

IDENTIFIED

81061

**TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT ISSUES PROJECT
(492-0340)**

PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

JUNE 1991

**TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT ISSUES PROJECT (492-0340)
PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT**

- I. Description of the Project
- II. Current Status of the Project
- III. Summary of Contributions
 - A. Planned Inputs
 - B. Actual Inputs
- IV. Assessment of the Project
- V. Post Project Monitoring Activities
- VII. Lessons Learned

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT

A. BACKGROUND

The \$4.5 million Training and Development Issues (TDI) Project started in July, 1983, to run through the end of 1988. The project was extended for two years through the end of 1990. The project intended to improve the capability of the Government of the Philippines (GOP) and other institutions in the Philippines to analyze development issues and make sound and timely development related decisions.

The National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA), the implementing agency is responsible for insuring coordination among the organizations participating in TDI. NEDA has considerable experience in managing USAID-assisted training activities and research related to development planning.

The original project included two major components: participant training and development issues.

1. Participant Training - provided financing for long and short-term foreign and local training which directly supports the institutional development objectives of development-oriented organizations and contributes to the improvement of manpower skills critical to national and regional development.

2. Development Issues - endeavored to improve the information base for development-related decision-making and policy review/formulation by supporting the conduct of researches and conferences/fora on selected development issues deemed critical to the successful implementation of the Philippine Development Plan; also facilitated the provision of technical assistance in the conduct of conferences/fora for the analysis and discussion of development issues as well as discussion/dissemination of research results.

In 1989, a third component, regionalization, was added. This component supports small research projects that address regional development needs and issues.

II. CURRENT STATUS OF THE PROJECT

The original TDI Project Agreement was signed in July 29, 1983 and under the Agreement the Project Assistance Completion Date (PACD) was on December 31, 1988. On October 20, 1987, the PACD was extended to December 30 1990 and as a result the life of the project was extended from five to seven years. The extension was supported by the 1986 evaluation's primary findings. Mid-Term evaluation states that, "the overall project progress is slow, however, current evidence supports continued usefulness of project towards objectives of building institutional capacities for development policy analysis and related decision making." Thus, the additional two years allowed for an improved implementation, an expansion of beneficiaries to regional recipients, and an orderly close out of TDI project.

The status of completion of various TDI project elements follows:

1. Participant Training - The training component of the project which was implemented by the External Assistance Staff and Scholarship Affairs Secretariat of NEDA provided training for 301 participants from 1984 to 1990. Almost all participants were selected by NEDA from the Philippine Government Service (two participants were selected from the private sector). A breakdown of participants who received local and foreign training are as follows:

	Academic	Non - Academic	Total
Participants trained in the Philippines	84	86	170
Participants trained in the U.S. and Third Countries	37**	94*	131
TOTAL	121	180	301

* includes 2 short-term participants who received training in Thailand.

** includes 2 academic participants from the private sector who received training in the U.S.

All participants returned to their respective agencies by the end of the Project Assistance Completion Date (PACD) on December 31, 1990 except two participants who are still in the U.S. One participant disappeared after the completion of her training and was reported as a "non-returnee" to the U.S. immigration service. The second participant requested self-financed extension of her stay until July 1991 because of a "high risk" pregnancy which prevented her travel to the Philippines.

2. Development Issues Component

A. Funding Assistance to National Based Projects - For the period July 1983 to December 1990 the DI component supported 33 researches, 26 workshops/conferences and 23 Technical and Management Assistance projects for a total of 82 projects. (See Annex I for the complete list of projects). The activities addressed the following broad areas 1) Employment, Human Resources and Income Distribution; 2) Financial Resource Mobilization and Public Expenditure; 3) Agriculture, Agrarian Reform, Industry, Trade, Energy, Science and Technology; 4) Rural and Regional Development; 5) Planning Methods and Statistical and Institutional Development; and 6) Long-term Planning and Policy Issues.

