PD-AA2-298

61327

AMEX INTERNATIONAL, INC.
1725 K Street, N.W., Suite 402
Washington, D.C. 20006
Tel: (202) 429-0222
Telefax: (202) 429-1867
Telex: 247018, 440461 & 759287
Cable: AMEX, WASH D.C.

Mauritania
Human Resources Development Project
(682-0233)

Mid-Term Evaluation

Submitted to:

U.S. Agency for International Development
Nouakchott, Mauritania

Submitted by:

AMEX International, Inc.
1725 K Street, N.W., Suite 402
Washington, D.C. 20006

March 25, 1989

Table of Contents

I. INTRODUCTION

II. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

III. MANPOWER CONDITIONS AND THEIR TRAINING IMPLICATIONS

3.1 Manpower and Employment in Mauritania

3.1.1 Population and the Labor Force
3.1.2 Evolution of the Occupational Structure in Light of the Rural Exodus, Sedentarization and Drought
3.1.3 Implications for Training for Productive Employment

3.2 The Contribution of Training to Achieving Mauritania's Development Goals

3.3 Efforts to Develop and Implement a Training Strategy and Action Plan in Mauritania

3.3.1 Government Policy, Capabilities and Institutions
3.3.2 The Mauritania Human Resources Development (HRD) Project in the Context of National Objectives and Capabilities
3.3.3 Relationship of the HRD Project to Training Provided by Other Donors

IV. EVALUATION BY PROJECT COMPONENT

4.1 Rural Development Component
4.2 Fisheries Component
4.3 Food Procurement, Importing and Distribution Component
4.4 Human Resource Development (HRD) Planning Component

V. EVALUATION OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT

5.1 The Role of OAR/M in Project Management
5.2 Role and Responsibilities of the Project Office and Project Manager
5.3 The Role of AID/W in Project Management
5.4 The Role of GIRM Ministries and Directorates
5.5 Role of U.S. Implementing Agencies
5.6 Performance Evaluation of Project Office and Project Manager
5.7 Personnel Management
5.8 Financial Management and Budget Issues
5.9 Participant Management
5.10 Coordination with GIRM institutions
5.11 Coordination with the Private Sector
5.12 Coordination with OAR/M and AID/W
5.13 Assessment and Recommendations about Seminars

VI. ACTIVITIES REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE PROJECT

6.1 Project Management and Administration 1989-90
6.2 Organization of a Seminar on Privatization
6.3 Reprogramming of Remaining Project Funds

VII. CONCLUSIONS REGARDING FOLLOW ON ACTIVITIES AND PRIORITIES

7.1 The Continuing Importance of Training in Mauritania

7.2 A Role for USAID

7.2.1 Rural Development
7.2.2 Support to Artisanal Fisheries
7.2.3 Training for the Customs Department
7.2.4 Reintegration of Current HRD Participant Trainees into Mauritania
7.2.5 Pre-Departure Language Training and Cultural Orientation for Future Participants
7.2.6 Strengthening Third Country Training
7.2.7 Support to CNROP
7.2.8 The Future Mix of Long Term University Level Participant, In-Country and Third Country Training
7.2.9 Linking CGEM Medium and Large Enterprises to Small and Micro-Enterprises

7.3 Recommended Studies and Analyses

APPENDICES

1. Summary of Participant Training Data
2. List of Persons Interviewed
3. List of Acronyms
4. Bibliography

I. INTRODUCTION

The Project Grant Agreement between the U.S. Agency for International Development (AID) and the Islamic Republic of Mauritania (GIRM) was signed on August 22, 1984 in the amount of $6.0 million, with a GIRM contribution of $1.1 million (the life of Project funding was subsequently increased to $6,591,000 in FY 1987). The overall goal of the project is to contribute to Mauritania's ability to achieve food security. This is consistent with both AID's country strategy and the priorities of the GIRM.

The project's stated purpose is to "improve the technical and administrative capacity of Mauritania's public and private sector institutions and personnel to meet the country's food security needs through a program of participant training of varied types, formal and informal, and to provide improvements in human resource planning." The project elements are: (1) rural development, (2) fisheries, (3) food procurement, importing and distribution, and (4) human resource development (HRD) planning. Anticipated project outputs include U.S. participant training, third country training, local training and improvements in human resource planning. Twenty percent of the training was to be provided to individuals in the private sector.

The Evaluation Team has determined that the project goal and purpose remain valid and respond directly to critical development needs. Specific project objectives also remain valid and should not be altered in any substantial way.

The project has been an enormous success in most areas. All participants who were to go to the U.S. are now in U.S. institutions; innovative approaches to the use of Third Country Training (TCT) have been developed which resulted in placements in Senegal, Tunisia, Mali and Morocco; successful seminars have been held in Nouakchott and local training courses have been arranged; a unique workshop for all AID-financed Mauritanian Participants was held in California; and the project has been well managed by a capable and culturally sensitive American Project Director fluent in French and Wolof. Project funds have also been competently managed and clear records maintained.

It is worth noting that, in a meeting with the Evaluation Team, the Secretary General of the General Confederation of Mauritanian Employers (CGEM) termed the project "the most important project in Mauritania in terms of its long term benefits," adding that he found the project's implementation to be "remarkable" in that "it (a) touches everyone in the country, in and out of government; (b) includes the private sector in more than a token way; and (c) is a practical and carefully drawn package of technical training aimed at the nation's critical weaknesses in human resources." A testimonial of this quality is a tribute to AID's success at designing a project which so well targets Mauritania's needs and to the project management staff which has worked diligently under often difficult conditions to implement the project's objectives.

The enthusiasm of the private sector for this project may in part be due to the fact that the project was designed to spend 20% of its funds on the sector whereas 28.5% was actually spent to support 77 private sector Participants, representing 67.5% of total long term Participants. The cost effectiveness of this component and its targeted nature has maximized its impact.

Two areas where improvement is needed during the next two years have been identified. First, the project should make a determined effort to spend some of the remaining funds on training for women. Of the 37 long term trainees in the U.S., none are women and of the 77 in Third Country Training (TCT) 5 are women. While there are valid cultural, historical and technical reasons for these statistics, AID nonetheless has an obligation in this area which the project has been unable to fulfill.

Secondly, the weaknesses in the Directorate of Plan in the Mauritanian government (GIRM) have resulted in less contact between the project and GIRM officials than would be desired. With the appointment of a new Director on February 2, 1989 the project may be able to identify ways to assist the Directorate in strengthening its HRD planning and improving its links with the Project Office. These issues are considered further below

II. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

(1) A brief needs assessment should be conducted at ENFVA in areas such as appropriateness of the curriculum, availability of relevant curriculum materials, adequacy of equipment, methods of recruitment of extension trainees, etc.

(2) Current methods of providing extension information to farmers in southern Mauritania should be reviewed to seek innovative approaches to support farmers efforts to increase production.

(3) The Mauritanian Participant Training Workshop of August, 1988 recommended that a newsletter be developed for Mauritanians studying in the U.S. under the HRD and other projects. OAR/M should fund the newsletter.

(4) The HRD Project should plan a second workshop in the U.S. for Mauritanian Participants for around June, 1990 with the themes of (1) strategies for Mauritanian development and (2) how each participant can best contribute to achieving the objectives of those strategies.

(5) OAR/M should recommend to the Office of International Training that all U.S. Participants currently handled by USDA/OICD be transferred to PIET for the duration of their stay in the U.S.

(6) OAR/M should consider offering summer scholarship awards for Mauritanian Participants in the U.S. with good research proposals in relevant areas to be conducted in Mauritania.

(7) Pre-departure English language training and cultural orientation should be provided for long term Participants going to the United States.

(8) It is recommended that the OAR/M support the development of an alumni association in Mauritania for graduates of American universities.

(9) Future projects should seek to build on the success of the HRD project in identifying placement possibilities in Jordan and Egypt by placing Participants in Arabic language technical programs in these countries where they also were required to obtain a reading knowledge of English.

(10) OAR/M should consider supplementary project funding during 1989-90 to provide for additional intakes of students into the technical fisheries training program in Tunisia.

(11) OAR/M should fund the proposal of the Institute of Marine Studies at the University of Washington (December, 1988) to support CNROP by providing participant training for five staff in bio-economics, resource exploitation and technology, the socio-economics of fishing, and statistics.

(12) Future training should focus more on in-country and third country training and more on middle level technical and management personnel rather than on long term U.S. Participant candidates for university degrees. Some long term university level training in the U.S. should be continued, however, even if the share of funds devoted to this element is reduced.

(13) Any new intake of long term Participants for the U.S. should reserve a fixed number of slots for women and the GIRM should be informed that funds for these slots will be lost unless the positions are filled by women.

(14) OAR/M should review with other donors and the GIRM the advisability of establishing a joint donor-GIRM National Training Council to promote coordination.

(15) The project should consider holding a seminar on privatization or, if already planned with regional funds, should consider a seminar on Exploitation of Marine Resources.

(16) Future seminars should seek to use more African trainers and seek cost free public buildings in which to hold them in order to reduce costs.

(17) Any follow on project should explore ways to link the medium and large scale enterprises which are members of CGEM to micro-enterprises to stimulate employment and the informal

sector.

(18) By 1992 most HRD Project Participants will have been back in Mauritania for two years. At that time, OAR/M should fund a small tracer study to measure long term impact of the project and to facilitate the design of future HRD projects.

(19) The forty documents generated from the AID-financed RAMS study are nearly ten years old. Selected studies should be updated to strengthen the data base regarding Mauritania's precise skill training needs and to identify specific areas for possible OAR/M intervention during the 1990-1995 period.

(20) OAR/M should review the documentation of the World Bank Third Education Project and recent studies by other donors relating to HRD. OAR/M could then consider funding a few manpower needs assessments in critical areas where data remains inadequate.

(21) Future evaluations of OAR/M projects should include involvement of Mauritanians. Having a representative from CGEM and the Directorate of Plan, for example, would have fed more of the evaluation's findings back into the Mauritanian milieu.

III. MANPOWER CONDITIONS AND THEIR TRAINING IMPLICATIONS

3.1 Manpower and Employment in Mauritania

3.1.1 Population and the Labor Force

The 1977 census shows that Mauritania then had about 1.34 million inhabitants. Though small in size, the population is quite dynamic with a growth rate estimated to be between 2.5 and 2.7% per year. Using the age cohort from 12-64, a manpower pool of 795,211 or 58% of the population can be estimated. If those between the ages of 6-11 years (240,376 or 17%) and persons 65 and over (51,154 or 4%) are included, an absolute upper estimate of the manpower pool would be 1.09 million or 80%.

If the "inactive" part of the population (e.g. handicapped, students) is deducted, the estimate of the economically active population in 1977 is 451,616 persons or 33% of the total population or 56% of the active labor force aged 12-64. Of this number, according to the RAMS Report (FS-21), about ten percent were unemployed. The definition of "unemployment" in the Mauritanian context is, however, hardly meaningful outside the modern sector.

3.1.2 Evolution in the Occupational Structure in Light of the Rural Exodus, Sedentarization and Drought

The above figures provide only the most general sense of the scale of the economically active population since capricious weather conditions, meagre and fluctuating yield for farmers and

herders and low farm productivity imply that extensive underemployment in rural areas is the norm. The precarious conditions for human survival in large parts of the country often force rural dwellers to abandon their villages or nomadic lifestyle altogether in favor of the minimal security afforded by the squatter areas around Nouakchott and in proximity to other population centers.

Deteriorating environmental conditions have stimulated the process of sedentarization. In 1977 the sedentary population was 67% of the total compared to just 33% in 1965. The major factor accelerating this process has been the periodic and sustained severe droughts occurring since at least the 1960s. By 1985 the nomadic population had been reduced to just 20% while the urban population tripled from ten to thirty percent.

