

PD-ABP-299

**An External Evaluation of
Opportunities Industrialization Center/Guinea**

94461

November 1992

Prepared by
Stanley A. Barnett and Associates, Westport, CT

Under contract to
Opportunities Industrialization Centers International
Philadelphia, PA

Per USAID Cooperative Agreement OTR-0244-A-00-0102-00

CONTENTS

PREFACE	iv
A. Aim of the Evaluation	iv
B. The Evaluator and Evaluation Methodology	iv
I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
A. OICG's Current Operating Status	1
B. OICG's Institutional Capability	3
II. AN INTRODUCTION TO OIC GUINEA	5
PART ONE: CURRENT OPERATING STATUS	7
III. VOCATIONAL TRAINING, TRAINEES AND TRAINEE SERVICES	8
A. Vocational Trainees	8
B. Vocational Training Courses and Trainers	10
C. Trainee Services	12
D. The Conakry Training Facility	12
IV. ENTERPRENEURIAL TRAINING	14
A. Formation and Activities of OICG's SED Unit	14
B. Impact Surveys of Upgraded Women Entrepreneurs	16
V. TRAINING OUTPUTS AND PLACEMENTS	18
A. Training Outputs	18
B. Job Placements	19
1. The Placement Process at OICG	19
2. Placement Patterns	21
3. The Secretarial Science Problem and Solution	24
C. Starting Salaries of OICG Graduates	25
D. Impact Survey of Conakry Employers	27
VI. IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF OICG'S GRANTS	28
A. Overall Inputs	28
B. IFESH's Debt for Development Subgrant	29
C. USAID Women Entrepreneurs Training Project, Phase II	32
D. UNDP Institutional Support Project, Phase II	33
E. The Government of Guinea and CECI	34

PART TWO: INSTITUTIONAL CAPABILITY	36
VII. ORGANIZATION, MANAGEMENT, SYSTEMS AND CONTROLS	37
A. OICG'S Organizational Structure	37
B. Administrative and Management Systems	40
C. Financial Management and Accounting Controls	41
D. Monitoring and Evaluation	42
VIII. OICI'S SUPPORT SERVICES TO OICG	43
A. OICI Support Assistance On-Site and Elsewhere in Africa during FY91 and FY92	44
B. Two Representative TDY Assignments at OICG	44
C. Prioritizing Needs for OICI Support	47
IX. RESOURCE MOBILIZATION AND INCOME GENERATION	49
A. OICG's Resource Mobilization Task Force	49
B. Revival of the OICG Production Unit	51
X. INSTITUTIONALIZATION AND SUSTAINABILITY	52
A. Institutionalization	52
B. Prospects for Long-Term Sustainability	54
APPENDICES	55
A. Evaluation Scope of Work	56
B. List of Persons Contacted	59
C. Impact Survey Questionnaire of Supervisors/Employers	61
D. OICG's On-The-Job Training Contract	63
E. OICG's Trainee's Follow-Up Form	65
F. OICG's OJT Performance Evaluation Form	67

FIGURES

1. Schedule of Phase I Activities, Program to Upgrade Managers of Women-Owned Microenterprises, 1990-1991	15
2. Training Outputs, First Four Vocational Classes and SED Seminars	18
3. OICG Vocational Job Placement Ratios	22
4. Job Placement Patterns Among the First Three Graduating Classes of OICG	23
5. Starting Salaries of Placed OICG Graduates from the First Three Classes	26
6. OICG Revenues, Fiscal 1990, in Thousands of GNF	29
7. OICG Revenues, Fiscal 1991, in Thousands of GNF	29
8. OICI's On-Site Support Assistance to OICG, FY91 and FY92	45
9. OICI's In-Service Training Support Elsewhere in Africa for OICG Personnel, FY91 and FY91	46
10. Status of Institutional Development Progress Indicators at OICG at the End of Fiscal 1992	53

ABBREVIATIONS

- ADF - African Development Foundation, an American PVO
- AID - Agency for International Development, Washington, DC
- AID/W - Agency for International Development, Washington, DC
- CECI - Conseil Canadien d'Etudes et de Coopération Internationale,
a Canadian NGO, very active in Guinea
- CPA - Certified Public Accountant
- DfD - IFESH's AID-funded Debt for Development Program
- GNF - Guinea francs
- IFESH - International Foundation for Education and Self-Help, an American PVO
- MIS - A Management Information System developed by OICI for use of OICs
- NGO - Non-governmental organization (European/multilateral term for a PVO)
- OECD - Organization for European Cooperation and Development
- OIC - Opportunities Industrialization Center (an indigenous African PVO
affiliated with OIC International)
- OICG - Opportunities Industrialization Center, Guinea
- OICI - Opportunities Industrialization Centers International (an American PVO)
- OJT - On-the-job training
- OPW - An annual Operational Work Plan developed by OICI for use of OICs
- PPT - An annual Program Performance Tracking form developed by OICI
- PVO - Private Voluntary Organization
- SED - Small Enterprise Development
- SOP - Standard Operating Procedure
- TDY - Temporary duty
- UNDP - United Nations Development Programme
- USAID - Mission of AID located in a developing country

PREFACE

A. Aim of the Evaluation

This external programmatic evaluation of Opportunities Industrialization Center/Guinea (OICG) assesses OICG's current operational status and institutional capability. The evaluation provides an update on program performance in terms of training, impact and sustainability and presents recommendations to increase program effectiveness and strengthen the prospects of long-term viability . A full description of the assigned Scope of Work is included as Appendix A to this report.

Because of their relevance to the evaluation, the report also reviews findings, conclusions and recommendations of 1990 and 1991 assessments of OICG conducted by external consultants on behalf of the U.S. Agency for International Development (AID) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).

B. The Evaluator and Evaluation Methodology

This external evaluation of OICG was conducted by Stanley A. Barnett, a developmental economist and program design/evaluation consultant who has worked in over 40 developing countries starting in 1953. Since 1976, he has participated in two-dozen evaluations, mainly in sub-Saharan Africa, and mostly of indigenous and American PVOs. A dozen or so of the assignments focused on OICI and/or its African-affiliate PVOs. He possesses in-depth knowledge of OICG, having evaluated the program on behalf of UNDP in 1989, visited it in 1990, and evaluated it for the International Foundation for Education and Self-Help (IFESH) in 1991 and in 1992.

Pre-field-survey activity for the assignment included primary and secondary research and analysis, working visits to the U.S headquarters of OICI and OICG's chief donor, IFESH, and development of evaluation plans and schedules, and materials for the visits to Guinea. The

external evaluator spent two weeks during May and September/October 1992 conducting the field survey aspect of the assignment in and around Conakry.

At Conakry, he reviewed key program reports and documents; consulted with key members of OICG's Board of Directors and of its administrative and instructional staffs; interviewed selected employers of the training program's graduates; and met with officials of the USAID and UNDP Missions to Guinea.

(Appendix B to this report lists the names of 37 key persons interviewed during the Evaluation. Appendix C reproduces the employers' questionnaire.)

This external evaluation is a service provided under OICI's current Cooperative Agreement Grant from AID/Washington.

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

From a small, under-financed, non-formal instructional center that began providing vocational skills in 1988 and SED skills in 1990, OICG, in less than five years, has overcome most initial structural and operating problems and is the recognized leader in vocational and SED training in Guinea.

I-A. Current Operating Status

In FY92, a seven person instructional staff graduated 72 disadvantaged young men and women in OICG's old, but serviceable and rehabilitated training center in Conakry; and its two-person SED unit conducted seminars that upgraded the skills of 84 woman entrepreneurs and trainers in all four of the country's geo-political regions.

Employment, not simply training, is OICG's primary goal. In vocational Classes One through Four, the Program has provided remunerative entry-level job skills to 254 Carpentry, Masonry and Secretarial Science trainees. OICG's vocational graduates are eagerly sought by employers: Masonry trainees boast a 94.5% three-year job-placement record, and Carpentry trainees an 88.9% record. The placement pattern for OICG Masonry and Carpentry trainees is characterized by multi-graduate employment by large construction firms. OICG's Secretarial graduates experience greater difficulty. Their job-placement percentage plummeted from 85% of Class One graduates to 44% of Class Three graduates. They tend to be employed individually, on a one-by-one basis. The disturbing drop in Secretarial placements results primarily from OICG's inability thus far to provide word-processing micro-computers and electronic typewriters for classroom training. Potential employers shy from graduates who lack computer skills. OICG is making strenuous efforts to procure the absent equipment, but requires donor assistance.

Because OICG maintains records of the starting salaries of those it job-places, the monetary value of their training is measurable. Comprehensive data indicate that the annual starting re-

muneration of all placed OICG vocational graduates in Classes One through Three totaled 136,300,000 Guinea francs (GNF), almost four times the 37,400,000 GNF they might have earned -- in the absence of OICG training -- as part-time unskilled laborers who managed to find work two-thirds of the time.

The secret of OICG's enviable job-placement record to date has been detailed, frequent follow-up and a management information system that regularizes and keeps track of the process. OICG reorganized the job-placement function in July 1992, reducing the Job Developer's level of effort and transferring it to the Student Coordinator, who exercises part-time supervision over the function. Although neither OICG's Board nor managing staff anticipated a resulting problem, the imminent loss of the CECI Job Placement Specialist suggests that the revised organizational structure will have to be monitored carefully, to avoid placing the Program's very effective OJT and job-placement operation in jeopardy.

This evaluator's conclusions drawn from an Impact Survey conducted among employers and supervisors of OICG vocational graduates tally closely with those of a 1990 joint external evaluation, which determined that OICG graduates generally are more competent than other entry-level employees and have positive work attitudes and motivation. Further, that employers would again seek OICG graduates when vacancies occur.

By the end of 1993, OICG will have upgraded the SED skills of over 350 seminar participants. OICG's successful completion of the one-year (1990-1991) program that trained 111 women entrepreneurs induced USAID/Guinea to add a two-year follow-on project to upgrade an additional 200 and help them access credit. Although USAID's follow-on action and anecdotal evidence point to significant initial progress, the development of a more comprehensive data bank would provide additional objectively quantifiable indicators to measure accomplishment more precisely. After OICG's FY92 successful initiation of income-generating SED seminars, more are being planned. That effort and the need to provide follow up services to beneficiaries of both phases of the USAID project make the speedy filling of the long-vacant SED instructor's position critically important.

OICG's revenues have become increasingly diversified as old donors renew projects (because initial projects achieved or exceeded planned targets) and as new donors underwrite additional projects. During FY90 and FY91, the Program received 54.3% of its funding from IFESH, 29.9% from USAID/Guinea, 9.6% from the Government of Guinea, and 4.4% from CECI. The remaining 1.8% was raised locally. Combined inputs of the two largest donors equalled 84.2% of

total two-year revenues and were almost all in cash -- IFESH's from a Debt for Development (DfD) Grant and the remnants of an earlier grant; and USAID's from Phase I of the Women Entrepreneurs Training Project. The 14.0% total from the Government and CECI were in-kind contributions in the form of rent equivalency for land/facilities and seconded salary, from the former, and services of an assigned intern, from the latter. With the IFESH DfD Grant continuing through FY94, a new Phase II USAID project running from August 1992 through July 1994, and new UNDP and World Bank projects expected to start by early 1993 -- OICG revenues should further increase in the near term.

I-B. Institutional Capability

OICG's Board of Directors has expanded, reorganized its standing committees and increased private sector representation, but tends to be reactive rather than proactive in most respects. OICG's instructional and administrative staffs are generally resourceful and competent. Its new Executive Director has improved staff morale and effectiveness and increased programmatic controls. On-site specialist interns assigned to the Program by CECI and IFESH have made invaluable short-term contributions to OICG's small permanent staff and the Program; equally skillful replacements must be sought. The anticipated arrival of a new Program Advisor, employment of a new Accounting Officer and appointment of part-time Stock-Control and Personnel Managers should further increase OICG's operating effectiveness. A year-long, intensive effort by OICG and OICI to identify and eliminate chronic problems in financial management and control had achieved marked success by the time of the external evaluation.

During FY91 and FY92, OICI monitored and helped improve OICG's institutionalization through continued, diversified back-up assistance under OICI's Program Support Grant from AID. Support included TDY visits from OICI Operations staff, technical assistance visits from OICI's field support staff, participation by selected OICG Board and staff in a regional workshop at Accra, experience-sharing visits by OICG SED personnel to counterparts in other African OICs (and vice versa), headquarters backstopping, and commissioning of independent audits and this external evaluation. OICG's prioritized technical assistance needs from OICI are: (1) help in re-energizing its Board; (2) having OICI's Field Training Specialist provide on-site advice and counsel regarding the recent reorganization of OICG's job placement unit; (3) continued improvement in OICI/OICG communication; and (4) selection and proper pre-service training by OICI of a strong, experienced, empathetic new on-site Program Advisor.

Local initiatives by OICG's Resource Mobilization Task Force have been creative and are producing results. The World Bank, African Development Foundation and OECD are reviewing OICG project proposals. Two income-generating seminars grossed more than 1,700,000 GNF; and plans are being made for local events to promote the Program to the larger Guinea community. Revival of OICG's past, trouble-plagued furniture production unit should be deferred for now.

With solid, well regarded training programs under way and diversified donor support, there is no question about OICG's short-term sustainability. If past performance is a guide, the Program is on the way to long-term sustainability. However, a cautionary warning: the experience of other African OICs suggests that, in addition to continuing resource mobilization efforts among multilateral and bilateral donors and private sources, OICG would do well to begin preparing the ground for future requests to the Government of Guinea for subventions to cover most recurring operating costs.

II. AN INTRODUCTION TO OIC GUINEA

Although their aims, aspirations and operations are philosophically and methodologically similar, each African OIC has a distinctive format and personality that reflects its unique set of national and community concerns, interests and cultural traits; and the nature and extent of its initial funding support.

OICG is one of OICI's youngest affiliates. The vocational and small enterprise development (SED) training center at Conakry was created in 1986, in response to the Government of Guinea's request for assistance in that country's reconstruction and privatization efforts.

OICG represented a new model of institutional development for OICI. It started-up with an initial modest level of financial support from an American PVO, the International Foundation for Education and Self-Help (IFESH), and donation of an obsolete manufacturing facility from the Host Government. OICG employed its first local staff member in February 1987; initiated vocational training in February 1988 and SED training in August 1990.

