PD-AAZ-026
ISN 63289
XD

LESOTHO

BASIC AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATION SYSTEMS (BANFES)

Interim Evaluation

(632-0222)

Prepared by SETS, Inc.
and USAID/Lesotho
April 1988

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS.
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit:

Mission or AID/W Office USAID/Lesotho
(ES# 632-89-2)

B. Was Evaluation Scheduled In Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan?
Yes [X] Slipped [ ] Ad Hoc [ ]
Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY 88 Q 3

C. Evaluation Timing
Interim [X] Final [ ]
Ex Post [ ] Other [ ]

D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)

Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligated to Date (000)
632-0222	Basic and Non-formal Education Systems (BANFES)	7/26/84	4/30/90	$25,750	$19,022,700

RECEIVED
MAR 31 1989
AFR/PD

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director

Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
1. Increase USAID/MOE dialogue on policy issues. a. Cost recovery by IMRC, NTTC, TSTC b. Allocation of resources (primary vs. tertiary) c. Personnel policies and procedures	USAID DIR MOE/P.S.	6/89
2. Address the counterpart issue - NTTC: Controller/ Financial Manager and Deputy for Academic Program; NCDC: Basic Education Specialist, Practical Skills Specialist, and Dissemination Coordinator; Central MOE: Staff Development and Training Coordinator.	USAID/L P.O. Layne MOE/P.S.	12/88
3. Improve coordination and communication among various Government of Lesotho, community, church, and implementation contractor entities.	AE COP Ru ell MOI 'roject Mar er Pitso	6/88
4. Improve project management by (1) more on-site visits by management, (2) cross-component workplans and flow-charts, (3) formally designated deputies to the AED C.O.P. and (4) revise Project Work Group terms of reference.	USA /Layne AED, OP Russell	12/88

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation: (Month) (Day) (Year)

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:

	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Name (Typed)	Patsy P. Layne	Thabo Pitso	Adrian de Graffenreid	Jesse L. Snyder
Signature	Patsy P. Layne	[signature]	[signature]	[signature]
Date	12-9-88	20 December, 1988		11/9/89

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

PES Abstract: BANFES

The project is to improve the cost-effectiveness and relevance of the Lesotho primary education by improving central MOE management and the efficiency of the primary system, incorporating practical skills into schools, strengthening non-formal education channels and community involvement to support education, and providing income-generating skills for rural areas. The project is implemented by the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the Academy for Educational Development (AED) which manages 21 Technical Advisors (TAs) in the field. This second interim evaluation was conducted by Science, Education and Technology Systems, Inc. (SETS), MOE staff, and a REDSO/ESA Project Development Officer (PDO). The purpose was to assess progress toward purposes and goals, and to suggest improvements to enhance project impact. The findings and conclusions are:

-In spite of a one year start-up delay, this well-managed project has made progress toward achievement of purposes, except for completing primary teacher in-service, providing adequate materials to classrooms, and securing community involvement in support of primary schools.
-The assumption that the MOE could provide sufficient counterparts has proven to be erroneous. Secondly, the low level of MOE budget support to primary education impacts negatively on progress.
-The Chief of Party needs more management staff assistance.
-More project support is needed to provide primary expertise and to accelerate development of classroom materials.
-Extensive reliance on long-term training creates problems.
-The MOE needs more financial planning and management assistance. Related to this is the need to give institutions such as the NTTC and the IMRC more control over financial management.
-Operational structure of the Thaba-Tseka Skills Center must change substantially if the program is to be cost-effective.
-AED and the MOE should develop a comprehensive, long-term MOE staff development plan as an urgent priority.
-Quantifiable indicators in the Logical Framework are in many cases now irrelevant, or too difficult to measure.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team Name	Affiliation	Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. $)	Source of Funds
Elizabeth Arakaki	SETS, Inc.	Contract No. 632-0222-C-00-8029-00	$105,193.44	Project No. 632-0222 BANFES
V. Rae Hanson	"			
Carol McCord	"			
Bernard Ostrowski	"			
Ivan Propst	"	180 person days		
Barbara White	"			

2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) 10

3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) 10

5.	Accelerate activities that provide resources, materials and training to primary classroom teachers, and the Non-formal Education program.	AED/COP Russell MOE/Proj. Mgr. Pitso	12/88
	a. Provide more primary education expertise for Components I and II.	AED/COP Russell MOE/PM Pitso	6/88
	b. Establish regular radio in-service programming at a convenient time for primary teachers.	AED/COP MOE/PM Pitso	6/88
6.	Assist IMRC to establish business management /cost recovery procedures.	AED/COP Russell MOE/PM Pitso	12/89
7.	Conduct rigorous cost-effectiveness studies on interventions as inputs to forward planning (Breakthrough to Literacy, Radio, English Language Arts, Thaba Tseka Skills Center, Mahlaseli, Primary Education Newsletter and Dissemination Network), and adjust accordingly.	AED/COP Russell	6/89
8.	Develop plan to meet TSU staffing, facilities and maintenance needs.	AED/COP Russell MOE/PM Pitso	6/89
9.	Assist MOE to provide NTTC with more effective personnel, maintenance and financial procedures.	AED/COP Russell MOE/PS Tsekoa NTTC Dir. Mathete	6/89
10.	Develop comprehensive, long-term MOE training /staff development plan.	AED/Trng. Coord. Schorn MOE Trng. Off. Lekhesa	6/89
	a. Accelerate and improve in-service training at all levels of project, across components (clearly defined focused skills objectives, training of trainers, impact assessment/ feedback by follow-up on-the-job observations.	AED/Trng. Coord. Schorn MOE Trng. Off. Lekhesa	6/88
	b. Re-examine the premises and implications of the Lesotho academic credit (Evening College) program, and revise contract as appropriate.	AED/Trng. Coord. Schorn MOE Trng. Off. Lekhesa	6/89
11.	Increase assistance to improve MOE financial management procedures.	AED/COP Russell MOE/PM Pitso	6/88
12.	Review Project Logical Framework and, if appropriate, revise.	USAID/PO Layne	

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)
Address the following items:

- Purpose of evaluation and methodology used
- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office:	Date This Summary Prepared:	Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report:

1. This second interim evaluation was to assess progress towards project goals and purposes, and to suggest measures to increase project effectiveness. A team of five education specialists contracted through Science, Education and Technology Systems, Inc., led by a REDSO/ESA PDO reviewed project documents and instructional materials, interviewed Ministry of Education (MOE), implementation contractor and USAID/Lesotho (USAID/L) staff, made on-site visits to schools and component institutions, and prepared detailed technical reports. The draft reports were submitted through USAID/L to MOE and contractor staff for comment. The final report incorporates results of the discussions.

2. The project is to improve the cost-effectiveness and relevance of the Lesotho primary education system by improving central MOE management and the efficiency of the primary system, incorporating practical skills into the formal school program, strengthening non-formal education channels and community involvement and support to education. The project supports teacher training; materials development, production and utilization; long-term, and in-service training; and operating costs for the Thaba Tseka Skills Training Center. The project addresses one of the major constraints to economic and social development of Lesotho...the need for an informed and literate citizenry. This constraint impacts on overall Mission efforts in agriculture production, health and family planning, and development of the private sector.

3. Findings:
The first evaluation found the implementation structure in place, but little progress toward purpose. Most of the recommendations have been implemented, except the MOE provision of counterparts and establishment of a governance structure for the Thaba Tseka Skills Training Center (TSTC).

3a. Management:
The project is well-managed and is making good progress toward achieving purposes. The implementation contractor, The Academy for Educational Development (AED), has provided effective personnel to the field in a timely manner and creatively adjusted procedures to changing conditions, as the situation warranted. Findings related to overall project management were: 1) The Chief of Party (COP) needs additional management assistance; 2) There are many complaints about lack of communication among MOE and technical advisory staff; 3) The USAID Project Officer is too heavily involved in implementation detail through Project Work Group (PWG), which closely monitors and manages project activities; 4) Important MOE policy issues remain unresolved, e.g., the MOE spends M57 per primary pupil (approximately $22) per year, as opposed to M6000 per University student; 5) The assumption that the MOE could provide needed counterparts has proven to be incorrect, and there are five key counterpart positions still not filled: the MOE Staff Development Coordinator, the National Teacher Training College (NTTC) Deputy/Financial Manager and Deputy for Academic Program, the National Curriculum Development Center (NCDC) Dissemination Coordinator and the Practical Skills Specialist.

d

3b. Progress:
Key MOE personnel have been trained. The primary teacher in-service training activity is well underway, but cannot be completed with a sustainable structure in place by the PACD. The School Supply Unit is now a functioning unit in the MOE. The Teaching Service Unit computerized and rationalized its teacher-force data system. The Personnel division completed a comprehensive Schemes of Service upon which the GOL based its salary revision, with substantial salary increases across the board. The Planning Unit has analyzed data and published reports through School Year 1986-1987, and developed the education sector section of the GOL Fourth Five Year Plan. The MOE held Policy Clarification and Action Planning Seminars. Support has recently been provided to the Financial Management division of the MOE.

The Curriculum Dissemination Network is functioning, providing orientation and materials to classrooms. Radio English language arts programs provide 30 minute daily basic instruction to Standards One and Two. However, there is still a serious dearth of supplementary materials in all primary classrooms, especially independent learner materials of all kinds and teacher guides. The Primary School Leavers Exam (PSLE) has been improved and revised, but practical skills has not been incorporated into the PSLE. Work has begun on minimal skills tests for each standard.

The NTTC has improved facilities and financial management, registration procedures, and student management. Under the guidance of a dynamic new Director, reforms are underway. A proposal has been presented to the MOE to give the NTTC more control over personnel and budget management. A Primary Education Division has been formed, and curricula improved for most of the subject matter divisions. The NTTC does not have the capacity to train the quantity of primary teachers needed to cope with rapidly increasing school-age population.

Twenty action-research communities now actively support schools. The Non-formal Education (NFE) component was late in starting, but is now operating in fifteen communities and with NFE groups (Girl and Boy Guides, and Young Farmer Groups).

The Thaba Tseka Skills Training Center improved instructional program, but indications are that the Center is not likely to be an economically viable, cost-effective institution unless major changes are made.

4. Principal Recommendations: (4.1) To improve project management, the COP should formally identify deputies for administrative matters, for coordinating program, and for evaluation. (4.2) The contractor should develop cross-component work plans to enhance coordination, and should increase efforts to improve communication among contractor staff and MOE institutions. (4.3) The Project Work Group should deal with major issues, leaving implementation details to the discretion of the contractor. The PWG should, however, make more site visits to improve morale, and to keep in touch with working realities. (4.4) The USAID Director should increase policy dialogue with the GOL to encourage more effective allocation of scarce MOE resources, and improved personnel management practices. (4.5) The counterpart issue should be addressed immediately. (4.6) The Contractor should provide more technical expertise in primary education and increase instructional materials production substantially. (4.7) All training should model teaching skills and provide more practicum content, rather than rely on verbal presentations. More attention should be given to assessing

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc., from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

The Mission is highly satisfied with the evaluation and believes the team was professional and unbiased in its work. The findings presented no new issues and served to validate many of the views the Mission had formed in its oversight reviews of this activity. Overall, we believe the project still conforms to the Mission's CDSS goal of assisting the GOL in providing universal education throughout the country. The project also responds to the expressed priorities of the GOL. There are, however, a variety of external factors affecting this project which are not identified in the evaluation, and these are listed below. By way of background, it is important to remember that Lesotho has a three tier education system evolving from the old missionary system established over a hundred years ago. It was run by the UK during the protectorate period to support a labor reserve goal and provide a trained cadre to assist in public administration of the country. This philosophy is only now changing. It is still dominated by religious organizations which provide over 95% of the 1,500 schools in Lesotho.

Likewise, the demographic and governmental factors adversely affecting this project are substantial and, we believe, were not adequately addressed during the design phase (it is not likely that a satisfactory solution could have been found for those problems except to minimize their impact on the project). Among the larger of these factors is the high population rate (2.7%) providing over 3,000 new primary entrants a year and causing in some areas over a 100:1 student/teacher ratio in the classroom. Classroom conditions themselves are inadequate, with many lacking basic water and sanitation facilities, blackboards, windows, desks and writing materials; this situation reflects the exceptionally meager fiscal resources of the GOL and local communities.

Many of the external constraints are also generic to Government. The lack of funds means GOL is unable to: 1) raise teacher salaries, therefore GOL is losing teachers to RSA faster than can be replaced; 2) maintain schools: and, 3) provide basic teaching materials. The general lack of personnel results in managerial weaknesses, inability to reduce student-teacher ratios, or provide counterparts for project implementation (the proposed GOL personnel reductions under the IMF's SAF may further aggravate this latter problem). The role by religious institutions limits GOL control over how schools are operated and local involvement. Also, the general weakness in the GOL fiscal/administrative capability limits the MOA's ability to budget/plan/maintain appropriately and causes inefficiency in its use of funds and personnel. The population growth rate and the fact that almost 50% pop. is under 14 yrs. places exceptional strains on an education system just to survive; it definitely constrains it from being able to expand and improve at a satisfactory rate. The MOA administration is overly centralized in the sense that most administrative and policy decisions are made at the headquarters level without adequate involvement by local communities.

XD-AAZ-026-A
ISN 60590

USAID/LESOTHO BANFES PROJECT
(No. 632-0222)
Second Interim Evaluation

22 April 1988

SETS, INC.
Honolulu, Hawaii

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

Table of Contents i

Acronyms v

List of Tables and Charts vii

Executive Summary 1

Final Report 6

1.0 Overview of the BANFES Project 6
- 1.1 Lesotho: Socio-Economic Context 6
- 1.2 Political Context 6
- 1.3 Educational Context 7
- 1.4 BANFES Project Purpose 7

2.0 Purpose and Methodology of the Study 8
- 2.1 Purpose of the Evaluation Study 8
- 2.2 Study Methods 9
- 2.3 Team Composition 9

3.0 Findings 9
- 3.1 Adequacy of Project Design 10
  - 3.1.1 Goal 10
  - 3.1.2 Purpose 10
  - 3.1.3 Assumptions 10
  - 3.1.4 Summary 11
- 3.2 Compliance with First Evaluation Recommendations 12
  - 3.2.1 Overall Compliance 12
  - 3.2.2 Summary 13
- 3.3 GOL/MOE Compliance with Project Agreement 13
  - 3.3.1 General Compliance 13
  - 3.3.2 Component Compliance 13
  - 3.3.3 Financial and In-Kind Contributions 13
  - 3.3.4 GOL/MOE Policies 13
- 3.4 AED: Inputs and Project Goals 14
  - 3.4.1 AED Inputs 14
- 3.5 AED: Progress to Date 15
  - 3.5.1 Progress in Component I 15
  - 3.5.2 Progress in Component II 16
  - 3.5.3 Progress in Component III 16
  - 3.5.4 Progress in Component IV 19
- 3.6 USAID Project Management 19
  - 3.6.1 Project Supervision/Monitoring (AID) 19
  - 3.6.2 Fiscal Monitoring Activities 21
  - 3.6.3 Recommendations 21

4.0 Conclusions..... 2
4.1 Project Evaluation..... 2
4.2 Project Subpurposes..... 2
4.3 Project Overall Purpose..... 2

5.0 Recommendations..... 31
5.1 Project Management Recommendations..... 32
5.2 Cross-Component Recommendations..... 36
5.3 Component-Specific Recommendations..... 41

Appendices

Appendix A..... 55

Appendix B..... 67

Appendix C..... 76

Appendix D..... 77

Appendix E..... 80

Bibliography

Documents List..... 87

Interviews..... 93

Curriculum/Instructional Materials Reviewed..... 95

Sites Visited..... 97

Component Technical Reports

BANFES Management..... 98

Component I: Institutional Strengthening of the MOE... 101
Out put 1: Trained MOE Staff and Ongoing Staff Development Plan..... 101
Output 2: A Functioning Personnel System, Resulting in Improved Staff Capability to Manage and Administer MOE Programs and Operations..... 104
Output 3: Data-based Information Systems for the Planning Unit to Increase Efficiency in Administration and Financial Management..... 106
Output 4: Improved Financial Management System.. 107

Output 5: School Supply Unit..... 103
Output 6: Improvement in the Teaching Services Unit..... 110
Output 7: Internal Management Improvement at the MOE..... 111
Output 8: Primary Inservice Training Coordinator... 113
Output 9 Formative Evaluation Coordination..... 114

Attachment 1 IEMS/BANFES Primary Education Leadership Certificate Sequence..... 114a
Attachment 2 BANFES/IEMS Early Childhood Leadership for Primary School Teachers Certificate Sequence..... 114c
Attachment 3 IEMS/BANFES Educational Management and Leadership Certificate Sequence.. 114e
Attachment 4 Evening & Week-end College, Maseru Campus Student Profile..... 114g
Attachment 5 Number of Applications for Each Regional Center..... 114i
Attachment 6 Qualifications Breakdown..... 114j

Component II: Strengthening the National Teacher Training College..... 115
Output 1: Sufficient and Trained Staff..... 115
Output 2: Revision of the NTTC Curriculum..... 119
Output 3: A Tested and Efficient Instructional System, Consisting of Trained Faculty and Appropriate Instructional Materials.... 126
Output 4: Improved Personnel, Administrative and Financial Administration..... 130
Output 5: A Functioning Program for Testing Teacher Training Curriculum and Teaching Methods, Through Linkages with Seed Schools and Communities..... 133

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials..... 135
Output 1: Revising Curriculum..... 135
Output 2: Improved Examination and Evaluation System..... 152
Output 3: Strengthen MOE's Capacity to Design, Evaluate and Disseminate Materials.. 157
Output 4: Systematize National Curriculum and Provide Inservice Training in the Use of Curriculum..... 162
Output 5: Increased Community Support and Participation..... 169
Output 6: Trained NDCD/IMRC Staff..... 171

Component IV: Rural Skills Training..... 174
Output 1: A Mechanism for Coordinating Non-formal Education to Develop Rural Income-generating Skills in the Thaba Tseka Area..... 174
Output 2: A Functioning RSTC in Thaba Tseka..... 175
Output 3: A Trained RSTC Staff..... 185
Output 4: Skilled Craftsmen Available to Serve the Needs of the Area..... 187
Output 5: A Tested Basic Education Program in Place in One Primary School..... 189

ACRONYMS

ACL	Anglican Church in Lesotho
AID	United States Agency for International Development
APTC	Advanced Primary Teachers Certificate
BANFES	Basic and Non-Formal Education Systems Project
CDCC	Curriculum Dissemination Coordination Committee
CDLC	Curriculum Dissemination Liaison Committee
CEO	Chief Education Officer
COSC	Cambridge Overseas School Certificate
CPDO	Central Planning Development Officer
DACUM	Developing a Curriculum
DEO	District Education Officer
Dip Ed	Diploma in Education
DSG	Dissemination Sustainability Group
EO	Education Officer
ERC	Education Resource Centre
GOL	Government of Lesotho
GNP	Gross National Product
JC	Junior Certificate
JCE	Junior Certificate Exam

IDM	Institute of Development Management
IEMS	Institute of Extra-Mural Studies
IMRC	Instructional Materials Resource Center
LAC	Lesotho Agricultural College
LAPIS	Lesotho Agricultural Production and Instruction Support
LDTC	Lesotho Distance Teaching Centre
LERA	Lesotho Education Research Association
LEC	Lesotho Evangelical Church
LIET	Lesotho Inservice Education for Teachers
LRLA	Lesotho Radio Language Arts
MOE	Ministry of Education
LOIC	Lesotho Opportunities Industrialization Centre
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOF	Ministry of Finance
NCDC	National Curriculum Development Center
NDP	National Dissemination Program
NFE	Non-Formal Education
NTTC	National Teacher Training College
NUL	National University of Lesotho
ODA	Overseas Development Administration (British)
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PEN	Primary Education News

PS	Principal Secretary
PTC	Primary Teacher Certificate
PSLC	Primary School Leavers Certificate
PSLE	Primary School Leavers Exam
REDSO	Regional Economic Development Support Office
RCC	Roman Catholic Church
RLAP	Radio Language Arts Project
RSA	Republic of South Africa
RSTC	Rural Skills Training Center
SEO	Senior Education Officer
STC	Secondary Teachers Certificate
STTC	Secondary Technical Teacher Certificate
TSC	Teaching Service Commission
TSRP	Training for Self-Reliance Project (World Bank)
TSTC	Thaba-Tseka Skills Training Centre
TSU	Teacher Service Unit
UK	United Kingdom (Britain)
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Economic, Social and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations for International Children's Emergency Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development Mission
WHO	World Health Organization

LIST OF TABLES AND CHARTS

Page

Component II

Output 1
Table 1: NTTC Training Activities 116
Table 2: NTTC Long-term Training Summary 116

Component III

Out put 1
Table 1: Overview of Basic Education Materials 133
Table 2: Summary Assessment of BANFES Initiated Instructional Material 134
Chart 1: Practical Skills Materials Development 15

Out put 4
Table 1: National Dissemination Programme System of Operations 16
Table 2: Level of Dissemination of Selected Major BANFES Curriculum Materials 16

Component IV

Table 1: TSTC Enrollment 17
Table 2: TSTC Student Fees 17

USAID/LESOTHO BANFES PROJECT (No. 632-0222)
Second Interim Evaluation

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

22 April 1988

SETS, INC.
Honolulu, Hawaii

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

I. EVALUATION BACKGROUND:

The Basic and Nonformal Education Systems (BANFES) project evaluation was a six-week interim evaluation initiated by USAID and the Government of Lesotho (GOL). The full evaluation report was submitted to the Mission on April 22, 1988.

