

IPP Technical Evaluations

US Partner: University of Georgia (UGA),
Carl Vinson Institute of Government
(CVIOG)

NIS Partner: Uzhgorod State University (USU),
Center for Public Administration Reform and Assistance
(CPARA)

Location of Visit: Uzhgorod, Vinogradovo, and Mykachevo, Ukraine

Dates of Visit: October 30 - November 6, 1996

**Date report submitted
to IREX:** November 26, 1996

A. Discuss the strongest aspects of technical and professional work being done by this partnership.

- This partnership has a number of significant strengths:

The CPARA research associates trained at UGA. Most appear to be dedicated to the project and quite technically competent in their areas of specialization.

All Ukrainians interviewed who spent time at UGA demonstrated a significantly heightened knowledge, awareness, and enthusiasm for the project and their field of expertise.

The project has created a variety of publications; specifically the training manuals on personnel management and on budgeting, the consulting project on local taxes, the Handbook for Mayors and Council Members, and the CPARA newsletter.

The regional administration of Transcarpathia is committed to CPARA's programs as in-service training for regional, district and local employees.

Discuss the weakest aspects of technical and professional work being done by this partnership.

Marketing is the weakest aspect of the work being done by the partnership. The absence of a viable marketing plan, and of one that is aggressively implemented, negatively affects the potential sustainability of the project. Marketing is the responsibility of the entire staff, and should be incorporated into all programs.

- There are serious questions about the sustainability of the project.

Training sessions observed consisted mostly of lectures on the Ukrainian or US systems of local government. Training should be interactive, and should focus on the development of solutions to governmental problems. Ultimately, training programs will not be successful unless they address concrete, practical issues.

Recommendations for Improvement:

The marketing plan should be revised, and the CPARA brochure should be completely reworked as a marketing tool. It is recommended that, if at all possible, UGA send a marketing professional to work with CPARA staff. The marketing professional should conduct an initial two to three week visit, perhaps with a follow up visit of a week or two.

A viable marketing plan should be a joint effort of the entire staff, and should include staff assignments for implementation of specific aspects of the plan.

The marketing plan should include an effort to secure the commitment of local government leaders to the goals of the project. This should include personal visits by CPARA leadership with copies of the project's publications, specifically the results from the consulting projects, so that leaders learn of the potential value to be gained from consulting with CPARA.

Several of the training sessions conducted during the site visit were the first to be held with Uzhgorod municipal government. CPARA should work to strengthen this relationship, as the project is perceived by the city as merely one involving visiting American professors speaking on US government.

CPARA should develop a schedule and list of training courses offered, and a list of available publications for use as marketing tools.

Each training session should begin with a general introduction to CPARA, its various activities, training subjects and publications. Material should be distributed at each training session, preferably on CPARA letterhead.

Center staff need to understand that, in order to be successful, they must offer concrete, practical advice and assistance to local officials. They cannot just teach current practices without application to the Ukrainian situation and to the needs of Ukrainian local officials.

The project should focus greater efforts on integrating training sessions presented by the American and Ukrainian partners. Ideally, all training should be team taught. With the exception of the environmental training sessions, there was no attempt to transfer knowledge from the American professors to the Ukrainian associates. The American presentations were not integrated into the training program as a whole, but were regarded as visiting lectures. There was no evidence that information and materials provided by the American professors will be integrated into training sessions offered by Ukrainians.

CPARA does not see itself as a resource center. It would greatly increase its credibility were it to develop a library of resources. It should develop a database of available materials for distribution as a marketing tool.

It is the responsibility of CPARA leadership to focus organizational resources on project sustainability. There is no assurance that US funding through the partnerships program will continue, and CPARA staff should aggressively explore options for governmental and private funding from other US, Ukrainian and European sources. This is the responsibility of CPARA staff, not of UGA staff.

CPARA should move to institutionalize itself within the law faculty, so it has a "place" within the university. It is perhaps premature to consider incorporation as an institute; many public administration programs in the US began as programs within a university faculty, and became stand alone institutes only after years of proven experience.

