

PD-ABG-858
84565

FINAL REPORT

**Botswana Workforce and Skills Training Project
Phase II (BWAST II)**

Contract number: 633-0241-C-00-8003-00

Contract period: November 6, 1987 - December 12, 1992

Issued September 28, 1993

Authors

Dave Benedetti

Helen Wilson Chason

Ray Kelley

Thandi Molefe

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
II.	OVERVIEW	
A.	BWAST Project, Core Contracts And Delivery Orders	10
B.	Strategic Objective And Primary Targets	12
C.	Employment Trends 1985 - 1991	12
III.	MANAGEMENT OF TRAINING	
A.	Introduction	14
B.	Training Officer's Meetings	15
C.	Development of a Management of Training System	16
D.	Training Institutions	18
E.	Problems	19
F.	Association of Training and Development Officers	20
G.	USAID Sponsored Donors' Meetings on Training	21
IV.	PARTICIPANT TRAINING	
A.	Overview	23
B.	Long-term Training	23
C.	Short-term Training	27
D.	Third-Country Training	27
E.	Follow-on Activities	27
F.	Observations and Recommendations	33
V.	LOCALLY FINANCED ACTIVITIES	
A.	In-Country Training 1988 - 1990	36
B.	Personnel, Workload and Procedural Changes 1990 - 1991	37
C.	Establishment of the BWAST Project Committee	38
D.	Implementation of PILS	39
VI.	LONG- AND SHORT-TERM TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	
A.	Operational Experts	50
B.	Consultants	67
VII.	PROJECT IMPACT	
A.	Original Logical Framework FY 86 to FY 94	70
B.	Assessment of Project Impact	71

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

A. OVERVIEW

The goal of the BWAST II Project was "to provide expatriate personnel to fill technical and professional manpower deficits within the Botswana public and private sectors while at the same time arranging long- and/or short-term training for nationals". There was some overlap with the predecessor to the BWAST II project; the original BWAST Project (now referred to as BWAST I), commenced in 1982 and had a PACD of September 1989. The Botswana Workforce and Skills Training Project, Phase II (BWAST II) had a contract period of November 6, 1987 - December 12, 1992. A core contract provided funding to AED to recruit and provide administrative support for long- and short-term technicians and to provide placement services and administrative support to long- and short-term, third-country and U.S. participant training programs.

Overall management of the project was accomplished by the Mission through the issuance of delivery orders to AED. Technicians and trainees were selected by DPSM, for the public sector, and BOCCIM, for the private sector, with the concurrence of the Mission.

In late 1990, the process for utilizing funds available through Project Implementation Letters (PIL) was revised substantially with the establishment of the BWAST Project Committee. The Committee, consisting of representatives from BOCCIM, MLHA, DPSM and USAID, was responsible for reviewing and approving quarterly program plans submitted by BOCCIM and DPSM. AED served as the Committee's Secretariat, provided the Chairperson and acted as the paying agent for PIL activities. This participative planning and review process overcame some problems which had developed in the late 1980's, especially in regard to tracking in-country training performance and funding.

In October 1991, after an extensive review of its Program Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting System under USAID/Washington's Assessment of Program Impact (API) initiative, the Mission's strategic objective for private enterprise development projects, including BWAST II, became "increased employment for Botswana in non-mining and off-farm sectors".

The three primary targets specified were:

- Improved policy environment for promoting private investment and employment in non-traditional sectors;
- Increased citizen skills for private sector development; and
- Private sector identification of and investment in business opportunities.

The introduction of the API strategic objective and the three principal targets more clearly reflected the actual focus of the BWAST II project and its emphasis on direct hands-on assistance to business through BOCCIM and BDC and its focus on policy analysis and implementation.

B. PROJECT INPUTS, OUTPUTS and IMPACT

BWAST II had four major components: Management of Training, International Participant Training, In-country Training and Development Activities, and Long and Short-term Technical Assistance.

Management of Training was not specifically addressed in AED's core contract. However, it soon became apparent that, if the training components of the project were to be successfully achieved, a management of training system had to be developed and that training coordinators had to be educated in training needs assessment and planning. The process, started during BWAST I for the public sector, was strengthened during BWAST II and the concepts were extended to the private sector with the following results:

- A fully institutionalized management of training system has been established within the public sector under the leadership of DPSM.
- All members of the DPSM training department are Batswana who have received training.
- All but about two of the thirty government training officers reporting to DPSM are Batswana who have received specialized training in courses, many of which were developed and implemented by BWAST OPEXers and the AED Training Directors.
- Training Briefings are now held monthly by DPSM for Government Training Officers with representatives from BOCCIM, ATDO and selected donor organizations attending.
- A fully institutionalized management of training system has been established at BOCCIM for utilizing donor and other funds to support private sector training scholarships.
- Private sector training needs have been surveyed and procedures for annual updates of needs have been established.
- Reviews have been made, and others are planned, to examine the capacity, course offerings and quality of local and regional training institutions, including those offering correspondence courses.
- The BOCCIM Training Officer and Secretary have assumed full responsibility for the BOCCIM Training Department.
- Local training institutions, including those in the private sector, have been provided with guidance from BOCCIM on what the Botswana private sector desires in the way of training to enable these institutions to successfully bid against outsiders on BOCCIM contracted training programs and to develop their own courses to offer the public directly.
- Through ATDO, a series of four symposia have been run on:

- On-the-Job Training
 - Training, Development and Localization to 2000AD
 - Management of Training
 - Evaluation of Training
- Working with the former USAID Human Resources Development Officer, a series of four meetings were held with donor organizations to discuss their training programs and plans.

International Participant Training was a major component of the AED core contract. Its objective was to "emphasize training (in the U.S. or Africa) in skills which foster employment generation".

- A total of 179 (169 in U.S. and 10 in the region) individuals were trained outside Botswana under BWAST II; eighty from the private sector and ninety-nine from the public sector. Of the total, 29% were women, 13% went to HBCUs and 99.4% returned to Botswana. Four participants failed to complete their programs, three for poor academic performance and one for medical reasons.
- 126 participants will complete long term training under BWAST II (of which 20 will complete after December 1992) in 25 fields of study. The leading five fields included: Business, Economics, Engineering and Construction, Public Affairs and Management. Of the degrees awarded, 53 were Masters, 57 Bachelors, 13 Associates degrees and three were diplomas.
- Approximately two-thirds of the long-term participants completed their programs ahead of original Delivery Order schedules.
- Under BWAST II, 43 MOE Trust Fund Participants completed long-term degree programs in the U.S. In July 1992, the Ministry transferred the management of the remaining 41 Trust Fund students to the Embassy of Botswana. This transfer was effected August 31, 1992.

In-Country Training and Development Activities handled locally through PILs became a significant component of the BWAST II project, particularly after establishment of the BWAST Project Committee. Significant outputs of this component were:

- During the BWAST II core contract period, 2,937 persons received in-country training as compared to 1,156 during BWAST I. Of the total, 1,648 received training in 1991 and 1,289 in 1992.
- Of the total, two thirds were from the private sector.

- BOCCIM originally allocated three-fourths of its in-country budget for scholarships to existing local courses. However, management perceived that these courses were not meeting critical private sector needs and were of widely varying quality. Consequently, in 1991, the emphasis changed to BOCCIM contracted courses. Almost 70 percent of the BOCCIM supported trainees enrolled in such contracted courses in 1991 and 1992. Not only were employers and employees better satisfied, but the cost per person per course was reduced by over one-third.
- Through the Committee meetings, both DPSM and BOCCIM managements benefitted from an interchange of information on planning, budgeting and implementing in-country training programs. As a result, both organizations are now able to manage in-country training programs with a minimum of outside assistance.
- BOCCIM financed 12 scholarship for regional training under PILs.
- Other activities financed by BOCCIM under the PILs are listed below.
 1. Three surveys of training needs, quality and training institution capacity. In addition to providing basic information for preparing private sector training strategies, the surveys provided valuable information on BOCCIM members' perceptions of barriers, challenges and opportunities in Botswana and implications for Government and private and private sector programs.
 2. Four IESC consultancies: two to strengthen B-MAP, and one each to provide assistance to ABCON and BOCCIM's Public Relations office. The consultancies were successful in that B-MAP was rejuvenated after almost one year of slow-down and private sector contributions to the program rose sharply. BOCCIM's promotional program became more effective and ABCON took a stronger role in lobbying for changes in Government tendering procedures and met with notable success.
 3. Three seminars/workshops including the Second Private Sector Conference in Francistown and a State of the Economy Seminar in Gaborone. More than 150 issues and recommendations came out of the Francistown Conference. The Government of Botswana is currently reviewing the proceedings of the Conference which were prepared and distributed by BOCCIM. A response is anticipated shortly. The proceedings of the State of the Economy seminar have not yet been completed. Since few Government of Botswana senior officials attended that seminar, its impact is unlikely to be as great as the larger, better attended, Francistown Conference.

4. The establishment of a Business-Education Partnership Program aimed at implementing a set of activities (training, attachments, materials development, and evaluation research) designed to assist administrators, teachers and students to understand the world of work, especially that of the private sector. The aim is to strengthen the relationship between employers and educators for the long term benefit of Botswana.

- Activities supported by DPSM included:

1. The preparation, publishing and distribution of two volumes in the "Preparing for Jobs" series:
 - "Correspondence Courses for Botswana" (1988)
 - "Directory of Selected African Training Institutions" (1990)

The two directories were published and distributed at no charge, to Government training officers through DPSM and to private sector training officers through ATDO. The Directory on Correspondence Courses was used by both GoB and BOCCIM in approving several scholarships for correspondence courses. The Correspondence Directory is being updated with greater emphasis on training opportunities in South Africa. This will provide DPSM with a basis for approving accredited courses.

The Directory of Selected African Training Institutions has had limited use as a basis for providing scholarships. As noted earlier, only twelve scholarships were awarded under PIL 8/9 for regional training. The Directory does not include training facilities in the Republic of South Africa, a serious shortcoming. BOCCIM has done some limited reviews of training facilities available in South Africa and has encouraged appropriate organizations to bid on contract training financed by BOCCIM. A substantial number of contracts were let to South African firms in 1991-1992. DPSM's policy not to use South African training firms is under, given the changes taking place in South Africa.

2. The establishment of a program aimed at establishing a system for accrediting Botswana training institutions, courses, awards and awarding organization. The first phase of this program was to examine the problem, suggest an appropriate system for Botswana, and to design a pilot study to test the proposed design. This phase has been completed and the pilot study is underway. The second phase, now underway, will complete the pilot study to test the proposed accreditation program. If successful, the program will be implemented in Phase III.

Long and Short Term Technical Assistance was a major factor in increasing private sector employment in Botswana, improving the policy environment for private sector development and strengthening training institutions within the country. Some of the identified results of this component are as follows:

- OPEXer support was provided to three activities, one at BOCCIM and two at BDC, which totaled approximately \$1.5 million, created or saved roughly 6,500 jobs, and generated almost P140 million in new investments. An estimated 5,000 additional jobs are expected to be created as projects now underway develop to their planned capacities.
- Major contributions were made to improve the policy environment of Botswana through OPEXer support to the Macro-Economic Planning activity at the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning:
 1. The initiation, preparation and promotion of the *Revised Income Policy* which Minister Mogae spoke of in his 1992 Budget Speech as "an essential component of the set of Government policies which include monetary and fiscal policy, financial sector policy and an improved industrial development strategy, intended to promote private sector development". This policy revision was approved by the National Assembly in September 1990. Many of the policy changes not requiring legislation have been implemented. Those requiring legislation have been implemented less rapidly or have not yet been implemented.
 2. The reactivation and strengthening of the Regulations Review Committee "to monitor change in legislation and regulations to ensure that they conform to established policy". Since March 1990, RRC has reviewed legislation and policy dealing with:
 - Work permits
 - Residence permits
 - Industrial licenses
 - Trade licensing
 - Employment legislation
 - Trade disputes legislation
 - Trade Unions and employers organization legislation
 - Occupational safety and health legislation
 - Civil aviation

Progress on virtually all issues has been made; however, it often takes a great deal of time to implement new policies, especially those that require legislation and represent a significant departure from previous policies.

3. A substantial impact on the fiscal and monetary policies implemented in Botswana through the preparation of National Development Plans, and Budgetary Guidelines and Development Strategies. As a result, Botswana's public finances are sound, a crucial ingredient for the enabling environment for private sector development.
- Improved implementation of key programs in public, private and parastatal sectors through assignment of OPEX personnel to the Central Statistical Office, BRIDEC, PAMA, RIIC, Selebi Phikwe Town Council, DPSM and Ministries of Local Government and Lands, Health, and Commerce and Industry.
 - Providing training support to the policy creation and program implementation function through OPEXer support at institutions which include:
 - Botswana Polytechnic
 - Wildlife Training Center
 - Institute of Development Management
 - Botswana Agricultural College
 - Department of Agricultural Research (MOA)
 - Office of Technical Education (MOE)
 - Ministry of Health
 - Botswana Institute of Administration and Commerce
 - BRIDEC
 - Providing 17 short-term consultants to support the on-going work of OPEXers or to supplement a special initiative in a BWAST-funded agency, all with the objectives of strengthening workforce skills and generating income and employment.

C. SUGGESTED FOLLOW-ON ACTIVITIES

Management of Training

- Encourage one or more training institutions to re-introduce a "Teaching Skills" course modeled after the one offered at IDM from 1988-1990.
- Encourage DPSM to update the "Preparing for Jobs" series reports which includes "Directory of Selected African Training Institutions", 1990 and "Training Opportunities in Botswana", 1987.
- The BOCCIM report "Management of Training", drafted by Currie and Betz in 1989, was never published because the BOCCIM Training Advisor wanted to publish it in two volumes: one for training officers and one for chief executives. This two-volume guide should be completed and broadly disseminated.
- ATDO should be encouraged to hold a series of half-day or evening workshops for training officers and training institutions to discuss management of training and to jointly

define private and public sector training needs and how they can be satisfied. Discussion groups with senior business executives should also be encouraged.

- The Accreditation Program Reference Group should continue its activities until a National Structure of Vocational Awards has been established, possibly based on Jack Mansell's *Report to the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education, Vocational Education and Training in Botswana*.
- The BOCCIM/ Ministry of Education "Business-Education Partnership" programs should be given the highest priority and be incorporated into the Basic Education Consolidation (BEC) Project.

Employment and Investment Generation

- The Mission should continue to place high priority on providing direct assistance to BOCCIM's Management Assistance Program and the restructured B-MAP activity to assist small and medium businesses to develop, expand and strengthen.
- Similarly, high priority should continue to be given to BDC's Property Development and Industrial Programs.

Improving the Policy Environment

- The BWAST policy reform activities seem to indicate that policy reforms can be made most effectively through the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning's Division of Economic Affairs rather than through the functional ministries, particularly in those ministries where senior management is resisting reform or is not particularly interested in policy issues. Future placement of policy advisors should be made accordingly.
- The BPED long-term policy analyst advisors, where possible, should focus on policy reforms which can be made without a requirement for enabling legislation. Some of Kopstein's suggestions for greater involvement of the private sector in the Accelerated Land Servicing Program (ALSP) and resource mobilization and financial institution development, for example, could benefit the country immensely and demonstrate the effectiveness of joint business - government ventures.
- Encouraging the development of private schools, especially senior secondary schools, is another important policy area which BOCCIM should consider. According to businessmen interviewed recently, the lack of educational facilities for expatriates is considered a major impediment in trying to recruit top and middle management personnel with families.
- BOCCIM should be discouraged from asking for government subsidies, special concessions, trade protection and other "Government hand-outs". At both the

Francistown Private Sector Conference and the Gaborone State of the Economy Seminar, trade protection and subsidies were a recurrent theme of several BOCCIM senior officials and others.

- BOCCIM as a member of the RRC, NEMIC and similar committees, should take a greater leadership role in policy reform. Representatives should come to these meetings well prepared to address the issues. By doing its "homework", BOCCIM's voice will be more respected and consequently have more influence. A major role of the long term policy advisor at BOCCIM should be to see that BOCCIM representatives are well prepared for such Committee meetings.

Increased Citizen Skills

Long-Term Participant Training - Although the Mission will no longer be supporting a major long-term participant training program (now known as Thomas Jefferson Scholarships), there will be several participants selected in most of its portfolio of projects. Mission personnel and its contractors might wish to consider the following:

- In the last two years, education budget cutbacks in some states have affected participant training programs. At some state universities, shrinking education budgets have resulted in fewer course offerings, overworked faculty and in a few cases, cancellation of specific degree programs. Fortunately, most participant programs were not drastically affected by these changes. However, the declining availability of both courses and faculty advisement did result in delayed completion dates for some participants.
- Employers, as well as participants, must be encouraged to make professional commitments to whatever training program is undertaken and to actively monitor and support the participant during training. This involves effectively communicating with the participant through the use of Workplace Activity Reports and other correspondence. Additionally, employers must be strongly encouraged to stand-by their agreements to continue salary payments and other support. Participants should also be given time to have re-orientation briefings and discussions, perhaps through the establishment of BOCCIM/DPSM re-orientation committees.
- BOCCIM and DPSM should encourage two-year Associate Degree programs when appropriate.
- Engineering, architecture and pharmacy are difficult fields for Batswana. It is recommended that greater flexibility for duration of program be given or that participants be required to complete one or two years with a C+ average at the University of Botswana in a Math/Science curriculum prior to being placed in one of these fields in the United States.

In-Country Training

- BOCCIM should continue to encourage local private sector training institutions to develop courses required by Botswana business. It should not compete by putting on its own training courses except in very special situations.
- BOCCIM should encourage private companies to pick up a greater share of the cost of training courses provided through BOCCIM contracts.

II. OVERVIEW

A. BWAST PROJECT, CORE CONTRACTS and DELIVERY ORDERS

The second Botswana Workforce and Skills Training (BWAST II) Project was established at the request of the Government of Botswana (GoB) in 1986 with a PACD of May 1994. BWAST II was a follow-on to BWAST (established in 1982 with a PACD of September 1989). With the initiation of BWAST II, the original BWAST project was referred to as the BWAST I project and will be so named in this report.