II. PURPOSE OF THE BANFES PROJECT:

The stated purpose of the BANFES Project is to strengthen the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Education (MOE) to efficiently provide an effective educational system relevant to Lesotho's development needs. While the project is continuing efforts to strengthen the institutional capacity of the MOE, it is also strengthening the primary teacher corps through inservice training.

The project goal is to promote rural-based income and employment and improve the quality of rural life through education. Thus, there are four components to the Project. A description of each of these four components follows.

- Component One: MOE Institutional Strengthening

Component One is to strengthen the MOE administration at the central level, improving the use of limited human and fiscal resources. The component provides training; strengthens the Personnel, Planning, Teacher Service, and School Supply Units; and attempts to improve overall MOE management procedures.

- Component Two: Teacher Training

Component Two is to strengthen the National Teacher Training College (NTTC), improving its personnel system, financial management, curriculum, and instructional methodologies. Practical and agricultural skills pedagogy is emphasized.

- Component Three: Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Component Three is to strengthen the National Curriculum Development Center (NCDC) by revising primary level curricula to include practical skills; supplementary material to improve basic education in Sesotho, English, and mathematics; developing an improved evaluation and testing system; and establishing a national dissemination network for new instructional materials.

- Component Four: Rural Skills Training Center

Component Four is to establish and institutionalize a rural skills training program at the Thaba Tseka Training Center, training staff and developing instructional module materials in areas such as home crafts, construction, and equipment repair.

The major education sector constraints this project addresses are scarce human and financial resources within the MOE, poorly qualified teachers, insufficient instructional materials, and an overly academic curricula. Other problems include severe

overcrowding and lack of basic educational materials (desks, paper, etc.). Th consequences are extremely high failure, repetition and dropout rates, especially primary school. Taken together, these problems constitute a major constraint Lesotho's development and a serious impediment to achieving overall AID/Lesoth Mission strategy.

III. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION AND THE METHODOLOGY USED:

A. The purposes of this interim evaluation were to (1) determine the extent to whic recommendations from the first evaluation have been acted upon; (2) examine th project's summative and formative evaluation plan; (3) assess progress made toward attaining project purposes and sub-purposes; and (4) make recommendations fo improving project management and implementation by USAID, the contractor, an MOE.

B. The evaluation was conducted by SETS Inc., assisted by an AID-REDSO Projec Development Officer and a Basotho educational research specialist. Evaluatio methodologies used were (1) review and analysis of all project documents; (2) pane and individual interviews of BANFES, USAID, and MOE principals; (3) on-sit observation of schools and MOE institutions; and (4) examination of instructional an supplementary materials developed by the project.

IV. PRINCIPAL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

1. Purpose: There has been considerable progress towards achieving the projec purpose. Progress was initially delayed due to an unexpectedly lengthy but necessar process of getting the project underway and building consensus between project staf and MOE institutions regarding what activities were needed to achieve projec objectives. Fundamental decisions have been made and the project is now engaged i specific activities directly related to reaching its purpose. It is expected that there will be greater progress towards achieving the purpose of the project during the final stages than there has been progress to date. As a result, many of the original purpose-leve indicators in the local framework are either unrealistic or no longer relevant.

> Recommendation: A revised logical framework should be developed to reflect the expansion in project purpose and establish more appropriate end-of-project status indicators. The AED contract should be amended to include this new local framework and revised evaluation guidelines.

2. Outputs: Project personnel and MOE staff have generated an impressive array of instructional materials and training activities and should be commended for their efforts. Of particular note are the National Dissemination Programme, Lesotho Radio Language Arts, Sesotho Monthly Reader, MOE data management systems, overall institutional strengthening of the NTTC, and the project's in-country training programs. However, activities remain too component-based, with insufficient attention paid to program thrusts. Inadequate cross-component communication and coordination have resulted in some duplication of effort and insufficient interchange of ideas. Too much time is spent on "product" than "process."

Recommendation: Workplans should be structured in such a way that cross-component activities, relationships and program thrusts are clearly defined. PERT charts should be developed to include information on project progress toward achieving outputs and objectives, progress of program areas, timelines and milestones for outputs and program activities, and personnel requirements.

3. Inputs: Project inputs have been slower than expected, mainly because of the aforementioned delays in getting the project underway and in obtaining consensus from all entities concerned. Many of the project initiatives are only just now reaching the field testing and dissemination stages. Proper implementation of these initiatives, to increase their effectiveness and sustainability, will probably require more than two years. At current rates of spending there appears to be enough money in the project to continue funding beyond the proposed project completion date.

Recommendation: Consideration should be given for a no cost extension of the Project Assistance Completion Date, contingent upon a program review to take place in twelve months time to assess (a) implementation of this evaluation's recommendations, (b) continued relevance of project purpose and direction, and (c) progress in increasing project impact and focus.

4. Sustainability: Due to the lack of counterparts and scarce human and financial resources available to the MOE, project sustainability is seriously in doubt. Maintenance of all commodities provided, production of instructional materials, and inservice teacher training activities are particularly vulnerable. The commitment and capacity of the MOM/GOL to sustain this project has not yet been demonstrated and requires further study.

Recommendation: An educational economist with extensive experience in recurrent cost financing should be brought in to provide six to nine months of short-term technical assistance. This person would: (a) examine the cost implications for sustaining the project's interventions, including the prospects for partial cost-recovery of certain initiatives; (b) analyze MOE and GOL capacity for financing the recurrent costs of the project's interventions; and (c) apply different levels of GOL financial support to set up a variety of scenarios for sustaining the project.

5. Project Management: Project management structures need to be modified. The Project Work Group (MOE Project Coordinator, AID Project Officer, and Contractor Chief-of-Party) spends too much time on implementation decisions that should be handled by the Contractor. The Chief-of-Party needs increased internal administrative and management support to implement the project. There needs to be increased consultation with the Basotho community.

Recommendation (A): The Project Work Group should be a forum to discuss questions of project focus, progress towards project purpose, and prioritization of project activities. They should not be

making lower-level implementation decisions.

Recommendation (B): AED Management staff should be increased to include an Administrative Officer to oversee administrative and fiscal matters, a Program Officer to insure cross-component and program thrusts, and an Evaluation Specialist to develop and implement formative and summative evaluations. The staff, along with the Chief-of-Party and Component Coordinators, should form a management council.

Recommendation (C): The Advisory Group to the Project Management Committee should be regularly convened by the MOE to provide increased community input.

6. Policy Dialogue: There is insufficient policy dialogue between AID and the MOE to address issues which are beyond the reach of the project yet inhibit project implementation and progress.

Recommendation: The AID Mission Director, Deputy Director, and Project Officer should play a larger role in raising policy level issues with appropriate personnel in the MOE (Minister, Permanent Secretary, etc.) and other key ministries. Issues such as as MOE staffing commitments, governance of the Thaba Tseka Training Center, clarification of roles among MOE institutions, and Church-MOE relations need addressing.

7. Thaba Tseka: The Rural Skills Training Center at Thaba Tseka has not met the performance objectives outlined in the project thus far. Furthermore, it is not clear that the Training Center is contributing to the achievement of the project purpose.

Recommendation: A financial audit should be undertaken of the Thaba Tseka Rural Skills Training Center, assessing the sustainability of this facility and the contribution the center makes towards achieving the overall project purpose. If the review does not indicate sustainability and significant contribution to achieving the project purpose, AID should consider phasing down this component.

9. Training: (A) There is insufficient screening, follow-up and evaluation of training activities to ensure that they are cost-effective, make an impact, and are clearly focused on achieving both component and project objectives.

(B) There is a need for increased teacher support in the use of new curriculum materials. The National Dissemination Programme and proposed inservice teacher training activities, while impressive, will not be adequate.

Recommendation (A): The Training Coordinator, and especially other BANFES Technical Advisors, should screen and evaluate training activities more rigorously to document changes in teacher/learner behavior in on-the-job performance.

Recommendation (B): Teacher training emphasizing classroom management and the use of instructional materials should be increased. For example, intensive demonstration-type in-service teacher trainer workshops could be held during the winter school break, conducted by the NCDC curriculum developers themselves. Workshop planning would include consultation with the Inspectorate (District Education Officers), Secretaries, headteachers, and school managers.

10. Insufficient Technical Assistance: Present types and number of Technical Ac are insufficient to implement increased teacher training and primary level curri development activities. Many of these technical advisors lack practical clas experience.

Recommendation: Additional short-term and long-term Technical Advisors should be obtained. Approximately six short-term advisors for six months each (on a staggered basis) and one long-term advisor are required to assist in primary-level training and curriculum development. Recruitment should be done by AED itself, not by Consortium universities because the emphasis on primary education and school impact suggests that university personnel may be inappropriate.

V. LESSONS LEARNED:

1. Although umbrella design projects can strengthen institutional linkages, th not easy to coordinate. Thus, communication problems and artificial linkages can if care is not taken during project design to ensure the compatibility of all compon

2. Project monitoring and evaluation plans should be built into project desig contracts. Such plans would provide for more ongoing evaluation activities (tim and milestones) to ensure focus on achieving project purpose.

USAID/LESOTHO BANFES PROJECT (No. 632-0222)
Second Interim Evaluation

FINAL REPORT

---

22 April 1988

SETS, INC.
Honolulu, Hawaii

Sa

Best Available Document

1.0 OVERVIEW OF THE BANFES PROJECT

In this section a brief overview of the BANFES project is provided along with a sketch of the socio-economic, political and educational context within which the project operates.

1.1 Lesotho: Socio-Economic Context

The Kingdom of Lesotho is a land-locked nation completely surrounded by the Republic of South Africa. The 1987 census recorded a total population of slightly more than 1.6 million, 99% of whom are Basotho and most of whom (84%) live in rural areas (Document D-4.01).

Lesotho's mountainous land mass, entirely above 5,000 feet, holds only a few natural resources that can be exploited: water, some agricultural and grazing land, and small amounts of diamonds and other minerals. The principal economic activities are agriculture and livestock. However, only 13% of the land is suitable for arable production and yields have been declining an average of 3% per year over the last decade due to soil erosion, the absent male labor force and poor farming practices. While Lesotho's terrain is well-suited to animal husbandry, it suffers from declining animal quality and inadequate disease control. Lesotho's only diamond mine closed in 1982 when falling world diamond prices rendered it a heavy loss maker.

The inability to provide jobs for its labor force (expanding by 12,000 workers per year) has made Lesotho vulnerable to economic domination by South Africa. It is estimated that approximately 60% of the adult males between the ages of 20 and 44 are employed in the mines of South Africa, generating over 50% of Lesotho's total GNP. Furthermore, over 95% of Lesotho's imports originate in South Africa, while its exports either end in South Africa or must pass through South African ports.

The absence from the country of over one half of the male labor force has far-reaching effects on the country's socio-economic fabric, making the role of women and male children unusually important in the domestic production process. About 65% of all households are managed by women, while boys assist in agricultural and pastoral activities, mainly taking care of the herds. However, the low returns from farming relative to employment abroad have been a disincentive for efficient farming and reduced the adoption of a low-input, low-return, low-risk system of cultivation.

1.2 Political Context

Formerly the British crown colony of Basutoland, Lesotho became independent on October 4, 1966. From 1966 until 1985, it was governed by Chief Jonathan Lebua.

In January 1986, a bloodless coup d'etat took place that ousted the Jonathan government, replacing it with a Military Council headed by Major General Lekhanya. According to a Military Council decree, the executive and legislative powers of the state are now vested in the Chief of State, King Moshoeshoe II, although effective control rests with the Military Council which formally advises on technical matters and oversees functional activities carried out by conventional ministries. While efforts have been made to build a new grassroots political structure to restore civilian rule, this

development is at an early stage, and no timetable has been set. However, domestic law and order have been restored, and Basotho appear generally to accept the current political situation.

1.3 Educational Context

Formal education in Lesotho is an enterprise undertaken through a partnership between the government, the churches and the community. It consists of a 7-year cycle of primary education, 3 years of junior secondary education and 2 years of high school education. There is one university, a liberal arts institution offering mainly undergraduate programs. There are also a few technical/vocational institutions in the country. The National Teacher Training College (NTTC) is responsible for training the majority of primary and secondary school teachers, while the development of curricula for these levels is undertaken by the National Curriculum Development Center (NCDC). The government attaches considerable importance to non-formal education (NFE), which is provided through such institutions as the Institute of Extra-Mural Studies (IEMS) at the National University of Lesotho (NUL) and the Lesotho Distance Teaching Centre (LDTC) of the Ministry of Education.

Pitsos. In 1978, the Government of Lesotho launched a National Education Dialogue. Through a series of village meetings (pitsos) with government officials and representation of the churches involved in education, a number of concerns such as a declining standard of education, declining quality and performance of teachers, and the lack of practical and relevant skills experience in the school curriculum were identified.

One result of this dialogue was the establishment of the Education Sector Survey Task Force in 1980. The report of this Task Force, published in 1982, was approved by the Government of Lesotho (GOL) as the basic policy document for the development of the education system in Lesotho to the year 2000.

1.4 BANFES Project Purpose

The stated purpose of the Basic and Non-Formal Educational Systems Project (BANFES) is to strengthen the institutional capacity of the MOE to efficiently provide an effective educational system that is relevant to Lesotho's developmental needs. While the project is continuing efforts to strengthen the institutional capacities of the MOE, it is also strengthening the Primary teacher corps through inservice training.

This Project addresses two major dimensions of the education problems in Lesotho: 1) making the best use of scarce financial and human resources through better management and 2) increasing the effectiveness of the educational system both qualitatively and quantitatively.

For management purposes, the project approaches these problems through four functionally interrelated components:

I Institutional Strengthening of the MOE;
II Strengthening the National Teacher Training College (NTTC);

III. Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials (National Curriculum Development Center,NCDC, and Instructional Materials Service Center,IMRC) and
IV. Developing a Rural Skills Training Center (Thaba Tseka Skills Training Center-TSTC).

A series of subpurposes and activities have been designed to support the project purpose, as well as the interrelationships between and among the MOE institutions and project components. The Project activities (Outputs) are designed to focus on the following subpurposes:

-strengthening the managerial efficiency of the MOE through trained staff, administrative reform in personnel and financial management; a functioning Teacher Service Unit, School Supply Unit, and Planning Unit; and reorganized MOE structure increasing coordination among MOE departments and the districts;

-strengthening the National Teacher Training College through trained staff and improved NTTC curriculum, instruction, management and community/demonstration school linkages;

-improving the NCDC and IMRC capability to develop and disseminate relevant and effective instructional materials through curriculum syllabi, evaluation and testing systems, instructional materials, a dissemination system, community support programs and trained NCDC/IMRC staff; and

-providing expanded opportunities for rural skills training through a non-formal education coordination system for Thaba Tseka, a functioning Rural Skills Training Facility, trained staff, trained craftsworkers for the Thaba Tseka area and a demonstration Basic Education Program.

2.0 PURPOSE AND METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY

In this section, the study purposes, methods, and team composition are briefly described.

2.1 Purpose of the Evaluation Study

The primary purposes of this evaluation as stated in the work statement are to 1) determine the extent to which recommendations resulting from the first evaluation (October, 1986) were implemented; 2) review the project's summative and evaluation plan and assess its validity and usefulness as a management tool; 3) assess progress towards attaining project purposes and subpurposes on the part of the contractor, Academy of Educational Development (AED); the Government of Lesotho (GOL) through its Ministry of Education (MOE) and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID); and 4) make recommendations for improving project management and implementation by USAID, the contractor and the Ministry of Education.

The present evaluation is "decision driven" in order to assist USAID, the contractor, and the host government to make decisions about whether, and/or what type of, modifications may be necessary to complete targeted goals, objectives and purposes within the project time period. In addition, USAID must begin now to consider longer term involvement in the Lesotho education system.

2.2 Study Methods

To provide this information, the following methods were used:

1) Both individual and panel interviews were conducted with BANFES, MOE, and USAID principals (listing in Appendix G-1);

2) Individual interviews were administered to BANFES Technical Advisors, their counterparts and other MOE personnel (Appendix G-1);

3) On-site observations were made at project institutions and at a sample of lowland, foothill and mountain primary schools (Appendix G-3)

4) Basic skills, practical skills and supplementary curriculum and instructional materials designed and/or produced by the project were examined (Appendix G-4); and

5) The project's extensive documentation (reports, budgets, meeting minutes, statistics, etc.) was reviewed (Appendix G-2).

2.3 Team Composition

The evaluation study was conducted by SETS Inc. of Honolulu, Hawaii. Members of the SETS Evaluation Team were (in alphabetical order):

1) Elizabeth Arakaki, Teacher Training Specialist
2) V. Rae Hanson, Practical Skills/Student Labor Specialist
3) Carol McCord, Management Specialist
4) Bernard Ostrowski, Program Evaluation Specialist
5) Ivan Propst, Bilingual Education Specialist
6) Dr. Barbara White, Instructional Media Specialist

Supporting the SETS Evaluation Team were:

1) Sam Carlson, AID-REDSO/ESA, Project Development Officer
2) Julia Savage, Word Processor
3) Dr. Molapi Sebatane, Lesotho Institute for Educational Research

3.0 FINDINGS

In this section the evaluation findings are presented and documented in terms of (3.

adequacy of the project design , (3.2) project compliance with the recommendations of the first evaluation, (3.3) GOL/MOE compliance with the Project Agreement, (3.4) AED inputs and their relevant project goals, (3.5) AED progress to date against objective indicators, and (3.6) USAID management of the project.