B. Regionalization Activities - With exception of Regions 2 and 9, which were unable to endorse projects within the timeframe of the TDI project, the DI component was able to support 21 research studies, 2 technical and management assistance projects and one workshop in the regions. (Please see Annex II for regional projects.)

III. Summary of Contributions

A. Planned Inputs

The Project Agreement of the Training and Development Issues project was signed on July 23, 1983 with an initial funding of \$1,000,000 in loan form and \$900,000 in grant form. This was subsequently amended on March 26, 1984 (Amendment No. 1), and July 24, 1984 (Amendment No. 2), providing additional loan amounts of \$2,000,000 and grant amounts of \$300,000, respectively, increasing the total of loan funds to \$3,300,000 and grant

funds to \$1,200,000. However, on August 30, 1986, the agreement was further amended (Amendment No. 3) converting all available loan funds to grant, effectively reducing loan funds to \$418,397.44 and increasing grant funds to \$4,081,602.56. USAID total commitments to the project was \$4.5 million, of which \$2,580,000 was allocated for the Training component, and \$1,920 for the Development Issues component.

B. Actual Inputs

The following table shows the obligation, earmark and commitment levels per project element as of December 31, 1990.

	Obligation (\$000)	Earmarks (\$000)	Commitments (\$000)
1. Long Term/Short Term Training	2,595	2,456	2,537
2. Training Workshops (in-country)	218	194	191
3. Technical & Mgmt. Assistance	505	462	426
4. Research	936	935	930
5. Equipment & Commodities	163	152	142
6. Evaluation	33	21	18
7. Project Management	50	50	50
TOTAL	4,500	4,360	4,294

Total contract approvals/commitments under the project amounted to \$4,294,000 as of December 31, 1990.

2. Fund Expenditure

As of December 31, 1990, the disbursement figures are as follows:

Project Element	Commitments	Expenditures	Unexpended Commitments
1. Long/Short term training	3,537	2,433	104
2. Training Workshops	191	172	19
3. Technical & Mgmt. Asst.	426	402	24
4. Research	930	922	8
5. Equipment & Commodities	142	129	13
6. Evaluation	18	18	0
7. Project Management	50	50	0
TOTAL	4,294	4,126	168

As of May 22, 1991, total estimated funds determined to be in excess of actual requirements for the project amounted to \$292,633.32. This is composed of the following:

Unearmarked obligations	\$240,014.80
Uncommitted earmarks	31,975.90
Uncommitted earmark reservations	<u>20,642.62</u>
TOTAL	\$292,633.32

The excess funds (\$292,633.32) were de-obligated accordingly.

IV. ASSESSMENT OF THE PROJECT

By the standards set in the project paper, the TDI project was successful. The number of GOP personnel trained in-country and abroad, and the research studies and technical assistance provided, support the overall usefulness of the project. As documented in the end-of-project evaluation, much of the project's success is attributed to the flexibility with which project management could respond to various demands, from either the GOP or USAID, to assess current development issues. Without this flexibility, the project would have slumbered through.

From hindsight, we would propose a design revision to improve similar project in the future. We suggest a focused selection of development issues to be tackled by the project. As designed, the project funded almost any study or technical assistance request. Although this approach had its advantages, the aggregate results were too diffuse so as to raise the question of whether the project had significant impact on the most pertinent development issues and policy considerations that needed to be addressed. A more focused approach requires close coordination between NEDA and USAID during the design stage specially in identifying the substantive parameters of the project. This would result in better use of limited resources.

VI. POST-PROJECT AID MONITORING ACTIVITIES

Monitoring activities of USAID beyond the PACD will be limited to the following:

1) Final inspection of the subprojects - The purpose of the inspections is to determine whether the proponents were able to finish their projects on time. This focuses primarily on regional subprojects which were not completed due to effects of the 1990 earthquake and other natural calamities. An administrative inspection was conducted by the TDI Project Manager or his assistant, while technical inspection was done by the NEDA regional office and by the NEDA/TDI-PMO.

