

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY PART I

PD-AA-151

Duplicate

(BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS)

XID

A. REPORTING A.I.D. UNIT (Mission or AID/W Office) USAID/Bangladesh (ES #)

B. WAS EVALUATION SCHEDULED IN CURRENT FY ANNUAL EVALUATION PLAN? yes slipped ad hoc

C. EVALUATION TIMING interim final ex post other

D. ACTIVITY OR ACTIVITIES EVALUATED (List the following information for project(s) or program (s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report)

| Project # | Project/Program Title (or title & date of evaluation report) | First PRGAS or equivalent (FY) | Most recent PWD (mo/yr) | Planned LOP Cost ('000) | Amount Obligated to Date ('000) |
|-----------|--|--------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 388-0027 | Technical Resources Project "Evaluation of the In-Country Modular Management Training Program for Women" | FY79 | 02/89 | \$63.7 | \$77.3 (69,761) (77,286) |

004207

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

Action(s) Required

See Attachment "A"

Name of officer responsible for Action

Date Action to be Completed

(Attachments, if necessary)

F. DATE OF MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE REVIEW OF EVALUATION

G. APPROVALS OF EVALUATION SUMMARY AND ACTION DECISIONS:

no 03 day 17 year 86

| | | | | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|----------------------------------|---|
| Signature Typed Name Date | Project/Program Officer <i>T. Bethune</i> T. Bethune March 17, 1986 | Representative of Borrower/Grantee NA | Evaluation Officer T. Bethune | Mission or AID/W Office Director <i>J. Westley</i> J. Westley |
|---------------------------------|--|--|----------------------------------|---|

In 1976, the Government of Bangladesh (BDG) announced an affirmative action policy directing that 10% of new government jobs would go to women for mid-level executive positions. The new appointees, however, lacked basic management skills. Therefore, the goal of the In-Country Women's Management Training Program was to train some of those inexperienced female appointees in management techniques to enhance their job performance.

USAID assisted the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs (MSWWA) through its Technical Resources Project (388-0027), of which the training program was a part. A total of 390 women attended training courses at the Center for Population Management and Research, the Academy for Planning and Development, and the Bangladesh Management and Development Centre, in October 1982, February and May 1983, respectively.

Over time, USAID perceived that serious management problems existed in the implementation of the project. As a result, the project was suspended in January 1984, pending an evaluation which took place from September - November 1985.

The team found through statistical sampling and interviews evidence of serious but not irremedial management problems with MSWWA, and USAID in implementation of the project. Neither had performed duties and responsibilities necessary for effective operation of the project. It also found unanimous, enthusiastic support among the alumnae who volunteered insights and suggestions for improvement.

Therefore, the team recommended that the project be continued with modifications: USAID should have a project officer assigned to monitor and assist the project; the MSWWA and the training institutes must receive TA in appropriate administrative responsibilities before the project is revived.

I. EVALUATION COSTS

1. Evaluation Team

| Name | Affiliation | Contract Number OR TDY Person Days | Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (US\$) | Source of Funds |
|-------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Dr. Catherine Lovell | Independent Contractor | P.O.#AID-103-85 | \$7192.00 | PD&S, Proj. 498- 0249 |

2. Mission/Office Professional
Staff Person Days (estimate) 5

3. Borrower/Grantee Professional
Staff Person-Days (estimate) _____

V

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY. PART II

J. SUMMARY OF EVALUATION FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Try not to exceed the 3 pages provided) Address the following items:

- o Name of mission or office
- o Purpose of activity (ies) evaluated
- o Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used
- o Findings and Conclusions
- o Recommendations
- o Lessons learned

NAME OF MISSION OR OFFICE

PRO/USAID/Bangladesh

PURPOSE OF ACTIVITY EVALUATED

The purpose of the In-Country Modular Training Program for Women was to provide management training for mid-level women in response to a BGD directive of 1976 which required active recruitment and placement of women in mid-level jobs with the government. The women recruited realized that they as a group did not have sufficient experience in mid-level management nor well-developed management skills to perform their tasks.

USAID/Bangladesh made a Technical Resources Project grant to the BDG which included management training for women in March 1982. USAID however, suspended the training program portion of the project in January 1984.,

PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION AND METHODOLOGY USED

The purpose of the evaluation was to determine the usefulness of the program, and, based on the evaluation, to decide whether or not to continue the project, and if so, with what modifications.

In conducting the evaluation, a team composed of an American Public Administration expert, two faculty members from Dhaka University and a research assistant performed the following tasks; 1) reviewed the curriculum used in the In-country Modular Management and Training Courses; 2) conducted a retrospective appraisal of the training by interviewing a statistically valid sampling of the participants; 3) interviewed personnel in the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs (MSWWA) involved in planning and administering the training program; 4) interviewed and assessed the institutional capabilities of the three training institutes involved and the problems associated with the courses; and 5) made suggestions to improve course content and administration of the program.

Date this summary prepared: 02/23/86

SUMMARY

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The evaluation team found that:

- 1) all 67 women alumnae interviewed responded positively, and agreed that the training should be continued;
- 2) there was need for improvement in three categories; a) curriculum development, b) training methods, and c) training program administration;
- 3) the MSWWA had many internal problems that had a negative impact on the project, but the major one was the lack of preparation internally to keep the project functioning well;
- 4) USAID had no one specifically charged with responsibility for the project;
- 5) the performance of the three training institutes was adequate, and they were skilled at managing their own formats;
- 6) even though this initial project was sidelined, the need for training women in management skills continues to grow, as the numbers of women responding to the BDG's affirmative action policy continue to increase;
- 7) men in BDG positions do receive management training;
- 8) other training opportunities exist for women in banking services;
- 9) little management training exists elsewhere for women to enable them to work in NGOs, small businesses, or government;
- 10) the Establishment Ministry, which is responsible for implementing BDG training programs, has not succeeded measurably and has no particular interest in training women;
- 11) the reaction to the evaluation team's suggestion of a consultancy group to work with the training institutes was conservative to negative;
- 12) the institutes were not ready or willing to make more than small changes in their training methods;
- 13) the overall costs of training, including food and lodging, averaged \$10.50 per person day, making these costs higher than other training programs in Bangladesh.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

4

The team concluded that:

- 1) the alumnae interviewed were generally satisfied with the course and found it useful;
- 2) the management training program increased the women's self-confidence and reduced their dependence on male superiors, colleagues, or subordinates;
- 3) the MSWWA had lacked clear interest in and responsibility for the management training program for women;
- 4) USAID should have maintained a consistent relationship with the program and with the parties involved, and USAID could have handled the reimbursement and notification problems within MSWWA had someone been charged with overall responsibility for monitoring the program;
- 5) the training institutes, APD, CPMR, BMDC, were more effective in handling reimbursement and notification problems;
- 6) the management problems common to MSWWA, USAID, and the training institutes were solvable by assigning adequate/interested staff in each entity with clearly defined responsibilities;
- 7) for \$10.50 per person day, the quality of the program could be improved and the number of trainees increased if there is effective management (the costs could go higher if major changes were made in the curriculum, course materials, and if the materials were translated into Bangla);
- 8) MSWWA must assign a woman with sufficient authority, interest, experience, and clerical support to manage the training program for women;
- 9) a consultancy group of 2 Bangladeshis and 1 expatriate is needed to advise MSWWA and the training institutes to help resolve fundamental management issues before resumption of the project;
- 10) both MSWWA and USAID could act together to revive the project.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The evaluation team recommended that:

- 1) USAID should continue the program;

CONFIDENTIAL

- 2) management of the program be invested in the MSWWA with 2 provisions:
 - a) that MSWWA choose someone with knowledge of training, a demonstrated interest in management training for women, and who agrees to work on the program; and further,
 - 1) MSWWA must agree to provide sufficient staff to assist with contract negotiation, recruitment notification, monitoring, evaluation, and financial management; and
 - 2) that the person be placed in the Directorate of Women's Affairs;
 - b) that MSWWA agrees to work, for at least 2 months, with a consultancy group composed of 3 persons, 2 of whom to be Bangladeshi, who should be knowledgeable in training methods including needs assessment, competencies identification, learning unit development, and management, in order to:
 - 1) develop selection criteria;
 - 2) develop and implement a needs assessment;
 - 3) set guidelines for curriculum and training methods to be used as the framework for contracting with training institutes;
 - 4) establish a monitoring/evaluation process which MSWWA staff will follow;
- 3) that USAID have a person whose duty it is to relate to the MSWWA throughout the implementation phase of the program in order to assist in handling problems as they arise.

LESSONS LEARNED

- 1) A project can flounder and risk termination when neither the host government nor USAID exercises due diligence in its implementation.
- 2) A project, no matter how poorly conceived and implemented, can nevertheless have an important salutary effect on its intended beneficiaries. Despite the inadequacies in implementation, participants perceived the critical importance of management training. This perception lead USAID to persist in its efforts despite the problems encountered and an initial reaction to terminate the project.

