

PD-ABG-735

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS.
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA					
A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: Mission or AID/W Office <u>HIRD/ET</u> (ES# _____)		B. Was Evaluation Scheduled In Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan? Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/> Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY ___ Q ___		C. Evaluation Timing Interim <input type="checkbox"/> Final <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/>	
D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)					
Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligated to Date (000)
497-0344	Education Policy and Planning (EPP)	1984	9/92	\$ 10,185	\$ 10,185

ACTIONS		
E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
1. Establish MIS policy for all provinces and also continue to provide more technical and management skills in the area of MIS to the provinces	Center of Informatic, Balitbang Dikbud	on/about March 1995
2. Strengthen relationship through more close coordination and consultation between the Center of Informatic and other units within MOEC in developing policy studies and data production and analysis needed for long-term institutional sustainability.	Center of Informatic, Balitbang Dikbud	on/about Dec. 1995
(Attach extra sheet if necessary)		

APPROVALS			
F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation:		(Month)	(Day) (Year)

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:				
Name (Typed)	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
	S. Grant, HIRD/ET	Prof. H. Bachtiar	E. Greeley, PPS	Charles F. Weden
Signature				
Date	2/3/93	2/12/93	2/12/93	2/22/93

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- | | |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Purpose of evaluation and methodology used • Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated • Findings and conclusions (relate to questions) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Principal recommendations • Lessons learned |
|--|--|

Mission or Office:

HIRD/ET

Date This Summary Prepared:

January, 1993

Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report:

Education Policy and Planning : An
Integrated Information Systems Approach

Purpose of Evaluation and Methodology Used

This evaluation is the final external evaluation of the Education Policy and Planning Project (EPP). Therefore, its focus is on the overall impact of the Project and its potential for sustainability. In the process of examining these factors project accomplishments are also reviewed.

Methodology for this evaluation included a review of relevant documents but concentrated on interviews with Indonesian and Americans directly and significantly involved in EPP. These included provincial education officials, key MOEC personnel, American contractor staff and USAID officers. An interview guide was developed on the basis of questions formulated in the evaluation scope of work and the experience from previous project evaluations. However, given the diversity of those interviewed some of the questions in the guide were emphasized more than others and some were not used at all with some of the interviewees.

Purpose of Activity Evaluation

The purpose of EPP is to contribute to better formulation, implementation and monitoring of education policies and long range plans by assisting the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) in acquiring, analyzing and utilizing more complete and accurate information.

Findings and Conclusions

1. Although the final amendment in 1990 was somewhat more specific in outlining the expected outcome of EPP by PACD, these outcomes flowed from and fit within the initial project strategy which was composed of five elements.

- to increase staff capacity for policy research and analysis;
- to improve the internal management of the Office for Educational and Cultural Research and Development (Balitbang Dikbud);
- to complete studies of key policy issues;
- to assist the Center for Information Systems (Pusat Informatika) in establishing an information system relevant to policy and planning needs;
- to support experimentation with planning and information systems at the provincial level.

These elements have all been successfully achieved. By the end of the project EPP will have provided long and short-term overseas training for 29 persons, including five Ph.D.s and six Master's degrees. Also, hundreds of persons have received in country training at the federal and provincial levels in policy analysis/research and MIS. This has resulted in a very competent, hardworking and dedicated staff, especially in the Center for Information (Pusat Informatika) which is the nerve center for this project.

2. Besides strong leadership, the management and sustainability potential of EPP has been improved through a series of mechanisms, including a steering committee at the policy, decision making level and task forces at the technical level.

21

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

The overall goal of EPP is to improve the quality of education in Indonesia. The purpose is to contribute to better formulation, implementation and monitoring of educational policies and long range plans by assisting the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) in acquiring, analyzing and utilizing more complete and accurate information. The impact of this project on both educational policy and planning has been amply demonstrated as indicated below:

Impact on Policy

- A shift from an emphasis on system expansion (access) to one on quality, efficiency and external efficiency - relating education more closely to the demands of the labor market.
- Extension of basic education from six to nine years to insure a later human resource base for industrial and technological development.
- Refocussing of investments in technical/vocational education.
- A new USAID project (partially based on EPP research) to assist the GOI and the private sector to develop a low cost financial family life services.

Impact on Planning

The data generated and policy studies completed under EPP are constituting the main basis for MOEC input into the annual GOI planning meeting of key decision makers. This then will form the basis for the next Five Year plan and Indonesia's second 25 Year Plan. This work has been accomplished in close coordination with major government units outside the MOEC, such as the National Planning Board (BAPPENAS) and the Ministry of Finance.

More specifically, the EMIS activities under EPP, which is the core element of the Project, have included (1) the development of data production, analysis and marketing capabilities, (2) a well designed MIS in the Center of Informatics, (3) steps taken in the direction of developing an integrated MIS throughout the Ministry of Education and Culture and (4) initial development of data production capability and an MIS at the provincial level. Policy research studies, leading to policy formulation and medium and long range planning by key decision makers, as described above, have included studies on cost analysis, finance and educational efficiency; low cost learning materials; quality and efficiency of vocational/technical education; in-service training of primary school teachers; quality of basic education; strengthening of local education capacity; and input to Indonesian 25 year planning.

While building a constituency among policy decision makers and positively contributing to major planning decisions and activities, the Office of Informatics has assembled (and EPP has trained) a core staff of well qualified persons. Training has had a major role in this project. Besides the academic degree training in the United State for Center staff, there has been considerable and continuous training in country, particularly at the provincial level. All this training has had a high pay off in terms of the policy research produced and in strengthening the potential for sustainability of the institutions involved in the project.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. \$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
Dr. Harold Freeman	Education Development Center, Inc. (EDC)	PDC-5832-I-00-0082-00 14 person/day	13,777	EPP project
2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>3 person/day</u>		3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) _____		

3

3. Policy research studies, leading to policy formulation and medium and long range planning by key decision makers have included studies on cost analysis, finance and educational efficiency; low cost learning materials; quality and efficiency of vocational/technical education; in-service training of primary school teachers; quality of basic education; strengthening of local education capacity; and input to Indonesia 25 year planning.
4. Pusat Informatika has established the basic institutional foundation for the MIS, which includes hardware/software, database, technical resources (personnel) and basic training. The MIS has helped Pusat Informatika consummate its role as a policy developer. The national major planning documents such as the second 25 Year National Development Plan, 5 Year National Development Plans, Rakernas (Annual Budget Plan), have been prepared by Pusat Informatika. Furthermore, information generated has become important as inputs to top level policy making agencies such as Bappenas (the National Planning Board).
5. EMIS capability has been extended to all 27 provinces, greatly improving their data management capacity, although the extent of using information varies among the provinces.

As a result of the EMIS development and completed policy studies mentioned above, the EPP project has already had an impact both on policy formulation and medium and long term educational planning.

Lessons Learned

Lessons learned have included the following;

- Project objectives have not remained constant during the span of the project. They have had to be occasionally revised or refined to be more realistic in compliance with changing conditions or available technology. For example, at the inception of the EPP project, the objectives were to improve the questionnaires for annual education statistics and related data flow. With the availability of micro computers in 1986, the objectives were broadened by including computerization system, policy analysis, and information marketing. With further advanced hardware and soft ware in 1989, the development of an MIS, objectives were allowed to be refined in line with computerized technical advances and on-going requirements.
- It is essential to obtain a commitment from the supervisors of host country counterparts that they will not assign them to work on other major projects. Otherwise the foreign consultant, though technically competent, may be working in a cultural and strategic vacuum. Also technical transfer of knowledge and experience is minimal.