The Academy for Educational Development (AED) was awarded the BWAST II core contract in November 1987 with a completion date of December 12, 1992. AED also had a BWAST I core contract which ran from late 1982 until the end of December 1987. Both AED contracts are referred to as core contracts as they merely funded the AED administrative support services needed to carry out the project's training and technical assistance activities which were, in turn, funded by specific delivery orders.

The AED BWAST II core contract required AED to accomplish the following through the delivery order process:

- recruit and provide administrative support for long-term operational expert (OPEX) personnel in Botswana.
- recruit and provide administrative support for short-term consultants.
- provide placement services and administrative support for short and long-term, in-country, third-country and U.S. training programs.
- assume responsibility for all participants in training and all OPEX personnel placed in Botswana under the previous contract, an estimated 117 participants and 26 OPEX personnel.

It is important to differentiate between the BWAST I and BWAST II projects and contracts. The projects overlapped for nearly three years. Many of the students and OPEXers funded by a

BWAST I project delivery order were actually supported by both BWAST I and BWAST II core contract personnel. Similarly BWAST II project delivery orders were issued well before the BWAST II core contract was awarded. For example, BWAST I students were still at universities in the U.S. in May 1991, over three years after the start of the BWAST II contract. Also, the first BWAST II project long-term operational expert started in September 1986 and was supported for over two years by AED under the BWAST I core contract.

This Final Report on BWAST II addresses the work done under the BWAST II core contract during the last five years with emphasis on those activities funded under the BWAST II project.

From the above, it should be noted that the contractor, AED, played an almost entirely administrative support role. This was particularly true throughout the BWAST I contract and for the first two-and-one-half years of the BWAST II contract.

The Mission essentially directed the technical aspects of the project through the issuance of delivery orders. The organizational locations, job descriptions and schedules of short and long-term technicians were approved by the Mission at the request of various public, parastatal and private organizations. Individual consultants were selected by the employing organization, with the Mission's approval, from a list of candidates submitted in alphabetical order by AED.

Once a long term operational expert (OPEX) took a position, he/she became an employee of the requesting organization and was expected to act accordingly. This was clearly stated in AED's Letter of Agreement with the OPEXer which was approved by the REDSO/ESA Contract's office at the commencement of the BWAST II contract. "The OPEX shall be an employee of the Employer and not the Agency for International Development (AID) or the Academy"... "All questions and disputes concerning the conditions and terms of employment shall be matters between the Employer and [OPEX] Contractor. The Academy may not intervene in such matters". The final OPEXer was placed in July 1990.

In addition to establishing organizational priorities for technical assistance through delivery orders, the Mission reserved BWAST II Project funds for programs and consultancies it administered directly. This procedure was basically altered in late 1990 with the establishment of a BWAST II Project Committee. The Committee consisted of representatives from BOCCIM, DPSM, MLHA and USAID. AED served as the Secretariat. The Committee reviewed and approved DPSM's and BOCCIM's quarterly plans for in-country training, surveys, evaluations, regional and international short-term training, technical assistance, workshops and seminars, and allocated funds among project activities based on total funds available in the approved Project Implementation Letters (PIL).

Subsequent sections of this report will describe and critically review the various elements of the BWAST II project in further detail. The point to be made here is that the AED staff had a relatively minor role in establishing priorities and overall direction of the BWAST projects.

In the case of international training, participants were selected by DPSM, for the public sector, and by BOCCIM, for the private and parastatal sectors; the Mission approved all final candidates. Once selected, AED provided necessary orientation, training, guidance and placement services, as well as continuing administrative and logistical support. The final five participant trainees were placed at U.S. educational institutions in early 1991; four were short-term trainees.

B. STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE and PRIMARY TARGETS

Although unstated in the BWAST II Project Design, the Strategic Objective of BWAST II, as well as other Mission private sector development initiatives, was "Increased employment for Batswana in non-mining and off-farm sectors". To achieve that objective, the Project focused on three primary targets:

1. Improved policy environment for promoting private investment and employment in non-traditional sectors;
2. Increased citizen skills for private sector development; and
3. Private sector identification of and investment in business opportunities.

The objective and targets were articulated after an intensive two-week exercise by the Mission in late October 1991 in which it reviewed its Program Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting System as part of USAID/W'S Assessment of Program Impact (API) initiative.

Prior to that, the Project was guided by a goal and purpose of a more general nature spelled out in the December 1985 Project Design Logical Framework as follows:

Goal: To assist the GoB's efforts in job formation.
Purpose: Increase the number of trained Batswana in positions which foster employment generation.

The API objective and targets clarified the private sector development aspects of the project. BWAST II incorporated direct private sector training and technical assistance as well as indirect private sector assistance to improve those portions of the public sector impacting most directly on the private sector.

In addition, the API exercise emphasized that the sole purpose of the project was not training as such (although properly directed training continued to be a principal target). Policy reform and investment projects were specifically recognized as principal targets to achieve increased employment of Batswana.

C. EMPLOYMENT TRENDS 1985 - 1991

Increasing employment was of particular concern at the commencement of BWAST II. Despite the remarkable growth in real gross domestic product (average of 12 percent annually

in the twenty years since Independence), over one-half of the working age population in 1985 were unemployed, or employed (mostly underemployed) in traditional agriculture.

During the first half of the 1980's total formal employment had increased at a rate of slightly over eight percent. However, the GoB projected that growth would slow to 5.7 percent between 1985 and 1991, and that the number of underemployed and economically inactive would continue to increase.

The GoB's concern about employment was reflected not only in the project goal stated in the Logical Framework (December 1985) but also in its Measure of Goal Achievement which was that the rate of non-Government job creation would equal or exceed NDP.6 (1985 - 1991) projections of 5.6%.

Had this been the appropriate "measure of effectiveness" for BWAST II, the project would be one of the pre-emanate success stories of the decade. Private sector employment actually increased by an average of 14.8 percent per year. The percentage of private sector employment to total formal sector employment increased from 54 percent to 63 percent from September 1985 to September 1991 while government (local and central) employment fell from 39 percent to 31 percent of the total during the same period.

NDP.6 projected a total employment in the formal sector of 160,000 by 1991. The actual formal sector employment in that year is estimated to be 229,000, a difference of 69,000 persons. Thus, in five years the percentage of persons in the labor force under or unemployed or working in traditional agriculture may have dropped by over 20 percent and represent about 41 percent of the labor force versus 53 percent in 1985.

While these achievements are impressive, unemployment of Batswana still remains a most serious issue. The number of new entrants to the labor force climbs annually. Many are unemployable, the product of an ineffective basic education system. Due to insufficient senior secondary education and training facilities and programs, only a small percentage are able to continue with further education or training.

The lack of a properly trained work force is an important aspect of unemployment. However, skills training is no assurance of work. Jobs must also be available, preferably in a productive, competitive private sector.

The BWAST II project has therefore placed increasing emphasis in recent years on encouraging competitive private sector growth. The major changes in focus are described in the sections that follow but are summarized here.

- Greater emphasis on short, in-country and third-country management and vocational training.
- A heavier emphasis on policy reform as opposed to academic institutional development.

- Establishment of closer linkages between the private and public sector to encourage policy dialogue.
- Active promotion of Botswana internationally as an investment location.
- Identification and promotion of specific investment projects at home and abroad.
- Proactive, hands-on direct technical assistance to small and medium businesses throughout Botswana.
- Improving the relevance and quality of local training provided to Botswana in both the private and public sector.

III. MANAGEMENT OF TRAINING

A. INTRODUCTION

The responsibility for the management of training, through the BWAST Project, had been originally defined as providing assistance to design, implement and coordinate training activities. As the project progressed, there was a slight shift in responsibility because it was clear that the ministries needed additional support in developing training plans and in professionalizing training and staff development functions. Under the BWAST II project, AED saw its role and responsibility to be one of institutionalizing a management of training system for both the public and private sectors in Botswana by working jointly with BOCCIM and its Training Committee, the Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM) and other Government Ministries, private and parastatal companies and local training institutions. In general, this meant that AED's role was:

- Articulate a Management of Training system within Botswana with DPSM, BOCCIM, ATDO, USAID, and others; develop instructional materials related to the management of training; design and implement training courses which strengthen the management of training.
- Train training coordinators in job skill areas; work to institutionalize a process so that the Management of Training system could be maintained in spite of personnel changes; act as a consultant/resource for training coordinators on various training issues including BWAST training requests.
- Provide technical assistance to DPSM and BOCCIM on staff training issues; work closely with BOCCIM so that it can become a coordinating body for managing training within the private sector.

- Increase the ability of the training institutions to be responsive to the needs of their consumers with workshops and certificate, diploma, and degree courses; foster a quantitative as well as qualitative increase in courses offered; strengthen training institutions to increase their ability to offer wider range of courses within Botswana.

By the beginning of the BWAST II Project, the Government of Botswana began to seriously consider the need for the further development and strengthening of a management of training system for the entire public sector. The basic components of such a system, policy planning, coordination and management, training design and implementation, and evaluation components had long been in place. Additional components needed included:

- Clear articulation of a system on the part of the Public Sector;
- Awareness and strengthening of the inter-relationships within the system;
- Identification and elimination of weaknesses within the system;
- Further professionalism of a corps of training coordinators in each Ministry;
- Development of DPSM staff to assume leadership in the management of the system;
- Development of an appreciation for the importance of a system and an awareness of responsibilities for its functioning throughout government;
- Development of a National Training Policy and;
- Further development of training plans and written materials for training coordinators and others.

B. TRAINING OFFICERS' MEETINGS

Based on the success of the Training Officers' meetings enjoyed under BWAST I, these meetings are held at more frequent intervals of once a month under BWAST II and were coordinated and chaired by the Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM). Under BWAST II, the representation at these meetings broadened to include representatives from BOCCIM, ATDO, USAID, British Council, and some local training institutions.

Discussions at these meetings included developing training plans, sharing resources for training between the public and private sectors, past and future events related to training, and sharing advice on specific issues of training both in the private and public sectors.

The BWAST Training Director received notices and invitations to participate in these meetings in specific ways to strengthen the management of training component of this project. All

members of the DPSM training department, who chair the meetings, are locals and only two, out of thirty, government training officers who attend these meetings are expatriates. The BWAST Training Director, has, therefore, assumed an observer/advisor role rather than that of implementor as was the case under the BWAST I Project.

It is also through these meetings that the Private Sector, through BOCCIM, was able to successfully acquire a portion of donor funds given to DPSM for use by the public sector. This strengthened the training programs in the private sector and facilitated more shared training projects (and more communication) between the public and private sectors. Credit for this strengthened relationship goes to the BWAST project.

C. DEVELOPMENT of a MANAGEMENT of TRAINING SYSTEM

The BWAST II project focused on specific areas in the development of a management of training system in Botswana. Three of these areas are discussed below.

The Public and Private Sectors Under the BWAST II project, a Management of Training System with DPSM, BOCCIM, USAID, Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs was articulated. The BWAST Project Committee, established 1991, was charged with reviewing and approving training plans from BOCCIM and DPSM, mainly for in-country and regional training (although a few requests were approved for international training for the private sector). It also streamlined the use of BWAST II funds allocated to BOCCIM and DPSM and, with AED as the Secretariat, both the private and public sectors were kept abreast of issues related to the management of training. This system gave both the public and private sectors access to information which enabled them to develop and implement well designed training plans and ensured that clear reporting systems were followed. Through the work of the Committee, several instructional materials related to the management of training were either up-dated or developed. These included the "Report on Private Sector Training Needs Survey", "Report on Private Sector Training Institution Quality Survey", "Report on Local and Regional Training Institution Capacity" and an update to the "Correspondence Programmes for Botswana".

Throughout the life of the project, AED maintained a clearing house of books and other materials related to training and noticed a substantial increase each year in the number of government ministries and private companies requesting information related to their capacity to manage training. There was also continued use of the Manual for Training Coordinators developed under BWAST I.

Training Coordinators Under BWAST I, the project pledged to train training coordinators in job skill areas; work to institutionalize a process so that the Management of Training system could be maintained in spite of personnel changes; act as a consultant/ resource for training coordinators on various training issues including BWAST training requests. The Training Coordination course at the Institute of Development Management (IDM), started by an OPEXer under the BWAST project, continues to be offered, long after the OPEXer's departure. Under BWAST II (1988 - 1992), seventy eight (78) training coordinators attended this course and this was in addition to the forty seven (47) trained under BWAST I. This shows resources well

targeted and used. It is important to note that this course continued to be taught even after the departure of the OPEXer's counterpart. The course has indeed, been institutionalized. The Director of Training of the BWAST II project on several occasions acted as a resource person on various training issues to IDM, BOCCIM and other government Ministries.

Technical Assistance Nine OPEXers worked with Government Ministries in various advisory capacities under the BWAST II Project. This had an indirect impact on stream-lining DPSM's activities related to training. Most of the OPEXers had counterparts who benefitted from the BWAST II project through off-site or on-the-job training. This contributed towards the management of training component of the BWAST II project.

From May 1988 through May 1990, an OPEXer was assigned to BOCCIM to assist in the establishment of BOCCIM's Training Department. Substantial progress was made, although the counterpart and present Training Officer was in the U.S. as a participant trainee.

In 1990, the BOCCIM training committee assumed full responsibility for selecting candidates for training. BOCCIM decided to exclude from its membership USAID representatives, including AED as a USAID contractor. This was an indication that, through the BWAST Projects, BOCCIM felt that it had gained enough capability to maintain a system of the management of training. In mid-1990, a second OPEXer was posted to BOCCIM as Training Advisor from 1990-92, to replace the previous Advisor. He worked closely with BOCCIM's training department to make BOCCIM a coordinating body for managing training within the private sector. His remarkable work under the component of management of training leaves in place today:

- trained counterpart and secretary to assume full responsibility for the running of the training department;
- developed training programs;
- strategic and operating plans to guide the work of the department.
- a computerized training administration system which provides reliable and quick responses to all parties involved in the process of training. This system has made easy the processes of tracking trainees; use of funds and general information on training for the private sector.

The BWAST II Training Director worked closely with the OPEXer in preparing for the re-entry and orientation of the counterpart on her completion of studies in the U.S. in 1991.

Through the BWAST II Project Review Committee, both DPSM and BOCCIM benefitted from exchange on how best to draw plans and budgets for project implementation. These skills will

remain with both organizations since they were represented by local counterparts and/or, locals in authority.

D. TRAINING INSTITUTIONS

The BWAST II project had a positive impact on increasing the ability of the training institutions to be responsive to the needs of their consumers. This was accomplished largely by providing technical assistance to training institutions e.g. IDM, BIAC, the Polytechnic and UB. The OPEXers posted at these institutions have worked with designated counterparts to:

- provide on-the-job training for counterparts in areas of carrying out needs assessment; planning/designing implementing and evaluating specific client-based courses. At IDM, a course in "Teaching Skills" for trainers of various institutions was started by an OPEXer and the course was run on an annual basis until 1990. From 1988-1990, fifty one trainers attended this course. Unfortunately, this course is also an example of one of the unfortunate experiences of the OPEXer/Counterpart relationship under the BWAST project. The OPEXer left in 1990, his counterpart resigned in the same year and with both of them gone, the capacity to run the course was lost. In 1991, the course was not even advertised by the institution because there was no one to teach it. In 1992, the course was advertised again. Eighteen trainers applied for attendance but still the course could not be run because there was no one to teach it. If the course had been run, a total of thirty eight trainers would have benefitted from it.
In an effort to foster a quantitative as well as a qualitative increase in courses offered by training institutions and to strengthen training institutions in an effort to increase their ability to offer a wider range of courses within Botswana, the second OPEXer based at BOCCIM designed and managed:

1. The first national private sector training institution quality survey.
2. The first local and regional training institution capacity survey.
3. The first general meeting between BOCCIM and its Training Contractors.

Since the beginning of BWAST II, there had been talk about local institutions lacking the capacity to train quality people for the private sector because the local institutions were more oriented towards the public service in course content. Also, they offered courses during the day (when the private industry cannot afford to release its people) and they offered courses lasting far too long a time e.g. up to eight consecutive weeks or more (as is the case with IDM and BIAC) and the private industry cannot afford to release its employees for this amount of time.

The two surveys on training institutional capacity and quality, then, were a much needed response to these concerns and they provided tangible results on which institutions could base their arguments for a change of approach in training.

Some attempt was made, under BWAST II, to try and strengthen IDM's ability to offer a range of courses that would cater for the private sector, at the times that the private industry could release its people and to offer courses whose content was discussed by both the client (private sector) and the training institution (IDM).

An OPEXer at IDM started offering evening courses in Supervisory Management and Small Business Enterprise. Although these courses generated a lot of interest within the business community and were popular, there were some logistical problems with the training institution, because it was a "day" institution. However, the Small Business Management course did run twice in 1989 with a total attendance of twenty eight (28) trainees. The Supervisory Management course also ran twice in 1990, with an attendance of forty-two (42) trainees.

Although the OPEXer had trained a local counterpart, he also left the training institution soon after the OPEXer's departure and no other similar courses have been run by the institution. What can be said and emphasized about these courses is that they were well received by the private sector and, undoubtedly, contributed to the mushrooming, soon thereafter, of similar courses run by other smaller, private training institutions.

Through the BWAST II project, it was realized that it is possible to diversify training resources and channel them to where they are most needed. In addition to these attempts at strengthening the training institutions and contributing towards the management of training, in general, the BWAST II Director of Training was invited on several occasions to make presentations on issues related to training.

E. PROBLEMS

The relationship between the OPEXers and their counterparts remained a problem under BWAST II. This problem was multi-faceted.

- The OPEXer might come on board long after the counterpart has departed for training so there would be no hand-over of duties and responsibilities.

As stated in the BWAST I final report, the Government continued to regard OPEXers, not as temporary replacements of officers who have gone for training, but as fully-fledged expert employees. This resulted in a diversion in OPEXer's duties to include duties which were not generally carried out by the counterpart. As a result, the Government became more dependent on the OPEXer and even after the counterpart had returned from training, the government was willing to request an "extension" of the OPEXer's contract. This, in most cases, defeated the purpose of the OPEXer/Counterpart arrangement and resulted in demoralized counterparts who frequently resigned from their posts, taking with them the academic skills and experience gained through the BWAST II project.