In addition to drought, a major cause of the rural exodus is the rural under-employment connected with low farming yields. Traditional cultivating techniques do not allow higher yields than 400 kg of millet or sorgum (on average) per hectare. Taking into account that an average farming household cultivates 2 to 4 ha of rainfed land, the evident problem of subsistence farming is that production has fallen below the level of minimal subsistence thereby feeding the strong current of rural migrants streaming into the towns and abroad.

There is a temptation to compare the low yields of rain-fed agriculture with the much higher yields of irrigated paddy fields (average 4 MT/ha) which are also subsidized by high producer prices. However, the impressive yield and marketing results from the irrigated Senegal valley cannot alone solve the essential problems of rural exodus with accompanying unemployment and food insecurity. There are limits beyond which the irrigated surface in the valley cannot be extended. Nevertheless, these perimeters are an important partial solution to maintaining the food supply.

While irrigated cultivation can be considered as one of the priorities in agriculture, the program for economic restructuring (PREF) correctly identifies the whole agriculture sector as the overriding priority for future growth and food security. The fact remains that the price incentive for substantial private investment in irrigated plantations (since 1985), followed by significant increases in production have not reflected broadly based increases in productivity within the agricultural sector as a whole. The speculative investment in irrigated perimeters touches only a very narrow segment of the farming population and a small percentage of cultivable land.

Therefore, the urgent and long term priority goal remains to develop the bulk of the population engaged in agricultural production within the framework of a global assistance package to support dry land farming.

Productive employment and technological advances in rainfed agriculture would be a strategic step forward in three ways: (1)

toward food security, (2) toward limiting the rural exodus, and (3) toward controlling urban unemployment.

Population and migration projections are so alarming that great attention must be paid to the consequences of a failure to at least alleviate issues (2) and (3) above. Consider the implications of the projections of the Statistical Service for Mauritania's population:

Population Projection (in thousands)

TYPE	1965	1977	1987	1997	2002
Urban	100	308	625	1.134	1.493
Nouakchott	17	135	285	487	618
Other Towns	83	173	323	592	791
New Towns			17	55	84
Sedentary Rural	409	615	779	911	972
Nomad	588	496	425	375	350
TOTAL	1.097	1.419	1.829	2.420	2.815

* Recensement Général de la Population 1977, Mars 1983

Due to rural exodus and population growth, between 1965 and 2002, urban population was expected to increase 15 times and in Nouakchott 36 times. Thus urban population, which represented in 1965 less than 1/5 of the total population, was expected to outgrow the rural population by the mid-1990s. In fact, most estimates indicate that urban population is already half of the total with Nouakchott now around 400,000 inhabitants compared to the 1977 projection of 285,000 for 1987. Such a rate of growth, especially for Nouakchott is unsustainable. The unemployment problem will quickly grow out of control, resulting in enormous social tension and human suffering.

This is probably the strongest argument supporting the PREF's identification of nationwide agriculture as a priority. In sum, the occupational structure is changing rapidly as large numbers of formerly agrarian and nomadic people move into cities to become marginally productive, to add to the dependent population or worse. The focus on agriculture (including fisheries) is, therefore, an essential component of any strategy to help stabilize rural populations or at least slow their decline. At the same time, opportunities within the emerging occupational structure should be identified and supported since these are long term and probably irreversible trends. The discussion of further

assistance in agricultural extension (7.2.1 below) should be viewed in light of the population projections given above from the agricultural perspective while the recommendations regarding urban micro-enterprises (7.2.9) could be viewed in light of the reality of long term trends mentioned above.

3.1.3 Implications for Training for Productive Employment

At the end of the '70s, Mauritania's literate population numbered 191,000, or 17 % of the population 6 years and over. Of these: 111,000 read/wrote Arabic only; 55,000 read/wrote Arabic and French, 24,000 French only and 1,000 other languages. The country's modern sector labor force comprises a high share of persons who are either trained at the post-secondary level (12%), or who are illiterate (28%), while the proportion trained at the secondary level and holding positions as middle level cadres or as skilled workers is low.

Numerous studies have demonstrated the link between basic literacy and numeracy and agricultural production and productivity. An economic transformation cannot occur until a significant proportion of the country's labor force is literate. Basic literacy and human resource development at all levels is, therefore, an obvious need throughout the workforce.

With regard to the labor market, there is a dearth of statistics and little analysis of the few that exist. The World Bank notes that the highest priority in this area is to "determine an overall framework to carry out routine monitoring of human resource development and initiate a relevant data collection and analysis process." This shall be attempted within the Directorate of Plan which is the counterpart agency to the HRD project. Until this capability exists, the relationship of training to labor force requirements will continue to have to be determined on a piecemeal basis by sector needs assessments conducted by various donors seking to develop projects in one area or another. In the meantime, the general trends in the labor force and in population patterns combined with the literacy rates give those pondering training programs a broad mandate in a number of skill areas to proceed even in the absence of precise manpower needs information.

3.2 The Contribution of Training to Achieving Mauritania's Development Goals

According to a recent UNDP report, Mauritania had a total of 195,000 students in 1987 of which 150,000 were in primary schools. Of that number, 65% will fail to complete primary school and only 35,000 will enter secondary school. About 65% complete the first three years of secondary school (the "Premier Cycle") and about 1,500 receive the baccalauriat annually (approximately equivalent to a high school diploma). Three technical secondary schools have a total of 1,170 pupils with 50 graduates per year. and there are seven vocational schools for health, agricultural

extension etc. Overall, only 1.4% of students are enrolled in technical and vocational studies. Two primary school teacher training colleges have 2,000 students enrolled. The university (established in 1983) has 5,000 students but only 22% graduate with a degree. The great majority of university students are also in the social sciences.

In 1985 only 707 "cadres superieurs" were produced of whom 359 were teachers; and 639 mid-level cadres were graduated, two-thirds of whom were also teachers. Despite these low figures, the GIRM spends 33% of its annual budget for education and training. At the same time, a 1987 census reported 386 Mauritanians without work hold higher level certificates. This can be attributed to a lack of manpower planning which produces surpluses in a few fields and shortages in many, a hiring freeze in the civil service and resistance by graduates to work outside the capital.

Under these circumstances, it is not surprising that the World Bank found that 67% of the government's civil servants have not completed primary school and only 6% have a high school diploma. In light of this and the numerous weaknesses throughout the educational system, the World Bank has prepared a Third Education Project in 1988 titled the Education Sector Restructuring (ESR) Project. The project will expand access to and improve primary education, improve secondary and higher education (especially in the technical and scientific areas) and strengthen the planning and management capabilities of key ministries responsible for education and training. In addition, IDA and the FAC (France) have provided a credit for a new training program for public sector employees.

This brief profile of education, training and manpower conditions in Mauritania establishes a framework for action for OAR/M and defines the magnitude of the effort required to address the country's human resource needs. Under these circumstances, the contribution to be made to Mauritanian development by an appropriate and well targeted training program cannot be overemphasized.

3.3 Efforts to Develop and Implement Training Strategies and Plans in Mauritania

3.3.1 Government Policy, Capabilities and Institutions

The Ministry of Education (MEN) employs more than a third of Mauritania's civil servants and manages 22% of the recurrent budget yet its capacity to manage these resources is extremely weak. Personnel management lacks proper records and control systems, the planning unit is understaffed and has only the most meagre ability to develop and implement training plans, there is little supervision or inspection of schools, etc. The World Bank project intends to assist several Directorates in the MEN and, in particular, strengthen overall planning and management capabilities. Details are provided in ESR Project documentation.

The World Bank project also will assist the Ministry of Economy and Finance by strengthening the Human Resources Unit in the Directorate of Plan and will support the Human Resources Directorate in the Ministry of Fisheries. The UNDP will establish a Manpower Planning Unit in the Ministry of Labor. Together, these initiatives should form an institutional framework to assist in the definition of training needs, preparation of training strategies and plans, management of training programs and evaluation of training results.

At the same time, the GIRM has liberalized the education sector by licensing private training schools and encouraging closer links between training providers and employers. Privately run training is now available in Nouakchott for computer operators, accountants and secretaries.

3.3.2 The Mauritania Human Resources Development (HRD) Project in the Context of National Objectives and Capabilities

The HRD Project goal and purpose, as noted elsewhere, conform to the highest priorities of the GIRM and the private sector emphasis has been welcomed by the GIRM and the private sector. The project's objectives were identified in a needs assessment undertaken by OAR/M in 1983-84 and the planned outputs are consistent with government objectives. Future assistance may require further needs assessment depending upon the areas in question since only a few sectors now have reliable data.

3.3.3 Relationship of the HRD Project to Training Provided by Other Donors

The current HRD project seems well coordinated with the ongoing training activities of other donors. In the future, however, OAR/M will need to be aware of all elements of the ESR Project in order to reinforce World Bank and GIRM training and institution building objectives while still addressing private sector and technical training needs in areas of AID priority. A number of the recommendations discussed in part VI below are made in light of World Bank plans in order to avoid duplication.

Training for rural development also needs to be coordinated with the UNDP and FAO programs since agricultural development represents 51% and rural rehabilitation 27% of the UNDP Country Program budget for 1987-91. UNDP has also budgeted a small amount for seminars and short term training ($142,000 for 1989-91) which is likely to be in rural development.

As the planning capacity of the Directorate for Plan develops, perhaps responsibility for assuring a coordinated training program among all donors will be theirs. In the meantime, OAR/M needs to encourage greater donor coordination in the training area. One approach may be to review the possibility of encouraging the GIRM to establish a National Training Council (NTC). The NTC would be composed of representatives from the key ministries

and Directorates involved in education and training, the principal donors financing training projects and the CGEM representing the private sector. Although non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are not well-developed in Mauritania, a representative from one of the local NGOs might also be included to encourage training activities through such entities.

IV. EVALUATION BY PROJECT COMPONENT

4.1 Rural Development Component

4.1.1 Rationale for Intervention

Mauritania's agricultural production and productivity levels are among the lowest on earth yet there is significant potential in the few areas with significant rainfall and in the irrigated perimeters along the Senegal River valley. Mauritania has an extension training institution (ENFVA) and an agricultural research institution (CNRADA) in Kaedi and a rudimentary system of extension agents in parts of the country.

The ENFVA was established at Kaedi in 1967 to train middle and lower level agricultural extension agents. Graduates are assigned to the appropriate Division of the Ministry of Rural Development for which they are trained (crop production, crop protection, animal husbandry and livestock health, rural engineering, or environmental protection). In addition, some of the graduates may be assigned to SONADER (a parastatal) and CNRADA depending upon need and availability. The curriculum is divided into five sections: Plant Protection, Rural Engineering, Animal Husbandry, Agricultural Extension and Cooperation. The curriculum is in need of upgrading to meet the needs of the students more adequately. Most teachers lack specialized training in agriculture and have backgrounds in general agriculture plus varying amounts of short-term training in specific subjects.

A skilled agricultural technical training cadre is needed at ENFVA, especially since expatriate instructors have recently been been replaced by Mauritanians who are not well qualified. This is the basic rationale for intervention in this area.

4.1.2 HRD Project Goals and Objectives

Long term training was planned for seven agricultural instructors plus other long and short term training in animal husbandry, environmental protection, irrigation engineering and rural roads construction. Seminars on agricultural development strategy and planning, agricultural production techniques and policies, and refresher courses for extension agents were to receive funding assistance.

4.1.3 Outputs to Date

To date seven instructors were sent to the United States to

pursue B.S. and Masters degrees. Of the seven, two were repatriated for reasons of inability to master English and problems of cultural adaptation. One replacement was sent home bringing the current number to six. The six specialized in the following areas: irrigation, agricultural engineering (farm machinery), animal science, range management, forestry, and agronomy.

Contact with the U.S. Participants has already demonstrated a keen interest in up-grading and modifying the curriculum in Kaedi, particularly in the area of math, physics, and chemistry.

Other long and short term training was provided in animal husbandry, environmental protection, irrigation engineering, and rural road construction. Approximately 50% of the participants were drawn from the Ministry of Rural Development.

