PD-ABD-030

ANALYSIS OF LAC WID WORKPLANS, ACTION PLANS AND SELECTED PROJECT PAPERS

Final Report

February 13, 1990

Paul Carlson, ICRW
Margaret Hagen, Consultant

International Center for Research on Women
1717 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W. Suite 302
Washington, D.C. 20036

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. **Introduction** 1

II. **LAC Bureau WID Action Workplans**

A. Summary and Analysis of LAC WID Workplans 2
B. Review and Analysis of Individual Mission WID Workplans 5

III. **WID Sections of LAC WID Plans - 1987, 1988 and 1989**

A. Summary and Analysis of WID Sections of LAC Action Plans 25
B. Review and Analysis of Individual Action Plan WID Sections 29

IV. **Summary and Analysis of Selected LAC Mission Project Papers**

Belize: Livestock Development 40

Caribbean/Regional Development Office (R/DOC): Agricultural Research and Extension 42

Caribbean/Regional Development Office (R/DOC): Small Enterprise Assistance 44

Costa Rica: Non-Traditional Agricultural Export Technical Support (NETS) 46

Dominican Republic: Child Survival 48

Dominican Republic: Family Planning Services Expansion 50

Ecuador: Small Enterprise Development 53

El Salvador: Health Systems Support Project 55

Guatemala: Private Enterprise Development 57

Guatemala: Administration of Justice 59

Haiti: Voluntary Agencies for Child Survival 61

Honduras: Forestry Development 63

Honduras: Health Sector II 65

Jamaica: Hillside Agriculture Project 67

Peru: Child Survival Action 69

I. INTRODUCTION

In August 1989, A.I.D.'s Latin American-Caribbean (LAC) Bureau contracted with the International Center for Research on Women (I.C.R.W.) to assist in three review/analysis activities. Three sets of documents were analyzed to obtain a measure of how much progress LAC Missions had made in institutionalizing gender considerations.

This activity was consistent with an increase in the Agency's overall emphasis on gender issues. In July 1988, the Administrator sent a cable to all Missions urging that efforts be made to "ensure our programmatic WID objectives are implemented with more regularity and effectiveness." The Administrator also directed all Bureaus to develop their own Action Plans indicating their procedures for instutionalizing WID throughout their activities. A LAC Bureau guidance cable was sent to all Missions in the region on January 1989. It set a deadline for completion of the WID Action Workplans (March 31, 1989) and suggested actions that could be taken in support of institutionalization.

The present reviews/analyses were conducted on the following sets of LAC Mission documents: the recently submitted WID Action Plans; the WID sections of the 14 Mission Action Plans for FY 1987, FY 1988 and FY 1989; and a selected sample of 15 project papers from across the region.

The WID Action Workplans and the Mission Action Plan-WID sections were analyzed individually and collectively. The individual analyses permitted diagnostic indications of each Mission's progress and the likelihood of institutionalization of gender concerns. In particular, the summary reviews of the WID Workplans permitted the development of a regional summary of current status with respect to the key diagnostic questions. The analyses of the Action Plan WID Sections led to the identification of the range of "process actions" and "specific program and project activities" currently or recently cited by the Missions.

The summaries and analyses of the 15 project papers provided information relative to actual implementation of WID in Missions' development activities. The analyses involved conclusions about the extent to which gender-related factors were incorporated into the projects. In addition, recommendations were made for improving design features of the individual projects.

The three summary/analyses provide a collective view of the progress that the LAC Missions have made. As well, they contain an important perspective on the needs and deficiencies that now require attention.

II. LAC BUREAU WID ACTION WORKPLANS

A. Summary and Analysis of LAC WID Workplans

Twelve LAC WID Action Workplans were reviewed and analyzed to determine whether they were likely to describe a strategy leading to institutionalization of gender concerns within a two-year period (ending in March 1991).

Each Workplan was tested against a series of five questions. These were adapted from the Guidance Cable (STATE: 004307) sent in January 1989, and the Administrator's Action Items Cable (STATE: 218365) calling for institutionalization of gender issues in all AID development activities.

The questions were as follows:

1. Do the individual Actions of the Workplan appear viable in themselves? Are there benchmarks?
2. Are the Actions logical in the aggregate: Do they lead from present status to institutionalization?
3. Do the actions lead to integration of WID throughout the program and project cycles?
4. Is there an overall Mission WID strategy with appropriately articulated systems and procedures?
5. Are there appropriate authority lines?
6. What is the prognosis for institutionalization?

These questions were also used because they had diagnostic value. Thus, they can highlight apparent deficiencies in the systems and procedures which, in turn, can lead to productive recommendations. All individual analyses, then, led to recommendations designed to strengthen and further the process of institutionalization of WID in the individual Missions.

The progress made in incorporating gender issues into USAID's programs and projects during the past two years has been substantial, with Missions now generally acknowledging the need for institutionalization of gender concerns. However, the Actions in the current WID Action Workplans are not, in most cases, sufficient to assure institutionalization. Often the deficiencies are remediable with timely additional Actions and involvement by the LAC Bureau.

In most cases, weaknesses were due to lack of appropriately defined systems and procedures. Chief among these was the lack of articulation of WID concerns across the Mission; insufficient systems leading to integration of WID in program and project cycles; lack of an overall Mission WID strategy and deficiencies in establishing clear and strong authority lines.

Institutionalization requires that support be established both horizontally and vertically within the Mission. Questions that relate to horizontal linkages (#3, incorporating WID into program and projects cycles and #4, overall mission WID strategy), and the question that relates to verticle linkages (#5, authority lines) proved to be problematic in most Missions.

It is noteworthy that the two Missions for which the prognosis for institutionalization appears good have been very active in obtaining technical assistance from A.I.D./W. Both also have strong support for their WID efforts from Mission Management (Deputy Directors). One has a Mission WID strategy, a representative WID Committee (horizontal linkages) and a Mission Order on WID (vertical). The recent increase in requests for technical assistance and training from other Missions is likely to have a positive long-term effect. It seems clear, however, that most technical assistance will not lead to institutionalization unless an overall strategy linked to a portfolio review is conducted and unless mission management articulates clear authority lines.

As noted, the weaknesses in the current Workplans are remediable in most cases, but solutions will require close coordination between the LAC Bureau, PPC/WID, contractors providing technical assistance, and Missions themselves. An examination of the types of technical assistance being provided seems appropriate at this time. The LAC Bureau may decide that it should communicate to all relevant parties that institutionalization is most likely when all emphases would be more desirable that individual project-specific or sector-specific activities. It also seems appropriate to contact each Mission and enlist the support of Mission management to revise the Workplans. The Bureau may wish to involve the Assistant Administrator in this effort.

Two final notes:

-- It is possible to institutionalize WID in less than two years, if institutionalization means establishing the required systems and procedures. The summary development of a programmatic approach by USAID/Peru indicates that, with Mission management involvement and cross-sectoral participation, events can move quickly. Effective liaison between the LAC Bureau and Missions is now critical to assure that all Missions establish their own strategies.

Preceding Page Blank

-- Some of the Action Workplans were submitted in March and April, 1989. The passage of time, with likely rotations of staff, suggests a need to verify events and determine the degree of each implementation. In several Missions, critical events such as constitution of WID Committees and issuance of Mission Orders on WID should already have occurred While such actions were often mentioned in the Workplans, their exact natures were seldom specified. The LAC Bureau may wish to consider cabling inquiries and request status reports concerning the current state of the WID efforts with specific references to the individual analyses.

B. Review and Analysis of Individual Mission WID Workplans

1. USAID/Belize

SUMMARY

USAID/Belize has identified the following four priority areas through which to integrate WID into its development activities: 1) strengthen the Department of Women's Affairs; 2) conduct research in key areas of agriculture and tourism; 3) conduct training for USAID staff and counterparts and for women leaders in the private and public sectors; and 4) develop and test procedures within the Mission to more consistently incorporate WID into their program.

In addition, there are four procedures to integrate WID systematically into the program.

1. Programs. The WID Committee, representing all technical offices, will clear program documents including the CDSS and Action Plans. A Mission Order will describe the responsibilities of the Committee.

2. Projects. The WID Mission Order will contain specific steps to be taken in preparing the design of new projects or significant amendments to existing projects. These steps include: Office Chief notifies WID Committee of the plan to design or amend a project; WID Committee provides standard guidance to the Office Chief to utilize in preparation of the SOW for the design team; the draft SOW is to be cleared by the WID Committee before issuance of the PIO/T; the WID Committee will meet with the design team and the project officer to share information on women in the particular field and share any issues or questions the Committee has. The team will meet periodically with the Committee throughout the process. At least one member of the WID Committee will participate in the review process. These procedures will be tested in one major amendment in FY89 and in another in FY90.

3. Reporting. When the Mission receives the WID indicators from AID/W and the decision regarding reporting on WID accomplishments in the semi-annual review, all staff will be informed by means of a meeting, and written guidance will be issued by the WID Committee. The bi-

monthly portfolio reviews will continue as the forum to assess progress toward achieving WID objectives in specific projects. The WID Committee member from the office whose portfolio is being reviewed has the responsibility to ensure that this element is included in both the report prepared for the meeting and in the discussion.

4. WID training. In addition to the training discussed above, the WID Committee intends to fulfill its leadership role within the Mission. This will include Mission support for attendance at workshops, courses, and conferences. The Committee also plans to request advance training from ICRW prior to the project managers' workshop to enable its members to be trained as trainers of WID considerations.

ANALYSIS

The four priority action areas for integrating WID into the Mission's development activities are reasonable and well-targeted to the overall Mission strategy. Item #4 ("develop and test procedures within the Mission...") is of particular importance for institutionalization.

The methods identified for integrating WID, the establishment and functioning of the WID Committee, training, etc., will, if consistently implemented, effectively promote systematic incorporation of gender concerns. Appropriate authority lines are articulated.

Clearance functions reside in the WID Committee, which has representation from each technical office. The WID Committee has clearance on all program documents, and the Mission order on WID will identify the steps to be followed in the review process and project design and amendments. The WID Committee will clear scopes of work. These suggests that elements of a WID strategy are in place with the Committee playing a critical role.

Concerns:

These are no benchmarks for any Actions except that the procedures currently being instituted will be tested during the project amendments in FY89 and FY90. No target date was mentioned for the issuance of the Mission Order.

There is relatively little emphasis on project implementation and still less on evaluation of the mission's development activities. Unless implementation and evaluation issues are dealt with, it will be difficult to effectively incorporate WID or gauge success over time.

Recommendations:

In order to further institutionalization, the Mission Order will need to detail not only steps to be followed in project design, but those in the entire project cycle. These actions, coupled with effective WID Committee oversight of that entire process as well as the program cycle, should provide assurance of consistent progress toward institutionalization.

The LAC Bureau should consider recommending to USAID that the Mission produce a formal, binding WID strategy that gives the WID Committee oversight over all stages of the program and project cycles as well as over research and training. Also the Bureau should consider recommending to the Mission that benchmarks be established leading from current status to institutionalization.

2. USAID/Bolivia

Note: The following is not an analysis of USAID/Bolivia's WID Action Plan. It is an analysis of the "Recommended Plan of Action" located in the WID Implementation Plan (pp. 11-12) which the Mission submitted to the LAC Bureau in January, 1990. The same questions used in the analysis of the LAC WID Workplans were applied to this document.

SUMMARY

The Plan calls for a phase in of WID activities with the first set targeted for the first year (those under A, " Making a start" below). It is assumed that the other activities (those under B and C below) will follow in sequence.

The Recommended Plan of Action specifies the following three-pronged agenda for FY 1990:

A. "Making a start"

--Identify WID concerns in three priority projects. (Some of these project-related activities have target dates, some are "continual" and others have dates that are "to be determined.") "Secondary projects" will receive attention within the next two years.

--Preparation of a new plan or an update, September 1990.

B. "Creating an Information Base"

This set of activities includes: studies profiling women in Bolivia; development of information systems including a gender disaggregated tracking system for project-specific monitoring and evaluation; semiannual reviews and action plan indicators. (Target dates not specified).

C. "Developing institutions and mechanisms for sustained effort"

Such mechanisms will include increased support for WID from the front office exemplified in issuance of a Mission Order on WID outlining the roles of the Mission personnel, including key staff (Director and Deputy Director, Division/Office Chiefs, the WID Officer, Project Officers, "WID Agents", Consultants. (Target dates not specified.)

ANALYSIS

The individual actions of the plan are logical although some are not clearly defined. Thus there is reference to a "plan" targeted for September, 1990. We might assume that this will be a follow-on

to the present document but its functions and content are not specified.

Concerns

As indicated above, it is assumed that the activities specified under B and C will follow those in A and will be in sequence. However, since there are no target dates provided for the actions in B and C, it is not clear what the progression will be. Questions which arise include the following: will the planned information base have to be completed before the activities in C are implemented, and wouldn't it be strategically important to place the actions in section C prior to all other parts?

With respect to the last question, it would seem that the actions in section C would be the most critical and, perhaps, should even be done first since they will involve the systems and procedures leading to institutionalization. This is especially relevant given the tendency for WID to undergo shifts in priority with staff changes.

The phased-in approach raises some questions. Priority projects are to be targeted first. These will be projects "where women are already active...(and where) women's participation is easily recognized as absolutely essential." It is not clear when the other projects (those "where a special effort has to be made to involve women, but where the potential payoff is great" will be dealt with. These are not specifically addressed in parts B ("Creating an information base") or C (Developing institutions and mechanisms for sustained effort").