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

✓
5

EDUCATION POLICY AND PLANNING
Final External Evaluation

A. Background

Education Policy and Planning (EPP) is a \$ 14.0 million project in cooperation with the Department of Education and Culture extending over an eight year period (July 1984 to September 1992). Project funds consist of \$ 10.5 million from AID (\$ 4.5 million loan and \$ 5.5 million grant) and \$ 3.5 million from the Government of Indonesia. The project was first amended in June 1988 to secure \$ 2.0 million in additional AID funding and to extend the PACD two additional years to September 1992. The project was again amended in July 1990 adding another \$ 2.0 million in AID funding and \$ 0.5 million in GOI contribution.

The overall goal of the project is to improve the quality of education in Indonesia through the formulation of better policies and long-term plans based on more complete and accurate information and better analysis of that information. To achieve this, the project strategy has five main elements :

- to increase staff capacity for policy research and analysis;
- to improve the internal management of the Office for Educational and Cultural Research and Development (Balitbang Dikbud);
- to complete studies of key policy issues;
- to assist the Center for Information Systems (Pusat Informatika) in establishing an information system relevant to policy and planning needs;
- to support experimentation with planning and information systems at the provincial level.

Technical assistance in the fields of education policy research and analysis, and information systems design and planning and in-country and overseas training (including 6 MAs, 5 PhDs and three one-year diploma courses) has been being provided. In-country training consists of short-courses, seminars and workshops in areas such as micro-computer applications to education planning and policy analysis. Training and technical assistance are intended to result in increased capacity to collect, analyze and store information, and in better informed policy formulation and long-term planning.

In addition to training and technical assistance, the project provides funds for the acquisition of data management equipment both at the central and regional level to help establish a functioning and integrated information system.

6

Project implementation is divided into two phases. Phase One, of roughly 2 years duration, was largely a period of experimentation and exploration of alternatives to the development of an information system master plan for supporting policy formulation and long-term planning, while Phase Two is a period of implementation of the agreed upon plan.

Overall responsibility for project management and implementation is exercised by a Project Steering Committee established by ministerial decree and consisting of representatives of the major units within the Department. A project Working Team has more immediate responsibility for coordinating and managing day-to-day implementation of the project.

Although regular reporting is carried out and workshops are periodically conducted to monitor progress against planned activities, an external evaluation of project implementation was carried out in June 1987 and July 1989. These mid-term evaluation assessed the validity of project assumptions and strategy and made recommendations to improve implementation and optimize chances for achieving institutionalization of objectives. The project was amended twice in 1988 and in 1990. The first amendment extended the project completion date to permit continued implementation of activities and to enable overseas participants to complete their degree programs. The second amendment was to continue implementation of activities which was expanded to include studies needed to develop options for shifting the role of government away from the provision of educational services and materials to accreditation and maintenance of quality.

The second amendment actually specified in detail the expected outcome of this project by PACD :

- An analysis of options for the training and retraining of over 1.2 million Indonesian teachers that will include and focus upon cost recovery and/or the use of private teacher training institutions;
- A body of research that clearly explores MOEC options for the delivery of improved instructional materials that will include market surveys for the encouragement of private materials production and distribution;
- Rationalization of educational output as a function of labor market demand;
- Improved capacity at the national and provincial levels to conduct policy analysis and to formulate policy options;

1

- replication of the EMIS in the country's remaining 22 provinces through utilization of the five existing EMIS centers as training sites.

B. Specific Issues

Since the EPP project will terminate in September 1992, the contractor will conduct a final evaluation of the project. The main focus of the evaluation is

- to review achievements (actual versus planned) of purpose-level targets (EOPs) to date according to the following criteria:
 - (1) who were the beneficiaries? What percent women?
 - (2) Is the achievement sustainable in whole or in part?
 - (3) Actual relevance or effectiveness of actual achievement for reaching project purpose :

a. increase staff capacity for policy research and analysis to formulate better policies and long-term plans based on more complete and accurate information and better analysis;

b. complete studies of key policy issues;

c. assist the Pusat Informatika in establishing information systems relevant to policy and planning needs

d. support experimentation with planning and information systems at the provincial level

- to review the impact of the project on Indonesian education policy.

- to review the effectiveness of the information management system. Has the MOEC been able to formulate more informed and appropriate policies? To what extent are the data and policy research utilized?

C. Evaluation Approach and Methodology

The contractor is expected to prepare a final evaluation report of the Education Policy and Planning project. The report will at the same time serve as part of the substance for the Project Assistance Completion Report.

It is planned that the final evaluation be conducted by one person who will spend two weeks from June 27 - July 11, 1992 to prepare and write the report.

In conjunction with the IEES/EPP Regional Conference to be held on June 29 - July 3, 1992 in Jogjakarta, Central Java, the contractor is expected to participate in the conference, interview and hold discussions with MOEC officials and other concerned parties on the EPP performance and impact. Results of the interview will be the input to the report.

Prior to the contractor's departure from Indonesia, he will provide a final briefing on his observations, conclusions and assessments and provide a final written draft to the USAID Mission and Balitbang.

The contractor must have prior experience in Indonesia and have good relation with GOI officials in the MOEC. He/she should also have education management background and A.I.D. experience either as Direct Hire or Contractor and should be familiar with A.I.D.'s evaluation procedures.

The logo consists of the letters 'EPP' in a large, bold, serif font. Below each letter, there is a small horizontal line with some illegible text underneath.

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

Education and
The Economy
The External Efficiency of Education

Walter W. McMahon
and Boediono, Editors



Pusat Informatika
Balitbang Dikbud

Center for Informatics
Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development

DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN
DAN KEBUDAYAAN

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

10

The logo consists of the letters 'EPP' in a large, bold, serif font. Below the letters, there are three small rectangular boxes containing the words 'ECONOMY', 'EDUCATION', and 'POLICY' respectively, though they are partially obscured by the 'EPP' text.

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

Education,
Economic, and
Social Development

Second 25 Year Development Plan
and Sixth 5 Year Development Plan
Background Papers and Goals

Boediono, Walter W. McMahon,
and Don Adams, Editors



Pusat Informatika
Balitbang Dikbud
DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN
DAN KEBUDAYAAN

Center for Informatics
Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development
MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

EPP

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

Improving the
Educational Quality
of Primary Schools

Ace Suryadi



Pusat Informatika
Balitbang Dikbud

Center for Informatics
Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development

DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN
DAN KEBUDAYAAN

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

12

The logo consists of the letters 'EPP' in a bold, serif font, enclosed within a rectangular border.

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

A Review of Teacher
Education Issues in
Indonesia

June 1990



Pusat Informatika | Center for Informatics
Balitbang Dikbud | Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development
DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN | MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
DAN KEBUDAYAAN | AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

EPP

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

An Analysis of the Status
of Curriculum Reform and
Textbook Production in
Indonesia

April 1990



Pusat Informatika | Center for Informatics
Balitbang Dikbud | Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development

DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN | MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
DAN KEBUDAYAAN | AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

14

EPP

EDUCATIONAL POLICY AND
PLANNING PROJECT

A GOVERNMENT OF INDONESIA - USAID PROJECT

Education Indicators for
Policy Purposes in
Indonesia

June 1990



Pusat Informatika
Balitbang Dikbud

Center for Informatics
Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development

DEPARTEMEN PENDIDIKAN
DAN KEBUDAYAAN

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
AND CULTURE

Jakarta, Indonesia

15

X.D. (16) 0735 11

Education Policy and Planning:

**AN
INTEGRATED INFORMATION
SYSTEMS APPROACH**

FINAL EVALUATION

Submitted to

**Office for Research and Development
Ministry of Education and Culture
Republic of Indonesia**

and

**The United States Agency for International Development
Jakarta, Indonesia**

Submitted by

**EDC
Education Development Center, Inc.**

Prepared by

Harold Freeman

Indefinite Quantity Contract

#PDC-5832-I-00-0082-00 D.O. #12

July, 1992

16

Acronyms

BALITBANG	Office of Educational and Cultural Research and Development in the Ministry of Education
BAPPENAS	National Planning Board
EMIS	Educational Management Information System
EPP	Educational Policy and Planning Project
GOI	Government of Indonesia
IKIP	Institute of Teacher Training and Education Sciences
MIS	Management Information System
MOEC	Ministry of Education and Culture
Centre for Informatics	Pusat Informatika
RAKERNAS	Annual MOEC Meeting to issue Annual Policies and Directives
REPELITA	Government Five Year Development Plan
USAID	United State Agency for International Development

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page

Executive Summary	1
1. BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION DESIGN	2
Background	2
Evaluation Design	4
Scope	
Methodology	
Limitations	
Consultant Services and Training	5
Relationship of EPP to IEES	8
2. IMPACT OF EPP ON POLICY	8
3. PROJECT ACTIVITIES	10
EMIS Activities	10
Background	
Progress to Date	
MIS Perspective	
Policy Analysis Development	15
Policy Research	17
4. INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF BALITBANG'S PLANNING CAPABILITY	21
5. LESSONS LEARNED	23
6. CONCLUSION	25

Appendix 1 : List of Persons Consulted

Appendix 2 : Interview Guide

Appendix 3 : Scope of Work

18

Executive Summary

This report is the final external evaluation of the Education Policy and Planning Project (EPP). The overall goal of EPP is to improve the quality of education in Indonesia. The purpose is to contribute to better formulation, implementation and monitoring of educational policies and long range plans by assisting the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) in acquiring, analyzing and utilizing more complete and accurate information. For the purpose of this evaluation the best way to determine the extent to which the project purpose has been achieved is by examining the major project components -- education management information systems (EMIS) development, policy research and analysis and institutional capacity building.

The impact of this project on both educational policy and planning has been amply demonstrated as indicated below :

Impact on Policy

- A shift from an emphasis on system expansion (access) to one on quality, efficiency and external efficiency -- relating education more closely to the demands of the labor market.
- Extension of basic education from six to nine years to insure a larger human resource base for industrial and technological development.
- Refocussing of investments in technical/vocational education.
- A new USAID project (based on EPP research) to assist the GOI develop and disseminate low cost learning materials through the private sector.

Impact on Planning

The data generated and policy studies completed under EPP are constituting the main basis for MOEC input into the annual GOI planning meeting of key decision makers. This then will form the basis for the next Five Year Plan and Indonesia's second 25 Year Plan. This work has been accomplished in close cooperation and coordination with major government units outside the MOEC, such as the National Planning Board (Bappenas) and the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Labour and the Central Bureau of Statistics.

More specifically, the EMIS activities under EPP, which is the core element of the Project, have included (1) the development of data production, analysis and marketing capabilities, (2) a well designed MIS in the Centre for Informatics, (3) steps taken in the

direction of developing on integrated MIS throughout the Ministry of Education and Culture and (4) initial development of data production capability and an MIS at the provincial level.

Policy research studies, leading to policy formulation and medium and long range planning by key decision makers, as described above, have included studies on cost analysis, finance and educational efficiency; low cost learning materials; quality and efficiency of vocational/technical education; in-service training of primary school teachers; quality of basic education; strengthening of local education capacity; and input to Indonesian 25 year planning.

While building a constituency and contributing to major policy and planning decisions and activities, the Centre for Informatics has assembled (and EPP has trained) a core staff of well qualified persons. Training has had a major role in this project. Besides the academic degree training in the United State for Centre staff there has been considerable and continuous training in country, particularly at the provincial level. All this training has had a high pay off in terms of the work produced and in strengthening the potential for sustainability of the institutions involved in the project. Other measures, described in this evaluation, also provide indicators of the institutionalization of the project.

BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION DESIGN

A. Background

Education Policy and Planning (EPP) is a \$14.0 million project in cooperation with the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) extending over an eight year period (July 1984 to September 1992). Project funds consists of 10.5 million from USAID (\$4.5 million loan and \$5.5 million grant) and \$3.5 million from the Government of Indonesia. The project was first amended in June 1988 to secure \$2.0 million in additional USAID funding and to extend to PACD two additional years to September 1992. The project was again amended in July 1990 adding another \$2.0 million in USAID funding and \$5 thousand in GOI contribution.

The purpose of the project is to contribute to better formulation, implementation and monitoring of educational policies and plans by assisting the MOEC in acquiring, analyzing and utilizing more complete and accurate information. To achieve this, the project strategy has five main elements:

- to increase staff capacity for policy research and analysis;
- to improve the internal management of the Office for Educational and Cultural Research and Development

VP

(Balitbang Dikbud);

- to complete studies of key policy issues;
- to assist for Information Systems (Informatics Centre) in establishing an information system relevant to policy and planning needs;
- to support experimentation with planning and information systems at the provincial level.

Technical assistance in the fields of education policy research and analysis, and information systems design and planning and in-country and overseas training has been provided. In-country training consists of short-courses, seminars and workshops in areas such as micro-computer applications to education planning and policy analysis. Training and technical assistance are intended to result in increased capacity to collect, analyze and store information, and in better information policy formulation and long-term planning.

In addition to training and technical assistance, the project provides funds for the acquisition of data management equipment both at the central and regional level to help establish an integrated information system.

Project implementation is divided into two phases. Phase One, of roughly 2 years duration, was largely a period of experimentation and exploration of alternatives to the development of an information system master plan supporting policy formulation and long-term planning, while Phase Two is the period of implementation of the agreed upon plan.

Overall responsibility of project management and implementation is exercised by a Project Steering Committee established by ministerial decree and consisting of representatives of the principal units within the Ministry.

Although regular reporting is carried out and workshops are periodically conducted to monitor progress against planned activities, an external evaluation of project implementation was carried out in June 1987 and July 1989. These mid-terms evaluation assessed the validity of project assumptions and optimize chances for achieving institutionalization of the objectives. The project was amended twice in 1988 and in 1990. The first amendment extended the project completion date to permit continued implementation of activities and to enable overseas participants to complete their degree programs. The second amendment was to continue implementation of activities which was expanded to include studies needed to develop options for shifting the role of government away from the provision of educational services and materials to accreditation and maintenance of quality. The second amendment actually specified in detail the expected outcome of this project by PACD:

21

Supplement No. 2 to EPP Project of 1990 (the Project's second amendment). Given the diversity of those interviewed -- provincial officials, key MOEC personnel, American contractor staff -- some of the questions in the guide were emphasized more than others and some were not used at all depending on the background of those interviewed. Also, to the extent the situation had evolved since the last evaluation, some questions were later revised or dropped. Finally, due to the brief nature of this assignment, while the writer takes full responsibility for the discussions of impact and sustainability, this report relies heavily on documentation from Florida State for the statements on specific achievements.

Limitations

1. Several of the EPP's policy studies were delayed because of unavailability of counterparts; others were identified and planned later in the project life. These two categories are only now reaching conclusion. For this reason and also because of the time allocated to this evaluation the writer is not able to comment on the quality of these studies. However, from conversations with key individuals it is the writer's impression that all studies are of reasonable quality and some are very good. More importantly, they will be used, and some are already used, in the preparation of medium and long term plans for education in Indonesia.
2. The time allocated for this evaluation only enabled the writer to conduct a small number of in-depth interviews but, fortunately, the interviewees were all key persons both in terms of knowledge of the project and level of position held.

Consultant Services and Training

Tables One and Two which follow quantify the amount and type of long and short term consultancy services provided over the life of the EPP Project as well as the study tours and academic long term training in the United States and short term training in Indonesia.

