

PD ABN-344  
91738



FINAL EVALUATION  
*for Coordination in Development Inc. &  
Lutheran World Relief*

African Women: Community Development and  
Combined Technologies

May 1996

Matching Grant Project Number:  
938-0158

Cooperative Agreement Number:  
FAO-0158-A-00-3050-00

This report was prepared by AMA Technologies, Inc., under contract number  
FAO-0158-A-00-3050-00 with The Office of Private and Voluntary  
Cooperation, Bureau for Humanitarian Response, US Agency for International  
Development.

Evaluation Team Leader: Hamelmal G. Aklilu  
Evaluation Team: Julia Nemon, WIDSR Contract/WID Office and Christine  
Grumm, Consultant, Lutheran World Relief

## Table of Contents

List of Acronyms  
Executive Summary

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Project Overview	1
	1.2 Purpose of Cooperative Agrrement	1
	1.3 Project Objectives	1
	1.4 Project Rational	2
	1.5 Identification ans Selection of Pilot Projects	2
	1.6 Project Appraisal	4
	1.7 Expected Outcome	6
	1.8 Time Line	6
II.	NATURE OF EVALUATION AND OBJECTIVES	6
	2.1 Evaluation Methodology	7
III.	INSTITUTIONAL BACKGROUND	8
	3.1 Management Systems & Monitoring/Evaluation Methodologies	9
	3.2 Project Activities	9
IV.	ETHNOLOGICAL CASE STUDIES ON THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES – REVOLVING LOAN/IRINGA	10
	4.1 Profile of Three Organizing Groups of the Women’s Trust and Development Association	10
	4.2 Profile of Women Receiving WTDA Loans	12
	4.3 Loan Schedule for the WTDA	12
	4.4 Evaluation Findings	14
	4.5 Lessons Learned	15
	4.6 Constraints	18
	4.7 Sustainability	18
	4.8 Recommendation	19
V.	ARUSHA INDIGENOUS VEGETABLE PROJECT	20
	5.1 Evaluation Findings	20
	5.2 Lessons Learned	21
	5.3 Constraints	23
	5.4 Sustainability	24
	5.5 Recommendation	25

VI.	BANANA PLANTATION	25
6.1	Findings	26
6.2	Lessons Learned	27
6.3	Constraints	28
6.4	Sustainability	28
6.5	Recommendation	29
VII.	CHARCOAL BRIQUETTE AND STOVE PROJECT	29
7.1	Evaluation Findings	29
7.2	Lessons Learned	30
7.3	Constraints	31
7.4	Sustainability	32
7.5	Recommendation	32
VII.	ORGANIC FARMING	32
8.1	Evaluation Findings	33
8.2	Lessons Learned	34
8.3	Constraints	35
8.4	Sustainability	36
8.5	Recommendation	36
XI.	CONCLUSION	36
X.	OVERALL RECOMMENDATION	39

#### ANNEXES

A.	Profiles of Implementing Agencies
B.	Budget
C.	Financial Status
D.	Time Line
E.	Scope of Work for Evaluation
F.	Evaluation Activities and Schedule
G.	Persons Met
H.	Resource Documents

## ACRONYMS

BHR/PVC	Bureau for Humanitarian Response/Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation
CODEL	Coordination in Development Inc.
KIOF	The Kenya Institute of Organic Farming
LWR	Lutheran World Relief
NEVEPA	Network Vegetable Production of Africa
PVC	Private and Voluntary Cooperation
VIP	Vijana Iringa Products
WID	Women in Development
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WCD	Women for Community Development
WTDA	Women's Trust and Development Association
YWCA	The Young Women's Christian Association

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Evaluation Team visited Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda from March 4-21, 1996 to assess the overall impact the "African Women: Community Development and Combined Technologies" project: a cooperative agreement between USAID and Coordination Development, Inc. (CODEL). The cooperative agreement consists of four pilot projects and one ethnological case study.

The pilot projects were designed to increase understanding of women's roles in natural resource management with a specific focus on combining traditional systems of natural resource management and scientific/modern technology. The result was to encourage sustainable ecological and social development. In all three countries, women farmers comprise the majority of small holders making significant contributions to agriculture production and playing key roles in environment and natural resource management. Thus, the projects were to acknowledge women's role, identify needs and provide them with access to and knowledge of practical skills. The assumption was that this would enhance women's roles as agriculturalists, household managers, and natural resource managers as well as lead to a better understanding of the role of women and natural resource management. The pilot projects are located in Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda.

The ethnological case study was designed to increase the understanding of women's roles in society by examining the impact of increased economic status. The case study revolved around a micro-enterprise credit scheme that was created for women in the Iringa region of Tanzania.

Both the pilot projects and the case study were designed by CODEL, an umbrella association of religious organizations, and submitted to USAID as a three-year cooperative agreement (August 1993-96). On the USAID side, the cooperative agreement is co-sponsored by the Private Voluntary Cooperative Office and the Women in Development Office for a total of US \$900,000. CODEL also contributed to the funding. The projects and the case study were implemented by five of CODEL's partner organizations located in the respected regions.

The specific objectives of the pilot projects were:

- to identify women's traditional wisdom about sustainable management of natural resources; and
- to integrate this knowledge with modern technologies for improved environmental and agricultural management.

The specific objective of the ethnological case study was:

- to understand the factors that lead to success in community development for women.

The project and case study components are:

- Iringa, Tanzania - case study: (Maryknoll Nuns)
  - To improve the social and economic situation of women through the formation of a new association and access to credit; and
  - To conduct an ethnological case study to document the role of women in a community development activities;
- Arusha, Tanzania: (TechnoServe)
  - To improve the production and consumption of nutritious indigenous vegetables;
- Kyotera, Uganda: (Bannakorali Brothers)
  - Fusion of traditional methods of banana plantation with modern technology;
- Kampala District, Uganda: (YWCA)
  - Promotion of charcoal briquettes and improved charcoal stoves;
- Nairobi, Kenya: (Kenya Institute for Organic Farming/KIOF)
  - Promotion and documentation of traditional organic agricultural practices and combine them with modern technology.

It is important to note that the projects were originally planned to begin in 1993. However implementation did not start till the end of 1994. The slow pace of implementation start-up was due to the varied disbursement methods for each agency, as well as the need for clarifying the initial project design. As a result, the period of operation was shortened to two years.

## Kenya

In Kenya, the Kenyan Institute for Organic Farming (KIOF) has been involved in organic farming for more than ten years. KIOF trained 38 women farmers in Muranga and Machakos Districts. The farmers involved have demonstrated commendable results in their increased agricultural outputs. Beneficiaries have learned skills in various organic farming techniques: soil conservation and cultivation, soil fertility maintenance, planting systems, seed selection, crop pest and disease control, crop harvesting and storage, animal husbandry, agroforestry and water harvesting. Though a few of the farmers had been practicing organic farming prior to their training, they have increased their knowledge through the use of additional skills. Moreover, the majority have been exposed to new skills in linking organic agriculture with indigenous knowledge.

## **Uganda**

In Uganda, the YWCA was instrumental in providing to more than 30 women skills training and awareness raising in the area of afforestation and use of the fuel efficient cook stoves and charcoal briquettes made from agro-wastes. The women in YWCA groups in the Nakawa and Makindye divisions in Kampala District, benefited directly from the training program by using the improved stoves for home consumption. They have also earned income from the sale of stoves and charcoal briquettes in their communities. The women interviewed have stated that the stoves have decreased their cooking time because they can cook more than 2 dishes at a time; and the stove benefits the conservation of energy and heat.

The Bannakaroli Brothers in Kyotera, Uganda have imparted skills training on banana plantation using traditional and modern methods. The plantation is part of an orphanage for children orphaned by AIDS. Bananas are the main staple in Uganda, and work experience on the plantation will provide the students with important farming skills necessary when they are older. The students also learn about the environmental impacts of farming and the benefits of using environmentally sound combinations of traditional and modern techniques. Furthermore, more than 45-50 female headed families who are guardians to orphans have also benefited from the program.

The Bannakaroli Brothers opened the orphanage in 1988, and established a school which now has more than 550 students with more than 60% female. In addition to the orphans, the school caters to others in the community such as the local women's group. It also offers a complete liberal arts education, and extracurricular activities, such as sports, drama and art.

## **Tanzania**

In the Hai District of Arusha/Northern Tanzania, TechnoServe is working with about 40 women farmers in two groups: Mwangaza women's group and the Kwankya women's group in Mungushi Village, Kilimanjaro Region of Northern Tanzania. These groups learned skills for the production and utilization of indigenous vegetables for seed production, sale, and home consumption. Because of the demand for seedlings, the Mwangaza group has established a new marketing outlet to the Alpha Seed Company. Future marketing plans for the Mwangaza group are to sell millet for brewing, and grow and sell maize.

In Iringa, Tanzania, for the ethnological case study, the MaryKnoll Sisters set up a two-year project with a dual purpose: a) to establish a formal women's association and provide a revolving credit fund to improve the social and economic situation of women in the region; and b) document the results and outcomes of the association and credit scheme looking at the 'relationship between women's economic position and community development.' As a result, the Women Trust and Development Association (WTDA), an umbrella association comprising of three women's group, was formed to plan, manage and implement the credit scheme. To date more than 200 women with varied ethnic, religious, age, marital and educational backgrounds have benefited from the program. The women were involved in a variety of home-based or small scale enterprise development activities.

## LESSONS LEARNED

Overall, the project has achieved its objectives in many respects. The evaluation team has observed awareness of and interest in environmental issues that have emerged among selected beneficiaries. The participants have also benefited through increased income and resulting increased status. The increase in income was a spin off of the projects that resulted from increases in produce as well as products such as the stoves.

It is important to note, that the evaluation was limited by the lack of an existing monitoring system for the pilot projects. Emerging lessons were not documented and there was very little pre-existing information on the projects. These reasons combined with time constraints resulted on a one-time observation. However, the team noted that the majority project participants are practicing their new skills. This appears to have caused significant changes in farming yields, soil conservation methods, eating habits, and welfare of the family.

Moreover, the pilot projects have shown that income generation component has a direct bearing in improving the health and education of children, and generate extra income for basic needs. It also enhances the status of women within their families and communities because of increase economic authority. More specifically, the skills and knowledge acquired through the projects have contributed to the following:

- increasing the awareness raising of women on self reliance;
- providing access to credit and basic knowledge on agriculture production;
- significant increase in earned income;
- developing leadership roles;
- group organization/mobilization;
- introduction to financial planning/management; and
- marketing.

Thus, the above skills had a direct bearing on improved child nutrition and basic needs, enhancement of the socio-economic welfare of women, as well as the status of women within their families and communities.

Equally important was the role of the implementing agencies who demonstrated that they have successfully executed the pilot projects. The NGOs were involved in the early stages of project identification and design and have provided appropriate technical assistance, assessed training needs, and ensured that the needs were met. Furthermore, they have maintained close relationship with the communities and the women smallholder. Some have indicated their commitment to contribute to the project beyond the completion in 1996, and a few have already integrated it within their on-going program activities.

While it is too early to measure the full impact of the pilot projects, they have succeeded in providing important economic and social services. This has occurred through mobilizing women to tap their existing skills and knowledge motivate them to improve their lives.

However, if the projects are to be expanded, changes are necessary. Clear objectives and criteria for evaluation need to be established in order to effectively build on the lessons learned. Criteria should be identified to measure project achievements, followed by an action plan. Performance indicators should be clearly defined during the design stage, and should be clearly related to the 'project's objectives' and should be a mix of input, process, and impact indicators.

It is also worth noting that to enable women to carry out productive work and take care of their families more efficiently, investments are required in literacy, health care, family planning and nutrition. In the future the links between women's welfare and their productivity, and economic development need to be clearly defined and initiated at the outset of the program.

It is important to note that for 25 years CODEL has proven its commitment to development work. This is especially true in areas of environment, natural resource management, agriculture with emphasis on strengthening the capacity of NGOs and grassroots women's organizations. However, in 1995 CODEL experienced major financial difficulties and had to lay-off key staff members who were instrumental in the design of the pilot projects. The same year it was forced to close-down the Headquarters office. The cooperative agreement was transferred to Lutheran World Relief (LWR). Unfortunately, the transition was rushed and during the transfer of management, files were missing, and/or were incomplete, and were not readily available for the evaluation team. The process of filing, information sharing, and documentation should have been carefully monitored.

Although CODEL had several supervision missions during the past 2 years, the level of monitoring was limited often with inadequate information about the project area, profile of beneficiaries, disbursement problems, budget vs. actual costs etc. CODEL's philosophy during its 25 years, was to leave the implementation of the primary monitoring of specific projects to the local implementing agency. Since agreement was made with USAID to continue the reporting system, LWR continued with the process and maintained the same reporting system. While in many cases it worked well, a systemic feed back mechanism should have been established to measure each project's impact and results should have been properly documented.

The challenge for CODEL was to ensure that the performance of the projects were continuously and correctly monitored, and prompt actions were taken to address emerging difficulties. Particularly for Lutheran World Relief the next practical approach would be that the lessons from each pilot project are quickly incorporated and documented highlighting the lessons learned and ensure the dissemination of the findings to the participating agencies, the beneficiaries, policy makers and donors. This will foster networking, broaden collaboration and expand the outreach. Furthermore, with the remaining funds LWR should seek to organize a follow up 'Consultation Meeting' with the participating agencies and others from the region to share the lessons learned, foster partnership, and discuss follow-up activities for Phase II in all three countries. This will inevitably be an on-going process.

## **SUSTAINABILITY**

The long term sustainability of all four projects and the case study depends on the following: more refresher training and provision of technical assistance, and more systemic follow-up visits. The degree in which this takes place varies according to the project. Furthermore, the linkages with other institutions providing similar training and support should be strengthened. This will allow the women to have continued access for future support.