Recommendations

It is essential that each step leading to institutionalization be specified, especially since "the Mission has a very diverse and dispersed program, making it difficult to focus priorities on WID, and likely to lead to difficulties in implementing the plan." The Mission Order and the plan should lay out the components more clearly in terms of their order and priority and calendar-driven benchmarks should be developed for the entire process.

It would be appropriate to ask USAID/Bolivia for its WID Action Workplan and to request that the above concerns be addressed. Specifically, the elements in Part C should be given a high priority and calendar-driven benchmarks should be considered in putting the institutionalizing mechanisms in place.

3. USAID/Costa Rica

SUMMARY

USAID/Costa Rica has identified the following elements and target dates:

--Mission Order on WID	December 31, 1989
--Establish WID Committee	February 1990
--Portfolio Review	Mid---------1990
--Training of Professional staff	By end of 2 yr. period
--Mission Strategy Statement on WID	Mid---------1990

Additional actions include establishment of monitoring and tracking systems, and providing assurance that there will be disaggregation of projects' agents and beneficiaries by sex. However, these are not given any target dates. Presumably, they will be developed for all future projects and major project amendments.

The workplan indicates that the Program Office will ensure that WID concerns are addressed in program documents such as CDSSs, Action Plans and project evaluations. The Project Development Office will be responsible for ensuring that WID concerns are addressed in all project documents.

ANALYSIS

Each of the major activities planned for the 2-year period is appropriate and should greatly enhance the probability of institutionalization.

Concerns

The Workplan omits some details that would provide further assurance of routine and systematic incorporation of gender concerns in all the Mission's development activities. Thus the role of the WID Committee relative to the various above offices is unclear. It would be helpful to specify whether it would have oversight authority or simply be a recommending committee.

It is also unclear what role Mission management will have in assuring institutionalization of gender across the Mission's portfolio.

Recommendations

The roles, functions and authority lines linking the WID Committee to other offices and the role of Mission management with respect to ensuring institutionalization should be clarified.

4. USAID/Dominican Republic

SUMMARY

Four major types of activity are indicated:

1. Programming Actions including: development of a WID policy determination statement or refinement of current WID policy statement; reestablishment of a WID Working Committee;

development of a Mission Operational Manual Order; development of baseline data; collaboration with local women's organizations; and donor coordination.

2. Project Actions including: evaluation and reporting (evaluate fundamental elements of all project evaluations for progress made in WID); comprehensive portfolio review; development of routine procedures for ongoing WID considerations from project design to final project evaluation; establishment and strengthening of a bibliographic data information system for Mission staff.

3. Special studies including: a comprehensive study of the current status of women in the D.R. with indicators to assist in comparison with other LAC countries, and a review of USAID's goals and objectives and their potential impact on women.

4. Training activities including: annual two-day workshops for staff; training, guidance and/or TA for GODR counterparts and private agencies; and participation by WID Officer/Program Officer in AID's regional and AID/W conferences.

ANALYSIS

Many of the Actions identified by the Mission show serious consideration and the plan is systematic and logical. The Actions reflect an appropriate mix of program and Mission-wide strategies, project-level activities, data gathering and training.

There is generally a logical ordering of the Actions, starting with the establishment of a WID Working Committee (June 1989). The last programmatic Action is the issuance of a Mission Operational Manual Order (March 1990). It is not clear why that Action needs to be delayed; it would be desirable to move the date up to as soon as possible. The strength of the Actions is in their specification of appropriate steps to be taken, the resource persons, and the target dates. Those Actions for which appropriate attention was paid to authority lines will likely be the most effective.

Concerns:

Deficiencies include lack of clarity in the actual functions. Thus the WID Committee's role and responsibilities and its authority are not specified. Another problem is that it is not clear whether the resource person(s) will, in fact, bear the responsibility for the Actions. This problem is especially pronounced in the Project Actions and Training categories, where contractors and A.I.D./W are specified as resource persons. Key Mission staff should hold responsibility in order to assure institutionalization.

An additional concern is that the authority of the WID Committee is not clearly established. It is not certain whether it will have oversight or simply advisory functions. This is critical since the WID Officer answers to the WID Committee in developing the Mission Order and in donor coordination activities. Without clear authority for the Committee, some fundamental efforts are likely to fail.

The absence of the Mission-wide WID Strategy, lack of clear authority lines throughout and failures to identify key Mission staff for each Action may prove to weaken the overall effort.

Recommendations:

Each Action should have one Mission staff member responsible for its completion. In addition, a feedback mechanism should be established to assure that each activity articulates with the others.

The development of a Mission-wide WID Committee and a WID Policy Determination Statement would help to provide assurance of institutionalization. These should lead to the development an overall strategy.

5. USAID/Ecuador

SUMMARY

The Mission has built its Workplan around an "equity" concept of WID. Its overall objective is "the elimination of all bias against full and equitable participation of women in the development activities ... we support in Ecuador."

Until now, the Mission has concentrated on project-specific interventions. Now the decision has been made to go beyond these activities and establish "procedures and mechanisms to ensure that project and policy content of all Mission efforts not reflect or allow explicit or implicit bias against women."

Four major actions leading to the establishment of these objectives are: 1) train Mission staff and counterpart agencies on the importance of gender-related data and information; 2) establish a sex-disaggregated data base to focus project activities and measure their impacts; 3) identify and work with local agencies with the capability to perform research and training tasks and assist in policy analysis on gender in Ecuador; and 4) reinforce and monitor the individual WID strategies proposed for the WID Action Plan period by each technical division, and share pertinent information to enable the Mission to measure progress on its overall WID strategy.

There are twelve Actions linked to institutionalization. The Mission-level activities are: developing case studies for training; conducting a workshop geared to the Mission's portfolio, leading to agreement on project design and implementation processes; identifying reporting requirements; and developing and trial of a gender monitoring system based on the workshop. The sector-specific Actions eight involve development of gender information data bases leading to integration of gender considerations into projects.

ANALYSIS

The Mission has identified many of the necessary components required for institutionalization such as the decision to move from project-specific activities to more programmatic procedures; training of Mission staff and of counterpart agencies; establishment of a sex-disaggregated data base; identification of and work with local agencies that can conduct research, training and policy analysis; and reinforcement and monitoring of individual WID Strategies.

Concerns:

The lack of a coordinated strategy that links these components into a unified program of action is a problem. There are insufficient systems and procedures leading to institutionalization. In the Mission-level Actions, the final step is development and trial of a gender monitoring system based on the workshop. This is an example of the type of activity that is necessary, but there is no Mission-wide WID strategy leading to institutionalization. No Mission Order on WID is indicated, there is no mention of a WID Committee with adequate representation and oversight across Mission activities, and no systematic review of the Mission's portfolio is called for. A workshop is planned to analyze gender implications of case studies for the Mission portfolio. It is anticipated that this workshop will reach agreement on project design and implementation; however, whether these agreements are binding is not addressed. It is also not clear whether this activity amounts to a comprehensive portfolio review. The status of the WID effort in the Mission is not clear, but the lack of clear lines of authority and involvement by program office professionals or Mission management appears to downgrade the total effort.

Recommendations:

The Bureau may wish to consider recent efforts including portfolio review activities and advise the Mission on establishing systems and procedures leading to institutionalization. Among these would be a Mission WID Strategy linking current activities and a WID committee with oversight functions across programs and projects.

6. USAID/El Salvador

SUMMARY

A two-pronged approach to institutionalization is specified.

1. Enhancement of awareness:

a. A WID Committee chaired by the Deputy Director of the Mission was to be constituted in April 1989. An operational leader was to be named, and each technical office and appropriate staff office would have a representative on the Committee. The primary responsibility of the Committee

is to ensure that gender is considered systematically in all Mission activities.

b. The Committee will formulate a Mission WID strategy and develop a Mission Order to outline the general Mission strategy. The operational leader of the Committee may have the authority to clear all PIO/Ts related to studies, surveys, evaluations, and program and project documents to assure that gender issues are considered.

c. The Mission will request AID/W to arrange training workshops in the Mission.

d. The planned library will contain a section dedicated to gender information.

2. Information gathering and database maintenance:

a. The Mission will take steps to create a gender-specific database. This will enable the Mission to develop program and project designs, modifications, and evaluations which more adequately address gender constraints.

b. The WID Committee and the Mission Order will elaborate more formally the procedures for integrating gender considerations.

c. The Mission will initiate a process to incorporate gender issues and strategies in all phases of project development and evaluation. The process will take place for FY90 starts and for major project amendments. In order to facilitate this, the Mission will use the Gender Variable Matrix.

d. The Mission believes that the overall approach will assist the Mission in raising consciousness and developing information, thereby facilitating the institutionalization of gender considerations in the portfolio.

ANALYSIS

This Workplan articulates many of the necessary components, including training of Mission staff, information gathering, and establishment of Mission-wide systems and procedures. Overall the individual actions appear viable. One key action, the "first step", constitution of a WID Committee was to have taken placed in April 1989. In addition, all FY 90 starts were to have been subjected to a process to incorporate gender issues and strategies. The plan initiates the institutionalization process appropriately by identifying important systems and procedures (e.g., WID Committee, Mission Order, information gathering).

Concerns:

Deficiencies include failure to establish benchmarks for all key activities. Moreover, while all FY90 starts will be subjected to a process to incorporate gender issues and strategies, the Mission Order,

which will indicate responsibilities and authority for the Committee as a whole and for the Operational Leader, will not undergo this process. Much of the procedure will rest on information gathering and database maintenance. There are no target dates for these activities, although there are some expectations that the information will be organized by December 1989.

The Plan does not provide evidence that all the key actions required for institutionalization will, in fact, occur. There is no indication that a comprehensive portfolio review will be conducted. The authority of the Committee is in doubt. The contents of the Mission Order and the feedback mechanisms for incorporating the gender-related data are all unspecified. (The WID Committee was to have been constituted last April and it is possible that many of these concerns have already been addressed.)

While there is discussion in the Plan of the WID Committee's responsibilities and authority and the authority of the Operational Leader, until the Mission Order specifies these, there is some doubt that they will occur. It is noted also that the specified functions of the Operational Leader are very demanding and there is some question as to whether so much of a burden on a single individual will create bottle necks in the institutionalization effort.

Recommendations:

Events in the Mission since April 1989 should be reviewed by the Bureau to determine the present status of the WID Committee and the Committee's Operational Leader. It is also recommended that the Bureau attempt to establish target dates for the Mission training and information gathering exercises, and the target date and contents of the Mission Order on WID. Finally, it is recommended that the Mission include in the Plan a comprehensive portfolio review to determine priority activities and initiatives. Disaggregation of all data should be assured in all programs and projects.

7. USAID/Guatemala

SUMMARY

Four priority activity areas are listed with specified actions.

1. Program aspects: Identify policy and institutional framework; improve coordination with other donors; incorporate gender more fully into Mission strategies.

2. Project development/implementation: Conduct portfolio review; address constraints and opportunities identified in portfolio review.

3. Evaluation/reporting: Establish routine procedures for ongoing review; analyze impact of Mission activities on improved socio-economic status of Guatemalan women.

4. Other: Improve WID database; expand reference and resource materials; improve capacity of GOG, Mission and private sector personnel to analyze, plan and implement WID.

ANALYSIS

The individual actions in the Workplan appear viable and they are logical in the aggregate. Both program and project cycles are addressed.

There is some wording in the Workplan that raises concern over institutionalization. These involve shades of meaning. For example, one of the recommended Actions under "Program Aspects" is "incorporation of gender considerations more fully into Mission strategies, Action Plans, etc. The word "more" and, to a lesser degree the "etc." place some limit on the commitment. However, this problem is usually offset by Key Action Steps which are more specific about consequences.

Provided that the WID Committee currently has representation from the Mission's technical offices, the support of Mission management, and oversight and clearance over the entire range of the Key Action Steps, the likelihood of institutionalization in this case appears good.

Concerns:

The current structure, representation and functions of the all-important WID Committee are not precisely defined in the Workplan. The current status of the Committee is basic to institutionalization. It is named as the "resource" in all nine Priority Actions in the Workplan. The Workplan does not provide assurance that the Committee presently has clearance on the Key Action-Steps or that it represents all the Key Officers in the Mission.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Bureau obtain assurances concerning the current status, representation and authority of the WID Committee from Mission management.

8. USAID/Haiti

SUMMARY

Following Bureau WID guidance, WID management has been strengthened. The Program Officer has been designated the WID Officer; he will establish a WID Committee. A Mission Order is being prepared, setting forth "rigorous requirements and procedures for incorporating gender concerns in programming documents and project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation."

Five Actions are specified with target dates. These are: the establishment of a WID Committee and quarterly meetings (3rd Q 89); issuance of a Mission Order which clearly states Mission Strategy

and identifies staff responsibilities (3rd Q 89); incorporation of a portfolio review in all future semi-annual reviews (4th Q 89); Mission training workshops (1st Q 90; 1st Q 91); and the establishment of WID indicators for all Mission projects (2nd Q 90).

ANALYSIS

The individual Actions in the Workplan appear viable and benchmarks are specified for each of the five Actions. A Mission Order is envisaged which "will set forth more rigorous requirements and procedures for incorporating gender concerns in programming documents and project design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation." This will provide strong impetus for institutionalization.

In addition, designation of the Program Officer as the WID Officer strengthens the management of WID concerns. Top management is apparently not directly involved, although issuance of a WID Mission Order may well supply the appropriate authority lines.

