

PD-ABH-441  
85736

## **Turkey**

### **FOREIGN TRIP REPORT**

**September 20 - October 11, 1993**

**Paul Auxila, MIS Program Director  
Management Sciences for Health  
Family Planning Management Development Project**

**Jack L. Graves, M.P.H., Program Analyst  
Mary Schauer, Public Health Advisor**

**U. S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES  
PUBLIC HEALTH SERVICE  
CENTERS FOR DISEASE CONTROL AND PREVENTION  
NATIONAL CENTER FOR CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION  
AND HEALTH PROMOTION  
DIVISION OF REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH**

**December 30, 1993**

**Table of Contents**

<b>I.</b>	<b>SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>PLACES, DATES, AND PURPOSE OF TRAVEL</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>PRINCIPAL CONTACTS</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>IV.</b>	<b>BACKGROUND</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>V.</b>	<b>ACTIVITIES</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>VI.</b>	<b>FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>VII.</b>	<b>FUTURE ACTIVITIES</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>VIII.</b>	<b>LIST OF ANNEXES..</b> .....	<b>7</b>

## **I. Summary**

As part of an ongoing project, this trip was made to finalize work on curricula, work with trainers and provide training for implementation of a pilot contraceptive distribution and service statistics MIS system in five provinces (see Annex 1). This training was well attended and well received. Additional contacts were made with representatives of the Administration and Finance General Directorate and the Customs Clearance Section of MOH, the International Health Training Project and the Association for Voluntary Surgical Contraception.

In addition, Mr. Graves worked with Dr. Roy Jacobstein AID/POP/W and Dr. Pinar Senlet, USEMB/Ankara on a plan to phase out AID's contraceptive contribution to the MOH MCHFP General Directorate. The plan under consideration at this point calls for gradual reduction with 1997 being the last year that contraceptives will be provided by USAID.

## **II. Places, Dates and Purpose of Travel:**

Paul Auxila, Management Information System Program Director of Management Sciences for Health (MSH) acting as consultant for the Family Planning Management Development Project (FPMD) and Jack Graves, Program Analyst and Mary Schauer, Public Health Advisor, both in the Division of Reproductive Health of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, Georgia (CDC/DRH) travelled to Turkey in September and October 1993: Mr. Auxila from Sept 27 - Oct 8, Ms. Schauer from Sept 16 - Oct 11 and Mr. Graves from Sept 16 - Oct 7.

### **A. The objectives for this visit were:**

- Consultation and adaptation of LMIS workshop Curricula after translation into Turkish.
- An LMIS workshop for staff from five pilot provinces culminating in an implementation plan for the top-up direct distribution system and the service statistics module of the computerized MIS.
- Provide expertise and assistance to USAID representative, Dr. Roy Jacobstein in development of USAID phaseout of contraceptives.

- Attend CA meeting and work toward more coordination with other agencies working in Turkey.

### **III. Primary Contacts**

**A. United States Agency for International Development, Washington, DC**

Dr. Roy Jacobstein, Country Specialist

**B. U.S. Embassy, Ankara**

Dr. Pinar Senlet, Health and Population Advisor  
Ms. Carol Miller, Assistant Population Advisor,  
University of Michigan Fellow

**C. Ministry of Health**

Dr. Ahmet Miski, Deputy Undersecretary

**D. Mother and Child Health and Family Planning  
General Directorate (MCHFP), Ministry of Health  
(MOH)**

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Akin Dervişoğlu, General Director,  
LMIS Team Supervisor  
Mr. Uğur Aytaç, Deputy General Director, LMIS Team  
Supervisor  
Dr. Mehmet Ali Biliker, Deputy General Director  
Mr. Munip Ustundag, Deputy General Director  
Dr. Kemal Hoşgeçin, LMIS Team Member  
Dr. İbrahim Açıkalın, LMIS Team Member  
Dr. Ufuk Miski, LMIS Team Member  
Mr. Erdoğan Kiraz, Chief Supplies and Customs  
Section

**E. Finance and Administration General Directorate**

Mr. H. İbrahim Kösel, Deputy Director

**F. Translation and Assistance**

Mr. Abdullah Kasapçı, LMIS Team Associate  
Ms. Bilge Önal

**G. Participants**

See Annex 2

Once again, we would like to acknowledge the hospitality, support and assistance of the MCHFP/MOH, the Provincial Health General Directorates, and the US Embassy and, as always, our translation staff for their constant availability.

