A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I PD-ABF-979

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE

IDENTIFICATION DATA 82601

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit:
Mission or AID/W Office: USAID/HONDURAS
(ES# FY93-1)

B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan?
Yes ☐ Slipped ☒ Ad Hoc ☐
Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY 92 Q 4

C. Evaluation Timing
Interim ☒ Final ☐
Ex Post ☐ Other ☐

D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated, if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)

Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost ($000)	Amount Obligated to Date ($000)
522-0273	PRIMARY EDUCATION EFFICIENCY PROJECT	1986	07/94	$27,500	$22,619.9

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director

Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
1. (a) An Agreement will be negotiated to specify time lines and HRD/ET responsibilities for implementing the MOE Management Information System (SIE)	HRD/ET and MOE	Oct. 92
(b) USAID/Honduras will contract external technical assistance to assist the MOE in the implemention of the SIE.	HRD/ET	Jan. 93
(c) The decentralized SIE will be implemented	MOE	Dec. 95
2. A Project Amendment will be negotiated with the MOE to redefine implementation arrangements and the project's logical framework and address evaluation recommendations accepted by USAID and the MOE.	HRD/ET and MOE	April 93
3. An institutional contractor will be contracted to provide local technical assistance, publicize project advances, and conduct research studies.	HRD/ET	March 93
4. (a) External technical assistance will be contracted to assist in developing criterion referenced standardized tests; develop a computerized test generating, grading and reporting system; and to define a statistically valid, stratified sample for testing purposes.	HRD/ET	May 93
(b) The new testing system will be completed and implemented with stratified samples.	MOE	Sept. 93
(c) A decision will be reached on whether a national standardized testing system should be implemented.	MOE	Dec. 93
5. The content and sequencing of textbooks for grades 1-2 will be revised for reprinting, and strategies will be defined to provide expanded access to these and other educational materials for student use beyond regular school hours and for private schools.	HRD/ET and MOE	Sept. 93

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation: (Month) April (Day) 21 (Year) 1993

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:

	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Name (Typed)	NED VAN STEENWYK	D. OMAR ROUSSEL, MOE	CARMEN ZAMBRANA, HDP DONALD SOULES, DP	MARSHALL D. BROWN
Signature				
Date	3/25/93	26/03/93		

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

Primary Education Efficiency Project

Designed to improve the quality, efficiency, and cost-effectiveness of Honduras' primary education system, the Primary Education Efficiency Project (1986-1994) consists of six interrelated components: textbooks, training, research, evaluation, management information system, and construction. The project is implemented by the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the Institute for International Research (IIR), the technical assistance contractor. The midterm evaluation took place during August 1991. Its purpose was to assess impact at midpoint and to recommend future actions. A seven-person team conducted extensive site visits to schools; interviewed project, USAID/Honduras, and MOE personnel; and reviewed relevant documents.

The major findings and conclusions include:

* Overall project performance at midpoint is satisfactory. The most significant impact of the project will be on the quality of education through the textbook and training components. These components will meet their output targets by the end of the project. Funding and production should continue as planned.

* Major problems exist in the availability and reliability of data to track the impact of the project. Several studies should be conducted in the next year by external consultants in order to provide a base of information for the final evaluation. (Mission does not fully agree, see Mission comments below).

* Assumptions in the design of the project that textbooks and training would significantly improve efficiency and cost-effectiveness are faulty. Success in these activities will not necessarily affect these indicators. Emphasis should be moved from efficiency to quality. (Mission does not agree, see Mission comments below).

* Each component was treated as a separate activity. No provision was made for overall coordination of the components. (Mission does not agree, see Mission comments below). Efforts should be made to better integrate the activities of the textbook, training and evaluation components.

Major lessons learned include:

* Project monitoring provides the crucial link between stages of project design, implementation, and evaluation. Each stage is generally the responsibility of a different institution [MOE, USAID and Contractors]. Unless clear responsibility is delegated for monitoring, feedback linkages easily dissolve.

* Accurate assessment of host country capabilities is essential for successful implementation and institutionalization of project activities. Human, physical, and financial resources all must be assessed.

* Establishing baseline measures is essential if project impact is to be tracked.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team Name	Affiliation	Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. $)	Source of Funds
John Edwards	AED	88	$24,200	TSO 41 & 42
Hernando Gelvez	AED	24	2,520	TSO 42
Martha Montero-Sieburth	AED	30	6,900	TSO 42
Alberto Zuniga-Wager	AED	20	4,460	TSO 42
John Zuman	AED/INCRE	36	17,294	TSO 41
Tom Cassidy	AED	10.5	2,135	TSO 41
Kurt Moses	AED	5.14	1,635	TSO 41

2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) 36

3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) 90

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)
Address the following items:

- Purpose of evaluation and methodology used
- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office:	Date This Summary Prepared:	Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report:
USAID/HONDURAS	SEPTEMBER, 1992	HONDURAS PRIMARY EDUCATION EFFICIENCY PROJECT - MARCH 1992

Purpose of Evaluation and Methodology Used

The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the impact of the Primary Education Efficiency Project at midpoint and to recommend changes in design and implementation in order to increase the probability that project investments would have a sustained and positive impact on the primary education system and on the productivity and quality of life of the Honduran people.

A seven-person team conducted research for the evaluation during August 1991. The team visited project offices and observed schools throughout Honduras. The team conducted interviews with teachers, parents, and students; Ministry of Education (MOE) personnel; USAID/Honduras personnel; Institute for International Research (IIR) personnel, the technical contractor for project implementation; and officials from other donors and Honduran organizations. The team reviewed documents relating to the primary education system and the project.

Purpose of Project

At the goal level, the Primary Education Efficiency Project was designed to improve the productivity and quality of life of the Honduran people. At the purpose level, the project was designed to improve the quality, efficiency, and cost-effectiveness of primary education in Honduras.

Findings and Conclusions

Overall project performance at midpoint is satisfactory and funding and production should be continued as planned. The rate of return to primary education in 1986 and 1990 was sufficiently high to justify investments in primary education. Based on international evidence about the impact of instructional materials and teacher training on student learning, the project should ultimately lead to improvements in the productivity and quality of life of Honduras. Specific findings and conclusions are summarized below.

* **Textbooks**. This component has been successful in writing, producing, and distributing instructional materials, however, it has not been able to coordinate its activities successfully with the activities of the teacher training and evaluation components. A plan is needed for the reproduction of the textbooks.

* **Training**. Although designed to complement each other, the activities of the textbook and training components have not been well synchronized. A great deal of training has taken place but not always in such a way as to enhance the use of the new materials or the performance of the teachers. Training has been theoretical, removed from the realities of the classroom, particularly the challenges of the multi-grade classroom. Like the textbook component, the training component is now shifting focus under the reforms of "Innovación Escolar." Under this new focus, more attention is going toward providing teachers with classroom management skills. Research is needed on the quality or impact of training.

* **Research.** This component, designed to produce research capability within the MOE, has received marginal direction from the project. The research unit has produced only four of the twenty studies called for and none of the conferences. The major barrier to accomplishment of research tasks is the lack of expertise in the design of research studies and the analysis of data. Research should be contracted out.

* **Evaluation.** Not until 1991 were learning objectives approved for grades 1-3; thus, the objectives have followed the development of instructional materials rather than providing guidance for the process. The first waves of testing took place in 1990 and 1991, too late to provide a baseline measure but useful for the validation of test items. Difficulties in carrying out the testing activities are related to the lack of Honduran expertise in test development and analysis and the small amount of technical assistance provided. In addition, little coordination has taken place with the textbook and training components, although in theory these activities should be well integrated. Therefore, additional technical assistance is required in this area.

