

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

1. PROJECT TITLE Population Planning (P. I. D. E.)			2. PROJECT NUMBER 391-11-580-384	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE USAID/Pakistan
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) 391-79-1	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 1973	B. Final Obligation Expected FY 1977	C. Final Input Delivery FY 1978	6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING A. Total \$ 692,000 B. U.S. \$ 630,000	
			7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION From (month/yr.) 2/75 To (month/yr.) 12/78 Date of Evaluation Review 12/3/78	

REGULAR EVALUATION SPECIAL EVALUATION

B. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Determine means to improve timeliness and quality of data provided by others, possibly through improved methodology and/or contracting procedures.	Evaluation Unit of PIDE Population Section.	Continuing
2. Conduct more studies on regional topics and disseminate the results on a regional basis.	PIDE Population Section	Continuing
3. Provide training needs to prospective foreign assistance donors.	PIDE	Continuing
4. Continuing emphasis on the integration of population policies in other sectors and in overall development plans.	PIDE	Continuing

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS	10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper <input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan <input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework <input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____ N.A. (Project Completed)	A. <input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or Change Implementation Plan C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project D. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Completed

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)	12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval
See listing under Item # 14, Evaluation Methodology.	Signature:
	Typed Name: William A. Wolffer
	Date: 12-24-78

13. Summary

The basic aim of the Project Agreement was institution-building, to establish at the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (P. I. D. E.) a formal population section and to provide the necessary resources to enable P. I. D. E. to do population-oriented and policy-relevant research. The Population Section has been established and personnel recruited and trained. The staff is capable of carrying out population impact analysis as well as the traditional technical demographic work designed to establish accurate population statistics. Forty-four useful research studies and a general purpose socio-economic/demographic data set (based on a sample size of 2,500 urban and rural households) have been produced. Evidence of the success of this venture in institution building is that the GOP has taken over full responsibility for the operating budget of the Population Section and has provided adequate funding. Also, P. I. D. E. staff members frequently serve on high-level committees and advise the government on various aspects of population policy and development.

Although the Population Section of P. I. D. E. is fully operational and providing good research, it does have an on-going problem of personnel turnover and external assistance in providing staff training would be helpful on occasion.

14. Evaluation Methodology

This is a regular End-of-Project evaluation in accordance with the Mission Evaluation Plan. Project achievements and problems were examined by the Joint Director of P. I. D. E., a Director from the Population Division of the Ministry of Health (a principal user of the research provided under this project), the Mission's Population and Evaluation Officers, the GOP's Project Director and the USAID Project Manager.

A long term consultant and a short term consultant who previously provided technical assistance wrote papers for this final project evaluation. Inputs were also obtained from (1) official GOP and USAID documents; (2) personal observation by the review participants; and (3) analysis of the activities generated by the project (analyses by GOP and USAID officials in addition to the consultant's papers previously mentioned).

The review participants were:

- (1) Dr. Sultan S. Hashmi, Joint Director, P.I. D. E.
- (2) Dr. Sabiha Syed, Director Survey & Registration, Population Division, Ministry of Health
- (3) Dr. Dorothy N. Glenn, Population Officer, USAID
- (4) Mr. Anthony H. Wirtz, Evaluation Officer, USAID
- (5) Dr. Mohammad Afzal, Project Director and Chief, Population Section, P. I. D. E.
- (6) Mr. Manzoor Hussain, Project Manager, Demographer and Economic Analyst, USAID

15. External Factors

There have been no major changes in the project setting. As for the continuing validity of assumptions, the project has supported the validity of the assumptions that there is sufficient interest in population problems to devote Pakistani resources to their study, and that GOP officials perceive a need for high quality demographic research and analysis. Good quality demographic research and analyses are being conducted and the government has taken over full responsibility for the institute's operating budget (salaries, rent, internal travel, utilities, supplies, communications etc.)

16. Inputs

Following is the summary of the project inputs:

Actual Obligations by USAID - FY 1973 thru 1977 (Dollars)

	<u>Commodities</u>	<u>Contract Services</u>	<u>Participants</u>	<u>Other</u>	<u>Total</u>
Original Obligations	169,000	238,000	59,000	175,000	641,000
Less Deobligations in FY 78	7,000	4,000			11,000
	<u>162,000</u>	<u>234,000</u>			<u>630,000</u>

The Ford Foundation's financial inputs amounting to \$12,284 covered only the overseas travel expenses of the training participants.