B. What do the Ukrainian partners see as the "criteria for success" for their partnership project activities? How close are they to attaining them?

The Ukrainian partners see a successful Center as one which has a "home", a stable financial base; and one which provides services that are needed by local governments. The project has made significant progress recently in production of training programs and products. It must now sustain and increase this production, while focusing efforts on marketing and sustainability.

Recommendations for Improvement:

The project needs to focus on the development of a curriculum that would be most beneficial to its audience. Currently, it appears that not enough attention is devoted to the types or areas of expertise that could be developed that would be of the most use to local governments. To be seen as an established resource of valuable information, the Center should provide specific skills which set them apart from other organizations, academic or otherwise, and which are viewed as essential by local governments. One potential area of expertise would be the design and application of the new local government law. A marketing survey should be conducted to determine how the Center can most efficiently meet the needs of local government.

C. Describe the technical merit and appropriateness of the following program components:

1. Training

There is no one location of course curricula, nor were any curricula provided for the training sessions observed. Upon request, syllabi were provided for the personnel management and budgeting courses; other syllabi are apparently available, but were not provided. I was impressed with the budgeting and personnel management courses, and believe the information they contain to be current, accurate and basic. Instructors should understand that courses should be continuously revised to reflect changing conditions and additional insights gained during successive course presentations.

Upon request, a list of training courses and a training schedule were provided. This information was not contained in any printed documents or marketing materials. The training schedule lists only the dates and prospective audiences, and not the courses to be provided.

- Training courses offered by CPARA include:

- "The Legal Aspects of Public Administration in Ukraine", G. Dynys

- "Introduction to Administrative Analysis", R. Holik

- "Financial Management", R. Holik

- "Personnel Management", M. Petskar

- "Budgeting", K. Sochka

- "Constitutional Issues", N. Palynchak

- "Organization of Local Administrations", I. Rizak
(organizational head of regional administration)

- "Commercial Legislation", G. Dynys

These courses differ from those listed on the UGA World Wide Web site, which should be updated to reflect current course offerings. Syllabi presented on the UGA/CPARA website also do not reflect current course offerings.

The majority of training sessions conducted during the site visit were presented by the two visiting professors from the University of Georgia. Three of the CPARA research associates also provided training on budgeting, financial management and personnel management.

- Future Training Courses and Products

Professor Palynchak is currently preparing a comparative analysis of constitutional law in the US and Ukraine. This work will be published as a booklet to accompany a training course on constitutional law that he will offer in January.

Professor Vasil Kertsman of the law faculty, a CPARA research associate as of September, is preparing two training courses. One of the course is on the role of local administration in social service delivery, and the other course is on the role of local government in the constitutional protection of human rights.

Two CPARA associates, currently at the University of Georgia, are preparing a course on privatization, and a course on citizen involvement in local government.

It is anticipated that booklets will be produced to accompany the training courses on each of these issues.

- Observation of training sessions

Training sessions observed included a full day seminar in Vinogradovo on Thursday, October 31, a half day seminar in Mykachevo on Friday, November 1, and seminars in Uzhgorod on Monday and Tuesday, November 4 and 5.

The seminars were conducted by two professors from the University of Georgia on their first visit to Ukraine. Professor Mel Hill spoke to approximately seventy *raion* level government officials in Vinogradovo on "The Legal Basis for State and Local Government". The program was quite general in nature, and principally an opportunity for the audience to become acquainted with the American system of government. Questions concerned the level and types of US taxes, and ownership of enterprises and property.

Professor Jim Kundell spoke to approximately thirty agricultural officials on "Land Use and Environmental Protection in the US". He explained the relationship between land use and its environmental effects, and the division and management of public property in the US. He also compared the US and Ukrainian constitutions on the issue of the environment. Questions concerned the portion of agricultural land in the public sector, agricultural taxation and land use, and governmental control of farmers.

At the conclusion of the first day's session, Professor Roman Holik, assistant director of CPARA for finances and technical assistance, gave a gloomy report on the economic prospects for local government in the coming year. The presentation was not a training session, but rather an economic report and lecture on living with less, with some suggestions for sources of additional tax revenue. He appeared to be telling the audience what they already knew.