A short course in rural mechanics was arranged through the CFPP and subsequently cancelled due to poor in-house administration and lack of equipment.

Twelve participants are being trained in a third country in the following fields: agricultural engineering, horticulture, forestry, natural resources, agronomy and topography.

4.1.4 Problems Encountered

The in-country seminars on agricultural topics were not funded due to a lack of capability and responsiveness from ENFVA when the Project proposed to assist in organizing them. There were also financial constraints within the Project.

4.2 Fisheries Component

4.2.1 Rationale for Intervention

Fisheries production, predominantly a private-sector activity, replaced iron ore as the greatest contributor to foreign exchange earnings in 1983. It continues to be the major revenue-earning industry in Mauritania, despite recent indications that catches may be declining due to poor resource management. It is estimated that over 70% of the sector's revenues flow out of the economy in the form of wages to foreign crews, payment to foreign suppliers, profits of foreign companies and servicing of foreign bank loans.

There are currently 150 fishing vessels operating under the Mauritanian flag. Over ninty percent of the crews are South Korean nationals. In 1986, the GIRM, anxious to strengthen national control over its fishing industry, organized a preliminary study to assess training needs and training facilities in Nouadhibou. Findings from this study revealed a critical need for fisheries training at all levels, technical as well as professional. In addition, training facilities in Nouadhibou were found to be under-equipped and overcrowded, and offered only low-level skills training. A year later, in 1987, the GIRM commis-

sioned another, more detailed study to determine specific training needs. RDA International Inc. produced a detailed strategy for human resource development, including specific training requirements at all levels of the fishing industry. As a direct outcome of this study, the Mauritanian Foreign Minister met personally with the U.S. Ambassador and the acting OAR/M Representative to request funding to train 700 seamen (including captains) at a Third Country site (either Morocco or Tunisia).

The sector is also acknowledged by other donors to be of central importance. The new World Bank Third Education Project includes plans to construct and provision a national fisheries training institute in Nouadhibou. In addition to the World Bank, a variety of donors are involved on a smaller scale, providing either technical assistance and/or financial and material support.

Given the current deficit of trained and licensed personnel, fisheries training efforts will require long-term support on the part of the GIRM and donor agencies. Therefore, over a million dollars has already been allocated for broad-range training in fisheries at U.S. and Third Country sites under the HRD project. According to the project manager, no other donor agency has, to date, made similar efforts in this area.

Of all areas of private sector industrial activity, therefore, fisheries has been given the highest priority by the GIRM and the OAR/M since it offers the greatest return on capital and human investment in the form of food security, income and employment and provides a strong rationale for training intervention.

4.2.2 HRD Project Goals and Objectives

Simply stated, the HRD Project goals for fisheries include:

(1) providing a low-cost food alternative for Mauritanians,

(2) generating substantial foreign exchange in order to meet the cost of imported food requirements, and

(3) creating employment opportunities for Mauritanians within the fishing industry.

The project's main objective is to provide technical and professional training in all areas of the fishing industry. It is anticipated that within three years Mauritanians will begin replacing foreigners on most fishing vessels operating within Mauritanian waters.

The project training strategy, as outlined in the Project Paper, targets training activities for the following areas:

1. Management level in business administration, economics, statistics and law as these relate to fisheries;

2. Management and marketing training in artisanal and industrial

fisheries;

3. Fisheries resource management;

4. Port engineering and Port administration; and

5. In-country training in marine mechanics and fisheries refrigeration.

A key role is played in the recruitment and selection of candidates for private sector training by the CGEM. Based on specific training needs and applicants' qualifications, selected candidates are sent to training sites in neighboring countries, or if possible, to in-country training institutions.

Third Country Training

After completing an on-site inspection at the Merchant Marine School (Ecole de la Marine Marchande) located in Sousse, Tunisia, the Project Manager negotiated an agreement with the Tunisian Technical Cooperation Agency (Agence Tunisnenne de Cooperation Technique). This official government placement agency assumes responsibility for the registration, reception, monitoring, and financial and administrative management of Mauritanian participants sent to Tunisia for training. This collaboration has proved both cost-effective (only $1500 tuition per student per year) and highly satisfactory in terms of quality of training and practical experience aboard fishing vessels made available through the school.

Last year, in 1988, the criteria for candidate selection was modified to allow for the Ministry of Fisheries and the Ministry of Education to submit student dossiers for consideration for technical training. Of the three hundred dossiers of recent baccalauriat students submitted, only 35 were selected. The final selection was made by a Tunisian fish training expert from the training institute in Sousse.

A committee composed of representatives from the Ministry of Fisheries, the private sector, the Directorate of Plan and the HRD Project made the final selection of ship captains in 1987 for training at l'Ecole de la Marine Marchande (Merchant Marine School) in Sousse, Tunisia. Fifteen candidates all with varying degrees of marine experience were selected for the program.

U.S. Training

Due to the critical need for high-level skills which require a more intense academic training, the Project arranged for long-term U.S.-based training in the following areas:

a) Artisanal Fisheries Management
b) Fisheries Investment Planning/Development
c) Fisheries Resource Management
d) Fisheries Statistics

e) Port Engineering.

Seven Mauritanians are currently enrolled in these areas at U.S. institutions.

4.3.3 Outputs to Date

While the key output of trained personnel in the fisheries sector remains to be achieved since the students are now in training, the project has achieved substantial success in tackling a critical HRD need in a creative way through TCT. The links forged between Mauritania and the training institutions of North Africa represent long term gains for Mauritania's range of training options. It is commendable that a U.S. funded project can promote contacts between African and Arab countries that are mutually beneficial.

4.3.4 Problems Encountered and Changes in the Original Design

Ideally, Nouadhibou, the hub of all industrial fishing activities in Mauritania would be the most likely choice for a fisheries training site. The Centre Mamadou Toure, the principal skills-training center in Nouadhibou, has a limited training capacity, and was not appropriate for the type of trainees designated in the Project Paper. In addition, the skills training levels at the Center are far below those required by the training strategy. After inspecting the site, the Project Manager determined that the Center was inadequate with respect to the quality of instruction, on-site equipment, level of instruction and student capacity. Funds were therefore devoted to meeting urgent manpower needs through training programs in Tunisia. As mentioned, the World Bank is funding a comprehensive maritime training facility to be located in the SNIM facility (the former training institute for mines) in Nouadhibou.

Major changes in the Project training strategy include the decisions to:

1) use only Third Country and U.S. training sites for fisheries training;

2) cancel training for one participant in Maritime Law (it was deemed unnecessary at this point in the project); and

3) cancel short-term Third Country training and workshop participation in the following areas:

   a) Fisheries Investment Planning Development
   b) Fisheries Resource Management
   c) Industrial Fisheries Marketing
   d) Fisheries Economics
   e) Port Administration
   f) Fisheries Law.

The reason given for cancelling this training was the need to respond quickly and appropriately to employment demands in fisheries (item 1 above), and eliminate unnecessary training in light of the updated needs assessment carried out in 1986 by the HRD Division.

The Evaluation Team concludes that these modifications in the project design were prudent and that project resources were appropriately reprogrammed to other priority areas.

4.3 Food Procurement, Importing and Distribution Component

The project goal of enhanced food security is directly linked to the capability of local governmental and private sector personnel to receive, process and distribute food aid, commercial food imports, food-for-work, etc. This project component includes third country business planning and management training for senior officials of parastatals and private enterprises plus in-country training for secretaries, bookkeepers and other clerical personnel. Vehicle mechanic training was also planned. Improvements in this sector will support the objectives of the other project components by creating a more efficient environment in which to market and distribute produce from the agricultural and fisheries sector.

Thus far the project has placed 27 long term Participants in Tunisia and Senegal for business planning and management training at the MBA level and below.

A seminar was held from April 27-30, 1987 to examine the factors which promote or inhibit the growth of the private sector in Mauritania. The seminar was organized and managed by the Confederation of Mauritanian Employers in cooperation with the Ministry of Economy and Finance and with the support of the University of Pittsburgh.

In examining how to promote private enterprise, conferees concluded that the four most promising sectors are fisheries, industry, agriculture and services. They also agreed that there are many things private companies can do to grow faster, reduce risk and increase competitiveness. For example, the seminar report stressed private financing of fish and produce marketing, self-financed management training and investment in repair and maintenance of equipment and infrastructure.

The seminar received wide coverage in the local press and was considered a success by all parties. Two problems identified by the Evaluation Team with respect to the seminar are: (1) the fact that only one woman attended, and (2) the problem of seminar follow-up. For future seminars, it is recommended that OAR/M make very explicit its strong desire to see greater participation by women and consider holding a follow-up half-day meeting about six to eight weeks after the seminar with the same conferees on the theme of seminar impact and effect and how the experience of the seminar has been and can be applied in the work environment of

the attendees. For more detail, see Part V below.

4.4 Human Resource Development (HRD) Planning Component

4.4.1 Rationale for HRD Intervention

The HRD planning component of the project is an element that cuts across other project elements and provides a link to the Directorates of Higher Education, Technical Education, Civil Service and Labor through its working relationship with the Directorate of Plan.

HRD planning was stressed in the project because of the lack of planning for staff development within the various ministries. There was a lack of available information on training needs, priorities and manpower planning activities. There was no systematic method used in the recruitment, selection, training and reentry of trainees. Trainee selection was not based on a needs assessment, since there are few basic studies available, but on estimates of needs at best and in some cases on guesses and personal relationships. As a result, more individuals were trained in some fields than were needed (e.g. mining engineers) while there existed a lack of trained people in other fields. The criteria for selection, therefore, too often had little to do with actual manpower needs.

Many administrative units in the GIRM have responsibility for aspects of human resource planning; none have the trained staff and other resources needed to fulfill their role efficiently. Administrative units involved with HRD planning include: Higher Education; the Civil Service; National Education; Plan and Regional Development; and Health, Labor and Social Affairs. Too many agencies shared the responsibility for human resource development and utilization, while few of them shared the information they had with others.

Given the above state of affairs, the Project Paper correctly included this element as fundamental to the long term optimal use of the planned outputs of other project components.

The Directorate of Planning within the Ministry of Economy and Finance is the focal point for coordinating project implementation. The Director of Plan is the counterpart to the project manager. The Directorate contains a Division of Human Resource Planning and the Project Paper indicated that the project team would function as part of Division. However, the Project Manager has worked out of a separate Project Office and directly with the Director of Plan. In light of the constraints within the Directorate of Plan, an independent Project Office proved essential to successful project implementation.

4.4.2 HRD Project Goals and Objectives

HRD planning affects all aspects of the project. The objectives of the HRD element are to provide training to help the GIRM

forecast its human resources needs better and to plan how it could meet those needs through skills upgrading. The Project Paper called for long term training for 9 planners, statisticians, and analysts (Directorates of Plan, Higher Education, Technical Education, Civil Service and Labor).

In addition, the Project Paper provided for a series of in-country seminars to be conducted by a U.S. organization experienced in HRD and manpower planning techniques. The participants were to be senior officials of the government who were concerned with various aspects of HRD planning.

A longer term objective was to strengthen the central coordination of HRD planning and implementation. Functional ministries were expected to gain a better appreciation of the benefits of an effective central planning Directorate through the experience of HRD Project implementation, in which professionally recognized criteria and procedures in HRD planning and development were applied.

4.4.3 Outputs to Date

Long Term Training

The project has placed nine planners, statisticians and analysts recruited from the Directorates mentioned above in long term training programs in U.S. universities.

The recruitment and selection process during the first year of the project was not well organized. However, after a change in Directors, the flow of dossiers was better organized and more rational criteria were used in selecting the dossiers to be reviewed for project funding. A system was established in which the nominees from the different ministries went to the Director of Plan for pre-selection before they were forwarded to the HRD project for final consideration. After pre-selection, they were then reviewed by the project manager and staff. A final decision was made by a selection committee composed of the Director of Plan, the Project Manager, the Project Training Assistant and the OAR/M Training Officer.