African affiliates normally depend upon the full-time presence of OICI resident advisor(s) to ensure that initial operations follow standard OICI methodology and philosophy. That did not occur at OICG. It had only the part-time services of an OICI Program Advisor until a UNDP Guinea grant provided a full-time Advisor in June 1988, some 15 months after the program had been started; however, since the May 1990 departure of the UNDP-funded Advisor, OICG has lacked any resident advisor at all.* The absence of continuing on-site OICI expertise during OICG's formative years, and its minimal staffing in non-instructional areas of operation, resulted in the rise of sub-standard and/or non-conforming administrative, management and financial practices that have been hard to eradicate.

Nevertheless, a joint 1990 USAID/UNDP/OICI evaluation noted that: "The OICI member of the evaluation team does not find the level of program capability and institutional development of OICG distinctly inferior to that of other OICs at a similar stage of development. The other evalua-

* A second phase program support project of UNDP/Conakry to provide two-year funding for a new, full-time OICG Program Advisor had been approved and was being processed as this evaluation was written; it is expected to take effect at the start of 1993 (see Section VI-D of this report).

tors were favorably impressed with OICG's level of institutional development, considering the tender age of the program and the special difficulties of operating in Guinea during its early years (when most institutional development support services presently provided by OICI were not available).

"UNDP and USAID officials, as well as the chief representative of CECI, a Canadian NGO which furnished volunteer instructors, characterize OICG as the best indigenous, development NGO in Guinea

"We believe that it is in many respects, and provided it can secure adequate funding, already a viable institution, an impressive accomplishment in the circumstances"*

Since that evaluation report, OICG's institutionalization has progressed further, as operational improvements are introduced and as funding sources continue to diversify. The low-initial-cost aspect of the new OICI program strategy represented by OICG wisely was emulated at OIC Centrafrique. However, OICI has not tried to replicate elsewhere the part-time Program Advisor aspect of the strategy. Nor should it. The absence from the start of a full-time resident OICI Advisor at OICG sowed the seeds of structural and operating problems that have taken much of four years to overcome.

* Page 48, Report on Evaluation of Opportunities Industrialization Center-Guinea, May 14-31, 1990, prepared by Richard J. Greene, Evaluation Consultant/Team Leader; Souleymane Yeleta Diallo, UNDP Consultant; and Quy D. Nguyen, Director of Evaluation, OICI.

Part One:

Current Operating Status

III. VOCATIONAL TRAINING, TRAINERS AND TRAINEE SERVICES

OIC Guinea is committed to the philosophy of self-help -- a motivating force that places responsibility for program management and operation in the hands of the Conakry community through an indigenous, private Board of Directors and staff.

Because potential trainees generally have not fared as well in school as others, and have been unable to find remunerative employment, OICG's program provides an intensive three-month "Feeder" course, to ensure that enrollees are motivationally prepared for their 15-month vocational skills courses and two-to-three-months on-the-job training (OJT). Individual personal counseling is available at OICG throughout the instructional process. The training program's emphasis on practical, "hands-on," non-formal, vocational training contrasts sharply with the theoretical orientation that generally predominates in similar Guinean institutions. Finally, OICG programs provide graduates with job-placement and self-employment services, and update curricula to reflect job-market priorities.

III-A. Vocational Trainees

OICG's Vocational Training Program attracts young men and women who (1) are young; (2) have completed junior secondary school; (3) are relatively poor; and (4) have been unable to find jobs. On 15 July 1992, the composition of OICG's Fourth annual Class (Groupement) -- scheduled to complete vocational training in January 1993 and OJT in April 1993 -- broke down as follows:

- o Total: 73 trainees.
- o Gender: male -- 56 (76.7% of total); female -- 17 (23.3% of total).
- o Age: 16 and under -- nil; 17 through 20 -- 3 (4.1% of total); 21 through 25 -- 46 (63.0%); 26 through 30 -- 19 (26.0%); and 31 and over -- 5 (6.9%) .
- o Educational Attainment: All 73 reportedly had had between 10 and 12 years of education.
- o All 73 had been unemployed before attending OICG.

The educational attainments of OICG's Class Five, undergoing recruitment as the evaluation was taking place, will be somewhat different. For those interested in the Secretarial Science track, OICG slightly upgraded requirements: it was seeking youngsters with from 11 to 12 years of education -- preferably those possessing good written and oral French proficiency -- because of increasing difficulty experienced in job-placing Secretarial graduates. On the other hand, for those on the construction trades track, the OIC slightly lowered educational requirements: it was accepting applications from young men and women with from nine to 12 years of education -- as low as nine years, because experience reportedly has shown that trainees with nine years of education could do well in Carpentry and Masonry.* As before, those meeting OICG's qualification standards were to take an entrance examination, with those attaining the highest scores being selected. In essence, selection is made on the basis of merit and qualifications, with the expectation that the best entrants will do best at OICG and in a job situation. Class Five was to begin Feeder on 2 November 1992 and finish on 31 January 1993.

It is the general consensus among OICG staff that trainees' parents do not represent the poorest segment of the population. Rather, they comprise lower middle class families who cannot afford to pay the tuition demanded by Conakry's for-profit private schools. OICG does not charge tuition, but requires a 5,000 Guinean franc enrollment fee (equivalent to somewhat under \$US5 at the October 1992 rate of exchange).

OICG recruits trainees through the radio and newspaper media. It reports receiving two- to three-times more applicants than openings for the Secretarial Science course, and up to twice the number of applicants for the construction trades courses. OICG statistics indicate that applications for OICG's 70 or so current vocational training slots rose from 113 for Class One, to 213 for Class Two, and 283 for Class Four.

* This "fine-tuning" of applicant qualifications is not new to OICG, which has been flexible in that respect in the past. The 1990 joint evaluation report noted that entrants for the OIC's First Class were required to be graduates of Guinea's public vocational training school (Centre de Formation Professionnelle), but that admission requirements gradually eased to enable increased enrollment of trainees with general education background. Thus the percentage of entrants with the CFP certificate dropped from 100% in Class One, to half in Class Two and 12% in Class Three. OICG had discovered that CFP graduates were so ill-trained that they had to attend Feeder and start all over again in the vocational skills courses.

This flexibility on the part of OICG has extended to the length of the training cycle and curriculum revision (see top of next page).

III-B. Vocational Training Courses and Trainers

The duration of OICG's training cycle (Feeder instruction through OJT placement) was lengthened two years ago from 15-16 months to the current 21 months.

- o Feeder is 2-1/2 to three months long. It starts with a two-week orientation (history and philosophy of OICI and OICG, hygiene, etc.), then continues into remedial numeracy, communication skills (the French language), motivation, job attitude, discipline, work legislation, safety rules, SED, etc.

- o Each vocational course is 15 months in duration and consists of about 70% "hands-on" practical work and 30% theory. SED instruction is fully integrated into the vocational courses, to assist those who seek self-employment rather than job placement; SED is taught by instructors of OICG's SED unit.

- o On-the-job-training (OJT) at an outside organization follows immediately upon completion of the vocational course. It lasts for 2-1/2 to three months, with the large majority of trainees finding subsequent employment with the same organization they had served in an OJT capacity. OICG trainees receive reimbursement for travel costs but no salary or fringe benefits.

OICG has a seven person vocational training staff: a Training Manager and six instructors, two for each of the three vocational courses. Although instructor turnover has been minimal since the 1990 joint evaluation, which reported they were well motivated but weak in teaching techniques, there is a general feeling among OICG management and recent OICI TDY visitors that the quality of instruction and trainee morale have subsequently improved, particularly since the current Executive Director assumed charge. It will be noted below, that changes have been effectuated in course curriculum and training methodology during the past two years or so.

The training center's three vocational courses and its training staff are discussed briefly below.

The Training Manager, an educator who has been seconded by the Government of Guinea to OICG since its inception, recently returned from a month's in-service upgrading at the Institute of Pedagogical Training in Lyon, France. He is completing a book, Teacher Training Courses, which includes chapters on pedagogical techniques, types of training, training needs and objectives, conduct of training classes, trainer evaluation, and support materials and equipment.

Vocational curricula are to be "fine-tuned" for Class Five trainees, based upon in-depth continuing research among job-placed Class Three graduates conducted by OICG's assigned CECI Intern and Job Developer. In the continuing absence of an OICI field training methodology

specialist, the Training Manager may want to seek the short-term assistance of a seconded Government of Guinea training methodology specialist, to assist in the curriculum-revision task.

Carpentry graduates are generally highly regarded for their practical expertise and the high level of instruction they have received at OICG. During the three-years ending 1991, almost 90% of the center's Carpentry graduates were job-placed. Courses of study in the current curriculum include general technology, special technology, technical drawing, preparation for employment/self-employment, and practical work assignments (70% of total time).

The chief carpentry instructor has been with OICG since it opened; he formerly was chief of the Guinean Railroad's carpentry workshop. Course emphasis has changed from an original concentration upon furniture-making to construction-related carpentry. It is this change that now permits applicants with only nine years of education to enroll in the course.

Masonry graduates of OICG are even more sought after than carpentry graduates -- almost 95% of the former were job-placed between 1989 and 1991. Masonry courses of study include general technology, special technology, technical drawing, topography, calculating quantity of materials needed, preparation for employment/self-employment, and practical work assignments (again 70% of total time).

The chief masonry instructor, who also has taught at the OIC since its start, earlier had had 14-years of experience as workshop chief for several organizations. He introduced the topography and how-to-calculate-quantity-of-materials courses of study into the curriculum to increase its practicality for trainees who are destined for employment in the construction trades. He contends that OICG is unique in the construction trades field; that Guinea lacks a comparable, practical, "hands-on" training institution.*

Secretarial Science courses of study include commercial French, oral communication, typewriting, stenography, business letters, office management, reception duties, travel and business meetings, preparation for employment, basic accounting and commercial transactions. (The last two are taught by SED instructors.) Recently, OICG has encountered a problem in job-placing Secretarial Science graduates; the subject is reviewed at length in Section V-B.3, below.

One Secretarial Science instructor joined OICG in 1988, the other in 1989. Both earlier taught the subject elsewhere -- one in a private school, the other in a public school. They divide

* The Carpentry and Masonry instructors maintain that the Centre de Formation Professionnelle, which offers two years of "French-type" construction-trades training offers no meaningful competition to OICG. This report noted earlier that numbers of ill-trained CFP graduates have attended OICG.

teaching responsibilities -- one concentrating on technical subjects, the other on subjects linked to communication.

Current vocational skills training difficulties include (a) delays in receipt of ordered training materials, tools and equipment for the construction trades courses; and (b) absence of needed training equipment, particularly electronic typewriters and computers/word processors for the Secretarial Science course. The recent appointment of a first-ever Stock Control Manager (see Section VII-B) should help with the first problem; Section V-B.3 discusses current actions and recommended steps to alleviate the second.

III-C. Trainee Services

Trainee services provided by OICG include student counseling, and OJT and job placement.

The Student Counselor provides services that are generally collective in nature. He conducts the two-week Orientation introduction to Feeder, but seldom becomes involved in attempting to solve individual trainee problems. This characteristic was noted by the 1990 joint evaluators who suggested that counseling could be improved by the Counselor's anticipating trainees' needs, rather than waiting for trainees to come to him. The Counselor also is responsible for the recruiting and job-placement efforts, functions that conceivably might dilute his counseling efforts. The situation is discussed in Section V-B.1

The organization and activities of the OJT- and job-placement efforts also are reviewed in Section V-B.1

III-D. The Conakry Training Facility

The old structures used by OICG for training purposes are far from ideal, but rehabilitation efforts have rendered them serviceable. Although the Government notified OICG that it cannot fund further rehabilitation of the facility under the 1992-1994 Plan of Development, other recent improvements have been made. OICG, using trainee labor, renovated and painted staff offices in FY 92; toilet facilities have been upgraded; and the training building is regularly swept and cleaned. The program's own generator provides the power and lighting needed for machines in the training workshops.

The training building not only has adequate space for current activities; it has room for expansion of training activities -- either to accommodate additional groups of masonry and carpentry trainees, or, if the anticipated grant from the World Bank (see Chapter IX) is received, to accommodate the plumbing and electricity training it would fund. Indeed, compared to the situation at some other African OICs, the OICG facility is presently underutilized.

The main current constraint to expansion of OICG construction-trades training activity appears, instead, to be a lack of work sites at which trainees can "learn by doing," and/or the lack of suitable vehicles to transport trainees to the work sites.

IV. ENTREPRENEURIAL TRAINING

IV-A. Formation and Activities of OICG's SED Unit

OICG's SED unit was organized in 1990 to conduct a series of upgrading training activities that the center had been called upon to perform under USAID/Guinea's Phase I Grant AFR-0463-G-SS-9065-00 to OICI for improvement in the management of women-owned microenterprises.* Under its terms, OICG was called upon to (a) conduct a needs assessment, (b) design and conduct workshops for 100 women entrepreneurs at sites in Guinea's four geographic regions, (c) conduct a follow-up assessment of participants and provide them with technical assistance, approximately three months after the training; and (d) employ a qualified staff to perform the program.

The OIC employed three Guineans (two males and a female) with combined training and business-development backgrounds to perform the assignment: The OICG project coordinator/instructor began work on 15 April 1990 and two instructors were employed by the end of July 1990. Their training design for Phase I workshops included four modules: general business management, basic accounting, marketing, and financing a business. The USAID Phase I assignment began April 1990 and ended in March 1991.

Figure 1, next page, presents a schedule of Phase I activities, during which OICG upgraded 111 managers of women-owned microenterprises --11 more than plan.

An external evaluator assessed the conduct and results of the Phase I assignment for USAID/Guinea. Her report noted:

"OICG has successfully completed a series of four workshops, one in each region of Guinea, for 111 women entrepreneurs...Based on end-of-training participant evaluations and the impact survey conducted during the follow-up mission, participants were stimulated by the training and a number have made specific improvements to their business operations, particularly in financial management and customer relations. A number

* The 1990 Grant was one element of USAID/Guinea's FY88 Training Plan to provide OICG an institutional development grant over a five-year period. Current implementation of Phase II of the Grant, which started August 1992, is reviewed in Section VI-C of this report.

of participants also have seen other improvements in their business, such as increased sales or the receipt of a bank loan they were previously unable to get...

