



PD-ABB-073
66555

7/23/79

CLASSIFICATION
EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE PL 480 TITLE II FOOD FOR PEACE		2. PROJECT NUMBER 511-0523	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE
4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) <u>28-9</u>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING		7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY	B. Final Obligation Expected FY	C. Final Input Delivery FY	A. Total \$	B. U.S. \$	From (month/yr.) <u>October, 1976</u>	To (month/yr.) <u>March, 1979</u>
					Date of Evaluation Review	

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Establish actual funding needs.	GTN, CRS, CARE	July 30, 1979
2. Obtain from the Ministry of Planning's GTN, an Outreach Support Grant project as prescribed by AID/W.	FFP	June 30, 1979
3. Update reporting requirements.	CRS, CARE	June 30, 1979
4. Conduct program supervision and administrative review.	FFP, CRS, CARE	Sept. 30, 1979
5. Involve Ministry of Planning's GTN in program planning.	FFP	July 30, 1979
6. Establish feasible program indicators.	GTN, CRS, CARE	Sept. 30, 1979
7. Involve Ministry of Planning's GTN in program evaluation plans.	FFP	July 30, 1979
8. Obtain publication of basic Nutrition textbooks to replace Nutrition Education for Maternal/Child Health Care until plans for activity are established.	FFP, GTN	July 30, 1979
9. Provide the FFP with two additional positions: One Officer Assistant/Inspector and one field Inspector.	USAID	June 30, 1979

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS			10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT	
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify)	A. <input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change	
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T		B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or	
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan	
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P		C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project	

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Name and Title)		12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval	
<i>Jean A. Wight</i> Mrs. Jean A. Wight Nutrition Officer		Signature: <i>[Signature]</i>	
		Typed Name: Daniel A. Chaij Acting Director	
		Date: April 12, 1979	

PL 480 TITLE II

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES)

13. Project Summary

The goal of the PL 480 Title II program is to combat malnutrition in the more vulnerable groups of the Bolivian population.

Priorities have been established in the recipient selection, to comply with the program purpose as follows:

1. Maternal Child Health Care

- a) Children 0-5 years old
- b) Expecting mothers
- c) Mothers in period of lactation
- d) Women in fertile age
- e) Other children: Children in kindergartens, day care centers, orphanages and summer camps.

2. Food for Work

- a) Voluntary workers and dependents
- b) Training

3. School Feeding

Primary school children

4. Humanitarian Food Assistance

- a) Adult Institutions
- b) Health Cases

5. Emergencies

The program is carried out through US registered Voluntary Agencies and their local counterparts:

Catholic Relief Services (CRS) - Caritas Boliviana

Cooperative for American Relief Everywhere (CARE) - National Social Action Council (NSAC); and one Government agency: the National Community Development Services (NCDS).

The CRS/Caritas Maternal Child Health Care program is channeled through over 1,000 mothers Clubs organized in 8 out of the 9 departments of Bolivia and demand is still increasing. Due to funding constraints nutrition education activities and program supervision decreased proportionately to the program coverage increase. The CARE/NSAC program reached only 30% of the planned goal, thus the FY 80 program proposes only the number of recipients actually reached (10,000). However a new approach will allow for raising the coverage if the Maternal/Child Division of the Ministry of Public Health is successful in reaching up to 30,000 recipients through the Sanitary Units of the MPH.

The Food for Work recipient category under the CRS/Caritas, CARE/NSAC and the National Community Development Service (NCDS) sponsorship has reached the desirable levels, although the CARE activity had to identify new implementation channels for a significantly increasing FY 80 program.

The Adult Institution and Health Cases programs are being implemented within the proposed levels under the CRS/Caritas sponsorship while the Adult Institution category is being deleted from the CARE program due to inadequate performance.

The emergency food assistance for disasters, although not included in the approved program, has being implemented successfully.

