

-1.

PD-ABA-891

66127

EVALUATION OF USAID'S GRANTS TO THE
ADULT LITERACY ORGANIZATION OF ZIMBABWE

USAID OPG'S NO. 613-0220 AND 613-0224

HARARE
NOVEMBER, 1983

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
<u>OBSERVATIONS BY THE WORLD EDUCATION EVALUATORS</u>	1
I. INTRODUCTION	2
A. Rationale	2
B. The Evaluation Team	2
C. Scope of Work	3
D. Aims and Organization of the Report	3
II. BACKGROUND OF ADULT LITERACY EFFORTS IN ZIMBABWE	4
A. ALOZ Programs	4
B. The National Literacy Campaign (NLC)	8
C. Objectives of the Initial AID Grant (613-0220) to ALOZ	11
III. THE EVALUATION DESIGN	14
A. Aims	14
B. Methodology	15
IV. COLLECTION OF DATA IN SELECTED AREAS	16
A. Testing of Instruments in the Harare area	16
B. Field Visits to Other Regions of the Country	16
V. FULFILLMENT OF THE GRANT OBJECTIVES	
A. Goal: Improving the Economic and Social Well-Being of the Poor in Zimbabwe	21
B. Objective One: Expanding the Absolute and Relative Number of Functionally Literate Adults, Especially Women	22
C. Objective Two: Project Activities	25
D. Objective Three: Training Literacy Teachers	27
E. Objective Four: Supervision of Literacy Teachers	28
F. Objective Five: Increasing Publication of Literacy Materials	29
G. Objective Six: State Development	32
H. Objective Seven: Improving the Information System	33
VI. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ALOZ AND THE NATIONAL LITERACY CAMPAIGN	34

VII. FORMATIVE EVALUATION OF THE ALOE PRESS	34
A. General Observations	34
B. Progress in Meeting Project Objectives	35
C. Costing and Pricing Methods	38
D. Management and Operation	41
E. Staff Training	45
F. Summary of Recommendations	46

APPENDICES

A. Members of the Evaluation Team
B. Members of the Steering Committee
C. Instruments Developed in Phase I
D. ALOE Press Costing and Pricing Forms
E. ALOZ Process Evaluation Instruments

OBSERVATION OF THE WORLD EDUCATION EVALUATORS

1. While not all of the objectives of the USAID grant were met in their entirety ALOZ has made important strides forward in all of these areas. The team feels that the objectives of the USAID grant are on their way to being achieved. However, at the time of the evaluation, the number of sponsors obtained, teachers trained and refreshed and students enrolled all fell short of the projected target. This was partly the result of the general economic situation of the country which was beyond ALOZ's control. Furthermore, there were delays and setbacks encountered in meeting some of the project's other objectives such as developing and unrealistic outputs publishing materials and instituting a new information system. In view of the short duration of the grant period (only 2 years) and the situation in which ALOZ found itself in the post-independence period, the expected outputs were unrealistic.
2. The evaluation team was impressed with the professionalism and sincerity with which ALOZ staff approaches their work. Their dedication and perseverance under demanding conditions is a real asset to the organization and to the country. Everywhere the team visited it found a reservoir of appreciation and good will toward the service ALOZ has been rendering over the years.
3. During the grant period ALOZ has begun a significant transition away from a more traditional syllabic method of teaching which had only literacy as its goal, to a psycho-social method with broader consciousness in raising human development objectives. The evaluation team feels that this reorientation is a praiseworthy one which should be vigorously pursued. There are always growing pains associated with significant changes, and certainly ALOZ has been free from these. It is still too early to assess any impact from this change in their literacy methodology.
4. ALOZ has faced difficulties adjusting to the socio-political changes that have occurred since independence. Previously, they were the major organization involved in literacy work in the country. Since independence the Government of Zimbabwe has launched the National Literacy Campaign and places considerable emphasis on literacy and basic education. ALOZ needs to adjust its modus operandi to this new national context to minimize conflict and to complement the effects of government.
5. ALOZ can make an important contribution in the fields of training and the development and publication of materials. In this latter regard it should work hand in hand with the government, filling the need for reading materials for new literates. Being a small organization ALOZ performs the important role of meeting the literacy needs of special learning groups that might not be reached by the National Literacy Campaign. These include for example,

unskilled workers in mining and industry who require further education for job promotion as well as minority groups such as the Tonga who wish to have materials developed in their own language.

I. INTRODUCTION

A. RATIONALE

On September 29, 1981, USAID/Zimbabwe and the Adult Literacy Organization of Zimbabwe (ALoz) entered into a grant agreement entitled "Adult Literacy Teacher Training and Text Production OPG Project No. 6713-0220". The purpose of this grant was to support a two-year program by ALoz to increase its capacity to provide training and supervision for adult literacy teachers and to provide textbooks for use by literacy teachers and students.

According to the grant document a formative evaluation was to be carried out at the end of the first year. The mid-term Formative Evaluation was carried out in September 1982. The grant document also specified that at the end of the project a summative evaluation would be conducted.

In the meantime, on November 16, 1982, USAID/Zimbabwe and ALoz entered into a second grant agreement entitled "Books for New Literates OPG Project No. 613-0224". The second grant grew out of recommendations made in the mid-term formative evaluation of the first grant and was designed to support ALoz over a two-year period in meeting the demand for simplified and relevant printed materials for new literates by increasing and improving its printing capacity. A formative evaluation was to be conducted at the end of the first year.

The present report fulfills the evaluation requirements of both grants. On the one hand, it is a summative evaluation of evaluation of the second grant.

B. THE EVALUATION TEAM

In August, 1983, World Education, Inc. of Boston was contracted to carry out the summative evaluation of the first grant (613-0220). The first two members of the World Education team, and adult education specialist and training specialist arrived in Zimbabwe during the last week of October and began work on October 24. The third member of the team, an economist, arrived one week later.

USAID/Zimbabwe felt that the summative evaluation should not only review the progress ALoz had made in meeting the grant objectives, but also explore the future direction for ALoz and make recommendations for changes if such changes were perceived as being warranted. For this reason, a Steering Committee was set up to oversee and to give guidance to the evaluation activity. The

Steering Committee consisted of six people: two members from the Ministry of Education, the Education Officer (Non-formal) and the Education Officer; two members from the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs, the Assistant Secretary for Training and the Principal Training Officer; the Chairman of the Department of Adult Education at the University of Zimbabwe; and the Principal of Ranche House College, a private community college.

C. SCOPE OF WORK

The scope of work for the evaluation included the following:

1. To elicit input from ALOZ staff, members of the Steering Committee, government ministry of officials, and AID officials on evaluation questions and indicators of performance.
2. To review the relevant document to find out the major objectivities and issues.
3. To prepare the necessary instruments and to gather relevant data.
4. To prepare a draft report and to present it to the Steering Committee for comments.
5. To prepare a final report which would include a description of the National Literacy Campaign, the relationship between ALOZ and the campaign, and recommendations for improving cooperation between ALOZ and the Government of Zimbabwe.

D. AIMS AND ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT

This Evaluation Report is divided into seven sections. The introductory sections has explained the rational for the evaluation, and outlined its scope of work.

Section two described the background of adult literacy efforts in Zimbabwe, including a brief history and description of ALOZ and its programs. It also outlines the objectives of the National Literacy Campaign. This section concludes with a summary of the objectives of the two USAID grants to ALOZ.

Section three discusses the evaluation design in detail outlining its aims and providing a detailed summary of the evaluation methodology.

Section four describes the collection of data. This includes information about the areas visited, the types of activities observed, the kinds of problems encountered and persons interviewed.

Section five summarizes the findings and makes observations regarding the achievement of the project's objectives. In addition to quantitative indicators, the quality of grant activities is also to be discussed as revealed by the data collected.

Section six examines the relationship between ALOZ and the National Literacy Campaign outlines possible areas for improving cooperation between ALOZ and the Government of Zimbabwe.

Finally, section seven is the formative evaluation of the second ALOZ grant. It examines the new ALOE Press and make recommendations regarding its future operation.

II. BACKGROUND OF ADULT LITERACY EFFORTS IN ZIMBABWE

A. ALOZ PROGRAMS

The Adult Literacy Organization of Zimbabwe (ALOZ) has four main functions: the training of literacy teachers; the supervision of literacy programs; the production of reading materials for new literates; and the promotion of income-generating activities for literacy groups.

The present ALOZ program evolved over a 20 year period. It began when the Christian Literature Agency (Lit-Lit) working in Matabeleland, pooled its efforts with the Adult Literacy Council then working Mashonaland. Both organizations were church-backed with the council having a strong Laubach tradition. In the early days volunteer literacy workers from the United States played a vital role in giving the organization professional guidance and direction. One of them Alice Sanderson from California, stayed with the organization and continued to work with it actively until her retirement in 1975. ALOZ was registered in 1970 as a welfare organization. Presently, formal membership in the organization stand at 24 persons. It is run by Management Committee, members of which are elected at Annual General Meetings. Two of the founding members still serve on the Management Committee.

ALOZ stresses teaching of literacy and numeracy and the training of literacy teachers. Trainees are selected by their community, church or industry and usually have at least a primary school education. Until 1981, they were trained in a 12 week course on how to run their classes using a syllabic approach to literacy teaching. After 1981, a 7-week course was instituted for those with some secondary education, and the 14-week course continued for those with less than secondary. There has since been changes to a 14-week course for all teachers.

Given the political and social conditions of pre-independent Zimbabwe, helping Africans become literate was a fairly radical act to which Government turned both a blind eye and a deaf ear. Independence in 1980 brought a socialist government into power which

values equality and social justice. In this new context, literacy takes on a broader meaning - not merely the reading of words but also the raising of consciousness about the world and ones responsibility to remake it. This extended view of literacy has taken roots in many countries since it was first elaborated by Paulo Freire in Brazil. In Africa, many of the pro-socialist governments, such as Guinea-Bissau and Ethiopia, have adopted Paulo Freire's methods of making people literate. In Zimbabwe, therefore, after years of colonial oppression and a military struggle to achieve independence, literacy took on a larger meaning than the mere reading and writing of words. Thus the institution of a new government in Zimbabwe presented ALOZ with a challenge to its values, methods, and very modus operandi.

Even, before independence, ALOZ has begun investigating the psycho-social method of Freirean school of literacy teaching. Staff members attended a few workshops on the method. While agreeing with the philosophy of the psycho-social method, ALOZ had reservations about its ability to really teach literacy. Even so ALOZ took and has continued to take positive steps to modify its approach and some features of the psycho-social method have been incorporated. In training programs, group discussion and to some extent group dynamics, are emphasized. Picture codes have been developed to help focus literacy group discussions on common economic and social problems. The themes for the codes were developed from studies carried out by the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs, the Ministry of Education, Catholic Commission for Social Services and Development, Lutheran Church, and ALOZ staff. Stories for readers are based on the themes which grew out of listening surveys carried out in the Harare area. Primers are prepared choosing generative words from the themes. Teachers are then taught how to lead discussions with the codes using reflection and stimulating action solving questions.

