

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

32 60974

PD-ABC-325

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS
 2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: Mission or AID/W Office <u>USAID/HONDURAS</u> (ES# <u>FY 91-1</u>)	B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan? Yes <input type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/> Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY <u>90</u> Q <u>2</u>	C. Evaluation Timing Interim <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Final <input type="checkbox"/> Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/>
D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)		

Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligate to Date (000)
522-0273.01	Component VII, Educational Media Program, Primary Education Efficiency Project (implemented through a Cooperative Agreement with the Association for Socio Economic Promotion and Development, AVANCE).	2 Qtr. FY 87	12/90	\$5,400 DA \$5,000 IC	4,700 DA \$3,060 LC
U.S. \$ equivalent in lempiras: 1\$U.S.=2L.					

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
Action(s) Required		
1. Conduct educational impact evaluations of the three educational media program activities.	LEDDY	5/90 (completed)
2. Review the results of the impact evaluations in conjunction with the midterm evaluation to determine future A.I.D. financial support to AVANCE.	LEDDY	8/90 (completed)

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation: (Month) 1 (Day) 25 (Year) 91

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:

Name (Typed)	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
	<i>[Signature]</i> Ellen Leddy	N/A	Donald Soules Carmen Zambrana	<i>[Signature]</i> John A. Sanbrailo
Signature				
Date	1-16-91		1/16/91	

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

The Educational Media program is implemented by AVANCE, a Honduran Private Voluntary Organization (PVO) through a Cooperative Agreement. The purpose of the Agreement is to have a private sector institution assist in improving Honduran primary education while attaining financial self-sufficiency. The media program consists of interactive radio instruction (IRI), educational radio programming, a weekly educational newspaper and other print media geared first towards the rural neoliterate and later toward primary school students as well. The midterm evaluation was based on document review and interviews. The purpose was to evaluate performance to date and recommend midcourse changes. The major findings and conclusions are:

- * Project design was overly ambitious and incorrectly assumed that AVANCE could expand its management capacity rapidly to carry out the many objectives assigned. Less than half of the objectives have been achieved.
- * IRI (mathematics) for grades one and two has been produced. It is a high quality product, but is hampered by weak marketing and distribution.
- * The educational radio programming (Sani Radio) has been kept operating, but lacks the resources to fulfill its educational mandate.
- * The weekly newspaper ("El Agricultor") has been strengthened, but lacks a defined audience and thus a coherent message. There are no other print media products.
- * Financial self-sufficiency will not be reached by PACD unless major changes are made in operations; e.g., strengthening all aspects of AVANCE's management, moving IRI personnel to performance specific contracts, transferring Sani Radio to alternate sponsors, and redefining the target audience and content of the newspaper.

Lessons learned included:

Requiring financial self-sufficiency for institutions which provide "public goods" like educational inputs results in conflicting internal goals and is difficult to achieve.

The difficulty in reaching truly rural population groups in Honduras was underestimated.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. \$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
Institute for International Research				
Wesley Boles	IIR	Contract No. PDC-1109-I-00- 7120-00. Delivery Order No. 17.	\$49,501	DA (Project funds)
William Kostrewski	IIR			
Bonnie Brownlee	IIR			
Rose Hughes	IIR			
2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>17</u>		3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>32</u>		

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- | | |
|--|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Purpose of evaluation and methodology used • Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated • Findings and conclusions (relate to questions) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Principal recommendations • Lessons learned |
|--|--|

Mission or Office: USAID/HONDURAS	Date This Summary Prepared: October 9, 1990	Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report: AVANCE Asociación de Promoción y Desarrollo Socio Económico. November 22, 1989
--------------------------------------	--	---

Background

The Educational Media program (Component VII of the Primary Education Efficiency Project) is implemented by AVANCE, a Honduran PVO. The program is implemented through a Cooperative Agreement. The purpose of the Cooperative Agreement is to have a private sector institution assist in improving the quality and efficiency of Honduran primary education while achieving financial self-sufficiency. The media program consists of interactive radio instruction (IRI) ("La Familia de Los Números"), educational radio programming (Sani Radio), a weekly educational newspaper ("El Agricultor"), and other print media geared towards the rural neoliterate. The target clientele for "El Agricultor" is referred to as the "rural neoliterate", although it should be understood that in its later stages of operation, the newspaper added primary school students to its target clientele.

Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used

The midterm evaluation is one of two evaluations called for under the Agreement. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the level of outputs reached, implementation constraints, administrative constraints and progress towards attaining financial self-sufficiency and to recommend midterm program corrections if warranted. The evaluation team reviewed all available project documentation and interviewed a large number of AVANCE and AID Mission staff and other Hondurans implementors.