Table Two

Fellowship Program

PhD	5 person
MA/MS	6 Person
Study Tour..... (Overseas)	18 Person (57 P/M)

In-Country Training

Policy Analysis/Research	523,440 P/D*
MIS	680,160 P/D

- * Since this project has primarily focused on capacity building rather than on broad-based training, most of the people trained received training multiple times per year and over the years. Therefore, in-country training is best expressed in person/days rather than in numbers trained.

Relationship of EPP to IEES

EPP strategy was derived from critical needs that were identified in the 1985 Education Sector Review conducted by the centrally funded Improving the Efficiency of Education Systems (IEES) Project, especially the need for an effective education management information system (EMIS) to provide reliable and timely data and for capacity for effective and continuing policy research within the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC).

The close and mutually supportive integration of EPP and IEES has proven to be an effective assistance strategy. EPP and IEES have leveraged resources to achieve significant policy impacts at a relatively small investment. In most cases IEES has served as a conceptualizer while EPP has begun to use staff and funds to operationalize the concepts. In some cases, although studies were initiated by IEES, their results have fed into the overall objectives and framework of EPP. Even IEES activities that have been centrally funded have contributed directly to the impact and sustainability of EPP - especially those activities geared to capacity building.

IMPACT OF EPP ON POLICY

While creating MOEC capacity to collect and analyze data and also effectively introducing data-based arguments into policy forums-- such as Rakernas where decision makers across ministries and from the provinces develop each year's policies and directives -- EPP has carried out a series of studies designed to provide answers to key policy questions of the Government of Indonesia (See section on Policy Research for a description of individual studies and their specific impact). EPP/IEES policy studies, including the 1986 Education Sector Review, have resulted in the following significant policy impact, improving both the quality and efficiency of the educational system.

- The shift from expansion of the education system to emphasis on improving quality and efficiency. Beginning in 1986, the creation of EPP focussed GOI attention on improving quality and efficiency. This focus is now broadly accepted across both GOI and external assistance agencies (the World Bank now supports a major quality improvement project in primary education).

- National policy decision to invest greater resources in lower secondary education-- extending basic education from 6 to 9 years. The current GOI emphasis on improving the quality of education is possible because the EPP study on the Quality of Education revealed 98.6% of the cohort now participates in Basic Education.

24

- Findings of EPP/IEES sector assessment and policy studies directly affected GOI decision to dramatically lower the previous targets to increase Vocational/Technical Education with more emphasis on basic education instead. (Vocational/Technical Education is also being expanded but within a market drive private context.) Current EPP studies now being completed focus on how to improve the quality and external efficiency of Vocational/Technical Education.

- Project studies have influenced GOI to explore greater cost recovery in higher education, with great potential for budget allocations. Student from general education and University have been automatically supported through GOI scholarships regardless of family ability to pay. EPP has provided evidence that greater equity can be achieved by lowering fees at the bottom (so that a broad section of the school age population can complete general education) and establishing reasonable tuition fees at University level.

- EPP/IEES have effectively argued for greater regional equity, as a step in the process of decentralization. The development of provincial data base system has helped strengthen the argument for local needs. Capacity building for sector analysis has also helped in analysis of local needs.

- EPP efforts at interministerial collaboration has resulted in establishing information linkages and retrieval systems. Interministerial sharing of human resources statistics better informs GOI policy and practice decisions. Interministerial BRIDGES now link MOEC with the National Planning Board, Ministry of Labor and Manpower, the Ministry of Finance, the Central Bureau of Statistics and the Provincial Planning Board through the development of research networks in the provinces and the execution of sector assessments at provincial levels. Due to EPP/IEES negotiations there is now more sharing and uniformity of data and the GOI moratorium on collected data has now been reduced from 3 years to 8 months.

- Recommendations from the curriculum reform study for efficiency improvements in secondary education have resulted in underscoring the current policy debate for sweeping simplification of primary and secondary curricula. This is also leading to plans for a continuous assessment of the curriculum.

- The data generated and policy studies completed under EPP are constituting the main basis for MOEC inputs into the Rakernas-- the annual planning meeting of Government of Indonesia decision makers -- which, in turn, feeds into the planning exercises for the next Five Year Plan and Indonesia's second 25 Year Plan.

3. PROJECT ACTIVITIES

EMIS Activities

A. Background

The development of MIS in the Education Policy and Planning Project was launched with two general objectives in 1985:

1. To establish a viable management information system in the Centre for Informatics (Pusat Informatica) for the Ministry's policy and planning activities;
2. To experiment with planning and information systems at the provincial level;

In the early stages of the project, an operational plan was developed. This plan has served as the blueprint for the establishment of the MIS thus far. The focus of this plan was geared toward the development of a viable information technology infrastructure, on which all data/information related activities should be based. Thus, the development of MIS in the EPP project has been approached from the institutional development point of view rather than data collection and processing per se.

In line with the general objectives set by the project, the head of the Informatics Centre specified major activities to be carried out as follows :

1. To establish an educational data base in the Centre for Informatics. This data base would serve as the main source of educational data for policy and planning activities.
2. To develop advanced computer application systems to meet the information requirements for policy and planning activities.
3. To conduct key policy studies for top decision-makers.
4. To establish a data bank in the Centre for Informatics, a unit serving clients (policy analysts, planner, researchers and other related administrators) with relevant information.
5. To realize an effective "transfer of technology." Advanced technical knowledge, skills and facilities should be introduced to the Ministry as they become available.
6. to conduct effective training programs to secure sufficient technical resources at the central and provincial levels.

The underlying principle here was that, to the extent these activities can be operationalized and institutionalized, the Centre for Informatics will become a sustainable organization within the MOEC.

B. Progress to Date :

At the central level (Centre for Informatics)

1. A well equipped computer center was established. This center is equipped with the central computer system of VAX 6210 connected with 23 units of IBM XT equivalent personal computer for data entry, editing and processing. This VAX system, mainly serving the central data base, is operated under various software including UNIX operating system and INFORMIX data base management system. There are also 10 units of self-standing IBM AT comparable in the Centre for Informatics to support policy and planning activities.
2. Although the development of an integrated EMIS in the MOEC has not yet been fully achieved, computer facilities have been utilized by various units of the Ministry and also related outside agencies. Below are a list of current major applications.
 - (a) Educational policy formulation (Centre for Informatics and other related units)
 - (b) Long and medium term planning (All education communities)
 - (c) Annual budget planning (All units in the MOEC)
 - (d) Manpower development (Centre for Informatics, Bappenas, Min. of Manpower)
 - (e) Teacher supply/demand (Centre for Informatics and Bureau of Personnel)
 - (f) School Mapping (Centre for Informatics and all 27 provincial offices)
 - (g) Indicator System (Centre for Informatics, Bappenas, Office of Basic Education)
 - (h) Education Statistics (Centre for Informatics and all 27 provinces)
3. The Centre for Inforamtics is equipped with various facilities for generating, collecting, and analyzing data. The following statements describe the current situation :
 - (a) The Centre for Informatics data base, since its establishment, has served as one of the main sources of education data. This data base has also been used as the main means of improving data quality, integrity and availability.
 - (b) The institutional capacity for handling data in the Centre for Informatics has greatly improved. It is equipped with various data analysis software such as Lotus, Basic, SPSS, Fortran etc. The more impressive

aspect, however, is a cadre of professional and technical people in Pusat, who are competent and knowledgeable in the MIS.