Concerns:

The Workplan would be stronger if the WID Committee's authority and functions were specified; if the nature and functions of the WID Strategy (mentioned in the "Introduction/Background") were specified; and if there were an information-gathering Action developed for monitoring and evaluation.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Bureau seek a full description of the WID Strategy; the role, authority and functions of the WID Committee; and USAID's plans to obtain sector-specific gender-relevant data. The need for in-country training should also be considered.

9. USAID/Honduras

SUMMARY

Procedures to integrate WID into development are as follows:

1. Strategic planning documents: The Mission plans to strengthen its emphasis on gender-based concerns in its strategic planning documents. The upcoming CDSS will describe the role of Honduran women, sector assessments and strategy documents will carefully examine the current role of women, and Action Plans will track gender-disaggregated data.

2. Monitor reports: The collection and analysis of gender-disaggregated information will be stressed throughout the semi-annual review. Gender-disaggregated data will be used in formulating specific

program performance indicators and as a measure of project outputs and results.

3. Project design: It is the Mission's goal to fully incorporate gender considerations into the design and implementation of new projects. Consideration of the role of women and the possible impacts on women will be considered at the earliest stages in project identification and will be reflected in project documentation and associated Scopes of Work. The Mission will continue to identify training opportunities for females.

4. Project information and evaluation systems: The information system will be strengthened by integrating gender considerations in all stages of the project information cycle and evaluation cycle. Increased emphasis on collection and analysis of data will create a pool of information regarding project impacts on women.

ANALYSIS

The individual actions of the Workplan appear viable. Each is essential for institutionalization and should lead to integration of WID throughout the program and project cycles.

Concerns:

There are no benchmarks leading to the conclusion of a defined process. Moreover, some of the individual actions lack clear functions. The creation of a WID Advisory Group is an example. It seems clear that this group, which might have been given oversight and clearance over program and project activities and documents, will have little authority.

This leads to the general concern that the accountability system is not clear. For example, the technical offices and ODF have the responsibility for including WID concerns in project design and project documents, yet it is not specified who performs which functions and who has oversight and clearance in the process.

The Mission Order, targeted for July 1989, may have addressed some or all of these concerns.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Bureau ask that the Mission share the Mission Order so that the questions about appropriate authority lines, oversight capacities and clearance functions of the technical officers, ODF, and the WID Committee will be sufficiently addressed to assure institutionalization.

10. USAID/Jamaica

SUMMARY

USAID indicates that there has been substantial progress in addressing the realities of women in the Jamaican economy. The progress is indicated, by sector, in increasing access to opportunity (private sector activities); improving productivity (health and population); human capital formation (education and training); and policy framework (housing and private sector). Twelve recent or current activities are summarized.

The WID activities and the role of women in Jamaica were said to lead to a two-year focus emphasizing: further collection and analysis of gender-disaggregated data related to AID projects; identification of constraints to women's participation; steps to overcome these constraints through a portfolio review; and Mission WID training and establishment of program and project indicators.

The Workplan provides details of its calendar-driven procedures. Nine procedures are specified. Each is linked to specific Mission offices whose staffs bear responsibility for the Action. Further, each is linked to a target date.

ANALYSIS

There are nine specified actions that have the potential to lead to institutionalization. The individual Actions appear appropriate and have benchmarks, and are in logical sequence. Thus the first Action is a portfolio review. The next indicates that in FY89 new projects will include gender-disaggregated data in project semi-annual reviews. There appears to be a clear sense of the steps that are needed to lead toward full, appropriate incorporation of gender concerns.

Concerns:

The portfolio review is not comprehensive; the envisioned Mission training is for "selected" (unspecified) offices; and the inclusion of gender-disaggregated baseline data for new projects is limited by lack of detail (e.g., there is no assurance that all new projects will include gender-disaggregated data nor that the data will lead to appropriate design features).

Moreover, as the nine specified Activities are described, there is no assurance that integration will really occur. No office or committee will operate with management functions to oversee program and project design, and portfolio reviews on the semi-annual reviews. While each Activity is linked to an office or offices, there is no specified authority line. There is no indication of Mission management sign-off or clearance functions. (The most helpful Action in this regard is the issuance of a Mission Standard Operating Procedure on incorporation of WID analysis in project design. This has the potential of leading to the establishment of a Mission-wide strategy with a WID Committee. Another hopeful sign is the establishment of WID indicators).

Recommendations:

The Bureau may wish to stress to the Mission the importance of a review of the systems and procedures (including authority lines and functions) to ensure institutionalization. The apparent deficiencies in the Workplan could be communicated to Mission management and the WID Officer concerning possible revisions.

Additionally, there is no overall Mission WID strategy and no mechanism to take the Actions to the next steps. Thus, the envisioned Action Plan Review (FY91/92) may lead to identification of gaps, but there is no specified activity that would address such deficiencies.

11. USAID/Peru

SUMMARY

The Workplan uses an office-by-office approach, identifying initiatives that will be undertaken within the Mission. Twenty-four initiatives/interventions are identified under the responsibility of seven offices as follows: Human Resources Office (10); Development Resources Office (3); Administration of Justice (1); Office of Agriculture and Rural Development (1); Program Office (5); Office of the Controller (1); Office of the Executive Officer (3). Each Action specifies an Action Officer and a benchmark.

ANALYSIS

The accomplishments to date indicate a high degree of Mission management involvement. The ambitious attempts to suffuse gender analysis throughout the Mission's development activities is greater and, to an extent, different in kind from initiatives in most Missions. Attempts to address affirmative action/equity issues in the Office of the Controller and the Office of the Executive Officer are examples. In addition, the scope of recent Mission training is unprecedented in involving direct hire personnel from across the Mission, contractors, and government counterparts. The Workplan reflects involvement and consideration by various offices in the Mission.

The individual Actions appear viable. Each is constructed to fit gender considerations into priority Mission activities, or to an in-house priority. Each has a benchmark.

The Program Officer will conduct a review of all project papers and PIDS. All PIDS and PP documents will be checked for gender implications by the Project Development Officer. The Program Officer is responsible for issuing a WID Mission Order and for revising the Action Plan "to disaggregate all statistical data to include gender considerations". Moreover, the Program Officer will verify and coordinate compliance with gender requirements within the Mission. This seems to assure that all program and project activities will appropriately integrate gender concerns.

While a strategy is not specifically identified, all program and project documents are channeled through appropriate offices and each technical office must monitor WID compliance within its sectoral activities. This is consistent with the Deputy Mission Director's position that all development officers in his Mission are WID Officers.

Concerns:

The Program Office holds the key to institutionalization; program and project documents must clear that office. And, again, it is responsible for issuing a Mission Order on WID.

If key professionals in that office rotate out and are not replaced by staff committed to gender issues, or if their functions change, the significant effort that this mission has expended on institutionalization of WID could be threatened. The fall-back resides in the Mission Order.

The Deputy Director is probably attempting to institutionalize WID by withdrawing his considerable presence; he is not mentioned as being involved in any oversight activities. This is a laudable experiment, but it is an experiment. If successful, it could become a model for other Missions.

Recommendations:

The LAC Bureau should consider asking that the Mission Order clearly specify accountability for institutionalization through top Mission management, and ask whether there is a mechanism for systematically linking actions together appropriately (e.g., that gender-disaggregated data feed into all relevant programs and projects).

NOTE: The USAID/Peru Workplan indicates that the Mission "...expects that A.I.D./W will ensure that all centrally funded activities submitted to the Mission for comments will have already been reviewed for their WID treatments i.e., plans to collect integral parts of the project design process. The task of providing this additional analysis should not fall on an already overburdened Mission staff."

12. Regional Development Office/Caribbean (RDO/C)

SUMMARY

The Workplan indicates that the following will be implemented over the next two years to ensure that WID is institutionalized in the Mission:

1. Actions of the Mission WID Officer:

   a. Continue to work on gender data base, expand analysis of gender to all projects, and

computerize and institutionalize continuing input of data.

b. Develop a women's profile for each island in order to identify constraints and find out what women need and want.

2. Project Documents: Documents will identify a WID counterpart in the Project Development Office to ensure that standard gender reporting requirements are systematically addressed in that office.

3. Training of USAID staff: As issues arise or interesting material becomes available, the WID Officer will convene meetings for purposes of sharing and discussion.

4. Participant training:

a. Monitor the number of men and women included in participant training programs; there has been a 12% increase over the Agency mandate that 40% of all trainees be women.

b. Identify constraints to women's participation (e.g., family separation)

c. Provide, strategies to overcome these constraints and enhance women's participation; explicit attention will be paid to female participation in new and on-going projects.

d. Determine benchmarks to implement these strategies; report on progress in achieving the work described above on a yearly basis.

e. Engage in policy dialogue; RDO/C will support women's leaders and groups on every island in order to help them contribute to the public debate on women's issues.

ANALYSIS

The Workplan identifies the WID Officer as having the responsibility for the programmatic thrust. Some of the individual actions (e.g., development of a gender data base and expansion of analysis to all projects, development of a women's profile for each island, and policy dialogue) are important prerequisites for institutionalization.

Concerns:

There is no indication that the WID Officer will have the support of top management in all the actions necessary to institutionalize WID. Moreover, there is no evidence that there is an effort to include all technical offices in the WID effort.

Additionally, the relationships between the Actions are not clear. And there are not sufficient systems and procedures leading toward integration of gender concerns across the portfolio. There

is no comprehensive portfolio review envisioned and there do not seem to be efforts leading to a comprehensive training program. The Development office will assure that project documents will comply with the Administrator's Action Items, but program documents are not assured of compliance with A.I.D. policy on WID.

There is no overall Mission WID strategy discussed nor are there appropriate authority lines that would assure institutionalization of WID across the Mission's development activities.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that the Bureau communicate with Mission management on the need to comply with the entire Action Items Cable from the Administrator, and that the Bureau share examples of WID Action Workplans from other Missions.

13. ROCAP

SUMMARY

The Workplan is said to integrate WID into ROCAP's present (FY 90-91) Action Plan focussing on policy reforms leading to rapid and sustained economic growth and spreading the benefits of growth. The Workplan links those goals to seven sectorally-related objectives: export promotion; natural resource management, health and child survival, housing, educational opportunity and regional economic and trade policy. The Workplan includes three sections covering ten Mission-wide activities, project-specific activities and a calendar for these two sets of events.

ANALYSIS

1. Mission-wide Activities

The ten Mission-wide activities are appropriate. Several (e.g., conducting a portfolio review, Mission-level training, incorporation of gender into semi-annual reviews, participation in the development of PIDs and PPs of new projects) are essential for institutionalization.

Concerns

The Workplan is lacking a clear, detailed, comprehensive strategy leading from present status to institutionalization. There is no specified link between the individual activities and there are few clearly articulated authority lines. Thus, for example, it is unclear how the portfolio review feeds into follow-on activities and how its implications will affect the institutionalization process. There are also important gaps and a lack of clarity on some of the actions listed. Thus it unclear who will be responsible for assuring that gender will be appropriately included in future PIDs and PPs. It is also uncertain what the role of the WID officer is (e.g., will he have oversight on program and project documents; will he chair a mission-wide WID committee; will he be responsible for

developing a comprehensive Mission strategy or an implementation plan WID?. In addition, there are questions about the staff training specified (e.g., what type of training is to be used, when will it occur, which Mission staff will be trained?).

2. Specific Project Activities

There is some clear evidence that incorporation of gender issues will reach into some key ROCAP projects. Thus the Workplan indicates that gender-related concerns will be incorporated into the RFP and Scopes of Work for monitoring of the new Regional Environmental and Natural Resource Management Project and gender disaggregated data will be obtained on the Non-traditional Agricultural Export Support Project. In all cases except one, the project managers will be the responsible persons. The WID Officer will be responsible for the Central American Rural Electrification Support Project.

Concerns

The Workplan does not provide an overview of ROCAP's portfolio so it is impossible to determine how "institutionalized" its project-by-project approach will be. However, some of the language in the Workplan suggests that more thought needs to be given to constructing such overview, perhaps building on its recent portfolio review. Thus its very specification of "projects that affect women's concerns" suggests that other projects do not.

While it is conceivable that gender considerations may not relate to a particular project, gender-differentiated effects are the norm and should be assumed to exist unless there is evidence to the contrary.

Recommendations

The LAC Bureau should consider asking for a more detailed document that would provide a comprehensive strategy--the systems and procedures requisite for institutionalization throughout the entire range of ROCAP's development activities. The strategy could establish Mission-wide functions that assure uniform, systematic, routine integration of gender concerns in all phases of program and project cycles. It would also establish clear function and authority lines so that gender is systematically included in each major regular development activity.

WID Sections of LAC Action Plans

1987-89

III. WID SECTIONS OF LAC ACTION PLANS - 1987, 1988, AND 1989

A. Summary and Analysis of the WID Sections of LAC Action Plans

The WID Sections of 13 Action Plans (APs) from LAC Missions were reviewed and analyzed with respect to two factors: PROCESS ACTIONS necessary for institutionalization and SPECIFIC PROGRAMS PROJECT ACTIVITIES. The analysis and summary for each follows in the next section. In this section we provide a summary and overall analysis of all of the WID sections.

1. Process Actions. The Process Actions that had the capacity to serve as steps toward institutionalization were as follows:

- research (e.g., on the economic status of women in country)
- establishing data bases
- assessment of Mission WID Actions
- sector analyses
- portfolio reviews
- establishing strategies
- articulating authority lines to assure gender consideration in program and project cycles
- strengthening WID management
- designation of offices and officers with key responsibilities for implementing, monitoring
- Mission orders on WID
- establishing linkages to local government counterparts
- Mission-level training
- issuance and implementation of Mission WID Action Workplans
- establishing representative WID committees in Missions
- testing new procedures to incorporate gender concerns in development activities and in Mission structure and functions.

