

PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT¹

I. **Background Data:**

1. Project Title: PVO Management Support Project
2. Project Number: 511-0578
3. Authorized LOP Funding: \$2,385,000
4. Planned Counterpart Contribution: \$ 874,500
5. Duration of Project: approximately 6 years (6/30/88 - 3/30/94)
6. PACD: March 30, 1994

II. **Project Status:**

The project terminated on March 30, 1994. Per the instructions for the preparation of this report, the following is a list of procurement instruments and their status:

1. Operation Program Grant (OPG) No. 511-0578-G-00-8223 with Planning Assistance, a U.S. Private Voluntary Organization, valued at \$1,635,000.
2. OPG No. 511-0578-G-00-2243, also with Planning Assistance, and valued at \$750,000.

The last major technical assistance activity conducted under the project was "hands-on" democratic participation training workshops for municipal government officials, community leaders and citizens of approximately 15 urban, peri-urban and rural communities in Bolivia. These workshops were conducted by Planning Assistance and were designed to increase citizen participation in municipal decision-making.

III. **Counterpart Contribution:**

The counterpart contribution planned for this project was \$874,500. Actual and accrued counterpart expenditures as of the PACD were \$1,081,049 or 124% of the total amount planned. Counterpart contribution was in-kind.

IV. **Project Accomplishments:**

The first phase of the project, entitled PVO Management Support, was successful in providing institutional strengthening technical assistance through Planning Assistance to PL 480 Title II sponsors including Caritas, ADRA, FHI, and Project Concern International. This technical assistance helped improve these organizations' administrative, financial, oversight, and

¹This report was produced in accordance with the guidelines established in Handbook 3, Chapter 14, App 14A, "Guidance for Preparing the Project Assistance Completion Report", September 30, 1982. Section I "Background Data" was added to provide basic project information.

distribution performance as implementors of the Mission's Title II Urban Food for Work program. This technical assistance to the Cooperating Sponsors has made the Title II program more efficient and less corruptible.

The second phase of the project marked a turn away from institutional strengthening of Title II cooperating sponsors, and toward the use of Title II Food and training as tools for experimenting with and facilitating citizen participation in municipal decision-making. Therefore, the amended project provided direct support to the Mission's strengthening democracy strategic objective. As such, USAID became the only donor in Bolivia focussing on the fundamental democratic initiatives issue of grass-roots participation in municipal decision-making. Through a policy dialogue effort and other mechanisms, selected experiences from the democratic development phase of this have been factored into the GOB's recently unveiled and revolutionary Popular Participation initiative.

V. Progress in Achieving the Project Purpose:

The goals and purposes of the original PVO Management Support Project were: (1) the extension of basic child survival services and assistance in improving agricultural production and income to the poorest members of Bolivian society; (2) the establishment of three strong, well-managed self sufficient private and voluntary organizations, Caritas, ADRA/OFASA, and Food for the Hungry (FHI); and (3) the insurance of effective management and utilization of PL 480 resources, principally the Title II commodities. According to the May, 1992 Project Paper Amendment, "there has been significant achievement of each of these three aims". CARITAS and FHI are providing child survival services, and so is ADRA although to a lesser extent. All three organizations are or have implemented agricultural production programs. All three organizations were strengthened institutionally by the project and it was concluded that FHI had become a "self-sufficient" organization. Finally, the Title II Food for Work program changed dramatically as a result of the project, focussing on areas of success, and reducing involvement in less positive areas such as Mothers Clubs and rural Food for Work projects. The Urban Food for Work program has expanded and become more effective as a result of the project.

Purposes were changed in the second phase of the project, e.g., that phase concerned with improving citizen participation in municipal decision-making. The amended project purposes were: (1) to increase citizen participation in municipal decision-making and create temporary employment opportunities in the 12 cities in relation to the development of services and infrastructure; (2) increase the responsiveness of municipal officials and ADRA and Caritas representatives in the 12 cities in providing services and infrastructure; and (3) strengthen the capacity of city officials and ADRA and Caritas representatives to support participatory processes and improve the effectiveness of the municipal Food for Work Program through the provision of training and technical assistance. Measurement in achieving project purpose was captured by the following two purpose level indicators: (1) Number of Neighborhood Associations Participating in Municipal Decision-Making; and (2) Number of Citizens Participating in Municipal Decision-Making. According to the penultimate project status report included in the Mission's September 1993 Semi Annual Report, LOP targets for these indicators had been surpassed, demonstrating that the amended project purpose has in fact been achieved.

VI. Recommendations for Final Adjustments in Project Design:

As the project has terminated, adjustments in project design are no longer applicable. Lessons learned from this project will be incorporated into the design of the Mission's Democratic Development and Citizen Participation project.

VII. USAID's Post Project Monitoring Responsibilities:

USAID/Bolivia's RCO is responsible for final closeout of OPG No. 511-578-G-00-2243. CONT and DP will take responsibility for deobligating unexpended funds, and will do so at the upcoming 1311 reviews.

VIII. Data Collection Results and Evaluations to be Undertaken:

A final project evaluation was conducted and presented to Mission management in September, 1993. The evaluation was approved and sent to USAID/W shortly thereafter. Although no additional evaluations or data collection will be conducted, interviews with project personnel will be undertaken as the Mission designs a related democratic initiatives project, entitled Democratic Development and Citizen Participation.

IX. Lessons Learned:

1. It is better for USAID to provide external technical assistance for the institutional strengthening of Title II Cooperating Sponsors than providing funding to the Cooperating Sponsor so that they might contract the TA for institutional strengthening themselves;
2. Democratic participation is the strongest where the Mayor's Office, the local citizenry and local organizations take an active interest in engaging in and making the process work;
3. If participation is to be sustained, an independent body should be established to do what Planning Assistance did under the project, i.e. facilitate participation and an ongoing dialogue between the Mayor's office and the citizenry;
4. Citizen participation in municipal decision-making is essential to engendering public confidence in the democratic process, and is therefore essential for ensuring that a transition to democracy is consolidated.