UNCLASSIFIED

CONFIDENTIAL

Date: February 23, 1986

IN-COUNTRY WOMEN'S MODULAR TRAINING PROGRAM (388-0027)

| <u>Action Decisions Required</u> | <u>Official Responsible for Action</u> | <u>Completion Date</u> |
|---|--|------------------------|
| 1. USAID Project Review Committee meets to determine: | Project Officer | end March 1986. |
| a) whether USAID should continue the project based on the Evaluation Report, and MSWWA, and training institute interest. | Project Committee | |
| b) whether the evaluation recommendations are sufficient to solve existing management problems. | " " | |
| c) Within USAID, who will have project implementation responsibility if USAID decides to revive the project. | " " | |
| d) the appropriate type of T.A. required. | " " | |
| 2. Subject to USAID's decision to provide continued support, the MSWWA should manage the revived program with the following provisions: | | |
| a) MSWWA agrees to place program management responsibilities in the Directorate of Women's Affairs; | MSWWA | December, 1985 |

| <u>Action Decisions Required</u> | <u>Official Responsible for Action</u> | <u>Completion Date</u> |
|--|--|------------------------|
| b) the Directorate of Women's Affairs assigns responsibility to an official with the appropriate authority. | Director of Women's Affairs | March, 1986 |
| c) Director of Women's Affairs agrees to accept Technical Assistance in redesign of training program. | Director of Women's Affairs | March, 1986 |
| d) Directorate of Women's Affairs and USAID jointly agree to the appropriate role of the training institutes. | Director of Women's Affairs | March, 1986 |
| 3. Subject to USAID and MSWWA agreement to continue the program, USAID will examine past program training costs and determine appropriate levels for future programming. | | |

Dupe

XD-4A/1-134-A

ISA 54104

EVALUATION OF THE IN COUNTRY MODULAR MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROGRAM
FOR WOMEN

EVALUATION TEAM

Catherine H. Lovell
Lutful Hoq Choudhury
Roushan Ara Chowdhury
Shafique Uddin Tarafdar

Submitted to USAID,
Dhaka, December 15, 1985

004201
5

EVALUATION OF IN-COUNTRY MODULAR TRAINING PROGRAM FOR WOMEN

INTRODUCTION

The following evaluation of the women manager's training program financed by AID, Dhaka from 1982 to 1984 was conducted in October and November, 1985 under P.O. AID 103-85, Dhaka, Bangladesh. The information on which the evaluation was based was obtained from examination of pertinent documents and from interviews with officers of the Ministry of Welfare and Women's Affairs, AID Training officers, administrators and course coordinators of the three participating training institutions and with some 67 women who had attended the training modules. (A list of persons interviewed and the sampling method may be found as Appendix 1.)

The evaluation team wishes to thank all those who spent their valuable time answering questions. We would also like to thank especially the Head office of Uttara Bank for making available their conference room for meetings with the women managers from the banks; Uttara, Agrani and Sonali Banks for calling to the meeting their women employees who had attended the training modules; the Directorate of Women's Affairs and the Department of Social Welfare in the Ministry of Welfare and Women's Affairs for making conference rooms available and calling their women employees who had attended the training, and to the National Academy of Social Services for making facilities available.

We would like also to thank, especially, Begum Mahmoodia Khanom, formerly with the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs and now with the Ministry of Establishment, whose concept and perseverance gave birth to the program, and who spent many hours with our team reconstructing the genesis and experiences of the early stages of the program.

GENESIS AND BRIEF HISTORY OF THE PROGRAM

On March 1, 1982 U.S. AID, Dhaka, made a Technical Resources Grant (388-0027) to the Government of Bangladesh which included a Women's Training element. The management training for women began under this element and \$46,175 was disbursed by AID to the Ministry of Women's Affairs for the initial training. In a letter dated August 8, 1983, AID agreed to commit an additional Tk 1,872,000 or \$77,286, of which \$63,761 has been disbursed. According to the project implementation letter the training was designed for female employees selected from ministries, development agencies, semi-autonomous organizations and private organizations. The objective of the training as stated in the March letter was "to enhance and strengthen women's performance in program planning and management, organization development, leadership, project design and evaluation."

By the time the program was suspended by AID in late Spring, 1984, 390 women from a target group of 1,200 developed by the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs had participated and 244 had completed the program.

The program had been the original idea of Begum Mahmooda Khanom of the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs (MSWWA) who started working to bring it into being in 1978. She had developed the idea from her personal experiences in the Bangladesh Womens Rehabilitation and Welfare Foundation, in NIPA and in MSWWA where she found women generally undertrained, having to depend on male clerks for understanding of official procedures, and working with men who had little interest in training them. Many women were coming into executive positions as a result of a government policy begun in 1976 which required the recruiting and advancement of women and has set a target quota for women's entry.

In 1978-79 Begum Khanom had an opportunity to go to the United States under AID auspices in a training program for higher level women executives. While in the United States she visited many training institutions and developed the idea for modular training -- that is training separated into several "modules" with regular work continuing between the modules so that the learning from the modules could be applied in practical situations on an ongoing basis.

It took several years for the idea to be translated into a particular program, with funding. Opposition to the idea developed within the MSWWA from the male Secretary and Deputy Secretary who did not see the reason for training exclusively designed for women. The Secretaries were eventually overridden by the female Minister who supported the program and negotiations with AID went forward culminating in the March 31, 1982 agreement between AID and the MSWWA. A part of the agreement was the stipulation that trainees would receive a daily stipend of Tk 100 to cover expenses related to training.

At the time of the agreement a three member committee was set up in the MSWWA to assist the Deputy Secretary in the administration of the program. The committee, on which Begum Khanom served, was given responsibility for selecting the training institutes to carry out the training, and for selecting the trainees.

The committee compiled a list of some 1,200 women administrators from government, semi-autonomous organizations, NGOs and the private sector (primarily banks). The criteria which served as a basis for placing women on this list are not clear.

Three training institutes were selected, with the approval of AID. They were:

1. The Training Academy for Planning and Development (APD)

2. The Centre for Population Management and Research, Institute of Business Administration, Dhaka University (CPMR)
3. The Bangladesh Management Development Centre (BMDC)

In the MSWWA the Deputy Secretary for Administration and one Section Officer were made responsible for supervising the program, including the notification of the participants (from the list provided by the Ministry three person committee) and implementing financial reimbursement matters.

In the early stages, Begum Khanom spent some time with APD and CPMR assisting them with curriculum planning. BMDC, which joined the program later, felt that it did not require such assistance. A decision was made that each module should last two weeks and that three modules would make up a complete course.

Basic budgets for each of the training institutes were developed and agreements about financial procedures were made. Basically the institutes were to submit their expenditures to the MSWWA which approved them and forwarded them to ERD, which in turn forwarded them to AID for reimbursement.

TRAINING PATTERN AND NUMBERS

The training was conducted between September, 1982 and April, 1984. The attached, Figure 1, shows the numbers and dates of modules conducted by each of the three training institutes. As the figure shows APD conducted training for 7 batches of women and all of the batches completed three modules. The CPMR started five batches but completed only two. In three of their batches only two of the three modules were completed. BMDC completed all three of its batches.

Of the originally contemplated 24 courses, 12 were completed and 3 others started but only two thirds completed.

Table 1, which follows, shows the attendance in the various modules at the three training institutions. APD started 176 women in its 7 batches, 141 (80%) of whom completed. CPMR started 135 in its 5 batches but only 29 women (21) completed all three modules. In the two batches in which all three modules were offered by CPMR the completion rates were 55% and 43%. BMDC started 90 women in 3 batches with a 95% completion rate.

Table 1 also shows the institutional homes from which the women came to the three training institutes. BMDC had the most homogeneous group of women with 90% of its women trainees coming from banks, and the others from financial agencies.

The other two institutions had more heterogeneous groups coming from eight ministries including some 8 different health

11)

FIGURE - 1
SCHEDULES OF TRAINING MODULES BY THE THREE INSTITUTIONS

| TRAINING INSTITUTE | 1 9 8 2 | | | | | | | | | | | | 1 9 8 3 | | | | | | 1 9 8 4 | | |
|---|---------|-----|-----|------|-------|-------|-------|------|-------|------|-----|-------|---------|-------|-------|------|-------|------|---------|--|--|
| | SEPT | OCT | NOV | DEC | JAN | FEB | MAR | APR | MAY | JUN | JUL | AUG | SEP | OCT | NOV | DEC | JAN | FEB | MAR | | |
| ACADEMY FOR PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 1 | 13-25 | | | | | 14-23 | | | | | | 15-25 | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 2 | | | | 1-14 | | | | 1-15 | | | | 15-28 | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 3 | | | | | 16-24 | | | | | | | 31-13 | | | | | 10-23 | | | | |
| BATCH - 4 | | | | | | | 18-10 | | | | | | | 24-8 | | | 4-19 | | | | |
| BATCH - 5 | | | | | | | | 23-7 | | | | | | 24-8 | | | | 7-20 | | | |
| BATCH - 6 | | | | | | | | | 16-20 | | | | | | 10-13 | | | | 7-20 | | |
| BATCH - 7 | | | | | | | | | | | | | 29-12 | | | | 15-28 | | | | |
| CENTRE FOR POPULATION MGT. AND RESEARCH. I.B.A. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 1 | 12-25 | | | | 24-6 | | | | | | | 1-15 | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 2 | | | | | 9-17 | | 13-5 | | | | | | 15-11 | | | | | | | | |
| * BATCH - 3 | | | | | | 14-20 | 13-15 | | | | | 16-24 | | | | | | | | | |
| * BATCH - 4 | | | | | | | | 23-7 | | | | | 2-13 | | | | | | | | |
| * BATCH - 5 | | | | | | | | | 14-23 | | | | | | | | | | 4-18 | | |
| BANGLADESH MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT CENTRE. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 1 | | | | | | | | | 29-9 | | | 14-25 | | 26-10 | | | | | | | |
| BATCH - 2 | | | | | | | | | | 20-3 | | 4-15 | | | | 3-14 | | | | | |
| BATCH - 3 | | | | | | | | | | | | | 28-11 | | | | 22-2 | | | | |

