

PD-AKZ-548
ISA 62079

**JOINT MANAGEMENT EVALUATION OF THE
COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT**

between

**U.S. Agency for International Development
and
African American Labor Center
(African Labor Development II - 698-0442)**

Contract No. PDC-5317-I-03-8127-00
Work Order No. 3

by:

**John H. Sullivan, Team Leader
Development Associates, Inc.**

**James L. Roush
Development Associates, Inc.**

**Patricia Topping
African American Labor Center**

Submitted by:

**DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATES, INC.
2924 Columbia Pike
Arlington, VA 22204
Telephone No.: (703)979-0100**

June 8, 1989

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
List of Tables.....	iii
List of Acronyms.....	iv
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	ES-1
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
A. The 1985-89 Cooperative Agreement.....	2
B. Evaluation Methodology.....	3
II. SUMMARY FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	6
A. Findings.....	6
B. Conclusions.....	12
C. Recommendations.....	13
III. CONTEXT AND TRENDS IN TRADE UNIONISM, 1985-1989.....	16
A. The Context.....	16
B. Trends.....	19
IV. AALC PROGRAMS.....	23
A. Country Programs.....	27
B. Regional Activities.....	30
C. International Trade Secretariats/Union-to-Union Programs.....	37
D. Impact Projects.....	42
E. Conclusions on AALC Program Content and Impact.....	47
V. MANAGEMENT OF THE AALC COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT.....	54
A. Overall Management Structure and Process.....	54
B. Budgeting and Financial Management.....	56
C. Implementation Monitoring and Reporting.....	59
D. Evaluation.....	61
E. Conclusions on Project Management.....	61

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS ON A FOLLOW-ON COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT.....	65
A. Desirability and Feasibility.....	65
B. Suggestions for Program Content.....	65
C. Program Management and Implementation.....	66
D. Evaluation.....	67

ANNEXES

A -- Summary of Evaluation Scope of Work.....	69
B -- List of Persons Contacted.....	73
C -- Report on Countries Visited by the Evaluation Team.....	79
D -- Other Country Reports.....	98
E -- Thoughts on Future AALC Evaluations.....	132

1237y

LIST OF TABLES

	<u>Table</u>	<u>Page</u>
I-1	AALC Funding Sources.....	1
IV-1	Countries Participating in AALC Programs by Type of Participation..	24
2	AALC Program -- Cumulative 1985-88.....	25
3	Status of AALC Program as of December 31, 1988.....	26
4	Long-term Objectives of AALC Country Programs.....	28
5	International Trade Secretariats and Affiliated U.S. Unions Participating in the AALC Program.....	40
6	ITS/Union-to-Union Programs 1985-88.....	41
7	Impact Projects 1985-89.....	44
8	Impact Projects by Component.....	45
9	Indicators of Progress in AALC Program Countries.....	52
V-1	Planned and Actual Obligations by Year.....	56
2	AALC Field Representatives/(Location)/Responsibilities.....	63
3	AALC/W Assignments.....	64

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AALC	African American Labor Center
AFL-CIO	American Federation of Labor-Congress of Industrial Organizations
AFT	American Federation of Teachers (U.S.)
AID	Agency for International Development (U.S.)
ARCOOP	Animation Rurale et Cooperative Paysanne (Zaire)
BFTU	Botswana Federation of Trade Unions
BRAC	Brotherhood of Railway and Airline Clerks (U.S.)
CAAT	Centre Afro-Americain du Travail (French for AALC)
CASOP	Caisse de Solidarite Ouvriere et Paysanne (Zaire)
CNTG	Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs de Guinea
CNTS	Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Senegal
CNTT	Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Togo
COTU	Central Organization of Trade Unions (Kenya)
CREDE	Regional Economic Research and Documentation Center
CWA	Communications Workers of America (U.S.)
DO ^r	U.S. Department of Labor
ECOCAS	Economic Community of Central African States
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
FIET	International Federation of Commercial, Clerical, Professional and Technical Employees (an ITS)
FKE	Federation of Kenyan Employers
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	Gross National Product
GSP	Generalized System of Preferences
GTUC	Ghana Trade Unions Congress
GWF	General Workers Federation (Mauritius)
IAHES	African Institute for Higher Trade Union Studies
IAM	International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers (U.S.)
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (now usually referred to as the World Bank)
ICF	International Chemical, Energy and General Workers Federation (ITS)
ICFTU	International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
ICCM	Institut de Coupe, Couture et Mode (Senegal)
IFBWW	International Federation of Building and Wood Workers (ITS)
IFFTU	International Federation of Free Teachers Unions (ITS)

IFPAAW International Federation of Plantation, Agricultural and Allied Workers (ITS)
 ILGWU International Ladies' Garment Workers Union (U.S.)
 ILO International Labor Organization
 IMF International Metalworkers Federation (ITS)

IMF International Monetary Fund
 ITF International Transport Federation (ITS)
 ITGLWF International Textile, Garment, and Leather Workers Federation (ITS)
 ITS International Trade Secretariat
 IUBAC International Union of Bricklayers and Allied Craftsmen (U.S.)

KANU Kenyan African National Union (political party)
 LCFTU Lesotho Congress of Free Trade Unions
 LFLU Liberia Federation of Labour Unions
 MLC Mauritius Labour Congress
 NOTU National Organisation of Trade Unions (Uganda)

OATUU Organization of African Trade Union Unity (Africa-wide)
 OCAW Oil, Chemical and Atomic Workers (U.S.)
 OTAC Organisation des Travailleurs de l'Afrique Centrale
 OTAO Organisation des Travailleurs de l'Afrique de l'Ouest
 OTUWA Organisation of Trade Unions of West Africa

PSI Public Services International (ITS)
 PTTI Postal, Telegraph and Telephone International (ITS)
 PVO Private Voluntary Organization
 SADCC Southern Africa Development Coordinating Committee
 SATUCC Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council

SEIU Service Employees International Union (U.S.)
 SFEPTU Sudanese Federation of Employees and Professional Trade Unions
 SFTU Swaziland Federation of Trade Unions
 SLLC Sierra Leone Labour Congress
 SWTUF Sudan Workers Trade Union Federation

TCU Transportation Communications Union (U.S.)
 TUC Trades Union Congress (Ghana)
 UFCW United Food and Commercial Workers International Union (US)
 ULC Uganda Labour Congress
 UNTZa Union Nationale des Travailleurs du Zaire

USAID Mission of the U.S. Agency for International Development
 USWA United Steel Workers of America (U.S.)
 WB World Bank
 WFTU World Federation of Trade Unions
 ZCTU Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The African-American Labor Center (AALC) was created in 1964 as an autonomous unit under the supervision of a board composed of the President and a number of vice-presidents of the AFL-CIO. Since that time, AALC has carried out programs which have assisted the great majority of African trade unions at a total cost of nearly \$78 million. Under a series of cooperative agreements, as well as other contractual mechanisms, foreign aid funds have been provided to help finance AALC-sponsored activities.

The current cooperative agreement was concluded between AID and AALC in 1985 for a five-year program (1985-1989) totalling \$19 million. The agreement recommended periodic evaluations of the AALC program, but no evaluation was performed during the first four years of the grant. An evaluation was seen as a necessary pre-condition to a new agreement. As a result, AID's Africa Bureau contracted with Development Associates Inc. for the services of its Vice President for International Activities and a senior associate to do an evaluation of the AALC project. They were joined by an official of the AALC to form a three-person joint evaluation team.

The 1985-1989 Cooperative Agreement

The 1985-1989 agreement called for long-term programs in 11 countries and short-term "impact" projects in 10 to 15 additional African countries. It also set six priority areas for AALC assistance:

1. Fostering free labor institutions such as trade unions, cooperatives and credit unions;
2. Worker education, trade union research and journalism;
3. Literacy, leadership and advanced training programs;
4. Women's programs, including income-producing projects and maternal and child care;
5. Community service projects; and
6. Cooperative and credit union education and the development of cooperative programs.

Evaluation Methodology

The present evaluation is a joint "management evaluation" which suggests emphasis on a review of how AALC carries out its programs, rather than a goal-related analysis.

The evaluation team visited four countries in Africa as part of this evaluation: Kenya, Botswana, Zaire and Senegal. These included both anglophone and francophone countries, and both democratic and authoritarian regimes. The labor movements in the four countries also represented a continuum of stages of development: from the fledgling trade union movement in Botswana, through Senegal and Kenya, to the highly organized federation in Zaire.

Findings

1. The highlights of the context in which African trade unions operate are as follows:
 - Rural economies. Wage earners as a group are a distinct minority in most African countries; African populations are predominantly rural.
 - Single party governments. More than half of African nations are ruled by the military or by monolithic political parties. Trade union independence, where it exists, is under constant pressure.
 - Large public sector. The public sector in many countries is the most predominant employer and its employees are often forbidden to organize or are only permitted to organize outside of the central labor federation. Often, the employees of the government and parastatal organizations are expressly forbidden to strike.
 - Economic decline. Economic conditions deteriorated precipitously in many sub-Saharan countries during the first half of the 1980s, exacerbating problems of unemployment and underemployment.
 - Tripartite systems. In virtually every country, there is a tripartite system in which the government plays a major role in settling labor-management disputes, either directly or through specialized labor courts.
 - Multi-donor competition. African unions often find a number of potential donors to assist them with their programs, but many donors come with very different ideological and political persuasion than AALC -- even those from Western Europe.

2. The principal trends that have developed or intensified during the past five years are:
- 'Structural Adjustment'. By the end of 1988, 27 countries in sub-Saharan Africa were actively engaged in some form of macro-economic structural adjustment program. Some benefits have resulted from these programs, but the impact on wage earners, including organized labor generally, has been negative.
 - The decline of 'African Socialism'. Governments are withdrawing from regulating their economies and are permitting the market more freedom in fulfilling its production and distribution functions. This positive development is generating pressure from indigenous businesses and potential foreign investors for reforms in some labor codes, reforms that will work against the interest of union membership -- at least in the short run.
 - Pragmatic regionalism. Regionalism has been a strong political theme for most African countries since their independence. The current interest in regionalism seems more pragmatic and therefore worthy of increased AALC support.
3. The most striking characteristic of trade unionism in Africa is the diversity of the trade union movement. There are countries in which trade unionism is almost nonexistent, others where it is highly developed and influential; the bulk of countries fall somewhere in between these extremes. This diversity in structures, programs and impact reflects historical developments, political and economic trends, the quality of union leadership, the attitudes and/or effectiveness of national governments, etc.
4. Within the diversity, there are also some commonalities -- or at least some generalizations that are valid for most of the countries being assisted under the AALC grant. In many countries in Africa, trade unions are the only significant demonstrations of democratic pluralism; they hold elections, frequently the only free elections in the country. ICFTU estimates that there are a million freely elected trade union officers in Africa today. Most unions are continually having to defend their independence from the government party (usually the only one permitted).

5. Reflecting the difficult economic situation in most countries and the unions' inability to negotiate significant wage increases, many unions have increased substantially their development-type programs, such as cooperatives, credit unions, and health and population programs.
6. There are increasing numbers of women in the labor movement. Many African unions are beginning to give new emphasis to the role of women in the workforce. Their programs are beginning to have some results:
 - a) a cadre of women leaders and trainers has been developed to carry activities to wherever there are groups of women workers;
 - b) increasing numbers of women are joining unions;
 - c) women-directed activities and services such as day care, pre-schools, and income-generating projects have proliferated.
7. There has been a notable increase in labor peace. In countries where strikes are permitted, they have been declining; the number of collective bargaining agreements has continued to rise. Internecine union strife has abated. Labor peace probably reflects the unfavorable economic conditions in Africa, the harsh political realities in some countries and the maturation of labor movements and labor leaders.
8. Increasingly the development "community" has become aware of the linkages between labor rights and economic growth. The new draft foreign assistance legislation from the House Committee on Foreign Affairs links the objective of economic growth in LDCs with the security of economic rights, including "the right of fair return to labor." The same draft bill later mandates that U.S. economic assistance programs be determined by governments' adherence to international agreements, particularly those relating to "free and fair trade practices and to respect for worker rights..."
9. The AALC program has been flexible and responsive. During the period, AALC has had to expand one program dramatically (Sudan), reduce another sharply (Ghana) and start six new country programs. Similarly, one regional program has been dropped because of budget cuts and inadequate African support and one has been expanded to reflect African unions' desires for more worker services.

10. The content of the AALC program has also been modified. While training is still the most important element, the types of training provided have shifted from information, communications, finances, and industrial relations to responses to the economic crisis, labor economics, instructor training. Country program objectives have shifted from strengthening the central headquarters to strengthening regional operations and expanding programs of services to affiliates. In the wake of structural adjustment, AALC has begun to emphasize economic training and research.
11. AALC has managed the AID grant well, particularly considering the reduction of field personnel that was necessitated by overall budget cuts and the program changes that were needed as a result of budget cuts and changing circumstances in Africa in general and specifically in some of the countries.
12. AALC has complied with AID instructions regarding its periodic reporting on project progress, but the reports are overly voluminous, do not provide information on overall trends in the labor field and the format is not very useful to the AID project officers or others interested in the program.
13. AALC's financial reporting meets AID requirements, but does not provide financial information to accord with the objectives specified for the individual country programs.
14. The annual budget submissions that AALC has been required to submit have been excessive in volume and detail, especially considering the amount of detail provided with the original budget submission.
15. The potential impact from the program has been reduced because:
 - The overall 1985-1989 budget has been reduced by around \$1 million because AALC was asked to carry out an expanded program in the Sudan -- about \$1.4 million more than had been budgeted -- and this was only partially offset by a reduction in the Ghana program.

- Effective implementation of the grant has been hampered by the habitually late approval by AID of annual budgets -- usually between April and June. AALC's budget year is a calendar year.
 - Program funding has been further eroded by inflation (in both U.S. and Africa) and the drop in the value of the dollar.
16. Long-term objectives for each country program were set forth in the original program submission and budgets were organized according to the objectives. Subsequent reporting and budget submissions made no mention of the long-term objectives, and financial reporting by objectives was not maintained.
17. It is clear that AALC and AID have a conflicted relationship, perhaps needlessly so. On the AALC side there is a belief, substantiated by the team's observations, that neither AID/Washington nor many of the African missions appreciate, or are even interested in, the work of the Center with African trade unions. On the AID side, an attitude of "benign neglect" seems prevalent -- the result of perceptions that AALC is not a development agency but rather a creature of the State Department. In most missions the State labor officer serves as AALC project officer.

Conclusions

1. Trade union development in Africa has been circumscribed by a small formal economic sector, single party governments that try to control unions and the severe economic conditions that have plagued many countries for years.
2. The trade union movements in many African countries clearly have matured during the past five years. They have become increasingly involved in a wide range of services for their memberships that go beyond traditional labor "bread and butter" issues.
3. In the African context, the trade union movements are primary examples of democratic pluralism. In many countries they stand above tribalism, offer practice in democratic techniques through election of union officials, resist government repressions, and offer an

independent source of allegiance for hundreds of thousands. African labor organizations should receive greater priority in the thinking and planning of those involved with the process of nation-building in Africa.

4. AALC programs await discovery by Africa Bureau personnel generally. AALC programs promote rights of free labor, democratic pluralism, and private and voluntary activities. More than that, many of the African trade unions have reached a level of maturity that enables them to act as intermediaries in programs which AID increasingly is carrying out through non-governmental organizations. AALC for its part should recognize the opportunities that may be open for their trade union brothers in Africa to benefit from other sources of AID funding.
5. Given the growing maturity of African unions and the increasing importance of their role in their country's development, a follow-on grant with increased funding is justified.
6. Given AALC's good track record and AID's limited staffing situation, a grant agreement should be used to finance the follow-on program rather than a cooperative agreement.
7. The overall management structure and process for implementing the grant is basically sound, but a reinstatement of some of the field representatives' positions will be needed to ensure a well-managed, high quality program.
8. The budgeting process is overly burdensome on AALC and should be simplified.
9. Financial accounting for country programs should correspond to the program's long-term objectives.

Recommendations

1. AID plan and budget for a follow-on grant (not a cooperative agreement) to AALC with increased funding.

2. AALC program the increased funding to:
 - a. expand programs that facilitate and support union-directed efforts in development activities such as credit unions, consumer and producer cooperatives, health and population and income-generating activities;
 - b. maintain and expand education programs which emphasize training for union leaders in such critical areas as economics and democratic unionism;
 - c. assist national federations to sustain their own programs so that AALC can begin to phase out some country programs; union-to-union support would continue through regional and impact activities and facilitation of contacts with USAIDs and other donors;
 - d. support weaker unions that are trying to overcome tribalism, keep out from under government control and stand out as exemplars of democratic action;
 - e. expand its support to selected regional institutions that enjoy the support of African union leaders; and
 - f. increase its field representation and possibly its accounting staff if the latter is necessary to implement the recommendations on financial management.
3. The budgeting process should be simplified and AID should strive harder to meet the annual increments of the approved budget.
4. The first funding increment of the new cooperative agreement should provide funding through March 1991. Then AID should be able to provide subsequent annual increments early enough to preclude the necessity for AALC either to interrupt operations or to borrow money.
5. Progress reporting should be streamlined and made more useful to AID by including:
 - a short summary of overall economic and political developments that can affect host unions or the AALC program;
 - substantially less historical data;
 - an assessment of progress against country program objectives; and
 - financial reports which include a breakdown of country budgets and expenditures by program objectives.

6. AALC-AID relations should be strengthened by:

- conducting annual joint reviews of program progress, with AALC representation at the Director or Deputy Director level and AID representation at least at the Division Chief level. A Department of State observer should be invited;
- the creation in the Africa Bureau of a new "Democratic Initiatives" office, similar to that in the Latin American Bureau, to deal with the growing U.S. concern for political/economic linkages and the assignment to it of responsibility for the oversight of the AALC program;
- assigning the field monitoring responsibility for the AALC program, with few exceptions, to a USAID officer -- while recognizing the continuing interest of the Department of State in the AALC program; and
- instructing USAIDs to consider using trade unions as intermediaries and/or implementers of AID-funded development activities and to coordinate with AALC representatives who could be expected to facilitate this development.

7. A mid-course evaluation should be scheduled for the follow-on grant. Evaluation criteria should be reviewed by AALC and AID and revised criteria included in the new grant agreement. Additional thoughts regarding evaluation of follow-on grants is included in Annex E.

- 1 -

I. INTRODUCTION

Early in the 1960s, as country after country in Africa was attaining independence, the AFL-CIO, which had championed an end to colonialism on the continent, created a specialized organization to assist African trade unions in their role as a force in nation-building. The African-American Labor Center (AALC), as it was called, was established as an autonomous unit under the supervision of a board composed of the President and a number of vice-presidents of the AFL-CIO.

Since that time, the AALC -- which celebrates its 25th anniversary this year -- has carried out programs of nearly \$78 million to assist the great majority of African trade unions. In accordance with provisions of the Foreign Assistance Act calling for support of economic and political pluralism, and specifically trade unions, the U.S. Agency for International Development (AID) has supported AALC's program. The importance of AID funding, provided under a series of cooperative agreements and other contractual mechanisms, is illustrated in Table I-1.

TABLE I-1

AALC FUNDING SOURCES, 1988

<u>Source</u>	<u>Amount</u> <u>US \$1,000</u>	<u>%</u>
AID (main grant, South Africa, Egypt)	\$5,072	76
National Endowment for Democracy	1,110	17
U.S. Information Agency	262	4
AFL - CIO	216	3
Other	20	*
Total	<u>\$6,680</u>	<u>100</u>

* Less than one-half of one percent.

The current cooperative agreement was concluded between AID and AALC in 1985 for a five-year program (1985-1989) totalling \$19 million. The agreement recommended periodic evaluations of the AALC by AID in conjunction with the Department of State, which has a deep interest in the program. No evaluation was undertaken, however, until this year as the December 1989 termination date for the agreement approached. AID officials assumed that another grant would be requested by AALC; an evaluation was seen as a necessary pre-condition to a new agreement.

As a result, AID's Africa Bureau sponsored this assessment of AALC programs under the cooperative agreement in anticipation of future negotiations. The evaluation does not deal with other AID-AALC relationships (e.g., programs in Egypt and South Africa) or with AALC activities funded by other organizations. To undertake the review, the Bureau contracted with Development Associates Inc. for the services of its Vice President for International Activities and a Senior Associate. They were joined by an official of the AALC itself to form a three-person joint evaluation team.

A. The 1985-1989 Cooperative Agreement

A cooperative agreement is a contractual mechanism commonly used by AID to fund multi-year, multi-activity programs with private and voluntary organizations (PVOs) such as AALC. The use of the cooperative agreement mode presupposes that AID wishes to interact with AALC on the implementation of the approved program.

The 1985-1989 agreement called for long-term programs in 11 countries and short-term ITS and "impact" projects in 10 to 15 additional African countries. It also set six priority areas for AALC assistance:

1. Fostering free labor institutions such as trade unions, cooperatives and credit unions;
2. Worker education, trade union research and journalism;
3. Literacy, leadership and advanced training programs;
4. Women's programs, including income-producing projects and maternal and child care;

5. Community service projects; and
6. Cooperative and credit union education and the development of cooperative programs.

The country-specific mix of these program and the resources to be allocated to them were included in Country Labor Plans that subsequently were drawn up by AALC, reviewed by Embassies, AID Missions and AID/W, and then put into effect. Although the plans usually had a five-year time frame, annual plans were submitted to AID with such changes as might be required to respond to circumstances.

The cooperative agreement also contained an implementation section that required AALC to:

1. Continue to staff and maintain offices as appropriate to implement its program activities;
2. Undertake surveys and other activities to develop the CLPs, plans, evaluations and other studies;
3. Seek cooperation and financial support from other unions and international organizations for its activities;
4. Provide participant training in the United States and Third Countries;
5. Provide assistance to certain AFL-CIO affiliated unions and international trade secretariats in support of program objectives; and
6. Provide consultation to U.S. Embassies, AID Missions and AID/Washington on labor affairs in Africa.

B. Evaluation Methodology

The methods for evaluating AALC programs have been in controversy for a number of years. The 1985-1989 cooperative agreement states that the criteria that AALC traditionally had used to measure the effectiveness of its African programs "rarely can be measured in quantitative terms" but rather "lend themselves to a more subjective and interpretive form of analysis." The agreement then proposed a series of generic questions about the labor movement in Africa. These questions also appear in the scope of work for the evaluation team (Annex A). Unfortunately, no provision was made in 1985 either by AID or AALC for establishing

performance indicators that would help bring more rigor to the development of the answers. Furthermore, without the establishment of baselines, it is hard to measure progress Africa-wide in such areas as viability of the labor movement, union effectiveness, union acceptance, leadership capabilities, etc.

The present evaluation is a joint "management evaluation" which suggests emphasis on a review of how AALC carries out its programs, rather than a goal-related analysis. Facing these several purposes for the evaluation, the team decided on the following course:

1. The emphasis would be on the management of the AALC 5-year program. Thus, the team reviewed the country programs to determine whether at the input, output, and -- to a certain extent -- purpose levels the organization has fulfilled the program planned in 1985 and, if not, why not. A similar analysis was undertaken for regional programs and for the impact projects. Finally, the AALC/Washington management of the AID grant was reviewed.
2. To the extent possible, answers would be given to the larger, goal-oriented questions posed in the AID/AALC cooperative agreement. These may be found in IV.E.3. of the report for those countries which were targeted in the cooperative agreement for country programs.

The evaluation team used several methodologies in arriving at the findings, conclusions and recommendations of this study. They included:

- Document Review: Both before and after the mission to Africa, the team reviewed a variety of documents, held both by AID and by AALC. These documents included AALC's semi-annual reports to AID during the 1985-1989 period, the annual budget submission by AALC to AID, country profiles prepared by AALC, financial records, and other relevant materials. In the field, AALC representatives and beneficiary union federations supplied materials to the team.
- Interviews: In the course of its study, the evaluation team interviewed more than 70 persons, both in the United States and in Africa. They included officials of the State Department, AID and the AALC (in the U.S. and in Africa), union representatives in four African countries, and others with relevant information and knowledge. A list of the interviewees is included as Annex B.

- Personal Observation. In each country it visited, the evaluation team took field trips to observe activities which AALC currently is supporting or has supported in the past. The team also looked at aspects of union programs not funded by AALC which demonstrated the services unions are providing to their members.

The four African countries which the team visited -- Kenya, Botswana, Zaire, and Senegal -- were carefully chosen to represent the geographic diversity of Africa, both anglophone and francophone countries, and both democratic and authoritarian regimes. The labor movements in the four countries also represented a continuum of stages of development: from the fledgling trade union movement in Botswana, through Senegal and Kenya, to the highly organized federation in Zaire. This range provided the team with the opportunity to compare and contrast the circumstances of each country and the response of the AALC to the challenges involved in each.

The team wishes at this point to acknowledge and thank the many persons who provided it with information and documentary materials. The cooperation and assistance of the AALC staff in Washington and the field, and of the African unionists, were outstanding and made it possible to gather a great deal of information in a relatively short time.