ALOZ encourages the literacy teacher to create a sympathetic learning environment in which adults are helped to improve their standard of living and the quality of life by:

- a. enabling them to consider family and local problems, and the sharing of common experiences;
- b. helping them to discover local resources (extension worker, local government bodies, local community leaders to help solve problems;
- c. encouraging them to see themselves as resources, both individually and in the process of group cooperation, and encouraging them to join community action bodies;
- d. assisting them to establish cash projects; and

e. equipping them with the necessary literacy and numeracy skills they need for full participation in family, community and citizenship activities.

After some experimentation in initial post-independence period, ALOZ has settled on a 14-week training course for all teacher trainees. The previous 7-week course designed for trainees with two years secondary education has been extended to 14 weeks. Course content for all trainees now includes: the principles of adult education, literacy center administration, recruiting and testing of students, the use of codes to stimulate discussion, literacy and numeracy teaching and use of the teacher's guide. A significant proportion of the training time is spent on the last two content areas. Trainees who will work with community groups do an added unit on income generating project planning and management, with some basic English. Trainees going to work in commerce and industry, on the other hand, concentrate on intensive English and Arithmetic teaching. A more learner-centered approach has been instituted and teachers are being trained in participatory classroom methods with an emphasis on group discussion. Even so the primary emphasis remains the acquisition of literacy skills. When a trainee leaves the course, he/she is equipped with a kit containing a full complement of books, lesson plans, word cards, a blackboard, a flannel board, a duster, a box of chalk, a clock face, pens, pencils, sharpeners and rulers. Refresher courses are held annually. All ALOZ trained teachers are urged to attend these. Refresher courses are used as a means of upgrading and updating the teacher's competencies in the new methods.

At present there are roughly 345 ALOZ - trained literacy teachers operating on a full-time basis throughout Zimbabwe. The over-all enrollment of learners is estimated at 18,000 for 1983, 78% of who are women. Training fees and salaries for the teachers are paid for by local agencies or community groups. The sponsor system was instituted in the early 70's as a result of limited financial resources. It provides approximately two-thirds of the cost of running the program. In 1983, sponsors contributed roughly Z\$430,000 toward literacy programs in Zimbabwe. Thirty seven percent of the sponsors are churches, 22% commerce and industry, 19% local government, and 25% other (community groups, central government, farms, etc).

Literacy Classes are supervised by a team of ALOZ supervisors, nine in the north of the country and two in the south. Sponsors pay the cost of supervisory visits which take place about three times a year. Each supervisor is responsible for a given area. Supervisors give advice and encouragement to teachers and administer a test for promotion of adult learners to the next stage.

At present, ALOZ offers three stages in its literacy program. Stage 1 runs for an average of 240 hours, lasting ten months, taking three two-hour sessions a week for 40 weeks. At the end of this

stage learners should be able to fluently read and comprehend simple passages in their mother tongue, write a short letter using paragraphs, address and envelope, identify the correct time from a clock replica and do addition and subtraction of numbers under 1000. Stage 11 is a 7-months course meeting three two-hours sessions per week for 28 weeks. Here more complicated reading and comprehension in the vernacular is done and simple English and cursive writing are introduced. More advanced arithmetical operations are also studied. Stage 111 leads to fluency in reading, comprehension and writing of simple vernacular language and English and an ability to use operations in arithmetic to solve problems involving money, time, fractions and measurement.

Of equal importance to training in ALOZ is the program of materials production. A team of six - two writers and four experienced trainers - are at present working to revise a primer and a teacher's guide in the two main languages of the country - Shona and Ndebele. These primers are oriented towards the new approach in ALOZ using picture codes and discussion. The demand for books has far outstripped ALOZ's ability to supply them. The recent acquisition of a modern press financed by USAID has greatly improved the quality and quantity of books. ALOZ materials are approved by the Ministry of Education.

Shortly before 1981, ALOZ found that class involvement in an economic activity improved attendance, motivation, and retention of literacy skills. Since then, literacy classes have been encouraged to establish some form of income-generating project such as poultry farming, market gardening, savings clubs and making items for sale such as school uniforms, roofing sheets and food items. Reading materials related to these activities are produced by ALOZ. Project co-ordinators who are full-time staff of ALOZ train literacy teachers in project management.

To support its growing program and staff requirements, * ALOZ raises funds from a variety of donor agencies in Zimbabwe and abroad. Most donors are church related, others are development agencies. The sources of income are not always regular, however, making fund raising, necessarily, a continuous function. The ALOZ budget for Sept. 81 - Sept. 1983 was:

Income:	\$587,407
Expenditure:	\$634,831
Deficit:	\$ 47,424

*Figure One shows the staffing and organizational structure of ALOZ. These figures do not include the amounts paid by sponsors mentioned above.

B THE NATIONAL LITERACY CAMPAIGN

Officially launched in July 1983, the National Literacy Campaign hopes to eradicate illiteracy from Zimbabwe within a period of three years by reaching two and a half million people. Preparatory work for the campaign began in 1981 with the establishment of a non-formal education unit in the Ministry of Education. Major responsibility for the campaign was initially vested in this unit. Staff visited literacy programs in Ethiopia, Nicaragua, Tanzania and Swaziland.

A steering committee was formed to prepare a plan for a literacy/numeracy campaign. The Catholic Commission for Social Service and Development (CCSSD), ALOZ and the Ministry of Local Government and Town Planning were invited by the Ministry of Education to serve on the committee. The aims of the campaign would be:

1. to promote a socialist and egalitarian society;
2. to mobilize and motivate illiterates and semi-illiterates to become literate;
3. to make illiterates and semi-illiterates functionally literate in their mother tongue;
4. to promote political and economic independence;
5. to promote national consciousness and patriotism;
6. to develop confidence in manipulating the environment based upon scientific analysis of cause and effect; and
7. to establish an awareness of the exploitation of women in Zimbabwean society.

In 1982, the Government felt that the Literacy Campaign should be shared between the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs (MCDWA) and the Ministry of Education. It was agreed between the Ministries that Education would perform the functions of materials development and production, training and evaluation while MCDWA would be responsible for mobilization, coordination and supervision of literacy classes. At this time, all District Literacy Coordinators (DLC's) who had been trained by the Ministry of Education were transferred to MCDWA.

By the time of the official launching of the Campaign, in July 1983, MCDWA published a revised version of the original objectives of the Campaign. These revisions reflected MCDWA's perspective of what they felt could be achieved in the three year period. The objectives as stated before will be reflected in the spirit the campaign and the materials produced. The broad objectives are:

1. to carry out a literacy campaign capable of wiping out illiteracy within a short period of time;
2. to promote national unity, consciousness and patriotism by a literacy campaign which people are encouraged to participate fully and effectively at all levels;
3. to promote and increase national productivity through enlightened literate workers and peasants;
4. to encourage and strengthen the participation of the newly literate people in organisations such as trade unions, co-operatives, womens's groups, youth groups and other socially motivated groups in our society.

The specific objectives of the Campaign are through literacy:

1. to impact communication skills on reading, writing and arithmetic;
2. to impact skills on political education leading to political awareness and consciousness of the masses;
3. to impact skills for contribution to economic production at all levels;
4. to provide continuing education to the new literates;
5. to eradicate illiteracy among Zimbabwean people.

and

To date, there are estimated to be over 7,000 literacy classes around the country and at least two DLC's in each of the 55 districts - and in some cases three per district. Six thousand teachers have been trained and 60,000 learners are currently attending classes. The DLC mobilizes the population and calls for volunteer teachers. Mobilization is also done by other government officials who give speeches at public rallies, or hold special meetings for community leaders to explain the importance of literacy.

The teachers are selected by each community that wishes to have a class. The teachers are then given a two-week training course by the DLC. Classes are held at times mutually agreed upon by teacher and learners. It is hoped that after 100 hours, learners will be able to read and write in their mother tongue as well as perform the basic operations of arithmetic using these to calculate sales tax, do budgeting and measurement.

The campaign has been running for only six months, hence no groups have been tested yet. A post literacy stage in Adult Basic Education is currently being planned. New literates will have the option of following the Adult Basic Education course, or continuing with post literacy materials and activities.

The literacy approach used by the National Literacy Campaign derives some of its features from the Paulo Freirean school of thought. Generative themes and codes are used to promote the goals of the campaign. Some listening surveys were done, themes thought to be applicable to the whole country were chosen to prepare generative words for the primers. Classes use the codes for reflecting and action oriented questions; emphasis is placed on discussion.

The training of District Literacy Coordinators takes four weeks. To qualify as a DLC, a person has to have O-level or 4 years of secondary education. Initially DLC's were ex-combatants (O-level). Later DLC's were drawn from a larger cross section of the population. During the four week training, some of the main topics covered are: the historical background of Zimbabwe, the present structure of government, literacy, understanding and working with the community, how to teach adults and how adults learn, communication skills, planning and organizing learning programs, setting up an office and office procedures, research, evaluation, planning for the future, and realisation of the need to maintain and improve educational standards of previously illiterate and innumerate people.

During the course, literacy receives as much time as the other content areas. The DLC's leave their course equipped with the knowledge of a training course for literacy teachers, a manual, the primers, codes and teachers guides.

In the districts, DLC's run two-week training courses for literacy teachers using more or less the same course content as described above. It is intended that the teachers leave the training course provided with two notebooks - one containing notes taken during the training course, the other to be used for records. They also have the teachers guides, picture codes, and a supply of primers. They are given a class register for keeping attendance as well.

Materials presently available for the Campaign include primers and basic numeracy books in the two main languages of the country - Shona and Ndebele, teachers guides, and picture codes. Follow-on reading materials are acquired by learners from the Literature Bureau, or on the open market. Eight writers recently trained by MOE have begun to prepare materials for the literacy and post literacy stages as well as the Basic Education Course for Adults.

The structure of the campaign is still in its formative stage. The MCDWA has proposed a National Literacy co-ordinating committee through the provincial, district, village and literacy class levels. The committees would oversee the implementation of the Campaign.

Funding continues to be a major problem. Even though teachers are volunteers, many of them are unemployed volunteers. UNICEF has assisted with eight Suzuki jeeps and 16 motorbikes. Another 39 motorbikes are expected to bring the number to 55 more per district. Funds are still required for materials such as chalk and blackboards, printing of primers the running of training courses, and for related expenses. USAID has concurred with a request from the Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning and Development to allocate Z\$2.6 million to the Campaign using local currency generated from the Commodity Import Program.

C. OBJECTIVES OF THE INITIAL AID GRANT TO ALOZ (613-0220)

In September of 1981, ALOZ entered into an agreement with USAID for a \$450,000 grant to be used by ALOZ over a two year period to increase its capacity to provide training and supervision of literacy teachers. The purpose of the grant, as described in the program description, was to expand the absolute and relative numbers of functionally literate Zimbabweans, particularly women. Functional literacy, was not meant to imply merely the acquisition of the skills of reading, writing, and arithmetic, but required that these skills actually help the person raise his/her critical consciousness and have confidence, human relations skills, techniques and initiative with which to act to improve his/her quality of life.