Professor Nick Palynchak, assistant director of CPARA for training, distributed the CPARA publication on church issues and discussed the conflict between the Orthodox Church and Greek Catholics (Uniate Church) regarding the disposition of church property previously confiscated by the state. Palynchak mentioned that the Center offers a sixteen hour course on this issue. There were no questions from the audience, and the issue did not appear relevant to their concerns.

The second day of training in Mykachevo for approximately thirty administrative officials was reduced by half due to a late start and an early conclusion for the afternoon holiday.

The presentations consisted of shortened versions of those provided the previous day. The audience expressed interest in the US system of budgeting at the local level, in civil service issues, and in local regulation of private property.

Professor Nick Palynchak again discussed the issue of the disposition of church property, and referred to the sixteen hour training course available on the subject. He noted that some of those in the audience had attended a previous training session in Uzhgorod, and that two of the participants in the audience were responsible for religious issues. He referred to the booklet on the church issue which had been distributed, specifically to page nine which contains an outline of how to work through conflict resolution. Palynchak also announced that the program intends to send three English speaking Ukrainians to the US for training.

On Monday, November 4, Professors Hill and Kundell spoke to approximately forty Uzhgorod city officials. Their presentations were for the first time accompanied by handouts prepared in Georgia in Ukrainian. The audience, as before, consisted of a variety of government officials with specific areas of expertise who believed the presentations were too general, and complained that they had been ordered to attend.

In the afternoon, Professor Kundell was joined by Professor Manyvchuk of CPARA at a session for regional environmental officials in Uzhgorod, while Professor Hill spoke to a group of *oblast* officials. Professor Kundell described his session as more productive than previous sessions, in that the audience of approximately forty officials was specifically interested in environmental and land use issues.

On Tuesday, November 5, Professor Hill spoke in the first half of the morning to approximately forty officials; Professors Holik and Sochka spoke in the second half of the morning to approximately twenty officials of Uzhgorod city government. Almost all of the participants were women who were responsible for financial issues. Professor Sochka spoke on budgeting; Professor Holik spoke on municipal finance. The Center's booklet on local taxes was distributed.

In his presentation, Professor Holik emphasized the need for additional sources of revenue at the local level, as the national government is delegating greater responsibility to local

government, and is providing fewer resources with which to fulfill these obligations. He mentioned the need to improve tax collection, and the potential for local revenue from privatization. He presented an overview of municipal finance in the US and touched on a number of different issues including: the issuance of debt, as is already practiced in Kiev and Kharkov; the need for local governments to be credit worthy and to publicly disclose their revenues and expenditures; the establishment of municipal banks or the use of local banks as a municipal depository on a competitive basis; program budgeting; and voter approval of tax increases and the issuance of debt for public projects.

Audience members expressed their frustration with the Ukrainian system, where the wealthy do not pay taxes and the poor cannot afford to. They did not ask questions in response to the presentation, but requested the assistance of the presenters in resolving their issues. It was a healthy discussion in terms of venting frustration, but the trainers were not prepared to offer specific suggestions, nor did they advertise the possibility that CPARA could address these issues through a consulting project. Professor Dynys ended the discussion by stating that the presenters were not there to solve their problems, but only to inform them about the system in the US. One audience member specifically requested assistance in improving the garbage collection system, and in understanding other methods of financing garbage collection.

No audience appeared for the Tuesday afternoon or Wednesday morning sessions on the environment. It was unclear whether the time allotted was too generous, or whether the subject matter was not particularly relevant to the audience, or whether some miscommunication occurred. It was not a good use of Professor Kundell's time, and demonstrates an overly aggressive effort to stage too many training sessions at once.

- General Observations

A printed program was produced and distributed for each group of trainees: a total of six programs for the five days of training.

Each participant received an evaluation form to complete. Overhead slides in Ukrainian had been prepared by the American professors (but were only used minimally due to technical difficulties), and were left for use by CPARA at the conclusion of the visit.