In the section that follows, the evaluation team summarizes its findings, conclusions and recommendations. The recommendations regarding a follow-on grant, and the drafting of Chapter VI upon which they are based, are exclusively the work of the consultants. The AALC team member did not feel her participation would be appropriate.

II. SUMMARY FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Findings

The AALC program relates to, and is affected by, developments in the trade union movement in Africa. These in turn reflect the African context and recent economic and political trends. Thus, this section starts with the context and recent trends and then moves to trade union developments and AALC's program response.

1. The Context

The highlights of the context in which African trade unions operate are as follows:

- Rural economies. Wage earners as a group are a distinct minority in most African countries; African populations are predominantly rural.
- Single party governments. More than half of African nations are ruled by the military or by monolithic political parties. Trade union independence, where it exists, is under constant pressure.
- Large public sectors. The public sector in many countries is the predominant employer and its employees are often forbidden to organize or are only permitted to organize outside of the central labor federation. Often, the employees of the government and parastatal organizations are expressly forbidden to strike.
- Economic decline. Economic conditions deteriorated precipitously in many sub-Saharan countries during the first half of the 1980s, exacerbating problems of unemployment and underemployment.
- Tripartite systems. In virtually every country, there is a tripartite system in which the government plays a major role in settling labor-management disputes, either directly or through specialized labor courts.
- Multi-donor competition. African unions often find a number of potential donors to assist them with their programs, but many donors come with very different ideological and political persuasion than AALC -- even those from Western Europe.

2. Important Trends

The evaluation team identified the following as the principal trends that have developed or intensified during the past five years:

- 'Structural Adjustment'. By the end of 1988, 27 countries in sub-Saharan Africa were actively engaged in some form of macro-economic structural adjustment program. Some benefits have resulted from these programs, but the impact on wage earners, including organized labor, generally has been negative.
- The decline of 'African Socialism'. Governments are withdrawing from regulating their economies and are permitting the market more freedom in fulfilling its production and distribution functions. This positive development is generating pressure from indigenous businesses and potential foreign investors for reforms in some labor codes, reforms that will work against the interest of union membership -- at least in the short run.
- Pragmatic regionalism. Regionalism has been a strong political theme for most African countries since their independence. The current interest in regionalism seems more pragmatic and therefore worthy of increased AALC support.

3. Trade Union Developments

The most striking characteristic of trade unionism in Africa is the diversity of the trade union movement. There are countries in which trade unionism is almost nonexistent, others where it is highly developed and influential; the bulk of countries fall somewhere in between these extremes. This diversity in structures, programs and impact reflects historical developments, political and economic trends, the quality of union leadership, the attitudes and/or effectiveness of national governments, etc.

Within the diversity, there are also some commonalities -- or at least some generalizations that are valid for most of the countries being assisted under the AALC grant. In many countries in Africa, trade unions are the only significant demonstrations of democratic pluralism; they hold elections, frequently the only free elections in the country. ICFTU estimates that there are a million freely elected trade

union officers in Africa today. Most unions are continually having to defend their independence from the government party (usually the only one permitted).

Reflecting the difficult economic situation in most countries and the unions' inability to negotiate significant wage increases, many unions have increased substantially their development-type programs, such as cooperatives, credit unions, and health and population programs.

There are increasing numbers of women in the labor movement. Many African unions are beginning to give new emphasis to the role of women in the workforce. Their programs are beginning to have some results: a) a cadre of women leaders and trainers has been developed to carry activities to wherever there are groups of women workers; b) increasing numbers of women are joining unions; c) women-directed activities and services such as day care, pre-schools, and income-generating projects have proliferated.

There has been a notable increase in labor peace. In countries where strikes are permitted, they have been declining; the number of collective bargaining agreements has continued to rise. Internecine union strife has abated. Labor peace probably reflects the unfavorable economic conditions in Africa, the harsh political realities in some countries and the maturation of labor movements and labor leaders.

4. Trends in Development Thinking

Increasingly the development "community" has become aware of the linkages between labor rights and economic growth. The new draft foreign assistance legislation from the House Committee on Foreign Affairs links the objective of economic growth in LDCs with the security of economic rights, including "the right of fair return to labor." The same draft bill later mandates that U.S. economic assistance programs be determined by governments' adherence to international agreements, particularly those relating to "free and fair trade practices and to respect for worker rights..."

In addition, trade unions usually are expressions of private and voluntary activity and of democratic pluralism, two other major components of current U.S. development policy. In the context of Africa, the importance of unions recently was recognized by a House Subcommittee on Africa staff study which specifically cited trade unions as important in giving the poor a voice in the making of structural adjustment policy.

5. AALC Programs

The AALC program has been flexible and responsive. It has been flexible both in terms of the countries assisted and in the content of its program. During the period, AALC has had to expand one program dramatically (Sudan), reduce another sharply (Ghana) and start six new country programs. Similarly with regional programs: CREDE has been dropped and the cooperative activity expanded to reflect African unions' desires for more worker services.

The content of the AALC program has also modified. While training is still the most important element, the types of training provided has shifted from information, communications, finances, and industrial relations to responses to the economic crisis, labor economics, instructor training. Country program objectives have shifted from strengthening the central headquarters to strengthening regional operations and expanding programs of services to affiliates: setting up women's units, establishing health and safety clinics, promoting credit unions and cooperatives, initiating literacy programs and creating employment generation activities.

Moreover, in the wake of structural adjustment, AALC has begun to emphasize economic training and research. By doing so, it responds to an important need for knowledgeable and effective labor representation in the halls of power where crucial economic decisions are being made at the prompting of the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the World Bank, and other donors.

While AALC flexibility and responsiveness is doubtless a result of its relatively small size, it also reflects the organization's non-doctrinaire and pragmatic approach to its work. Long ago, it would appear, AALC learned that each country must be approached as an individual entity, not as a repository for made-in-the-USA solutions.

6. AALC Management

AALC has managed the AID grant well, particularly considering the reduction of field personnel that was necessitated by overall budget cuts and the program changes that were needed as a result of budget cuts and changing circumstances in Africa in general and specifically in some of the countries.

AALC has complied with AID instructions regarding its periodic reporting on project progress, but the reports are overly voluminous, do not provide information on overall trends in the labor field and the format is not very useful to the AID project officers or others interested in the program.

AALC's financial reporting meets AID requirements, but does not provide financial information to accord with the objectives specified for the individual country programs.

The annual budget submissions that AALC has been required to submit have been excessive in volume and detail, especially considering the amount of detail provided with the original budget submission. AID has not convened any joint AID-AALC annual reviews of the program, even though this was called for in the Cooperative Agreement.

The overall 1985-1989 budget has been reduced by around \$1 million because AALC was asked to carry out an expanded program in the Sudan -- about \$1.4 million more than had been budgeted -- and this was only partially offset by a reduction in the Ghana program.

Effective implementation of the grant has been hampered by the habitually late approval by AID of annual budgets -- usually between April and June. AALC's budget year is a calendar year.

Program funding has been further eroded by inflation (in both U.S. and Africa) and the drop in the value of the dollar. AALC was not permitted by AID to include these contingencies in the budget even though this is standard practice for many long-term AID projects.

Long-term objectives for each country program were set forth in the original program submission and budgets were organized according to the objectives. Subsequent reporting and budget submissions made no mention of the long-term objectives, and financial reporting by objectives was not maintained.

7. AALC-AID Relationship

It is clear that AALC and AID have a conflicted relationship, perhaps needlessly so. On the AALC side there is a belief, substantiated by the team's observations, that neither AID/Washington nor many of the African missions appreciate, or are even interested in, the work of the Center with African trade unions. This was dramatized in one country when the presence of the team brought together for the first time the AALC representative and the AID Mission Director although both had been in their jobs for two years. On the AID side, an attitude of "benign neglect" seems prevalent -- the result of perceptions that AALC is not a development agency but rather a creature of the State Department. In many missions the State labor officer serves as AALC project officer. AALC staff members themselves sometimes have sought to distance themselves from AID.

Exceptions exist, of course, both in Washington and the field where AID employees know and care about AALC programs. Some AALC representatives enjoy close and collaborative relationships with their AID counterparts. These are, however, the minority.

B. Conclusions

1. Trade union development in Africa has been circumscribed by a small formal economic sector, single party governments that try to control unions and the severe economic conditions that have plagued many countries for years.
2. The trade union movements in many African countries clearly have matured during the past five years. They have become increasingly involved in a wide range of services for their memberships -- and even outside -- that go beyond traditional labor "bread and butter" issues. These activities permit trade unions both to serve their members better and to contribute to the economic development of their country. Unions which have embarked on this course should be encouraged in those directions, and used and strengthened in their development activities.
3. In the African context, the trade union movements are primary examples of democratic pluralism. In many countries they stand above tribalism, offer practice in democratic techniques through election of union officials, resist government repressions, and offer an independent source of allegiance for hundreds of thousands. With more widespread appreciation of the links between democratic pluralism and economic development, African labor organizations should attain increased importance in the thinking and planning of those involved with the process of nation-building in Africa.
4. AALC programs await discovery by Africa Bureau personnel generally. AALC programs promote rights of free labor, democratic pluralism, and private and voluntary activities -- all high priorities for Congress and others in the implementation of development assistance abroad. More than that, many of the African trade unions have reached a level of maturity that enables them to act as intermediaries in programs which AID increasingly is carrying out through non-governmental organizations. AALC for its part should recognize the opportunities that may be open for their trade union brothers in Africa to benefit from other sources of AID funding. Mutual recognition by AALC and AID

that each can benefit the other could open a new era of cooperation and collaboration. Organizational changes and new procedures will be needed to bring it about.

5. Given the growing maturity of African unions and the increasing importance of their role in their country's development, a follow-on grant with increased funding is justified.
6. Given AALC's good track record and AID's limited staffing situation, a grant agreement should be used for the follow-on program rather than a cooperative agreement.
7. The overall management structure and process for implementing the grant is basically sound, but a reinstatement of some of the field representatives' positions will be needed to ensure a well-managed, high quality program.
8. The budgeting process is overly burdensome on AALC and should be simplified.
9. Financial accounting for country programs should correspond to the program's long-term objectives.

C. Recommendations

1. AID plan and budget for a follow-on grant (not a cooperative agreement) to AALC with increased funding.
2. AALC program the increased funding to:
 - a. expand programs that facilitate and support union-directed efforts in development activities such as credit unions, consumer and producer cooperatives, health and population and income-generating activities;
 - b. maintain and expand education programs which emphasize training for union leaders in such critical areas as economics and democratic unionism;
 - c. assist national federations to sustain their own programs so that AALC can begin to phase out some country programs; union-to-union support would continue through regional and impact activities and facilitation of contacts with USAIDs and other donors;

- d. support weaker unions that are trying to overcome tribalism, keep out from under government control and stand out as exemplars of democratic action;
 - e. expand its support to selected regional institutions that enjoy the support of African union leaders; and
 - f. increase its field representation and possibly its accounting staff if the latter is necessary to implement the recommendations on financial management.
3. The budgeting process should be simplified and AID should strive harder to meet the annual increments of the approved budget.
 4. The first funding increment of the new cooperative agreement should provide funding through March 1991. Then AID should be able to provide subsequent annual increments early enough to preclude the necessity for AALC either to interrupt operations or to borrow money.
 5. Progress reporting should be streamlined and made more useful to AID by including:
 - a short summary of overall economic and political developments that can affect host unions or the AALC program;
 - substantially less historical data;
 - an assessment of progress against country program objectives; and
 - financial reports which include a breakdown of country budgets and expenditures by program objectives.
 6. AALC-AID relations should be strengthened by:
 - conducting annual joint reviews of program progress, with AALC representation at the Director or Deputy Director level and AID representation at least at the Division Chief level. A Department of State observer should be invited;
 - the creation in the Africa Bureau of a new "Democratic Initiatives" office, similar to that in the Latin American Bureau, to deal with the growing U.S. concern for political/economic linkages and the assignment to it of responsibility for the oversight of the AALC program;

- assigning field monitoring responsibility for the AALC program, with few exceptions, to a USAID officer -- while recognizing the continuing interest of the Department of State in the AALC program; and
 - instructing USAIDs to consider using trade unions as intermediaries and/or implementers of AID-funded development activities and to coordinate with AALC representatives who could be expected to facilitate this development.
7. A mid-course evaluation should be scheduled for the follow-on grant. Evaluation criteria should be reviewed by AALC and AID and revised criteria included in the new grant agreement. Additional thoughts regarding evaluation of follow-on grants is included in Annex E.

1237y/5.89

III. CONTEXT AND TRENDS IN AFRICAN TRADE UNIONISM, 1985-1989

In the course of its investigation, the evaluation team noted a number of significant contextual elements in the African labor scene which deserve attention. The team also perceived a number of trends which bear both on the present activities of the Center and its future program.

A. The Context

The most striking characteristic of trade unionism in Africa is the diversity of the trade union movement. There are countries in which trade unionism is almost nonexistent, others where it is highly developed and influential; the bulk of countries fall somewhere in between these extremes. This diversity in structures, programs and impact reflects historical developments, political and economic trends, the quality of union leadership, the attitudes and/or effectiveness of national governments, etc.

The team found several elements to be particularly significant in understanding the environment in which the trade union movement operates in Africa. They include: economies in which wage earners are a relatively small minority, single party states or military regimes, large public sectors, economies in trouble, "tripartite systems" for settling labor disputes, and multi-donors in the labor field.

1. Rural economies. Although labor organizations are among the earliest associations of native Africans -- dating in some cases back to the 1920s -- wage earners as a group are a distinct minority in most African countries. African populations are predominantly rural. While some labor federations have an important rural base -- for example, Kenya where plantation and sugar workers are a vital force -- most union movements in Africa are urban-based. These demographic realities constrain the number of workers who potentially might be organized. In some countries in which AALC works, therefore, the prospects for substantially increasing union memberships are bleak.

While it is true that rural-to-urban migration continues, most of that manpower either is unemployed or working in burgeoning informal sectors where organization is very difficult.

2. Single party governments. As many African countries approach 30 years of independence, more than half those nations are ruled by the military or monolithic political parties. Authoritarian regimes, so long as they are not too oppressive, are tolerated in Africa as an antidote to tribalism and tribal politics that could well result in instability, civil war, and chaos. The evaluation team visited two single party countries -- Kenya and Zaire -- and observed the tensions that exist for labor leaders who daily must deal with the demands of their rank-and-file, yet not seem "disloyal" to their governments.
3. Large public sectors. Another constraint upon the trade union movement is the large public sectors whose employees are forbidden to organize, or are organized in their own associations apart from the central labor federation, or are expressly forbidden to strike. In some countries, public employees make up a large and important segment of the trade union movement, but this is the exception rather the rule.
4. Economic decline. During the first half of the 1980s many of the economies of sub-Saharan Africa declined precipitously. Falling international prices for primary products, excessive debt service requirements, and sluggish domestic economies, when combined with the devastation of war, plague and drought had rendered many countries virtually bankrupt by mid-decade. Stagnating economies have, in turn, exacerbated problems of unemployment and underemployment. Large labor surpluses tend to undermine vigorous and active trade unionism. When people are willing to work for almost any wage rather than starve, employers can be cavalier in their attitudes toward labor.

5. Tripartite systems. For the most part, the classic Western models of labor-management relations do not apply in Africa. In virtually every nation on the continent, the government is an active third party in labor disputes and negotiations, giving rise to "tripartite systems" in which labor agreements are hammered out. Many African countries have laws that, while recognizing some right of labor to strike, make strikes very difficult because of preliminary steps that must be fulfilled before a walkout can be authorized. Another feature of the tripartite systems are labor courts. These courts are empowered to settle labor disputes when the tripartite system has failed. Usually their verdicts are final, but some may be appealed. Often government and business are much better equipped to use such mechanisms than the workers; AALC programs are helping to change this in some countries.

6. Multi-donor Competition. The African trade union movement began with the transference of labor organizations from the metropolises into the colonies. Where, as in France, the labor movements were fractured into ideological and political camps, those differences were also expressed in Africa. Although the movement toward single, government-approved federations has reduced these conflicts, the European unions continue their links with their African counterparts. For example, four West German labor institutions work in Africa, each one representing a different political party. French unions, including both communist and non-communist, are active in about 14 countries in Africa, including the French department of Reunion.

There are a number of state-controlled union organizations from the Eastern Bloc that provide huge sums of money and materials to African unions. The Scandinavians, Italians, Japanese and Israelis are relative newcomers but very active on the African scene. The Scandinavians and other Europeans are now doing much the same kinds of things as AALC and with funding from their governments even though they previously were critical of AALC's activities and funding source. AALC does not lack for company as it carries out its programs. Concomitantly, African unions often can look to a plethora of potential donors for any activity they seek to have funded. Donors are played off against each other by union leadership seeking to maximize outside assistance.

B. Trends

From its on-the-ground visit to four countries, numerous interviews and document reviews, the team identified a number of important trends that have developed during the past five years:

1. A Period of Relative Labor Peace. The last five years have been relatively peaceful in labor-management relations. In virtually every country in which they are allowed, the numbers of strikes have declined. At the same time, the number of collective bargaining agreements concluded has risen. Internecine strife between and among unions also has subsided as more and more unions are affiliated with one or two major federations within a country. Labor peace also can be seen as a result of the difficult economic times many of the countries have experienced; government and public tolerance of labor strife has been low. Another cause appears to be the maturation of labor movements and labor leaders who are seeking opportunities to demonstrate the willingness of their unions to contribute to national recovery rather than just insist on higher wages for their members.

2. Impact of "Structural Adjustment." By the end of 1988, 27 countries in sub-Saharan Africa were actively engaged in some form of macro-economic structural adjustment program, often under the tutelage of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) or the World Bank. The result has been increased assistance flows and some moderate debt relief associated with "structural adjustment" programs. The price for this outside help, however, has been the initiation of IMF-dictated reform programs whose impact has been particularly felt among wage earners, including organized labor:
 - Restrictive wage policies can lower real wages and undermine collective bargaining between unions and employers;
 - Reducing subsidies on essential commodities raises the price of staple items and erodes the purchasing power of wages;
 - Reduced government budgets can result in layoffs and lower the real wages of public sector workers;

- Requiring parastatals to privatize, either by opening them to competition or devolving them to private ownership, often causes redundant workers to be let go;
- Devaluation of currencies raises the price of imported items, again eroding the buying power of the wage earner; and
- Tightened credit weakens demand in the economy, which can eliminate jobs and contribute to unemployment.

As the "richest of the poor" in Africa, the urban wage earner has felt the effects of structural adjustment perhaps more keenly than any other single group.

3. The decline of African Socialism. A major shift is occurring in the economic philosophy of African countries. With centrally-run economies like China and the USSR making attempts to "liberalize," with the evident failure of Nyerere's Tanzanian socialist experiment, and confronted with their own economic weaknesses, African nations are abandoning the concept of African Socialism -- once a watchword. Governments are withdrawing from regulating their economies and permitting the market more freedom in fulfilling production and distribution functions. One result of this increased emphasis on private enterprise is rising demands from indigenous businesses and foreign investors for changes in national labor codes and regulations, many of which exist to protect workers. Thus the unions have been forced to witness "reforms" that in effect work against the interests of their membership, at least in the short run.
4. Unions as Instruments of Development. Whether in Botswana where the labor federation sponsors a small vegetable-growing coop, or Zaire where the federation manages three holding companies with more than a dozen diverse enterprises, the trend in Africa appears to be the use of labor unions as instruments of development. In some cases government leaders have challenged the unions to go beyond their traditional concerns for "bread and butter" issues of their members -- to participate in a broader vision of national growth and development. Whether fitted for, or comfortable in, such a role, African labor leaders have accepted it as part of their agenda. This has inspired

new emphasis on credit and savings unions, consumer and producer cooperatives, and a wide range of income-generating activities. The challenge involved in making these initiatives succeed is dominating the attention of African labor leaders as never before.

5. Pragmatic Regionalism. Regionalism long has been a strong theme in Africa, but the trend today is toward a more pragmatic understanding of the term. All-Africa labor organizations have lost some attraction, as regional labor organizations have been formed that parallel African regional economic groupings. Thus, the formation of the Organization of Trade Unions of West Africa (OTUWA) groups federations from the member countries of the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), the Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council (SATUCC) groups federations in the member countries of the Southern Africa Development Coordinating Committee (SADCC), and the Organisation des Travailleurs de l'Afrique Centrale (OTAC) groups federations in the member countries of the Economic Community of Central African States (ECOCAS).

Because most of these organizations are relatively new, it is too early to determine their ultimate viability, except in the case of SATUCC which is fast becoming a focal point for united action in the Southern African region. As the AALC increasingly regionalizes its own operations, these groups provide potential points of focus.

Other expressions of pragmatic regionalism can be found in the interest in East Africa to form a regional organization, using the Tom Mboya Labour College, to service trade unionists from outside Kenya, and the greater participation by regional organizations in existing programs such as the Institute for Higher Trade Union Studies (IAHES) in Dakar.

6. Women in the Labor Movement. During the past half-decade, many African unions have given new emphasis to the role of women in the workforce. Women's components have been opened by many labor federations and unions under a variety of names and organizational patterns. They all have a similar purpose: to provide programs directed at the woman wage earner. These programs are bearing several results: (1) a cadre of

women leaders and trainers of trainers has been developed to carry activities to wherever there are groups of women workers; (2) increasing numbers of women are joining unions, and (3) women-directed activities and services such as day care, pre-schools, and income generating projects have proliferated. While women are still seldom seen in the hierarchy of national unions, some have been given considerable responsibility at mid-levels. Just as important, male union leaders throughout Africa apparently not only accept the emphasis on women but seem proud of the accomplishments that have been made in that direction.

Having surveyed key components of the context and development of African trade unionism during the past half-decade, the study now turns to a review of the AALC programs.

IV. AALC PROGRAMS

The AALC program is composed of:

- country programs;
- regional activities;
- impact projects, usually in countries without annual programs; and
- support to International Trade Secretariats' activities and U.S. union-to-union projects.

A total of 37 countries have participated in the AALC program during the period of the current grant. At the outset of the grant there were 11 country programs; 6 have been added since: 1 in 1986, 2 in 1987, 2 in 1988 and 1 in 1989. Of the 21 countries that have received impact projects, only seven have had a second project. There were also 21 countries that were recipients of ITS or union-to-union activities; 13 hosted more than one activity. IAHES seminars have been held in 16 countries, with participation involving even more countries. Nine countries participated in a CREDE seminar in May 1985 on labor press activities. See Table IV-1 on the following page for the distribution by country of the various programs.

It will be noted from Table IV-1 that impact projects and IAHES seminars, with few exceptions, have been reserved for countries that do not have a regular program under the grant. For example, only two impact projects were approved for countries that had a regular program at the time. Only one-fourth of the IAHES seminars were held in the original program countries. Impact projects were precursors to country programs in four of the six new country programs during the period of the grant.

TABLE IV-1
COUNTRIES PARTICIPATING IN AALC PROGRAM
BY TYPE OF PARTICIPATION

COUNTRY	COUNTRY PROGRAM ^{1/}	IMPACT PROJECT ^{2/}	ITS/UNION TO- ^{2/} UNION ACTIVITY ^{2/}	IAIES SEMINAR ^{2/}	CREDE SEMINAR	TRADE UNION SERVICES ^{3/}
Benin			x			
Botswana	x		x			x
Burkina Faso		x		x(3)	x	
Burundi		x(2)		x		
Cameroon				x(3)		
Chad		x		x		
Djibouti		x(2)				
Ethiopia		x				
Gabon		x		x(4)		
Gambia		x	x	x		
Ghana	x		x(4)	x		
Guinea	x(86)			x	x	
Guinea Bissau				x	x	
Ivory Coast		x	x(4)		x	
Kenya	x		x(4)			x
Lesotho	x	x				
Liberia	x		x	x		x
Madagascar		x(2)				
Malawi	x(89)	x				
Mali		x(2)	x(2)	x(3)	x	x
Mauritania			x	x(2)	x	
Mauritius	x		x			x
Mozambique			x			
Niger	x(88)	x	x(3)	x(2)	x	
Nigeria		x	x(4)			
Ruanda		x(2)				
Senegal	x(87)	x	x(4)	x(2)	x	
Sierra Leone	x	x	x(2)			
Somali		x				
Sudan	x		4/			x
Swaziland	x(88)		x			x
Tanzania		x(2)				
Togo	x		x(4)	x(2)	x	
Uganda	x(87)	x	x(4)			
Zaire	x		x(2)	x(2)		
Zambia		x(2)	x(6)			x
Zimbabwe	x		x(4)			

^{1/}Numbers in parentheses indicate the year the country program was initiated. Others had programs from grant inception.

^{2/}Numbers in parentheses indicate the number of projects/activities; x = one only.