The specific objective of the Grant was to enable ALOZ to assist approximately 46,000 adults to become functionally literate during the two years of the Project. In addition, social and economic development activities were to be undertaken by groups of literacy students. The grant was to enable ALOZ to significantly expand its operations, in particular:

1. the training of literacy teachers nominated by sponsoring groups;
2. the supervision of ALOZ-trained teachers once they actually begin literacy work in their communities on salary support provided by their sponsors;
3. the development and provision of graded reading materials suitable to adult learners; and
4. the provision of assistance to literacy teachers and groups engaged in development activities to formulate use of skills and knowledge acquired during the literacy training.

The major outputs anticipated during the grant period were five:

1. The Sponsorship Approach: ALOZ would continue its policy of training literacy teachers to be employed by other organizations, rather than employing these teachers itself. It was expected that sponsors for 250 new literacy teachers would be forthcoming during the two years of the project.

2. Training of Literacy Teachers: The standard methods of teaching and techniques of adult literacy would continue to be used by ALOZ in training teachers, with a heavy emphasis on participatory learning, including role play, discussion, and field practicals. Under the anticipated training program, teacher trainees would be taught the full range of their duties: to recruit, enroll and pre-test students, plan teaching timetables, run a literacy center, keep class registers, obtain and distribute reading materials, use adult literacy teaching methods and aid as well as basic education principles, integrate literacy teaching with students' like skills, and follow-up on past students. The trainees would be evaluated at the end of the course and, if successful, issued with a certificate of competence.

During the first year of the project, ALOZ teacher trainers as well as trained literacy teachers would participate in an evaluation of the training program with the aim of identifying areas for improvement and modification. Special attention would be given to project identification and assessment.

3. Supervision of Literacy Teachers: At the time of the grant the ratio of supervisors to literacy teachers was 1:42. During the first year of the project, five new supervisors were to be hired and another five hired the second year. Thus the ratio would be about 1:26 for the first year and 1:25 for the second year. This expansion in permanent staff would be required as ALOZ increased its output of trained literacy teachers. Under the project ALOZ would maintain flexibility in regard to cost of supervision, and when necessary the organization would cover costs ordinarily borne by sponsors (e.g. transport, meals, and lodging of the supervisors plus a daily rate).

4. Publications: During the lifetime of the project, ALOZ was to conduct an assessment to identify students' learning needs and, based upon the findings, new reading materials (at least five publications) would be developed.

ALOZ would establish a new post - Evaluation/Publications Officer - to cover these responsibilities. The Officer would also be responsible for establishing and maintaining linkages with other organizations - including Development Agencies, and Government Ministries, and to provide guidance on technical information related to the subject matter of the publications developed.

5. Projects: Based upon ALOZ's previous experience and ongoing work, it was anticipated that development activities under the project would include, for example, the construction of village sanitation facilities, schools, community meeting halls, bridges and projects such as small livestock production, market-gardening, especially fruit crops, introduction of new farming methods and savings clubs, establishment of input and marketing committees, and production of roofing and other commodities for rural use.

It was anticipated that approximately one-third of the teachers would have students who were involved in group development activities and that an estimated 150 development activities would be implemented during the Project.

ALOZ would create a Project Team, financed by a donor other than AID, that would be responsible for providing technical guidance, establishing linkages with relevant agencies, and assisting in procurement of materials. ALCZ would operate a project activity fund, financed from sources other than AID, to assist groups to undertake development activities.

During the 1982 formative evaluation of the project, it became clear that ALOZ's print capacity would be unable to meet the demand for books. Moreover, it would be totally inadequate to cope with any further expansion of literacy work by ALOZ or the Government of Zimbabwe. Hence another agreement was signed between USAID and ALOZ for \$300,000 to improve ALOZ's printing capacity thereby helping ALOZ to meet effectively the demand for simplified and relevant printed materials for new literates.

The specific objectives of this second grant were to enable ALOZ to provide simplified, relevant and affordable reading materials to the growing number of new literates. The number of new literates was expected to increase from 236,000 in 1983 to 952,000 by 1985. This increase would be the result of efforts by organizations such as ALOZ and the National Literacy Campaign, which was about to be launched by the Ministry of Education and Culture and the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs.

The specific outputs expected to result from the second USAID Grant:

1. efficient production of books and other reading materials for new literates capable of meeting the estimated demand for such materials.
2. elimination of the 50 percent subsidy on printed materials sold by ALOZ; and

3. establishment of a fully equipped and operational non-profit print shop which would be capable of financing its operation through income earned from sales of its services and output.

III. THE EVALUATION DESIGN

A. AIMS

The need to measure and evaluate project accomplishments has been a continuing theme since the ALOZ program grant began in 1981. The original project document in this regard, presents a Logical Framework Matrix where the broad project goal and purpose, along with five specific outputs are described along with appropriate "objectively verifiable indicators", and means of verification (See Figure 2).

This figure is presented in its entirety because it illuminates original assumptions concerning the type and scope of evaluation activities thought necessary to properly assess project goals. As we shall soon see, the summative evaluation design is considerably expanded and elaborated.

The evaluation timetable layed down in the 1981 agreement called for a formative evaluation at the end of the project's first year. This would be carried out by "ALOZ together with an AID participant and a member of the GOZ or University of Zimbabwe". This initial assessment took place in September 1982. (See "Mid-term Formative Evaluation: Adult Literacy Teacher Training and Text Production OPG 613-0220", by two AID/Washington representatives). This evaluation concluded that "ALOZ is successfully carrying out the activities described in the grant document". It also recommended an expansion of printing capacity so output could keep up with the rapidly growing demand for printed materials. Why a GOZ or local university representative was not included in the evaluation team was not explained in the reports but seems to have been a function of the strained relationship between ALOZ and the GOZ. This unfortunate omission, however, limited the formative evaluation's scope insofar as it failed to take into account the larger socio-political context and to specifically address this major problem area. A year later, in creating an evaluation team for the summative evaluation, the Ministry of Education and Culture, the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs, a University member as well as other Zimbabwean professionals and academics played a central role in the evaluation design and in its implementation.

This in turn has led to a broadening of evaluation aims and has necessitated a more complex, rigorous and time-consuming methodology. Where our original evaluation aims sought to measure project output goals, the revised evaluation objective has been primarily concerned with assessing the work of ALOZ in the larger

national context of literacy and national development. Accordingly, the summative evaluation has two basic aims. The first is to provide a discrepancy evaluation contrasting project attainments and project goals. This will be the heart of the present Phase I report. Phase II will report on an impact evaluation that examines in greater depth ALOZ's contribution vis-a-vis current national literacy goals and programs.

While the discrepancy and impact evaluation models used in Phases I and II share a number of assumptions and data collection techniques, they are different in scope and methodology. It may therefore be helpful to briefly address these differences.

B. METHODOLOGY

The discrepancy evaluation design elaborated by the original three member World Education team during their first week in Harare, proposes a variety of outcome verification measures. These included structured and unstructured interviews, document analysis, direct observation of literacy class, assessment of ALOZ printed materials, and cost-effective analysis, among others.

With the addition of two Ministry of Education experts in the second week, the team, along with the USAID HRD officer, agreed to accept the more ambitious and global impact evaluation plan put forth by the Ministry of Education members. This decision superceded the earlier discrepancy design and necessitated the development of a dozen structured questionnaire instruments. This activity along with the pilot testing of the questionnaires and schedules in greater Harare, and in six of the country's eight provinces occupied most of the team's time during the second and third weeks of the evaluation. Each instrument went through a number of drafts as the team worked intensively on problems of coverage, objectivity, reliability, relevance, and the like. The results of this work are included in Appendix C: Instruments Developed in Phase I.

By the fourth and final week the team had acquired an adequate data base to prepare a preliminary report on Phase I focusing on specific project goal attainments along with some preliminary suggestions for ALOZ, USAID, and the Ministry of Education. As the greatest part of the World Education team's time in Zimbabwe had been spent in the preparation and pilot testing of survey research instruments, a demanding task not specified in the original scope of work, the discrepancy evaluation is less detailed and rigorous than originally planned.

While the methodology for the first stage of the summative evaluation has by necessity received less attention than we would have hoped, the team has made a very substantial contribution to the Phase II stage where the instruments will be applied nationally using a stratified random sampling approach. As previously noted, data will be coded and punched for computer analysis.

The formative evaluation of the ALOE Press presented in Section VI was carried out by two AID representatives with a section on costing and pricing contributed by a World Education team member. This work seeks to identify problems, and to propose solutions that can be carried out during the grant's second year. It is accordingly, more problem oriented and by necessity gathers in-depth information from structured and open-ended interviews, direct observations, and a very close reading of project records and financial accounts. The earlier ALOZ grant, in contrast, has now run its course and our recommendations address the need for a successful conclusions to Phase II.

IV. COLLECTION OF DATA IN SELECTED AREAS

A. TESTING OF INSTRUMENTS IN THE HARARE AREA

The team visited ALOZ classes in six of the eight provinces of the country. Field work began in earnest during the third week with pilot-testing of the instruments in the Harare areas. These trips, and follow-up instrument revision sessions at the Ministry of Education, enable the team to refine the instruments, eliminate problems, and check on adequacy of data vis-a-vis evaluation goals.

B. FIELD VISITS TO OTHER REGIONS OF THE COUNTRY

Figure three below provides a graphic presentation of the team's visitation schedule. The ten-day gap between October 28 and November 9 was spent designing and revising the evaluation instruments - i.e. structured interviews, questionnaires, and literacy tests.

Figure Three
Schedule of Phase I Field Work to Visit ALOZ Program Location

<u>Date</u>	<u>Province</u>	<u>District</u>	<u>Locality</u>	<u>Sponsor*</u>
Oct. 27	Mashonaland East	Mudzi	Dendera	1
Oct. 28	Mashonaland East	Harare	James North Co. Blue Ribbon Foods	4 4
Nov. 8	Mashonaland East	Chitungwiza	Zengeza Township	2
Nov. 9	Mashonaland Central	Bindura	Bindura RAN Mine Trojan Mine	2 6 6
Nov. 10	Mashonaland West Mashonaland East	Chegutu Harare	Pfupajena Town/S Glen Noran	2 1
Nov. 14-15	Midlands	Kwekwe Redcliff Kadoma	Mbizo Township Zisco Steel Tawistock Farm	2, 3 4 7
Nov. 13-15	Matabeleland North	Bulawayo	Jairos Jiri Center Tshabala Mpopoma	9 1 1

		National Railways	5
		Mzlikazi	9
	Bubi	Mbembesi	3
		Fingo	2
Nov. 13-15 Manicaland	Chipinga	Sakwinje	2
		Mbeure	2
		Chibuwe North	9
		Chibuwe South	2
	Mutare	Karina Textiles	4
		Dangamvura T/S	1
	Honde Valley	St. Columbus Ms.	1
		Holy Family School	9

*Sponsor code: 1-church; 2-local government; 3-community group; 4-commerce and industry' 5-central government; 6-mine; 7-farm; 8-individual; 9-NGO; 10-other

This section will very briefly comment on the regional field trips made during the Nov. 13-15 period. The team decided to split into groups of two, including one Shona speaking member and one World Education team member, in order to visit those regions offering the most programs meeting the following criteria: (1) Stage I classes; (2) teachers prepared in psycho-social method (PSM); (3) PSM materials in use; (4) a variety of sponsor types; and (5) accessibility. ALOZ personnel helped to contact local staff. In addition, two of the teams were accompanied by ALOZ supervisors from Harare responsible for the programs to be visited. The third team picked up ALOZ support in the area.