Handouts prepared in Ukrainian by the American presenters were provided for the final three days of training, and included some excerpts from the constitution of the State of Georgia, a chart detailing the relationship between the levels of government in the US, and information on environmental issues. This information was also left with CPARA for use in future training.

CPARA distributed only the booklet on church issues at the first two days of training in Vinogradavo and Mykachevo.

- Trainer and trainee interviews

A meeting was held with the chief of staff to the mayor of Uzhgorod at the conclusion of the presentation by the American professors to his staff on Monday morning, November 4.

CPARA has worked previously principally with *oblast* officials, and this was their first experience with the city administration. It was clear that the chief lacked basic knowledge of CPARA, as he perceived the project as one involving American professors occasionally giving lectures.

Audience members interviewed generally expressed appreciation for the sessions, but expressed their concern that training should address concrete solutions to issues.

Professor Palynchak marketed the sixteen hour course on the church issue (his specific area of research) each time he made a presentation on the issue. At the second day's session he also mentioned that the Center intends to send three Ukrainians for training in the US. However, he did not give a presentation on the Center generally, or its programs specifically.

CPARA and the training sessions received media coverage in the local newspaper, and Professor Hill conducted an interview with a radio reporter. Media coverage is an important aspect of overall marketing for the Center and should continue to be pursued at every opportunity.

Recommendations for Improvement:

- General Recommendations

A list of training courses offered by CPARA should be compiled and available for distribution as a marketing document.

A training schedule should be compiled which lists dates, audience, course title, and trainers.

Although evaluation forms were distributed at each session, it was unclear the extent to which the results are analyzed and incorporated into future planning.

- Improving the quality of training sessions

Training sessions should be more specifically geared to each audience. Many audiences were too general in their areas of expertise for the sessions presented.

American professors should be more thoroughly briefed prior to their arrival, and they should have some initial meetings with local government officials prior to their

presentations to learn of local issues so that they may tailor their presentations to the needs of the audience.

Establishment of a system of progressive training sessions would help to institutionalize the program, and demonstrate educational progress for those trained. Several attendees had participated in previous sessions and it was unclear whether information was repeated. "Progressive" training involves a developmental process. For example, a participant would initially participate in a basic, overview course (say, on budgeting), and then "progress" to courses of greater detail and difficulty (say, on cost accounting, or payroll, or intergovernmental transfers, or on spreadsheet development). Progressive training would allow the successful participant to demonstrate a more thorough knowledge of a given subject (much as the interns gain from their stays in the US), rather than just a broad overview.

- Teaching methods

Ideally, all seminars when Americans are in Ukraine should be team taught. Not only would this reflect a true "partnership", but it can instill audience confidence and ensure that the Ukrainian partner has the active experience to teach the course on his/her own in the future.

- Appropriateness of material

Handouts should be an integral aspect of all sessions. They give a specific focus to the session and improve the likelihood that participants will retain the information learned.

Additionally, handouts on CPARA letterhead serve as a marketing tool.

- Marketing of training

Development of a list of available materials and training sessions, and a comprehensive distribution plan, would be a useful marketing tool. Additionally, each session should begin with a presentation on CPARA and its activities (distribution of a brochure or handout on the subject would be particularly helpful).

Participants should be told of the types and topics of training activities, and be provided a schedule of upcoming training sessions.

2. Products

Recommendations for Improvement:

Publications have only recently been produced. During the site visit, the Handbook for Mayors and Council Members, and the booklet on local taxes were in the process of being

printed. Sufficient time has not passed in which to assess the effectiveness of these publications as teaching tools or as resources for Ukrainian local government audiences.

The project has recently produced three booklets, two developed from the work on each of the two consulting projects- on taxes and on church relations- and a third booklet on personnel management. The three booklets have been printed in an initial run of 300 copies each. The products produced for the consulting projects are reviewed in section 4. Marketing products are reviewed in section 3.