* **Management Information System (MIS).** No consensus exists within the project or the MOE as to the purpose of the MIS component. Expectations for this component were high and entailed improving the existing information system, broadening access to it throughout the MOE, and generally producing reliable information and analyses for use in education policy and decision making. In addition to confusion over its role, there is doubt over the quality of the data it is producing. Technical assistance was mostly ineffective due to the lack of leadership and a plan for long-term implementation. Staff of the MIS unit do not have the skills or the appropriate hardware and software to carry out the level of analysis needed. Major efforts are needed to address all these constraints.

* **Project Data.** According to the evaluation team, there are significant weaknesses and gaps in the data available to measure the project's impact on the primary education system. As an example, the project had not carried out the proposed standardized testing of students; thus, there was no data related to impact on quality.

The burden of proof, therefore, had fallen to measurements of efficiency: repetition and dropout rates and years needed to produce a sixth-grade graduate. There is, however, no intrinsic relationship between these measures and the project's inputs. Whether or not these measures improve is extraneous to the bulk of the project's efforts, which relate to quality. Not only is the relationship between the indicators and the design of the project faulty, but the reliability of the data available from the MOE to track these measures in also highly susceptible. With the data available it is not possible to say if the project has had an impact on the measures of efficiency. (Please see Mission comments on the subject in section L below).

* **Construction.** Funded out of a local currency account, this unit of the MOE was very successful in carrying out a community-based, low-cost approach to the construction, renovation, and maintenance of school facilities. Altogether over 400 new classrooms were built and over 1,000 existing classrooms renovated. Only the preventive maintenance program remains to be carried out.

* **Innovación Escolar.** "Innovación Escolar" represents a significant attempt on the part of the MOE to address the needs of the large numbers of rural schools with multi-grade classrooms. The changes it has brought about in the instructional materials and the teacher training activities of the project are likely to enhance the effectiveness of the project in improving quality.

* **Technical Assistance.** The greatest share of technical assistance was devoted to the textbook component. There the assumption was made that training and transfer of knowledge and skills could take place simultaneously with production. In fact, the need to meet very demanding schedules allowed production demands to outweigh training concerns. The technical contractor did not play a coordinating role in terms of providing assistance to the five components. In effect, each component went its own way, and the technical contractor followed. Technical support is still needed in areas such as MIS.

* **Gender.** Girls do somewhat better in school than boys. Higher grades have a slightly higher percentage of girls than boys. The real problem for girls appears once they enter the labor force. Women in the same occupations as men, with the same level of education and job experience, earned 20% less than men. By design, project textbooks try to be a progressive influence in their avoidance of stereotypical depictions of the sexes. Training content should also address gender issues.

Principal Recommendations

* **Funding.** The project should focus its efforts on the educational input components and proceed with funding and production as planned. The information components should be consolidated into one unit, and the funding for the research unit should be used to commission needed studies. Additional local currency funding should be provided for the construction unit.

* **Studies. (Action No. 3).** So that the final evaluation team is not faced with the same dearth of data as the midterm evaluation team, the following studies should be conducted by outside consultants: (1) Attach education module to the Household Survey of the Census Bureau and integrate data from this survey with existing MOE data; (2)Conduct study to identify all potentially relevant threats to the quality of MOE data and develop strategies to ensure reliability; and (3) Develop stratified random sample of students in grades 5 and 6 that can be geographically matched with the Household Survey and with other MOE data. Administer standardized achievement tests (criterion–referenced) to this sample. (Action No. 4).

* **Study findings.** All external reports and evaluations should be widely disseminated if the results are to have an impact on the education system. (Action No. 3).

* **Components.**
  - Focus on achieving coordination among the textbook, training, and evaluation components. (Ongoing).
  - Develop implementation plan for MIS component with dates and specific activities for addressing questions of system design, institutional fit, procurement and security, and purpose of the new MIS within the Ministry. Determine mechanisms for addressing information management needs of the other project components. (Actions Nos. 1 and 3).

* **Institutionalization and sustainability.** Both the MOE and USAID/Honduras must face the question of how project outputs are to be maintained after the project is finished. (Completed). The MOE must plan how to absorb the skills of project personnel and the lessons of project experience. (See Attachment C).

Lessons Learned

* **Project monitoring.** Monitoring provides the crucial link between the stages of project design, implementation, and evaluation. Each stage is generally the responsibility of a different institution. Unless clear responsibility is delegated for monitoring, feedback linkages easily dissolve.

* **Baseline measures.** Establishing measures of baseline conditions is essential if monitoring and evaluation are to show project impact.

* **Capability.** Accurate assessment of host country capabilities is essential for successful implementation and institutionalization of project activities. Human, physical, and financial resources all must be assessed.

* **Technical assistance.** To successfully achieve transfer of knowledge, project managers must distinguish between those functions related to training/transfer of knowledge and those related to production/completion of specific tasks. The former required constant efforts.

* **Study findings.** Results of all studies and activities must be widely publicized in the national language if such results are to have an impact on educational development.

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

Attachment A: Outline of Basic Project Identification Data

B: Project Paper Logframe and Recommended Changes

C: Complete list of Recommendations

D: Final Report - Midterm Evaluation of the Primary Education Efficiency Project (522-0273)

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

The MOE and USAID concur with most of the evaluation's recommendations and began implementing these recommendations in late 1991 upon receiving the initial draft of the evaluation report (See Attachment C). However, there are several findings and recommendations which are inappropriate and inaccurate.

Education Data: While the implementation of the MIS will improve the availability and quality of data for project monitoring and additional studies will be conducted as recommended (Actions Nos. 1 & 3) USAID is not convinced that there are insurmountable problems with the availability and reliability of current educational data. The project is using indicators to track project impact which are internationally recognized as measures of the efficiency and quality of education.

Baseline data on the efficiency of primary education as measured by enrollment, dropout, repetition and promotion rates has been available since the inception of the project. Cohorts from first grade enrollments through the sixth grade show a 15% reduction in dropout rates and a 14% reduction in repetition rates since 1986. These improvements are most noteworthy in rural areas and in grades 1-3 where the project has concentrated its resources. In contrast, grades 4-6 which did not receive educational materials and teacher training had promotion rates which remained the same or declined during the same period. Baseline data on student achievement also exists. Standardized tests were administered in grades 1-3 in 1990, 1-6 in 1991 and will continue to be administered through the end of the project. Test scores from 1990-91 show improvements in academic achievement rates of up to 20% on grade levels 1-3 where the project's educational materials are in use. Further, the highest average test scores were recorded in grades 1-3 and the lowest in grades 4-6.

This information was made available to the evaluation team after USAID and the MOE received the initial draft of the report but improvements in academic achievement were not included in the final report and improvements in efficiency were only reported in an Annex to the report, rather than in the body of the report.

Textbooks and Teacher Training for Improving the Efficiency and Cost-Effectiveness of Schooling: The evaluation states that it was incorrect to assume that the availability of teacher training and textbooks could affect the efficiency and cost-effectiveness of schools. However, educational researchers in various parts of the world have concluded that textbooks and trained teachers are two of the most consistent predictors of academic achievement [which includes grade levels completed] for students in developing countries (See USAID/LAC/DR Lessons Learned in Basic Education in the Developing World; USAID: 1990). The project impact indicators discussed above also sustain this hypothesis.