Activities Evaluated

AVANCE was expected to assist in improving the quality and efficiency of Honduran primary education (in conjunction with an ongoing AID/Ministry of Education (MOE) education project) while achieving financial self-sufficiency.

Over the Life of Project (LOP), AVANCE was to produce and disseminate IRI in math and Spanish to 10,000 primary school classrooms (grades one through three) and to operate a radio station providing educational programming to the residents of the Department of Gracias a Dios (La Mosquitia).

In print media, it was to strengthen and expand distribution of "El Agricultor" as an educational weekly to reach teachers and students in 5,000 classrooms. AVANCE was also to develop the capacity to create, publish and distribute a variety of educationally useful publications the sale of which would contribute to the organization's self-sufficiency.

AVANCE was to create a social marketing division which would help develop and sell AVANCE products and, for a fee, offer the same services to other agencies. In addition, AVANCE was to have in place the required facilities, trained staff and administrative systems.

Findings and Conclusions

AVANCE created the Sistema de Educación Interactiva (SEI) which has produced an IRI mathematics program called "La Familia de Los Números". Programs for grades one and two have been produced and distributed to approximately 2,500 classrooms. No progress has been made on the planned Spanish language programming.

SEI appears to produce a quality educational radio program which does contribute significantly to children's learning of math concepts. However, the division's productivity has been low and at its current pace, it will not meet its quantitative goals. SEI has not adequately resolved the problem of distribution.

Sani Radio is located in Puerto Lempira, Gracias a Dios. AVANCE assumed responsibility for the station in July, 1987. Sani Radio's mandate was to provide bilingual educational programming for the miskito speaking residents of the area, but a budget cut in 1988 nearly eliminated educational programming at the station.

Currently Sani Radio offers a limited but popular social service to the area. A recent one year grant from the Interamerican Development Foundation will fund additional educational programming. Adequate supervision of Sani Radio is difficult owing to its remoteness from AVANCE's central offices.

"El Agricultor" was originally created under the Print Media for Farm Families Project and was located in the capital. In an attempt to make the paper more profitable it was moved to San Pedro Sula, the country's commercial and business center in February, 1989. Paid circulation now ranges above 15,000 copies weekly, an estimated 60% of which goes to teachers and students.

The newspaper needs to define its target audience. Currently it is directed at students in urban and semiurban areas in an effort to reduce distribution costs and to attract advertising revenues. Content is not focused on any one audience. Content could also be improved in terms of quality.

No capacity to develop new publications has developed. The only commercial printing capacity established to date by AVANCE is a quick print facility, located at the central offices in Tegucigalpa, organized in April 1989. It has acquired several clients and should generate a modest operating profit by 1990.

A social marketing division was established which assisted in the marketing of AVANCE products. This division was disbanded in late 1988 with marketing responsibilities assigned to AVANCE's individual divisions. No capacity for the sale of marketing services remains.

AVANCE has four facilities in place and a reasonably trained staff. Its sales of products and services now cover about 35% of its operating expenses. It has had serious management problems and, as an organization, lacks unity and a sense of direction.

The effectiveness of AVANCE's management has been limited in two ways; first by AID's assumption that it could expand from a minor weekly newspaper operation to a complex multiactivity organization with little or no managerially oriented technical assistance; and second, by personal limitations within and between the Board of Directors and AVANCE professional management.

Mission insistence on adequate management systems for AVANCE could have come earlier in the program. The technical assistance provided under the program has been directed primarily to AVANCE's products and not to management or institutional development. Adequate financial, personnel and administrative support systems have only been put in place in mid-1989. A comfortable and effective relationship between AVANCE's Board of Directors and its top management has not yet developed.

The Cooperative Agreement authorizes grant funding of \$5.4 million and L*10 million. As of September, 1989, \$3.8 million and L5.0 million had been earmarked or disbursed. AVANCE expects a 1989 operating deficit of about L1.7 million of total expenditures exceeding L2.5 million. If realized, projected increases in revenues will reduce the deficit to less than L1.0 million by 1992.

*One Dollar = Two Lempiras through March 1990. Thereafter, rate changes according to Central Bank of Honduras resolutions.

Financial self-sufficiency is only realistic if AVANCE divests itself of Sani Radio, terminates production of IRI by PACD limiting itself to distribution of completed products and cuts costs and improves efficiency within the organization.

Recommendations

- * AVANCE management should be strengthened and its Board should be made an integral part of the strengthening process. The process should include reestablishing a central marketing capability.
- * Alternative sponsorship for Sani Radio should be sought.
- * Funding of IRI should be changed to a product specific contract base. This would clarify the two functions: program production which is a one-time cost and program sales and distribution which is a continuing cost.
- * "El Agricultor" should define its audience, change its name and improve the quality of the paper in an effort to approach financial self-sufficiency.