^{3/}Regional project: Trade Union Service Project Development

^{4/}Sudan also benefited from ITS/Union-to-Union Activity, but it was charged to the expanded country program which was initially assumed to be a separate grant.

A summary of the budgetary allocations of the AALC program is shown in Table IV-2 below.

TABLE IV-2
AALC PROGRAM -- CUMULATIVE 1985-88
(US\$ 1,000)

<u>Components</u>	<u>Original Budget</u>		<u>Revised Budget</u>		<u>Commitments</u>
	<u>\$</u>	<u>%</u>	<u>\$</u>	<u>%</u>	
Country Programs	7,162	48	7,988	54	7,495
Regional (IAHES, CREDE, Coops, etc.)	1,671	11	1,339	9	1,453
Impact Projects	1,072	7	885	6	908
ITS/Union-to-Union	750	5	939	6	936
Sub-Totals	<u>10,655</u>	<u>71</u>	<u>11,151</u>	<u>76</u>	<u>10,792</u>
Headquarters) 4,287) 29	1,317	9	1,274
Indirect Costs))	2,228	15	2,577
Total Program	14,942	100	14,696	100	14,643

The biggest change in the budget is the expansion of country programs from 48 to 54 percent of the budget. This is largely due to the necessity of expanding the Sudan program by nearly \$1.5 million.

Table IV-3 on the following page gives the original budget figures by years for 1985-88 by budget line item. The cumulative 1985-88 totals are compared to the revised budget figures that have evolved. Cumulative commitments and expenditures are also shown. The cumulative commitments figures in the table include what is classed as expenditures by AALC plus advances to AALC field representatives or ITSs (or U.S. unions under the ITS program). Given the natural delays in submitting documentation from the field and processing it in AALC/W, the commitments figure is probably closer to accrued expenditures, as defined by AID, than the AALC expenditure figures.

TABLE IV-3

STATUS OF AALC PROGRAM AS OF DECEMBER 31, 1988

(US\$ 1,000)

	Original Budget Figures					Revised Budget	Commit- ments	Expendi- tures
	1985	1986	1987	1988	Cum.			
Headquarters <u>1/</u>	1065	1065	1068	1089	4287	3547	3851	3627
<u>Regional</u>	411	411	413	436	1671	1339	1453	1422
IAHES	248	248	249	263	1008	876	1075	1044
CREDE	80	80	81	85	326	308	230	230
Credit Unions/Coops/ Member Services	83	83	83	88	337	155	148	148
ITS/Union-to-Union	187	187	188	188	750	938	936	682
Impact Projects	268	268	268	268	1072	885	908	716
<u>Country Programs</u>	1755	1757	1768	1880	7160	7976	7495	6953
Botswana	159	159	160	174	652	643	501	494
Ghana	228	228	230	244	930	325	152	142
Kenya	347	347	349	363	1406	1467	1353	1300
Lesotho	45	45	45	47	182	160	237	212
Liberia	131	131	133	147	542	590	627	614
Mauritius	178	179	180	184	721	544	524	497
Sierra Leone	147	148	149	163	607	500	536	508
Sudan	15	15	15	20	65	1548	1147	1022
Togo	50	50	50	52	202	187	217	155
Zaire	257	257	258	272	1044	1034	1277	1170
Zimbabwe	198	198	199	214	809	764	690	636
Other Countries	--	--	--	--	--	214	244	203
Grand Total	3688	3688	3705	3861	14942	14696	14643	13399
As % of Total:								
Headquarters	29%	29%	29%	28%	29%	24%	25%	27%
Regional/Impact/ITS	23	23	23	23	23	22	23	21
Country Programs	48	48	48	49	48	54	51	52

1/ Includes both direct and indirect costs.

The various AALC program components are summarized and assessed in this chapter. A more extensive discussion of the country programs of the four countries visited by the evaluation team is included in Annex C. The rest of the country programs are discussed in Annex D.

A. Country Programs

At the outset of the grant in 1985, there were 11 country programs: Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Mauritius, Sierra Leone, Sudan, Togo, Zaire and Zimbabwe. During project implementation, six additional country programs were added: Guinea in 1986, Senegal and Uganda in 1987, Niger and Swaziland in 1988 and Malawi in 1989.

A report on each of these countries is provided in Annexes C (Botswana, Kenya, Senegal and Zaire) and D (all others). The country reports are organized around five topics: 1) Trade Union Movement; 2) Trade Union Relations with the Government; 3) Trade Union Programs; 4) AALC Support; and 5) Findings and Conclusions.

This section provides some comparative information on the program content for the 11 countries selected in the original agreement for national programs (Table IV-4 on the following page) and some information on U.S. training. Progress in achieving the long-term objectives specific to each country is discussed in the reports in Annexes C and D. Table IV-9 at the end of this chapter provides an assessment of the performance of the 11 countries in relation to the general indicators of progress set forth in the cooperative agreement.

As can be seen from Table IV-4, the highest priority for AALC-supported programs is the expansion of services to federation affiliates and union members, especially in the areas of credit unions and cooperatives, health and safety programs and the establishment/expansion of women's activities. Strengthening of headquarters operations and of regional operations tied for second most frequently cited program objective. Expanding and improving education programs was seen as a very important element of strengthening both headquarters and regional operations.

TABLE IV-4
LONG-TERM OBJECTIVES OF AALC COUNTRY PROGRAMS

OBJECTIVES	BOTSWANA	GHANA	KENYA	LESOTHO	LIBERIA	MAURITIUS	SIERRA LEONE	SUDAN	TOGO	ZAIRE	ZIMBABWE	TOTALS
1. <u>Strengthen Headquarters Operations</u>												
a. Education Program		x				x		x		x	x	5
b. General		x		x	x	x			x	x	x	7
2. <u>Strengthen Regional Operations</u>												
a. Education program	x			x	x				x		x	5
b. General		x	x	x	x		x		x		x	7
3. <u>Increase Services to Affiliates/Members</u>												
a. Women's programs/women's unit	x	x	x	x	x		x			x	x	8
b. Health and safety	x	x	x	x	x		x			x		8
c. Credit unions/coops	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			10
d. Literacy	x		x				x					4
e. Vocational education/job creation				x		x						2
4. <u>Establish a Research Department</u>	x										x	3
5. <u>Increase Trade Union Participation in Government Decision-making</u>						x			x	x		
6. <u>Establish/Strengthen Labor College</u>		x	x									2
7. <u>Achieve Economic Self-Sufficiency</u>						x						1
8. <u>Recruit New Union Affiliates/Members</u>	x				x							2
9. <u>Improve Financial Management</u>	x				x					x		3
10. <u>Establish Union Publications</u>					x							1

Training is the most important element in the AALC program in terms of meeting the foregoing objectives. The bulk of this training is carried out in Africa, sometimes using trainers brought from the United States, but more and more frequently using Africans who have benefited from earlier training programs. The amount of U.S. training financed from the grant is small and declining. Such training, however, is important. If it is not continued under other auspices (as discussed below), it will be necessary to include additional funding for U.S. training in future AALC budgets.

U.S. Training

Very little training has been carried out in the U.S. under AALC's current cooperative agreement with AID. Prior to this agreement, AALC (in cooperation with the Harvard Trade Union Program) sponsored three-month study programs for trade unionists at Harvard. Many of Africa's current trade union leaders participated in this program, e.g., the secretaries-general of federations in Ghana, Lesotho, Kenya, Zambia. AALC discontinued this project nearly eight years ago because of the rising costs of tuition and maintenance, the increased sophistication of Africa's trade unionists, and their requests for specialized education programs that were more relevant to their needs.

The small amount of training that now occurs using funds from this grant consists of short-term (three-week) study tours for specific individuals, e.g., the principal of the labor college in Kenya toured similar facilities in the U.S., newly-elected officials were invited to discuss cooperative programs, etc. Most programs of this nature have been carried out through the ITS program, i.e., American unions have invited counterparts' members to attend conventions, observe union attempts to deal with health hazards in specific industries, visit union education facilities, or discuss other topics that are common to the unions -- collective bargaining, arbitration, organizing, etc. An average of five trade unionists per year visit the United States on these kinds of programs.

Using the Impact Fund, AALC provides training for union women each year. This program consists of a two-week program which combines basic trade union education at the AFL-CIO's Summer School for Union Women with on-site visits to community development projects in selected U.S. cities.

AALC has used funds from the National Endowment for Democracy (NED) to finance two high level seminars in the United States each year, one for francophone trade unionists and one for anglophones. These seminars are tied in with similar programs held in Africa, either through the regional institute in Dakar or on the national level. Approximately 35 trade unionists each year participate in this program.

The U.S. Information Agency also finances programs in the U.S. for African trade unionists. USIA selects the participants and AALC arranges the program. These programs correspond to the stated needs of the participant and are not training programs per se. About 15 programs are arranged each year, either for individuals or groups.

AALC has little direct input into AID/Department of Labor (DOL)-sponsored study tours. These opportunities are publicized by AID, and the participants are selected by AID missions and programmed by DOL. AALC is usually included in the program for a brief visit, but it is not involved in determining the overall content of the program. There are about five such tours each year.

B. Regional Activities

The regional activities supported by AALC include the Trade Union Service Project Development, African Institute for Higher Trade Union Studies (IAHES), and the Information and Research Center. The principal achievements of these activities are discussed below.

1. Trade Union Service Project Development

a. Background

In the AALC's five-year submission, this activity originally was titled "Credit Union and Cooperative Development." The focus of this regional program was to provide technical assistance to African labor federations in the establishment of various types of credit unions and cooperatives. In 1987, the project was re-titled "Trade Union Service Project Development" and expanded to include social and

economic programs in the area of food production, small businesses, handicraft centers, and a wide range of job creation and income-generating activities.

b. AALC Support

Over the five-year period, union federations in the following countries received technical and material assistance in formulating and implementing a wide variety of service projects:

- Kenya (housing cooperatives);
- Botswana (food production, secretarial services, credit unions);
- Zambia (credit unions);
- Lesotho (textile crafts center, credit unions);
- Sudan (cooperatives);
- Mali (agricultural cooperatives);
- Mauritius (credit unions, small businesses, agricultural production);
- Swaziland (food production, sewing centers).

Much of this assistance has consisted of training in credit union and cooperative management, contributions to revolving funds, and materials and equipment. Most recently, some of this assistance has gone to the Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council (SATUCC) so that this organization could undertake a regional program to exchange ideas, methodology and problem solving in a region threatened not only by the general economic crisis but also by economic retaliation from the Republic of South Africa.

c. Findings and Conclusions

Service activities have not only helped individual workers improve their standard of living, they also have acted as a magnet for unorganized workers. In Botswana, for example, the success of the railway workers savings cooperative has resulted in an increase of nearly 100 percent in the union's membership. Also in Botswana, the creation of a workers' service organization is expected to lend added stature to a labor movement handicapped by government restrictions.

In Mauritius, membership in the Mauritius Labour Congress has increased because of its involvement in a wide range of service activities. What began as a small textile/vocational training project for unemployed women in Lesotho is now generating income as well as members for the Lesotho Congress of Free Trade Unions. Given the low dues structure of most African unions, these additional sources of income can be used to train organizers, shop stewards, and negotiators and to carry out other programs that will develop the labor movement as a whole, making it better able to represent workers before the government and employer bodies.

This new role for the trade union movement will assume even greater importance in the future as long as national economies continue to stagnate, unemployment increases, and wages remain low. It is timely for the AALC and AID to consider new ways to help the trade union movement expand and sustain service projects.

2. Africa Institute for Advanced Trade Union Studies

a. Background

The African Institute for Advanced Trade Union Studies, known by its French acronym, IAHEs, is located in Dakar, Senegal. It is a regional education center serving trade unions in West and Central Africa. It does not provide in-house training; rather, it organizes and coordinates training programs which are held at various locations in West and Central Africa.

Most of the international and national organizations assisting African labor federations over the years have provided their own brand of labor education, resulting in a confusing potpourri of ideologies and methodologies and little rational, non-ideological labor training. This confusion led the AALC to join with the CNTS of Senegal and a pan-African labor organization, the Organization of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU) in the 1980 establishment of a truly African institute, one which would respond directly to the education needs of African workers.

The new Institute's objectives were ambitious, including particularly that the OATUU eventually would assume full financial responsibility for its support. Another regional labor group formed in 1985 by federations from the sixteen countries in the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) also was expected to help finance this project after several years.

The objectives of this project for the 1985-1989 grant period were the development of: 1) an English language capability in francophone trade unions; 2) effective trade union leadership; and 3) a worker education capability within national union federations.

b. AALC Support

At the beginning of the current grant period, the AALC maintained a permanent representative in Dakar with responsibility for overseeing the Institute's programs. A staff of six Senegalese nationals constituted the remainder of the Institute's personnel. AALC has provided 100 percent funding for IAHS.

Because of overall budget cuts, the American representative was removed in 1987 and the staff reduced to three (a director, administrator, and secretary). Much of the responsibility for curriculum design and program implementation was taken over by the AALC's headquarters office in Washington, D.C.

Despite the reduction in personnel and the gradual transfer of program and administrative responsibility to Washington, program activities were maintained throughout the period and objectives adjusted accordingly. An effort has been made to avoid duplication among donors to regional programs and to make the Institute's offerings more consistent with those sponsored for African trade unionists by the AALC in the United States.

c. Findings and Conclusions

Teaching English to French-speaking trade unionists proved difficult. For approximately two years (1985-86), a pilot language program for CNTS staff provided instruction for sixty men and women in the evenings and on weekends. The major obstacle facing the unionists was that of time; many had full-time jobs in addition to their union responsibilities and simply could not devote enough time to their studies. Since the major impetus for the program had been provided by the AALC's representative and little progress was being made by unionists because of time constraints, the program was discontinued when the representative left Dakar in 1987.

With regard to the second IAHERS objective, various education programs were designed and implemented between 1985 and 1989:

- a) 10 regional seminars on major themes (economic research, union finances, industrial relations, union administration, etc.);
- b) 19 national seminars on shop steward training, labor law, collective bargaining, etc.; and
- c) the dissemination of standardized curricula and instructors' manuals for use by national trade union centers. Approximately 1,000 trade unionists participated in these seminars.

Comparing the themes of regional seminars in 1985 (information, communications, finances, industrial relations) with those in 1987-1988 (response to the economic crisis, labor economics, instructor training) illustrates how IAHERS has adjusted its training to enable union leaders to participate on a more equal footing with government and employers in formulating national economic policy to respond to the economic crises plaguing most African countries. In many countries, federations are involved not just through collective negotiations, but also through participation on national tripartite commissions. Regional and national seminars on labor legislation has provided another avenue for increased worker participation.

In national education programs, the curriculum has shifted from general trade union education, shop steward training, and collective

bargaining to rural development, communications, labor research, and education planning and evaluation. As trade union educators become more knowledgeable about fundamental trade union practices, their needs become more specialized. Education departments with permanent staffs now exist in virtually every trade union federation in Africa. Research departments have been established or are being established in a number of the federations. Quality statistical research on current economic developments affecting workers is being produced. Long-term education planning is fast becoming a theme of regional and national workshops.

Through a conscientious effort to develop a curriculum responsive to the changing needs of unions in Africa, the IAHES (with AALC support) has contributed to the increased quality and effectiveness of trade union leaders. Through planning, evaluation, and an emphasis on instructor training, national worker education departments have developed the capacity to conduct more effective and relevant programs for union members.

The rationale behind the establishment of a regional education center is a sound one. Given economic conditions in Africa, the high cost of national programs, the common problems facing unions on the continent, and the trend towards regionalization in other areas, the delivery of consistent and non-political union education on a regional basis continues to make good sense.

A question remains, however, on the effective administration of IAHES and its future expansion. The team believes that to fulfill the potential of the organization, an AALC representative should be permanently assigned to Dakar both to help administer the organization and to serve as a senior trainer. The same individual could, of course, supervise a Senegal country program.

3. CREDE/Information & Research Center

a. Background

The establishment in 1972 of the Regional Center for Economic Research and Documentation, known by its French acronym, CREDE, grew out of African unions' desire for a pan-African research center that would provide the continent's labor movements with current labor news and data and that would assist them in creating local documentation and research capabilities. As in the case of the IAHER, the Center's activities would be carried out under the aegis of the Pan-African organization, OATUU, and the AALC, with the expectation that OATUU eventually would assume financial responsibility for the project. An OATUU co-director resigned in 1980 and was not replaced; since then, OATUU has had only a token role in the project.

b. AALC Support

Since its creation and for the first two years of the grant period (1985-86), AALC supported CREDE publication of a monthly socio-economic journal, Labor and Development, and a newsletter, African Trade Union News, in both French and English. Both publications were received by nearly 1,500 trade unionists, labor ministers, and other government officials. The center also organized several colloquia on labor journalism and produced studies on topics of interest to African trade unionists. A trade union library, which was established at the Center's offices in Lome, was used by the local trade union federation, regional seminar participants, and visiting trade unionists.

AALC provided \$80,000 a year for the support of CREDE during 1985-86. Faced with increased overall budget constraints, AALC decided in 1986 to terminate the project. The acting director was moved to the AALC's Regional Office in Abidjan, Ivory Coast, to help oversee other AALC projects in the region and to revive some CREDE activities on a more modest scale (\$40,000 a year under the information and research budget category).

c. Findings and Conclusions

The AALC staff member responsible for the project, who has assumed additional duties in the AALC's regional office, is trying to revive at least part of the original CREDE project, e.g., the publication of African Trade Union News. Using funds from non-AID sources, the first edition (in both French and English) was published and distributed in March 1989. The team found the publication interesting and professionally done.

The issue of a research and documentation center was raised on several occasions during the evaluators' trip. Some trade union leaders mentioned their regret that the CREDE operation had ceased to function and emphasized the usefulness to their organizations of an African publication and research center.

The AALC may wish to consider some consolidation of former CREDE functions with IAHER, expanding the activities of the latter organization. At the same time, AALC should continue its efforts at making the programs as self-sufficient as possible, for example, either through sales or from contributions from African regional organizations or other donors.

C. International Trade Secretariats/Union-to-Union Programs

1. Background

International Trade Secretariats (ITSS) are organizations composed of unions in a similar industry or service sector. For example, unions such as the International Ladies Garment Workers Union (United States), the Textile Workers Union in Senegal, and the Mauritius Textile and Garment Workers Union are affiliated to, or have a relationship with, the International Textile, Leather and Garment Workers Federation located in Belgium. There are currently 16 ITSS with affiliates throughout the free world. International Trade Secretariats are in turn associated with the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU). A list of ITSS and American affiliates participating in the AALC program is provided in Table IV-5 at the end of this section.

The AALC, as the representative of the AFL-CIO, cannot provide assistance directly to another federation's affiliate. Some of the assistance provided to national centers can be used by that center to assist an affiliate, but it is considered inappropriate for the AALC to bypass a national center to help an individual union. Therefore, the AALC provides funds to American unions or to ITSS to help individual unions in selected African countries.

The AALC's objective in this area is much the same as in its other programs, i.e., the development of the national labor movements in Africa by contributing to the strength of their affiliates. AALC's involvement in this aspect of international labor relations has other objectives: increasing the awareness on the part of American unions of international affairs and the benefits of union-to union relationships; assisting American unions to respond to some of their counterparts' requests; enabling ITSS to respond to their affiliates' needs; and encouraging the formation of similar organizations in Africa to resolve certain problems confronting particular industries or sectors on a regional level. If an affiliated union of an "unfriendly" national trade union center is strengthened through this kind of assistance, it is better able to influence its own national center in a positive way, thus facilitating a potentially more cordial and productive federation-to-federation relationship.

The procedures used to implement activities in this program begin with a request from a national union either to its ITS or to a counterpart union. An ITS or counterpart national union may receive requests from unions in several African countries. The ITS or counterpart union then consolidates its requests and submits them to the AALC. Based on its resources, the AALC then makes a decision on funding, taking into account the overall objectives of the grant and the estimated impact on the project budget. When an activity is approved, the AALC advances the funds to the ITS/counterpart union which implements the project. The ITS/counterpart union subsequently submits to AALC a completion report on the activity, including a financial report.

2. AALC Support

Nearly \$940,000 was allocated to ITS activities during the period 1985-88. This was nearly \$200,000 more than originally budgeted, approximately equal to the reduction in the revised budget for impact projects. AALC-supported programs undertaken by American unions and ITSs have covered a wide range of topics and activities: providing funds for international conferences; the purchase of vehicles for organizing purposes; arranging exchange programs and study tours for individual union members. Table IV-6 at the end of this section indicates the countries in which American unions/ITSs carried out programs or sponsored exchange visits during the grant period.

3. Findings and Conclusions

The number of American unions interested in international labor affairs and willing to contribute time and expertise to their African counterparts is steadily increasing. In 1989 alone, three additional U.S. unions have expressed interest in participating in the AALC's ITS programs. The AFL-CIO encourages the involvement of its affiliates in international affairs, a fact amply illustrated by the increasing numbers of its officers who have traveled abroad over the past few months.

For their part, African unionists continue to express the need for the specific expertise that their American counterparts can provide. The common bond created by the problems they confront in similar industries establishes the basis for joint problem-solving, cooperation, and action. A continuation of the program at gradually increasing levels seems appropriate.

At the same time, American unions should be expected to provide their own contributions, in cash or in kind, to African counterpart unions. These contributions would, of course, count toward the AFL-CIO total contribution in support of AALC programs.

TABLE IV-5

INTERNATIONAL TRADE SECRETARIATS AND AFFILIATED U.S. UNIONS
PARTICIPATING IN THE AALC PROGRAM

International Federation of Building and Wood Workers (IFBWW)

International Union of Bricklayers & Allied Craftsmen (IUBAC)

International Chemical, Energy and General Workers Federation (ICF)

Oil, Chemical & Atomic Workers International Union (OCAW)

International Federation of Commercial, Clerical, Professional and Technical Employees (FIET)

United Food and Commercial Workers International Union (UFCW)
Service Employees International Union (SEIU)

International Metalworkers Federation (IMF)

United Steelworkers of America (USWA)

International Federation of Plantation, Agricultural and Allied Workers (IFPAAW)

United Food and Commercial Workers International Union (UFCW)

Postal, Telegraph & Telephone International (PTTI)

Communications Workers of America (CWA)

Public Services International (PSI)

Service Employees International Union (SEIU)

International Federation of Free Teachers Unions (IFFTU)

American Federation of Teachers (AFT)

International Textile, Garment, and Leather Workers Federation (ITGLWF)

International Ladies' Garment Workers Union (ILGWU)

International Transport Workers Federation (ITF)

International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers (IAM)
Transportation Communications Union (TCU) -- formerly the Brotherhood of
Railway & Airline Clerks (BRAC)

TABLE IV-6

ITS/UNION-TO-UNION PROGRAMS 1985-88

Country	In-Country Training	Equipment	Study Tours/Exchanges
Benin	CWA		
Botswana	CWA		
Gambia	AFT		
Ghana	AFT	SEIU	UFCW, SEIU
Ivory Coast	IAM, CWA		ILGWU, SEIU
Kenya	USWA, CWA		BRAC, OCAW
Liberia			AFT
Mali	CWA		IUBAC
Mauritania	CWA		
Mauritius	ILGWU		
Mozambique			IUBAC
Niger	AFT, CWA		UFCW
Nigeria	AFT		ILGWU, BRAC, OCAW
Senegal	UFCW, AFT, CWA, ILGWU		
Sierra Leone	CWA		AFT
Swaziland	CWA		
Togo	UFCW, AFT, CCWA, ILGWU		
Uganda	IAM, UFCW, CWA, BRAC		
Zaire	CWA		USWA
Zambia	UFCW, AFT, CWA, IUBAC		AFT, UFCW
Zimbabwe	IAM, AFT		IUBAC, IAM

D. Impact Projects

1. Background

The Impact Project fund enables the AALC to respond to the needs of certain regional groups or "constituencies" not adequately covered by individual country programs, e.g., trade union women, books for union libraries, regional study tours, and to assist federations in countries where there is no regular country program. Occasionally it is used to supplement existing country programs when unforeseen needs arise.

Certain criteria are used in selecting projects for funding through the Impact Project fund:

- The project must conform with the overall objectives of the AALC, i.e., the development of free and democratic trade unions.
- The project should be one that can be implemented, if possible, within a calendar year.
- The project's budget should not exceed \$50,000.

As Impact Project funds are requested, a detailed proposal and budget are drafted. Prior to implementation, the proposal is submitted to the American Ambassador to ensure that the activity does not conflict with U.S. policy objectives in that country. Regional projects are submitted to AID/AFR for the same concurrence. Projects are then implemented by AALC regional representatives, headquarters staff, or the trade union federation itself.

2. AALC Support

Since 1985, the AALC has implemented 35 Impact Projects in 21 countries plus 7 multi-country projects (see Table IV-8 below). Most of this \$765,000 program has been in support of education programs. Construction projects, provision of a vehicle, support to cooperatives, and study tours have also been financed.