Efficiency vs. Quality: The Mission and the MOE do not agree with the recommendation that the project should focus on improving the quality of education and move away from activities for improving efficiency. Equity in primary education is closely associated with the efficiency of education, equity is an agency wide concern, and inequities could increase if the recommendation were implemented. The project will continue to emphasize interventions designed to improve the coverage, quality and efficiency of primary education.

Project Implementation: USAID and the MOE do not concur with the finding that project Monitoring and Coordination responsibilities were not explicitly assigned or that "each component was treated as a separate entity." While it is recognized that there is a continuing need to improve coordination among components, to state that there has been "no provision" to coordinate components was incorrect and misleading. A major flaw in the report was related to the evaluators' failure to identify two key factors which affected project implementation, coordination and monitoring: 1) the project was initially designed with one government administration, began implementation under a second administration, is currently with a third administration, and will end with a fourth administration; with each change in government administrations there were significant changes in personnel, new component chiefs, new project Directors and administrators. 2) Similarly, the project had five (5) Project Officers in less than six years. The conceptualization, coordination and implementation of the project were affected by these changes.

ATTACHMENT A

OUTLINE OF BASIC PROJECT IDENTIFICATION DATA

1. Country: Honduras

2. Project Title: Primary Education Efficiency

3. Project Number: 522-0273

4. Project Dates:

   a. First Project Agreement: 08/29/86
   b. Final Obligation Date: FY 93
   c. Most recent Project Assistance Completion Date (PACD): 07/30/94

5. Project Funding: (amount obligated to date in dollars or dollar equivalents from the following sources)

a.	A.I.D. Bilateral Funding	US$ 22,619,900
b.	Other Major Donors	US$ N/A
c.	Host Country Counterpart Funds	US$ 6,082,660
	Total	US$ 28,702,560

6. Mode of Implementation: Ministry of Education, USAID and Institutional Contractor

7. Project Designers: Government of Honduras, Honduran Educators and USAID/Honduras

8. Responsible Mission Officials: (for the full life of the project)

   a. Mission Director (s): John Sanbrailo
      Marshall Brown

   b. Project Officer (s): Richard Martin
      Henry Reynolds
      Ellen Leddy
      Nadine Dutcher
      Ned Van Steenwyk

9. Previous Evaluation (s): N/A

ATTACHMENT B

LOGICAL FRAMEWORK
PRIMARY EDUCATION EFFICIENCY PROJECT (522-0273)
Revised 05/92 as part of midterm evaluation

Goal	Original Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Revised Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
To improve the productivity and quality of life of the Honduran people	-Increased agricultural productivity -Improved public health status -Reduced fertility -Increased family income	-Over the longer-term (1986-2006) there will be increased family incomes, longer life spans, and lower fertility rates of people completing grades 4-6, with lower infant mortality rates for their children; as compared to people who do not attend primary school. -Over the shorter-term (1986-94) there will be a 45% increase in 4th grade graduates and a 40% increase in 6th grade graduates.	-GOH statistics from Household Survey -MOE education statistics	-Annual earnings for economically active population completing 4-6 years of grade school will continue to be at least 50% higher, will have longer life spans, lower fertility rates, and their children will have lower infant mortality rates; as compared to people who do not attend primary school. -Teacher training and the availability of educational materials will improve the efficiency of education. -Political stability -Continuing democratic process
Purpose				
To improve the quality, efficiency, and cost-effectiveness to primary education in Honduras	-60% improvement in student achievement -30% reduction in grade repetition rates -10% reduction in dropout rates -13% reduction in school years to produce a 6th	-200% total aggregate increase in academic achievement in the four basic subjects in grades 1-6 (1990-94). -20% reduction in grade school repetition rates (1986-94).	Standardized tests MOE and project statistics	Teacher training and the availability of educational materials will improve the quality and efficiency of education.

Goal	Original Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Revised Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
	grade graduate - 28% reduction in cost per student in grades 1-6	-20% reduction in dropout rates based on grade cohorts (1986-94). -15% reduction in the number of school years required to produce a fourth grade graduate (1986-94). -10% reduction school years to produce a 6th grade graduate (1986-94). -20% increase in total enrollments (1986-94).		-Demand for primary education will continue to increase

Outputs	Original Objectively Verifiable Indicators	Revised Objectively Verifiable Indicators
I. Textbook Component		
1. New national textbook series written and field tested and officially approved	1. 24 new textbook titles and 24 new teacher guides (4 subjects, 6 grades) written, reviewed, field tested, and approved by MOE	1. 16 new textbook titles and guides (4 subjects, 1-4 grades); 4 new workbook titles; 40 new individualized study modules (5 modules per subject, 4 subjects, grades 5-6) written, reviewed, field tested, and approved by MOE
2. Honduran capability to write modern textbooks	2. 4 teams of 5 authors each trained and experienced in textbook preparation and revision	2. 4 teams of 5 Honduran authors each trained and experienced in textbook preparation, revision, editing and production
3. Textbooks and teacher guides printed and distributed	3. Full book coverage of the primary system in 1991: 3,988,000 new textbooks provided to 997,000 primary	3. 5,000,000 new textbooks, teachers' guides, workbooks, individualized modules and other educational

3.	Textbooks and teacher guides printed and distributed	3. Full book coverage of the primary system in 1991: 3,988,000 new textbooks provided to 997,000 primary school students; 157,168 teacher guides provided to 39,292 primary school teachers	3. 5,000,000 new textbooks, teachers' guides, workbooks, individualized modules and other educational materials printed and distributed for full book coverage of the primary system by 1994
4.	Enhanced capability to print and distribute textbooks in the Honduran private sector; enhanced MOE capacity to administer printing and distribution of textbooks	4. Private sector printers and distributors with experience in massive-scale printing and distribution of textbooks. New MOE capacity to project demand, plan, order, store, ship, and deliver textbooks based on computerized inventory system	4. Honduran Private sector experience in printing and distributing educational materials. New MOE capacity to project demand, plan, order, store, ship, and deliver textbooks based on computerized inventory system
II.	<u>In-Service Teacher Training Component</u>		
1.	National program of in-service teacher training workshops expanded and functioning	1. 300 professional teacher trainers, 18 departmental supervisors, and 300 regional supervisors and model teachers trained to serve as in-service teacher trainers	1. 300 professional teacher trainers, 18 departmental supervisors, and 300 regional supervisors and model teachers trained to serve as in-service teacher trainers
2.	Functioning National In-service Teacher Training Center	2. La Paz Teacher Training Center functioning for project purposes 3 months per year for first 5 years of project	2. This item cancelled
3.	Experimental system of in-service distance teacher training field tested and evaluated	3. Use of rural newspaper and/or radio to reinforce in-service teacher training tested for 3 years and evaluated with 10,000 teachers	3. This item cancelled along with the educational media component
4.	Teachers trained in use of new	4. 39,292 teachers, the total number of	4. 25,000 MOE teachers, the total number