Discussion

The APs reflected a wide variety of Process Actions. Also, the amount of emphasis placed on them varied from Mission to Mission and from year to year within Missions. Some had none, others had extensive Actions. Most APs mentioned a small number of them. None provided sufficient numbers,

or clarity of linkages between actions to guarantee that institutionalization would occur.

Analyzed across years, some Missions showed a type of regression. Thus one Mission's 1987 AP reported the formation of a WID Committee, and development of a portfolio review. It also indicated gender-disaggregated data and assured that this would be addressed in all future projects. The 1988 and 1989 APs from the Mission failed to report further on any of these Actions.

In general, there were two type of relations across years within Missions: repetition and complete discontinuity. Repetitions of portions of one year's AP in the next was quite common, suggesting the likelihood that there had been little advancement in the institutionalization of gender issues. Complete discontinuities (which are illustrated in the paragraph above) also suggest that there is little continuous progress.

There was a clear distinction between the APs of 1987 and 1988 and those of 1989. The two earlier years' statements tended to emphasize general in-country conditions of women and rather disconnected, stand-alone accomplishments, such as project-specific activities. The 1989 APs reflected a greater number of Process Actions and an apparent concern over the need to articulate a strategy leading to institutionalization. This is a positive trend which reflects recent and potential legislation, substantial technical assistance to LAC Missions, regional and Mission-specific training, the Administrator's Action Items cable, and LAC Bureau guidance on WID.

Recommendations

It is recommended that:

1. The Process Actions be streamlined and that guidance be provided to Missions on those Actions that are most likely to lead to institutionalization.

2. The appropriate document (e.g., semi-annual reviews) be identified as the appropriate ones in which to report on WID progress. (Some Missions reported their intention to move reporting on WID from the annual Action Plans to the semi-annual reviews).

3. As much individual attention be paid to the progress on institutionalizing WID within Missions as possible. Each is uniquely positioned with respect to its 1989 strategies and there are some idiosyncratic developments that will have a bearing on institutionalization. For example, one Mission that is among the leaders in meeting requirements for institutionalization has no Mission WID Committee. Missions are not all using the same approach to institutionalization, and it is not clear that they should. Monitoring them individually will allow a more functional diagnostic procedure to be put into place, and will allow AID/W to interact with Missions to assist them in making appropriate decisions regarding training, technical assistance, and other support.

2. Specific Program and Project Activities

The following are summary estimates of the frequency with which the 13 Missions are linking WID to project/sector activities.

Agri.	Ch. Surv.	Dem.Inst.	Educ.	Envt.	Health/Nutr.	Housing
12	5	4	12	3	12	3

Infrastr.	Pop.	Private Ent.	Training	Other
5	11	13	11	2

Tourism	Instit'l develop.	Land Titling	Exports	Anti-narcotics
1	1	1	1	1

Discussion

The above numbers are estimates rather than substantiated facts. They may overestimate or underestimate the extent to which WID is being addressed as a cross-cutting issue. Underestimation may occur, for example, in cases where Missions intended their presentation to be simply illustrative. Indeed, there were references to the project/program descriptions as examples rather than as exhaustive accounts. Moreover, some Missions indicated that their WID activities were "in addition to areas traditionally regarded as women's." Overestimation may occur when, for example, the WID activities really were planned but failed to occur, or the Mission decided to provide a more "Process Actions" approach to the WID description and not devote valuable space to individual actions.

Even with these caveats in mind, the estimates provide a glimpse of the emergence of the LAC Missions' perspectives on WID. Typically, the Missions are reporting on activities that go well beyond the "traditional women's sectors". In fact, there seems to be a clear consensus among them that integrating gender concerns is appropriate in agriculture, education, private enterprise and training. While there should be no illusion that these figures represent true integration of gender concerns throughout the individual sectoral activities, the concept of WID as a cross-cutting issue seems to be established in the region.

Another factor supporting this conclusion is that gender is being identified in sectors that are Mission priorities. It may not be surprising that WID is being linked to agriculture, private enterprise and training activities since there has been so much technical assistance, research, training and even Congressional mandates focused on these areas. However, democratic institutions, environment, housing, and activities reported in the above "other" section above are often excluded from WID

considerations. Their inclusion here suggests that at least in some missions, there is a more generalized understanding of the appropriateness of gender issues throughout the development process.

The spread of gender considerations across Mission sectors and project-level activities is not matched by a corresponding up-to-date view of women as participants, and analysis of the documents is constrained by vagueness and lack of standardization of reporting. Each of these deserves comment.

1. Dominance of the beneficiaries approach.

The operational definition of WID was most clearly seen in the constant references to women as beneficiaries and the rare references to women as participants in the development process. Thus one Mission's 1989 AP reported that "over half the (people) trained and currently in training (in this program) are female...Thirty percent of loans made under (this project) went to women-owned small and microbusinesses... Eighty percent of the jobs created by the (project) were for women."

2. Language as a factor in analysis and monitoring.

The language of some Action Plan WID sections is so vague that monitoring of progress is impossible. An example is "USAID/---integrates women into (country) developmental processes throughout the various objectives being pursued."

3. There is a need for a standard format for reporting.

While gender issues should not be reduced to "boilerplate" presentations, there is advantage to standardizing the format for reporting. Indeed, the present format of PROCESS ACTIONS and SPECIFIC PROGRAMS AND PROJECT ACTIVITIES may be adopted as guidance to Missions for reporting. It is timely to consider this now if the Missions switch their WID presentations from the annual Action Plans to semi annual reviews.

Recommendations

- That the LAC Bureau consider formulating a set of suggested Actions leading to institutionalization and emphasize the importance of both programmatic and project foci.

- That the Bureau consider formulating guidance concerning the need to place appropriate emphasis on women as participants as well as beneficiaries in the development process.

- That the Bureau consider providing guidance to Missions on the need to present specific, measurable program and project activities when reporting on their gender-related activities.

B. Review and Analysis of Individual Action Plan WID Sections

1. USAID/Belize

Process Actions:

1987: Participation of WID Officer in monitoring project design, review and implementation; participation of WID Officer in bi-monthly portfolio reviews and proposing areas for further analysis; communication with GOB's Women's Department; and building a data base on women in Belize.

1988: Same as 1987.

1989: Retained the earlier Actions and added 1) preparation of report (in 1989) which organizes most of the information on the status of women in country into usable research and program activities; 2) submission of a WID Action Plan, laying out the two-year strategy; 3) devising a plan to conduct research in key areas of agriculture and tourism; training of USAID staff, counterparts and women leaders and developing and testing of institutionalization procedures within the Mission.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: Identification of women as beneficiaries in health, private sector, infrastructure, family planning, exports and tourism, education and agriculture activities.

1988: Same as 1987.

1989: Same as 1987.

The most significant development was the emergence of Process Actions to prominence within the Mission.

2. USAID/Bolivia

Process Actions:

1988: Training for project managers and technicians to address gender issues in Mission's portfolio; produce follow-on training in other Bolivian cities.

1989: Develop implementation plan with project managers; conduct series of workshops in country to engage USAID staff, counterparts and other private sector officials in discussions of gender issues; with [illegible], study women's access to credit; conduct portfolio review.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: Gender-related considerations in private enterprise; agricultural production; education and training; family planning, child survival, nutrition: PL 480 infrastructure activities.
1988: Same as 1987.
1989: Same as 1987 plus strengthening democratic institutions.

The relative prominence of the Process Actions suggests that the Mission is responding to WID as an A.I.D. priority. However, there are not enough process components to make a strategy resulting in institutionalization.

3. USAID/Costa Rica

Process Actions with potential implications for institutionalization were limited to the 1987 AP. It identified three actions: an assessment of the situation of women in Costa Rica in 3 sectors (agribusiness; training and institutional development and housing); and a study of women's housing needs and the establishment of a WID Committee.

The Specific Program/Project Activities of the 1988 and 1989 APs were largely drawn from the 1987 AP. Three sectoral emphases raised in the 1987 plan resurfaced. The 1988 and 1989 APs cite female beneficiaries in agriculture and agribusiness, training and institutional development, and housing. The 1987 AP raising the likelihood of establishment of a WID Committee and calling for a study of women in housing were not discussed in the later APs.

4. USAID/Dominican Republic

Process Actions:

1987: A representative WID Committee was reportedly formed (in FY85). It commissioned a portfolio review which found a dearth of gender disaggregated data. Data collection was reportedly begun and USAID claimed to ensure that all projects were collecting gender disaggregrated data.

1989: Indicators were established for USAID's programmatic objectives, targets and accomplishments; overall little progress in WID initiatives this year due to budget constraints; and there were plans to host a gender Awareness Workshop for project managers. Indicators were kept of USAID's programmatic objectives, targets and accomplishments in four sectors (training programs, agribusiness, free trade zones, and small and micro-enterprises). Also training of staff in agriculture, microenterprise training (vocational and participant) and health and population was conducted, WID Action Plan was prepared and a local firm will assess the role of women in the D.R.

Specific Program and Project Activities:

1987: Studies were conducted in agriculture with gender disaggregated data bases. There were increases in women's inclusion in participant training in the agriculture sector training project and others including non traditional areas (e.g., computers, export promotion, graduate management training, human resources development and other key mission areas). A start has been made in the industrial sector to incorporate women, especially in extending available credit to small and micro levels. Also, Mission is increasing women farmers' access to financial services and increasing women's participation in training in health and population.

1988: There was continued emphasis on training programs, free trade zones and credit to women-owned small and micro businesses.

1989: Mission is using indicators to monitor accomplishments in incorporating women in training programs, new jobs in agribusiness, new jobs in free trade zones and extension of credit to women-owned small and micro businesses.

5. USAID/Ecuador

Process Actions:

1987: There has been articulation of a strategy to expand employment opportunities for women through facilitating women's access to management and technical training, credit and technical assistance. Also, information gathering on women's economic activities was seen as particularly important in sectors where they traditionally play an active role.

1988: Mission developed a strategy to reduce constraints to women in variety of sectors and to investigate gender factors in several projects. Again emphasis was on project-level activities where women have traditionally demonstrated the greatest potential to improve their well being.

1989: An affirmative action-based strategy was developed which should lead to elimination of all bias in the full, equitable participation of women in development activities. Focus for this AP period was on establishing mechanisms and procedures to ensure that project and policy content of all Mission efforts not reflect bias. Four major tasks were identified to meet this objective:

1) sensitize Mission staff;
2) establish sex disaggregated data base to measure impacts;
3) identify and work with local agencies which can perform research or training;
4) reinforce and monitor individual WID strategies by each technical tasks; division and share pertinent information to enable Mission to measure progress.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: The following Activities were reported: active recruitment of females for the Central American Scholarship Project; training in accounting, marketing, production management, loan application procedures, poultry, food preparation and production and handicrafts (under the Overseas Education Fund).

1988: All above (1987) activities were reported plus child survival, nutrition, improved sanitation, shelter, infrastructure activities, education and microenterprise activities.

1989: This AP shifted away from specific projects to Mission-level strategies and policies.

6. USAID/El Salvador

Process Actions:

1987: No Process Actions in this AP.

1988: The AP indicated that USAID had been unable to systematically record the impact of its portfolio on women except in traditional areas of population, health and nutrition; that it recognized the need to get accurate data; that it was exploring methodologies to do so; and that next year's AP would have better data.

1989: The AP indicated that WID Workplan submitted to A.I.D./W in March was to be the submission here. The WID Workplan specified the following expected actions; establish representative WID Committee chaired by the Deputy Mission Director; issue a Mission WID strategy in the form of a Mission Order on WID; develop a gender-specific data base to affect program and project design, modifications and evaluations.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: The following Activities were reported: active recruitment of females for the Central American Scholarship Project; training in accounting, marketing, production management, loan application procedures, poultry, food preparation and production and handicrafts (under the Overseas Education Fund); employment generation of the Earthquake Recovery Program; planned parenthood support; child health and nutritional activities (La Leche League); training in nutrition (program for displaced women); and training at the United Schools of America in Florida.

1988: Activities were conducted in health, population, nutrition, short-and long-term training, participation in the CAPS program in-service training for school teachers.

1989: AP contained no Specific Program or Project Activities.

7. USAID/Guatemala

Process Actions:

1987: Measurement of women's progress in mainstream development was occurring during project implementation; maintenance of a gender disaggregated data collection system will be encouraged; and policy dialogue will seek measures to increase employment opportunities and target legislation for women.

1988: The following activities were reported: a Mission-level WID workshop was held to sensitize development workers; a comprehensive WID strategy was developed; practical guidelines were produced to be used in design and implementation of more effective/efficient programs. Integration of WID into the portfolio as a whole was reported to have been successful.

1989: The AP reported that constraints to women's participation have been identified and that these were addressed in the updates to the CDSS, sector strategies and related programs and projects. The Mission has incorporated gender considerations as one of eight cross-cutting issues. A WID strategy has been finalized, which establishes separate WID objectives for each of the Mission's principal Action Plan objectives. A WID Action Plan has been developed.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: Mission reported that it sought to broaden the participation of women especially in the agriculture sector. Health and education activities were said to address gender issues and an FY 86 evaluation of potable water and environmental sanitation systems looked at gender implications.

1988: Gender was being addressed in private sector projects, the CAPS program, family planning and health.

1989: Loans were made available for women microenterpreneurs and training and education programs were offered under CAPS and other Mission-sponsored activities.

