 2% of the children met the English criterion and 1% the Math criterion to benefit from instruction at the next level.</p> <p>Targets: Improved qualifications of primary school teachers(% of Teachers trained to a minimum standard); Improved access in the Northern, Upper East and Upper West Regions; Increased Availability of Educational Materials(% of students with textbooks and % of teachers with instructional materials); Increased management capacity at the district level(% various personnel hired and trained).</p>

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
II. Quality of API	API Quality (L/M/H)	Narrative Commentary on API
Narratives	HIGH	I agree with most of the reviewers that the quality of this years API, including the narratives, is excellent. The placement of the narratives under or near the relevant data helped the reader get the messages.
Indicators	HIGH	The mission made significant changes in the performance indicators this year, based on an extensive review by a team from PRISM. Appendix A contains a description of the changes made, as well as reasons for the changes. There were also changes in targets and some were dropped. There was some improvement in gender reporting, although more could have been done.
Data	Medium/ HIGH	Data for 1993 were not available at the level of program goal, in most cases. LE did not change; Annual % change in real GDP/capita had not been determined and pvt. sector investment as a % of GDP had also not been calculated. Data for 1993 were not available at the level of the two sub-goals, as well. For SO 1 and SO 2, data were not available but changes in some of the target indicators were provided. Data were provided for SO3&Ts.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GHANA		
III. Status of Mgt. Contract	Date of contract	Narrative Commentary on Management Contract
CPSP or Concept Paper	July, 1991	Mission is working to fulfill contract. All SOs are being implemented through programs/projects. The portfolio is maturing.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

SO1

Target 1.1

The mission might wish to do a study to learn if the three indicators being used are adequate to determine if the enabling environment for export promotion. " there may be more important elements, such as the availability of credit".

-People-level-impact should be highlighted

-"To increase the likelihood that women-owned businesses will not only maintain their role in export industries, but hopefully to expand, the Mission should consider adding an indicator to measure the number of women-owned firms provided assistance under the TIP program".

-number of new exporters could be disaggregated by gender

-It may be appropriate to rearticulate the target 1.1 to more accurately reflect the anticipated results in areas (other than feeder roads) which are directly attributable to Mission activities.

Target 1.3: Thought should be given to developing additional and/or alternative measures of export capacity (rather than the value of a firms exports) since a change in the world price of a given commodity, or a change in the level of domestic production could have a huge impact on the level of exports of a specific or large group of firms.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

SO2 The mission might consider using "women of reproductive age" rather than "currently married women" as the denominator in measuring what % are using contraceptives, know of modern methods, etc. since all sexually active women of reproductive age are at risk of pregnancy.

SO3 Modify the target year for PREP to have an impact on adult literacy to 1997.

Modify the operational definition of the % of children who Pass the CRT from 1/3 of items correct to a criterion that reflects functional literacy attainment. Then change the 1995 40% target for literacy attainment to a more realistic one.

-text book utilization rather that distribution should be the indicator used.

GOAL LEVEL Since life expectancy as an indicator for the overall program goal is not very useful, it does not change rapidly with time, the mission might consider using another health/quality of life indicator such as infant and/or child mortality, which are more sensitive/useful.

Sub-Goal 2 Use data on adult literacy from the Ghana Living Standards Survey, rather than from UNESCO (based on P4), because this is a more accurate reflection of the actual condition in Ghana. Starting point would be 32.5% rather than 60%