The Impact Fund has also been used to respond to some of the concerns of trade union women. Since 1985, the AALC has been able to conduct four programs in the United States for trade union women from anglophone and francophone countries. Trade union women have been able to attend the AFL-CIO's Summer School for Union Women and to visit community development projects in selected U.S. cities. These programs have resulted in greater and more effective involvement in union activities by some of the African trade union women once they return home. The realization of longer term goals, e.g., placing women's concerns on the federation's agenda and having women elected to leadership positions, is occurring in some countries.

Finally, funds from this category have allowed the AALC to sponsor study tours for trade union leaders who would not have had an opportunity to participate in other exchange programs such as those sponsored by AID or USIA. On two occasions, the AALC was able to provide this opportunity to newly-elected leaders of trade union federations, e.g., in Nigeria and Somalia. These funds have also been used to finance African unionists' attendance at AFL-CIO conventions.

Table IV-8, which follows immediately behind Table IV-7, lists all the countries that have benefited from impact projects (including through multi-country projects) and shows how they have benefited.

TABLE IV-7
IMPACT PROJECTS, 1985-89

<u>Country</u>	<u>Project</u>	<u>Date(s)</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Burkina	Education	1987	\$ 7,000
Burundi (2)	Education	1985	15,000
		1987	10,335
Chad	Education	1988	12,500
Djibouti (2)	Education	1987	8,000
		1988	10,000
Ethiopia	Education/US	1985	20,000
Gabon	Cooperatives	1987	15,000
Gambia	Education/Equipment	1985	17,000
Ivory Coast	Education/Women	1987	15,000
Lesotho	Construction/Headquarters	1985	15,000
Madagascar (2)	Education & Equipment	1986	24,000
		1987	10,000
Malawi	Education	1986	30,000
Mali (2)	Education/Equipment	1987	15,000
		1989	20,000
Niger	Education/Equipment	1987	25,000
Nigeria	Study Tour	1987	50,000
Rwanda (2)	Education	1987	15,000
		1988	17,241
Senegal	Building Renovation	1986	20,000
Sierra Leone	Education/Equipment	1986	37,000
Somalia	Study Tour/US	1988	10,000
Tanzania (2)	Education	1987	15,500
	Vehicle	1988	15,000
Uganda	Administrative Expenses	1986	16,000
Zambia (2)	Cooperatives/Education	1986	49,750
		1989	45,000
<u>Multi-Country</u>			
Pan-African	Model Library	1986	7,840
Pan-African	AFL-CIO Convention/Study Tour	1987	30,000
SATUCC	Education/Projects	1988	35,000
Women (4)	Study Tour/US	1985	31,495
		1986	39,310
		1987	24,035
		1988	37,550
			\$764,556
	TOTAL		

TABLE IV -- 8
IMPACT PROJECTS BY COMPONENT

Country	Training	Women	Services	AdminCosts	Constr/Equipmt	Study Tours	Other
Botswana		x				x	
Burkina	x						
Burundi	x				x	x	
Cameroon		x				x	
Chad	x	x				x	
Cote d'Ivoire	x	x				x	
Djibouti	x						
Ethiopia							x
Gabon		x	x		x	x	
Gambia	x				x		
Ghana		x				x	
Guinea		x				x	
Kenya		x				x	
Lesotho	x	x			x	x	
Liberia		x				x	
Madagascar	x				x		
Malawi	x	x			x	x	
Mali		x	x		x	x	
Mauritius		x				x	
Niger	x				x		

TABLE IV -- 8 (Cont.)

Country	Training	Women	Services	AdminCosts	Constr/Equipmt	Study Tours	Other
Nigeria						x	
Rwanda	x				x		
Senegal		x			x	x	
Sierra Leone	x	x	x		x	x	
Somalia						x	
Sudan		x				x	
Tanzania	x	x			x	x	
Togo		x				x	
Uganda		x		x		x	
Zaire		x				x	
Zambia	x	x	x			x	
Zimbabwe		x				x	

3. Findings and Conclusions

Although funding for AALC's overall grant has remained fairly constant over the past five years, rising personnel costs in other categories and the addition of new country programs have caused the funding allocation for impact projects to fall from \$268,000 in 1985 to \$125,000 for the first nine months of 1989. This is natural to some extent as some impact project recipients in earlier years have graduated to a country program -- Zambia is expected to do so in 1990.

Federations in other countries, such as Tanzania, Mozambique, Benin, and the Central African Republic, are expected to increase their requests as the countries liberalize their economies and the federations pursue more open relationships with the AFL-CIO. Contact has already been made with trade union federations in Namibia which will require AFL-CIO assistance.

So that the AALC can respond to the needs of these federations and continue to help other smaller federations and other important constituencies within the African labor movement, funding in this category should be increased above the current level and should remain constant throughout the term of the next multi-year grant.

E. Conclusions on AALC Program Content and Impact

1. Activity Selection Process

Country programs presented to AID by AALC are based on discussions between AALC field representatives and their counterpart labor federation officials. Many of the unions are not in a position to do long-term planning, but the AALC planning process helps to get union leaders to look at least a little into the future. Because of the political and/or economic changes that have occurred in a number of countries, some of the long-term objectives that were planned in 1985 have turned out to be overly ambitious -- or, occasionally, inappropriate.

Needed changes in program direction have been effected through the establishment each year of annual objectives. These also are based on discussions with local union leadership.

Regional projects were established in response to expressed needs by national union leaders, and the continuing activities of the AALC-supported regional institutions are designed to meet training and technical assistance needs expressed by the national unions. Their requests reflect not only their local conditions, but concepts and approaches with which they have become familiar through orientation visits to the U.S. or in regional meetings. Thus, indirectly AALC affects the perceived needs of union leaders.

The programs sponsored by the International Trade Secretariats and the union-to-union programs which are financed by AALC are generally of three types: attendance at conferences, orientation visits to the U.S. or the carrying out of seminars or planning activities in Africa. All of these are appropriate for different countries at different stages of trade union development. The activities are usually proposed by African union leaders, although the idea for some may originate with the ITS or the U.S. union. At times, AALC must establish priorities between activities because it cannot fund all the proposals. It may also offer suggestions to U.S. unions on content or implementation mode.

In sum, the evaluation team was generally pleased with the way AALC has determined program content; it was satisfied that AALC was trying to ensure that the program met the felt needs of African trade union leaders.

2. Mix of components

The AALC program includes country programs, regional projects, support to ITS/union-to-union activities and impact projects. They are all important and in most cases mutually supportive. The country programs are designed to be used where some degree of planning is feasible and

some measurable objectives can be established. Over time, it should be possible to increase the share of total funds devoted to country programs. In the meantime, use of the other three program components can help countries get to where a country program is feasible.

The other three components are also important in broadening the perspectives of trade union leaders and helping them share their views with their rank and file membership. The other components can be helpful in promoting pluralism within trade unions and helping them survive in authoritarian systems.

Some of the training and research activities need to be carried out on a regional basis because a number of countries cannot afford to support these functions on a local basis. In some cases, it probably is more cost effective to carry them out on a regional basis even if the regional organizations are not yet able to support them.

The ITS/union-to-union program can be useful in special cases. To justify the level of funding, however, it needs to be targeted more in terms of countries or other overall objectives.

The impact projects are to meet unforeseen needs or to provide support to countries which are not ready for a country program. It is difficult to foresee future funding needs, but the current level is likely to be on the low side, especially if it is not adjusted for inflation and currency changes.

3. Overall Impact of the Program

In the 1985-1989 Cooperative Agreement, a number of questions were listed which were designed to be the basis for evaluating the success of the AALC program. These questions are listed in Annex A and most are included in Table IV-9 at the end of this section. Some of the questions appeared to be meant to apply to the labor movement in Africa in general. The team has discussed in Chapter III the general context in which many unions are operating and some trends which seem to be

fairly general. Beyond that, the evaluation team believes that comments about the "African labor movement" have little utility.

The team felt it was useful to try to answer the questions for those countries which have had country programs since the start of the current grant. The result of this exercise is set forth in Table IV-9 at the end of this section. There is a great deal of subjectivity involved in such an exercise. In addition, we found that there is some ambiguity in interpretation of the ratings. For example, one question asks whether the labor movement has grown in its ability to sustain itself. In most countries there has been improvement and this is reflected in the ratings given; in very few countries, however, could one say that the movement can yet sustain itself fully.

In general, the team found significant improvement in those aspects that can be most directly affected by the AALC program, e.g., union effectiveness, union acceptance by its members and union leadership capabilities. Unions are attempting to expand services to their members, but the progress varies widely. It would appear it could be more effective if AALC were able to devote more technical and financial support and help unions find ways to participate in AID or other donor-funded service activities.

Union acceptance by governments and management varies considerably. This seems to be more a function of the local political and economic scene than of the effectiveness of the AALC program. AALC programs have been helpful and should be continued because this is an area where progress, although it may be slow, is very important to trade unions and to development in the countries.

There is increasing recognition of the need for more and better labor statistics and research. The progress in this area is quite varied. It is also an area where creating a good institutional capability is likely to be overly expensive for a number of countries. Thus, this is an area that calls for a greater effort to create regional institutions able to support a number of smaller countries.

The evaluation team believes that there is utility in reviewing the type of questions included in the Cooperative Agreement, but the team offers some caveats:

- It is essential to recognize that exogenous political and economic factors can outweigh the impact of the AALC program.
- The AALC program is not big enough in many countries to have a dramatic impact.
- Some specific quantitative and qualitative baseline data should be collected at the time of a new grant so that the degree of subjectivity can be reduced.
- Some of the questions added for this evaluation are not of the same type as those in the Cooperative Agreement and are not helpful in determining the impact of the program, e.g., some of the questions relating to training and training costs. Similarly, the question on increasing institutional capabilities in labor statistics and research was not originally included so there were no data available on the situation at the outset of the grant.

The team believes that collecting the type of data suggested, with certain modifications, can be helpful to AALC in periodic reviews of program progress and in ensuring that the composition of country programs remains valid. See Annex E for some additional thoughts regarding evaluation of the next grant.

TABLE IV-9
INDICATORS OF PROGRESS IN AALC PROGRAM COUNTRIES
 (0=no progress or retrogression; 1-5=rates of progress, with 5=outstanding progress)^{a/}

Indicators	Botswana	Ghana	Kenya	Lesotho	Liberia	Mauritius	Sierra Leone	Sudan	Togo	Zaire	Zimbabwe
A. VIABILITY OF LABOR MOVEMENT											
1. Has labor movement (LM) grown in (a) internal strength; and (b) ability to sustain itself?	(a) - 3+ (b) - 3-	(a) - 3+ (b) - 3+	(a) - 3 (b) - 3	(a) - 1 ^{b/} (a) - 1	(a) - 1 (b) - 3	(a) - 3 (b) - 3+	(a) - 3+ (a) - 3	(a) - 3 (b) - 2+	(a) - 3 (b) - 3	(a) - 5 (b) - 5	(a) - 3 (b) - 3-
2. Has overall financial position or (prospects) improved?	3	3	3	1	3	3	3	3	3	5	3
3. How favorable is overall future outlook?	3	3+	3+	2	3	3+	3+	3	3+	4+	3
B. VISION EFFECTIVENESS											
1. Labor center's ability to serve its constituent unions?	3+	3+	3	2	3	4	3+	3	4	4+	3+
2. Has authority and decision-making ability of central labor organization increased?	3+	3+	3	2	3	3+	3+	4	3	5	3
3. Is there greater efficiency in communication within LM?	4	3	3+	2	3	4	4	4	4	4+	3
4. Are unions becoming more efficient in collective bargaining and grievances handling?	3+	2	4	2	2	3+	3	4	4	3+	2+
5. Are unions making progress in secondary services:											
Health and safety	3	3	n.a.	0	n.a.	2	3	3	0	4	n.a.
Co-ops/credit unions	4	0	4+	1	3	4	3	3	4	3-	1
Literacy	0	n.a.	n.a.	0	0	n.a.	3	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	2
Job creation/job training	2	3	3	2	3	3	3	3	4	3	n.a.
C. UNION ACCEPTANCE											
1. Has LM gained acceptance within the government?	2+	4	3	0+	2+	3+	2+	4	3	5	2
2. Has LM increased its influence in governmental bodies considering questions relevant to LM members?	2	2	3+	0	1	3	3	4	3	4	1
3. Has LM gained in acceptance by management?	Mixed	2	4	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2
4. Has LM gained in acceptance by workers?	4	3+	3+	2+	3-	4	4	4	3+	4+	3

TABLE IV-9
INDICATORS OF PROGRESS IN AALC PROGRAM COUNTRIES
 (0=no progress or retrogression; 1-5=rates of progress, with 5=outstanding progress)^{a/}

Indicators	Botswana	Ghana	Kenya	Lesotho	Liberia	Mauritius	Sierra Leone	Sudan	Togo	Zaire	Zimbabwe
D. LEADERSHIP CAPABILITIES											
1. Indicators of greater leadership maturity?	4	4	4	2	2	3+	3+	4	3	4	2
2. Have union officials who have been provided educational opportunities made contributions to LM that are attributable to training? ^{c/}	3	4	4	2	2	3	4	3	4	4	2
3. Has union increased its own educational programs and its capacity to administer them?	4	3+	4	2+	4	4+	4	3	4+	5	3
E. EXTERNAL INFLUENCES											
1. Progress in resisting external forces which try to use LM for their own political purposes.	3	3	4	2	2+	4	3	4+	3	4	3
F. LABOR STATISTICS & RESEARCH^{d/}											
1. Progress in increasing institutional capabilities in collecting and analysing labor statistics and data.	1+	3+	4	1	1	2	1	2	3	3+	1

NOTES:

n.a. = Not applicable.

^{a/} = Where there is more than one national labor movement, answers refer to the one with which AALC works.

^{b/} = The history of Lesotho's labor movement over the past five years has been characterized by vacillation regarding the question of labor unity. The time and energy that should have been devoted to internal consolidation and growth has thus been largely deflected by internecine quarrels, competition, and government interference. At the present time, the labor movement is deeply divided, a state which could be interpreted as lack of progress. If the current unity talks result in a merger, the establishment of labor unity should be viewed as real progress in many of these categories and lead to greater progress in others.

^{c/} = Training occurs at all levels within labor federations, from the lowest official (shop steward) to the highest (secretary-general). Training is also tied to certain substantive themes, e.g., economic research, management of credit unions and cooperatives, instructor training, health and safety, etc. Some correlation exists between training and progress in certain categories, i.e., the development of credit unions, cooperatives, health and safety programs, communication, collective bargaining, etc. See Chapter 4 for further discussion of training, and Chapter 5.n. regarding evaluation criteria.

^{d/} = The emphasis placed on the importance of labor research and data collection by African trade unionists is a fairly recent development and should be viewed as a direct result of the economic crisis besetting African countries and their labor movements. Though most unions have not yet published research or statistics themselves, the training of researchers in each federation has taken place over the past 18 months through the AALC in the U.S., the regional education institute in Dakar and other international organizations.

V. MANAGEMENT OF THE AALC COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT

A. Overall Management Structure and Process

The African American Labor Center project is financed by AID as an African regional project through a cooperative agreement with the African American Labor Center in Washington, D.C. The AID Project Officer is located in the Office of Technical Resources in the Africa Bureau. As he/she deems appropriate, the Project Officer solicits comments from USAIDs and Embassies and the Labor Officer in the Africa Bureau of the Department of State on the content of proposed programs and on the implementation of approved programs.

The Washington office of the African American Labor Center (AALC/W) negotiates the agreement with AID and manages the grant and is accountable to AID for it. AALC/W solicits country program proposals from its field staff, which the latter submit after consultation with leaders of the national trade union federation(s). AALC reviews and adjusts the field submissions and prepares a consolidated program and budget for AID's approval. AID has consistently insisted upon a smaller level of annual funding than requested, even though the request was in accordance with the original budget, and AALC/W has had to prepare a revised program and budget within the level accorded by AID.

Upon approval by AID of the program and budget, AALC advises its field representatives of their program level and the expected allocation of these funds. With approval of the country program, the AALC Representative is ready to negotiate program details with the relevant federations. The representatives have the flexibility to adjust budget line items by 20 percent within their total program allocation -- these line items generally accord with the objectives cited in the budget document.

When a country program is ready for implementation, the AALC Representative requests that funds be advanced to him/her to undertake the activity. The request is approved in AALC/W by the appropriate Program

Officer and the Controller, and a check is deposited to the Representative's account in a U.S. bank or the money is wired directly to the AALC account in the appropriate country. AALC/W notifies the Representative that the deposit or wire transfer has been made. If a deposit, the Representative writes a check against his/her U.S. bank and deposits it locally in a national currency account. Upon completion of the activity, the Representative submits accounting reports with supporting documentation to AALC/W for liquidation of the advance.

Field Representatives are subject to two reporting requirements: 1) a weekly report to AALC/W which is essentially a "keeping the home office informed of local developments" type of report; and 2) a semi-annual project progress report for incorporation in the semi-annual and annual reports which are submitted by AALC/W to AID in accordance with the terms of the Cooperative Agreement.

Regional activities generally are administered from AALC/W. However, field representatives may propose, and are expected to report on, Impact Projects carried out in the countries for which they are responsible. Under the International Trade Secretariat (ITS) activity, the Trade Secretariats and a number of cooperating U.S. unions are advised of funding possibilities and are invited to submit proposals. They are required to submit a report on the activity after its completion; the report is a prerequisite to approval of any subsequent proposal.

Although the IAHER is located in Dakar, Senegal, the AALC project officer is located in AALC/W since the departure in 1987 of the Field Representative that had been stationed in Dakar. The follow-on activities to the CREDE program are administered out of the regional office in Abidjan, Ivory Coast.

A list of field representatives, with location and country responsibility, is presented in Table V-2 at the end of this chapter. It is followed by a listing of AALC/W assignments (Table V-3).

B. Budgeting and Financial Management

As a basis for approval of the Cooperative Agreement, AALC submitted an extensive budget document which was appended and made a part of the Cooperative Agreement. The budget provided for programs in 11 countries, with AALC representatives in 10 of them, 5 multi-country activities (Impact projects, ITS activities, the CREDE research center in Togo, support of cooperatives, and the IAHERS training office in Senegal), and headquarters and indirect costs support for the program. These have been the line items of the approved budget and the basis for the financial accounting by AALC. Financial reports are submitted quarterly to AID.

The life-of-project budget was set at \$19 million in the Cooperative Agreement; the initial obligation of \$3.5 million was made on April 12, 1985. The planned and actual obligations by year are set forth in Table V-1 below.

TABLE V-1
PLANNED AND ACTUAL OBLIGATIONS BY YEAR
(\$1,000)

	<u>Planned Obligations</u>	<u>Actual Obligations</u>	
1985	3,688	3,499 722(a)	Apr Aug
1986	3,688	3,350 900	Mar Sep
1987	3,705	3,225(b)	Jun
1988	3,861	3,000	May
1989	<u>4,058</u>	<u>3,000(c)</u>	Feb
Total	19,000	17,696	

- a) Of which \$550 for a new expanded Sudan program.
- b) Of which \$1,000 for the new expanded Sudan program.
- c) For January-September only.

In response to a major change in the political environment in Sudan, a special obligation of \$550,000 was made in September 1985 for an expanded program. In June 1987, another \$1 million was obligated for the Sudan program. Since the original budget for Sudan was only about \$100,000, this means that the total grant should have been expanded by \$1.4 million to \$20.4 million or else Sudan should have been funded and accounted for as a separate grant. The latter is what AALC expected based on conversations with the Assistant AID Administrator and the Assistant Secretary of State.

To date, however, the total amount of the grant has not been changed and the expanded Sudan program is being accounted for as part of the original grant. This represents, therefore, a reduction of about \$1.4 million in funds available for the program (excluding Sudan) planned for the 1985-89 period. This is partially offset by the reduction in the Ghana program (about \$800,000) less the new country programs that were not foreseen in the original budget (\$360,000). Besides this net cut of about \$1 million, the value of the program has been further eroded by: 1) inflation in the U.S. and in many of the recipient countries; and 2) the fall in the value of the US dollar -- which reduced the value of goods and services that could be purchased in participating countries. AID did not allow AALC to include line items in the original budget for inflation and contingencies, even though they are standard in regular AID-financed projects.

In 1984, AALC submitted a 93-page budget document to justify the funding for its cooperative agreement. AID reduced the amount requested, and the entire budget document had to be revised to conform to the \$19 million ceiling for the agreement. Each year since, this procedure has been repeated, with AALC submitting a 90-page budget document for its annual funding under the grant, AID refusing to accept the request, and the document having to be revised to conform to the amount eventually approved.

In addition to the large amount of paper generated to justify the annual allocations against an already approved project, the AID approvals of the annual budgets have been tardy -- from February (the most recent and the earliest) to June, even though AALC's fiscal year starts in January. In the first year of the grant, AALC had to get a bank loan to provide bridge funding from the end of the previous grant until AID approved the new one. The late

approvals of budgets have meant some program activities could not be initiated during the year in which planned. Not only was there a reduced number of months in which to carry out programs, the period which was lost in some countries was the dry season, the only time to carry out some activities.

In the original grant budget, objectives were set forth for each country program and for the regional institutions being supported by AALC. The budget was organized according to the objectives -- the 1985 budget according to the short-term objectives, and all five years by the long-term objectives. In subsequent years' budget submissions, only short-term objectives were cited and the budget was organized according to the short-term objectives. No mention was made in subsequent budget submissions of long-term objectives.

Although budgets are prepared by objectives, the financial accounts are not maintained so that one can readily determine how much has been spent against individual objectives -- either short or long term. According to the AALC Controller, AID has required quarterly financial reports to be based only on the line items of the budget, i.e., the individual country program totals, individual regional projects, impact projects total, direct costs, and indirect costs. He estimates it would take about 20 hours of work to prepare a report showing obligations or expenditures by program objectives -- once the present computer change-over is completed. The AALC Controller was concerned that if his organization did accounting by objectives within each country or regional program, AID would insist that the 20 percent flexibility between line items would apply at the objectives level rather than at the country level.

The evaluation team was given a list of the impact projects approved under the grant. The total of the individual projects was about \$200,000 less than the cumulative commitments under the program in the December 1988 financial report. It was explained that in the early part of the grant, liquidations of advances from previous years had been treated as expenditures in the current year. The procedure has been changed, but it has not been possible to go back and adjust figures from the early part of the grant period.

C. Implementation Monitoring and Reporting

AALC has field staff to monitor the implementation of country programs and some regional activities. Field staff has been reduced from 11 in 1985 to 6 in 1989, due largely to funding cuts. The field staff is responsible for program planning and development; they also provide technical assistance and/or general advice to a number of the union federations. In other words, administration and monitoring are only a part of the field staff's duties.

Field representatives are obliged to submit weekly reports on developments in their countries, including significant happenings related to the implementation of the country program. They also submit semi-annual reports for each of their countries which serve as the basis for AALC/W's semi-annual report to AID.

AALC/W provides indirect monitoring of the country programs through review of field reports, conversations with African trade unionists in various fora, and periodic field visits by management and program staff. AALC/W provides direct monitoring of IAHER (since the AALC field representative was transferred from Dakar, Senegal), other regional projects (other than CREDE follow-on activities which are implemented by the regional office in Abidjan, Ivory Coast), and the ITS activities and Impact Projects.

The Cooperative Agreement provides that AALC will provide semi-annual and annual progress reports to AID, with the annual report serving as the second semi-annual report. No specific instructions on format have been given to AALC. Because AID, at one point, was asking for additional background information, the semi-annual reports have become quite voluminous, including the same amount of background as AALC provided for the original grant in 1985. Reports on developments which occurred in subsequent periods were added incrementally to this background material.

In the original budget submission, long-term objectives with some indicators of achievement were provided, along with a statement of short-term objectives for the year in question. Subsequent budget submissions have also listed short-term objectives. The semi-annual/annual reports have alluded only to short-term objectives, not long-term ones. In the 1988 annual report, there is

no citation of objectives; however, the sub-headings in 5 of the 16 countries correspond to short-term objectives.

The semi-annual/annual reports do not provide any general assessment of progress or make mention of developments or events that affect the overall program. The report is made up of a compilation of sections covering the Impact Projects, the ITS activities, and all regional and country programs. Each section has four sub-sections:

- A. Goal -- a broad goal statement; neither long nor short-term objectives are mentioned.
- B. Trade Union Situation -- an extensive background, including historical events stretching back considerably before the beginning of the grant.
- C. Past AALC Activities -- from AALC's creation and occasionally earlier, i.e., AFL-CIO activity which pre-dated AALC.
- D. AALC Activities (Current Year) -- in a few cases, this sub-section is divided into mini-sections according to the short-term country objectives.

AID monitoring responsibility rests with AID/W, which is supposed to get comments from USAIDs and Embassies. AID/W also is to hold annual reviews with AALC on project progress.

The AID/W Project Officers have had no special experience or training in trade union activities. Furthermore, there has been a rapid turnover -- four Project Officers in four years. There have been no formal reviews of program progress.