- (c) The establishment of MIS at the provincial level has resulted in many positive outcomes for the improvement of data management. First, the provincial offices now possess technical capacity to manage data for their own needs. Such capacity at the provincial level has also contributed to the improvement of data communication between these provincial offices and the central office.
4. The MIS has helped the Centre for Informatics consummate its role as a policy developer. The national major planning documents such as the second 25 Year National Development Plan, 5 Year National Development Plans, Rakernas (Annual Budget Plan), have been prepared by the Centre for Informatics. Furthermore, information generated has become important as inputs to top level policy making agencies such as Bappenas (the National Planning Board).
 5. The Centre for Informatics has established the basic institutional foundation for the MIS, which includes hardware/software, data base, technical resources (personnel) and basic training. However, the level of the analytic capacity should continually be improved. Therefore, advanced technical training in the areas of modelling, simulation, information synthesizing and presentation, etc., will be very useful for MOEC departments and especially for the provinces.

(Note: It is hoped that financing of this training will be made available through the World Bank).

At the Provincial Level

1. At the inception of the project, three provinces (West Java, South Sulawesi, and West Nusa Tenggara) were chosen as the pilot sites and the Division of Planning in each was designated the project unit. The focus of the development was to establish a viable MIS capacity at these provincial offices. In this connection, an MIS taskforce was formed in each of these provinces and was given intensive basic skill training (DOS, Lotus, Dbase III, Picture maker, Basic, SPSS, Pascal and Wordstar). Encouraged by the positive outcomes demonstrated in the pilot efforts, the project's Steering Committee, the governing body of the project, decided to expand the pilot scheme to all 27 provinces, preceded by an interim step of increasing the number of pilot sites to 5 provinces. Thus, two more provinces, East Java and West Sumatra joined the project in 1988. These five pilot provinces have also been designated

28

the regional training centers to assist neighboring provinces in their respective regions. The Steering Committee also decided to experiment with the MIS on the district level. For this purpose one district in each pilot province (exception:

for West Java 2 districts) was chosen and has participated in the project activities.

2. The use of the MIS varies among the provinces. Some of them use it very effectively both for planning and management purposes. In these provinces, the MIS has been a means of vitalizing related office functions and management cycles. Below listed are some of the major applications :

- (a) Compilation of annual education statistics
- (b) Individual record system for teachers and administrators
- (c) Budget preparation and analysis
- (d) Projections of student enrollments
- (e) Student flow and cohort analysis
- (f) Project Monitoring
- (g) School mapping
- (h) Indicator systems (primary level)

This information opens the dialogue between the central and provincial levels and helps the central level to develop policies that are more realistic.

3. Besides providing information to the center for policy purposes, the establishment of the MIS has greatly improved data management capacity at the provincial level. Each of these provincial offices is now serving as the center of managing its own data. All data related attributes have been steadily improved, inspired by a sense of ownership. This saves time for the central unit because, instead of having to go to schools for information they can go to the province.
4. Again, the extent of using information varies among the provinces. Some provinces, backed by the MIS, take the initiative in planning and management activities. In some cases, new functions such as research and training emerge. The relationships with other government agencies have become more cooperative, backed by information generated by the MIS.
5. At the provincial level, needs for the MIS are many. First, they need more training in the technical and management areas. Second, more computers will be needed as the skills and knowledge improves in these provinces. Third, technical assistance will be useful to improve the quality of the MIS. To this end the Centre for Informatics should :
 - a. Establish MIS policy for all provinces;
 - b. Provide more training in MIS skills;
 - c. Continue technical assistance to provincial data units;

29

- d. Take leadership in advancing new technologies.

C. MIS Perspective

The EPP Project, after seven years of operations, comes to an end in September 1992. The overall legacy will be the establishment of a "viable" MIS capacity at the central office (Centre for Informatics) and all 27 provincial offices.

The Centre for Informatics is now equipped with an advanced computer center where all data related activities are carried out. This center is filled with a cadre of competent MIS specialists. Education statistics, projections, simulations, indicator systems, school mapping, and graphics, etc., are some of the major activities carried out by office staff themselves. The data base, which is also a product of this project, has been a useful information source not only for the MOEC, but also other related agencies including other ministries and universities.

Various policy studies such as Basic Education Quality Study, Vocation-Technical Education Quality and Efficiency Study, Manpower Projection, Internal and External Efficiency of Education, etc., have been carried out with the support of this computer center.

For the provincial offices, through the EPP Project, information technology was introduced to these provinces for the first time. As of now, the stages of progress in these provinces are diverse: Some provinces have been making remarkable progress, while others still lag far behind. But, the future is promising even for those who are behind. The EPP project adopted an institutional development approach for this MIS development. With the aim of building capacity, a substantial amount of effort was spent on technical training, especially, in the early stages of development. Thus far it has been amply demonstrated that MIS can be an effective catalyst to transform the provincial offices from their minimal capabilities to efficient and effective institutions. Information generated by the MIS provides the provincial administrators and planners with new perspectives of their responsibilities and duties. The facilitation of administrative processes by the MIS has helped the related administrative cycles become faster and more efficient. Backed by the MIS, research activities have emerged in these provinces by their own initiative.

Concerns

1. In the eagerness to move forward quickly with information leading to policy formulation at the national level there has been a tendency on the part of the Centre for Informatics to
- 

material for the annual planning meeting (Rakernas) and for the next Five Year Plan (Repelita Six), he expressed a desire for more interaction between his department and Balitbang especially in relation to data production and analysis.

At the time of EPP's second evaluation it was noted that a Policy Analysis Group (PAG) had been established and members designated (including staff returning from participant training in the United States.). However, the PAG was quietly dropped as an institutionalized group due to the heavy workload of its former members and a feeling that to be responsive to particular needs and problems as they arise, individuals with skills specific to the problem being addressed should be pulled together on an ad hoc, as needed basis. In the case of studies related to external efficiency of the 25 Year Plan, for example, representatives from Bappenas, Statistics and Manpower might be included. The mechanism to do that was the creation of Task Forces.

Determination of Task Force Activities

The determination of what Task Forces will be created is based on the following set of circumstances.

1. Every year Balitbang asks MOEC principal units and other ministries what problems they have.
2. The Minister of Education and Culture asks Balitbang to evaluate existing policies and recommend new ones in preparation for the annual Rakernas meeting of key decision makers in the Government of Indonesia. Also, problems are identified at the Rakernas meeting for study and preparation of findings for presentation at the next Rakernas.
3. Within MOEC the Minister has a meeting at least once a month with the heads of all MOEC units. Problems for study are discussed there.
4. Other ministries; e.g. Labor or Manpower, will raise issues about external efficiency for Balitbang study.

Once problems for Task Force analysis have been identified Balitbang decides whether to ask Bappenas for funds or to seek assistance from donors. A case of the latter was a request to the UNDP, which was granted, for funds to map a research agenda of "burning" issues.

Models for Determining the Composition of Task Forces

1. The typical pattern is one where a core internal Balitbang Task Force is formed, primarily from within the Centre for Informatics but sometimes using staff from the Education Research Centre depending on the expertise required. During the life of EPP this staff has been supplemented and assisted by American consultants under the Florida State contract. Alternatively, the Centre for Informatics will pull in persons from other ministries or senior staff from IKIPs and universities as short term consultants to the core team.
(Note: Some EPP Project consultants have had to do most of the work on their own with little counterpart help because their designated counterparts either were too busy with other tasks to be released full time for this work or else they did not have a sufficient level of skill to enable them to collaborate fully. The latter has become less of a problem as EPP trainees have completed their programs. This should even be more of the case once all participants return home.)
2. Balitbang sometimes contracts out what would normally be a Task Force activity due to a shortage of staff or skills. This has had mixed results because it is not always easy to find available qualified persons to contract with and it is hard to control for quality and for submission of reports on a timely basis. Thus far this model has not been used under EPP but it could be a possibility after EPP ends.
3. A core team will be formed by hiring people from a university on a temporary basis ranging from a few months to a couple of years. For that period of time they are considered members of Balitbang.
4. Finally, people are "borrowed" from a university and put on loan to Balitbang. These persons usually end up becoming "permanent" staff.