10

	textbooks, multi-grade teaching, community relations, basic learning objectives, and testing and evaluation	1991 primary school teachers, trained in 2-week workshops over 4 years	of 1991 primary school teachers, trained in 2-week workshops over 4 years
III.	Education Policy and Research Component		
1.	Education policy study unit	1. One unit with 2 full-time professional education policy researcher/analysts	1. This item cancelled as a sustainable unit.
2.	Studies of policy and administrative alternatives	2. Average of 5 studies completed per year (3 with original data-gathering from the field); LOP total of 40 studies	2. LOP total of 6 major studies completed
3.	Policy research conferences, workshops, observational visits, and technical assistance.	3. Average of 2-3 workshops per year; LOP total of 20 workshops	3. LOP total of 8 policy research workshops on results and recommendations of the 6 major studies and policy issues in education.
4.	Technical assistance provided on major educational policy issues and a minimum of 4 observational visits to other countries by decision makers on major policy issues.		
IV.	Management Information System (MIS) Component		
1.	Enlarged computer capacity	1. Expanded CPU; expanded and decentralized terminal access in MOE; remote access through 12 departmental supervisors	1. Expanded CPU; expanded and decentralized terminal access in MOE; remote data input and access in 3-5 regions
2.	Enlarged base of trained users	2. 200 MOE staff trained in MIS utilization	2. 20 MOE staff trained in MIS operations and 180 MOE personnel trained in utilization

V.	Learning Objectives and Evaluation Component				
1.	Officially approved basic minimum learning objectives	1.	24 final lists of minimum objectives (4 subjects, 6 grades)	1.	24 final lists of enabling objectives, minimum learning objectives, and explicit evaluation criteria for each objective (4 subjects, 6 grades). Criterion referenced standardized test banks developed for grades 1–6; with test items based on the highest order MOE minimum learning objectives for each grade level. A computerized test generation, grading, and reporting system in place
2.	Permanent test item bank	2.	Computerized item bank with 24 files (4 subjects, 6 grades)	2.	Computerized test item bank developed (4 subjects, 6 grades)
3.	Model tests with instructions for using minimum learning objectives and for scoring tests in teacher guides	3.	6 model tests (1 test per grade) printed and distributed to teachers with instructions for using minimum learning objectives, evaluation criteria, scoring tests, the use of tests as formative and diagnostic instruments, and for making pass/fail decisions.	3.	1 model test per grade printed and distributed to teachers with instructions for using minimum learning objectives, evaluation criteria, developing test items, scoring tests, the use of tests as formative and diagnostic instruments, and for making pass/fail decisions
4	Academic achievement tests developed for national evaluation	4.	24 tests in use with periodic upgrading from item analysis and item bank	4.	6 model tests in use
5.	Academic achievement testing program functioning at national level	5.	Tests being administered to representative national sample of primary school children at the beginning and end of each school year; results analyzed and disseminated	5.	Criterion Referenced Standardized Tests being administered to stratified, representative national samples of primary school children at the end of each school year; results analyzed and

			disseminated
6.	Results from national testing program for project tracking	6. At least 10 waves of test data available (2 per year for 5 years)	6. At least 4 waves of standardized test data available (1990–93) during LOP with the use of tests by MOE after PACD
7.	Teachers voluntarily using nationally developed tests for student evaluation and diagnosis	7. At least 20% of teachers making regular use of model tests for grading students	7. At least 20% of teachers making regular use of model or criterion referenced tests for grading students
8.	Project evaluations completed	8. 2 major empirical project evaluations completed in Year 5 and Year 8 of project impact on achievement and efficiency indicators	8. 2 major empirical project evaluations completed in Year 5 and Year 8 of project impact on achievement and efficiency indicators
VI.	Construction, Renovation, and Maintenance Component		
1.	New system of community-based construction, renovation, and maintenance developed	1. MOE community promoters working with teachers and communities to plan and implement school projects with local labor and materials	1. MOE community promoters working with teachers and communities to plan and implement school projects with local labor and materials
2.	Classrooms constructed	2. 150–300 school classrooms constructed per year for 3 years for a LOP total of 450–900 schools depending on success of MOE cost-reduction strategy	2. 600 classrooms constructed and equipped with school furniture (1987–1993); at least 25 school classrooms will be constructed by women teams
3.	Classrooms renovated	3. 100–200 schools classrooms renovated per year for 3 years for a LOP total of 300–600 schools depending on the success of the MOE cost-reduction program	3. 500 classrooms renovated (1987–91)
4.	Schools receiving maintenance	4. 100–200 schools receiving maintenance per year for 3 years for a LOP total of 300–600 schools depending on success of MOE cost-	4. 900 schools classrooms receiving preventative maintenance (1987–93)

5.	School maintenance manuals distributed to all schools	reduction program 5. School maintenance manuals distributed to 9,000 schools. Directors and teachers trained in school maintenance and upkeep
6.	More cost-effective classroom construction strategies developed and disseminated.	6.
		6. Low cost classroom construction strategies and technologies developed to reduce construction costs by at least 50% as compared to traditional cement block classrooms, to encourage increased community involvement in classroom construction; strategies and technologies shared with other donors, GOH and PVO school construction programs.
VII. Educational Media Component		VII. This Component deleted.

NOTE: Please note that "Means of Verification" and "Assumptions" for outputs remain the same as original logframe.

ATTACHMENT C

COMPLETE LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

A. SCOPE OF WORK QUESTIONS

What is the project impact to date on the quality, efficiency, and cost effectiveness of Honduran primary education?

Recommendations

Note: To carry out the studies recommended below, the project should hire external consultants. Whenever possible, the project should contract Honduran experts rather than expatriates.

1. The project should focus less on repetition and dropout rates. They are poor measures of project performance, and the targets laid out in the logframe are not justifiable. More emphasis should be placed on measures of quality by immediately producing and administering standardized tests. Because project personnel do not possess the skills needed to carry out this effort, a team of experienced external consultants should be brought in as soon as March 1992 to begin work on testing. The team should immediately begin the following tasks (see recommendation 3.a under Evaluation component):

   - design a stratified random sample of primary school children that can be geographically matched with the Household Survey (see recommendations 2 and 4 below)

   - design and administer standardized tests to the stratified random sample

   ACTION: *The Mission and MOE do not agree that emphasis should be on quality, rather than the efficiency of primary education (See Section L. Comments by Mission and Borrower/Grantee on Full Report). However, an external technical consultant was contracted to assist the project as recommended to define evaluation criteria for learning objectives and to develop criterion referenced test items for standardized tests. Currently, an external technical consultant is being contracted to continue this work (Action No. 1 on face sheet) and a computerized test generating, grading and reporting system will also be developed for the MOE by another external contractor. (Actions Nos. 3 and 4 on face sheet).*

2. The Honduran Census Bureau has been surveying 11,000 Honduran households twice each year since 1986. Three-quarters of the sample is kept from one period to the next. This data should be carefully analyzed for its content about education, and the

MOE should enter into discussions with the Census Bureau to examine the possibility of attaching an education module to the upcoming March 1992 survey or to those thereafter. An outside consultant should be hired to design the questions for the education module to be attached to the Household Survey. These questions should be aimed at clarifying the following policy issues:

- the magnitude of repetition and dropout rates
- the socioeconomic determinants of student performance
- the effect of crowding (class size) on student performance

ACTION: *USAID developed an education module which will be used in addition to the Household Survey in early 1993. The project's new institutional contractor will conduct studies on the magnitude of repetition and dropout rates, the socioeconomic determinants of student performance, and the effect of crowding (class size) on student performance as recommended. The application of criterion referenced tests in the schools of families included in the National Education Module Survey will also be considered during 1993. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

3. In the meantime, USAID/Honduras should amend the project indicators to include changes in the total number of years of schooling rather than repetition and dropout rates alone. Gains significantly above the secular trend are probably a good indicator of a more productive school environment. "Promoción automática" or other GOH changes in promotion standards would of course reduce the reliability of this indicator of improved productivity and are <u>not</u> recommended.