ALOZ PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

MIDLANDS

The Midlands team spent one day in Kwekwe at a community center, and a youth hall. The second day saw visits to the Zisco Iron and Steel works at Redcliff, and to a large agricultural estate near Kadoma.

A number of problem were observed and bear some comment. One concerns teachers trained in psycho-social methods during the past year who are unable to secure the teaching materials to support this method as the materials are still under revision.

A second problem was note at the steel mill where the male students in the classes wanted materials with at least some reference to sports, or other masculine interests. Present materials are largely aimed at women and perhaps the current orientation is, in fact correct, given women make up 78% of all ALOZ adult students. Some changes in this direction, i.e., addition of male-oriented content, however, should be made in future editions.

A third problem arose when literacy tests in Shona were administered on the agricultural estate. The majority of State I students tested were not native speakers of Shona and did very poorly. This situation may be more the rule than the exception in large scale agricultural, or industrial institutions or in border areas adjacent to Malawi and Mozambique.

MATABELELAND

During class visits in the Bulawayo area three problems stood out: the shortage of staff, the presence of large numbers of school-age children in literacy classes, and a shortage of instructional materials.

There are presently 81 teachers operating 226 adult literacy classes in 79 centers in the south, but with only two supervisors. This situation is further exacerbated by the total lack of transport at the regional office. The security situation in the south only makes this difficult situation worse.

The large number of school-aged children in what are adult classes creates an additional instructional problem for the teachers. The teacher must cater the lessons to two audiences. Despite this, the children appeared to be making good progress in the literacy classes. Their presence in the classes was the result of dislocated families who had moved from rural to urban areas because of the security situation and the difficulty of getting them enrolled in midyear.

Teachers constantly mentioned the shortages of ALOZ books and materials. This was the problem they seemed to feel most acutely, and it seems widespread throughout the southern region.

MANICALAND

The Manicaland team spent one day visiting classes in the rural areas of Chipinge district. Unlike classes visited previously, all of these groups met out-of-doors under trees. All had hopes of moving to enclosed shelter in the future. Community halls at present are only half built.

Chipinge was chosen because this was an area where the new Shona primers using large picture codes and the psycho-social teaching methods are being tested. Unfortunately, the picture codes were not available at the classes visited. Since the primer itself has no pictures, the teachers faced serious problems in using the new approach. One solution would be to print the codes in the primers in a manner similar to the National Literacy Campaign primers.

ALoz feels that each learner having his own copy of this code would detract from the discussion in class as it would reduce group interaction. This problem would be avoided if the students were broken into small groups to discuss the code and then each group, using the large code would report its findings to the class. In this manner group interaction would remain high, discussion could be carried out even if the posters were not available, people with poor eyesight could see this code letter, and the primers would be made more attractive and interesting through the addition of illustrations.

On the second day of the regional visit, the Manicaland team visited the Karina Textile company in Mutare and a church-sponsored class in a nearby high density suburb. The teacher at the church was distressed because her entire stage III class had been arrested in a recent round-up of alleged prostitutes. All concerned hoped the situation would soon return to normal.

On the same day the team visited two classes in the Honde Valley region. In one case the sponsor provided only a classroom and training assistance for the teacher and no salary. The teacher was supposed to collect \$2 a month from her students. This remuneration scheme however, was not working as the students were unable to pay. The teacher, though highly praised by the sponsor, was seriously thinking of quitting.

This problem points to a need for ALOZ to give more attention to the proper orientation of sponsors. In the past, ALOZ gave workshops for sponsors. Perhaps this practice should be reinstated. Also a more uniform wage policy should be urged upon sponsoring bodies and guideline materials produced.

Everywhere the team visited there were concerns voiced that not enough men were taking advantage of the classes. Various reasons were given for this. One reason given for this was that men were working during normal class times and were not free to participate. Another reason was cultural. Men would not be comfortable sitting in a class with women students and taught by a woman. If more men are to be attracted to the programs, attention must be given to recruiting more male teachers and making at least some instructional materials more male-oriented.

By the end of the field phase of the evaluation, team members had visited 28 project locations, interviewed 57 students, 35 teachers, 19 sponsors, 12 community workers, almost all ALOZ staff members, and observed 15 classes.

V. FINDINGS AND COMMENTS

FULFILLMENT OF THE GRANT OBJECTIVES

A. IMPROVING ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL WELL-BEING OF THE POOR IN ZIMBABWE

The project document defines the grant's goals as the improvement of the standard of living among communities who benefit from the work of trained literacy teachers. At the time of the mid-term formative evaluation, ALOZ had not been able to make much progress in gathering data to assess the effectiveness of its programs. The Evaluation/Publications Officer hired for this purpose had resigned and work had to begin again virtually from scratch. A new Evaluation Officer was hired in July 1983 and since the time of the mid-term formative evaluation, ALOZ had been able to undertake a six month study to evaluate the benefits of literacy training using a sample of six literacy classes. One hundred and two literacy students took part in the study. Environmental factors affecting each of the classes, along with significant events occurring within each class were described. This information was used in the impact study. The study investigated the participation of adult learners in income-generating projects, savings clubs or other community activities. It also explained how learners applied their literacy and numeracy skills and other effects of the program as identified by student, spouses and other knowledgeable sources.

Briefly, the findings of the study may be outlined as follows:

1. It was found that students definitely increased their involvement in income-generating activities during the first six months of the literacy program. The study cautions, however, that other factors in addition to the literacy classes, such as the involvement of development workers, contributed to the increased involvement.
2. Although ALOZ teachers are trained and encouraged to start savings clubs whenever possible, the study found that the number of students joining savings clubs during the first six months of the literacy program was small.
3. The study found that there was a significant increase in the number of students involved in community organizations particularly cultural and recreational groups or clubs. The study suggests that as students gain self-confidence and meet more people through involvement in the literacy classes, their social roles may change and broaden.
4. With regard to the use of literacy and numeracy skills, the study found that a significant number of learners involved in income-generating activities were using these skills. Students reported being able to count their change when shopping and read simple written materials in Shona. Some could also calculate the cost of purchases and write letters.

5. The study also reported a number of other outcomes of the literacy classes. These included positive changes in family relationships, care of the home and family, work competence, and participation in community life.

Thus, the study done by ALOZ indicated that the standard of living among the adult learners improved in a number of measurable ways. The visits by the summative evaluation team support the conclusions of the ALOZ study.

B. OBJECTIVE ONE: EXPANDING THE ABSOLUTE AND RELATIVE NUMBERS OF FUNCTIONALLY LITERATE ADULTS, PARTICULARLY WOMEN

ALOZ set itself the ambitious objective of increasing the number of functionally literate adults by 46,000 during the two year project period. Of these, at least 70% were to be women.

It is not possible to obtain precise data on the number of students who have become literate through ALOZ-trained teachers during the grant period. While teachers are urged to submit enrollment reports to ALOZ, there is no way to force them to comply since they are not employees of ALOZ. ALOZ has estimated the number of students enrolled during the life of the grant as 32,236. This estimate was calculated as follows:

1. IN 1981/82 there were 259 teachers operating. Eighty six new teachers were trained, of which approximately 50 began teaching. This would make a total of 309 teachers in operation for the grant's first year.

2. In 1982/83, allowing for a dropout rate of approximately 25% of the total number of teachers operating or trained the previous year (345), the number of active teachers would again be estimated at 259. Another 86 were trained of which approximately 50 began actually teaching, bringing the estimated number of teachers in operation to 309 for the second year of the grant.

3. In 1983, 92 teachers, or about 30%, submitted enrollment figure. These indicated an average enrollment of 52 students per teacher, including all classes at all stages. Extrapolating this information based on the number of teachers estimated to be operating, ALOZ concluded the following:

1981/82 309 teachers with an average of	
52 students =	16,068
1982/83 309 teachers with an average of	
52 students+ =	<u>16,068</u>
Total student enrollment	<u>32,236</u>

This estimate indicate that ALOZ fell short of the original goal of increasing the number of functionally literate adults by 46,000. However, these figures must be taken with caution and are likely to overestimate the number of students. A number of the assumptions are questionable. For example, it is assumed that the 70% of the teachers who failed to submit reports are teaching on as large a scale as the 30% who did. Since those who reported selected themselves, there is a more than equal change that the teachers who failed to reply are less successful. Another problematic point in the calculation is that a certain portion of the students are counted in the estimates twice. Those who were in Stage I in 1981/82 would be the same students as those reported in State 2 in 1982/83. This may not have produced a serious discrepancy, however, since ALOZ estimates that 78% of its students dropout after Stage I. A final note of caution should be mentioned. At the time of the Phase I evaluation the supervisors had records of only 240 active teachers, considerably short of the 309 used to project the student enrollments.

In a situation such as this, where ALOZ has, little control over its source of data, accurate information is virtually impossible to obtain. Therefore, it is more instructive to turn to the causes for the significant shortfall in student enrollment.

The primary reason was the the number of teachers in operation during the two-year grant period fell far short of what ALOZ had anticipated. If each teacher had an average of 52 students, in order to meet the targets of the proposal, more than 440 teachers would have had to be functioning both years. The proposal bid, in fact, project that by March of 1983, 443 teachers would be in operation. This target, however, provided to be unrealistic. First, the number of teachers trained was considerably less than the 250 predicted for the two-year grant period. ALOZ reported that 189 teachers had either completed training or were in training by the time of the evaluation. Secondly, the dropout rate among trained teachers was considerably higher than anticipated. Of the 172 teachers who had completed training 59, or 34% were not working at the time of the evaluation.

One of the assumptions in the original grant proposal which lay behind the objective of enrolling 46,000 adults was that sponsors would continue to support literacy teachers. As it turned out, sponsors were less willing than expected to invest in literacy programs. The grant document was signed at a time of great optimism in the country. The war of independence had recently been brought to a successful conclusion and everyone was optimistic about the future. The economy was experiencing rapid growth. ALOZ has suggested the following reasons for the reticence of sponsors to initiate programs during the 1981 to 1983 period.

1. the increasing cost of living and the financial recession;

2. two consecutive years of drought which put literacy at a lower priority relative to more important survival needs;
3. the inauguration of the National Literacy Campaign which uses volunteer teachers.

In the sample of 19 sponsors interviewed by the evaluation team, the problem that was most often cited was financial constraints. A sizeable number of sponsors suspended classes because they could no longer afford to pay teacher salaries.

Regarding the objective of enrolling at least 70% women in the classes, a 1982 study by ALOZ showed that 78% of the students were women. In the small sample of 57 students interviewed by the evaluation team 46, or 81%, were women. It would seem from this evidence that this objective was likely to be realized.