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
I. Program Impact	Progress (1-5) Impact (L/M/H)	Narrative (examples from the data)
<p>Goal</p> <p>Improved economic and social well-being of all Guineans in a participatory society.</p>		<p>Positive trends:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inflation rate down from 16% in 1992 to 10% in 1993 - Treasury bonds introduced - Electoral Commission established - Multiparty elections set for late December <p>Problem areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Per capita GDP grew at .4% in '92; following -.3% in 1991 and 1.5% in '90 (below projections): low export prices for and reduced output of bauxite slows growth. - Despite stable exchange rate and broad access to hard currency, most Guineans still have difficulty accessing credit. - GOG macroec. policy performance slips in '93 due to elections - Weak admin. and financial management systems reduce impact of some USAID development activities.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
<p>Sub-Goal 1 Increased per capital income from non-mining activities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Non-mining GDP data suggest a slow diversification of economy away from mining (but rates are below projections). - Non-mining GDP grew by 1.5% in '92 but will likely slip to .5% in '93. - Conditions are right for new wave of private investment: pre-election uncertainty has slowed investment, (hopefully only temporarily.)
<p>Sub Goal 2 Improved human resources for sustainable economic growth</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infant mortality remains high; life expectancy low. - AIDS will generate 40-50,000 orphans in next 5-10 years although HIV prevalence rate relatively low. - Fertility rate unchanged since 1989 baseline rate of 6.5. - Literacy rates low. - Steady progress in basic ed. reform but great improvements still needed. - Over 1200 Guineans trained through HRDA project. USAID also building capacity of three public and private training institutions.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
Strategic Objective One Growth and increased efficiency in agricultural markets	Progress 2 Impact L	<p>Key USAID activities relatively new; quantitative data on program impact is sparse. This is due in part to lack of donor funding for agency that collects ag. statistics. Some positive anecdotal trends: According to major traders, pineapple exports more than doubled and mango exports increased 8-fold in the 1991/2-1992/3 period.</p> <p>USAID programs laying groundwork for impact:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- projected three-fold expansion of credit to small holders and rural microenterprises- Ag Marketing Foundation established as Guinean NGO to provide business services and analysis;- land tenure code established and implementation plan in process;- financial/admin. systems improved at Ag. Ministry;- procedures manual for bank inspections and improved systems for commercial bank supervision developed (which led to restructuring of two banks); <p>Other sectoral improvements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- reported decrease in no. of collection pts for informal taxes along Conakry-Labe corridor.

Handwritten mark

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
Strategic Objective Two Increased ability of families to determine household size.	Progress	Foundation laid for real impact. However, contraceptive prevalence rates will not be known until DHS survey in '95.
	4	
	Impact	Significant accomplishments:
	M	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Total couple years of protection (CYP) increased by 2,300 in past year; and by 12,800 between '91 and '92.- Number of primary health care centers with info. and commodities increased 3-fold between 1992 and 1993 (and surpassed targets)- No. of private family planning information ad commodity delivery sites increased 1.5 times between 1992 and 1993.- Natl. population policy adopted in 1992; family code under review.- reproductive health curriculum being developed at U. of Conakry- IEC activities appear to have increased awareness about AIDS and condoms, particularly in coastal areas.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
<p>Strategic Objective Three Increased enrollment in primary schools, with emphasis on rural female participation.</p>	<p>Progress 4 Impact M/H</p>	<p>Significant increases in primary school enrollment, (although levels still below average for sub-Saharan Africa.) Poor revenue collections; strict deficit spending targets; delays in host country financing and late disbursements have been constraints to education reform.</p> <p>Improvements in ed. sector have been dramatic:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Over 30% increase in primary school enrollment over 3 years; gross enrollment ratio up from 28% in 89/90 to 36.5% in 92/93. - growth rate for new enrollments between 1989 and 1993 was 67.1%, with fastest growth in rural areas and among girls. - promotion rate (to seventh grade) increased from 55.1% to 62.1% between 1989 and 1991. - repetition and drop out rates have fallen as has the number of cycles per student; - GOG exceeds USAID/World Bank conditions re: increased budget allocations for pre-university education, with increasing portions toward primary education; - per pupil and per administrator spending targets were met or exceeded in last three years. - major gains being made re: Ministry financial and admin. reform, including redeployment of 1,806 secondary teachers to elementary schools with further redeployment planned for 1994; and Ministry ability to produce a detailed, line-item budget.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
II. Quality of API	API Quality (L/M/H)	Narrative Commentary on API
Narratives	M	Comprehensive overview provided. However, narrative does not always connect with strategic objective and target indicators in API charts. Narratives could be improved if they described first what is captured in the data and then discuss elements that affect the strategic objective but are not apparent from the data. Mission could also take more credit for the improvements highlighted in text.
Indicators	M	Indicators for goals, objectives and targets are generally satisfactory. S.O. #1 and S.O. #3 indicators could be expanded; minor revision of S.O. #2 indicators might be merited; see suggestions section. [Question: Are indicators for strategic objective one excessive? Total: 16 indicators for S.O. 1 and its targets; 9 indicators for S.O.2 and its targets; 6 indicators for S.O. 3 and its targets].
Data	L/M	Work remains on establishing baselines and performance targets, although some progress has been made since last year. Mission should soon have more complete info. through upcoming USAID & GOG assessments. Better data - esp. in ag. sector - to develop baselines and track performance will be critical if USAID is to effectively measure impact of program in Guinea.