2) Financial close-out review - The purpose of this review was to determine whether the proponents were able to perform their financial responsibilities in the conduct of the project, and to determine the total expenditures and accordingly determine the amount of refund and/or reimbursement due to the proponents.

VII. FINAL PROJECT EVALUATION

The final impact evaluation of the TDI project was conducted in December 1990 on the basis of a review of project documents, interviews with project personnel, beneficiaries, policy makers and academics. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the project's broad impact and to determine whether it achieved its purpose.

V. LESSONS LEARNED

The following lessons/conclusions are quoted from the December 1990 TDI Impact Evaluation:

"The lifetime of the TDI project is in many ways several lifetimes in recent Philippine political and economic history. If the project was going to be relevant--in both the near term and the long term--it had to have the flexibility and adaptability to adjust to changing circumstances. This is particularly true because of what the project was about: improving the abilities of government to understand and address significant development policy issues. Flexibility by USAID permitted project management staffs in NEDA to learn about and increasingly assume greater responsibility and initiative for the project. Indicative of flexibility by both USAID and the GOP was the move to develop procedures for regionalizing research agenda development and channeling funds to the regions to support research. While the project had an indicative idea of what kinds of issues it was likely to address, those ideas always remained indicative. Consequently, by and large, the project could support research and training proposals that were as good as the proponents could propose. By permitting a wide range of organizations and individuals to seek support, and ultimately in fact by openly encouraging that wide spectrum of proposals, the project ensured it would not be the prisoner of its own initial preferences. This flexibility built in to the original project design was an absolutely crucial element."

Examination of the proposal review process along with the research utilization workshops underlines a basic lesson: effective utilization of policy-oriented research begins with the research proposal; it is significantly strengthened during research implementation; and the groundwork for future collaboration is confirmed through formal mechanisms of end-of-project "research utilization." This is not to deny that research results and analysis alone have important policy impacts. They do. However, it is to argue that sustainable policy-oriented research utilization is more often a process, a form of dialogue much more than it is an act of consumption."

"Given USAID's interests in processes of policy dialogue that generate sustainable and appropriate policy reforms in the Philippines, it should look with pride at what was built by TDI. At the same time, however, it should carefully consider what it and other donors can do to support a broadening of who are involved in research-policy linkages and strengthening in particular the independence that those on the research side need to credibly participate in such relationships."

ANNEX I
COMPLETED NATIONAL PROJECTS

Research

1. Linguistic Society of the Philippines (LSP), "Institutional Profiles for a Proposal to Evaluate Ten Years of the Bilingual Education Program in the Philippines"
2. LSP, "A Proposal to Evaluate Ten Years of the Bilingual Education Program in the Philippines" Commissioned Studies
 - Implementation of the Bilingual Education Policy
 - Policy Monitoring of Government Agencies and the Community
 - Contribution of Scholarly Societies
3. National Tax Research Center (NTRC), "A Study on Philippine Tax Administration and Compliance"
4. Economic Development Foundation (EDF), "Development of an Assistance Program for Employees Displaced by the Ongoing Government Reorganization"
5. University of the Phils. Statistical Center (UPSC), "Development of a Framework for Sectoral Classification of Trade and Investment Data"
6. UP Social Action and Research for Development Foundation (UPSARDF) Inc. "An Evaluative Study of DSWD's Self-Employment Assistance Program"
7. UP Public Administration Research and Extension Services Foundation (UPPAF), Inc. "Assessing Primary Health Care as a Strategy in Health Service Delivery"
8. Consortium-UPPAF, UPSARDF and Food and Nutrition Research Institute (FNRI), "An Analysis of Factors Relating to the Success or Failure of the Philippine Food and Nutrition Program"
9. Center for Research and Communication (CRC), "The Philippine Shelter Finance System: Issues and Recommendations"
10. Development Academy of the Philippines (DAP), "Examining and Maximizing Current Decentralization Efforts of the Philippines Government"
11. UPLB Foundation Inc. (UPLBFI), "Impact of Government Policies on the Transportation of Agricultural Commodities: The Case of Rice and Corn"