* These Batches did not have 3rd Module

TABLE - 1
ATTENDANCE AND COMPLETION

| TRAINING INSTITUTE | BATCH | NO: I-NATED | ATTENDED | | | COMPLETED | | | * INSTITUTIONAL CATEGORIES Of those who completed. | NAME OF THE COURSE COORDINATOR(S) |
|--------------------|-----------|-------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|-----------|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Mo- dule 1 | Mo- dule 2 | Mo- dule 3 | No. | Per- cen- tage by star- ted. | Per- cen- tage by star- ted. | | |
| A.P.D | Batch - 1 | 30 | 29 | 21 | 19 | 19 | 63.33 | 55.52 | Cat.2 (19) | M-1. A.Fatima Yousuf M-2. -do- M-3. -do- |
| | Batch - 2 | 26 | 24 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 84.62 | 91.67 | Cat.2(21), Cat.3(1) | M-1. Harun Choudhury M-2. A.Fatima Yousuf M-3. -do- |
| | Batch - 3 | 31 | 29 | 23 | 23 | 23 | 74.19 | 79.31 | Cat.1(16),Cat. 2(3), Cat.3(2) Cat.4(2) | M-1. Enamul Hoq Khan M-2. Abdur Rahim Khan M-3. Shamsul Hoq |
| | Batch - 4 | 29 | 25 | 22 | 21 | 21 | 72.41 | 84 | Cat.1(13),Cat. 2(5),Cat.3(2), Cat.4(1) | M-1. Enamul Hoq Khan M-2. Arifur Rahman & Shamsul Hoq M-3. Kaniz Fatima. |
| | Batch - 5 | 30 | 24 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 73.33 | 91.67 | Cat.1(4),Cat.2 (12),Cat.3(5) Cat.4(1) | M-1. Shamsul Hoq M-2. -do- M-3. A. Rahim Khan |
| | Batch - 6 | 30 | 24 | 14 | 12 | 12 | 40 | 50 | Cat.1(5),Cat.2 (4),Cat.4(3) | M-1. A. Fatima Yousuf M-2. Mursheda Khatun M-3. -do- |
| | Batch - 7 | 24 | 21 | 20 | 21 | 21 | 88 | 100 | Cat.1(7),Cat.2 (8),Cat.3(4) Cat.4(2) | M-1. Kaniz Fatima M-2. Arifur Rahman M-3. -do- |
| | Total | 200 | 176 | 146 | 141 | 141 | 70.5 | 80.11 | Cat.1(45),Cat.2 (72),Cat.3(14), Cat.4(9) | |
| CPMR, I.B.A | Batch-1 | 31 | 29 | 22 | 17 | 17 | 54.84 | 58.62 | Cat.2(17) | Coordinator-M.Alimul- lah Miyan. Dy.Coordi- nator Abdur Rab Miah. |
| | Batch - 2 | 28 | 20 | 16 | 12 | 12 | 42.86 | 60 | Cat.2(12) | -do- |
| | Batch - 3 | 26 | 31 | 25 | | | | | ** Cat.5(25) | -do- |
| | Batch - 4 | 30 | 27 | 24 | | | | | ** Cat.2(24) | -do- |
| | Batch - 5 | 28 | 28 | 22 | | | | | ** Cat.2(22) | -do- |
| | Total | 143 | 135 | 109 | 29 | 29 | 20.28 | 21.48 | Cat.2(29) **Cat.2(46)Cat.5(25) | |
| BMDC | Batch - 1 | 30 | 27 | 26 | 26 | 26 | 86.67 | 96.3 | Cat.1(2),Cat.5 (24) | M-1. Mrs.Deena Rashid M-2. -do- M-3. -do- |
| | Batch - 2 | 32 | 29 | 27 | 25 | 25 | 78.13 | 86.21 | Cat.5(25) | M-1. Mrs.Sabiha Khatun M-2. -do- M-3. -do- |
| | Batch - 3 | 28 | 23 | 24 | 24 | 24 | 85.71 | 104.35 | Cat.1(3), Cat.5(21) | M-1. Mrs.Nilufar Karim M-2. Mrs. Nadira Huda M-3. Mrs.Nilufar Karim |
| | Total | 90 | 79 | 77 | 75 | 75 | 83.33 | 94.94 | Cat.1(5) Cat.5(70) | |
| GRAND TOTAL | | 433 | 390 | 332 | 244 | 244 | 56.35 | 62.56 | Cat.1(50),Cat. 2(101),Cat.3(14), Cat.4(9),Cat.5(70) | |

* Cat.1-All Divisions, Departments, Directorates, Collectorates, Commissions under the Ministry of Finance and Planning. Ministry of Industries & its affiliated corporations. Ministry of Labour and Man Power.

Cat.2-Ministry of Social Welfare and Women Affairs and its affiliated departments, Directorates, Training Institutions & Projects, Ministry of Health & Population Control and its affiliated Hospitals, Research & Training Institutes or Centers.

Cat.3-Ministry of Agriculture & Ministry of Local Government Rural Development & Cooperative.

Cat.4-Others - Ministry of Education, Ministry of Information, Ministry of Communication, Ministry of Establishment.

Cat.5 Banks.

** Institutional Categories of those who didn't complete.

*** This figure is above 100% because 1 participant switched to this module after doing earlier modules with other batches.

and welfare units within MSWWA and the Ministry of Health, two rural development and agricultural units within the Ministries of Agriculture and Local Government, and a scattering from Education, Information, Communications and Establishment Ministries.

Figure 1 shows that the three training institutes used different schemes for the spacing of their modules, some as close as 2 months and others as far apart as 5 months.

THE THREE TRAINING INSTITUTIONS -- FACILITIES, CURRICULUM, TRAINING METHODS UTILIZED

Academy for Planning and Development (APD)

APD, located at Nilkhet, Babupura, is a semi-autonomous in-service training institute under the Planning Division of the Ministry of Finance and Planning. It conducts training for GOB, non-GOB and corporate organization personnel. Its main purpose is to promote the professional and technical competence of personnel working directly in the areas of planning and development. The facilities are well designed for training and hostel accommodations are available for out of town participants. (For a complete description of APD and the other two training institutions see Bangladesh Training Institution Profiles, report by Annemarie Russell, submitted to AID December, 1983.)

APD has a small full time faculty (7 at the time of the training program for women and 11 persons at present) and depends to a great extent on outside lecturers to supply the faculty for its training programs. The fulltime faculty, most of whom have extensive training experience as well as government experience, serve primarily as course coordinators although they do give lectures or lead discussions in some parts of training sessions. None at the present, with the exception of the Director, has an academic background in management.

The APD, like the other training institutions, uses the "course coordinator" method of organizing a course. One person is appointed coordinator and is responsible for putting together the curriculum after general consultation with the Director, and sometimes with other faculty members. The coordinator is responsible for lining up the outside guest speakers, organizing field trips, or other exercises. The coordinator does not attend all the classes and is not necessarily familiar with the subject matter but is responsible for the smooth running of the class, the timing, logistics, etc. Often the coordinator mingles with the trainees at tea breaks and lunch and generally makes herself/himself available for problem solving for individual trainees. The content of specific subjects and the preparation of handout materials is left almost entirely to the guest lecturers. Materials are brought by the outside lecturers and circulated at the time of the lecture presentation so serve only to reinforce the lecture but not as preparatory reading.

During the training of the seven batches of women at APD, as we can see from Table 1, in only 1 batch did the same coordinator remain throughout the three modules. Of the seven course coordinators utilized for the seven batches, three were women. The original coordinator together with the Institute Director designed the modules for the first batch and those modules were copied very closely for the remaining six batches. The course coordinator who participated in the design is an economist and has no management training. The academic field of the Director is public administration, therefore his participation in the planning was important.

No formal needs assessment, in which potential trainees or their superiors could be surveyed to ascertain their training needs, was done because the participants who would be assigned were not known in advance. However, APD knew that participants would come primarily from the Ministries of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs and Health. Several meetings were held with Begum Khanom who contributed many of her ideas as to what she thought the women needed. No list of competencies required by the women administrators was developed.

The contents of the APD curriculum are summarized in Table 2 which also compares the APD curriculum with that of the other two institutes. APD utilizes a time format with 1 1/2 hour segments. The logic of sequencing of topics in these various time segments is difficult to ascertain. Unrelated topics are interspersed with one another -- for example, on one day the four time segments may be devoted to Leadership - Theory and Practice; Motivation and Morale; Budgeting as a Tool of Management; and Fact Finding and Problem Solving. On another day the four segments may be Methods of Project Evaluation; Planning in Bangladesh - Philosophical Analysis; Fund Allocation and Fund Release; Case-Study on Supervision.