8. USAID/Haiti

Process Actions:

1987: Mission made a commitment to data collection, especially in the evaluation program. The Mission intends to increase attention to special concerns of women in sector analyses and project design; will assure adequate representation at all levels of proposed training; and will assure that

female leaders will be included in the A.I.D. finance joint program with USIS.

1988: The reported strategy was to incorporate gender issues into key projects.

1989: The reported objectives were to strengthen WID management (Program Officer was designated as Mission WID Officer); Mission Order on WID will set forth more rigorous requirements and procedures in programming documents and project design, implementation and evaluation; a WID Committee will be established; the portfolio review will be incorporated into all future semi-annual reviews, a mission training workshop will be conducted; and WID indicators will be established for all Mission projects (target dates for these have been set).

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: Private enterprise activities were emphasized which included: 1) financial reform to enhance credit for micro-entrepreneurs of both genders; 2) creating intermediary institutions and programs to assist women and others; 3) legal reforms to remove obstacles; e.g., ownership of property, permission to borrow money or own businesses. Also, the Factory Worker Improvement Project was said to be designed to enable factory workers, mostly women, to upgrade skills, education and productivity leading to improvements in microenterprises, health and literacy. Also, the Interim Swine Repopulation Project, the A.I.D.-supported agricultural credit program and health, child survival and family planning programs were said to have strong benefits to women.

1988: Emphasis was placed on the benefits to women of efforts in agricultural production, extending credit to women entrepreneurs, preserving natural resources, improving educational opportunities and increasing participant training and reducing infant and child mortality.

1989: The following activities were indicated: explicit directives to each design team to examine constraints to women's participation; strengthening the role of women in business through both credit and training; improvements in basic education to both boys and girls and participant training (75% of the participants in the PTIIC Program are women) and child survival activities.

9. USAID/Honduras

Process Actions:

1987: No Process Actions included.

1988: AP indicated that USAID integrates women into Honduras developmental processes throughout the various objectives being pursued.

1989: The Mission reported that evaluation of the Privatization of State-Owned Enterprises Project will include assessment of the impact on women.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: AP cited vocational training efforts, appropriate rural technologies, agricultural development efforts, small farmer credit, training and technical assistance, training in natural resource management and livestock production, and micro and small scale enterprise and family planning activities.

1988: The Mission indicated that women actively participated in and benefitted from projects in agricultural production/natural resource management, population, health and child survival primary education and microenterprise activities.

1989: AP stated that women were beneficiaries of projects in agricultural production, stabilizing of financial structures, promotion of export earnings, family planning, health and child survival, housing, education, employment generation and strengthening democratic institutions.

10. USAID/Jamaica

Process Actions:

1987: AP reported that three studies and a "solid core data base on the economic status of women" was prepared to provide sharper analysis. Contractors were directed to disaggregate their data.

1988: AP contained no Process Actions.

1989: The Mission indicated that there had been substantial progress in incorporating gender issues in the current program and that there would be a portfolio review.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: Reported activities with significant impact on women included: funding of the National Development Foundation which resulted in significant increases in employment for women in micro business; family planning initiatives; and funding a program training women in construction trades. Also, Strengthening the Agriculture Sector was expected to yield greater employment for women and women were seen as likely candidates for jobs in the Promotion of Investment and Exports activities. Also, PL 480 local currency was to be used to finance the food stamp program which will yield support to the lowest income strata and women will benefit from health initiatives in the private sector.

1988: The Mission reported that new projects that could have significant impacts on women included AIDS/STD Prevention and Control; health sector initiatives; technical and vocational education initiatives; primary education/community development; participant training and private sector

activities (no mention of agriculture here).

1989: AP cited the following accomplishments; over half of the revenue agents trained and currently in training are female; thirty percent of loans made under the Emergency Rehabilitation project went to women-owned small and micro enterprises; there has been an increase in percentage of female students in agricultural education; 80 percent of the jobs created by the Private Enterprise project are for women; family planning initiatives have probably influenced the decline in the birth rate; Mission had targeted women through the media regarding AIDS; 57 percent of people in the PTIIC Project (Democratic Institutions) are female; and half the judges under the Caribbean Improvement Projects are women.

11. USAID/Peru

Process Actions:

1987: The Mission emphasized integrating women into mainstream programming, and carefully considering the concerns of women in building in appropriate elements when new projects are in the design stage. Also, the published National Rural Household Survey provided important data for future agricultural activities.

1988: AP provided the same information as the 1987 AP.

1989: Mission reported on the designation of all USAID Officers as WID Officers; Deputy Director serves as WID Coordinator; women will be effectively considered through 1) existence of women-oriented projects (especially in health and population) and in overall portfolio mix; 2) the design of discrete women-related elements in multi-component projects; and 3) integration of gender considerations in new project design and implementation.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: AP reported that women were likely to be positively affected in project involving agricultural production, agricultural extension, private sector support, and reducing infant, child mortality.

1988: The following development activities were cited as matters receiving careful attention for their impacts on women: agricultural production and agricultural extension; private (especially informal) sector activities; training; family planning; child survival; health care delivery systems; rural water systems and environmental sanitation and participant training.

1989: Activities in which women's concerns were being addressed included: agriculture, private sector; natural resource management and preservation; family planning; health and child survival; alleviating malnutrition; strengthening democratic institutions (at least half of those in participant training and in the judicial systems are women); and anti-narcotics program (women seem as change

agents for drug use prevention).

12. Regional Development Office/Caribbean (RDO/C)

Process Actions

1987: AP established five performance indicators to measure progress in reaching women beneficiaries in: credit programs; participant training in managerial and technical professions; training and/or technical assistance to women-owned small and medium businesses; employment creation in manufacturing; and extension programs where extension agent visits to women farmers contribute to increases in technology transfer and agricultural production.

1988: AP reported nothing on the above. Instead, it indicated that a Mission Order on WID was issued in November, 1989 and that it designated the Deputy Director as WID Officer and placed the role of the WID Coordinator in the Program Office. Also, the Mission commissioned the Institute of Social and Economic Research, University of the West Indies, to assess RDO/C assistance to women in the Caribbean to increase the integration of WID in development strategy, project design and implementation.

1989: The Mission indicated that it would implement a new WID Workplan; institute a data base to monitor women's participation in projects and ensure that WID will be systematically considered in all new project designs; and ensure the sectoral reviews will be conducted.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: AP provided none.

1988: The Mission indicated the following activities in which women were beneficiaries: overseas training, small enterprise assistance, agriculture, training, infrastructure, and health and population projects. RDO/C also reported that it provides small individual grants under the Special Development Activities Program to women's groups, cooperatives and other grass roots organizations (mostly for income generation, increasing productive activities, improved technologies, improved education, encouragement of conservation, enhancement of health, and strengthening disaster preparedness).

1989: The Mission indicated that it would conduct sectoral reviews to examine the roles of women in the private sector, education, agriculture, population, demographic initiatives, and infrastructure.

13. Regional Office: Central American Programs (ROCAP)

Process Actions are missing from all three Action Plans for this Mission.

Specific Program/Project Activities:

1987: AP included: export, non-traditional agricultural production (some training scholarships will be reserved for women); agriculture (women will be recruited to attend the Regional Agricultural School for Humid Tropics and women will benefit from the Tree Crop Production Project since researchers, policy makers and foresters will be sensitized to the role of women in production and consumption of fast-growing trees); reduction of infant and child mortality; technical support for food assistance programs (research will examine the social, economic and health/nutrition impacts of these programs on women, children and families); rural electrification and the CAPS program (greater emphasis will be placed on recruiting women participants).

1988: ROCAP reported that women would benefit from the following: the encouragement of the production of non-traditional agricultural products through agribusiness credit lines for the sorting and packing of produce, normally done by women; expansion of rural employment for women under previously mentioned projects; tree crop production (yielding better fuelwood supplies and hiring women professionals); reduction of infant mortality (women represent high percentage of the professionals involved in the project's research, training and technical assistance); technical support for Food Assistance Program project (will examine social, economic, health/nutrition impacts of these on women, children and families); rural electrification; and participant training.

1989: The following activities were reported to benefit women: nutrition (using professional women and women researchers); a project which promotes formation and operation of women's cooperatives and trains rural women in income generation; and recruitment of women under the Export Management Training Projects.

SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF PROJECT PAPERS

IV. SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF SELECTED LAC MISSION PROJECT PAPERS

Belize: Livestock Development
505 - 0006
(1983 - 1989)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to improve pork, beef and dairy production of small and medium farmers and to expand market outlets for their products. The project includes four specific interventions: technical experts to assist in swine improvement and pasture improvement programs; a market demand study for fresh milk; technical assistance to teach modern meat processing technologies to interested private sector parties; and government staff training in policy formulation. The first two interventions impact directly on the small and medium farmers, and on women in particular who, according to the Social Soundness Analysis, are largely responsible for swine management.

COMMENTARY

The Social Soundness Analysis notes that there is a long tradition of swine production by women in Belize, yet past swine improvement programs have directed educational efforts at men. This project, it states, will deviate from the past and encourage rural women's participation from the outset of the swine improvement field activities. At the same time, swine production activities will focus on the Toledo district of Belize, the most remote and least developed region of the country which at the same time produces the most pork in the country. The majority of the population is composed of Mayan Indians. Careful thought was given to the special circumstances of the Indian communities, and the project includes the services of a sociologist/anthropologist during implementation to assist in designing proper technical assistance to effectively reach the Indian communities. The same cannot be said for women's special requirements. The project's interventions do not reflect the constraints women might face in improving livestock production.

Constraints that would be faced by women include the need for women to carry more water, the additional time required to look after pigs, and the use of limited income to purchase feed supplements if recommended. Moreover, ways of reaching women in remote rural communities, while suggested as necessary in the project paper, are not spelled out. Women do not usually belong to formal farmer's groups and associations so exactly how to effectively cover remote and isolated communities of women may be difficult. One suggestion to overcome such an obstacle is to reach women through women's traditional associations and informal networks which would require additional research by the project team.

The project design conceptualizes pig raising as an economic activity of poor farmers to spread their risks and broaden their business potential. On the other hand, Inter-American Development Bank technical experts who have designed swine production projects say that rural low-income families that raise pigs have a slightly different focus--pigs are seen as a cash "savings bank", a commodity that can be converted to cash in time of need. This is true in most subsistence communities in Central America where pigs are often sold to pay for urgent family needs such as emergency health care or school expenses. Thus the pigs are sold, not at the optimum size or when market prices are highest, but at the time money is needed.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Since the project is nearly completed, recommendations for implementation would be a little late. The evaluation of the project, however, could usefully provide information on the following:

1. How did the project technical assistance in swine production reach women, and what successes and constraints were experienced in delivering effective technical assistance to women?

2. Disaggregate by gender all data collected on farmers (female farmers/male farmers), and use this data as the basis for a gender disaggregated analysis of project failures and successes.

Caribbean/Regional Development Office (RDO/C): Agricultural Research and Extension # 538 - 0164 (1989 - 1994)

BACKGROUND

The project purpose is to strengthen the institutional capacity of national agricultural extension services in the Eastern Caribbean and support regional research and extension efforts to improve agricultural technologies.

COMMENTARY

The project framework represents a refreshing approach to agricultural development because it envisions development from the farmer's point of view: that is, as a farm/home management scheme with farm and home considered as one economic unit. Furthermore, the farm/home management concept includes the consideration of "gender differentiated income stream within farm households which involve different stakes or interest in agricultural improvements for men and for women farmers". (p 84)

The preparation of the project and incorporation of gender issues into the mainstream of the project design is based on early inputs in the project preparation process from local and U.S. based groups--especially the Women in Development Unit (WAND), based in Barbados, of the University of the West Indies and the Women in Development group of the Mid-West Universities Consortium for International Agriculture (WID/MUCIA). This work, supplemented by research and AID's assistance to agricultural extension projects in the Caribbean since 1983, provided a profile of the farming population which led to understandings of gender differences in the economics of the agricultural production.

The project design is a collaborative approach between research and extension services to introduce diversified crop technologies to small farmers. The initial period of project implementation will include data collection and review to determine small farmer problems, needs and resources in order to guide later project activities. This phase will explore the potential (gender specific) adverse effects of increased labor involved in the production and marketing of non-traditional crops for export promotion and import substitution.

More important than the recognition of women's role in agriculture are the actions planned by the project to address women's economic participation and constraints. These include a baseline study of women's role in agriculture, training and workshops to raise the awareness of research and extension staffs regarding women's role in agriculture, and improvement of the data collection system which will include gender disaggregated data as tools for project activities. Workshops will

be carried out by WAND, the UWI/WID office, and the Caribbean Feminist Research Association (CAFRA) located in Trinidad. Pilot efforts experimenting with different delivery mechanism will be tried in one or more communities to provide gender-specific resources and support materials. A WID coordinator will be hired who will most likely be an agricultural economist located within the implementing agency, and a WID advisory group will be formed. Monitoring and evaluation of the project will assess the WID component as a priority subject in project review.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The overall focus and project start-up activities appropriately address women's issues. During implementation other women's issues will need to be addressed such as access to credit, internal and external market systems, and continuing on-farm and off-farm income.

Caribbean/Regional Development Office (RDO/C): Small Enterprise Assistance
538 - 0133
(1986 - 1991)

BACKGROUND

The project is to assist micro, small and medium enterprises in seven Eastern Caribbean states and Barbados to sell their goods in the local, regional and extra-regional markets. The implementing agency is the Caribbean Association of Industry and Commerce (CAIC).