The implementing agencies have proven their commitment to build on the lessons learned, and some have already integrated the projects within their on-going program activities. For example, TechnoServe plans to continue providing support through refresher courses (record keeping/management) beyond the completion date. The Bannakaroli Brothers have already integrated the 'banana plantation' into their overall education/income generation program. The YWCA is also committed to continue working with the women in improving the processing methods, upgrade the quality of the stoves, and establish a marketing outlet through an already existing delivery network. The success of the credit scheme from the case study has led to the formulation of an investment program for future revolving loan funds. According to the Maryknoll Sisters the project will continue to be self financing for the next two years. KIOF plans to continue monitoring the progress made by the women.

The challenge now is to back them up, especially those with best approaches and ensure that the lessons are incorporated into design.

# **AFRICAN WOMEN: COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND COMBINED TECHNOLOGIES**

*(FAO-0158-A-00-3050-00)*

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1 PROJECT OVERVIEW**

The African Women: Community Development and Combined Technologies project was designed to identify women's traditional wisdom about sustainable management and fuse the knowledge with modern technologies for improved environmental and agricultural management. The three year pilot project (1993-96) was financed under a cooperative agreement between USAID and the Coordination in Development (CODEL), an association of Christian organizations. The total amount is US \$900,000. As a result, five partner agencies in three East African countries, Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania were selected to implement the pilot projects. In addition to the pilot projects, the grant supported a case study with the aim to assessing and documenting the role of women in community development. The project is now in its final phase of implementation.

### **1.2 PURPOSE OF COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT**

The purpose of the Cooperative Agreement was to provide financial support for a) four combined technology community projects, and b) an ethnological case study focused on women in development in East Africa. A third component was originally scheduled with an ongoing CODEL project. This was to be a control group to test indicators and to compare the results and findings. However, for a variety reasons including timing and applicability, CODEL, in agreement with USAID, dropped the control group component.

### **1.3 PROJECT OBJECTIVES**

The overall objective of the project was to develop four combined technology community pilot projects in East Africa (Uganda, Kenya and Tanzania) and an ethnological case study project focused on women in small enterprise development. The ethnological case study was conducted in Iringa District, 300 miles outside of Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania.

The primary objective of the combined technology projects was:

- To identify women's traditional wisdom about sustainable natural resource management and fuse the knowledge with modern technologies for improved environmental and agricultural management.

The secondary objective was to provide low income and disadvantaged women with assistance through:

- Access to credit to achieve economic independence and to help them establish their own small-scale enterprises;
- Increasing and enhancing the management and leadership capabilities of women through basic skills that will enable them to organize, manage and lead groups; and
- Impart skills training in business/financial management, and marketing.

#### **1.4 PROJECT RATIONALE**

The pilot projects were initiated with the joint collaboration effort of USAID and CODEL. The projects were based on the rationale that addressing Africa's growing social, economic and developmental problems, women need education and training to better fulfill their roles as agriculturalists, household managers, and natural resource managers. There was a clear link, between women's ability to earn income and their status within the family and community. In communities with a strong tradition of female entrepreneurship and active female participation in the market production, women have a much larger say in how family resources were spent.

Therefore, the projects were designed to survey, document, and disseminate the critical roles women play; acknowledge and strengthen their contribution to sustainable development using combined traditional and modern/scientific technologies focused on organic agriculture and natural resource management.

The joint collaboration effort of USAID and CODEL met their respective objectives. For CODEL, the cooperative agreement fulfilled their efforts to increase capacity building of local NGOs particularly women's grassroots organizations; and provide support to small-scale farmers groups, and sustainable and environmentally sound development activities. USAID was successful in promoting it's policy of integrating women in all sectors of development, addressing their needs and interest, and empowerment through grassroots community participation.

#### **1.5 IDENTIFICATION AND SELECTION OF PILOT PROJECTS**

The three countries (Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania) were selected for various reasons: CODEL's past working relationship with the partner agencies; large concentration of CODEL-sponsored projects in this region of East Africa; and representation of more than twenty CODEL member organizations actively working in the selected countries.

Proposals were submitted by several NGOs with extensive field experience working with community organizations. However, five NGOs (the Maryknoll Sisters and TechnoServe in Tanzania; The YWCA and the Bannakaroli Brothers in Uganda, and The Kenya Institute of Organic Farming in Kenya) were selected based on their expertise in the area of environmental issues, field based experience, and prior working relationships with CODEL.

### **1.5.1 OVERVIEW OF THE PILOT PROJECTS**

CODEL selected the following five partner agencies to implement the pilot projects: in Tanzania, the project was implemented by two NGOs, the Maryknoll Sisters in Iringa District, and TechnoServe in Arusha. In Uganda two NGOs were responsible: the YWCA and the Bannakaroli Brothers, and in Kenya, the project was undertaken by the Kenya Institute of Organic Farming (KIOF).

#### **1. TechnoServe, Arusha, Tanzania**

Project: To improve the production and consumption of nutritious indigenous vegetables in the Hai District.

Total Cost: \$30,000

The pilot project was undertaken with the objective to create awareness on nutritional value of indigenous vegetables; and improve the production and consumption of indigenous vegetables. Skills training were organized by TechnoServe, and other government/and non-governmental organizations. Twenty-four small holders in two women's groups participated in the program.

#### **2. The YWCA, Kampala District, Uganda**

Project: Promotion of Charcoal Briquettes and Improved Charcoal Stoves

Total Cost: \$15,000

The objective is to provide skills training for women in a) making charcoal briquettes as an alternative source of energy; and b) improved charcoal stoves to fuse traditional methods with modern technology as a means of sensitizing and protecting the environment; reducing time in preparing meals for their families. A second objective is to improve the nutrition of women through the accessibility of easier/faster ways of food preparation. A third objective is to create awareness and introduce them to the market value to impart income generating activities through the briquettes and improved charcoal stoves. Two target groups with a total number of 30 women participated in the project.

#### **3. The Bannakaroli Brothers, Kyotera, Uganda**

Project: Fusion of traditional methods of banana plantation with modern technology

Total Cost: \$15,000

The banana plantation run by the Bannakaroli Brothers is part of a larger project to assist children orphaned by AIDS. The purpose of the grant is to teach the orphans organic farming techniques for growing bananas, produce high yields, and gain both knowledge and income to expand their activities in the school. Approximately 75 are directly participating in the plantation project. Of the 550 students, 350 are girls.

**4. The Kenya Institute of Organic Farming, Nairobi, Kenya**

Project: Documentation of traditional agricultural practices and combine them with modern technology to improve farming in two communities.

Total Cost: \$30,000

The goal was to determine the traditional agricultural practices and knowledge among smallholder farmers in high potential areas (rainfall above 1200 mm per annum, soil is productive); and low potential areas (rainfall is low and soils are sandy). Skills training in organic farming techniques were organized. The primary beneficiaries were 39 smallholder farmers in two groups.

**5. The Maryknoll Sisters, Iringa, Tanzania**

Project: Ethnological Case Study

Total Cost: \$66,000

The objective of the case study was to improve the social and economic situation of the women in Iringa region through formation of a new association and provide access to credit; and b) conduct an ethnological case study to document the role of women in a community development activities. The case study was conducted in Iringa, Tanzania, 300 miles outside of Dar-es-Salaam.

**1.5.2 BENEFICIARIES**

The target beneficiaries for the pilot projects and ethnological case study were low-income and disadvantaged women engaged in economic development activities through small scale enterprise or home-based business in agriculture and natural resource management.

**1.6 PROJECT APPRAISAL**

**1.6.1 PERIOD OF COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT**

The Cooperative Agreement was originally scheduled to start on August 31, 1993 with a completion date of August 30, 1996. However, project implementation did not begin till November 1994, almost fifteen months after the due date. This was caused partly by the delay in the release of funds, as well as the need for clarifying the initial project design.

## **1.6.2 BUDGET**

The total estimated amount of the Cooperative Agreement for the full period (August '93 - 96) between USAID and CODEL was \$900,000 of which \$850,000 was an FHA/PVC Matching Grant Program. The FHA/PVC funded \$200,000 and the remaining \$650,000 was provided by R&D/WID, and \$50,000 came from the recipient organization, CODEL. The projected annual budget was: \$400,000 for '93-'94; \$250,000 for '94-'95; and \$250,000 for '95-'96.

## **1.6.3 DISBURSEMENT**

Transfer of accounts to implementing agencies was transacted based on individual agency agreements. The agreements were as follows: The YWCA/Uganda and KIOF/Kenya received funds directly from CODEL; TechnoServe, Bannakaroli Brothers and the Maryknoll Sisters received funds through their respective offices in the United States. This dual disbursement policy reflects the differing financial management styles of the implementing partners.

The arrangement for the flow of funds from CODEL to its partner agencies was based on standard CODEL procedure. Prior to signing agreements CODEL requested partner agencies to indicate the process of financial disbursement. While some preferred direct disbursement, others had funds directed through their headquarters. Many experienced delays in their transfer of funds, thus hindering adequate planning and implementation of the activities.

This somewhat complex financial system made it difficult for the evaluation team to do a complete fiscal evaluation to accurately identify the costs of the various activities. This in no way implies financial mismanagement, but rather describes the problem in retrieving all the appropriate financial documents from the various sources.

## **1.6.4 TOTAL COST**

Total remaining balance by July 1, 1995 (after the transfer of management to LWR) was \$90,000. By September 1995, an additional obligated amount of US\$75,000 was released by USAID/WID. By March 1996, expenses accrued by LWR totaled \$38,077, (covering personnel and administrative cost), which leaves a remaining balance of \$126,923. (Annex A)

According to LWR, the funds have been used for monitoring and evaluation of the reports. With the remaining funds available, LWR plans to use it for follow-up activities based on the recommendations from the evaluation report.

The data used are the best estimates of project costs made available to the evaluation team during the preparation of the report. Despite the difficulty of identifying the costs involved for each project, the team has tried to arrive at an estimate of cost.

## 1.7 EXPECTED OUTCOME

The expected outcome of this grant was:

- Increase understanding and recognition of women's vital role in sustainable agriculture and natural resource management;
- Preserving traditional wisdom and supporting combined technologies that meet today's challenges to ensure food security and a healthy environment;
- Enhancement of women's ability to engage in the fusion of traditional wisdom and modern technologies;
- Increased access to indigenous knowledge
- Development of specific combined technologies by testing their strengths and weaknesses.
- Sensitization of new methods of addressing environmental issues by using natural resources.

Expected beneficiaries: Approximately 1,200 women

## 1.8 TIME LINE:

<i>Year I:</i>	<i>Year II:</i>	<i>Year III:</i>
1. Annual Work Plan	1. Annual Work Plan	1. Annual Work Plan
2. Annual Report	2. Final Evaluation	2. Final Report
3. Case study design	3. Brief Quarterly reports	3. Final Case Study

A detailed time line describing the expected outcome is listed in Annex C. Except for the Final Report which is expected to be completed soon, the above tasks have been fulfilled accordingly.

## II. NATURE OF EVALUATION AND OBJECTIVES

As stated in the terms of reference (see Annex D), the purpose of the evaluation was to assess the effectiveness of the three pilot projects and ethnological/case study in meeting the stated goals and objectives; identify the achievements and major constraints/gaps; and assess the overall impact of the pilot projects with emphasis on findings and lessons learned. The evaluation was conducted from March 4-21, 1996 (refer to Annex E for the schedule).

The evaluation team consisted of:

- Ms. Hamelmal G. Aklilu, PVC/Consultant, Team Leader
- Ms. Julia Nenen, WIDSR Contract/USAID/WID Office
- Ms. Christine Grumm, Consultant, Lutheran World Relief

Dr. Caroline Njuki, Project Consultant, Lutheran World Relief acted as resource person.

## 2.1 EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

In consultation with the Lutheran World Relief, and the Evaluation Team, PVC and the WID office prepared a schedule prior to the trip in order to organize the data collection, and methods for collecting the necessary information

Three main data sources were utilized:

- Desk review of the following documentation: project proposal, interim and quarterly reports, correspondence between USAID and CODEL, and financial records of the pilot projects.
- Meetings, discussions and interviews were held in each country with project stakeholders. The list of persons met is presented in Annex G. Unfortunately, it was not possible for the evaluation team to observe the training activities, since none were conducted during the team's stay in each country. Thus the evaluation of the trainers conducting training activities is based on reports and interviews. However, on few occasions the participants did a demonstration on lessons learned by fusion of traditional methods and modern technology.
- Since the ultimate beneficiaries of the project were women participating in income-generating activities, more emphasis was put on field visits so that we could meet the beneficiaries and visit their income generating activities. In Tanzania, the team visited three entrepreneurial women's groups, and seven individuals who received loans under the credit scheme (Iringa District) and two groups focusing on indigenous vegetables (Kilimanjaro Region). In Uganda three groups were visited: the banana plantation in Kyotera and two charcoal briquette projects in Nakawa and Makindye Divisions in Kampala District. In Kenya, the evaluation team visited two districts, the Muranga and Machakos Districts. Though the selection of the groups to be visited were arranged by the implementing agencies, individuals within the group were randomly selected by the evaluation team, and interviews were held with the project representatives in each country to ensure diverse representation (urban, rural, size of enterprises, age, marital status, # of children etc.) Through the group and individual interviews a comparison has been made between the present and prior economic status of the beneficiaries to determine changes brought after participating in the projects.

- Individual Case studies were also conducted to cover the qualitative aspect of the project as well as to assess the process of individual change affected through the project. The individuals were selected randomly at the site.
- In addition, the Team Leader and the USAID/WID Advisor held separate meetings with the Project Directors and/or financial officers to discuss the overall program activities and review the financial management.

### III. INSTITUTIONAL BACKGROUND

CODEL was an association of Catholic, Orthodox and Protestant organizations whose primary purpose was to assist people in the developing world who have limited opportunity to participate in social, economic, environmental and political decisions that affect their lives. The priority areas of CODEL's work were:

- providing direct support to small-scale, sustainable, and environmentally sound development activities identified by local communities that focus on agriculture, health care, community development, and skills training;
- promoting greater awareness of environmental issues related to sustainable development, through communications, training, publications, and seminars/workshops.