In addition to these numerical indicators, the evaluation team tried to assess some of the qualitative indicators of progress which were also suggested in the grant document. In interviews with 57 adult learners (almost all of them in State 1) 35 teachers (all teaching State 1 classes), and 19 sponsors, the team tried to discover how the learners were using their literacy and numeracy skills and what other benefits they might be deriving from the program. Any conclusions from such a small sample must necessarily be tentative, but trends can be suggested. For the purpose of this analysis, the responses to the open-ended questions have been divided into attitudinal changes and behavioral changes. The behavioral changes have been broken down into communications skills, family like skills, and functional skills.

Among the attitudinal changes cited by sponsors, changes in enthusiasm or motivation were mentioned most frequently, followed by changes in confidence or self-reliance. Sponsors also reported involvement in the clubs and community life. Like sponsors, almost a third of the teachers also cited growth of confidence or self-reliance as an outcome of participation in the program. Attitudinal changes were rarely mentioned, however, by the students themselves. This might indicate a lack of conscious awareness on their part of the importance of attitudinal changes. With regard to communication skills, sponsors most often cited ways in which learners were using their ability to read and write. Most frequently mentioned was the ability to read various kinds of instructions such as safety posters in industrial setting, notices, manuals, fertilizer bags, or recipes. The ability to read and write letters was also noted. But a number of the sponsors also mentioned that learners could now express themselves better, either in their native tongue, or in English. Applications of reading and writing were also frequently mentioned by the teachers.

Almost all of the students, when asked how the classes had benefited them, mentioned aspects of reading and writing. In many cases, learners mentioned that they could now travel in urban areas without getting lost. They could read street names bus directions, house numbers, and so forth. Others mentioned that they could now read recipes, notices, their husbands' mail and similar things.

With regard to family like skills sponsors most frequently mentioned that learners could now budget, plan their shopping and save money. Other changes reported by sponsors were an improved standard of living at home, better relationships between learners and their spouses, and cleanliness. Teachers most frequently mentioned better care of children, followed by cleanliness, and improved relationship with spouses. Students most often emphasized the ability to calculate prices and count change. Saving money and budgeting were also mentioned, as was knowledge of sewing, child care, homekeeping and nutrition.

Amount the functional benefits of the program a majority of the sponsors interviewed mentioned things that they felt would be useful on the job or for earning more money. In several cases, these skills were associated with projects and included such abilities as counting, measuring, following instructions, and communicating. Many of the sponsors also reported that students had advanced to the next literacy stage or enrolled in other training programs. They gave this as evidence that the learners were motivated to upgrade their skills.

Although these findings are based on a very small sample, they tend to corroborate the conclusions cited earlier in the six-month impact study conducted by ALOZ. Increased confidence or self-reliance was often cited as a project outcome and the variety of ways in which literacy skills are being used shows they are being applied to the solutions of everyday problems. The mention of family like skills such as improved relationships with spouses, better homemaking and childcare practices show that many aspects of functional literacy are being addressed.

C. OBJECTIVE TWO: PROJECT ACTIVITIES

Over the grant period 150 development activities initiated by learning groups were to be created. ALOZ does not have a complete and up-to-date inventory of project activities.

The team did visit 28 ALOZ sites and found flourishing project activities at most of them. While the greatest part of this activity is at a very basic level, we found, it to be enthusiastically supported by the newly literate and to be important to community and family life.

Regarding types of project activities, it is probably better to describe them as "clubs" or voluntary group activities which include gardening, sewing and knitting, baking, poultry-raising, sports, crafts, brickmaking, pottery, and others. Where projects are well developed and products are produced for sale, members sometimes form a savings club and income is put away - most often for a Christmas party or some other special occasion to be shared by the literacy class.

The evaluation team found projects to be very popular with the adult learners and closely paralleled their concerns and aspirations for a better life. They had by-and-large little to do with the literacy training per se. Rather, they offered valuable opportunities to form new social networks, new horizontal mutual support networks to practice and to develop new social skills, and to improve family well-being.

It must be kept in mind that these students are for the most part desperately poor. As illiterates they suffer social marginality with little hope of self improvement or betterment of their socio-economic status. With improving literacy skills and the promise of greater self realization, individual students can use clubs to meet some of their new expectations for a better life. Making class uniforms and knitting baby clothes, and taking home baked goods for the family are important manifestations of better family life, more so, perhaps, than savings accounts.

Another important factor supporting projects is help from community and religious organizations operating in concert with the ALOZ classes. This overlap is important for it frequently helps to supply additional trained leadership, equipment, such as ovens or sewing machines not available from ALOZ, and a link-up with related project/club activities, often at a more advanced level and in a wider community context.

Factors inhibiting project/club activity were also observed from site visits. ALOZ classes without projects were found most often in large-scale commercial agriculture, in mining, and in the textile and steel industries. In commercial farms, classes operated in isolated settings where students frequently had to interrupt their studies to pick crops. While basic needs of these students may be pressing, related community support systems are lacking. In the classes sponsored in mining and textile companies, the students were largely adult men who sought literacy primarily for improved job mobility, and much less to help improve social and domestic conditions. Thus, group projects were not viewed as important to the attainment of these individual goals.

The nation-wide drought currently in its third year, has severely limited the number of gardening projects. Local authorities have prohibited use of water by gardening clubs.

The evaluation team believes that ALOZ should continue its emphasis on development projects and concentrate on those activities that the adult learners themselves view as most rewarding and essential. We also recommend that ALOZ attempt to collaborate when possible with local government authorities and other welfare agencies.

D. OBJECTIVE THREE: TRAINING LITERACY TEACHERS

The grant document specified that during the two-year project period 250 new sponsored teachers would be trained and 250 teachers would attend refresher courses. Part B of this section has already discussed the reasons why only 189 teachers completed training or were in training by the end of the grant period.

Only 176 teachers attended refresher courses during the grant period. Refresher courses, lasting one week each, introduced teachers to the new psycho-social methods that ALOZ developed. It became apparent, however, that development of the new primers would be considerably delayed, and 20 refresher courses were temporarily suspended.

In addition to examining the quantitative indicators of number of teachers trained or retrained, the evaluation team examined in the training program of ALOZ which were design to improve its relevancy to the adult learner and help him/her improve the quality of life. The new ALOZ Animators Guide clearly states the following principles.

1. The experience of the learner is important to the learning process;
2. Literacy should aim at making learners aware of their rights and obligations;
3. Literacy should give power to those who are poor and oppressed; and
4. Literacy should help learners to understand, control and change the world they live in for their own benefit.

The principles are derived from the Freireian methodology based on creating critical consciousness. For ALOZ this represents a radical re-orientation from a highly instructional program with strong emphasis on literacy techniques to a conscientization program that continues to place a strong emphasis on literacy.

To become better acquainted with this new approach, members of ALOZ staff travelled to Kenya to observe and exchange ideas with a conscientizing program there. Also workshops in the psycho-social methods were organized for ALOZ staff. Furthermore, staff attended a workshop on group discussion and group dynamics facilitated by a

Mr. Hart from the United States brought to Zimbabwe specifically for this purpose.

The course content for training literacy teachers was expanded to include: handling of trust and acceptance, soliciting participants' expectations, importance of literacy, and communication skills (listening, member behavior, leadership skills). The principles of the psycho-social method and how to use picture codes were also taught.

In addition to changing the underlying philosophy, introducing the psycho-social method and expanding the course content, ALOZ also stepped up its project activity. ALOZ values projects because they help learners to retain their literacy skills and also contribute to the quality of their lives. Literacy teachers going to work with community groups are given 4 weeks of training on income-generating projects.

In several discussions with ALOZ staff and in observations of the content and design of ALOZ's training program, a certain hesitation about fully using the psycho-social method is sensed. This ambivalence is probably caused by conflict between those who feel literacy is an end in itself and those who regard it as a means to community action and individual consciousness raising. The evaluation team believes it will take time to work out these inherent conflicts and encourages ALOZ to continue on the path upon which it started during the last few years.

E. OBJECTIVE FOUR: SUPERVISION OF LITERACY TEACHERS

The grant document specified that the ratio of supervisors to teachers would improve from 1:42 to 1:26 during the first year and 1:25 during the second year of the project. Five new supervisors were also to be hired.

Five new supervisors were hired and the supervisor teacher ratio for the Northern ALOZ Region as of November, 1983, was 1:18 while in the Southern ALOZ Region it was 1:40. The low supervisor to teacher ratio in the Northern Region may be due to the large drop-out of teachers. Many of the centers closed due to lack of sponsors. The high supervisor to teacher ratio in the Southern Region is partly due to the fact that the five new supervisors were assigned to the Northern Region, and no new supervisors have been hired for the South. This was the result of the security situation in Matabeleland which at present does not permit supervisors to travel freely about the countryside.

F. OBJECTIVE FIVE: INCREASING PUBLICATION OF LITERACY MATERIALS

During the project period five new publications were to be developed under the grant and 90,000 booklets were to be published.

Six new publications were developed during the grant period although not all of them could be printed. The major materials development effort of this two-year period was the writing of two new primers with picture codes and a guidebook to go along with each one. The Ndebele language primer, Asibambaneni, has 32 picture codes. The Shona language primer, Mazano Marairanwa has 26 picture codes. The Shona primer and codes have been published in experimental form and are being used on a limited basis. Both primers and guidebooks are currently under revision. Two other books were also developed and published during the period. The first one, Umbai Hupeny Hwemhuri Yenyu is simple reader dealing with topics of preventive health, nutrition and hygiene. The other book, For Your Safety, was developed for workers in industry who are studying English.

In addition to these six new publications a number of other books were revised and even re-written in order to reflect developments since independence. Ten Shona books and 13 Ndebele books revised during the grant period are now at the Ministry of Education and Culture awaiting approval.

The objective of printing and distributing 90,000 books for new literate was also more than fulfilled. During the grant period 123,931 books were printed and 115,405 were distributed. In spite of this, the supply of books was not able to keep up with the demand.

The establishment of the new ALOE Press as a result of the second grant from USAID (613-0224) will go a long way toward solving future problems of printing and timely distribution. A detailed description of the second grant is contained in Section VI of this report.

The evaluation team also tried to assess the quality of the materials produced by ALOZ. The opinions of teachers who are using them were sought. The views of 35 ALOZ trained teachers who were surveyed are discussed below.

By and large the teachers interviewed were satisfied with the materials published by ALOZ and reported that their students liked them. A number of criticisms were voiced, however, and some of these merit consideration. The discussion of materials is subdivided into four sections: design and illustrations, production and supply, language and content.

1. Design and Illustrations: A number of teachers complained that the illustrations were not clear. This was largely due, however, to the quality of the printing and not to the artwork itself. During the grant period ALOZ inaugurated a system for pre-testing illustrations with appropriate target groups. A current research effort being carried out by ALOZ, has revealed that photographic block outs are more readily perceived than other art forms. However, the line drawings used in ALOZ books are clear and realistic and should not be abandoned. Line drawings can be easily

reproduced whereas photographic block outs depend upon high quality original picture and minimum loss in reproduction.

Concerns were also voiced about printing quality. The readers are generally composed on a typewriter. With the new press, ALOZ will be using a larger type size and cleander layout.