The selection criteria included the following:

1. pursuing training in a food related science or field which would be beneficial in contributing to Mauritania's ability plan for achieving food security;
2. quality of academic record and file;
3. quality of references;
4. experience on the job (minimum 3 years);
5. officially nominated and screened by the Director of Plan or, in the case of the Private Sector, through the CGEM.

After the selection of the Participants, very little orientation was provided for preparation for long-term training in the USA. There is no longer a USIS Cultural Center in Mauritania and

the project was not organized to provide pre-departure orientation. Although orientation was provided by the receiving academic institutions, Participants would have benefitted from a pre-departure program which might have been developed through a local sub-contract with resident Americans or the Peace Corps. This is an output which was not realized.

Seminars and the Mauritania Participant
Workshop in Pomona, CA

A review and analysis of the results of all in-country seminars appears in Part V below. This discussion is confined to the conference held in the United States for all Mauritanian Participants. California State Polytechnic University conducted the conference from August 13-20, 1988. The meeting served as a vehicle to review the training underway and make recommendations for adjustments to their training programs. Key GIRM officials, the Assistant Director of Plan (now Director), Director of Civil Service and the Director of Higher Education attended this conference. Representatives from AID's Office of International Training (OIT), the African-American Institute, and Partners for International Education and Training (PIET) attended along with the OAR/M staff.

Many students expressed regret that their USDA/OICD program officers were not present at the conference since many issues affecting academic training and financial matters could have been resolved. Many hours were spent in formal and informal meetings talking about problems of program management and coordination, and the re-integration process for Participants' after returning to Mauritania. The conference is an important output of this component.

4.4.4 Problems Encountered or Anticipated

The project has been adversely affected by the weaknesses in the Directorate of Plan caused by its understaffed and under-qualified character. This led to the project being implemented from a separate project office which worked primarily with the Director. However, the less than ideal level of involvement of the Directorate in the coordination of the project should not be overstressed since weaknesses in the Directorate were well known to OAR/M prior to the beginning of the project. Indeed, the constraints in HRD planning and the Directorate were a major reason for including the HRD planning component of the project.

A potential problem which can be minimized with advanced planning is that of the re-entry of long term Participants into the Mauritanian job market. The project should begin working with the CGEM and the Directorate of Plan during 1989 to develop initiatives and plans which will facilitate re-entry into government and private sector positions which will make full use of their new skills. Such advance planning can significantly increase the long term impact of project outputs in terms of the optimal application of new skills in relevant positions. The

conference recommended for Washington, D.C. in 1990 (see part VII below) is one example of an initiative in this regard.

V. EVALUATION OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT

5.1 The Role of OAR/M in Project Management

All HRD Project activities are monitored and supervised by the OAR/M Assistant Representative, including issues concerning personnel, procurements, and vehicle repair. In addition, he is responsible for reviewing the Project Implementation Report (PIR) every six months, which is then passed to the OAR/M Representative for review and approval prior to sending it to AID/W.

The Assistant Representative also submits an annual evaluation of the Project to the OAR/M Representative. Weekly meetings are held between the Project Manager and Assistant Representative to review Project activities. All PIO/Ps must be approved by the AID/M Representative before implementation of training.

5.2 Role and Responsibilities of the Project Office and Project Manager

The Project Office is responsible for the following:

1) Assist with candidate recruitment, solicitation, nomination, and selection for both private and public sectors;
2) Review of dossiers (together with GIRM officials);
3) Verification of local documents;
4) Pre-departure interviews/orientation;
5) Travel arrangements;
6) Inspection and selection of training sites;
7) Coordination with the GIRM, the private sector, OAR/M, OICD, PIET, TCT institutions and sub-contractors;
8) Management of Participants, personnel and seminars;
9) Overall management, logistics project documentation; and
10) Securing office space for the Project and overseeing all project-specific procurements.

5.3 The Role of AID/W in Project Management

All new and continuing projects must be reviewed and monitored by the Office of Project Development, Sahel and West Africa Division (AFR PD/SWA). The Africa Office of Training and Research, Education and Human Resources Division, (AFR/TR/EHR) provides substantial backstopping for HRD projects. The division's responsibilities include identifying consultants and supporting the regional HRDA Project.

The Office of International Training (OIT) handles training worldwide, including programs in the U.S. It also functions as the intermediary between USAID and U.S.-based contractors (OICD and PIET) and processes data on HRD participants.

5.4 The Role of GIRM Ministries and Directorates

Coordination with GIRM ministries and directorates is critical to the overall success of the Project. Three ministries contain administrative units which are involved with some elements of human resource planning. They are:

1) Directorate of Plan (Ministry of Economy and Finance),
2) Directorate of Higher Education (Ministry of Higher Education), and
3) the Civil Service (Fonction Publique).

These three coordinating bodies must work closely with the Project Manager to assist in the nomination and selection of project candidates. The Director of Plan and the Director of Higher Education are responsible for establishing criteria for candidate selection and for developing screening procedures.

The Civil Service plays an especially critical role upon the return of public sector, long-term trainees since they are responsible for ensuring fair and expeditious reinsertion of Participants into appropriate civil service positions.

Technical ministries involved in any aspect of food security or human resource development are responsible for nominating qualified candidates in their areas.

5.5 Role of U.S. Implementing Agencies

The USAID/OICD and PIET are U.S.-based contracting agencies that manage AID's participant training programs. Their services include designing individual training programs that respond to specified training objectives and trainees' needs, academic background and professional experience; monitoring promptly and fully the progress of long-term academic students; keeping AID/W fully informed about issues and problems arising out of individual training programs; maintaining close contact with trainees and educational advisors; and making timely financial disbursements to trainees.

Given the vital role they play in the participants' ability to adjust and perform in a U.S.-based educational setting, it is of paramount importance that they deliver the services entrusted to them.

The performance of OICD (USDA) to date has been less than satisfactory. From the fall of 1986 to the fall of 1987, the Project Manager received no communication from OICD regarding the first group of Participants who had been sent the U.S. in 1985. No attempt was made to communicate grade reports or even placement. Virtually no monitoring was being done and budget accounting was unreliable and not timely. On the occasion of a visit to the U.S., the Project Manager discovered one Participant living alone near Atlanta in the basement of a dilapitated house who, after two years, still had not learned sufficient English to

begin his course-work. The Project Manager was obliged to initiate repatriation procedures. The failure of OICD to send a representative to the Pomona Conference was further evidence of the agency's negligence.

In contrast, PIET receives high marks for its performance in all areas of contracted services. They have done an excellent job of determining degree equivalencies, a difficult task in the best of circumstances, and in the case of Mauritania, herculean, considering that many of the Participants were trained at institutions with vastly differing standards and grading systems. For example, much of the documentation required for Participants' dossiers comes from institutions in the USSR, China and various Third World institutions. PIET has proven especially conscientious about monitoring students and up-dating student records and Project documentation.

5.6 Performance Evaluation of Project Office and Project Manager

5.6.1 Overall Management, Logistics and Documentation

Generally speaking, the Project Manager has implemented the Project effectively. Most Project documentation is up-to-date and easily accessible, with the exception of trainee tracking. Evaluators were informed that in the next few months documentation efforts will be measurably improved by a PTMS (Participant Training Management System) scheduled to be installed soon.

The Project office is clean and orderly, and relations among staff are friendly and courteous. Office equipment is functioning (with the exception of a printer that was subjected to the wrong voltage and was sent off for repairs).

The Project Paper called for a Technical Assistance team to manage the HRD Project. In an effort to reduce overhead expenses, the OAR/M opted for a Personal Services Contractor (PSC), thereby freeing up a considerable sum of money that could be used to fund additional training activities.

On arrival in Mauritania, the Project Manager was given additional duties as HRD Officer in charge of all training activities funded through OAR/M. As a consequence, he was obliged to maintain an office at OAR, in addition to the Project Office, located a block away. In the earlier phases of the Project, he claims to have devoted 90% of his time to Project demands.

In the modified project design, it was hoped that the Project Office would be located within the Directorate of Plan, thereby assuring close contact with the designated Mauritanian counterpart. However, due to the delicate nature of scholarship awards (too often prey to the favoritism) coupled with a lack of space and lax security in public buildings, the Project Manager decided to locate the Office in neutral territory.

The one complaint frequently voiced by the Project Manager concerns procurement procedures. All office expenses, including vehicle repairs and maintenance of office equipment must go through the Supply Management Office (SMO) at the OAR/M. This proved to be a tedious and lengthy process, and in many instances crippled the efficiency of the office and absorbed a significant amount of the Project Manager's time.

5.6.2 Participant Selection

The selection procedure, though well-conceived, leaves much to be desired in practice. Factors which complicate and impede the process include discordant relations among ministry officials, little if any HRD planning ability within the Ministries, incomplete dossiers (and, in some cases, fraudulent documents), problems with degree equivalencies, and inadequate translation services.

The process itself is sound. Technical ministries submit their nominations either to the Directorate of Higher Education, who then works in concert with the Director of Plan, or directly to the Director of Plan to determine eligibility based on well-defined criteria. At this point both directors meet with the Project Manager to make the final selections.

As is the case in many countries, scholarship awards sometimes fall prey to a patronage system. People with influence within the government put pressure on the selection committee to select family members or friends. Nothing can be done to totally eradicate these practices, as they are both culturally acceptable and difficult to expose. The Project Manager is aware of this problem and has struggled to convince GIRM officials of the importance of establishing tight, clearly-stated criteria to ensure a more equitable selection, thereby granting equal opportunity to all Mauritanians.

5.6.3 Inspection and Selection of Training Sites

Over the course of the last three years, the Project Manager travelled to Morocco, Tunisia, Senegal, Jordan and Egypt for the purpose of inspecting potential training sites for HRD Project participants. His ultimate choice of third country institutions was subject to the following criteria:

1) strong Arab and/or French language capability;
2) well-developed monitoring and design capabilities;
3) low cost per trainee.

Of all the sites visited, Tunisia ranked highest in terms of the quality of instruction and training facilities. A government agency (Agence Tunisienne de Cooperation Technique - ATCT) was prepared to handle all in-country responsibilities for the trainees.

Training sites in Morocco had equally high standards, but the country lacks a government-sponsored centralized placement and monitoring agency. The Project Manager would be obliged to depend entirely on USAID/Morocco support. In this case, the USAID Mission has been reluctant to take on a monitoring and supervisory role.

Senegal has first-rate training institutions and meets all the criteria mentioned above. Furthermore, the USAID/Senegal Mission has an excellent reputation for managing third country participants. According to the Project Manager, Jordan and Egypt also look very promising for future third country training, but to date, no training placements have been made.

5.7 Personnel Management

The Project Manager is responsible for hiring all Project staff including: Project Assistant, Project Secretary, Chauffeur and Janitors. The first Project Assistant was terminated in early 1988. A replacement was identified, hired and began work in April, 1988.

Staff development is a high priority at the project office. The current Assistant will be trained in PTMS (Participant Training Management System), a computer program that will greatly facilitate the tracking of individual participants and make readily accessible pertinent data concerning participants' course work, location, training fees, etc. The Project Manager delegates as much responsibility as the Assistant can handle, and entrusts him with running the office during the Project Manager's absence. The current Project secretary (hired in the fall of 1988) is granted leave-time in order to attend English classes at the OAR/M, which will eventually enable her to function bilingually in an office where much of the documentation is in English.

The Evaluation Team experienced some delay in obtaining access to detailed participant information (i.e. numbers, locations, costs). It is hoped that with the installation of the new PTMS this problem will be alleviated.

5.8 Financial Management and Budget Issues

Since the Project's budget is controlled and disbursed by the OAR/M, the Project Manager has budget planning responsibilities; but little financial disbursement oversight. All procurements related to the office are handled through the SMO within the Mission. In general terms the Project has operated within budget. All training funds have been committed (though not all training projections have been met).

