

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

PD-ARD-069 72989

- 1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS.
- 2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: Mission or AID/W Office <u>O/AID/REP, Afghanistan</u> (ES# <u>FY 91-1</u>)	B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan? Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/> Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY <u>91</u> <u>Q 1</u>	C. Evaluation Timing Interim <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Final <input type="checkbox"/> Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/>
--	--	--

D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)

Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligated to Date (000)
306-0202	Education Sector Support Project	1986	12/31/95	\$49,200,000	\$31,200,000 including Manpower Training Program

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
A. Mission Action		
1. Mission review	O/AID/Rep Swain/Eighmy	Completed 12/6/90
2. Implementation guidance letter re future project direction.	Eighmy	Completed 12/19/90
3. Amendment of Activity Approval Memorandum (AAM) focusing on primary education and incorporating team recommendations (Part II, Section J). AID/W approval for LOP authorization to \$49.2 million, PACD to 12/31/95, was received 7/91.	Swain/Eighmy	Drafted, finalized 8/91
4. Needs Assessment, Project Design for new Human Resources Development (HRD) Project, incorporating participant training and manpower development.	Swain/Eighmy	8/91-9/91 Ongoing
5. Calculate likely expenditures to end of UNO contract.	Eighmy/Controller	Completed

(continued)

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation: _____ (Month) _____ (Day) _____ (Year)

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:

Name (Typed)	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
	Thomas Eighmy SGDO (Health/Ed)	M. Rahmanzi A/COP	Nancy Hardy PROG	Robert Bakley AID/REP
Signature	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>
Date	5 Aug 91	July 31, 91		

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

The Education Sector Support Project (ESSP) began in 1986 with the objective of meeting Afghan educational needs by supporting primary schools inside Afghanistan, by providing literacy training for Afghan Freedom Fighters while in Pakistan, and by assisting the Afghan political groups in Pakistan to develop capabilities in administering educational programs. A non-degree university scholarship program was added in 1987, and a two-year degree program initiated in 1989.

The project is being implemented through a contract with the University of Nebraska at Omaha (UNO), a United States based educational institution. This mid-term assessment was conducted by outside consultants and was based on a review of project documents, site visits, and discussions with Private Volunteer Organizations (PVOs) involved in Afghan refugee and cross-border education. The purpose of the evaluation was to make recommendations for the direction of the ESSP in a postwar Afghanistan. Major findings and conclusions are:

- ESSP is a generally well managed project which has made substantial progress in its activities under unique and difficult conditions (no host government and no U.S. travel in Afghanistan).
- ESSP should alter its focus and target primary education. Quality issues (curriculum development, teacher guide development testing) will be the emphasis.
- Due to the prohibitive costs and manpower required to operate the participant training component and associated English Language program, this component will be phased out to a new Human Resources Project.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. \$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
Gary Theisen	AED	PDC-0085-1-00- 9061-00	\$46,824.00 per State Cable # 329312 dated 09/28/90	Technical Support Project 306-0200
Richard Betz	AED			
Victor Cieutat	Consultant			
2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>15</u>		3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>30</u>		

2

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director (continued)

B. Contractor Action

- | | | |
|---|------------|---|
| 1. Work plan modification and TA inputs per implementation guidance. | Contractor | Ongoing (10 TDYS between 2/91 and 8/91) |
| 2. Plan for salary capping and new school selection criteria approved by the Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA). | Contractor | In draft, ongoing |
| 3. Development of a curriculum and teacher guides that systematically and sequentially build skill levels. Revision of the primary textbooks in accordance with this curriculum. | Contractor | T.A. TDY 3/91,6/91 Continuing |
| 4. Short term training seminars for the ECA in areas such as policy analysis and planning, curriculum development, evaluation and budgeting. | Contractor | T.A. TDY scheduled 7/91 and continuing |
| 5. Development of functional literacy materials for demobilized individuals (men and women) focusing on topics of practical importance such as house repair, animal husbandry, health, etc. | Contractor | Ongoing |