A final concern about the design of the books was that the covers frequently became detached. This comment seemed to refer primarily to the test version of the new Shona primer whih has a stiff cover which does not wrap around the book. ALOZ is aware of the problem and plans to bind the final published version of the book differently.

2. Production and Supply: A number of complaints were heard that orders for books were not filled on time and that supplies were inadequate. This problem was mainly caused by the inadequacy of ALOZ's printing capacity. Another cause for delay was that a great many ALOZ books are being revised and 29 are awaiting approval from the Ministry of Education and Culture. These are problems which should be resolved soon by the new ALOZ press.

A number of teachers as well as sponsors mentioned that ALOZ books were inexpensive and affordable. However an equal number mentioned that they were too expensive. Perceptions as to the price of books were inconsistant and relative. ALOZ predicts, however, that prices will drop with the output from the new press.

3. Language: Most teachers felt the language was appropriate to the level of the learners. In the Chipinge area a few problems were mentioned however, as the people of that area speak a dialect of Shona. ALOZ books are written in standard Shona as are book produced by the government and the Zimbabwe Literacy Bureau. ALOZ frequently consults people at the Department of African Languages at the University about language appropriateness.

A number of complaints were heard that the language of the books was not advanced enough to allow for an easy transition to the formal school system. ALOZ acknowledges that there is a gap between the complexity of their Stage 3 readers (English) and the books that are commercially available. There have been many requests for a Stage 4 course to bridge this gap. ALOZ sees this as a low priority, however, as 78% of its students drop out after Stage 1. Also evening courses are availble through the Ministry of Education and Culture for those who are interested in continuing education. ALOZ is looking into the possibility of producing comics and may want to consider publishing books at a simpler reading level than those available from the Literacy Bureau. Such books would likely be of interest to graduates of the National Literacy Campaign.

A number of concerns were raised with regard to the English material taught in Stage 2 and 3. ALOZ acknowledges that their

English materials are traditional, somewhat out of date, and in need of revision.

4. Content: Most of the teachers felt the content of the books was interesting and relevant to the learner. One problem that was frequently mentioned, however, was that the Stage 1 readers were geared mostly to rural situations and to women. One teacher typified this objection when he voiced the opinion that there should be stories about boxing or football or factory workers, and less about babies and nursing. ALOZ is planning a new primer focussing on men at work. They might also consider an alternate set of work. They might also consider an alternate set of supplementary readers for different target groups.

A number of teachers found the coverage of the numeracy materials inadequate. They felt that learners were not prepared for the level of math they would encounter in Grade 7. ALOZ is in the process of revising its numeracy materials, but not in the direction of the formal school curriculum. The new numeracy materials will be functional and focusing on money, savings, keeping records and other real life issues. ALOZ feels that students wanting a more academic grounding can get this through the night schools.

Some respondents felt the ALOZ stories treated topics too superficially. ALOZ is revising most of its readers to give them more substance. They report the revised additions will inform the learners not only what they should do, but also why. ALOZ has carried out listening surveys in the Harare area to generate many of the topics discussed in the readers. They plan to involve people from the Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Services, the Ministry of Education and Culture, and the trade unions in the development of the new primers for working men. ALOZ materials appear to be well researched, tested and are revised whenever deemed necessary. They meet a high professional standard.

One final comment with regard to material needs to be made. It has been noted earlier that many of the teachers have received training or have attended refresher courses which introduces them to the psycho-social method and the use of picture codes. Yet the new ALOZ materials are not available to these teachers for use in their classes. It was found during the field visits that many teachers in frustration, returned to their old tried-and-true teaching habits awaiting the publication of the new materials before trying the new methods.

At the same time the National Literacy Campaign primers, in both Shona and Ndebele, were readily available. A fairly cursory comparison of the government primer and the new ALOZ primer showed that they deal largely with the same generative themes and often even use the same key words. It would seem that one solution to the problem would have been for ALOZ teachers to be given training in the use of the government primer. The techniques used in class

would be closer to the spirit and philosophy of the new ALOZ primer than what is now occurring, which is by-and-large a return to the old didactic methods. The campaign is only scheduled to last a few years. ALOZ trained teachers could be getting valuable experience by using the campaign materials.

G. OBJECTIVE SIX: STAFF DEVELOPMENT

By the end of the grant period, it was hoped that ALOZ would be managed principally by Black Zimbabweans. The 1983 Management Committee of ALOZ is composed of seven blacks and three whites. The top management of ALOZ's operational staff has only three whites. Hence, the majority of both the committee and the ALOZ staff are blacks.

A black Zimbabwean has not been appointed as director because the Management Committee does not use colour as criteria for hiring. The present director of ALOZ is a white Zimbabwean. The grant emphasis on black leadership misses the point. What is required for ALOZ's survival is leadership that can effectively integrate ALOZ into the new national ideology. Thus skin colour whether white or black is not a crucial issue, the real issue is ideological or philosophical orientation of both the Management Committee and ALOZ senior staff.

No management training per se was carried out during the project period. The one Regional Officer who attended a four day course in junior management is retiring at the end of November. Various members of staff have attended short courses related to improving performance at their jobs. Other members of staff are continuing their university degree or other academic studies.

The hiring of new staff has met with partial success. The Evaluation/Publications Officer resigned after a short stay. It was felt at that time that the functions of evaluation and course development were too much for one officer to handle, so responsibility for materials and course development were vested in a team of two experience trainers, now designated development officers, and three program designers, one a former publications officer, another a former supervisor, and the third a journalist. Five new supervisors were hired during the grant period. However, the second Evaluation Officer has now moved to the post of Regional Officer, leaving the post of evaluator vacant once again.

H. OBJECTIVE SEVEN: IMPROVING THE INFORMATION SYSTEM

ALOZ was to develop an improved feedback system capable of measuring (1) socio-economic gains from literacy education and projects, and (2) information on the aspirations and skills desired by potential literacy class participants. The team found considerable progress towards meeting these two objectives. The most ambitious undertaking was a "process evaluation" of literacy

projects. During 1983, the newly hired Evaluation Officer produced five questionnaires (for spouses, students, teachers, supervisors, and sponsors - see Appendix E). Major areas covered included (1) students perceptions of problems in literacy involvement, (2) changes in personal income, (3) program context and local conditions, (4) development project activity problems and outcomes, (5) recruitment and drop out, and (6) pedagogical effectiveness.

Using a random sample, the Evaluation Officer selected six literacy teachers and four supervisors in six literacy centers. One hundred and thirty nine adult literacy students were also selected to complete a 12 page "Log Book" (in Shona) over a four week period. Questions included among others, the following:

"What new things did you learn this week?"

"What problems did we meet in our learning?"

"What did we do to solve these problems?"

"What helped us to learn during the week?"

"What would you like to learn that will help you in your day-to-day life?"

During the past half year, information from this process evaluation was selectively used in both the refresher courses and in project development and management. The bulk of the data has been tabulated and compiled, but it has not yet been analyzed and put into readily useable form. With the ALOZ Evaluation Officer recently promoted to Regional Officer, it is not clear who will analyze the tabulated data and when this will take place.

Since the process evaluation project ended, ALOZ supervisors continue to supply monitoring data on a regular basis. Information on projects especially has been used in setting new targets and making changes in this area. When the data analysis is completed ALOZ expects that supervisors will sit down together and adjust operations using information from the "process evaluation" system now in place.

ALOZ staff readily admit that efforts to create a better information system followed in large part from the USAID grant requirements. In this process, they claim to have become better aware of the value that process evaluation offers for improved internal efficiency. Everything the team saw tended to support this claim.

VI. THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ALOZ AND THE NATIONAL LITERACY CAMPAIGN

ALOZ has been represented on many of the working groups organized to get the National Literacy Campaign initiated. Together with the Catholic Commission for Social Service and Development, it was invited by the Ministry of Education to serve on the Subcommittee that did preliminary planning for the campaign. After that, several members of the ALOZ staff worked on a five-month exercise with the Ministry of Education to prepare the Ndebele and Shona primers. The next stage was the participation in the training of District Literacy Coordinators (DLC's) in Harare along with other non-governmental organizations involved in literacy. Other training events mounted by the Ministry of Education were also attended by ALOZ. They include the writers' workshop, regional seminars with DLC's, and refresher training for DLC's. ALOZ is also a member of the Directorate of the National Literacy Campaign under the auspices of the Ministry of Community Development and Women's Affairs.

VII. FORMATIVE EVALUATION OF THE ALOE PRESS

A. GENERAL OBSERVATIONS

The first USAID Operational Program Grant to ALOZ (No. 613-0220) included as one of its outputs "an increase in publication of literacy materials". The formative evaluation team, in September 1982, found that although ALOZ was rapidly expanding the total number of publications it produced, it was unable to keep up with demand. During the formative evaluation period, a graphic arts production consultant conducted an assessment of the ALOZ printing operations. His report pointed out that the books, especially, the primers, were printed in a type that was too small for beginning readers. Also, the print was often of poor quality, due to poor inking in the printing process. At that time, ALOZ equipment consisted of a Gesterner 318, a direct image print maker, and two mimeograph machines. The annual demand was estimated to be one million impressions of 8" x 12" units. As of September 1982, the out of stock backlog was 969,000 units suggesting that ALOZ was only meeting 50 percent of its demand.

The consultant recommended that ALOZ move away from using office duplicating equipment to establish a printshop with modern print equipment to improve the efficiency and quality of its printing operation. The consultant estimated that the press should be capable of producing an average of 2,500 units of 8 1/2" x 11" per hour or some 20 million units per year. Also, he suggested that the printshop be established either as subsidiary of ALOZ or as a cooperative.

Shortly after the graphic arts consultant completed his report, ALOZ submitted a request to USAID for funding for a printshop. ALOZ specified that it wanted to obtain equipment for

which maintenance, repair and parts could be provided by local firms. Subsequently and Operational Program Grant (No. 613-0224) for US\$300,000 was approved by the USAID/Director and the Grant Agreement signed November 16, 1982. The Grant is effective through December 31, 1984.

The printshop, named ALOE Press, began functioning in early October 1983, one month prior to initiating this evaluation. The evaluation team has focused on difficulties and achievements to date and on weaknesses which ought to be rectified so that the printshop evolves this coming year on a sound basis which will allow it to achieve the aim and intent of the grant.

B. PROGRESS IN MEETING PROJECT GOALS

1. OBJECTIVE ONE INCREASE THE AVAILABILITY OF SIMPLIFIED AND RELEVANT READING MATERIALS FOR NEW LITERATES

Documents concerning the project explicitly state that the aim of the grant includes literacy materials, that is materials used in teaching and learning literacy, not just materials for new literates. Also, the documents show that the intent was to make available low-cost and high-quality printing services to government agencies and to non-government organizations or volunteer organizations as well as to meet ALOZ demand for printed materials.