- Booklet on "Legal Basis for Church/State Relations"

This publication presents a political analysis of the decision making process, with specific attention to conflict resolution. The issue of the disposition of church property is used as the primary example through which to discuss the process of conflict resolution. The booklet also contains other sample case studies.

- Booklet on "Local Government Taxes and Charges"

This booklet, published during the time of the site visit, is a training manual which contains a course syllabus and materials to accompany a three day training course. The course compares the US and Ukrainian systems of taxation, and of revenue collection and expenditure at each level of government. It also presents information obtained on Ukrainian local finances as a result of the tax consulting project.

- Booklet on "The Basis of Personnel Management"

This training manual also contains a course syllabus to accompany a five day course on personnel management. The publication contains lessons, occasional case studies, and sample forms. It contains a good overview of personnel management issues, and includes: personnel management strategy, the main problems and mistakes made in personnel management, career development, personnel training and development, personnel recruitment, personnel communications, patronage and merit systems, steps to encourage professional development and to develop managers, how to motivate personnel, and how to apply total quality management to Ukrainian government. The booklet includes a sample job description for a personnel manager, a time management questionnaire for managers, a job evaluation exercise, a job performance evaluation, and a sample job announcement and interview questionnaire. The publication also contains a list of all laws affecting personnel issues in Ukraine.

- Handbook for Mayors and Council Members

The handbook, currently in print, contains twelve chapters, two of which (citizen complaints and the administrative authority of local governments) were added as a result of comments received from local officials at a conference CPARA held to review the

handbook. It is clear that the conference helped produce a more useful product. The current local government law and Ukrainian constitution are also included in the handbook. Interviews were held with the authors of individual chapters, where possible.

Chapters in the book include:

I. The constitutional basis of local government in Ukraine

II. The structure of local government in Ukraine

III. Personnel management

This chapter was prepared by Miroslava Petskar who also teaches the training course on this issue. The chapter differs from the booklet (see above) prepared to accompany the course in that the chapter in the handbook discusses the legal basis for personnel management in Ukraine, makes recommendations regarding personnel performance appraisal, and recommends reforms within the current system.

IV. Budgeting

This chapter contains an overview of the Ukrainian budget system, the budget process, budget preparation, budgetary approval, execution of budget, internal budgetary control, adoption of executed budget, role of taxes in local budgets and a discussion of laws which regulate budgets. The discussion is more broad than that contained in the publication on the tax consulting project which covers only local taxation. The chapter does contain tables detailing the Uzhgorod city budget, with a three year comparison of projected and actual figures for different sources of revenue. This is a significant contribution to the understanding of local government, as such comparative data had not previously been published.

V. Privatization

Small scale privatization, for which local government is responsible, is almost complete in the City of Uzhgorod, but has yet to be completed in other regions of Transcarpathia. This chapter discusses the definition of municipal property, privatization procedures, post privatization support of enterprises, and municipal property management in foreign countries. It also contains sample privatization documents, contracts, and rental agreements. This chapter is of limited long term value, though some amount of privatization will continue through the next year or two. This chapter should eventually evolve into a discussion of management and maintenance of municipal property.

VI. Ecology

VII. International relations with bordering countries

VIII. Foreign investments

This chapter is an initial attempt to address economic development issues. Means of foreign investment, such as through the securities market or through the purchase of property, are mentioned. The rights of investors, legal issues concerning foreign investments, and registering enterprises with foreign investments are discussed. The chapter also presents issues which can negatively affect investment such as the complexity and level of taxes, customs regulations, aversion to the investment risks and lack of information in Ukraine; it also makes suggestions on how to obtain foreign investments. This is a valuable chapter that should be expanded to emphasize overall economic development and not just foreign investment. It should focus on the role of local government in improving a region's economy.

IX. Interdenominational relations

X. Computer technology

This chapter contains an introduction to the applicability of computers in the workplace, including discussion of data bases, word processors, and spreadsheets. It discusses computer applications in accounting, e-mail, and the Internet; and presents an analysis of different types of custom and package software. It mentions GIS systems and the benefits to computerization of the election process, and focuses on the benefits of computerization in the workplace, such as increased access to information, and computer use in decision making and analysis.