Substantive changes have been made in the program without seeking field comments; the revised budget for 1989 was not submitted for field comment. The USAIDs, for their part, have generally shown no interest in the program; at least one Mission Director refused to even meet with the AALC Representative. USAIDs have turned over their monitoring responsibilities to U.S. Embassy labor reporting officers or regional labor attaches. In three of the four USAIDs visited by the evaluation team, AID officials did not know the extent of trade union activities; they did not realize that the union programs were increasingly developmentally oriented.

D. Evaluation

According to the terms of the cooperative agreement, there were to be two evaluations during the period of the grant, one after two years of implementation and a second in year four. No evaluations were ever scheduled -- until the current one which is taking place in year five of the grant. Some AALC officers told the evaluation team that they would have welcomed an earlier evaluation to help ensure that AALC and AID were on the same wave length.

E. Conclusions on Project Management

The overall management structure and process is basically sound. It would appear, however, that the number of field representatives may have been cut too drastically to ensure a continued high-quality, well-managed program.

The budgeting process is overly burdensome on the grantee. After the overall budget is approved for the grant period, subsequent budget submissions should require only:

- a) a brief overview statement providing information on changes in the context in which the programs are being carried out;
- b) an explanation of any change in the objectives in a country program or regional activity and of any major change in funding for a specific line item;
- c) a table giving the proposed funding distribution by country, regional activity, etc.; and
- d) a financial table showing planned and actual budgets and accrued expenditures for the previous year (and cumulative after year 1).

The foregoing information should be sufficient for a meaningful discussion of the budget level for the following year. It would also facilitate providing information to the field for comment by USAIDs and Embassies. Once an agreed level was established, a revised presentation, if necessary, of a), b), and c) above could be incorporated into the obligating document.

Both the semi-annual and annual reports should be simplified and reduced in size. The January-June report could consist of a brief narrative report which summarizes the principal developments (economic and political) affecting trade

union activities, highlights of trade union activities, and any significant happenings (physical or financial) in AALC-financed activities. It should not be necessary to cover a country extensively if nothing special has happened during the reporting period.

The annual report should be comparable to the semi-annual report, but should be supplemented by one to two pages on each country program and regional activity. These sheets would summarize important developments in the country and cite accomplishments in relation to targets established in the statement of objectives that were approved in the original submission (as modified in subsequent budget submissions). Actual vs. planned funding would also be given.

AALC's accounting system should be set up so that it can provide budget and expenditure data by objectives established for country programs. This may entail some additional expense in the new grant, and may require additional staffing for the AALC Controller's office.

USAIDs should become more cognizant of the AALC program and should participate increasingly in the review of the program. USAIDs and embassies should have the opportunity to comment on any proposal for a significant change in a country program. AID/W should hold a formal annual review of progress with AALC and provide the field with a summary of the principal conclusions.

TABLE V-2

AALC FIELD REPRESENTATIVE/(LOCATION)/RESPONSIBILITIES

Nate Gould (Kenya): Kenya, Uganda, Zambia, Tanzania, Mauritius

Tom Medley (Zimbabwe): Zimbabwe, Malawi, Mozambique, Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council (SATUCC)

Dan O'Laughlin (Botswana): Botswana, Swaziland

Glenn Lesak (Liberia): Liberia, Sierra Leone

Hy Hoffman (Zaire): Zaire, Rwanda, Burundi, Chad, Gabon, Cameroon, Organization of Workers of Central Africa (OTAC), Central African Republic

Akou/Miller (Ivory Coast): Organization of Trade Unions of West Africa (OTUWA), Benin, Burkina, Ivory Coast, Togo, Ghana, Gambia, Nigeria, Mali, Niger, Guinea, Mauritania, Senegal, Organization of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU)

TABLE V-3

AALC/W ASSIGNMENTS

<u>Country</u>	<u>Staff</u>	<u>Country</u>	<u>Staff</u>
Algeria	Topping	Mozambique	Charlton
Angola	Charlton	Namibia	Charlton
Benin	Topping	Niger	Topping
Botswana	Charlton	Nigeria	Topping
Burkina	Topping	Rwanda	Topping
Burundi	Topping	Sao Tome	Topping
Cameroon	Topping	Senegal	Topping
Cape Verde	Topping	Seychelles	Charlton
C.A.R.	Topping	Sierra Leone	Topping
Chad	Topping	Somalia	Charlton
Comoros	Topping	South Africa	Charlton
Congo	Topping	Sudan	Topping
Djibouti	Charlton	Tanzania	Charlton
Egypt	Topping	Togo	Topping
Equatorial Guinea	Topping	Tunisia	Topping
Ethiopia	Charlton	Uganda	Charlton
Gabon	Topping	Zaire	Topping
Gambia	Topping	Zambia	Charlton
Ghana	Topping	Zimbabwe	Charlton
Guinea	Topping	AID	Brombart
Guinea-Bissau	Topping	American Unions	Charlton
Ivory Coast	Topping	Swaziland	Charlton
Kenya	Charlton	Cooperatives	Topping
Lesotho	Charlton	Education	Martens
Liberia	Topping	ITSS	Brombart
Libya	Topping	NED	Topping
Madagascar	Charlton	Reporting	Sarr
Malawi	Charlton	Visitors	Lomax
Mali	Topping	Women	Topping
Mauritania	Topping		
Mauritius	Charlton		
Morocco	Topping.		

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS ON A FOLLOW-ON COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT

This chapter looks ahead to the future relationship between the AALC and the Africa Bureau of AID.

A. Desirability and Feasibility

The performance of the AALC over the past five years has demonstrated its ability successfully to administer a program of assistance to the trade union movement in Africa. It has met many of the objectives which it and AID jointly set in 1985. The goal of the AALC program remains an important one. The needs in Africa are expanding and becoming more urgent.

The evaluation team proposes that a new five-year grant be approved for AALC before the end of FY 1989. Given AALC's good track record and AID's limited staffing situation, a grant agreement is proposed in lieu of a cooperative agreement. It is recommended that the amount of the grant be increased significantly to offset inflation and reduced buying power of the U.S. dollar and to permit some program expansions as proposed in B. below.

B. Suggestions for Program Content

As noted in Section I, the 1985-1989 cooperative agreement set out six areas in which the AALC was to assist labor movements in Africa. The evaluation team believes that the six objectives remain legitimate, but might be restated in a way that permits increased emphasis on the directly developmentally relevant aspects of its program. An illustrative restatement follows:

"The AALC will help labor movements in these countries to plan, develop, implement, improve, or expand:

- "1. Free labor institutions that contribute to democratic pluralism and help gain respect for worker rights by governments;

- "2. Free labor programs that seek to improve the standard of living of the membership while also promoting national economic growth through programs such as credit-and-savings unions, producer and consumer cooperatives, and income-generating projects;
- "3. Leadership and advanced training programs, particularly in the areas of economics, research and democratic trade unionism;
- "4. Women's programs, including income producing projects and maternal and child health care and family planning; and
- "5. Regional programs designed to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of trade union efforts in the above areas."

Actual language of the cooperative agreement, of course, would be left to the joint agreement of AALC and AID.

If additional funding can be made available, it should be programmed to:

- a. expand programs that facilitate and support union-directed efforts in development activities such as credit unions, consumer and producer cooperatives, health and population and income-generating activities;
- b. maintain and expand education programs which emphasize training for union leaders in such critical areas as economics and democratic unionism;
- c. assist national federations to sustain their own programs so that AALC can begin to phase out some country programs; union-to-union support would continue through regional and impact activities and facilitating contacts of field representatives;
- d. support weaker unions that are trying to overcome tribalism, keep out from under government control and stand out as exemplars of democratic action;
- e. expand its support to selected regional institutions that enjoy the support of African union leaders; and
- f. increase its field representation and possibly its accounting staff if the latter is necessary to implement the recommendations on financial management.

C. Program Management and Implementation

1. Administration

- AALC should re-establish some of the field representative positions that were abolished because of funding cuts.

- AALC should augment its accounting capability so that it can provide financial data according to country and regional program objectives.
- The budgeting process should be streamlined, AID should strive harder to meet its commitments under the grant, and the first funding increment of the new agreement should provide funding for 15 months to preclude periods of non-availability of funds.
- Joint AALC-AID reviews of project progress should be held annually.
- Africa Bureau should assign responsibility for the AALC program to an office, perhaps still to be created, that is concerned with the concern for political/economic linkages and the promotion of economic pluralism.
- USAIDs should be instructed to consider using trade unions as intermediaries and/or implementers of AID-funded development activities and to coordinate with AALC representatives who could be expected to facilitate this development.

2. Monitoring and Reporting

- While recognizing the continued interest of the Department of State in the AALC program, field monitoring of the new agreement should be assigned, with few exceptions, to an AID officer.
- Progress reporting should be streamlined and made more useful to AID by including:
 - a short summary of overall economic and political developments that can affect host unions or the AALC program;
 - substantially less historical data;
 - an assessment of progress against country program objectives; and
 - financial reports which include a breakdown of country budgets and expenditures by program objectives.

D. Evaluation

In order to make future assessments more meaningful, evaluation questions should relate to factors which are most likely to be affected by the AALC program. While it may be useful to assess certain factors across all participating countries, as was done in Table IV-9, primary consideration should be given to assessing progress against long-term objectives established specifically for country programs and some regional activities.

Agreement should be reached between AALC and AID on the baselines from which progress is to be measured. At present AALC is collecting a considerable

amount of information through circulation to its field representatives of a new "Standard Survey of Trade Union Development in Africa." The results of this survey could help establish the jointly agreed baselines, as well as provide indicators of progress.

Additional thoughts regarding evaluation in a follow-on grant is included in Annex E.

1234y/6.89

ANNEX A

SUMMARY OF SCOPE OF WORK FOR JOINT MANAGEMENT EVALUATION OF
COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT BETWEEN USAID AND AALC (698-0442)

The purpose of this "joint management evaluation" is to assess activities carried out by the African-American Labor Center so as to determine the degree to which the objectives and goals of the Cooperative Agreement have been achieved: to develop and strengthen free and democratic trade unions in Africa aimed at improving conditions of the laboring populations through planning, developing, implementing, or improving programs given below:

- free labor institutions such as trade unions, cooperatives, and credit unions, etc.;
- worker education, trade union research, and journalism;
- literacy and leadership training;
- women's projects: income producing and maternal and child care projects;
- community service projects; and
- expertise, capital and equipment to selected labor centers.

More specifically, the evaluation will examine the following:

- (1) Effectiveness and flexibility of AALC's Country Labor Plans (CLPs) for meeting the needs and objectives in view of changing circumstances and priorities which have been annually reviewed by the AALC labor experts.
- (2) Inputs (review and concurrence procedures) by U.S. Embassies and AID missions on AALC's program strategies in respective countries in view of prevailing environments, sensitivities, and available resources.
- (3) Qualitative examination of AALC activities for consistency and complementary with FAA mandate for AID to implement a labor policy "to strengthen free, effective, and well organized trade unions representing both urban and rural workers for the purpose of protecting their legitimate rights, ... to improve the well-being of the workers, help to assure the equitable distribution of income, and act as a force for change on issues related to working conditions, human rights, and family..."
- (4) Appropriateness of incorporating AALC activities with AID development programs in areas of literacy, health services, credit unions, information dissemination, etc. as suggested in AID's policy determination on labor-manpower (Sup A to BH 1, PD-52, TM 1:27).

- (5) Extent and desirability of cooperation with other international organizations providing assistance to African labor unions for activities carried out under this cooperative agreement to maximize limited resources and avoid duplication.
- (6) Mutual facilitation and complementarity of AALC activities and services funded by different U.S. Government agencies, i.e., USIA, USDOL.
- (7) Management-level relationships between AALC and AID personnel, both in Washington and in field missions dealing with labor affairs in Africa and backstopping of activities at posts.

Since the mid-1970s, AALC has used certain criteria in assessing the effectiveness of its activities in Africa. In carrying out its objectives of aiding free trade union development, AALC relies on the "management by objectives" approach "for setting goals, time frame and achievement criteria." Certain objectives such as trade union growth and maturity, the ability of the union to command respect and attention, the union's effectiveness in dealing with employers and government, and its success in serving the rank and file may defy quantification. Nevertheless, the proposed joint management evaluation will provide both qualitative and quantitative assessment in the areas listed below. Thus, the evaluation will document for AALC staff, AID/U.S. Embassy personnel, and other U.S. Government agency personnel the status of AALC programs, their effectiveness and achievements.

(The following questions, except those marked (*), are taken verbatim from the Cooperative Agreement.)

(a) Viability of Labor Movement in Africa:

- (1) Has the labor movement grown in internal strength and ability to sustain itself?
- (2) Has its overall financial position (and/or prospects) changed?
- (3) How favorable is the overall future outlook for the labor movement?

(b) Union Effectiveness:

- (1) What has happened to the labor center's ability to serve its constituent unions?
- (2) Has the central authority and decision-making ability of the labor movement been increased?
- (3) Is there greater efficiency in communication between the central body and the national unions, and/or between the national unions and their constituent branches?

- (4) Are the unions becoming more efficient in providing basic services to their membership, e.g., in collective bargaining and grievances handling?
- (5) Are unions making progress in secondary services, e.g., medical programs, co-ops, literacy, etc.?
 - (i)* How many individuals have been trained? In what sector and skills? What ripple effect from this training?
 - (ii)* What has been/will be done to upgrade trainers? What are the costs per trainee?

(c) Union Acceptance

- (1) Has the labor movement gained increased acceptance within the government as a constructive force with legitimate economic and social objectives?
- (2) Has the trade union movement been invited to participate with greater frequency, or in more influential ways, in governmental bodies considering questions relevant to the trade unions and their membership?
- (3) Has the labor movement gained greater acceptance with management?
- (4) Has the labor movement gained greater increasing general acceptance by workers?

(d) Leadership Capabilities

- (1) Have there been indications of greater leadership maturity?
- (2) Have union officials provided with educational opportunities over the past two or three years made any valuable contributions to the labor movements that are attributable to that training?
- (3) Has the union increased its own educational programs and capability to administer them?
- (4)* What has been the effect of U.S. training on the development of free trade union movement in Africa?
- (5)* Have the training programs in the U.S. sponsored by U.S. governmental agencies other than USAID been closely coordinated to meet the increasing needs? If not, what financial and managerial improvement could be made?
- (6)* Have AALC activities achieved their objectives of increasing the capabilities of African labor unions to provide members with needed services?

(e) External Influences

- (1) Is there growing presence of external forces trying to utilize the labor movement for their own political purposes? If so, what is the relation of AALC programming to such external forces and to labor's susceptibility to them?

(2)* How and to what extent has trade union unity in a given country been affected by such external influences?

(f) Labor Statistics and Research Institutions

(1)* Under the AALC program, what efforts have been made to increase institutional capabilities to produce reliable and current labor-manpower statistics in order to formulate realistic quantitative targets for employment, earnings, productivity, and other amelioration of work-related problems of the labor force?

(2)* Has the AALC program sponsored research study projects that would enable the workers to find suitable employment and share in the benefits of economic development? If not, what recommendations can the evaluation team make toward achievement of these objectives?

1342y/5.89

ANNEX B

LIST OF PERSONS CONTACTED

KENYA

John N. Gould
Regional Representative
African-American Labor Center

J. J. Mugalla
Secretary-General
Central Organisation of Trade Unions (COTU)

Joseph Mungai
Director of Education, COTU

John Ogonje
Principal
Tom Mboya Labour College, Kisumu

Gershon Konditi
Deputy Executive Director
Federation of Kenya Employers (FKE)

George Griffin
Charge d'Affaires
U.S. Embassy

Harry O'Hara
Regional Labor Attache
U.S. Embassy

Steven W. Sinding
Director, USAID

BOTSWANA

Daniel O'Laughlin
Regional Representative
African American Labor Center

Elias Mbonini
Chairman
Botswana Federation of Trade Unions (BFTU)

Boniface Tshoko
Cooperative Officer, BFTU

Onalena Lethamo
Head of Women's Council, BFTU

Shirley Lekwape
Acting Manager
Workers Service Organisation, BFTU

Dr. Tshidi Moeti
Director, Occupational Health Unit
Ministry of Health

Rose Solema
Occupational Health Unit
Ministry of Health

Orchard Muzungo
Administrative Secretary, BFTU

E. B. Setlhare
Executive General Secretary
Railway Workers Union

The Hon. Peter Mmusi
Vice President and Minister of Finance
Government of Botswana

Suping
Organizer, BFTU

G.I. Nilsson
Managing Director
SANITAS (Gardening and Agricultural Innovations)

Kaj Jensen
ILO Representative

Dr. Gykye
Professor of Economics
National University of Botswana

Ambassador John Kordek
U.S. Embassy

John Hummon
Director, USAID

Trudy Thompson
Labor Reporting Officer (Outgoing)
U.S. Embassy

ZAIRE

Hy Hoffman
Regional Representative
African American Labor Center

Kombo Ntonga Booke
Secretary General
Union Nationale des Travailleurs du Zaire (UNTza)

Kalala Kayisha
Assistant Secretary General
UNTza

Buensa Dia Malosa
Assistant Secretary General
UNTza

Dipesa Ngomba
Secretary, External Relations
UNTza

Ndongala N'Sibu
Assistant National Secretary, External Relations
UNTza

Manwana Mungongo, Director
Institut Supérieur des Sciences du Travail (ISST)

Mwadi Mwamba
National Secretary, Women's Department
UNTza

Ilunga Beta Kambala
National Secretary, CASOP
UNTza

Angbongbo Boluki Mpelenga
Administrative Director
OZAC (Office Zairois de Contrôle)

Mark Baas
Charge d'Affaires
U.S. Embassy

Gerald Scott
Political Officer
U.S. Embassy

Robert Moser
Labor Reporting Officer
U.S. Embassy

Dennis Chandler
Director, USAID

John Bierke
Program Officer, USAID

Dr. Glenn Post
Chief, Division of Public Health & Population
USAID

Mr. Kamal Zein
Training Officer, USAID

Jerry Funk
Ex-AALC

SENEGAL

Andre Akou
Assistant Regional Representative
African American Labor Center
Abidjan, Ivory Coast

Goumbo Toure
Administrator
Institut Africain des Hautes Etudes Syndicales (IAHES)

Moustapha Thiam
Director, IAHES

Madia Diop
Secretary General
Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Senegal (CNTS)

Oumar Taal
Director, INEFO

Papa Mamadou
Secretary for Workers Education, CNTS

Farba Lo
Secretary for Cooperation, CNTS
GOS Minister of Relations with the National Assembly

Mme. Goumbala nee Maymouna Fall Bassirou
Institut de Coupe Couture et Mode (IOCM)

Babacar Gueye
Professor, IOCM

Director of Cabinet
Ministry of Social Development

Michael Davis
Political Officer
U.S. Embassy

Sarah Jane Littlefield
Director, USAID

AID/WASHINGTON -- BUREAU FOR AFRICA

Keith Sherper, Director
Office of Technical Resources

Brian Kline
Office of Technical Resources

Buff McKenzie
Office of Technical Resources

Ms. Dagnija Kreslins
Office of Technical Resources

John C. Chao
AALC Project Officer
Office of Technical Resources

Fred Fischer, Director
Office of Southern African Affairs

Jonathan M. Conly
Southern Africa Regional Desk

Charles Gladson
Former Assistant Administrator

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

Anthony Freeman
Special Assistant to the Secretary
of State for Labor Affairs

Anthony Kern
Labor Affairs Advisor
Bureau of African Affairs

AFRICAN AMERICAN LABOR CENTER -- WASHINGTON

Patrick J. O'Farrell
Executive Director

David Brombart
Deputy Executive Director

Edward S. Harrison
Controller

Byron W. Charlton
Assistant to the Executive Director

Michael T. Lescault
Program Officer

George R. Martens
Director of Education and Research

John T. Sarr
Program Officer (Reports)

Gebreselassie Gebremariam
Sudan Country Representative (on TDY)

1194y/5.89

ANNEX C

REPORT ON COUNTRIES VISITED BY THE EVALUATION TEAM

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Country</u>	<u>Page</u>
Botswana	C-1
Kenya	C-5
Senegal	C-9
Zaire	C-13

ANNEX C

REPORT ON COUNTRIES VISITED BY THE EVALUATION TEAM

BOTSWANA

A landlocked country the size of Texas, Botswana has a population of 1.1 million and an unemployment rate of about 25 percent. Average GNP per capita growth was 8.8 percent between 1965 and 1986; GNP per capita was \$840 in 1986. Botswana is predominantly agricultural; mining (47% of 1986 GDP) is the major industrial activity. A "front line state" dependent upon South Africa economically, Botswana is one of Africa's true parliamentary democracies.

During its four-day visit to Botswana, the evaluation team interviewed a wide spectrum of individuals involved in labor and development issues, from the country's Vice President to a Swedish expatriate specialist in vegetable growing. It made three half-day field trips to communities near Gaborone, the capital.

1. Trade Union Movement

The Trade Union Act of 1969 authorized the formation of trade unions in the private, government and parastatal sectors and legitimized already existing trade unions. In 1977 the Botswana Federation of Trade Unions (BFTU) was established as an umbrella organization. It currently has affiliation from 12 unions, representing 30,412 members. A few national unions, however, remain outside its structure. The BFTU currently represents about one in every four wage-earners in Botswana. Dues check-off is voluntary; one-fourth of the dues collected goes to the BFTU. There is minimum wage legislation; no family allowances.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

Vice President (and former Labor Commissioner) Peter Mmusi told the team that GOB officials scored the BFTU, and Botswana labor leaders generally, for immaturity and a lack of dedication. He also questioned union contributions

to the national economy. His remarks highlighted the often bumpy road the unions have been forced to travel in Botswana, where highly conservative economic and fiscal policies have been the norm and the government has been markedly pro-business.

Virtually alone among African countries, Botswana's laws forbid anyone holding union office who does not have a full-time job in an enterprise. Thus, the development of a professional cadre of labor officials has been rendered impossible. A case in point: during the team's visit to BFTU headquarters, we were introduced to the federation president, who also works full time as a diamond sorter in a town some distance away. He had come to Gaborone to meet with the management of an foreign-owned firm which apparently was seeking to roll back prior union gains. He had been forced to take a full day from his work (requiring his employer's concurrence) in order to attend the meeting. He had done the same thing the prior week only to have the meeting cancelled. The incompatibility of a full-time job with union work has resulted in a rapid succession of BFTU leaders. Unless the law is changed, the BFTU is likely to remain in a weakened position.

3. Trade Union Programs

In addition to its trade union functions, the BFTU has become involved with the development of socio-economic activities, including the promotion of credit unions, income generation and job creation projects and food production activities. These activities have, in part, been the result of government pressures on unions to prove their value to national development. As a demonstration, the BFTU is financing a project in vegetable production that uses a locally-developed "growing bench" technology. Beneficiaries are mine workers returned from South Africa and their families who are being established as a cooperative on land near the town of Thamaga. Although such a project can make only a small dent in the country's employment needs, it looms large for BFTU leadership as an expression of labor's contribution to Botswana's economy.

The BFTU and its affiliates also conduct socio-economic activities directed at or for its own members. They include:

- Occupational Health and Safety Seminars, which are conducted in conjunction with the Botswana Ministry of Health, on a decentralized basis, for specific groups such as mine workers, construction workers and women. These seminars also have resulted in manuals on health and safety that are disseminated among the labor force.
- Credit Unions, which are a new and promising initiative by the unions. A savings facility begun by the Railway Workers Union in 1987 not only has proved a success with its members, but has been a magnet to draw other workers to the union. Membership has increased from 650 to 1,300 in approximately 18 months. (A union delegation from South Africa visited Botswana to study credit union efforts and returned home determined to replicate the effort.) The rates of saving (through the employer check-off process) are impressive, with some workers saving up to 20 percent of their wages.
- The Workers Service Organization, which is a newly-formed sub-unit of the BFTU whose purpose is to provide both developmental services and income to finance cooperative and other activities of the Federation. Its first manifestation is the provision of office and secretarial services to the general public (and unions), including book-keeping for coops and credit unions. Future services contemplated include food service, larger scale vegetable production and retail sales of vegetables.

4. AALC Support

In 1985 AALC set three major objectives for its work in Botswana:

- 1) support and development of BFTU headquarters staff;
- 2) decentralization of education programs and the opening of a training center at Francistown; and
- 3) enhancement of services to the membership through such activities as credit unions, health clinics, and a woman's department.

Expenditures for the Botswana program have been \$494,000 over the 1985-1989 period or about 75 percent of the planned allocation. The shortfall represents overall reductions by AID in the funding for AALC.

The AALC investment in Botswana is relatively modest. The total country budget for FY 1989 is \$125,383, of which \$85,383 is for "program coordination," that is, the cost of maintaining an AALC representative, including office expenses. That leaves \$40,000 in the program budget, divided between:

Administrative Support (\$15,000) which encompasses costs involved in helping to sustain and enhance the capacities of the BFTU leaderships; and

Trade Union Education (\$23,000) which pays for a broad series of seminars on labor-related subjects, including economics.