With its headquarters in New York, CODEL worked through its partner agencies in more than 30 countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America. Its primary function was institutional building and capacity building of community based organizations, particularly women's groups, churches and its members.

The project was financially managed at various points: CODEL being the overall manager, however CODEL folded in June 1995 and in July 1995 the Lutheran World Relief, headquarters office in New York took over the management and monitoring of the project till the completion, August 96. In the case of some of the implementing agencies it was managed by their parent organizations in the US; while others were directly managed on the ground.

However several administrative changes occurred in 1995; the Director of the Environment and Development Program who was instrumental in the design and implementation of the pilot projects was laid off; in April, the Director of CODEL resigned; in June CODEL folded and in July, the Lutheran World Relief (LWR) inherited the management responsibility. The LWR retained the services of one staff member, the Project Director to oversee the grant till the end, August 1996.

### **3.1 MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS & MONITORING/EVALUATION METHODOLOGIES**

The cooperative agreement between USAID and CODEL in the management, implementation and monitoring/evaluation was as follows:

- The five implementing agencies were required to provide CODEL: Six month progress and financial reports, audited statements of accounts, as well as mid-term and end-of-grant evaluations.
- CODEL to provide USAID: proposed year-plan, quarterly and year-end-reports on specific activities and progress toward and achievement of project goals and objectives.
- Under the leadership of the Executive Director, and the Executive committees, the Project Director, was responsible for the overall management and monitoring of the pilot projects and the ethnological case study. Site visits to the pilot projects were planned in coordination with partner agencies. The Project Director visited the project sites twice a year, while the environment and development staff from CODEL visited the projects once to assess the environmental impact of the projects.
- In order to make a smooth transition, after June 1995, LWR retained the services of the previous Project Director (Dr. Caroline Njuki) as a long term consultant to continue her role in supervising and monitoring the projects till the end of the project (August 1996).

### **3.2 PROJECT ACTIVITIES**

The pilot projects were envisaged to be implemented in three stages. It began with organizing a "Consultation Meeting" in Nairobi with key leaders on environment and natural resources management to discuss traditional wisdom and modern technology in natural resource management. This was followed by identifying pilot projects and the selection of implementing agencies. The last phase was for CODEL to present findings of the ethnological/case studies at the UN Conference on Women in Development in Beijing, China.

#### **3.2.1. NAIROBI CONFERENCE**

In March 1994 as part of the planning for the implementation process, CODEL organized a five day Consultation in Kiboswa/Kitsumu, Kenya with a theme "Traditional Wisdom and Modern Technology in Natural Resources Management." More than forty development practitioners, representing tribal groups, Christian development organizations, the government, advocacy groups and academic institutions from East Africa and a representative from Asia participated.

The purpose of the Consultation was to promote and create awareness on utilization of traditional systems of natural resource management in conjunction with appropriate scientific technologies to encourage sustainable ecological and social development with special emphasis on women.

The Consultation was an entry point to brainstorm and discuss with practitioners, academicians and international and local NGOs to appraise the role of traditional wisdom for development.

CODEL pre-selected those partner organizations with whom it had long standing relationships and expertise on environment and natural resource management to act as implementing agencies for the pilot projects. The implementing agencies had a chance to work with other practitioners in the field of sustainable agriculture development and fine-tune their proposals for the projects.

### **3.2.2 BEIJING CONFERENCE**

An important aspect of the project was to conduct an ethnological case study to assess and document the role of women in development with the aim of determining the relationship between women's economic position and community development. In agreement with USAID, CODEL made a presentation to a larger audience on the results and findings of the study at the UN Women's Conference in Beijing. Since the Beijing Conference was half-way through the implementation process, the findings were based only on the mid-term results.

According to the Project Director, the workshop attracted more than 50 participants and due to the high interest, an informal discussion session was held for a larger audience. As a result, several requests were made to receive copies of the final report of the findings.

## **IV. ETHNOLOGICAL CASE STUDIES ON THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES - REVOLVING LOAN FUND/IRINGA**

Iringa is approximately 300 miles outside of Dar in the Southern Highlands of Tanzania, and access is primarily by road. The 1994 estimated population of Iringa is 100,621 with a little over 50% comprising of female. Iringa is noted as a difficult place to do business as compared to Mbeya or Arusha, because of its lack turnover of money. As stated in the research document, (refer to attached) this is due in part to the general poverty of the area along with the wahehe tradition of not parting with their money to readily.

### **4.1 PROFILE OF THREE ORGANIZING GROUPS OF THE WOMEN'S TRUST AND DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION (WTDA)**

The Women's Trust and Development Association's (WTDA) has reflected its efforts to establish and organize self reliant groups of women who are able to articulate their needs, priorities and skills. WTDA is an association of three sub-groups comprising of 30 women who are already

involved in small scale enterprise development activities and provide access loan access and skills training to low income women in Iringa. The project addresses women as an entry point in the community for the benefit and welfare of their families by enhancing their status through participation in income generating activities. Access to credit and knowledge have allowed women to create a resource of assets, gained confidence on their ability to earn an income and manage them successfully.

The following description is specific to the three organizing groups of the Women's Trust and Development Association (WTDA).

#### **4.1.1 VIP IMANI GROUP**

The VIP group was started in 1989 with a purpose to provide training and employment to young women in Iringa. They are involved in the following small scale activities: a tea shop, kiosk, jams and peanut butter; growing vegetable seedlings for selling; and embroidery and sewing (school bags). The twelve members of this group have the following characteristics. The age range is from 17-32 with the median age of 24.5. All have completed Standard VII (primary education) and are from a mixture of tribes and religion with the majority (58%) being Roman Catholics, (25%) Lutherans and Anglicans, and (17%) Islam. Most are from the Wahehe tribe (67%). The majority (9) are from Iringa while 3 moved from neighboring villages. Only one is married but, there are five single mothers in the group. All of these women live in extended family household with the majority in housing without running water and electricity. They all come from a poor economic background, but have been able, through their participation in this group, to vastly improve their incomes over the past five years. All of the women had at least three other dependents that they support. Since joining the group they all had the potential of making more than the minimum wage.

#### **4.1.2 MATUMAINI CO-OP**

There are 15 members in this group. They are all single teen mothers who have been together for the past four years. Currently the median age of the group is 22, with a mixture from seven different local ethnic groups. The majority (93%) are Lutheran and Roman Catholic with the remaining 7% Islam. The group is evenly divided with seven born and raised in Iringa and nine moving from outside villages. Seven of the participants have completed Standard VII (Primary) while the remaining nine vary in their completion from Form II and IV. Four live with their parents, 7 with other relatives and 4 live on their own. The majority live in housing without running water and electricity and all have more than two other people depending on their income.

The majority comes from very poor economic backgrounds, but all by virtue of their status as single teen mothers have the potential, if forced to be on their own without membership in the Co-op, of being at the bottom of the income ladder. Since joining the Co-op all members are making more than minimum wage (14-20% more), but it is still necessary to supplement their income by having access to some small field to grow their maize. This access is dependent on ownership of land by relatives.

### **4.1.3 WOMEN FOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

This is a small group made up of three women. The median age is 43. All of them have a high level of education, are married and would be considered middle income. Each has a full time job, two as teachers and one as a fiscal manager. They are all Roman Catholics. They have all lived in Iringa for more than 10 years, but only one was born and raised in there. They come from three different tribes and are all married to men of different ethnic group than their own. Between the 3 of them they have a total of 17 children, and own homes with electricity, and 2 out of 3 have running water.

### **4.2 PROFILE OF WOMEN RECEIVING WTDA LOANS**

Thirty five ethnic groups are represented in the 163 women who received loans, with 31% or the largest representation from the Wahehe tribe. The majority (85%) come from Christian households with Roman Catholic and Lutheran being the largest denominations in that group, with a remaining 15% are Islam. The age profile shows the median age of 35.7 with nearly three-fourths of the women in their thirties and younger. Homemaking (26%), farming, (22%) and teaching (21%) were the three most frequent occupations (111 women or 69%) of this group. Other occupations listed were sewing, petty business, army and office worker. Almost 40% (65) of the total group are single headed households (widowed, single mothers or separated). Except for a very small number of single women the remaining loan recipients are married. Of those who are married and living with their husbands, many reported the husbands have another wife or companion. Several others reported having to support children from extra-marital affairs of the husband, and all loan recipients support children with their incomes.

The economic status of this group ranges from very low income to low middle class. However, with the large number of single heads of household supporting children, the economic status of this group could radically change downward with the loss of job or health by the primary provider. Therefore, in the long term, income level is difficult to define due to this lack of stability.

### **4.3 LOAN SCHEDULE FOR THE WTDA**

The granted operational loan fund for WTDA was \$25,000, however US\$1,000 was initially deducted for investment purposes to be utilized at the end of the project depending on the rate of repayment. In addition as of 6/95 the fund had lost US \$289.87 on devaluation of the shilling. As of the date of the evaluation (3/96) a total cumulative amount of US\$26,064.69 loans had been disbursed with an additional US \$1,886.79 scheduled to be made available for the 6/96 round of loans. As of 6/95 there was approximately US\$ 8,000 in the loan fund as a result of the repayment of the loans, and were told verbally by the researcher that this fund had greatly increased from 7/95 to 1/96 as the result of the increased loan repayment. The overall rate of repayment at the time of this report was over 80% with 159 out of 163 recipients either having

paid back their loans or are in the payment process. Based on the repayment schedule (as of 3/96) and with no new capital investment, the WTDA estimates that it will be able to continue making loans for approximately two more years. The loan schedule to date is as follows:

	<u># of loan recipients</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Average</u>
	104	11/94	US\$ 12,698.04	US\$ 122.00
	15	2/95	US\$ 2,390.18	US\$ 160.00
	<u>44</u>	5/95	<u>US\$ 7,250.98</u>	US\$ 165.00
<i>Total</i>	<i>163</i>		<i>US\$ 22,339.20</i>	

In November 1995, 22 loans were granted to those who had successfully repaid the first loan for the total amount of US\$ 3,725.49, with an average loan of US\$ 169.00. (The rate of exchange used for this document is Shilling 510 to US \$1.00).

#### **CASE STUDY I: IRINGA, TANZANIA LOAN PROGRAM**

Johari Mwanuke, a 35 year-old woman, who runs a small eatery near the bus station in Iringa. She is a mother of four two boys and two girls (between the ages of 16 and 2 1/2), and is married. However, since her husband took a second wife and moved back to the village, Johari has been the main supporter of her family. Her husband visits the family once a month but not provide any financial support. Prior to the introduction of the loan program, Johari used to borrow supplies from food suppliers in the market, and negotiate to repay after she sold enough meals. The income was barely enough to support the family.

After hearing about the loan through family members, in 1995 Johari applied and received a loan for approximately \$130. The loan gave Johari the opportunity to pay for the supplies up front as well as expand her business. Business improved enough that Johari was able to hire two workers to assist her. Since she has already repaid her loan, she plans to apply for a second loan and hope to start a second shift to cater to the morning bus traffic.

Her improved economic status has enabled her and her family to improve their standard of living and enhanced self-confidence and independence. Although Johari has been supporting her four children for the past twelve years, she complained about the difficulty in managing the family and business. With the expansion of her business, she can now afford essential household expenses such as school fees for the children, and medical expenses. Johari has also stated that due to the increase of her income, more responsibility in decision making, she is less dependent on other male family members to cover expenses when she could not meet them.

- **Linkages Between Projects:** Because of the oversight of the MaryKnoll Sisters, several linkages were formed between loan participants and the groups. Because of their involvement in other community projects, the Sisters were able to make connections between the different actors. For examples, peanuts grown by loan participants in Lyadebwe Village (a three hour drive from Iringa town) were sold to members of the VIP group for their peanut butter processing.
- **Mentoring:** There are also linkages between the WTDA members in the form of mentoring and support. The more senior (by age and professional/business experience) of the 'executive committee members' are looked upon as mentors and their management and leadership skills are highly appreciated and trusted.
- **Independence and Self-Esteem:** The women interviewed both in the groups and those who received loans stressed the correlation between increase in income, self-esteem, empowerment, and independence. Each women interviewed talked about the importance of having independence, and being able to provide for household goods such as school fees, clothes, and food. Having their own income meant having the power to make their own decisions. The beneficiaries also mentioned the importance of educating their daughters and how their increased incomes would better ensure that their daughters would enroll in school.
- **Skills Training:** The MaryKnoll Sisters and WTDA provide skills training, both formally and informally. This includes group sessions for the women to discuss their problems and provide support and team solidarity. Seminars were also held on financial management and leadership skills through formal and informal mentoring.
- **Incentives:** The Maryknoll Sisters provided a one time grant to the three founders of WTDA as part of an incentive to provide them with assistance to improve their income generating activities, and as a measure to avoid competition. While the Matumaini Co-op used the grant (US\$4,851) to purchase supplies for doll making, the VIP group (US\$3,330) purchased a freezer, electric stove and jars for their jam processing, and the WDC (US\$ 4,035) purchased an incubator to hatch chicks, and a freezer.