In addition to salaries and other personnel related expenses, the Government of Pakistan provided a contribution of Rs.488,400 which was utilized for the general maintenance and operation of the project including printing and routine expenses such as office supplies and utilities with the following breakdown:

Printing/publishing	:	Rs. 10,145
Office supplies and utilities:		<u>Rs. 478,255</u>
Total:		<u>Rs. 488,400</u>

17. Outputs

A. Research Studies

The population research program is well-established. Forty-four research studies (including a monograph of the population of Pakistan presented at World Population Conference) have been produced since the section was created, most of them published in the Pakistan Development Review. (See attachment.) Most of this research is based on analysis of secondary data previously collected, but the Institute has begun to collect and analyze its own data since 1975. Data collection activity is ever expanding: P.I.D.E. staff have recently completed the pilot phase of a long-term project designed to supply policy makers and researchers with a national, general purpose socio-economic/demographic data set based on a sample size of 2,500 urban and rural households. The survey is complete, data punched, clean and ready for analysis.

A qualitative assessment of the research output of the Population Section reveals an uneven quality. Most of the work is first-rate and of immediate utility to the population and development planning

community. Other studies have been either less relevant or of poorer quality. However, it can be concluded that the overall quality of the research has improved with each successive year of the project.

B. Technical Assistance

Further evidence of the impact^{of} the project is that PIDE staff members are frequently called upon by the government to serve on committees and panels and to advise on various aspects of population policy and program development. PIDE staff members served on advisory committees to the Planning Commission to draft the population, manpower, rural development and health chapters of the Fifth Plan. They have served on the Technical Advisory Committee to the Pakistan Fertility Survey, a government undertaking, and they have provided technical advice and assistance in various matters relating to demographic statistics and a population program management information system in recent years. The GOP recognizes P.I.D.E. as a basic source for demographic research.

C. Improved Staff and Facilities

One of the purposes in the project agreement was to hire and train demographers. This has been done but with mixed success. In terms of numbers, six researchers have been or are being trained, all at the masters level. The section now consists of the Chief, two Senior Research Demographers, six staff Demographers, and six staff Associates. Possibly less than half of the existing demographic staff are capable of truly independent research, and few have the necessary computer skills to handle the ever-growing number of large-scale micro data sets. Because of this, communications between researchers and programmers are limited and further training in this area is recommended. The most pressing problem at this time is attracting and keeping senior-level researchers (two of the senior researchers have recently joined international research organizations).

P. I. D. E. 's existing and projected research facilities are more than adequate to support high-quality policy research, and it is currently moving in a direction which may do much to remove another binding constraint on output -- that of a sufficient supply of policy-oriented data.

About 75% of the projected holdings of the Population Library are now in place and the data on Pakistan's population required for the data bank increasingly available in useable form. These facilities are being increasingly used by P.I.D.E. as well as outside researchers, mainly from Government Ministries.

D. Publications

The quarterly journal "The Pakistan Development Review" (suspended since 1971) was restarted in 1973 and is widely circulated on a regular basis.

The first edition of the "Population Research Bulletin" was published in January 1978 and the second is now in preparation. It will continue to appear on a half yearly basis. Its earlier publication was delayed because of complex government regulations.

18. Purpose

The project purpose is threefold:

- To foster a general interest, concern and desire for informed action among government planners and administrators, and among private citizens with regard to measures which could be taken to reduce problems associated with population increase and distribution.
- To stimulate other institutions and private researchers to undertake investigations into the population-related aspects of various sector programs and of GOP policies, laws, and regulations, etc. with the aim of formulating a comprehensive population policy.
- To provide analysis and conceptual framework needed for the inclusion of population considerations in the GOP planning and decision-making process.

As stated in the Project Paper, the "End of Project Status" conditions indicate that the institutional aspects of the purpose have been achieved but the established EOPS conditions do not measure the element of the project purpose which impacts on the project goal,

namely the aim of formulating of a comprehensive population policy, and this is discussed under Item # 19.