Modifications in training projections (including seminars), necessary in part due to unrealistic cost estimates and the inadequacy of in-country training facilities, made it necessary to send trainees to more costly institutions in third countries.

5.9 Participant Management

The OAR/M negotiated an agreement signed in early 1986 with the CFPP (Centre de Formation et de Perfectionnement Professionnel), a World Bank-funded, non-formal educational training facility located in Nouakchott, to provide training for secretaries and bookeepers. A third training program in rural mechanics was cancelled due to unsatisfactory training conditions. After the first year, the CFPP program was reviewed and improvements in the training program were requested and instituted. In the third year, conditions again deteriorated. The agreement was then cancelled due to low training standards, poor management, unqualified instructors, and unpredictable closures.

An important, yet overlooked, aspect of Participant management concerns pre-departure orientation for U.S.-bound Participants. The Project Manager claims to have spent up to an hour and a half with individual Participants before their departure. This is clearly not sufficient time for a proper orientation, especially in light of the fact that the great majority of the Participants speak no English.

The Project Manager agreed that orientation was one of the weakest areas of the Project. Since the USIS closed its doors in 1986, there remains no U.S. institute to perform this valuable service. As a result Participants arrive in the U.S. unprepared for culture shock, academic expectations, and communication difficulties.

5.10 Coordination with GIRM institutions

Unfortunately for the Project, coordination with GIRM ministries posed a variety of problems, some of which could not be avoided. In the early phase of the project, the Director of Plan had so many other commitments that he could not lend as much support to the Project as had been expected. Though they met regularly, the Director was slow to develop a firm set of criteria for Participant selection. The Project Manager noted that the Director was unprepared to take initiatives or to encourage his staff to be involved in the Project. The Director also failed to designate someone from the technical level within the Directorate to work as a counterpart to the Project staff.

Subsequent Directors (there have been four during the life of the project) were more effictive, particularly the current Minister of Information. Under his leadership steps were taken to establish firm criteria for candidate selection and to improve management.

Fewer problems were encountered with the Directorate of Higher Education. The weakness here was due to the lack of coordination between the two Directorates. An agreement between the Civil Service and long term Project Participants sent to the U.S. guaranteed them their salaries while in student status. The

first intake of students claimed never to have received their salaries.

The major factor limiting collaboration between the Project and GIRM institutions is the lack of basic HRD planning and management capability. This affects all aspects of the Project's relations with government. The HRD Project is working to rectify this through the training being provided to Participants in HRD planning and management.

5.11 Coordination with the Private Sector

Coordination with the private sector has yielded positive results. Private enterprise is clearly the most dynamic part of the Mauritanian economy, and business associations as well as individual entrepreneurs have demonstrated a heightened interest in collaborating with the Project Manager on seminar planning, scholarship recruitment and human resource needs assessments.

CGEM, the powerful employers association, sub-contracted with the HRD Project to organize two of the three seminars held in Nouakchott (Private Enterprise and HRD Planning). Under the able direction of Mr. Mohammed Aly, the CGEM is constantly looking for ways to stimulate economic growth and thereby create badly needed jobs for unemployed or underemployed Mauritanians.

5.12 Coordination with OAR/M and AID/W

Given the dual nature of the Project Manager's role (maintaining offices at both the OAR and the Project and managing all Office training programs), coordination proved to be both easy and efficient with the exception of procurement (see section 5.8 on financial management).

AID/W occasionally made requests that the Project Manager could not meet, particualrly in the area of dossier elements not properly translated or, in some cases, not available. For the most part, from the Project Manager's point of view, good relations were and continue to be maintained.

On the other hand, two of the evaluators spent three days prior to departure for Mauritania gathering information from AID/W offices involved with the Project. Little was learned about actual Project implementation and there was the clear impression that the Project had a rather low priority. Written documentation, however, was made available and forerunners to the project were discussed at some length, (i.e. Sahel Human Resources Development and the HRDA Project).

5.13 Assessment and Recommendations about Seminars

The Project Paper called for 12 seminars to be conducted during the life of the Project with a budget estimate of $154,000 ($10,000 to $17,000 per seminar). These figures do not include the cost for the U.S. Evaluation Workshop at Pomona. Only three

seminars plus the Pomona Workshop were in fact implemented at a total cost of $158,000, a dramatic cost overrun that warrants scrutiny if future seminars are to be planned. In effect, the Project chose quality over quantity and decided to hold fewer, longer seminars rather than many short ones.

Needs assessment, design, documentation and facilitation for the seminars were sub-contracted through NASPAA (National Association of Schools of Public Affairs and Administration) to the University of Pittsburgh International Management Development Institute (for seminars I and III), and Washington State University (for seminar II).

The University of Pittsburgh has a strong reputation in international management training and conducts outstanding seminars in French and at considerable cost. Washington State University is little known in international training circles, and judging from its performance in Nouakchott, should not be used in future seminars (see the discussion on seminar II below for details).

The Project Manager and the Director of Plan took responsibility for planning and organizing Seminar I, which was held at the Hotel El Amady, several kilometers from Nouakchott. Because of his unfamiliarity with local facilities, and the excessive amount of time required to attend to small details, he decided to sub-contract these tasks to CGEM for Seminars II and III. As a result, the last two seminars were held at CGEM headquarters.

The main objective was to provide a forum whereby mid to upper-level officials from government, parastatal and private institutions (including leaders in private enterprise) could identify problems in project management and HRD which negatively affect food stability and explore ways to overcome them.

A second objective was to expose Mauritanian professionals to American approaches to resolving management problems through group participation, feedback techniques and general problem solving excercises. Group dynamics and team building were introduced wherever appropriate through small and large group presentations. Group behaviour standards were established to encourage the free flow of ideas, critiques of established practices, respect for dissent and risk-taking without fear of repraisals. An effort was made throughout all three seminars to ensure cross-sectoral groupings to enhance the exchange of ideas.

The seminars were designed to emphasize practical rather than theoretical management approaches (i.e. break away from the theoretical French approach which to which most Mauritanians have been exposed). Furthermore, participants were encouraged to refer to real management issues, projects and case studies drawn from their personal work experience.

SEMINAR I: Project Management

Sixty participants from mid and upper level management within ministries most directly involved with food production and/or HRD planning attended the first seminar, which lasted ten days. Seminar content included project design, analysis, implementation, monitoring, follow-up and evaluation. Further subtopics included: financial analysis, HRD Planning, identification of constraints, and organization analysis. Of the 60 participants, 45 received certificates, awarded on the basis of regular attendance and participation.

The lead trainer completed a needs assessment proir to the seminar to ensure relevancy of content to the Mauritanian setting. He, along with the late David Gould from the University of Pittsburgh provided outstanding services based on their many years of experience in management training in the U.S. as well as Africa. Documentation and training were of the highest calibre and this seminar set high standards for seminars to follow. Participants reacted favorably to the participatory techniques introduced and overall satisfaction was acknowledged throughout the training.

SEMINAR II: Private Enterprise

Thirty participants representing mid to upper-level management from both the public and private sectors attended this four day seminar held at CGEM headquarters. Trainers were recruited through NASPAA and included a marketing specialist from Washington State University, a local trainer from Nouakchott, and a third U.S.-based French expert in business management. The participants represented a cross-section of managers and business leaders recruited from CGEM, and GIRM ministries directly involved with supporting and stimulating private sector development.

The seminar objectives were to set priorities for private sector development and training, to improve management capability in private and parastatal sectors and to develop an action plan for follow-up activities. An informal though equally critical objective was to forge public and private sector partnerships for the promotion of private sector development.

Seminar themes or topics were drawn from a 1986 OAR/M-financed study titled "Investment Climate Assessment and Private Sector Survey".

The seminar achieved most of its objectives, particularly in the area of identifying constraints and opportunities for small and large businesses. It made great strides in opening a dialogue between public and private sectors, which had previously been suspicious of one another regarding regulation and privatization.

There were weaknesses in the training team. One of the three lead trainers had poor French language ability and a weak

grasp of cross-cultural issues. In addition, the French, U.S.-based management expert lacked skills in training techniques. These training weakness had a negative impact on overall seminar activities, and should be avoided in future seminars through more thorough evaluation of sub-contractors' qualifications, experience and language abilities.

SEMINAR III: HRD Planning

Forty participants representing both public and private sectors and members of the international community in Nouakchott attended this three day seminar held at CGEM headquarters. A training needs assessment was prepared, and a group of four Mauritanian professors (three from ENA, one from University of Nouakchott) produced a preliminary study entitled "Problems and Perspectives of HRD Planning".

The seminar objectives included an analysis of current training and job placement constraints, an examination of socio-economic constraints to HRD planning, and the development of an action plan for improving HRD planning within the Mauritanian context. The overall reaction to the seminar was very postive, and there were many requests for follow-up workshops on the same topic.

Recommendations

1. Despite the excellent quality, the high cost was a concern for evaluators. A concerted effort to identify qualified African trainers should be made to avoid the high cost of U.S. sub-contractors. Seminar documentation expenses could be reduced by identifying local or nearby sources for reproduction and translation. Also, the amount of documentation in some cases seemed excessive.

2. Future seminars should be targeted for mid-level managers (government and private) who are actually impelementing projects and who desperately need planning and design skills.

3. Sub-contracts with CGEM for seminar organization and logistics should be more carefully negotiatied. Some costs seemed excessive (i.e. renting space at CGEM headquarters). Seminar locales could be found in public institutions at little or perhaps no cost.

4. Shorter more narrowly focussed workshops could be tried to see if they might be more cost effective when combined with African trainers.

5. A Training of Trainers (TOT) workshop should be planned for local trainers in order to develop a training capacity in Nouakchott.

VI. ACTIVITIES REQUIRED TO COMPLETE THE PROJECT

6.1 Project Management and Administration 1989-90

The project will require continuous management through the PACD of 12/31/90. The Project Manager's current contract ends on 12/31/89. In discussions with the Project Manager, it is clear that he is not interested in extending his contract for another year due to other long term commitments. The Evaluation Team has considered three options for management of the final project year as follows:

1. Replace the Project Manager with another Personal Services Contractor (PSC) recruited through normal procedures (advertisement in the Commerce Business Daily, etc.).

2. Replace the Project Manager with a locally hired American already living in Nouakchott or nearby Senegal.

3. Assign project management duties to another AID PSC or Direct Hire AID employee at the Mission and hire either a Mauritanian or a Peace Corps Volunteer whose service is ending to handle the more routine tasks under that person's overall supervision.

The Evaluation Team concludes that the second option is preferable since the first option would be very costly for a 12 month period and the third option does not take full account of the already heavy workload of the small Mission staff. The disadvantage of option three is also the fact that management in 1990 will need to be fairly intensive as Participants return to Mauritania, the proposed follow-up conference is organized in Washington, D.C., project finances are reconciled, etc. An experienced HRD officer will need to devote considerable attention to completing project objectives and helping design any follow on activities.

It may be possible to recruit (1) an individual currently working on another project which is ending, (2) an American free lance consultant working in the area, (3) a spouse living in the region who has appropriate skills and is willing to return to work, or (4) a highly skilled Peace Corps Volunteer completing his or her assignment in the region. For either option two or three, the current Project Manager would be available for one or two short term consultancies if this were required.

6.2 Organization of a Seminar on Privatization

Funds are available in the project for perhaps one more major seminar. The Secretary General of CGEM has recommended a seminar on privatization where GIRM officials and Mauritanian entrepreneurs together with outside specialists on the privatization process could have a detailed and technical review of the various mechanisms and options for privatizing some of the

parastatal operations and government services which might be handled more efficiently by the private sector. This recommendation conforms well with AID's priorities and with the private sector training objectives of the project. An organization like the AID-financed Center for Privatization in Washington, D.C. or a major business school might provide technical assistance.

A Privatization seminar could also build upon the USAID-financed Private Sector Climate Assessment completed in 1986 and the private sector colloquium held in 1987 as well as reinforce initiatives planned through Sahel regional funds for workshops and technical assistance for private sector development.