In interviews with the course coordinator responsible for the design, the explanation for the logic behind the topic sequencing and apparent scattering of topics was that in management there is no required order of topics and that interspersing of unrelated topics prevents boredom.

Another explanation for the arrangement of topics seems more likely. Since outside lecturers are heavily utilized, the times that they are available must be accommodated, consequently their availability may heavily influence sequencing.

No system of learning units with learning objectives was used.

The training method utilized by APD was largely lectures. As the analysis of training methods (Table 3) shows, lectures were used as the training method 74% of the time. Of the lectures presented 70% were given by lecturers invited from the outside, the remainder by the institute's own faculty. Once during the

TABLE 2
CURRICULUM ANALYSIS OF COMPLETED MODULES



| CURRICULUM CATEGORIES | A.P.D Minimum & Maximum hours in 7 Batches* | | | | CPMR, IBA Minimum & Maximum hours in 2 completed batches* | | | | BMDC Minimum & Maximum hours in 3 batches* | | | |
|--|---|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|---|--------------|--------------|---------------------|--|-----------|---------------------|-----------------------|
| | Mod 1 | Mod 2 | Mod 3 | Total | Mod 1 | Mod 2 | Mod 3 | Total | Mod 1 | Mod 2 | Mod 3 | Total |
| 1. General Theories and Functions of Mgmt. | 3 - 5 | 3-10.5 | 0-6 | 7.5-19.5 | 0-5 | 1-2 | 0-1 | 1-8 | 5-8 | - | - | 5-8 |
| 2. Specific Aspects of Management | 7.5-15 | 3-18 | 9-19.5 | 24-49.5 | 12-16 | 7-12 | 3-6 | 22-39 | 17-20 | 2-3 | 0-2 | 18-23 |
| 3. Behavioral Skills and self Development | 4.5-10.5 | 3-9 | 1.5-18 | 13.5-37.5 | 3-4 | 3-6 | 0-7 | 6-17 | 8 | 6-9 | 29-30 | 44-47 |
| 1. Office Management-Noting, drafting, filing, indexing | 6-9 | 3-9 | 1.5-4.5 | 13.5-16.5 | 6-7 | 1-3 | - | 7-10 | 8 | 0-2 | 0-3 | 8-12 |
| 2. Supervision | 1.5-3 | 0-3 | 0-7.5 | 1.5-10.5 | 0-2 | 3-4 | 5 | 6-8 | 6-8 | 5-8 | 2 | 12-15 |
| 3. Financial Management | 1.5-6 | 0-6 | 1.5-12 | 6-18 | 3-6 | 4-5 | 2-7 | 10 | 5 | 5-6 | 3 | 12-15 |
| 4. Women as Manager | - | - | 0-1.5 | 0-1.5 | 1-2 | 0-3 | 0-1 | 1-5 | 2 | 2-6 | 2 | 5-9 |
| 5. Effective Presentation Written or oral | 0-7.5 | 3-7.5 | 3-4.5 | 12-16.5 | 0-1 | 9-17 | 15-17 | 25-34 | - | 0-3 | 3-6 | 3-9 |
| 6. Money Banking & Credit | - | - | - | - | ** | - | - | - | - | 15-23 | 2-6 | 17-29 |
| 7. Laws | - | - | - | - | ** | - | - | - | - | 5-9 | 5-8 | 9-17 |
| 8. Misc. Costomer Service, work study etc | 0-1.5 | 0-3 | 0-1.5 | 1.5-4.5 | 0-1 | 2 | 1-2 | 3-5 | 6 | 2-6 | 0-2 | 8-14 |
| 9. Field Study | 3-4.5 | 3 | 3-4.5 | 9-10.5 | 6 | 0-5 | 7 | 13-18 | - | - | 3 | 3-6 |
| 10. Services Rules | 3-7.5 | 3-6 | 4-12 | 12-25.5 | - | 1-2 | 1-2 | 1-3 | - | - | - | - |
| 11. Inventory, Quality control, Production Control, Marketing | 0-9 | 0-3 | - | 0-12 | 3-9 | 2-5 | 1-2 | 10-12 | - | - | - | - |
| 12. General Governmental Issues of B/Desh | 0-6 | 0-7.5 | 0-6 | 4.5-13.5 | 2-7 | 2-7 | 4-7 | 11-18 | - | - | - | - |
| 13. Orientation, Objective Setting | 1.5-3 | 0-1.5 | - | 1.5-4.5 | 0-2 | 1 | 0-1 | 1-4 | - | - | - | - |
| 14. Examination & Course Evaluation | 1.5 | 0-1.5 | 0-1.5 | 3-4.5 | - | 0-2 | 1-2 | 1-4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 7.5 |
| 15. Administration & Logistics (Registration, Certificate awarding etc) | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1 | 4.5 | 0-1 | 0-1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | - | 2 | 3 |
| GRAND TOTAL | 52.5- 60 | 51- 58.5 | 49.5- 58.5 | 162- 179.5 | 47-55 | 55-60 | 54-58 | 161- 168 | 60 | 60 | 58.5- 60 | 178.5- 180 |

The hours listed show the variation between batches on the numbers of hours devcted to each subject area!

* CPMR designed one module for bankers but the curriculum is not reflected here because it was on of the batches not completed

TABLE - 3
TRAINING METHODS USED FOR BATCH-1 IN THREE INSTITUTES

| Training Method | APD | | | | | CPMR, IBA | | | | | BMDC | | | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|------|-------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|------|-------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|------|
| | Mod 1 Hours | Mod 2 Hours | Mod 3 Hours | Total Hrs No. | % * | Mod 1 Hours | Mod 2 Hours | Mod 3 Hours | Total Hrs No. | % * | Mod 1 Hours | Mod 2 Hours | Mod 3 Hours | Total Hrs No. | % * |
| 1. Total Lectures | 43.5 | 34.5 | 43.5 | 122 | 74 | 38 | 34 | 21 | 93 | 59 | 49.5 | 45 | 37.5 | 132 | 78 |
| Guest Speakers | 30 | 21 | 34.5 | 85.5 | 70** | 20 | 23 | 16 | 59 | 63** | 3 | 27 | 13.5 | 43.5 | 33* |
| Faculty Member | 13.5 | 13.5 | 9 | 36 | 30** | 18 | 11 | 5 | 34 | 37** | 46.5 | 18 | 24 | 88.5 | 67** |
| 2. Discussion | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 2 | 2 | 1.2 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 4.5 | 2.65 |
| 3. Syndicate or small groupwork | 3 | 3 | 3 | 9 | 6 | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.5 | - | 1.5 | 0.88 |
| 4. Field study/visit | 3 | | 3 | 9 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 18 | 11 | - | 3 | 3 | 6 | 3.5 |
| 5. Case study/practical Exercise | 7.5 | 3 | 3 | 13.5 | 8 | - | - | - | - | - | 6 | - | 3 | 9 | 5.3 |
| 6. Workshop | - | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 11 | - | - | 11 | 7 | - | 3 | 6 | 9 | 5.3 |
| 7. Audio Visual | - | | - | - | | 1 | - | 2 | 3 | 1.9 | - | - | - | - | - |
| 8. Project Report Presentation | - | 7.5 | - | 7.5 | 6 | | 15 | 16 | 31 | 20 | - | 3 | 4.5 | 7.5 | 4.42 |
| Total | 57 | 51 | 55.5 | 164 | | 56 | 55 | 45 | 158 | | 57 | 57 | 55.5 | 169.5 | |

* The %'s are rounded to the nearest tenth.

** The % figures on Guest Lecturers and own Faculty lecturers are % of total lecture time.

three modules participants were taken on a field trip to observe organizations where management was effective and ineffective. Films, syndicates, workshops, case discussions, small group discussions, general discussions, and exercises were almost never used except insofar as lecturers incorporated some discussion time in the time segments controlled by them.

Each module was evaluated in two ways, by a questionnaire presented to the participants and through a brief pre-test - post test. There was no attempt made to do followup evaluation after the women had returned to their jobs either between the modules or after the last module.

Centre for Population Management and Research, Institute of Business Administration

The (CPMR) is a sub-organization of the Institute of Business Administration, University of Dhaka. Its purpose is to provide effective support to the population program in Bangladesh specifically, and population issues in general. It does this through research, managerial staff development, advisory services and development of appropriate institutional linkages. Training is normally conducted for specific target audiences and related to identified needs.

CPMR does not have its own full time faculty -- those who operate the institute are all faculty members of IBA, although it has some of its own support staff -- clerks, research assistants, etc. The faculty members who manage and operate CPMR do so on a regular part-time basis and its management and operation is a major responsibility for them for which they receive pay in addition to their faculty salaries. It draws on the IBA and other University departments for lecturers and also on experts from outside the University.

Classroom facilities are adequate. No hostel for participants is yet available although one to accommodate the various programmes of IBA is now under construction.

CPMR also uses the class coordinator method although a bit differently than the other two institutes. For this training there were 2 co-coordinators who remained the same for all of the modules. Neither of the coordinators was present in the classroom throughout all sessions of the training.