Although not specified in various project documents, the evaluation team concluded that the project purpose statement ought to be more broadly interpreted to cover educational, motivational and development-oriented materials for low-level readers and supportive aids, such as materials for teachers and extension workers. We believe that this falls within the original intent of the project, and is needed at this stage of Zimbabwe's development. Rural and town dwellers have little access to relevant and inspiring reading materials. Also, government and other agencies are undertaking many types of development activities to redress the great imbalances under previous governments, and some of these activities could use ALOE Press services. Further, for ALOE Press to be self-financing it needs to have a broader range of potential clients, without having to rely too heavily on commercial customers.

RECOMMENDATION

USAID and ALOZ agree in writing that the project purpose be interpreted to cover educational, motivational and development oriented materials for low level readers, and supportive aids.

2. OBJECTIVE TWO: ELIMINATION OF THE 50% SUBSIDY ON MATERIALS SOLD BY ALOZ:

Under ALOZ's former publications system, it provided a subsidy on books in order to make them more accessible to students and

teachers. For example, in 1982 it cost ALOZ approximately Z\$.50 per book to produce 5,000 copies of a 36-page book. This same book was sold for half the actual cost.

A new price list for ALOZ materials was issued in May 1983. It reflects the actual cost of the seven books which had to be printed commercially in Marh-April 1983 because ALOE Press equipment had not arrived and the small Gestetner printer needed parts not available in Zimbabwe. The May price list for Shona material reflected substantial price increases for many books. Although the cost of some books doubled, none of the student books cost over Z\$1.00.

To date no ALOZ materials printed by ALOE Press are being sold. The Press is in the process of printing and binding five books for ALOZ. The Press Manager estimated that the cost of 36 page book, with a press run of 5,000 copies or less, will be Z\$.23. Thus, it is likely that the more efficient printing system will facilitate making ALOZ books accessible to student and teachers at price similar to those in fact prior to the May 1983 price increases, but without a subsidy. Moreover, students and teachers will receive higher quality printed materials.

RECOMMENDATIONS

ALOZ should revise its price list, a least at six month intervals as its materials printed by ALOE Press become available. ALOZ should also inform teachers and their sponsors of the reasons for these periodic revisions.

3. OBJECTIVE THREE: EFFICIENT PRODUCTION OF BOOKS AND OTHER READING MATERIALS FOR NEW LITERATES CAPABLE OF MEETING ESTIMATED DEMAND FOR SUCH

The evaluation team believes that ALOZ should seek ways to increase its market for books. It is unlikely that the demand for ALOZ materials will be as high as the original projection of 18 million impressions. The number of new teachers will be significantly lower than the 750 anticipated by 1985.

By the end of the project (December 31, 1984), ALOZ will probably have some 525 teachers ordering books. With this number of teachers the effective for ALOZ books will have doubled during the life of project rather than tripled.

The anticipated use of the Press services by the National Literacy Campaign, under the Government of Zimbabwe has not materialized. Nor have other branches of GOZ and non-governmental organizations or voluntary groups used ALOE service for production of educational or development oriented materials. Therefore, special attention needs to be given during the forthcoming critical months to building up this potential market.

Under its current pricing system, ALOE Press appears to charge very attractive prices in comparison with most other printshops. For example cost comparisons of 3,000 copies of one 36 page book revealed that ALOE Press, with a 10% mark-up was 30% below the cost of commercial printers.

ALOE should, therefore, examine its distribution system to provide simple reading materials for post-literacy student. Such a system for with spread distribution of simple, low cost reading materials has yet to be established in Zimbabwe.

ALOE, through its network of teachers and current distribution system, is in an advantageous position of reaching new literates in rural areas and towns. Presently ALOE teachers have book order forms which they submit to ALOE, and then ALOE sends the books to the teachers for distribution to students. ALOE could make order forms and possibly sample copies of books available to teachers who would in turn publicize to students and other community members the availability of these books, take orders, and forward these with payment at the same time they submit their normal orders for class materials. An alternative would be the use of individual mail order forms distributed by teachers but returned separately; this is likely to involve the customer in cumbersome arrangements for transmittal of payment and involve an extra cost due to handling and postage.

RECOMMENDATIONS

ALOE should seek additional markets for its books.

4. OBJECTIVE FOUR ESTABLISHMENT OF A FULL EQUIPPED AND OPERATIONAL NON-PROFIT PRINTSHOP CAPABLE OF FINANCING ITS OPERATION THROUGH INCOME EARNED FROM THE SALE OF ITS MATERIALS

ALOE Press has filed papers to be registered as a non-profit company under the Company's Act.

D. COSTING AND PRICING METHODS

The following review of how ALOE Press establishes unit costs, how it sets prices and some record keeping practices should be regarded as an initial assessment. The Price Waterhouse report which will be available at the end of November, 1983, will present a more detailed account as well as provide a baseline for the 1984 audit and the 1984 summative evaluation. Both the Price Waterhouse accountant and the ALOE Press Manager provided information for this initial assessment. Before proceeding to costs and prices, it may be helpful to note that delays in procuring all the essential printing equipment resulted in ALOE Press commencing operation about the first of October 1983 instead of June as originally planned.

As of this evaluation, the Press had been in operation five weeks. ALOE Press had on order, in process, or completed, some 32 printing jobs. The first five jobs were forms required by the printshop. The distribution of this work and the income generated is contained in Figure I. In addition, 12 typesetting jobs were completed. ALOE Press was not involved in the printing of these jobs.

Figure I
ALOE's Production, October 1 - November 7, 1983

<u>Number of Jobs Requested by</u>		<u>Total Invoiced</u>
ALOZ	= 5	\$4,550
Welfare	= 12	
Commercial	= 10	<u>\$3,650</u>
	Income To Press	<u>\$8,200</u>

While most all this work was in the private sector, the press currently has a number of large jobs for government under consideration. Included in the commercial category are 4 jobs for printing forms for the City of Harare.

As may be seen in Appendix A. 1-3, the Press follows set procedures in costing each printing job. These include computing labor costs, material costs and fixed costs including depreciation. This process provides "overhead" costs that when combined with labor costs, make it possible to ascertain specific costs for required labor materials inputs into a job estimate (See Appendix A. 4 and A. 5). A comparison with estimated costs per function for local commercial printers is also included and indicates something of the press's considerable cost advantage.

Examination of these procedures raises several questions. One is the seemingly incomplete specification of or accounting for fixed costs such as plant maintenance and cleaning and annual audit. A second concerns depreciation. While a depreciation cost per hour i.e., \$1.70 has been computed by Price Waterhouse, Schedule No.1 does not have the basis for this computation. It appears that depreciation of printing equipment is figured on a fixed installment or straight line method over a 10 year period. It is not known, however, if all equipment is included. While 10 years may be a reasonable period to write off the heavy machinery, a good deal of the small more complex equipment might well be amortized over a shorter period, thus increasing depreciation costs.

This raised a third issue - i.e., the Press' near complete focus on cost accounting and batch pricing, and the seeming absence of financial accounting with attention to periodic balance sheet positions, to determination of profits, but not necessarily to how and where profit arose. With this emphasis on cost accounting, the

compositon of cost and the sources of profit, the press must periodically revise direct and indirect costs and corresponding overheads. With inflation currently running about 20% annually in Zimbabwe this might best be done on a quarterly basis. GOZ efforts to bring up lower labor rates must also be taken into account.

Policy on mark-up and final prices is determined by the ALOZ Management Committee and Printshop Subcommittee; as illustrated in Appendices D.5, 6, 7, and 8. Current practice fixes the following mark-up after production cost per unit as follows:

1. ALOZ jobs	5%	added
2. Welfare and Development Groups	10%	added
3. "Social Consciousness raising groups" (i.e. Lions, Wildlife Federation et al)	15%	added
4. Commercial Jobs	25%	added

Prior to this evaluation, no policy has been set by the Management Subcommittee on the mark-up for the Government of Zimbabwe. During the evaluation, the Press Manager stated that materials for the GOZ literacy campaign should probably receive the same mark-up rate as ALOZ jobs. The evaluation team agrees. The team also suggests that development of educational materials should fall in the 10-15% categories and logistical materials such as forms should be priced at the commercial rate. Thus, the mark-up should take into account not only for whom the work is done but also the target population and type of job being printed.

RECOMMENDATION

The Management Subcommittee ought to immediately establish a pricing policy on different categories of jobs for the GOZ, including local government agencies and educational institutions, and for parastatals.

Even with a 25% commercial mark-up several camparisons of prices charged by other printers indicated that the Press was highly competitive. An 80 page National Literacy Campaign primer could, for example, be printed by ALOE Press at \$.36 a unit if the MOE supplied them the paper and board. If the Press supplied these items the price would be \$.54c each. The commercial press charges \$1.50 each.

The AID grant has provided advanced state-of the-art printing equipment which will enable ALOE Press to offer a better product at a lower unit cost to ALOZ, other welfare groups, and the Government which have paid high commercial rates in the past or gone without such services. The temptation to favor the more profitable

commercial market at the expense of the welfare and public sectors, however, must be a constant concern if the promise of the Press and the AID grant are to be realized in the years ahead.

In concluding this section, it is noted that the Press has instituted sound cost accounting practices and undergoes an annual audit. It has strong competitive advantage over other printshops with less efficient equipment. While this price advantage is real, it may prove to be somewhat less than presently thought if recurring costs are more accurately computed and overheads are, accordingly, adjusted upward.

RECOMMENDATION

A financial analysis of cost and income, should be financed by AID, with the aim of reviewing and making recommendations on Press charges.

The analysis should include a review of the number of jobs, types of jobs (literacy materials and materials for new literates and supportative guides; educational or development oriented; fund-raising or promotional; and logistical), and customer category for each. This financial analysis should recommend a reasonable limit on commercial jobs. This analysis should take place after April 1984 when ALOE Press will have had a six month record of operations.

E. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATION

In February 1983, following the signing of the AID Grant Agreement, and the recruitment and hiring of the Printshop Manager, the ALOZ Management Committee agreed that a Printshop Subcommittee should be formed to take responsibility for overseeing the establishment of the printshop. The committee was to address such issues as: the control structure, printshop functions, cost procedures, and the ALOZ Director's relationship to the printshop.

During this formative stage, the Press is in great need of guidance and monitoring in establishing policy, setting guidelines, and in making itself known to its prospective and desired clientele. As it stands now, despite the formation of the Management Subcommittee, there is not yet in place any structured mechanism for decision-making. The organization chart proposed (see Appendix D.8) does not reflect the current decision-making process. The Printshop Manager has been making some non-technical decisions on his own, decisions that should be made in conjunction with the Printshop Subcommittee and Director of ALOZ.

No clear terms of reference have been developed which outline the discrete responsibilities of the Management Subcommittee and its relationship to the Manager of the printshop and to the Director of ALOZ. Individual interviews with the Management Subcommittee

members, and the Manager of the printshop and ALOZ Director revealed in each case divergent views and perceptions of the responsibility of the office they hold and who has final say with regard to the policy and operation of the printshop. There was general agreement, however, that the Printshop Manager has full responsibility and qualifications for the technical aspects of running the shop. Compounding this problem is the failure of the Subcommittee to maintain minutes of its meetings. There is no record of when they were held, and what specific decisions were reached.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is absolutely essential that questions regarding the management of ALOE Press be resolved immediately.