According to a 1987 World Bank assessment, "recent economic reforms have not been sufficient to stimulate a measurable increase in private sector initiatives with the notable exceptions of irrigated rice production and transportation." A general survey of parastatals in 1986 revealed that very limited progress has been made in reducing the number of parastatals via privatization. Before private investors are willing to consider buying a parastatal operation, it may be necessary for management and accounting practices to be strengthened and for the GIRM to consider further regulatory reforms. These issues could be among those forming the substantive basis for the proposed seminar.

Alternatively, the CGEM suggests a seminar on the Exploitation of Marine Resources in terms of the management, control and conservation of marine resources. In light of increasing Mauritanian competence in the fisheries sector, this may be a logical evolution of OAR/M's support to the fisheries sector and could be considered if the privatization topic is already being planned through the use of other funds or by other donors. The seminar could link difficulties in fish export expansion to resource management constraints.

6.3 Reprogramming of Remaining Project Funds

Project funds have been so carefully expended that only $125,000 remain uncommitted for long term training and $133,000 is available for the technical assistance component. In addition, about $40,000 may be de-committed and made available for other purposes. These funds may be able to be used for the seminar recommended above and to finance summer research projects for long term Participants as recommended below.

VII. CONCLUSIONS REGARDING FOLLOW ON ACTIVITIES AND PRIORITIES

7.1 The Continuing Importance of Training in Mauritania

OAR/M's Program Statement for 1987 concluded that "although Mauritania's harsh environment....constrains economic development, the country's major development obstacle is its insufficiently developed human resources....Only a massive, sustained

effort of training and education undertaken over the long term... can establish the basis for future development." (p. 3) This has been the basic rationale for the HRD project and the development strategy of the Mission for several years. Given current skill levels, there is no question that strengthening the human resource base will remain the fundamental priority in any development strategy for the country.

The challenge, therefore, is not the establishment of basic goals but the articulation of priorities in light of limited resources and virtually unlimited needs. As noted above, the HRD project has successfully addressed critical needs in carefully targeted areas of the economy. This fact will have a long term positive impact on Mauritanian development. AID can strengthen and broaden this impact with further assistance designed to build on the accomplishments of the HRD project while taking into consideration new initiatives of other donors and changes in the Mauritanian economy since the HRD project was approved in 1984.

7.2 A Role for USAID

The Evaluation Team has developed a series of recommendations for follow on activities based on the foregoing analysis and interviews with GIRM and OAR/M officials and individuals in the private sector. They are presented below and summarized above, immediately after the Introduction.

7.2.1 Rural Development

By 1990, the HRD project will have produced six qualified agricultural specialists to staff the National Agricultural Training School (ENFVA) in Kaedi. ENFVA is the only rural development training institution in Mauritania. Of the 25 staff at ENFVA, five have B.A. degrees and three of them are Sudanese nationals. The Project Paper defined this training as an effort to up-grade the agricultural extension training service to better transfer improved technology to farmers so that a more effective extension program could be designed and implemented. At the same time, OAR/M has funded the Agricultural Research II (AGRES II) Project which provides institutional support to the Mauritanian Agricultural Research Center (CNRADA), also located in Kaedi. The objective of AGRES II is to support the design and application of appropriate farming systems research and to provide training in agricultural research through the University of Arizona's Arid Lands Center.

Beginning in late 1989, OAR/M expects that implementation of the Mauritania River Valley Development Project (682-0237) will begin operating on the Dirol Plain which is adjacent to Kaedi. This project is primarily an agricultural engineering and water control program designed to increase the benefits accruing to the region with the inauguration of the Senegal River dams.

A continuing weakness in this most promising of agricultural areas in Mauritania is effective and sustained extension of

appropriate agricultural technologies to farmers. ENFVA has an adequate physical plant, has benefited from thirteen years of technical assistance from FAO (ending in 1981) and will have greatly increased its teaching ability but neither the training school nor the research center is primarily engaged in extension. The government extension service is minimal and is mostly concerned with infrastructure.

Given the above, the Evaluation Team recommends that OAR/M:

(1) Conduct a brief needs assessment at ENFVA in areas such as appropriateness of the curriculum, availability of relevant curriculum materials, adequacy of equipment, methods of recruitment of extension trainees, etc. This assessment could benefit from similar inquiries conducted by the World Bank in 1988 but should be updated by AID since the Mission will want to assure itself that its seven graduates are returning to an institution in which they will be able to use their new knowledge and teaching skills. The assessment will also be relevant to the Dirol Plain project since its fundamental goal is increased production. OAR/M should begin to plan now to ensure that the instructors who return to Kaedi are motivated to remain there and teach because they have a functioning institution to return to that is visibly improving and supported by outside agencies.

(2) Review current methods of providing extension information to farmers in southern Mauritania (if any). The 1987 OAR/M Program Statement stressed its willingness to fund "simple, productive projects that require little management or maintenance." It appears that the classic extension approach of well-trained government agents visiting farmers is not practical due to transport, fuel and other constraints. A project promoting appointment of "village extension captains" (mostly non-literate) who could be nominated by a village and sent to Kaedi for basic extension training could be considered. Training would be entirely practical and would be held in demonstration plots at the school. Visual aids could be considered (e.g. a series of simple drawings) which the captains could take home to remind them of what they learned about weeding, water, fertilizer, etc. This type program could be supported by a rural radio program 2-3 times per week which could be taped in the voice of the same instructors teaching the village captains. (perhaps using the radio station in St. Louis).

(3) Consider ways to train motor pump maintenance and repair personnel for the river valley. OAR/M could consider funding a four month consultancy for a motor pump mechanic who might be attached to a private agricultural enterprise in the river valley area. The consultant mechanic could teach basic repair and maintenance on site and select two of the best trainees as counterparts to continue and follow up the training after the consultant's departure. This approach was used on the AID-financed Guinea Bissau Rice Production Project in 1983-84 with positive results.

(4) In light of the above, future training needs are likely to include (1) irrigation management, (2) control of desertification and the environment, (4) forestry, (5) agricultural research and statistics, (6) plant breeding, and (7) pest control. The importance of enhancing research capability as undertaken through AGRES II is also stressed in order to develop, in time, an institutional capacity similar to Land Grant Universities in the U.S. where extension, instruction and research work closely together and complement one another. It is envisioned that ENFVA and CNRADA will be combined in the future and may become a regional training center.

The dams regulating the flow of the Senegal river permit new irrigated farming systems and offer hydro-electric potential. Future training should respond to these new developments and be coordinated with the World Bank proposal to fund an agricultural engineering component at ENFVA.

7.2.2 Support to Artisanal Fisheries

In light of the recent opening of the EEC funded Institute Superieur de Science et Technologie Halieutique (ISSTH) in Nouadhibou, OAR/M should consider funding trainees to attend the Institute if the quality of training is found acceptable. Artisanal fishing is an important source of income and employment for growing numbers of Mauritanians who could benefit from credit programs, an improved incentive structure and management of small scale fish production businesses.

7.2.3 Training for the Customs Department

The new Investment Code approved in October, 1988 and the tariff reform measures in the process of being adopted will help stimulate foreign trade and investment. This may place additional burdens on the customs service which needs efficient personnel able to provide services to the private sector. Although the training would be of GIRM civil servants, if this is not included in the new IDA/FAC project or elsewhere, AID may wish to consider ways to overcome this potential bottleneck to private sector expansion.

7.2.4 Reintegration of Current HRD Participant Trainees into Mauritania

After as much as four years out of Mauritania, many trainees could benefit from initiatives to assist them in their reintegration into their society and economy prior to and after their arrival home. A few recommendations follow:

(1) The Mauritanian Participant Training Workshop of August, 1988 at California Polytechnic University (Pomona) recommended that a newsletter be developed and circulated once every month or two to all Mauritanians studying in the U.S. under the HRD and other projects. Although a small and inexpensive measure, it can be very helpful by providing news and information about Maurita-

nia on those nights when Mauritania is not featured on U.S. news broadcasts. A newsletter gives recipients a sense of being "connected" to others who attended the Pomona workshop and to Mauritania. The University has offered to organize the newsletter and the HRD Project Manager is prepared to forward materials from Mauritania for inclusion in it. OAR/M should fund it.

(2) The Pomona workshop was enormously successful and the Evaluation Report praised the effort as a model which should be incorporated into other AID participant training programs. Again, here is an opportunity for OAR/M to build on its success by planning a second workshop for June, 1990 in Washington, D.C. The workshop could be held just after the graduation of many trainees and focus on two themes: (1) strategies for Mauritanian development and (2) how each participant can best contribute to achieving the objectives of those strategies. The location of the workshop in Washington would permit access to a wide range of knowledgeable World Bank, IMF and U.S. government officials (e.g. USDA, NOAA), a visit to the National Agricultural Library and similar activities. Washington would also be convenient for the Mauritanian Embassy, AID and the implementing agencies (PIET and USDA/OICD).

(3) It is recommended that the OAR/M support the development of an alumni association for graduates of American universities. Such an association can build on the links forged at the Pomona workshop and the proposed 1990 workshop in Washington, D.C. It is a cost effective way to help those with a common exposure to the U.S. educational system to retain their English language skills and to maintain professional contacts among one another.

(4) It is recommended that the project office work with the Directorate for Plan and CGEM during 1989 to identify methods to help re-integrate returning Participants once they reach Mauritania. The newsletter recommended for circulation among Participants in the U.S. could, for example, feature returning Participants and be distributed in Mauritania.

(5) A number of Participants in the U.S. have inquired about conducting summer research projects in Mauritania. There is an acute absence of data about numerous features of the rural economy, labor force, informal sector, etc. The Project should consider budgeting funds for well-conceived research projects as a contribution to the Mauritania information base and as a means to promote re-integration of students into Mauritanian society. A fixed number of research scholarships could be announced for June-August, 1989 and Participants could compete for them with proposals prepared in a standard format sent out by the Project. Perhaps ten at about $2,500 each could be offered.

7.2.5 Pre-Departure Language Training and Cultural Orientation for Future Participants

For future long term Participant training in the U.S., some English language training should be provided in Mauritania

between the time candidates are selected and their time of departure. If selection can be completed well in advance of the start of the academic year, more time may be available for this purpose. In addition, some pre-departure cultural orientation would help ensure that Participants were able to adjust to their new academic and social environments.

7.2.6 Strengthening Third Country Training

One of the most successful aspects of the HRD project has been the innovative use of Third Country training in North Africa and the Middle East. Tunisia and Morocco have received Participant Trainees and contacts for future placements have been established in Egypt and Jordan through the Project. Training in these countries is less expensive, does not require Participants to learn another language and promotes cooperation among moderate states friendly to the U.S. and interested in long term development. In the area of Third Country Training, the Evaluation Team recommends:

(1) that future projects seek to build on the success of the HRD project TCT program by placing Participants in Arabic language technical programs in Egypt and Jordon where they also would also be required to obtain a reading knowledge of English.

(2) that OAR/M consider supplementary project funding during 1989-90 to provide for additional intakes of students into the "Capitains Cotiers" program in Tunisia. The program is given the highest priority by government since fish production represents 65% of foreign exchange earnings and 20% of government budgetary revenues while most positions in the industry are held by expatriates. Since the project is already in place and the fishing industry is a major priority of the current project, a supplementary allocation may be feasible. This would be consistent with the long term Fisheries Strategy Statement adopted by the GIRM in April, 1987.

7.2.7 Support to CNROP (The National Center for Oceanographic and Fisheries Research)

A recent needs assessment of CNROP by the Institute of Marine Studies at the University of Washington (December, 1988) concluded that the institution could be considerably strengthened by the provision of Participant Training for five CNROP personnel in bio-economics, resource exploitation and technology, the socio-economics of fishing, and statistics. The Team concludes that this represents a sound initiative in view of the well-documented needs in Mauritania's fishing industry.