Attachment: Financial Status Report

Clearance:

ARD:SPinzino

ARD:JSleeper

PD&I:LLucke

DP:ESzepesy

CONT:RGoughnour

RCO:MKidd

RLA:SAllen

SP Date 4/14/94
JS Date 4/15/94
LL Date 4/15/94
ES Date 4/22/94
RG Date 5/14
MK Date
SA Date 5/16

HP

UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT
memorandum

DATE: May 26, 1994

REPLY TO
ATTN OF: Humberto Alcocba, Financial Analyst CONT-94/0380

SUBJECT: Financial Close-out Report, Project 511-0578, P.V.O.s
Management Support

TO: Jonathan Sleeper, Project Manager

THRU: Richard J. Goughnour, Controller USAID/Bolivia

The purpose of this memo is to provide financial input, for the P.V.O.s Management Support Project Close-out Report.

1.- **Background**

The purpose of the Grant, signed on 06/30/88 with Planning Assistance was to provide technical assistance to expand the Caritas, ADRA/OFASA and Food for the Hungry capability to implement child survival and agricultural production and income interventions.

According to Amendment No.1 to grant agreement, the life of project budget was increased in support of two additional activities through subgrants to reduce vitamin "A" deficiency in Bolivia.

To increase the developmental impact of P.L. 480 Title II resources in Bolivia, a second grant agreement was signed on 06/19/92 with Planning Assistance, providing support services for the P.L. 480 Title II Urban Food for Work Program to

increase: a) citizen participation in Municipal decision-making, b) the responsiveness of municipal officials, ADRA and Caritas to the needs of poor neighborhoods, and c) to strengthen ADRA and Caritas capability to improve the effectiveness of the municipal food for work program through the provision of training and technical assistance.

To assist Planning Assistance to meet the cost of carrying-out the project, the total revised life of project grant was authorized up to \$2,385,000, provided on an incremental basis, as follows:

A) Grant Agreement No.511-0578-G-00-8223

June 30, 1988	(Original Agreement)	\$ 400,000
September 29, 1988	(Amend. No.1)	135,000
November 14, 1988	(Amend. No.2)	150,000
January 10, 1989	(Amend. No.3)	450,000
July 28, 1989	(Amend. No.5)	100,000
September 28, 1989	(Amend. No.6)	200,000
July 30, 1990	(Amend. No.7)	<u>200,000</u>
Total obligated		\$1,635,000 =====

B) Grant Agreement No.511-0578-G-00-2243

June 19, 1992	(Original Agreement)	\$ 400,000
March 30, 1993	(Amend. No.1)	<u>350,000</u>
Total obligated		\$ 750,000 =====
Total Project Obligated		\$2,385,000 =====

2. Financial Status

A) A.I.D. resources disbursed for project activities:

<u>Project Elements</u>	<u>Obligated</u>	<u>Disbursed</u>	<u>Balance</u>
Grant No.511-0578-G-00-8223			
01 Technical Assistance	\$ 712,042	\$ 712,042	0
02 Travel	54,205	54,205	0
03 Training	25,136	25,136	0
04 Operating Expenses	200,472	200,472	0
05 Equip,Materials & Supp	52,547	52,547	0
06 Evaluations	13,809	13,809	0
07 Management & General	361,507	361,507	0
08 Vitamin "A" Subgrants	<u>215,282</u>	<u>215,282</u>	<u>0</u>
Totals	<u>\$1,635,000</u> =====	<u>\$1,635,000</u> =====	<u>\$ 0</u> =====

Grant No.511-0578-G-00-2243

01 Salaries	\$ 228,204	\$ 234,363	\$(6,159)
02 Fringe Benefits	45,081	31,482	13,599
03 Consultants	11,031	12,549	(1,518)
04 Central Office Support	3,233	3,570	(337)
05 Travel and Per Diem	89,594	92,830	(3,236)
06 Operational Costs	64,023	73,562	(9,539)
07 Equipment and Supplies	60,263	58,123	2,140
08 Workshops and Seminars	4,857	4,307	550
09 Project Evaluation	42,200	37,700	4,500
10 Management & General	<u>201,514</u>	<u>201,514</u>	<u>0</u>
Cost			
Totals	<u>\$ 750,000</u>	<u>\$ 750,000</u>	<u>\$ 0</u>
Total Project	<u>\$2,385,000</u> =====	<u>\$2,385,000</u> =====	<u>\$ 0</u> =====

B) Counterpart Contribution

The counterpart contribution was provided in-kind by private organizations and municipal governments, as follows:

	<u>G/A 8223</u>	<u>G/A 2243</u>	<u>TOTAL</u>
01 Technical Assistance	\$113,577	\$ -	\$ 113,577
02 Equip., Materials & Supp	19,500	-	19,500
03 Pilot Projects	411,103	-	411,103
04 Municipal Governments	<u>-</u>	<u>536,869</u>	<u>536,869</u>
Totals	<u>\$544,180</u> =====	<u>\$536,869</u> =====	<u>\$1,081,049</u> =====

The counterpart contribution represents 45.32% of the life of project revised financial plan.

3. Conclusion and recommendation

After the expiration of PACD (March 30, 1994), the Controller's office performed all necessary actions to financially close-out the project. According to audit reports prepared by KPMG Peat Marwick for the CYs. 1991, 1992, funds disbursed by USAID to the project were fairly managed with no material weaknesses by Planning Assistance were identified.