Policy Research

A number of policy studies have been undertaken to focus on specific, major issues and problems of Indonesian education as well as to point the way for future direction in education. These studies support the data analysis generated by Centre for Informatics to assist the MOEC in the formulation of educational policy and long range plans for educational development. The previous section on Policy Analysis Development described the process by which these studies are generated and implemented. The following is a brief summary of some of the key studies and their potential impact.

included: legal/regularity conditions, licensing, purchasing capacity of parents and training needs for the private sector. Responsibilities from the national level down to the school system were examined. These analyses have served to provide USAID with an understanding of the rate and degree of household expenditures on learning materials and overall private costs related to primary schooling. Direct and immediate impact of this research is the development of a new USAID project -- Privatization of Educational Support Services -- currently in the final stages of the USAID approval process.

4. In-Service Training of Primary School Teachers.
The improvement of the quality of teachers, especially at the primary school level is a national priority, mandated under the present Five Year Plan. The objective of this study was launch policy research and development + activities related to the MOEC's effort to provide professional upgrading to all of its current primary school teachers through in-service training; within that framework the specific focus under EPP has been to analyse cost financing and private sector involvement of in-service teacher training and to conduct action research related to training in remote areas with an emphasis on utilizing educational technology as a tool to reach these areas.
5. Quality of Basic Education. This long term study has collected one of the richest data sets on the quality of basic education in developing nations and is used as a basic planning and reference document by donor agencies assisting education in Indonesia. The study provides exceptionally complete and comprehensive data base for the investigation of those factors that most enhance educational effectiveness, efficiency and quality of the primary level.
6. Strengthening Local Education Capacity II. This research initiative focuses specifically a community support and financing of education. It draws upon the community support information available in the Quality of Basic Education data set and also the SLEC I research project under IEES which focused on strengthening parental and societal participation in school activities in order to enhance community commitment to the schools. This research is directed towards improved planning for educational efficiency by moving in the direction of the country's long term objective of decentralization. It also has a process impact related to institutional sustainability of Balitbang, as it is a first-time joint research effort between Balitbang and the Bureau of Planning within the MOEC.

7. Input to Indonesian 25 Year Planning, Indonesia is in process of preparing its second 25 Year Plan. This plan is the umbrella under which more specific plans are developed as Five Year Plans and finally, annual plans. Each Ministry develops its component of the 25 Year Plan in collaboration with other policy making bodies such as Bappenas and Finance. The EPP Project has had a major role to play in developing the planning documents for the MOEC component of the Plan. All the studies mentioned above will feed into the planning process.

Besides the above studies, a global study has also been undertaken to examine the interaction of education, cultural, social and political systems in the context of societal change. This study was targeted at interpreting the non-economic consequences of educational and the implications for long-range planning, particularly related to changes in the curriculum. A companion piece to this study was a survey of education policy makers and administrators to identify priorities among national educational goals and objectives and to select strategies to cope with problems anticipated by these participants in the educational system.

A more comprehensive statement of achievements to date may be found in Chapters One and Two of the document entitled "Summary of Activities and Policy Studies" which was presented at the June 29-July 3 EPP Conference on Information Systems and Policy Analysis and is available at both USAID and Balitbang. It is the writer's understanding that this document will be refined and form the basis for Florida State's final report of the EPP Project due around September, 1992.

Policy Research at the Provincial Level

Under the direction of the Education Policy Research and Development Center in Balitbang, Provincial Policy Research Networks have been established in ten provinces with a plan to increase this to 14 in the near future and, eventually, to almost all the provinces. These networks are composed of local representatives from the Regional Planning Board, the provincial MOEC, teacher training institute, the local universities and the Office of Religious Affairs. The purpose of the networks is to help with policy problems at the provincial level. This is an effort at decentralization of research to concentrate on local policy issues and problems. The eventual aim is to have research results serve as inputs to regional planning while developing ability and skills at the provincial level. The research will initially be directed by Balitbang but, as local capacity is strengthened through seminars, workshop and training, research will be generated locally. To avoid overlapping, other provinces in the research network will be invited to these activities. At the same time this will provide a forum for an exchange of information and ideas.

24

EDC **Education
Development
Center, Inc.**

INTERNATIONAL PROGRAMS

Joseph P. Carney, Deputy Director, OHIRD
USAID/Jakarta
American Embassy
Jakarta, Indonesia

November 2, 1992

Dear Mr. Carney:

It has come to my attention that the mission has not yet received the final evaluation report for the Educational Policy and Planning Project. We did in fact mail five copies of the report to your attention via the AID/Washington mail system on September 28, 1992. I cannot account for the delay in your receipt of this material but have enclosed five additional copies of the final evaluation report for your review. We apologize for the delay and any inconvenience it has caused.

If I can provide any further assistance please do not hesitate to contact me.



Mitch Kirby
IQC Project Coordinator

55 CHAPEL STREET
NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02160
TELEPHONE 617 969-7100
FAX: 617 332-6405



INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF BALITBANG'S PLANNING CAPABILITY

The strongest evidence of Balitbang's potential for institutional sustainability resides in its well qualified staff and the quantitative and qualitative analytical capabilities they have demonstrated through the data analysis and policy studies they have thus far produced. Perhaps even more important is the acceptance of these products by both the MOEC and external planning agencies and their use as the MOEC's input to the development of Indonesia's medium and long range development plans. This being said, it will also be useful to examine some of the processes used by Balitbang under EPP to arrive at these products.

One mechanism to insure support and understanding for EPP activities has been the project Steering Committee, composed of key decision makers both within MOEC and from outside agencies, which was designed to meet at least once a year to review past activities and determine the research agenda for the next period. There are differing impressions about the functioning of this Committee by its own members. The Director General of Primary and Secondary Education stated that he did not remember the last time the Committee met. The Secretary of Balitbang, while admitting that the Committee had not met as frequently as originally designed, noted that it had been meeting -- the last time was about a year and a half ago -- and had in fact given its approval to the program of activities EPP was undertaking. It was at this last meeting that the following activities were approved: pilot EMIS activities from three to five provinces, partial dissemination of the MIS models to all provinces, expansion of training for staff in the provinces, and policy studies such as the Quality and Efficiency of Vocational/Technical Education (QVTE) and the research component of the decentralization project (SLEC II). The provision of computers, primarily for the Centre for Informatics but also for the line departments and the Office of Education and Culture in the provinces (27 provinces without exception), were also approved at that time. Decision making sheets on these decisions, prepared by the EPP Chief of Party (Dr. Richard Pelczar) jointly with the Centre for Informatics are available at the EPP office.

Another element of institutionalization is the Task Forces described in the Policy Analysis Section of this evaluation. Although they are ad hoc in their terms of reference, they clearly are a response to demands from "end users" and, as such, strengthen the viability and utility of Balitbang as a needed support group.

Yet another example of activities Balitbang undertakes to be responsive to "end users" and thus to enhance its credibility and potential for sustainability is its provision of service to others in the MOEC. Some recent examples are:

36

1. Assisted PENMAS with an evaluation of a World Bank financed community education project.
2. Assisted the Department of Primary and Secondary Education with the following activities:
 - a. To prepare a feasibility study in preparation for the World Bank's forthcoming quality of education (PIQIP) Project.
 - b. Advice to the Department's educational television unit from Balitbang's Educational Technology division.
 - c. To conduct policy studies on educational finance related to private schools and unit cost requirements.
 - d. To develop test item banks at the central level through the Examination Centre of Balitbang and at the provincial level through their offices of Education and Culture.
 - e. Feasibility studies on the nationwide expansion of "open" secondary schools.
 - f. The development of secondary education MIS under the World Bank assisted Project (Second Slice).