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- | | |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Purpose of evaluation and methodology used • Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated • Findings and conclusions (relate to questions) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Principal recommendations • Lessons learned |
|--|--|

Mission or Office: O/AID/REP Afghanistan	Date This Summary Prepared: July 1991	Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report: Evaluation of Afghanistan Education Sector Support Project (306-0202), Dec. 1990 (received Feb. '91 during Mission evaluation status)
---	--	--

The Education Sector Support Project (ESSP 306-0202) was designed to address primary education by: a) rapidly establishing primary schools inside Afghanistan; and b) establishing the Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA) which would act as a core group of education specialists and a counterpart organization to manage education activities in the future in Resistance-held areas of Afghanistan.

Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used

The purpose of the ESSP evaluation was to assess the effectiveness of the project compared to original AAM and work plans, and to offer the O/AID/REP recommendations for future directions. The principal assumption in the 1988 evaluation of a proximate move to Kabul has not been met.

The team reviewed key documents (quarterly reports, AAM, and work plans) while in Washington, D.C. Upon arrival in Islamabad, the team was briefed by the project officers. From November 4-25, 1989, the team was based in Peshawar where they met with project staff, made site visits, and interviewed members of the ECA and Private Volunteer Organizations (PVOs). A detailed list of the assessment methodology and persons consulted can be found in the evaluation report, Annex B.

Findings and Conclusions

The assessment team found the ESSP to be a very ambitious and successful project. The ESSP, now in its fifth year of operation, has produced a substantial set of accomplishments in a short period of time. These accomplishments include:

- 5.0 million primary textbooks produced and distributed;
- 7,200 teachers and staff salaries paid inside Afghanistan;
- 166,000 students served inside Afghanistan;
- Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA) created and maintained;
- 82,000 lower secondary textbooks produced and distributed;
- nearly 2,000 adult literacy courses conducted;
- 15,000 literacy kits and 320,000 mine awareness kits produced;
- 105 scholars participating in one or two year studies in the U.S.;
- 2 vocational training centers created with 141 graduates produced.

These activities have clearly provided a solid foundation of educational services inside Afghanistan.

Recommendations

As Afghans move towards reconstruction, the nature of education services supplied by PVOs and the ESSP will be required to shift accordingly. The role of the ESSP in the reconstruction of Afghanistan's education system would be enhanced by the following recommendations:

Primary Education

1. The development of teacher guides to compensate for low skill levels among teachers is perhaps the most cost-effective way to achieve tangible improvements in instruction. UNO is encouraged to explore collaboration with other donors or PVOs.
2. A curriculum needs to be developed that systematically and sequentially builds skill levels. Integration within and across subject areas is imperative to reinforce effective learning.
3. The UNO-produced primary textbooks need to be revised in accordance with the curriculum described above.
4. The production of instructional materials (silkscreens, literacy boards, etc.) should be continued, but carefully linked to key concepts in the curriculum. Priorities and objectives should be established before production of new material commences.
5. Girls' access to primary education is a critical problem in Afghanistan and needs to be directly addressed through the development of a comprehensive, long-term plan to increase their enrollment. UNO

S U M M A R Y (Continued)

and AID/REP are encouraged to consult the abundant literature on strategies for improving female access to school and to explore access to both fiscal and documentary resources through PPC/WID.

Secondary Education

1. Development of an integrated curriculum is a necessary precursor to further production and development of the secondary school texts. With proper planning and design, this task can be accomplished within one year.
2. Improvement in the quality of the secondary textbooks should begin with the completion of the curriculum and must involve field-testing and subsequent revisions of prototype materials.
3. ESSP's role in secondary education would be best limited, at least for the next two years, to the production of materials.