12. Philippine Institute for Development Studies (PIDS), "Rural Agriculture-Based Development Strategy and the Aggregate Saving Rate"
13. UPLB Foundation, Inc. "Studies on Agrarian Reform Issues"
14. VISCA, "Study on the Effects of Logging Ban in Region VIII"
15. UP Management Education Center, "Monitoring Selected Government Programs Through People's Participation: Focus on Non-governmental Organizations"
16. PIDS, "Reestimation of Shadow Prices for the Philippines: The Shadow Exchange Rate, the Shadow Wage Rate, and the Social Rate of Discount"
17. UPEcon Foundation, "Validation of the Semestral Econometric Model of the Philippine Economy"
18. UPSARDF, "The Slum Improvement Through Upgrading of Sites and Services Program of the National Housing Authority: An Evaluation of Three Selected Sites in Pampanga, Cagayan de Oro and Bacolod"
19. PIDS, "Central Bank Policies and Regulations and the Performance of the Money Market:"
20. SWS, "A Series of Four Rounds of Public Opinion Surveys"
21. PIDS, "Natural Resource-Based Industries in the Philippines: Structure and Policy Implications"
23. U.P. National Engineering Center, "Development of Data, Models and Techniques to Determine Optimal reliability Level of Electric Power Supply for the Philippines"
24. UPECON, "Distributive Effects of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies"
25. PIDS, "The role of Rural Non-Farm Employment in Development: The Case of Bicol, Philippines"
26. Institute for Labor Studies, "New Approaches to Improving Working Conditions and Productivity in Small and Medium Scale Industries"
27. National Wages Council, "Labor Cost Survey"
28. UP Local Government Center, "The Impact of the Operations of Tax-Exempt Institutions on Local Development"

29. Foreign Service Institute/Dept. of Foreign Affairs, "Seminars/Workshops on Economic Diplomacy"
30. NTRC, "An Assessment of the Value-Added Tax (VAT)"
31. Punlad Research House, "Interest Groups and the Philippine Tariff Structure"
32. PIDS, "An Inquiry into the Extent and Effects of Volatilities on the Economy"
33. PIDS, "Leading Indicators Project"

Technical and Management Assistance

1. Bureau of Mines and Geo-Sciences (BMG), "Financial Assistance for the Travel Expenses and Per Diem of Three Foreign Lecturers Attending the Symposium on Mineral Deposit Modelling"
2. NEDA, Dr. Marianos' Consultancy Services for NEDA
3. Cabinet Assistance System (CAS), "Travel of CAS Representative to Conference in the US"
4. NEDA/National Planning and Policy Staff (NPPS), "Sources and Uses of Funds Accounting Framework for the Philippines"
5. NEDA, "Local Consultancy Services for NEDA"
6. NEDA, "Consultancy for the Local Area Network (LAN) Project"
7. NEDA/NPPS, "Consultancy for Dagum Income Distribution Model Project"
8. Department of Trade and Industry (DTI)/Bureau of Export trade Promotion (BETP), "Technical Assistance for the Development of Econometric Models for Selected Non-Traditional Products"
9. DAP/Project Development Institute, "Basic Skills Course in Project Development"
10. Evaluation of the TDI Project (Mid-term)
11. UPNSRI, "Travel and Living Expenses of Lecturer to the International Course in Cell and Molecular Biology Techniques"
12. NEDA-TIUS, "Enhancement of Industrial Planning Approaches and Methodologies: Dr. Bautista's Consultancy"