25

- Although WTDA advertised for loan applicants and has a strict procedure for receiving and processing loans, many applicants either had some connection to the groups or the group had methods of investigating the credit worthiness of the applicant. These means were informal in nature and are usually based on the applicants credibility within the community and information about their household activities. The community in which the loans were granted is small and therefore was manageable for WTDA. As a result, WTDA had stronger assurances of the credit worthiness of the candidates.
- From the beginning WTDA had established a strict structure for loan repayment, thus the formal nature gave authority to the cooperative. There was a delicate balance between a simplified loan process and the safeguarding of funds. However, the fact that the MaryKnoll Sisters (executing agency) were well respected in the community, and the informal channels mentioned above have definitely contributed to the high rate of repayments on the loans. Another factor is the door to door visits made by WTDA members as a reminder to the defaulters, and subsequently invited participants to come in the office and discuss problems encountered that might affect their repayment. The end result is that although they were individual loans, WTDA represented group pressure which ensured higher repayment.
- **Low Costs:** Because WTDA is made up of volunteers (the exception being the one paid staff), administrative costs are low. This allows for more funding to go towards loans instead of administrative costs for running the program.
- **Loans Geared Towards Needs of Applicants:** Loans were given to women based on their interest and capabilities. As a result, the type of activity varied greatly. Support to valuable advice and counseling were provided to the participants in the loan application process and on their business ventures, and WTDA members were available throughout the process.
- **Quick Loan Repayment:** The majority of the loan applicants repaid their loans very quickly. The procedure allowed for flexibility in repayment which meant that women could pay according to when they had the finances as long as it was within the one year time period. However, the fact that the women repaid quickly is indicative of the market. Women's ability to participate in markets is a question of access. For the women in the project, very little (a \$200 loan) was needed to gain that access. The success of loan repayment was due to many factors, an important one being the direct contact (house to house visits) between loanees and the Executive Committee of the WTDA as well as the respect given to women throughout the entire process.

#### 4.4 EVALUATION FINDINGS

One of the major findings that the case study proved was that the project was successful because it fused many of the traditions which define the African women's community such as: women working in groups; (susu) traditional methods of revolving funds among the groups; women using each other for support system; women learning and mentoring from each other etc.. and combining it with modern financial concept of credit scheme. This fusion allowed women to maintain the positive part of their traditional identity while increasing their socio-economic status as women.

This project was built on the understanding that income generating activities have been an integral part of the basic survival of women in East Africa. For many of the women participants who were already involved in economic activities this project provided them with an opportunity to increase their income. At the same time, participants new to economic development activities used this project to embark on new ventures. This was also the first opportunity for the target beneficiaries to get access to credit, and gain knowledge for skills.

The major change brought about by the credit scheme was the enhancement of the social and economic status of women. It is evident from the data provided that a majority of the women who have invested their loans in income generation activities are diverse group by age, educational background, ethnicity, religion and marital status. Overall, the ethnological (research data) demonstrates that the loan program has introduced some significant changes in the lives of disadvantaged rural women. More specifically:

- incomes were increased and in a number of cases women were able to live independently
- increase in the status of loan participants in the community
- performance of repayment rate shows that 80% of the loans to date have been repaid and profits gained, in spite of the poor business climate of the area.
- as incomes grew, women experienced problems related to increased expectations from relatives, jealousy from others in family or community as well as sexual harassment resulting from living alone.
- one of the economic drains for the women in this community was the practice of men taking on additional wives/partners, thereby either increasing household budgetary needs or leaving women as sole support of the family.
- while the poverty cycle continues in many Iringa households, this loan program has provided "breathing space" and for many of its recipients that has allowed for a very different vision of the future.
- The credit program has provided a breakthrough in that husbands are willing to assist in the business, and noticing the difference in these women, it has created social recognition and others in the community are beginning to show interest to get credit.
- The project has also created interest in, and demand for, more training in business, financial management and marketing.

As an indicator of how the project impacted the socio-economic status of women, a sample in-depth survey of twenty women from WTDA gave the following results:

- 100% reported that their income was more than it had been two year ago. (The range of increase was from 25% to 300%. It is important to note that the lower percentage of increases were made by those of higher wages, while the high end of the increases were made by those at the lower end of the wages);
- 100% have a better diet and health (60% have the ability to go to a private clinic or hospital. 80% now eat meat once a week, which contrasts 40% a year ago.);
- 50% of the group are involved in some other small income generating project;
- 100% of those surveyed agreed that there has been an improvement in their self-image and self-esteem, which is in marked contrast to when the study began where many defined themselves as failures and unable to cope;

Furthermore long term goals were defined in the following manner:

- 40% expressed a desire to acquire a plot of land and/or build a house;
- 35% wanted to start another project at home;
- 20% wanted to educate their children; and
- 5% wanted to put money in the bank for savings.

#### 4.5 LESSONS LEARNED

- **Diversity:** The Women's Trust and Development (WTDA) is an association of three sub-groups comprising of 30 women who are already involved in income generating activities and provide access to and knowledge on credit to poor women to impart in small business ventures. The way that WTDA was formed has had a variety of impacts on the group.
  - Because the founding members of WTDA were already established, they were not faced with many of the constraints in mobilizing and establishing new groups. Thus, they began on solid grounds and structure which allowed a smooth start-up.
  - The three groups formed under different auspices and have different makeups. Therefore, WTDA is a diverse group with a mixture of age, economic background, marital status, ethnic and education background. As a result, women of different backgrounds are working together. There is greater diversity in input and for the younger women involved, there are opportunities for greater leadership training and mentoring.
- **Effective Management Style:** WTDA made use of the informal networking schemes combined with close supervision and commitment which created a successful management style for the size of the project. This is most apparent in the way that loans are granted and collected.

that the MaryKnoll Sisters (executing agency) were well respected in the community, and the informal channels mentioned above have definitely contributed to the high rate of repayments on the loans. Another factor is the door to door visits made by WTDA members as a reminder to the defaulters, and subsequently invited participants to come in the office and discuss problems encountered that might affect their repayment. The end result is that although they were individual loans, WTDA represented group pressure which ensured higher repayment.

- **Low Costs:** Because WTDA is made up of volunteers (the exception being the one paid staff), administrative costs are low. This allows for more funding to go towards loans instead of administrative costs for running the program.
- **Loans Geared Towards Needs of Applicants:** Loans were given to women based on their interest and capabilities. As a result, the type of activity varied greatly. Support to valuable advice and counseling were provided to the participants in the loan application process and on their business ventures, and WTDA members were available throughout the process.
- **Quick Loan Repayment:** The majority of the loan applicants repaid their loans very quickly. The procedure allowed for flexibility in repayment which meant that women could pay according to when they had the finances as long as it was within the one year time period. However, the fact that the women repaid quickly is indicative of the market. Women's ability to participate in markets is a question of access. For the women in the project, very little (a \$200 loan) was needed to gain that access. The success of loan repayment was due to many factors, an important one being the direct contact (house to house visits) between loanees and the Executive Committee of the WTDA as well as the respect given to women throughout the entire process.

- **Linkages Between Projects:** Because of the oversight of the MaryKnoll Sisters, several linkages were formed between loan participants and the groups. Because of their involvement in other community projects, the Sisters were able to make connections between the different actors. For examples, peanuts grown by loan participants in Lyadebwe Village (a three hour drive from Iringa town) were sold to members of the VIP group for their peanut butter processing.
- **Mentoring:** There are also linkages between the WTDA members in the form of mentoring and support. The more senior (by age and professional/business experience) of the 'executive committee members' are looked upon as mentors and their management and leadership skills are highly appreciated and trusted.
- **Independence and Self-Esteem:** The women interviewed both in the groups and those who received loans stressed the correlation between increase in income, self-esteem, empowerment, and independence. Each women interviewed talked about the importance of having independence, and being able to provide for household goods such as school fees, clothes, and food. Having their own income meant having the power to make their own decisions. The beneficiaries also mentioned the importance of educating their daughters and how their increased incomes would better ensure that their daughters would enroll in school.
- **Skills Training:** The MaryKnoll Sisters and WTDA provide skills training, both formally and informally. This includes group sessions for the women to discuss their problems and provide support and team solidarity. Seminars were also held on financial management and leadership skills through formal and informal mentoring.
- **Incentives:** The Maryknoll Sisters provided a one time grant to the three founders of WTDA as part of an incentive to provide them with assistance to improve their income generating activities, and as a measure to avoid competition. While the Matumaini Co-op used the grant (US\$4,851) to purchase supplies for doll making, the VIP group (US\$3,330) purchased a freezer, electric stove and jars for their jam processing, and the WDC (US\$ 4,035) purchased an incubator to hatch chicks, and a freezer.

## CASE STUDY II; IRINGA LOAN PROGRAM

Lucy Mhando, a dynamic 35 years old woman, lives in Iringa with her two children, ages 14 and 10, and is a widow. An avid worker with lots of talent and creativity in handicraft, sewing, and tailoring. She was encouraged by friends and family members to explore her talents. During the day, Lucy teaches in a primary school, and at night she tailors from home.

In 1995 she applied and received a loan for \$115.00 and purchased a sewing machine and expanded her business. Since the salary of primary school teachers are low, with the two incomes earned Lucy has managed to double her income and pay for rent, school fees and other household necessities. She plans to apply for a second loan soon.

## 4.6 CONSTRAINTS

- **Size of Organizational Structure:** Organizational structure with only one full time office manager is sufficient for the current size. However, if need to expand further, the management will not have the capacity to expand its outreach without increasing its human resource, especially in recruiting experts in financial management or informal credit schemes.
- **Size of Credit Program:** The familiarity with the community and the nature of the loan program i.e. being pilot project has allowed it to be manageable and risk free. Managing a credit program in a larger scale would require expertise in financial management, and knowledge about 'informal credit programs.' Several issues need to be addressed and analyzed: Volatility of Tanzanian market/banking system; leadership capacity and capability of WTDA; marketing outlets; savings; and identification and strengthening the non-income aspects of poverty such as literacy,

sanitation, nutrition, and family planning etc. At present there is a high degree of emphasis on income generation at possible expense of other sectors such as health, formal leadership training, marketing, etc.

- **Monitoring:** Follow-up methods (house to house home visits) on defaulters could create unnecessary workloads and demands on the Executive Committee, unless they develop a system of responsibility and group collateral.

## 4.7 SUSTAINABILITY

The Maryknoll Sisters have already made a positive impact by investing \$14,420 to be used as operational cost. The base for the revolving fund will depend upon the success of the repayment process. The plan is that the resources generated from the investment will sustain the credit scheme for at least the next two years, however, the Maryknoll Sisters and WTDA plan to solicit funds for future expansion. The low cost of rent and salary for a secretary at WTDA has allowed the program to operate at a low cost. In as much as the credit scheme has provided a viable approach to provide access to credit and knowledge to low/disadvantaged women in the rural

areas, it would be worthwhile to assess the overall impact of the credit scheme after the completion of the project and full transfer of autonomy and leadership to WTDA. The program has demonstrated an approach to sustainable development in reaching communities in the most remote areas. However, due to its limited coverage and because WTDA is an emerging and young approach, there are some fundamental issues that need to be considered and recognized.

- Can WTDA in its present administrative position, undertake an expansion of the project, or should it continue to strengthen its on-going program and recognize its potential, and nurture the approach prior to adapting it further?
- What would happen to the future viability of WTDA in the event of change of leadership? Can it maintain its effectiveness and quality without the cadre of committed and motivated executive committee members? Does WTDA plan to maintain the skeleton staff or plan to hire qualified personnel to manage and supervise the credit program?
- Can WTDA maintain its existing quality and effectiveness if the credit scheme is replicated in other parts of the country?

#### 4.8 RECOMMENDATION

- **Dissemination of Lessons Learned:** The ethnological case study report on the “role of women in community development through a small scale enterprise development” should be disseminated to NGOs with credit programs, groups working with unwed teen mothers, as well as donors and policy makers. The experience is by far the most innovative approach in rural credit programs for disadvantaged women with the low-cost high impact credit scheme and a relatively low risk mechanism.
- **Increase Planning:** To effectively and successfully provide credit to poor/disadvantaged women, careful planning with a precise credit delivery and recovery mechanism is required. This would involve assessing the best practices, establishing basic conditions such group organization including regular attendance, regular savings, and establishing of a group bank account.
- **Increase Savings:** Credit schemes must have an element of group and individual savings as it serves the dual purpose of an insurance to the credit program for non-performing loans and a resource to cushion unforeseen incidental expenses for women.
- **Formation of Loan Groups:** Group solidarity, mutual trust, peer pressure, self discipline would provide excellent substitute for tangible collateral. Membership in a group gives a feeling of protection, and could also create peer pressure to keep the members in line with the broad objectives of the credit program. Groups should be small in order to improve manageability.

- **Increase in Skills Training:** If program needs to be expanded, a much greater effort should be placed in skills training on financial management, planning, leadership, marketing, and quality control. WTDA should provide refresher courses to further develop the competence in business management.

## V. ARUSHA INDIGENOUS VEGETABLE PROJECT

In 1995 TechnoServe in collaboration with Network Vegetable Production Africa/Arusha, conducted a household survey (62) the two women's group (Kwankya and Mwangaza) and a control group to collect data on intake of indigenous vegetables, preparation and cooking methods, different types of vegetables, etc. The purpose of the study was to look at dietary needs and indigenous vegetables. Vegetables found in the region have a higher nutritional content than the exotics that are grown as produce. However, despite the higher nutritional content, villagers in the region did not grow the vegetables only collected what grew in the wild.

As a result of the study, a pilot project on growing indigenous vegetables was proposed by TechnoServe. The pilot project consisted of two women's groups - the Kwankya and Mwangaza women's group, (Kwankya 16 members/Mwangaza 8 members) with a total membership of 24 (original plan was targeted for 37. Drop of membership is due to strict rules in work schedule and attendance.) The project focus was on three major areas: seed packaging, alternative markets for indigenous vegetable seed, and promotion of organic farming. The groups planted amaranthus, black nightshade, okra and cowpeas.

### 5.1 EVALUATION FINDINGS

The Kwankya group started in 1970 under the women's union of Tanzania, a political wing of the ruling party. As a result, the group is much more established and sustainable. Initially, they ran a local brewery and Kiosk as income generating activities. Due to political uprising they were dismantled in 1980. By mid-80's they regrouped, raised money and built a house to started sunflower oil processing mill. The mill started operation 1995 and the same month it earned 27,480 (US\$52.00). The group generates income from selling sunflower seed processing and sales of sunflower seed cake as well as new activities under the indigenous vegetable project. The group focuses on seed production and some home consumption. (60% of the Kwankya women have started home-based indigenous vegetable gardening.)