In the case of Botswana, the notion that the AALC representative provides only "program coordination" is misleading. His primary function is what traditionally has been considered technical assistance, with the purely administrative handling of program funds a minor element. It should be noted as well that the cost of an AALC representative is allocated to the country of residence even though each of them has responsibilities for other country programs. For example, the Botswana-based AALC representative is also responsible for Swaziland and Lesotho, although the presence of AALC's South Africa representative in the latter country reduces the administrative burden there.

5. Findings and Conclusions

Without the support of the AALC over the past five years, the labor movement in Botswana would be considerably weaker than it now is. Results have greatly exceeded expectations in the area of BFTU-sponsorship of credit unions and cooperative enterprises. The contemplated system of BFTU branch offices has not been realized; nevertheless, regional committees which were organized to run events for the BFTU's 10th anniversary celebration are being maintained for other activities.

The AALC program in Botswana has much to recommend it. Given the present weakness of union structures and the suspicion with which the government views the labor movement, the AALC effort clearly meets the immediate needs of the BFTU to establish itself as the leading voice of the Botswana labor movement and a positive contributor to national development. Some initiatives, such as the credit unions, are proving that they can enhance union membership while serving as a source for capital formation and productive loans. While the outcome of BFTU vegetable growing and the worker service organization cannot yet be assessed because they are so new, the direction of financial self-sufficiency is a desirable one. The AALC has operated in Botswana with intelligence and sensitivity during the past several years; the opportunity to continue should be realized.

KENYA

Well-off by African standards, Kenya's 23 million people have seen economic growth eroded in recent years by a 4 percent annual population growth rate, one of the highest in the world, and declining international prices for its exports. Per capita income declined from \$420 to \$300 from 1981 to 1986. With a poor natural resource base, a large current account deficit, and a major problem of urban migration and unemployment, this one-party democracy faces difficult decisions in the structural economic adjustment process that clearly will impact upon the wage-earning population.

The team spent four days in Kenya, meeting with the AALC representative, Kenyan union officials, representatives of AID and the State Department, and a representative of employers. It also took an overnight field trip to Kisumu to review the programs of the Tom Mboya Labor College.

1. Trade Union Movement

The Central Organization of Trade Unions (COTU), was created by government decree in 1965 to replace two competing Federations. It is made up of 28 affiliated unions and claims a membership of 300,000 workers, including an important component of rural-based plantation and agricultural workers. Two major segments of the work force are excluded by law from union membership: teachers, who are organized in an unaffiliated union, the Kenya National Union of Teachers (estimated membership, 100,000); and civil servants, who have a non-union association.

The trade union movement functions under a tripartite system (labor, management and government) established in 1962. In 1964, the GOK established an industrial court to which all unresolved disputes between management and workers are referred for arbitration. Collective bargaining agreements are negotiated by COTU and the employer's representative organization, the Federation of Kenyan Employers (FKE). Some 200-250 contracts were negotiated annually during the 1980s. There are some 55 wildcat strikes annually, often reflecting union members' dissatisfaction with the speed at which the system functions.

COTU has been beset for many years by internal frictions -- often with regional or tribal overtones, by overt external intervention and by frequent upheavals in leadership. At the time of the team's visit both problems were evident. There were frequent press allegations and criticisms about COTU's current leader, J.J. Mugalla, who won the seat of secretary-general in a hotly contested election in 1986. The election is still being contested, and dissident unionists continue to seek his ouster.

COTU has been seeking ways of healing the divisions and increasing its membership -- potentially by another 100,000 workers. Recruitment efforts have been going slowly: "We don't seem to be selling ourselves," a COTU leader told the team. The impact of the economic recovery program may be exacerbating the internal problems inherited by the new federation leadership.

2. Relations with the Government

The necessity of maintaining an appropriate working relationship with Kenya's ruling single party, the Kenya African National Union (KANU), has been the cause, as well as a reflection, of some internal frictions. The government has been attempting to draw the labor movement closer to KANU, promoting concern that the union federation would become an official arm of the party.

While COTU generally supports the government's domestic programs, frictions have arisen in recent years on some socio-economic issues. These relate to questions of employment generation, wage guidelines and worker health and safety -- issues that have become more sensitive to workers because of Kenya's growing economic difficulties.

3. Trade Union Programs

Representing a relatively mature labor movement, COTU has for many years carried on in the areas of worker education and formation of cooperatives:

- Worker education is a traditional and ongoing point of emphasis for COTU, providing rank-and-file and leaders alike with a wide range of training opportunities. The highest expression of this emphasis is the Tom Mboya

Labor College at Kisumu on Lake Victoria. Encouraged by the success of the AALC-supported Worker Education Institute formed in 1974, COTU initiated in 1978 the construction of a new residential education complex. The approximately \$2.5 million cost was paid for entirely by Kenyan trade union members who doubled their check-off allotment to COTU for several years. No foreign assistance went into the construction, possibly a first in Africa and a source of pride to COTU leaders and members alike. The result is a first-rate facility which, as the team observed, has been well maintained since it opened in 1982. It is named in honor of Tom Mboya, a union leader and Kenyan political figure who was assassinated July 5, 1969. Daily operational costs are paid for by COTU while foreign donors (including AALC) provide some financial assistance and residential technical personnel. Other income is raised by renting the facilities for weddings and other events.

The Labor College has been underused because of a shortage of faculty. With the hiring of several professional educators, including the new principal of the college, and designation of a new Board of Governors, use has increased substantially. In 1988, 28 seminars were held in which 778 union members participated, including 224 women. While some tensions were evident between faculty who come from the ranks of labor and newly-hired professional educators, optimism was expressed on all sides about the future of the College.

- Cooperative Activities have been a second major thrust of COTU. Since 1974, COTU has established more than 510 workplace savings and credit societies. They now have combined capital of more than \$27,300,000 and have provided loans for a wide variety of productive activities. Success of these credit cooperatives has led COTU into the area of cooperative housing for its members.

4. AALC Support

The AFL-CIO has had close relationships with the Kenyan labor movement since before independence. It provided the funds for construction of Solidarity Building (in a working class area of Nairobi) where COTU presently has its offices. The AALC has played a particularly significant role in COTU's educational program. It assisted the establishment of a Worker's Educational Institute (WEI) in 1974. WEI brought educational programs to unionists throughout Kenya until 1983 when it was replaced by the Tom Mboya Labor College program. AALC has also supported the College, having maintained a resident full-time economist on the faculty from 1983 until the end of 1988 when budget reductions resulted in the position being eliminated. AALC has provided overseas training for union leaders at the George Meany Center for Labor Studies and elsewhere. It also has helped create COTU credit unions and cooperatives.

In its 1985-1989 planning document, AALC proposed long-range objectives for 1) decentralizing COTU's administration, 2) upgrading the labor college and 3) broadening COTU's services to its members, including creating of women's committees and establishing a medical service system. The objectives have been met only partially:

- Decentralization has proved difficult because of management and financial constraints. Recently AALC provided the federation with a new vehicle and computers designed to assist its organizational efforts. These complement earlier training in branch organizing.
- Upgrading Tom Mboya Labor College has proceeded reasonably well, despite the personnel cutback. The attempt to create a research arm of the college is expected to be realized by the end of the year, and a printing facility already is in place to publish and disseminate instructional and other union-related materials. Because of delays in getting its own programs up and running, however, little has been done to date to establish the college as a regional training facility for students from other anglophone countries.
- Service increases have resulted for women during the past 5 years with the establishment of a women's wing in COTU. Plans for medical services for members have been delayed but not abandoned. With COTU set to move to new quarters from Solidarity House, that facility is to be turned into the headquarters for the coops and, potentially, a clinic for union members and their families.

On balance, AALC's programs during the past five years have contributed to the organization's goals and furthered the cause of free unionism in Kenya.

5. Findings and Conclusions

Maximizing the use of the excellent physical facility at the Tom Mboya Labor College offers a clear challenge and agenda for AALC in Kenya. COTU officials and school administrators alike are enthusiastic about the regional possibilities of the college. AALC has been promoting the idea in and out of Kenya. When the faculty and curriculum have reached a level of effort and competence to meet national needs, which could be soon, the creation of a labor education center for English-speaking Africa seems a logical next step.

The research activity is badly needed, and some technical assistance may be required to establish a strong program and to identify ways of ensuring its

sustainability. The U.S. Embassy felt that the withdrawal of the AALC economist from the Mboya College was premature. The Embassy would have objected had it been given the opportunity to participate in the decision.

The evaluation team is supportive of the Embassy's position because economic research and training will be very important in Kenya in the next few years. The AALC Representative in Kenya personally cannot meet the need at the College because he must be in Nairobi with the national federation. In addition, he has regional functions which require travel to four other countries in East Africa and the Indian Ocean. It is likely that AALC activity in some of these countries will expand and that the number of countries to be served may also increase.

SENEGAL

The size of South Dakota, Senegal is the closest country in Africa to the Western Hemisphere. A working democracy, Senegal has a predominantly rural (70%) population of some seven million. The climate is dry in the North with savanna vegetation graduating to a more tropical climate in the South. Light industry, transportation, tourism and the civil service provide most of the 225,000 salaried jobs, of which some 60,000 are government employees. The modern urban informal sector includes some 250,000 persons and urban unemployment is estimated at 150,000 to 175,000 and growing as the poor and unemployed migrate to cities from the countryside. GNP per capita was \$420 in 1986.

The team spent four working days in Senegal's capital of Dakar. There we met with union leaders, U.S. AID and State Department officials, Senegalese government representatives, and others. Although AALC has no representative in Dakar, a Togolese staff member from the organization's regional office in Abidjan preceded the team to Dakar to arrange meetings and provide general assistance to the team. We also were accompanied by an official of the AALC-funded African Institute for Higher Trade Union Studies (IAHES) which is located in Dakar. The team took several field trips in and around Dakar to review a bakery project, a school for design, and the shop of a design graduate. The team also attended the opening of a seminar for women union members on current issues affecting women in the workplace.

1. Trade Union Movement

Senegal was the birthplace of trade unionism in French-speaking Africa and the labor movement traces its beginnings back to 1919. Linked to French unions of varying political stripes, labor groups for many years were marked by ideological divisions and a high degree of politicization. The leading federation, the Confederation National de Travailleurs du Senegal (CNTS), was formed in 1972. It showed little promise until 1982 when new leadership--less politicized and more dynamic--began to reorganize and revitalize Senegalese trade unionism. This leadership has halted the decline in union membership, completed a nationwide collective bargaining agreement and began a regular newspaper.

Today CNTS is a large national federation with 15 professional federations that group 66 affiliated unions. It features a nationwide coordination structure of departmental, rural and urban unions. The evaluation team had opportunities to observe and talk to CNTS officials both at work and in their homes. They impressed us by their seriousness, the modesty of their living conditions, and their plans for the future.

Senegal has minimum wage and family allowance and legislation. Check-off dues is voluntary; 20 percent of the dues go to the national federation, 20 percent to the regional union offices and the balance to the local union.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

Top union officials are members of the ruling political party, the Socialist Party; the head of the Women's department and one union vice president are also ministers in the government. Despite these close political relationships, there is evidence that labor leaders are attempting to distance themselves to some degree from direct political roles. There is also a growing question about the value of CNTS political ties. In a recent labor dispute which occurred when much of the CNTS leadership was out of the country, a powerful minister bypassed the federation and concluded an agreement with an individual union. Observers believe it was a deliberate attempt to undermine CNTS as the single instrument for national collective bargaining.

Structural readjustment also poses problems for CNTS in its relations with government and employers. In a move widely applauded by donor countries, Senegal in 1987 accepted a new World Bank structural adjustment loan of some \$85 million, contingent upon implementation of further economic reforms. Among the reforms were a greater role for the private sector and changes in the labor codes to eliminate employment "rigidities." As former government parastatals have found it difficult to compete in the new liberalized business environment, they have laid off workers -- a process made easier by the changes in the labor laws. Now the government, under pressure from business interests, is considering more labor code changes. The CNTS has resisted. "Whenever they reform, we lose jobs," said one labor official.

At the same time, rising prices of both imported and local goods have eroded the buying power of urban wage earners to about 65 percent of the level found at independence. The CNTS often has found it difficult to explain to its members why restrictive policies are needed and why labor should support the government.

3. Trade Union Programs

In addition to its collective bargaining and organizing activities, the CNTS carries on a range of programs aimed at improving the effectiveness and welfare of its members:

- Educational activities The federation carries on a continuing series of leadership seminars. The sessions, which normally have up to 25 union cadre attending, deal with collective bargaining strategy and grievance settlement, among other topics. Specialized training is also provided to young workers and to women.

The evaluation team attended the opening session of a seminar in which women trainers were being instructed in subjects affecting female workers. Those included: protection and promotion of the rights of women, the role of women in the labor movement, the politics of population in Senegal and its impact on development, family planning, and the prevention of sexually transmitted diseases.

- Communications The purchase of a printing press in 1986 has permitted the CNTS to publish a regular newspaper, as well as a variety of other pamphlets, flyers, brochures and documents of interest its members. It has made possible the publication of labor-management agreements so that their provisions can be publicized among the workers.

- Cooperatives The CNTS sponsors credit unions and, more recently, income-employment-generating cooperatives. It runs a series of bakeries established with the assistance of Italian labor unions. At six installations daily, some 4,000 loaves of French bread are produced, distributed and sold. The activity has generated 16 jobs directly and makes a profit for the union cooperative. Notable too is that the bakery is the sole source of a more nutritive loaf, called "pan mil ble" that makes use of a 15 percent mix of millet, a locally grown grain. The unions have marketed it to local hotels which regularly serve it to their guests. The team visited a bakery and was impressed by the level of activity and maintenance of equipment.

Recently the CNTS was given a building for its use by the government. When renovated, it will permit considerable expansion from the currently cramped quarters it occupies in downtown Dakar. The new quarters have encouraged thinking about expanding union programs into new directions. Plans include operation of millet mills, fabric dyeing factory, sewing, fish drying, glass-making. Union officials also talked of digging 50 wells to water livestock and starting a housing cooperative that would build homes for 5,000 workers.

4. AALC Support

An AALC representative was based in Senegal from 1972 until 1986. Although he was primarily responsible for IAHER after 1979, he oversaw the development of a training facility for aspiring and employed tailors and seamstresses. Called the Institut de Coupe, Couture et Mode (ICCM), the facility was a joint effort of the AALC, French unions and the Senegalese government.

Whatever value the school once had for Senegal, its value to CNTS was marginal and the AALC phased out its help in 1978. The team visited the ICCM, which is now part of Senegal's school system. It is in a run-down building, using antiquated sewing machines, and shows distinct signs of having deteriorated. The faculty, which must moonlight to make a living, was proud to take us to the shop of a recent graduate who is making a living at his trade and hires four other employees.

During the period between 1966 and 1980, AALC -- despite having a resident representative -- was constrained by financial limits from mounting a country program. Its aid was in the form of impact projects that responded to specific

union requests. In 1979, however, the African Institute for Higher Trade Union Studies (known in French as IAHES -- See Chapter V) was created in Dakar by AALC, CNTS and the Organization of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU). While the Institute was not specifically involved in assisting CNTS, its presence has stimulated and assisted trade union education in Senegal through instructor training and drafting of model courses.

AALC also has assisted CNTS by providing printing equipment. It continues to contribute through the purchase of printing supplies and defraying machine maintenance costs.

In 1986, the AALC representative was removed from Dakar because of overall budget cutbacks. Since that time the Senegalese programs have been administered from Washington and Abidjan. During the five-year period, Senegal has received \$55,000.

5. Findings and Conclusions

The team found many reasons to be encouraged about the trends in trade unionism in Senegal, while at the same time recognizing the challenges that clearly lie ahead. Although CNTS leadership was noncommittal on the importance of an AALC presence in Senegal (while at the same time interested in a much larger program), the U.S. Embassy representative and AID Mission

director expressed the hope that an individual could be stationed there to work with CNTS and to help run IAHES. We believe too that Senegal deserves priority as a future site for an on-the-ground AALC presence. The next several years are likely to be unusually significant for the labor movement in that country; AALC could play a pivotal role there.

ZAIRE

Zaire is a major country of Africa. With a population of over 33 million, Zaire covers 400,000 square miles in the equatorial heart of Africa -- an area equal to the United States east of the Mississippi River. It is a country endowed with

extractive minerals and at independence had one of Africa's most highly developed and diversified economies. Seventy percent of the population are farmers, growing staple crops on small plots. Wage earners number about 1.1 million of whom 500,000 are in the public sector.

Potentially a rich country, Zaire has been kept poor by years of mismanagement and corruption. During the 1970s, like other African states, Zaire was hit hard by the decline in prices for its commodity exports. Working with the IMF on stabilization, Zaire's leaders in recent years have brought some improvement to the economy, but there is little sign yet of real growth. With a nearly three percent population growth rate, it is not surprising that there has been negative GNP per capita growth (-2.2 percent) between 1965 and 1986; GNP per capita was \$160 in 1986.

The evaluation team spent four days in Zaire. It met with AID and State Department officials, trade union representatives, and the resident regional AALC representative, and took field trips to see a number of union activities: the central health facility, a union health clinic, a day care center, the training center, and the site of a planned future training facility. The program thus provided the team with an overview of the major union programs and facilities.

1. Trade Union Movement

The labor movement in Zaire dates back to 1920, but effective freedom of association for black workers was granted only in 1957 by the Belgian colonial authorities. Initially, unions were organized along regional, tribal and ideological lines. In 1965 after General Mobutu launched the Second Republic, which was led by a single political party, pressures were placed on unions to merge into one body. Consequently, in 1967, the major trade unions met in national congress and agreed to form a single organization, now known as the Union Nationale des Travailleurs du Zaire (UNTZA).

In Zaire all salaried workers are automatically considered members of UNTZA. Of those, however, roughly 800,000 have union dues deducted from their paychecks and some 700,000 are employed in enterprises under contract negotiated by their unions. About 75 percent of the nation's workers are union members.

The size of the workforce and the automatic dues check-off provide UNTZa with resources far beyond those of most other labor movements in Africa. While these resources have permitted dynamic organizational expansion, they have not prevented internal political maneuverings which characterized the federation until 1981 when the present General Secretary, Kombo Ntonga Booke, was elected in a democratic vote.

UNTZa has developed an impressive institutional structure which features six specialized departments: external relations, research, cooperatives, education, women and social services. It has six functional services including industrial relations, information, finance, audit, administration and personnel. UNTZa can claim almost 1,000 collective bargaining agreements currently in place.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

UNTZa leadership has close links with President Mobutu's ruling party, the Movement Populaire de Revolution (MPR). They are party members and some are ranking members of the party hierarchy.

President Mobutu has given the union a number of parastatal organizations to run. They include:

- Production and processing of chicken, pork, milk, tomatoes, and fruit juices, activities employing about 1,000 employees in Kinshasa and Lumumbashi;
- Importation, storage, and distribution of imported fish and manioc;
- An insurance company;
- A transportation company with refrigerated trucks;
- A real estate firm;
- Several farming operations;
- Both the Hyundai and Mazda dealerships for the country;
- Gold and diamond mining; and
- Coffee exploitation in the Haut Zaire region.

In total, UNTZa is responsible for managing 15 separate manufacturing and commercial operations, arrayed within three holding companies. It has established a special internal audit division to supervise the management and control of the enterprises assigned to it.

Within Mobutu's authoritarian state, strikes are actively discouraged and are seen as a form of political protest. Thus, the labor movement has not been able to confront employers, either public or private, with repeated demands for higher wages or threatened walkouts. Rather, UNTZa has worked to improve fringe benefits and increase salaries through job reclassification. UNTZa does negotiate with the government for salary increases for government employees. Although UNTZa does not call for strikes, affiliated unions or local unions do strike, but usually only for a day or two to focus attention on a local grievance.

3. Trade Union programs

UNTZa, far beyond any other union programs reviewed by the evaluation team, has developed a number of socio-economic services for its members. These operate in four major areas: education and training, health services, consumer and producer cooperatives, and specialized women's programs.

- Education and training. The education of shop stewards and cadre has had a high priority for UNTZa. In addition to maintaining a full-time training staff of some 25, the federation funds an Institute for Higher Labor Union Studies (in French, ISST) which provides university level courses for about 200 staff members and shop stewards. The evaluation team visited ISST, a dark, dingy and run-down facility along a busy market street, and discussed the training program with the director and members of his staff, many of whom are also professors at local universities. Despite the poor learning environment, ISST is credited with training hundreds of individuals.

Union officials also took the team to the Mont-Ngafula/Joli site outside Kinshasa which was constructed some years ago as a major live-in training center for UNTZa members and, eventually, for other francophone trade unionists. The site today is overgrown, the buildings vandalized and dirty, with no electricity or running water. Currently a "white elephant," built with funds from union members, the realization of the project remains a goal for UNTZa leadership. They have continued to request assistance from AALC and other labor organizations with whom they have relations.

- Health and Related Social Programs are operated through the UNTZa's social service department, called CASOP, which was created in 1969 with a single dispensary in Kinshasa. From there it has expanded to some 25 dispensaries located throughout Zaire and a decentralized system of 150,000 mutual aid societies boasting 150,000 members. The evaluation team visited the CASOP central clinic, pharmaceutical warehouse, and administrative offices. They compared very favorably to similar installations in other LDCs. The team also visited a newly finished clinic facility, as yet unopened, provided by the government within a parastatal complex which is to be operated by the union. This clinic was large, well designed, and expected to provide at least primary health care to a large number of workers and their families.
- Producer and Consumer Cooperatives also have been a major emphasis of UNTZa in recent years. From 82 cooperatives in 1984, the number has grown to 257 by 1988, a 217 percent increase. The number of coop members rose during the same period from 5,203 to 14,984. However the numbers directly benefiting financially from the cooperative activities is only 1,063 -- about 7 percent of the total membership. ARCOOP, the UNTZa department, is attempting to improve that result.

It supervises a variety of cooperative activities located throughout Zaire, with an emphasis on production of agricultural commodities and transport. Credit unions have fared less well. From a beginning in 1985, credit union membership has grown only from 645 members to 815 in 1989.

- Women's Programs have been emphasized in more recent years. UNTZa's women's department (DFT/FUPROF) conducts extensive activities throughout Zaire, organizing working women, operating maternal and child health centers, and developing income-generating activities. The evaluation team visited a child care facility for working mothers. It was clean and well-kept. The team also reviewed briefly a nutrition course for mothers fostered by the women's department.

4. AALC Support

Since the Zaire country program was begun in 1967, AALC has assisted the federation develop its educational activities, cooperatives, research program, health services system, financial management, and women's programs. UNTZa officials are quick to acknowledge the contribution made by AALC.

In its five-year 1985-1989 program for Zaire, AALC set four long-term goals: 1) to increase the effectiveness of trade union leadership in "bread and butter" and health and safety efforts; 2) to assist the cooperative projects of ARCOOP and the income-generating efforts of the women's department, 3) improve the financial management of UNTZa, and 4) to help create a permanent research capacity within the union.

Despite the cutback in AALC funds which resulted in a 5-year allocation to Zaire of just over \$1 million, rather than the projected \$1.3 million, the four objectives appear to have been, by and large, achieved. The AALC representative particularly emphasized the resulting quality of the union's research department. He noted that it has advanced over the past five years to a high professional level, with an autonomous staff doing effective economic and union-related research.

5. Findings and Conclusions

UNTZA used the opportunity of the evaluation team visit to present its "wish lists" for the future. It did so with a series of documents, impressively done themselves, which laid out needs. Although no priorities were offered, funds for the Mont-Ngafula facility were mentioned prominently.

AALC's future in Zaire raises a number of questions. On the one hand, the UNTZA is so large, wealthy and powerful that the contribution of AALC, while not insignificant, is far less important than in the three other countries the team visited. Moreover, union leadership is part of the political structure of an authoritarian regime noted for corruption and a shaky commitment to development.

On the other hand, elements of the labor movement stand apart from government. Reportedly, union elections at local and regional levels are democratically run. The UNTZA has a reputation for managerial dynamism that was reinforced by the observations of the team. Because the AID Mission is seeking to channel much of its assistance to Zaire through the private sector, it is possible that UNTZA, or component organizations, would be effective channels for USAID programs in such areas as women in development, Food-for-Peace distribution, small enterprise lending, family planning, child survival, and management training.

This suggests that AALC should re-assess its role in Zaire, perhaps being less directly involved in bankrolling labor programs but acting as a facilitating intermediary for direct AID funding for union programs.