- Due to frequent, often unwarranted, transfers of officers within the public sector, an OPEXer sometimes had to change counterparts during the two years of service. This disrupted the smooth transfer of knowledge and experience.
- There was seldom adequate overlap; between OPEXer's departure and the counterpart's return from training. This resulted in a waste of resources and caused frustration on the part of the counterpart who needed all the help he/she could get at re-entry into the workplace.

Some improvement was made under BWAST II, most notably in the case of the BOCCIM training officer and Training Advisor, but there was still much room for improvement at the end of the project.

F. ASSOCIATION of TRAINING and DEVELOPMENT OFFICERS (ATDO)

Although the ATDO did not play as an important role in the project as was originally envisaged, it did make several important contributions to the Management of Training with the help of BWAST II OPEXers and the local AED office staff.

- The former Executive Secretary of the ATDO completed project-funded short-term training in the U.S. which included an internship with the *American Society of Association Executives*. Upon his return from training he incorporated ideas he acquired during training on how to improve membership drives and how to maintain links with several American associations. To date, the office of the ATDO is receiving information, on a regular basis, from associations in the U.S. and this helps in strengthening the ATDO.
- An OPEXer acted as Director of the ATDO, on a part-time basis, from 1988-1990.
- The AED Training Director served on the Executive Council of the ATDO from 1990 - 1992, attended all general meetings and contributed towards maintaining the ATDO's role in supporting the management of training in Botswana. She was also involved in organizing a one-day seminar for the ATDO on "Evaluation of Training".
- The AED Chief-of-Party, two Training Officers and two OPEXers were members of the ATDO Symposium Planning Committees in 1990 and assisted in the preparation and implementation of 1991 symposia. The OPEXers specifically used their expertise in program planning and scheduling and in the selection of appropriate topics and presenters. Some participants to the ATDO symposia were funded through the BWAST II In-Country Training Fund in 1988 and 1990. Symposia were run on various topics related to the management of training: 1988: On-the-Job Training, 1990: Training, Development & Localization through Year 2000, 1991: Management of Training, 1992: Evaluation of Training.

Proceedings and papers presented at these symposia are compiled into a handbook each year and distributed for future reference. The success of these symposia can be attributed to the BWAST II Project.

- The ATDO initiated discussions and expressed the need for an Accreditation System in Botswana. With strong support of AED local staff, BOCCIM, OPEXers and DPSM, the ATDO prepared a Scope of Work and obtained funding for the definition phase (Phase I) and pilot testing phase (Phase II) of the Botswana Accreditation Program (see below for further details).

G. USAID SPONSORED DONORS' MEETINGS on TRAINING

Working with the USAID Human Resources Development Officer, AED hosted a series of four meetings from 1989 through early 1992, to which all the major donor organizations with offices in Botswana were invited (see distribution list attached). The purpose of these meetings was to:

- become acquainted with other donor personnel involved in training in Botswana;
- learn, through presentations, about each of the donor training programs and plans;
- discuss key issues in the training and education sector of Botswana;
- define areas in which coordination and cooperation between donors might be useful;

Representatives of the public and private sectors (DPSM and BOCCIM), were invited to these meetings. This proved to be an asset because both were exposed, in one forum, to the operations of these donor agencies. This helped in streamlining the use of training resources to avoid duplication in funding the same projects and it also helped in the identification of areas which needed funding.

At the last donor meeting, it was agreed that these meetings were worthwhile and should be held periodically. This is an indication of one of the long lasting contributions to the management of training in the public and private sectors of Botswana, through the BWAST II project. Indeed, the Management of Training Component "has been the "glue" which has held together and has maximized the other components of the project.

List of Donor Agencies

British Council
British High Commission
Canadian High Commission
Danish Volunteer Service
Dienst Over Grenzen
European Economic Community
German Embassy
Germany Volunteer Services
Germany Agency for Technical Cooperation
Indian High Commission
Netherlands Development Organization
Norwegian Agency for International Development
Southern African Center for Cooperation in Agricultural Research
SADCC-Regional Business Council
Southern African Development Coordination Conference
Skillshare Africa
Swedish International Development Authority
United Nations Children's Funds
United Nations Development Program
United Nations Volunteers
United States Agency for International Development
United States Information Services
United States Peace Corps
World University Services of Canada

Invitees: AED (Secretariat)
 BOCCIM
 DPSM

IV. INTERNATIONAL PARTICIPANT TRAINING

A. OVERVIEW

The objective of participant training under BWAST II was to emphasize training (in the U.S. or Africa) in skills which foster employment generation". Participants were selected from public sector ministries, parastatals and the private sector. A total of 179 individuals were trained outside Botswana under BWAST II; eighty private sector employees and ninety-nine public sector employees.

Of the total, 126 participants completed long-term training in the U.S. in approximately 25 fields of study. The leading five fields of study included: Business, Economics, Engineering and Construction, Public Affairs and Hotel Management. 53 Masters degrees were awarded, 57 Bachelors degrees, 13 Associate Degrees and 3 Diplomas. Four participants completed long-term, certificate or diploma programs in Africa.

BWAST II was successful in meeting objectives to train women and to use Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs). 28% of the total number of participants trained under the project were women. The total number of long-term participants trained at HBCUs was 17/126 (13%). The HBCUs at which the participants matriculated include: Alabama A & M, Dillard University, Howard University, Kentucky State University, Morgan State University, Norfolk State University and North Carolina A & T.

Of the 179 individuals who completed training under BWAST II, 99.4% returned to Botswana. An additional four long-term participants started programs in the U.S. but had their scholarships terminated; three for poor academic performance and one for medical reasons.

B. LONG-TERM PARTICIPANT TRAINING

Selection and Placement Process

Participant selection under BWAST II was conducted by USAID, GoB and BOCCIM. Criteria included job training needs critical to manpower development, localization, and income and employment generation. Initial screening by GoB, USAID and BOCCIM included review of the candidates' academic credentials to confirm whether they met the minimum requirements for placement in a degree program in the U.S. and to also confirm that their training objectives could not be met in-country or regionally.

The Associate Director from Washington made a 3-4 week trip each year to Gaborone to meet with selected candidates and their training officers or employers. The purpose of these meetings was to clarify training objectives, discuss the system of American education and to review specific university catalogues to find appropriate programs together. The candidate's current and future job responsibilities were discussed at length to determine which type of program would be most appropriate and whether supplemental training would be needed.

In addition, the Associate Director conducted two seminars in Gaborone; one for participants and one for their employers or training officers, on the U.S. system of higher education and the BWAST II scholarship program. These seminars served as an introduction to the scholarship program and made both participant and employer aware of the placement process, the responsibilities of the participant, the responsibility of the employer. The USAID Participant Responsibilities and a placement procedures memo were distributed at each seminar so that both employers and participants would know the commitment that they were each making to training.

By including the employer in the meeting with the selected participant and by involving the employers in the seminars, placement in appropriate programs was greatly facilitated. By establishing early a relationship with employer as well as participant, the employer became more a part of the training program.

Before the Associate Director returned to Washington, each participant had received a letter stating which credentials were still outstanding, the registration deadlines of the required exams (SAT/TOEFL/GRE/GMAT), a copy of the book "Living in the USA" and another copy of the placement procedures memo. Participants were encouraged to use AED's library frequently to peruse the university catalogues and to use the Peterson's software computer program on selecting a U.S. college.

Participants and employers received notification of preparatory classes being offered under the scholarship program or through AED. These programs included: college math/algebra preparation, English composition, GMAT and GRE preparation, an introduction to computer skills.

AED submitted five applications per participant, sending a minimum of one application per student to an Historically Black College or University whenever an appropriate program of study was offered. Participants and employers were kept informed of the status of applications through the Placement Status Chart which was faxed to AED/Gaborone a minimum of twice a month.

Pre-Departure Orientation

Shortly before the participants were scheduled to depart for the U.S. for their degree programs, they participated in a three-day pre-departure orientation program conducted by AED/Gaborone. This pre-departure orientation included discussions of the following:

- . Objectives of BWAST II project; the roles of USAID, BOCCIM, GoB and AED;
- . Responsibilities of the participant and employer;
- . Brief overview of American culture
- . Brief overview of U.S. system of higher education;
- . Study skills;
- . Logistical information regarding departure: visa, medical exam, air ticket, passport;
- . Explanation of scholarship allowances.

Orientation in Washington, DC

AED conducted an in-depth five-day orientation program for participants upon their arrival in Washington. Each participant was given an AED Orientation Handbook which contained information on Scholarship Information, Finances and Allowances, American Culture, Health and Nutrition, Housing, System of Higher Education, Communication with Employer and Re-entry. In addition, each participant was given a Campus Arrival Packet which contained the logistical information they would need for their first two weeks on campus.

The orientation included:

- A full-day cross-cultural orientation by a specialist in the field;
- A discussion on health and AIDS by a member of AED's AIDSCOM staff;
- A discussion on U.S. legal and law enforcement system by a member of the District of Columbia Police Department;
- A panel discussion on culture shock and American system of education by Batswana studying in the Washington area;
- Presentations by each of the BWAST II project staff;
- A tour of Washington, DC;
- Small group meetings with AED Program Advisor to discuss individual academic programs, terms of admission and campus arrival.

Monitoring and Counselling

Each participant was assigned to the AED Program Advisor who had conducted his/her placement. Because the Program Advisors had worked with the participant's file during the placement process, they were already familiar with the academic background of each of their caseload when the participant arrived in the U.S. and could therefore spend the week of orientation getting acquainted with the participants and advising them on a variety of issues to prepare them individually for an easier adjustment once they arrived on campus. After the participants were settled at their campuses, they kept in touch with their AED Program Advisor as often as they wished by using the AED toll-free number.

Campus visits were an important component of program monitoring. Program advisors and the Associate Director conducted a number of campus visits each semester. Often a group dinner meeting was held to discuss common concerns and issues if there was a cluster of participants

on any one campus. The following day AED staff would meet separately with each participant and his/her academic advisor, the admissions officer and International Student Office staff. Campus visit reports were written for each participant visited and copied to the field office and participant's file.

In addition to counselling participants on scholarship rules and regulations, allowance rates and academic matters, AED staff often counselled participants on personal matters relating to culture shock, grieving, legal problems, racism, mental and physical health and relationships.

Academic Monitoring

In accordance with Handbook 10 regulations, AED collected a completed Academic Enrolment and Term Report (AETR) from each participant at the end of each academic term. If AETRs were submitted to AED without the academic advisor's signature or without all of the information completed by the participant, they were returned to the participants to complete fully and correctly. Their maintenance for the following month was held until AED received a fully completed AETR. To facilitate easier tracking of term grade point averages, AED added in 1987 a section to the AETR in which the term grade point average was recorded.

Participants with low grades or changing completion dates were contacted immediately to discuss any problems they were experiencing. The academic advisor was then contacted for information and guidance on how best to address the problem. Together, participant, Academic Advisor and AED Program Advisor would arrive at a workable plan to get the participant back on academic track. Often, this involved arranging additional tutoring for the participant or locating a skills building supplemental program (such as speed reading, composition writing or test-taking).

Participants who fell below the required minimum grade point average for one academic term were issued a warning letter by AED and informed that if grades fell below the minimum a second consecutive term, their scholarship might well be terminated. They were instructed to write a letter to USAID and their employer to explain their poor academic performance and what plans they had to improve their grades. Under BWAST II, three long-term participants were terminated for poor academic performance.

Professional Reintegration

Responding to requests from returned participants who had encountered a difficult re-entry to the workplace, AED began conducting a Professional Re-entry Workshop for participants within 6 months of completing their degree programs. These workshops were a huge success; participants were able to discuss their fears, concerns, and questions about returning to the workplace in Botswana without any hesitation. Although this workshop was only offered for two years of the projects, the participants who were able to attend commented that it facilitated their professional and personal re-entry because they were forewarned about some of the difficulties and problems and thus were not overwhelmed upon their return.

Trust Fund

Under BWAST II, an additional 43 Ministry of Education Trust Fund participants completed long-term degree programs in the U.S. The training programs of the Trust Fund participants were administered in the same manner as AID-funded participants under BWAST II; placement and monitoring activities were identical. In July 1992 the Ministry of Education decided to transfer the management of the remaining 41 Trust Fund students under the BWAST II contract to the Embassy of Botswana. This transfer was effected August 31, 1992.

C. SHORT-TERM TRAINING

An additional 42 participants completed short-term (1-3 months) training programs; five of these participants completed short-term programs in Africa. Ten of these short-term programs were off-the-shelf courses offered by the International Management Development Institute at the University of Pittsburgh; seven were offered by the Institute of Public Service at the University of Connecticut. The large majority of the remaining short-term programs were off-the-shelf courses offered by training institutions. For ten of these short-term participants, AED arranged practical supplemental training in the form of internships or observational tours in order for the participants to realize all of their training objectives.

D. THIRD-COUNTRY TRAINING

During the selection process, USAID, GOB and BOCCIM decided whether the training objectives of a candidate would best be met by attending a training course, in-country, within the region, or in the United States. Technical courses appropriate for some BWAST II short-term participants were offered in Kenya, Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe. Twelve individuals participated in short-term programs in one of these four countries. Travel, medical insurance, course fees and per diem/allowance payments were arranged and handled through AED/Gaborone. There was some difficulty in communicating with some of the training institutions in other countries; occasionally the phones or the facsimile machines would be out of order and cause a delay in logistical aspects of programming. This third-country training was in addition to that conducted under the PILs.

E. FOLLOW-ON ACTIVITIES

Attached is the BWAST II Follow-On Questionnaire which was mailed in December 1991 to all completed long-term BWAST II participants. After two additional mailings (one in May 1992 and one in October 1992 and numerous follow-up telephone calls) AED received 56 completed questionnaires by November 10, 1992.

Of those responding:

- 46% had received a promotion since completing training
- 39% had changed employers after completing training
- 29% had localized a position upon return from training
- 57% felt that their training had provided them with ideas to create new jobs.
- 54% felt they used their training to a large extent in their present job.
- 61% were very satisfied with their overall training experience.

Of those unable to fully utilize training in their jobs, 24 individuals said that a constraint had been lack of support from their superiors; 19 individuals said one constraint was resistance to change from others; 16 individuals said one constraint was lack of the equipment, supplies and resources needed to do the job; and 12 individuals said one constraint was lack of qualified staff.

When asked which activities they had been able to undertake as a result of their training, 33 individuals responded that they improved operational procedures, programs or services. 31 individuals said they managed a project, office, division or company; 30 said they trained others; 16 initiated new projects or services and 12 participated in research activities.

A significant number of individuals felt they had been involved in or influenced activities which may have contributed to sustaining economic growth in Botswana: 27 individuals said they were providing training to others; 21 were assisting new entrepreneurs in getting business started; 19 were providing management assistance; 15 were providing marketing assistance, and 14 were drafting new policy and/or regulations.

BOTSWANA WORKFORCE AND SKILLS TRAINING PROJECT II

Results of Post-Training Follow-up Questionnaire

TRAINEE QUESTIONNAIRE

In December 1991 a post-training follow-up questionnaire was mailed to 82 completed long-term participants trained in the U.S. under BWAST II. In March and September of 1992 AED conducted second and third mailings and made telephone calls to get participants to return completed questionnaire.

56 participants had responded by November 10, 1992. Information on these participants and their completed questionnaire follow:

Respondents:

Male:	43	Public Sector:	35
Female:	13	Private Sector:	18
		BDC:	03

Year completed training

1988	04
1989	13
1990	16
1991	18
1992	05

The results of the questionnaires completed and returned is summarized below:

1. **If present position is different from that prior to training, does this change represent:**

Promotion	26 or 46%
Lateral Move	15 or 27%
No change	14 or 25%
Demotion	01 or 02%

2. **If you changed employers, for how long did you remain with your previous employer before leaving?**

Less than 3 months	03
3-6 months	06
6-12 months	03

One year or longer 10

Total number of those changing employer after training 22 or 39%.

3. Have you localized a position as a result of your training?

Yes 16 or 29%
No 40 or 71%

4. Have you started your own business as a result of your training?

Yes 04 or 07%
No 52 or 93%

5. Do you feel that your training provided you with ideas which helped you to create new jobs?

Yes 32 or 57% No 24 or 43%

6. To what extent do you use your training in your present job?

Large extent 30 or 54%
Moderate Extent 21 or 38%
No extent 05 or 09%

7. If you have not been able to fully utilize your training, what have been the constraints?

Number of times item checked by entire group:

Lack of equipment/supplies/resources 16
Lack of qualified staff 12
Lack of support from superiors 24
Resistance to change from others 19

8. Which of the following activities have you been able to undertake in your job as a result of your training?

Number of times item checked by entire group:

Manage a project/office/division/company 31
Initiate new projects/services 16
Improve operational procedures/programs/services 33
Train others 30
Participate in research activities 12

9. To what extent have you been able to share new ideas and techniques acquired during your training with the following:

<u>Supervisors</u>		<u>Colleagues</u>		<u>Subordinates</u>	
Large extent	12	Large extent	04	Large extent	20
Moderate extent	18	Moderate extent	20	Moderate extent	10
Small extent	16	Small extent	13	Small extent	08
No extent	04	No extent	02	No extent	04

10. Since completing your training, how frequently have you been in contact with your U.S. university faculty?

Often	07 or 13%
Occasionally	40 or 72%
Never	08 or 15%

11. If you have membership in professional associations/societies does your employer pay the membership fee?

Yes 04 or 07%

12. Have you gone on any short course training since completing your degree program in the U.S.? If yes, please complete.

Yes 14 or 25%

Payment for course made by:

Employer	05
USAID	03
GTZ	01
NORAD	01
UN	03
SIDA	01

13. Have you been involved in, or influenced, any of the following activities which may have contributed to sustaining economic growth in Botswana?

Number of times item checked by entire group:

Providing management assistance	19
Providing marketing assistance	15
Introducing new technologies	05
Providing training to others	27
Drafting new policy and/or regulations	14
Assisting new entrepreneurs in getting business started	21

14. How satisfied were you with your overall training experience?

Very satisfied	34 or 61 %
Moderately satisfied	19 or 34 %
Slightly satisfied	03 or 05 %

Follow-On Workshops

Two follow-on workshops were conducted in Botswana in 1991; one for returned participants and one for training officers/employers of returned participants. Each group stressed the importance of communication between employer and participant before training and during training. Employers and training officers admitted that many were not as involved as they should have been in working with the participant on planning and reviewing his/her training program before departing for training. They also commented that participants returning to the workplace too often wanted immediate promotions. Participants commented that they were often frustrated by how long it took to receive a promotion upon their return. They also expressed frustration with some supervisors who were reluctant to give them additional responsibility upon their return or had given additional responsibility to others in their absence.