Finally, other indicators of institutional sustainability that have already occurred or are anticipated include funds being provided by the Department of Primary and Secondary Education to the provinces to conduct research and strengthen their EMIS being developed by the Centre for Informatics; the World Bank working with the Centre for Informatics on the development of EMIS components within the framework of all of their projects; an indication from Bappenas that it will provide additional funds to Balitbang for educational policy and planning activities and last, but not least; the encouraging fact that the trained staff with graduate degrees have all remained in their jobs at Balitbang.

One of the persistent issues that continually surfaced during the course of this evaluation is the different perception of the role of the Centre for Informatics between its Director and others in the MOEC. Since the essence of EPP resides in the work of the Centre for Informatics, this is an issue that requires elaboration. At the outset it should be stated that it is the writer's belief that these differences, although they have evoked rather strong expressions of concern, are less related to the achievement of long term goals than to emphasis, priorities, management styles, and the means to reach the overall objective.

Essentially, many key people in the MOEC feel that the Centre for Informatics has not moved quickly enough to fulfill its mandate to develop an integrated management information system across all departments in the ministry and to carry it down to all the provinces as well as the lower administrative levels within the provinces. This they see as the Centre for Informatics major function -- and one that should have been completed by this time. An irritant that exacerbates this frustration is what is sometimes referred to as a management style that does not promote close

231

coordination and cooperation. On the other hand the Head of the Centre for Informatics feels very strongly that, in addition to his long term responsibility for both horizontal and vertical development of the MOEC's management information system, given a limited amount of time and money, he must use his resources to emphasize the production, analysis and marketing of data for policy formulation that relates immediately and directly to the very crucial planning exercises that are currently underway. This refers to the MOEC's inputs to the annual, Five Year and 25 Year development plans. The Minister of Education has directed the Director of the Centre for Informatics to take responsibility on his behalf to (1) produce and analyze pertinent data, including the special studies carried out within the EPP Project, (2) formulate MOEC policies and medium and long range plans based on these analyses, (3) prepare the necessary documentation for presentation at national planning meetings and (4) prior to this meeting "market" the MOEC position to the key decision making bodies outside the MOEC such as Bappenas and the Ministry of Finance.

The Director of the Centre for Informatics states that gearing up an MIS to produce the necessary data and then proceeding with the activities outlined above had to have higher priority over the institution building aspects of EPP, and in fact have absorbed most of the time, money and staff resources he has had at his command.

This has been a controversial approach within the MOEC and it has implications for the ultimate impact and sustainability of EPP. On the positive side, the Centre for Informatics has responded to the needs of the Minister of Education and Culture and to the educational policy and planning requirements for the Government of Indonesian's development plans. At the same time, to accomplish these objectives, the Centre for Informatics under EPP has assembled and trained a core of competent and hard working data specialist and a unit capable of using state-of-the-art technologies and producing quality data analysis for policy formulation. This work is being recognized throughout the government of Indonesia and should enhance the prospects for sustainability of the Centre for Informatics. However, this does have to be tempered by the fact that there has been a price to be paid; that is, the EMIS for the Ministry has not been developed as extensively as anticipated it would be by this time, leading to some unhappiness on the part of other units in MOEC. Also, the focus to date has been more on products than an institutionalization of the Centre for Informatics within the Ministry.

It is the writer's feeling that, although EPP is ending and USAID funding is terminating, everything is in place to enable The Centre for Informatics to now give greater attention to developments internal to the MOEC. The resources, the knowledge, the capability are there. The support from other Ministries is there. Now it will be up to all parties involved to make it work. There is every

reason to believe it will.

LESSONS LEARNED

1. The development of the MIS in Indonesia has been a process of creating a new system from the old traditional manual systems, organizing various components such as hardware, software, people, facilities, management, and money. It has been greatly dependent upon the leadership at various levels of the system. Under a participatory and motivating leadership, the MIS development has been successful. In other cases, the development has been less so. Over the next few years it is anticipated that the examples of the stronger provinces will lead the way to a functioning MIS in all provinces.
2. Project objectives have not remained constant during the span of the project. They have had to be occasionally revised or refined to be more realistic in compliance with changing conditions or available technology. For example, at the inception of the EPP project, the objectives were to improve the questionnaires for annual education statistics and related data flow. With the availability of micro computer in 1986, the objectives were broadened by including computerization, policy analysis, and information marketing. With further advanced hardware and software in 1989, the development of an "MIS" became a realistic objective. Therefore, for the development of an MIS, targets or objectives should be allowed to evolve or be refined in line with changing conditions or requirements.
3. It is important to try to obtain a commitment from the supervisors of host country counterparts that they will not assign them work on other major projects. Otherwise the foreign consultant, though technically competent, may be working in a cultural vacuum. Also, he will not leave behind his knowledge and skills.
4. In addition to the problem of counterparts being assigned too many responsibilities in their organizations, due to the low salary received by government officials in Indonesia, they are also forced to hold more than one job. Therefore, it is unrealistic to expect too much of the time and attention of counterparts -- unless A.I.D. can find a way to be flexible with regard to payment of honoraria or some other kind of financial incentive. This is being done by the World Bank and other friendly donors, such as UNDP, Overseas Development Administration; International Development Research Centre.
5. Key studies to be addressed in any EPP type project are those related to the economics and financing of education, as these

29

can have a direct impact on intermediate and long-range national educational planning.

CONCLUSION

Looking at the larger scheme of things, the educational policy and planning capacity within Balitbang essentially resides in one unit within a staff arm of the MOEC. As such, its impact is contingent upon (1) the quality of the work it produces, (2) the relevance of its work to the concerns of the decision making line organizations in the MOEC and other pertinent agencies of the Government of Indonesia, (3) whether it is perceived as a competing unit or is welcomed as a service organization to help others to do their jobs better and, finally, (4) whether its products work their way into the short and long term educational planning processes of the nation.

As described in this evaluation, EPP has made a real contribution in terms of developing a strong data production and analysis capability within Balitbang and a management information system which eventually will be integrated across the MOEC and extend to all the provinces and districts of Indonesia. A corollary of this capability is the strong core staff of well educated, hard working, dedicated Indonesians working in the Centre for Informatics within Balitbang. Their work is being noticed and will be increasingly used as awareness of their capability spreads. Then there are the many volumes of policy studies which in one form or another will find their way into the meetings and decisions of the policy makers regarding key aspects of educational development in Indonesia. These will be distributed across ministries and within the MOEC by Balitbang and internationally by FSU according to USAID dissemination procedures. Lastly and perhaps most significant will be the process by which the Indonesians discuss, review, study and absorb the work produced and ideas that have emerged during the life of the EPP project. Already it is clear that the impact of EPP activities on policy changes to improve educational quality and effectiveness has resulted in its prominent role now in planning for the next 25 years of education in Indonesia.

41

PERSONS CONSULTED

Washington, D.C

Dr. Richard Pelczar, R & D/ED, USAID/Washington

Yogyakarta/Jakarta

Dr. Norman L. Rifkin, Chief, Education and Human Resources
Office, USAID.

Dr. Simon Ju, Chief of Party, EPP Project

Dr. Jack Bock, EPP Project Manager, FSU

Dr. Jerry Messec, FSU

Dr. Donald Adams, University of Pittsburgh

Dr. Dean Nielsen, IIR

Dr. Jerry Strudwick, IIR

Dr. Walter McMahon, University of Illinois

Dr. Donald Holsinger, IBRD

Prof. Dr. Moegiadi, Secretary, Balitbang

Dr. Boediono, Head, Information Centre

Dr. Aris Pongtuluran, Head, Planning Bureau

Prof. Dr. Hassan Walinono, Director General, Department of
Primary and Secondary Education

Dra. S. Juliani Djajadi, Head, Planning Division, East Java

Dra. Dwi Kuntari, Head, Planning Division,
Nusa Tenggara Barat

42

INTERVIEW GUIDE

A. ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITY OF RESPONDENT IN THE EDUCATIONAL PLANNING OR POLICY MAKING PROCESS. DIRECT INVOLVEMENT/RELATIONSHIP WITH EPP

B. COMMENTS ON SPECIFIC EPP COMPONENTS

EMIS

(ACHIEVEMENT) 1. How has Pusat Informatika been strengthened over the last three years since the previous (1989) evaluation?