The Mwangaza group was formed in 1993, and since 1994 have participated in 10 bookkeeping training sessions. They are trained to produce vegetable for market and home consumption. (90% of the women have started home-based indigenous vegetable gardening.)

- Membership fee for both groups is 1,000 shillings per year (US\$ 2.00). Initiation fee for Mwangaza 6,000 shillings (U.S\$11.00 and 10,000 shillings (US. 19.00) for Kwankya group.
- Kwankya group has participated in 10 management sessions held during the group's monthly meetings

- The Kwankya group has allocated three-quarters acre plot from the Mungushi village government.
- While the Mwangaza group work 2 days a week for a total of three hours, the Kwankya group work 1 day a week (3 hours). During harvest time the hours are longer.
- Both groups learned different farming techniques: spacing, weeding, transplanting, fertilizing, pest control, mulching etc. Skills learned have allowed them to use organic manure and natural insecticides at their indigenous vegetable plot.
- TechnoServe assisted in developing a market outlet through a major seed company, the Alpha Seed Company.
- Created employment opportunity: i.e. hired watch person to work and live in the field
- Introduction of new initiatives in the area of agriculture sustainability and vegetable gardening.
- Assisted the women in becoming self reliant in promoting opportunities for income generation and creating a sense of participation within the community.

## 5.2 LESSONS LEARNED

- **Formation of the group:** The formation of the women's groups, drafting of the constitution and organizing work schedule to work by shift at the vegetable plot (twice a week for the Mwangaza group, and once a week the Kwankya group). Executive committee in each group meet monthly. The Kwankya group have also established a three member committee to ensure efficient production and marketing. The sense of community in a group, and participation has had a positive impact in the lives of the women. Emphasis has been placed on on-farm activity through group dynamism and economic empowerment of women.
- **Improved Farming Techniques/Replication of Techniques:** New initiatives in the areas of agriculture sustainability through cultivation, harvesting and processing of indigenous vegetables were introduced. Group members received extensive training on organic farming techniques, and thus have improved production and consumption of indigenous vegetables.. These new methods are cheaper since chemical fertilizers and pesticides are not needed and produce higher yields. Once other community members saw the increased yields, they started replicating the organic farming techniques. As a result, the village as a whole is moving towards more environmentally sustainable farming techniques. Effective group pressure has also contributed to the individual responsibility to increase production.
- **Self Empowerment:** Participation in the group has enhanced the social and economic status of the women (beneficiaries), and have gained respect in the family, and are highly regarded in the community. Thus the women have been self-reliant by gaining opportunities for income generation activities, and creating a sense of participation among the community. Creating of home-based indigenous vegetable gardening both for consumption and income has had a dual effect, increase in income and better diet and health. The lessons learned have also been shared with others in the community.

- **Skills Training:** The skills training that both groups received were effective and improved their planning, management, finance, record keeping and marketing/pricing skills. Furthermore, it has enhanced their leadership skills and improved their working relationships. The management training is highly participatory where members were involved in the design and drafting of the constitution, discussing management matters, and financial progress. The training materials are prepared in Kiswahili language, and the trainees have who have participated in bookkeeping classes have begun to write receipts and payment vouchers and transfer into a cash book.

Furthermore field visits were organized for the women where they stayed with other farmers for a week and got exposure to different farming techniques.

TechnoServe also held sessions on consciousness raising for husband and male family members. TechnoServe worked with the males in the community to overcome biases against women earning income.

- **Increased Nutritional Value:** Creating awareness and providing skills in the nutritional value and use of indigenous vegetables, vegetable seed production and processing techniques. The indigenous vegetables have higher nutritional values than "exotic" types that are currently popular. Both groups strongly expressed the need to improve the diets of their families and thus have increased their production and consumption of indigenous vegetables. The indigenous vegetables are also believed to have medicinal value.

TechnoServe also looked at food preparation as part of increasing the nutritional value for the groups. Preservation and storage were also encouraged. Talk about cooking look at report. Report should that knowledge does not always result in changes in eating habits.

- **Increase in Income:** Although the marketing aspect of the project is new, both groups discussed the importance of the increase in income. A major breakthrough is the marketing opportunity to a major seed company. Because of the availability of the vegetables neighbors have begun purchasing it from the two groups rather than going to the market. The two groups have collectively increased the supply of vegetables to consumers.

Additional income means more money for school fees, more say in sending their daughters to school, more meat at meals, and more money for other household activities.

The increase in income also meant employment opportunities. The Kwankga women's group were able to hire a night watch person (who was homeless) and someone to help with the plots. The woman is provided one room with her family.

- **Independence and Self-Esteem:** The increase in income also means more independence as the women have more decision making powers and are less dependent on male family members. This is especially pertinent because local custom states that women should not make more money than men. Other factors that have contributed to the feeling of independence was the struggle to get land from the government. The women had to use negotiating skills and persistence which paid off. Furthermore, opportunities have increased through skills training and because the women have direct contact with seed marketers, a new market for them. They now know about additional opportunities and how to set up such opportunities. Lastly, because of the success of the groups, the women are gaining more respect in the community.
- **Women in Water Committee:** Traditionally, women were not allowed to sit in water committees and had to relay their complaints through male spokesman who can then speak on their behalf. However the group has managed to sit in the counsel meetings has given them the opportunity to voice their opinions.
- **Communication/Networking/Information Sharing:** Frequent field visits to the project site indicates excellent rapport and communication between the women's groups and TechnoServe. Interaction and networking among the two groups confirms a high degree of solidarity and team spirit. The creation of informal channels between various cooperating agencies, i.e. government, academic institutions, research organizations etc. underscores the effective networking mechanisms.

TechnoServe has also maintained linkages with other NGOs with similar programs, especially NGOs who are presently participating in the pilot projects in Kenya and Uganda, i.e. KIOF and YWCA, and other participants who attended the 'Consultation Meeting' in Kisumu, Kenya.

- **Formation of group savings.** Individual commitment has been a primary factor in the success of the group. The group members deposit their savings into a joint account where 80% of the profits, and all the dues are invested in the savings account. Women receive dividends from the investment.

### 5.3 CONSTRAINTS

- **Initially high drop out rate:** The number of members dropped due to other household responsibilities (Mwangaza from 14 - presently 8) (Kwankya from 28 - presently 16).
- **Water shortage:** Water shortage is a much greater problem in Mungushi District, and has caused crop failure, and has also affected production, and as a result decreased income.

- **Labor intensive:** The women found that some of the tasks are labor intensive and the physical exhausting task comes at the time of a very long and exhausting workday. The women work longer hours in the field in addition to their time on household tasks and the home-based income generating activities.
- **Distance:** Though many members live within close vicinity of their farm, some live further away, and as a result walk long distance. (more than 3 km.)
- **Slow start:** Initially there was a slow start due to lack of cohesiveness especially for the Mwangaza Women's group. Attendance in group meetings was also poor in the beginning due to family responsibilities and other internal problems.
- **Lack of information:** Lack of concrete data on medicinal values of indigenous vegetables. Current beliefs seem to be based on traditional values and beliefs
- **Educational levels:** The educational levels of the participants, especially in systems concepts related to record keeping is still a challenge for those attending bookkeeping training. It is a slow process and needs careful planning and assistance from TechnoServe staff.

#### 5.4 SUSTAINABILITY

The project is scheduled to end in August 1996. However, TechnoServe is committed to continue working with the two groups until they are able to sustain themselves. The Mwangaza group seems more established and is anticipated that they will be able to operate on their own by the end of 1996. However, TechnoServe plans to continue supporting the Kwankya group for at least a year after the day of completion (1996).

The projects do fit well within the ongoing project activities at TechnoServe, and as such would be easier to integrate it within their on-going program activities. Through TechnoServe, both groups have established good linkages and rapport at the local level and have drawn on existing facilities, services and resources, and would continue to benefit from the numerous resources.

Emphasis should also be put to strengthen the 'market outlet' and be able to maintain the present demand by supporting the farmers smallholder in increasing volume of production. Similarly with increase in income, the women will gain independence and greater control over their income.

## 5.5 RECOMMENDATION

- **Training:** In order to create greater effectiveness and impact of the program, TechnoServe will need to foster two areas of training (a) increased literacy and (b) health. Because of the level of education, it would be beneficial to include numeracy so that women would benefit in the long run. Support is required in terms of equipping them with 'practical skills' that will sustain their program. Special attention with practical guidance should be given to improve their level of understanding in 'record keeping/bookkeeping'.
- **Organizational development support:** Women in both groups have shown their capacity to organize themselves, participate in community development activities, and gained control of resources. It is crucial to continue supporting them at a slow but steady pace.
- **Studies:** More studies should be conducted on the various indigenous vegetables to: a) increase the knowledge and benefits; assess both the nutritional and medicinal values of indigenous vegetables, and the data collected should be shared to the community at large to reinforce increase in the consumption of indigenous vegetables.
- **Reinforce linkages:** The women should continue to reinforce the linkages with different partners, non-government organizations, village organizations and other women's groups. They should also join in common cause and build alliances with other groups who share similar vision.

## VI. BANANA PLANTATION

The banana plantation run by the Bannakaroli Brothers is part of a larger project to assist children orphaned by AIDS and in 1988, the Bannakaroli Brothers opened an orphanage in Kyotera, Uganda to address this increasing problem. The Brothers started with twenty children from local villages and have since developed an orphanage and a primary school for 550 children in the area. Of the 550 students, 350 are girls.

The school is also open to children in the area who are not orphans and offers a complete liberal arts education. Once graduating from the primary school, students are sent to secondary school. Funds are raised for many of the students who cannot afford secondary school fees.

Because of the demands of running an orphanage and the constant need for funding, the Brothers have devised an integrated approach to gain resources both at the community level and outside the region. The banana plantation is part of this integrated approach.

In 1994, the Bannakaroli Brothers received a grant from CODEL for \$15,000. The purpose of the grant is to teach the children at the school organic farming techniques for growing bananas. The Brothers chose bananas for several reasons: they are the main staple for Uganda, experience

on the plantation will provide the students with important farming skills necessary when they are older, and because the bananas will be a source of income for the orphanage. The Brothers also chose to implement organic farming techniques for several reasons: it is less expensive than using chemical fertilizers and pesticides (weevils are a common problem in the area), it is better for the local environment, and organic farming techniques produces higher yields. The students work on the plantation approximately three hours a week as part of their science class. There is an equal share of participation between boys and girls.

Although, bananas are grown throughout Uganda and in particular around Kyotera, running a banana plantation was a new adventure for the Brothers. To get the necessary technical expertise, the Brothers turned to several sources: the local community, in particular a local women's group; Makerere University; foreign donors; and government extension workers. From the lesson learned they designed their own innovative formula for pesticides and fertilizers. As a result, the Brothers devised a system that combines traditional wisdom of farming with modern techniques.

Once the plantation was established, the Brothers continued their outreach approach. The plantation serves as a model for local farmers, and anticipate that the students share this knowledge when they return to their villages during holidays. In particular, the Brothers have worked closely with the local women's group, providing training on organic farming. The women have reciprocal by assisting with the maintenance for the farm. The women have also been instrumental in other aspects of the orphanage--identifying orphans in need, providing daycare for younger orphans, teaching local crafts, and providing meals at the daycare center.

## 6.1 FINDINGS

- Five acres of land were purchased for the plantation and in 1995, the land was cleared and banana suckers were planted.
- Approximately 70 students work 3 times a week for one hour as part of their science class. There are an equally number of boys and girls
- Women from the local community group assist in plantation activities as well as other activities such as running a daycare center (76 children).
- Uses a combination of modern technology and traditional farming techniques.
- Provides awareness raising and education on environment and natural resource management to the students and the community at large.
- Solicited financial and technical assistance from a variety of organizations such as Makerere University, the government and research organizations.

## 6.2 LESSONS LEARNED

- **Grassroots Community Organizing:** The overall success of the plantation and the orphanage is due to strong grassroots community organizing skills on the part of the Bannakaroli Brothers. The Brothers have been very successful in mobilizing local resources as well as receiving outside funding to implement their programs. In particular, the Brothers have been instrumental in tapping local resources such as the community women's group to participate and support orphanage activities.
- **Integrated Approach in Information Collection:** The Bannakaroli Brothers have heavily relied on outside assistance and used an integrated approach to collect information. Information comes from a variety of places ranging from village elders, the local women's group, to Makerere University and foreign donors. The end result is a combination of traditional wisdom and modern technology.

The plantation benefits from the services of graduate students at Makerere University who provide the services as agriculture experts, and also receive on-the job training through their internships.

- **Exporting of Information/Model Farm:** Just as the Brothers looked at a variety of resources to collect information, they are equally broad in their outreach. The plantation is used as a model for farmers in the area to learn more about organic farming, and create awareness and knowledge in the area. Students also play a crucial role in disseminating information when they return to their villages.
- **Environmental Education:** The purpose of the plantation is to produce income and teach skills to the orphans, however, it is done under the auspices of environmental education. Because of the civil war and other pressures on forested areas, Uganda has experienced a large degree of deforestation. As a result, the country is facing increasing climatic changes. Attention is being drawn to environmental issues and the importance of better managing natural resource. The Bannakaroli Brother's approach for organic farming came out of these concerns. Along with learning methods of organic farming, the students learn the benefits of using organic farming and are well versed on the environmental issues.

### **CASE STUDY III: MODERN AND TRADITION-THE BANANA PLANTATION:**

The fusion of modern technology and traditional wisdom is the basis of the banana plantation run by the Bannakaroli Brothers. As part of the science classes taught at the St. Kizito primary school and orphanage, the Brothers devised an integrated system based on information gathered from elders in local villages, foreign donors, research organization and government extension workers. The result is an integrated approach to growing bananas.