The 2 co-coordinators designed the course. They did rather extensive needs analysis in spite of the fact that they were unable to know exactly which participants would be assigned to them. They visited various field offices and Dhaka offices of the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs and the Ministry of Health and Population, and several banks from which their participants were to be drawn. One of their batches was made up entirely of bankers, the other four entirely of what we have called Category 2 participants: MSWWA and MHF women. Begum

Khanom also suggested topics.

The extent to which the needs assessment influenced the curriculum is revealed by a comparison of the modules designed for the bankers and those for the other groups. This examination reveals clear differences. For example, in the module for the bankers 22 hours were included on money, banking and credit, while none of these subjects were touched in the modules for the other batches. Other specific, more organization related topics were different for the two audiences.

The curriculum as summarized in Table 2 shows that CPMR emphasized similar subjects to the other two institutions, particularly AFD which had a similar clientele. (Not reflected in Table 2 is the curriculum of the modules designed for the banking women referred to above since only two of the three modules were completed.)

CPMR used a 1 hour time segment system rather than the 1 1/2 hours system used by the other two institutions. This is undoubtedly because IBA courses are 1 or 2 hours in duration and faculty lecturers' schedules can be accommodated. Also, lecturers are accustomed to this time frame. The sequencing of topics showed some focusing although topics often appeared scattered and unrelated (as in the AFD discussed above).

No learning unit system with competencies to be achieved appeared to be utilized explicitly.

The learning methods used by CPMR, although predominantly lecture (59%) included other training methods to a much larger extent than did the other two institutions. (See Table 3). Workshops in which the participants were given tasks so that they could learn by doing were used on several topics. A number of hours were devoted to presentations by the women themselves. Field trips, and reports on work experiences between modules were assigned as was a major project report and presentation. Clearly in CPMR the training methods were more participatory than in either of the other two and emphasized the women doing learning exercises themselves. Of the lectures 63% were given by outside faculty but the two course coordinators gave 37% of the lectures themselves. In other words, the coordinators played the role of teacher-trainers much more than did coordinators in the other two institutions.

The sessions were evaluated by means of an evaluation questionnaire. No explicit field followup evaluation was conducted, although women came in to the CPMR offices between modules for help and consultation on their field work.

The reason why CPMR did not finish the third module in three of its batches appears to be financial. They had a problem receiving reimbursement for expenditures made. On one occasion one of the coordinators advanced money from his own pocket for the daily stipend to several out of town participants so that

they could pay for their room and board while in Dhaka. CPMR, unlike APD and BMDC, did not have its own institutional resources to enable it to handle multi-month delays in reimbursement. The participants assigned to one of the non-completing batches were entirely from outside Dhaka and for a second non-completing batch, over half were from outside. These participants were heavily dependent on their stipends for living costs while in Dhaka for the training.

Bangladesh Management Development Centre (BMDC)

The BMDC is a semi-autonomous institution located on Mirpur road in Dhaka. It has sub-centres in Chittagong and Khulna. It offers training courses in all aspects of management to both public and private sector personnel; its primary clientele is public enterprises. It is currently being aided to build up its library, improve facilities, increase available audio-visual and other equipment, develop case materials, and develop faculty by a World Bank project. Besides training it also does research and publications designed to create awareness of modern management theories and techniques.

Its training facilities are very good and training equipment supplied by an audio visual centre is available. At the time of training it had hostel facilities for some 32 persons and those are now being expanded. Its management library is second only to that of IBA in Dhaka. At the time of the training it had over 40 full time staff members including 34 trainers. The academic background of most of the trainers is in management.

BMDC, like the other training institutes, uses the course coordinator method. During the three batches conducted by BMDC two were coordinated by one coordinator each and the third batch by two different coordinators, one for two of the modules and a different person for the other. At BMDC as in the other two institutions the coordinator does not attend the module throughout.

The course at BMDC was basically designed by the coordinator of the first batch together with the Director. Almost all of the participants were bankers so needs assessment was done by visiting with bank officers and talking with the bank training institutes to get their perceptions of what the participants needed. No learning unit system with learning objectives was used.

An examination of Table 2 which summarizes the curriculum offerings of the three institutions shows the emphases of BMDC. The second and third modules for each group included banking topics along with other more generic management subjects. The Table shows that there was some variation among the topics offered and time allocations for the 3 batches but little variation in times allocated for field trips and non lecture offerings.

BMDC utilizes the 1 1/2 hour time segment. Like the other two institutes, sequencing of topics appears somewhat unfocused and it is difficult to determine why one topic is interspersed between two others. Again, the observer has the feeling that topics are scheduled more for the convenience of the lecturer's schedule than in relation to logical sequencing demands.

Training methods at BMDC also depend to a large extent on lectures (78%), however, most of its lectures were provided by its own faculty members (67%). Some portion of the time segments allotted to lectures were used for discussions. BMDC utilized more case studies than did either of the other institutes.

Evaluation was done by a questionnaire administered to participants on the last day of each module and a participant evaluation report was prepared. No followup evaluation was done after the modules were completed.

NON-COMPLETION

The training had some drop out -- that is women who did not complete. The following shows the non-completion picture.

433 nominated by the Ministry
390 started the first module
244 completed all three modules
71 did not complete because CPMR did not offer the third module in three batches

Of the remaining 75 who started and did not complete, the reasons for drop out of 24 persons were obtained, (one third of all those who dropped). Six dropped because of pregnancy, 5 because they left the country for training abroad, 4 were on personal leave because of family problems, 4 were not able to leave their job duties, 2 were informed too late to be able to attend, 2 were ill and 1 person retired. No one dropped because she did not like the training or found it too difficult.

Surprisingly, in APD and BMDC the drop out rate was slightly lower for those who came from outside Dhaka, 80%, compared to 70% for those already stationed in Dhaka. Both those institutions have hostel facilities. The outside Dhaka drop out rate was higher for CPMR which did not have hostel facilities indicating that hostelting may have constituted a problem. As has been noted above, the stipend reimbursement problem was severe for the CPMR and caused special problems for those who needed to pay for lodgings.

PARTICIPANT EVALUATIONS

Participant evaluations were obtained in three ways, 1) through reading the questionnaires administered to the

participants by the training institutions themselves, 2) through interviews with a sample of 67 of the 244 participants completing the course, and 3) through three group discussions held with 45 of the participants. (The sampling method is explained in Appendix 2).

Although many of the questions on the evaluation questionnaires collected by the institutions themselves were directed toward institution specific questions, the data that were common generally confirmed the findings of the interviews conducted by the evaluation team. Therefore, the following discussion concentrates on the results of the team's interviews and the group discussions with the participants. (A copy of the interview schedule may be seen at Appendix 3.)

The following Table 4 summarizes information on the employers of the women and the locations of their work assignments at the time of training. As the Table shows the women who started came predominantly from what we have called Category 2, which includes the Ministry of Social Welfare and Women's Affairs and its affiliated Departments, Directorates, Training Institutions and Projects, and the Ministry of Health and Population Control and its affiliated Hospitals, Research and Training Institutes and Centres (198). The second largest number was from Category 5, Banks (105). The remaining were from Category 1, Divisions, Departments, Directorates, Collectorates, and Commissions under the Ministries of Finance and Planning, Industries and its affiliated corporations, and Labour and Manpower (57). Category 3, Ministries of Agriculture, and Local Government, Rural Development and Cooperatives (21), and Category 4, Ministries of Education, Information, Communication, and Establishment (9). The proportions in each category who completed may be found in Table 4, also.

It is unclear why such a large proportion came from just one commercial sector, the banks, especially since the banks have their own training institutions on banking subjects and also do avail themselves of BMDC training.

The Table also shows that 36% of those who started the program came from outside Dhaka and 21% of those who completed all three modules came from outside.

Table 5, which may be found as Appendix 4, summarizes the data obtained from the sample of 67 women interviewed by the evaluation team members.

None of the women knew why they were chosen for the training. They were simply informed by letter, in most cases from their own ministries, a few days or hours before the training was to start, that they were to report to the training institution.

Slightly more than half (36) of the 67 respondents earn salaries below Tk3,000 per month although most of these (30) earn

TABLE - 4
EMPLOYERS AND LOCATION OF PARTICIPANTS

| Categories of Employer. | | APD | | CPMR, IBA | | BMDC | |
|-------------------------|---------------|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|---------|-----------|
| | | Started | Completed | Started | Completed | Started | Completed |
| Category 1 | Total | 52 | 45 | - | - | 5 | 5 |
| | Dhaka | 44 | 38 | - | - | 5 | 5 |
| | Outside Dhaka | 8 | 7 | - | - | - | - |
| Category 2 | Total | 94 | 72 | 104 | 29 | - | - |
| | Dhaka | 71 | 58 | 40 | 23 | - | - |
| | Outside Dhaka | 23 | 14 | 64 | 6 | - | - |
| Category 3 | Total | 21 | 14 | - | - | - | - |
| | Dhaka | 18 | 18 | - | - | - | - |
| | Outside Dhaka | 3 | 2 | - | - | - | - |
| Category 4 | Total | 9 | 9 | - | - | - | - |
| | Dhaka | 9 | 9 | - | - | - | - |
| | Outside Dhaka | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Category 5 | Total | - | - | 31 | - | 74 | 70 |
| | Dhaka | - | - | 31 | - | 74 | 70 |
| | Outside Dhaka | - | - | - | - | 25 | 23 |
| Total | Total | 176 | 140 | 135 | 29 | 79 | 75 |
| | Dhaka | 142 | 117 | 71 | 23 | 54 | 52 |
| | Outside Dhaka | 34 | 23 | 64 | 6 | 25 | 23 |

Cat.1-All Divisions, Departments, Directorates, Collectorates, Commissions under the Ministry of Finance and Planning. Ministry of Industries & its affiliated corporations. Ministry of Labour and Man Power.