(ACHIEVEMENT) 2. To what extent are the pilot provinces for EMIS serving as regional training centers for other provinces and what has training to date accomplished in terms of increased capacity to use databases for planning and decision making? To what extent has EMIS been extended to the other provinces for: student enrollment projections, distribution and allocation questions and other planning uses? To what extent are provincial officials supporting and utilizing EMIS development? In responding, indicate the role that Pusat Informatika is playing in this.

(IMPACT) 3. Does Pusat Informatika have an overall MIS plan for the MOEC? To what extent is this plan in effect and what is Pusat Informatika's role in managing MIS throughout the MOEC? Is there an MOEC Computerization Committee to work horizontally across departments and across donor funded projects?

(IMPACT) 4. How relevant is EPP's EMIS to MOEC policy and planning?

42

- Do others in MOEC use EPP's database?

- How much emphasis does Pusat Informatika give to providing data services to clients versus development of the data capacity of the clients?

- What implications does this have for impact and sustainability?

- Will other donor activities enhance or inhibit the sustainability of the system?

EMIS Issues Raised at Last Evaluation

- | | | |
|-------------------|----|---|
| (ACHIEVE
MENT) | 5. | Can additional databases be developed before the <u>school code system</u> is authorized? |
| (ACHIEVE
MENT) | 6. | Is project completion information; e.g., on completed school construction, available? |
| (ACHIEVE
MENT) | 7. | Have indicators been developed to monitor the meeting of targets? |
- 44

- (ACHIEVE
MENT) 8. What steps are being or have been taken to make data sources more valid and reliable?

POLICY RESEARCH

- (ACHIEVE
MENT) 1. How does the Policy Research Center interact with (1) the Policy Analysis Group and (2) potential users? What is the linkage between policy research studies and policy analysis activities?

- (ACHIEVE
MENT) 2. Does the Policy Research Center have adequate staff to conduct research and/or commission and supervise research? How much, if any, of the latter do they do?

- (ACHIEVE
MENT) 3. Have the following studies, programmed under the 1990 Second Amendment to EPP, been completed?
- a. Options for training teachers, including focus on cost recovery and use of private teacher training institutions.
 - b. Research on delivery of instructional materials that includes private production and distribution.
 - c. Rationalization of educational output as a function of labor market demand.

Are you satisfied with their quality? How will they be used?

- (IMPACT) 4. Are the potential users of these and other studies, including users at the provincial level, aware of their purpose and design? Are they initiating requests for them? Are they supporting and utilizing them?

4/5

(IMPACT) 5. How do these and other studies have an impact on policy making?

POLICY ANALYSIS/LONG RANGE PLANNING

(ACHIEVEMENT) 1. Has the Policy Analysis Group (PAG) become institutionalized within Balitbang? If not, are there plans for this?

(ACHIEVEMENT) 2. How does the Policy Analysis Group relate to the EMIS and Policy Research Center?

- Do all entities understand each other's roles and functions and actively interact with each other?
- Is the PAG involved in the design of the EMIS and in the design of policy research? Give examples.
- Does the PAG draw on both the quantitative analysis by Pusat Informatika and the qualitative analysis of the Research Center in its policy analysis work?

(ACHIEVEMENT) 3. Does the PAG call on others within the MOEC or from the provinces to assist with policy analysis?

(IMPACT) 4. Does the Policy Analysis Group focus on the implications of existing or already planned policies as well as on new policy formulation?

(IMPACT) 5. Is there any evidence that policy analysis papers have influenced the development of Repelita V?

INSTITUTIONALIZATION (SUSTAINABILITY) OF BALITBANG'S MEDIUM AND LONG RANGE PLANNING

1. Management

- Are Steering and Technical Committees meeting regularly? Is there provision to continue these committees after the project ends?

- Is Balitbang drawing on outside resources (expertise) to define problems and participate in design and implementation of research and information systems; i.e. is Balitbang serving as a manager of human resources by contracting for R&D activities as well as a producer of research?

- What is the status of the new functional Balitbang organizational structure for R&D management that has been proposed? Have there already been organizational changes in Pusat Informatika and/or the Policy Research Center?

- What is the status of Balitbang staff compared to 1989 (last evaluation) in terms of qualifications, numbers and plans for training and staff development?

- 47 -

2. Utilization

- a. To what extent is Balitbang keeping the users of its services aware and informed of its work and its potential to assist them in their policy and planning decisions by providing them with:
- utilization workshops for 2nd and 3rd echelon officials in the MOEC and at the provincial level to demonstrate what MIS systems can do?
 - case studies for the Minister and Director Generals illustrating the uses of information and research in policy making and long term planning?
 - research and analysis focussed on implications of policies already in the planning stages or already initiated?
 - documentation of cases where information, research or analysis provided by Balitbang has been utilized for policy making or planning?
- b. To what extent is the following evidence of utilization of Balitbang's work available:
- statements by decision makers indicating their awareness of Balitbang's work.
 - use of information and research products in policy statements and plans.

4/8

- interaction between Balitbang and decision makers in MOEC, especially in terms of Balitbang's responsiveness to their expressed needs.
 - application of models and techniques developed or refined by Balitbang in specific national or provincial educational policies and reforms.
- c. To what extent is the work of Balitbang encouraging decision makers to give more emphasis to the quality of education?
- d. To what extent are the inter-ministerial concerns about the external efficiency of education being addressed?

C. ACHIEVEMENT OF GENERAL PURPOSE.

- (IMPACT) 1. Have better plans and policies resulted from EPP activities? Give examples.
- (SUSTAIN ABILITY) 2. Will the GOI continue support for EMIS development and policy research in Balitbang Dikbud when USAID withdraws its support? At what level?

(SUSTAIN ABILITY) 3. What provincial and local support could be expected for continuation of EMIS development and planning research when USAID withdraws its support?

(SUSTAIN ABILITY) 4. Overall, what is your judgement regarding the potential for the sustainability of information systems and policy research as a tool of MOEC decision makers for formulating better educational policies and plans? Cite reasons.

D. MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS

1. Technical Assistance

What is your opinion on the timing, type (long term/short term) and amount of technical assistance provided under this project? Any suggestions for future projects like this one?

2. Training

What is your opinion about the training provided under this project -- short term, long term, in country, in the U.S.? Are those trained utilizing their training? Any suggestions for future projects like this one?

3. Consequences and Lessons Learned

- Were there any unintended or unanticipated consequences from this project that had an effect on education in Indonesia?

- Were there any "lessons learned" from this project that would be helpful for designing future projects like this one?

51

Scope of Work

As stated in the PIO/T, the contractor shall prepare a final evaluation report of the Education Policy and Planning Project. The report shall at the same time serve as part of the substance for the Project Assistance Completion Report.

In conjunction with the IEES/EPP Regional Conference to be held on June 29 - July 3, 1992 in Jogjakarta, Central Java, the contractor shall participate in the conference, interview and hold discussions with MOEC officials and other concerned parties on the EPP performance and impact. Results of the interviews shall be part of the project.

The contractor shall provide a final briefing on his observations, conclusions and assessments and provide a final written draft to the USAID Mission and Balitbang.