7.2.8 The Future Mix of Long Term University Level Participant, In-Country and Third Country Training

There appears to be a preponderance of opinion within the GIRM and among Project staff that future training should focus more on in-country and third country training and more on middle

level technical and management personnel rather than on long term U.S. Participant candidates for university degrees. The Evaluation Team's analysis of the current manpower situation in Mauritania reinforces this perspective. However, the shortage of high level manpower remains so acute that some long term university level training in the U.S. should be continued even if the share of funds devoted to this element is reduced.

Any new intake of long term Participants for the U.S. should reserve a fixed number of slots for women and the GIRM should be informed that funds for these slots will be lost unless the positions are filled by women. Under the HRD Project, of 37 long term Participants sent to the U.S., none were women; of 77 TCT Participants, five were women. Clearly, there are significant barriers in traditionally male sectors like fisheries. The Mauritanian culture compounds the difficulty of identifying and training women in fields which are not "traditionally" female. Nevertheless, a program where only 4% of U.S. and TCT training is provided to women is unacceptable.

The problem lies partly in the original project design which did not consider this issue. The problem was noted in the 1986 Country Training Plan prepared by OAR/M which attempted to compensate somewhat in the provision of in-country training to secretaries and bookkeepers. Over three years, 120 were trained, of whom 80 were women.

For future programs, the issue should be addressed in the design phase and funds incorporated for training slots in areas where women are available, even if they are outside the priority areas identified for the HRD project. The recently approved Grant Agreement for the regional HRD Assistance Project takes specific note of the need for training of women and sets aside funds for a Women's Management Training Seminar in Atlanta and for training for women in Tunisia. This approach could serve as a model for any follow on activities to the HRD Project.

7.2.9 Linking CGEM Medium and Large Enterprises to Small and Micro-Enterprises to Stimulate Employment

The CGEM is a Confederation of eight sectoral federations of employers with a total of 350 business members. To be a member, a business must (1) have at least three full-time salaried employees on which taxes are paid and (2) pay an annual membership fee of about $50. The micro-enterprise sector (informal sector) is quite dynamic, has employment creation potential especially in the squatter areas around Nouakchott and could benefit from credit, training and links to larger firms. It is recommended that OAR/M review possibilities for building sub-contract and other relationships between micro-enterprises and members of CGEM. With proper resources and an innovative project design, a follow on HRD project might begin to look for practical training opportunities for micro-entrepreneurs within established Mauritanian businesses.

This recommendation echoes a major conclusion of the 1981 AID-financed RAMS study which states, "one of the most positive findings of the study concerns the dynamic nature of non-formal and informal manpower training activities in Mauritania." A 1985 survey by the Statistics Department also highlighted the importance of the sector by identifying 12,000 micro-enterprise units generating 30,000 private sector jobs. Many of these were also linked to a well established apprenticeship system in traditional and more contemporary areas. OAR/M could benefit from knowing more about this sector and seeking to integrate assistance to it with continued support to CGEM members.

7.3 Recommended Studies and Analyses

In addition to the recommendations above, the Evaluation Team has noted the dearth of documentation which exists on Mauritania in general and manpower requirements in particular. Consequently, the Team recommends that OAR/M consider funding the following analyses:

1. A Tracer Study. By 1992, the HRD project will have graduated a substantial number of Participants. By 1992 most will have been back in Mauritania for two years. The OAR/M will likely have continued to fund human resource development programs through 1992. It would be helpful to know (a) what proportion of Participants who returned to Mauritania are working in a position which was foreseen in the project or which directly uses the skills acquired under the program; (b) the extent to which graduates have achieved positions which may influence the policy dialogue in areas of priority interest to the U.S. (agriculture, fisheries, etc.); and (c) whether there are observations on the program's effectiveness from former Participants which would help in future HRD project design.

2. Updating Selected RAMS Project Studies. The forty documents generated from the RAMS study are dated 1980 and 1981. Selected studies should be updated to strengthen the data base regarding Mauritania's precise skill training needs and to identify specific areas for possible OAR/M intervention during the 1990-1995 period.

3. Manpower Planning Studies. Except for fisheries and a few other sectors, manpower needs in Mauritania are poorly documented. OAR/M should consider reviewing the documentation of the World Bank Third Education Project and recent studies by other donors to identify gaps in manpower needs data in critical areas. Manpower needs assessments in those areas would help donors and the GIRM to respond more accurately to training needs.

APPENDIX I

Summary of Participant Training Data

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTION
CAPITAINES COTIERS 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 11/11/89	270	155,250.00	90	575.00	118,500.00	350	279,750.00					
1. BA, AMADOU ALY 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 11/11/89	18	SEE.CAP.COT	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			Coastal Captain	Private Sector	Ecole de Pêche Pêche/SFAX
2. AIDARA, BRAHIM 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
3. DIOP, ABDOUL BOCAR 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11.87 05/11/89	18	SEE.CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
4. MOHAMED EL HAFED EL MAMY O 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE.CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
5. FAYE, PAPA MACOUMBA 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SE CAP. COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
5. STDI HORMA, HADRAME O/ 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
7. M'BODJI IBRAHIMA 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP. COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
8. MOHAMED, MOHAMED AHMED O 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP. COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY . . TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTI
9. AHMED SIDI, MOHAMED EL 1 -50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP. COT.	6 6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR					
10. YAHYA, MOHAMED O/ 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			Coastal Captain	Private Sector	Ecole de Pêche de SFAX
11. SAER, SAIDOU 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
12. SALL, ALIOUNE 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87	18	SEE CAP. COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
13. SOW, MAMADOU LAMINE 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
14. MOHAMED, SID'AHMED O/ 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP.COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
15. ST MALAL KESE 1-50086	TUNISIA	11/11/87 05/11/89	18	SEE CAP. COT.	6	ERR	ERR	24	ERR			IDEM	IDEM	IDEM
16. JIDDOU, AHMED MOHAMED O/ 1-50093	TUNISIA	11/15/87 11/15/90	36	23,050.00	0	640.28	0.00	36	5,349.00	TERM	0.00	Business Administration	SONIMEX (Sté Nat. Imp-Export)	ISG TUNIS Inst.Sup d. Gestion)
17. BA, ABDOULAYE 1-50082	TUNISIA	01/21/87 01/21/89	24	14,200.00		591.67	0.00	24	24,820.00			Financial Management	Ministry Of Finance	IFID institut d. Financement dev.du Magh -CHOTT Mari School- (Ecole d'hor culture)
18. DIOP, MAMADOU 1-50078	TUNISIA	10/24/86 10/24/90	48	27,980,00	0	582.92	0.00	48	27,980.00			Agricultural Engineer		

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTION
19. ABDEL JELIL, MOHAMED O/ ABDERAHMANE I-50092	TUNISIA	11/15/87 11/15/90	36	23,050.00	0	640.28	0.00	36	2,438.00	TERM		Financial Management	SONIMEX	ISG TUNIS
20. TALL, AMADOU	TUNISIA	11/11/87	24	16,200.00	6	675.00	(4,050.00)	18	16,028.00			Computer Programer	C.N.S.S	C.N.I
21. RAJEL, ISSA O I-70015	TUNISIA	11/11/87 11/11/89	24	16,200.00	6	675.00	(4,500.00)	18	16,028.00			Comp.Program.	C.N.S.S.	C.N.I
22. SIDI BOUD BOUDA O/ I-70015	TUNISIA	11/11/87 11/11/89	24	16,200.00	6	675.00	(4,050.00)	18	16,028.00			Compt.Program	SOMIS	C.N.I
23. HADRAMI, MOHAMED O/ I-50079	TUNISIA	10/24/86 10/24/90	48	27,980	0	582.92	0.00	0	5,629.79	TERM	0.00	Agricultural Engineer	Private Sector	CHOTT Mar... School
24. DIALLO, BABA I-50022	SENEGAL	09/01/86 09/01/89	24	15,000.00	8	625.00	5,000.00	32	18.900.00			M B A	SONIMEX	CESAG
25. DIA, HAMIDOU I-50095	SENEGAL	10/15/87 10/15/89	24	18,400.00	0	766.67	0.00	24	18.400.00			M B A	C F P P	CESAG
26. CHEIKH, MOHAMED O/ I-70016	SENEGAL	10/30/87 10/30/89	24	28,493.00	0	1,187.21	0.00	24	29,493.00			Statistics	CNROP	ENEA
27. SAKHO, IBRAHIMA I-50094	SENEGAL	11/16/87 11/16/89	24	18,400.00	0	766.67	0.00	24	10,400.00			M B A	Ministry of Rur. Dev	CESAG
28. MANGASSOUBA ABDOULAYE I-50037	MOROCCO	09/23/85 09/20/87	24	25,200.00	0	1,050.00	0.00	24	25,200.00	TERM		Horticulture	Ministry of Rur.Dev.	LAV-Meknes

40

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY .. TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTI
.9. DIOP, ISSA 1-60063	MALI	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	9,966.00	0	415.00	0.00	0	9,966.00			Road Maintenance	Public Works	ENI-Bamako
30. LY DJIBRIL 1-40059	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/89	12	7,500.00	0	625.00	0.00	0	7,500.00			Maritime Law	Freelance	University of TUNIS
31. ABDEL AZIZ, MOHAMED	TUNISIA	01/18/88 01/18/92	24	10,800.00	24	450.00	19,300.00	24	30,100.00			Public Administration	private Sector	E N A
32. MERHALLA, ISSELMOU 1-60069	SENEGAL	10/01/88 12/28/89	4	11,441.00	0	2,860.25	0.00	0	11,441.00			PIFM	Private Sector	CESAG
33. WATT, ALIOU 1-60081	SENEGAL	10/01/88 10/11/89	12	10,760.00	0	896.67	0.00	0	10,760,00			Accounting	Private Sector	ENSLT
34. KANE, HABY 1-60068	SENEGAL	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	19,278.00	0	803.25	0.00	0	19,278.00			M B A	Private Sector	CESAG
35. MOULAYE IDRISS ALLAL 1-60066	SENEGAL	10/01/88 10/01/89	12	12,550.00	0	1,045.83	0.00	0	12,550.00			PIFM	Private Sector	CESAG
36. WANE, ABDOUL AZIZ 1-60067	SENEGAL	10/01/88	24	19,278.00	0	903.25	0.00	0	19,278.00			M B A	SONADER	CESAG
37. ANNE, MAMADOU 1-60065	SENEGAL	10/01/88 30/12/89	14	13,317.00	0	951,21	0.00	0	13,317.00			Auditing	sonimex	cesag
38. MAGUTRAGA, ABDOULAYE 1-60075	MALI	10/01/90 10/01/90	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Forestery	D P N	IPR Katibougou.