XI. Citizen complaints

XII. Administrative authority of local government

Production of the Handbook is a significant undertaking, and the most useful marketing tool developed by the project. It is a major accomplishment of the partnership.

Consideration should be given to including the following topics in future editions of the Handbook:

- mayor/council relations
- council procedure, including parliamentary procedure
- communicating with the public and the media
- economic development
- management of public utilities and city service delivery
- urban planning and land use

- General Recommendations

The booklets on personnel management and on budgeting are training manuals which can be used for self study or to accompany a training course. Future publications should be modeled on these two booklets, which are significant accomplishments of the project.

3. Resource and Learning Centers

Recommendations for Improvement:

The Center has produced several marketing publications:

- CPARA Brochure

The brochure, intended as a marketing tool, contains an overview of the institutional partnership, and defines CPARA, its history, activities and goals. Approximately 200 copies have been printed and have been distributed to participants, though no targeted mailing has been conducted. The brochure is more an historical review of CPARA rather than a marketing tool, in that it does not directly advertise the center as offering specific courses or consulting services. It lists courses that have been offered, but does not advertise future course offerings. It makes no mention of publications that have been produced or that are available, nor does it mention the two consulting projects that have been conducted.

The brochure is a good beginning, but should be redeveloped as an advertising vehicle, and should specifically and aggressively advertise courses, publications and consulting services. A marketing and distribution plan should also be developed for the brochure in the context of an overall marketing program.

- Newsletter

Two issues of the Center's newsletter have been produced, the first by UGA, and the second by CPARA in Ukraine. The third issue will be prepared by UGA and is anticipated for December 1996 publication; CPARA will prepare the fourth issue. The first issue described the overall purpose of the program, while the second, published in July, contained articles on the preparation of the Handbook for Mayors and Council Members, on the development of the sustainability plan, on the April training session that was held, on a consulting project, on a Ukrainian's impressions of the US, on an American's impressions of Ukraine, and an article on upcoming conferences. Approximately 100 copies of the second newsletter were printed, and, in contrast to the brochure, the newsletter was mailed out to past participants and to 25 state and regional administrations, and to the 13 regional administrations in Transcarpathia.

The newsletter is a valuable marketing tool, and an impressive publication. There are no recommendations for improvement of the product.

- CPARA Marketing Plan

Marketing is the weakest aspect of the work being done by the partnership. The absence of a viable marketing plan and of one that is aggressively implemented negatively affects the potential sustainability of the project. Marketing is the responsibility of the entire staff, and should be incorporated into all programs.

The marketing plan should be revised. It is recommended that, if at all possible, UGA send a marketing professional to work with CPARA staff. A viable marketing plan should be a joint effort of the entire staff, and should include staff assignments for implementation of specific aspects of the plan.

A survey should be developed and distributed to governmental leaders in the region soliciting their suggestions for both consulting opportunities and training sessions. The survey should be preceded by a complete description of CPARA, its services, its staff, and its publications and training courses. The survey could also suggest potential topics for consulting and assess the level of interest in those topics. Survey results should serve as a basis for revision of the marketing and sustainability plans.

The CPARA brochure should be completely reworked as a marketing tool. The marketing plan should include an effort to secure the commitment of local government leaders to the goals of the project. This should include personal visits by CPARA leadership with copies of the project's publications, specifically the results from the consulting projects, so that leaders learn of the potential value to be gained from consulting with CPARA.

CPARA should develop a schedule and list of training courses offered and a list of available publications for use as marketing tools, and a comprehensive distribution plan for these materials. Each training session should begin with a general introduction to CPARA, its various activities, training subjects and publications. Material should be distributed at each training session, preferably on CPARA letterhead.

CPARA does not see itself as a resource center. It would greatly increase its credibility were it to develop a library of resources. It should develop a database of available materials, for distribution as a marketing tool.