ACTION: *The Mission does not fully agree. Repetition and dropout rates will continue to be used as project indicators. However, the years required to produce a sixth grade graduate will be monitored as recommended. See also the new project logframe in Attachment B. This recommendation will be closed with the issuance of a project agreement amendment to redefine the project logframe and outputs. (Action No. 2 on face sheet).*

4. The Census Bureau currently collects geographic location data for sample subjects, but most of this data is discarded during processing. The MOE should encourage the Census Bureau to stratify its sample and disaggregate the location data as much

as possible so that household survey data can be matched with reliable MOE data on teacher salaries, training, school type and construction, and other direct inputs to the educational process. Such analysis will eventually make it possible to gauge the optimal mix of public inputs to education and to disentangle the effect of these inputs from domestic, social, and economic influences on educational attainment.

The studies described above in recommendations 1 and 2 above should be administered in such a way as to bridge existing MOE data on class size and teacher education and training with the Household Survey data. The aim of the studies is to clarify spending priorities and provide an independent basis for checking the quality of the MOE's own statistics.

ACTION: *The project's new institutional contractor will utilize the Household Survey, disaggregate date to the extent possible, and work with the education module data in conducting educational research and studies (See recommendation number 2 above). The educational module will also include the disaggregation of date. If further stratification of samples is required for educational research, the institutional contractor will advise USAID and the MOE. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

5. To deal effectively with the MOE data, USAID/Honduras should commission a study by external consultants to identify all potentially relevant threats to the quality of the MOE data and develop strategies and methods to ensure high level of reliability (see recommendation 2.a. under MIS component). This study should carefully consider the effects on data quality of the General Regulation of Primary Education, Article 144, which ties the salaries of school personnel to the enrollment, repetition, and dropout rates they report.

ACTION: *This action will be executed as recommended by the project's new institutional contractor, see also actions for recommendations 2 and 4 above. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

6. Finally, the MOE should consider the issue of under-age enrollments. If under-age enrollments are as prevalent as the evaluation team's preliminary results suggest, the MOE needs to know whether this phenomenon is contributing to poor performance in first grade and whether the crowding effect has a serious negative impact on the performance of the children of legal school age, especially in multi-grade classrooms. If so, significant improvements in performance could be gained simply by enforcing the entry age.

A substantial amount of information related to under-age enrollments can be obtained from the existing Household Survey, but a better understanding would come from the education module proposed above in recommendation 2.

ACTION: *To be executed as recommended by the project's new institutional contractor, see also actions for recommendations 4 and 5 above. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

- **What has been the progress in implementation of the project components?**

Recommendations

1. USAID/Honduras and the MOE should acknowledge the *de facto* split between the three educational input components (textbooks, teacher training, school construction) and the three information components (research, evaluation and testing, and MIS).

   ACTION: *Split is recognized by both USAID and the MOE. In January of 1991 USAID and the MOE reviewed alternatives to reorganize the project based on this split and concluded that the information components could be combined, when the MIS component is implemented (see number 3 below) but that the combination of the teacher training, textbooks and school construction components was not warranted because it would only result in an additional administrative level within the project and would not contribute to increased coordination among components. The recommendation is closed.*

2. In the short time left to the project, its efforts should be concentrated on the educational input components. Because these components have been generally successful, funding and production should continue as planned subject to the specific, short-term recommendations presented below for each of these components. Failure in the information components should not hold up progress in the educational input components.

   ACTION: *The project continues to emphasize educational input components as recommended, but not at the expense of the information components for which implementation activities continue. The recommendation is closed.*

3. USAID/Honduras should consolidate the information components into one unit. The effort to create resident research capability within the project should be abandoned, and funding

from the research component should be reallocated for specific studies by outside consultants (see recommendations for studies under number 2 above).

ACTION: *Information components will be consolidated as recommended with the implementation of the Management Information System (MIS). Implementation of the MIS has begun. (See recommendation number 1 above). Educational research is being contracted as recommended. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

4. In looking to the time when project funding has ceased, the MOE should begin planning for integration of project personnel into the MOE for the maintenance, improvement, and continued expansion of project outputs. The crucial role for the MOE is to productively absorb project capacities into regular MOE units. The most important questions for the MOE to resolve are the following:

   - What happens when textbooks deteriorate, when classrooms need maintenance, and when new teachers need training?

   - Can the MOE institutionalize the project experience and absorb the personnel it trained?

   - What will happen to project computers, vehicles, and equipment? What will happen to the facilities at Picacho?

   To take action on any of these issues, the MOE should begin now to develop a plan for continuing project activities, estimate the costs of absorbing project functions, and seek new sources of funding. The MOE must make decisions about its priorities and alternatives. Once such a plan has been developed, the MOE should sign a memorandum of understanding with USAID to avoid any misunderstanding when the project ends.

   ACTION: *The MOE will fund the printing of textbooks as they deteriorate after the PACD. All of the current activities under the project will continue, with the exception of the educational research component. Teacher training, school construction, MIS and testing will continue with MOE funding after the PACD as specified in the Project Agreement. However, current project personnel will not all be employed by the MOE because of the lower level of effort anticipated in most components. Project Equipment will be MOE property to be used for project related activities after the PACD. A Memorandum of Understanding is not required because activities which are to continue with MOE funding after the PACD are*

clearly defined with MOE commitments in the original Project Agreement, Project Amendments, and Project Implementation Letters (PILs). The recommendation is closed.

- **How appropriate is the new Ministry policy "Innovación Escolar"?**

Recommendations

1. While the innovations incorporated in "Innovación Escolar" offer possible solutions to the needs of the multi-grade classroom, the problem deserves further study. Other solutions, such as a two-shift system that would reduce pressure for school construction or an increase in the number of teachers, might represent more productive uses of existing resources. These options should receive some study.

   ACTION: *To be executed as recommended by the project's new institutional contractor, see also actions for recommendations 2, 4, 5 and 6 for Scope of Work Questions summarized above. (pp 1-3). However, it should be noted that while two shifts can reduce school construction needs, it will not reduce needs for additional teachers or additional salaries for the second shift. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

- **How effective has the technical assistance been?**

Recommendations

1. It is essential to distinguish between two kinds of technical assistance: (1) training and technology transfer versus (2) expert assistance in specific, technical tasks. The first is of a long-term nature, the second short-term. Long-term contractor personnel must build long-term collegial relationships with Honduran counterparts. Careful distinction must be made between skills counterparts need to carry on project responsibilities effectively once contractor personnel are gone and skills that may be contracted to short-term experts.

   ACTION: *The differences in technical assistance are recognized. However, the Mission does not agree that technical assistance cannot provide both training and complete technical tasks at the same time. Recent technical assistance in testing achieved trained local educators in test item development and completed the definition of specific evaluation criteria for all learning objectives. The project will continue to contract technical assistance which can impact on both areas whenever possible. The recommendation is closed.*

2. The findings or conclusions of any consultant effort should be presented in an open forum to members of the MOE, the Mission, and any other appropriate organizations. All consultant reports should be produced in or translated into Spanish and should be widely disseminated. Copies of the report and any data gathered should be provided to the MOE and university libraries for long-term handling and storage. Data should be requested in usable format on diskette with extensive documentation.