"It is recommended that USAID/Guinea continue support of the OICG program, evaluating it yearly on the basis of continued improvements in quality, effectiveness and cost-benefit." *

Figure 1. SCHEDULE OF PHASE I ACTIVITIES, OICG'S PROGRAM TO UPGRADE MANAGERS OF WOMEN-OWNED MICROENTERPRISES, 1990-1991

Region of Guinea	1990 Needs Assessment	Training Seminars		No. of Trainees	1991 Follow-Up Mission
		Location	Dates		
Moyenne	30 May-5 June	Labé	30 July-4 Aug	30	2 January
Haute	21-28 August	Kankan	3-8 September	25	N.A.
Forestière	10-20 September	Guéckedou	24-29 Sept.	26	27 January
Basse	17-31 October	Conakry	19 Nov-1 Dec	30	23-28 March

Source: Evaluation of OIC/Guinea Seminars to Improve the Management of Women-Owned Microenterprises, Mary Ann Zimmerman, May 1991

Since the conclusion of Phase I activity, OICG's SED Coordinator and Instructor(s) have engaged in various activities, including:

- o Integrating SED instruction throughout the OICG training cycle, to assist trainees who initially opt for self-employment, or who subsequently decide open their own firms. For Secretarial Science trainees, they teach courses of study in accounting and in commercial transactions.
- o Conducted an income-generating training seminar in small enterprise development and credit for a group of nine U.S. Peace Corps Volunteers.
- o Conducted an income-generating training seminar in small-business management for a group of 25 Guinean women participants in an program sponsored by the United Nations' International Labor Organization.
- o Developing a strategy to increase the SED unit's income-generating activities through upgrading seminars for Guinean business persons.
- o Initiated a new series of seminars and associated activity under a subsequent Phase II Grant from USAID/Guinea (see Section VI-C).

* "Executive Summary, p. v, Evaluation of OIC/Guinea Seminars to Improve the Management of Women-Owned Microenterprises, prepared for USAID/Guinea by Mary Ann Zimmerman, Labat-Anderson Inc., 10 May 1991.

IV-B. Impact Surveys of Upgraded Women Entrepreneurs

Both the USAID-selected external evaluator and OICI's Philadelphia-based Small Enterprise Development Specialist recently have conducted Impact Surveys among representative women entrepreneurs who had been upgraded during the Phase I project -- the former in April-May 1991, and the latter in May-June 1992. For those reasons, and, because of the large distances and time losses that would have been involved, it was not deemed cost-effective for the external evaluator authoring this report to repeat the process for the third time in a year and a half.

- o The 1991 external evaluator surveyed six of the Conakry beneficiaries, noting that they reported their upgrading had made impacts in terms of modernization of facilities and equipment, formalization of the business, improvement of product quality and production methods, better financial resources, knowledge passed on to others in the enterprise, better work organization, new employment, use of new basic marketing tools (signs, better shop appearance and client relations) and bank loans.

- o The OICI Small Enterprise Development Specialist's 1992 Impact Survey of 12 former women direct beneficiaries of the Phase I seminars and advisory visit activity (eight in Middle Guinea and four Conakry) convinced him that: "OICG is making a meaningful impact on the development of the indigenous female private sector "of Guinea; and that "all (interviewed) enjoy increased profits and sustainability of their business ventures as a consequence of OICG services.*"

Evaluator's Comments:

(1) Although the anecdotal evidence cited by both interviewers points to significant upgrading among the Phase I beneficiaries -- and USAID/Guinea's later funding of a Phase II Grant is a strong indicator of the funding agency's satisfaction with the results achieved -- the 1991 external evaluator reported that "no indicators of either short-term or longer-term 'success' were documented. However a set of informal indicators of the value of the training was identified from discussion with the SED staff, ranging from level of interest of participants (on-time attendance), level of interest among town and local government officials, participant evaluations at the end of training (which indicated a high degree of satisfaction), and changes seen in enterprise opera-

* Page 1, "OIC Guinea -- Temporary Duty Visit Report," 24 May to 15 June 1992, submitted by C. Ross Croulet.

tions during the follow-up survey (financial, marketing, client relations, bank accounts, and so forth).^{*}

Some enterprise-operation data included in OICG's April 1991 report describing the post-seminar follow-up missions^{**} do, in fact, provide measurable indices of improvement, e.g., comparative pre-seminar vs post-seminar sales volumes, and capital-invested totals for many of the beneficiary enterprises. By developing additional indicators, including an enterprise's adoption of new management, production and marketing techniques; pre-seminar and post-seminar numbers of employees/members; introduction of recommended accounting techniques, and so forth, OICG might develop objective measurements of success re SED-unit performance as reliable and weighty as the valuable indices developed by job placement personnel re the vocational trainees.

(2) The 1991 evaluator also noted that all three members of OICG's SED staff who "implemented the series of seminars and developed the ongoing SED program...have significant, relevant work experience and educational backgrounds in accounting, finance, management and training."^{***}

Thanks to OICI's 1990-1992 Micro-Enterprise Development and Training Initiative (UNDP Project RAF/87/151), OICI was enabled to further upgrade the OICG SED specialists' skills through a panoply of activities, including (a) their participation in regional OICI SED seminars in Cameroon (in 1991) and Ghana (1992), (b) three in-depth technical assistance visits to OICG during the period by OICI's Small Enterprise Development Specialist, (c) individual one-on-one 1991 exchange-of-experiences visits by OICG's SED staffers to counterparts in Côte d'Ivoire and Cameroon; and (d) the same type of visits to the OICG SED specialists by counterparts from Sierra Leone and Côte d'Ivoire. Moreover, the guidelines and policies for OICG's USAID Phase II Revolving Credit Fund for women microentrepreneurs were developed from material presented at the regional OICI seminars noted in (a), above.

The UNDP micro-enterprise project was a major force behind OICI's strengthening ability to provide SED support to OICG and many other African affiliates.

(3) OICG's SED activity is accelerating quickly. There may be a danger of trying to do too much too fast with too few personnel. The Program is urged to accord priority to the filling of the SED Instructor's position that was vacant at the time of this evaluation.

* Mary Ann Zimmerman, op. cit., p. 5

** "Rapport Rélatif à la Mission de Suivi Effectuée en Janvier et en Mars 1991 dans les Quatre Régions Naturelles de la Guinée," prepared by OICG's SED unit, April 1991.

*** Mary Ann Zimmerman, op. cit., p. 6.

V. TRAINING OUTPUTS AND PLACEMENTS

V-A. Training Outputs

By the time OICG's Fourth Class of trainees complete their OJT in January 1993, the program will have turned out 254 vocational skills graduates: 94 in secretarial Science, 83 in Masonry and 77 in carpentry.

Figure 2 reveals different growth patterns between Secretarial graduates and those in the construction trades. The number of Secretarial graduates peaked with 36 in the Second Class

Figure 2. TRAINING OUTPUTS, OIC GUINEA, FIRST FOUR CLASSES					
	First Class	Second Class	Third Class	Fourth Class	4-Year Totals
Carpentry Completers	14	19	21	23	77
Masonry Completers	14	17	24	28	83
Secretarial Completers	20	36	16	22	94
TOTAL VOCATIONAL	48	72	61	73	254

	1989	1990	1991	1992	Total
USAID SED Seminars	-	81	30	50(a)	161
Peace Corps SED Seminar	-	-	-	9 (b)	9
Dalaba SED Seminar	-	-	-	25 (c)	25
TOTAL SED SEMINARS	-	81	30	84	195

GRAND TOTAL	48	153	91	157	449
--------------------	-----------	------------	-----------	------------	------------

(a) Short seminars, plus follow-up assistance, to upgrade women entrepreneurs; OICG is to upgrade an additional 150 women in the USAID/Conakry-funded project in 1993. (b) Income-generating seminar for Peace Corps Volunteers. (c) Income-generating seminar for Projet d'Appui aux Femmes Rurales

Source: OICG statistics

(after intake had been doubled for that course) -- accounting for fully half of total vocational graduates that year -- and will reach 22 in the Fourth Class (30% of the vocational skills total). On the

other hand, the numbers of construction skills graduates have shown steady, year-to-year increases, with Carpentry completers rising steadily from 14 to 23, and Masonry completers rising steadily from 14 to 28, from the First Class to the Fourth Class.

Training outputs in terms of OICG's SED activity fluctuates more widely than outputs in the vocational skills area because of the short-duration (generally one to two weeks) of SED upgrading seminars. In 1990 and 1991, OICG upgraded 111 managers of woman-owned microenterprises, under Phase I of the Grant from USAID/Guinea. In Calendar 1992, the SED unit conducted income-generating seminars for 34 rural women and Peace Corps Volunteers, and will have conducted seminars for 50 additional managers of women-owned microenterprises under Phase II of the USAID Grant. In 1993 it plans to train the remaining 150 of the 200 total of women managers it is to upgrade under the Phase II assignment.

OICG's income-generating SED seminars are by-products of the program's own resource mobilization initiatives (see Section IX for additional information).

V-B. Job Placements

V-B.1. The Placement Process at OICG

Fully conscious of the fact that employment is the sought-after end-product of its instructional activity, OICG places as much stress on job placement of vocational trainees as it does on their skills training. As a result, the program's job-placement methodology is one of the most thorough-going and successful among OICI's African affiliates.

At OICG, the Job Developer, and his counterpart, the Job Placement Intern from CECI* operate under overall supervision of the program's Student Coordinator. The Job Developer circulates on a continuing basis among current and potential employers in the Conakry area in order to: uncover OJT placement openings, visit OICG trainees working on OJT assignment, and maintain relationships with supervisors of OJT trainees in order to facilitate their transition from unpaid OJT workers (who receive no salary, but are paid a transportation allowance) to full-time, paid employees. The Job Developer normally travels to work sites by motor bike; when joined by the

* The Conseil Canadian d'Etudes et de Coopération Internationale (CECI) is a Canadian NGO, very active in Guinea, which has assisted OICG since its inception through two-year assignments of specialist Interns. Past CECI Interns have taught Carpentry and Secretarial Science courses at the OIC.

CECI Intern for curriculum-revision research that both conduct with employers and supervisors, or for key visits to work sites, they use an automobile.*

Upon conclusion of the two-to-three-month OJT training period, the host firm generally employs the trainee. For the relatively few who are not employed by a firm after completion of OJT, the Job Developer places them in another OJT slot for a two-month period.

The secret of OICG's enviable job placement record to date (80% of trainee completions) is detailed follow-up. Depending upon the nature of the OJT assignment, the situation at the work site and employer-related factors, the Job Developer averages weekly to bi-weekly visits to trainees placed with construction firms, and monthly visits to trainees with Secretarial skills. Graduates who are full-time employees and their supervisors also are visited periodically during early stages of the employee's service.

The Job Developer maintains a three key specialized forms to regularize and keep track of OJT and job-placement. The forms, designed by the CECI Job Placement Intern, are:

- o On-The-Job Training Contract (Contrat de Stage). A two-page form, signed in three copies by the trainee, the employer and the Job Developer, stipulates (a) duration of the contract (three months); (b) reimbursement of the trainee's transportation cost (up to 800 Guinea francs per day, payable weekly); (c) trainee's hours and days of work; (d) trainee's responsibilities (work to best of his/her abilities, follow instructions of the training supervisor and respect the Job Developers recommendations); (e) obligations of the employer (respect laws, provide trainee with adequate working environment); (f) obligations of the Job Developer (weekly visits to follow trainee's progress, consult with the employer); and (g) obligations of all three signers (to evaluate trainee from start to end of training). Appendix D to this report is an English-language version of the Contract.

- o Follow-Up Form for OICG Completers (Formulaire de Suivi des Finissants). Another two-page form. It lists (a) basic background facts about the trainee, his/her education, training position desired, etc.; (b) the trainee's OJT placement history (including dates of follow-up by the Job Developer); (c) the trainee's job placement history (including name of firm, position, supervisor, dates of employment and leaving [and reason why], and, importantly, starting remuneration; and (d) follow-up data (dates of visits; and trainee positions, salaries, performance, etc.). Appendix E is an English version of the Form.

- o OJT Performance Evaluation Form (Grille d'Evaluation). It lists a score or so professional attributes/characteristics of the OJT trainee, each to be graded in four steps from "Unsatisfactory" to "Satisfactory" to "Good" and "Very Good." It is completed at the conclusion of the OJT period by the employer. Appendix F is an English-language version of the Form designed to cover Secretarial Science trainees.

* This on-site research is augmented from time to time by meetings at OICG's training facility. One such session occurred in January 1992, when the Program's Executive Director and Training Manager joined the Job Developer and CECI Intern at a session devoted to employer/supervisor assessment of graduates skills. The Job Developer and Intern also meet periodically in one-on-one sessions with the Training Manager and instructors.

o Reorganization of the Job Placement Function: In the past, the Job Developer has devoted full-time to placement and the CECI Intern has devoted 75% of her work effort to the job development function. With the Job Developer and CECI Intern spending the equivalent of one and three-quarters persons on the placement task -- and an annual output of vocational skills graduates averaging about 70 -- OICG has been able to mount an intense, successful, continuing job-placement program -- especially since 70% of graduates have their OJT or full-time employment at construction companies, which (see V-B.2, below) tend to accept them in multiple numbers.

On 8 July 1992, OICG's Board of Directors realigned several staff functions, including two that impact directly on the Program's job placement operation. The Job Developer was also named Personnel Officer (an area in which he has previous experience) and is to spend part-time in each of the two functions. To compensate for the lost half of the Job Developer's available time for job placement, the Student Coordinator/Job Placement Supervisor has been asked to take up that amount of slack. Since he also conducts the Orientation phase of Feeder training, his work effort will become even more diversified. OICI's management team and the CECI Intern all support the change; state their confidence that the Student Coordinator/Job Placement Supervisor can function concurrently and effectively in his new mix of multiple positions and that the Program's job placement effort will not suffer from the changes.

Evaluator's Comment: The missing ingredient from the above described equation is the fact that the CECI Intern completes her two-year assignment with OICG in February 1993. Unless she decides to renew her contract (considered doubtful at the time of this evaluation), OICG will be faced additionally with the loss of her valuable three-quarters-of-a person job-development effort. If she is firm about leaving, the Program should take priority steps to seek a similarly qualified replacement from CECI. In any event, the Board and management team must closely and continually monitor the new structure. OICG's very effective OJT and job-placement operation cannot be permitted to be placed in jeopardy.