The team's recommendations for the management of ALOE Press are as follows:

1. The Chairman of the Subcommittee should receive all concerns of the Printshop Manager, call for full Subcommittee meetings and inform the ALOZ Director of all issues and decisions. The Printshop Manager will send copies of his quarterly reports to the Subcommittee and the Director of ALOZ.
2. Terms of reference be developed for, and distributed to the Subcommittee by the Management Committee, one that would incorporate the following scope of responsibility:
 - Printshop policy and costing
 - Criteria for selecting and prioritizing jobs
 - Monitoring the establishment of a sound financial management system including proper accounting procedures and records managements
 - Staff hiring, dismissals and grievance (There is at present no grievance procedures for printshop employees. The Subcommittee should develop and distribute such procedure to all printshop staff and to the Director of ALOZ).

The Printshop Subcommittee should act as a liaison between the Printshop Manager and the office of the Director at ALOZ, who should, in turn report to the Management Committee. The Director and Deputy Director of ALOZ should continue to serve in an advisory capacity to the printshop.

3. That meetings of the Submcommittee should be held monthly prior to the Management Committee meetings. The chairman of the Subcommittee should inform all members of the meeting date. Minutes of the meeting should be taken,

typed and distributed to all members, the Printshop Manager and the Director of ALOZ in accordance with the regulations set forth in the amended Companies Act of 1951. A record of all meetings should be placed in the printshop files.

There were eight positions budgeted for in Annex A. of the Grant Agreement. These are presented below:

<u>Personnel</u>	<u>Salaries (per annum)</u>
Manager of Printshop	\$26,000
Printer/Make-up and Camera	\$15,000
Printer/Camera	\$15,600
Typesetter	\$14,000
Binder 1	6,500
Binder 2	\$ 6,500
Bookkeeper	\$ 8,400
Guillotine Operator	\$ 5,000

The table below indicates personnel hired as of the evaluation, their respective salaries, and start dates. The actual salaries are significantly lower than those projected in the Agreement due mainly to the impact of the Zimbabwe devaluation in late 1982. The USAID grant was denominated in US dollar reflecting an exchange rate of US1.30 = Z\$1.00.

<u>Position</u>	<u>Start Date</u>	<u>Actual</u>
Salary (yearly)		
Manager of Printshop	1/83	\$16,700
Printer	10/83	8,250
Artist/Apprentice		5,925
Typesetter (1/2 Time)	7/83	6,250
General Hand 1	7/83	2,400
General Hand 2	7/83	2,400
Admin. Officer	6/83	10,110
Guillotine Operator	10/83	7,05
General Hand	6/83	1,545

Two of ALOZ's former printing staff were hired in the General Hand 1 and General Hand 2 positions, while the other 2 were absorbed in ALOZ in a different capacity.

The level of sophistication and the uniqueness of the equipment purchased for the printshop combined with the relative dearth of semi-skilled print operators in Zimbabwe made it necessary to provide on-the-job training to most of the personnel hired. Also, because the printshop staff size is very small, the Printshop Manager has always acknowledged the necessity of training each staff member to perform one other job in addition to the one for which he or she was hired. This has the advantage of ensuring the full operation of the shop in the absence of any one person. In

addition, it means that persons will have the opportunity to learn another marketable skill.

Staff interviews carried out as part of the evaluation confirmed that all staff members were indeed being trained in new areas and satisfied with the training they were receiving. Taking into account the fact that the printshop has been operational for little over one month, the workload has been a bit slow. Almost all staff expressed a strong desire for more intensified training as jobs began to come in. Some printshop staff voiced a desire to visit some of the adult literacy sites in order to appreciate their role within the larger scope of the work of ALOZ.

As of November 1983, the Manager of the printshop, in addition to his technical responsibilities, was responsible for bringing business to ALOE Press. The shop has produced leaflets that are being distributed around town and they are in the process of developing a brochure of the Press's typesetting capability. A few jobs have been undertaken for welfare organizations and the Printshop Manager contacts with relevant government ministries and parastatals have been nearly non-existent. Since the Printshop Manager does not see the contacts, particularly with government ministries, as his responsibility, at this point no one has assumed this crucial responsibility. This could have serious implications for the future viability and self-sufficiency of the printshop, and its achievement of the purpose and intent of the project.

It will become necessary in the near future and as soon as it is financially feasible, to bring on an individual to act as an assistant to the Printshop Manager. This person should be capable of acting as the financial manager for the shop plus have the personality, the contacts and the savvy to handle all public relations with government, parastatal and welfare organizations.

The original OPG to ALOZ gave recognition to the racial balance achieved in the hiring of personnel but recommended that the organization pay closer attention to the relatively low numbers of black Zimbabweans hired in higher level positions. In a review of the personnel recruitment and hiring procedures utilized by the printshop and in staff interviews, we found that while in all but two cases jobs were advertised and persons interviewed by at least two persons, the actual persons hired, especially for more highly specialized positions, are whites (and in at least two cases, non-Zimbabweans) who were known personally by either the Printshop Manager or the Director of ALOZ.

A perusal of personnel files and the file containing the letter from applicants responding to advertised job vacancies raises some concern about the criteria utilized in selecting a couple of the staff. One of these people, the artist, has entered into an extended probationary period and his progress was being closely monitored by the Printshop Manager and the ALOZ Director. It is

very likely that he will be replaced in the near future. Though such scrutiny of the performance of even acquaintances that are hired is to be lauded, management should remain aware of the morale problem that could develop once such hiring practices become common knowledge.

RECOMMENDATIONS

We recommend the following actions be taken as soon as possible:

1. The the AID Grant agreement be amended and funding be found in order that ALOE Press may hire a full-time person to act as Finance Manager and to handle all public relations and business contacts with the government ministries, parastatals, welfare and church organizations and others in the NGO community. The person to be sought should, first and foremost, have the contacts, personality, savvy and desire to interface with these important potential clientele for ALOE. He or she should have the background and experience that would enable him or her to properly manage the finances of ALOE. Ability to converse in Shona and Ndebele would be preferred and any technical experience in the printing field would be welcomed though not required.

2. That while steps are being taken to fulfill (1) AID find a means of financing a short-term (six months or less) local finance. Specifically, he or she will begin to form relationships between ALOE and its prospective clientele.

3. That complete job descriptions be drawn up for each employee of the printshop, and approved by the printshop subcommittee, the Printshop Manager and ALOZ Director. The Printshop Manager should then discuss them with each employee who if, in agreement, will sign them. They should then be placed in the individual personnel files.

F. STAFF TRAINING

As regards staff training concerns, the Printshop Manager has expressed his intention to train each staff member, in at least one other area. This training becomes crucial in a small shop where the absence of one machine operator could conceivably close down the entire operation, resulting in a loss of time and money. It became clear in discussions with the Manager that he has not seriously considered the need for such flexibility in the case of the typesetter. The person hired is working only part-time on equipment which is available in only one other shop in Zimbabwe. An individual had to come in from Johannesburg to provide training for her on the equipment.

While the part-time hours are suitable for the person currently in the position they are likely to be unsuitable for the printshop business. The typesetter also expressed her concerns about being the only one on the staff who has the training to operate the equipment, which is critical to the ALOZ and the Press. It is also a money-earner on its own since there are instances where a customer would come to ALOE requesting typesetting work only.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That one member of the ALOZ secretarial staff receive training in the use of the typesetter so that there will be a back-up person for the present Typesetter, filling in at the times when she is not there.
2. That steps be continually and systematically taken by the Printshop Manager to ensure that all staff are trained in at least two areas as planned.
3. That periodic reviews of printshop staff salaries be undertaken so that appropriate adjustments can be made in line with their higher level skill acquisition.

Concerns were raised about the lack of the smooth running financial information system that would permit the person responsible for bookkeeping to make expenditure projections. These projections would also facilitate an organized and systematic procedure for applying for project funds under the USAID grant. The responsibility rests ultimately with the Printshop Manager who has delegated it to this Administrative Officer. The Administrative Officer was hired admittedly, with no bookkeeping experience but has begun receiving training from the ALOZ Finance Officer with some assistance from the staff of Price Waterhouse who are currently reviewing the books of ALOZ.

RECOMMENDATION

1. That the administrative officer of the Press continue to receive bookkeeping training in accounting procedures. Enrolling in bookkeeping course would probably be adviseable.

Acquiring the necessary film, chemical and typesetting paper has been problematic from the beginning and is a continued source of concern for the Printshop Manager. The products are not stocked in Zimbabwe and apparently, local agents will not take on new customers. There is the option of approaching Kodak and BBC directly for these supplies. We recommend that forward planning be done so that enough supplies can be ordered to meet the projected increase in demand for print services.

F. Summary of Recommendations

<u>Actions</u>	<u>Date (To be Completed)</u>	<u>By Whom</u>
1. USAID and ALOZ agree in writing that project purpose be interpreted to cover educational, motivational and development oriented materials for low level readers and supportive aids.	Feb. 1984	AID/ALOE
2. ALOZ should revise its price list at least at 6 months intervals as materials printed by ALOE become available periodically.		ALOE
3. ALOZ should inform teachers and their sponsors of the reasons for periodic price revisions.	Feb. 1984	ALOE
4. ALOZ should seek more markets for its books.	Ongoing	ALOE
5. ALOZ should investigate the potential of offering a large number of books of low-level readers.	June. 1984	ALOE
6. The Management Subcommittee should establish a pricing policy for different categories of jobs for GOZ, including local government agencies and educational institutions, and for parastatals.	Jan. 1984	ALOE
7. A financial analysis of costs and income of ALOE, should be financed by AID with the aim of reviewing and making recommendations on ALOE changes.	May 1984	AID
8. The organizational chart for the decision-making process be revised.	Jan. 1984	ALOE
9. Terms of Reference be developed for, and distributed to, the Subcommittee by the Management Committee.	Jan. 1984	ALOE

- | | | | |
|-----|---|------------|----------|
| 10. | Meetings of the Subcommittee be held monthly and that proper minutes be taken and distributed. | Ongoing | ALOZ |
| 11. | The AID Grant Agreement be amended and funding sought to hire a full-time Finance Manager and Public Relations person. | Feb. 1984 | AID/ALOZ |
| 12. | AID seek ways of financing a short-term local consultant to handle ALOE public relations as a stop-gap measure while Rec. 11 is in process. | Feb. 1984 | AID/ALOZ |
| 13. | Complete job description be drawn up for each employee of the printshop. | Feb. 1984 | ALOZ |
| 14. | One member of the ALOZ secretarial staff receive training in the use of the Typesetter. | Mar. 1984 | ALOZ |
| 15. | Steps be taken continually and systematically to ensure that all staff are trained in at least two areas as planned. | Mar. 1984 | ALOZ |
| 16. | Training in bookkeeping and accounting procedures be intensified. | Feb. 1984 | ALOZ |
| 17. | All personnel recruitment be carried out as stipulated in the Grant Agreement. | Ongoing | ALOZ |
| 18. | Forward planning be done so that enough supplies can be ordered to meet the projected increase in demand for print services. | Feb. 1984 | ALOZ |
| 19. | Staff be trained in simple service operations. | April 1984 | ALOZ |