ACTION: *To be executed as recommended by the project's new institutional contractor. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

3. All consultant reports and studies should be reviewed by an outside technical expert. Ideally the review would be a double blind review, in which neither the author nor the reviewer know the identity of each other.

ACTION: *This will be done when controversial or contradictory findings or recommendations are produced by technical experts. However, the Mission does not agree that this should be done with all reports and studies because of the costs of contracting additional outside technical consultants to review the work of other consultants. The decision to carry out these reviews will be approved by the Project Committee. The recommendation is closed.*

- **How have recommendations of the 1989 Subsector Assessment been implemented?**

Recommendations

1. If evaluations and assessments are to have an impact, the USAID Mission and the project must widely publicize the reports and their findings. Various formats exist for the dissemination of the results of technical studies:

    - hold seminars
    - distribute copies of the report
    - commission independent review of the study
    - encourage private sector participation
    - store copies in libraries with public access
    - make sure that the data is available for future use

ACTION: *To be executed by the project's new institutional contractor as recommended. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

B. PROJECT MANAGEMENT

The team made several observations that relate to project management in general and thus to all the components. These findings and recommendations are presented in brief below.

- **Accountability for and Security of Equipment**

Because project activities are widely dispersed among several far-flung locations -- the main MOE headquarters, the project offices at Picacho, the MOE construction unit, the office of the technical contractor, and the USAID Mission -- systems must be created to track the existence of all equipment purchased with project funds. Such a system must involve the delegation of responsibility for each kind of equipment and authority to enforce security procedures.

Before any further equipment is purchased for the project, the Ministry of Education and the USAID Mission should ensure that stringent accountability and security systems are in place. In the following text, any mention of purchasing or acquiring equipment, particularly computers, presupposes the existence of these systems.

ACTION: *Recommendation is closed. New equipment inventory systems and controls, accountability and security systems were designed and implemented as recommended by the evaluation, and to comply with FARS and RIG recommendations, by the project with assistance from an external consultant (Price Waterhouse).*

- **Vehicles**

The project currently maintains a fleet of 22 vehicles for alternate-day use. Vehicles are essential to the effective functioning of the project, but the project could save much money from the opportunity cost of the unused vehicles with a waiver from the Government of Honduras to allow the project vehicles to be used everyday rather than every other day.

ACTION: *Waivers have been requested and granted as recommended. The recommendation is closed.*

Maintenance of Project Outputs

An essential question that the USAID Mission and the MOE must ask now in the final two years of the project is "How are project outputs to be maintained?" Each component has specific material and human outputs that could be lost if care

is not taken to plan for their survival. These outputs are listed in brief below. The specific recommendations for each component should be understood in reference to this larger question of sustainability.

Textbooks:
replacement and refinement of instructional materials
trained personnel

Training:
refinement of training materials and processes
training for new personnel

Construction:
upkeep of new school facilities

Testing:
development and refinement of tests based upon basic competencies
trained personnel

MIS:
upkeep and use of computer equipment
trained personnel

ACTION: The recommendation is closed. See Action No. 4 under ***"What has been the progress of the project components?***

C. COMPONENTS

TEXTBOOKS

Short-term Recommendations

1. First grade textbooks

a. Develop plan to reproduce and replace first grade texts.

ACTION: *The Project has developed plans to reprint first and second grade textbooks during 1993 as recommended. The recommendation is closed.*

b. Conduct feasibility and cost study of reproducing first grade texts in form that would allow students to take books home and in quantity that would allow private schools to purchase copies.

ACTION: *To be negotiated with the MOE prior to reprinting first and second grade textbooks. (Action No. 5 on face sheet).*

2. Management information system

a. Provide textbook distribution office with computer so that information can be automated rather than filed manually.

ACTION: *Textbook distribution office will be provided with a computer with the implementation of the MIS component during 1993. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

b. Develop textbook tracking system to record information about inventory of textbooks, distribution of textbooks, and school enrollment figures.

ACTION: *To be developed with the implementation of the MIS component. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

3. Personnel management

a. Resolve personnel contractual issues, and create policies that attract experienced and qualified personnel on the basis of merit.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed. Contractual issues were resolved as recommended with USAID approving all personnel contracted by the project based on the technical qualifications of candidates.*

4. Coordination with other project components

a. Develop close coordinating mechanism for textbook, training, and evaluation units, so that all three units embody a shared vision of the curriculum, learning objectives, minimum competencies, instructional materials, and testing program. This is of special importance for the development and distribution of the learning materials for grades five and six.

ACTION: *Coordination has been improved with all teacher training designed to assist teachers in using textbooks and educational materials produced by the project, and all educational materials are developed using the project's minimum learning competencies (learning objectives). Improved coordination among the information components will be achieved with the integration of these components and the implementation of the MIS component. See also* ***"What has been the progress of the project components; Recommendation No. 3.*** *(Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

b. Conduct classroom-based research to discover how teachers actually use the textbooks, teachers guides, and supplementary materials, so that this reality may come to inform the process and content of teacher training.

ACTION: *To be executed by the project's new institutional contractor as recommended. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

Long-term Recommendations

1. Reconceptualization of Textbooks

With the curriculum reform of 1987 and the innovations set forth by the new government, the issues of content and process are equally demanding. In past years, the move away from a content-centered curriculum to a process-oriented curriculum made it difficult to know what is important knowledge for children to learn. Thus, there is a need for reconceptualizing the curriculum in terms of what it should teach, along with how it is to be taught and for whom. As the textbooks are replaced, editing should focus on the following items:

a. content issues;

b. appropriate sequencing of content match to test items and testing issues;

c. messages dealing with gender, family size, ethnic and racial differences should be made explicit, not only in the content but also in the training sequences.

ACTION: *The recommendation will be closed with the review and reprinting of textbooks for grades 1 and 2 by the project. The content of educational materials for other grade levels are developed on the basis of MOE minimum learning objectives. The recommendation is closed for grades 3-6. (Action No. 5 on face sheet).*

2. Goals for Textbook Production

Goals for textbook production should be global in nature and should include the teachers guides and supplementary materials as well in a general package of material for teachers, supervisors, and directors. Learning objectives as set forth in the testing program will need to be redefined to measure more than just the content found in the textbooks. The minimum competencies need to be reformulated in terms of the learning objectives in order to ensure they are learned.

ACTION: *Materials for students, teachers and teacher training are being produced, are integrated and complementary as recommended. Minimum learning competencies (learning objectives) were reviewed, redefined and explicit evaluation criteria were defined for each competency. However, the Mission does not agree that minimum learning competencies should be redefined to include additional objectives, beyond the content of textbooks and other educational materials produced by the project. Minimum learning competencies serve as the foundation for developing educational materials. The recommendation is closed.*

- **TRAINING**

Short-term Recommendations

1. **Coordination with other project components**

   a. same as 4.a. above under Textbooks
   b. same as 4.b. above under Textbooks

ACTION: *See Textbooks 4.a and b above. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

2. **Content of training**

   a. Focus training on helping children learn. Integrate the content of training to include learning objectives for children, teachers' roles and responsibilities, government policies, and community and parental concerns. The new instructional materials should not be the primary focus of training; instead, they are a tool to help children learn.

   b. Emphasize classroom management skills so that teachers receive training that acknowledges and builds on classroom realities.

   c. Focus training explicitly on issues of gender and ethnic group if equity is a concern. Issues related to urban marginal families should be included as well.

   d. Provide training in simple research skills that teachers can apply back in the classroom.

   e. Provide training on the meaning and uses of testing.