V-B-2. Placement Patterns

Figure 3 (next page) charts OICG's vocational placement ratios for trainees graduating in Classes One through Three.

o Overall totals reveal that the Program found employment for 80.1%, or 145 of its 181 graduates over the three-year period -- a placement rate that must be among the best among OICI's affiliates, in today's climate of economic uncertainty in Africa. OICG's 96%-placed perform-

Figure 3. OIC GUINEA VOCATIONAL JOB PLACEMENT RATIOS*				
Graduates:	First Class	Second Class	Third Class	3- Year Totals
Carpentry	14/14 (100%)	15/19 (79%)	19/21 (90%)	48/54 (88.9%)
Masonry	15/14 (107%)	17/17 (100%)	20/24 (83%)	52/55 (94.5%)
Secretarial Sci.	17/20 (85%)	21/36 (58%)	7/16 (44%)	45/72 (62.5%)
Total	46/48 (96%)	53/72 (74%)	46/61 (75%)	145/181 (80.1%)

* The first number in each pair of figures represents the number of graduates job-placed; the second number represents the number of graduates. Thus, the 15 in the 15/21 ratio for Third Class Carpentry graduates represents the number placed, and the second number, 21, indicates the number of Carpentry graduates in the third Class.
Sources: Placement totals from OICG's Annual Placement Lists; completions from Figure 2, "Training Outputs."

ance for Class One graduates settled down to the three-quarters level for the succeeding two Classes.

o However, the overall 80.1% three-year placement rate masks excellent placement performances for construction trades graduates and a deteriorating performance in the case of Secretarial Science graduates:

-- Fully 94.5% of Masonry graduates (52 out of a total of 55) were placed during the three years, with the lowest performance occurring for Third Class graduates (20 of whose 24 Masonry grads -- 83% of total -- were job-placed).

-- OICG's performance for Carpentry graduates was not far behind: 88.9%, or 48 of the 54 graduated in the first three Classes were job-placed, with the annual percentages varying from 100% to 79%.

-- Employment was found for only 62.5%, or 45 of the 72 Secretarial Science graduates over the three years, and the trend, disturbingly, was downward, with jobs being found for 85% of First Class graduates, 58% of Second Class Secretarial graduates, and 44% of Third Class graduates.

Figure 4's placement patterns (next page) suggest one reason why placement is more difficult for Secretarial Science trainees than for construction trades trainees:

Pattern of Job Placement among Construction trades Graduates: Many of the placements of OICG's Masonry and Carpentry graduates are multiple in nature, i.e., the same firm tends to employ more than one at a time when staffing up for construction projects. Figure 4 reveals that AFRICOM employed 24 OICG graduates in three years, SATOM 16, BATCO 14 and four

other firms each hired from four to seven. The trend towards concentration of placement among fewer and fewer firms is increasing: the 28 First Class Masonry and Carpentry graduates were employed by 14 firms, an average of two per firm; the 32 Second Class graduates were hired by 11 firms, an average of almost three per firm; and the 36 Third Class graduates were employed by six firms, an average of six per firm. The multiple employment pattern for construction trades graduates makes the job placement and follow-up efforts comparatively easy.

Figure 4. JOB PLACEMENT PATTERNS AMONG THE FIRST THREE GRADUATING CLASSES OF OIC GUINEA				
Organizations Where Employed	First Class	Second Class	Third Class	3-Year Total
CONSTRUCTION GRADUATES				
AFRICOF	3	12	9	24
SATOM	-	1	15	16
BATCO	4	7	3	14
CDE	-	-	7	7
ECOPRIM	-	4	-	4
Holzman	3	-	1	4
Sylla	4	-	-	4
Other Firms (#)	(10) 14	(7) 8	(1) 1	(18) 23
(# Firms) & Total Grads Placed	(14) 28	(11) 32	(6) 36	(25) 96
Total Self-Employed	1	-	3	4
Total Construction Graduates	29	32	39	100
SECRETARIAL GRADUATES				
Organizations employing two	(2) 4	(2) 4	-	(4) 8
Organizations employing one	(12) 12	(11) 11	(7) 7	(30) 30
(# Organizations) & Total Placed	(14) 16	(13) 15	(7) 7	(34) 38
Total Self-Employed	1	6	-	7
Total Secretarial Graduates	17	21	7	45
<u>Sources:</u> OICG placement documentation.				

Pattern of Job Placement among Secretarial Science Graduates: The pattern for Secretarial graduates is quite different; they tend to be employed one at a time, by different firms. Hence, the 16 First Class Secretarial graduates were employed by 14 firms, the 15 Second Class graduates were hired by 13 firms, and each of the seven Third Class Secretarial graduates was employed by a different firm. Over the three years, only four of the 30 firms employed more than a single Secretarial graduate; and the four each employed two. That employment pattern makes it more difficult for job placement and follow-up. (It will be noted that although more than twice the number of construction trades graduates than Secretarial Science graduates (96 vs 38) were em-

ployed during the three years, the Secretarial graduates were employed by more firms (34) than were the construction trades graduates (25).

Job Retention Patterns: Job retention patterns also appear to be markedly different for Secretarial and construction trades graduates. All the Class Three Secretarial graduates whose employers were interviewed in the external evaluator's September-October 1992 Impact Survey were still employed at the organizations at which they had been job placed. Such was not the case for Masonry and Carpentry graduates. A SATOM construction site supervisor reported to the evaluator that, whereas he had had a dozen Class Three Carpenters and Masons working at his job site a year earlier when construction activity was at its height, he currently employed only two. He offered critical remarks about some of the OICG graduates he had let go (see Section V-D's review of Impact Survey findings), but admitted that, as work at the site had slowed, he had had to discharge some desirable OICG workers. Although Secretarial placements are harder to make, they seem to be far more secure and long-term, on the average, than placements in the construction trades.

V-B.3 The Secretarial Sciences Problem and Solution

But placement patterns for Secretarial Science graduates are not the fundamental cause for their current problems. The OICG management team, staffers engaged in the job development process, and employers, agree that three main factors underlie the falling job placement record of Secretarial trainees: (a) inadequate French language proficiency, (b) difficult economic times, and (c) OICG's inability until now to provide its trainees with experience using the technologically advanced items of equipment which are transforming work practices at OICG's overwhelmingly non-government potential clients. (Government of Guinea restructuring efforts generally bar public agencies from employing new employees).

(a) Inadequate proficiency in oral and written French. This factor is not OICG-specific, but is a national (albeit transitory) problem whose effects are felt widely by all educational institutions. Under Sékou Touré, French was replaced as the primary language of instruction in the school by the local indigenous language. Because French was reintroduced as the official school language only in 1985, Guinean students who started school during the Touré regime tend to lack mastery of that language. And for the next several years, OICG enrollees will be handicapped in that respect.

(b) The job market in the Conakry area has not grown appreciably during recent years: and joblessness, although new in post-Touré Guinea, is prevalent. This factor, again, is non-OICG specific.

(c) The main reason behind OICG's poor record in placing Secretarial Science graduates is its lack of equipment whose classroom use would better prepare them to meet employer needs and expectations. The evaluator refers not to electric typewriters, of which OICG has only four (the remaining 22 typewriters used in the Secretarial classroom are manual), but rather to word processing micro-computers (micro-ordinateurs, traitement de texte) such as Xerox model 6040, and, to a lesser degree, electronic typewriters (machines électroniques) with memory, such as Xerox model 6018. Many employers have not employed OICG Secretarial graduates because they have not mastered electronic data processing equipment. Two organizations visited by the evaluator during the Impact Survey had accepted OICG Secretarial graduates without computer skills; they were content to train motivated applicants on the computer (a relatively easy, short-term task for typists), and let them learn on the job; they, however, do not appear to be the norm.

Evaluator's Comment: Obtaining micro-computers/word processors and electronic typewriters -- second-hand as well as new -- for the use of Secretarial Science trainees should represent a priority area for OICG (and OICI) resource mobilization efforts. OICG already has initiated action towards that end, having revised the equipment list for its projected Phase II UNDP support grant to include 15 Xerox 6018 electronic typewriters and one Xerox 6040 micro-computer/word processor. The Program may be able to purchase several others from IFESH DfD funds.

V-C. Starting Salaries of OICG Graduates

Because OICG maintains records of the starting salaries of those it job-places, one can quantify the monetary value of their training . Figure 5, next page, indicates the starting monthly salaries of OICG graduates from the first three Classes:

- o Monthly starting salaries during the period for OICG Masons and Carpenters ranged from 30,000 Guinea francs (GNF) to 172,000 GNF, with mean averages of 82,047 GNF, 55,125 GNF and 82,048 GNF for Classes One, Two and Three, respectively. The figures are based upon data covering 78 of the placed 96 construction trades graduates -- 81% of the total.

- o Monthly starting salaries for OICG Secretarial Science graduates ranged from 29,500 GNF to 275,000 GNF, with mean averages of 58,586 GNF, 99,500 GNF and 130,487 GNF, re-

spectively, for the three succeeding classes. The figures are based upon data covering 22 of the 34 placed -- 65% of the total. (Admittedly, the data base for Secretarial graduates is far smaller than that for Masons and Carpenters, hence is more influenced by aberrant salaries.)

Figure 5. STARTING MONTHLY SALARIES OF PLACED OIC GUINEA GRADUATES FROM THE FIRST THREE CLASSES				
	Class	Salary Range in 000 GNFs	Mean Average	Data Base vs. No. of Grads
Masons and Carpenters	1st	30-172/month	82,047	22 of 28
	2nd	35-150/month	55,125	24 of 32
	3rd	30-150/month	82,048	32 of 36
Secretarial Graduates	1st	30-90/month	58,586	7 of 16
	2nd	29.5-275/mon	99,500	11 of 15
	3rd	50-200/month	130,487	4 of 7
Estimate for average unskilled laborer, provided he/she worked 15 days/month in 1992				100-134
		22.5-37.5/mon	30,000	-----
<p>Sources: Starting salaries of OICG grads from Annual Placement Records, 1989-1991; unskilled laborer remuneration estimated by OICG's Job Developer and Student Coordinator at 1,500-2,500 GNF/day in September 1992</p>				

o OICG's Job Developer and Student Coordinator place the September 1992 daily remuneration of an unskilled laborer at 1,500 GNF to 2,500 GNF. Assuming that the unskilled laborer worked for 15 of the 22 work-days in an average month (an optimistic assumption), he/she would average 2,500 GNF per day and 30,000 GNF per month.

Based on the above data, and adjusting them to include the 34 OICG placed graduates whose salaries were not part of the data base, one can project the combined average annual salaries of OICG's Masonry, Carpentry and Secretarial Science graduates at 136,300,000 GNF. The three Classes graduated the trainees during the 1989-1991 period. By adjusting the September 1992 estimate of 360,000 GNF annual remuneration of an unskilled laborer for an annual Guinean inflation rate of 32%,* one arrives at a conservative three year (1990-1992) equiva-

* The World Bank's "République de Guinée Memorandum Economique, Volume II: Analyses Sectorielles," dated November 1991, estimates that the average mean annual inflation rate in Guinea varied from 28% to 37% between January 1987 and January 1990.

lent of 37,400,000 GNF total remuneration, had the 134 OICG-placed graduates not attended the training center, and remained unskilled.

In sum, OICG training has made a huge difference in the life of trainees, most of whom otherwise would have been condemned to a lifetime of unemployment and under-employment. Their first-year's (post-training) earnings were almost four-times higher than they would have been, had they entered the job-market as part-time, unskilled laborers. The difference between their annual starting salaries and their projected annual remuneration as unskilled, part-time laborers was 98,900,000 GNF -- the equivalent of US\$ 45,441 at the 680 GNF /US\$1 ratio prevailing in Guinea in mid-1990, when the Program's IFESH Debt for Development Grant funds were converted.

V-D. Impact Survey of Conakry Employers

As part of their 1990 USAID/UNDP/OICI joint evaluation, the evaluators conducted an Impact Survey among seven employers/supervision of OICG graduates: AFRICOF (two sites), BATCO, Davidag, Guinea Pressing, Nissan, Radio Télévision Guinea, and Société Industrielle de Pêche de Bourouma. During 1992, this external evaluator also conducted an Impact Survey among seven direct employers/supervisors from five additional firms: Africare-Guinea, COGIP, CDE, l'Office National de Formation de Perfectionnement Professionel (two subdivisions), and SATOM (two sites). Half of the 14 interviewees worked for construction firms; the other half had employed Secretarial Science trainees.

Most findings of the two Impact Surveys were identical: both sets of supervisors/employers found OICG graduates generally more competent than entry-level employees trained elsewhere; were particularly impressed with the positive attitude and motivation of the Secretarial graduates; and would again seek OICG graduates for employees (because of positive past experiences with the Program's output of trainees). Interviewees reported that large percentages of OICG-trained employees had progressed to higher positions, and almost all interviewees made constructive suggestions regarding the strengthening of OICG training.

However, during the 1992 Survey (unlike findings in 1990), two supervisors questioned the motivation and competency of some construction trades trainees. A job-site supervisor for a large, professionally operated, construction firm reported that several of his dozen or so OICG Class Three graduates had either been incompetent, insufficiently motivated, or lacked discipline. A second job-site supervisor reported that one of the two OICG graduates working for him lacked motivation. The subject is further explored in Section VIII-C, "Prioritizing Needs for OICI Support."

VI. IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF OICG'S GRANTS

VI-A. Overall Inputs

Figure 6 and Figure 7, on the next page, review OICG's revenues for FY90 and FY90, respectively, broken down by source of funds and by type of funds (i.e., contract revenue, in-kind contributions and other revenue).

o In Fiscal 1990, OICG's major donor was USAID/Guinea, whose year's funding for Phase I of the project to improve the management of women-owned enterprises totaled 84,500,000 GNF, and equalled 60.0% of OICG's total. Second largest source of funds was IFESH, which contributed 40,462,000 GNF, 28.8% of total, as last payment of a pre-Debt for Development (DfD) program support grant. Third was the Government of Guinea, whose in-kind contribution (i.e., equivalent of rent for OICG's facility) was valued at 10,000,000 GNF. The training center raised 5,078,000 GNF, 3.6% of the total, in local funds, and witnessed the start of in-kind services by the Job Placement Intern from CECI. Revenues for FY90 reached 140,753,000 GNF.

o In Fiscal 1991, OICG's revenues rose to 189,924,000 GNF, an increase of 49,171,000 GNF, or 34.9% over the previous year. By FY91, grant payments for Phase I of the USAID/Guinea women entrepreneur project had fallen to 14,513,000 GNF, 7.6% of total, as funding for that phase of activity ended. However, the loss was more than replaced by OICG's receipt of initial FESH DfD subgrant payments, which reached 139,025,000 GNF (127,016,000 GNF in local currency and 12,009,000 GNF in-kind, for the services of an IFESH International Fellow intern). The IFESH DfD contribution accounted for 73.2% of OICG's total for the year. The Government of Guinea's 21,857,000 GNF in-kind contribution, the equivalent of rent and the seconded services of OICG's Training Manager, equalled 11.5% of the total. And CECI's in-kind contribution was valued at the equivalent of 13,819,000 GNF, 7.3% of the total. The FY91's revenues that OICG received from the IFESH DfD subgrant alone equalled 98.8% the Program's entire revenues the previous year.

The remainder of this chapter reviews OICG's major grants/subgrants from donors and details their current states of implementation.