F. OBSERVATIONS and RECOMMENDATIONS

Effect of cutbacks in state education budgets

During the last two years of the project, AED noticed that faculty and staff at some universities were less involved in participants' programs. AETRs would arrive without the academic advisor's signature or comments and phone calls from AED program advisors would not be returned promptly by faculty. These faculty and staff would explain apologetically, that they no longer had time to complete forms and return calls for advisees; that they were being assigned other responsibilities by university administration and simply could not devote as much time to advising as they had previously. International Student Office staff at some state universities, particularly those in California, were laid off due to lack of funds.

In addition to affecting availability/involvement of faculty and staff, education budget cuts resulted in some courses being dropped during the semester and some degree programs being dropped entirely.

Many academic advisors were reluctant to commit to an estimated date of completion for a participant because he/she could not be certain that all of the required courses would be offered in the proper sequence. This resulted in "floating" estimated dates of completion for many participants. Although cutbacks in state educational budgets were frustrating to all those involved, AED was able to work with both faculty and participants to keep training programs on track to the best of our abilities.

Effect of Improved Screening and Selection Process

AED was pleased to see a significant improvement in the quality of candidates put forward under BWAST II. TOEFL scores, GRE/GMAT and SAT scores were generally higher and the candidates selected undertook their training programs in earnest.

AED recommends that USAID, GoB and BOCCIM encourage all future participants and employers to make a professional commitment to the training program and to work together to establish clear and appropriate training objectives and to select an appropriate training institution.

Private Sector Participants

Although BOCCIM did an excellent job of establishing guidelines and procedures for selection and communication and decision-making regarding participants, it could not control the individual employers. At least ten long-term private sector participants complained that their employers violated previous agreements by terminating their salaries and/or their position, while they were in training.

AED recommends that BOCCIM establish a committee to work with returned private sector participants to address issues of this matter to get their feedback on how best to resolve the problem.

Communications During Training

Successful training and successful reintegration of skills acquired during training require effective communication DURING training between employer and employee. AED designed the Workplace Activity Report in 1990 to facilitate communication between employer and employee on training in the U.S. This form was mailed to each employer or training officer from AED/Gaborone; the employer was requested to return the completed form to AED/Gaborone to forward to AED/Washington to mail to the employee. AED recommends that USAID, GoB and BOCCIM consider Workplace Activity Reports for future training projects. Employers need, and in many cases, desire, to be more involved in the training process.

Associate Degrees

Some participants did not have the academic preparation to be admitted to a Bachelors degree program and were therefore placed in an Associate degree program. Early on in the project, some of these participants were frustrated that they could not continue on to a Bachelors degree program because they felt an Associate degree was not a "good enough" credential. Midway through the project, AED began an information campaign about the value of associate degrees. Fortunately, Batswana now seem to better appreciate the value of an Associate degree. It appears there is a growing understanding about this two year degree and that is often the most appropriate degree for certain training objectives and/or participants.

Accounting

The Accounting curriculum at a number of U.S. schools proved too demanding for participants who were originally selected for BS Accounting degrees; some participants received approval from employers and USAID to transfer into a less demanding Business major such as

Finance when it became clear to their academic advisors that they simply were not going to be able to complete the requirements for the Accounting major.

CPA Exam: Many of the participants trained in Accounting expressed the desire to remain in the U.S. upon completion of their degree so they could sit for the CPA exam. Only two participants actually submitted a formal request for an extension to do this. Both requests were turned down; the pass rate on the CPA exam is approximately 10% for all first-time takers. A few participants have said that the lack of a CPA upon their return home has hindered their professional advancement. AED has recommended to these participants that a professional group of participants trained in Accounting in the U.S. be established to study this issue. AED offered to coordinate the first meeting but to date there has been no interest in pursuing this idea.

Fields of Study

Engineering, architecture and pharmacy are three curriculums which were very challenging for project participants. Not only is there a substantial quantitative skills requirement in these fields, but they are all degree programs of usually five years, and require a specific sequencing of courses. If a student does not do well in the first course in the sequence he/she will have to re-take it and thus set their entire program back one semester.

AED recommends that future training programs in the U.S. in these areas either allow flexibility for duration of program or, perhaps require that the participant have completed one or two years with good grades at the University of Botswana in a Math/Science curriculum.

Practical Training/Internships

When possible, AED submitted applications for candidates to universities which had cooperative education or internship programs built into their curriculum. The participants who selected these universities found the practical training component an essential part of their training experience.

Participants pursuing degrees in Hotel Management were very satisfied with their training programs; they also tended to perform well. AED suggests that this is because Hotel Management programs generally require students to complete an internship. Participants are able to get practical experience and thus are more actively engaged in their academic programs.

This also holds true for some of the programs in Business; many Business schools offer students the opportunity to get practical experience as independent study or as cooperative education.

Overall Observation about U.S. Training

Each year of the project saw a marked improvement in each of the following: the selection process of the participants for U.S. training; the general level of understanding among

participants, employers and training officers about project activities and objectives; the commitment with which employers and participants undertook training.

V. LOCALLY FINANCED ACTIVITIES

A. IN-COUNTRY TRAINING 1988 - 1990

During BWAST I, over 1,400 persons from the public sector were approved for in-country training. Of this total, 81 percent had completed their training programs by the end of the BWAST I core contract in December 1987. Total approvals for in-country training in 1987 were 365.

January 1988 - August 1990

During the period January 1988 through August 1990, a total of 1,289 in-country training requests were approved. Participants were selected from the private, public and parastatal sectors as follows:

Private Sector	595
Public Sector	648
Parastatal Sector	46
Totals	<u>1,289</u> (BWAST I - 454; BWAST II - 835)

BWAST funds committed to in-country training during the same period were as follows:

BWAST I	P 793,368
BWAST II	P 827,690
Total	<u>P1,621,058</u>

November 1990 - December 1992

By early 1990, it had become apparent that approval of training did not assure that training would be implemented. BWAST funds committed by USAID in 1988 totalled P622,960, but funds expended (invoices paid by USAID) totalled only P148,255. Similarly, BWAST funds committed by USAID for 1989 in-country training totalled P938 thousand but only about P250 thousand were invoiced by training institutions. Courses were cancelled. Others were oversubscribed so those approved for training by USAID were unable to attend. Another 100 persons who had received BWAST scholarships did not go on training for a variety of work and personal reasons.

If training did not take place, the employer was unlikely to notify DPSM, BOCCIM, USAID or AED, thus leaving a blank in the tracking system.

Since USAID lacked knowledge of training cancellations, they were unable to deobligate funds. This was of particular concern in late 1989 and 1990 as the BWAST I PACD was past and the Mission wanted to reobligate available funds.

In February 1990, AED proposed that it be given a more active role in the payment of invoices so as to monitor payment. AED had made a similar request in 1984, but it was rejected.

During 1990, in-country training activities came to a virtual standstill as availability of funding was uncertain. DPSM used no BWAST funds for local training. A total of 99 private sector participants were approved by BOCCIM by the end of August 1990 and P130 thousand was committed by USAID. No information was made available to AED as to how much of and how these funds were utilized. The USAID Mission hired a contractor to sort out the whole in-country training financial situation, but AED never received a copy of the report.

On September 14, 1990, USAID and the GoB signed an amendment to increase BWAST II funding by \$769,341. Plans for the use of these funds were spelled out in Project Implementation Letter (PIL) No.6 of November 7, 1990.

B. PERSONNEL, WORKLOAD and PROCEDURAL CHANGES 1990-1991

The year 1990 was a year of substantial change in Mission management and AED field staff. Within a few months in 1990, the USAID Mission in Gaborone had a new Director, Assistant Director, Controller, Executive Officer and BWAST II Project Officer. A new Contracts Officer took over at REDSO/ESA. The AED Project Director and Chief-of-Party switched positions. The AED Training Director position in Gaborone was localized, the position of Director of Private Sector Initiatives was eliminated and, by late 1991, the AED field support staff was reduced from four to two persons. Staff time devoted to BWAST II activities at AED Gaborone was reduced by fifty percent.

By the Fall of 1990, all BWAST II OPEXers had been recruited and placed with their employers, all but one BWAST II long-term participants going to the U.S. had received orientation and had been placed at U.S. Universities and Colleges. Four short-term and one long-term participants were placed at training institutions during the winter of 1991. Those were the last BWAST II placements in the United States.

Time devoted to the core contract by AED/Washington staff was reduced by over 25 percent during 1991. The reduction would have been substantially greater were it not for the unanticipated placement of 40 Trust Fund students in 1990 and 1991. USAID's support of the Trust Fund students for the Ministry of Education was finally withdrawn at the end of August 1992.

In Botswana, the AED staff continued to provide back up support to the Washington AED office for BWAST II students with the help of the USAID Mission's Training Officer. Although the number of OPEXers had been reduced substantially, the local staff also devoted considerable time to the support of those OPEXers who remained. Also, the local staff continued to be involved in assisting DPSM and BOCCIM to strengthen their Management of Training, especially with regard to in-country training.

However, the in-country training system was barely functioning. Furthermore, the Management of Project Implementation Letters was done through the Mission with virtually no input from the BWAST contractor nor the implementing agencies.

C. ESTABLISHMENT of the BWAST PROJECT COMMITTEE

Shortly after the GoB and USAID signed Amendment 10 increasing BWAST funds by \$769,341, the new Mission Project Development Officer encouraged the various implementing agencies to form a BWAST Project Committee to more effectively program and administer the remaining resources under the Project. The Committee was formed in November 1990 and consisted of members from DPSM, BOCCIM, MLHA and USAID. The Committee chose AED to be the Secretariat and to provide the Chairperson for the Committee meetings.

The first official meeting was set for December 21, 1990 at which time DPSM and BOCCIM were to present plans for utilizing PIL.6 funds. A detailed plan was requested for the first quarter of 1991. An illustrative plan was also requested for the second and third quarters of 1991.

The Committee was responsible for planning activities for the BWAST II project, allocating available funds amongst the authorized activities, reviewing and approving technical assistance and training plans submitted by DPSM, for the public sector, and BOCCIM, for the private sector. Funding requests were based on rolling semi-annual plans which were updated quarterly.

USAID earmarked funding based on the approved semi-annual plans and provided advances to AED to fund the approved activities. AED established a separate Pula bank account for the control and use of PIL funds. USAID processed the advances upon receipt from AED of a Cash Needs Report. Subsequent advances were provided to AED based on project progress and on receipt of a Certified Fiscal Report detailing the use and balance of the previous advance, and the presentation of a current Cash Needs Report for the following advance period.

Each quarter DPSM and BOCCIM submitted six-month plans thus allowing adjustments, if necessary, in the last quarter activities of the previously submitted six-month plans.

As appropriate, DPSM and BOCCIM submitted a payment request to AED by PIL line item and activity with a description of each charge and whom to reimburse. After payments to the various suppliers were made by AED, AED returned original invoices to BOCCIM and DPSM with a stamp indicating payment. AED retained copies in their files for easy reference.

Training institutions were expected to invoice DPSM or BOCCIM directly within 30 days of course completion to receive payment. Training institutions were also expected to provide an assessment (course transcript or course report) of each BWAST-funded participant. Unfortunately, neither DPSM nor BOCCIM enforced these requirements, so invoices were often late and valuable assessments of the participants training was not provided.

However, for the most part, the system worked well and AED had a current record of funds available to DPSM and BOCCIM by PIL line item.

D. IMPLEMENTATION of PILS

Over the two years during which the Committee operated, four PILs were approved (Numbers 6-9). Funds were programmed and disbursed in accordance with quarterly plans of DPSM and BOCCIM as approved by the Committee.

A total of \$1,519,341 were provided under the PILs of which \$598,501 were allocated to DPSM and \$920,840 were allocated to BOCCIM.

The \$769,341 allocated by PIL.6/7 have been fully expended, and the additional \$750,000 allocated by PIL 8/9 are expected to be fully utilized by the BWAST II contract completion date of December 12, 1992.

DPSM Funding

In-Country Training Approximately 95 percent of the funds allocated to DPSM were used for in-country training of public sector personnel at IDM.

In 1991, DPSM sent 201 participants to IDM for training utilizing BWAST II funds totalling P558 thousand. To date (November 1992) DPSM has expended P427 thousand in BWAST II funds for 97 trainees to IDM. An additional P156 thousand is expected to be utilized by the end of the BWAST II contract in December.

DPSM used only two training institutions:

- **BIAC** (Botswana Institute of Administration and Commerce) which is a part of DPSM and therefore no tuition is paid,
and
- **IDM** (Institute of Development Management) which charges DPSM tuition and boarding expenses.

The reason given for utilizing only these two organizations is that no other training institutions offering similar courses are accredited by GoB. This apparently is a DPSM policy rather than

a government one as the Police Department sends their officers to the Academy of Business Management (ABM), a private firm.

In any event, both DPSM and BOCCIM agree that a system of accrediting training institutions, awards and awarders should be established in Botswana. Consequently, DPSM has allocated \$30,000 from its PIL 8/9 budget for technical assistance to support early work in establishing a methodology for implementing an accreditation system and for conducting a pilot study to test the methodology in two subject areas. The program, which is now in its second phase, is described in further detail below under "Technical Assistance".

Technical Assistance DPSM will also allocate a small part of the \$30,000 (about \$5,000) to update a report completed by AED in 1988 entitled, "Preparing for Jobs : Correspondence Programmes for Botswana". Most of the updating work will be done by Charlotte S. Krakoff, the principal author of the 1988 report. AED's Gaborone office will revise the original report slightly by adding a section, "Correspondence Courses Available in Southern Africa".

This report update is scheduled to be completed by December 12, 1992. The Phase II (Pilot Project) of the Accreditation Program will not be completed by December 12th. However, DPSM plans to continue the program into 1993 using its own funds.

Accreditation Program Of the nine principal training firms used by BOCCIM, only two are listed in the 1987 publication "Preparing for Jobs: Training Opportunities in Botswana": IDM and Deloitte. The other seven, all private, sprang up along with many more private vocational schools in recent years.

In 1987, only two Botswana institutions provided training in the use of computers - IDM and Afro-British Computing Associates. By 1991 there were 32 organizations providing such training according to the "Directory of Computer Services in Botswana 1991" published by the Botswana Personal Computer User Group.

The number of training institutions in other subject matter areas is also growing rapidly which presents problems of registration, monitoring, accreditation and validation. The Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education, has the power under the Education Act to control the registration, supervision and, where necessary, the temporary or permanent closure of a private vocational school. However, he does not have the staff to provide him with the required information to make well-informed timely decisions. Nor does he have any system for accrediting these schools.

As things currently stand, Botswana training institutions provide a great variety of training. Many provide diplomas, certificates and other qualification awards. However, potential users, both employers and trainees, are confused as to which institutions and courses are most pertinent to their requirements. Both government and private sector organizations strongly believe that procedures should be developed so that users of training institutions and courses will have a basis

for judging the quality and relevance of the training options available and for appraising the merit of certificates and diplomas.

The Association of Training and Development Officers (ATDO) examined this issue and recommended that an outside consultant with solid knowledge and experience in the field of accreditation procedures be retained to examine the problem and suggest procedures for satisfying the needs of Botswana employers and trainees.

The British Council offered to obtain a consultant through the British Executive Service Overseas (BESO). The BFAST II Project Committee approved the allocation of \$30,000 from DPSM's PIL.8 funds to commence Phases I and II of the program.

DPSM hoped that the program could be initiated in early 1992. Unfortunately, a consultant was not available until late August 1992. The program consists of three phases;

Phase I examined the issues involved, defined the characteristics of an accredited system, and suggested procedures for implementing the system on a pilot basis.

Phase II, now underway, will test the proposed procedures for two subject areas - information sciences (with a focus on the use of personal computers) and basic business skills (with a focus on Secretarial Skills).

Phase III will involve implementation of a national structure of competence - based vocational awards and establish the necessary executive function and technical support necessary to promote, implement, develop and monitor the national vocational award structure.

In early 1992, an Accreditation Program Reference Group was established consisting of representatives from AED, ATDO, BOCCIM, British Council, DPSM, MLHA, MOE and USAID. The first meeting of the Reference Group was held in February to draw up the Terms of Reference for the consultancy.

Mr. Jack Mansell, the BESO consultant, arrived in Botswana in late August and submitted his report in early October 1992.

His report made it clear that the accreditation of trainers, awards and awarders are interrelated processes which should be an integral part of any structure of accredited vocational awards. He suggested that the pilot (Phase II) should address the practicalities of the development necessary to obtain competence statements based on national standards, as well as addressing the practicalities of establishing accreditation criteria.

The objective of the pilot phase is to demonstrate in action - the principles and processes of accreditation, the changes that have to be made to the existing system, and the outstanding issues to be resolved.

The following eight processes were suggested for each subject matter area selected for the pilot:

- defining within the vocational area, one or two occupations relevant to Botswana;
- reviewing work already done, or in hand, in the vocational area;
- drafting and discussing national standards for the occupation(s) chosen, and refining the competence statements for each appropriate level of the award structure;
- checking the credentials of the existing awarding bodies and placing the existing awards at appropriate levels in the structure suggested;
- identifying deficiencies, duplications and overlaps in existing awards, in relation to the national standards;
- negotiating, developing or accepting one or more appropriately designed awards;
- developing accreditation criteria for the awards, the trainers and the awarders;
- testing the acceptability of the criteria.

This practical approach will require not only a team-leader well versed in accreditation and testing, but also team-members who have subject expertise, training experience and communication skills. It will also be seen from the above that much field work will be necessary and, depending on how much work has already been done on the particular occupation, the project officer will have to play a pro-active role, using whatever models exist as a starting-point for discussion. The negotiation processes implied in (iii) and (iv) above will probably require the convening of small expert groups of subject experts, trainers and providers. The development and testing of criteria described in (vii) and (viii) above in effect require the drafting of rules and their information. This will certainly test the authority required of the accrediting body, and for the pilot the Reference Group will need to act in this capacity.