Reporting requirements and adequacy of funding were the major problems. Reporting is being corrected through Mission and Volags continued actions, while possibilities of an Outreach Grant support offers funding alternatives.

14. Evaluation Methodology

Evaluation of the program is made periodically to serve as a basis for yearly program plans.

During 78/79 three evaluations were conducted by Nathan Associates, AID/W Food for Peace consultant Ms. Joyce King, Dr. Roberto Rueda Williamson of the New TransCentury Foundation, and the Ministry of Planning's Technical Nutrition Group (NTG) with the purpose of recommending actions for program improvement. Periodic AID Mission internal evaluations are conducted on a yearly basis by the Commodity and Recipient Status reports established by the AID regulations.

An evaluation of the program impact on the nutritional status of the recipients was proposed repeatedly by all parties involved but never conducted due to its high cost.

Program Logical Frameworks were used in the past for the Title II program as a basis for periodic evaluations (PAR) but as this format was discontinued, the yearly Program Plans prevailed as the only measurable proposed program scopes.

Evaluation by the Mission to verify program conditions in the field during the past twelve months has been minimal due to staff limitations and the increase in paper work due to increased program volume and emergency food assistance activities.

Recent liaison with the Ministry of Planning would provide additional possibilities in developing an acceptable methodology to assure adequate evaluation in the future.

15. External Factors

The major change in program setting was the reorientation of the program criteria, moving its scope from the urban to the rural areas which increased program costs. This increasing costs has not coincided with a similar increment in the operational budget provided by the GOB. The net result was a decrease in program supervision and a lack of desirable collateral activities such as in nutrition education which had been planned to complement the food distribution to obtain significant changes in the basic quality of life which is considered an important element to the program objective i.e. to combat malnutrition.

Host government priorities recently established coincide with Title II program priorities and goals. The objective of the program to benefit the most needy recipients in the most deprived areas of Bolivia is being cited more often and will constitute a major compromise, if the necessary funding is finally obtained through the Ministry of Planning and the Outreach Grant support.

Socio-economic conditions influenced by a deteriorated financial situation occurring in Bolivia since 1974 did not favor the successful implementation of changes proposed during the same period to improve program scope and quality. Deterioration of the fulfillment of reporting requirements was also a direct consequence, because more time and more personnel had to be devoted to an expanded program.

16. Inputs

While the food commodities provided in 1974-77 by the program suffered

during the period of 1978-79, the pipeline was adequate. However overstocking for CRS/Caritas occurred due to the late initiation of the school year, and a low program performance for CARE/NSAC. The overstocking was in part diverted to emergency assistance. Salaries and operative funds provided by the GOB were inadequate in the case of the CRS/Caritas, the detrimental output effects are described in paragraphs 13 and 15. Although Caritas salaries were in fact increased in some 18% to prevent a program suspension due to an nationwide announced strike of the Caritas personnel, such action mitigated the situation but did not solve it in its entirety.

As a result of the overstocking, the availability of warehousing constituted a major problem. The use of churches, hospitals and provisional facilities had to be obtained, and many of the storage conditions were deplorable. Funds for colateral activities such as nutrition education and program supervision were nonexistent in one case and inadequate in the other.

Program sponsors and the Mission, are encouraged by the new trends arising for the recently created Institute of food and nutrition under the Ministry of Planning which can provide the additional required support, both technical and financial, to improve this condition.

The FFP staff has been reduced from 10 in 1969 down to 3: one local officer, one inspector and one secretary, while the program volume increased by 100% during the same period. As a result program supervision has decreased influencing the quality of the program.