4. Consulting Services

- Church Consulting Project, and Publications

The final consulting report was printed near the conclusion of the site visit. A booklet produced in conjunction with the project, which addresses conflict resolution issues, was distributed at most training sessions where Professor Palynchak spoke on the church issue. Additionally, a publication was produced for a September conference with local government leaders who are responsible for church relations.

Although there is official separation of church and state in Ukraine, there is a role for local government to play in attempting to resolve the interdenominational conflicts regarding the disposition of church property previously confiscated by the state. Volodya Dideck, the main specialist for church affairs for the *oblast* administration stated that the project was of great assistance to the *oblast* and village governments. The project provided assistance to the governments in resolving legal issues, and in arbitrating among confessions. The project analyzed the basis of the interdenominational conflicts and brought interested parties together to discuss and attempt to resolve the issues. Recommendations included the institution of shared facilities, and the introduction of community fundraising to build new facilities. It is clear that the September conference was a useful product of this consulting effort. As the final report has just been printed, it is not yet possible to evaluate its effectiveness. Professor Palynchak has developed a sixteen hour training course on conflict resolution as a result of this project.

- Local government taxes and charges: consulting project and publication

The *oblast* financial department served as the client for this consulting project. The project involved an inventory of taxes collected at the local level, and recommendations for additional sources of revenue, specifically through introduction of a customs and transit tax, which was recently authorized by the Ukrainian Rada. Sergei Popyk, chief of the tax inspection department for the *oblast* administration, who interned at UGA, worked on this project with CPARA research associates. Professor Lauth of UGA served as advisor, and his influence is notable; all Ukrainians who worked with him appear to have gained considerable insights into financial issues.

Recommendations for Improvement:

The quality of the two completed consulting projects is good. Center staff should be careful that future consulting projects are truly responsive to the needs of local government officials. It is not clear whether current ideas for future consulting projects (youth unemployment, privatization and land use) are truly reflective of the needs of local governments.

A survey should be developed and distributed to governmental leaders in the region soliciting their suggestions for both consulting opportunities and training sessions. The survey should be preceded by a complete description of CPARA, its services, its staff, and its publications and training courses. The survey could also suggest potential topics for consulting and assess the level of interest in those topics. Survey results should serve as a basis for revision of the marketing and sustainability plans.

In addition to the survey, individual meetings should be held with heads of local governments to obtain the same information.

D) What additional technical assistance do you believe the Ukrainian side could use to improve their work in general?

It would be good for the Ukrainian partners to participate in training courses on organizational management, and on marketing. Perhaps UGA could send a marketing and/or management professor to provide technical assistance to the Center staff.

E) What new directions do you see as a natural follow-on for this project? Are there others working in the sector that this group might contact and/or collaborate with?

There is an organization of Ukrainian mayors with which CPARA should develop a partnership. The organization could be a potential consulting client, and could serve as the host organization to train new mayors. A partnership could strengthen the viability of each organization.

The Ukrainian Parliament is currently reviewing a draft law on local self government. There appears to be no relationship between CPARA and the members of Parliament's local self government committee. All questions asked regarding this issue were considered the area of expertise of a member of the law faculty who occasionally works with CPARA, and who was out of town at the time of the site visit. The perceived lack of involvement in this important issue of the legal basis for local government can be seen as a lost opportunity for CPARA to strengthen its political clout and reputation as an intellectual and academic authority on local government. If the Center cannot secure a paid consulting contract to review and comment on the draft law, it should nonetheless provide comments on the draft in an effort to establish itself as an authority on the issue, and to develop a training course on the law.

F) How do you assess the partnership sustainability plan? What is your sense of how close the partners will be to meeting these goals?

The draft sustainability plan, as downloaded from UGA's World Wide Web site is but the briefest outline of future activities. During the site visit, CPARA staff repeatedly stated their opinion that local governments will not pay for their services. In that they appear to have done little marketing, it is doubtful they have even attempted a serious effort to secure governmental cooperation for future consulting projects. In fact, subjects for future consulting were mentioned, and there is no indication that the issues CPARA staff intend to address are ones of concern to local government. It may well be the case that local governments will be unable to pay for CPARA's services; if this is the case, the sustainability plan should reflect an alternate arrangement to secure funding.