3.1 Adequacy of Project Design

3.1.1 Goal

The goal of the BANFES project is to improve rural-based income, employment and quality of life through education. While this goal is still relevant, direct impact on rural income, employment, and quality of rural life will probably not be measurable within the life of the project. Many of the curriculum materials that will improve education are just now being field-tested and inservice teacher training activities are still being developed on a relatively small scale.

3.1.2 Purpose

The project purpose is supposed to address two major dimensions of the education problem, stated in the Project Paper as: 1) "making the best use of scarce financial and human resources through better management" (page 16, emphasis added); and 2) "increasing the effectiveness of the educational system" (page 16, again, emphasis added). Unfortunately, neither what constitutes "better management" nor an "effective" education system is clearly or independently defined. Indeed, each seems to be defined (rather vaguely) in terms of the other. For example:

> The progress that can be made in curriculum reform, in the improvement of instruction and in the extension of meaningful education to rural areas will rest ultimately on the management capability of the MOE (Project Paper, p.16, emphasis added); and
>
> Vigorous action toward curriculum reform, strengthening of the NTTC and establishing a viable rural skills program can serve as a catalyst to improve management practices and reform policies within the MOE (Project Paper, p. 16, emphasis added).

This lack of clear, independent definitions of basic project goals and dimensions (both in the body of Project Paper and in the Project Agreement) constitutes a serious problem.

Secondly, how will achievement of the project purpose be measured? The project logical framework does provide some verifiable indicators, but several of these appear to be rather unrealistic and inappropriate. For example, it is naive to think that, in five years, the project can measurably reduce dropout, failure and repetition rates, while population growth continues at 2.7% and pupil:teacher ratios worsen to 52:1. Poor indicators make it quite difficult to measure progress; new indicators must be developed, negotiated and included in project documentation.

3.1.3 Assumptions

There are two basic assumptions underlying the design of the BANFES project. They are:

1) that central MOE institutions have the capacity to fully utilize all project inputs to efficiently provide an effective educational system; and

2) that an umbrella project which combines "several interrelated components into one project strengthens the operational linkages necessary to direct institutional support for improvement of system performance" (Project Paper, page 15).

Assumption 1: The first assumption concerns MOE absorption capacity, the belief that the MOE had the capability to fully utilize and manage all of the extensive inputs provided by the BANFES project, although a primary subpurpose of the project is to improve MOE managerial capacity. In effect, this was putting the cart before the horse (especially in the case of the Thaba Tseka Skills Training Center). Sending critical MOE personnel for long-term training and expecting the MOE to provide qualified personnel for all BANFES technical advisors simply stretched the MOE too thin. The assumption that the MOE would supply counterparts for all technical advisors was unrealistic; its human and financial resources are not enough. More importantly, instability and high turnover within the MOE (four Ministers of Education and three Permanent Secretaries since the project began) has resulted in slow decision making and unclear MOE policies and procedures, particularly regarding staffing.

Assumption 2: The second assumption, that an umbrella project is the best approach, appears to hold somewhat for Components I-III, but not for Component IV (Thaba Tseka). In any case, it appears that combining all four components into one project has generated serious coordination and communication problems. Consider the following excerpt from a memo on "Communication and Focus" written by the BANFES Contractor COP to the evaluation team:

> BANFES was designed as a large project to do diverse things, albeit always addressing program reform and institutional efficiency. To some people, BANFES is teacher training improvement - to others, it is materials development - to others, it is better services to teachers - to still others, it is help with financial management, etc. etc. etc...too many people still do not know all of the goals or do not understand the relationship between a mini-project and a goal or goals. The problem is communication.

To be sure, the project has improved functional coordination between central MOE institutions, and this has improved "system performance." On the other hand, it is apparent that the linkages are not as strong as it was assumed they would be, particularly concerning the linkage (or lack thereof) between the Thaba Tseka Training Center and the other MOE institutions involved in BANFES. The lesson to be drawn is that umbrella-design projects are not easy to coordinate, although they can strengthen institutional linkages. Communication problems and artificial linkages can result if care is not taken during project design to ensure the compatibility of all components.

3.1.4 Summary

The BANFES Project design, as specified in the original Project Paper (1983) and

Project Contract, was reviewed in the light of three years of implementation experienc and the following conclusions were drawn:

1) The project goal remains relevant and valid, although measurable progres towards it is unlikely;
2) The basic terms of the project purpose are not clearly defined, either in the body o the Project Paper or in the Project Agreement;
3) Many of the purpose-level indicators in the Logical Framework are unrealistic anc inappropriate;
4) What was assumed to be a basic strength of the BANFES Project design (i.e. the combination of several interrelated components) has resulted in problems of communication, although some institutional linkages have been strengthened;
5) The capacity of central MOE institutions ability to absorb project inputs and improve the entire educational system was overestimated.

3.2 Compliance with First Evaluation Recommendations

The first formal evaluation of the BANFES Project was completed in October 1986. The final report found that the project was essentially on-track and that the design was valid. Major problems, however, were found with regards to recruiting Technical Advisors, the lack of continuity in the MOE, the change of government and the size and complexity of the project. Thirty-eight specific recommendations were reformulated into action plans (PIL No. 17) and formally agreed to by USAID, AED and the GOL/MOE. These recommendations, PIL No. 17 Action Plans and documented assessments of the current status (i.e. compliance) are reported by project component and cross-component in Tables 3.2.1 through 3.2.5 in Appendix A.

3.2.1 Overall Compliance

Overall, the data show moderately good compliance with the first evaluation recommendations. The recommendations "completed" tended to focus on management issues such as funding of the MOE-BANFES coordinator position (Rec. 9), agreements concerning financial reporting (Rec. 12) and strengthening cross-component management (Rec. 32).

Those in progress tended to focus on collaboration and training, e.g. collaboration issues such as involving the Inspectorate in the project (Rec. 10) and developing more cohesion among NCDC divisions (Rec's 18, 21, 22); and training issues ranging from assuring the availability of trained data processors (Rec. 6) through providing short-term workshops for top management (Rec. 7) to implementing cross-component training (Rec. 37).

Recommendations "not complete", on the other hand, focused on personnel and policy issues; e.g. personnel issues such as identifying a counterpart for the Curriculum Dissemination Technical Advisor (Rec. 23), seconding a counterpart for the Training and Staff Development Technical Advisor (Rec. 1b), and resolving the unfilled positions problem at NTTC (Rec. 27). Policy recommendations not completed include the development of a policy on broadcasting (Rec. 20), and developing a flexible governance structure at TSTC (Rec. 27).

3.2.2 Summary

Overall compliance with the 38 recommendations of the First Evaluation has been moderately good in that 28 (74%) of the recommendations have been or are being implemented. Of the 10 (26%) that have not been complied with, however, several are concerned with important personnel and policy issues; e.g. issues concerning unfilled counterpart positions to work with project Technical Advisors and policies needed to govern the Rural Skills Training Center at Thaba Tseka.

3.3 GOL/MOE Compliance with Project Agreement

In this subsection, the progress made by the GOL and MOE in meeting the terms and conditions set out in the Project Agreement will be assessed. Special consideration will be given to financial and in-kind contributions and GOL/MOE policies.

3.3.1 General Compliance

The GOL/MOE terms and conditions given in the Project Agreement are listed by component in Tables 3.3.1 through 3.3.4 (Appendix B) and include assessments of compliance and documentation references for each assessment. Generally, the MOE has met its commitments to the Project. The commitments not met require action on personnel and financial matters. Lack of action on these matters, however, affects the entire Project. This must be resolved at the top management level (Mission Director/Ministry) if the full potential of the project is to be realized.

3.3.2 Component Compliance

Component I. The only Project Agreement item not complied with in Component I (Strengthening MOE Management) is the one calling for a staff person to be seconded to the MOE Planning Unit (3.3.1).

Component II. Commitments have not been met on two of the three Project Agreement items concerning the NTTC. The first has to do with filling two positions, and the latter concerns a plan for specifying enrollment limitations (3.3.2).

Component III. Commitments have not been met on one of the five items in the "Curriculum and Instructional Materials Development" component, the agreement to provide agreed-to counterparts (3.3.3).

Component IV. Commitments have not been met on two of the seven Project Agreement items relating to the provision of rural skills training at Thaba Tseka; one having to do with the establishment of assistance fund procedures, and the other with the establishment of income-generating activities (3.3.4).

3.3.3 Financial and In-Kind Contributions

The data in Table 3.3.3 (Appendix C) summarize the financial and in-kind contributions made by the GOL to this USAID project. Note that the local contribution over the three-year period specified (1 July 1985 - 30 June 1988) is M 4,574,233.

3.3.4 GOL/MOE Policies

As noted in other sections of this report, there are policies which are clarified (or not clarified) by the MOE which directly impact on attainment of the project goals and objectives. It is also understood that the MOE is making efforts to resolve major issues through activities such as the Policy Clarification Seminar. Some of the major issues concerning project implementation and sustainability are the following:

1. The delay in providing MOE counterparts to work with the Technical Advisors has had a serious negative effect on the MOE goal of developing a trained staff at management level. Important positions which are affected by this delay include the MOE Training Coordinator and the NTTC Director of Academic Affairs and the Deputy Director/Financial Controller. A number of unfilled positions exist within MOE institutions which hinder the implementation of MOE training activities and the development, production and dissemination of materials.

2. There is a need for a policy to guide the IMRC in its efforts to support educational institutions in the production of media and materials. The lack of clear operating guidelines has resulted in confusion with respect to IMRC's responsibilities to NCDC, NTTC and other institutions. Thus, the primary role of IMRC is unclear. This issue must be addressed in order for IMRC to have a viable and creditable role in the MOE structure (see Component III, Technical Report for details).

3. A policy has not yet been established to guide the administration of the Rural Skills Training Center at Thaba Tseka. The lack of governance structure has resulted in minimal guidance and supervision of the program and staff at TSTC and has contributed to inefficient operation of the facility. Until the GOL/MOE formulates a policy to govern TSTC, the institution will be unable to function as prescribed by the project (see Component IV, Technical Report for details).

4. Policies need to be developed regarding inservice teacher training activities. Issues such as credit for courses and salary implications of teacher professional improvement must be resolved. While teachers have been enrolling in courses, programs and training activities without regard for credit, this should be addressed as part of the effort to develop a professionally responsible teacher corps for Lesotho.

3.4. AED: Inputs and Project Goals

In this subsection, BANFES Project input will be described in terms of dollars spent (Table 3.4.1a) and person years in Technical Advisors and training provided (Table 3.4.1b). Dollar expenditures will be compared to estimates from the original Project Paper and relevance to project goals will be examined.

3.4.1 AED Inputs

The data in Table 3.4.1a (Appendix D) indicate that total BANFES inputs since the project began amount to $8,601,794, which represents 144 person-years of technical assistance and training (Table 3.4.1b [Appendix D]). Long-term Technical Advisors are by far the largest expense, amounting to $5,285,500, or 66% of total expenditures. This represents approximately 48 person-years of technical assistance. The second largest input is long-term training in the U.S. ($1,657,500), which represents 40

person-years of training. Short-term Technical Advisors are next, amounting to $408,582 or 6.85 person-years, representing the fourth largest expense and over 49 person-years of training, or $7,519 per person-year, an impressively low figure. Commodities, vehicles and other logistical support expenses amount to $881,793.

By component, inputs for Component One (MOE) have been the greatest, amounting to $3,013,578 or 35% of all project expenditures. Component Two (NTTC) has had the second largest expenditure, $2,713,513 (32% of total project expenditures), while inputs for Component Three (NCDC/IMRC) total $1,889,118 (or 22% of total costs). In all three components, long-term technical assistance has been the greatest cost. Expenses for Component Four (TTSC) amount to $985,515, or just 12% of total project expenditures. While long-term technical assistance is again the primary expense in Component Four, it is short-term technical assistance which is the second largest cost.

Comparison with the original Project Paper estimates given in Table 3.4.1c (Appendix D) indicate that the total BANFES inputs of $8,601,794 amount to 33% of total life-of-project (LOP) funding. Component One has spent 42% of its estimated LOP funding, Component Two, 52%, Component Three, 27%, and Component Four, just 22% of its LOP funding. Looking at dollar inputs by major category, expenditures for short-term technical assistance amount to 17% of total LOP short-term technical assistance funds allotted. Long-term technical assistance amounts to 41%, training to 61% and logistical support to just 16%. With only two years of this six-year project left, it appears that the project is underspent.

This is primarily due to the approximate year delay in getting the project underway and to an increase in the value of the dollar versus their maloti. Nonetheless, at present rates of spending, and taking into account the year delay in getting started (i.e. assuming the project is just three years old, not four), there is enough money in the project to fund it for another five years. Some consideration should be given therefore for a no-cost extension of the Project Assistance Completion Date (PACD).

3.5 AED: Progress to Date

This section describes the progress achieved by the Contractor, AED, with respect to 50 selected indicators taken from the Contract and Contract Amendments, and representing the major requirements to be achieved by the project. Appendix E lists the indicators and the current status of each.

Of the 50 selected indicators, 50% are completed or in progress. Foremost among them is the establishment of the computerized information system for the Teacher Service Unit (TSU) within MOE (Component I), and the completion of the Primary Teacher Certificate Program (PTC) requiring all teachers to complete a course in agriculture/practical skills (Component II). Within Component III, the Primary School Leavers Examination has been designed, field tested and implemented and the National Dissemination Programme to disseminate curriculum and instructional materials to teachers has been established.

3.5.1 Progress In Component I

The contractor has completed several outputs, including the development of the Schemes of Service for all Divisions within the MOE and the implementation of a

computerized information system in the Teachers Service Unit.

A Personnel Training Coordinator has developed a comprehensive training data base which is used to monitor activities in terms of numbers and types and costs. There is a need for an overall training cost/effectiveness analysis which should result in a profile of successful training activities as measured by short and long-term results (behavioral changes in the classroom). There is also a need for a comprehensive plan for continuous and permanent training for MOE internal management personnel.

Several activities and programs are underway which focus on in-service teacher training. Within this Component are the incountry academic program (Evening College) and the Primary Inservice Education Program. Because both are relatively new, it is too early to determine effectiveness, but enrollments and interest indicate there is a definite need for these training programs.

The School Supply Unit has been formed, and a system for inventory and materials distribution has been designed and is soon to be implemented. The issue of delinquent fee collection has yet to be resolved. This is a major issue as it affects the financial capabilities of the revolving fund for purchasing texts.

3.5.2 Progress In Component II

The process of upgrading the NTTC teacher training program was extensive and had its beginning with an in-depth review of the academic and non-academic needs of the College. The NTTC staff, with the assistance of BANFES Technical Advisors, have developed a course instructing future teachers on how to teach Agriculture and Practical Skills within the academic curriculum. This resulted in the implementation of a plan that led to significant progress in the areas of 1) maximum use of staff; 2) appropriate training of staff; and 3) development of relevant course objectives, lesson plans and instructional materials. These changes will allow the College to respond to organization and academic issues in an efficient and effective manner during the remaining years of the project.

3.5.3 Progress In Component III

Output Ia: Basic Education

The scope of Basic Education in Standards 1 - 3 has been defined as Sesotho, English and maths.

Local curriculum developers at NCDC have expressed opinions that BANFES has been supportive and facilitative rather than directive with respect to local efforts at curriculum development. Curriculum products are viewed as developed by Basotho which indicates a high level of commitment and sustainability.

Major BANFES initiatives in Basic Education include such instruction programs/materials as Lesotho Radio Language Arts (an English program via radio currently being used in most Standard 1 classrooms and planned for expansion into Standards 2 and 3 by the end of the project); Breakthrough to Literacy (a Sesotho Language Arts program being pilot-tested in several Standard 1 classrooms);

Mahlaseli (a monthly reader written by primary students and distributed to eve: students in Standards 1 -3); and supplementary materials for English, maths, ar Sesotho.

Relatively little supplementary material for Basic Education has been developed t meet the need for independent learning materials in large multi-level classes. There a need for functional, practical criteria to be used in order to determine what curriculu materials need to be developed and to determine what materials are successful an appropriate for system-wide dissemination.

The radio English program has no systematic process for obtaining feedback fror classroom implementation, for monitoring teachers' use of the program, or fc providing greater teacher support for maximizing the potential of radio as an effectiv instructional tool.

Output 1b: Practical Skills

The practical skills curriculum within NCDC has developed and is pilot-testing 1 major curriculum activities.

During the first phase of the program, project staff addressed the issue of how practica skills were to be introduced into the primary curriculum. The process involved NCD(and NTTC in very lengthy and intensive research using the Action Research Surve: and resulted in a plan for the inclusion of practical skills into the content areas of: 1 arts and crafts, 2) agriculture, 3) small business, 4) social studies, 5) hom economics, and 6) health.

Development of major curriculum projects followed this planning phase. Project: included teachers' guides and manuals for arts and crafts, student text/manuals fo agriculture and small business, and support materials for agriculture, small business home economics and practical skills.

It is anticipated that these materials will be pilot-tested, revised, produced anc disseminated by the end of the project. This will, however, be a difficult task given the number of documents to be completed and the inservice training requirements tha should accompany dissemination.

Output 2: Revised Primary School Leavers' Exam

A major accomplishment of Output 2 has been the revision of the Primary School Leavers Exam (PSLE). The revision process included 1) obtaining key curriculum indicators from Basotho educators, 2) involving education officers and teachers in test item development, 3) reviewing test items for structure and congruence with the curriculum, and 4) pilot-testing to improve validity and reliability coefficients. In addition, a bank of recyclable items for continued PSLE revision is being developed.

A second examination to assess student achievement in relation to curricula objectives is currently being developed. The initial development relies on Basotho educators identifying key objectives for specific curriculum areas and Standards. Referred to as the Continuous Assessment Programme, this activity, like the PSLE, is on schedule.

Institutionalization of the CAP may be difficult because the only teacher training planned for its appropriate use will be via the National Dissemination Programme. This may not be adequate training to enable teachers to either use the CAP in the way it was intended or to understand the relationship of key indicators and testing. As with the PSLE, another issue is that, if key objectives for each subject and Standard are not known to the teachers, there will be little benefit to their administering the exams. Teachers must be provided with inservice training in using testing procedures to improve teaching.

Output 3: The Instructional Materials Resource Center

The Instructional Materials Resources Center (IMRC) has proven, through its cooperative efforts with NCDC in the development and implementation of the Lesotho Radio Language Arts Program, that it can support other educational institutions.

The IMRC, however, suffers from a shortage of personnel and a lack of policy clarifying its role. The lack of coordination between NCDC and IMRC pointed out in the first evaluation report has grown worse and the management relationship between the two institutions has not improved.

The IMRC currently is drifting towards being a second government printing office. The IMRC must be guided by MOE policy delineating the role it should play, and appropriate budget and personnel support must be provided.