From the elders in nearby villages, the students have learned traditional methods of identifying weevil infestation, pest control, and fertilization. From donors and research organizations, they learned concepts of organic farming not used in the area. Instead of planting the banana trees close together, common practice on most farms, the banana trees were spaced with nitrogen fixing trees interspersed. The students also learned soil preparation and improved methods of preparing organic fertilizers and pesticides.

As a result, the orphanage has a model banana plantation and the students have a better understanding of organic farming and the importance of looking at both the tradition and the new technologies.

### **6.3 CONSTRAINTS**

- **Size and Impact:** Despite the large degree of successful outreach practiced by the Brothers, this is a small project which means that the impact is yet to be determined in the near future. However, at the individual level, the project has had a significant impact, but the level of impact at a community or a region will be a continuous process. It might even take several years before there is a critical mass of students and local farmers educated in organic farming to create a sizable impact.
- **Environmental Indicators:** This is an environmental project. However, indicators to measure the impact on the environment are not incorporated nor is the orphanage currently set up to monitor environmental indicators.

### **6.4 SUSTAINABILITY**

The sustainability of the banana plantation is dependent on the future of the orphanage. The operational cost to run the plantation was quite small (US 15,000) and could potentially be offset by money saved from buying less food and income gained from sales of bananas. Therefore, the plantation will probably continue its program activities as long as there is interest, and the orphanage remains operational. There appears to be a great degree of dependency on donations, and at present it is too premature to assess the sustainability of the project, much depends on the orphanage. However, for the past eight years, the flow of funding has been steady, and the orphanage has not only been operational but has also expanded its program services.

## 6.5 RECOMMENDATION

- **Continue Experiment Aspect of Project:** The most appropriate approach for the Bannakaroli Brothers is to continue with the experimentation of the organic farming for the banana plantation. Although the project is still experimental, it represents an example of a new indigenous agricultural knowledge system which constitutes a valuable resource.
- **Link with Other Pilot Projects under the Cooperative Agreement:** The integration of the farming techniques within the on-going education program activities should be complemented and supported through linkages with the other participating agencies in Kenya and Tanzania to facilitate the transfer of knowledge and innovations from one country to another.

## VII. CHARCOAL BRIQUETTE AND STOVE PROJECT

The objective of the Charcoal Briquette and Stove project has been to train women in skills of making charcoal briquettes; promote awareness on its use as alternative source of energy; and increase standard of living through income generation. The project was undertaken under the YWCA and was implemented through two women's groups in Nakawa and Makindye Divisions outside of Kampala. The groups are of about 30 women each.

The project was created due to the problem of deforestation caused by direct cutting of trees for fuel wood, and have not been replaced. The climate has been affected, price for wood has been increased, and because of the scarcity many families have been affected. More than 90% of Uganda's population are using wood fuel for cooking, commercial activities, pottery making etc. and more than 40% of Ugandan forests have been cleared. Realizing the urgent need to avoid deforestation, the YWCA and several NGOs developed awareness raising on afforestation and promotion of improved fuel cook stoves and promotion of fuel efficient technologies. This pilot project was inspired by the women in the communities.

### 7.1 EVALUATION FINDINGS

The women are making the briquettes out of agro-waste and other products that are easily attainable. (i.e. banana peels, cassava, dung, ash, clay, etc.) The women meet once a week to make the briquettes and occasionally clay stoves that are more fuel efficient. Although the process is time consuming, the women in the group are enthusiastic because it saves time during the week. Using the fuel efficient stoves and briquettes means that less time and money is spent collecting fire wood, and less time is spent on cooking. The briquettes are slow cooking and therefore, the women do not need to tend to the stove as much leaving time to work on other activities.

It is important to note, however, that one of the ingredients for the briquettes is clay and there are very new and strict laws about retrieving clay from wetland areas. It is unclear whether the clay used is being retrieved in an environmentally sustainable method.

- Due to scarcity of fuelwood, poorer communities are boiling water less and cooking food less which is causing an increase in poor health.
- People are eating less nutritious foods because some of the traditionally more nutritious foods take longer to cook.
- Increasingly women are having to go farther and pay more to collect fuelwood. Price for charcoal has increased as a result.
- 2,000 indirect beneficiaries (number in respected communities)
- YWCA and other local NGOs have embarked on awareness raising/training on deforestation issues.
- YWCA conducted training in charcoal briquette making with carbonization of materials, crushing and dry soil and carbonized material; mixing and kneading, molding etc. Skills in kneading/wedging, drying and firing were also provided for stove making.
- Needs were identified by the women and requests were made to the YWCA in acquiring technical skills.

## 7.2 LESSONS LEARNED

- **Collaboration:** Women working together, can generate a high degree of team spirit and solidarity in spite of the economic incentives. The formation of a group is very crucial to the success of a program, and a sense of 'community' empowers the self esteem of women, and encourages them to be more effective in carrying out the activities.
- **Existing Linkages:** YWCA has used community development as an entry point in that women became accustomed to working together in a group and identifying their own needs and constraints before the training activities have been introduced.
- **Innovative Approaches:** Innovative approaches were introduced to create awareness of afforestation and promotion of improved fuel cook stoves as well as promotion of fuel efficient technologies. The women in Nakawa and Makindye village benefited directly from the training by using the stoves for home cooking, and a few have earned income from the sale of stoves and charcoal briquettes in their communities.
- **Decrease in Labor:** The beneficiaries have now begun cooking more than 2 dishes at a time, saves cooking time, and has relieved them to do other household chores. The stoves has also the dual purpose of being used as energy/heat for the house.
- **Community Outreach:** When women gained knowledge and exposure to new approaches, they share it with others in the community, and in this particular project, the awareness and knowledge has brought about change of the community in general.

- **Fusion between Traditional Wisdom and Modern Technologies:** The fusion of traditional wisdom and new techniques has been clearly introduced, where banana peelings or cassava skins are used glue the briquettes together.
- **Entrepreneurship:** The sense of entrepreneurship in a collective group effort is dual faceted, with community development on one hand and income generation on the other. Such an approach directly addressed a women's need for self reliance within a social and economic environment. The majority of the women who participated in this project are highly enterprising, where they have managed more than one home-based income generating activities, i.e. poultry raising, vegetable gardening, piggetry, etc. Once they mastered a sense of self reliance, these women played a key role in mobilizing a group; shared the lessons learned and assisted others in learning new skills and empowering them to make changes in their lives.
- **Economic Benefits:** While economic benefits at present are on a small scale, changes in attitudes, awareness and group interaction has been impressive.

### 7.3 CONSTRAINTS

- **Transportation:** Transportation to purchase the brick from the plot has been a major constraint for the women.
- **Time Consuming:** Molding and kneading of the briquettes is time consuming and labor intensive, and thus requires concerted efforts by many women. The women are still using traditional methods of making briquettes. Molding is done manually it takes longer and requires groups efforts. Drying of the raw materials also takes time and has delayed the production.
- **Space:** At present space is being provided by individuals and to accommodate a much larger group, a permanent working area is required. Collective efforts could increase production and generate more income
- **Design of the Stove:** The stoves both in terms of design and quality need to be improved, need more quality control.

44

## 7.4 SUSTAINABILITY

The sustainability of the project would depend on the commitment of the YWCA to continue monitoring the progress of the project, and provide refresher courses as needed. Realizing the groups efforts and commitment, the YWCA should continue to support the women's group through coaching and phase out gradually. Since this is a new innovation, it would take much longer to acquire the skills and improve the quality of the finished goods (stoves).

Since the stoves and briquettes have already been introduced to the community, and the women are keen to continue with the production, training should be designed either by the YWCA or its external affiliates to upgrade their skills, and also improve the processing methods. The benefits have been recognized at the individual and community level, thus it has a high degree of success and potential to reach a much broader market.

## 7.5 RECOMMENDATION

- **Refresher courses:** Provide refresher courses to upgrade the skills in clay processing in order to decrease the labor intensive methods. Identify local artisans to design locally made machines to process mixture and kneading of the materials instead of manually to increase volume and save time.
- **Training on other related issues:** Create a balance between income generation and social issues. Need to provide information/training on basic health and environment to create awareness among the women's groups.
- **Marketing:** The YWCA with its membership of 1.6 million could create a marketing outlet through it's ongoing sales office at the headquarters level. This way the women benefit by directly establishing a link and at the same time expand their outreach.

## VIII. ORGANIC FARMING

Kenya Institute for Organic Farming (KIOF) is a Kenyan NGO whose aim is to increase the standard of living for small farmers by encouraging use of sustainable methods of agriculture. Founded in 1986, KIOF has conducted many training at the village level working with small scale farmers on how to better improve their yields through organic farming. KIOF also acts as a resource and research organization for organic farming.

KIOF received \$30,000 over three years from CODEL to carry out training on alternative traditional methods (organic farming) with two farming groups in Kenya. The groups are in the Muranga and Machakos districts, have approximately 17 members each and are predominately women. The regions were chosen because of their different climates. Muranga is considered a high productivity area because of the adequate amount of rainfall and Machakos, a low productivity area because of the drought conditions. The pilot project started in 1994.

The goal of the project is to investigate how farmers can combine traditional farming methods with modern technology to improve farming in their communities. The goal is to be achieved through investigating existing traditional agricultural practices; investigate existing modern technologies; document the process; implement the combined methodologies using indicators of sustainability.

## **8.1 EVALUATION FINDINGS**

### **8.1.1 MURANGA**

Muranga is the more established group having formed in 1991. The group chair started organic farming in 1987, and was so impressed with the results, became the catalyst for bringing KIOF to the area. As the group has been established for some time, they are well along the path of implementing organic farming techniques. Group members are experiencing increase in yields, are self sufficient, and do not have to purchase vegetables. The group has also established a small market in the community by selling to the neighbors, and have begun savings.

It is important to note that because of the relative wealth of the group and the increased income due to increased yield, group members can afford to hire labor. Organic farming is very labor intensive and the extra assistance means that group members can double dig and use other organic farming techniques through their entire plots. As a result of the extra soil preparation, the group gets higher yields.

### **8.1.2 MACHAKOS**

The Machakos group was formed in 1994, and is only using organic farming techniques in demonstration gardens. It differs from the first group as it less well established because of the relative newness of the group, has less disposable income, and is in area with significantly less rainfall resulting in lower yields. To address the lack of rainfall, the group has started a nursery with assistance of forestry extension officer. Deforestation is a large problem in the region and the group is working in increasing the use of agroforestry on their farms

Both groups have gone through similar trainings by KIOF.

- Data for both groups is collected during planting season to determine the indigenous knowledge
- One-week training is provided with focus on soil cultivation- double digging, intercropping, animal husbandry, agroforestry, compost making, seed selection etc....
- KIOF staff are scheduled to visit after 3 months to assess if farmers are utilizing the skills
- To date farmers have adopted the following skills: soil fertility maintenance and making compost; water harvesting and other methods of improving yield without chemicals.
- Women smallholder meet regularly to exchange ideas and also assist individuals

- Women are mainly responsible for on-farm and off-farm activities; and men work in the city and visit family members weekly or monthly.
- On average the women have 3-5 acres of land, comprising of banana plantation, vegetable gardening, and have other income generating activities, i.e. chickens, rabbit raising, and dairy farm)

## 8.2 LESSONS LEARNED

- **Combination of Indigenous and Modern Technology:** KIOF provides training in organic farming techniques that are based on traditional wisdom and modern technology. In some cases, the participants are already familiar with the traditional methods and are able to rely on their previous knowledge and understanding.
- **Increased Yields and Increased Incomes:** Almost all the participants reported increased yields after implementing organic farming techniques. The Muranga group has greater yields as they are in the high productivity area, where the rainfall was above 1200 mm per annum, soils are deep, and are farming organically on all of their plots. The increase yields mean increased food security as the participants are less likely to have to buy vegetables, as well as increased income. The group has also developed a marketing outlet in the community to sell the vegetables. The group is also saving money by not purchasing chemical fertilizers and pesticides.
- **Increased Health Benefits:** The participants reported that because of increased consumption of fresh vegetables, they have witnessed better health for their families. Nutritional values of the vegetables are being recognized. Furthermore, particularly in Muranga group, the participants reported feeling healthier because they were no longer using chemicals. Some members of the Muranga group reported having rashes and other problems because of the chemicals used in the past.
- **Group Participation:** Through the training, KIOF established community groups that continue to work on organic farming. As a result, the group will develop stability after the training. This is especially beneficial given the labor intensive nature of organic farming, where groups meet weekly to help compost and carry out other activities. In some cases, the women have established a support group for others whose husbands work in the city. The exchange of ideas, sharing of responsibilities and the mentoring has been beneficial to both groups in fostering their relationship and support.
- **Linkages with Extension Workers:** The Machakos group has involved the local forestry and livestock extension workers. Both are aware of the group's activities and provide assistance on a regular basis. This is especially true for the forestry extension officer who has helped the group establish a nursery and works with agroforestry.

#### CASE STUDY IV: ORGANIC FARMING

Beth Wamaeth is a 60 years old farmer, married with 2 sons and 3 daughters. Though her children are married they live with her, and help in the farm. Her husband and her two sons work in the city and come on weekends. The family owns 5 acres of land and grows banana plantation, avocado, coffee, maize and beans. In addition, she has a goat and chicken breeding, and a cow as income generation. Ms. Wamaeth belongs to the Muranga group which was formed in 1991.

Ms. Wamaeth has participated in the 5 days training by KIOF and has learned different planting methods, terracing, deep digging and fertilizer techniques. Since then she has increased her yields, which means surplus for both consumption and income. Ms. Wamaeth claims that she feeds her family more vegetable and fruit and as a result has made a positive impact in the health of the household.

Subsequently to her participation in the women's group, Ms. Wamaeth confirms the improved agricultural yield and increase the opportunity for more income. Mrs. W. sells her yields in the nearby market. The extra income has also allowed her to hire piece-meal laborers for intensive tasks, such as double digging. The Muranga group has also provided Mrs. W. and her family with other tangible benefits, the friendship, networking and information sharing with other women smallholders. She also assists others with the new skills she has learned, and has established an informal support group of women whose husbands are working in the city. Her attitude to the training and belonging to the group, based on the success it has brought her, is an extremely positive one.