17. Outputs

A tabular comparison of program levels actually reached in terms of number of recipients and quantity of food, against proposed and approved levels, follows:

CRS/CARITAS	FY 1978						FY 1979 (6 months)					
	APPROVED		ACTUAL				APPROVED		ACTUAL			
	No. of Recipients	Food 000 Kgs.	No. of Recipients	%	Food 000 Kgs.	%	No. of Recipients	Food 000 Kgs.	No. of Recipients	%	Food 000 Kgs.	%
Maternal and Child Health	117,000	7,513	101,069	86.4	4,750	63.2	148,000	4,751	116,379	78.6	3,623	76.3
School Feeding	160,000	4,792	169,583	106.0	2,815	58.7	164,000	2,994	42,491	25.9	352	11.8
Pre School Child Feeding	3,000	108	1,059	35.3	27	25.0	3,000	59	1,148	38.3	54	91.5
Other Child Feeding	12,000	1,073	7,175	59.8	406	37.8	15,000	630	6,257	41.7	294	46.7
Health Cases	-	-	-	-	-	-	2,000	89	190	1.0	9	10.0
Food for Work	24,000	2,449	18,956	79.0	656	26.8	40,000	2,255	23,038	57.6	1,177	52.2
Emergencies	-	-	30,550	-	195	-	-	-	28,973	-	189	-
Drought	-	-	210,315	-	4,446	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Adult Institutions	4,000	311	3,922	98.1	159	51.2	4,000	169	2,938	73.5	116	68.6
	320,000	16,246	542,629	169.6	13,454	82.8	376,000	10,947	221,414	58.9	5,814	53.1

CARE/NSAC	FY 1978						FY 1979 (6 months)					
	APPROVED		ACTUAL				APPROVED		ACTUAL			
	No. of Recipients	Food 000 Kgs.	No. of Recipients	%	Food 000 Kgs.	%	No. of Recipients	Food 000 Kgs.	No. of Recipients	%	Food 000 Kgs.	%
Maternal and Child Health	37,000	2,376	23,837	64.4	815	34.3	37,000	1,122	22,370	60.5	804	71.7
Pre School Child Feeding	800	63	-	-	-	-	800	30	-	-	-	-
Other Child Feeding	5,400	482	3,895	72.1	190	39.4	-	-	-	-	-	-
Food for Work	10,000	1,097	4,002	40.0	37	3.4	10,000	519	10,386	104.0	109	21.0
Adult Institutions	2,000	155	1,450	72.5	10	6.5	2,000	72	400	20.0	4	5.6
Emergencies	-	-	3,400	-	9	-	-	-	21,010	-	160	-
	55,200	4,173	36,584	66.3	1,061	25.4	49,800	1,743	54,176	108.9	1,077	61.5

From past experience and based on the fact that a series of factors determines that 100% program accomplishment does not often occur, a level of 75% is considered acceptable. Factors influencing accomplishment range from food shipment delays, lack of funding, late school year initiation, and program implementation problems. The factors mentioned, usually correspond to the School Feeding recipient category. The recipient contribution help defray program costs.

Caution should be exercised in the interpretation of figures contained in the tables, because the number of recipients does not coincide with the amount of food distributed. If distribution to some centers such as the Mothers Clubs is not continuous the number of recipients reached remains constant however for the year, while the actual projected amount of food distributed will be lower than that programmed. The reason for this in the past has been that the Mothers Clubs need to pick up the food commodities from the central or district warehouses and must cover the transportation costs to their centers, which sometimes may not occur on a timely basis. Also during the first half of FY 79 the School Feeding program is not operative because of school vacation and thus program coverage seems low.

18. Purpose

Each year the program purposes are defined in terms of number of recipients to be reached and amount of food commodities to be distributed. The purpose of the FY 77/79 programs is included in Section 17 tables in addition to the status at the end of each period. The main reasons for the shortfalls in reaching the proposed purposes in terms of the linkage with inputs, outputs and external factors are also described.

19. Goal/Subgoal

Although the definition provided in the text of Title II PL 480 to "Combat malnutrition in the most vulnerable groups..." is considered the goal of the program, the ultimate goal can be defined as "lowering the mortality rate" or "improving the health of..." etc.

