

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

PD-ABG-014  
 RA 82632

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS.
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA

<p>A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: <b>USAID/BOLIVIA</b></p> <p>Mission or AID/W Office (ES# <u>10/93</u>)</p>	<p>B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan?</p> <p>Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY <u>93</u> Q <u>3</u></p>	<p>C. Evaluation Timing</p> <p>Impact <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Interim <input type="checkbox"/> Final <input type="checkbox"/></p> <p>Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/></p>
---	--	--

D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)					
Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligated to Date (000)
598-0640.01/ 511-0603	Andean Peace Scholarship Program	1985	9/30/94	6,666	6,666

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
Action(s) Required		
1. Training programs/activities under the Bolivian Peace Scholarship Program (BPSP) must demonstrate how they support the democratic initiative Strategic Objective in concrete ways, (by specifying the expected outcomes for training groups and how those outcomes relate to the broader objective.)	Beatriz O'Brien	On going
2. The vital group homogeneity in educational and/or occupational level should also be observed in group selection. This action applies to BPSP.	Beatriz O'Brien	On going
3. The institutional contractor under the BPSP must be given significant follow-on implementation responsibilities for both the APSP and the BPSP.	Beatriz O'Brien	On going
4. Most BPSP trainees should be given a U.S. homestay or visits with american families, as appropriate.	Beatriz O'Brien	On going
5. Under the BPSP, expanded linkages with Bolivian organizations should be established to strengthen and improve the relevance of the training program design. These linkages will assist USAID/Bolivia in providing an institutional framework for trainees.	Beatriz O'Brien	On going

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation:	(Month)	(Day)	(Year)
--	---------	-------	--------

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:				
Name (Typed)	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
	Beatriz O'Brien	N/A	Steve Smith <i>[Signature]</i> 5/28/93	Carl H. Leonard <i>[Signature]</i>
Signature	<i>[Signature]</i>		<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>
Date	5/28/93		6/1/93	6/1/93

**Abstract**

The report evaluated the impact of Andean Peace Scholarship Program (APSP) training in Bolivia (Project 511-0603) on the development-related performance of returnees. APSP was the USAID/Bolivia Mission project of the first phase of the Caribbean and Latin America Scholarship Program (CLASP-I), and was implemented from 1987 through 1992. The goal of the evaluation was to determine the role that APSP training plays in the current activities of returned Trainees and to assess the impact that these Trainees are having in their jobs and communities.

The evaluation reviewed activities in the workplace, volunteer and community activities, Trainees as multiplier agents, and the Follow-on program. Special attention was given to differences in public and private sector Trainees, and the issue of all-women training groups was reviewed. Changes in Trainee understandings and opinions of the United States were also examined, since the upcoming successor project to APSP, the Bolivia Peace Scholarship Program (BPSP), is designed to support the USAID/Bolivia Strategic Objective relating to democratic institutions and processes (especially improving citizen participation in the decision-making process). The evaluation generally found high levels of satisfaction with the training. Trainees discussed their applications of the training on the job and in other activities, and provided concrete examples of areas in which APSP training has had a positive impact. The report also identifies certain problematic areas of implementation related to the effectiveness of Trainee impact, and provides recommendations to strengthen BPSP, especially in the areas of group recruitment, linkages to the intermediary institutions in which Trainees work, and Follow-on.

C O S T S

**1. Evaluation Costs**

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. \$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
Roger Rasnake	Aguirre International	LAC-0661-C- 00-0046-00	28,848	Project

<p>2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>3 p/d</u></p>	<p>3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>34 p/d</u></p>
---	--

2

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

S U M M A R Y

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- Purpose of evaluation and methodology used
- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office:	Date This Summary Prepared:	Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report:
BOLIVIA	March 30, 1993	Impact Evaluation of CLASP in Bolivia / 2/93

**Purpose of the Evaluation**

The report evaluated the impact of Andean Peace Scholarship Program (APSP) training in Bolivia (Project 511-0603) on the development-related performance of returnees. The evaluation set out to determine the role that APSP training plays in the current activities of returned Trainees and to assess the impact that these Trainees are having in their jobs and communities. Specifically, the scope of work called for evaluation research which would:

- ascertain whether returned Trainees continue to serve as leaders and "change agents" in their workplace, in their communities, and in other spheres in which they are active;
- document how those Trainees who *can* be classified as change agents are applying their APSP training in their activities; and
- assess how programming options adopted in APSP selection (such as selecting public sector Trainees, forming all-women groups, or approving training in certain U.S. institutions) may have differentially affected the outcomes of Trainees in their role as change agents.