Cat.2-Ministry of Social Welfare and Women Affairs and its affiliated departments, Directorates, Training Institutions & Projects, Ministry of Health & Population Control and its affiliated Hospitals, Research & Training Institutes or Centers.

Cat.3-Ministry of Agriculture & Ministry of Local Government Rural Development & Cooperative.

Cat.4-Others - Ministry of Education, Ministry of Information, Ministry of Communication, Ministry of Establishment.

Cat.5 Banks.

between Tk2,000 and 3,000. Another 17 earn between Tk 3,001 and 4,000, and a top group of 14 earn between Tk 4,001 and 5,000. Most of the over Tk 4,000 group work in banks. None of the women from the government ministries held positions above the level of Director. One of the bankers was a women's branch manager.

Benefits of the Course

The responses from the interviews showed that the women were generally satisfied with the course and had found it beneficial. All 67 of the women responded positively. When questioned 56 out of the 67 could remember specific examples of subject content. Only 1 respondent was unable to give at least one specific example of an application of something learned.

The specific examples of application most often given were note drafting and correspondence, 44 women mentioned this, and application of improved methods of supervision, also discussed by 44 women. Ways to motivate employees were also mentioned by 39 women and improvement in work planning by 36. Other learning that was applied included improved oral and written correspondence, filing, knowledge about service rules, and financial procedures.

Only 1 respondent said that her work was not improved as a result of the training, all others cited examples of areas in which their work was improved. (For specifics see Table 5)

Suggested Improvements

Although all expressed general satisfaction with the courses, most of the women had suggestions for improvements in curriculum, methods of presenting the training and for organization and management of the process.

Table 6 which follows presents these findings. On curriculum changes 23 of the respondents felt that the training should go into some subjects in more depth, 14 thought the topics could be more job related, and 15 thought that some of the offerings should be more practical and not so theoretical. This was related to the response from half the women that the curriculum should include more field trips so that actual work in other organizations could be observed in operation. Fourteen of the women volunteered the idea, with no prompting, that more attention should be given to the problems of women as executives.

The women made a number of suggestions for improvements in training methods, most of them related to their desire for more participation in their own learning. Twenty seven said that there should be more time for discussion, 20 said that there should be more alternatives to lectures, 16 suggested the use of more case studies, and 12 said there should be more use of audio-visual offerings. A number of others proposed more small group

TABLE - 6
 SUGGESTIONS FROM THE 67 PARTICIPANTS
 INTERVIEWED FOR COURSE IMPROVEMENTS

| <u>Suggestions for changes in Curriculum</u> | <u>No. of res- -pondents.</u> |
|--|-----------------------------------|
| 1. More field trips | 30 |
| 2. Should go in more depth | 23 |
| 3. Should be more practical | 15 |
| 4. Should be more Job related | 14 |
| 5. More topics on Women's problem as an executive in Bangladesh, (Special problems of women) | 14 |
| 6. Should be more different topics | 12 |
| 7. More relevant to specific work context | 5 |
| <u>Suggestions for Improvements in Training Methods</u> | |
| 1. More time for discussion | 27 |
| 2. Need more alternatives to lectures | 20 |
| 3. Materials should be in Bengali | 19 |
| 4. More Case Studies | 16 |
| 5. More film shows (related to Job) | 12 |
| 6. More feedback on work (more time to discuss feedback) | 7 |
| 7. Should be small group work | 6 |
| 8. Cases too theoretical and not relevant | 4 |
| 9. Lectures too long | 4 |
| 10. Training materials should be distributed before the lecture | 1 |
| 11. Half hour break after every two hour session | 1 |
| 12. More lecture should be followed by practical exercise | 1 |
| 13. More Class Test | 1 |
| <u>Suggestions about other aspects</u> | |
| 1. Generally like the idea of training for women | 48 |
| 2. Training should be longer | 21 |
| 3. Group should be homogeneous | 15 |
| 4. Gap between modules should be closer | 13 |
| 5. Wanted more higher training for self | 13 |
| 6. Better needs assessment | 12 |
| 7. Accomodation for women from outside Dhaka | 10 |
| 8. Miscellaneous | 9 |
| 9. Training course should be designed with either 1 or 2 modules | 5 |
| 10. Should include more women from outside Dhaka | 4 |
| 11. More women trainers | 3 |
| 12. Follow up training - one or two day w/shops for participants | 3 |
| 13. Training should be provided for all categories of women not exclusively for executives | 3 |
| 14. Training for male higher officers needed | 2 |

work , more feedback on field projects presented by the trainees, and more practical exercises related to the lectures. Several suggested that lectures were too long and that there should be longer breaks between lectures.

Nineteen of the women said that the handouts should be in Bengali for easier reading and comprehension and some suggested that handouts should precede lectures, not be given out at the time of lectures.

The most common complaint about the management process was the lack of advance notice about the course. No one reported receiving more than 2 days notice, many received notification the morning of the training itself. Suggestions were also made about other aspects of the training. Fifteen of the women suggested that groups should be more homogeneous, and another 12 called for better needs assessment. Twenty one of the women felt that the training should be longer and several suggested short followup workshops. Thirteen felt that the gap between the modules should be shorter.

Ten women pointed out the problem of lack of accomodation for women from outside Dhaka. Several women suggested that there should be more women trainers. Three women said that training should be provided for all categories of women, not exclusively for executives.

Findings from the Group Discussions with 45 Participants

In addition to the individual interviews, discussions were held with three different groups of participants. One group composed of 19 women from three banks (Uttara, Sonali and Agrani) was held at the head office conference room of the Uttara Bank. A second meeting was held with 12 women from the MSWWA Directorate of Women's Affairs in a conference room at the office of the Directorate. The third meeting included 14 women from the Department of Social Services, MSWWA, and was held at the National Academy of Social Services whose Principal had been one of the participants.

The discussions were intentionally kept open-ended but were guided by several major questions. The purpose was to stimulate the women to discuss among themselves whether they feel that special training for women is important, if so was what they learned valuable, and how could the courses be improved to better serve other groups of women. Discussion was informal and almost entirely conducted in Bengali.

Much of what the women said in the discussions has been reflected above in the interview responses. However, several key findings were reinforced and several points that did not come out in the one to one interviews were added.

The principle finding reinforced was that the women found the

training valuable and think it should be continued, albeit with some improvements. The program has increased their self-confidence, and reduced their dependency on their male superiors and clerks. Each woman felt she had learned specific skills that she has been able to apply. An added benefit has been the opportunity to interchange with women from other departments and ministries. Such contacts are valuable now for mutual reinforcement and may be valuable in future career development. The women expressed their feeling that they represent the first generation of women administrators in Bangladesh and therefore are role models for women coming after. They are still learning how to handle their dual roles as wives and mothers as well as responsible executives.

Almost all of the women felt it would be important to include some discussion of the special problems of women in the training programs. BMDC in one of its modules invited the women to bring their husbands for a discussion. That session was found useful. AFD had included a panel on women's problems (with two men and one woman on the panel) but there was little time for discussion or open interchange. The women feel that such discussion could be very useful if the format were improved.

All of the women urged for future programs that earlier notification about the dates of training be given. Since all have many work responsibilities, it is very difficult to cancel all work and appear for training on a day's notice. They would prefer at least two weeks, preferably a month's notification in advance..

They generally liked the curriculum but feel that more thought should be given to depth on certain subjects. They particularly urge that more participative methods should be utilized in the training so that more real learning and internalization of both knowledge and skills can take place. Those who did assigned projects found them very useful for learning but felt that not enough time was allowed for the projects and insufficient feedback given.

They recognize that the younger women in particular are not proficient in English and therefore the reading material should be in Bengali, not only in English. Most English language material was couched in the language of modern, western concepts rather than in the language of women in Bangladesh. (Preparation of handout materials in Bengali is a particularly difficult problem and requires a lot of investment to solve. In many cases neither words nor concepts exist in Bengali for some aspects of management. If handouts in Bengali are considered a necessity it is possible that some incentive for their production will need to be offered.)

The problem of lack of homogeneity of groups was discussed and pros and cons about homogeneity were identified. If the groups are to be heterogeneous as to age, length of experience, and work background and responsibilities, very special care must

be given to dealing with such heterogeneity. They indicated that perhaps parts of the modules where generic management knowledge is imparted could be taken together but where more specific applications are required the groups could be split. They had few specific recommendations but wished to call the issue to the attention of planners of future programs.

Finally, they urged more careful needs assessment and more careful thinking about the learning purposes and the knowledge, skills and attitudes that the training is to improve. The women, particularly those from the government ministries, feel a heavy responsibility about the duties and the needs of the people they must serve. They feel training is important if it really helps them in their present work and lays the basis for better performance in future work.