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUT.
39. DIOP, BOUBACAR 1-60074 1-60074	MALI	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Natural Resources	MDR	IPR Katibo gou.
40. KANE ABDOUL, KARIM 1-60077	MALI	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Agronomy	MDR	IPR-Kati-gou
41. GANDEGA , BAKARY ELY 1- 60076	MALI	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Agronomy	MDR	ipr kAtibou gou
42. TRAORE WALO 1-60078	MALI	10/01/88	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Agronomy	MDR	IPR Katibo gou.
43. SARR, MANE SEIDOU 1-60080	MALI	10/01/88	24	13,902.00	0	579.25	0.00	0	13,902.00			Topography	MDR	IPR Katibo gou
44. SADEG, ISMAEL 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			Financial Management	Private sector	ENA TUNIS
45. BEYE, MOUSSA TAND 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Ministry of Finance	"
46. MOHAMED SGHAIR ISSELMOU 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Ministry of C.Sce	"
47. FALL, AHMED 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	16.100.00			"	"	"

42

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTION
58. MOHAMED YEHDIH JEMAL 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			Financial Management	Private Sector	ENA-TUNIS
59. M'BOUYE dit BEBE 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	"	"
60. HAMOUDI , DAH 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	"	"
61. MOHAMED M'BABA, ABDALLAHI 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	"	"
62. MAYOUF, MOHAMED 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	SOMIS	"
63. ABBA, MOULAYE IDRISS 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Min.Finan.	"
64. SIDI, MOHAMED SIS 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Private	"
65. BOUDUM PAPA ABDOULAYE 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Port de	"
56 BAL, MOHAMED EL HADI 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	B O M (Bureau Organisat. et Methode	"

43

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUT
57. MANGASSOUBA, YAYA 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			Financial Management	Ministry of Finance	ENA TUN
58. MENNA, ABDALLAH 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	"	"
59. DJIMERA, BAKARY 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Home Off.	"
60. DIA, IBRAHIMA 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Private	"
61. SOUMARE, EL HADJ 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	Private	"
62. DIOULDE, EL HADJ 1-70048	TUNISIA	10/01/88 10/01/90	24	18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			"	C.N.S.S.	"
63. DIALLO, EL HACEN 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	24	721,000.00 18,100.00	0	754.17	0.00	0	18,100.00			Financial Management	Ministry of Fisheries	ENA-TUN
64. SOW AMADOU TIANE 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			Ships Mecanic	"	Ecole Mar Marchanda
65. BA, BOUBACAR 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
66. MAMEDEN, MOCTAR 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"

44

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUT
67. BRAHIM, HAMDI 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			Ship Mechanic	Ministry of Fisheries	Ecole Mar. Marchan
68. OUMAR, MA MADOU 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
69. KHARCHY, BATTY MOHAMED AHMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	10,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
70. MOHAMED ABDAL-MOHAMED LEMINE 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600			"	"	"
71. SIDATY, FADEL 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	10,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
72. SALECK, MOHAMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20, 600.00			"	"	"
73. SOW MOUNTAKHA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
74. BOUNA, ABOU 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
75. ACHOUR, SAMBA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
76. ABDALLAHI, EL HASSEIN 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
11. ABDALLAHI, SY YACOUB 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUT
78. AHMED TALEB, MED ABDERRAHMA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			Ship Mechanics	Ministry of Fisheri	Ecole Marin Marchand
79. EL-HASSEN, BAH 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824,00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
80. SIDI MOHAMED, YAHYA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
81. MOHAMED EL HASSEN MED SIDIN 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
82. SIDI ABDALLAHI MED ABDALLAHI 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
83. AHMED, MOHAMED ALY 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
84. BAMBA, ABDALLAHI 1-40064 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
85. SIDI BOUYA, MOHAMED LEMINE AHMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"

56

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTION
86. MOHAMED LEHBIB AHMED TALEB 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			Ship Mechanic	Min.OF Fisheries	Ecole Mar: Marchande
87. MOHAMED EL HASSEN MOHAMED SIDINA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	500.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
88. SIDI ABDALLAHI MED ABDALLAHI 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
89. AHMED, MOHAMED ALY 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12.31.90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
90. BAMBA, ABDALLAH 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
91. SIDI BOUYA MOHAMED LEMINE AHMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
92. MOHAMED LEHBIB AHMED TALEB 1-40064	TUNISIAI	01/01/89 12/31 90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
93. MOHAMEDOU, AHMEDOU 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
94. MOHAMED MAHMOUD MOHAMED LEMINE 1-40064	TUNISIA	1 /01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY . TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER EXD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INST...
.95. KHATTRY , SIDINA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89	25	20,600,00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			Ship Mechanic	Ministry of Fisheries	Ecole .. Marc..
96. SIDI, MAHFOUD 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
97. HAMDAH, MOHAMED MD 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
98. MOHAMED MAHMOUD MED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
99. BOUTOU MOHAMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
100. MOHAMED BABACAR MOH. YESLEM 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
101. SEYID, MOHAMED MOUSTAPHA 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
102. CHEIKH ABDAL-LAH MOHAMED 1-40064	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/90	25	20,600.00	0	824.00	0.00	0	20,600.00			"	"	"
103. EL BAH ABDERRAHIM 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	14	19,108.00			Computer Programer	Public Sector	C.N..

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0223)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER EXP	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTI...
104. SY, OUMAR 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			Computer Programer	Public Sector	C.N.I
105. BA, KHADIJETOU 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Public	"
106. SYLLA, MAMA 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"
107. DIDI, ISSELMOU 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"
108. LY, RAKY BINTOU 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"
109. HANEFI, MOH. LEMINE 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,103.00			"	Private	"
110. MA HFOUDH, TALEB AHMED 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"
111. MOHAMED, AHMED 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	private	"
112. MOHAMED, AHMED 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364,86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	private	"
113. SIDI, MOHAMED 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"
114. SALL, FATOU 1-70047	TUNISIA	12/01/88 01/31/90	14	19,108.00	0	1,364.86	0.00	0	19,108.00			"	Private	"

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING
(682-0233)
TRAINING COST SHEET

NAME PIO/P N°	COUNTRY	ON BOARD DATE EST COMP DATE	MONTH $	PIO/P AMOUNT	MONTH OVER/ UNDER ECD	AVERAGE MONTH COST	ADJUSTMENT NEEDED	TOTAL EST MONTH	TOTAL COST	TOTAL ACTUAL COST	EXCESS	FIELD	EMPLOYER	INSTITUTION
115. SY, BOUBACAR ALPHA I-50111	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/89	12	7,600.00	0	633.33	0.00	12	7,600.00			Agriculture Technics	Private Sector	Centre Natl de formation
116. DIALLO, COUMBA I-60095	TUNISIA	01/01/89 12/31/89	12	9,600.00	0	800,000	0.00	12	9,600.00			Secrétariat	Private	OFPE-TUNIS
117. MARKET TOWN CONFERENCE I-50113	IVORY COAST	01/08/89 01/13/89	0,4	11,250.00	0	28,125.00	0.00	0,4	11,250.00			N/A	N/A	N/A
2 Analysts				38,216					35,216					
118. CAMARA Sidi Adama I-60083	TUNISIA	12/01/88 12/01/90	24	19,108.00	0		0.00	24	19,108.00			Data - Application	Public Sector	C.N.I
119. Mohamed Lemine O/ WALED I-60083	TUNISIA	12/01/88 12/01/90	24	19,108.00	0		0.00	24	19,108.00				Private	C.N.I
TOTALS				2,049,551.00					1,899,891.00					

APPENDIX 2

LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

- Mr. Moustapha Ould Abeiderrahmane
  Minister of Information

- Mr. Victor Barnes
  Education Policy Advisor

- Mr. James Bednar
  Food for Peace Office
  USAID

- Mr. Mohamed El Beji
  Tunisian Official (3rd Country Training)

- Mr. Walter Boehm
  AID Deputy Director, OAR/M

- Mr. Boubou Camara
  Directeur du Plan, GIRM

- Mrs. Turkia Ould Daddah
  Wife of His Excellency Abdellahi Ould Daddah
  Ambassador of the Islamic Republic of Mauritania

- Mr. Aliou Samba Diallo
  Senior Advisor International Management
  Development Institute and Representative
  of the University of Pittsburgh

- Ms. Deborah Egan
  Senior Placement Specialist, PIET

- Ms. Carol Fenn
  Placement Specialist, PIET

- Mr. Andrew C. Gilboy
  Project Manager, OAR/M

- Mr. William Hammink
  Deputy Chief Project Development Office
  USAID, Dakar

- Mr. Bill Holt
  Program Specialist
  USDA/OICD

- Ms. Yvonne John
  Officer in Charge,
  Sahel and West African Affairs
  AID, Washington

- Mr. Mohamed Lemine Ould El Kettab
  Directeur du Projet de l'Université

- Mr. Hamadi Lam
  Advisor, Ministry of Interior
  (Former Director, ENFVA)

- Ms. Nancy Mckay
  Project Development Officer
  AID, Washington

- Mr. Papa Sagogno N'Diaye
  Training Assistant
  Project Development Office
  USAID, Dakar

- Mr. Mamadou Lamine N'Dongo
  Ex-Directeur du Plan

- Ms. Judy Shampain
  Project Manager, HRDA
  AID, Washington

- Mr. Mohamed Aly Ould Sidi Mohamed
  Secretary General, CGEM

- Mr. Glenn Slocum
  AID Representative
  Mauritania

- Mr. Souleymane Sow
  Chef du Service de la Planification
  Responsable du Développement Rural
  Directorate of Plan

APPENDIX 3

A C R O N Y M S

AID	Agency for International Development
CFPP	Centre de Formation et de Perfectionnement Professionnel
CGEM	Confédération Générale des Employeurs de Mauritanie
CNRADA	Centre National de Recherches Agronomique et de Développement Agricole
CNROP	Centre National de Recherches Océanographiques et des Pêches
ENA	Ecole Nationale d'Administration
ENFVA	Ecole Nationale de Formation et de Vulgarisation Agricole
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
GIRM	Government of the Islamic Republic of Mauritania
HRD	Human Resources Development
MT/HA	Metric Tons per Hectare
OAR/M	Office of the A.I.D. Representative/Mauritania
OIT	Office of International Training
PACD	Project Agreement Completion Date
PIET	Partners for International Education and Training
PIO/P	Project Implementation Order/Participants
PSC	Personal Services Contract
PTMS	Participant Training Management System
SONADER	Société Nationale pour le Développement Rural
TCT	Third Country Training
TOT	Training of Trainers
USDA/OICD	International Cooperation for Development
USIS	United States Information Service

APPENDIX 4

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Cheikh, Saad Bouh Kamara. L'Urbanisation de la Mauritanie (Nouakchott: La Documentation Francaise, October, 1988).

Diallo, Aliou Samba. Planification des Ressources Humaines,(Nouakchott: December,1987)

Gould, David. Identification et Analyse de Projects de Developpement, (Nouakchott: November, 1986)

Government of Mauritainia. Population and Development in Mauritania, (Nouakchott: December, 1987)

Government of Mauritania. Rapport Nationale Sur les Progrés de la Reforme Agraire et du Développement Rural, (Nouakchott: 1985)

International Labor Organization. Planification de la Formation en Mauritanie, Analyses et Perspectives, (Nouakchott: October, 1984)

Johnson, Patricia. Establishment of the English For Business Professional Program, Draft Report, (Nouakchott: July, 1988)

Kaczynski, Vlad. Present Status of Scientific Fisheries Management in Mauritania, (Seattle: 1988)

Lo, Gourmo Abdoul. Problèmes et Perspectives de l'Adequation Formation Emploi en Mauritanie, (Nouakchott: 1988)

RDA International. Etude de la Formation dans le Secteur de Pêches, (Nouakchott: October, 1987)

Sadok, Ben Othman. Evaluation Des Besoins de Formation Du Secteur Mauritanien de la Pêche, (Nouakchott: 1986)

Samuels, Maurice. Mauritania, Recent Economic Developments, and Prospects, (Nouakchott: November, 1988)

USAID. Evaluation Report SMDP, (Washington, D.C.: September, 1985)

USAID. HRD Assistance Project Paper, (Washington, D.C.: July, 1987)

USAID. Investment Climate and Private Sector Survey, (Nouakchott: August, 1986)

USAID. Project Paper, Mauritania Human Resources Development, (Nouakchott: August, 1984)

USAID. Proposal for the Classification of American Degrees, (Senegal)

USAID. Rural Assessment and Manpower Surveys, (Nouakchott: 1965-1980)

USAID. Sahel Human Resources Development III, Third Country Training Management Study, (Washington, D.C.: April, 1987)

USAID. Sahel Manpower Development II Country Training Plan, (Nouakchott: August, 1983)

USAID. Towards Development of a Private Sector Strategy for Mauritania, (Nouakchott: March, 1987)

USAID/Mauritania. SHRD, Country Training Plan 1986-1990, USAID/Mauritania, (Nouakchott).

The World Bank. Staff Appraisal Report, GIRM, Education Sector Restructuring Project, (Washington D.C.: June, 1988)