Output 4: National Dissemination Program

A nation-wide system for disseminating educational materials as well as classroom and school management techniques has been established within the MOE. Titled the National Dissemination Programme (NDP), the system is based on a multiplier effect where one level inservices the next following a National Dissemination Workshop. According to the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Assistant, an MOE committee has agreed that the dissemination function should be located in the Inspectorate, specifically at the level of the Primary Education Officer. While this will not totally solve the problem of a lack of an MOE counterpart for the Dissemination Coordinator, it will place a higher-level emphasis on the task.

While the NDP is not problem-free, it does provide a framework in which improvements can be made. There are two areas especially in need of improvement. These are: 1) to make the NDP a two-way system in which communication can begin from bottom up as well as top down, and 2) to more closely tie dissemination procedures with better teaching methods.

Output 5: Non-Formal Education

The non-formal practical skills and basic education program did not receive major attention during the first half of the project. This was due primarily to the difficulty that was faced in determining how practical skills was to be incorporated into the curriculum.

Once this was determined, however, development activities concentrated on the basic

education program for the primary schools and the development of practical studies for the primary and junior secondary schools. Thus, a program for the non-formal setting was not developed.

Currently, a BANFES Technical Advisor is developing a program which will utilize the Action Research Survey Schools, the Lesotho Distance Teaching Centre, and materials developed within basic education and practical studies at the NTTC.

The primary issue at this time is the question of how much can be accomplished in the remaining months of the project. Capitalizing on already existing systems and materials will certainly enhance the chances of a program being developed before the end of the project.

3.5.4 Progress In Component IV

The findings of the evaluation of TSTC and its effectiveness in training Basotho in rural income-generating skills indicate that although a vocational training program has been in place since 1985, it has not met the outputs anticipated in the original project plan.

Since it began in 1985, TSTC has trained individuals in four vocational courses of study: 1) Leatherwork, 2) Textile Fabrication, 3) Building Construction, and 4) Basic Furniture-making. Given that a total of 130 students have completed the program in three years, it does not appear feasible that a total of 400 craftsworkers will have been trained by the end of the project in less than two more years.

These results can be partially attributed to the fact that the training program was developed simultaneous to training of students. In addition, the instructors hired were trained craftsworkers, but only one had had any teaching experience. Thus, during the first two years of the project, BANFES Technical Advisors assisted the instructional staff in developing the training program, and to the extent they were able, provided instructional training and advice. Although basic vocational training programs are in place, modular learning programs to provide a more independent learning approach have not been developed. Instructors have been assisted in basic curricula development but have had little training in instructional methods and class management skills. There has been little inservice training for administrators and support staff in business and remedial instruction except that which has been provided by BANFES Technical Advisors.

3.6 USAID Project Management

A comprehensive set of up-to-date project document files are easily accessed in the AID office.

3.6.1 Project Supervision/Monitoring (AID)

The USAID General Development Officer (Project Officer) is a member of the Project Management Committee and its sub-committee, the Project Work Group. The Project Work Group (PWG) serves as a project executive committee and its membership consists of the representatives of the Ministry of Education, the Contractor (COP), and USAID (Project Officer). The PWG meets weekly to discuss Project implementation,

personnel, budgetary and other matters; it is a primary source of information regarding the Project. Written reports and documents, such as the Project workplans and semi-annual Project implementation reports, are reviewed and commented upon as necessary. These and other Project data are kept in the unclassified Project files in the USAID Mission office.

The Project Officer makes scheduled and unscheduled visits to conferences, workshops, seminars and training sessions and institutions such as the NTTC and TSTC. These provide the opportunity to discuss the Project with a broad spectrum of people.

PROJECT OFFICER - MONITORING ACTIVITIES

ACTIVITY	SCHEDULED MEETINGS	ATTENDED
Executive Council Mtg.	2/yr	2
Consortium Mtg. (AED)	1/yr	2
Management Committee	monthly	8
PWG Meetings	weekly	43
Project Implementation Committee Mtgs.	ad hoc	2
Principals Sec. (MOE) mtgs.	ad hoc	4
BANFES briefings	ad hoc	19
Workshops	ad hoc	6
Participant orientation mtgs.	ad hoc	3
Site visits	ad hoc	13
Ceremonies	ad hoc	11
Meeting with persons with interest in Project/sales people, etc.	anytime	40

ne hiring of long-term personnel (Technical Advisors) and long term consultants is e responsibility of AED with the concurrence of the MOE. However, the Project ficer maintains a roster of personnel and other visitors to the Project and, as required AID regulations, secures official approval for the entry of consultants, visitors and ng-term personnel.

e Contractual obligations of both AED and MOE are monitored for adherence. rious questions, e.g. those that might result in a change in Project scope or the odification of a major project goal are brought to the attention of the Mission Director d the AID Project Implementation Committee.

eview of contractor documents, including contract amendments, indicate that there a few areas of mismatch, primarily around the use of personnel. For example, job

descriptions do not reflect current activities. It has also been noted in the Findings this report that the logframe does not adequately reflect realities of the project ar should be revised to include realistic project targets.

A complete set of project documents is on file in the USAID offices for which th Project Officer is responsible. These files include items such as the First Evaluatio the Project Implementation Letter (PIL 17), BANFES semi-annual reports,trainir plans, annual project workplans, contractual amendments, memos to th contractor/MOE, travel and concurrence reports, Project cables, monthly AE vouchers, monthly TSTC vouchers, monthly MAC's, meeting notes and minutes an other Project related materials.

3.6.2 Fiscal Monitoring Activities

The Project Officer is responsible for reviewing and accepting the monthly vouchers fc further review and forwarding for payment action. If there are questions related t specific allowable expenditures, they are discussed with the Mission Controller and/c Executive Officer (EXO), then with the contractor. In the case of Thaba Tseka Skil Training Center, the Project Officer reviews and accepts for processing the monthl payment vouchers. Procurement is monitored relative to the contractual agreement and USAID regulations; if there are concerns, they are referred to the EXO and/c Controller for resolution.

When questions arise, the Project Officer informs the COP and MOE of USAI regulations and procedures which might affect the Project after consulting wit appropriate Mission officers. These include matters such as those related to fisca reporting requirements, advertising for personnel requirements and procuremen practices.

It should be noted that the project fiscal reports to AID/Lesotho are generally severa months behind actual expenditures. The contractor sends reports to AED Washington where they are then put in AID format and forwarded to AID Washington, then they are forwarded to AID/Lesotho. Thus, it takes several months to return the reports tc Lesotho.

3.6.3 Recommendations

1. The end of project indicators and the verifiable indicators in the Logica Framework need to be modified in keeping with the current project directions anc activities. This is needed to provide both the Project Officer and the Contracts with benchmarks against which to check project progress throughout the remainder of the project.

2. The contractor should supply copies of the monthly expenditure reports directly tc the Project Officer in order to facilitate local AID project management.

3. The Project Officer should hold a series of scheduled Project reviews/presentations with the major project program in order to obtain an overview of project status. This should be done on a bi-annual basis.

4. Contracts should be updated to reflect current project activities and use of

personnel.

4.0 CONCLUSIONS

In this section, the conclusions of the report are given as answers to questions concerning Project Evaluation, Project Subpurposes and the Overall Project Purpose.

4.1 Project Evaluation

EQ-1 Will the Project's Summative and Formative Evaluation Plan enable managers to determine how well the project succeeded in its purposes and to measure ongoing progress towards subpurposes?

The project's summative evaluation plans do enable managers to assess progress in achievement of the project purpose and subpurposes. The evaluation plan in the project paper, while brief, calls for annual evaluations and states the general terms of the evaluations' objectives. For the first evaluation, to be conducted twelve months after the arrival of the Technical Assistance team, the evaluation was to determine if contract conditions and covenants had been met, the design was still valid, weaknesses existed in implementation plans or management to achieve outputs, and make recommendations for improving design and implementation.

Twenty-four months later, an in-depth external evaluation was called for to examine continued adequacy of project design, implementation of the first evaluation's recommendations, effectiveness of project management, progress towards achieving the project purpose and sub-purposes, and make recommendations for improving project management and implementation.

In terms of project monitoring, there are a wide variety of documents and activities which permit summative assessment of progress towards purpose. There is the contract with AED, the contractor's implementation plan, annual workplans submitted by each component, staffing plans, financial and commodity procurement plans, and project training plans. There is also extensive documentation of financial disbursements, Project Implementation Letters, and minutes of Project Work Group and Project Management Committee meetings available at the AID Mission. All of these materials enable the project managers at AID, AED, and the MOE to measure ongoing progress towards achieving the project purpose.

Clearly, the summative evaluation plan does enable managers to determine project progress. However, it is important to point out that it will be much more difficult to measure project success because many of the purpose-level end-of-project-status indicators are either unrealistic or no longer relevant.

Formative evaluation, though not as well documented as the summative evaluation efforts, began in the early stages of the project, particularly in the area of curriculum development. In designing the basic education and practical skills curriculum, the Technical Advisors and their counterparts sought information from the school through the Action Research Survey. This process provided the bulk of the formative data on what existed at the school level and what parents, teachers, and school administrators felt was most needed. This process of interacting with the schools through gathering

specific information about "what works" has been continued through pilot-testing c many activities, i.e., Breakthrough to Literacy and many of the practical skil materials. Currently, these Action Research Schools are also being utilized as "seec schools, where more intensive interaction is going on with the teachers and masters i the area of community participation.

EQ-2 To what extent have the recommendations of the first evaluation been acte upon, and what were the effects of such action or failure to act?

As indicated in the Finding Section, 3.2.1, interviews, document reviews, anc observation data show moderately good overall compliance with the first evaluatior recommendations, i.e., 28 of the 38 recommendations were either completed or are ir progress.

The major effects of compliance resulted in 1) the settling of various managemen issues having to do with financial reporting, Technical Advisor assignments, and a new MOE-BANFES coordinator position; 2) increasing collaboration with the Inspectorate and within the NCDC; and 3) increasing cross-component training including the training of selected positions from data processors to top management.

The major effects of failure to act on the first evaluation recommendations resulted ir the lack of counterparts and other MOE positions, thus threatening both the impact anc sustainability of the project activities. This was especially true for positions ir Component I (the training and staff development counterpart), Component II (the financial controller counterpart) and Component III (the curriculum disseminatior counterpart).

4.2 Project Subpurposes

EQ-3 To what extent has the managerial efficiency of the Ministry of Educatior (MOE) been strengthened? (Subpurpose 1).

The Project has been assisting the Ministry to efficiently address and implemen programs to meet some of its most critical needs and problems. Areas such as improving MOE staff training, materials distribution, evaluation and testing, anc information system development are being addressed. Ministry personnel are receiving training through short-term in-country training activities and through long-term overseas training programs. The people who have returned from overseas training are functioning in leadership positions within the Ministry, and it is anticipatec that the management structure will be further strengthened with the return of those presently overseas.

The development of the "Schemes of Service" was a major effort which involved all o the Ministry divisions. During this process development, participants took an active part in analyzing their division, its goals and objectives, its organizational structure, the roles of each position within the division and the relationships of that division with others. It was noted by Ministry personnel that this activity has contributed to their understanding of organizations and how they function and has assisted them in their managerial activities. The "schemes" are an important tool for making management more efficient.

The Policy Clarification Seminar has been another major step in the implementation of efficient management strategies by the MOE. The first conference was held in September 1987, and a second conference is to be scheduled shortly. This forum provides an opportunity for the management to work through policies and issues which have been hindering their activities and increase progress toward the achievement of effective management of the MOE and its institutions.

The computerized information system has assisted the Planning Unit in developing standard formats for tables and charts for the annual report. This resulted in decreased data collection and layout time. Data entry and quality control procedures are in place for primary and secondary school data entry with source files marked where annual changes need to be entered. Statistics can be quickly returned from the central data processing center. This is important in meeting immediate and short-term planning and data needs. The PSLE scoring, analysis and report is handled quickly and efficiently through the Planning Unit and is distributed on a timely basis. The TSU has improved the accuracy of teacher personnel data, and this will enable payroll to be produced more accurately and reflect changes more rapidly.

While many positive activities are taking place, one factor limits the improvement in efficiency. The lack of trained personnel at the technical support level, e.g., computer operators, system designers, programmers and computer technicians. Long-term impact and sustainability will be a question of commitment on the part of the MOE to provide financing for equipment operation and maintenance and operations personnel. One of the major factors impeding development of efficiency has been the high turnover in the top management levels. A change generally causes a period of inactivity and adjustments which affects personnel productivity.

The training of support staff in areas such as typing, secretarial word processing, clerical skills, time management and computer operations has had a strengthening effect on the managerial efficiency of the MOE. This impact could be measured in a variety of ways and should be done as part of the end of the project evaluation.

EQ-4 To what extent has the National Teacher Training College (NTTC) been strengthened? (Subpurpose 2)

NTTC has been strengthened by the BANFES resources and the leadership of the new Director over the past two years. This is building the capacity to respond to organizational and academic issues in an efficient and effective manner.

Clarification of the important issues to strengthen NTTC is necessary, however, to determine the extent of institutional change still needed. The first dimension in strengthening the institution is to increase management's capacity to assess and improve itself. In its review, NTTC personnel identified the difficult problems of low staff morale, lack of a financial system, the need for clarity of roles and responsibilities of administration and staff, and lack of course curriculum as basic problems. Certain solutions have been implemented which have had important benefits.

The College is focusing on the upgrading of the academic program in all departments and is establishing course objectives for each course to assure that the College is clear on what is to be covered in each area. With assistance from the BANFES Technical Advisors, the primary education curriculum has been developed, and the

BANFES Technical Advisors and financial management specialists have assisted the College in streamlining their basic administrative operations and forecasting future needs and demands on the institution. Individuals who have received long-term training under the auspices of BANFES have returned and are assuming leadership roles in key areas (i.e., inservice training), and short-term consultants have provided assistance assessing and formulating recommendations in areas needing redirection (i.e., internships).

In spite of an increase in NTTC's capacity to function efficiently and effectively, the following issues need to be addressed in the future: 1) unfilled posts of the Deputy Director/Financial Controller and Deputy Director/Academic Affairs to ensure the sustainability of successful efforts; 2) curriculum efforts to increase the quality of NTTC graduates in the Lesotho classrooms; and 3) feedback mechanisms to ensure tutors model the primary methods and strategies in the classroom.

EQ-5 To what extent has the capability of the NCDC and the IMRC to develop and disseminate relevant and effective instructional materials been improved? (Subpurpose 3)

While the primary school curriculum has become more relevant with the inclusion of practical skills and greater emphasis placed on lower primary basic education, effectiveness is currently only a potential result of the curriculum activities supported by BANFES.

To be more specific, the extent to which capability to develop and disseminate effective, relevant instructional materials has been reached is, for the purpose of this study, determined firstly by assessing the extent to which instructional materials have, in fact, been developed and disseminated. The Technical Report on Component III, Output 1 lists the kinds and amounts of curriculum and instructional materials developed with the assistance of the BANFES project. The report also indicates what instructional materials have been disseminated through the system. Clearly, instructional materials have been developed and disseminated.

Secondly, the capability aspect of this subpurpose question must be addressed by determining to what extent the project has facilitated and assisted (and, as a result, trained) local curriculum developers in the process of developing and disseminating curriculum. It is important, therefore, to state that the Lesotho curriculum developers at NCDC perceive the Technical Advisors as being facilitative, and that the local curriculum staff clearly have a feeling of ownership with regard to the instructional materials developed with BANFES assistance. This attitude could only come about if the BANFES staff at NCDC were clearly working through the local curriculum staff and thereby strengthening their capability.

Dissemination system ownership is not quite as clear because the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Advisor does not have an MOE counterpart, an issue which the MOE Principal Education Officer is currently addressing. Other than the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Advisor, however, the entire National Dissemination Programme (NDP) has established linkages throughout the dissemination network, thereby strengthening the capability for local educators to sustain the system. To what extent the curriculum is effective is more difficult to assess. There exists no data to

allow one to conclude that the curriculum materials have been effective. In th absence of such data, functional criteria for determining the potential effectiveness c curriculum materials must be developed and used. Furthermore, it is essential that th criteria not be so exhaustive and time-consuming to apply that they becom impediments to the development of instructional materials.

When the need for effective instructional materials in the lower primary classroon (where untrained and undertrained teachers are likely to have multi-level classes of 8(to 100 or more students) is so great, it would seem that a critical capability/need is the streamlining of the curriculum development process so that the need foı teacher-independent learning materials is at least partially met.

As with curriculum development, the extent to which the dissemination system is effective is also difficult to determine. An evaluation of the NDP was conducted after the system was first implemented. That study (D.2.31) concluded that the dissemination system was effective. However, conversations with teachers in the field, as well as with NTTC faculty, indicate that (1) not all target recipients have received the instructional materials disseminated via the system, and (2) not all those who have received the materials know how to use them. There is an obvious need for continued monitoring of the system itself, as well as of the classroom teachers who are the ultimate beneficiaries of the system in order to obtain feedback on the effectiveness of the NDP and in order to improve its capability to train teachers to adequately use new instructional materials.

The IMRC was designed to assist developers and disseminators by providing advice about the most appropriate kind of media to use for various types of instructional materials and by producing and testing prototypes. Unfortunately, the role of IMRC is not clearly established at present and therefore its integration into the development/production/dissemination system has not taken place, except for the highly successful activities leading to production of the audio tapes for the Lesotho Radio Language Arts Program.

EQ-6 To what extent have Agriculture and Practical Skills curriculum materials for primary and junior secondary schools been developed and disseminated? (Subpurpose 4)

The initial effort to develop primary and junior secondary curriculum materials in agriculture and practical skills were delayed considerably, due to the lack of clear guidelines on what specific content should be covered within the area of practical skills. Once this question was resolved, however, the practical skills team members from NCDC and NTTC were able to design and develop twelve major curriculum activities in the areas of arts and crafts, agriculture, home economic, small business, social studies and practical studies.

At NTTC, the emphasis on practical skills has been in the areas of home economics and health and the revision of course content to include practical skills. In addition, the Technical Advisor has assisted the instructors in the development of instructional materials and lesson plans to accompany the revised syllabi.

Final dissemination of the bulk of the practical skills materials has not begun. The majority of materials are in draft and pilot-test stage, with expected completion of most

materials by late 1988 or early 1989. This time schedule poses the major concern fc the dissemination of materials, since it means that the majority of materials must b disseminated to schools throughout the country between mid-1989 and the end of th project, March 1990. Dissemination may be difficult to accomplish through the ND since materials from other project activities will also be ready for distribution.

A further concern is the need for adequate inservice training for teachers. Althoug certain materials are self-explanatory (The Garden Wall Chart), maximum utilization c the materials will only occur through inservice training. Limitations on staff and tim may limit comprehensive inservice training.

EQ-7 To what extent has a relevant, educationally sound Testing and Examinatio System been developed and institutionalized? (Subpurpose 5)

Efforts to improve the testing and examination structure have focused on th development and improvement of two examinations. One is the Primary Schoc Leavers Exam (PSLE), and the other is referred to as the Continuous Assessmer Programme (CAP)

PSLE: The PSLE is administered to all Standard 7 students and is an integral part c the Lesotho educational system. To improve the PSLE, the Testing and Evaluatio Section is 1) increasing the validity and reliability of the exam and 2) developing a item bank so that the PSLE can be continually revised.