The involvement of training providers and employers throughout the pilot will require an iterative, consultative approach. The pilot officer would be proactive throughout e.g. by putting forward draft documents for discussion.

A pilot study such as described above (expanded by Small Business Management, if funds become available) should, on completion be capable of extrapolation into a scheme for implementation. It should illustrate most, if not all, of the issues in action and it should provide a development model for other vocational areas. It should demonstrate how the public and private training institutions can cooperate to provide a more understandable, responsive and quality-conscious vocational training system for Botswana.

BOCCIM Funding

From the beginning of the BFAST Project Committee, in December 1990, BOCCIM had a much more diversified program than DPSM. Figure - demonstrates the percentage of fund utilization by budget line item. (Administrative costs have been allocated on the basis of fund use by line item). The majority of funds were used for in-country training. Although training outside of Botswana (both in the U.S. and regionally) accounted for less than eight percent of fund utilization, the combination of training items (in-country and external) account for almost two-thirds of fund utilization. The remaining one-third of the PIL budget was allocated relatively evenly between evaluations and surveys, technical assistance and workshops and seminars.

In-Country Training

During 1991, BOCCIM expended P225 thousand for a variety of in-country training programs. During the period January 1, 1992 through October 1992, BOCCIM has submitted invoices to AED for in-country training totalling P490 thousand.

Figure I shows the top training providers to BOCCIM in terms of invoices paid by AED. IDM is the clear leader followed by ABM, PROMAN, P-E Consult, MaST and Damelin.

From the beginning of PIL.6 planning, BOCCIM's in-country training program provided scholarships to three types of training programs:

- existing local training programs
- locally held BOCCIM contracted programs, and
- locally held BOCCIM designed and managed custom programs.

The initial 1991 budget allocated about three-fourths of the in-country budget for scholarships to existing local training programs. However, it was soon recognized by BOCCIM that private sector demand for these programs was low. The courses apparently did not meet critical private sector needs, were not offered at convenient times and locations, and were of widely varying quality. Consequently, the emphasis changed to BOCCIM contract courses in March 1991.

By November, BOCCIM was able to report that it had assisted 353 trainees with USAID sponsored scholarships averaging P935 each. BOCCIM contracted training programs had reduced average cost per trainee by over one-third and were providing more relevant courses. Demand increased significantly. The previous seven courses had been over-subscribed, with sufficient requests for the 1991 courses for small business owners to be offered again in 1992.

In 1991, BOCCIM's Training Department awarded or recommended 634 scholarships of which 604 were BWAST II In-Country, 5 BWAST Regional and 4 BWAST International. Of the In-country training, 195 trainees went to existing local training programs and 509 participated in BOCCIM contracted courses.

In 1992 to date, BOCCIM has provided training scholarships to 721 participants of which 580 were financed under BWAST II. Of the total, 423 participants received training in 32 BOCCIM contracted courses. By the end of 1992, BOCCIM anticipates that a total of 770 persons will have received training during the year.

In its Program Plan for January - June 1992, BOCCIM reported to the BWAST II Project Committee that serious training problems had been uncovered as a result of their studies and training results, namely:

- small business owners continue to be reluctant to train their people for fear of losing them to competitors, and
- most local training firms are not geared for private sector small business needs.
- BOCCIM's training strategy for 1992 envisaged a much closer working relationship with government, especially MOE, "to significantly improve Botswana's training capacity, relevance, and quality to rapidly produce effective small business managers, technicians and trainers.

The BWAST II funded, DPSM sponsored Accreditation Program, with MOE, MLHA and BOCCIM on the Reference Group, is a step in the right direction as is the Business-Education Partnership Program, a joint MOE-BOCCIM venture (discussed below).

BOCCIM's 1992 Training Strategies and Objectives, articulated first in November 1991 and repeated in the Program Plan for the last half of 1992, are as follows:

"Increase local training capacity and create a multiplier effect by:

- *Training education/training institution teachers, training firm employees, and training officers in key need areas (trainer skills, management training, vocational/technical training, and preparation for the work-place subjects) through joint private-public sector ventures utilizing regional resources;*
- *Working with government in curriculum reform and teacher training by consulting and utilizing private sector linkages;*
- *Consulting with local educational institutions and training firms to design and market courses to meet the needs of the private sector;*

- *Assessing private sector satisfaction with local training courses and providing feedback and consulting to local training firms.*

Assist Botswana business owners in increasing training opportunities for themselves and their employees by:

- *Implementing a "training benefits" awareness campaign.*
- *Implementing a "business to business" personnel exchange program.*
- *Managing scholarship funds for relevant high-quality local and regional courses for Botswana.*
- *Designing courses for small business owners and employees.*
- *Contracting with local and regional firms for course delivery for small business owners and employees.*
- *Consulting with business owners and senior managers to maximize the benefit of training programmes in their companies."*

The Program Plan for the first half of 1992 included in-country training scholarships for vocational/technical skills upgrading and a series of contracted courses covering cost control, productivity, quality control and production.

Several joint-venture in-country training projects were planned with MOE but, due to scheduling problems, these projects were removed from BWAST II and the funds allotted were transferred to in-country training for use in the last half of 1992. Similarly, a course to provide training to B-Map Counsellors was deleted from the BWAST II budget in mid-1992.

These programs, as well as others originally planned for BWAST II, are presumably being incorporated into the BPED project program for 1993.

Allowing implementing agencies to easily shift scheduled activities from one USAID project to another could be a dangerous precedent to establish. In this case, BOCCIM was relieved of the responsibility of meeting established schedules for high priority programs - schedules that BOCCIM had established itself - and may have taken away financial and other incentives for the joint venture partner, in this case MOE, to adhere to their schedules.

Under PIL 9, the amount of funds reallocated to in-country training is over 70 percent of the original PIL 8 budget. According to BOCCIM's request to shift funds, a principal reason is that BPED funds were not available for in-country training. Therefore "all in-

country training activity schedule for BPED in the first half [of 1992] had to be done under BWAST".

External Training

PIL 6, as originally drafted, projected the use of \$145,000 to provide training for 29 person in regional (Southern Africa Institutions) and \$70,000 for 7 trainees to attend international (U.S.) training institutions.

PIL 7 reduced those budgets to \$44,500 for regional and \$10,000 for international training. BOCCIM actually expended a little over \$20,000 for regional and about \$85 for international training. The \$85 was for application fees, but no one was sent for international training. Four persons were sent for regional training; two to Namibia for inventory control courses put on by ESAMI, one to Kenya to the Evelyn School of Design, and one BOCCIM employee was sent on an attachment to K-MAP in Kenya.

The original PIL 8 budget provided \$55,000 for training 12 persons at regional institutions and \$50,000 for one or two persons outside Africa. These budgets were subsequently reduced by BOCCIM to \$35,000 and \$12,500 respectively. The remaining funds were transferred to in-country training.

To date, under PIL.8, eight trainees have utilized regional training funds for a total cost of about \$9,000. All eight trainees were sent to South Africa. Two other persons have gone to the US at a cost close to the budget figure of \$12,500.

Despite early warnings that external training preparatory procedures were more complex than for in-country training, BOCCIM did not provide sufficient advance notice of external training plans to either USAID or AED. This caused a series of "last minute flaps" which generated unnecessary stress for both trainees and the various organizations involved. Procedures have yet to be followed properly.

The procedures are not that complex provided USAID and AED receive proper advanced notice of an impending external training placement. A 30-day notice was suggested so that the USAID/OIC Handbook 10 regulations could be observed. The various organizations involved in BPED should learn from the BWAST II experiences and develop and enforce the appropriate procedures. Fortunately, there were only the fourteen trainees sent outside Botswana under PIL funding, but the number could, and perhaps should, be higher under BPED. It should also be noted that these problems occurred only under PIL funding and in no way reflects on the much larger Participant Training Program discussed in Section IV, above.

Evaluations and Surveys

BOCCIM completed two surveys utilizing local consultants with about \$65,000 in PIL funds. The first, a *National Training Needs Survey* was done by SIAPAC-Africa in early 1991. The second was a *Training Quality Survey* carried out by Tsa Badiri Consultancy in mid-1992.

The needs survey was designed to identify the manpower and training needs of the private sector by administering a survey to BOCCIM members. The objectives were to:

- Assist BOCCIM member firms to undertake basic manpower planning and assess training needs.
- Provide Government, donors, training institutions and others with data useful for planning purposes.
- Provide data of sufficient quality to allow generalization from sample firms to the population of BOCCIM member firms, and use their data as indicative of the private sector as a whole.
- The survey took account of the Central Statistics Office's occupational coding scheme. This allows for the comparison of the GOB's 1989 employment survey and the forthcoming March 1993 CSO employment survey. BOCCIM also plans to update its survey as part of BPED.
- An analysis of the survey results indicated that the greatest training needs are for senior and mid-level management and supervisory personnel followed by business operations and accounting/finance courses.
- In addition to providing information on training needs, and projected manpower usage and needs, the survey provided valuable information on BOCCIM members' perceptions of barriers, challenges and opportunities in Botswana, and implications for government and private sector programs.
- The *Training Quality Survey* was designed to obtain the views of employers as to the value of training courses held in Botswana where participants were sponsored in whole or in part by BOCCIM. It was conducted by a postal survey covering 541 participants (85% of the 634 scholarships awarded by BOCCIM during 1991 using BWAST II and other donor funds). Approximately 60 percent of those contacted, responded.
- Generally, employers felt that their training objectives had been met by the training but, surprisingly, they found little change in participants' performance after attending a course. Employers who themselves attended courses rated the training higher in terms of having improved their performance.

- Courses were rated by both subject matter and training institution thus providing information which BOCCIM can use in the planning of future training activities.

Technical Assistance

BOCCIM utilized the services of IESC on four occasions in 1991-1992. The first was a consultancy to help in the establishment of B-MAP's organization and procedures. Currently, a follow-on consultancy is being done for B-MAP under BPED to review organization and procedures after two years of operation.

A second consultancy was aimed at helping ABCON, the association for the construction industry, develop organization's and procedures for strengthening ABCON. While this consultancy was not funded by BWAST II, BOCCIM was actively involved in the work.

In addition, IESC undertook a program to strengthen BOCCIM's public relations activities through on-the-job training and assistance to BOCCIM's Public Relations Officer.

BOCCIM also used funds allocated to "technical assistance" to obtain assistance in the preparation of promotional materials. Rustic Touch prepared an export products catalogue entitled "The Kalahari Collection" to promote the export of a variety of Botswana craft items produced by nine local firms. Although, the catalogue was an excellent brochure, the export promotion program did not result in any significant increase in exports.

Rustic Touch also prepared a promotional brochure entitled "BOCCIM is Business" for use in BOCCIM's membership drives. BOCCIM's membership drives have been quite successful. Membership has increased from 550 members to 1.338 during the last three years.

Finally, BOCCIM purchased the services of Inter-AFRICA Outdoor Advertising for the placement of an illuminated sign about BOCCIM at the arrival hall in the Gaborone airport.

Workshops & Seminars

Francistown Conference

BOCCIM held a major conference in Francistown the first week of September 1991. The conference, *The Second Private Sector Conference* was sponsored jointly by USAID, UNDP and CIPE. The conference theme was "The Private Sector as the Engine of Growth in Botswana - Key Constraints and their Removal".

Approximately 100 delegates from the private, parastatal and government sectors attended.

The conference was well attended by senior GoB officials and, over the three days, government and private sector leaders were able to exchange views on a variety of subjects with emphasis on:

- physical infrastructure,
- human resources,
- finance,
- government service, and
- the policy environment

More than 150 issues and recommendations came out of the conference. The Proceedings of the Conference were prepared, published and distributed by BOCCIM.

State of the Economy Seminar

A seminar was held on October 8, 1992 at the Gaborone Sheraton Hotel and Towers. The purpose of the seminar, entitled "Inflation and Recession; Which Way Out?", was to explore the economic situation confronting the business community in Botswana. The one-day session was well attended by the private sector. However, few senior GoB officials attended. BOCCIM has a contractor preparing the Proceedings of the seminar which will contain recommendation for GoB action as well as other items discussed.

Special Seminar for Botswana Training Firms

A special half-day seminar for training firms interested in bidding for 1993 BOCCIM training course contracts was held on September 25, 1992 at the Gaborone Sun. The purpose of the seminar was to provide Botswana training firms with important information on how to bid for and win BOCCIM training course contracts, and to provide BOCCIM's recommendations on how to meet the training needs of Botswana's private sector.

The seminar was well attended and most attendees found the discussions very helpful.

Business - Education Partnership

One of the most important initiatives taken by BOCCIM's Training office under BWAST II was the Business-Education Partnership program. BOCCIM proposed a five-year program which "involves implementing a set of activities (training, attachment, materials development, and evaluation research) designed to assist administrators, teachers and students to understand the world of work, especially that of the private sector; plus developing a competitive mini-grant system funded by the private sector for individual teachers to use for special small projects. Employers, trainers, and educators will work together to develop and implement these activities. The aim is to "strengthen the relationship between employers and educators for the long term benefit of Botswana".

BOCCIM held a series of brainstorming sessions with members during late 1990 to identify problems firms were experiencing with graduates and school leavers, and with the formal education system in general. From these sessions, a list of some 250 possible action steps was generated for action in cooperation with the MOE. This list was then sent to and discussed with the PS, MOE.

This was followed by a series of meetings in 1991 with MOE officials which resulted in a proposal for a series of seminars with MOE Department Heads in May 1992. In June, each MOE Department submitted memos proposing the types of links and activities, which should be established with the private sector.

In July 1992, twenty four business leaders met with MOE Department Heads to establish matches between MOE needs and private sector interests. The business leaders agreed to assist in specific targeted areas. A summary entitled "Business-Education Need-Resource Match" was distributed by BOCCIM to its members on July 29th, together with a checklist for members to tick areas of interest. (See Figure).

Now that the issues have been defined, the organizational structure in the process of being established, and a group of BOCCIM members assigned to defined activities, it is hoped that the program will continue to pick up momentum. Hopefully, this BOCCIM initiative will be integrated into USAID's Basic Education Consolidation (BEC) project which will shortly be underway.

VI. LONG- and SHORT-TERM TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Long-Term: Operational Experts (OPEXERS)

The chief role of the OPEXer was to perform duties of a line position in government or related institutions in the parastatal or private sectors while a Motswana was sent on training. Often preferred by government over non-line advisors because they were reportable and accountable to the existing management structure,

OPEXers represented a key factor in the institutional strengthening component of the project. These public- and private-sector officers were responsible to their host agency, company or association to carry out its professional mandate; they trained co-workers in their departments and organizations, and formed a liaison network among related agencies and firms.

Over the ten-year life of BWAST, 1983 through 1992, 59 individuals performed these OPEX functions in 73 job title posts; in USAID terms, they delivered nearly 162 person years (1,943 person months) of long term technical assistance to strengthen Botswana's economy and workforce. Of that total, BWAST II funded 30 individuals in 35 job title posts to deliver 90 person years of long term technical assistance. These figures are separate from the 339 person months (28-25 person years) of long-term technical assistance delivered under AED's two BWAST contracts but funded from other USAID project sources.

Strategy for Development

To describe the success of the OPEX component of BWAST is to highlight five factors which, taken together, illustrate an effective development strategy.

Each OPEX post was one of high-impact, primarily because an OPEXer occupied an established line position in government, the private sector, or the hiring agency. Each position selected for BWAST funding - a process which, in early years, enjoyed considerable government input - was in a high priority need area and represented the potential for broad impact. Therefore, the posts were, by government definition, critical to accomplish national economic development goals. The people who filled these posts were neither advisors whose advice could be disregarded nor consultants whose reports were often shelved; they were required to function within the institution and were held accountable to their employer for policy actions and program implementation. They interacted horizontally and vertically in the organization to accomplish their tasks.

USAID/Botswana structured a balanced team of OPEXers as part of a three-pronged approach to tackle the employment and income objectives. One prong was policy formulation in which positions addressed national issues and set the direction; a second was program implementation in which positions focused on local concerns and put plans into action; the third was training undergirding the entire system and assuring its sustainability. All three components were required for the overall strategy to succeed.

Periodically, a weakness existed with the tendency to overload the strategy in one category or another (e.g. policy level) thereby lessening the impact in the other two. When this three-pronged approach was juxtaposed with geographic factors (urban/rural), a second weakness emerged: technical assistance to stimulate employment and income in rural areas did not receive the same priority as in urban areas. When OPEX personnel were removed from BRIDEC and Ministry of Agriculture, for example, the only remaining direct impact on rural areas was provided through OPEXers at BotswanaCraft and PAMA, which were also soon to terminate.

All OPEXers, even those below the policy making level who were involved in local level program implementation and training, addressed issues vital to a balanced income and employment strategy. For example: Ministry of Health training upgraded the country's medical treatment capacity, often voiced as a concern to potential large scale foreign investors. BRIDEC management training strengthened local capacity to absorb expanding businesses. Handicraft development activities improved the quality of products being exported and enabled villagers to make more money, BAC academic preparation helped prospective agribusiness employees and commercial farmers be more cost-efficient in livestock production, thus increasing profits.

OPEXers formed an "interactive development network" which multiplied impact far beyond what their individual job descriptions would suggest. For example, a BotswanaCraft employee worked with Ministry of Agriculture on its reforestation strategy, assuring continuity of resource supply,

a BIAC Lecturer served on the Executive Committee of ATDO¹ one of whose organizational aims is to strengthen training within the private sector, the Head of the Art Curriculum consulted with the Handicraft Development Specialist to assure consistency with export quality and product design objectives, a BDC Manager lectured at IDM² to private sector employees on personnel policies; a BRIDEC officer provided management training to Village Development Committees; a BOCCIM officer successfully got private business involved in Botswana's public education system.

Government of Botswana highly regarded the OPEX scheme because a counterpart was trained and when the OPEXer departed, localizing the post, this provided necessary training and reduced the overall number of expatriates in decision-making positions. Government's considerable financial support to the many OPEX positions represented a strong endorsement of the concept. However, the practice of terminating an OPEXer before the counterpart returned from training left some positions vacant, exacerbating the manpower shortage.

Following are sketches of the individuals who served in OPEX posts and brief descriptions of their role. To better illustrate the three-pronged development approach defined above, the posts are described in terms of their impact in Policy Formulation, Program Implementation, or Training.