MANAGEMENT OF THE PROGRAM

There were three entities responsible for the management of the program -- The Ministry of Welfare and Women's Affairs, the three training institutions and U.S.A.I.D. Each had strengths and weaknesses in their portion of the program's management. The program did happen and some 244 women were exposed to a full training program and another 146 to some modules. In this sense the program was "successful." However, a number of problems did arise whose recognition can serve to educate future efforts.

The Ministry

The management of the program within the Ministry was never given high priority. The responsibility for it was assigned to a busy Deputy Secretary and delegated to a busy Section Chief with many other duties. The financial part of the program (reimbursements to the institutions) was delegated to a clerk who already had other full time duties.

The lack of clear interest and responsibility for the program resulted in four key problems:

1. Selection criteria for participants were not clearly established. Some women about to retire were included, others who were about to be sent overseas were included, etc. No guidelines were made explicit.
2. Notification of those selected was very late, often arriving on the day of the training or only 1 or 2 days before. The training institutions all had great difficulties knowing when they could schedule modules and whether or not the women would be notified. One of the institutions finally negotiated an arrangement with the ministry that they would do their own notification. The long gaps between the modules was due largely to the

Ministry problem. In several cases modules had to be canceled at the last moment because women had not been notified.

3. There was no monitoring and evaluation system set up by the ministry. No monitoring or evaluation was done.
4. Financial reimbursement to the training institutions was a serious problem. The institutions submitted their bills to the Ministry who were to approve them and forward them to the ERD which in turn forwarded them to AID for reimbursement. This process took a minimum of 4 months and in many cases longer. A misunderstanding arose early in the program about the acceptability of reimbursement for tea and some overhead charges. Some of the problems are still unresolved. (See next section on AID)

U.S.A. I.D.

The management of the program by AID showed some problems also. At the time of the original planning of the program there were apparently no guidelines established about such issues as selection criteria, needs assessment, curriculum, training methods and evaluation and monitoring. From existing records it appears that there was no one at AID who was consistently related to the program who could relate to the ministry or problem solve. If someone had been monitoring the program it would seem to have been possible to help improve at least the notification problem and the reimbursement misunderstandings. There were also misunderstandings about monitoring and evaluation which AID was expecting the Ministry to do.

These and other problems which arose might have been avoided if AID had been able to maintain a consistent monitoring and helping relationship. Although the Project Implementation Letter of August 8, 1983 specified that AID would monitor the training programs to "ensure that quality of training is maintained," apparently turnover of staff and other pressing problems prevented consistent and effective attention to it. It must be said here that there is no evidence in the files of advance thought being given as to how it would be possible to accomplish effective monitoring and make corrections after the modules were designed and in progress.

The Institutions

The administration of the program by the institutions was apparently adequate although there is some evidence that some of them were sometimes slow in preparing their reimbursement requests and accounting for their advances. Also, some of the women interviewed complained that promised completion

certificates had never been delivered.

Clearly some of the institutions were more effective than others in working with the Ministry and clearing up problems both financial and in terms of nomination and notification of women. The institutions are certainly skilled at managing training in their own formats. Whether management problems would arise if format changes were required is unknown.

In summary, some management problems were detected in all three sectors of the program. Most of these can be solved in future programs by the assignment of adequate and interested staff with clearly defined responsibilities and real commitment to the program.

COSTS OF THE PROGRAM

The total amount of money paid out by AID to date (November 26, 1985) on the program has been \$109,936. There are still some reimbursement requests from the institutions pending.

For this amount of money 244 women received 36 days of management training each and another 71 received 24 days of training making a total of 10,488 person days of training given. The cost per person per day averaged \$10.50. The Ministry made no charges itself so all costs were those submitted by the three institutions. (This cost will average a bit higher when all bills are finally negotiated and paid.)

The costs of the program are somewhat higher than costs of other comparable training programs in Bangladesh. Evaluation team members have examined costs of other training programs where costs have run from \$25 per person day in programs with all imported expatriate trainers, to a high quality NGO training program in which costs average \$3.50 per person day including food and lodging. More comparable, perhaps, is a planned IBA women's training program being funded by the Asia Foundation which is budgeted to cost about \$5.50 per person day, including lodging and meals in a hostel.

For the amount expended, if there is effective management, quality should be able to be improved and numbers of people trained be increased. If there were to be major curriculum and training method improvements, including trainers assigned to each course and handout materials carefully translated, costs could go higher.

GENERAL ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FUTURE

It will have been clear to the reader that the women who took the course believe that a program of management training for women administrators is worthwhile and needed. The evaluation

team, after its examination, concurs.

Because women are entering businesses and government in increasing numbers for the first time, and because government policy is encouraging such entry, and because women themselves appear to want to work in administrative positions, management training becomes a necessity. A few women who enter the government cadred service through the BCS process receive training in the Public Administration Training Centre, but a large number of women entering government do not have access to management training although they may receive training on other aspects of their work in their own ministry's service institutes or academies. A large number of men in government have, over the years, received management training, but since women are newly entering government service -- some laterally entering at above entry positions -- they have no such trained group developed.

Women in the NGOs and in smaller businesses have little access to training institutes in which management training is offered. The women in banking do receive training in the banks' training centers along with men. Business training courses being offered at BMDC, for example, for banks and other larger institutions do now include in most courses some women sent by their employers.

Because there are still a large group of women who have had little access to management training, particularly in the government departments, special programs are necessary. In the Ministries of Health and Social Welfare and Womens Affairs alone there are several thousand women now working who are attempting to do project development or implementation without relevant training.

If it is agreed that management training for women is necessary, then five questions arise.

1. Who should be selected for such training and according to what criteria?
2. What knowledge, skill and attitude competencies do the selected trainees need to learn?
3. What type of training should be provided and by whom?
4. What methods should be used to impart the training?
5. Who should manage the training program?

To answer the first four questions a process is required, a process which needs to be managed and which should include persons who can appropriately participate in answering the questions. The answer to the fifth question then becomes crucial because managing the program not only includes development of answers to the first four questions but also includes implementation and monitoring of those decisions.

Our recommendation here will concentrate, therefore, on the management process. Management of the program includes five key aspects, 1) developing the process for deciding the focus of the program and selection criteria for trainees, 2) developing a needs assessment process and assuring its implementation, 3) developing the curriculum and delivery method guidelines and negotiating contracts with training institutions willing to work within those guidelines, 4) developing and implementing a monitoring and evaluation system and 5) managing the finances of the project.

Five possible management models have been explored. Each with its pros and cons is described below.

1. Management by the Ministry of Social Welfare and Womens Affairs, but with the stipulation that the Ministry must assign a woman with sufficient authority, interest, time and clerical support to manage the program.

The argument against this choice is that the track record of the Ministry in handling the program previously was not good although there is now a new Secretary and newly active Directorate of Women's Affairs.

The argument for this choice is that the Ministry has a special interest in women, has access to other Ministries and to women in business and NGOs through its Directorate of Women's Affairs and can obtain nominations and obtain assignments to training for women from other ministries as well as the private sector. The new Secretary is very interested in the development of women and this management training program in particular and told the evaluation team that he would strongly support it. The Director of the Womens Affairs Directorate is also a supporter.

2. Management by another ministry. The only other ministry that is logical is the Ministry of Establishment which has responsibility for training for government employees.

The argument for this choice is that this ministry has a special training responsibility.

The argument against this choice is that the ministry has no particular interest in training for women and has not yet succeeded in implementing adequate overall government training programs.

3. Management by a consortium of training institutions.

The argument for this model would be to cut out one layer of management and put the management into the hands of those most experienced in training.

The arguments against are that the consortium arrangement would be difficult to achieve, external monitoring would have to be arranged in some other way, and that external pressures to improve their products would not necessarily operate. Also, selections of training nominees from the ministries could be difficult to obtain.

4. Management by one of the training institutions which would subcontract with the others.

The arguments for this model would be again the value of putting the management directly in the hands of a training institution with special competence in management training.

The arguments against are that external evaluation would still need to be developed, and most important, that the training institutions would not like to act as sub-contractors from one of their own.

5. Management by the Executive Leadership Program of the IBA which would do all of the training itself.

The arguments for this model are that it would be the most clear cut and simple arrangement. The Executive Development program is developing a good reputation as a high quality program. It has a track record of training for women having recently completed two programs for rural women leaders and in planning stage two other women's courses under an NGO grant.

The argument against the program is that the IBA could not do realistically more than 4 courses a year for about 20 women each. The Director of IBA told the evaluation team this constraint. Also, the nomination process would have to be handled externally by some other entity.

RECOMMENDATION BY THE EVALUATION TEAM

The recommendation of the evaluation team is Model One, management by the MSWWA provided the following two requirements are met.

1. That the ministry agrees to employ or depute a person with some knowledge of training and a demonstrated interest in management training for women to work on the program and agrees to provide her with sufficient clerical assistance so that the required work including contract negotiation, recruitment, notification, monitoring and evaluation and financial management, can be done effectively. (AID might be able to facilitate the placement of such a person as part of the program grant.) The director of the program should be placed in the Directorate of Women's Affairs but should have a position high enough to have access to all parts of the Ministry and to other ministries.