The following EOPS conditions concerning institution-building have been achieved:

- Existence of a well-staffed, trained and funded organization carrying out and sponsoring carefully directed research into various broad population issues, including demographic issues.
- Existence of institutionalized permanently established programs to stimulate interest in and awareness of population issues among the literate citizens of Pakistan.
- Existence of a continuing relationship between government planners and administrators and P. I. D. E. staff, in which the former ask and rely upon the latter for policy analysis and advice.
- Widespread quotation, citation, discussion and other use of P. I. D. E. studies by researchers elsewhere and in professional literature both in Pakistan and abroad.

19. Goal

The Project Paper defines the Sector Goal as follows:

A. The existence of a general interest, understanding, concern and desire for informed action among Pakistan's planners, administrators and decision-makers, as well as among private citizens about the problems of population increase and distribution and the measures which can be taken to meet these problems with particular emphasis on achieving fertility decline.

B. Consideration of population problems in the formulation of social policies. (Population Impact.)

C. The existence of a comprehensive population policy for Pakistan, widely understood and accepted, and incorporated in government financial and implementation plans.

D. The existence of public and private institutions to provide family planning services and commodities as required to achieve the aims of the national population policy.

E. The existence of other public and private population influencing activities to encourage the adoption of smaller family size norms among Pakistani couples of child-bearing age.

It is too early to quantify those elements of the Goal which have been met or partially met. There are more than 20 separate research projects designed to answer important policy questions in the areas of education, manpower, agriculture, labor supply and expenditure patterns - all in relation to measuring demographic impact. It will be possible after the completion of these projects plus periodic fertility surveys, contraceptive usage reporting and other demographic research activities to determine the achievement of sector goals.

It can be stated that at this date, due to reasons beyond the control of this project, there is no comprehensive population policy for Pakistan that is widely understood and accepted and fully incorporated in government financial and implementation plans. Although the project has been quite successful in achieving its institution-building purpose and is necessary for goal achievement, it cannot by itself accomplish the project goal

20. Beneficiaries

Because this project was designed to create an institutional research capability and a set of policy relevant research products, it has no direct relationship to the poor, but much of the research which has been produced has relevance for policies which, themselves, do or can affect the poor. For example, much of P.I.D.E.'s research on the determinants of fertility has played a role in the formulation of government policies which are designed to improve the standards of living of particular social groups; women (especially rural women), small farmers, and urban migrants etc. Government priorities, as expressed in the Fifth Plan, in primary education, job creation of women, improved deliveries of health services have resulted at least in part, from P. I. D. E. research findings which relate improvements in these sectors to lower fertility.

The outputs of the project are aimed at providing relevant research information on population for use by various agencies of the Government of Pakistan, particularly the Planning Commission. The project has developed within P. I. D. E., the capability for analyzing the impact of population growth rates on the national well-being, for developing basic information on population growth and distribution for investigating the special circumstances surrounding family planning decisions in Pakistan, and for developing recommendations on both population responsive and population influencing policies. All this is likely to help foster the growing understanding of population issues in Pakistan's development and ensure that population related issues are given consideration in the country's overall planning process. The benefits will filter through the policy-makers of the Planning Commission down to the general public through multi-sectoral development planning.

21. Unplanned Effects

It is too early to ascertain any unplanned effects produced by the project.

22. Lessons Learned

A. The autonomy of the research unit is important. Since the Population Section is under P. I. D. E. and not the organizations using its research, it is under no pressure to reflect in its research conclusions the natural biases of the user organizations. Also it can concentrate on population research and not be forced into other studies as has happened with the population research unit in the Ministry of Health.

B. Greater impact can be gained through more dissemination of research results on a regional level, for example, highlight migration in the NWFP and do more research in sample areas of Baluchistan and provide results to provincial organizations.

C. Special efforts must be made to insure that project commodities can be maintained. A copying machine purchased in the U. S. was manufactured in a third country and repair parts cannot be obtained from the U. S. distributor and the foreign manufacturer.