Figure 6. OIC GUINEA REVENUES, FISCAL 1990, IN THOUSANDS OF GNF						
	Local Fund	USAID/Conakry	IFESH Grant (Pre-DfD)	Govt of Guinea	CECI/Canada	TOTAL
Contract Revenue		84,500	40,224			124,724
In-Kind Contribn				10,000(a)	713(b)	10,713
Other Revenue	5,078		238(c)			5,316
TOTAL	5,078	84,500	40,462	10,000	713	140,753
Percent of Total	3.6%	60.0%	28.8%	7.1%	0.5%	100%

(a) Equivalent of rent for the OICG facility. (b) For services of CECI Intern. (c) Interest on IFESH funds.
 Source: Lucas Tucker & Co, CPAs, FY 1990 Financial Statements

Figure 7. OIC GUINEA REVENUES, FISCAL 1991, IN THOUSANDS OF GNF						
	Local Fund	USAID/Conakry	IFESH DfD(a)	Govt of Guinea	CECI/Canada	TOTAL
Contract Revenue		14,513	127,016			141,529
In-Kind Contribution			12,009	21,857(b)	13,819(c)	47,685
Other Revenue	710					710
TOTAL	710	14,513	139,025	21,857	13,819	189,924
Percent of Total	0.3%	7.6%	73.2%	11.5%	7.3%	100%

(a) Contract revenue is for the Debt for Development subgrant; in-kind contribution covers cost of the services of the IFESH International Fellow. (b) For equivalent of rent for the OICG facility, plus Government salary for seconded Training Manager. (c) Covers cost of services of the CECI Intern.
 Source: Lucas Tucker & Co, CPAs, FY 1991 Financial Statements

VI-B. IFESH's Debt for Development Subgrant

Project PO 53 for Institutionalization of OICG's Vocational and SED Training Program is a subgrant from OICI, which received the Grant directly from the International Foundation for Education and Self-Help (IFESH). OICI fulfilling its program support role, is providing oversight and technical support to various OICs receiving the subgrants.

Background: In September 1990, AID/Washington provided IFESH with a grant payment of \$470,000 to cover all DfD-funded projects in Guinea. Within a month, American Express Bank, Ltd. had used that amount to purchase \$1,000,000 of commercial debt owed to U.S. companies -- a figure that represents 212.8% of the grant from AID. On 29 December 1990, the purchased debt was converted into local currency at the rate of 680 GNF to the US\$, and half was released by the Government of Guinea for DfD subgrantee project use. By January 1992, IFESH's Board of Directors had approved 680,247,000 GNF to be used to support designated self-help projects of several grantees. Of that amount, 442,947,000 GNF, or 65.1% had been set aside for OICG's PO53 subgrant.

OICG's DfD funds are deposited at the BICGUI bank on Avenue de la République in Conakry. Through 20 June 1992, OICG had received payments of 208,608,719 GNF, 47.1% of the subgrant total.

OICG's use of DfD funds is restricted. The revenues may be used only for direct training and related expenses, and to cover administrative and operating costs. They are not to be used for capital expenditures.

Objectives and funding: On behalf of OICG, OICI submitted a first-year proposal for PO53 to IFESH in 1990. Its stated purpose was to start the institutionalization of "the OICG non-formal skills training center (to) accomplish the following objectives: training and job placement of young school-leavers, and strengthening of the private sector through training of small and medium entrepreneurs."

During FY90, IFESH's Board approved 126,387,000 GNF for first-year (i.e., FY91) funding of PO53. It approved a further 316,560,000 GNF for the remaining three years (FY92-FY94) of the Project in January 1992. The overall Project funding is the equivalent of US\$651,393 at the time of the December 1990 debt conversion.

Objectives of the four-year Project are stated in somewhat more specific terms in the "Revised Grant Agreement PO53 for Continued Funding of OICG Skills Training Center," dated 24 April 1992: To (1) train and place young school-leavers, (2) strengthen the private sector through training of small and medium entrepreneurs, (3) train women for entrepreneurship, and (4) upgrade or retrain present and retrenched civil servants."

Trainee Outputs:

The first-year proposal calls for a FY91 Output of 60 vocational training graduates -- 20 each in Carpentry, Masonry and Secretarial Science; and the upgrading of 100 entrepreneurs, small business people through SED seminars.

Figure 2 in the preceding chapter notes that OICG actually graduated 61 in its Third Class of vocational trainees -- 21 Carpenters, 24 Masons and 16 Secretarial -- one over plan; and 30 participants in SED seminars. The participant shortfall resulted from delayed funding of Phase II of USAID/Guinea's Woman Entrepreneurs Training Project (see VI-B, below). Eighty-one of those target beneficiaries had been upgraded in FY90.

Figure 2 also indicates that OICG is expected to exceed plan during 1992, with the Fourth Class graduating 72 vocational trainees -- 23 in Carpentry, 28 in Masonry and 22 in Secretarial Science -- and will have trained 84 persons at SED seminars.* The numbers of vocational skills graduates during the first two years of IFESH's DfD Project are expected to total 133, 10.8% over the 120 planned. It is anticipated that the two-year shortfall in numbers of SED upgradings will be overcome in IFESH DfD Project Year Three, during which at least 150 women and perhaps more will be trained.

Evaluator's Comment:

The June 1992 evaluation report on the second year of IFESH's DfD Program stated that: "As demonstrated by experience thus far...debt for development may not always be the optimum mechanism for generating maximum local currency funds for development purposes." The report cited the one-third loss in value of the Guinea franc since conversion of the AID/W dollar grant, due to progressive devaluation and inflation, but admitted that, "as of the time of the evaluators' visit, the amount of 680,000,000 GNF obtained through conversion of the \$1,000,000 debt at the 680 GNF : US\$1 prevailing on 29 December 1990 still exceeded that which could be obtained by converting a residual US\$400,000 of the original \$470,000 grant at the current (20 May 1992) rate of 908 GNF : US\$1.**"

The immediate problem looming before OICG appears to be the freeing of the remaining half of the converted debt (i.e., the part not released by the Government of Guinea in December 1990). As noted above, by June 1992, shortly before the the half-way mark of OICG's four-year DfD funding, the Program had already received 47.1% of total Grant funds. It is bound to bump against the ceiling of released funds in the near future. A check with IFESH reveals that it is aware of the situation. If IFESH has not already done so, OICG and OICI will want to urge the Foundation to take swift action to avoid that possibility.

* It is OICG's understanding that a new IFESH International Fellow was to arrive in Guinea at the start of September 1992 on a nine-month assignment. The Fellow had not arrived by October fourth.

** Second Annual Evaluation of IFESH's Debt for Development Program, June 1992, prepared by Stanley A. Barnett and Charles D. Ward for AID/Washington and IFESH, p. 50.

VI-C. USAID Women Entrepreneurs Training Project, Phase II

Chapter IV of this report recounted OICG's successful activity during Phase I (April 1990 - March 1991) of the USAID/Guinea Grant to improve the management of women-owned enterprises, noting parenthetically that the FY88 Training Plan of USAID's Human Resources Development Assistance Project had approved an Institutional Development Grant for OICG over a five-year period. Phase I, was a first-year's Incremental Grant of \$130,000 to carry out a series of four seminars for 100 women owners of small and microenterprises throughout Guinea.

There was a 17-month hiatus between the end of Phase I activity and the August 1992 start of OICG's current Phase II Project.

OICG is to produce five specific Outputs over a two-year period during Phase II of the USAID Grant:

- (1) 471 direct beneficiaries:
 - o 200 indigenous women entrepreneurs trained in eight regional-based seminars;
 - o 160 young vocational skills trainees (in Carpentry, Masonry and Secretarial Science) at OICG's Conakry training center;
 - o Continuing follow-up business advisory monitoring and extension services for the first 111 women entrepreneurs trained during Phase I, plus the 200 additional to be trained during Phase II.

- (2) Creation of business association(s) on a pilot basis, starting in the Conakry area, among the first, most experienced women trained during Phase I.

- (3) Initiation and implementation of appropriate business management skills for 160 vocational skills trainees at OICG's Conakry training center -- to render them more competitive on the job market and provide a skills base for those starting their own businesses;

- (4) Design and implementation on a pilot basis through one or more business associations, of a means for OICG target beneficiaries to access credit.

(5) Further institutionalize SED as a major program service area of OICG. One element of the strategy: creation of a management committee of the Board of Directors to directly supervise OICG SED activities.

Progress to Date: At the time of this evaluation, OICG's SED unit had initiated needs assessment research in Guinea's four regions and was gearing up for the initial Phase II seminars. It anticipated conducting the first two seminars, in the Middle Guinea and Forestière Guinea Regions, by the end of 1992. Seminars in the Upper Guinea and Lower Guinea Regions were to take place in February 1993. The second round of four regional seminars was scheduled to be completed by the end of 1993.

A women's association, "L'Association des Microentrepreneurs Feminin," has been formed in Conakry. Through the end of August 1992, it had developed its statutes and selected its Board of Directors. The Association's first loans from a 20,000 GNF revolving fund provided out of Project revenues are scheduled to be made during 1993, and La Banque Populaire Maroc-Guinéene has been asked to maintain the fund. Tentative plans call for loan recipients to be selected from among past seminar participants by a committee that includes representatives from the Association, OICG staff, Chairman of the Resource Mobilization Committee of OICG's Board of Directors, and the bank. Recipients are to receive two to three days of training by OICG's SED unit personnel before receiving money.

As of the end of September 1992, OICG's Board of Directors had not yet approved the revolving fund.

VI-D. UNDP Institutional Support Project, Phase II

Phase I of UNDP's Institutional Support Project provided \$215,000 to OICG to cover the cost of (a) an on-site Program Advisor for two years (June 1988-May 1990), (b) staff development for an OICG SED unit, (c) carpentry training tools and equipment, and (d) a vehicle and generator.

The UNDP contractor who participated in the work of the joint USAID/UNDP/OICI evaluation of the Phase 1 Project wrote a separate summary* of his evaluative findings and recommendations in which he noted that:

"OIC Guinea has achieved in three years a level that has required six years in other OICs of the region that were additionally assisted by larger funding as well as an

* "Summary of OICG Evaluation Report prepared by UNDP Contractor (Souleymane Yeleta Diallo) on the May 1990 Evaluation," dated June 1990.

(on-site) technical assistance team. The Government of Guinea should continue its sizeable support to this unique training center it considers to be important...(and) UNDP should fund Phase II training activities...through (provision of) a full-time advisor and part-time consultants."

Although there had been a hiatus of 28 months since the conclusion of Phase I, at the conclusion of this external evaluators stay in Guinea, it appeared almost certain that Phase II of the UNDP/Guinea Institutional Support Grant to OICG would take effect at the start of Calendar 1993. The approved UNDP Program Document, GUI/91/007/A/01/31, had been signed both by UNDP and the Guinea Minister of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation in May 1992, and UNDP/Guinea's Project Manager expressed her confidence that the necessary funds (\$255,000) would become available at the advent of the new year.

The Project Document states that the aim of Phase II is to "help consolidate the new activities envisaged by OICG and (hence) further UNDP's strategy of eliminating obstacles to the growth of small enterprise."

UNDP support under Phase II provides for:

- (1) A Principal Technical Advisor (Program Advisor) for two years;
- (2) Cost of travel, per diem and materials for six months of short-term consulting by OICI to train OICG's Board of Directors and staff. (OICI is to pay their salaries.) Specific areas of consulting assistance are to include accounting controls and evaluation;
- (3) A 4 x 4 Toyota vehicle to logistically support travel of trainees to work sites; training equipment for the vocational skills training courses; and a computer and photo copier for the OIC director's office.

VI-E. The Government of Guinea and CECI

VI-E.1. Support from the Government of Guinea

As an initial donation from the Government of Guinea, OICG received the land and buildings (valued at 224,000,000 GNF) on which its Conakry training center operates. The Government also has underwritten two phases of facilities renovation for OICG, through the donation of

materials and services valued at the equivalent of 66,000,000 GNF. The local currency funds had been received by the Government in the form of a PL480 Grant. In addition, as noted earlier in this report, the Government seconds the Training Manager to OICG and pays his Government salary and fringe benefits. (OICG supplements the Training Manager's remuneration.)

VI-E.2. CECI Support

The Conseil Canadian d'Etudes et de Coopération (CECI) is a Canadian NGO. Section V-B.1 of this report has noted that CECI has assisted OICG since its inception through two-year assignments of specialist Interns who have been of significant assistance to the young training center, and donations of classroom furniture. Past CECI Interns served as technical advisors to OICG's Carpentry and Secretarial Science courses. The current CECI Intern is the highly-valued Job Placement Specialist who is scheduled to complete her assignment with OICG in February 1993.

Through FY91, CECI services to OICG have been valued at the equivalent of 57,950,000 GNF.

OICG's support services to OICG are discussed in Chapter VIII.

Part Two:

Institutional Capability

VII. OICG's ORGANIZATION, MANAGEMENT, SYSTEMS AND CONTROLS

VII-A. OICG's Organizational Structure

OIC Guinea is a community-based not-for-profit indigenous non-governmental organization that is managed and operated by Guineans.

OICG'S BOARD OF DIRECTORS

The Program's Board of Directors is responsible for developing policies and priorities, coordinating activities with Guinea's public and private sectors, mobilizing resources, and providing general program oversight and guidance to OICG's management staff -- in order to develop and sustain program operations and create opportunities for eventual program replication.

The Board is community-based and serves on a voluntary basis, without remuneration. In mid-1991, it expanded from eight to 12, with addition of new members from the private sector. In October 1991, the Board elected new officers and reorganized its Committee structure. The Board Chairman, Vice Chairman and Treasurer, and much of committee leadership is drawn from among the new Board members.

The community Board is almost evenly split between members of the public and private sectors. At the time of the external evaluation, the Board had six members with experiential backgrounds in industry and commerce, and five Government officials (General Director of the National Training Office, Director of the National Private Enterprise Development Center [the Board's sole woman], Inspector of the National Employment and Manpower Office, and officials of the Ministries of Education and of Interior/Decentralization). Of the Board's four officers, the Chairman was a businessman, the Vice President and Secretary were Government officials, and its Treasurer was Director of Finance for a private firm. Nine of the members were either officers of the Board or served on a committee of the Board. One functioned both as Board Treasurer and Chairman of its Finance Committee, and one had no assignment. The Board normally convenes on a quarterly

basis and on special occasions, such as debriefings by visiting OICI TDY specialists and consultants.