#### **IV. Background**

These activities were undertaken as part of an ongoing collaboration between MSH/FPMD and CDC/DRH in association with the MOH/MCHFP General Directorate, to improve the contraceptive distribution system including a well functioning Management Information System (MIS) for service statistics as well as logistics. (See USAID trip reports: Auxila, Graves, Schauer, April/May 1993; Auxila, December 1992; Graves, Timmons, July 1992; Graves, Ewen, Timmons, March 1992; Graves, Helfenbein, November, 1991; Graves, November 1991, Crowley, Graves, June 1991.)

#### **V. Activities**

##### **A. Workshop Preparation**

Upon arrival in country, logistics arrangements for the workshop were finalized with hotel selection, official approval and notification of participants. The workshop schedule and objectives were reviewed to ensure agreement from all involved. Training philosophy was agreed upon and basic outline for sessions clarified. The summer implementation workplan was reviewed.

##### **B. Curricula Adaptation**

As translation was completed, the training sessions were reviewed and revised to suit the individual responsible for the particular sessions. The curricula and handouts were typed to disc and left in country.

##### **C. LMIS Implementation Workshop**

The workshop was held Oct 4 - Oct 7 in Ankara with 30 participants from the five pilot provinces of Ankara, Kirikkale, Izmir, Aydin and Manissa. Participants included representatives from MCHFP and Administration Finance, warehouse, medical

staff and Deputy Provincial Health Directors. In addition, representatives of the MCHFP General Directorate, the AVSC, and the SEATS Project attended the workshop. (See Annexes 1 and 2)

The goal of the workshop was to provide the skills needed for a pilot implementation of the top-up contraceptive distribution system and the service statistics computerized management information system.

The final activity of the workshop was the development of implementation plans by each province for the Top-Up Distribution system and MIS Service Statistics System. The provinces will all be preparing and seeking to begin implementation by at least Jan 1994.

D. Implementation and Follow-up Plan for MOH LMIS Team

Monitoring and follow-up plans were developed for the central LMIS team so that they can follow the progress of the individual provinces and provide assistance and support when needed. (See Annex 3)

E. Development of Alternate Phase-Out Models

Mr. Graves prepared several alternative plans for phasing out AID's contribution of contraceptives to the MOH/MCHFP Program. The final version with complete phase out by end of 1997 was presented to the General Director and Deputy General Directors and was accepted. The plan was then incorporated into a general strategy paper for AID's contributions to family planning activities in Turkey, and this plan was discussed at a meeting of Cooperating Agencies (CA) who work in Turkey. The plan was modified according to input from the CAs, and a final version was prepared for presentation to AID/W. (See Annex 4). This is now under consideration by AID/W.

F. Attendance at a meeting of cooperating agencies (CA) working in family planning in Turkey

Mr. Graves and Mr. Auxila attended the CA meeting where the commodity phase-out plan was discussed as well as other changes possible due to changes at USAID.

**G. Meeting with the Chief of the Customs Clearance Section**

Ms. Schauer met with Mr. Erdogan Kiraz to discuss any actions that could facilitate the movement of commodities from the port to the central warehouse in Ankara.

**V. Findings and Recommendations**

**A. Follow-up on Summer Implementation Workplan**

The implementation workplan developed for the summer (see trip report April-May, Auxila, Graves, Schauer) was incomplete for a variety of reasons. Kirikkale and Aydin were without current orientation to these two systems at the time of the workshop although Aydin had previously participated in a training workshop on these topics.

**B. Translation**

It must be noted that translation, particularly of documents, has been a major constraint in project activities. In the future, all documents will need to be translated generally followed by a technical review to ensure that technical issues are appropriately represented. This represents a significant input of time and resources.

**C. Training**

The training was well received and participants enthusiastically designed implementation plans which were presented the final day of the workshop. The training team emphasized that provincial staff is now part of a team to fine tune a system that can be adapted for use in all of Turkey. Evaluation forms were filled out and will be summarized and translated.

**D. Logistics Training For MCH-FP Logistics Team Member**

USAID will be sponsoring Logistics Management Training in Washington, D.C. March 4-21. It is recommended that members of the LMIS team and/or their supervisor attend this training. USAID has approved a translator and requests that two people attend for cost efficiency. Another logistics

management training is tentatively scheduled for the last two weeks of September which provides an alternate time.

**E. Request for Donation Documents**

It has been requested that donation documents be sent along with shipping documents in order to save an extra step in customs clearance. It is also requested that documents be mailed at the same time contraceptives are shipped by sea so that they may arrive well in advance of the contraceptive delivery.