ANNEX D
OTHER COUNTRY REPORTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Country</u>	<u>Page</u>
Ghana	D-1
Guinea	D-3
Lesotho	D-5
Liberia	D-8
Mauritius	D-11
Sierra Leone	D-14
Sudan	D-17
Swaziland	D-22
Togo	D-25
Uganda	D-27
Zimbabwe	D-30

ANNEX D

OTHER COUNTRY REPORTS

GHANA

Ghana, like most other African countries, has been hard hit by economic problems. GNP per capita was only \$380 in 1986, reflecting an overall negative annual growth (-1.7%) between 1965 and 1986. By responding to the conditions prescribed in 1983 by the IMF and the World Bank for reviving Ghana's economy, the economic situation has begun to improve, with GDP growth averaging six percent annually between 1984 and 1987. However, many problems remain, including rapid growth in Ghana's population of 14 million.

1. Trade Union Movement

The Ghana Trades Union Congress (TUC) has existed in its present form since 1958. It groups 17 national affiliates with a total membership of 608,000 out of a work force of approximately 4.6 million, with the largest proportion of that work force engaged in agriculture. Dues are collected by check-off by which one percent of members' salaries is deducted. Of this amount, 30 percent goes to the TUC, 50 percent to the professional federation and the remaining 20 percent to the local branch. There is minimum wage legislation, no family allowances.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The TUC's primary concern throughout the implementation of the Economic Recovery Plan has been and continues to be the protection of the declining living standard of its members whose wages and benefits have not kept pace with inflation. Over the last five years, the TUC has participated in many of the government's deliberations on the economy and has managed to negotiate some adjustments in the minimum wage and a reform of the tax system which will reduce personal income tax rates and broaden the sales tax base.

3. Trade Union Programs

While its achievements and influence continue to be limited by government interference and the economic climate, the TUC has managed over the past five years to carry out a number of programs designed to train its membership to participate more fully in economic decision-making and to counter some of the more deleterious effects of the Economy Recovery Plan. The Ghana Labour College, which AALC helped found in 1967 and provided the first principal, was all but destroyed in 1981. It was renovated with AALC assistance from 1985 to the present and provides residential seminars not only for Ghanaian workers but also for trade unionists from English-speaking countries in the West African region.

The TUC is also involved directly or indirectly in a number of other projects which demonstrate its ability to participate in the national development process. These include the provision of low-cost housing for workers, the establishment of a secretarial school and a home science school, the creation of a clinic at TUC headquarters and one at a sugar factory, and past involvement in food distribution.

4. AALC Support

Because of the political circumstances that caused the removal in 1985 of AALC's representative, and the economic and political climate that has existed in Ghana for the past five years, the AALC budget for the five-year period was drastically cut (from \$1.2 million to about \$370,000) and many planned objectives had to be abandoned.

The TUC needs during this time were in the area of organizing and education, and the AALC attempted to respond to these priorities. In 1987, the AALC provided six vehicles to the TUC to enable it to resume its organizing campaigns in the interior and to carry out education programs on a regional basis. The AALC provided funds to the Labour College for needed renovations and office and kitchen equipment. This aid enabled the Labour College to regain much of the ground lost by the events of 1981 and to be well on its way to becoming an active regional education center for anglophone West Africa.

5. Findings and Conclusions

Apart from the development projects noted above, the TUC has been circumscribed in its development and service activities by its limited resources and its pre-occupation with the "bread and butter" impacts of the economic recovery. Its future needs, therefore, will continue to include training in economics, research and responsible participation. Once the economic situation improves, the TUC expects to branch out into other activities.

AALC's assistance has been appropriate and important. It should be continued -- and expanded when circumstances permit.

GUINEA

The country of Guinea, located in West Africa, has a population of just under 6 million, with a total workforce (formal and informal sectors) of approximately 2.4 million. Most of these workers are in the agricultural sector; about 190,000 salaried workers are in industry, commerce, services, and the civil service. Per capital GNP was \$320 in 1985, the year in which the government that came to power in 1984 introduced sweeping economic reforms that have begun to reduce the economic stagnation and decline of the previous 27 years.

1. Trade Union Movement

Because of Guinea's post-independence history and the oppressive policies of Sekou Toure, especially towards the end of his rule, the history of democratic trade unionism in Guinea can be said to begin in 1984 with the onset of the post-Toure era. The national labor confederation, CNIG, faced a formidable task, both in terms of internal organization, its reaction as an institution to external forces, and the definition of its role in the new society. It was reconstituted with a new leadership determined to follow a more democratic and representative course vis-a-vis its members, the economic development of the country, and participation in the changing industrial relations system.

Fourteen national unions are affiliated to the CNTIG, with an estimated total of 13,000 members, roughly 7 percent of the salaried work force. No union dues are currently authorized. There is minimum wage legislation, family allowances are provided.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

Between 1958, when Guinea became independent, and 1984, when Sekou Toure died, the Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs de Guinea (CNTIG) was barely distinguishable from the single political party; it had little autonomy or representative functions. Since 1984, CNTIG's relations with the government and the ruling party have been non-confrontational, representing the spirit of "responsible participation" which characterizes many of the unions in west Africa. The government has made no effort to incorporate the unions into the party structure and appears to recognize the need for an effective and equitable industrial relations system.

3. Trade Union Programs

A priority of the newly constituted federation in 1984-85 was training, from the rank-and-file to the new leadership. Recognizing the importance of the worker's participation in national development, the CNTIG created two training projects for its members as well as for those potential members affected by the government's structural adjustment programs. One such project involves a secretarial training project to upgrade the skills of secretaries and bookkeepers to fill positions in the newly-privatized industries. Another project involves the establishment of a sewing center for unemployed women.

4. AALC Support

The AALC has had a country program in Guinea since 1986. Prior assistance to help the CNTIG renovate its headquarters and formulate an education strategy was provided from other sources. Since 1986, assistance programs have been administered through the AALC's regional office in Abidjan and have consisted of education programs in instructor training, occupational

safety and health, economic trends and research, and the role of women in the union movement. In addition, the AALC provided supplies and equipment to the women's secretarial training project.

5. Findings and Conclusion:

Because the CNTIG is still in the process of rebuilding, assistance will continue to be required in the area of rank-and-file education, particularly at the regional and prefecture levels, and in training in labor economics and statistical research. The CNTIG will require the expertise to play an ever-increasing role in the development of the country through its participation with government in the structural adjustment. Finally, additional development projects in the area of job creation and vocational training will be developed as the CNTIG develops its institutional capacity to administer such projects.

Although the input of the AALC is relatively small (approximately \$30,000 annually) compared to the total contribution of other international donors, its assistance at this early and formative stage of the CNTIG's development has been and continues to be instrumental in the CNTIG's growing status as a democratic institution in Guinea's rapidly changing polity.

LESOTHO

Lesotho, located within the east-central part of the Republic of South Africa, has been at the mercy of the Republic for food, employment, and most other basic necessities and services. A mountainous country of 1.6 million inhabitants, Lesotho supplies approximately 150,000 workers annually to the mines, farms, and industries in South Africa. The remaining work force is employed primarily in subsistence agriculture, livestock raising, handicrafts, and limited industrial activity. Per capital GNP was \$460 in 1986. The country benefits economically from repatriated funds from Basotho miners (in excess of \$200 million annually), tourism and remittances from the revenues derived from the Common Custom Union.

1. Trade Union Movement

Historically, the Lesotho trade union movement has been divided along political and ideological lines. Efforts in 1984 to merge the Lesotho Council of Workers and the Lesotho Federation of Trade Unions was only partially effective as the election "losers" continued to operate as a maverick union. The newly merged organization, the Lesotho Congress of Free Trade Unions (LCFTU), established itself in all ten districts with a smattering of industrial unions in the capital city, Maseru. Total membership is about 10,000.

The lack of protective labor laws; the existence of a ruling unelected military council; the absence of large, single employers; the broad distribution of members; and the re-assertion of the minority federation (with government support) following the January 1986 coup have all mitigated against a truly effective labor movement.

Check-off of dues is partial and voluntary, with 45 percent of collected dues going to the national federation. There is no minimum wage or family allowances legislation.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The military coup d'etat in early 1986 which ousted Prime Minister Leabua Jonathan gave credibility to the maverick union in an apparent effort to divide and weaken the LCFTU and avoid union opposition on the political front. In August 1986, the GOL approved the existence of more than one central labor federation. In June 1988, the GOL selected the minority federation to represent the workers of Lesotho at the ILO meeting and confiscated the passport of the Secretary General of the LCFTU when he appealed the decision.

In 1989, the government set up a Unity Working Committee to look into the possibility of a merger of the two federations. The government has not yet decided who will represent Lesotho workers at this year's ILO Conference.

3. Trade Union Programs

Despite this restrictive political atmosphere and limited economic development, the LCFTU has been successful in providing an assortment of programs and activities for its members. A vocational training program was initiated in the early 1980s, a credit union followed, and in 1985 a women's program in weaving, design, tapestry, and tie-dying was started. The LCFTU has an on-going trade union education program intended to train members and involve them in the union. The LCFTU also sits on the board of the Institute of Labour Studies (ILS) which is part of the National University of Lesotho. A current activity of the LCFTU is increasing the involvement of worker service organizations within Lesotho in job creation and cooperatives. To respond to the needs of the high numbers of Basotho mine workers leaving for South Africa, the LCFTU has a migrant labor program sponsored by the International Labor Organization (ILO).

The LCFTU is an active participant in regional, continental, and international affairs. The federation belongs to the Southern African Trade Union Coordinating Council (SATUCC), the Organization of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU), and the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU).

4. AALC Support

The African-American Labor Center has had a continuous country program in Lesotho since the early 1970s. For most of the period, however, the program has been administered by the AALC Field Representative in Botswana who made regular trips to Lesotho. A permanent representative, who also administers the South African program, has been in Lesotho since 1986. The AALC credit union specialist was instrumental in establishing the credit union program; various impact projects assisted the women's program.

The AALC was also instrumental in providing the foundation which led to the 1984 merger through a series of education programs for both federations which explained the merger process and need for unity. More recently, the AALC specialist in worker service programs has been making regular trips to Lesotho to assist the LCFTU establish essential programs for their members.

5. Findings and Conclusions

The future growth and development of the labor movement in Lesotho will depend on a number of factors: the progress of unity talks; possible changes in the political system; the state of the economy; and the evolution of the situation in South Africa. The ability of Lesotho's workers to unite, to speak with one voice and to establish cooperative relationships with South African unions would go a long way toward the establishment of an effective labor movement. Whether there is a continuation of military rule or the return to a civilian democracy may determine the degree of trade union maneuverability, freedom and influence. Finally, an end to apartheid in South Africa and the contract migrant labor system could create mass migration from Lesotho to South Africa as families joined miners, repatriate earnings through the present GOL system would cease and the common customs union would probably be dissolved as South Africa shifted the resources to meet internal needs.

The AALC has a role to play in encouraging worker unity, helping Lesotho's labor leaders provide education and services to the membership and preparing the national labor movement for future economic and political changes.

LIBERIA

Liberia, located in West Africa and having a population of approximately 2.5 million people, is the only African country without a foreign colonial experience. Most of the wage labor force of 160,000 is concentrated in the agricultural sector, although the mining of iron, gold and diamonds accounts for the majority of Liberia's export activity. Per capital GNP was \$460 in 1986.

1. Trade Union Movement

The Liberia Federation of Labour Unions (LFLU) is the sole national center in Liberia, following the merger of three national centers in 1980. The LFLU has 12 affiliates with a total membership of 15,000 dues-paying members.

Organizing efforts are concentrated in the agricultural sector, where most of the wage earners are located and where many of the foreign-owned concessions are not unionized. Civil servants, who constitute a large part of the urban work force, are prohibited by law from forming unions. The teachers' unions are not affiliated to the national center. Two other large unions remain outside the LFLU: the Bong Miners Union and the National Agricultural and Allied Workers Union. Currently, there is no labor law in effect, a situation which frequently incurs the criticism of the international labor community and which is being used in a pending case against Liberia to remove it from the Generalized System of Preferences (GSP). Check-off of dues is voluntary; 60 percent of collected dues go to the national federation.

The LFLU is a fairly weak player in Liberian society. The authoritarian nature of the political system, the mismanagement of the economy, and the existence of important labor groups outside the LFLU limits the trade union movement's influence and potential importance.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The LFLU's relations with the government are fairly cordial, perhaps because the trade union movement is rarely viewed as a threat to government control or to economic activity. Strikes are outlawed, though they have occurred over the past few years — mostly by groups that are not affiliated to the national center.

Despite its weak position, the LFLU, in cooperation with other workers' groups, was able to mobilize opposition in 1987 to the passage of a highly restrictive law which threatened to limit the trade union rights of government and public corporation employees.

3. Trade Union Programs

Despite the highly unfavorable climate in which it operates, the LFLU has ongoing programs in education, cooperative development, and organizing. It has recently established a women's department. Since its creation in 1980,

the primary objective of the LFLU has been to increase its membership. Organizing drives in the agricultural and mining sectors have had mixed success during the past five years, with some increases in membership that often have been offset by retrenchment, plant closings, etc. In the area of cooperative development, a small multi-purpose society has been created and registered and, in cooperation with the Ministry of Agriculture, produces vegetables for the Monrovia market. Future plans include poultry and dry-season crop production and marketing. The women's department has a non-voting seat on the LFLU executive board, meets regularly, and has established a sewing project which creates employment for women and provides low-cost school uniforms to union members. In spite of its limited income, the LFLU's education staff is now operating without external salary subsidies for the first time and continues to function at a professional level.

4. AALC Support

The AALC has had a resident representative in Liberia since the early 1970's. AALC has supported LFLU's education programs and organizing campaigns since the latter's formation. Since 1987, when a representative with considerable experience in cooperative development was posted to Liberia, AALC assistance has encouraged the formation of credit unions, women's projects, and cooperative ventures in job creation and income generation. An encouraging sign in an otherwise gloomy picture has been the phasing out over the past five years of AALC salary support to the LFLU's education department to the point where no salary subsidies are now provided.

Because of the fluctuations in membership of the LFLU during the past five years, the overall political and economic climate, and internal leadership problems within the LFLU itself, many of the long-range objectives first set forth in 1985 have not been realized: the doubling of LFLU membership by 1989 and the establishment of regional education centers, a newspaper, and a literacy program. Nevertheless, the LFLU continues to make small gains in membership and the co-op project and women's department are functioning efficiently.

AALC's expenditures in Liberia have been at a fairly low but consistent level since 1985. The total country budget for FY1989 is \$143,681, of which \$108,681 covers the costs of maintaining a representative, including office expenses. Remaining for programs with the LFLU is \$35,000 divided among education, organizing, and union service projects. AALC's representative also is responsible for program administration in Sierra Leone which he visits every two months.

5. Findings and Conclusions

While the short-term prospects for the LFLU in terms of membership gains are not encouraging, the numbers of currently unorganized workers are sufficiently high to warrant optimism for the long-term outlook, provided the economy and political climate show improvement. The LFLU must concentrate its efforts in organizing these workers and in encouraging younger workers to participate in the activities of the labor movement. Given the economic climate and the difficulties in recruiting potential members, the LFLU's emphasis on services is appropriate -- as is AALC's choice of representative, with his expertise and experience in the development of cooperatives and his encouragement of the LFLU's women's program.

MAURITIUS

A small but strategically sited island in the Indian Ocean, Mauritius has a multi-racial society of slightly more than one million. Since independence in 1968, it has maintained a democratic form of government. Over the past five years, the country has prospered through IMF-imposed reforms and the creation of an export processing zone in which some 100,000 workers are employed. The result is a decline in unemployment from 20 to 10 percent of the working age population and lessening dependence on sugar production (which occupies about 90 percent of arable land). Per capital GNP was \$1,200 in 1986.

The evaluation team obtained information about the program from the AALC representative in Nairobi, who currently is responsible for the Mauritius

program, and from the representative in Botswana, who formerly was the resident representative in Mauritius. The team also viewed a slide presentation on labor movement employment-generating activities in Mauritius.

1. Trade Union Movement

Although the present government is in favor of free labor unions, the movement in Mauritius has been hampered by the existence of some 300 unions organized within some eight federations. The two most significant labor groups are the Mauritius Labor Congress (MLC), with ties to the present government, and the General Workers Federation (GWF), allied to a left-wing political party which led an earlier government.

In recent years the MLC has been successful in attracting new affiliates among larger independent unions, including the government workers and teachers, bringing its dues-paying membership to some 46,000 -- more than 65 percent of the organized work force. Dues check-off is mandatory; about 10 percent is paid to the national federation. There is minimum wage legislation, but no provision for family allowances.

In recent months, the MLC has sought to assimilate new affiliates and their members, to attract unaffiliated labor groups, and to organize the unorganized -- particularly workers involved in the export processing zone. The MLC also carries on a program of membership services that include cooperatives, credit unions and other income-generating projects.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

Although the MLC has done well during the current government administration, it faces several new challenges. As jobs in the sugar industry have declined, the federation has recognized the need to organize in the fast-growing export processing zone where many workers are unrepresented. To date, MLC and other federations' efforts have met with limited success; employers have resisted their efforts and the government has been reluctant to interfere. The MLC leadership is seeking changes in existing labor

legislation, which dictates a political process for areas that might better be left to collective bargaining. Again, the government has been reluctant to change.

3. Trade Union Programs

MLC has been involved in a range of programs characterized by a concern for unemployment and a desire to foster economic and social programs to redress it. Thus, MLC has pioneered a variety of job creating schemes, including a furniture factory, manufacture of wooden heels for shoes, and a commission agency for export/import sales. While the conditions which led to the Job Creation Scheme no longer prevail, the projects continue to prosper and nine unions are involved in them. The MLC also carries on credit union activities and a major program of education (in legal rights, occupational health and safety, etc.) for rank-and-file members and leaders, an effort that sets it apart from rival federations.

4. AALC Support

AALC has been a major contributor to the free labor movement in Mauritius, and more particularly to the MLC, sponsoring many programs in the fields of worker education, credit unions, cooperatives and job creation. In 1983, at the request of MLC and encouragement of the government, AALC placed a representative in-country. He was responsible for a major program of assistance in worker education and cooperatives.

AALC cited three long-term objectives for its 1985-1989 assistance program: 1) to help develop effective trade union leadership within MLC, 2) to help increase the federation's economic self-sufficiency, and 3) to promote employment. Despite financial short-falls, which led to the removal of the AALC representative in 1987, the objectives appear to have been achieved in many instances:

- MLC Leadership has been strengthened through ongoing seminar programs and was able to carry on with programs begun under AALC sponsorship. Their ability to represent their members effectively with government and employers on wages, benefits, health and safety, and grievance remains constrained.

- Economic self-sufficiency is still a goal, but the MLC has advanced toward it by increasing the number of its affiliates significantly and by achieving increases in the dues paid by members. Lack of funds, however, continues to limit the range of services MLC can provide its membership.
- Employment generation, while less pressing, has proceeded. Some 50-60 jobs have been created. Credit unions have expanded as the MLC developed a fully operational cooperative section able to provide effective assistance to union-sponsored credit unions. More than 15 had been developed by 1989.

Perhaps the most important and far-reaching assistance AALC has given Mauritius was its successful advocacy that the country be given a larger share of the United States textile import quota. It based its support on the country's democratic system and its recognition of worker rights. The increased trade has given an important boost to the Mauritian economy.

5. Findings and Conclusions

It is clear that AALC support has, along with a more favorable political and economic climate, benefited MLC and the free labor movement generally in Mauritius. Much of that success can be attributed to the kind of day-in, day-out technical assistance that an on-the-site AALC representative can give. Facing new challenges, particularly the need to convince the government to establish an equitable labor and industrial relations policy in the export promotion zone, the MLC clearly could benefit from a similar presence in the future. If funding levels do not permit that, however, AALC's continued support of worker education, membership promotion, credit unions and income-generating activities still will make a substantial contribution.

SIERRA LEONE

The west African country of Sierra Leone, located on the Atlantic coast, has a population of approximately 3.5 million and an economically active population of 1.4 million, with the majority engaged in agriculture. Approximately 389,000 people are in the formal sector which consists of industry and services. Per capita GNP was \$310 in 1986.

Sierra Leone has been one of the countries hardest hit by the economic crisis. Declining public sector revenues, corruption, illegal exports, an overstaffed public sector and rampant inflation have forced the government to accept IMF guidelines as a condition of emergency credits. An "economic emergency" declared in 1987 had only limited success as the leone's value declined, goods became more difficult to find in local markets, and the purchasing power of the workers continued to fall. Inflation continues to rise because of the country's dependence on imported consumable and durable goods. Political power is centralized in the All People's Congress and the President, J.S. Momoh, who was elected in peaceful elections in 1985.

1. Trade Union Movement

The Sierra Leone Labour Congress (SLLC) was established in 1976 after the merger of two factions -- the Sierra Leone Federation of Labour and the Sierra Leone Council of Labour. It consists of 20 national affiliates with a total membership of 87,000, amounting to 22 percent of the workers in the formal sector.

There is no legislation providing for a minimum wage, family allowances or obligatory check-off of union dues. Fifteen percent of the dues collected go to the national federation, 70 percent to the professional union and 15 percent to the member's local.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

In 1981, after a national strike over food price increases, leaders of the SLLC were imprisoned and union activities were abruptly halted. Elections, ordered by the government, resulted in an entirely new slate of officers and, after several months, the national center resumed operations. Those events continue to shape the SLLC's relationship with the present government and the role the SLLC has assumed in the society.

3. Trade Union Programs

To deflect unwanted government attention from its headquarters operations, the SLIC in 1981 began to emphasize district level organizing and education and to initiate a number of programs in such non-controversial areas as literacy instruction, cooperative development and agricultural production. It pursues a non-confrontational course vis a vis the government, emphasizing self-sufficiency, cooperation with government programs and participation in the national development process. In this context, it has been successful in negotiating modest wage increases for its members, participating in food distribution, and in becoming a partner in the government's literacy campaign.

By the end of 1988, the SLIC's agricultural project was progressing at a steady rate. A local agricultural technician was employed and individual plots were growing groundnuts, yams and rice. A women's department, established in 1988, provides leadership training and basic trade union training for the SLIC's women members. The SLIC continues to conduct a three-cycle education program for shop stewards and regional officers which now includes a "refresher" program for past participants.

4. AALC Support

The AALC has provided assistance to Sierra Leone's workers since 1966 and posted a permanent representative to Freetown in 1977. Since 1981, the AALC together with other donors, has helped the SLIC to rebuild, offering renewed educational and technical assistance in the wake of the government's repressive actions.

Since 1985, AALC's support has included assistance to the education programs in leadership training, district organizing, women's seminars, and literacy instruction. In 1985, it was expected that the SLIC would be able to reopen its cooperative store and embark on a program of health care in the rural areas. The nationwide shortage of consumer goods forced the temporary

suspension of the cooperative project and lack of adequate resources prevented the establishment of a health care program. Nevertheless, the SLIC acquired a 650-acre farm in 1987 which enables it to provide a livelihood for approximately 100 retrenched workers. The AALC was able to provide funds for farming equipment for this project.

The budget for 1989 includes support for continuing these projects as well as funding for the renovation of the SLIC's headquarters office. AALC assistance now is administered by its representative in Liberia who travels to Freetown every two months.

5. Finding and Conclusions

The SLIC has been remarkably effective in representing its members' interests during the current crisis and in contributing to their welfare through the various projects it has developed in recent months. AALC assistance and encouragement has been instrumental in enabling the SLIC to rebuild the labor movement at the base and to participate in the country's development. The labor movement in Sierra Leone is solid, is recognized as a partner in national development, appears responsive to members' concerns and is deserving of continued AALC support.

SUDAN

The political and economic environment in the Sudan during the grant period has been fluid and volatile. General Nimeri's military government was overthrown in 1985 while he was visiting the U.S. A union-dominated coalition government ruled under a military council until a new government was elected in 1986. The new government tried to deal with the deteriorating economic situation and bring about a cessation of fighting in the south. Recently, after the military again intervened, a broader-based coalition has taken charge. Economic revival will be difficult under the best of circumstances; it will be impossible without peace in the south.

Sudan has a population of 24 million; GNP per capita was \$320 in 1986. Over 70 percent of the labor force is in agriculture. The principal agricultural areas are in the war-torn southern part of the country; industrial activity is primarily in the north.

The evaluation team had the opportunity to interview the AALC Representative for Sudan who is on temporary duty in Washington.

1. Trade Union Movement

During the British Administration, two trade union federations were established: the Sudanese Workers Trade Union Federation (SWTUF) for blue collar workers and the Sudanese Federation of Employees and Professional Trade Unions (SFEPTU) for other workers and professional people (including self-employed). The SWTUF has membership of about one million; the SFEPTU 300,000.

Most of the union leadership prior to the Nimeri administration had a Marxist orientation, and the SWTUF was affiliated with the Communist-dominated World Federation of Trade Unions (WFTU). This continued for some time during the Nimeri period but the affiliation was suspended when Nimeri severed ties with the Sudanese Communist Party. The leftists were replaced by pro-Nimeri labor leaders.