Activities and Accomplishments of OPEX Personnel

OPEX personnel were distributed throughout major government ministries, parastatal organizations, private sector firms and associations to assure the successful attainment of BWAST goals.

Posts Which Represent Major Focus on Policy Formulation

In order to effectively design a nationwide strategy to increase employment and generate income, it was necessary to united public and private sector leadership around those objectives; this required an intervention into the customary decision making process to assure that policies emanating from various agencies reflected this unit of purpose. Each agency continued its traditional role - governing, relating, monitoring, financing, promoting - in whatever sector it served, but the focus and initiative centered on establishing policies which worked together to attain the employment creation and income generation objectives of the National Development plans. Key government agencies included the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning,

¹ *Association of Training and Development Officers; an organization of over 250 training and personnel officers from both public and private sectors, ATDO is the only such volunteer professional association in the Southern African region.*

² *Institute of Development Management; recognized as one of the premier management training facilities in the Southern African region, IDM is headquartered in Botswana with satellite campuses in Lesotho and Swaziland. In Botswana, IDM currently trains approximately 1,500 people annually.*

the Ministry of Commerce and Industry, Ministry of Local Government and Lands, and the Ministry of Agriculture.

The following posts were selected for OPEX funding because of their potential to influence the creation of policy. Each was pivotal in assuring the consistency of national policy across sectors and agencies.

Ted Valentine (July '86 - May '90 : BWAST I Funding)
Head, Employment Policy Unit
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning

With an objective to strengthen the workforce and create employment, it was critical for BWAST to provide technical assistance at several levels, e.g. national policy formulation; agency program implementation; training institution strengthening, etc. Valentine's responsibilities were representative of their first - policy formulation; his post, in concert with posts of Deputy Head of Employment, Principal Economist, and Senior Macro-Economist (all occupied by BWAST-funded OPEXers) became the focal point of government's employment policy. Valentine drafted position papers for inter-agency review as the government structured its policies on employment, income levels, work permits, and public sector growth. He conducted the Financial Assistance Policy (FAP) Evaluation, provided follow-up support to the National Conference on Strategies for Private Sector Development, streamlined work and residence permit procedures and consulted on Incomes Policy. He coordinated a major study on the Impact of Minimum Wage on Labour Productivity, wrote policy papers and speeches for the Vice President (Minister of Finance) and contributed to the Annual Budget Presentation.

Valentine was seconded by the Vice President to the National Employment, Manpower, and Incomes Commission (NEMIC), a Presidential panel to chart future economic growth. Valentine's position was localized by his counterpart, who is still head of the Employment Policy Unit.

Armand Boucher (Aug '89 - Sept. '92)
Principal Economist and Deputy Director, Employment Policy Unit
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning

Because Boucher held this post after Dempsey, the individual responsibilities and impact were considerably different. Boucher served as Secretariat to the inter-ministerial, Permanent Secretary level Regulations Review Committee, the Committee reported to the Office of the President and was empowered to review and streamline all government regulations affecting business starts. The Committee implemented the Presidential Directive on work and residence permits, and investigated industrial and trade licensing policies. Boucher led the unit to devise overall strategy and monitor specific implementation components; e.g. Financial Assistance Policy (FAP) which provides

government loans to small businesses, the Productive Employment Coordinating Committee, and the Wage Policy Committee.

Jay Salkin (Oct. '83 - Dec. '85: BWAST I; Sept '87, Sept '90 and Sept '91 -Sept 92 BWAST II; Sept '90 - Sept '91 Cost Sharing)

Principal Economist/Macro

Ministry of Finance & Development Planning

Salkin also provided policy-level input to employment creation strategies and advised MFDP on the expansion of income generating opportunities. He was the chief author of policy papers, guidelines, and terms of reference for NDP-VII for the 1992-1997 planning period, he served as a member of the NDP-VII Steering Committee, assisted in preparing the Report of the Presidential Commission on the Revived National Policy on Incomes, Employment, Prices and Profits. He served as a member of the Project Review Team to review all project memoranda submitted to MFDP for funding and advised on their economic merit and consistency with national economic development plans. He coordinated materials for all of the recent Annual Budget Presentations to Parliament, prepared policy reports for the Vice President (Minister of Finance), and served on various government-wide committees; e.g., Housing Policy and Accelerated Urban Land Servicing Programme, World Bank and Bank of Botswana Financial Sector Study; Consultative Working Group on Exchange Rate and Interest Rate Policy. He served as Chief advisor to the Economic Consultant on trade issues, import statistics and Southern Africa Customs Union, advised senior staff on budgetary and economic policy matters, and trained Macro-Economics staff.

Ed Ambrose (Aug '88 - Aug '91: BWAST II; Aug '91 - Apr '92 : Cost Sharing)
Advisor, Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (TIPA)

Ministry of Commerce and Industry

When Government created this new unit to promote foreign investment in Botswana, it actually had a dual function to make policy and to implement programs. Carrying out the first, he assisted in formulating and improving policies and regulations dealing with private corporate structure and operations, tourism, patents, trademarks, industrial designs, industrial property rights and copyrights. He guided MCI input to annual budget speeches and to NDP-VII'. Ambrose wrote several of President Masire's commercial business speeches, including those for his visit to the United States and advised on the commercial "posture" for discussions with US President Bush. For the second, he developed "Business Start Up" fact sheets, definitions of regulations impacting on business starts, all with an eye to strengthening TIPA into a "one stop" business development agency. He directed the work of consultants to design a series of international promotional materials, established a US public relations consultancy, and organized investment missions. He worked with BOCCIM devising strategy to support emerging businesses, contributed to the Ad Hoc Committee to coordinate promotion of investment with BDC and the Selebi Phikwe Regional Development Project, and

coordinated several committees for the Gaborone International (Trade) Fair. He developed a Trade Information Data Bank, and was instrumental in strengthening the information flow to Botswana's Commercial Attaches posted in various countries. Ambrose did not have a counterpart, and his position still remains unfilled.

Ken Kopstein (Oct '88 - Oct '90 : BWAST II)
Housing Officer/Finance
Ministry of Local Government and Lands

Six functions of this post impacted on private sector growth; (a) formulation of policy for land servicing and housing production; e.g. convincing government to use lower cost construction techniques (housing costs in Zimbabwe and South Africa were at that time 25-40% lower than in Botswana). (b) development of housing finance mechanisms (demand for mortgage money was then projected to be about P1.5 billion vs available funding of P250 million): Kopstein worked with MFDP, Bank of Botswana and the private sector to identify alternative sources of funding, e.g. private building societies; (c) coordination of a temporary housing scheme, easing restriction of private sector growth caused by housing shortage; (d) completion of the design of a system to monitor land servicing and housing production; (e) development of rural accelerated land servicing programs; (f) development of indigenous building materials industry in cooperation with BDC. (BDC initiated three cement projects, a brick project and a roofing tile project with Kopstein's input). Kopstein did not have an official counterpart.

John Larsen (Oct '84 - Sept '87 : BWAST I; Oct '87 - Sept '89 : BWAST II)
Senior Agricultural Economist
Ministry of Agriculture

This position represents policy level impact on national agricultural development strategy. Larsen was the principal economist in Ministry's Planning unit, responsible for all agricultural development projects undertaken by government, most of which dealt directly or indirectly with income generation and employment creation in rural areas. He served as the chief liaison between Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Finance & Development Planning (MFDP). As such, he wrote most of the agriculture sections of two National Development Plans³, monitored the projects and coordinated the mid-Plan Project Reviews; he was the chief author of the Ministry's input to the Vice President's annual National Budget Presentations. Among his major agricultural development planning activities was Pandamatenga Development Programme, government's attempt to stimulate large scale agriculture alongside smaller scale development primarily irrigated horticulture and crop production, it also served to diversify agricultural income.

³ *National Development Plan* the document which defines goals of each national planning cycle; NDP-VI covered 1986-1991; NDP-VII covers 1992-1997.

Posts With Responsibility for Program Implementation

Without a level of program implementation to undergird new initiatives, policy directives are ineffective. Key decision makers and supportive legislation may be in total agreement, but if the practices surrounding daily handling of administrative tasks are not similarly coordinated and supported, policy initiatives will not easily succeed. Recognition of this fact led BWAST planners to target key program implementation agencies in public, private and parastatal sectors to receive OPEX personnel.

Certain agencies or aims of federal ministries were selected to effectively extend the work of the given ministry to specific target audiences: Central Statistics Office of the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning; Brigades Development Centre (BRIDEC) of the Ministry of Education; Poultry Agricultural Management Association of the Ministry of Agriculture; Rural Industries Innovation Centre (RIIC) of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry. In one case, a district administrative body was selected to help disseminate information about and implement a federal ministry's program; Selebi Phikwe Town Council to implement MFDP's Financial Assistance Policy (FAP). In another case, a department of a federal ministry (Local Government and Lands) was selected because of its responsibility for an area critical to economic development-housing. Ministry of Health was selected because of the need to strengthen health delivery services to a growing workforce. In parastatal and private sectors respectively, BDC was selected for its role in stimulating economic growth, one of its subsidiary companies was selected for its potential in reaching rural areas, and BOCCIM was selected for its role as prime lobbyist for business.

Dick Dempsey (Dec. 86 - Mar '88)
Deputy Director, Employment Policy Unit
Ministry of Finance & Development Planning

The post was initially selected for OPEX funding to strengthen the impact on national employment policy; the intent was to provide an advisor on manpower planning issues to entities in both public and private sectors. Dempsey's background with the US Department of Labor Statistics enabled him to effectively counsel on data gathering, labor assessment, manpower projection, job-education correlation, and management of manpower training. He introduced a Job Task Skill Analysis process and Job Identification system to enable accurate manpower planning for all industrial sub-sectors in the private sector as well as for the public and parastatal sectors. Dempsey served as Labour Statistician for Occupational Data before that post at the Central Statistics Office was designated for OPEX funding, see the specific responsibilities outlined under Marcia Musisi-Nkambwe, below.

The following illustrations will exemplify the extension of policy impact - the support to program implementation - intended by BWAST designers.

Marcia Musisi-Nkambwe (Sept '88 - Dec '90 and Oct '91 - Sept '92 BWAST II;
Jan '91 - Sept '91 PSC USAID)
Labour Statistician/Occupational Data
Central Statistics Office
Ministry of Finance & Development Planning

A BWAST-funded OPEXer in this post represented Government's first attempt to develop an Occupational Information System (OIS), collecting in one location and summarizing all data related to employment in Botswana. Musisi-Nkambwe's initial hurdle was to "clean up" previously collected data; as much as 40% margin of error existed in some early data, unscientific extrapolations often led to unrealistic manpower planning goals. She trained enumerators, improved data collection methods, and systemized processing. Once in place, the system proved critical to formulation of employment generation strategies and was used by a number of audiences: private sector employers to develop manpower plans and supporting training strategies, potential investors to evaluate investment opportunities; employer and worker associations to formulate policies and programs affecting membership. Marcia had a counterpart who, after training in Australia, worked only about six months before being transferred to MOE.

Norman Root (Feb '86 - May '88 : BWAST I)
Manpower Planner
Directorate of Public Service Management

Critical to the objective of strengthening a workforce is the accurate planning of labour needs throughout both the public and private sectors. Compiling data from other agencies, Root and his staff projected future labour needs in various subsectors of both government and industry. His counterpart, who now holds the post, received a degree in Economics, and continues to monitor labour force needs. To illustrate the liaison network created by OPEXers, Root used data from and conferred regularly with the Labour Statistician at the Central Statistics Office, and Head of the Employment Policy Unit, Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, both posts occupied by OPEXers.

Rasik Joshi - (Jan '86 - Jan '88: BWAST I; Apr '88 - Apr '90: BWAST II)
Assistant Director/Organization & Methods
Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM)

One aim of the Directorate is to increase effectiveness of government by providing human resources so that services to the public and national development activities are carried out and national objectives attained; the O & M Unit seeks to improve performance of ministries and departments and to optimize use of available manpower in the public sector. OPEX assistance to DPSM was based on recognition of the fact that an efficient public sector is an important factor in the formula to facilitate systematic growth in the private sector. The employment generation objective within government itself was an issue of "localization" of existing posts, not creation of new posts, in central government,

the "Professional", "Technical" and "Technical Instructor" cadres continued throughout BWAST to employ the highest percentages of expatriate officers.

Ana McLean (May '87 - May '90 : BWAST II)
Financial Assistance Policy (FAP) Advisor
Selebi Phikwe Town Council

McLean's task centered on putting business development plans into action at the local level. She processed all applications to the Town Council for Financial Assistance Policy Grants (as noted above, FAP was coordinated by MFDP's Employment Policy Unit). McLean was active in the Selebi Phikwe Development Program, a concerted effort by town business leaders to stimulate additional investment in the area, especially to lessen dependence on mining-related income. As part of their strategy, she produced videotapes and other promotional material, and consulted with local individuals and groups wishing to start small businesses.

Sarah Heath (Nov '87 - Nov '89 : BWAST II)
Senior Technical Officer/Management
Brigades Development Centre (BRIDEC)

BRIDEC is the educational support arm to the Brigades, autonomous village-based organizations which provide on-the-job training to primary school leavers. Located in one of the key institutions in government's strategy to provide employment generation support in rural areas, this post actually includes both program implementation and training. Production Brigades (agriculture, horticulture, building, handicrafts, textiles) provide employment opportunities. Training Brigades (building, metalwork, vehicle repair and maintenance) prepare future employees. During Heath's tenure, the Shakawe Brigade was formed and served as the only other employer (besides school) in the far Northwest village of 3,000-4,000 people. After two years, it employed 50 people and produced a P300,000 annual volume of business, making and selling bricks/blocks (previously trucked in) and providing artisan services. Increased demand for skilled manpower pushed Brigade enrolment from 700 trainees in 1985 to 1,200 in 1990. During this expansion, Heath provided business management training to the 26 village based Brigade Coordinating Committees and to the numerous small companies which had spun off from brigade activities in the villages. Brigades used BOCCIM management courses and BOCCIM, recognizing the impact of brigades on rural industrial development, still includes a brigades representative on its Small Business Advisory Group. Heath's position was filled by another expatriate until December 1992 when it was localized by a BWAST II participant.

Henry Jeppesen (Oct '86 - Oct '90 : BWAST II)
Manager, Poultry Agricultural Management Association (PAMA)
Ministry of Agriculture

The NDP-5 goal of reaching self-sufficiency in poultry and egg production by mid 1980's was somewhat realized in Gaborone but not in the rest of the country; poultry products are still imported from South Africa, particularly by large volume consumers like hotels and fast food outlets. Poultry consumption increased by 40% in 1988 and another 25% in 1990; responding to that increased demand, PAMA expanded hatchery operations to 50,000 chicks/week with BDC funding. PAMA, an umbrella organization of producers, represented potential for direct impact on rural income generation by providing chicks and materials to villagers who wanted to start small-scale poultry production units. These units would employ village residents in production; PAMA handled slaughter, distribution and marketing. As production units increased in number, more people were employed at the village level and, as nationwide production increased, PAMA employed more people itself. With OPEX assistance for three years, PAMA improved its financial situation to the point where government could privatize the organization. Aside from meeting employment generation objectives, the PAMA operation contributed to the government goals of attaining food self-sufficiency and reducing dependency on South African imports.

Chris Sharp (Jun '87 - Jun '89 : BWAST II; also BWAST I Aug '83 - Aug '84 as Planning Officer, MLGL; BWAST I)
Project Coordinator
Ministry of Health

Though a private hospital was also being created, the expansion of Princess Marina Hospital in Gaborone was deemed vital to provide adequate medical services to a growing workforce and, indeed, to attract additional foreign business investment. Sharp, an experienced planning officer funded by BWAST I at the Ministry of Local Government and Lands, was recruited to coordinate the project for the Ministry of Health. He interfaced with Ministry officials, hospital officers, planners, architects, and construction contractors to initiate the much-needed hospital expansion.

Jim Polan (Apr '86 - Apr '89 BWAST I; Apr '89 - Apr '91 and Apr '92 - Nov '92 : BWAST II; Apr '91 - Apr '92 cost sharing)
Property Development Manager
Botswana Development Corporation (BDC)

BDC is a parastatal overseeing business development. After completing a tour as Senior Project Officer, Polan headed a new division to address property-related issues of private sector development, his prime responsibility was to develop the new property projects and industrial areas. Phase IV, comprising 300 hectares in Gaborone West, was a joint venture with Botswana Housing Corporation, and was considered the first "private enterprise" industrial area. He also had oversight responsibility or Board Member/Chairman roles with: (a) Residential Holdings, a private residential project with 100 hectares and 49% BDC investment, (b) Gaborone International Hotel Company, a P45 million project employing 300 people at the new Sheraton, (c) Clinic Holdings, a P35

million project which created the country's first private hospital; and (d) the OK Complex and Gaborone Hotel with over 400 new jobs; (e) industrial areas in other cities and rural areas; e.g. Selebi Phikwe Factory Shells, a P6 million project with 6,000 square feet of new factory space and 750 new jobs. Additionally, Polan sits on the Board of some 20 other BDC companies.

Charles St. Clair (Sept '87 - Nov '92)
Manager, Commercial/Industrial Division
Botswana Development Corporation

This OPEX post proved to a highly influential position within BDC itself and throughout the large portion of the private sector which has BDC investment. St. Clair served on the BDC Board of Directors and on the Board of 39 private corporations in which BDC had financial interest totalling some P67 million; the Division accounted for roughly 75 % of BDC's annual income. The Commercial/Industrial Division generated 6,000 new jobs for FY 89 alone, with continuous growth ever since. St. Clair's corporate involvement included Image Botswana, Kwena-Rocla, Frasemet, Exotic Timbers, Sugar Industries, Francistown Milling and Trading, Lobatse Clay Works, Tiro Afrique, B & D, Makoro Brick and Tile, and others representing a wide range of traditional and new commercial undertakings. Under St. Clair's leadership the Division employed Peace Corps volunteers for the first time in private companies with notable success. St. Clair liaised with BOCCIM and IDM to devise private sector development strategy and to design training materials for business-related courses.