12

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

Country: GUINEA		
III. Status of Mgt. Contract	Date of contract	Narrative Commentary on Management Contract
CPSP or Concept Paper	CPSP approved: Oct. 1991	The Mission continues to work toward strategic objectives and target of opportunities as set out in the management contract. The management contract remains valid.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

- Mission followed guidelines for 1993 API submissions. The overall document was well prepared. Mission Gender disaggregated data was good.
- Note: Recommendations made by AID/W for last year's API, which related to relatively small changes in indicators, were not incorporated into the 1993 submission.
- Comments on data:
 - o Lack of data to measure impact in some areas is cause for concern. For example:
 - o For strategic objective 2: Mission might wish to consider some small select surveys to help it assess impact, unless other donors are already funding data collection activities. (AFR/ARTS believes that other donors might be working with MOH on this.) If Demographic Health Survey is not to be performed until 1995, its results will most likely not be available until 1995. Better data to measure impact will be very important before then since the current CPSP concludes in 1995.
 - o For strategic objective 1: Does Mission believe it will have access to data in near future to better measure impact? Mission might wish to consider funding the agriculture statistics center that is responsible for collecting data and/or initiating USAID or multi-donor assessments/information system to collect additional data, unless other donors are already funding programs to collect this data. Centrally funded projects might be available for ag. statistic collection.
 - o Some data appeared to be missing that people felt should be available. For example, the # of persons trained by USAID in 1993 should have been known or estimated; education specialists in ARTS know that data for indicators under Target 3.1 are available, including actual figures of % of budget investment in 1991-1993; 1991 projection for increase in share of education budget to primary education; and 1993 actual and planned figures for share of primary education budget to non-salary operating expenses.

REVIEW OF FY 1993 ASSESSMENTS OF PROGRAM IMPACT

-- Comments on indicators:

o S.O.#2, Target No. 2.2.: AFR/ARTS recommends it be revised to read "Increase in access to family planning." An indicator should then be added which measures the percent of the target population that actually has access to family planning services.

o S.O. #2, Target 2.3: Increased demand does not equal knowledge. Perhaps mission should substitute or add an indicator which measures the % of women who want to limit or space pregnancies. This is a better measure of demand than the # of people with knowledge of contraceptives. If mission keeps indicator 2.3.1, then data on males with contraceptive methods knowledge should be included along with females.

o S.O. #3 indicators might eventually deal with measuring what children are actually learning. However, this can be more fully explored in the context of major education sector program/project amendment now underway.

-- Regarding narrative:

o Mission should take more credit for some of the dramatic improvements in education sector. The program has been very effective and the reforms are tied directly to the conditionalities of our NPA.

o In ag. sector, mission should discuss more its role in land tenure and take some credit for adoption of 1992 Land Tenure Code.

o In ag. sector, it would be helpful for mission to discuss in more detail the "people level impact". For example, something about the beneficiaries of the producers of exported fruit and vegetables would be useful. How much income accrued to producers from increased exports? Are they large or small farmers? Did they benefit from small USAID PRIDE loans? IF so, Mission could more directly take credit for increases.