It is the responsibility of CPARA leadership to focus organizational resources on project sustainability. There is no assurance that US funding through the partnerships program will continue, and CPARA staff should aggressively explore options for governmental and

private funding from other US, Ukrainian and European sources. This is the responsibility of CPARA staff, not of UGA staff.

CPARA should move to institutionalize itself within the law faculty, so it has a "place" within the university. It is perhaps premature to consider incorporation as an institute; many public administration programs in the US began as programs within a university faculty, and became stand alone institutes only after years of proven experience.

G) Other Comments:

What other topics might CPARA add to their offering to better serve local government?

- Economic development
- Local government law
- Intergovernmental relations
- Service delivery

Is CPARA itself a resource center? What additional materials (electronic and print) might they obtain to make themselves a resource center for local government employees?

No, CPARA is not functioning as a resource center, nor do the staff appear to put any emphasis on that function. There is no evidence that a data base of information accumulated (including materials provided by UGA professors during the site visit) has been developed, or marketed for distribution. A great deal of information, much of it in Ukrainian has been produced by other US government funded projects. The project should position itself as the Transcarpathia distribution center for information that could assist local government officials.

The products produced by ISAR (see attachment 1) are a good example of information CPARA could easily acquire. Additionally, ISAR may be a prospective funding source for an environmental project conducted with a Transcarpathian environmental NGO.

How are the US internships for the local government employees helping them with their positions? What might be done to improve these?

Sergei Popyk, chief of tax inspection department for *oblast* administration spent one month at the UGA as an intern. Two weeks of the internship were spent with the City Government of Savannah where he acquired a variety of skills he is currently applying in Uzhgorod. It is apparent that without the internship, he would not have acquired the firsthand knowledge necessary to master some fundamental financial skills.

As a result of his internship, he has initiated efforts to computerize his operation. Computers were obtained two months ago, and they have begun to use computers to analyze tax collection, to transfer money between accounts, and to develop spreadsheets. Mr. Popyk explained that in Georgia, he learned of various administrative systems, and studied the process of tax collection - specifically property taxes, which will be implemented in Ukraine next year, and will become one of the main sources of revenue for local budgets.

How are the US internships for CPARA associates helping them with their positions at CPARA? What might be done to improve these?

This is one of the best aspects of the entire partnership in that the quality of the staff is one of the strengths of CPARA. Staff associates trained in the US demonstrated a high level of understanding of municipal issues in their areas of expertise; the knowledge they exhibited about the US systems could only have been gained through long term exposure in country.

Attachment 1

- Projects from ISAR's office in Kyiv

ISAR-Kyiv provides technical, informational and financial assistance to NGOs in Belarus, Moldova and Ukraine. The grant-making program offers small seed grants for concrete environmental projects in fields such as media and public awareness, legal and legislative policy, alternative sources of energy, biodiversity protection, environmental education, community cleanup, pollution monitoring, sustainable agriculture and waste management. The program also offers support to joint projects between groups in different republics and to US-NIS partnerships. Proposals are reviewed four times a year by a local board of environmental specialists.

ISAR-Kyiv also serves as an information clearinghouse for NGOs. It has developed an extensive database of regional environmental groups and in 1995 published a directory of NGOs in the West NIS involved in environmental activities, which it distributed to Ukrainian, Moldovan and Belarusian NGOs. ISAR continuously updates its database and plans to publish an expanded directory in 1996. In the last two years ISAR-Kyiv has published over a dozen environmental publications, including many translations of foreign works on environmental themes. These materials are distributed free of charge to NGOs in the region. In addition, ISAR-Kyiv produces and distributes a monthly bulletin, which includes information about seminars, conferences, publications, grant and scholarship opportunities and other events of interest to local environmentalists. The bulletin is available in both hard copy and electronic form.

Ukraina 252006, Kyiv, a/c 47
Tel/Fax: (044) 269-2157
E-mail: <isar@isar.freenet.kiev.ua>
Helena Gubar, Administrative Director