23. Comments and Remarks

On balance, it is possible to conclude that the research work produced by P. I. D. E. has been welcomed by user organizations, and has resulted in the development of a stable population-oriented research institution fully funded by the Government of Pakistan.

A list of the titles of the research studies completed under the project is attached.

RESEARCH COMPLETED IN
POPULATION AND DEVELOPMENT

1. Afzal, Mohammad. "1972 Census Population: expected and actual". PDR. XII(2), Summer 1973.
2. Afzal, Mohammad. "Denominator adjusted PGE Fertility and Mortality rates for Pakistan and Bangladesh". PDR. XVI(2), 1977. No. 2.
3. Afzal, Mohammad. "New Development in Population Data on Pakistan". Proceedings of the Seminar on Population Implications of Pakistan Development Policy, held at Murree, Pakistan from August 23-26, 1976.
4. Afzal, Mohammad. The Population of Pakistan. PIDE Special Study in 1974. World Population Year CICRED Series.
5. Afzal, Mohammad. "Dual Collection as a Permanent Data Source of Pakistan's Vital Events". Chapter 5 in Issues in Demographic Data Collection in Pakistan. Edited by Karol J. Krotki and Sultan S. Hashmi. Census Organization, Islamabad 1978.
6. Afzal, Mohammad, Mohammad Azhar and Tariq Sajjad Jan. "Estimation of net Currently Married Life within the Reproductive period for Females in Pakistan". PDR. XIV(1), Spring 1975.
7. Afzal, Mohammad and Tauheed Ahmad. "Limitations of Vital Registration System in Pakistan Against Sample Estimation Project". PDR XIII(3), Autumn 1974.
8. Afzal, Mohammad, M. Iqbal Hashmi and N.H. Nizami. "Marriage Patterns in Rural Agglomeration". PDR. XII(3), Autumn 1973.
9. Afzal, Mohammad, Leo L. Bean and Intiazuddin Hussain. "Muslim Marriages, Age, Mehr and Social Status". PDR. XII(1), Spring 1973.
10. Afzal, Mohammad and Kaushia Iftikhar. "Net Nuptiality Tables for Males and Females in Pakistan". PDR. XII(1), Spring 1974.
11. Afzal, Mohammad, Zubeda Khan and Naseer A. Choudhry. "Age at Marriage, Fertility and Infant-child Mortality in a Lahore Suburb (Part I)". PDR XV(1) Spring 1976.
12. Afzal, Mohammad, Zubeda Khan and Naseer A. Choudhry. "Age at Marriage, Fertility and Infant-child Mortality in a Lahore Suburb (Part II)". PDR. XV(2), Summer 1976.
13. Alam, Iqbal. "Relationship of Infant-child Mortality to Fertility: Some theoretical and empirical considerations relevant to Pakistan". PDR. XIII(4), Winter 1974.
14. Alam, Iqbal and Charles Nobbe. "Impact of Age Misreporting on Fertility Estimation". Chapter 2 in Issues in Demographic

16. Azhar, Mohammad and J. Gilbert Hardee. "Change and Differentials in Men's Knowledge of, attitude towards and Practice of Family Planning during the 1960's. PIDE Research Report No. 100.
17. Beg, M. Afzal. "A Review of Labour Force Participation Rates in Pakistan". PDR. XII(4), Winter 1973.
18. Board of Economic Enquiry, NWFP, University of Peshawar "Factors Influencing Migration to Peshawar city". PIDE Report No. 102, September 1977.
19. De Tray, Dennis N. "Age of Marriage and Fertility: A Policy Review". PDR. XVI(1), Spring 1977.
20. De Tray, Dennis N. and Zubeda Khan. "On the Care and Handling of Regression Specifications in Fertility Research". PDR. XVI(3), Autumn 1977.
21. Farooqui, N.I. and Iqbal Alam. "Provincial Abridged Life Tables for Urban and Rural Areas in Pakistan, Based on PGS 1968 and 1971". PDR. XIII(3), Autumn 1974.
22. Hardee, J.G. "Population Planning, Policies and Programmes: Implications for Education. Paper presented at the National Seminar on Population Dynamic and Educational Planning under the Auspices of the Bureau of Educational Planning". Islamabad November 4-8, 1974.
23. Hardee, J.G. and Mohammad Azhar. "Change and Differentials in Women's Knowledge of, Attitude towards and Practice of Family Planning in Pakistan During the 1960's". PDR XIV(3), Autumn 1975.
24. Helbock, Richard W. "Differential Urban and Distance Considerations in Domestic Flows in Pakistan". PDR. XIV(1), Spring 1975.
25. Helbock, Richard W. "Urban Population Growth in Pakistan". PDR. XIV(3), Autumn 1975.
26. Iftikhar, Naushin and Mohammad Afzal. "Marriage Patterns in Pakistan through Net Nuptiality Tables 1968 and 1971". PDR. XIV(2), Summer 1975.
27. Karim, Mehtab S. and Iqbal Alam. "Age Reporting in Pakistan and its Implications for Fertility Analysis". PDR. XIV(1), Spring 1975.
28. Karim, Mehtab S. and Iqbal Alam. "Fertility differentials by family type". PDR. XIII(2), Summer 1974.
29. Krotki, Karol J. "The 1972 Census Evaluation Survey in Pakistan in the light of Experience with similar Endeavours elsewhere". Chapter 8 in Issue in demographic Data collection in Pakistan, op. cit.