COMMENTARY

Women are well established in the micro to medium size private enterprise sector in the Eastern Caribbean, especially in agro-related businesses and traditional enterprises such as fresh produce marketing, handicrafts, service industry and garment manufacture. The project paper recognizes this fact, and the design has attempted to incorporate elements specifically directed at women. Unfortunately, the design compartmentalizes women as a separate problem to be addressed during project implementation rather than adjusting the design to ensure project benefits reach women as a matter of course. Two examples of this are the delivery of training and the credit system within the project.

Training and technical assistance for entrepreneurs will be provided through Island small business associations, yet according to the project paper women do not belong to these commercial business associations. The project response to this problem is to develop, during the implementation period, special packages for women ("...there are a number of WID agencies both within the islands and regionally that can be hired to service the particular problems women are encountering"). A more appropriate approach would be to identify women's organizations as eligible conduits for training and technical assistance, and to further develop a recruitment program through women's informal networks and associations.

Credit will be provided through the project. The project paper points out that married women need co-signers in order to receive credit. This may prove a serious flaw as it will effectively limit or exclude some women from the benefits of the project. Project design would have been better served if the designers had set up a credit delivery system for women that was based on a full understanding of how existing informal credit systems function, and then incorporated appropriate elements of this system such as size of loans, repayment schedules, into the project. Some successful examples of formal credit systems based on understanding of the informal credit system are SEWA of India and the Grameen Bank of Bangladesh. These programs have dealt with the difficult loan guarantee question by forming women's groups to collectively guarantee loans for individual members.

The Women in Development office in Barbados was preselected for participation in the project as one of the groups that will assist women entrepreneurs. No details on the history, management and previous activities of WID/Barbados is included in the project documentation although an institutional analysis of this organization would have made a useful contribution to understanding such organizations and assisting in their growth. This information would indicate if additional technical assistance for institution strengthening and training resources might need to be targeted to WID/Barbados. This could be an issue as local and regional WID groups formed to promote the economic participation of women often lack resources and the in-house capacity to provide services themselves. When the project implementing agency has all the technical resources at hand to provide resources to other beneficiaries as it does in this project, it does not make great sense to hand off service delivery to women through an organization that may have scant resources, unless they have a proven track record and capacity.

This project represents a case where recognition of women's role in the sector and the incorporation of a women's group into the project do not add up to a serious consideration of women in project design. The training and credit interventions discussed above are two examples that could be redesigned to effectively reach more of the target population--women.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The project implementing agency should either undertake an active recruitment program for women to join small business associations or choose appropriate women's organizations to serve as a conduit for the technical assistance and training provided by the project.

2. The project should seek solutions to the dual problems of co-signers and lack of collateral in order to facilitate women' access to credit.

3. Institutional analysis and, if necessary, subsequent technical assistance for institutional strengthening should be offered to WID/Barbados and other WID groups to be involved in project execution.

Costa Rica: Non-Traditional Agricultural Export Technical Support (NETS)
515 - 0237
(1987 - 1991)

BACKGROUND

The goal of the project is to stimulate growth of non-traditional agricultural products for export to the U.S., European and Asian markets for the purpose of generating foreign exchange earnings and internal employment. The project will provide funds for technical assistance, policy studies and export trade promotion, with the Costa Rican private sector Coalition for Development Initiative (CINDE) acting as the NETS implementing agency.

COMMENTARY

The Project Paper's Social Soundness Analysis is a simple identification of categories of the target population: entrepreneur/investors, unemployed or underemployed laborers and farmers. Women were not identified in the project paper as a singular group. While it is understandable that the project focus is primarily on export and trade promotion activities and entrepreneurs/investors are a hard group to characterize, the farmers' willingness and ability to introduce new crops is essential to project success, and women constitute a significant percentage (up to 40%) of these farmers. It would benefit project implementation to look more closely at the division of labor among farm families in target areas and their willingness and ability to put new crops into production.

The project design has preselected 21 crops for production and export promotion within the project. Noteworthy characteristics of these crops are their suitability for small scale intensive cultivation by farmers with limited parcels of land. The crops can be particularly interesting to women as part of the smallholder farming community because they offer opportunities attractive to women, such as:

- Only small parcels of land, to which women may have easier access, are required for cultivation. In addition, these plots can be located near home so women can attend to other responsibilities while monitoring crop growth.

- Women are particularly receptive to new ideas that will allow them to generate income (which is often their source of funds for expenses such as medical and educational expenses).

- If women farm the new crops, they are perhaps more likely to be able to keep the cash income (conversely, if men farm the new crops they will keep the income).

On the negative side, the introduction of new crops can often be opposed by women if it requires additional labor on their part without giving them any direct benefit. Some of the preselected crops

have heavy labor requirements which the project paper says will be met by contracted labor. It is not clear from the text, however, how this labor will be contacted and if such labor is available on a casual basis. In Central America men temporarily migrate to new locales to harvest the large cash crops such as coffee and sugar cane but women provide most of the casual labor for hand-picked crops. Most of the crops to be introduced in this project will not offer sufficient work to attract migrant male labor (at least in the initial stages), and are to be hand-picked, so whether the additional labor is hired or comes from within the household, women will be likely to do the harvesting.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The implementation team should carefully analyze the division of labor in small farm households to see whether labor and other resource constraints exist that need to be addressed.

2. Women may be the farmers most interested in the project if they can be reached and provided with technical assistance to introduce the new crops. The project should attempt to reach women through private voluntary organizations or other women's farm groups, and design ways to meet their needs for assistance in introducing new crops.

Dominican Republic: Child Survival
517 - 0239
(1987 - 1991)

BACKGROUND

The project goal is to improve the quality and expand the coverage of child health care and maternal/child nutrition services to three geographic regions in the country. The target population is 750,000 low-income children under the age of five and their families. The project is based on a 1987 Child Survival Plan (PLANSI) of the Ministry of Health (SESPAS) which, together with private voluntary organizations operating in the country, will be the implementing agencies.

COMMENTARY

The project has been designed as a pilot approach to removing prior constraints in child health care delivery systems. The project will be implemented in three geographic regions by private voluntary organizations already operating there, as a test case of the efficacy of delivery and service management of PVOs as part of the national service delivery system.

The innovative approach here is the focus on the health care promoter as the key person in the delivery system and all other staff, including supervisors and management, playing a support role to the promoter.

Commendable to the project is the effort to give the promoter all the advantages and tools possible to effectively do her job: all of the promoters are women; they are provided with transportation, community maps, locales within each community to store records and small equipment; and are responsible for a minimum but well defined list of reporting/data collection requirements. The leadership role and responsibilities of the promoter to address families in child health education (it was found that often older siblings, aunts and other family members rather than the mother were primary care givers to young children) were also defined. The responsibilities of the supervisors of promoters are to serve as technical trainers of promoters in the services offered by the project, verify the accuracy of information and records gathered by the promoter, and serve as a resource for the community and a liaison with other institutions. During project implementation the participating organizations are to explore different work incentives for promoters.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Two basic elements in the project--the content of the training program for promoters and a needs assessment of the communities--were not defined at the time of the project paper and will be carried out during the implementation stage. These operational aspects need to focus on women's particular constraints in both areas.

1. For the promoters, training content will need to address their particular time constraints (especially when they are unpaid volunteers), cultural barriers in the community (such as resistance to educational messages from male members), and their own attitudes as a key component.

2. For the users of child health care services, research should consider the following factors influencing their decisions to seek/utilize services: age and parity, education, information availability and accuracy, competing time demands, income levels, and socio-cultural and attitudinal factors.

Dominican Republic: Family Planning Services Expansion
517 - 0229
(1986 - 1989)

BACKGROUND

The project aims to consolidate gains made in the first family planning project by removing constraints identified in meeting demands for family planning services from low-income persons and couples. The constraints identified include (1) lack of service delivery capacity, (2) inadequate central program management and coordination, and (3) lack of effective mass communication and patient education.

The institutions delivering family planning services in the Dominican Republic and implementing the project are the National Council for Population and the Family (CONAPOFA) under the Secretariat of State for Public Health and Social Assistance (SESPAS) and the Dominican Association for Family Welfare (PROFAMILIA), a not-for-profit private sector organization. Both have a long history and extensive experience in family planning.

COMMENTARY

The project was conceived on the basis of data from surveys which showed an increasing unsatisfied demand for family planning services from women who are not participating in any national family planning programs or served by private pharmacies and physicians. Meanwhile, the growth of CONAPOFA and PROFAMILIA's programs overburdened their administrative structures, and at the same time it became evident that the promoters in the field were not accomplishing their task. Therefore neither current nor future demand could be met by the institutions.

The project design has responded to these problems by including components to restructure the administration of the organizations and modernize their management information systems, to institute public media campaigns, and to train and retrain community-based promoters and supervisors and expand the services of clinic-based operations. Of these three components, the largest is the training of 4500 new promoters and supervisors and the retraining of an additional 1000 staff (a total of 5500) for community-based service delivery and the improvement of facilities and services in the CONAPOFA and PROFAMILIA clinics.

What is not clear in the design of the project, however, is whether the project understands why the promoters' performance has been inadequate or what constraints the users might be facing in seeking family planning services. The interventions planned by the project are to contract outside technical assistance to provide training and education in family planning to the community-based promoters and supervisors (the content is not discussed in the project paper) and provide equipment and supplies and promotional materials to the clinic-based family planning services. While these actions

are valuable, more understanding of the problems encountered by promoters in the field and women seeking family planning services would greatly enhance effectiveness of the project.

Some of the questions the project paper did not ask but which are relevant to improving service delivery are: who are the health promoters (men or women); does the program include women as supervisors and women in program management; what perks and work incentives are there for promoters; what tools of the trade do promoters need that they do not have (transportation is mentioned, but other useful tools are maps of the community, places to store supplies and materials in each community); what are the work conditions; are job descriptions well defined; are there ambiguous lines of command?

An example of constraints in effective delivery systems is the problem of attitudes on the part of promoters. Promoters can inadvertently send negative signals to women, causing them to drop out of the program. These attitudinal problems are often a result of the worker's own dissatisfaction with the working environment or administration of the program, or may be caused by their frustration in not having adequate information and supplies to meet the demand.

Another important analytical omission are the constraints faced by family planning users (the project paper recognizes user discontinuation by funding a study on that subject during the implementation period). It does briefly mention that reliability and safety of family planning methods are a constraint. In order to overcome the constraint of negative information on family planning devices, health workers need to be fully educated themselves on the adverse effects of different methods as well as the positive benefits of family planning methods. Women need full information in order to make appropriate choices for their own lives and circumstances. Partial information can be very detrimental to the program in the long run, especially in the Dominican Republic where the relative educational level is high and word of mouth is the primary source of information for the large majority of women.

A secondary objective of the program is the introduction and expansion of user fees into the whole system. The survey to be undertaken during project implementation related to user fees needs to include information on women's income levels and cash available for services in order to adequately understand what women can afford to pay for services. Research in other countries has shown that most women pay for family planning services and other health services out of their own pockets with what little disposable income they earn. The amount and flow of income, as well as how they earn it (marketing, their own agricultural production, wages from outside employment, etc.) will be crucial to establishing a realistic user fee system.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The surveys and evaluations to carried out during project implementation need to collect detailed gender disaggregated information on attitudes toward, access to, and acceptance of family planning services.

2. The project should evaluate the reasons why the community promoters are not effective in their task, from the standpoint of job satisfaction and feasibility of implementing the tasks for them, and from the standpoint of management support for their work. The training and support programs should reflect responses to these constraints.

3. As part of the above, the promoters need to be provided with understanding of the communities in which they operate and how to attain good community relations, and with the tools of their trade such as transport (already included in the project), maps of the communities, and meeting places that are comfortable and convenient for women attenders. The project should build in a system of incentives for promoters related to their professional performance with the community.

4. The project should evaluate the constraints women face in seeking family planning services, especially the obstacles of previous misinformation about services and family planning methods. This could be carried out by one of the surveys proposed in the project.

Ecuador: Small Enterprise Development
518 - 0056
(1986 - 1989)

BACKGROUND

The project will provide credit, technical assistance and representational services to micro-entrepreneurs and small scale enterprises in Ecuador for the purpose of increasing employment and generating income for the country's urban population. The enterprises are located in secondary cities.

COMMENTARY

In many areas of Latin America, projects that reach small scale entrepreneurs and the nonformal sector are the most successful in reaching the largest number of women in the private sector. While traditional precepts limit women's private sector participation at the upper economic levels, at the micro-entrepreneurial and nonformal levels, the sector tends to be dominated by women. For example, virtually all retail food marketing in Latin America is handled by women, and women predominate in handicrafts, garment making, food processing and open air marketing. The non-formal sector attracts women for a variety of reasons. The attraction could be due to any one, or a combination of the following: the lack of income generating opportunities elsewhere for poor and uneducated women; the lack of entrance requirements; the flexible schedules and hours (if a market woman does not show up on time, the loss is her own responsibility); and the opportunity to simultaneously take care of infants.

The project paper and its annexes target women as project beneficiaries. Gender issues discussed in the project paper include the following: women have less access to public information than men and may be discouraged by male members of their households from developing their own businesses; the multiple roles of women may restrict the amount of time or distance that they can be away from home for technical assistance and (possibly) credit activities; women's educational levels tend to be lower than men's and therefore technical assistance and credit application procedures should be adjusted accordingly; and women's businesses have fewer assets than men, which argues for continuation of the solidarity group or similar mechanism for providing loan guarantees. The project monitoring and evaluation system will include appropriate indicators and data collected by the project will be disaggregated by gender.