OICG's Board of Directors is organized into five standing committees: Executive, Finance, Program Review, Personnel, and Resource Mobilization -- with the following division of authority:

- o The Executive Committee meets in emergency situations.
- o The Finance Committee is responsible for ensuring sound financial practices, developing and updating relevant financial control and management policies, reviewing and approving budgets and financial reports, and conducting periodic internal audits.
- o The Program Review Committee is responsible for ensuring quality training, developing and updating relevant policies, and reviewing/approving the Program SOP (standard operating procedure).
- o The Personnel Committee is responsible for ensuring fair personnel practices and compensation, reviewing/updating personnel policy items, reviewing updated job descriptions and personnel record-keeping systems, and evaluating management staff.
- o The Resource Mobilization Committee is responsible for developing revenues for the Program, developing relevant new/updated policies, supervising creation of promotional materials and completing annual fund-raising plans

Since its October 1991 reorganization, the Board, for the most part, has devoted its main attention to analyzing the Program's operating weaknesses and instituting corrective measures. The Board reacted forcefully after having reviewed the hard-hitting Talibé audit of OICG's administrative and financial procedures.* At its April 1992 meeting, the Board authorized a structural reorganization of the Program's staff (see below).

Unfortunately, the Board, although expanded and better organized since the time of the 1990 Joint Evaluation, appears to have few activist members, and tends to be reactive. Its committees are said generally to lack initiative and motivation, except for the Program Review Committee, since that Committee Chairman's return from OICI's May 1992 Regional Technical Assistance Conference at Accra.

* "Internal Audit of Administrative and Financial Procedures of OIC Guinea," by Baldé Boubacar Talibé, IAAF (Inspector of Administrative and Financial Affairs), 27 February 1992.

OICG'S STAFF

Section III-B of this report discussed OICG's Training Manager and instructional staff. Sections III-C and V-B reviewed the activities of the Program's student services staff -- the Student Coordinator and Job Developer. The nature and duties of OICG's minimal administrative staff at the time of this external evaluation are summarized here:

o The Executive Director assumed the position in mid-1991, replacing a previous Executive Director who had been with the Program since its inception. The current Executive Director formerly was Chairman of OICG's Board of Directors. The external evaluator concurs with assessments made by visiting OICI TDY specialists, OICI headquarters staff and OICG staff that significant improvements in administrative and managerial efficiency and morale have taken place at OICG since the current Executive Director's accession to that position.

o The Accounting Officer is new to the program, having assumed the responsibility on 1 August 1992. His predecessor had been dismissed three months earlier. The Accounting Officer had 18 years of relevant experience in Senegal before joining OICG. His competency is highly regarded by OICI's Field financial Officer, who has provided him in-service training.

o The Stock Control/Purchasing Officer: The position was newly created by OICG's Board of Directors in July 1992. It had been called for by several auditors and evaluators over the years. The position is part-time and is filled on that basis by the Program's Bookkeeper, who has been with OICG since December 1989. The Stock Control/Purchasing Officer reports directly to the Executive Director.

o Personnel Officer: As noted earlier, this is a part-time position held by the part-time Job developer, and was authorized at the Board's July 1992 meeting.

o Support staff: This staff consists of seven: two secretaries, two watchmen, a messenger, a janitor and a driver.

DONOR-FUNDED ON-SITE SPECIALISTS

OICG's salaried staff has been augmented by outside personnel provided by donor agencies. They have included the UNDP-funded OICI Program Advisor (1988-1990), three CECI-sponsored Interns and an IFESH International Fellow .

Section VI-D noted that UNDP's soon-to-start Phase II Institutional Support Project calls for a second two-year assignment of a Program Advisor to OICG. Despite recent operating efficiencies brought about by the Executive Director, the presence of a strong Program Advisor with expertise in OICI methodology/philosophy and with management and resource mobilization skills will be a crucial element in assuring OICG's near-term institutionalization.

Assigned Interns have proven quite helpful to OICG, which, as noted above, operates at a low level of staffing. This report has discussed the valuable assistance that CECI's assigned Job Placement, Carpentry and Secretarial Studies Interns have provided the Program. The recent services of an IFESH International Fellow, assigned to OICG from September 1991 to May 1992, also helped the Program in measurable terms. The Fellow worked closely with the SED unit; he developed base-line data, conducted other relevant research, and conceived of and successfully promoted the two income-generating SED seminars conducted by OICG during FY92.

TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

OICG lacks a Technical Advisory Committee -- a group of outside business executives providing feedback to the Program regarding curriculum changes that could further improve trainee employability. Given the close working relationship among Job Developer, instructors, Training Manager and Student Coordinator, formation of a Technical Advisory Committee rightfully is accorded low priority.

VII-B. Administrative and Management Systems

MANAGEMENT CONTROL PROCEDURES AND FORMS

OICG implements four management control documents developed by OICI for use by its affiliate OICs. They are used as management tools, with copies being disseminated to pertinent committees of OICG's Board of Directors and to OICI. Importantly, the documents include:

1. A Standard Operating Procedure (SOP). OICG's updated SOP was completed during Fiscal 1992.
2. Quarterly Programmatic Management Information System (MIS) Program Activity Reports, which quantify, by month, key training statistics at three separate levels: Intake and Orientation, Feeder Training and Vocational Training. For each level, the forms provide essential

operational data and data about trainee characteristics. OICG submits the quarterly reports regularly.

3. An Annual Operational Work Plan (OPW), which schedules and details Program activities by three-month periods in each of three key areas: Administration, Feeder Training and Vocational Training.

4. An Annual Program Performance Tracking (PPT) Form, which schedules important monthly actions to be taken in various categories, including the Board of Directors, staff development, planning, curriculum, training, equipment, facilities, budget and finance, SOP, resource mobilization, commodities, reporting, planning, government, community relations and evaluation.

OICG's Personnel Policy was detailed and adopted at the inception of the Program.

PROCUREMENT AND STOCK CONTROL

Past evaluators and auditors attest to the fact that OICG has traditionally had problems with the speed of procurement of needed training materials, regularizing the receipt process regarding purchase of goods and services, and accounting for and controlling materials once purchased -- and have been unanimous in stressing the need to improve procurement and stock-control practices by employing a new person, or designating a current staff member, to undertake the assignment. OICG, as noted above, finally has taken the step.

The procurement and stock control difficulties suggest that, although OICG prepares the administrative and management control documents cited above, it has at times been less than conscientious about ensuring that schedules for action have been executed in a timely manner.

VII-C. Financial Management and Accounting Controls

The absence of continuing on-site OICI expertise during OICG's formative years, and its minimal staffing in non-training areas of operation (see Chapter II and Section VII-A, above) gave rise to a pattern of poor financial management and control that has been of chronic concern to OICG's Board and top management, as well as to OICI, auditors and evaluators.

Happily, a year-long, intensive effort to identify and eliminate the major problems in financial management and control had begun demonstrating marked success by the time of this exter-

nal evaluation. The Program's recent employment of an experienced, qualified Accounting Officer is expected to be the final element in completing the transformation.

Under the impetus of OICG's Board and Executive Director, and of OICI, many outside agents of change have participated in the updating and corrective process during the past year, including: OICI's Director of Finance and Administration; OICI's Field Financial Officer (who made several multi-week visits during the period); Lucas Tucker & Company independent external auditors;* Baldé Boubacar Talibé, internal auditor; OICI's Philadelphia-based Program Advisor II; and OICI's backstopping officer for OICG. (Figure 8, in Chapter VIII, following, lists the month of visit, and types of support assistance provided for that purpose by OICI specialists and commissioned auditors.)

VII-D. Monitoring and Evaluation

Like all OICs, OICG is responsible for submitting quarterly programmatic and financial reports to OICI/Philadelphia and to major donors. OICG's Executive Director prepares the quarterly reports in a comprehensive and timely manner.

OICG's evaluative cycle includes (a) internal evaluations/reviews and (b) summative, external evaluations, generally conducted at the mid-point and the conclusion of major donor-financed projects.

The periodic internal evaluations/program reviews are conducted by the OICG's Executive Director and/or its Board of Directors. If performed by the Executive Director, he provides copies of the report to the Board Chairman, relevant Committee Chairmen, and OICI.

It is OICI's responsibility to conduct or commission the periodic external evaluations of OICG. The evaluations are financed under terms of OICI's Cooperative Agreement OTR-0244-A-00-0102-00 with AID. The first external evaluation of the Program, cited earlier in this report, was conducted in May 1990 by a joint team whose members were selected by UNDP, USAID/Guinea and OICI; it took place upon the Program's completion of Phase I of the UNDP Institutional Support Grant. The external evaluation reported herein has taken place at the mid-point of OICG's IFESH Debt for Development Grant PO53.

* OICI's program support to OICG includes an annual audit by an independent American Certified Public Accounting firm. The financial audit for FY92 was conducted by Lucas Tucker & Co. of New York City.

VIII. OICI'S SUPPORT SERVICES TO OICG

OICI helps transform affiliate programs into sustainable institutions. Over the years, OICI has developed a methodology for accelerating affiliate institutionalization that includes assistance on board and staff development, establishment of effective management controls and training systems, help in developing community and donor support, creation of systems that accelerate financial sustainability and help ensure program replication, and pre-service training for program advisors and for interns assigned to OICs by other NGOs.

A past independent evaluation conducted for AID/Washington* stated: "OICI's record in the area of institutional development is perhaps unsurpassed by any comparable organization... OICI is unique in the extent to which it has been instrumental in creating and supporting independent indigenous development organizations."

OICI also provides affiliates with continuing, diversified backup support that assumes a variety of forms:

- o Long term technical advisors who assist local OIC boards of directors and staffs;
- o Short-term TDY specialists who help resolve problems, provide technical assistance and train local boards and staff;
- o Technical assistance conferences and sector-specific workshops;
- o Creation of uniform systems and manuals that facilitate staff development;
- o OICI-commissioned audits and evaluations by independent CPA firms and program evaluators;
- o Inter-OIC training which enables OIC staffers to receive upgrading assistance from specialists of other OICs, and to exchange related experiences;

* An Evaluation of OIC International: Its Institutional Development Performance, Impact and Cost Effectiveness, by Robert R. Nathan Associate, Inc., et al, August 1987.

- o Philadelphia headquarters backstopping of requests from OICs to resolve problems, expedite commodities, improve public relations, and advise on resource mobilization, program monitoring and grant administration.

VIII-A. OICI Support Assistance On-Site and Elsewhere in Africa during FY91 and FY92

The external evaluator has discussed various aspects of OICI's backup support to OICG elsewhere in this report. Below, he presents specifics of OICI 's on-site technical assistance to the Guinea training program during Fiscal 1991 and Fiscal 1992

During that period, OICI monitored and helped improve the indicators of OICG's institutional development through TDY visits from OICI Operations staff, technical assistance visits from OICI's regional support staff (the Field Financial Officer and Field Training Specialist), SED instructors from other African OICs, and from independent auditors and an evaluator.

Figure 8, next page, provides 14 specific instances of OICI 's on-site support to OICG during the two years.

Figure 9, on the page after Figure 8, lists OICI-sponsored assistance that enabled OICG Board and/or staff members to travel elsewhere in Africa for in-service training during that period.

VIII-B. Two Representative TDY Assignments to OICG

In order to more adequately capture the nature and scope of visits to OICG by OICI staff personnel, it is appropriate at this point to review in greater detail two of the TDY visits to Guinea cited in Figure 8.

The 24 May-15 June 1992 TDY visit of OICI's Philadelphia-based small enterprise Development Specialist. During his 23-day assignment, the SED Specialist, working with OICG management and its SED unit:

- o Developed a detailed, comprehensive plan of action and a revised budget for Phase II of the USAID-funded Women's Entrepreneur Training Project.
- o Initiated the formation of a women entrepreneurs' association in Conakry
- o Interviewed 12 women entrepreneurs trained during Phase I of the USAID Project, for feedback re possible changes in seminar curriculum and training methodology

Figure 8. OICI'S ON-SITE SUPPORT ASSISTANCE TO OICG, FY91 AND FY92

Date(s)	Person/Persons	Type of Support Assistance
November '90	OICI Director of Finance Administration	Ten-day Internal audit and provision of technical assistance
November '90	Lucas Tucker & Co. Independent Auditors	Research/analysis re FY90 financial audit & compliance/internal control report.
November '90	OICI Small Enterprise Development Specialist	Three-week visit re Phase II Proposal to USAID/Conakry for microentrepreneur training seminars and extension work
March '91	OICI Small Enterprise Development Specialist	Further assistance re USAID Phase II project and other SED-related assistance.
April '91	OICI Senior Planning Officer	Pre-appraisal visit re potential replication of OICG elsewhere in Guinea.
June-July '91	OICI Field Financial Officer	Four weeks of help to upgrade OICG's accounting/financial reporting system.
September '91	SED Instructor from OIC Sierra Leone	Experience-sharing visit to personnel of OICG's SED unit.
September '91	SED Coordinator from OIC Côte d'Ivoire	Experience-sharing visit to personnel of OICG's SED unit.
October '91	OICI Director Finance/ Administration & OICI Field Financial Officer	Internal audit and preparation for forthcoming audit visit by auditors from Lucas Tucker & Co.
Oct-Nov '91	Lucas Tucker & Co. Independent Auditors	Research/analysis re. FY91 financial audit & compliance/internal control report.
October '91	OICI Program Advisor II & Field Tng Specialist	Board and staff training and provision of technical assistance.
May-June '92	OICI Small Enterprise Development Specialist	Three-week technical assistance visit re Phase II of USAID SED Grant, plus resource mobilization activity.
July-Aug '92	OICI Field Financial Officer	Three week visit to update financial records & train OICG's new Accountant
Sept-Oct '92	Independent External Evaluator	Program evaluation at mid-point of IFESH Debt for Development Program, Phase I.

Figure 9. OICI'S IN-SERVICE TRAINING SUPPORT ELSEWHERE IN AFRICA FOR OICG PERSONNEL FY91- FY92		
Date(s)	Person/Persons	Type of Support Assistance
February '91	OICG Small Enterprise Development Coordinator and two SED Instructors	Participation in OICI's First SED Conference, in Cameroon
October '91	OICG Small Enterprise Development Coordinator	Experience-sharing visit to the SED unit at OIC Côte d'Ivoire.
October '91	OICG Small Enterprise Development Instructor	Experience-sharing visit to the SED unit at OIC Cameroon.
May '92	OICG's Board Chairman, Chairman Board's Program Review Committee, Executive Director, Student Counselor, SED Coordinator & SED Instructor.	Two-week OICI Regional Technical Assistance Conference at Accra, Ghana re training methodology, trainee services and small enterprise development.
Sept-Oct '92	OICG's newly employed Accounting Officer	Training by OICI's Field Financial at Bouaké, Côte d'Ivoire.