- 2
30. Krotki, Karol J. "Pakistan's Population size and Growth in the light of the 1972 Census Evaluation Survey". PDR XV(2), Summary 1976.
 31. Krotki, Karol J. and Khálisha Parveen. "Population Size and Growth in Pakistan Based on Early Reports of 1972 Census" Pakistan Development Review, Vol. XV. No. 3, Autumn 1976.
 32. Nobbe, Charles and Iqbal Alam. "Age Recordings for the same Person in a Punjab Village in Pakistan". Chapter 10 in Issues in Demographic Data Collection in Pakistan. op. cit.
 33. Pakistan Institute of Development Economics. "Cost-effectiveness of Pakistan's Family Planning Programme". A Study prepared for Planning Division, Government of Pakistan, January 1977.
 34. Qureshi, M.L. "Economic Implications of Population Growth in Pakistan". Paper presented at the National Seminar on Population and Family Education, Khanspur Ayubia, July 14-17, 1973.
 35. Qureshi, M.L. "Impact of Population Growth on Costs of Primary and Middle School Education". PDR. XIII(4), Winter 1974.
 36. Shah, Nasra M. and S. Firasat Ali Kazi. "Attitudes, Contraceptive Practice and Children Ever-born among Currently Married Women". PDR. XVI(4), Winter 1977.
 37. Shah, Nasra M. "Fertility of Working and Non-working Women in Pakistan". Presented at the Seminar on "Women and Development" Dacca Bangladesh, March 28-April 1, 1977. Being published in the Proceedings.
 38. Shah, Nasra M., Nasreen Abbasi and Iqbal Alam. "Inter-district and Interprovincial Differentials in Correlates of Female Labour Force Participation, 1961". PDR.XV(4) Winter 1976.
 39. Shah, Nasra M., Makhdoom A. Shah and Tauseef Ahmad. "Labour Force Employment and Unemployment Statistics in Pakistan". Pakistan Manpower Institute. Manpower and Employment Statistics in Pakistan. Islamabad, May 1977, pp 100-123.
 40. Shah, Makhdoom A. and Nasra M. Shah. "Population and Demographic Statistics for Manpower Planning in Pakistan". Pakistan Manpower Institute. Manpower and Employment Statistics in Pakistan. Islamabad May 1977, pp. 52-74.
 41. Shah, Nasra M. "The Role of Interspousal Communication in the Adoption of Family Planning Methods: a Couple approach". PDR. XIII(4), Winter 1974.

42. Shah, Nasra M. "Work Participation of Currently Married Women in Pakistan: Influence of Socio-economic and Demographic Facts". PDR. XIV(4), Winter 975.
43. Shah, Nasra M. "Female Labour Force Participation and Fertility Desires in Pakistan: An empirical Investigation". PDR. XIV.(2), Summer 1975.
44. Social Sciences Research Centre, University of the Punjab. "Factors influencing Migration to Gujranwala City". PIDE Research Report No. 101. September 1977.