Charles Krakoff (Aug '87 - Aug '89)
Project Officer
Botswana Development Corporation (BDC)

Krakoff reviewed business development proposals submitted to BDC for funding and advised the Board on their economic viability, growth and employment potential. He hosted foreign investment missions both to BDC and to the broader business communities in Gaborone, Lobatse, and Selebi Phikwe, he identified overseas and arranged contacts for export products, and made BDC promotional tours to Milan and Hong Kong. Sitting on the Boards of Directors of several BDC subsidiary companies enabled Krakoff to assist in strengthening internal management, improving financial accountability, and streamlining employment practices.

Beth Terry (Sept '87 - Aug '89)
Handicraft Development Specialist
BotswanaCraft Marketing Company
Botswana Development Corporation (BDC)

Administratively part of BDC's BotswanaCraft, this position served several craft producers, primarily in rural areas, prime purpose was to improve quality control of craft

items being exported and stimulate new product design, again primarily for export. It represented one of the comparatively few OPEX posts which was selected to impact on rural or village level income and employment generation. Terry nurtured a newly-emerging Botswana Handicraft Association, the country's first craft trade association; long range objective was for the association to serve as an umbrella organization for small producers, similar to the role of PAMA in poultry production. Terry's development strategy required consultation and cooperation with Financial Assistance Policy (FAP) officers, Integrated Field Service (IFS) extension staff, Department of Tourism, and Remote Area Development Programme (RAD) officers (craft marketing remains as one of the few sources of income to San people, or "Bushmen", chief beneficiaries of RAD efforts). Sustainability of her efforts was assured through cooperation with Village Development Committees (VDCs), Production Development Committees (PDCs), District Development Committees (DDCs) and the Rural Industrial Officer (RIO) Cadre of Ministry of Commerce. She coordinated efforts within ministries of Agriculture and Commerce to replenish raw materials and wildlife products being consumed by craft production.

Bob Ash (Oct '89 - Nov '92)
Management Assistance Specialist
Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry & Manpower (BOCCIM)

Created in October 1989, this relatively new post became the cornerstone of BOCCIM's expanded service to emerging businesses. The position was designed to create the capacity within BOCCIM to research, design and deliver management assistance to companies, to design programs to support new venture and entrepreneurial development, provide technical support to BOCCIM regional offices and promote expansion of small business through a variety of media and channels. As a first step, Ash organized an aggressive membership drive, increasing corporate enrolment from 400 to 1,100 in one year. He was instrumental in developing and strengthening private sector groups including Botswana Metal Products Association, Botswana Credit Bureau, Small Business Association, Women in Business Association. He provided practical technical assistance through the Botswana Management Assistance Programme, developed a Botswana Venture Capital Group, and created a Partnership in Education Programme to link private companies and public schools.

Warren Jones (Jul '84 - Aug '86: BWAST I; Oct '86 - Oct '88: BWAST II)
Research & Development Workshop Manager
Rural Industries Innovation Centre (RIIC)
Rural Industries Promotion
Ministry of Commerce and Industry

One of RIIC's charges is to design appropriate technology for rural application, particularly but not exclusively in agriculture, and to provide training in its use. The Centre served as a training site, receiving BWAST In-Country training money, for such

rural income generating schemes as bone carving, and bread baking. Implicit in that charge is the need to research and develop appropriate technology around which income generating training can be built. Jones was responsible for managing all the design work of the Centre resulting in new or modified designs for agricultural implements to reduce cost and increase income. He chaired an inter-agency taskforce on the Ministry of Agriculture plans to promote an Animal Driven (Water) Pump, designed to reduce water supply costs in the livestock and horticulture industries.

Positions Created to Provide Training Support to the Policy Creation and Program Implementation Functions:

Under BWAST I, training was seen as the primary means to strengthen the workforce: to upgrade skills in key potential growth subsectors. Under BWAST II, the role of training was expanded to assure sustainability of policy initiatives and program directions in support of the project's broad economic development goals. With this broader definition, posts were designated for BWAST funding for similarly broader reasons. Some were selected because of potential to plan and manage training in important sectors: BOCCIM to increase training throughout the entire private sector, Ministry of Health to upgrade health delivery services and, thereby, not deter foreign investment. Those in agriculture - BAC and Ag Research - were selected to support the country's largest non-mineral source of income. Training institutions were selected to house BWAST-funded OPEX personnel because they either (a) served a potential growth industry (Wildlife Training Centre to support expanded tourism); (b) provided training in a critical skill area (Polytechnic in Engineering; College of Education in commercial art, University of Botswana in Business, BRIDEC in auto trades); or (c) delivered necessary training to employers to strengthen the private sector workforce (IDM, BIAC).

The following are illustrations of the OPEX impact input and impact in training:

John Bruton (Jul '84 - Dec '86: BWAST I; Mar '87 - Jul '90: BWAST II)
Fluid Mechanics Lecturer
Botswana Polytechnic

The Polytechnic is a key institution in the government strategy to deliver technical and vocational training to both the formal sector in urban areas and the informal sector in rural areas. Enrolment grew from 820 in 1985 to 1500 in 1990 and the number of Instructors required to support this expansion increased from 91 in 1985 to 171 in 1990. The Polytechnic set as its goal to offers a Bachelor's degree in Engineering to stimulate localization and lessen the country's training cost to prepare qualified engineers to supply the rapidly expanding construction sector. Bruton was one of the key faculty brought in to strengthen the curriculum in that effort. He modified the syllabus for Ordinary Technical Diploma (OTD) to make it more relevant to Botswana industry and improved ties between the Polytechnic and local industry. He participated in Photovoltaic Pumping

and Lighting Committees, developed a "Strength of Materials" laboratory and set up a Mechanical Engineering Computer facility.

Terry Cacek (Sept '88 - Sept '90)
Instructor, Wildlife Training Centre,
Department of National Parks and Tourism
Ministry of Commerce and Industry

In the NDP-6 planning period, 1985-1991, tourism was targeted for considerable expansion with the required supporting manpower projected to increase between 4.1% - 15.9% per year. Wildlife Training Centre was the only training facility at that time directly supporting the planned expansion by preparing potential employees in the wildlife and national park sector. Department of Wildlife and National Parks impacts on Tourism in two ways: protecting the natural resource base and regulating and facilitating related industry. One objective of the recent Wildlife Utilization Policy was to provide up to 2,500 new jobs in rural areas.

Neil Currie (May '88 - May '90)
Training Officer
Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry & Manpower (BOCCIM)

Currie was the first BWAST OPEXer to be placed at BOCCIM and was instrumental in developing a sustainable training capacity to support private sector training needs. He worked with employers and training officers to strengthen skills in planning and managing training within companies. His post served as the Secretariat to the BOCCIM Training Committee, channelling donor assistance to the private sector. With BOCCIM's pivotal role in the private sector, he worked closely with ATDO and TIPA. He was instrumental in assisting IDM to expand its course content and alter class format to cater to private sector needs.

Will Cain (Jul '90 - Oct '92)
Training Officer
Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry & Manpower (BOCCIM)

Cain was the second BOCCIM Training Officer and continued the role of planning, promoting and implementing in-country and international training programs for the entire private sector. He established a Training Unit with annual Operating Plans, completed the on-the-job training of the Counterpart, conducted follow-up private sector needs assessments, administered scholarship programs from various donors, and liaised with local training institutions.

Jack Doty (Sept '89 - July '92)
Professor & Head, School of Accounting & Management Studies
University of Botswana

A fairly new position which began in September 1989 to support the University's efforts to strengthen its Certificate and Diploma programs in Business Administration, to expand its Bachelors in Commerce degree, and to establish an MBA program. To meet these goals, Doty implemented newly-developed business management curricula and restructured the Department; under his leadership, the Bachelors degree program was significantly strengthened and the school's first MBA program officially implemented in September 1991. The Business Faculty now prepares future business leaders at a significantly reduced cost to the country (compared to current cost of overseas business training).

Rich Pfau (Sept '84 - Dec '86: BWAST I; Jan '87 - Mar '91 : BWAST II
Curriculum Director/Training and Development
Institute of Development Management (IDM)

Pfau headed a new Training & Development Unit to address training needs in the private sector. Pfau devised the curriculum, supervised faculty, directed core courses, and developed and implemented several courses directed at the private sector: e.g., an On-The-Job Training Workshop; a Training Coordination Course; a Teaching Skills Workshop; a Training of Management Educators course. He devised outreach courses, training needs assessments, training of trainer programs, and seminars on education and employment. Because of IDM's key role in supporting other training initiatives, Pfau spent up to 30% of his time as Executive Secretary to ATDO, and served as chief liaison with BRIDEC and BDC for management training.

Jim Hellerman (Aug '88 - Aug '90)
Business Marketing Lecturer
Institute of Development Management (IDM)

Hellerman headed a new curriculum unit in Marketing and Business Management which expanded rapidly to meet increased needs in the private sector. He surveyed private sector training needs, designed curriculum and structured course formats in response to company training needs: established evening courses for private sector employees; provided marketing and small business management courses in outlying towns; developed an Office Management and Secretarial Skills courses; explored correspondence courses to reach private sector employees in far-outlying areas. With IDM's expanded outreach policy, Hellerman worked with TIPA, BDC, ATDO and BOCCIM to devise private sector curricula and to incorporate private sector issues in public sector training.

Charles Cambridge (May '86 - Aug '88)
Management Curriculum Director
Institute of Development Management

As IDM began to offer more training to the private sector, one of the first areas to be highlighted was Management, this post was created to consolidate all management training

and to focus its relevance for private business. With extensive experience in business management, Cambridge reviewed existing curricula, redirected a variety of courses, and designed new training modules in response to private sector employers' needs. He was a key liaison to the business community, including private employers, BDC, BOCCIM, the emerging Chamber of Commerce, and ATDO. Based on his successful expansion of the Management Department. Cambridge was promoted to Academic Dean responsible for all of IDM's training in all three countries.

Laura Ives (May '88 - May '90)
Technical Education Officer/Arts
Ministry of Education

Part of a nationwide effort to design junior secondary education curricula and introduce income generating and practical life skills, this BWAST OPEX post was established to work closely with the USAID-funded JSEIP⁴ Project. The Art Education and Art Employment Research Project identified 377 new positions (150 surveyed companies) which required art training. Most commercial artists in Botswana are still expatriate, 54% of the companies still contract out (usually to South Africa) a great deal of art work because of this skill shortage. The long range impact of this position was to train artists to provide services being performed outside Botswana and to localize art-related private sector positions held by expatriates. In support of that goal, Ives developed art curriculum (drawing, color and printing, crafts, commercial art and fabric design, sculpture and carving) and trained prospective art teachers.

Cal Merinar (May '83 - May '86; BWAST I; May '86 - May '87: BAC; May '87 - May '89 BWAST I/II
Animal Production Lecturer
Botswana Agricultural College (BAC)

At the time the last BWAST OPEXers were assigned to BAC, it was being incorporated into the University to offer a Bachelors degree in Agriculture. Merinar was the only faculty member in animal production trained to Masters level, therefore the only one qualified to teach the Bachelors syllabus. BAC continues to train government-employed Agricultural Demonstrators (ADs) and Community Development Officers (CDOs); the expanded curriculum now addresses training needs from the private agricultural sector, preparing potential employees for agribusinesses and commercial farming.

Geoff Heinrich (Jan. '91 - Nov '92)
Dryland Agronomist

⁴ *Junior Secondary Education Improvement Project, Florida State University was the contractor.*

Department of Agricultural Research
Ministry of Agriculture

One of the last to be designated for BWAST funding, this position was responsible for supporting Farming Systems Research through technical backstopping and on-the-job training of Farming Systems staff. Heinrich, formerly with the USAID-funded ATIP⁵ project, was instrumental in facilitating a smooth transition from ATIP to an integrated Farming Systems Research program, significantly, he strengthen linkages between the departments of Ag Research and Ag Field Services, thereby enabling technologies developed by Research to reach the farmers.

Ed Oshiro (Apr '88 - Apr '90)
Training Officer
Ministry of Health

During the time of the BWAST Project, an often-cited deterrent to large scale foreign investment was Botswana's lack of adequate medical treatment facilities and trained personnel. Oshiro completed several training needs assessments, planned and developed education programs for the expanded cadre of health officers required through the year 2000. He designed orientation materials for expatriate physicians (Batswana were being trained under BWAST and through the Ministry of Education Bursaries Programme, but it would be years before supply of trained physicians could meet demand), finalized a system to prioritize training and selecting candidates for medically related training (pharmacists, physiotherapists, nutritionists, physicians, physician assistants, family nurse practitioners, nurses). He also developed curriculum, planned and implemented a variety of modules being used in on-going in-service training.

Ruth Stark (Jan '84 - Aug '86: Health; Jun '87 - Jan '89 : BWAST II)
Staff Development Educator
Ministry of Health

Building on the work initiated under USAID's Health Services Development Project, Stark implemented a series of professional development programs for health delivery staff. She surveyed regional and district staff, assessed training needs, developed curricula, and devised and taught courses. The broad goal was to increase the efficiency of health services delivery throughout the country, not least in urban areas where foreign business might be attracted. Importantly, Stark also assisted with Botswana's AIDS education campaigns, particularly among private sector employers who face severely a reduced workforce as the disease takes its toll.

⁵ *Agricultural Technology Improvement Project, Mid America International Agricultural Consortium - MIAC*
- was the contractor with Kansas State University as lead institution.

Sue Williams (Jan '88 - Jan '90)
Lecturer/Business Education
Botswana Institute of Administration & Commerce (BIAC)

Williams was primarily responsible for revising the business education curriculum in response to needs of private sector employers. She implemented an Executive Secretary Course, based on the Secretarial Needs Analysis, and added several computer and word processing courses, she assisted BIAC to direct more training activities to private sector emphasis. She served on Executive Committee of ATDO and consulted regularly with BOCCIM and IDM. As the commercial sector continued to expand, business related training remained a high priority to produce skilled office workers.

Frank Cajthamal (Mar '87 - Mar '89)
Lecturer/Accounting
Botswana Institute of Administration & Commerce (BIAC)

BIAC was founded as a public-sector serving institution but expanded its curriculum to meet a steadily increasing demand from private sector employers for skilled manpower. An early BWAST private needs assessments identified Accounting as one of the most critically lacking job skill areas. Cajthamal reviewed BIAC's existing Accounting curriculum, updated portions of it, tailored it to the current Botswana workplace, and introduced new teaching methods in order to strengthen the department. He introduced computer software packages for business application and wrote several new textbooks for future training.

Bob Rokos (Oct '83 - Mar '84; RSG; May '84 - May '86: BWAST I; Sept '86 - Apr '89 : BWAST II)
Assistant Education Officer/Automotive Trades
Brigades Development Centre (BRIDEC)

Many of the 26 community-based Brigades offer training to potential employees in a series of automotive trades, vehicle maintenance, vehicle repair, welding, panel beating. Rokos, formerly a Training Officer for Central Transport Organization (CTO), revised curricula, sought training resources, trained teachers, and evaluated instruction for those Brigades which included automotive trades as part of their Training units. In those which included auto trades in their Production units (e.g. Molepolole), Rokos assisted management units, particularly in areas of fiscal control. Auto Trades comprised a significant portion of the Molepolole Brigade's annual P3 million gross business volume, clearly an important source of income to local villagers.

B. Short-Term Technical Assistance: Consultants

The use of short term consultants was severely curtailed under BWAST II. BWAST I funded 21 consultants who delivered 109.6 person months of technical assistance; BWAST II funded 17 consultants who delivered 35.5 person months of technical assistance.

Tasks were selected to support the on-going work of long-term OPEXers or to supplement a special initiative in a BWAST funded agency, all with the objectives of workforce strengthening, income and employment generation clearly in view. The following are illustrative examples of the work of short term consultants.

Vivian Nossiter
Institute of Development Management (IDM)

A human resources management specialist, Nossiter designed and conducted a training course for human resources managers from the public and private sectors, the focus was on personnel management, management of training professional/corporate growth, and staff development.

Peter Olson
Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry and Manpower
(BOCCIM)

In response to request from private sector employers, Olson researched Botswana's Labour Laws and authored a handbook to explain in popular terms the rules and regulations which govern the workplace; to facilitate personal interaction with employers, he designed and conducted a series of supplemental workshops throughout the country.

Bob Pearlman
Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (TIPA)
Ministry of Commerce and Industry

TIPA's plan included a global campaign to attract foreign investment, but the available promotional materials were outdated and ineffective. Pearlman researched, designed and produced two brochures which captured the Botswana message and which were effective enough to compete on a global scale with other publications.

Bill Scott and Richard Davis
Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (TIPA)
Ministry of Commerce and Industry

The concept of a one-stop business development center had been discussed in many circles, but no definitive study had been done. Scott and Davis interviewed employers, private sector association leaders, government agency heads, union officials et al, researched alternative strategies, and recommended the viability of creating such a small business development center.

Jim Scoville
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning (MFDP)

In response to a need of the National Employment, Manpower, and Incomes Commission (NEMIC), Scoville estimated the impact of Botswana's minimum wage on business productivity.

Jim Scoville and Kofi Dompere
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning (MFDP)

Also in response to a NEMIC request, Scoville and Dompere conducted an analysis of the relationship between Botswana's inflation rate and productivity of the workforce.

Kofi Dompere
Central Statistics Office (CSO)
Ministry of Finance and Development Planning (MFDP)

Dompere completed two additional consultancies, both to provide specialized assistance and training to CSO staff in statistical manipulation, extrapolation methodology, and projection.

Robert Coldwell and Howard Gray
Botswana Development Corporation

At the beginning of BWAST II funding, this consultancy was to advise on BDC's targeted role as a key BWAST implementing agency. The BDC Board of Directors requested a detailed consultancy to appraise BDC's financial strategy for future business development and to outline an action plan for each of its Divisions to implement over the next ten years.

Evan Stone
Botswana Development Corporation (BDC)

One of BDC's roles is to attract investment but its promotional materials could not compete for attention of sophisticated investors. Stone researched BDC's mission, its services and areas of potential industrial growth, and produced an effective promotional brochure for worldwide distribution.

Charles Cambridge
Institute of Development Management (IDM)

Following his term of service as an OPEXer, Cambridge was called back to IDM to teach a section of the *Advanced Certificate in Management* course, a program he had earlier expanded and strengthened.