## **VI. Future Activities**

### **A. Monitoring and Supervision of Pilot Program**

The plan developed for the central LMIS team will ensure the best outcome of the pilot. (See Annex 3) The timing of the monitoring and communication will be ongoing as needed and especially after the first round of top-up deliveries. As provinces experience problems, it is important to learn about them quickly and provide all possible assistance for their resolution. The MOH will need to cover any expenses associated with this monitoring as outside project funds are not available for this purpose.

### **B. Evaluation**

An evaluation visit to Turkey will entail visits to Health Centers and MCH-FP Centers in the pilot provinces to see if stock levels are within proposed max-min guidelines. Anecdotal data from staff at all levels will be collected regarding success, problems and potential solutions. Provincial stock levels will also be checked as well as delivery schedules and adherence to them. MIS data input will be evaluated by whether or not a database exists for the provinces involved. Quality of this data will be checked by comparing with paper copy. A problem list and proposed solutions will be collected. This can take place either after the first round and the initial monitoring and evaluation are completed or after the second round in conjunction with the workshop (See Annex 3).

### **C. Evaluation/Planning Workshop**

Staff from pilot provinces involved in implementation of the L/MIS systems will be brought back together to present the results of the pilot in their province. They will be asked to bring their successes, problems and proposed solutions keeping with an eye to national implementation. This should not happen until at least two top-up visits have been made, but should be no later than May of 1994.

### **D. Data Analysis Workshop**

This would be incorporated as part of the evaluation workshop but will entail training decision makers to use the data provided for program management. Real data will be analyzed and the group will consider the actions to be taken based on the information provided.

## **LIST OF ANNEXES**

**Annex 1: Workshop Schedule**

**Annex 2: Workshop Participant List**

**Annex 3: Follow-Up Workplan for LMIS Central Team**

**Annex 4: Proposed Phase-Out Schedule for AID-Provided  
Contraceptives**

**Logistics/Management Information System Workshop  
October 4-7, 1993  
Ankara Starton Hotel  
Workshop Schedule**

Monday

9:30 - 10:00	Session 1:	Opening Ceremonies
10:00 - 10:30	Tea Break	
10:30 - 12:15	Session 2/3:	Introduction to Workshop; Workshop Logistics; Introduction of Participants and Trainers
12:15 - 13:30	Lunch	
13:30 - 14:30	Session 4:	Intro to MIS: Definition/Context
14:30 - 15:00	Session 5:	Family Planning Information System
15:00 - 15:15	Tea Break	
15:15 - 15:30	Session 5: (Continued)	

Tuesday

9:00 - 9:15	Summary of Previous Day	
9:15 - 10:30	Session 6:	Goal and Importance of Contraceptive Logistics
10:30 - 10:45	Tea Break	
10:45 - 12:00	Session 7:	Introduction to Top-Up Distribution System
12:00 - 1:30	Lunch	
13:30 - 14:00	Session 8A:	Skill session: Scheduling Delivery Routes
14:00 - 15:00	Session 8B:	Skill Session: Preparing for the Visit
15:00 - 15:15	Tea Break	
15:15 - 16:15	Session 8C:	Skill Session: Determining Max-Min based on AMC and determining amount of stock to leave

a'

16:15 - 17:00 Session 8D: Supplying Health Houses

**Logistics/Management Information System Workshop**  
**October 4-7, 1993**  
**Ankara Starton Hotel**  
**Workshop Schedule**  
**(Continued)**

Wednesday

9:00 - 9:15	Summary of Previous Day
9:15 - 9:35	Session 8E: Storage Conditions/mfg/exp date
9:35 - 10:35	Sessions 8F,G,H: Training Tips, Special Circumstances, 1st vs subsequent visits
10:35 - 10:45	Tea Break
10:45 - 12:30	Session 9: Delivery Simulation Session 10: Learning the Computerized Service Statistics System
12:30 - 14:00	Lunch
14:00 - 15:00	Continuation Sessions 9 & 10
15:00 - 15:15	Tea Break
15:15 - 16:00	Session 11: Wrap up of simulation exercise
16:00 - 17:00	Intro to Session 12: Implementation Plan

Thursday

9:00 - 11:00	Session 12: Continue Work on Implementation Plans
11:00 - 12:00	Session 12: Presentation of Plans
12:00 - 12:30	Closing Ceremony
12:30	Closing Lunch

**Participant List  
LMIS Workshop  
Oct 4 - 7, 1993**

**Ankara City Health Directorate**

Dr. M. Ali Özbek, Deputy Health Director  
Dr. Handan Bilgiç, MCHFP Division Director  
Ms. Seluna Karaduman, Medical Technologist  
Ms. Fatma Avcı, Senior Nurse  
Ms. Yildiz Aras, Medical Technologist