Implementation of Recommendations

The subject midterm evaluation and continuing administrative problems of AVANCE indicated that the organization was not likely to reach its self-sufficiency goal. However, AID was unwilling to terminate grant funding if the Educational Media program was having a clear development impact. To that end, educational impact evaluations were conducted for "El Agricultor", Sani Radio and interactive radio in the Spring of 1990.

The results of the educational impact evaluation were analyzed in conjunction with the midterm evaluation, FARS Financial Reviews and AID's knowledge of AVANCE's current financial and administrative status. Each division, as well as the organization as a whole, was examined from two points of view: contribution to improvements in the quality and efficiency of Honduran primary education and financial self-sufficiency.

The Mission determined that only interactive radio mathematics contributed significantly to improvements in the quality and efficiency of Honduran primary education and that AVANCE cannot become financially self-sufficient before the PACD. In addition, the Mission concluded that, given a continuation of its management problems, AVANCE could not be expected to ever achieve financial self-sufficiency.

AID and AVANCE have agreed to terminate the Cooperative Agreement for convenience. Both parties agree that the level of educational benefits that can be expected to result from AVANCE activities will not be commensurate with the further expenditures required under the project.

Funding to AVANCE for the Educational Media program will terminate for most of the project effective December 31, 1990. Some Mission contracting actions will not be completed until January or early February. In addition, the Mission will work with AVANCE and the Ministry of Education to see whether the Ministry would be interested in funding additional AVANCE services in the area of radio math.

Lessons Learned

- * Project design should be tailored closely to the capacity of the implementing institution.
- * The tradition of local voluntary service to agencies like AVANCE is not well established.
- * Requiring financial-self sufficiency is very difficult for agencies delivering a "social good".
- * The difficulties in distributing AVANCE's products in truly rural Honduras was underestimated.

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

Attachment I: Outline of Basic Project Identification Data

Attachment II: Final evaluation report titled AVANCE Asociación de Promoción y Desarrollo Socioeconómico. This report was forwarded to AID/W on June 11, 1990.

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

AVANCE is required to fulfill two very different yet equally important goals: assisting in improving the quality and efficiency of Honduran primary education and achieving financial self-sufficiency. At the mid point of the project, it became apparent that AVANCE was behind schedule on the first goal and not making acceptable progress towards the latter. Because the two goals are inextricably intertwined, the subject evaluation was designed to concentrate almost exclusively on AVANCE's management and financial status.

The evaluation report fully met the demands of the scope of work. The report covers management, finance, marketing, technical assistance and AID backstopping. The report also provides information on AVANCE's progress towards fulfilling its quantifiable goals and objectives.

The findings and conclusions presented in the report concur with the conclusions reached by USAID/Honduras staff. We are in agreement with the lessons learned as well. As a result of the report, USAID/Honduras decided to conduct educational impact evaluations of the three existing educational media activities. The results of these evaluations were reviewed in conjunction with the results of the midterm evaluation in order to determine the scope of future relations between AID and AVANCE (see Implementation of Recommendations, page 5 of this Evaluation Summary).

The evaluators approached their task in an efficient and professional way. They accepted direction well and were responsive to input from AID staff. They remained unbiased in the face of strong pressure from AVANCE to present a positive report and did not hesitate to point out areas in which both AID and AVANCE could improve program management. The resulting report was clear, concise and easy to read.

OUTLINE OF BASIC PROJECT IDENTIFICATION DATE

1. Country: Honduras
2. Project Title: Component VII, Educational Media Program, Primary Education Efficiency Project
3. Project Number: 522-0273.01
4. Project Dates:
 - a. First Project Agreement: 08/07/86
 - b. Final Obligation Date: FY 04/25/90 (both planned and actual)
 - c. Most recent Project Assistance Completion Date: 12/31/90
5. Project Funding: (amounts obligated to date in dollars)
 - a. A.I.D. Bilateral Funding (grant and/or loan) US\$4,700,000
 - b. Other Major Donors US\$ - 0 -
 - c. Host Country Counterpart Funds US\$3,060,000
 - TOTAL US\$7,760,000
6. Mode of Implementation: Host Country Contractor, AVANCE
7. Project Designers:

Edward Landau, DF
Richard Martin, HRD
Marco Tulio Mejía, HRD/E
Mary Ott, USAID/GUATEMALA
Henry Reynolds, HRD/E
Randall Peterson, EPA
8. Responsible Mission Officials:
 - a. Mission Director (s): Anthony Cauterucci: 07/21/82 - 08/11/86
John Sanbrailo: 11/22/86 - 06/91
 - b. Project Officer (s): Richard Martin: (1987)
Nadine Dutcher: (1988)
Ellen Leddy: (1988-1990)
9. Previous Evaluation (s): None