PD-ABB-553
67 809

ENTERED 1/28/75

file

No PRW

AID 1020-25 (10-70)

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1,1974 TO Jan 10,1975	Bolivia	FY 1975- 5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLD)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY 64 Ends FY 77	7. DATE LATEST PROP Jan. 1973	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR May 31, 1974
10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $ 125,000	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $ 500,000

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
AIFLD	AID/LA-C-73-10

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE

I. Summary Statement

During the contract year which began April 1, 1974, AIFLD continued an intensive training program which enjoyed a warm welcome from Bolivian labor. Most worker organizations of national significance participated in the program, and the demand for AIFLD services, both education and social projects, was far in excess of the level which AIFLD's budget could provide.

Although the GOB's view of labor unions would tend to favor a certain degree of union dependence on government as opposed to AIFLD's view of union autonomy, the GOB has apparently considered AIFLD's activities as productive on the whole. The Ministry of Labor demonstrated its favorable disposition to the program during the year by approving lost-time payments for trade unionists participating in AIFLD courses.

Nevertheless, during the year the underlying tension between the unions and the GOB became pronounced and this development affected progress toward the achievement of project purpose -- the development of effective, autonomous and democratic worker organizations. In November, 1974, the GOB suspended trade union activities and appointed "labor coordinators" to take the place of leaders at all levels of union organization. The GOB made clear that this action was

D. REPLANNING REQUIRED REVISED OR NEW ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW 1/21/75

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE	MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE
John LaMazza 1/16/75	John R. Oleson 1/21/75

AID 1020-26 (10-70) REPORT U-043

PAGE 1 A

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1, 1974 to Jan 10, 1975	Bolivia	FY 1975-5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLD)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Begun FY _____ Ends FY _____	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
			temporary, was not aimed at unions as such, but was designed to prevent political parties from using the labor movement to oppose political reforms which had been announced by the GOB.	
			The reaction of labor was varied, but, considering the historically political orientation of Bolivian labor, showed a new conception of the role of unions on the part of leaders and rank and file to which AIFLD training may well have contributed. Labor largely ignored the political aspects of the GOB reforms and concentrated on rallying in defense of worker organizations. Most former labor leaders were appointed as "labor coordinators" and those who accepted such appointment have discharged their duties more as worker representatives than as government agents. Some labor leaders refused appointment as "labor coordinators" in order to demonstrate publicly their attachment to the concept of union autonomy. Workers have remained grouped in their unions applying pressure for the prompt resumption of normal trade union activity.	
			The year showed that the achievement of project purpose will not be easy, but that, at the same time, the elements for more significant progress are present as evidenced by a growing conception of unions as engines of defense of the socio-economic rights of the workers rather than the arms of political parties, a solid attachment of the rank-and-file to their organizations and increasing statesmanship on the part of union leaders.	

D. REPLANNING REQUIRED REVISED OR NEW: ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

2

AID 1020-25 (10-70) REPORT U-043

PAGE 1 B

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1, 1974 TO Jan 10, 1975	Bolivia	FY 1975-5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLD)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Begun FY _____ Ends FY _____	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	NOSY	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE

II. Status of Recommendations (From PAR FY 1974-9)

There were three recommendations in the previous PAR:

1. Recommendation - In view of AIFLD/B and USAID/B interest in cooperative development as a means to spread the benefits of their respective programs to more low income population groups in rural areas, AIFLD/B and USAID/B respective activities and plans should be closely coordinated. This should be done through regular exchange of information on this aspect during the monthly AIFLD project review meeting and through operational consultations on specific activities.

Action - In addition to exchanging information at the monthly AIFLD meeting, AIFLD has begun receiving reports and materials from the Community Development Division. AIFLD will also place the Community Development Division on its distribution of reports. In addition, the AIFLD Country Program Director will seek to meet periodically with relevant NCDS personnel to discuss their respective programs and seek ways to collaborate in the implementation of pertinent activities.