ACTION: *Training is being provided as recommended in all areas with the exception of d. The Mission and MOE do not believe that educational research skills for classroom*

teachers are a priority for the project. The recommendation is closed.

3. Format of training

   a. Replace the "multiplier" model with a "cluster" model. The multiplier model, in which national trainers train successive layers of trainers throughout the country, replicates a top-down, hierarchical system in which teachers wait to be told what to do rather than adopting an active, problem-solving stance toward teaching. The cluster model, in which each community selects an experienced and trained teacher to work closely with local teachers, would build on the community participation efforts of the construction component and fit within the development of the CADs.

      ACTION: *This is being done with the CADs as recommended. However, the training of teachers by MOE trainers will also continue. The recommendation is closed.*

   b. Revive use of radio for providing distance education for teachers, supervisors, and directors.

      ACTION: *The Mission will consider funding teacher training by radio during 1993 and has requested a proposal from the MOE on this activity.*

4. **Impact of training**

   a. Conduct research on quality of training and its eventual impact in the school and classroom. Thus far, evaluation of training has focused simply on counting numbers of teachers and other personnel trained, not on the quality of training. Coordinate this research with recommendation 4.b. above under Textbooks (classroom-based research) to identify how teachers are using new instructional materials.

      ACTION: *To be executed by the project's new institutional contractor as recommended. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

5. **Management information system**

   a. Create database of teachers, directors, and supervisors trained by geographic location and by distribution of new

instructional materials. Identify personnel who have moved into positions for which training was already given and who thus need catch-up training.

ACTION: *To be executed with the implementation of the MIS component. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

Long-Term Recommendations

1. Community Involvement

The new law of municipalities affords the possibility for communities to run their schools. While leadership training is part of the component for municipalities, the possibility of offering such training on a broad basis should be considered. If parents are to participate in such efforts, training along the lines of group dynamics, community empowerment, etc. needs to be part of the CAD and in-service training component.

In the same spirit, the positive experience of the school construction component in generating community participation should be studied closely. It is important to preserve the independence of the school construction component that has served it so well. But at the very least, community groups that have helped build schools should not then be dissolved. Rather, there needs to be a bridging mechanism to involve the community in the daily functioning of the school.

ACTION: *The Mission and MOE will consider activities in this area if the Educational Modernization program the MOE is now considering is adopted and implemented. The school construction component has maintained its independence, this portion of the recommendation is closed. The bridging mechanism to involve the community in the daily functioning of the school, which implies a legal basis for doing so, will depend upon the final manner in which the new municipal law is applied and whether the Educational Modernization program is adopted and implemented. No further action can be taken at this time. This recommendation will be discussed during project amendment. (Action No. 2).*

2. Quality of Training

While the in-service component has been driven to meet numbers trained, the emphasis on quantity may overshadow the need for quality in the training of teachers. There are no evaluation reports on the quality of delivery of in-service training; much of what is known has been collected unsystematically from field site visits.

ACTION: *Training objectives and the evaluation of participants in training programs were included in the 1992 work plan. Results will continue to be monitored and evaluated throughout the LOP. The recommendation is closed.*

- **EDUCATION RESEARCH**

Recommendations

1. Cease attempts to create resident research capability within the project.

   ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, research is being contracted as recommended.*

2. Use remaining funding to commission specific studies by outside consultants (see list of recommended studies under discussion of project impact above).

   ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, research is being contracted as recommended.*

- **LEARNING OBJECTIVES AND EVALUATION**

Recommendations

1. **Test administration**

   a. Postpone goal of <u>national</u> testing program.

      ACTION: *The Mission does not agree that a national testing program should be delayed if the MOE agrees to execute a program of this nature. A final decision will be made during 1993 on whether or not the project would support a national standardized testing program. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

   b. For the remainder of the project, focus testing on stratified random sample of students.

      ACTION: *A stratified random sample will be defined by the contractor who will develop the computerized test generating, grading and reporting system. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

   c. Administer the currently available tests at least until the end of the project, despite their design problems. This should be done to expedite the testing and to ensure

that changes over time are attributable to real changes in performance rather than changes in the structure of the test. The analysis of test results should be sensitive to the biases inherent in test-design.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, testing with existing instruments continues.*

d. Develop tests based upon criteria for grades 1-6.

ACTION: *Criterion referenced tests are being developed. They are scheduled to be completed during 1993. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

2. Learning objectives

a. Establish consensus for set of learning objectives for grades 1-6.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, consensus was reached on learning objectives for grades 1-6.*

b. Integrate learning objectives as foundation of curriculum with efforts of textbook and training components.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, learning objectives are now the curricular foundation for textbook development and teacher training.*

3. Criterion-referenced minimum competency tests

a. For the short-term, immediately develop stratified random sample for test administration. This should be done by qualified professionals with no ties to the MOE or to the project. Have outside professionals administer tests to grades 5 and 6 prior to distribution of new instructional materials in order to establish baseline data for use in final project evaluation.

ACTION: *A stratified random sample will be defined and additional guidance on the administration of the new criterion referenced tests will be provided by the contractor who will develop the computerized test generating, grading and reporting system (See 1.b. above). The Mission and MOE, however, do not believe that it will be necessary to contract outside consultants to administer the new criterion referenced tests. Project and MOE personnel will continue to administer tests. Norm referenced tests were developed and*

administered at the end of the 1991 school year to provide baseline data for grades 4-6, prior to the distribution of textbooks and educational materials for these grade levels. Ideally, criterion referenced tests would have been used to establish baseline data for these grade levels but these tests will not be completed until 1993.

b. Design test sample so that MOE data on teacher education and class size can be incorporated in the analysis of test results.

ACTION: *See 1.b. and 3.a. above. With the implementation of the MIS component additional data will be available for analyzing test results as recommended. In addition, the project will consider administering criterion referenced tests in the schools of the families included in the National Education Module Survey to provide additional socioeconomic data which can be used to analyze test results. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

c. Focus on developing the capability within the MOE to design criterion-referenced tests based on the established learning objectives and academic standards to test student achievement. One test should be developed per grade.

ACTION: *This recommendation is closed. Local MOE test development capabilities are being developed with the assistance of external technical consultants as recommended. However, this recommendation contradicts* ***A. SCOPE OF WORK QUESTIONS*** *1, which recommends that external consultants should develop these tests.*

4. Computer support

a. Provide access to computers and software suitable for test development and analysis.

ACTION: *A contractor will develop the computerized test generating, grading and reporting system as recommended. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

5. Personnel

a. Obtain qualified long-term external technical expertise to work with Honduran project staff in the areas of development of standards, test development and validation, statistical analysis of test data, and reporting of results.

ACTION: *An initial expatriate consultant was contracted as recommended and additional consultants will be contracted to assist the MOE in completing criterion referenced tests, develop the computerized test generating, grading and reporting system as recommended. (Action No. 4 on face sheet).*

b. Stabilize project staffing and provide long-term training to a cadre of Honduran education professionals in the areas of test development and statistical analysis.