### 8.3 CONSTRAINTS

- **Labor Intensive:** Many aspects of organic farming are very labor intensive. For example, to double dig five acres of land takes a significant amount of time as well as endurance. The Muranga group compensates for this by hiring additional help. The Machakos group is less fortunate and cannot afford to hire extra labor. As a result, the Machakos group only uses organic farming techniques in their demonstration plots. Although the group is aware of the benefits of organic farming, it is too labor intensive. As a result, the farmers have adopted some of the techniques but still continue to use chemical fertilizers and pesticides and do not have the higher yields enjoyed by those that have completely adopted organic farming.
- **Lack of Adequate Markets:** In both regions, market possibilities are limited. Even if the farmers were to expand their organic farming techniques and further increase their yields, there may not be a market for the produce. Currently, the increase in production is used mainly for home consumption and to sell to neighbors.

## 8.4 SUSTAINABILITY

Both groups are independent and for the most part self-sufficient. This is especially true for the Muranga group which has worked together as a group for many years. The Machakos group, being new to the techniques, and as a newly formed group (1994) would still need additional training and assistance. Realizing the benefits of the training and participation, both groups will continue integrating organic farming techniques, but would benefit from KIOF's input, as well as and strengthening the linkages with government extension workers.

## 8.5 RECOMMENDATION

- **Additional Training and Follow-up:** Both groups expressed positively about the training that they received and the new skills they acquired. However, they have requested more training in marketing, leadership skills, and record keeping.

Increased training and follow-up visits are needed to assist the groups beyond the initial stages, especially for the Machakos group which is newer and requires proper monitoring to assess the constraints and needs, and provide practical training.

## IX. CONCLUSION

The Africa Women: Community Development and Combined Technologies has aimed at ensuring the sustainability through institutional capacity building at the field level by developing existing institutions; using existing capacity by broadening the partnership of the NGOs, the government and the community, and strengthening of beneficiaries' ownership and commitment at the at the grassroots levels.

Furthermore, the high impact and low cost of the pilot projects coupled with the involvement of local communities in general and women in particular, have proven to be effective and innovative. The activities have focused on interventions that address basic needs for women and their families. Invariably, all the projects have generated interest and requests have been , made by others in the community.

Drawing on the analysis through field visits and discussions with the beneficiaries, it could be assessed that the greatest gain from raising the socio-economic productivity of women farmers was in the form of improved nutrition, meeting household food expenses, clothing, school fees, and in some cases savings.

Because of the perceived benefits of the projects, many have indicated the demands from neighboring areas to join their groups, and the beneficiaries have shared the skills with others who are indirectly benefiting through information sharing.

Interviews with the beneficiaries indicated that the leadership skills have generated a high degree of team spirit and solidarity among the groups.

The creation of village groups, and the formation of homogeneous groups is one of the most important lessons learned. Participation in group organizations has enhanced the social and economic status of the beneficiaries, and have gained respect in the family, and are regarded highly in the village community.

The integrated approach to women's development, and the emphasis placed upon mobilizing women to tap their existing skills and knowledge to motivate them to improve their lives has been a participatory process between the women's group and the implementing agencies.

The most important impact observed was that the project in general, and training in particular was an eye-opener for the women: they became more aware of their needs and constraints. They also developed self-confidence, and gained personal and economic independence.

The contributions of all the pilot project lies in the indirect impact on the women, family and community levels. At the family level, there is evidence of changes in behavior and attitudes of family members where women are frequently consulted by their husbands, and are also making independent decisions.

It is important to note that the primary level of the success of the pilot projects is contingent upon the degree and commitment and initiative shown at both the management level (implementing agencies) and the grassroots level (women's groups/organizations). In most cases, inquiries were usually answered promptly, through extension workers who are either placed in the communities, or are assigned to make frequent field visits to the project sites.

Communication, cooperation and coordination with local government agencies (agriculture, livestock, environment to name a few) were effective in promoting community development activities. Linkages have been developed with such service centers in the past to provide training, and/or organized field visits for exposure programs.

At the level of training, the methodology and the content of the training program was generally appropriate and useful for addressing the women's needs. In all three countries, training were however, too short to ensure the development of an adequate level of knowledge and skills, particularly in cases when the women were illiterate. Follow-up refresher courses would be more appropriate.

The project was ambitious, in that it set many levels of objectives that were difficult to achieve within the planned duration of the project. As the evaluation team observed though CODEL had produced indicators for 'Sustainability' to measure project achievements; CODEL folded while the tool was being field tested. However partner agencies have indicated that they were too technical, and would have liked a more simpler version, specifically adaptable to each country.

The sudden change of management from CODEL to LWR was not also properly channeled to the implementing agencies. This has caused clarity among the agencies in understanding the role of LWR, the status of the project after '96, and therefore lacked preparation in planning and requesting assistance to further improve or expand the pilot projects.

Furthermore, the change in management has also created constraints in obtaining files and documents etc... and pertinent information were unavailable prior to the evaluation trip. The files obtained at USAID did not have detailed updated information on the present status of the projects, nor did it cover breakdown of actual costs of each project. The supervision reports from CODEL clearly did not cover the above, and lacked in-depth analysis on the status of the projects. During our discussion with LWR, the team was informed that since agreements with USAID has been accepted, LWR maintained the services of the staff member who originally was in charge of the projects, and the reporting system was maintained. This was a reflection of a rush in the transition of management, (especially LWR to oversee the final phase of monitoring) which did not allow enough time for LWR to develop a more systemic monitoring approach.

This created constraints for the evaluation team in gathering information, and could have also saved time spent in digging preliminary data while in the field. Reports were only provided at the site, and often needed updated information. Thus, the evaluation team depended on information gathered from the beneficiaries and implementing agencies. The evaluation team would have liked to meet other partners organizations, i.e. NGOs, and government officials. Unfortunately, the duration of the evaluation was too short and did not allow enough time.

Despite the constraints encountered during the implementation process, i.e. delays in implementation and disbursement; and change of management at headquarters level, at the field level the projects have demonstrated commendable results as an experimentation (2 years) in improving the lives of many women.

While some of the implementing agencies have expressed interest to integrate the pilot projects into their on-going program activities, others have indicated their intention of phasing out gradually after August 1996. The challenge now is to back them, especially those with 'best approaches' and ensure that the lessons are incorporated into design.

## X. OVERALL RECOMMENDATION

In order to sustain and build upon the achievements of the pilot projects at the various levels, the Lutheran World Relief should plan to use the remaining funds after August 1996 to organize a follow-up 'Consultation Meeting' to gather the participating NGOs and other practitioners, possibly in one of the East African Countries with an objective to:

- To share the lessons learned, to foster linkages and networking among NGOs, academicians and grassroots organizations; and identify follow-up activities.
- To ensure that the case studies, research, surveys, publications, and the evaluation report are disseminated to a broader audience
- To gather information for a final publication of the projects
- To seek funding or seek other donors interested to ensure a second phase of the 'best approaches'.

On a more specific note, a number of these projects have needs beyond the time of the contract. While the WTDA project in Iringa could use additional funds for their revolving funds, TechnoServe could continue assisting the two groups in Arusha by providing more training in business and management as well an in-depth analysis on the medicinal value of the indigenous vegetables. The Bannakaroli Brothers need funds for building a dining room for the orphans as well as strengthen the banana plantation. The YWCA realizing the labor-intensity of the charcoal processing, has designed a machine with the help of a local artisan to improve the processing, but need assistance for production. Finally, the Kenya Institute of Organic Farming (KIOF) could provide more refresher courses to build on lessons learned, and with it's experience in research and documentation KIOF could play an active role in documenting the lessons learned in each country.

## ANNEX A

### PROFILES OF IMPLEMENTING AGENCIES

#### *Maryknoll Sisters*

The Maryknoll Sisters is a roman catholic global missionary society headquarters in New York, U.S.A. In 1948 they began their work in Tanzania with an emphasis in education. In cooperation with the Tanzanian government, they were instrumental in the setting up of numerous schools throughout the country. Today, approximately 30 sisters are involved in a wide range of programs and projects in a variety of communities in Tanzania. They are strongly committed to community based organizing/organizations and a current emphasis is working with women. This work is focused on the empowerment of women in all aspects of daily life including access to the market place in order to provide means of financial independence for women.

Because of their long history, knowledge based regarding both formal and informal systems and commitment to the country, they are highly regarded in Tanzania and have access to all levels of officials in both government and the private sector. All of these characteristics make them an excellent choice in the implementing a small community based pilot projects.

#### *TechnoServe*

TechnoServe has more than 26 years' experience in creating viable, rural agricultural enterprises in Africa, Latin America and Central Europe. In 1989, TechnoServe initiated a program to promote small scale milk processing enterprises in the Arusha and Kilimanjaro regions of Northern Tanzania. The Tanzania program was broadened in early 1990 when it began formal assistance to farmer associations in an attempt to promote a "green revolution" in Tanzania. In 1992, TechnoServe initiated an integrated women's enterprise and community development plan in Tanzania in partnership with the McKnight Foundation. TechnoServe has concentrated on the milk, maize and horticultural sectors in Northern Tanzania. Since, TechnoServe has been working with ten predominately women's enterprises incorporating nearly one thousand members. The largest, a Mala milk enterprise in Nronga, has been considered a model of successful women's development.

#### *Bannakaroli Brothers*

The Bannakaroli Brothers are a religious congregation founded in 1927. Their primary objective is to provide formal education and skills training. Carpentry, farming skills and construction are among the various skills provided to youth by the Bannakaroli Brothers. Due to the increasing numbers of orphans in the district because of the HIV epidemic in the region, the Bannakaroli Brothers, in 19-- established an orphanage for 73 children who lost both parents, and provided them with academic education and skills training. To date they have more than 500 enrollment with more than 50% girls.

Most of the orphans have been adopted by widows who have children of their own. The widows in most cases do not have an income but depend on farming to get food for the children, and have become guardians through relatives that have died or have taken the children left alone in the community.

### *YWCA*

The purpose of the YWCA is to assist women and girls to participate in projects and programmes aimed at raising their educational, social, health and economic standards, thereby playing their rightful role in National development. The Uganda YWCA has a total membership of 1.6 million members and is the second largest YWCA in the world. Among the various training activities the YWCA provides: Environmental Protection, vocational training, literacy, appropriate technology, livestock and agriculture; cottage industry; primary health care. Furthermore, the YWCA is involved in a number of income generating activities such as book shop, hostel, two restaurants; grocery, handicraft and variety shops at headquarters and around the country.

### *Kenya Institute of Organic Farming*

The Kenya Institute of Organic Farming (KIOF) was officially established in 1986. It aims at reviving and developing sound husbandry practices to show that it is possible to combine good yields with high quality produce while building lasting soil fertility and improving the overall environment. Since the small scale farmers are in effect the caretakers of the natural environment, KIOF plans to stimulate them to better manage the environment by starting with sound agricultural principles on the farm. KIOF acts as: a) a resource organization for organic agriculture in Kenya; b) a research body, that researches and documents Kenyan traditional sustainable agricultural practices and tests adaptation to the Kenyan situation practices from other regions; and c) a acts as a training institution for small farmers.

ANNEX B

BUDGET

BUDGET FOR COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT NO. FAO-0152-A-00-3050-00 (WID/PVC)

INCOME BUDGET

	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	TOTAL
PVC	\$200,000			\$200,000
WID	\$150,000	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$650,000
CODEL	\$50,000			\$50,000
	<u>\$400,000</u>	<u>\$250,000</u>	<u>\$250,000</u>	<u>\$900,000</u>

EXPENSE BUDGET

	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	TOTAL
<b>PROGRAM:</b>				
PILOTS	\$30,000	\$30,000	\$30,000	\$90,000
RESEARCH PROJ.	\$20,000	\$30,000	\$16,450	\$66,450
CONTROL PROJ.	\$50,000			\$50,000
	<u>\$100,000</u>	<u>\$60,000</u>	<u>\$46,450</u>	<u>\$206,450</u>
<b>CONSULTATION:</b>				
TRAVEL	\$37,100			
BOARD/LODS/CONF:	\$25,000			
PUBLICATION		\$3,500		
STAFF TIME	\$15,000	\$5,000		
	<u>\$77,100</u>	<u>\$8,500</u>	<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$85,600</u>
<b>EVALUATION:</b>				
<b>PUBLICATION:</b>				
PILOTS			\$8,000	
RESEARCH PROJ.		\$1,000	\$8,000	
STAFF TIME		\$5,000	\$20,000	
EVALUATOR	\$15,000	\$15,000	\$20,000	
	<u>\$15,000</u>	<u>\$21,000</u>	<u>\$56,000</u>	<u>\$92,000</u>
<b>TRAVEL</b>				
INTERNATIONAL	\$0	\$60,000	\$30,000	\$90,000
<b>TOTAL PROGRAM</b>	<u>\$192,100</u>	<u>\$149,500</u>	<u>\$132,450</u>	<u>\$474,050</u>

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

	1993-94	1994-95	1995-96	TOTAL
<b>CODEL STAFF:</b>				
COORDINATOR AND ASSISTANT	\$20,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	
E IN D STAFF	\$12,500	\$12,500	\$20,000	
PROGRAM DIRECTOR	\$12,500	\$20,000	\$12,500	
ADMINISTRATION	\$6,250	\$12,500	\$12,500	
	<u>\$57,500</u>	<u>\$76,250</u>	<u>\$76,250</u>	<u>\$210,000</u>
<b>TRAVEL:</b>				
DOMESTIC	\$5,000	\$5,000	\$7,500	\$17,500
<b>NICRA</b>	<u>\$56,525</u>	<u>\$67,113</u>	<u>\$74,813</u>	<u>\$198,450</u>

55

ANNEX C

FINANCIAL STATUS

(provided by LWR)

⌘ LUTHERAN WORLD RELIEF ⌘

390 Park Avenue South  
New York, N.Y. 10016  
TEL: 212/532-6350  
FAX: 212/213-6081

ATTENTION: JOYCE MUNGHERERA FOR  
CAROLINE NJUKI

FAX MEMORANDUM

DATE: April 8, 1996

Page 1 of 1.