The project micro credit program is similar in design to now almost "classic" models of micro credit programs that have successfully reached women entrepreneurs and women in the non-formal sector in Asia and Africa (SEWA in India, the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh, Women's World Banking in many countries). These models include elements of solidarity groups, short term loans, technical assistance and training, and a loan guarantee mechanism. The loan guarantee mechanism proposed in the project would provide 65% coverage by an outside organization with the remaining risk taken by the lending institution. This is an important step in overcoming women's lack of collateral and guarantors, which has traditionally been one of the most significant barriers women face in obtaining credit.

On the other hand, micro credit experience in conservative Latin American communities in Central America and Colombia suggests that commercial lending institutions seek up to 200% coverage in lending operations to any type of small enterprise. If this should prove true in the six secondary cities serviced by the project, the amount of guarantee will not be sufficient and the project implementation team will have to intervene, possibly by negotiating more coverage or designing additional credit guarantee mechanisms.

The timing and hours of technical assistance and training for entrepreneurs could become an implementation issue for all of the project, and for the participation of women in particular. It is hard to envision how small scale entrepreneurs will be able to find the time in any week to attend 25 hours of outside training, let alone the 60 hours of training in one month planned by the project. This amount of time seems even more unreasonable for women who have additional responsibilities and time commitments for childcare and household duties. A more reasonable approach would be to streamline and compress technical assistance and training time, offer childcare during training sessions and schedule sessions around peak market hours.

A possible negative side effect of the institutional strengthening component for representational organizations working with microentrepreneurs is the eventual exclusion of women from such organizations unless women are actively recruited for management and staff positions as well as for membership. The implementing agency will select organizations for grants from among existing chambers of industry as well as artisan and small merchant associations. The extent of women's participation in these organizations is not discussed in the project document although the technical analysis recognizes male dominated organizations as a constraint to women's participation. If, as suspected, the organizations implementing this component have limited participation of women, the project implementation team will need to search out and work directly with women's organizations in which women do readily participate, and insist that more male dominated organizations recruit women as members, and for management and training staff.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Restructure the proposed timetable for technical assistance and training to respond to women's time availability.

2. Explore the need for additional loan guarantees for women entrepreneurs. Some sources of additional guarantors outside the project might be women in development committees and private voluntary agencies operating in the country.

3. Make a point of identifying and working with chambers and associations in which women participate fully.

4. Recruit women for management and staff and training positions in the participating organizations.

El Salvador: Health Systems Support Project
519 - 0308
(1986 - 1991)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to strengthen the Ministry of Public Health to deliver and support basic health care services, including preventive and primary care services of the Ministry's Child Survival Program. The beneficiaries will be "1.1 million women of childbearing age and infants and children under five years of age" and the "under-served rural population."

The project has three components: logistical support (management and distribution of drugs, medical supplies, equipment and facilities); improvement of the delivery system (training for health care workers, technical assistance for the malaria control program and child survival outreach activities); and strengthening of policy and programming management (MIS and applied research studies).

COMMENTARY

Three issues stand out in reviewing the project content and design: 1) the community service delivery approach in light of the ongoing military conflict in the country; 2) the focus of training for health workers; and 3) the areas selected for applied health research. These issues are important to the project as a whole but they are particularly important to women whose participation in the project as health care workers and as target beneficiaries of the program's actions was not addressed in the project document.

Health care services in El Salvador are based on delivery by community workers. However, with communities in a constant state of upheaval and displacement because of the military conflict, community health workers may not be safe and women may not want or be able to go to the local health unit outpost. In fact, the project paper seems to substantiate this impression by references in the text to high attrition rates among health care workers, and statistics indicating a shift away from the use of health care outposts and toward the use of established hospitals and clinics. The phenomena are not explained in the text, but may be explained by the danger to health workers traveling around rural communities and by the willingness of the population to travel to established medical institutions because localized conflict prevents them from receiving medical attention in their own communities.

The component for improving basic health care services delivery focuses on improving MOH support services for basic care facilities and health education and training for service providers. The project interventions do not focus on the needs and constraints faced by the service providers--community health workers--in carrying out their tasks. Interventions to improve service delivery in other AID sponsored projects have included "tools of the trade" for community workers such as transportation, community maps, storage areas for supplies and materials, incentives for improved professional performance, training in attitudinal problems (community relations) and the emphasis on having women as community workers to work with women and children. Such considerations would have

usefully contributed to project design.

Studies to be carried out under the project are 1) strategies for cost recovery and cost reduction; 2) health provider training and employment (which will provide information for the future that was needed in the current training program); and 3) drug supply and use. In these studies, especially in the first and second studies, it will be crucial to disaggregate data by gender and analyze women's role as both participant and provider in the current health care system. For example, in order to determine the ability to pay for health services, women's income (or contribution to economic productivity if income statistics are not available) has been shown to be determinant in seeking health care for themselves and their families. Women's income (rather than men's) is used for health care services almost universally in developing countries. Another factor in successful health care delivery has been shown to be the degree of "comfort" women have in approaching health car workers, and that this level is increased if the health care workers are women and if the health care workers have positive attitudes and approaches to their communities. These factors are but examples of some of the women-oriented analyses that will contribute to an accurate study of the current and future possibilities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Some consideration of the effects of civil war on women and children would be valuable. Such factors as displacement, economic burden and hardship, and threats to safety in seeking health services as well as the negative impact on sustainability of services need to be explored.

2. Efforts to improve basic health care delivery should include a focus on the needs and constraints of the service providers themselves.

3. The studies to be undertaken by the project and the reviews and evaluations to be carried out through the life of the project need to make the role of women as beneficiaries and as health care providers a central issue in the analysis.

Guatemala: Private Enterprise Development
520 - 0341
(1988 - 1992)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to strengthen the role of private enterprise by improving small and medium firms' access to technical and managerial knowledge and financial resources, address and alleviate non-traditional export production constraints, and support a policy dialogue with the government and larger private sector organizations.

COMMENTARY

The few studies available dealing with women in business in Latin America, as well as casual observation in Guatemala, would seem to indicate a high prevalence of women-owned or managed businesses, especially in textiles, clothing and food trades. Most of these businesses are at the "take-off" stage: that is, they are successful in that they survive and provide an adequate income to the owner, but have not moved to a second stage that would require outside capital investment and a more sophisticated management arrangement. They are businesses that are largely one-person operations with a few employees. There are, however, a few larger businesses owned by women. It has been shown in Central America as elsewhere in Latin America, that the businesswomen who do survive in the formal sector are highly competitive in spite of enormous odds.

The project has the potential to reach female entrepreneurs as well as male, and could have a positive impact on small- and medium-scale businesswomen who are in need of the support services the project hopes to provide. In order to fulfill the potential, however, the project will need to deliberately address women's particular constraints and opportunities. For example, one important constraint for women is the lack of collateral for obtaining credit. The project seeks to provide 50% of the 200% guarantee required by local commercial financial institutions in business loans. There is no information in the project paper as to how the remaining 150% guarantee requirement will be met, but it is assumed the business owners will provide the amount. This is likely to be a significant constraint for women business owners who usually do not have title to properties in Guatemala, and therefore less accessible collateral. A special intervention by project in this case would usefully serve the purposes of the project in making credit accessible to women.

Such an intervention could be designed around existing organizations which work with women's groups in Guatemala. Several international groups such as Women's World Banking and OEF International work with loan guarantee funds and credit operations for women in Central America. National groups may also be able to provide collateral or guarantees for women entrepreneurs.

Other constraints faced by women entrepreneurs are related to training and recruitment. The project intends to recruit women for the training programs which are to take place at night. Evening training sessions will make it easier for women to attend, yet the recruitment and delivery of training through traditional male organizations may limit women's participation overall. In order to encourage

and increase women's participation in training, relevant experience suggests women should be actively targeted through women's groups and informal networks.

There are significant social barriers to women's full economic participation in the SME sector. The project could contribute to removing these barriers by including qualified women on the boards and directorates of the management and training institutions implementing the project. Women should also be recruited as trainers for the project.

Overall the project offers good opportunities to reach female entrepreneurs. Perhaps one of the most important long term contributions the project could make is the collection of gender disaggregated data on businesses in Guatemala. The baseline survey planned by the project could provide important information on the extent of female business ownership, the size of their businesses and their requirements for growth. The data collected by the project, in the baseline survey and/or in periodic and final evaluations, should provide the following information as a minimum:

- Size, location and kinds of businesses owned by women
- Percentage of women-owned businesses as a part of the small and medium enterprise sector
- Women's participation in management organizations and informal networks
- Access to credit, disaggregated by gender

Finally, the policy dialogue supported by this project could forward small and medium enterprise development concerns to the government and larger private sector organizations, such as: women business owner's relatively unequal access to credit and the reluctance of commercial financial institutions to lend to women; the lack of participation and involvement of women in commercial chambers which excludes them from the benefits of membership (networking and information); and how future government policy will address the unequitable access of small and medium enterprises to markets.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Revise the credit operation to include special interventions for providing collateral and credit guarantees for women.

2. Undertake an active program to target project resources to women through women's organizations and informal networks.

3. Bring qualified women onto the boards, directorates and staffs of the organizations involved in the project.

4. Gender disaggregate all data collected in the project.

5. Ensure that the policy dialogue supported by this project include representatives of women's organizations, and address women's particular roles, needs, and constraints as business owner's and operators.

Guatemala: Administration of Justice
520 - 0369
(1988 - 1991)

BACKGROUND

The project goal is to strengthen Guatemala's democratic institutions in order to promote social progress and economic well being of the population. The purpose of the project is to provide fair, effective and accessible legal services nationwide through the improvement of the (non-police) functions and institutions of the justice system. The project is administered by the Supreme Court.

COMMENTARY

The project deals exclusively with the formal legal system (Ladino system), considering only some aspects of how this system might effectively reach out to the Indian community (such as court translators).

The cultural disparity between the dominant Ladino culture and the Indian communities discussed in the Social Soundness Analysis overshadows gender issues, although there are gender issues within each community. The Project Paper does not specifically address or discuss women and the law.

The law functions as an instrument of society's control by promoting or inhibiting access to economic and social resources of the community and is supported by social attitudes and behaviors. The law in Guatemala sanctions the subordination of women, and in some cases may constitutionally guarantee it, especially in labor law, penal law and civil law which governs legal rights and obligations in marriage, inheritance, income, land rights and participation in public affairs. The character of the economic system in Guatemala has special relevance for women in the area of labor law. "Womens' occupations" afford few rights and little protection; their jobs are not usually in the organized sector and thus expose women to exploitation.

RECOMMENDATIONS

In order to establish a fair and equitable legal system for women, the project must look at some of the major issues for women within the law.

1. The project document suggests that one area for study is women and the law; it is recommended that project implementation follow through with this suggestion by undertaking a thorough review of the law as it affects women in Guatemala. The most common substantive legal issues for women are:

Constitutional issues:	Equality, Human Rights, Civil Rights, Political Rights.
Economic Issues:	Credit, Ownership and Control of Poverty, Inheritance.

Labor Issues:	Wages, Working Conditions, Maternity Benefits, Social Entitlement, Opportunities for Employment, Protective Legislation.
Family Relations:	Marriage, Divorce, Child Custody and Guardianship, Reproduction.
Health:	Health Entitlement, Birth Control, Abortion.
Violence and Exploitation:	Rape, Other Forms of Violence Against Women, Prostitution, Pornography.

2. The project should also undertake a component to teach women about their rights under current law.

Haiti: Voluntary Agencies for Child Survival
521 - 0206
(1987 - 1992)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to develop the institutional capabilities of private voluntary organizations (PVOs) in Haiti and improve their service delivery programs in child survival health care interventions.

The project will "buy-in" to ongoing programs by offering grants, on a competitive basis, to PVOs whose outreach program falls in line with new government strategy to support a new class of minimally trained health workers who would organize "rally posts" at the village level. An outside technical assistance organization will serve as intermediary for grant making.

COMMENTARY

The project benefits from being built on the lessons learned from previous AID and PVO experiences in community outreach programs. This experience has brought to light some problems of implementation and constraints in service delivery to the target population which were presented very clearly in the project paper. Factors negatively affecting child health care service delivery in the past are listed here for the benefit of other projects, and include:

Among users (user rather than system factors appeared to be more influential as barriers to service utilization):

- competing priorities, such as meeting the daily subsistence needs of the family and completing household chores, and family problems such as illnesses or marital discord;
- lack of motivation (low value attributed to health economic constraints), travel costs, demands of daily subsistence, and not having proper or clean clothes to attend the rally post;
- fear about the side effects of immunizations;
- manner in which mothers were treated at the rally posts;
- little understanding of the immunization schedule and the diseases which the vaccines can prevent.

System or program factors:

- accessibility of the rally post--poor roads, unpredictability of the scheduled rally post day, rally post held at inconvenient times which conflict with other activities such as peak market hours, and inadequate notification to the community of upcoming rally posts.

To overcome system constraints the project design has incorporated some pragmatic solutions such as: the use of animal transport rather than vehicles for the health team in areas where access is poor or unreliable; retraining of health personnel to be more sensitives; using gifts as incentives for rally post attendance; improving the rally post notification system; minimize scheduling conflicts with

other community activities; and using social networks more to encourage new mothers or non-users to attend rally posts.

Despite the fact that PVOs are working with a greater body of knowledge of the constraints on child health care delivery systems than many other AID supported projects, and that there is a clear definition of the steps that need to be taken in improving delivery such as given in the examples above as well as others in the text of the project paper, the danger is that the implementing PVOs will not take all of the factors into account. The project implementation team needs to ensure the effort put into project analysis is not lost in implementation.