To accomplish these tasks, an eight-step developmental process was initiated t accomplish such things as 1) obtaining key curriculum objectives from curriculu specialists, 2) involving education officers and teachers in test item development, 3 reviewing test items, for structure and congruence with the curriculum and 4) fie testing for double the number of items required, in order to drop items lacking goc statistics. Functional pilot testing with stratified random sampling followed. As a resul reliability coefficients are currently at .8 and above for all but the Sesotho divisior Validity tests are also positive, but a small evaluation project is currently bein conducted to assure that test items reflect the instruction provided in the classroom.

In addition, a PSLE item bank, which will include approximately 400 items per subjec is being developed. The item bank will provide recyclable items which can be used fc continual revision of the PSLE.

The PSLE is based on key objectives identified by Basotho educators, is valid an reliable and is an integral part of the education system. One pertinent issue remain: Teachers do not know which of the objectives in each subject syllabus are thos identified as key indicators. This information must be made known.

CAP: The purpose of the CAP is to provide teachers with instruments to diagnose an evaluate student achievement, to validate teacher judgment concernin promotion/retention decisions, and to facilitate an ongoing classroom managemei system related to student mastery of minimum competencies. The CAP is in th developmental stage and cannot be evaluated for its relevance and soundness excep in general terms.

As with the PSLE, CAP development is beginning with input from Basotho educators who are identifying key objectives for their respective areas. Even with this involvement, institutionalizing the CAP may be difficult as the only teacher training planned for appropriate use will be via the National Dissemination Programme. This may not be adequate training to enable teachers to either use the CAP in the way it was intended or to understand the relationship of key indicators and testing. As with the PSLE, another difficulty in institutionalizing the CAP is that if key objectives for each subject and Standard are not known to the teachers, there will be little benefit to their administering the exam. Teachers must be provided a list of key indicators for each Standard and subject area.

EQ-8 To what extent have expanded opportunities for rural skills training been provided? (Subpurpose 6)

The major purpose to be accomplished through the establishment of the RSTC was to provide a well-equipped training center in the Thaba Tseka region which could train 100 Basotho annually in rural income-generating skills. The Rural Skills Training Center (RSTC) offers a vocational training program in five areas: 1) Textile Fabrication, 2) Leatherwork, 3) Building Construction/Masonry, 4) Basic Furniture-making, and 5) Metal Lathe. Instructional support is also provided through courses in business skills and remedial instruction. There are a total of ten professional staff: two administrators and eight instructors. Currently 29 students are enrolled in four of the five programs. To date, 130 students have been enrolled in courses at RSTC, and 99 have completed at least one course.

Thaba Tseka has expanded the opportunities for rural training in the region through the courses of study offered at the Center. It has not, however, been able to attain the purposes of the project, as outlined in the Project Paper, which were to produce 100 trained craftsworkers each year, with a total of 400 trained during the life of the project. The original project intent also called for the development of a modular study approach, which would allow flexible scheduling and instruction, and thus serve a greater number of students. This has not occurred, and courses have been developed on an incremental basis. Thus, a more rigid, teacher-centered instructional approach limits the number of students the Center can presently serve.

In addition, support programs for students including an "earn as you learn" program and a "start-up loan" program for students who have completed training have not been instituted. Further information is also needed on students who have completed a course of study at RSTC to determine how the program is achieving its purpose in assisting individuals in expanding their opportunities for employment.

4.3 Project Overall Purpose

EQ-9 To what extent has the project met its overall goals/purposes; i.e. has there been improvement in the capacity to efficiently provide effective education that is relevant to Lesotho's development needs?

Has there been improvement? The answer is yes. The extent to which there has been improvement requires an analysis of key words in the purpose statement: capacity, efficiency, effectiveness and relevance.

Relevance. A relevant education is defined as one which provides basic literacy, numeracy, and practical skills so that a learner will be more productive, enjoy a higher quality of life, and have a higher income. (D-1.01, p. 16)

The evaluation team has concluded that the greatest improvement has been made in terms of relevance. It is no small accomplishment that a major shift in MOE priorities has taken place in the last three years, with appreciably more emphasis being given to primary education. Taking up the mandate of the Basotho people through the education pitsos, BANFES has assisted NTTC in improving the teacher training curriculum so that it focuses more directly on the basic and practical skills needed by primary school children; it has assisted NCDC in designing, producing, and disseminating curricula to meet those needs; and it has provided technical assistance in improving the Primary School Leavers Exam (PSLE), which now includes questions on practical skills, thereby making it more relevant. The one area which the project has not addressed fully is its original intent to support non-formal education. Developments in basic education and practical skills have taken precedence during the last two years of the project. A Technical Advisor has recently begun designing the non-formal education program for implementation during the final phase of the project.

Efficiency. An efficiently managed education system is one which makes the best use of scarce financial and human resources. (D-1.01, p. 16)

While the final test of primary school management efficiency may be the average amount of time and money required to complete Standards 1 - 7, it is felt that the project could not, in all fairness, be measured by this criterion. The BANFES project could very well increase the operating efficiency and effectiveness of all the institutions it is assisting without decreasing the time required to complete primary school. Several factors beyond the reach of this project, such as the worsening student-teacher ratio and severe shortages of basic instructional materials (paper, pencils, books, etc) have strong offsetting effects. It was therefore decided to assess the improvements in efficiency of the MOE institutions themselves.

Less has been accomplished by the project in terms of efficiency than in terms of relevance. Definite progress, however, has been made. Problems and needs have been identified; responsible persons have met to address these problems; decisions have been made and actions have been taken. Other major accomplishments include an improved personnel system which has resulted in MOE staff having job descriptions, being properly placed on the salary scale and receiving more accurate and timely pay checks. Considerably more efficiency is needed, however, so that decision-making ultimately results in a more effective instructional system. The decision-making that affects learning (e. g., how to deal with the worsening pupil-teacher ratio, etc.) must be streamlined. Each year that passes without dramatic improvement in classroom instruction results in the loss of literally tens of thousands of students who drop out of school or who waste time and resources by repeating a standard.

Effectiveness. Education is effective to the extent that student learning improves nation-wide. It is in this area that the project has accomplished least. No evidence was found to show that student achievement has improved. Knowledge and skills acquired by teacher trainers and curriculum developers through the massive training program mounted by the project, however, show promising potential for making

primary school instruction more effective. The numerous relevant instructional materials currently being developed, pilot-tested, and disseminated are indicators of this potential. Especially heartening is the recently added emphasis on in-service teacher training to be directed at lower primary teachers in the schools.

Capacity-sustainability

Finally, it must be added that efficient implementation of the recommendations contained in this evaluation, together with the actions evident in the project work plans (also efficiently managed) should result in considerably more progress over the next two years than has been the case to date.

Capacity: Perhaps the most important word in the purpose statement is "capacity". The term "capacity" encompasses the criteria of effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability. However, because the first two criteria have already been addressed, the team restricted its discussion to sustainability. Sustainability implies that the improvements made in the educational system during the life of the BANFES project can be maintained by the MOE. While the project has gone far to address the issue of sustainability, the evaluation team feels it is not yet evident the project will continue to have a significant and enduring impact on the educational system after it ends.

To assess the project's sustainability, the team looked at several factors: MOE and GOL institutional capacity and commitment; the provision of counterparts for BANFES technical advisors; the attitudes and support of the educational community at large; and the estimated costs of maintaining all the vehicles, computers, office equipment, buildings, and other commodities provided by the project.

On a positive note, there are several project initiatives and MOE policy decisions which bode well for the project's sustainability. First, the team was very encouraged to see the MOE meeting and discussing ways to institutionalize the National Dissemination Programme. This is a critical link in the development and dissemination of new instructional materials and in the provision of much-needed inservice teacher training. The lack of a counterpart for the Dissemination Advisor has seriously jeopardized the program's continuity, and so the MOE's movement in this area is especially important.

Second, it was the sense of the team that the materials developed at the NCDC were very much a product of the institution and not of the technical advisors. There was a sense of "ownership" which is extremely important if the NCDC is to continue in the development of high-quality basic education and practical skills curriculum.

Third, the increased training of the MOE Primary level teachers increases the project's sustainability. Such training should enable teachers to use instructional materials, manage their classrooms and improve their teaching skills long after the project ends. Another important development (and a significant policy level decision) regarding teachers is the restructuring of teacher salaries recently announced by the MOE. This should go a long ways towards increasing morale, reducing the incentive to enter the private sector and decreasing the migration of teachers to the homelands.

On the negative side, it is simply not apparent that the MOE will have the human and financial resources to sustain the BANFES project when it ends. Just servicing and

maintaining all the commodities provided by the project will require considerable recurrent cost expenditures. More importantly, the lack of counterparts for the BANFES technical advisors means that few MOE staff are receiving the on-the-job training they need in order to take over when the advisors leave. This is extremely important training, often more beneficial than formal overseas training and is directly relevant and applicable to MOE responsibilities.

Third, it is fair to say the MOE's commitment to the project has been hard to discern, especially in light of the high turnover of senior MOE personnel since the project began. This has obstructed decision-making, obscured lines of authority and impeded the implementation of the project. However, the evaluation team has been greatly encouraged by the remarks offered by the new Minister of Education. Through the National Educational Policy Clarification Seminar which should be held soon, it is hoped that many of these policy issues can be resolved.

The attitudes and support of the education community at large is another critical factor to the project's sustainability that is not yet being adequately addressed. There is simply not enough dialogue, consultation and coordination with the schools, the Churches and the Basotho people themselves, who can all be called "beneficiaries" of the BANFES project. It is unfair to think that the MOE can do it all by themselves; other actors in the educational system must be involved in implementing and sustaining the BANFES project. The lack of involvement of the Advisory Group to the Project Management Committee, which includes representatives from the larger educational community, is an example of this inadequate communication.

In sum, while good progress has been made concerning the sustainability of certain discrete project initiatives, much more needs to be done in all areas to ensure the enduring impact of the project. The potential is there. With a clear commitment from the MOE, provision of at least some key counterparts, improved information regarding the cost implications of sustaining the project and increased communication with the broader educational community, significant progress can be made in truly increasing MOE capacity to provide quality education.

EQ-10 To what extent has the Project identified "other" problems in the education sector? Should it address those problems?

There have been several "other" problems identified in the education sector during the course of this evaluation. These problems and whether or not BANFES should address these problems are discussed below.

1. Worsening Student:Teacher Ratios: The increasing school population in relation to the impact on pupil:teacher ratios and financial burdens on the GOL/MOE needs to be analyzed and addressed. While the government policy is to reduce teacher:pupil ratios in the lower standards, the rate is actually increasing. It has been suggested that if pre-schools or day-care centers were developed, this increase could be stemmed, particularly in the lowest standards. However, before the MOE can address this issue, the full dimensions of the problem must be examined and understood. The BANFES project should not directly address this issue, except by developing instructional materials which can be effectively used in classes of very large size. In addition, opportunities may arise through the natural course of project progress where BANFES

could consider this issue (e.g., as a management training exercise in problem-solving or in a research project of an evening college course).

2. Lack of Basic Supplies: There is an urgent need for basic educational materials and equipment, such as benches, writing surfaces, chalkboards, paper and pencils in most schools. How all of the new instructional materials developed by the project will be used effectively if students lack these basic supplies is not clear. It is the understanding of the evaluation team that student fees are at least partially for the procurement of supplies, so the lack of basic materials is puzzling. There needs to be a concerted effort on the part of the GOL/MOE to address this issue, working with the school managers, Churches, and communities. While this is not an area for the project to address directly, the reality of the school setting needs to be kept in mind when developing materials and activities for the classroom.

3. Shortage of Teachers: There is a shortage of primary level teachers, especially qualified ones, and the NTTC is not able to keep up with the demand. Currently, NTTC graduates approximately 156 students per year, and there is a need for 182 teachers per year, just to maintain student:teacher ratios. In addition, this figure does not include teachers needed to replace those teachers that leave for higher paying positions elsewhere (e.g. in the South African Homelands) or for other endeavors. BANFES cannot directly address this problem other than by providing inservice training for underqualified teachers and continuing its work at the NTTC.

4. Community Support: There is a need to build community support for the MOE, its programs and activities. This is necessary for the long-term sustainability of this and other programs which reach into the communities and schools. More specifically, there needs to be support and involvement of the school managers, as well as of the parents, if government-led programs are to be accepted, implemented and maintained.

The school manager is in a pivotal position. This person can assist in program implementation by facilitating the flow of information and materials, and ensuring that fees are collected and passed on to the central government and/or used for school operations, supplies and maintenance. Or this person can obstruct this process, largely dependent on whether or not s/he perceives MOE policies to be in his or her own interest. Clearly, it is vital to have the active support of this person. While the project has trained some school managers, the evaluation team feels much more could be done.

Regarding the involvement of parents and other community leaders, the Action Research Schools (ARS) have shown that parents do have an interest in the schools, although many of them are hesitant to get involved in what they see as the domain of the Church and Government. On the other hand, the ARS have shown that with parent involvement, meaningful changes in a school's physical condition, as well as in attitudes, can come quickly. The BANFES project is not addressing this problem directly on a large scale but is initiating small-level efforts through activities such as the ARS. It appears that BANFES could do more to resolve this problem.

5. MOE Turnover: The high turnover rate of senior level personnel at the MOE has had a disturbing impact on the management and staff of the MOE and on the educational system as a whole. Changes of this type have an unsettling effect as it

takes time to adjust to new people, new directions and new ways of doing thing: Every change causes disruption and potential loss of effectiveness in manageme: until lines of authority are reestablished, policies are clarified, and issues are resolve: Obviously, there is little BANFES can do to address this problem, but it must be kept i mind when considering the circumstances under which the project operates.

5.0 In this section, recommendations are provided in three categories: Projec Management, Cross-Component, and Component-Specific.

5.1 Project Management Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION No. 1

AID Management

Name: AID/GOL Policy Dialogue

Rationale: Based on the findings that the Project Work Group (PWG spends too much time trying to work through problems and/o around problems such as MOE staffing commitments and Thab Tseka governance which are policy issues but need to b resolved if the project is to be fully implemented; it i recommended that:

Recommendation: The AID Mission Director, Deputy Director,and Project Office play a larger role in raising policy level issues with appropriat personnel in the MOE (Minister, Permanent Secretary, etc.) an other key ministries. Policy level concerns need to be resolve without awaiting the regular bi-annual Executive Committe meeting. These issues, defined by the PWG, should be brough to the attention of the Minister of Education by the MO Coordinator. The AID Project Officer should bring such matter to the attention of the Mission Director.

RECOMMENDATION No. 2

AID Management

Name: Project Work Group Modification

Rationale: Based on the findings that the Project Work Group presently functions like a general project management team, addressing specific budget items, publication problems and implementation decisions which are internal project management matters; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The Project Work Group (PWG) function as a program/project review group for the PWG members (similar to a Board of Directors or Review Committee). The Group should be a forum to discuss questions of project focus, progress towards project purpose and prioritization of project activities. It should not be making lower-level implementation decisions.

RECOMMENDATION No. 3

AID Management

Name: AID Project Officer Monitoring

Rationale: Based on the findings that the AID Project Officer needs to play a larger role in ensuring project cohesion and focus, and that s/he needs monitoring information from sources other than central project management structures; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The AID Project Officer hold regularly scheduled program/project reviews with BANFES and MOE personnel. Each program (e.g. inservice teacher training, materials dissemination, practical skills instruction) should make a formal presentation of its activities, networking, progress towards meetings goals and outputs (especially cross-component objectives), and other concerns and problems. These meetings should be held on a biannual basis, on-site, so materials and other specific matters can be reviewed and discussed in context.

RECOMMENDATION No. 4

AID Management

Name: Increased AID Mission Communication

Rationale: Based on the findings that the AID Project Officer will soon be leaving; that so much information, history and understanding of the project reside in this person; and that no meaningful mechanism exists for transferring this knowledge (beyond the files); it is recommended that:

Recommendation: An additional AID person become familiar with the project and its activities. Within AID, the Project Implementation Committee should receive regular briefings from the Project Officer on major project developments, concerns and policy-level issues. This would allow a broader group of AID officers to understand the project and relate the experience gained from it to other projects. It would also allow present AID staff to assist in the briefing and orientation of the future Project Officer about the project.

RECOMMENDATION No. 5

MOE Management

Name: MOE/GOL Policy Dialogue
(See Recommendation No. 1)

RECOMMENDATION No. 6

MOE Management

Name: Increased MOE Communication with the Community

Rationale: Based on the findings that it is vital that the entire Basotho educational community be aware of and involved in MOE/BANFES activities if the project is to have a significant and enduring impact, and because consultation and dialogue are important tools in preventing problems and misunderstandings from arising because of lack of information on the part of the recipients (i.e. teachers, students); it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The MOE convene the Advisory Group to the Project Management Committee on a regular basis to keep the broad educational community involved and informed regarding project directions and activities.

RECOMMENDATION No. 7

AED Management

Name: Increased Administrative, Program, and Evaluation Support for BANFES Chief of Party

Rationale: Based on the findings that:
1) The project will be increasing the rate of project implementation (e.g. materials production, dissemination, teacher training) over the next two years;
2) It is critical for the Chief of Party to maintain the high quality of the relationships developed with the MOE, AID, and others;
3) The quality and cohesion of the materials and activities must be maintained;
4) It is important for project initiatives to be evaluated (on a

formative and summative basis); and
5) Cross-component programs be coordinated, and the contractor be able to handle the increasing administrative, fiscal, and administrative activities; and that because all these responsibilities are simply too much for the Chief of Party to handle, it is recommended that:

ation: The Chief of Party obtain additional management and support staff. This would minimally include an Administrative Officer to oversee administrative and fiscal matters, a Program Officer to ensure cross-component and program thrusts and an Evaluation Specialist to develop and implement formative and summative evaluations.

.2 Cross-Component Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION No. 1

---

ame: Project Coherence

ationale: Based on the findings that project coherence is an issue that must be addressed at several levels including:
1) Monitoring. On the first level, there is a need by all BANFES and MOE staff to analyze their own activities on a regular basis for internal purposes. (Note: This does not mean more reports and paper output, but a systematic process of self-assessment.) The process of "reality checking" is tied in with this, getting out into the schools (and out of Maseru) on a regular basis to see what learning conditions are really like. Project initiatives must be appropriate, realistic, and sensitive to local school conditions if they are to have an impact and be sustainable.
2) Planning. On the second level, there is a lack of integrated planning of the BANFES component activities with respect to the program thrusts and overall purpose of the project. The provisions for highlighting areas of collaboration and communication are not evident in the current workplan structure.
3) Formative Evaluation. On the third level, formative evaluation, there does not appear to be a plan for relating program thrusts to cross- and inter-component activities. It is difficult to see how the project will remain focused on achieving its project purpose without this. To be fair, the BANFES Evaluation Specialist has begun to address this issue and should be commended. However, because the lack of attention in this area in the past means more effort is required; it is recommended that:

Recommendations: 1. BANFES advisors and management, and MOE staff increase efforts to make on-site school visitations. Schools which are being pilot-tested and those which are not being directly touched by the project should be visited.

2. Workplans be structured in such a way that cross-component activities and relationships are clearly defined.

3. PERT charts be developed, including: information on project progress toward achieving goals and objectives; progress of program areas; timelines and milestones for outputs and program activities; and program personnel requirements. This can be used for planning and evaluation purposes.