The evaluation provides recommendations designed to strengthen the upcoming successor project to APSP, the Bolivia Peace Scholarship Program (BPSP).

**Methodology**

The in-country field research for the impact evaluation was carried out between August 17 and September 4, 1992. Two principle methodologies were used to gather the information brought together in the report: first, a quantitative survey of 174 APSP Trainees (of the total 432 who received scholarships), using the CLASP Returnee Questionnaire. The sample was stratified by sex, region, and long-term/short-term training status. Second, ten focus groups were held around the country with returnees, which permitted Trainees to speak in a more non-structured way about their experience and accomplishments. Considerable further information relevant to the report was gained through field visits and open-ended interviewing with Trainees, co-workers and employers, and Mission personnel. Project documents were reviewed. The results of the survey were entered into SPSS PC+ data files and analyzed statistically.

**Summary of Impact Findings and Conclusions**

Impact-related findings concentrated on the workplace, community or volunteer activities, the role of Trainees as multiplier agents, and Follow-on activities.

- *In training impact on the workplace*, most Trainees assert that the U.S. training was either "useful" or "very useful" for their present job (84 percent), for learning new practical and technical skills (77 percent), and for a broader career advancement in the future (80 percent), three proxy indicators for job impact. Many Trainees can specify in concrete detail examples of the training-related impact they have been able to have at their workplaces. A large majority of Trainees also report increased job satisfaction and greater responsibilities on the job; about half report increased income as well. All but a very few APSP returnees are currently employed. Reservations about the direct applicability of the training was voiced by a significant majority of Trainees. These concerns are substantiated by the fact that, in spite of the high percentages who characterize the training as "useful," four in ten Returnees

interviewed also report using the training only "some" or "not at all" on the job. Presumably, this indicates that Trainees face certain obstacles to application.

- **About 77 percent of all Trainees are actively involved in volunteer activities.** Nearly 69 percent of Trainees of those involved before training believe they are participating *more* in volunteer activities and community affairs than before they went to the U.S. The range of activities is wide: significant proportions are involved in educational projects, civic or union activities, charity concerns, cultural programs, and in community improvement.
- **Trainees act as multipliers of their training both in the workplace and in the community.** Returnee estimates suggest that all APSP returnees, taken together, have shared their training with up to 100,000 Bolivians, between co-workers and community contacts. Both in the workplace and in community activities, nearly 90 percent of returnees assert that the training has made them more effective leaders. Trainees also report by large majorities that their relative status has risen as a result of APSP training, in the eyes of their employers, co-workers, family, and community. Returnees also confirm that their own self-esteem has been supported by the APSP training experience.
- **In Follow-on, Trainees have been supported in wide-ranging efforts to share the results of their training or other areas of expertise.** Seminars for professionals, a national youth congress, an urban nutritional fair for poor neighborhoods, as well as workplace seminars in the public sector have all occurred. However, certain procedural difficulties in Follow-on discussed in the report may be limiting the degree to which it involves the more isolated returnees, especially the most economically disadvantaged.

#### Characteristics of Effective Training Groups: Findings

The evaluation sought to identify those factors in APSP training programs which best explain the relative impact of returnee activities. Six groups which were especially effective in applying their APSP training were examined to isolate those characteristics which appear to have enhanced their effectiveness. The following characteristics emerged:

- Selection of strong leaders;
- Concrete, relevant training themes;
- Strong institutional affiliations, especially after training;
- Geographical clustering; and
- Active participation in Follow-on Programs.