- o Provided advice and counsel to OICG regarding operations, particularly in the area of personnel policies and procedures and the organizational relationship of SED staff to other training elements of OICG.

- o Followed up on progress made in the processing of all-but-approved OICG proposals to UNDP/Conakry and the World Bank/Conakry for program support funding.

The 17 June-8 July 1992 TDY visit of OICI's Côte d'Ivoire-based Field Financial Officer.

(a) During the first two-weeks of the three-week assignment -- and in the absence of an OICG Accounting Officer (who had been dismissed by the Board several months earlier) -- the OICI Field Financial Officer:

- o Reviewed the grant funds, financial books and records situations with OICG management and Board..
- o Prepared OICG's quarterly (April-June 1992) MIS Financial Reports covering the IFESH DfD Project and Phase II of the USAID Women Entrepreneur Project.
- o Reviewed progress OICG had made in remedying internal control deficiency and non-compliance findings of Lucas Tucker & Company's FY91 audit team.

(b) During the third week of his assignment, the OICI Financial Officer initiated the in-service training of OICG's replacement Accounting Officer, who assumed his post on 1 August .

VIII-C. Prioritizing Needs for OICI Support

There are four areas -- all noted earlier in the report -- in which OICI technical support can be of immense value to OICG. All can be remedied, given speedy advice and counsel. They are listed in order of probable difficulty.

1. Motivation of OICG's Board of Directors. Re-energizing OICG Board members, all of whom voluntarily contribute their services, and most of whom concurrently pursue busy careers, is a problem OICI undoubtedly has faced and resolved before. It must be difficult to accomplish, for solution would appear to demand an approach that transcends mere repetition of a Board's standard training in OIC methodology and philosophy, and could well differ from one OIC to another.

One answer may lie in an inter-OIC exchange of experiences, similar in nature to those which occurred at OICI's May 1992 Regional Technical Assistance Conference at Accra. The Conference apparently made so profound an impression upon certain of OICG 's Board and staff who attended the sessions, that it inspired them to become more pro-active regarding the training Program. In this instance, resolution may lie in short, one-on-one visits by individual Board members to counterparts in selected neighboring OICs -- travel similar to the recent, successful series of short-term UNDP-funded visits by one OIC SED specialist to his/her counterpart at another OIC. Whatever the answer, it must be cost-effective; must locate a source of travel funds; and must take into account that a Board member's lack of French/English bilingual ability could circumscribe its applicability.

OICI should not delay seeking an answer to this deceptively simple but fundamental important concern.

2. Potential after-effects of the July 1992 reorganization of OICG's job placement unit. Various indicators discussed earlier in the report suggest that it would be helpful for OICI's Africa-based Field Training Specialist to visit the Program in the near future to provide advice and counsel regarding possibly interrelated difficulties in job placement and student counseling -- both of which are closely integrated at OICI -- and the recent reorganization of the job placement unit. The indicators include: (a) reduction from full-time to part-time of the Job Developer's effort, as he assumes Personnel Officer functions; (b) the imminent departure of CECI's dynamic Placement Specialist; (c) reports, unusual and possibly unrepresentative, from job-site supervisors about lack

of motivation and discipline among some recent OICG graduates; and (d) the Student Coordinator's relatively reactive approach to individual trainee counseling, as compared to the practice at other OICs.

3. Communication. The Chairman of OICG's Board recently discussed this concern at OICI's Philadelphia headquarters. Admittedly, commercial communication links between Guinea and the United States are tenuous and imperfect. But over and above their unpredictability is the Chairman's feeling (also held by the Executive Director) that needed information from OICI is being lost or sidetracked somewhere in the process. The Executive Director noted that he had made several unsuccessful visits to the Conakry Airport in early September, anticipating the imminent arrival of the new IFESH International Fellow, and that he still lacked a projected arrival date. He also attributed OICG's failure to anticipate the external evaluator's September 27 arrival to OICI not having confirmed a much earlier preliminary announcement. The problem may, in part, be cultural. Removal of this relatively minor irritant is called for.

4. Qualifications of the new on-site Program Advisor. In helping to select the new on-site Program Advisor whose two-year presence at OICI is called for by the forthcoming UNDP/Guinea Phase II Institutional Support Grant, OICI should insist on a person (a) whose qualifications include extensive field expertise in OIC methodology and philosophy; (b) who possesses the twin attributes of forceful articulation of his/her views and an empathy that facilitates a harmonious working relationship with nationals of another country, and (c) who has strong management and resource mobilization skills. The combination is difficult to find in one person. However, OICI and OICG are well aware of the need to avoid problems encountered during the tenure of UNDP's Phase I Program Advisor. OICI pre-service training should concentrate on strengthening the new Program Advisor's experiential background, where needed.

IX. RESOURCE MOBILIZATION AND INCOME GENERATION

OICG's Executive Director periodically visits selected Conakry-based branches of multilateral and bilateral donor agencies in connection with current and prospective OICG projects financed by the agencies.* And the Program's Board of Directors has named a two-person Resource Mobilization Committee.

IX-A. OICG'S Resource Mobilization Task Force

However, since early 1992, OICG's main effort has been conducted by its Resource Mobilization Task Force. At the time of this external evaluation, the Task Force was chaired by the CECI Intern, and included the Program's SED staff (Coordinator and Instructor) and the Training Manager. During his 1991-1992 assignment at OICG, IFESH's International Fellow also had been active on the Task Force. Earlier promotional efforts were essentially ad hoc in nature.

Local resource mobilization initiatives have been creative. Several have been successful; and others are in the process of achieving success. The initiatives have included:

- o Proposal to the World Bank/Conakry for \$65,000 to fund OICG's expansion into the Electrical and Plumbing vocational training areas. During his May/June 1992 TDY visit, OICI's backstopping Desk Officer for OICG met with local officials of the World Bank and of the Guinea Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation. Both confirmed that the proposal was in the final stages of the approval process, and that the project should become a reality by the end of 1992, or the start of 1993. On 1 October 1992, the World Bank confirmed that timing to OICG's Executive Director.

* OICI's Philadelphia-based SED Specialist (who also is OICI's backstopping Desk Officer for OICG) makes similar promotional visits during his periodic TDY visits to the Program.

o Two income-generating SED workshop/seminars: one for 25 women being trained under sponsorship of Projet d'Appui aux Femmes Rurales, and one for nine Guinea-based Peace Corps Volunteers working in small enterprise development . The former reportedly brought in 1,378,300 GNF of revenue and the latter earned approximately 325,000 GNF.

(N.B., members of the Resource Mobilization Task Force have conducted re-search into the training needs of Guinean small and medium enterprises. On-site visits to the firms and entrepreneurs convince OICG's SED unit that there is lively interest in OICG-conducted SED training. The unit is beginning to develop ideas regarding income generating seminars for that audience.)

o July 1992 proposal to the African Development Foundation (ADF), to fund an SED credit access program. The proposal was prepared by the Task Force and presented to the Foundation's representative to Guinea several weeks after he had informed the Program and OICI's backstopping Desk Officer that ADF might be willing to underwrite a revolving fund to provide credit to small enterprises. OICG's proposal quantified project costs at 220,100,000 GNF, for (1) a fund through which 48 women's firms and six OICG vocational trainee enterprises could obtain needed credit; (2) training costs of trainers and per diem for participants; (3) costs of evaluation/follow-up activities, including a vehicle and driver.

o September 1992 proposal to the Organization for European Cooperation and Development (OECD) for the training of trainers; computers/computer accessories; teaching materials, etc. -- to reinforce OICG's institutionalization. Project costs were quantified at \$46,000 (equivalent to 45,200,000 GNF)

o To increase community support, the Resource Mobilization Task Force is developing plans to organize an OICG Week at the end of 1992 or in early 1993, to celebrate the graduation of the Program's Fourth Class of vocational trainees, presentation of diplomas to Class Three, and the start of training for Class Five. The celebration is to be marked by a soccer game between Fourth Class teams, and by a recreational evening. OICG also is planning to establish an alumni association, for both promotional and fund-raising purposes.

IX-B. Revival of the OICG Production Unit

OICG's Production Unit was organized in February 1989 to generate income during the early, cash-starved years of the training program -- through the manufacture of furniture. Its clients, including several local and international agencies, were well satisfied and were increasing in number and size of purchases when, 10 months later, the operation was closed after a salary dispute between OICG and the Unit's staff (four Carpentry graduates). Between February and December 1989, sales had totaled 8,376,350 GNF (equivalent to \$14,294 at the prevailing exchange rate) and net income was 2,888,907 GNF (\$4,930).^{*} In May 1990 the Unit reopened with a new staff of OICG graduates, but again ceased operations after a short period.

Strong criticism by recent evaluators and auditors concerning the Production Unit's lack of production and sales documentation, and OICG's past inability to exercise effective oversight and control over the Unit's operations have dimmed the chances of the Units imminent revival . All those at OICG who were asked by the external evaluator about the possibility of the Production Unit's revival replied in the negative. All reiterated, in similar words, Inspector Talibé's February 1992 admonition that, although the Unit conceivably could again become an excellent source of revenue, it should not be re-established without a strong matrix of control "procedures that would safeguard the Center's patrimony."^{**}

Evaluator's Comment: The recent appointment of a Stock Control/Purchasing Officer and arrival of the new Accounting Officer might presage the possibility of establishing controls that would make reintroduction of a Production Unit less dangerous than it was in the past. However, given the imminent introduction of two new vocational skills courses (Plumbing and Electricity) through the anticipated World Bank Grant, and soon-to start Phase II of UNDP's Institutional Support Grant, revival of the Production Unit is understandably of secondary priority.

^{*} Richard Greene, Souleymane Diallo and Quy Nguyen, 1990, op.cit. p. 29.

^{**} Baldé Boubacar Talibé, op.cit. p. 7.

X. INSTITUTIONALIZATION AND SUSTAINABILITY

X-A. Institutionalization

Figure 10, next page, charts the status of eight indicators of OICG progress towards institutionalization, as of the end of FY92.

The following observations are, necessarily, impressionistic. The external evaluator conducted in-depth secondary research among a myriad of pertinent documents in the United States and Guinea, including five reports of recent (1990, 1991 and 1992) external evaluations and external audits of OICG -- all cited throughout this document -- and visited the headquarters of OICI in Philadelphia and of IFESH in Phoenix . And, during two separate stays in Conakry, he interviewed local representatives of OICG's major donor agencies, and was able to interview almost every member of OICG's administrative and instructional staffs. On the other hand, he was less successful in interviewing/ and/or meeting as high a proportion of the members of OICG's Board of Directors as he would have wished, and only had time to survey a small proportion of vocational trainees' supervisors and employers. Given these caveats, the rankings of Figure 10 reflect the evaluator's considered judgment that, in a relatively short period, OICG has clearly progressed a long way towards institutionalization. They also suggests that there are distances to be traveled:

1. Effective Board of Directors and Functioning Committees: OICG's Board has been enlarged to increase private sector representation, and has been reorganized into five standing committees. However, it tends to be reactive rather than proactive.

3. Capable Staff in Place and Functional: The staff of OICG generally is resourceful and conscientious in performing duties. The Executive Director has improved Program operations and morale. The new Accounting Officer is more knowledgeable than his predecessor.

4. Resource Development Strategy Developed/Implemented: OICG's Resource Mobilization Task Force has undertaken creative and successful local initiatives. Replacement of its contributing IFESH and CECI interns (one gone, the other to depart shortly) is important. OICG's

Figure 10. STATUS OF INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRESS INDICATORS AT OICG AT THE END OF FISCAL 1992

	Not Started	Effort Begun	Mostly Done	Accomplished
1. Effective Board of Directors & Functioning Committees		●		
2. Sound Management Structure and System in Place			●	
3. Capable Staff in Place and Functional			●	
4. Resource Development Strategy Developed/Implemented			●	
5. Acceptance and Support by Host-Government		●		
6. Community Acceptance and Support		●		
7. Appropriate and Permanent Facilities				●
8. Replication Potential		●		

Resource Mobilization Task Force would benefit from strong supplementary assistance by its Board, and from periodic help by OICG in approaches to large multilateral and bilateral donors.

5. Acceptance and Support by the Host Government: After the initial donation of land and buildings, and early allocation of PL480 Grant funds for renovation of the training facility, the Government's contribution has lessened, and currently only covers remuneration for the seconded Training Manager.

6. Community Acceptance and Support: The pro bono services of OICG's Board of Directors testify to tangible community support. However, the OIC is first starting to initiate steps to gain the attention and backing of the general populace of Conakry.

7. Appropriate and Permanent Facilities: The OIC has appropriate and permanent facilities for current and for expanded operations.

8. Replication Potential: With strong, successful vocational and SED training programs, OICG is well positioned for replication, provided sufficient funding can be obtained to start the new center (s) with a full-time Program Advisor who can guide a new program's Board and staff in applying OIC methodology and philosophy. Replication also will require funding and staffing to establish a coordinating national secretariat.

X-B. Prospects for Long Term Sustainability

With a solid, well regarded program under way and diversified donor support, there is no question about OICG's short-term sustainability. It is (a) half way through a four-year IFESH Debt for Development Grant; (b) has just begun the two-year Phase II of USAID/Guinea Women Entrepreneurs Training Project; and -- no later than the early months of 1993 -- expects to receive grants (c) from UNDP for the two-year Phase II of the Institutional Support Project, and (d) from the World Bank for expansion into Plumbing and Electrical skills training areas. In addition, at the time of this evaluation, OICG (e) was developing plans to develop a series of income-generating SED seminars, and (f) had two proposals under study by potential donors. (See Chapters VI and XI for relevant details.)

Evaluator's Comment: If the past performance is a guide to the future -- OICG, which began operations with a modest grant from a single donor six years ago -- is well on the way to longer-term sustainability.

A potential weak point in this prognosis is OICG's lack of continuing financial support from the Government of Guinea. Other African OICs have discovered the hard way that, over the long term, Government subventions and other forms of continuing financial assistance generally represent their most reliable sources of funds to cover recurring costs. "Graduate" OICs generally depend on continued government support for much of their continuing viability. Legislative restrictions may make it difficult for agencies of the Government of Guinea to financially assist private, non-formal training centers such as OICG. However, the Government's past allocation of PL480-generated funds to the center, and its current seconding of the Training Manager, suggest that public subvention on a continuing basis might be possible, when the need arises. OICG would do well to start building that case now.