RECOMMENDATION No. 2

Name: Sustainability

Rationale: Based on the findings that sustainability requires addressing several factors including: the MOE's institutional capacity and commitment to the project; the provision of trained personnel to replace BANFES Technical Advisors (see Counterparts below); the maintenance of all vehicles, office equipment, buildings, etc. provided by the project; and the attitudes of the community at large and their support for the project; it is recommended that:

Recommendations: 1. A highly qualified educational economist with extensive experience in recurrent cost financing be brought in to provide at least six months of short-term technical assistance. This person would: (a) examine the cost implications of sustaining the project's interventions, including prospects for partial cost-recovery of certain initiatives; (b) analyze MOE and GOL financial resources to determine the GOL's capacity for sustaining project interventions (using the recently completed World Bank review of Lesotho's public expenditures as a starting point); (c) apply different levels of MOE funding to describe a variety of scenarios for sustaining the project. This process would greatly assist the MOE and GOL in determining where their limited financial and human resources can have the most impact in sustaining the initiatives the BANFES project has undertaken.

2. The Advisory Group to the Project Management Committee become a functioning, constructive and active forum for the interchange of ideas and concerns regarding project activities. Although the Advisory Group exists on paper in BANFES

organizational charts, it does not function as intended, if at all. This Group should be reconvened at the earliest possible date by the MOE and should meet thereafter at regularly scheduled times. This is all the more urgent as the project reaches the stage of pilot-testing and disseminating its instructional materials.

RECOMMENDATION No. 3

Name: Provision of Counterparts

Rationale: Based on the findings that:
1) Lack of counterparts means BANFES Technical Advisors work independently, without the professional support and knowledge of Lesotho's educational system which they need, and that this significantly impedes project implementation and progress;
2)) Lack of counterparts means numerous invaluable on-the-job training opportunities are missed, and that such training is often much more beneficial to host-country staff than formal training received overseas or in workshops; and
3) Perhaps most importantly, that the lack of counterparts seriously threatens the project's sustainability, (If there is no one trained to take over the work of the BANFES Technical Advisor it is most unlikely the project will continue to make a significant impact on the educational system when it ends); it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The MOE and AID seriously and realistically address the counterpart issue. This is an important policy level problem that the AID Mission Director, Deputy Director, and Project Officer need to raise with appropriate GOL personnel in the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Finance, and the Ministry of Economic Planning, Manpower, and Development.

RECOMMENDATION No. 4

Name: Increased Teacher Support in Use of the New Curriculum Materials

Rationale: Based on the findings that once classroom teachers have received initial orientation in the use of new instructional materials as well as in the use of basic instructional materials such as textbooks and accompanying teacher's guides, there is insufficient support provided to improve their use of the instructional materials to ensure they are being used as was intended by the curriculum developer who originally designed the materials, the consequence is that expected and intended

performance results are not obtained. Therefore it is recommended that:

Recommendation: Additional inservice training in the use of new instructional materials beyond initial orientation through the NDP be provided. One means of doing so during the remaining life of the project would be to fund and assist in conducting demonstration-type intensive in-service workshops during the winter school break. At such workshops, NCDC curriculum developers themselves could set up demonstration-participatory teaching in classrooms at a centrally located training site in order to train cadres of teachers.

RECOMMENDATION No. 5

Name: Product versus Process

Rationale: Based on the findings that there has been an increased emphasis on products rather than process and that products do not have the longevity or impact that a process does; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: BANFES Technical Advisors and their MOE colleagues prioritize their proposed activities according to those most likely to have the most impact and longest lasting effects. Every possible effort should be made to include activities which will promote sustainability of the process long after the initial products are gone. For example, teaching Basotho educators how to organize classroom activities or how to manage several groups of students doing a variety of tasks will do far more for the education system than distributing manuals which are not properly used and eventually discarded.

RECOMMENDATION No. 6

Name: Cross-Component Networking

Rationale: Based on the findings that:

1) Many talented individuals - Basotho and expatriate - comprise the BANFES project and that these individuals are involved in a wide variety of activities resulting in situations in which portions of one person's activity duplicates another's or where an activity or portion thereof crosses over (or should) another person's activity (e.g. inservice teacher training);

2) These crossovers provide opportunities to integrate ideas and build on each other's strengths;

3) Currently these individuals have few opportunities to interact on a semi-formal basis to compare and contrast ideas and to avoid duplication of effort;
4) BANFES advisors are often so focused on their own component that they lose sight of other activities and of the overall project purpose which cause insufficient coordination and communication, with the result that the project is not as strong as it ought to be, it is recommended that:

Recommendation: A system of networking be implemented to encourage cross-component exchanges of ideas and activities. Such a system might include informal "brown bag meetings" in which participants take turns leading discussions of ideas or sharing proposed or newly developed materials. Such meetings should take place within components and across them, perhaps on a monthly basis. They could be convened by any BANFES advisor or MOE staff member.

RECOMMENDATION No. 7

Name: Personnel, Quantity and Type

Rationale: Based on the findings that personnel are the critical component in developing and implementing any successful project, especially one of this magnitude and complexity, and that it is important to have "the right person for the right job" it is recommended that:

Recommendation: 1. Both short-term and long-term technical advisors with extensive experience teaching in primary-level classrooms, preferably in developing countries, should be added to the project. These advisors should also be experienced in dissemination, teacher training, bilingual environments, and curriculum development. One long-term technical advisor is needed, and six short-term advisors are needed for six months each (on a staggered basis). To facilitate this, recruitment should be done by AED itself, and not through the Consortium universities. The emphasis on practical experience in bilingual settings and in primary-level classrooms, especially in developing countries, suggests that university personnel may be inappropriate.

2. The MOE make greater efforts to fill openings in a timely manner with appropriately trained personnel. For example, there are open positions in several institutions which have resulted in a reduced capacity to develop and produce instructional materials.

5.3 Component Specific Recommendations

RECOMMENDATION No. 1

Component I: Trained MOE Staff

Name: Teacher Training Activity Cost/Effectiveness Analysis

Rationale: Based on the findings that:
1) Teacher training activities should be designed and implemented with consideration of their financial burden as well as their effectiveness in reaching program goals and objectives;
2) Data need to be available on immediate and long-term effects of training strategies (including classroom impact) in order to determine and analyze the nature of successful training activities;
3) This data should then be used for planning future training activities in a cost-effective manner; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: A profile of successful training strategies be compiled by developing and implementing evaluation and data collection procedures of teacher training activities including a data base of information on the immediate and long-term impact of the various training processes and techniques as well as their cost effectiveness relative to project goals, objectives and outputs. This analysis should be used by the Training Committee and the Management Council in making decisions related to training activities.

RECOMMENDATION No. 2

Component I: Trained MOE Staff

Name: Advanced Degree Teacher Education Program

Rationale: Based on the findings that one of the major efforts is providing inservice training for teachers and upgrading teacher certification and that the only program providing the opportunity for advanced degrees is long-term overseas training and that financial considerations make the sustainability of this training questionable once the project concludes; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The development of a Lesotho-based training program that provides academic credit from a United States university at the upper level undergraduate and/or masters degree level in primary education and education leadership be reexamined.

RECOMMENDATION No. 3

Component I: Trained MOE Staff

Name: MOE Management Training Program Plan

Rationale: Based on the findings that while there have been a series of MOE management training activities, no comprehensive program plan for continuous and permanent training of management personnel exists; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: There be a comprehensive plan developed for continuous and permanent training for MOE internal management personnel. The plan should be based on an analysis of interests and needs as determined by MOE top management and staff personnel. It should include specific training targets, i.e. personnel management, organizational planning, as well as word processing and computer operations.

RECOMMENDATION No. 4

Component I: Trained MOE Staff

Name: School Supply Unit Materials Distribution and Teacher Training

Rationale: Based on the findings that the distribution of instructional materials without teacher training in effective utilization reduces the potential effectiveness and impact of the materials on the learner, it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The School Supply Unit work with the National Dissemination Programme and others such as NCDC, IMRC, and NTTC to provide teacher training programs in coordination with the distribution of textbooks and other instructional materials.

RECOMMENDATION No. 5

Component I: Trained MOE Staff

Name: Teacher Service Unit Facilities Utilization and Improvement.

Rationale: Based on the findings that the TSU is mandated to maintain current and accurate data regarding a variety of complex teacher payroll related matters and that this data need to be located in clean, secure facilities with adequate and proper storage capabilities and have trained personnel available; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The TSU facilities, operational, maintenance and personnel needs be analyzed and a plan be developed and implemented for meeting these needs.

RECOMMENDATION No. 6

Component II: Strengthening of the National Teacher Training College

Name: NTTC Staffing Agreement

Rationale: Based on the findings that U. S. AID contractual agreements require the grantee to establish, fill and finance the positions of a Deputy Director/Financial Controller, and a Director of Academic Affairs (Program Coordinator), at the National Teacher Training College; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The Government of Lesotho treat the staff agreement as a matter of urgency so that vacancies of 1) Deputy Director/Financial Controller, NTTC and 2) Director of Academic Programs NTTC, be filled by September 30, 1988. If the grant agreement stated above is not fulfilled, it is further recommended that the Mission Director include this issue in his discussions with the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Finance.

RECOMMENDATION No. 7

Component II: Strengthening of the National Teacher Training College

Name: NTTC Curriculum Revision

Rationale: Based on the findings that the NTTC curriculum needs to be better integrated to avoid duplication of course competencies and that the DACUM process has been successful in the NTTC departments in which it has been used; it is recommended that:

ecommendation: The project support the efforts of the NTTC faculty to revise the curriculum using the DACUM process.

RECOMMENDATION No. 8

---

omponent II: Strengthening of the National Teacher Training College

ame: Incorporate Primary Methods and Strategies into the NTTC Primary Teacher's Certification (PTC) Curriculum

:ationale: Based on the findings that the primary teachers in Lesotho classrooms must cope with instructional problems and constraints such as large classes, multi-age/ability levels, and lack of instructional materials; and that cross-curricula teaching methods and strategies are needed for the local educational setting; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The project support the revision of the NTTC PTC curriculum to emphasize teaching methods and strategies appropriate to the local educational setting. To accomplish this recommendation:

1) Research should be conducted to determine primary methods that work best in the Lesotho classrooms;

2) Tutors should make primary school visitations to improve their understanding of classroom teachers' needs;

3) Training should be provided tutors so that they can incorporate these methods and strategies throughout all departments.

RECOMMENDATION No. 9

Component II: Strengthening of the National Teacher Training College

Name: Incorporate Practical Skills into NTTC Curriculum

Rationale: Based on the findings that basic education and practical skills are the primary education needs and that practical skills will be incorporated into the PTC; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The project support the version of the PTC curriculum to incorporate practical skills by:

1) developing a plan for incorporating practical skills into PTC which aligns practical skills topics with specific departm course offerings;

2) developing two or three transportable practical skills which include teachers' guides and instructional materials (tc accomplished by April 1990). The teachers' guides sho include the objectives and related student competencies;

3) pilot-testing draft curriculum in consultation with Evaluation Specialist; and modifying as necessary.

RECOMMENDATION No. 10

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructio Materials

Name: Increase Potential Impact of Radio English Program

Rationale: Based on the findings that there is inadequate continuir systematic support for immediate improvement of classroc teachers' use of LRLA (Radio English Program) and that system-wide effective use offers the possibility of making significant impact upon Basic Education throughout Lesotho, it recommended that:

Recommendation: 1) A more systematic monitoring and feedback system of tl program be implemented (include the use of an observati form).

2) This information be used to determine the content of tl weekly inservice radio programs (part of which would t indicating language features that students are not adequate acquiring and describing ways classroom teachers could revi these language features during post-broadcast lessons).

3) The inservice radio programs be broadcast at a better tim than is currently the case.

4) At least one additional local staff person should be hired t facilitate the above.

5) Establish a series of intensive in-service training workshops t take place during the winter school break which would includ demonstration-participatory teaching with a classroom c students.

7) Hire one long-term consultant to coordinate the activities described above. Qualifications must include (a) training in ESL and (b) experience in primary classroom teaching, as well as knowledge and experience in the use of radio as an instructional medium.

RECOMMENDATION No. 11

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Increase the Development of Supplementary Learning Materials/Activities

Rationale: Based on the finding that there are numerous primary level classroom teachers with large, multi-level classes and that they have few, if any, supplementary independent learning materials; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: Considerably more effort be expended to design independent learning activities and/or to produce/adapt/purchase independent learning materials for basic education and that inhibitors to this activity be identified and eliminated or reduced. (Note: The concomitant requirement for training in the use of these materials and the implication this has for "overloading" the dissemination programme and inservice training must be addressed prior to initiation of activities leading to the development of such materials/training.)

RECOMMENDATION No. 12

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Instructional Materials Assessment

Rationale: Based on the finding that no formally-stated functional criteria exists for determining the types of supplementary materials/activities to be designed/produced/adapted/purchased and that the only means of determining the appropriateness/effectiveness of locally developed materials/activities is on the basis of relatively large-scale pilot-testing; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: A realistically functional and manageable set of criteria should

be developed for determining what type of supplementary materials/activities are needed, and that when small-scale trial and feedback activities in the classroom demonstrate the appropriateness/effectiveness of such supplementary materials/activities, they be disseminated on a system-wide basis.

RECOMMENDATION No. 13

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Breakthrough to Literacy Program Implementation

Rationale: Based on the finding that the Breakthrough to Literacy program is highly unlikely to be appropriate for system-wide dissemination due to requisite conditions regarding class size, basic supplies, writing areas, and an adequate number of independent learning materials; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: The significant potential for classes which meet necessary conditions for effectiveness not be reduced by attempting to disseminate/implement Breakthrough to Literacy system-wide until it is proven that it can be used in classes which do not meet such prerequisite conditions. This would require additional pilot-testing in classes which are not characteristic of the classes where BTL is currently being pilot-tested. Since it is doubtful that BTL would prove effective in large classes which lack basic supplies, it is furthermore recommended that the program be adapted to meet such conditions or that an alternative program be developed for such conditions.

RECOMMENDATION No. 14

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Clearinghouse for Instructional Materials

Rationale: Based on the conclusion that the two most potentially successful BANFES initiated/supported educational program interventions are the Lesotho Radio Language Arts and Breakthrough to Literacy, and on the fact that both are adaptations of successful instructional programs developed elsewhere in Africa; it is recommended that:

ecommendation: The BANFES project establish in-country clearinghouse procedures for the collection of information about successful basic education instructional programs, as well as supplementary materials, from sources worldwide and that information be channeled to the appropriate Technical Advisors and curriculum officers and that they channel potentially usable material to a teacher they may assist.

RECOMMENDATION No. 15

---

omponent III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

ame: Incorporate Practical Skills into Primary Education

ationale: Based on the findings that the development of Practical Skills curriculum has resulted in 12 major activities (including student texts, teacher guides, and instructional support materials) which are to be disseminated by the completion of the project; it is recommended that:

ecommendation: 1) A detailed analysis of the current production schedule of the major curriculum activities be undertaken to determine:

a) the realistic and adequate timeframes for the completion of field testing, revision, and production of the major activities now in process;

b) the capability of the project staff to revise and disseminate materials, and provide inservice training;

c) the adequacy of funding for the total package of Practical Skills materials now planned for final production; and,

d) the feasibility of the completion of all activities by the end of the project.

2) An analysis be made of the MOE's capability of sustaining the Practical Skills materials, including continued dissemination, inservice training and revision of materials after the completion of the project.

3) Action Research Schools be utilized as possible sites for more intensive and short-term field testing of materials and methods.

RECOMMENDATION No. 16

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Teacher Awareness of Syllabi Key Indicators

Rationale: Based on the findings that key indicators/competencies for each curriculum area are used as the basis for test item development for the Primary School Leavers Exam (PSLE) and the Continuous Assessment Programme (CAP); it is recommended that:

Recommendation: 1) Curriculum specialists group objectives in the syllabi as a) key indicators (minimum competencies) and b) secondary competencies. Minimum competencies should be limited to those objectives which could be attained in any school regardless of the facilities, materials, or equipment available. PSLE and CAP test items should then be weighted to emphasize key indicators.

2) Syllabi or an appropriate reference guide with key indicators delineated must be disseminated by subject specialists to all teachers.

RECOMMENDATION No. 17

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Inservice Training in the Use and Purpose of the Primary School Leaver Exam (PSLE) and the Continuous Assessment Programme (CAP)

Rationale: Based on the findings that teachers do not fully understand the relationship of key curriculum indicators to test items in the PSLE and CAP or how to interpret test results for diagnostic purposes of their students or for their own classroom/instructional management system related to student mastery of minimum competencies; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: Teachers be provided inservice training in test item analysis and test result interpretation, in the purpose and possible uses of the CAP and PSLE and the relationship of these tests to the key indicators/competencies identified by the curriculum specialists.

RECOMMENDATION No. 18

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: IMRC Policy Development

Rationale: Based on the findings that IMRC effectiveness revolves around the resolution of policy development including definitions of terminology, delineation of operational constraints, and provision of budget and personnel support; and that, as an integral output of Component III, BANFES needs a policy statement from the MOE regarding IMRC in order to determine what can be accomplished during the last two years of the project and to pave the way for sustainability; it is recommended that:

Recommendation: 1) The MOE delineate the role it wants the IMRC to play and then develop and enforce policy in that regard, including appropriate budget and personnel support. Two points in particular must be clarified: a) Should IMRC be limited to prototype production? If so, what level of production is considered "prototype?" b) Should IMRC materials production be limited to that which is used in the classroom? If so, what is considered "for classroom use?"

2) BANFES assist the MOE in its deliberations concerning the role of the IMRC by supporting a review of the following issues: a) services required of IMRC users and abilities of IMRC to respond, b) cost effectiveness of IMRC services, c) linkages IMRC has or should have with other GOL/MOE institutions, d) internal management of IMRC and staff training needs, e) appropriate staffing levels, f) policy development and enforcement.

3) BANFES investment in equipment, personnel, and supplies for the IMRC be limited until MOE has developed policy concerning its role. Should the MOE policy for IMRC not be in accordance with BANFES goals and objectives, contract agreements between U. S. AID and MOE may need adjustment.

RECOMMENDATION No. 19

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: Effectiveness of Dissemination Techniques for Teacher Inservice

Rationale: Based on the findings that the effectiveness of various dissemination techniques have not been evaluated in terms of 1) usefulness, 2) availability, and 3) input processes; it is recommended that:

Recommendation 1) The National Dissemination Programme (NDP) be evaluated for its ability to: a) obtain feedback from teachers on the effectiveness of the system, and b) serve as a link in the communications network with input from all users of the system.

2) Primary Education News (PEN) be reviewed for its usefulness to teachers in an informal process designed to allow them to provide input on concerns and issues.

3) Radio broadcast inservicing be monitored to determine: a) appropriateness of media, b) usefulness of content, c) desirable program duration, frequency of airing, and preferred day/hour scheduling.

RECOMMENDATION No. 20

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instruction Materials

Name: Inservice Training for Change Agents in the National Dissemination Programme

Rationale: Based on the findings that the National Dissemination Programme serves as a vehicle to model exemplary instructional methodology, it is recommended that:

Recommendation: Change agents in the National Dissemination Programme (those who serve as "linkers" in the multiplier effect) should be inserviced on workshop planning and teaching methodology so as to effectively model exemplary instructional techniques and effective classroom and materials management. Furthermore, one of the three days of the National Dissemination Workshop should be used to model the one-day workshop that change agents will be expected to do when they inservice the next group.