2. That the ministry agrees to work with a consultancy group (mutually agreed upon by AID and the Ministry) for at least two months in the formative stages of the program to assist its staff in 1) the process of developing selection criteria, 2) developing and implementing a needs assessment, 3) setting guidelines for curriculum and training methods to be used as the basis for contracting with the training institutions, 4) assist in searching the environment for training institutions that might be invited to participate, and 5) establishing a monitoring and evaluation process which the staff in the ministry will follow.

It would be our recommendation that the consultancy group could be composed of about three persons, two at least of whom should be Bangladeshi. The group should include persons qualified in training methodologies (including needs assessment, competencies identification, and learning unit development) as well as persons qualified in the field of management.

The recommendation for such a consultancy group is made with some reluctance because from conversations with the training institutions it is not clear that they are ready and willing to make more than small, incremental changes in their training methods. The principle value of this group, as far as influencing the training institutions, would be in helping set guidelines which the institutions would need to follow if they wish to negotiate a contract to participate. Setting up careful curriculum and training method requirements and developing some incentives for the training institutions to want to participate in the program within the required parameters will be the real challenge for this group. The evaluation team sees little possibility for even incremental improvements in the training offered unless agreements can be made on these subjects before the contracts are awarded.

Development of monitoring and evaluation systems to see that the guidelines are followed will be an important part of the duties of the consultancy group, also, as well as the key duty of the Ministry staff once the courses are underway.

It is also the team's recommendation that someone at AID be made responsible for relating to the Ministry throughout the implementation of the program so that problems can be solved before they become unmanageable (as in the case of CPMR which aborted two very well planned and generally high caliber courses).

APPENDICES

- Appendix 1 List of Persons Interviewed
- Appendix 2 Sampling Table
- Appendix 3 Copy of Interview Schedule
- Appendix 4 Table 5: Interview Responses --
Categories, Salaries, etc.
- Appendix 5 The Evaluation Team

APPENDIX - 1

List of Persons Interviewed

1. Dr. Abdur Rab, Associate Professor
Institute of Business Administration
University of Dhaka
* Co-coordinator CPMR training
2. Mrs. Aksirun Nessa, Principal
National Academy for Social Services
Directorate of Social Services
3. Mrs. Anisatul Fatema Yousuf, Associate Instructor
Academy for Planning & Development
* She was the coordinator for 3 modules of 1st batch
and other 3 module of different batches.
4. Syed Akmal Ali, Deputy Director (Admin)
Department of Social Services
Ministry of Social Welfare & Women Affairs
5. Mrs. Deena Rashid, Additional Director
Directorate of Women Affairs
Ministry of Social Welfare & Women Affairs
* She was the coordinator for the 3 module of 1st batch.
6. Mrs. Gule Afruz Mahbub, Director
Directorate of Women Affairs
Ministry of Social Welfare & Women Affairs
7. Dr. Hafiz Golam Azom Siddiquei, Director
Institute of Business Administration
8. Mr. Jainul Abedin, Vice Principal (incharge)
Academy for Planning & Development
9. Mrs. Mahmuda Khanom, Deputy Secretary (Enquiry)
Ministry of Establishment
14/2 Topkhana Road
* Former Position - Deputy Secretary Ministry of
Social Welfare & Women Affairs
10. Mr. Mujibur Rahman, Deputy Secretary (Admin)
Ministry of Social Welfare & Women Affairs
11. Mr. Mujibur Rahman, Director General
Department of Social Services
Ministry of Social Welfare & Womens Affairs

-More-

31

APPENDIX - 1 (Contd)

12. Mrs. Nadira Huda, Sr. Management Councillor, BMDC
* She was the coordinator for 2nd module of 3rd batch.
13. Mr. Serajul Islam, Director General, BMDC
14. Dr. Rahim Boks Mollah, Chairman, CPMR
15. Mr. Syedul Rahman, General Manager, Agrani Bank, Head Office
16. Mr. Helaluddin, Deputy General Manager
Personnel Div., Janata Bank, Head Office
17. Mr. K.I. Khaled, Deputy General Manager
Human Resource Development Division
Agrani Bank, Head Office
18. Mr. A.I.M. Iftikar Rahman
Assistant Managing Director, Uttara Bank,
Head Office.
19. Md. Zahiruddin Ahmed, Section Officer, MSWA
20. Mr. Mel Chatman, Project Manager, USAID
21. Mr. M.A. Ghafoor, Training Unit, USAID
22. Mr. M.M. Pathan, Training Unit, USAID
23. Mr.A.M.A. Rahim, Secretary, Ministry of Social Welfare
and Women Affairs.

APPENDIX-2
SAMPLING METHOD

| | | Cat 1 | Cat 2 | Cat 3 | Cat 4 | Cat 5 | Total |
|-------------|--------|-------------|-------------|------------|------------|-------------|-------------|
| APD | Total | 45 | 70 | 11 | 9 | - | 136 |
| | Sample | 11 (24%) | 21 (30%) | 5 (45%) | 2 (22%) | - | 39 (29%) |
| CPMR IBA | Total | - | 29 | - | - | - | 29 |
| | Sample | - | 9 (31%) | - | - | - | 9 (30%) |
| BMDC | Total | 5 | - | - | - | 70 | 75 |
| | Sample | 2 (40%) | - | - | - | 17 (24%) | 19 (25%) |
| Total | Total | 50 | 99 | 11 | 9 | 70 | 244 |
| | Sample | 13 (26%) | 30 (30%) | 5 (45%) | 2 (22%) | 17 (29%) | 67 (27%) |

Sample Categories:

- Cat.1-All Divisions, Departments, Directorates, Collectorates, Commissions under the Ministry of Finance and Planning. Ministry of Industries & its affiliated corporations. Ministry of Labour and Man Power.
- Cat.2-Ministry of Social Welfare and Women Affairs and its affiliated departments, Directorates, Training Institutions & Projects, Ministry of Health & Population Control and its affiliated Hospitals, Research & Training Institutes or Centers.
- Cat.3-Ministry of Agriculture & Ministry of Local Government Rural Development & Cooperative.
- Cat.4-Others - Ministry of Education, Ministry of Information, Ministry of Communication, Ministry of Establishment.
- Cat.5 Banks.

APPENDIX - 3

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE FOR WOMEN TRAINEES WHO COMPLETED

1. Employer _____ Completed 3 mods: Y__N__

2. Course taken: BMDC ___ IBACPMR ___ APD ___

3. How were you informed about the training? _____

4. Why were you chosen? _____

5. Has your job title changed since the training? Yes ___ No ___

If yes was the change a promotion? _____

If yes was the promotion a result of the training _____

6. Your total monthly salary (including benefits) before training _____

Now _____

7. What do you remember about the subjects covered in the course?

8. Can you think of any instances (examples) in which you have applied something you learned.

9. In what ways (or aspects) has your work improved as a result of taking the course?

APPENDIX - 3 (Contd)

10. Were you satisfied with the course? Facilities, trainers, subjects covered, training methods, materials?

11. If a course for women managers were planned in the future what would you suggest be done differently?

12. Other comments (if any).

APPENDIX - 4

TABLE - 5

INTERVIEW RESPONSES: CATEGORIES, NOTIFICATION, SALARIES ETC

| | |
|--|----|
| <u>How Informed About Training</u> | |
| Letter from own Ministry | 52 |
| Letter from MSWWA (If not own Ministry) | 15 |
| <u>Why Selected for Training</u> | |
| Don't know | 67 |
| Other | 0 |
| <u>Job Change Since Training</u> | |
| Yes | 31 |
| No | 36 |
| <u>Change within organization</u> 26 | |
| <u>Promotion</u> | |
| Yes | 14 |
| No | 17 |
| <u>Promotion due to training</u> | |
| Yes | 0 |
| No | 14 |
| <u>Present Salary Range</u> | |
| Less than Tk.2,000 | 6 |
| Tk.2,001 - 3,000 | 30 |
| Tk.3,001 - 4,000 | 17 |
| Tk.4,001 - 5,000 | 14 |
| Over Tk.5,000 | 0 |
| <u>Remembered Specifics of training content</u> | |
| Yes | 56 |
| No | 11 |
| <u>Examples of application of Learning to Improve work</u> | |
| Work generally improved | 66 |
| Improved methods of supervision | 44 |
| Improved note drafting | 44 |
| Improved uses of motivation | 39 |
| Better office procedures | 38 |
| Better work planning | 35 |
| Better written and oral communication | 35 |
| Improved self confidence | 31 |
| Getting on with boss and subordinates | 21 |
| Knowledge of service rules | 18 |
| More general breadth of knowledge | 12 |
| Improvements in monitoring and evaluation of projects | 12 |
| Improved customer relations | 12 |
| Improved financial procedures | 9 |
| Better time management | 4 |
| Very little scope to apply | 2 |
| Miscellaneous applications | 4 |

THE EVALUATION TEAM

Catherine H Lovell, Ph.D is Professor of Management at the University of California, Riverside.

Lutful Hoq Choudhury, Ph.D is Professor of Public Administration, Dhaka University.

Roushan Ara Chowdhury, M.A. is Assistant Professor, Institute Educational Research, Dhaka University

Shafique Uddin Tarafdar, M.A. is a Research Assistant