13. Energy Regulatory Board, "Energy Regulation Manpower Development"
14. NEDA/TIUS, "Lecture on Economic/Statistical Tools in the Analysis of Policies Relevant to the Trade, Industry and Utilities Sectors"
15. TDI-PMO, "TDI Research Review Panel"
16. Bureau of Export Trade Promotion, "Review and Improvement of the Trade Documentation Collection and Export Publicity/Publications Programs"
17. "Consultancy Assistance to the Management Information Systems of the Department of Labor and Employment"
18. Institute for Development Alternatives, "Installation and Operationalization of a Barangay Cluster Development System in Six Coastal Municipalities of Congressional District II of La Union"
19. PCCARD, Resource Persons for DSSAT Workshop"
20. PAEDA, "36th Annual Convention of PAEDA"
21. FNRI, "Development of Dietary Guidelines for Filipinos"
22. NAST, "Asian/Regional Seminar Workshop on Biotechnology"
23. DIS/NEDA, "Consultancy and Advocacy Project"

Fora

1. UPLBFI/IAST, "Workshop Series on the Accelerated Agrarian Reform Program (Workshops 1, 2, and 3)"
2. PIDS, "NEDA-Coordinated Consultations on the Development Plan"
3. Philippine Statistical Association (PSA), "Fourth National Convention on Statistics"
4. Commission on Audit (COA), "IDI-ASOSAI Conference Workshop on Human Resource Management"
5. National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA), "Workshop for the Development of a Framework, Criteria and Methodology for Prioritization in Investment Programming"

6. Philippine Economic Society (PES), "Silver Jubilee Convention"
7. Philippine Agricultural Economics and Development Association (PAEDA), "34th Annual Convention of the PAEDA"
8. Philippine Social Science Council (PSSC), "National Social Science Congress II"
9. National Statistical Coordination Board (NSCB)/PIDS, "Seminar Workshop Series on Agricultural Statistics"
10. Development Academy of the Philippines (DAP), "Senior Executive Seminar on Development Management"
11. TDI-PMO, "TDI-Research Agenda Formulation Workshop"
12. Ministry of Local Government (MLG), "International Travel Cost for Prof. Cristina Slaton"
13. PSSC, "Resources for People Program-Forum Series on Development"
14. NSCB-Economic and Social Statistics Office, "Documentation and Deliberation on the Revised Philippine System on National Accounts"
15. DAP, "Promotion of the Role of Information Technology (IT) for Decentralized Development in the Philippine Government"
16. National Engineering Center, "Seminar on Hazardous Waste Management and Forum on Privatization of Environmental Control Services"
17. NEDA-Management Information Systems Staff, "Information Systems Strategic Planning Workshop for NEDA"
18. FNRI, UPCSWD, UPPAF, "Series of Consultation Seminar-Workshops Analyzing the Factors Related to the Success of the PFNP"
19. Leyte-Samar Rural Development Workers Association (LABRADOR), "GO-NGO Consultation in Region 8"
20. National Computer Center, "IT Policy Formulation Workshop"
21. PSA, "Fifth National Convention on Statistics"

22. Food and Nutrition Research Council, "Recommended Dietary Allowances: 7th Revision"
23. Farming Systems and Soil Resources Institute (FSSRI)/Center for Policy and Development Studies (CPDS), "Seminar Series on Policy Support to Farming System Development"
24. National Computer Center, "ISP Training Program"
25. PCARRD, "Decision Support System for Agrotechnology Transfer"
26. Ateneo de Naga, "Seminar Workshop on Local History, Peace and the Rise of National Consciousness"

Equipment and Commodities

1. TDI-PMO, Procurement of Fuji Xerox Machine
2. National Statistics Office (NSO), "Computer Supplies for the Family Income and Expenditures Survey (FIES)"
3. NEDA/NPPS, "Request for Computer Equipment and Peripherals for the LAND Project"
4. Department of Finance (DOF)/International Finance Group (IFG), "Computerization of the IFG"
5. PPJ Reprint
6. Procurement of NPPS Facsimile Machine
7. Procurement of 2 Computers and Printers for PMO
8. Procurement of Books for the NEDA Library
9. NPPS LAN Upgrade