RECOMMENDATION: No. 21

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional

Materials

me: Designation of a Counterpart for the Dissemination Coordinator

tionale: Based on the findings that the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Advisor does not have an MOE counterpart; it is recommended that:

ecommendation: A counterpart for the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Advisor be identified as soon as possible to ensure the continuity of the National Dissemination Programme. If it is not feasible to employ a full-time counterpart, an existing MOE staff position job description should be rewritten to include dissemination responsibilities. This person should be working with the Dissemination Coordinator Technical Advisor for a minimum of two days per week for the remainder of the Project.

RECOMMENDATION No. 22

---

omponent III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

ame: Delivery of Practical Skills and Basic Education to Individuals in Non-formal Education Settings

Rationale: Based on the findings that the development of the non-formal education program has been delayed and development has just begun, it is recommended that:

Recommendation: 1) The Non-formal Technical Advisor identify realistic goals and timetables in order to complete all activities by the end of the project;

2) Project management identify and provide the necessary support system to enable the Technical Advisor to achieve these goals.

RECOMMENDATION No. 23

Component III: Developing and Disseminating Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Name: National Awareness Campaign Implemented for Practical Skills and Basic Education

Rationale: Based on the findings that a national awareness campaign is currently in process to inform the Basotho of the practical skills and basic education programs, it is recommended that:

Recommendation: To the extent possible, information about practical skills and basic education be prepared in both English and Sesotho.

RECOMMENDATION No. 24

Component IV: Rural Training Skills (RSTC)

Name: Thaba Tseka Rural Skills Training Center

Rationale: Based on the finding that:

1) A governance structure has not been established and implemented for TSTC, and there is no direct MOE supervision of TSTC administration and staff;

2) Student enrollments have declined since the inception of the program with no apparent justification; and

3) Specific program commitments of staff and administration have not been implemented (or have been only minimally implemented), including the:

a) Student Assistance Fund for the "earn as you learn" program and the "start-up loan" program for TSTC graduates,

b) Establishment of a Tuckshop for the primary purpose of marketing student products and selling supplies to graduates,

c) Implementation of a student follow-up program of TSTC graduates for the purpose of determining their success in attaining employment upon completion of training,

d) Establishment of a flexible schedule for the school which allows the school to function as proposed in the project,

e) Development of modular learning activities to provide for two years of training in at least five trade skill areas; and

f) Development and implementation of an inservice training program for instructors;

it is recommended that:

Recommendation: 1) A financial audit be undertaken of the Rural Skills Training

Centre at Thaba Tseka.

2) The results of this audit in conjunction with the review completed by the Evaluation Team (See Technical Report, Component 4) be utilized to determine the sustainability of this program/vocational training facility.

3) If it is determined by U. S. AID upon completion of this analysis that a) this component cannot be sustained and b) that it is unlikely to significantly contribute to achieving the project purpose, then USAID should consider phasing down this project component.

Table 3.2.1

COMPONENT I: Response to First Evaluation Recommendations

Recomendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	Reference
1. Establish full-time Training and Staff Development position	1 a) MOE/BANFES prepare position description requesting position by February 1, 1987	-Completed	I- 2.01 I- 2.03 D- 2.44
	b) MOE identify appropriate counterpart	-Mr. J. Lekhesa, on overseas training identified as potential candidate	I- 2.03
Second a professional staff in the meantime	c) Counterpart work with BANFES Training Coordinator	-Not yet done	I- 2.01, 2.03
	d) BANFES provide on-the-job training and short-term course work	-Not yet done	I- 2.01, 2.03
	e) BANFES fund position for two years	-Proposed	
	f) MOE fund thereafter	-N/A	
2. Replace Principle Personnel Officer leaving for Training with equally qualified individual	2 a) MOE seek authorization to replace	-Completed Mr. Lehana replaced Mr. Tsuinyane	D- 2.44
3. Develop plan to address need for trained computer systems operators and consider ways of recruiting, training, and retaining Nationals for key roles.	3 a) MOE/BANFES analyze situational identify critical areas	-Partially completed via "Schemes of Service" project	I- 2.02 D- 2.44 D- 3.12
	b) BANFES work with MOE to ensure training is provided for adequate back-up staff in critical posts	-In Progress	I- 2.01 I- 2.03
4. Improve MOE financial management Have NTTC financial TA work with other MOE institutions.	4 a) MOE/BANFES convene meeting of Dept. Heads and Senior Mgrs. to identify problems/ strategies	-There has been ODA Financial Advisor at MOE. It was decided not to involve BANFES until after his departure which just recently took place	I- 1.03 I- 2.02 I- 2.03 D- 2.44
		-Short-term assistance is being provided as requested by MOE	I- 2.24

APPENDIX H

Table 3,2,1

Component 1...

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	References
5. Conduct survey of constraints to books and supplies delivery.	5 a) MOE School Supply Unit Management Committee to be responsible for all aspects of distribution	-Completed	I- 2.07
	b) Detailed scope of work to be specified for BANFES School Supply Unit Advisor	-Completed	I- 2.07
6. Assure availability of trained data processors.	6 a) BANFES to provide training	-Ongoing	I- 2.02 I- 2.01 I- 2.04
7. Provide appropriate short-term workshops for MOE top management.	7 a) MOE/BANFES identify problem areas	-Ongoing.. beginning to utilize Schemes of Service	I- 2.01 I- 2.02 I- 2.03
	b) MOE/BANFES develop workplan by March 31, 1987	-Completed	D- 2.04
8. MOE and BANFES simplify and expedite approval of training activities:	8 a) MOE/BANFES identify problem areas and set out management improvement initiatives and related training	-Sessions held.. ongoing contract	I- 2.01 I- 2.02
-BANFES Training Office should expand its support to component	b) MOE/BANFES Collaboration on mgmt. improvement to include		
-Develop more cross-sectoral training.	-Schemes of service across MOE	-Completed	I- 2.02
-MOE and central project should resolve unfilled establish post problem.	-Systems upgrading at TSU	-In process	D- 3.12 I- 2.04
-Dialogue should be undertaken on retaining staff after overseas training filling vacancies on list acting on new post recommendations.	-Policy Clarification planning and conference	-Held	I- 2.03
	-Mgmt. training workshops on selected topics	-Ongoing	I- 2.02
	-Schemes of Service consulting for Church School Secretariats	-In process	I- 2.02

APPENDIX A

Table 3.2.1

Component I...

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	References
9. Ammend the Contract to clearly define modifications in Contract output required in light of current realities.	9 a) Project to fund a BANFES Coordinator to act on behalf of the PS and MOE	-Completed...Mr. T. appointed to Coordinator position	I- 2.01 D- 2.44
10. Involve Inspectorate staff in achievement of project purpose.	10 a) MOE's COE and PEO will meet with PWG and BANFES Training Coordinator to explore possibilities and recommend actions to MOE and BANFES	-Ongoing...Inspectorate is being involved in in-service training activities	D- 2.44 I- 2.01 I- 2.03
11. PWG discuss seminar on BANFES Project, its assumptions and approaches.	11 a) PWG to discuss...	-Policy Clarification Conference held	D- 3.13
		-Regular Project Mgmt. Meetings held	I- 2.01 I- 2.02 I- 3.08
		-Information pamphlets produced	D- 2.24
		-Video tape produced	I- 2.01 I- 2.10
		-Executive Council Meetings difficult to arrange (only 3 held as of this report)	I- 2.01 I- 1.03
12. USAID and GOL arrive at Agreement concerning frequency and level of detail for financial reporting.	12 a) USAID to provide quarterly financial reports to MOE Project Coordinator	-Ongoing	I- 1.03 I- 3.08
	b) MOE to provide quarterly GOL project contribution reports to USAID	-Ongoing	I- 1.03

APPENDIX A

Table 3.2.2

COMPONENT II: Response To First Evaluation Recommendations

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No 17	Current Status	REFERENCES
13. MOE and Central Project staff should resolve issue of established posts that remain unfilled; dialogue on related personnel issues.	13 a) MOE and Central Project staff should resolve issue of establishing posts that remain unfilled	-Not completed for NTTC. . .	D- 2.44 I- 3.07, 2.23
	b) Dialogue should be undertaken on filling other vacancies on established list	-Some vacancies advertised (little response)	see above
		-Register post has been filled	see above
		-BANFES agreed to fund some posts if MOE agrees to take after a period of time	see above
14. a) Role of Practical Skills Specialists should be clarified...	14 a) Under the Director, NTTC Academic Program Advisor practical Skills spec. Agr. Spec. will work to clarify rules...	-Completed... workable definition presented to PWG	D- 2.44 I- 2.13, 2.16, 3.07
		-Arrangements for implementing accepted	see above
b) Development of primary pedagogical techniques should be established.	b) NTTC staff/ BANFES TA's to develop techniques..	-Paper on Pract. Skills prepared by Curriculum Committee and accepted by Director/Board	see above
		-Primary Methodology Group established is developing implementation plan (due May 1988), DACUM task analysis work-	see above

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	Reference
15. Instructor training at NTTC should be carried out in primary/basic content and methods with emphasis on Lesotho classrooms.	15 b) Component II principals/ BANFES training coordinator to include strategy in work plans...	-NTTC tutor (provided training to MA level) is coordinating primary Methodology Group.	D- 2.44 I- 3.07, I- 2.15
		-Additional tutor being sent for training.	see above
		-Individualized primary school visitorship program has been developed and primary methodology is working on implementation plan.	D- 2.139
16. MOE should involve BANFES in organizational issues such as autonomy and the internship program so they can appropriately assist.	16 a) Joint report on Intership Program provided PS and PWG by June 1, 1987	ACCOMPLISHED	D- 3.13 I- 3.07, 2.15
	17 b) MOE expresses interest in going outside BANFES for help; issue be resolved by October 1987	ACCOMPLISHED	D- 4.03 I- 3.07, 2.15
17. BANFES project administrator should review BANFES work assignment of Component II TA's and revise workplans if necessary.	18. NTTC Director and Component Coordinators to submit revised workplan to PWG by May 1, 1987 BANFES will act on recommendation of PWG	-Workplans drawn up	I- 1.03 D- 2.44 2.08
		-Plan for "Seed Schools" being developed (timeline change)	D- 2.06
		-Identification of "case schools" completed.	D- 2.06
		-List of equip. and commodities for seed schools developed.	D- 2.44

COMPONENT III: Table 3.2.3
Response To First Evaluation Recommendations

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17		Current Status	References
18. Encourage a more collaborative approach among NCDC divisions. (Presently subject matter oriented rather than child centered and inefficient.)	19	PEO and NCDC Director/BANFES staff submit plan to PS and PWG by February 28, 1987	-Not accomplished but plans are to reactivate Curriculum Coordinating Committee: Cross Curriculum Coordinating Coordinating Committee and Curricula Dissemination Coordination Committee are active, which results in some cross curriculum approach.	D- 2.44
19a) Clarify role IMRC and NCDC should play in facilitating improved learning opportunities.	20	Plan presented to PS and PWG by Feb. 28, 1987 by Director of NCDC, Dir. of IMRC, the SEO, and the PEO assisted by BANFES staff.	Administrative Structure revised: NCDC and IMRC to have a coordinator each who will both report to a single director.	I- 2.10 I- 3.04
b) Resolve management problems in the two institutions.				
c) Resolve coordination problems among inspectorate, NCDC and IMRC.				
20. Develop policy regarding broadcasting in order to facilitate maximum use.	21a)	PEO assisted by BANFES staff be responsible for developing an an MOE policy and submitting it it to PS and PWG by Oct. 1987.	-Not accomplished	I- 2.10 I- 3.08 D- 2.44
21. More collaboration needed at NCDC.	22	See Recommendation 13.		
22. Some divisions not collaborating on dissemination activity.	23	See Recommendation 13.		
23. Identify a counterpart for the the Curriculum Dissemination TA as soon as possible.	24	PS will ensure that a curriculum dissemination counterpart is designated by Feb. 1987.	-In process	I- 2.14

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	References
25a) MOE assisted by BANFES staff should review/clarify tasks relative to practical skills and basic education goals...	25a) MOE committee established by PS.. will plan: how practical skills will be introduced; how to ensure basic education is available to primary age cohort.	-Accomplished	D- 3.11
b) TA and other resource allocation should be reviewed and adjusted as needed.	b) Committee will determine target groups for practical skills instruction and how promoted whether to address through NCDC and IMRC and/or outside resources; and identify/agree on policy questions.	-Accomplished	D- 3.11
	c) Committee will: determine target group for basic education; determine definition of basic education, decide on extent to which basic education effort described in BANFES Grant Agreement is still valid; and if necessary, recommend, changes; determine if development and dissemination of basic education material can be addressed entirely through NCDC and IMRC ...etc.	-Accomplished	D- 3.11
	d) Plans to be incorporated into the workplan of components II and III	-Accomplished	D- 2.88 D- 2.30
26. Component II and III principals and the BANFES Training Coordinator should work together to plan for, identify and publicize local opportunities.	26a) Directors of MOE Institute and Component Coordinators will assist BANFES training Coordinator in preparing and implementing cross-sector training plans..	-Not accomplished, but several in-country training opportunities have been developed and carried out.	D- 2.44
	b) The cross-sector training plans will be presented to the Project Training Committee by June 1, 1987.	-Accomplished	I- 2.03 D- 2.130

APPENDIX A

Table 3.2.4

COMPONENT IV: Response to First Evaluation Recommendations

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	References
27. TSTC needs flexible governance structure.	27 Director of TSTC and the BANFES COP will submit a proposal for the governance structure to PS by PS by June 1, 1987	-TSTC staff submitted recommendations to COP.	I- 3.08, 1.03 I- 2.22, 2.02 I- 3.12
		-COP in consultation with PS and PWG agreed to have BAFFOE Associates do a study.	I- 2.02 I- 3.12
		-BAFFOE Associates submitted report to MOE, May 1987.	I- 3.08
28. GOL should develop policy on funding for the Center's personnel, operational and maintenance expenses.	28 See Action 21a.	-GOL established subvention policy and contributed M54,000 for FY 87-88.	D- 2.44
		-MOE has included TSTC subvention.	D- 2.44
29. Train Administrative staff in how to fund-raise.	29 USAID does not agree that fund raising skills is urgent	-First steps toward generating funds internally have been taken: M 16,375 student fees 6,415 interest on call account 16,345 student income generation 16,306 saleable stock added by TSTC 12,045 capital assets added to buildings.	D- 2.44

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Actions Agreed To in PIL No. 17	Current Status	References
b) Continue short-term assistance to help staff develop skills in designing competency based curriculum	b) TSTC will have modular learning programs operative and will design and implement student labor programs by June 1987.	-Modular learning curricula are in in place in one course of study.	V- 2.10
c) Support plans to build additional teacher housing as part of the Instructional program.	c) USAID, MOE, and AED are acting on the recommendations to provide additional staff housing.	-Two staff houses and a house caravan have been provided in the interim.	V- 2.10
		-A triplex unit is under construction as an advanced training practicum involving 18 students.	V- 2.10
30. Course flexibility must be ensured; program development should be based on a demonstrated relationship between skills to be taught and existing or expected employment/ entrepenuerial opportunities e.i. the Highland Water Scheme.	30a) TSTC will implement flexible course planning and will seek to improve their needs assessment procedure.	-Flexible planning has not been instituted needs amendment	V- 2.09 I- 3.50
	b) TSTC Director and BANFES COP will submit preliminary report to PWG re: Highland Wather Scheme employment and training opportunities	Completed -Report prepared by consultant	I- 3.50 I- 3.62
31. TSTC should play a facilitative rather than a supervisory role in testing a Basic Education program in a Tahba Tseka primary school.	(No mention of this recommendation in PIL No. 17)	-Currently providing materials preparations support to Peace Corp worker who is assisting Katlehong.	D- 2.63

APPENDIX A

Table 3.2.5

CROSS-COMPONENT ISSUES: Response To First Evaluation Recommendations

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Current Status	References
32 a) Role of the Component Coordinators should be retained and streghtened as feasible.	Accomplished	I- 2.01, I- 2.03
b) An Administrative Office should be desginated to help COP.	In Progress	I- 2.01,
c) A small central BANFES Administration/Clerical support unit is needed.	In Progress	I- 2.02
33. Whether feasible, USAID should rely on BANFES staff for direct project implementation activities.	AID Project Officer continue to review proposals and reports and other comments on education effectiveness	I- 1.03
34. All necessary steps should be taken to assure effective GOL Coordination of BANFES. Project staff should look to PS for guidance in this matter.	In Progress	I- 2.01
35. Regular meetings between the PS AND COP should be continued; the Deputy PS might be involved regularly..	In Progress	I- 2.01 I- 1.03
36. A PIL should be written to extend existing Covenant deadlines	No PIL, but progress as follows:	
a) Definition of Assistance Fund procedures.	Not accomplished	I- 2.03
b) Detailed plan for NTTC-LAC program of practical training Agric.	In Progress	I- 1.03
c) Detailed plan for integrating practical skills into primary and secondary curricula.	Accomplished	D- 3.11
d) Director of Academic Affairs position at NTTC remains to be established.	Post not established Filled with acting Dir.	D- 2.44 I- 3.07, 2.23
37. Training recommendations include:	Accomplished:	
a) COP should review alternative ways of approving Non-training activities outside the training committee.	COP now reviews and approves non-training activities.	I- 2.03

Recommendations of Firs Evaluation	Current Status	References
37 b) Cross-sectional training should be initiated by the Training Coordinator.	Accomplished: 46 cross-component training activities completed or planned for 1988.	I- 2.03, I- 2.1
c) Periodic reviews should be undertaken of training review and approval process, with a focus as limiting data collection, for simplification.	Accomplished: Review Finding in process should not simplified more because of accounting requirements and the complexity of many training activities.	I- 2.03, I- 2.1
d) Training Office should strenghten its training support role.	Accomplished: Provides logistical support through part-time logistical assistants and computer system tracking logistical expenses.	I- 2.03
e) Training Coordinator should meet periodically with component staff and their counterparts...	Accomplished: Every six months coordinator meets with component staff to review training activity mini-contracts. Greatly increased implementation of training plans.	I- 2.03
f) Have training plans developed with accompanying budgets?	Yes; developed with training	Table 4.42
g) Short-term training should be given preference over long-term participant training.	Accomplished: short term in country training greater than long-term participant training. Evening College if futher example.	I- 2.24
h) Counterparts and other staff members at BANFES related institutions should be involved in developing training proposals and plans etc.	Inadequate. Responsibility lies primarily with Component TA, not Framing coodinator.	I- 2.03
i) Training Coordinator should conduct Trainer of Training Workshops.	Being done via dissemination network and in-service programs. Training Coordinator would like to do more but insufficient interest from Component TA's that initiate training activities.	I 2.03

APPENDIX A

Table 3.2.5

Cross-Component Topics

Recommendations of First Evaluation	Current Status	References
38 a) COP should review mechanisms for coordinating efforts with other donors.	Not Accomplished	I- 2.01 I- 2.02
b) BANFES COP coordinate meetings of informal group of education sector donors with PS Planning Division of MOE.	In Process	I- 2.01 I- 2.01

PGA REF.		GOL/MOE Project Grant Agreement: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
		COMPONENT I: MOE	
Sec. 4.1 a,b,	1)	The Grantee will furnish (a) statement of the name of the person holding or acting in the office of the Grantee and (b) a project coordination plan (principal representative of the Grantee and establishment of steering and management committees).	
		Status COMMITMENT MET	
Sec. 5.1	2)	The parties agree to establish an evaluation plan.	I-1.03; D-2.44
		Status: COMMITMENT MET The plan, essentially is to have a first and second interim evaluation, and a final summative evaluation. No formal planning document was produced.	I-2.01; D-2.44
Sec. 5.2.3	3)	The Office of Cabinet Personnel shall second to the MOE the project supplied Personnel Specialist.	
		Status: COMMITMENT MET	I-2.02
Sec. 5.2.4	4)	Cabinet Personnel will second to the Planning Unit of MOE for the the purpose of conducting research and analysis such staff of the Bureau of Statistics as are agreed upon between the Principal Secretaries.	
		Status: COMMITMENT MET	I-2.02; I-3.02; D-2.
Sec. 5.2.5	5)	Cabinet Personnel will ensure that the designated posts for counterpart personnel are established and filled for all technical assistance personnel provided under the project.	
		Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET	
Sec. 5.2.6	6)	Cabinet Personnel will provide office space, facilities and normal administrative support for all technical assistance personnel provided under the project.	D-2.44

APPENDIX B
Table 3.3.1
Component I...