Three issues that often impact on health care service delivery but not mentioned in the text are: 1) outreach programs to all family members who might be involved in child care (a child survival program in the Dominican Republic found that it was often older siblings, aunts or grandparents who were responsible for daily care of infants and small children); 2) women as health care workers and physicians and in the management of PVOs; 3) and the use of traditional birth attendants (TBAs). No mention is made of TBA education and alternative medical systems that provide services in Haiti, yet TBAs and traditional healers play an important part in Haiti's medicine.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The child survival program should reach out to all members of the family who might be involved in child care.

2. Program administration should ensure that women are recruited as health agents, supervisors, doctors and management.

3. The role of TBAs in the program should be explored, with consideration given to the role of traditional medicine in child health care.

Honduras: Forestry Development
522 - 0246
(1988 - 1994)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to improve the management and sustainable productivity of Honduras' commercial pine forests. The coordinating government agency for project implementation is the Honduran Development Corporation (COHDEFOR) which will receive technical assistance to improve forest management and to enhance its support of the private sector in commercializing lumber and wood products. The project also includes the preparation and implementation of a forest management plan involving, among other things, small scale forest enterprise activities for campesinos (such as logging with oxen, charcoal production and products from small dimensional lumber) and improved agricultural practices for slash-and-burn farmers. Finally, the project includes assistance and credit for private sector sawmillers and loggers to improve the efficiency of their operations.

COMMENTARY

The population of the project area is relatively small--about 30,000--but apparently their negative impact on the forests is substantial, and will be even more so if immigration into the area and continued agricultural and grazing practices continue unabated.

The project design has taken into account, in a general way, the needs of the farmers, coffee growers and cattlemen to participate in the benefits of forest and to improve their current practices for a more sustainable income. The target population in its majority are small scale slash-and-burn farmers who have immigrated from other areas of the country. There are only about 250 coffee growers and a smaller number of cattle operations. The baseline socio-economic surveys of the population to more precisely determine their requirements and the technical assistance to implement specific projects will be contracted out to a private voluntary organization during project implementation.

While not designed in detail, a principal project intervention is the creation of economic incentives to participate in forestry production, and the improvement of agricultural practices among the target population, especially in farming methods for the small basic grain farmer practicing slash-and-burn agriculture.

The outlined intervention is based on a social analysis included as an annex in the project documentation. This social analysis includes a description of the importance of the role of women in the existing farming community. In the analysis it is estimated that one-fourth of the farm families are headed by women and that all women contribute to income generating activities. In cases where women's income was a second family income, the family or woman was more willing to take risks in new technologies and investments, and women had actually led the way in new investment ventures that then were later copied on larger scale by men. The social analysis had also found that women were sensitive to soil conservation measures and had actively promoted a resurgence in agro-forestry cooperative activities even if they themselves were not members of the

cooperatives. It is unclear why, despite the substantial information about women's roles and the recommendation in the Social Analysis section that the project actively promote the participation of women, the project design did not address gender issues.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Given that one-fourth of the target population are women-headed households, and the importance of women's economic contribution has been recognized, it is recommended that the project implementation team take the following immediate measures to incorporate women into the project:

1. The baseline data survey on target beneficiaries should disaggragate data by gender, and collect information on income generating activities of women, especially income derived from forest products.

2. The PVOs selected to work with the beneficiaries on agricultural improvements and agro-forestry small enterprise development need to have in-house expertise on women in natural resource management and in developing the economic role of women. (As a suggestion, the FAO Community Forestry Office is aware of women who are experts in silviculture and women's participation.)

3. Technical assistance to cooperatives and farmers' associations needs to specifically address the role of women and determine how to deliver new technical information to women farmers either through these formal groups or through informal networks and associations of women.

4. COHDEFOR, as the coordinating government agency, should bring women into its management and extension staff and technical advisory groups.

5. The project needs to monitor the distribution of resources and income from project activities, doing whatever it can to ensure that women maintain control of income from their work and that men do not take over the control of activities begun by women just as they begin to produce significant income.

Honduras: Health Sector II
522 - 0216
(1988 - 1995)

BACKGROUND

This is the second phase of a program to improve national health services in Honduras. The first phase was to improve management at the central government level. This second phase will focus on sustainable implementation of the system improvements at the regional and subregional level. The emphasis is on child survival with components in primary health services delivery and water and sanitation. The activities will be carried out on a country wide basis.

COMMENTARY

In spite of important achievements in health care such as the reduction of infant mortality rates, promotion of breastfeeding, increased contraceptive usage, successful malaria program and mass media campaigns, and improved access to water and sanitation facilities, the project paper identifies many constraints to be addressed in this second stage project. These include institutional constraints (lack of strong regional structures, inadequate central office support, inability to analyze and make use of data, poor logistics); financial management constraints in the Ministry of Health (overcentralized financial and logistical control that inhibits flows of funds and materials to local offices) and in the water and sanitation agency (overdependence on external funding), and technical constraints in the child survival program (some physicians remaining resistent to the use of ORS, knowledge gaps to deal with acute respiratory infections, breakdown of the cold chain supply of vaccines, and ignorance of health care professionals of the benefits of birth spacing, childhood nutrition, and breastfeeding).

It is interesting to note that the project paper and by implication the program to be implemented make no reference to women and children and the constraints they face in seeking services nor to factors in service delivery at the local level which influence the population's use of services. All constraints identified in the project paper are dealt with as 'technical constraints' that can be resolved by the provision of physical, financial, promotional and technical resources and the institutionalization of local programming and decentralized decision making. While these interventions go halfway in removing barriers to utilization, the other very important half of an effective delivery system is the removing of the constraints faced by the users (the participant and beneficiary population).

Some of the user factors affecting utilization of health care services include age and parity, education, information available to the population, competing time demands on women to attend to other activities or family problems, income levels of women, and socio-cultural and attitudinal factors. The service factors influencing the decision to use health care services include, among others, the availability and accessibility of service, the cost in time and money to women to come to the clinics or medical outposts, and the quality of care provided. Program and management issues affecting utilization not discussed in the paper include poor work conditions and incentives for field workers.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Constraints and barriers of the target population and of the health care workers who deliver services to the population (as suggested in the last paragraph above) should be evaluated and solutions incorporated into the training, technical assistance and management improvements proposed by the project.

Jamaica: Hillside Agriculture Project
532 - 0101
(7 years) (no dates on doc I received)

BACKGROUND

The project will promote perennial cropping by small-scale hillside farmers in the Rio Cobre and Rio Minho watershed regions. The project will provide funding for projects identified and carried out by local community organizations, and will contract out for technical assistance and training as needed. The project design is decentralized: it will have very little staff on site and the Project Manager shall serve networking and coordinating functions and will not be responsible for any management or operational functions.

The project design lays responsibility for implementation on local community and farming groups. The goal of promoting perennial crops is to reduce soil erosion and increase income from traditional perennial coffee and cacao, and to introduce selected new deep rooted perennials such as mango, pimento and papaya.

The project will provide grants to non-profit groups to carry out projects within the framework of the overall project goal. Such grantees could include commodity boards, research institutions, farmers' organizations, agro-processors, cooperative societies, private voluntary organizations and GOJ agencies.

COMMENTARY

The Project Paper and the Social Soundness Analysis, while noting many of the economic, financial and institutional constraints that have contributed to low productivity of the hillside small farmer, did not include any information or speculation on what factors might induce the farm family to change its cropping patterns or introduce more productive methods of farming. Particularly noticeable was the lack of any social information on hillside farmers, including the lack of any reference to the role of women and the division of agricultural labor in the farm household.

This is an important omission, as it may affect the capacity of the project to properly identify the types of technical assistance and training needed by various groups, especially those composed mainly of women. In addition, this information will be important in analyzing the appropriateness and viability of project proposals.

In traditional farming societies in similar countries of the Caribbean and Central America, farm labor and income are divided by gender within the farm household--with men using the income from cash crops for long-term investments and farming expenses and women using what income they can earn from annual crops and marketing toward household and family expenses (medical, education, clothing etc.). Development projects elsewhere have found that cash crop projects have been resisted by women when they are expected to help with the labor but do not have access to the benefits. A closer look at this division of labor and income might have revealed similar patterns among hillside farmers in Jamaica that would lead to redesign of project interventions.

Subproject funding proposals are expected to percolate up from existing organizations working with farmers to the project coordinating committee through the project coordinator's outreach efforts. In order to reach women farmers, the project coordinator needs to ensure that network and coordinating efforts are extended to women's groups and informal associations. Past experience has shown that women do not participate in formal agricultural groups that are traditionally male, and often oppose interventions in their farm work proposed by those groups. Women farmers can be reached, however, through women's organizations, informal network channels and social groups. Technical assistance and training activities provided by the project should also be directed through these groups when appropriate to the subproject activities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. During implementation, the project coordinator should network with women's organizations, informal networks and social groups in order to reach the women farmers who constitute 25% of farm heads of households of the target farmers, and encourage and assist subproject funding proposals from these groups.

2. The project should ensure subprojects to be implemented by women's groups or for women will receive any additional technical assistance and training they may need. These groups have historically received less "technical" attention than traditional farmers' organizations, and so may be starting from a different information base.

3. Gender disaggregated data on the socio-economic characteristics of the hillside farming society--especially the intra-household allocation of labor, resources, and income--should be collected in order to contribute to present and future understanding of the social dynamics and economic consequences of planned interventions. This information will also be valuable for project monitoring and evaluation.

Peru: Child Survival Action
527 - 0285
(1988 - 1993)

BACKGROUND

The purpose of the project is to assist the Ministry of Health and the Peruvian Institute of Social Security make institutional improvements in order to implement a major child survival program. The project is designed to strengthen public sector capacity to deliver improved and expanded health services and decentralize support systems for sustainable child health care services delivery.

COMMENTARY

As is appropriate to an institution strengthening project, much of the project paper's focus is on the current and planned institutional capacity of the Peruvian implementing agencies and the constraints the health care system has faced in the past, especially low acceptance rates for child health services and family planning services.

A major discrepancy in the paper is the lack of linkage between the institutional strengthening goals, which are directed toward increasing acceptance rates such as decentralization of services and improvement of the quality of health workers, and consideration of the final beneficiary population. For example, women are not mentioned in the text. Children are the beneficiaries of the project, but it is women as mothers who need to be targeted in order for the health services to reach children.

In order to overcome low acceptance rates the project plans to decentralize the delivery of health care services, although only two references on decentralization appear in the text (pp 5 and 74) in addition to the commentary in the Social Soundness Analysis annex (pp 132-133). Unfortunately, the references in text do not analyze how decentralization will make the services more accessible to the target population, linking the institutional action of the program with the final beneficiaries.

Accessibility for women is a major issue in seeking health care for themselves and their children, especially for well-baby care such as inoculations. Services must be at convenient times for mothers to bring their children. Experience has shown that travel time to clinics and hours of operation of clinics are directly proportional to acceptance rates. Women tend to have little free time to travel to take sick children to clinics, let alone for well-baby care, and often do not have the money to take public transportation. Some solutions to the problem of accessibility which have worked in the past are the establishment of evening hours for clinics and bringing inoculation programs directly to villages, inoculating all children of all ages on a previously announced day.

"Attitudes" or socio-cultural disparity between government health workers and the population was cited in the project paper as a major constraint to increasing low acceptance rates. This constraint can be eased by providing health care workers with tools that increase their coverage of the community such as motorcycles and maps of villages, training in approaching unfamiliar communities, and incentives for increased performance. The project implementation team needs to ask: how many of the health care workers and promoters are women; how freely do they travel; if the workers are men, are they effective in reaching and teaching women?

From the project paper it appears relatively few traditional birth attendants (TBA) are included in the training programs. In Peru, as elsewhere in Latin America, TBAs are often the only source of outside childbirth assistance and neonatal care information women receive. It has been shown that TBAs, armed with modern medical information and accepted by the medical community, are effective in increasing awareness of well-baby care, family nutrition and family planning options.

Another factor not included in the project paper but that could increase coverage in the family planning program is the delivery of family planning information to young girls. Sociologists understand that most perceptions and health care practices are formed in pre-pubescent or early pubescent ages; therefore an effective delivery system will include reaching out to this part of the population. Moreover, education for young girls now will relieve the load on the health care delivery system in the future.

In other actions proposed by the project two stand out as actions that would benefit from increased attention to women and women's roles. These are the baseline data survey planned for 1988 and program evaluation and monitoring. The data collection hopefully included factors significantly affecting mothers' utilization of child health care services such as women's income, employment and women's access to services. These factors are important because they determine women's willingness to use the services and ability to pay for services. Program evaluation and monitoring, in addition to the factors considered in the text, could also evaluate such factors as educational programs to reach women, regional and local accessibility to services, family and mothers' income levels and ability to purchase services, women' understanding of the services provided, and their understanding of the nutrition needs of small children.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The project implementation team needs to be aware of the fact there is a gap in the project design between institutional improvements for health care workers and understanding of the target population. With no direction given as to how health care workers are to overcome constraints in the field and how best to reach women, the team may uncover some major stumbling blocks that limit achievement of project goals. Some specific recommendations are included above in the following areas:

1. Profile women as the target population, determining what constraints they have in seeking services (e.g. time, location, education and income).

2. Accessibility is a major issue and requires additional project planning to determine the location and timing of health care services.

3. Provide tools of the trade and training in cultural interaction and interaction between sexes (for male workers) for field health care workers.

4. Consider including TBAs and outreach to young girls as part of the program's activities.