#### Recommendations

- The Mission should review the process of designing the training for the six successful groups to determine exactly what factors contributed to their extraordinary achievements. Success factors appear to include: (1) the identification of appropriately trained and motivated candidates, (2) ample communications with Trainee employers before training, (3) training which is well suited to the backgrounds of the Trainees, and (4) training that is *directly* applicable to the Trainees' jobs or volunteer activities. The vital principle of group homogeneity in educational level should also be observed in group selection.
- Given reduced A.I.D. funding, stand-alone training projects such as BPSP will need to demonstrate that they are consonant with Mission Strategic Objectives. Human resource development projects must be envisioned not as a separate sectoral activity but as a distinctive development tool which supports various sectors' efforts. Training projects must demonstrate how they support Strategic Objectives in concrete ways, by specifying the expected outcomes for training groups and how those outcomes relate to the broader objectives. Specifying expected outcomes of each training program is also a useful way to conceptualize and measure impact.
- The selection process of training groups should provide for more contact with proposed Bolivian intermediary institutions -- those Bolivian organizations which nominate Trainees and to which the Trainees will return to work. While contact has always been made prior to initial recruitment of

Trainees, it is recommended that expanded commitments relating to training design and employee support be established between the Training Division and the nominating institutions. Employers and nominating institutions should be considered key *stakeholders* whose active involvement will improve the recruitment and selection process.

- Expanded linkages with the Bolivian intermediary organizations can strengthen the selection process and improve the relevance of the training program design. Such linkages will also assist the USAID/Bolivia Training Office in providing the institutional framework for Trainees to apply their training on the job or in their communities upon their return. Agreements should be established with these institutions which will increase employer (or organizational) support for efforts by returned Trainees to undertake initiatives based on their training in the workplace.
- The U.S. homestay is key to forming social relationships with U.S. citizens outside the training course itself. All BPSP Trainees should be provided a homestay.
- Since perceived discrimination was most often mentioned in the focus groups and on the survey as the most negative aspect of the U.S. observed by Trainees, Experience America for BPSP should include in its predeparture orientation a broader discussion of multiculturalism in the U.S., the history of racial and ethnic relations, and especially the legal and social efforts to overcome discrimination. This should also include a discussion of the history and present role of Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs).
- While 85 percent of *short-term* Trainees reported being active in community or educational activities prior to training, only 64 percent of *long-term* Trainees made the same statement. Leadership qualities and actions evident in the workplace are, without question, important criteria for selection. However, a well-rounded leader would normally be expected to be active in some aspects of community life in addition to their job. The Mission should consider expanding leadership definitions to include some volunteer activity for all long-term Trainees under BPSP.
- All-women training groups may be appropriate for certain economically disadvantaged groups, in which Trainees might not be able to participate otherwise. Barring that circumstance, BPSP should avoid forming groups with disproportionate numbers of either men or women. While CLASP goals only require a 40 percent goal for women, the Mission should consider setting its own goal of sending fifty percent women under BPSP to provide a wider array of training opportunities to a group which has traditionally had little chance to do this.
- A strong Follow-on Program for 432 Trainees requires more than a single coordinator's efforts, especially at certain moments when several Follow-on events are occurring simultaneously. The Mission has designed the BPSP program such that the in-country contractor will take on logistical tasks involved in BPSP Follow-on. It is recommended that the contractor be given significant Follow-on implementation responsibilities for both APSP and BPSP.
- Delays in the financing of small Follow-on projects at the local level have led to considerable Trainee frustration. Since one cause of delays in project approval seems to lie in the great amount of labor involved in processing the proposals and the attention required to initiate the specific activities, the new in-country contractor should also be requested to take on these activities, in conjunction with the Follow-on coordinator, of review and financial disbursement.

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

Impact Evaluation of CLASP in Bolivia.

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

1. The evaluation made very useful recommendations which the Mission has taken or will take into consideration during the implementation of the Bolivian Peace Scholarship Program (BPSP) 511-0611.
2. The evaluation raises the point of placing follow-on implementation responsibilities under the contract with the institutional contractor. The Mission will incorporate this valid suggestion, as well as additional BPSP administrative functions within the terms of the institutional contract.
3. The evaluation adequately met Mission expectations and provided good answers related to the implementation of the Andean Peace Scholarship Project (APSP) and is assisting in implementation of the BPSP. Also, the evaluation provided a good conceptual framework for participant training programs.