PD-AAX-884

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY PART I

56484

(BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS)

A. REPORTING A.I.D. UNIT: OAJC/MUSCAT/OMAN
(Mission or AID/W Office)
(ES#)

B. WAS EVALUATION SCHEDULED IN CURRENT FY ANNUAL EVALUATION PLAN?
yes ☒ slipped ☐ ad hoc ☐
Eval. Plan Submission Date: FY ___ Q ___

C. EVALUATION TIMING
Interim ☐ final ☒ ex post ☐ other ☐

D. ACTIVITY OR ACTIVITIES EVALUATED (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report)

IDENTIFICATION DATA

Project #	Project/Program Title (or title & date of evaluation report)	First PROAG or equivalent (FY)	Most recent PACD (mo/yr)	Planned LOP Cost ('000)	Amount Obligated to Date ('000)
272-0102	SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION PROJECT	1983	9/88	37.5	37.5

ACTIONS

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

Action(s) Required	Name of officer responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
No future actions	-	-

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. DATE OF MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE REVIEW OF EVALUATION: mo___ day___ yr___

G. APPROVALS OF EVALUATION SUMMARY AND ACTION DECISIONS:

	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Signature				
Typed Name	ED MARQUIT		SAMUEL SCOTT	D.R. MILLER
Date:		Date:	Date:	Date:

H. EVALUATION ABSTRACT (do not exceed the space provided)

The purpose of this project is to improve access to primary and intermediate-level education and upgrade the quality of primary and intermediate education through provision of the better facilities.

In lieu of an evaluation, a Project Assistance Completion Report (PACR) was completed. Its purpose was to summarize the final level of inputs and outputs with particular attention given to the operational sustainability of the school units and evaluate the impact on Omani educational system. The major findings and observations in this report were:

* The project's well defined and easily quantifiable set of targets and the simplicity of the FAR method as an implementation mechanism served to facilitate an effective monitoring of all activities.

* Key characteristics which enabled this project to be successful are:

Technically feasible plan of action, strong cultural and social value which the Government of Oman places on education, appropriately targeted objectives and carefully delineated rationale for AID to assist the Government of Oman in meeting the goals, and existence of strong and reasonably reliable "construction community in Oman."

The following lessons should be noted:

* Contracting agency's capability to effectively manage all contracting activities made the FAR method of implementation the most appropriate.

* Issues like erecting temporary signs at project sites to identify AID support must be settled in the early stages of the project.

ABSTRACT

I. EVALUATION COSTS

1. Evaluation Team Name	Affiliation	Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (US$)	Source of Funds
S. SCOTT	ANE/PD	14	2,800	MISSION
E. MARKESET	MISSION			
M. AL-MAZRUI	MISSION			

2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (estimate) 35

3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (estimate) 5

COSTS

2

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY PART II

J. SUMMARY OF EVALUATION FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Try not to exceed the 3 pages provided)
Address the following items:

- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Purpose of evaluation and Methodology used
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office: MUSCAT/OMAN

Date this summary prepared:

Title and Date of Full Evaluation Report: PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT FOR SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION PROJECT

*Purpose of Activity Evaluated

The broad program goal was to improve the quality of Omani human resources. The specific project purpose was to improve access to primary and intermediate level education and upgrade the quality of primary and intermediate education through provision of the better facilities.

Program on Sector Goal:

Outputs: 91 new fully equipped primary and intermediate schools primarily benefitting 30,000 children annually attending the schools.

Improved teaching/learning environments for teachers, school administrators, etc.

Inputs: AID & GOVOMAN 50% contribution to project.

Engineering & construction services.

*Purpose of Evaluation and Methodology Used

Since the project from its early beginning progressed well without major problems or constraints which may have inhibited the attainment of the objectives of the project, the Mission decided that a full scale evaluation was not required. It was not believed that significant information would be gained by conducting a final evaluation. Completion of the project on time and within budget further confirmed that there was no need for further evaluations. It was, therefore, determined to do a Project Assistance Completion Report (PACR) which would summarize level of inputs and outputs, provide end-of-project status regarding achievements of objectives, review of financial status and summary of lesson learned.