ANNEX II
COMPLETED REGIONAL PROJECTS

1. CAR

1.1 Development Research Environment and Agribusiness Management Services, Inc. (DREAMS), "Proposed Study to Formulate Appropriate Planning Standards for the Cordillera Administrative Region"

1.2. Cordillera Tribal Communities Development Foundation, Inc., "Identification of Indigenous Social Structure, Cultural Beliefs and Practices in the Cordilleras and their Implications on the Socio-Economic Development of the Cordillera"

1.3 Saint Louis University - Center for Research and Extension Services, "Poverty Level Study of the Cordilleras"

2. Region I

2.1 Department of Environment and Natural Resources - Regional Office I, "Policy Studies on Forest and Land Resources Management"

2.2 Department of Local Government - Regional Office I, "Government Expenditure Allocation and Socio-Economic and Demographic Impacts: The Case of the Ilocos Region"

2.3 F. Lorente Research Services, "Manpower Demand and Supply Profiles Vis-a-Vis the Employment Situation in Region I"

2.4 Saint Louis University - Center for Research and Extension Services, "Impact Studies on Non-Formal Training Programs in Region I"

3. Region III

3.1 Population Commission - Region III, "Study on the Effect of Women's Employment in the Formal and Informal Sector on their Status and Fertility in Region III"

4. Region IV

4.1 Cybersoft Information Technologies, Inc., "Systems Analysis and Design for NEDA Region IV's Data Banking System and Pilot Development of a Computer-based RPMS"

4.2 Center for Policy and Development Concerns, "Reassessment of Extension Service Delivery System in Rural/Depressed Areas in Region IV"

5. **Region V**

5.1 People's Integrated Livelihood Development Foundation, "A Study on the Implementation of Policies Concerning Wages in the Region"

5.2 Management Technologies for Bicol Development, Incorporated, "Rationalization of Power Rates in the Bicol Region"

6. **Region VI**

6.1 Kahublagan sang Panimalay, "Study on the Institutionalization of the Data Banking Systems in Support to Regional and Local Government Planning and Administration"

6.2 Social Science Research Institute - Central Philippine University, "A Study on the Socioeconomic Benefits of the Labor Intensive Projects of DPWH as Perceived by its Target Beneficiaries in Western Visayas"

7. **Region VII**

7.1 University of San Carlos - Water Resources Center, "The Effects of the Prawn Industry on the Groundwater Regime in Relation to Agriculture, in Talisay and Sibonga, Cebu"

7.2 Divine Word College of Tagbilaran, "Urbanization Patterns of Tagbilaran: Their Implications to City Planning and Development"

7.3 Cebu State College, "A Demographic, Physical and Socio-economic Survey of the Settlers of Nine Upland Barangays in the Managa Watershed Area as Basis for a Proposed Rehabilitation Program"

8. **Region VIII**

8.1 Visayas State College of Agriculture - Foundation for Agriculture and Rural Development, "Poverty Studies for Region VIII covering the Provinces of Eastern Samar, Northern Samar, Leyte, Southern Leyte and the sub-province of Biliran"

15

9. Region X

- 9.1 FX Foundation, "Seminar-Workshop with Barangay-Based Consultations to Update the Provincial and Municipal Development Plans of Agusan del Sur"

10. Region XI

- 10.1 Davao Academy for Development, "A Study on the Financial Operation, Status and the Support Needs of the Microenterprises in Region IX as of 1989"
- 10.2 Regional Council for Research and Development Foundation, Inc., "A Study on Heavy Engineering Equipment Capacity Utilization in Region XI"
- 10.3 SERC-Notre Dame University and POPCOM Region XII, "A Study of the Migration Patterns of Skilled and Unskilled workers of Major Industries of Region XII"