John Kerrigan
Association of Training and Development Officers (ATDO)

Kerrigan, a renowned author of texts on management training, provided the keynote address at ATDO's first annual symposium. His topic, On-The-Job Training, had recently sparked the interest of private sector employers.

VII. BWAST II Project Impact

A. Original Logical Framework FY 86 to FY 94

The original goal of the BWAST II Project was "to assist the GoB's efforts in job formation". The measure of goal achievement was that the rate of non-government job creation equals or exceeds 5.6 percent during the period 1985-1991.

Actually, private sector formal employment increased by an average of 14.8 percent during those years, an increase of 81 thousand in the private sector labor force alone. Total paid employment during this period increased by over 112 thousand persons.

Most of the other "verifiable indicators" of project success relate to numbers of persons trained and length of training, number of person months or days of long and short term technical assistance provided, and the amount of funds expended on different activities.

Unfortunately, the "magnitude of outputs" specified in the Logical Framework refer to varying or imprecise time frames or to outputs which are not clearly defined. For example, in regard to in-country training, the Logical Framework sets a goal of 1,000 Batswana trained by FY 90. (The start date is not mentioned). During the period FY 86 to the end of FY 1989, over 2,000 Batswana had actually completed in-country training.

In regard to long term international training, the goal was 176 completing Batswana participants by FY 93. Actually, 267 Batswana participants had completed training under the BWAST II contract between December 1987 and September 1992, the beginning of FY 93.

The goal for short-term international training in the Logical Framework was 64 Batswana. The actual number of Batswana who completed under BWAST II was 67, of whom 42 were trained in the U.S. and 25 were in third countries.

Since the Logical Framework was developed two years prior to the start of the BWAST II AED core contract and appears to relate more to the BWAST II project, it is not a particularly useful exercise to continue through the numbers. It is sufficient to note from Sections III through VI above that the actual "magnitude of outputs" of BWAST II generally exceed the goals established in the 1985 Logical Framework and the guidelines incorporated in the AED core contract of November 1987.

It is more to the point to relate project impact to those targets established during the API exercise in late 1991, recognizing that at that time the BWAST II project was about to enter its seventh year and that the five-year AED core contract was eighty percent completed in terms of duration.

E. Assessment of Project Impact

Introduction

As discussed earlier, the strategic objective of the Mission's private sector development projects was "Increased employment for Batswana in non-mining and off-farm sectors". In order to bring more Batswana into the modern workplace, the Mission chose to focus on the three primary targets:

- Improved policy environment,
- Increased citizen skills, and
- Identification of and investment in business opportunities.

To meet these three principal targets, seven sub-targets were established as part of the API exercise of which six apply to the BWAST II project.

The purpose of this Section of the report is to review the Strategic Objective and each of the applicable Targets and Sub-targets to determine what impact BWAST II may have made in achieving those targets or in providing an experience or methodological base upon which future Mission private sector development projects might build, with particular reference to BPED.

Employment and Investment Generation

In conducting the API exercise, it was recognized that the Mission's private sector development project should not be held accountable (or get credit) for the rate of growth of employment or investment in the economy as a whole. Growth of the national economy was "not within the manageable interests of the Mission or within the scope of USAID funded activities". Accordingly, the first "indicator" selected for measuring the success of the program was "increased employment directly attributable to USAID supported activities". A second indicator was "increased foreign and domestic" investment, also attributable to USAID supported activities.

A review of the Mission's private sector development activities indicated only two implementing agencies which could demonstrate a direct and measurable relationship between USAID support and employment and investment growth; BDC and BOCCIM. The three activities supported by USAID within BWAST II that met these characteristics were:

- Property Development Program (BDC)
- Industrial Program (BDC)

- Management Assistance Program (BOCCIM)

USAID support to these three activities consisted primarily of support for three OPEXers: Jim Polan, Charles St. Clair and Bob Ash. The USAID funding for these three activities totalled about US \$1.5 million over five years, including funding support of the B-MAP (Botswana Management Assistance Program) at BOCCIM.

It should be noted that employment and investment changes were tracked by activity not by individual OPEXer. The three OPEXers were part of qualified managerial, technical and administrative staff whose combined actions produced a synergistic impact on results.

It is estimated that USAID's supported activities at BOCCIM have created or saved 4,510 jobs in Botswana during the last three years through 1,347 outreach interventions. Grants and loans approved for these businesses totalled P4.5 million. It is estimated that total investment in creating these jobs was about P6 million, about P1,330 per job.

The BOCCIM employment changes are based on the changes in the employment levels of each firm from the time assistance was provided until late 1992. Each case is fully documented in the BOCCIM files. It is quite likely that additional employment will be generated in the future by these firms as a result of BOCCIM's assistance. An annual update by BOCCIM would be a useful exercise and might also provide insight as to future technical assistance requirements.

Similarly, it is estimated that the two USAID activities at BDC have created or saved about 14,000 jobs with a total investment of P670 million, about P48,000 per job. Obviously, BDC's business projects were much larger and more capital intensive than BOCCIM's where the focus was on small labor-intensive operations.

The principal contribution to both investment and employment growth at BDC was through the programs of the Property Development Division. This Division, over the last three years, managed projects which created 596 new hotel rooms, 19,000 square meters of shopping center space, 1,250 hectares of serviced plots, 133,500 square meters of factory space, three new office buildings, a new private hospital plus residential housing for the BDC staff.

The Industrial Division developed or saved ten projects over the last few years which have added (or saved) 1,656 new jobs. Total investment was in excess of P60 million. In addition - and not included in the totals - previously established industrial projects continued to expand, doubling by the end of 1991, and increase of about 750 jobs.

BDC anticipates that these projects will expand over the next few years as factory shells are leased and developed and as individual projects expand.

These three BOCCIM/BDC job employment and investment development activities have had a measurable and impressive impact. USAID's support costs of about \$1.5 million amounted to about \$80 per job ultimately created. Perhaps USAID could learn some lessons

from these three programs.

- The three activities were focused on providing direct support to businesses through technical assistance or infrastructure provisions.
- Each activity was managed by an experienced OPEXer, employed by the implementing agency, in line positions with clear responsibilities and commensurate authorities.
- Each OPEXer was in the position for a period of over three years, long enough to plan and implement programs.

Improved Policy Environment

As Section VI indicated, there were six OPEXers whose principal focus was to assist in the formulation of policies and development plans to encourage private sector development. Through these OPEXers, USAID provided support to the Ministries of Agriculture, Commerce and Industry, Local Government and Lands, and Finance and Development Planning. The impact of this USAID support on employment can not be quantified.

The indicator of success for the Target "improved policy environment" is: "Number, quality and significance of new or revised policies, procedures and regulations which have been implemented". Unfortunately, even this indicator is difficult, if not impossible, to address except in a subjective manner.

Policies may be categorized into two types:

- those requiring enabling legislative or revision of existing legislation such as employment legislation, industrial licensing regulations or occupational safety
- those not requiring legislation but which can be implemented directly by the Executive Branch, possibly with the broad concurrence of the assembly. Such policies include monetary, fiscal, and foreign exchange policies, and budgetary ceilings and priorities for national development planning.

To provide some guidance to USAID for planning future policy, this report exams two activities which focused on policy and development plan formulation: Macro-Economic Planning and Housing Finance.

Macro - Economic Planning

During BWAST II, five OPEXers were employed by the Division of Economic Affairs, MFDP. Two of those, Dempsey and Musisi-Nkambwe, were involved in developing manpower

planning tools, data, and data collection, processing and dissemination procedures. The other three were key policy formulators employed by the Ministry in senior line positions where they worked closely with top government officials on a day-to-day basis. Their joint impact on policy formulation and implementation was immense.

Valentine's principal contribution was to assist in the revision of broad government policy through the initiation, coordination and promotion of the Revised Incomes Policy. This policy is referred to by Minister Mogae in the 1992 Budget Speech as "an essential component of the set of Government policies which include monetary and fiscal policy, financial sector policy and an improved industrial development strategy, intended to promote private sector development".

The Revised Income Policy, also known as the "White Paper" was approved by the National Assembly in September 1990. Many of the policy revisions could be made without legislation; most of these were implemented. Policy revisions needing legislation took longer. Many have been implemented. However, many important ones have neither been implemented nor has legislation been prepared.

Minister Mogae, in the same speech went on to say, "Ensuring that this set of policies is quickly and efficiently implemented is now a matter of the highest priority". He also stated that, "The Regulations Review Committee is monitoring change in legislation and regulations to ensure that they conform to established policy". The Secretary to the RRC is OPEXer Armand Boucher. Boucher, working closely with the PSP and other senior officials, re-established the RRC after years of inactivity. The first meeting of the Committee was held in March 1990. Thanks to Boucher's insistence, the early issues introduced to the Committee were the contentious ones of work and residents permits and industrial and trade licensing, policy issues apposed by the implementing Ministries, Labor and Home Affairs and Commerce and Industry.

Boucher's responsibilities as Secretary to the RRC included preparing analyses of existing and new legislation and regulations to determine their impact on employment creation in the private sector and recommending appropriate action by the RRC. He was also responsible for relaying RRC recommendations to relevant Ministries, parastatals and private sector organizations. His was a pro-active role to keep senior government officials and private sector representatives focused on the issues and implementing Committee decisions.

From March 1990 to date, RRC reviewed legislation and policy dealing with:

- work permits
- residence permits
- industrial licenses
- trade licenses
- employment legislation
- trade disputes legislation
- trade unions and employers organizations legislation

- occupational safety and health legislation
- civil aviation

As Boucher says in his final report, "progress on virtually all issues has been made; however, it often takes a great deal of time to implement new policies, especially those that represent a significant departure from previous policies.

"An example relates to the issuance of work and residence permits. A new policy was established in December 1988 requiring greater flexibility in issuing work and residence permits. However, by the time the revived Regulations Review Committee (RRC) met in April and May 1990, the Committee learned that most of the key changes had not been implemented. Since then, implementation has been pursued relentlessly by the Chairman and Secretary of the RRC. First we wrote a Savingram from the Permanent Secretary to the President (the most senior Government Officer) to the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs (MLHA) insisting that these changes be implemented. "Next, given that the 1991 Budget Speech was being prepared within the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, we were able to include detailed reference to required changes in work and residence permits that had or had not been implemented, as well as the expected timing of full implementation.

In addition, at every opportunity (for example, during the recent World Bank Missions) senior officials in MLHA were reminded of the urgency and importance of these required changes. As a result of pressure and constant reminders, the relevant Acts and Regulations are now finally being revised to accommodate the required changes.

Another key issue is the relaxation of licensing requirements, mandated by the Revised Incomes Policy (September 1990). Progress on the legislative and regulatory fronts has been disappointing to date. The Regulations Review Committee reviewed the Industrial Development Act and Trade and Liquor Act in November 1990. Since then, there have been many meetings and exchanges of correspondence between the Chairman and Secretary of the RRC and senior officials of MCI. At the time of writing this Final Report, we are reviewing new, revised draft legislation. Unfortunately, these latest drafts still fail to conform fully with the Revised Incomes Policy".

Both Valentine and Boucher were employed in the Employment Policy Unit of Macro-Economic Planning. They worked closely with Jay Salkin, the OPEXer who was Director of the Macro Unit which coordinates the preparation of the National Development Plans and Mid-Term Reviews, provides general economic policy advice, and liaises with the Bank of Botswana and advises on monetary and exchange rate policy. Both the Employment Policy Unit and the Macro Unit make considerable input to the Annual Budget and help to prepare the Annual Budget Speeches.

Salkin, as Director of the Macro Unit, has had a substantial impact on the fiscal and monetary policies implemented in Botswana through the preparation of national development plans and

budgetary and development strategies. As a result, Botswana's public finances are sound, "a crucial ingredient for the enabling environment needed for private sector development".

The Macro Unit also prepares the guidelines and base cases for the National Development Plan, and proposes budgetary ceilings and allocations of resources to the various Ministries and Parastatals. These global and ministerial budgetary ceilings reflect Government's priorities and patterns of development and are approved by Cabinet prior to the preparation of the Plan and are then closely monitored.

The Macro Unit prepared two key chapters in NDP.7, Chapter 3, "Economic Performance and Prospects" and Chapter 5, "Public Sector Expenditure and Manpower".

Thus, the Macro Unit played a vital role in establishing non-legislative policy as well as influencing the direction and priorities of national development.

Sub-Targets

The Target "improved policy environment" has three sub topics, the first of which deals with policies that promote profitable natural resource projects. This is not a BWAST II sub-target. However, the other two do relate to BWAST II and deal with two of the tools which can be used in promoting policy reform: improved analysis of policy issues, and use of forums to encourage policy dialogue among and between the public and private sector.

USAID's support of the Division of Economic Affairs of the Ministry also resulted in successes in contributing to the early use of private-public sector forums and improved analytical tools, data and personnel:

- The Employment Unit, with Valentine's leadership, was instrumental in setting up and successfully implementing the first "Francistown Conference" with the help of BOCCIM, USAID, UNDP and others.
- As noted above, Ms. Musisi-Nkambwe has developed procedures and data to better determine national manpower needs and prepare manpower plans. The next employment survey in March 1993 will utilize the new procedures. Hopefully, surveys will be conducted annually.

Ms. Musisi-Nkambwe also contributed to the 1991 Population and Housing Census by designing the questionnaire, preparing the enumerators manual, training of trainers and census supervisors, preparing occupational and industry coding schemes, providing technical assistance during and after the census, and drafting tabulation plans.

The 1991 data is now available and the Central Statistics Office is accepting requests (directed to the Government Statistician) for tabulations from various institutions and individuals. United Nations consultants who have come in to evaluate the census have expressed great satisfaction with the overall quality of the data. The census database contains a wealth of information

relevant to manpower planning and will provide the baseline data for occupational, labour force, employment and household and income and expenditure surveys to be conducted over the next few years.

A major accomplishment of the "Macro Unit" is the progressive upgrading of the Macro-Economic Model of Botswana (MEMBOT) as a powerful tool for policy analysis. This model, which runs on a microcomputer, provides 10-year forecasts of various economic indicators for 19 industrial sectors. Major National Development plans and Mid-term reviews are based on the latest MEMBOT forecasts.

During BWAST II, the Division staff has learned many of the skills and techniques of policy research and economic analysis. They are now able to "better inform and advise policy makers and decision makers on the preferred choices and alternatives to be pursued in order to achieve National Development Plan goals and objectives".

Conclusions

A number of factors may have contributed to the success of USAID's support of the Division of Economic Affairs. Some of these are:

- The Ministry, in general, and the Division, in particular, are in a powerful position to influence policy. Furthermore, they are staffed by some of the best political and civil servant personnel in the country.
- USAID's support was focused on a key Division with five OPEXers attached therein who could, when appropriate, support each other and exchange ideas.
- The OPEXers were in senior line positions working on a day-to-day basis as fellow employees, with top officials.
- All were employed sufficiently long to enable them to become recognized experts and were thus able to be convincing providers of advice.
- Most had able counterparts and were able to localize their positions; in Salkin's case, several times.

Housing Financial Advisor, MLGLH

In terms of achieving implementation of new or revised policies, procedures and regulations, the support by USAID of a Housing Financial Advisor at MLGLH was relatively unsuccessful. The Advisor, Ken Kopstein, wrote an interesting final report explaining the problems he encountered and some of the reasons for his lack of success.

During the Advisor's two-year assignment the major accomplishment was the surfacing and focusing attention on housing development and finance. This led to a USAID "study on urban development standards and engineering design as they relate to development costs and affordability". The study had a "definite impact on revising urban development standards to more affordable levels; however, this progress is not sufficient and much more needs to be accomplished in this area".

The Advisor's study of the Accelerated Land Servicing Programme (ALSP) showed that the proportion of upper-income plots greatly exceeded lower-income plots in contradiction to needs. By raising this issue, the Ministry made some small adjustments to make plot distribution more consistent with income.

However, most policy activity was carried out on a day-to-day basis through informal meetings. "Senior Ministry officials are not prone to policy discussion, preferring ad-hoc decision-making to analysis".

Also, policy studies were seldom used. "Several excellent consultant studies (most funded by USAID) languished on shelves, forgotten; staff turn-over at almost the entire policy-level had been frequent and the new senior officials were unaware of these studies".

Kopstein subsequently recommends that the position of Housing Financial Advisor should be placed at BoB or MFDP rather than at MLGLH, a sound observation in view of subsequent developments.

Kopstein states that his principal unmet objectives in policy development can be summarized as not achieving sustained and in-depth internal Ministerial discussion on issues. Decisions continue to be rendered without extensive analysis which has generated, at times, confusion and counter-productive policies. Long-term implications of policy decisions are similarly not considered; this has the effect of creating intractable problems, such as a growing subsidy element in housing, that may well not be sustainable and drain valuable national resources away from other more productive investments. Furthermore, the lack of considering long-term implications may result in substantial dislocations in the economy, perhaps even leading to recession as Government must abruptly adjust to the results of improper policies adopted at the stage".

Kopstein did improve MLGL's (now MLGLH) policy analysis by providing training to the Chief Housing Officer. His comments on training may be of interest:

"No counterpart was ever assigned to me. However, I adopted the Chief Housing Officer as a counterpart. Over the two years, by working closely with him, a significant education process was accomplished and his knowledge of, and ability to deal with, issues has measurably increased. In regards to training, generally, short-term courses, and even advanced degree courses, appear to have limited utility foremost Government officials unless there is some technical person in the Ministry to work with the official on his/her return to duty. Generally, short-term courses appear to be most relevant to Botswana

because officials are transferred from one post to regard to expertise in their field and so they require quick orientation and exposure to relevant subject material. For example, the Chief Housing Officer received a Master's degree in agricultural economics and was without any background in housing or urban development on assuming his post".

In retrospect, Kopstein's impact, on a scale of one to ten was barely a one. Two principal reasons are suggested:

- He was assigned to a Ministry not particularly interested in having him or his advice. His appointment was largely the result of the support from RHUDO/ESA, who paid for his first year as advisor, and did not emanate as a result of the Ministry's perceived needs.
- He was in an advisory position with no counterpart, reporting to a supervisor unwilling to support his main thesis that Botswana's financial sector does not have sufficient liquidity, especially medium and long term finance, to support the nation's housing program. He therefore pushed his thesis at BoB and MFDP alienating the later and, consequently, the Mission.