When Nimeri fell in April of 1985, a number of pro-Nimeri trade union leaders lost their positions. Independent leaders who had helped overthrow Nimeri (and who had received assistance from the AALC) were elected. The Communists failed to gain any leadership positions in either federation in spite of an intensive campaign. When they failed, they petitioned the ILO to pressure the government to allow more than two federations in conformity with the convention on freedom of association. Through this strategy, they planned to form splinter federations. The government acquiesced, and the SFEPTU was split into three new federations at the end of 1988:

- 1) Teachers -- Islamic and moderate
- 2) Professional workers -- leftist-dominated leadership
- 3) Employees (all others) -- moderate and leftist

The trade union movement in Sudan has been the focus of a fierce struggle for leadership and ideological orientation during the 1985-88 period. At the same time, trade unions have been instrumental in restoring a democratically elected government to the Sudan and have taken initiatives to find an equitable (and thus lasting) solution to the long-standing civil war in the south. Trade unions are about the only place that northerners and southerners can meet on an equal basis. Another characteristic of the Sudanese trade union movement is that 80 percent of organized workers are employees of the government or government parastatals.

Union dues checkoff is permitted. Twenty-five percent of the dues collected are distributed to the national federation and 75 percent to the individual's professional union, of which there are 42 for each federation.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The leaders of the two federations were represented in the leadership of the ruling political party during the Nimeri administration. Trade union leadership was a part of the government between the time of the overthrow of Nimeri and the accession to leadership of the elected government in 1986. At that time, union leadership decided that the unions would not be a part of the government; however, individual unionists were free to join the political parties. There are currently two union leaders in the cabinet, one of whom is Communist.

There are procedures for government intervention in labor disputes if labor and management do not come to agreement. However, because of government inefficiency in carrying out the dispute settlement process, unions often prefer to utilize private arbitration services which is also permitted.

3. Trade Union Programs

In addition to traditional bargaining with employers over wages, benefits, and working conditions, Sudanese unions have been active working for democratic government and for peace in the south. They have also established a number of member services activities:

- a. Pharmacies;
- b. Worker health clinics -- for agricultural workers only so far;
- c. Consumer cooperatives, including a cooperative of the transport workers union which buys cars for resale; and
- d. A workers' bank -- union members can take shares in the bank for savings. They can also obtain loans for productive activities -- and, more recently, for housing.

4. AALC Support

The AALC program began in late 1985 and expanded quickly, with expenditures rising from \$6,000 in 1985 to \$346,000 in 1986. A major emphasis was on training, particularly with the larger federation, the SWTUF. In-country seminar topics were relevant to the changing situation in the unions and the country: trade unionism and democracy; trade unionism and economic development; how to run elections; how to organize; how to manage trade union finances. Some union leaders attended AALC courses in the U.S., and scholarships were provided for study at the AALC-supported Workers' University in Cairo, Egypt. AALC has supported SWTUF in setting up its first labor newspaper.

Training has continued to be important in the program, with the number of seminars in Sudan increasing during the period. The number of seminars by year and the number of participants is shown in the table below:

	Number of Seminars	Number of Participants
1985	4	123
1986	6	303
1987	10	573
1988	12	525
Total	32	1,524

Economics seminars have become particularly important, because broader economic issues have come to the fore as the government has begun to implement an IMF-approved structural adjustment program.

The AALC also has supported worker service programs, e.g., by financing transportation for medicines donated in the U.S. and Europe for the union's pharmacies and by providing refrigerators and small equipment for the consumer cooperatives. AALC technical helped set up the workers' bank. Total program expenditures 1985-88 were a little over \$1 million.

5. Findings and Conclusions

When the situation in Sudan changed in 1985 and a program could be initiated, AALC moved quickly and effectively to mount a program. The program contributed to the triumph of moderate forces in trade union elections, particularly in the largest federation--the blue collar workers' SWTUF.

In its Cooperative Agreement with AID, AALC set forth three long-term objectives for the Sudan program:

- 1) Development of a workers' education department in the two federations.
- 2) Improvement of workers' standards of living by helping in the development of pharmaceutical and consumer cooperatives and a pilot health project.
- 3) The establishment of a health and safety program in both federations.

A workers' education program has not yet been established in the two federations, but a workers' education committee has been created in the SWTUF, which is now the primary focus of the AALC program since the SFEPTU has split into three federations. A number of instructors have been trained, but basic teaching curricula have not been developed pending the establishment of an education department.

The development of cooperatives and a pilot health project has been achieved. No progress has been made in developing health and safety programs in the federations, primarily because the government does not see a role for the unions in this activity.

Neither the AALC program nor any of the union programs have benefited from or been associated with any USAID activity in Sudan. In fact, the former USAID Director chose not to have any contact with the AALC Representative. The evaluation team believes that consideration should be given to allowing friendly union federations to participate in some AID-funded activities, e.g., P.L. 480 food distribution and health and population activities, perhaps in conjunction with women in development activities.

Because of difficult living conditions, the AALC representative's family lives in Cairo. He stays in Sudan, returning to Cairo periodically. He has to carry a supply of food in to Sudan. At one point, all Americans were called to have meningitis vaccinations, but the AALC representative had to use local health facilities--which re-use their needles. To facilitate implementation of this AID-financed, Embassy-supported activity, the evaluation team recommends that the Embassy authorize the AALC representative to have access to the commissary, the Embassy health unit, and the pouch and be covered by the Embassy evacuation plan.

The U.S. Embassy has strongly endorsed the AALC program in Sudan and spoken highly of the AALC representative (Cable: Khartoum 2299 of 28 Feb 89). The evaluation team supports the Embassy view that the program merits continued funding. The team believes that good use could be made of even higher funding, especially if conditions in the south improve to the point that unions in that area could participate. Such additional funding through AALC would be additional to union participation in other AID-funded activities as mentioned above.

SWAZILAND

One of the smallest countries in Africa, Swaziland is landlocked, surrounded by Mozambique on the east and on the other sides by South Africa, whose policies affect the country significantly. The 700,000 Swazis are dependent upon South

Africa for jobs, commodities, transportation, communications and revenues. Sanction efforts against South Africa potentially have two divergent effects: First, some South African-based companies have moved to Swaziland, benefiting the country's development. Second, the sanctions could lead to a loss of jobs in South Africa, and the migrant workers are the most vulnerable (25,000 from Swaziland).

Per capita GNP was about \$650 in 1986. Only one third of the labor force is in agriculture.

Because the AALC Swazi program is directed by its representative in Botswana, the evaluation team was able to be briefed on the program there. The team was also provided with a special survey report on trade union development in Swaziland 1985-88.

1. Trade Union Movement

Before and immediately following independence (1969), the trade union movement in Swaziland was very active. Considerable industrial activity occurred from 1963-72; trade union leaders emerged and acquired skills and experience. In 1973, King Sobhuza repealed the constitution, suspended the parliament and assumed all governmental powers. The King viewed the union as a threat and restricted it severely.

Following the King's death in 1982, an effort ensued to return the country to more democratic principles. New national industrial relations legislation authorized the formation of industry-based unions, their affiliation to a national trade union center and an industrial court to oversee the implementation of the law. Nevertheless, the trade union movement was still in disarray at the beginning of 1985. The Swaziland Federation of Trade Unions (SFTU) existed on paper, but its structure, programs and activities were marginal.

During the past four years, considerable progress has been recorded. The SFTU is represented on the National Wage Council, tripartite committees and a new Labour Conciliation Committee. The federation has improved union structure and

provided more services to members in a more professional manner. Six unions have affiliated with SFTU, bringing the total number of affiliates to 15 with a combined membership of 18,150 (16 percent increase). Only two unions remain independent of the SFTU (2,000 teachers and 1,200 nurses).

Swaziland has minimum wage legislation, but no family allowances. Dues check-off is not approved. One-fourth of the dues collected go to the national federation, the balance to the professional union.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The SFTU's relationship with the government has improved significantly over the last four years. The SFTU is sitting on tripartite councils and is permitted to present cases to the Industrial Court--which was not possible in the early days of the Court.

SFTU is now permitted to participate in international programs, to host international meetings and to affiliate with regional organizations and the ICFTU. The government has accepted ILO contributions to labor legislation and has adopted ILO Convention 144 regarding safety in the use of asbestos.

3. Trade Union Programs

The major effort of the SFTU has been in educating its rank-and-file and leadership in the purposes and responsibilities of trade unionism. The SFTU has up-graded its education and research departments and added a women's wing and a projects department. The latter department has initiated job-creation schemes and credit unions for affiliates and members. Socio-economic seminars and women's issues are new additions to the education program.

4. AALC Support

AALC support of the SFTU is aimed at strengthening that institution to respond more professionally to the needs of its affiliate unions and workers. It provided no direct support to the SFTU during 1985-86. In 1987, \$10,000 was

allocated to administrative and educational support. A recent ambitious effort was a workshop held in Mbabane during May 1988 on the role of SFTU and its affiliated unions in the promotion of cooperative, job creation and food production activities. This has been followed up by technical assistance from the AALC Regional Representative in Botswana. The \$15,000 program for 1989 is primarily for education and training with some administrative support of these activities.

5. Findings and Conclusions

The SFTU has made considerable progress since the coming to power of a more supportive government. Recent programs have not overcome all internal problems, but they have strengthened affiliated unions. The development of credit unions may offer the most likely opportunities for increasing membership services by SFTU and its affiliates. Continuing educational efforts will also be important. A continuation of modest AALC support appears justified.

TOGO

A small state the size of West Virginia, Togo is a sliver squeezed between Ghana and Benin. Its 3.3 million population is largely rural; only about one-fourth of the population lives in cities such as Lome, the capital, and other towns. It is estimated that there are about 80,000 wage earners, of whom 35,000-40,000 are considered active union members.

The average annual growth of real per capita GNP was only 0.2 percent between 1965-86, the per capita GNP figure for 1986 was \$250.

The team reviewed documentation on the Togo program and had the opportunity to interview a Togolese who headed CREDE (which was located in Lome) and who now works for the AALC regional office in Abidjan.

1. Trade Union Movement

Despite its small numbers, the labor movement in Togo has played a relatively large role in the country's history. Beginning in 1945 two rival French affiliated unions, one Christian, the other Communist, established local affiliates, resulting in years of ideological conflict. That ended with the formation of a single party state in Togo in 1973 and with the creation of a single, national labor organization, the Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Togo (CNTT). Blessed with able leadership, CNTT has revitalized the labor movement, more than doubled union membership, unified its affiliates and helped create a framework for effective labor participation in national affairs.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

The CNTT has made good progress, within the bounds of an authoritarian state. It has negotiated a nationwide collective bargaining agreement, replacing a series of pre-independence pacts. It also has been able to obtain government/employer agreement to a universal dues check-off to provide it the financial resources required to build a professional organization. Proceeds to the union are estimated at some \$235,000 annually, with additional income from the government and external donors.

3. Trade Union Programs

The CNTT has a variety of programs to serve its members:

- Education. In a decentralized setting, CNTT has created regional headquarters and worker education centers. The first was created in the city of Dapaong in 1987. The Dapaong Center contains classrooms, dining hall, dormitories and administrative offices. It is the site of on-going training programs. A second center is now being created at Atakpame. The CNTT has a regular trade union newspaper.
- Cooperatives. CNTT has an extensive network of cooperatives, including credit unions and employment/income activities.
- Women's Activities. A women's wing has been established and is rapidly consolidating women's activities throughout the country.

4. AALC Support

The AALC began assisting the Togolese labor movement in 1969 when it assisted with the construction of a worker education center in Lome. AALC also assisted in the expansion of the Dapaong Center, providing funds for dormitory construction, equipment and furniture, and installations for water and electricity. It is now assisting with the Atakpame Center through the provision of equipment and supplies.

AALC also has encouraged the creation of women's programs, which are showing signs of making some headway in consolidating women's activities throughout the country and in initiating income-generating enterprises. In 1987 AALC provided funds for initial equipment needs for a cold storage unit for fish which the CNTT Women's Committee was constructing. The project is expected to serve some 5,000 women involved in marketing fish.

The Togolese labor movement also benefited from the opening of the Regional Economic Research and Documentation Center (CREDE) which had impacts on local labor research and journalism. With the closing of CREDE in 1987 and the relocation of staff to Abidjan, the day-to-day contact by AALC representatives with CNTT has been lost.

5. Findings and Conclusions

Despite political conditions in Togo, the labor movement appears to be moving on a strong course. It would appear that a continuing modest investment there in the CNTT programs is warranted. Should the political climate liberalize significantly, consideration could be given to returning a resident AALC representative.

UGANDA

Uganda has a population of about 16 million; it is rich in natural resources. It enjoys regular rainfall, fertile soil, and abundant mineral deposits such as copper and cobalt. However, the political and social upheaval of the past twenty years,

coupled with corrupt and oppressive political leaders, have all but destroyed the fabric of Ugandan society. Uganda's tremendous economic potential remains untapped; its once viable social institutions are struggling to regain their former vitality.

The evaluation team was able to discuss the Uganda program in Kenya with the Regional AALC Representative and the State Department's Regional Labor Officer and with the relevant Program Officer in AALC/Washington.

1. Trade Union Movement

Labor unions existed in Uganda prior to independence (1962). By 1966, a Labour College had been established, two rival federations had merged, and the resulting Uganda Labour Congress (ULC) comprised 24 national unions with membership of over 100,000.

These promising developments were sabotaged by the Obote government which closed both the ULC and the Labour College in May 1968. During Idi Amin's tenure, trade union leaders were jailed and beaten, and many were killed. Nevertheless, it was during Amin's rule that Decree No. 29 was promulgated, providing for the establishment of a national trade union center in Uganda. As a result, the National Organization of Trade Unions (NOTU) was formed in 1974. It remained subject to many constraints. Restrictions against trade unions continued when Obote returned to power.

The Museveni government, which came to power in January 1986 after a civil war, has endorsed the concept of a strong, viable, and free trade union movement which can contribute to a revitalization of the nation. Continued rebel actions in the country, however, have severely hampered the development of the economy. Thus, too few jobs have been restored or created to bring NOTU anywhere near the independent and viable position it once enjoyed.

At present, NOTU has a claimed membership of 200,000, distributed in 15 industrial unions. It continues in weak financial condition because payment

of membership dues is voluntary; there is no check-off system. The new leadership elected in 1988 appears more directed toward trade union, rather than political, activities.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

As indicated above, neither the Obote nor Amin administrations wanted a free trade union movement. They tried either to eliminate the movement altogether or coopt the leadership. Although the Museveni government has endorsed the concept of free trade unions, it also has tried to coopt the movement's leaders -- the previous secretary-general was given a sub-cabinet post.

3. Trade Union Programs

During 1985, and for many years before, trade union leadership was busy trying to stay alive. Beginning in 1986, it began to rebuild its organization from the ground up. Given the lack of financial resources and the leadership problems caused by the government's attempt to coopt the movement, NOTU has not been able to establish any programs. However, with AALC assistance, it is trying to organize needed training programs.

4. AALC Support

Given the political chaos in the country and the attitude of the Ugandan governments, AALC support was unable to provide significant financial support, but its informal actions were at times helpful in saving the lives of individual trade unionists. Following the advent of the Museveni government, re-installation of a country program became possible. Administrative support of \$16,000 was provided to NOTU in 1986 by use of an impact project; a regular country program was resumed in 1987. In that year \$3,700 was expended for administrative support, help with the national congress, and some educational assistance. With new leadership in 1988, support levels reached \$14,800, primarily for administrative support and some training. Essentially, the AALC funding is being used to help the NOTU stay afloat until internal security and

political conditions improve sufficiently to permit the federation and important constituent unions to rebuild their internal infrastructure and begin to rebuild membership.

5. Findings and Conclusions

The AALC, along with the ICFTU, and with some support through some ITSS, has helped individual unionists stay alive and provided essential support to NOTU leadership. Because of the internal conditions in Uganda, there is little to show for AALC's efforts. However, because the support provided has helped maintain the structure of the trade union movement, rebuilding will be possible in less time when conditions permit. The orientation of the revived trade union movement is much more likely to be moderate and western oriented as a result of the modest AALC investment.

ZIMBABWE

Zimbabwe, formerly Southern Rhodesia and Rhodesia, became independent in 1980 following considerable destruction and economic dislocation in what had been a relatively well-developed economy. During the pre-independence period, black trade unions were organized along ethnic, ideological, and regional lines. This was part of a deliberate policy of the colonial administration to dilute the potential economic influence of blacks. To overcome this situation, the newly independent government encouraged the formation of a single federation. The unions established the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) in 1981, which set about organizing the scattered company and regional unions on an industry-wide basis. The objective was to de-emphasize political differences and unite workers in specific industries regardless of regional or tribal affiliations.

The Zimbabwe program was reviewed with the relevant program officer in AALC/Washington.

1. Trade Union Movement

In 1985, 42 unions representing about 172,000 workers were affiliated with the ZCTU. In 1988, there were 30 national unions affiliated, representing about 163,000 workers. The decline in the number of unions affiliated reflected in part the merging of a number of unions in 1986 and 1987. The decline in membership reflects a reduction in economic activity, some past inflation of membership figures and internal union problems, such as the dismissal of leaders based on charges of corruption on at least three occasions during the period of the grant.

In spite of the leadership problems, ZCTU has gradually increased its effectiveness. Affiliates now pay dues to ZCTU, even though there is no national dues checkoff system. Problems caused by tribal, regional, and political differences have been largely overcome. Although the ZCTU maintains a pro-government position, it attempts to remain separate from the government and the government party.

2. Trade Union Relations with the Government

As a means of overcoming tribal, regional, and political differences, the Mugabe government encouraged the formation of a single trade union federation for Zimbabwe. The government also has worked to establish a single political party and has tried to make the federation subservient to the party. The federation has retained its independence, electing its own leaders, but its independence has been threatened by the corruption of a number of its leaders. The government rarely consults with ZCTU on economic matters affecting union membership.

3. Trade Union Programs

ZCTU has given priority to education programs, including rank and file programs, as a means of helping build support for the ZCTU. It has been establishing regional offices to support this effort. Some women's activities have been undertaken, and there is increasing support for recruitment of women members.

4. AALC Support

Three long-term objectives were established for the period of the grant:

- 1) Staffing and equipping five regional offices to be established by the ZCTU.
- 2) Strengthen the education department, helping it to establish a research department and an industrial relations department and to strengthen regional offices so they could be responsible for education programs in their region.
- 3) Provide increased services to members and affiliates, including:
 - a) Establishing a women's wing in ZCTU.
 - b) Providing literacy instruction to members.
 - c) Initiating a co-operative project such as a savings bank, a credit union, a provident fund, or a consumer co-operative.

With regard to the first objective, the ZCTU has opened three regional offices of the five hoped for; two of these were opened in 1988 but were not fully operational by the end of the year. AALC has provided administrative support to these offices as well as equipment and furnishings. The office established in 1987 has a functioning educational department (with AALC financial support).

ZCTU has not yet established a research department or an industrial relations department. Although the federation has carried out some activities in support of women, it has not yet established a women's wing. The literacy program was initiated in 1988. No co-operative project has yet been established, but it is expected that planning for this activity will be initiated in 1989 with the assistance of an AALC expert.

5. Findings and Conclusions

At first glance, it appears that the budget for Zimbabwe of around \$200,000 annually is fairly high in relation to the accomplishments. However, more than half of the budget is for the AALC office located in the country, and that office also serves two other countries. Furthermore, the amount actually spent is considerably below the amount originally programmed.

This reflects overall budget cuts by AID to some extent, but also includes reductions made by AALC because of problems within the union leadership which reduced the federation's absorptive capacity.

The union leadership elected in 1988 and the new secretary general elected in April 1989 are younger and appear to be more oriented to moving ahead with the types of objectives cited above. Therefore, continued significant support to the ZCTU appears justified given its potential importance in Zimbabwean development and the political importance of Zimbabwe in the efforts to bring about a peaceful solution in South Africa.

ANNEX E

THOUGHTS ON FUTURE AALC EVALUATIONS

1. Interim Evaluation

It is recommended that there be an interim evaluation about mid-point in the life of the follow-on project. This would be especially important if a grant rather than a cooperative agreement is used for funding the follow-on program.

The purpose of the interim evaluation would be to ensure that the basic design assumptions of the grant are still valid, that reasonable progress is being made in achieving outputs that are supposed to result in achievement of project purpose(s) and that there is mutual understanding of plans and potential achievements by AID and AALC.

2. Impact Evaluation

In the beginning of the last year of the follow-on grant, a regular evaluation should be scheduled. The evaluation should be focused more on judging the impact of the program than was possible in the current evaluation. To do so, however, will require greater attention to the structure of the follow-on project, better country labor plans and special attention to indicators.

a. Project Structure

It is suggested that the Goal for the project (in the context of the Logical Framework) should read something like the following:

"An independent, self-sustaining free labor movement in each African country which is: (1) promoting democratic pluralism and respect for worker rights; and (2) seeking to improve the standard of living of its membership while also promoting national economic growth with equity."

The Purpose statement for the overall project might read as follows: "To graduate ___ national labor centers to self-sustaining status, ___ to Category A status and ___ to Category B status." In this context, countries included in the grant would need to be categorized as follows: Category A -- countries whose trade union movements probably could reach self-sustaining status within five years; Category B -- countries whose trade union movements are not expected to reach self-sustaining status within five years, but which are sufficiently developed and are operating in an environment that permits the preparation of long-term (e.g., five-year) plans; and Category C -- countries in which it does not make sense to prepare five-year country labor plans because of the domestic political or economic situation or the internal situation within the labor movement.

This model would suggest that a strategy would need to be drafted for each country expected to receive assistance under the grant. For category C countries, this would mean reviewing the factors which keep the country from becoming a Category B country and looking at the options available under the program to help deal with the situation. Thus, a general plan would be developed, but it might not have specific time-phased outputs, because its main focus might be taking advantage of targets of opportunity. It would provide, nevertheless, a more structured framework in which to plan the use of ITS, impact and regional activities.

For category B countries, five-year plans would be prepared. This category might be further sub-divided into: (1) B-1 countries, whose Purpose might be graduation to Category A by the end of the grant period; and (2) B-2 countries, where it might not be possible to have a specific Purpose statement but rather some targets for achievement within the life of the project, i.e., a series of time-phased Outputs.

Category A countries would be those for which a plan would be prepared that would help the country reach self-sustaining status by the end of the grant. Achievement of self-sustaining status would not preclude any AID-financed activity with the country, but it would presuppose termination of a country program and limiting financial support to participation in regional activities, an occasional impact project under special circumstances

and possibly some ITS/union-to-union activity. It is recognized that there are probably no more than one or two countries that would be classified as Category A at this time (Zaire would be a suggestion by the evaluation team).

AALC has stated that the overall country goal is Trade Union Development and that there are various objectives and activities that can lead to the attainment of the goal. The consultant sees "trade union development" as a means, not an end. In AID parlance, a goal is an end, albeit a long-term one.

The Purpose is also an end statement, one that can be achieved within five years (or whatever the length of the project) and which will contribute to the eventual achievement of the goal. Thus, "trade union development" would not be considered either a project goal or purpose.

Outputs in AID logical framework terminology are even shorter term ends which are deemed necessary prerequisites to the achievement of the project purpose. They differ from AALC's "objectives" in that many of the latter are stated in terms of "promotion of internal trade union development," "promotion of democratic pluralism," etc. while AID's "outputs" will be stated in terms of indicators that are independently verifiable. Put another way, how would you know when you had finished "promoting?"

AALC's "activities" corresponds to AID's "inputs," i.e., they are both considered means.

It is suggested that AALC be provided with copies of the material in AID Handbook 3 which deal with Means-Ends Analysis and the Logical Framework and that AALC reproduce these materials for distribution to the its field representatives.

b. Country Labor Plans

Country labor plans for Categories A and B countries should include more analysis than in the past of what is needed to become independent and self-sustaining and what steps are needed to get there. To some extent, the objectives established in the current program are based on this type of

analysis, but it is not well documented. Needed is a clearer statement of the institution building process for trade unions, particularly in the African environment where the tripartite labor system is prevalent. If additional research on this process is needed, this could be a project for one of the AALC-supported regional institutes.

Improved planning could also facilitate the preparation of simplified PERT-like networks for programs for Category A and Category B countries that could demonstrate more clearly the interaction of different objectives and make time-phased projections more realistic.

c. Indicators of Progress

Using the framework set out above should facilitate the choosing of indicators. In the first place, certain indicators will flow directly from the individual country plans (or strategies in the case of Category C countries). Using the framework may also suggest some different indicators for cross-country comparisons than those in Table IV-9. Reviewing cross-country comparisons may be useful in developing country plans and in testing institution-building theses that may be developed. They should not be seen, however, as a substitute for Purpose and Outputs statements as discussed above.

Whatever the indicators chosen, collection of baseline data is essential. This suggests reviewing the planned outputs (objectives) from the country labor plans and the cross-country indicators with a view to determining what data can be collected that will give meaningful answers. This analysis may result in changing the framing of questions or the definition of indicators; it may also suggest different questions and indicators. Again it would be well to get Africans involved in this type of exercise through regional institutions or seminars.