✓ Efforts to establish suitable indicators to measure the rate of accomplishment toward the proposed goal are difficult to implement.

For the Maternal/Child Health Care recipient category, for instance, the use of weight/height charts was selected as an indicator. While under the CARE/JIAS program this was feasible because the Mothers Centers develop their activity in urban center facilities with full

time doctors and nurses the CRS/Caritas Mothers Clubs scattered in rural areas do not have this opportunity. To institute this procedure would require significant trained personnel and funding inputs.

Within the School Feeding program, the only indicator found suitable under present conditions, is the rate of absenteeism which would require involvement of the Ministry of Education. This has not been possible to obtain in the past. A more difficult indicator such as "improved school performance of the students" is not feasible to measure due to the difficulty in isolating the effect of a simple factor (supplementary food) from a number of concomitant factors.

The recent liaison with the Ministry of Planning, mentioned elsewhere in this report, would again offer an opportunity for a) establishment of basic indicators and b) development of impact evaluation of measurement on the nutritional status of program recipients.

20. Beneficiaries

Identification of beneficiaries by program category is as follows for FY 1979:

Maternal/Child Health Care

CRS/Caritas	148,000	Reduce infant mortality
CARE/NSAC	37,000	" " "

Other Children

CRS/Caritas	18,000	" " "
CARE/NSAC	800	" " "

Food for Work

CRS/Caritas	40,000	Reduce rates of unemployment and underemployment
CARE/NSAC	10,000	" " "
NCDS	10,000	" " "

School Feeding

CRS/Caritas	164,000	Supplement daily diet
-------------	---------	-----------------------

Humanitarian Assistance

CRS/Caritas	6,000	" " "
CARE/NSAC	2,000	" " "

21. Unplanned Effects

The Maternal/Child Health Care recipient category included as collateral activities weekly meetings of enrolled mothers to be provided nutrition, health, and income generating education in such as arts and crafts. This approach resulted in a change of behaviour since from these meetings the idea of creating cooperatives for production and later marketing of sewing/knitting products began to spread among many Mothers Clubs. Also, as the Mothers Clubs grew, departmental "federations" were formed. As the Mothers Clubs members pay a monthly unassociate contribution, each Club was required to open a Bank account which, in a sense, contributed to their participation in the economic system.

Under the Food for Work recipient category, an unplanned although foreseeable effect was that certain communities that received food assistance for communal works, were later able to perform similar work projects without the assistance. The self-help motivation to organize themselves in project committees and to perform activities such as road construction, school construction, irrigation canals, etc. on their own was generated.

Another unexpected effect was detected in the School Feeding activity in the rural areas where children having to walk daily 10 or 15 kilometers from home to school, used to attend morning classes only. When the school lunch was established, field inspections showed that many students remained at school all day since it was not necessary for them to go home for lunch.

22. Lessons Learned

Two areas seem to be critical for an efficient Title II program implementation:

- a) Work relations. The Food for Peace Office has to deal directly with the PVO program sponsors and thus obtain the required action from the sponsors local counterparts. The sponsors are generally very sensitive to the Mission's dealing directly with the counterparts. This structure demands a continual open communication flow between all concerned parties and all persons related in any way with the activity. If sufficient care is not given these relationships, program monitoring is not likely to be successful as the Mission needs to require the fulfillment of numerous and varied program regulations.

- b) Program supervision. A need exists within the Mission Food for Peace Office as to assure a continued, permanent field inspection. The Food for Peace program deteriorates in its quality as soon as of field activities the supervision declines. Both Maternal Child Health Care and School Feeding programs were complying with the initial agreed upon requirements and all parties involved were active in monitoring the process at the project sites. However when this phase terminated, program implementation deteriorated.

Supervisory activities made by the sponsors and counterparts are insufficient, since in some cases critical problems are not purposely identified to avoid criticism.

III/TFP: A Peñaloza: di