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE Project Grant Agreement: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
	Status: COMMITMENT MET	
	This is addressed under other sections of the paper. The various institutions of MOE are providing offices. In addition, the project has constructed an office building. The following reports on Components 2,3, and 4 speak to other details under this commitment.	

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE PROJECT GRANT AGREEMENT: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
Sec. 4.3	1) Prior to disbursement under the Grant for the National Teacher Training Component, or to the issuance by AID of documentation pursuant to which such disbursement will be made, the Grantee will, except as the parties may otherwise agree in writing, furnish to AID in form and substance satisfactory to AID, evidence that the Grantee will establish and fill, and will finance from Grantee funds, the following positions: (1) Deputy Director/Financial Controller, National Teacher Training College. (2) Director Academic Affairs (Program Coordinator), NTTC	
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET Neither of the positions have been created and filled. To date, however, by internal NTTC arrangement, one person has been called upon from the academic staff to fill, on an acting basis, the non-established post of Deputy Director, Academic Affairs.	I- 3.07; I-2.33 D- 2.44
Sec. 5.2.5	2) Within eighteen months of signing the Project Agreement, a detailed plan satisfactory to AID will be prepared and submitted to AID for a National Teacher Training College/Lesotho Agricultural College Coordinated programme for instruction and practical training in agriculture education of all PTC, APTC, and STC certificate trainees at the National Teacher Training College.	
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET (IN PROGRESS) Joint NTTC/LAC training programme for teachers of agriculture was developed, but before its implementation both the directors of NTTC and LAC were replaced. New directors of the respective institutions are studying the programme anew. There is a possibility of reviving the programme after appropriate modifications have been affected to the satisfaction of the new directors. Joint conferences, seminars and workshops in Agriculture have been held between NTTC and LAC staff; and there is collaboration at school level, especially now between BANFES and LAPIS sponsored programmes. In fact, a detailed proposal for BANFES/LAPIS cooperation is now being prepared.	I- 2.17 D- 2,44

APPENDIX B
Table 3.3.2
Component II...

PGA REF	GOL/MOE GRANT AGREEMENT: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
Sec. 5.2	3) Within eighteen months of signing the Project Agreement, and using the MOE Curriculum Development Policy (1980) and the GOL Education Sector Survey (1982), submit to AID a detailed plan of action satisfactory to to AID to integrate practical studies, such as agriculture and home production education, into primary and secondary school curriculum and related examinations.	
	Status: COMMITMENT MET (AND IN PROGRESS)	
	-The Pitso Report on Practical Studies produced	D- 3.05
	-Practical Skills TA's at NTTC and NCDC have started a number of initiatives in the area of agriculture, home economics, arts and crafts, and health education, which the PWG has approved and blessed.	D- 2.128 I- 2.08 I- 3.07
	-A consultancy on practical skills was set up	
	-NTTC Curriculum Committee facilitated the formulation of an NTTC definition of practical skills and recommendations for staff programme and facilities development at NTTC. This was approved by the Academic Board and is being implemented through the Primary Methodology group at NTTC.	
Sec. 5.2.6	4) The Office of Cabinet Personel will provide office space, facilities, and normal administrative support for all technical assistance personnel provided under the Project.	
	Status: COMMITMENTS MET (FOR THE MOST PART) For NTTC staff al TA's have been provided with space, albeit in severely circumscribed circumstances in some cases; they have also been provided administrative support, although secretarial assistance has been severely limited. Maintenance of photocopy services has been difficult, despite Project equipment input.	I- 2.15
Sec. 5.2.8	5) It (formalized Memorandum of Agreement) shall establish appropriate accounts and accountability procedures for each MOE entity identified below to receive and disburse monies accrued through income-generating activities: the TSTC, IMRC and the Agriculture and Practical Skills Department of NTTC.	
	Status: COMMITMENT MET (IN PART)	I- 2.17 I- 2.24

PGA REF	GOL/MOE PROJECT GRANT AGREEMENT: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
Sec. 5.2.9	6) Within eighteen months of signing the Project Agreement, it shall prepare and submit to AID a detailed plan of action, satisfactory to AID, for appropriate limitations of the number of students enrolled in off-campus, and on campus programmes of the NTTC. The plan shall include a time-phase programme of action for filling all required professional and staff personnel at the NTTC, and the Instructional Materials Resources Centre, and for developing an instructional management plan for optimum utilization of teaching staff and facilities.	
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET ODA Consultancy on NTTC autonomy has been completed. Under this arrangement if GOL approves, NTTC will enjoy considerable influence in appointment and promotion of staff, as well as financial and administrative matters of the College. A Cabinet paper is in the process of being prepared by MOE. BANFES sponsored Consultancy on Alternatives to Intership has been completed. GOL has given directive for the replacement of the one-year internship with a 3-4 month teaching practice. Implications of this decision are being studied by NTTC with follow-up actions being planned as soon as a final written confirmation of this arrangement has been received from MOE. No time-phased program of action for filling vacant positions or creating new positions has been drawn up. No apparent explanation available. Need for long-range planning at NTTC remains.	D- 2.44 I- 2.15; I- 2.24

APPENDIX B

Table 3.3.3

COMPONENT III: Status fo GOL/MOE Compliance with Project Grant Agreement

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE PROJECT GRANT AGREEMENT: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
Sec. 3.2.b	1) The resources provided by Grantee for the Project will be no less than equivalent of U.S. $5, 520.000, including costs borne on an "in-kind" basis	
	Status: COMMITMENT MET Detailed in	Table 4.3.5; D- 2.44
Sec. 5.2.2	2) Within eighteen months of signing the Project Agreement, and using the Ministry of Education Curriculum Development Policy (1980) and the Government of Lesotho Education Sector Survey (1982), submit to AID a detailed plan of action satisfactory to AID to integrate practical studies, such as agriculture and home production education, into primary and secondary school curriculum and related examinations.	
	Status: COMMITMENT MET Accomplished April, 1987, through the plan developed by a task force charied by Mr. Thabo Pitso.	D- 3.05
Sec. 5.2.5	3) The Office of Cabinet Personnel will ensure that the designated posts for counterpart personnel are established and filled for all technical assistance personnel provided under the Project.	
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET The Curriculum Dissemination Specialist has no counterpart at all. The Basic Education Specialist and the Practical Skills Specialist work closely with the Heads of the Sesotho and Agricultural/Technical Education Divisions, respectively, but neither adviser has a counterpart with broad responsibilities in the basic education or practical skills areas. The reason for not implementing this commitment is that the NCDC is severely short of staff. Many existing positions are vacant. The NCDC has not been able to fill its establishment vacancies, let alone create the three new positions which would be required to meet this obligation.	I-2.03 D- 2.44
Sec. 5.2.6	4) It will provide office space, facilities, and normal administrative support for all technical assistance personnel provided under the Project.	

Table 3.3.3

Component III...

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE PROJECT GRANT AGREEMENT: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
	Status: COMMITMENT MET Accomplished for all Technical Assistants - However there is very limited space to accomodate the seven locally hired, BANFES - funded assistants at the NCDC.	I- 2.03 D- 2.44
Sec. 3.2.8	3) It shall establish appropriate accounts and accountability procedures for each Ministry of Education entity identified below to receive and disburse monies accrued through income generating activities: the RSTC, the IMRC, and the Agriculture and Practical Skills Department of the National Teacher Training College. Those procedures will enable the named entities to control and utilize income generated by U.S. Grant Funds under this project for the specified purposes, such as securing replacement supplies for commodities in a timely and efficient manner. **Status:** COMMITMENT MET	

APPENDIX B

Table 3.3.4

COMPONENT IV: Status of GOL/MOE Compliance with Project Grant Agreement

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE Project Grant Agreement: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
Sec. 4.4.1	1) Prior to disbursement under the Grant for the Rural Skills Component, the Grantee will, except as the parties may otherwise agree in writing, furnish to AID - evidence that the Grantee will establish and fill, and will finance from Grant Funds on a timely basis, the following positions. Administration, Rural Skills Training Centre, Deputy Administration, Liaison/Coordinator. Status: COMMITMENT MET	D- 244
Sec. 4.4.2	2) Evidence that the Grantee will establish and fill, and will finance from Grantee funds, the following positions: - five instructors in fields to be determined by a needs assessment. - six support staff. Status: COMMITMENT MET	D- 2.44
Sec. 4.4.3	3) Evidence that the Grantee will make available to the Project the facility in Thaba Tseka. Status: COMMITMENT MET	I- 2.01
Sec. 4.4.4	4) Evidence that the Grantee will make available in a timely manner and at no expense to the Grant two homes for Technical Assistance staff. Status: COMMITMENT MET	D- 2.44
Sec. 4.5	5) Prior to disbursement under the Grant for the Rural Skills Training Centre Assistance Fund, the Grantee will except as the parties may otherwise agree in writing, establish procedures acceptable to AID for operation of the assistance fund. Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET No assistance fund has been established.	D- 2.44 I- 1.03 I- 3.12
Sec. 5.2 (7)	6) Within one year of signing the Project Agreement, a formalized Memorandum of Agreement will be entered into among IEMS, LDTC and the Ministry that LDTC is to provide pre-counseling, post counseling and remedial education for RSTC trainees and IEMS is to provide entrepreneurial and management training.	D- 2.44 D- 2.51 I- 3.12 V- 2.10

PGA REF.	GOL/MOE Project Grant Agreement: COMMITMENTS AND COMPLIANCE	REFERENCE
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET (MODIFIED)	
	The TSTC has chosen to place a remedial education on its staff. There is also an extension person and a business educator on staff. The school has chosen to do pre-counseling, post counseling and remedial education through its own staff - as opposed to contracting for this with LDTC. The school does have a contractual relationship with IEMS in which (a) staff training seminars have been held and (b) business educator is assigned by IEMS to the school.	D- 2.44
Sec. 5.2 (B) 7)	It shall establish appropriate accounts and accountability procedures for each MOE entity identified below to receive and disburse monies accrued through income generating activities.	
	Status: COMMITMENT NOT MET	
	The Thaba Tseka Skills Training Centre has developed and operating accounting section. It draws down from USAID quarterly in accordance with detailed procedures worked out by the school and USAID. Further consideration may want to be given by MOE and USAID to accounting for income generating. The school hopes to become increasinly successful with income generating project. When the BANFES Project finished in early 1990 the MOE will (a) need to be satisfied with all procedures that it inherits and (b) budget for operations that cannot be covered from school income. Become increasingly	D- 2.44 I- 1.03

Appendix C

Table 3.3.3

Summary of GOL Contributions (1 July 1985 - 30 June 1988)
By Category, Year, and MOE Unit (Source: MOE)

Category	Year	HQ's	TSU	MCDC/IMRC	NTTC	TOTAL
1. Land	85-86	900	-	3,750	42,000	46,650
	86-87	900	-	3,750	42,000	46,650
	87-88	900	-	3,750	42,000	46,650
2. Offices	85-86	937	435	1,485	1,800	4,657
	86-87	937	435	1,485	1,800	4,657
	87-88	937	435	1,485	1,800	4,657
3. Furniture	85-86	2,970	4,627	9,261	7,553	24,411
	86-87	2,970	4,627	9,261	7,553	24,411
	87-88	2,970	4,627	9,261	7,553	24,411
4. Equipment	85-86	35,500	73,500	194,500	19,400	322,900
	86-87	35,500	73,500	194,500	19,400	322,900
	87-88	35,500	73,500	194,500	19,400	322,900
5. Housing	85-86	-	-	-	-	216,000
	86-87	-	-	-	-	360,000
	87-88	-	-	-	-	528,000
6. Office Administration	85-86	766	821	423	3,292	5,302
	86-87	1,031	629	504	3,372	5,536
	87-88	1,073	722	949	5,836	8,586
7. Personnel Services	85-86	50,740	28,150	66,906	234,339	380,135
	86-87	50,740	28,150	66,906	234,339	380,135
	87-88	50,740	28,150	66,906	234,339	380,135
8. Transport and Travel	85-86	2,272	133	755	767	3,927
	86-87	2,590	190	780	837	4,397
	87-88	3,508	199	1,745	927	6,379
9. Other Operating Costs	85-86	210	-	757	5,804	6,771
	86-87	3,000	-	631	6,330	9,961
	87-88	600	-	1,320	8,768	10,688
10. Local Partic. in Training	85-86	-	-	-	-	64,168
	86-87	-	-	-	-	107,120
	87-88	-	-	-	-	107,120
11. Overseas Part. Trng(S)	85-88	-	-	-	-	51,840
12. Thaba Tseka (RSTC)	85-88	-	-	-		[illegible]

BANFES INPUT (In dollars)
By Major Category, Project Component And Major Items
(As of March 31, 1988)[1]

PROJECT COMPONENT	MAJOR CATEGORY: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE		TRAINING		COMMODITIES/EQUIPMENT[2]			TOTALS
	SHORT-TERM	LONG-TERM	SHORT-TERM	LONG-TERM	COMPUTERS	VEHICLES	OTHERS	
1. MOE	130,549	1,732,500	105,969	832,500	56,552	92,524	62,984	3,013,578
2. NTTC	22,977	1,496,000	103,567	625,000	8,417	22,909	434,653	2,713,523
3. NCDC/IMRC	83,832	1,320,000	147,249	150,000	103,213	41,301	43,523	1,889,118
4. TTSC	171,224	737,000	11,629	50,000	0	10,667	5,055	985,575
SUBTOTALS	408,582	5,285,500	368,414	1,567,500	168,182	167,401	546,215	
TOTALS	5,694,802		2,025,914		881,798			8,601,794

1) Source: BANFES office

2) Does not include USAID construction of BANFES office ($85,00) or TSTC operating expenses ($116,009).

Appendix D
Table 3.4.1b

BANFES INPUT (In person years)
By Major Category and Profect Component
(As of March 31, 1988)1

PROJECT COMPONENT	MAJOR CATEGORY: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE		TRAINING		TOTALS
	SHORT-TERM	LONG-TERM	SHORT-TERM	LONG-TERM	
1. MOE	2.2	15.75	12.8	20.0	50.75
2. NTTC	0.4	13.6	10.1	14.4	38.5
3. NCDC/IMRC	1.4	12.0	25.7	4.5	43.6
4. TTSC	2.85	6.7	0.5	1.0	11.05
SUBTOTALS	6.85	48.05	49.1	39.9	
TOTALS	54.9		89.0		143.9

1) Source: BANFES Office

Project Design USAID/BANFES inputs (Dollars)1

PROJECT COMPONENT	MAJOR CATEGORY: TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE — SHORT-TERM	TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE — LONG-TERM	TRAINING (Includes long and short-term)	LOGISTICAL SUPPORT (Includes vehicles, commodities, local staff, contingency, etc.)	TOTALS
1. MOE	507,000	4,420,500	642,400	1,579,304[2]	7,149,204
2. NTTC	641,400	3,459,750	466,600	678,300	5,246,050
3. NCDC/IMRC	571,100	3,269,100	2,084,300	1,150,000	7,099,500
4. TTSC	728,900	1,581,600	142,400	2,117,050	4,569,950
SUBTOTALS	2,448,400	12,755,950	3,335,700	5,524,654	24,064,704 1,648,529[3]
					25,749,233

1) Source: Project Paper, 1983 (page 59)

2) Includes $244,204 for evaluations

3) Contractor Fee

Appendix E
Table 3.5.1

Component I: Status On Selected Objectives Indicators

CONTRACT PAGE	SELECTED OBJECTIVE INDICATORS (FROM AED CONTRACT)	STATUS	REFERENCE
5	1) Computerized information system developed in Planning Unit	COMPLETED	V - 1.04
7	2) Approximately 2.5 person years of short-term TA provided	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.03
7	3) Approximately 27 person years of long-term TA provided:		
	-Adm./Mgmt. Specialist	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.01
	-Personnel Mgmt. Specialist	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.02
	-Systems Analyst	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.02
	-Supply Mgmt. Specialist	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.02
	-TSU Mgmt. Specialist	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.04
7	4) 12 person/yrs of long-term training.		
	-2 Comp. and System Anal.	CHANGED...	I - 2.03
	-2 Ed. Planning, and Adm.	1 Comp. Prog.	
	-2 Ed. Financial Plan.	1 Ed.Fin. Mgmt	
8	5) 5 Persons/yrs. of short-term training to include :		
	out-of-country.		
	2 Basotho (6 mo. with procurement office of large school district in U.S.)	CHANGED... (personnel not yet ready, will train when ready)	I - 2.03
	In-country		
	-School Mgrs./Inspectors (yearly courses on staff placement and coordination)	IN PROGRESS (improving Comm. between MOE and school managers)	I - 2.03 I - 2.04 D - 1.01
	-School Managers (Seminar on Purchasing and Commodity Control)	COMPLETED stock control	I - 2.04 D - 1.01
	-MOE Dept. Heads and Accounts Personnel.	IN PROGRESS "Essential	I - 2.03 D - 1.01

CONTRACT PAGE	SELECTED OBJECTIVE INDICATORS (FROM AED CONTRACT)	STATUS	REFERENCE
9	1) A primary teacher Certificate Program will be a course for teachers providing skills and knowledge to teach Agriculture and practical skills relevant to rural schools/communities in addition to the skills related to academic subjects.	COMPLETED	D - 2.98
10	2) Five Basotho staff from NTTC will receive long-term training to the M.A. level. -NTTC Director -NTTC Dep. Dir. for Finance -Academ. Prog. Coordinator -2 Faculty members.	CHANGED	D - 2.02
10	3) The curriculum will be revised to include practical skills training for the primary teachers Certificates (PTC) students.	COMPLETED	D - 2.98
10	4) The above will be based on a task analysis of primary and junior secondary classroom teaching tasks.	NOT COMPLETED	
10	5) The curriculum objectives based on the above task analysis will be states in specified behavioral terms.	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.08 I - 2.05 D - 2.126
12	6) Innovative schedueling and groupings of NTTC students will be developed to achieve the more efficient use of staff and facilities.	IN PROGRESS	I - 2.08 I - 2.15 I - 2.16 I - 3.07