ACTION: *The Mission does not fully agree with this recommendation. Short-term training and technical assistance is being provided to develop local capabilities in these areas. In contrast, long-term training investments in these areas would be very difficult to justify under this project because: (1) long-term training is very costly; (2) it would be difficult to assure that people returning to Honduras with long-term studies in test development and statistical analysis would remain with the MOE because of the low salaries paid by the MOE; and (3) there is not enough time remaining in the project to select trainees, provide pre-departure training, complete long-term training and return to the project by January of 1993 (six months prior to the July 1994 PACD as required by USAID-Handbook 10). However, the Honduran Peace Scholarship project may consider funding scholarships for long-term academic training in test development and statistical analysis if appropriate candidates and sponsors are identified.*

- **MANAGEMENT INFORMATION SYSTEM**

Recommendations

Efforts to improve the MIS should not be abandoned. The U.S. $1 million that has been set aside for computer purchase and training should be used for these purposes, primarily for technical assistance and training. Effective implementation of this component during the remainder of the project will require early agreement among the MOE, USAID, and the project on a set of clearly defined activities and a strategy that promotes broad-based collaboration among MOE units on system design and development. Employment of a full-time technical expert to lead the MIS component for two years is critical for the success of these efforts.

The MOE and USAID should develop an implementation plan for this component with dates and specific activities for addressing system design, institutional and resource issues, procurement, and the implementation of the new MIS.

ACTION: *An implementation plan for the MIS has been developed and agreed upon by USAID and the MOE as recommended. Full-time technical experts are being contracted to assist in implementing the plan and a Project Implementation Letter is being drafted which will include specific dates, activities and responsibilities for implementing the MIS. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

1. **Organizational issues**

   a. Develop clear lines of responsibility for data collection, maintenance, and reporting within the MOE. This would involve Informática, Sección Pedagógica, and other relevant department-level units.

   b. Clarify to whom Infórmatica reports in MOE.

   ACTION a-b: *These two recommendations will be closed with the implemention of the MIS component. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

   c. Consider the symbolic renaming of "Informática" to a name that reflects the subservience of technology to decision making -- for example, "Oficina de Información para la Toma de Decisiones."

   ACTION: *The recommendation is closed. "Informática" was renamed and is now called the "Sistema de Información Educativa" (SIE), Education Information System.*

   d. Establish institutional relationships with other ministries to gain access to their education-related data. This would involve the Census Bureau, the Ministry of Health, and the Ministry of Finance.

   ACTION: *The recommendation will be closed with the implemention of the MIS component. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

   e. Make an accurate assessment of the level of effort that would be required to decentralize MIS operations and use in the ministry and in departmental education units by pilot testing use of an improved microcomputer-based MIS in two or three selected functional units in the

Ministry, and in one department. Consult with the Ministry of Health on its experience with decentralization.

ACTION: *The decentralization of MIS/SIE operations is currently being considered by USAID based on a request from the MOE to decentralize data input and analysis activities. The project has also reviewed the experience of the Ministry of Health with its decentralization program as recommended. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

2. Educational data

a. Conduct study to identify all potentially relevant threats to the quality of educational data and develop strategies and methods to ensure high level of reliability.

ACTION: *The study will be conducted by the project's new institutional contractor. (Action No. 3 on face sheet).*

b. Reduce the amount of time it takes to complete a single data collection and reporting cycle of school-based data from two years to one year.

ACTION: *The cycle was reduced to 3 months to provide basic national data on 1991 enrollments, desertion, promotion and repetition rates. However, reducing the cycle for all educational statistics will require the full implementation of the MIS/SIE as noted above. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

c. Demonstrate effective use of information in policy analysis, educational debate, and planning to selected line offices and functional units of the MOE.

ACTION: *The recommendation will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE noted above and by the project's new institutional contractor. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

d. Provide training and technical assistance to policy analysts and planners in selected units of the MOE to develop capacities to assess the efficiency of the education system and to design and develop basic planning and resource allocation models.

ACTION: *The first policy analysis and decision making seminar was held September 21-25. The full recommendation will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE noted above and by the project's new institutional contractor. (Actions Nos. 1 and 3 on face sheet).*

e. Improve the decision-supporting capabilities of the existing MIS by (i) providing an expanded set of routinely generated reports, including the reporting of basic education indicators; (ii) developing a capability to present data in tabular and visual formats, e.g., graphically and using maps generated by a geographic information system; (iii) improving Informática's capacity to respond to ad hoc data requests, and (iv) conversion of the existing education database in Informática to a relational database format for use on microcomputers.

ACTION: *The MIS/SIE now has computer mapping capabilities and the remainder of the recommendation will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE noted above. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

3. MIS Unit

a. Clarify role of the MIS Unit in project and relationship to other components.

b. Provide training and technical assistance to system administrators and technicians in the following topics: the use and maintenance of microcomputers; the design, development, and maintenance of relational databases; and the dissemination of educational data in written and computer-based formats.

ACTION a-b: *The recommendations will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE as noted above. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

4. Purchase of equipment

a. Purchase and install several powerful microcomputers and/or work stations in MIS Unit and two or three selected functional units and/or the offices of one or more senior MOE officials.

b. Purchase several additional types of software, including a relational database, a spreadsheet, a geographic information system, and a statistical analysis package.

ACTION a-b: *The recommendations will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE as noted above. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

c. Postpone decisions on the purchase and installation of a minicomputer and establishment of a computerized network (LAN) until institutional and human resource development issues raised above have been thoroughly addressed.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, institutional and human resource development issues are addressed in the MIS/SIE implementation plan. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

- **SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION, RENOVATION, AND MAINTENANCE**

Recommendations

USAID/Honduras should initiate additional funding for this unit once the MOE has undertaken the following activities.

1. Inventory of physical facilities

a. Conduct detailed study of physical facilities (micro-location study) and assemble information by geographic location.

ACTION: *The recommendation will be closed with the implementation of the MIS/SIE as noted above. (Action No. 1 on face sheet).*

b. Further investment in construction of new classrooms should await the outcome of this study.

ACTION: *The Mission and MOE do not agree with this recommendation. The need for additional classrooms is so evident that there is no need to stop school construction until recommendation a. is closed. Classroom construction is continuing in the poorest departments, in rural communities in southern Honduras, based on clearly defined needs for additional classrooms.*

2. Preventive maintenance program

a. Implement nationally the preventive maintenance program developed under the previous USAID-funded project.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, preventative maintenance programs are being implemented as recommended.*

3. Double-shift schooling

a. Conduct feasibility study of double-shift schooling, whereby one classroom is used for two groups of students, in order to increase efficiency of space use.

ACTION: *The study will be conducted by the project's new institutional contractor and is scheduled to be completed during 1993. However, the MOE is already using double shifts whenever possible to expand access to primary education, but in rural areas this is not always possible because of the distance children would have to walk to get to school. See also 1.b. above, which is the justification for continuing classroom construction in rural communities in southern Honduras.*

4. Community groups

a. With training component, develop strategy to involve the community groups that participated in school construction in school activities on a regular basis.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, the project's Training Component is providing training in community involvement as recommended. However, as discussed above under* ***Long-Term Recommendations: 1. Community Involvement;*** *involving communities in the daily functioning of schools implies a legal basis for doing so, and will depend upon the final manner in which the new municipal law is applied and whether the proposed Educational Modernization program is adopted and implemented. No further action will be taken at this time, but the Mission and MOE will consider additional activities in this area if the Educational Modernization program is adopted and implemented. This recommendation will be discussed during project amendment. (Action No. 2).*

b. Use community groups to train teachers in school maintenance skills.

ACTION: *The recommendation is closed, teachers are being trained in school maintenance as recommended. However, the training is being done by the School Construction Component' the Mission and MOE do not believe that community groups are capable of providing this training.*