2. Recommendation - The AIFLD Country Program Director (CPD), together with the U.S. Embassy Labor Attaché and the USAID Deputy Program Officer, should study and propose concrete and viable benchmarks to measure in a more meaningful way progress towards the

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES REVISED OR NEW: ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

3

AID 1020-28 (10-70) REPORT U-440

PAGE 1 C

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1, 1974 to Jan 10, 1975	Bolivia	FY 1975-5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLL)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY _____ Ends FY _____	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
			achievement of the project purpose regarding the development of effective, autonomous and democratic worker organizations in Bolivia.	
			Action - Benchmarks now listed in the Project Design Summary (Logical Framework) include: 1. Labor organizations function on a democratic basis - as verified by the number of elections held. 2. Major labor organizations capable of providing meaningful labor education programs on their own - as verified by reports from unions. 3. Major labor organizations self-financed through dues collection - as verified by reports from unions. 4. There exists a productive association between local worker organizations and democratically oriented international labor organizations as verified by the number of affiliations and by observation. In addition to these benchmarks, the form "AIFLD - Labor Section Program" which was submitted as Appendix IV to TOAID A-8 contains 15 qualitative indicators measuring the development of the Bolivian labor movement. These indicators will be incorporated in the Logical Framework.	
			3. Recommendation - The Country Program Director should follow up on previous efforts to create an autonomous trade union education institute as a means to institutionalize AIFLD training activities. As an alternative, the CPD should develop a plan of action for CT consideration specifying the steps that will be	

D. REPLANNING REQUIRED

REVISED OR NEW: ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

AID 1020-25 (10-70)

REPORT U-566

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1, 1974 TO Jan 10, 1975	Bolivia	FY 1975-5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLD)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY _____ Ends FY _____	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
			taken to establish present AIFLD activities, primarily training, on a firm institutional basis.	
			Action - The question of an autonomous trade union education institute is tied up with the issue of the Central Obrera Boliviana and the relations between the GOB and the union movement. At the moment these issues have a political cast and it would not be prudent for AIFLD to play a role in the controversy. However, there seems to be interest in the labor movement for such an education institute and as soon as the issue loses its political trappings, AIFLD/B will study the possibility of fostering such a labor institute.	
			III. Recommendations for Action	
X			1. In view of the unsettled state of government - labor relations, the AIFLD Country Program Director, the Embassy Labor Attaché and the USAID Deputy Program Officer will re-examine program strategy within three months and periodically thereafter to fit it to new developments.	Every three months starting April 30, 1975
X			2. The Country Program Director, the Labor Attaché and the Deputy Program Officer will continue to refine benchmarks on progress toward the attainment of program purpose.	January of each year
			3. The Country Program Director should continue his follow-up efforts regarding the institutionalization	Continuing

D. REPLANNING REQUIRED

REVISED OR NEW: ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

5

AID 1020-25 (10-70) REPORT U-440

PAGE 1 E

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
511-11-410-043	April 1, 1974 to Jan 10, 1975	Bolivia	FY 1975-5

5. PROJECT TITLE

LABOR TRAINING (AIFLD)

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY _____ Ends FY _____	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
			of AIFLD training activities through the creation of a Labor Training Institute. The AIFLD CPD should prepare a progress report on this recommendations by June 1975.	
			4. In view of the congressional mandate which urges the Agency to seek ways to improve the status of women and to promote their participation in the development process, the CPD should develop a paper outlining possible programming ideas and ways to respond to the above congressional mandate during the course of implementing the AIFLD program.	June, 1975

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES REVISED OR NEW: ☐ PROP ☐ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

6

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 2 PAR	PROJECT NO. 511-11-410-043	PAR FOR PERIOD: April 1, 1974 TO January 10, 1975	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1975-5

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT — CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN: UNSATISFACTORY 1	2	SATISFACTORY 3	4	5	OUTSTANDING 6	7	C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X): LOW 1	MEDIUM 2	3	4	HIGH 5
1. AIFLD					X							X
2.												
3.												

Comment on key factors determining rating

With the exception of one factor considered not applicable, the remaining performance factors were rated satisfactory including understanding of project purpose, planning to achieve purpose, staff of proper size, timely arrival of personnel, technical qualifications of personnel, adherence to work schedule, contractor's home office support, relations with cooperating country nationals, local staff training and utilization, effective administration of participants, timely submission of required reports, candor and usefulness of required reports, responsiveness to AID direction and adherence to scope of work.

4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
					X							X

Comment on key factors determining rating

10 Bolivians were trained in the US and 12 in Third Countries. US and Third Country training caps the AIFLD labor education cycle and is reserved for leaders who show the greatest promise.

5. COMMODITIES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5

Comment on key factors determining rating

No US financed commodities are provided under this project.

6. COOPERATING COUNTRY		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
	a. PERSONNEL												
	b. OTHER				X								X

Comment on key factors determining rating

AIFLD deals directly with labor unions and GOB participation in the AIFLD program is minimal. For example, the only meaningful GOB involvement through the Ministry of Labor, was to issue directions to employers to pay lost time to trade unionists attending AIFLD courses.