TO: Julie Nemon, FAX 703 816-0266  
Hammy Aklilu, FAX 703 442-7771  
Christine Grumm, FAX 415 920-9339

CC: Cathy Jane Bowes  
FAX 703 351-0212  
Caroline Njuki  
FAX 256 41 241 519

FROM: Kenlynn Schroeder - LWR *Kenlynn Schroeder*

SUBJECT: REVISED - Financial Status - #FAO-0158-A-00-3050-00.

<u>BALANCE</u> - CODEL July 1, 1995	\$90,000	
Additional Obligated on September 22, 1995	<u>75,000</u>	
		\$165,000

EXPENDITURES:

C.Njuki professional fees July 1 - Dec. 31, '95	19,500	
C.Njuki expenses July 1 - Sept. 30, '95	3,877	
R.Kunkler professional fees July 1 - Dec. 31, '95	7,200	
R.Kunkler final report-final payment	2,500	
C.Grumm evaluation professional fees March '96	<u>5,000</u>	
		<u>-38,077</u>
		\$126,923

ESTIMATED ADDITIONAL EXPENSES:

C.Njuki professional fees Jan.1 - Aug. '96	19,000*	
expenses Oct. 1, '95 - Aug.31, '96	16,000	
Evaluation expenses	6,000	
C.Grumm professional fees & expenses, evaluation & report	10,000	
Other activities depending on evaluation report and recommendations:	<u>75,923</u>	
		<u>\$126,923</u>

276 days left of the up-to-154 days @ \$250 in the LWR/C.Njuki signed agreement.

56

## *ANNEX D*

### **TIME LINE: PILOT PROJECTS**

#### *Year I:*

- Selection of six partner NGOs from the three targeted countries (Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania) to participate in a consultation meeting on combined technologies with partner agencies, CODEL members and other agencies
- Selection of three implementing NGOs to identify a set of community needs within the three countries; establish detailed geographic, technological and environmental specifications, design objectives and strategies to be achieved over two years.

#### *Year II:*

- Establish a monitoring system that ensures adequate support for the three pilot project implementing agencies. Monitoring field trip planned.

#### *Year III:*

- Final evaluation trip.

### **TIME LINE: RESEARCH/CASE STUDY**

#### *Year I:*

- The partner agency, CODEL, and PVC/WID to develop a case study design that includes development of study questions as well as indicators to measure base line data and ongoing project effects
- Update the CODEL literature review on women in development and include samples of successful relevant CODEL projects
- Hire researcher/consultant for research project
- Select control project, an ongoing CODEL community development project for women.

#### *Year II:*

- Collection of case data will begin
- Preliminary report be available for the UN Conference in Beijing
- CODEL to continue monitoring the research and control projects

#### *Year III:*

- Gather final data
- Review of preliminary results by partner agency, PVC/WID, and CODEL
- Results and findings to be compared to control group
- Case study data to be developed into a report for dissemination by WID, PVC, and CODEL

## ANNEX E

### SCOPE OF WORK FOR CODEL EVALUATION Matching Grant # FAO-0158-A-00-3050-00

Countries: Kenya, Uganda, Tanzania  
Approximate Dates: March 1996

Evaluation Team Composition: Ms. Hamelmal G. Aklilu  
WID/USAID representative - Julia Nennon

Resource People: Ms. Caroline N'juki  
LWR representative

#### Project Background:

The project implemented three combined technology community projects and one case study project focused on women in development in east Africa. The combined technology projects identify women's traditional wisdom about sustainable management of natural resources and fuse this knowledge with modern technologies for improved environmental and agricultural management. The case study identifies factors that lead to success in community development for women.

#### Purpose of the Evaluation:

The purpose of the evaluation will be to determine to what extent the projects supported by CODEL were able to reach their goals and objectives. For projects unable to achieve their goals and objectives what were the major hinderance and lessons learned from implementing the projects.

The team will be responsible for gathering information on the following aspects of the Combined Technology pilot projects:

- a) the goal and objectives of each project including how far along the project is in reaching these benchmark;
- b) the 'combined technology' practices at each project site including how the traditional practice was identified;
- c) how beneficiaries measure the success of the project;
- d) the financial and administrative management structure of the project including who and how decisions are made;
- e) how the need for technical assistance was identified and once it was identified, how

the project received technical assistance;

f) the project's monitoring system including who is responsible for collecting the information and how the information is being feed back to the participants. the project's utilization of the 'indicators for sustainability' developed by CODEL;

g) the cost per beneficiary of the project including a breakdown of direct costs vs. indirect costs; and

h) the sustainability of each project.

The team will be responsible for gathering information on the following aspects of the Research projects:

a) the goal and objectives of research project including how far along the project is in reaching these benchmark;

b) the project's monitoring system including who is responsible for collecting the information and how the information is being feed back to the participants [all weekly diary sheets need to be reviewed as well as the baseline data survey and any other qualitative and quantitative collected data ] ;

c) review of the income-generating practices to identify if they are following 'best practices';

d) how the need for technical assistance was identified and once it was identified, how the project received technical assistance

e) how beneficiaries measure the success of the project;

f) the project's utilization of the 'indicators for sustainability' developed by CODEL;

g) a breakdown of direct costs vs. indirect costs;

h) the financial and administrative management structure of the projects including who and how decisions are made; and

i) the sustainability of the project.

#### Evaluation Methodology:

In-order to fulfill this scope of work the evaluation team shall....

1. Visit the pilot and research project sites.

2. Meet with and interview participants involved with both the pilot and research project including but not limited to; women's groups, community groups, implementing NGO representatives, host government representatives, and USAID representatives.

3. Review all documentation associated with both projects.

**Documents to be Reviewed:**

The proposal, all interim and quarterly reports submitted by CODEL to USAID and by the pilot project and the combined technologies projects to CODEL, all communications between USAID and CODEL which are pertinent to the evaluation, and the financial records of the pilot and combined technology projects.

**Schedule:**

See attached.

**Roles and Responsibilities of each Team Member:**

Team Leader: The team leader will have the overall responsibility of field evaluation including making decision regarding the roles and responsibilities and delegating work to the other evaluation team members and the resource people. The team leader will be responsible for the preparing a rough draft of the teams findings and presenting this rough draft for comment to USAID, LWR and the CODEL. The team leader will be responsible for preparing a final report for USAID/BHR/PVC

Evaluation Team Members: The role of each evaluation team member will be determined by the team leader. The responsibility of a team member may include but is not restricted to: reading project documents, making site visits, debriefing field projects, and assisting in the writing of the draft evaluation report.

Resource Team Members: The resource people will be responsible for preparing a final project report and distributing the report before the evaluation, making in-country travel arrangements and lodging for all team member and responding to requests generated in the field by the team leader .

**Proposed Level of Effort:**

	Days
Preparation/Background Research	23
Headquarters Interviews	1
Field Work/TRAVEL	1820
Draft Report	5
Final Report Revision	1
Debriefing	1

TOTAL

31

OK mm. *[Signature]*  
OK 60

**Deliverables:**

a. a debriefing by the evaluation team of their findings (if time allows) at each project site visited and with the USAID/BHR/PVC project manager;

b. a final report formatted as follows:

- a. Title Page
- b. Executive Summary
- c. Table of Contents
- d. Introduction and Background
- e. Methodology
- f. Findings and Conclusions
- g. List of Acronyms
- h. Appendices
  - 1. SOW of Evaluation
  - 2. Evaluation Team Itinerary
  - 3. Individuals Contacted during the Evaluation
  - 4. References cited or consulted

*ANNEX F*

**EVALUATION ACTIVITIES AND SCHEDULE**

*(March 1 - 21, 1996)*

<b>Friday, March 1</b>	Dept. to Dar-Es-Salaam
<b>Sunday, March 3</b>	Arrive in Dar-Es-Salaam
<b>Monday, March 4</b>	
8:00 a.m.	Dept. to Iringa (9 hrs. drive)
<b>Tuesday, March 5</b>	
9:00-1:00 p.m.	Field visit to project site interviewed seven women who received loans
2:00-5:00 p.m.	Visit projects of the three founding groups of WTDA: WDC, Matumaini Coop, and VIP-Imani group
6:00 p.m.	Dinner with the Maryknoll Sisters
<b>Wednesday, March 6</b>	
<i>(Tanzania)</i>	
6:45 a.m.	Dept. to Lyadebwe Village to visit women who received loans
10:00 - 11:30 a.m.	Visit at Lyadebwe
12:00 p.m.	Lunch
1:00 p.m.	Drive to Iringa
3:00-4:00 p.m.	Meet with WTDA members
4:00-5:00 p.m.	Debriefing with Sr. Rachel/Research

**Thursday, March 7**

8:00 a.m. Dept to Dar-es-Salaam

4:00 p.m. Arrival in Dar-es-Salaam

**Friday, March 8**

2:30 p.m. Debriefing at USAID Mission

**Saturday, March 9** Dept. to Arusha

**Monday, March 11**

9:30-3:30 p.m. Field Visit: Two project Sites: Kwankya and Mwangaza Women's group

5:00-6:30 p.m. Meeting with Project Director

**Tuesday, March 12**

9:30 a.m. Meeting with Executive Director/TechnoServe

11:30 a.m. Meeting with Training Coordinator and Financial Manager

1:00 p.m. Desk review of project documents

2:30 p.m. Final Meeting Project Manager

**Wednesday, March 13**

Uganda

9:30 a.m. Meeting with Executive Director/YWCA

10:00 - 4:30 p.m. Field visits to 6 project sites - Charcoal Briquette and Stove

**Thursday, March 14**

9:00-3:30 p.m. Field Visit to Kyotera - Banana Plantation - Research Project for Orphans

3:30-4:30 p.m. Meeting with Executive Director and Staff

5:00 p.m. Return to Kampala

**Friday, March 15**

10:30 a.m. Debriefing at USAID/Kampala

1:00 p.m. Working lunch with Senior Staff at YWCA

**Saturday, March 16**

9:30 a.m. Final meeting with Executive Director and Project Manager

**Sunday, March 17** Dept to Kenya

**Monday, March 18**

*(Kenya)*

9:00 a.m. Meeting with Field Program Coordinator

10:00 - 3:30 p.m. Field Visit to Project Site

3:30 p.m. Meeting with Project Director

4:30 p.m. Departure to Nairobi

7:00 p.m. Arrival

**Tuesday, March 19**

9:00 - 6:00 p.m. Field Visit to Machakos Site

8:00 p.m. Dinner at LWR Regional Director's home

**Wednesday, March 20**

9:00 am-12:00 p.m.

Debriefing at USAID Mission

**Thursday, March 21**

8:30 a.m.

Departure to US

## *ANNEX G*

### **PERSONS MET**

#### **WASHINGTON**

##### *USAID/Washington*

- Ms. Sally Jones, PVC
- Ms. Noreen O'Meara, AMA Technologies

#### **IRINGA, TANZANIA**

##### *THE MARYKNOLL SISTERS*

- Sister Rachel Kinder/Researcher
- Sister Noreen

##### *WOMEN TRUST AND DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION*

- Mrs. Berta Fungo
- Mrs. Domina Kambanyamu
- Members of Executive Committee

#### **ARUSHA, TANZANIA**

##### *TECHNOSERVE*

- Mr. Paul Wamika, Director
- Mr. Adrienne Naga, Training Advisor
- Ms. Maria Ijumba, Project Manager
- Mr. Ignas Matula, Financial Officer

##### *USAID MISSION*

- Ms. Hedwiga Mbuya, Program Office
- Dr. Anne Fleuret, Impact Assessment Advisor
- Mr. Daniel Ngowi, Economist
- Mr. Herment Mrema, Program Development Officer

## UGANDA

### *Bannakaroli Brothers*

- Brother Anthony, Director of Orphanage School

### *YWCA*

- Mrs. Mungherera Joyce, Executive Director
- Mrs. Mukiibi Robinah, Supervisor Nakawa Division
- Mrs. Ddungu Robinah, Supervisor, Makindye Division
- Ms. Proscovia Nalukwago, Project Director

### *USAID MISSION*

- Ms. Susan Fine, Project Development Officer
- Ms. Rosern Rwampororo/Agricultural Economist/Monitoring and Evaluation
- Ms. Ruth Sempa, Project Management/Agriculture and Natural Resource Management
- Ms. Louanne Douris, Program Officer/Program Office General
- Ms. Rhemie Kiggundu, Project Manager/Gender & Development
- Ms. Nightingale Nantamu, Program Manager/Natural Resource Management

## KENYA

### *KIOF*

- Ms. Esther Mugure, Field Program Coordinator
- Mr. Nehemiah M. Mihindo, Project Manager

### *USAID MISSION*

- Mr. Keith E. Brown, Director/Regional Economic Development Services Office for East and Southern Africa
- Mr. Carlton Terry, Program Office
- Ms. Teresa Muraya, Program Office
- Ms. Carole Jones, EXO

### *Lutheran World Relief*

- Mr. Sigurd Hanson, Regional Representative

*ANNEX H*

**RESOURCE DOCUMENTS:**

"Relationship Between Women's Economic Position and Community Development," Iringa, Tanzania.

"Linking Organic Agriculture with Indigenous Knowledge and Wisdom in Kenya."

"Production, Consumption and Preservation of Indigenous Vegetables in Mungushi Village, Hai District, Tanzania."

Consultation Report on "Fusion of Traditional Wisdom and Modern Technology in Natural Resource Management, Kenya (March 1994)