**Aydin Provincial Health Directorate**

Dr. Zafer Muradoğlu, Deputy Health Director  
Mr. Abdullah Eroğlu, Administration/Finance Division  
Director  
Ms. E. Ayşe Özdanır, Computer Officer  
Ms. Selma Koprülü, Warehouse Employee

**Izmir Provincial Health Directorate**

Dr. Meltem Ağzitemiz, Deputy Health Director  
Dr. Haydar Çetin, Deputy Health Director  
Dr. Saadet Yardın, MCHFP Division Director  
Dr. Çetin Başöz, Computer Officer  
Mr. Selçuk Kurt, MCHFP Division Employee

**Kirikkale Provincial Health Directorate**

Dr. Hüseyin Kalkan, Deputy Health Director  
Dr. Suat Duronoy, Deputy Health Director  
Mr. Fatih Kavaklıoğlu, MCHFP Division Director  
Dr. Suat Duronoy, Deputy Health Director  
Mr. Saadettin Topsoy, Administration/Finance Division  
Director  
Mr. Erdal Öztürk, Warehouse Official

12.

**Participant List LMIS Workshop (continued)**

**Manisa Provincial Health Directorate**

Dr. Suzan Çelik, Deputy Health Director  
Dr. M. Şehnoz Hatipoğlu, MCHFP Division Director  
Mr. Necdet Taçkin, Administration/Finance Division Director  
Ms. Halil Akço, Health Official  
Ms. Emel Arici, Computer/Statistics Official

**Other Participants**

Dr. Derman Boztok, AVSC  
Mr. Tamer Kutluay, SEATS Program Logistics Manager

**MOH Participants and Trainers**

Dr. Ahmet Miski, Undersecretary, Ministry of Health  
Prof. Dr. Ayşe Akin Dervişoğlu, General Director, MCHFP  
Mr. Uğur Aytaç, Deputy General Director, MCHFP  
Dr. Kemal Hoşgeçin, MCHFP, Trainer  
Dr. İbrahim Açıkalın, Division Director and Trainer, MCHFP  
Dr. Ufuk Miski, MCHFP, Trainer  
Dr. Burcu Ozatay, MCHFP  
Ms. Fatma Bayraktar, MCHFP

**Other guests**

Dr. Roy Jacobstein, USAID, Washington  
Dr. Pinar Senlet, AID Population Advisor, US Embassy, Ankara  
Ms. Carol Miller, Assistant AID Population Advisor, US Embassy, Ankara  
Mr. Paul Auxila, Management Sciences for Health, Boston  
Mr. Jack Graves, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta  
Ms. Mary Schauer, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta  
Mr. Abdullah Kasapçı, Translator

### Annex 3: Follow-up Workplan for LMIS TEAM

Activity	Responsible Party	Product	By When	Remarks
1. Communication with Provinces:	MOH LMIS Team	Official Letter to Governors of Pilot Provinces	Oct. 11 1993	Requested by workshop participants
Follow-up Contact	MOH LMIS Team	Initial progress report	Oct 31, 1993	
Problem Collection	MOH LMIS Team	Problem List Potential Solution List	Dec 31, 1993	
Ongoing contact	MOH LMIS Team	Regular progress reports	Ongoing	Will correspond to provincial plans and as need dictates
2. Monitoring	MOH LMIS Team	Monitoring Visit Report	1.Nov-Dec 2.Jan-Feb	During Preparation and then after first round of deliveries
3. Establish evaluation criteria for plans	MOH LMIS Team	List of consistent criteria for use in Provincial Plan evaluation	Oct 8	Arrange for Translation and fax to CDC/MSH team
Evaluate Provincial Workplans	MOH LMIS Team	Feedback if necessary to Provinces	Oct 29	

14

### Annex 3: Follow-up Workplan for LMIS TEAM

4. Determine Resource Requirements from MCH-FP	MOH LMIS Team	List of support needed/perhaps a workplan to ensure provision of support	As soon as Possible	Follow-up Plan for provision of support including communication with provinces necessary
5. Install computer module for Logistics Data	CDC LMIS Team	Logistics Program for Forms A, B, C, D.	April	Dependent on smooth operation of manual program and finalization of forms.
6. Establish Evaluation Indicators	MOH/CDC/MSH LMIS Team	List of Criteria	Prior to initial evaluation	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Evaluation of months of supply</li> <li>2. Schedule?</li> <li>3. Schedule kept?</li> <li>4. Data entry?</li> <li>5. Staff skills in using program</li> </ol>

15