The performance of unions has been satisfactory. 75% of the instructors at AIFLD courses are from the Bolivian labor movement. Unions pay lost time to participants when employers do not. Unions have also contributed classroom space, some educational materials and pay for medical exams, passport, etc., for participants in US or Third Country courses. Local union ability to contribute remains limited.

7. OTHER DONORS See p.3, III.A.4 footnote	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors)

AID 1020-2B(10-70) PAGE 3 PAR	PROJECT NO. 511-11-410-043	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/1/74 to 1/10/75	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1975-5

II. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY a/ TO DATE	CURRENT FY a/ TO END	FY 76 a/	FY 77 a/	END OF PROJECT
1. Trained union staff in place (a) Trained leaders d/	PLANNED	b	690	690	690	690	continuing
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1431 c	1238				
	REPLANNED			1238	690	690	continuing
2. Trained union staff in place (b) Trained staff specialists d/	PLANNED	b	241	241	241	241	continuing
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1609 c	1408				
	REPLANNED			1408	241	241	continuing
3. Local leaders exposed to International Labor Movement d/	PLANNED	b	96	96	96	96	continuing
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	243 c	190				
	REPLANNED			190	96	96	continuing
4. Local labor organizations assisted in developing social projects for the benefit of their members and communities. e/	PLANNED		5	5	5	5	continuing
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	7 c	7				
	REPLANNED			7	5	5	continuing

B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS

1. COMMENT:

a. Contract year April - March.
b. 20351 Trained, but no breakdown available.
c. May 1972 - March 1974.

2. COMMENT:

d. Performance exceeded planning partly because last time payments were covered by employers or unions freeing AIFLD funds for additional training.
e. Of these social projects, 4 were funded by the AFL-CIO.

3. COMMENT:

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR ,	PROJECT NO. 511-11-410-043	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/1/74 to 1/10/75	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1975-5

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged.

2. Same as in PROP? ☒ YES ☐ NO

To develop effective, autonomous and democratic worker organizations in Bolivia.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
1. Labor organizations function on a democratic basis.	An observer could intuit considerable concern in the labor movement for regular elections to keep the endorsement of leaders by the rank and file current. However, this could not be demonstrated during the year. A state of seige was declared in January and prolonged through mid-year thus preventing any union elections. In July and August many unions scheduled elections, and, although a number of elections took place, the November suspension of trade union activities forced the cancellation of many contests. This suspension of union operations is expected to be temporary and it is likely that opportunities for the democratic functioning of unions will appear next year.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

Greater participation of Bolivian workers in the country's economic and social development process.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

Yes.

Effective, autonomous and democratic worker organizations are the workers' only hope to defend current standards of living and possibly raise them if the nation's economic progress allows. (Refer to Annual Labor Report - Bolivia 1974 (classified) for examples and detail).

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR A	PROJECT NO. 511-11-410-043	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/1/74 to 1/10/75	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1975-5

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged. 2. Same as in PROP? ☐ YES ☐ NO

B. 1. Conditions which will arise when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
2. Major labor organizations capable of providing meaningful labor education programs on their own.	Influential labor leaders again showed interest in the establishment of a single trade union education institute. This aspiration has its logic since no one sector could afford to operate a worthwhile training institute of its own. However, once again movement on the project was stymied by GOB suspicion that a joint institute might serve as a substitute labor central and by tentative GOB planning for a government controlled labor education institute.
3. Major labor organizations self-financed through dues collection.	Self-financing by Bolivian unions has always left much to be desired, and progress in this field has been slow. In addition, trade unions were forbidden to collect dues by GOB decree in November 1974. This development is believed to be temporary but union finances will be subject to new and as yet unknown rules to be promulgated next year in a new labor code. The GOB decrees freezing union financial opera-

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

10

AID 1020-28 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR B	PROJECT NO. 511-11-410-043	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/1/74 to 1/10/75	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1975-5

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged.

2. Same as in PROP? ☐ YES ☐ NO

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
	tions have demonstrated eloquently to many in the labor movement the importance of union finances and reserves and progress in this field may well have been made more likely by the November resolutions.
4. There exists a productive association between local worker organizations and democratically oriented international labor organizations.	4. Almost half of existing Bolivian federations and confederations are affiliated to International Trade Secretariats (although among the unaffiliated are some of the nation's largest organizations). During the contract year, interest among textile unions in affiliation to the FITTTV was high but affiliations are likely to be postponed pending resolution of the question as to whether textile unions will remain part of the Bolivian Factory Workers Federation or form a Federation of Textile Workers.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.