*Findings and Conclusions

1. Government of Oman/MOEY Performance and Education Sector Impact

SUMMARY

a) Consultant/Contractor monitoring, control aspects during design/construction phases

Though there were delays at the beginning of the project primarily due to land acquisition problems, A/E Consultant's unfamiliarity with new MOEY design concepts and requirements and Government Tender Board administrative issues, the MOEY moved forward expeditiously to ensure timely contracting for quality design, construction and supervision. The MOEY/ Contractor/Consultant professional working relationship proved more conducive to more than satisfactory output delivery within designated time frames and estimated cost projections.

b) Appropriateness of design and ability to equip/maintain new school facilities

Discussion with teachers and administration staff at the new schools revealed satisfaction with the design of the facilities. Furniture, equipment and materials have been provided by MOEY as per prescribed standards. Schools in more remote areas appeared to have difficulties with supply of replacement items. Repairs are carried out by the Construction Contractor for a period of one year after facility handover. After that, the regional directorates claim to make considerable effort to be as responsive as possible. At some schools, teaching staff and parents carry out fund raising events to help with maintenance.

c) Ability to provide necessary teaching staff for new facilities

Oman is still heavily dependent on expatriate arab teachers and administrators for schools around the country, but the quality and commitment levels appeared to be adequate. However, the number of qualified Omani teachers continues to expand and there will be less reliance on expatriate personnel in the future.

d) Effect of new schools on access to education, enrollment rates and quality education

This project is consistent with GOVOMAN's high priority policy to provide education to as many children as possible. This activity can surely be counted as a success as it is in line with Government's emphasis to build educational facilities in areas where they don't exist and to replace those below acceptable standards. Based on OAJC inspection and MOEY statistics, school enrollment has continued to rise at about 20% per year. The new attractive and comfortable OAJC funded schools, which constituted 15% of all primary and intermediate schools at the start of 1987-88 academic year, have also helped reduce student dropouts and runaways.

SUMMARY (continued)

2. AID's Ability to Monitor and Effectively Implement this Type of Activity

a) Collaboration and Consultation:

It can be confirmed that the close collaboration between OAJC direct hire engineering and project management staff and MOEY/PD professionals together with A/E Consultants throughout design, construction and supervision stages has resulted in quality constructed schools which meet GOVOMAN's educational needs. Due to competitive environment among contractors in Oman at the time of tendering, the actual tender costs of the individual schools were close to half of the estimated costs.

b) The Fixed Amount Reimbursement (FAR) System as A Financial Management and Implementation Tool:

Assumptions made at the project design stage that the FAR system would be the most efficient mechanism for financial management and implementation proved valid. The two Governments agreed on fifty-fifty reimbursement agreement for the first loan. The second loan agreement was agreed on the basis of seventy-thirty AID/GOVOMAN split. FAR payments were made to the Government in three stages. 40% reimbursement upon shell completion, 45% upon completion of construction and 15% when the school was operational. In all the three stages, MOEY/PD certified in writing to the OAJC of their satisfaction of the stage-completion and OAJC verified and certified the same.

SUMMARY (continued)

*Principal Recommendations

Although AID funded facilities are still relatively new and troublefree now, it is recommended that a close watch should be kept on potential inefficiencies in the MOEY's maintenance/ service delivery system with special attention to schools in the more remote areas of the country.

*Lessons Learned

Drawing from this experience these are the major lessons learned:

- Successful implementation of many A.I.D. projects hinges in many cases upon the effectiveness of the contracting methods being used. For this project the appropriateness of the FAR method proved to be the correct choice since the host country contracting agency had the capacity to effectively manage all contracting activities.

- The Loan Agreement and PIL No. 1 clearly pointed out the government's responsibility for erecting temporary signs at the project sites and to place plaques on the schools to appropriately identify A.I.D. support to this project. This was never carried out to full satisfaction. The lesson to be learned is that these issues must be settled in the early stages of implementation and not be allowed to slip to such a late stage that the impact is lost.

K. ATTACHMENTS (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier)

ATTACHMENTS

PACR for School Construction Project (Phases I & II)

L. COMMENTS BY MISSION, AID/W OFFICE AND BORROWER/GRANTEE

MISSION COMMENTS ON FULL REPORT

Using an In-House Assessment in the form of a PACR in lieu of a formal end-of-project external evaluation has proven to be the right choice for this project for the following reasons:

1) No follow-on activities regarding school construction are proposed.

2) The project progressed very well, was completed on schedule and within budget and experienced no major implementation obstacles.

3) Since the focus of the evaluation is on input/output measurement the methodology of using a PACR is particularly well suited.

4) An In-House PACR saves on cost and staff time.