Institutional Development

1. ESSP should give high priority to the development of technical, reconstruction-related planning, management and finance skills among ECA and appropriate AIG staff.
2. Short-term training seminars would facilitate the previous objective. Expatriate technical experts might conduct workshops on topics such as,
 - o policy analysis and planning;
 - o subject areas such as curriculum development and evaluation;
 - o reconstruction-specific skills such as budgeting, projections, etc.
3. Development of a series of strategic, policy options papers in conjunction with the seminars and workshops noted above would give AID/REP leverage on reconstruction policies and provide the Afghans responsible for implementation with a jump-start on mobilization. The papers would help to rationalize the reconstruction process and would promote efficiency in the allocation and utilization of resources.
4. UNO and AID/REP should conduct an analysis of current fiscal and human resource capacities to determine the feasibility of adding a systems development/planning/finance component to the project.

Participant Training

1. A cost-benefit re-examination of the entire long-term training program is encouraged in the context of the project goals and with respect to the primary focus of improving and expanding primary education services.
2. Depending on the outcome of the cost-benefit appraisal, re-examine the need for and efficacy of each of the following sub-elements:
 - o ASPIL;
 - o placement rates and locations;
 - o priority of disciplines.
3. The low participation rate of females in the training program needs to be addressed through a low-key, but affirmative effort to increase their involvement.

Literacy

1. The creation of new, functional literacy materials for demobilized individuals should be developed for both men and women and focus on topics of practical importance such as house repair, animal husbandry, health, etc.
2. ESSP is encouraged to continue to be a catalyst in the production and distribution of these literacy materials to other organizations that are actively involved in the delivery of literacy training.
3. ESSP is also encouraged to restrict its role in the literacy area to technical advice, and to the development, production and dissemination of literacy materials, and not to become actively involved in training itself.

Teacher Training

1. The priority need is to develop a feasible and fully-costed plan for teacher training that is less susceptible to the attenuation effects of the current multi-stage strategy. The plan should focus on:
 - o institutionalization/portability issues;
 - o support required by teachers to maintain acquired skills;
 - o development of an inexpensive, but value evaluation plan to monitor the effect of the program.

2. A plan, with attendant costs, should be developed for increasing the numbers of female teachers.

Manpower Training

1. There is need for an Advisory Committee to integrate the content of training with employment opportunities, to increase women's access to training and to bolster private sector linkages.
2. MTP is encouraged to add a program component focused on the development of self-employment skills, job-seeking skills, and income-generating skills.
3. An evaluation of current courses and a follow-up study of graduates are needed to check on the quality and relevancy of instruction. The review might also produce a costed plan for implementing the MTP model in Afghanistan.

Lessons Learned (Mission Comment)

1. Project implementation under the severe conditions present in Afghanistan is possible. These conditions principally include a lack of cooperating host country government, a counterpart organization created by AID [the Education Center for Afghanistan (ECA)], and the inability of Americans to travel in Afghanistan, hence the necessity of operating the project cross-border from Peshawar/Quetta, Pakistan. The principal pre-war educational infrastructure (Kabul University, teacher training colleges, and most high schools) remains in Communist regime hands after the withdrawal of Soviet troops in 1989. These institutions are thus not available for project operations.
2. Project success is due principally to "Afghans working with Afghans". The U.S. Technical Assistance team is comprised mainly of U.S. trained Afghan-Americans working with an Afghan politically appointed staff of ECA. Unlike health or agriculture sectors where there is general technical agreement on methods, the formal schooling that a culture imparts to its children is highly sensitive. Acceptance of the textbooks by Afghans of wide persuasion inside Afghanistan and in the refugee camps has been due to the high Afghan and low U.S. profiles.
3. The project has operated largely in reverse sequence from normal AID education projects. For example, the process of textbook development, teacher training and guides, testing procedures and a retrofitted curriculum is not logical. Under the circumstances, it has worked because team members recognize that in previous Afghan education projects, the 10-year period which it took to reach an agreed-upon curriculum could not be duplicated in a country at war.
4. Low cost, locally printed textbooks and imaginatively produced teaching aids (silk screen cloth prints, velcro backed number-literacy boards) are transferrable to primary education projects elsewhere in developing countries.

c 6'

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

"Evaluation of Afghanistan Education Sector Support Project (306-0202)"

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

(See Lessons Learned)