Appendices

EVALUATION OF GUINEA OIC

An assessment of the operational status and institutional capability of Guinea OIC

September 1992

SCOPE OF WORK

I. PURPOSES

First, this evaluation is an assessment of Guinea OIC's current operational status and institutional capability. It will provide an update on program performance in terms of training, impact and sustainability. Recommendations will be made wherever necessary to increase program effectiveness and strengthen the prospects of long-term viability.

Second, lessons learned will be drawn from both OICI and Guinea OIC's experiences in project design, technical assistance, local program management and operations, and resource development. Factors that differentiate Guinea OIC from OICI's earlier programs will be identified, and an assessment will be made of the replicability elsewhere of OICI's program development strategy that was adopted in Guinea.

Third, the evaluation will include a review of OICI's support services to Guinea OIC in terms of their appropriateness, adequacy and effectiveness. Recommendations will be made to assist OICI in its on-going effort to improve services to field programs.

The evaluation will target four main audiences: Guinea OIC, Government of Guinea, donors and OIC International. It is a service provided under the current Cooperative Agreement grant from AID to OICI.

II. METHODOLOGY AND MAJOR TASKS

- a) **Evaluator:** This evaluation will be conducted by Mr. Stanley A. Barnett, a consultant specialist in project design and evaluation. Mr. Barnett has an in-depth knowledge of Guinea OIC's operations. He had twice visited the program, in 1991 and early 1992, to evaluate the support of IFESH to Guinea OIC through the Debt-for-Development program of AID. Mr. Barnett also headed a feasibility study of UNDP

in 1989 that included Guinea OIC among the potential beneficiaries of a regional small enterprise development support program.

- b) Utilization of existing information: This evaluation will rely heavily on the consultant's extensive background on Guinea OIC: its objectives, historical development, past performance, current issues and needs. The consultant will retrieve and review the relevant information gathered during his previous studies of Guinea OIC. Additional information can be obtained from program reports that might be available at OICI Central Office but not yet seen by the consultant.
- c) Consultations with key partners and contributors: Since a major objective of this evaluation is the identification of lessons learned and assessment of the replicability of program development strategy, it is critical that the consultant will take into consideration the viewpoints and experiences of the various partners of and contributors to the program. These include OICI, Guinea OIC, the Government of Guinea, and donors such as IFESH, UNDP and USAID.
- d) Field Work: The consultant will visit the Guinea OIC training center, review major program reports and documents, and consult with key Board and staff members and appropriate representatives of the Government of Guinea and donors. The consultant will also identify and interview selected employers of Guinea OIC's graduates to determine the quality of the graduates and their skill training.
- e) Evaluation Report: The evaluation report will be structured to fully respond to the purposes indicated in Part I above.

The discussion of operational status should include an update on the progress of the implementation of on-going grants; the relevance of the current training contents; and, the marketability of the graduates.

The discussion of institutional capability will include both a brief description and an assessment of each of the key elements critical to a fully developed OIC institution:

- | | |
|--|---|
| -Board of Directors | -Staff |
| -Management & control systems | -Training curricula & methods |
| -Financial support | -Facilities (site, buildings, equipment...) |
| -Community support | |
| -Replication and/or expansion capacity | |

III. SPECIFIC EVALUATION QUESTIONS/ISSUES

The questions/issues listed below should be sufficiently addressed as part of meeting the objectives of the evaluation. OICI and/or the consultant may find additional questions/issues requiring attention as the evaluation progresses.

- a) What has been the experience of Guinea OIC's graduates with respect to employment or business opportunities? Are training contents and methods geared toward preparing trainees for the realities of local labor market and business conditions? Is the original project design still valid in respects?
- b) Are staff and financial resources sufficiently allocated to ensure a satisfactory job placement or business creation rate? Does program management pay adequate attention and provide enough support to this critical element of the OIC model? The same questions should be asked with respect to post-training follow-up.
- c) In what particular area(s) does Guinea OIC need technical assistance most? In what way can these needs be best addressed?
- d) How strong are the current prospects of Guinea OIC's long-term program and financial sustainability? What are the major assumptions?

IV. SCHEDULE OF ACTIVITIES

- a) Evaluation contract effective date: August 24, 1992.
- b) Date of research visit to OICI Central Office: Sept. 2, 1992.
- c) Date of field visit (to Guinea): Sept. 27 - Oct. 3, 1992.
- d) Date of evaluation debriefing at OICI: Between October 15 and 22, 1992. Exact date to be determined upon the return of the consultant.
- e) Date of final report: by November 30, 1992.

APPENDIX B

LIST OF PERSONS CONTACTED

Eric Acolatse - Director of Finance/Administration, OIC International, Philadelphia
Raymond Baillargeon - Education Advisor for CIDA at DNETFP, Conakry
Khaly Bangoura - Personnel Director/Job Developer, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Mamadou Adama Barry - Coordinator, Small Enterprise Development Unit, OIC Guinea
Mohamed Lamine Barry - Executive Director, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Makhtar Bengué - Work Supervisor, CDE Construction Company, Conakry
John Berman, Africare Country Representative to Guinea, Conakry
Alsény Camara - Work Supervisor, SATOM Construction Co., Conakry
Charles Djibi Camara - Student Services Coordinator, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Rose Marie Camara - Project Manager, UNDP Institutional Support Project, Conakry
Ross Croulet - SED Specialist, Guinea Desk Officer, OIC International
Oumar Sylla Délafrigue - Member, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea
Mamadou Nassirou Diallo - Treasurer, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Mamadou Saidou Diallo - Vice Chairman, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea
Mustapha Diallo, USAID Manager, OICG's Women's Entrepreneur Project
Souleymane Diallo - Private Sector Training Manager, USAID Conakry
Thierno Saadou Diallo - Secretarial Instructor, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Thierno Hadia Diop - Chairman, Resource Mobilization, OIC Guinea Board of Directors
Fodé Doumbouya - Chief, Carpentry Instruction, OIC Guinea, Conakry
M. Guéyé - Work Supervisor, CDE Construction Company, Conakry
Amadou Fofana - Secretarial Instructor, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Reginald Hodges - Director of Program Support, OIC International, Philadelphia
Laminidian Kaba - Chairman, Program Review, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea
William Kaschak - Director, USAID Mission at Conakry, Guinea
Aboubacar Sidiki Keita - Sub-Accountant, Stock Control Manager, OIC Guinea
Michael Keita, Training Manager, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Jean Klein, Guinea Delegate, French Consulting & Development Society at ONFPP

Appendix B., List of Key Contacts (Concluded)

Olivier Foromo Maomou - Chief, Masonry Instruction, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Quy Nguyen - Director of Evaluation, OIC International, Philadelphia
Ralph Perkins - Program Advisor II, OIC International , Philadelphia
S.K. Reddy - Chief, Rural Development Office, USAID Conakry, Guinea
Gary Robinson - President & Chief Executive Officer, OIC International
Anne-Marie Saulnier - CECI Cooperante (intern) at OIC Guinea, Conakry
Toumany Sidibé -Secretary, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Boubacar Souaré - Member, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Sekou Mohamed Sylla - Chairman, Board of Directors, OIC Guinea, Conakry
Soriba Youla, Assistant Director of Technical Instruction & Professional Training,
DNETFP, Conakry

APPENDIX C. EMPLOYERS' QUESTIONNAIRE

La date _____

L'interviewer _____

**1992 ENQUETE PARMIS DES CONTREMAITRES/CHEFS D'ATELIER ET
EMPLOYEURS AU SUJET DES DIPLOMES DE L'OIC GUINEE**

Le nom du diplômé ou de la diplômée _____

Le nom de l'organisation où le/la diplômé(e) est employé _____

L'adresse de l'organisation _____ Ville _____

Le nom du contremaître, chef d'atelier ou l'employeur _____

Sa position dans l'organisation _____

1. Combien de diplômés/diplômées de l'OIC travaillent sous votre supervision? _____
2. Dans quelles spécialisations professionnelles? _____
3. Pendant combien de temps avez vous dirigé/employé
les diplômés de l'OIC Guinée? _____
4. Pendant ce temps-là, combien de diplômés ont travaillé pour vous? _____
5. Ont-ils commencé leur travail au niveau le plus simple? OUI ___ NON ___
6. Est-ce qu'ils travaillent encore au même niveau? OUI ___ NON ___
7. Si non, quel pourcentage/nombre ont obtenu de l'avancement? _____
8. Quelles sont leurs positions et rangs actuels? _____
9. La formation reçue par les diplômés est-elle adéquate à la tâche qui leur est assignées
dans votre organisation? OUI ___ NON ___
10. Si non, quelles étaient/sont leurs points de faiblesse?

S'IL VOUS PLAÎT, REPONDEZ AUX QUESTIONS SUIVANTES PAR LA SELECTION D'UN,
ET SEULEMENT UN, DE CES TROIS CHOIX

11. Comment trouvez-vous leur attitude générale vers le travail?
Au dessus de la moyenne ___ Moyenne ___ Au dessous de la moyenne ___
12. Comment trouvez-vous leur formation théorique?
Au dessus de la moyenne ___ Moyenne ___ Au dessous de la moyenne ___
13. Comment trouvez-vous leur formation pratique?
Au dessus de la moyenne ___ Moyenne ___ Au dessous de la moyenne ___

Appendix C (Concluded)

14. Comment trouvez-vous les diplômés de l'OIC Guinée en comparaison avec d'autres qui travaillent au même niveau?

Supérieur ___ Même ___ Inférieur ___

15. En cas où vous auriez besoin des postes vacantes, feriez-vous appel aux diplômés de l'OIC Guinée?

OUI ___ NON ___

16. Pourquoi avez-vous répondu "oui" / "non"?

17. Comment l'OIC Guinée peut-elle améliorer la formation technique de ses stagiaires?

18. Autres commentaires:

APPENDIX D. ON-THE-JOB TRAINING CONTRACT

OIC GUINEA

PLACEMENT SERVICE

TRAINING CONTRACT

CONTRACTING PARTIES

Between _____, residing at _____
_____ represented by M. _____
_____ designated as the "EMPLOYER", for one part;

and Mrs., Miss, Mr. _____
born on _____ of _____ and _____
originally from _____ district _____
designated as the "TRAINEE"

and Guinea OIC, represented by M. Khaly Bangoura, placement advisor
this training contract agreement is concluded and submitted to the
following articles:

DURATION OF CONTRACT

The present contract is agreed for a three-month period during which
neither the employer, the trainee, nor GUINEA OIC will require
remuneration for services provided.

REMUNERATION AND WAGES DURING THE CONTRACT PERIOD

The employer has no obligation toward the trainee relative to any salary
or wages; the employer will provide transportation fees to the trainee
from his house to the place of work up to the amount of 800 FG a day. In
such case, the transportation fees are for the amount of _____ FG,
payable once a week on friday.

WORK SCHEDULE AND LEAVE PERIOD

The trainee will work at the same schedule observed by the other
employees doing the same job from _____ to _____
from _____ to _____. Leave period will be the same according
to the employer.

Appendix D (Continued)

TRAINEE'S OBLIGATIONS

1. The trainee is obligated to offer his/her services as _____
2. The trainee is obligated to do his/her work to the best of his/her abilities, and to follow the instructions of his/her training supervisor and respecting his/her advisor's recommendations defined as follows:

3. If any problem, the trainee will contact the supervisor or advisor.

EMPLOYER'S OBLIGATIONS

The employer is obligated to:

1. Respect the laws and policies in force in the country.
2. Provide the trainee with an adequate environment as required above.

JOB DEVELOPER'S OBLIGATIONS

The advisor is obligated to:

1. To visit the place of employment at least once a week to control the trainee's evolution, talk to the employer about the trainee, and try to solve any problem either one could have during the training.
2. Proceed, with the trainee and the employer, to the evaluation of the trainee from the beginning to the end of the training, using the form attached to the contract.

END OF THE CONTRACT

In case of ending the contract by either party, notice has to be given to the other parties twenty four (24) hours in advance.

DONE AND SIGNED IN THREE (3) COPIES

PLACE AND DATE: _____

The Trainee

The Employer

Job Developer

APPENDIX E.

GUINEA OIC - PLACEMENT SERVICE

TRAINEE'S FOLLOW-UP FORM

NAME OF TRAINEE: _____ AGE: _____

SECTION: _____ CLASS: _____ YEAR: _____

IDENTIFICATION CARD NUMBER: _____

EDUCATION: _____

JOB EXPERIENCE: _____

PLACE/TYPE OF TRAINING DESIRED: _____

POSITION DESIRED: _____

REMARKS: _____

JOB TRAINING PLACEMENT

Name of enterprise: _____

Address: _____ Tel.: _____

Name of Supervisor: _____

Duration of training: _____ Transportation: _____

Date of training: From: _____ To: _____

Remarks: _____

Follow-up: Date: _____

Date: _____

Date: _____

Date: _____

Date: _____

Appendix E. Trainee's Follow-Up Form (Continued)

JOB PLACEMENT

Name of enterprise: _____

Address: _____ Tel.: _____

Position: _____ Salary: _____

Name of Supervisor: _____ Position: _____

Date of employment: _____

Date of leaving: _____ Reasons: _____

Follow-up:

Date	Position	Salary	Performance	Remarks	Initials

APPENDIX F. OJT PERFORMANCE EVALUATION FORM

O.I.C. GUINEA/PLACEMENT SERVICE

EVALUATION OF SECRETARIAL TRAINING

I. IDENTIFICATION:

NAME OF TRAINEE:
PLACE OF TRAINING:
DATE:
DATE OF TRAINING (FROM/TO)
CLASS:

LEGEND :

1 = Non satisf.
2 = Satisfactory
3 = Good
4 = Very Good

II. PROFESSIONAL APTITUDES:

		1	2	3	4
1 .	Oral communication				
2 .	Knowledge of the French language (grammar and spelling)				
3 .	Aptitude in writing: letter, report and french communication				
4 .	Knowledge of the English language (grammar and spelling)				
5 .	Level of usual english vocabulary				
6 .	Knowledge of notions of organizations, meetings and business trips.				
7 .	Welcoming a visitor and telephone communication				
8 .	Knowledge of job policies and rights				
9 .	Knowledge in accounting and business transactions				
10.	Management and control of purchase of materials and business supplies				
11.	Aptitude in keeping records and filing				
12.	Knowledge of the AZERTY keyboard in typing				

Appendix F. (Continued) - OJT Performance Evaluation Form

		1	2	3	4
13.	Capable of producing a typed document with no error or misspelled words				
14.	Knowledge of conventional signs of correction and ability to read manuscripts				
15.	Able to take the initiative of doing things cleanliness				
16.	Speed and accuracy in typing				
17.	Knowledge of other business machines				
18.	Knowledge of stenography and able to transcript				
19.	Speed in taking notes in stenography				